A Defenſe of the Apologie of the Churche of Englande.

Conteininge an Anſweare to a certaine Booke *lately ſet foorthe by M. Hardinge, and* Entituled, *A Confutation of &c.*

Whereunto there is alſo newely added an Anſweare vnto an other like Booke, written by the ſaide M. Hardinge, Entituled, *A Detection of ſundrie fowle Errours &c.* Printed at Louaine, Anno. 1568. *and inſerted into the former Anſweare, as occaſion,* and place required, as by ſpecial Notes added *to the Margine it maie appeare.*

By Iohn Iewel *Biſhop of Sariſburie.*

3. ESDRAE. 4.
Magna eſt Veritas, & prævalet.
Greate is the Truthe, and preuaileth.

Imprinted at London in Fleeteſtreate, at the Signe of the Elephante, by Henry VVykes.

Anno. 1571. 16. *Septembris.*

Cum Gratia & Priuilegio Regiæ Maieſtatis.

A Defeale of the Apologie of the Church of England.

Conteining an Answere to a certaine Booke lately set foorth by M. Hardinge, and Entituled, A Confutation &c.

TO THE MOSTE VERTVOVS, and Noble Princesse, Queene Elizabeth, by the Grace of God, Queene of Englande, France, and Irelande, Defender of the Faithe, &c.

IT had benne greately to be wished, moste Graceous Soueraine Lady, that, as God of his mercie hathe geuen vs, euer sithence the firste time of your Maiesties moste happy gouernemente, sutche successe in al ciuile affaires, sutche concorde, and quietnesse in al Estates, as our Fathers seldome haue seene before: so our hartes with like felicitie mighte thorowly haue consented in the profession of one vndoubted Truthe, and al our willes, whiche nowe are so violently rente asunder, and so farre distracted, mighte fully haue ioined togeather in the Wil of God: that al quarrelles, and contentions sette aparte, wee mighte with one mouthe, and one minde glorifie God, the Father of our Lorde Iesus Christe. Howe be it, it appeareth by the continual storie, and whole discourse of the Holy Scriptures, that Almighty God, of his deepe Iudgementes, and secrete Prouidence, suffreth sommemen oftetimes to delite in darkenesse, to withstande the Gospel, to seeke occasions, and wilfully to sette them selues against the knowledge, and Truthe of God. I write not this, Moste Graceous Lady, to thintente to make them odious in your Maiesties sighte, that this daie are the procurers of al these troubles. God is hable euen of the harde vnsensible stones to raise vp children vnto Abraham, and to make them the vesselles of his Mercie. Neuertheless, as S. Paule teacheth vs, sutche menne there haue benne in times paste, that haue had theire Consciences burnte with hote irons, speakinge and mainteininge Lies in Hypocrisie: that haue geuen them selues ouer into reprobate, and wilful mindes, and haue despised the Wisedome of God within them selues. And, notwithstandinge sutche battailes, and dissensions, specially in the Churche of God, whiche is called the House of Vnitie, be offensiue, and greeuous vnto the Godly, and therefore woorke greate hinderance vnto the dewe passage of the Gospel of Christe, yet in the ende the trouble hereof in Goddes Electe is recompensed abundantly with greate aduantage. For Goddes Truthe is mighty, and shal preuaile: Dagon shal falle downe headlonge before the Arke: the Darkenesse shal flee before the Lighte: and the more fiercely mannes Wisedome shal withstande, the more glorious shal God be in his Victorie. 1. Timoth. 4. Roman. 1.

But, shortely to discourse vnto your Maiestie the particulare occasions hereof from the beginninge, after it had pleased Almighty God, at the firste entrie of your Maiesties Reigne, by a moste happy exchange, and by the meanes of your Maiesties moste Godly trauailes, to restoare vnto vs the Lighte, and comforte of his Gospel, there was written, and published by vs a Litle Booke in the Latine tongue, entituled, An Apologie of the Churche of Englande, conteininge the whole substance of the Catholique Faithe, nowe professed, and freely preached throughout al your Maiesties Dominions: that thereby al forreine Nations mighte vnderstande the considerations, and causes of your Maiesties dooinges in that behalfe. Thus in olde times did Quadratus, Melito, Iustinus Martyr, Tertullian, and other Godly, and Learned Fathers, vpon like occasions, as wel to make knowen the Truthe of God, and to open the groundes of their Profession, as also to put the Infidelles to silence, and to stoppe the mouthes of the wicked.

This Apologie, beinge thus written firste in Latine, and afterwarde, vpon the comfortable reporte of your Maiesties moste Godly enterprises, translated into sundrie other tongues, and so made common to the moste parte of al Europe, as it hathe benne wel allowed of, and liked of the Learned, and Godly, as it is plaine by theire open testimonies, touchinge the same, so hathe it not hitherto, for ought, that maie appeare, benne anywhere openly reproued, either in Latine, or otherwise, either by any one mannes Priuate writinge, or by the Publique Authoritie of any Nation.

Onely one M. Hardinge, not longe sithence your Maiesties Subiecte, now misliking the pre-

ſent ſtate, and reſiant in Louaine, hath of late taken vpon him, againſt the ſaid Apologie, *with the whole Doctrine, and al the partes of the ſame, to publiſhe an open* Confutation, *and to offer the ſame vnto your Maieſtie: Wherein he ſheweth him ſelfe ſo vehement, and ſo ſharpe, and buſie in finding faultes, that he doubteth not to ſeeke quarrels againſt vs, euen in that Wee maintaine the Baptiſme of Chriſtian Infantes, the proceedinge, and Godhed of the Holy Ghoſte, the Faithe of the Holy, and Glorious Trinitie, and the General, and Catholique Profeſſion of the common Creede. Thus, ſir that he hathe once ſeuered him ſelfe from vs, he beareth nowe the Worlde in hande, Wee can beleeue nothinge without an errour. The maigne grounde of his whole plea is*

Conf. fo. 334. b
Con. fo. 285. a.
Confu. 324. b.
Confu. 204. b.
Confu. 306. b.

this, That the Biſhop of Rome, what ſo euer it ſhal like him to Determine in Iudgement, can neuer erre: that he is alwaies vndoubtedly poſſeſſed of Goddes Holy Sprite: that at his onely hande Wee muſte learne to knowe the Wil of God: that in his onely Holineſſe ſtandeth the Vnitie, and ſafetie of the Churche: that Who ſo euer is diuided from him, muſt be iudged an Heretique: and, that Without the obedience of him, there is no hope of Saluation. And yet, as though it were not ſufficiente for him, ſo vainely to ſoothe a man in open Errours, he telleth vs alſo ſadly, and in good

Confu. fo. 180. a
Et 305 b.
Con. fol. 247. b
Con. fo. 248. b
Con. fol. 178. b
Con. fo. 178. b.

earneſt, that the ſame Biſhop is not only a Biſhop, but alſo a Kinge: *that vnto him belongeth the Authoritie, and right of bothe Swerdes, as wel Temporal, as Spiritual: that al Kinges, and Emperours receiue their Whole power at his hande, and ought to ſweare obedience, and Fealtie vnto him. For theſe be his Woordes, euen in this Booke ſo boldely dedicate vnto your Maieſtie:* It is a greate eie ſoare, *ſaithe M. Hardinge,* to the Miniſters of Antichriſte, to ſee the Vicare of Chriſt aboue Lordes, and Kinges of this world, and to ſee Princes, and Emperours promiſe, and ſweare obedience vnto him. *And whereas* Pope Zacharie *by the conſent, or conſpiracie of the Nobles of France, depoſed* Chilperichus, *the true, natural, and liege Prince of that Realme, and placed* Pipinus *in his roume, Lo ſaith M. Hardinge,* yee muſt needes confeſſe, that this was a Diuine power in the Pope: for otherwiſe he could neuer haue done it. *Thus mutche he eſteemeth the diſhonours, and ouerthrowes of Goddes Annointed.*

Con. fol. 182. a

Whereas alſo Pope Boniface *the Eighth, for that he could not haue the Treaſurie of France at his commaundement, endeuoured with al his both Eccleſiaſtical, and Worldly puiſſance, to remoue* Philip *the Frenche Kinge from his eſtate, and vnder his Bulles or Letters Patentes, had conueighed the ſame ſolemnely vnto* Albertus *the Kinge of Romaines, M. Harding here telleth your Maieſtie, that al this Was very wel done,* to thintent thereby to fraie the Kinge, and to keepe him in awe, and to reclaime his minde from diſobedience. *Nowe, touchinge your*

Confut. a. Folio 182. b.

Maieſties moſt Noble Progenitours, the Kinges of this Realme, Whereas We, as our loialtie, and allegiance bindeth vs, iuſtely complaine, that Pope Alexander 3. *by violence, and tyrannie forced* Kinge Henrie *the Seconde to ſurrender his Crowne Emperial into the handes of his Legate, and afterwarde for a certaine ſpace to contente him ſelfe in Priuate eſtate, to the greate indignation, and griefe of his louinge Subiectes: And that likewiſe* Pope Innocentius *the thirde ſtirred vp the Nobles, and Commons of this Realme againſt* Kinge Iohn, *and gaue the Enheritance, and Poſſeſſion of al his Dominions vnto* Ludouicus *the Frenche Kinge, (as for the miſvſinge of your Maieſties moſte deere Father of moſte Noble Memorie,* Kinge Henrie the Eighth, *for as much as the ſmart therof is yet in freaſh remembrance, I wil ſaie nothing): To theſe, and al other like tyrannical iniuries, and iuſt cauſes of griefe, M. Hardinge ſhortely, and in light*

M. Hardinge Fol. 340. b.

manner thinketh it ſufficient to anſweare thus: VVhat though Kinge Henrie the Seconde were il entreated of Pope Alexander 3? VVhat though Kinge Iohn were il entreated of that Zelous, and Learned Pope Innocentius 3? VVhat though Kinge Henrie the Eighth were likewiſe entreated of the Popes in our time? *I knowe right wel, moſt Souraine Lady, the goodneſſe of your Graceous Nature deliteth not in ſuche rehearſals. Neither doo I make report hereof, for that ſuch thinges ſometimes haue ben done: but for that the ſame things euen now at this time, either ſo lightly are excuſed, or ſo boldely are defended. Such humble affection, and obedience theſe men by their open, and publique Writinges, teach your Maieſties true Subiectes to beare towardes theire Natural Prince. It ſhal mutche warrante the honour and ſafetie of your Roial Eſtate, if your Maieſtie ſhal ſometimes remember the diſhonours, and dangers, that other your* Noble Progenitours *haue felte before you.*

But concerninge the Maieſtie, *and right of* Kinges, *and* Emperours, *M. Hardinge telleth*

M. Hardinge Fol. 318. b.

vs, They haue their firſt Authoritie by the Poſitiue Lawe of Nations, and can haue no more Power, then the people hath, of whom they take their temporal Iuriſdiction: *as if he Would ſaie,* Emperours, *and* Kinges *haue none other right of gouernment, then it hath pleaſed their*

ſted their Subiectes by compoſition to allowe vnto them. Thus he ſaith, and ſaith it boldely: as if God him ſelfe had neuer ſaide, Per me Reges Regnant: By mee, and my Authoritie Kinges beare rule ouer their Subiectes: *Or, as if* Chriſte our Sauioure *had neuer ſaide vnto* Pilate *the Lorde Lieutenante*, Thou ſhouldeſt haue no Power ouer mee, were it not geuen thee from aboue: *Or, as if* S. Paule *had not ſaide*, Non eſt Poteſtas, niſi à Deo: There is no Power, but onely from God. *And yet further, as if their whole ſtudie were fully bente, in reſpecte of the Pope, to deface the Authoritie, and Maieſtie of al Princes, euen nowe one of the ſame companie doubteth not to teach the world, That* the Pope is the Heade, and Kinges, and Emperours are the feete: *Like as alſo an other of the ſame faction ſaith*, The Emperours Maieſtie is ſo far inferiour in dignitie to the Pope, as a Creature is inferiour vnto God. *Wee diuiſe not theſe thinges of malice, Moſte Gracious Lady, but reporte the ſame truely, as wee finde them proclaimed, and publiſhed this daie by their vaine, and dangerous Writinges, whiche notwithſtandinge they would ſo faine haue to be taken as Catholique. If this Doctrine maie once take roote, and be freely receiued emongeſt the Subiectes, it ſhal be harde for any Prince to holde his Righte. As for your* Maieſtie, *for that it hathe pleaſed Almighty God in his Mercie, to make you an inſtrumente of his Glorie, as in Olde times he made many other Godly, and Noble Princes, to reſtourme his Church from that huge, and lothſome heape of filthe, and rubbe, that either by violence, or by negligence had bene throwen into it, therfore M. Harding euen in this ſelfe ſame Booke, vnder certaine general threates, chargeth you with diſordred preſumption, by the example of* Ozias *the wicked Kinge*, vpon whom, *as he ſaithe*, God ſente his vengeance for the like. *For be the Abuſes, and Errours of the Church neuer ſo many, be the falles, and dangers neuer ſo greate, be the Prieſtes, and Biſhops neuer ſo blinde, yet by this Doctrine, it maie neuer be lawful for the Prince, be he neuer ſo learned, or ſo wiſe, or ſo zelous in Gods cauſe, to attempte any maner of Reformation. And therefore thus he ſaith vnto your* Maieſtie, *and with al his skil, and cunninge, laboureth to perſwade your Maieſties Subiectes, if any one, or other happily of ſimplicitie wil beleue him, that the Godly* Lawes, *whiche your* Maieſtie *hathe geeuen vs to liue vnder, are no* Lawes: *that your* Parlamentes, *are no* Parlamentes: *that your* Cleregie, *is no* Cleregie: *Our* Sacramentes, *no* Sacramentes: *Our* Faithe, *no* Faithe. *The Church of Englande, whereof your Maieſtie is the moſt Principal, and Chiefe, he calleth a malignant Churche, a Newe Churche erected by the Diuel, a Babylonical Tower, a Hearde of Antichriſte, a Temple of Lucifer, a Synagoge, and a Schoole of Sathan, ful of Robberie, Sacrilege, Schiſme, and Hereſie. And al this he furniſheth with ſutche libertie of other vncourteous, and vnſeemely talkes, as if he had ben pourpoſely hired to ſpeake diſhonour of your* Maieſties *moſt Godly dooinges.*

Of al theſe, and other like Tragical fantaſies, for as mutche as he hathe ſo boldely aduentured to make a preſent vnto your Maieſtie, *wee haue great cauſe to reioice in God, for that our controuerſies are brought to be debated before ſutche a perſonage, as is hable ſo wel, and ſo deepely to vnderſtande them. For I haue no doubt, but as by your great Learninge, and marueilous Wiſedome, you ſhal ſoone ſee the difference of our Pleadinges, ſo of your* Maieſties *gracious inclination vnto al Godlineſſe, you wil readily finde out the Falſehed, and geue ſentence with the Truthe. Verily, after that your* Maieſtie *ſhal haue therowly conſidered the manifeſt Vntruthes, and corruptions, togeather with the Abuſes, and Errours of the contrarie ſide: the Weakeneſſe of the Cauſe, the Boldeneſſe of the Man, and the immoderate bitterneſſe of his ſpeach, I haue good hope, the more aduiſedly you ſhal beholde it, the leſſe cauſe you ſhal finde, wherefore to like it. For the diſcouerie hereof, for my poore portion of Learninge, I haue endeuoured to doo, that I was hable: And the ſame here I humbly preſente vnto your* Maieſtie, *as vnto my moſt Gracious, and Soueraine Liege Lady, and, as now, the onely* Nource, *and* Mother *of the Churche of God within theſe your Maieſties moſt Noble Dominions. It maie pleaſe your Maieſtie graceouſly to weigh it, and to iudge of it, not according to the skil, and habilitie of the Writer, which is but ſimple, but according to the weight, and woorthineſſe of the cauſe. The poore labours haue benne mine: the Cauſe is Goddes. The goodneſſe of the one wilbe alwaies hable to counteruaile the ſimplicitie of the other.*

God euermore enflame, and direcle your Maieſtie with his Holy Sprite, that the Zele of his Houſe maie therowly deuoure your Graceous harte: that you maie ſafely walke in the waies of your Father Dauid: *that you maie vtterly abandon al Groues, and Hille Aultars: that you maie liue an Olde* Mother *in* Iſrael: *that you maie ſee an ende of al diſſenſions, and ſtabliſhe Peace, and Vnitie in the Churche of God, Amen.*

Your Maieſties moſte Humble Subiecte, and Faitheful Oratoure,
Iohn Sariſburie.

Prouerb.8.
Iohan.19.
Roman.13.
Dorman.fo.15
Staniſlaus Orichouius in Chimera, Fol. 97.
M.Hard.fol. 298.a.
Confuta.277.
Confuta.328.a
Confuta.172.b
Reioind. 314.
Confut. 87.a.
Confut. 269.b
Reioind.42.a
Confutat.43.a
Confu.269.a.
323.b.334.a.
338.a.348.b.

A Preface to the Reader conteininge

the cauſes of this newe Impreſſion.

Good Chriſtian Reader, I doubte not, but the very Title, and firſte entrie of M. Hardinges laſte Booke is ſuffitiente to aſtonne thy ſenſes. For thus he beginneth: A Detection of Lies, Cauilles, Sclaunders, &c. As if Hercules Furens, or Aiax Maſtigophorus were newely turned into Engliſhe. If I ſhoulde quite him, either with number of Bookes, or with courteſie of Speache, I ſhoulde be like vnto him, and encombre the worlde with nedeleſſe Laboures. Wherefore beinge moued eftſoones to Printe my late Booke, intituled, The Defenſe of the Apologie of the Churche of Englande, I thoughte it good by a ſhorte Augmentation, to diſcharge al ſuche quarrelles, as M. Hardinge in his laide Detection hathe moued againſte certaine parcelles of the ſame: and therein to vſe ſuche temperance of wordes, not as maie beſte anſweare M. Hardinges eloquence, but as maie be comely for the cauſe.

Nowe if thou ſhalte vouchelaue to examine our doinges, I beſeeche thee to iudge vprightly, and not to ſuffer thee ſelfe by ſhewes, and ſhiftes to be beguiled. What man would ſeeme to deale ſo plainely, as a Juggler? He will ſtrike vp his ſleeues, and make bare his armes, and open his Handes, and Fingers, and laie al thinges before thee, and bid thee beholde: and thou wilte thinke him to be a good plaine man, and maruelle that thou ſhouldeſt poſſibly be deceiued. And yet in deede his whole ſkil, and ſeekinge is nothinge els, but to deceiue thee: and the more ſimply, and plainely he woulde ſeeme to deale, ſo mutche the ſoner he will deceiue thee. otherwiſe he were no Juggler. Thou ſhalte thinke, thou ſeeſte al: and yet ſeeſte nothinge. Thou ſhalt thinke, thou feeleſt it ſenſibly with thy Fingers, that thou holdeſte it faſte, and canſte not loſe it: And yet ſhalt thou open thy handes, and finde nothinge. So eaſie a thinge it is to enueigle thy ſenſes.

When thou heareſt a Counſeller pleadinge for his Cliente at the Barre, perhaps thou wilt thinke it is al Lawe, that he ſpeaketh, and that the caſe is plaine, and nothing to be laide to the contrarie. But, when an other Counſeller ſhal ſtande forthe, and replie againſte him, and rippe vp his tale, and weigh his reaſons, and diſcloſe the errours, & weakeneſſe of his pleadinge, then wilt thou begin to miſlike, that thou liked before, and wonder at thine owne ſimplicitie, that euer thou were ſo fonde to beleeue the former. Yea the Iudge him ſelfe, notwithſtandinge vpon ſomme good likelihoods of the cauſe, he be inclined to fauour the one ſide, yet ſommetimes by weight, and force of better reaſon, he changeth his opinion, and geueth Sentence with the other. There is greate darekeneſſe in mannes wiſedome. Oftentimes it is true, that we take to be falſe. Our phantaſie is no righte meaſure of Goddes counſels.

But M. Hardinge telleth thee, That I falſifie al that I take in hande: That I forge, and counterfeite, and leaue out, either the beginninge, or the middle, or the ende, and reporte nothinge as I finde it: Briefly, that al my writinges are freight with Lies. It is no harde mater for M. Hardinge, thus to ſaie. It were more maruelle, if he woulde ſaie otherwiſe. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Qui mendax eſt, neminem putat verum dicere. He is a partie, and woulde be lothe, to yelde to any thinge againſte him ſelfe.

2. *Chryſoſt. in Matth. Hom. 19.*

For thy better ſatiſfaction in theſe caſes, good Reader, I haue here laide forthe before thee, a fewe ſuche examples, as wherein M. Hardinge would ſeeme to haue founde moſte aduantage. This haue I donne in as fewe wordes, and as briefly, as the cauſe woulde beare: and yet, I truſte, ſo openly, and ſo plainely, that thou maiſte eaſily ſée the truthe, and vprightneſſe of his dealinge. And althoughe perhappes thou be his friende, and for ſomme particulare affection wiſhe fauourably vnto his ſide, yet I wil not refuſe to make thee Iudge betweene vs bothe.

Firſte

Firſte therefore to beginne with that thinge, whereof M. Hardinge and certaine his Welwillers haue made greateſt triumphe, Where I ſaie, that one Euſychius, beinge within Holy Orders, and the Biſhop of Cæſarea in Cappadocia, married a Wife, and ſhortely after, beinge as yet but newely married, was put to deathe for the name of Chriſte, and died a Martyr, M. Hardinge hereunto anſweareth thus: M. Iewel moſte falſely corrupteth the Reporter of this Storie: Beholde the falſehedde of this man: Sozomenus nameth him Εὐσύχιον Καισαρείας παπάδοκιαν τῶν Ἑνετῶν τριβοῦν, As mutche as, *Euſychius, one of the Lordes, or one of the Nobilitie of the Citie of Cæſarea in Cappadocia.* M. Iewel was ſo bolde to falſifie the place, and to put in of his owne, this woorde, *Epiſcopum*, to healpe his mater. Thus he taketh vpon him, to make him a Biſhop, who was a Laie man, as wel a Biſhop, as he him ſelfe is &c. Herein therefore, good Reader, ſtandeth the ſtrife. I ſaie, Eupſychius was a Biſhop: M. Hardinge ſaithe, he was a mere Laie man, and no Biſhop. The iſſue is this, whether this Eupſychius were a Biſhop, or no. And as thou ſhalte finde him true herein, ſo maiſte thou truſte him in the reſte. Firſte in the ſeconde Councel of Nice this ſelfe ſame Eupſychius is called Eupſychius Presbyter Cæſareæ: Eupſychius *a Prieſt of the Church of* Cæſarea. Here maiſte thou ſée, that Eupſychius was a Prieſte, that is, I trowe, ſomme what more then a mere Laie man, and in ſomme poſſibilitie to be a Biſhop, al M. Hardinges waſte woordes, of Lordes, and Noble menne, notwithſtandinge. If this Authoritie ſuffice him not, let him further be aduiſed by that Ancient, and Godly Learned Father Athanaſius, whom Socrates calleth the greate Starre of Aegypte. He wil telle him by plaine woordes, that Eupſychius, and this ſelfe ſame Eupſychius in very deede was a Biſhop. Thus he ſaithe of him, Scripta Leontij, & Eupſychij Epiſcoporum Cappadociæ: *The Writinges of* Leontius, *and* Eupſychius Biſhoppes *of the Kingedome of* Cappadocia. Marke, good Reader, and telle M. Hardinge, Athanaſius ſaithe not, Eupſychius the Lorde, or Noble man, but Eupſychius the Biſhop. He was the Biſhop of Cæſarea: and Cæſarea was the chiefe Citie of Cappadocia. This is plaine dealinge. I leade thee not aboute, as M. Hardinge doithe, with conjectures, & gheaſſes. I ſhewe thée by expreſſe, and plaine woordes, that Eupſychius was a Biſhop: and that I proue by ſufficiente Authoritie of Anciente Fathers. Here thou haſte the ſame Countrie Cappadocia, the ſame Citie of Cæſarea, the ſame time of Perſecution vnder Iulianus Apoſtata, the ſame man, the ſame Martyr, and the ſame name. If this be true, as in deede it is, what maiſt thou then thinke of M. Hardinge, that ſaithe, It is falſe? what maiſte thou then thinke of him, that ſo boldely telleth thée, that this Eupſychius was neuer, neither Biſhop of Cæſarea, nor of any other place els: no not ſo mutche as a Prieſte, or Deacon, or Subdeacon? What maiſte thou then thinke of him, that bluſſheth not, thus vainely to blotte his papers, and thus to telle the worlde: M. Iewel hath fathered a ſhameful Lie vpon Caſſiodorus: M. Iewel hathe belied, and falſified Sozomenus, and his Tranſlatour? What maiſte thou then thinke of him, that ſo impatiently crieth out without cauſe, Phy vpon ſutche ſhameleſſe Liers: O lamentable ſtate, where the people of God is compelled to heare ſutche Prophetes. It were better for M. Hardinge, to be wiſe, and ſober, then thus to fare.

M. Hard. in Præfa. ad Lector. ✶✶✶✶✶ij.

Con. Nicen. 2 Actio. 6. pag. 381.

Socra. Lib. 4. cap. 23.

Athana. in oratione, 1. contra Arianos.

M. Har. Detect. fo. 302. a.

M. Har. Detect. fo. 185. a.

Where as againſte the inordinate Ambition, and Pride of the Biſhoppes of Rome, I allege theſe woordes out of the Booke called Opus Imperfectum, bearinge the name of Chryſoſtome, *Who ſo deſireth Primacie in Earthe, ſhal in Heauen finde Confuſion*, M. Hardinge anſweareth, Theſe woordes are not, neither in *Opere Imperfecto*, nor in any other Booke of Chryſoſtome: Chryſoſtome hath no ſuche ſaieinge: It is a forgerie: and that you knowe wel yenough: yet yee are not aſhamed to deceiue the ignorante. Here haue we a very peremptorie Negatiue boldely preſumed. And a man woulde thinke, that a Doctour of Diuinitie woulde not ſo ſtoutely warrante a mater, onleſſe He knewe it. For ſo perhaps he might be founde ignorante, and be deceiued. But, good Reader, if thou happen at any time to haue acceſſe vnto him, I beſeeche thée, euen as thou haſte affiance in his worde, and tendereſt his credite, deſire him to

open his Booke, called Opus Imperfectum, and to turne to the fiue and thirtie Homilie of the same. There shalte thou finde these selfe same wordes, whiche he so constantly telleth thee, can neuer be founde in al the worlde: Quicunque desiderauerit Primatum in Terra, inueniet in Cœlo Confusionem: *Who so euer ambitiously desireth Primacie in Earthe, He in Heauen shal finde Confusion.* These wordes, I saie, M. Hardinge shal finde, not onely in his owne Gratian, whiche thinge vnto him had benne sufficiente, but also in the Authour him selfe. Aske him therefore, what he meante, so out of season to talke of forgerie. Aske him what so hainous offense M. Iewel hathe committed herein, whereof he ought to be ashamed.

3. *Chrysostom. in in Opere imperfecto, Hom 35.* *Distinct. 40. Multi.*

Where I saie, Pope Zosimus, the better to mainteine his ambitious Claime, corrupted the Holy Councel of Nice, M. Hardinge answeareth, Neuer did any Honest man saie so from the beginninge of the worlde. Good Reader, I beseeche thee euen for the Truthes sake, harken aduisedly, what I shal saie. The case is cleare: thus it standeth: Aboute eleuen hundred yeres agoe Pope Zosimus began to claime Superiorittie, and Iurisdiction ouer al the Churches, and Bishoppes of Aphrica. The Bishoppes of that Countrie, to the number of two hundred and seuentiene, assembled togeather in the Aphricane Councel, misliked the strangenesse of his attempte, and openly refused him, and tolde him plainely, They knewe of no suche Authorittie, that he had ouer them. Pope Zosimus for his warrante alleged a Decree, or Canon, that he him selfe, or somme other his Predecessour, had forged vnder the name of the Councel of Nice. The Bishoppes answeared him, that they them selues also had Copies of the same Nicene Councel: But any suche Canon, touchinge suche Superiorittie of the Pope, they founde none there. The Pope saide, their Copies were corrupted: and they saide the like of the Popes. For trial of the mater, they agreed togeather to sende vnto the moste famous Churches of al the East, vnto Constantinople, Alexandria, and Antioche: and from thence they receiued the true Copies of the Greeke Originals, vnder the Authentical Seales of the Patriarches there. By conference whereof it was euidente vnto al the worlde, that the Popes onely Copie disagreed from al the reste, and was falsly corrupted, to serue his turne, and so consequentely, that the Pope was a Falsifier, and a Forger of Councelles. Thus standeth the very true Storie of this whole mater, as it is euidente by the Councel of Aphrica.

4. *M. Har. Detect. fo. 249. a*

Conci. Aphrica. ca. 102. 103 In Græc. pa. 82.

And therefore Marcus, the Archebishop of Ephesus, togeather with Ioseph the Patriarke of Constantinople, Bessarion the Archebishop of Nice, and Isidorus the Metropolitane of Syria, with others moe Archebishoppes, and Metropolitanes of greate Prouinces, and Countries, and a greate number of other inferiour Bishoppes, saide thus openly in the late Councel of Florence by waie of Protestation against the Pope: Nónne vides, Reuerende Pater, Summum Pontificem (Zosimum) falsum Decretum, & non in Synodo promulgatum, ad tantum Concilium pro re tam magna misisse? *And see you not, Reuerende Father, that* Pope Zosimus, *beinge then the Highest Bishop, for a mater of greate weighte sente vnto that worthy* Councel (*of* Aphrica) *a false, or a falsified Canon, suche as neuer was published in the* Councel of Nice? Bidde M. Hardinge marke wel theise wordes. This Canon (saie they) is false, and falsified: and suche, as neuer was Decreed in the Councel of Nice. As if they woulde saie, wil you beare vs downe, or auaunce youre Authorittie by this Canon? It is wel knowen to be a forgerie. What can there be more plainely spoken? They saie expressely, euen as we saie, This newe Canon was forged, and falsified, and that, either by Pope Zosimus, or by somme other Pope, his Predecessoure. And yet can M. Hardinge so sadly telle vs, That neuer honeste man saide so from the beginninge of the worlde? Or, can he make vs beleue, that of al theise Metropolitanes, Archebishoppes, and Patriarkes in the Councel of Florence, and of the other two hundred and seuentiene Bishoppes in the Councel of Aphrica, emonge whom was Alypius, and S. Augustine, there was not one honest man? D. Tonstal in his Sermone pronounced openly before Kinge Henrie, disclosed,

Concil. Floren. Sessione, 20.

closed, and reproued the same falsehed. Likewise Doctour Redman in open writinge acknowledged, and confessed the same: yet were they not vnhonest menne.

Whereas I saie, *It was specially prouided by the* Councel of Carthage, *that the Bishop of Rome shoulde not be called the Vniuersal Bishop*, Ne Romanus Episcopus appelletur Vniuersalis, M. Hardinge answeareth, A shameleſſe man: An impudent Gloser: Three impudent Lies: These be not the woordes of the Councel of Carthage: They are to be referred to the thirde parte of the Distinction, that foloweth afterwarde. *M. Hard. fol. 190. b. 191. a.* If these be not the woordes of the Councel of Carthage, yet at leaste they are Gratians woordes, reportinge the woordes of the Councel of Carthage. Uerily, whose woordes so euer it shal please M. Hardinge to make them, by his owne confession, they are none of mine. The woordes be plaine, Vniuersalis autem nec etiam Romanus Episcopus appelletur: *Let not the Bishop of Rome him selfe be called the* Vniuersal Bishop. *Dist. 99. Prima.* And this, saithe M. Hardinge, is the very meaninge of Pope Pelagius, that foloweth nexte afterwarde in the same Distinction. Nowe if these be the expresse, and plaine woordes of Gratian, if they be eftsones uttered, and confirmed by the Gloſe, if by implication, and meaninge they be the woordes of the Councel of Carthage, and of Pope Pelagius, to be shorte, if they be no woordes of mine, was not then M. Hardinge wel occupied, so vainely to crie out, Three impudente Lies: A shameleſſe man: An impudente Gloser? A sober man woulde be better aduised, what he speaketh.

Where I saie, Pope Liberius *was an* Arian Heretique, M. Hardinge answeareth, Or els yee are an errante Sclaunderous Lier. Iudge thou betwéne vs indifferently, good Christian Reader: and let the Lier haue his méde. This is not my iudgment of Pope Liberius: it is written, and reported by sundrie others, euen by suche, as M. Hardinge maie not iustely condemne for errante Liers. *M. Hard. fol. 249. b.* Here wil I speake nothinge of S. Hierome. For M. Hardinge vtterly refuseth his iudgement in this behalfe, and saithe, he was mutche deceiued. Howe be it, errante Lier, I trowe, be wil not calle him, for his Authorities sake. But Sabellicus saithe, Liberius, vt quidam scribunt, ex confesso factus est Arianus: Pope Liberius, *as somme menne saie, by open profession became an* Arian. Alphonsus de Castro saithe in plaine woordes, De Liberio Papa constat, fuisse Arianum: *As for* Pope Liberius, *it is wel knowen, he was an* Arian Heretique. The same is auouched by Rhegino, by Platina, by Cardinal Cusanus, by Anselmus Rid, and by others, as afterwarde it shalbe alleged in place conueniente more at large. Al these, and others moe haue reported, that Pope Liberius was an Heretique. Therefore, good Reader, bid M. Hardinge to be better aduised, what, and howe many they be, whom he so rashely condemneth for errante Liers. *M. Ha. Confut. par. 6. ca. 5. dist. 2. Sabel. Enne. 7 Lib. 8. Alphō. contra Hæres. Lib. 1. cap. 4.*

Where as I saie, Pope Cœlestinus *was a* Nestorian Heretique, M. Hardinge answeareth, VVho euer hearde suche an impudente man? A moste impudente Lier: A wicked Sclaunderer. *M. Har. Detect. fol. 253. b.* Al this vaine winde is sone blowen ouer. Laurentius Valla, a Canon of the Churche of Rome, saithe thus, Papa Cœlestinus sensit cum Hæretico Nestorio: Pope Cœlestinus *agreed in Iudgemente with the* Heretique Nestorius. *Laurent. Val. de Donatione Constant.* Nowe iudge thou, good Christian Reader, who is impudente, and who is a Lier. And bid M. Hardinge to construe these woordes, and to be better assured, before he speake. For rashe iudgemente argueth somme folie.

Where I saie, Pope Bonifacius 2. condemned S. Augustine, and al the whole Councel of Aphrica, and saide, they were al leadde by the Diuel, for that they withstoode the Ambition of the Churche of Rome, M. Hardinge answeareth, Here is Bonifacius 2. fowly belied: It is an impudente Lie: This man is not ashamed to lie. Pope Bonifacius 2. neuer condemned S. Augustine by name, nor the Councel of Aphrica by any solemne Sentence. *M. Har. Detect. fol. 172. a.* A man woulde thinke, so many greate woordes shoulde beare somme weighte. Howe solemne the Pope was in his Sentence, it forceth not greately. Certaine it is he condemned Aurelius the Bishop of Carthage, with al others his felowe Bishoppes, and saide, they were al entised, and leadde by the Diuel: and one of his saide felowe Bishoppes, was S. Augustine the Bishop of Hippo, as it is

moste

moſte euidente by the Subſcription of the Councel of Aphrica. The wordes of the ſaide Pope Bonifacius be theſe: Aurelius Carthagineuſis Eccleſiæ olim Epiſcopus, cum collegis ſuis, inſtigante Diabolo, ſuperbire cœpit contra Romanam Eccleſiam. Therefore, good Reader, once againe thou maiſte telle M. Hardinge, that Pope Bonifacius 2. in deede, and vndoubtedly condemned S. Auguſtine, and ſaide, He was leadde by the Diuel, onely for that he would not yelde to his Predeceſſours ambitious folie. This is neither Impudencie, nor Lie, but manifeſte Truthe.

Bonifa. 2. Epiſt. ad Eulalium.

Where I ſaie, youre Fathers in the Councel of Baſile, and youre frendes in the late Councel of Tridente, yelded, and gaue place to the Bohemians, and vnto ſuche others, as you calle Heretiques, M. Hardinge anſweareth, This Lie is ſo cleare, and ſo euidente, that our Confutation is needeleſſe. Whether this Lie be ſo cleare, and ſo euident, as here it is told vs, or whether it be any Lie at al, Let M. Hardinge him ſelfe be the Iudge. In the Councel of Baſile it is written thus, Indultum Liberationis Communionis ſub vtraq; ſpecie: *The graunt of deliueringe the Communion vnder bothe kindes.* The like thinge M. Hardinge might haue founde recorded by Cardinal Cuſanus, that was preſent at the Councel of Baſile. For thus he writeth to the Bohemians: Scribitis, nos Compactionis ignorare: *Yee ſaie, that wee knowe not the Agreemente, or Compoſition.* Where alſo he expreſſely maketh mention of that parcel of the Agreemente, wherein the Libertie of the Communion vnder bothe kindes was conteined: and calleth it Caput de Libertate Communionis. Aſke therefore M. Hardinge, what cleare cies he had, to ſee this Lie to be ſo euidente.

M. Har. fol. 98. a.

Concil. to. 3. In apend. Con. Baſi. pa. 243. Hac Sanctus. Nicol. Cuſan. ad Bohemos, Epiſt. 2.

Where I ſaie, *The Goſpel was preached in this Realme, either, as* Theodoretus *ſaithe, by* S. Paule *the Apoſtle, paſſinge this waie into* Spaine, *or by* Simon Zelotes, *as ſaithe* Nicephorus, M. Hardinge anſweareth, Here M. Iewel extremely belieth Theodoretus, and Nicephorus. Good Reader, notwithſtandinge the reporte hereof were vntrue, yet, as thou ſeeſte, it conteineth not any ſuche extremitie, or horrour of Lieinge. Whether S. Paule were here, or no, it is no Article of our Faithe. We maie wel either receiue it, or refuſe it without danger. It were greate folie, to be ouer earneſt in ſo ſmal a mater.

M. Hard. fol. 83. b.

Howbe it, touchinge S. Paules beeinge, and preachinge within this Realme, three Learned menne of our time, Matthias Flacius Illyricus, Iohannes VVigandus, and Matthæus Iudex haue written thus: Theodoretus Libro nono de curandis Græcorum affectibus indicat, Paulum è priori captiuitate Roma dimiſſum, Britannis, & alijs in Occidente Euangelium prædicaſſe. Idem ferè tradit Sophronius Hieroſolymitanus Patriarcha: Theodoretus *in his nienth Booke,* De curandis Græcorum affectibus, *ſheweth vs, that* S. Paule *beeinge ſette at Libertie after his firſte impriſonmente in Rome, preached the Goſpel to the people of the Ilelande of* Britaine (nowe called Englande) *and to other Nations of the Weaſte.* But perhaps M. Hardinge wil yelde ſmal credite to theſe three menne, notwithſtandinge their Learninge. Therefore, for his better ſatisfaction, maie it like him rather to beleue Theodoretus him ſelfe. Theſe be his wordes: Noſtri illi Piſcatores, & Publicani, Sutorq; ille noſter (Paulus) cunctis Nationibus Legem Euangelicam detulerunt. Neque ſolùm Romanos, quiq; ſub Romano viuunt Imperio, ſed Scythas quoq; & Sauromatas, Indos præterea, Æthiopas, Perſas, Seras, Hyrcanos, Britannos, Cimmerios, & Germanos, vtq; ſemel dicam, omne hominum genus, Nationeſque omnes induxerunt Crucifixi Leges accipere: *Our Fiſhers, and Publicanes (that were the Apoſtles) and our Cobler* (S. Paule) *carried the Lawe of the Goſpel to al Nations. And they forced, not onely the* Romaines, *and others Liuinge vnder the Romaine Empiere, but alſo the* Tartarians, *the* Sarmatians, *or* Polonians, *the* Indians, *the* Ethiopians, *the* Perſians, *the* Serians, *the* Hyrcanians, *the people of* Britaine, (nowe called Englande) *the* Cimmerians, *and the* Germaines, *and to be ſhorte, al kindes, and Nations of menne to receiue the Lawes of Chriſte Crucified.* Here haue wee the people of Britaine: Here haue wee S. Paule the Apoſtle, whom Theodoretus calleth a Cobler, for that by his occupation, he ſewed ſhinnes together, to make Bootes. I ſee, what maie be M. Hardinges anſweare. But if he wil ſaie, S. Paule

Centur. 1. Li. 2. Cap. 2.

Actor. 18.

S. Paule came neuer into this Ilelande, then let him telle vs, what other of the Apostles came euer hither. For that one of them came hither, and here preached the Gospel, by Theodoretus wordes it semeth euidente.

Touchinge Simon Zelotes, Nicephorus saithe thus: Simon Zelotes Doctrinam Euangelij ad Occidentalium Oceanum, Insulasque Britannicas perfert. Therefore for M. Hardinge so vainely, and so vncivilely to crie out in so light a mater without cause, I wil not calle it, Extreme Licinge. But verily somme man maie wel calle it, Extreme Folie. *Niceph. Lib. 2. Cap. 40.*

Where as I saie, Pope Hildebrande, as he was charged by the Councel of Brixia, was an Aduouterer, a Churcherobber, a periured man, a Mankiller, a Sorcerer, and a Renegate of the Faithe, M. Hardinge answeareth, I knowe that you Lie, I maie saie it sauinge my charitie, rather then your woorshipp. For Pope Hildebrande was a very holy man. You shal finde your selfe a Lier, and Pope Hildebrande a vertuous man. Marke this thinge, I beseche the, good Reader: In al this whole place, touchinge Pope Hildebrande, I allege not one worde of mine owne: but onely reporte the wordes of the Councel of Brixia. We the reporte of the Councel true, or false, certainely my reporte is true. For I reporte onely, that I finde. The Councel in moste plaine wise calleth Pope Hildebrande, Virum procacissimum, Sacrilegia, & Incendia prædicantem, Periuria, & Homicidia defendentem: Hæretici Berengarij Antiquum Discipulum, Diuinationum, & Insomniorum Cultorem, Manifestum Necromanticum, Pythonico Spiritu Laborantem, & à Vera Fide exorbitantem. If thou doubte the credite of this Councel, Nauclerus, Lambertus Scaphnaburgensis, Anselmus Rid, Sigibertus Gemblacensis, and others haue confirmed the same. *M. Hard. fol. 256. b.* *Abbas Vrsper.*

Nauclerus hereof writeth thus, *The Clergie saide, that* Pope Hildebrande *had defiled the Apostolique See with Simonie, Heresie, Murder, and Aduouterie: that he was a Renegate, and had forsaken the Faithe of Christe: and that therefore he was for good causes, and iustely excommunicate by al the Bishoppes of* Italie. *Nauclerus Generatio. 36*

Sigibertus Gemblacensis saithe, Pope Hildebrande *in his time troubled al the states of Christendome, and for his outrage, and cruelnie beinge banished, and driuen out of Rome: in the ende, when he sawe deathe approche, He made his Confession to one of his Cardinalles, that he had abused his Pastoral Office, and that he had troubled mankinde with malice, and mischiefe by the counsel, and procurement of the Diuel.* *Sigibertus Gemblacensis. Se suadente Diabolo, contra humanum genus odium, & iram concitasse.*

Al this notwithstandinge, M. Hardinge saithe, Pope Hildebrande was a very vertuous, and a Holy man: and so constantly telleth vs, I knowe, that you Lie: you shal finde your selfe to be a Lier.

Where as I allege a Dialogue, of Anselmus, sommetime Archebishop of Canturburie, to proue, that in his time, it was not thoughte vnlawful for Priestes to Marrie, their Holy Orders notwithstandinge, M. Hardinge answeareth, This is none of Anselmes Dialogues: It is a rifferaffe: It is a forgerie: I wil not calle it plaine Licinge. Good Reader, Here M. Hardinge ouer boldely presumeth, as his wonte is, before he knowe. If he knewe more, he woulde saie lesse. In deede it is one of Anselmes Dialogues. I haue seene it, and readde it in Authentical Copies: as otherwhere I haue proued more at large. And the wordes of the saide Dialogue are euen as I haue alleged them. Desideramus certificari tua solutione, super vulgari toto Orbe quæstione, quæ ab omnibus penè quotidiè ventilatur, & adhuc lis celatur indiscussa, An liceat Presbyteris post acceptum Ordinem Vxores ducere: *Whether it be lawful for Priestes beinge in Orders to Marrie Wiues, or no.* And this question, saithe he, at that time, that is to saie, in the Daies of Kinge Henrie the First, was beaten, and disputed throughout the whole worlde, and yet Laie stil vndiscussed. If M. Hardinge had benne better informed, he woulde not haue called this either Rifferaffe, or plaine Licinge. But oftentimes he is hardiest man to speake, that hathe leaste to saie. *M. Hard. fol. 308. a. b.* *Pagina, 564. & 565.* *5. An. Do. 1109*

Laste of al, where as I allege an Authoritie of Damasus, taken out of Gratian, to proue, that sundrie Popes were Priestes Sonnes, O, saithe M. Hardinge, who

who euer sawe so impudente a man? what shal I saie to this felowe? Phy for shame man. A minister of fables: A minister of Lies: Foolishe ignorance: Shameleſſe malice: So ignorante: So witleſſe: howe coulde Damasus write of so many Popes so longe to comme after his deathe?

M. Hard. fol. 167.

6. To terrible is M. Hardinge in his dealinge. But be not afraide, good Reader, of al this smoke. Thou shalte see it suddainely blowen al to vanitie, from whence it came. Firste of al, as touchinge the very truthe of the storie, euery of theſſe Popes by Gratian alleged was in deede a Prieſtes Sonne. And this onely was it, I had to saie. And nowe the same I saie againe. Euery of theſſe Popes was a Prieſtes Sonne, not one excepted, as in place it shal be proued. What cause then had M. Hardinge, so vainely to disquiete him selfe, and thus to crie out vpon poore Ministers, of Lies, and Fables? That I saie is true: and Truthe is no Lie: Truthe is no Fable.

Pag. 207.

But you wil saie, Damasus was deade longe before theſſe Popes were borne. Howe then coulde he knowe, who were their Fathers? Herein I graunte, there is an errour. But, good Reader, it is Gratians errour: It is not mine. I repoſte Gratian onely as I finde him. I put not to him: I take not from him. I alter not one Letter of al his woordes. Therefore telle M. Hardinge, it is Gratian his owne Doctour, and Dearlinge, that thus hathe written. Bidde him calle Gratian Ignorante, Foolishe, Shameleſſe, and Witleſſe, and what him listeth, and let him not spare. Let him hardely strike him, that did him hurte. For M. Hardinge hathe tolde vs otherwheres, that who so striketh one man for an other, is but a Fole.

M. Har. Confut. 340. a.

Thus, good Christian Reader, thou seeſte one whole Iurie of M. Hardinges greateſte Untruthes, wherein he reposeth his greateſte truſte, is clearely attainted. As he hathe dealte vprightly herein, so maiſte thou truſte him in al the reſte. By a smal draught of Sea water, thou maiſte iudge the verdure of the whole.

But O good God, what sturre keepeth M. Hardinge emongeſte other his litle preatie petite quarrelles? He telleth thée, I haue named Iohannes Camotensis for Iohannes Carnotensis: And therein, as in a mater of greate weighte, he hathe beſtowed greate stoare of voide woordes, and foure whole Pages of his Booke. Uerily a simple treſpaſſe, whereof to grounde so greate a battaile. It is to light a Laboure, to striue for names. If he like not the one, let him hardly take the other. Certainely Ghesnerus in his Epitome, and Cornelius Agrippa calle him plainely, as I do, Iohannes Camotensis. But be it Camotensis, be it Carnotensis, or what you wil. His woordes be euen as I allege them: In Eccleſia Romana ſedent Scribæ, & Phariſæi. Ipſe Papa iam factus eſt intolerabilis: Papæ Pompam, & Faſtum nullus Tyrannorum vnquam æquauit: Papæ Legati ſic Bacchantur in Prouincijs, acſi ad flagellandam Eccleſiam Satan egreſſus ſit à facie Domini. Vim faciunt Scripturis, vt habeant plenitudinem Poteſtatis. Let M. Hardinge graunte thus mutch, and vſe the Names at his pleaſure.

M. Hard. fol. 408. 409.

Gheſnerus. Cornel. Agrip de Vanitate Scientiarum.

Againe he saithe, I haue named Zarabella, for Zabarella: Heruæus, for Iohannes Pariſienſis: Iohannes Pariſienſis, for Heruæus, and Petrus à Scoto, for Dominicus à Scoto. He saithe, I allege Heruæus by Chapters, whereas Heruæus is diuided by certaine other Diſtinctions, and not by Chapters. He saithe, I haue named Pius Secundus by the name of Pope Pius, a peere, or a monethe, or ſomme certaine time before he was Pope. No doubte, a perilous caſe. The man was one, and his woordes were one, but his name was changed. In one place, he saithe, I haue leaſte out, Enim: In an other place, I haue leaſte out, Hoc: In an other place, my Printer hathe miſplaced Schemate, for Schiſmate: Pigghius, for Pighius: and I knowe not what. Dutche weighty cauſes hathe M. Hardinge pikte out, to make vp his tale. Hereat he lighteneth, and thundreth, & shaketh Sande, and Sea togeather. Hereat, and at other maters of like force he crieth out, Lewde wretches, Iewiſhe, Heatheniſhe, Shameleſſe, Blaſphemous Villaines: As if it were lawful for a Doctour of Louaine, to saie what him liſteth. If he eſpie any ſuche ſimple ouerſighte, as I haue ſhewed, or any Sentence miſalleged, or any one Authour miſintemed,

theire misnamed, or any thinge els, that male be wrested from the pourpose, Ye hate the straine, False Ministers: False Harlottes: Yee bragge: Yee boaste: Yee Lie falsely: Yee Lie for aduantage: Yee are impudent Liers: Lewde Lies: Heapes of Lies: Nothinge but Lies: And al is Lies: Wity as greate wisedome, and discretion, as did sometime Anaxagoras, the Philosopher of Grecia: who, when he had seene a litle Pegle stoane fallen downe from Heauen, imagined therefore, that the Sunne, the Mone, the Starres, and al the whole Heauens were made of Stoanes. By theise preatie posies, and flowers of speache, we male easily discrie M. Hardinge from al his felowes. Howe beit, herein I truste to be so vnlike vnto him, as he is like vnto him selfe. Neither can our cause apprare the worse in the Iudgemente of the Wise, for that M. Hardinge hathe so good a grace to speake il. Il speache is not alwaies prouke sufficiente of good matter. Maxentius saithe, Hæretici cùm peruersitatis suæ non possunt reddere rationem, ad maledicta conuertuntur: *Heretiques, when they finde them selues not hable, to yeelde a reason of their wilfulnesse, then they falle to plaine railinge.* *Diogen. Laertius.*

But one thinge specially much misliketh M. Hardinge aboue al the reste, that, the better to disclose the deformities, & weakenesse of his Doctrine, I haue alleged so many Canonistes, & Schoole Doctours. For al them he weigheth no better now, then Esopes Fables. And therefore he saithe, As for the gewgawes of the Schoolemenne, and Canonistes, I despise them vtterly. *Detect. 277. b* What then? Would M. Harding that we should rather allege S. Augustine, S. Ambrose, S. Hierome, S. Chrysostome, S. Basile, and others the Ancient, and Learned Fathers, touchinge his Priuate Masses, his Halfe-communions his Doumbe Praiers in a tongue vnknowen, & other like disorders of the Churche of Rome? Did euer any of these Fathers, either receiue the Holy Sacrament him selfe alone, the whole people lokinge on him: Or minister the Communion vnto the people in one onely kinde: or saie ỳ publique prayers in a strange tongue, the people not knowinge, what he saide? Would any of these Fathers euer haue saide, The Pope hath Vniuersal power ouer al the world: we al receiue of the Popes fulnesse. The Pope cannot erre. The Pope is aboue al General Councelles: The Pope hathe power ouer the Angelles of God: Kinges, and Princes holde their Crownes, and Dominions of the Pope? Alas theise good Fathers were drade many hundred yeres, before theise, and other like vanities were knowen in the worlde.

But male it not be lawful for vs, with M. Hardinges good fauoure, to allege sutche witnesses, as beste knowe the cause? Or was there euer any man iustely reproued before any indifferente and reasonable Iudge, for prosecutinge of honest, and lawful witnesses? Or, are al the Schoole Doctours, and Canonistes, nowe becomme Intestabiles, that is to saie, so farre out of Credite, so infamous, and so vile, that they male not be allowed to beare witnesse? Whose then are they? Of whether side stande they? Are thei not al M. Hardinges owne Doctours? Is he nowe ashamed of his owne? Are they not al sworne to the See of Rome? And what were they? What roumes bare they in the Churche? Were they not Abbates, Bishoppes, Archebishoppes, Cardinalles, Sainctes, and Popes? Was not Panormitane an Abbate? was not Albertus Magnus a Bishop? was not Antoninus an Archebishop? was not Holcote a Cardinal? was not Caietanus a Cardinal? Is not Bonauentura a Sainct? Is not Thomas a Sainct? was not Innocentius. 2. a Pope? was not Adrianus a Pope? Did not Pope Gregorie. 9. write the Decretals? Did not Pope Bonifacius 8. write the Sextus? Did not Pope Clemens write the Clementines? Did not Pope Iohannes. 22. and other Popes write the Extra Vagantes? Were not these Christes Vicares? Were they not Peters Successoures? Were they not the Lighte of the worlde? Bare they not the Keies of the Kingedome of Heauen? Is not Gratian called Fundamentum Iuris Canonici, and that euen by Eugenius. 3. the Pope him selfe? Were not theise for the space of fiue hundred yeres togeather the onely Rulers of the Churche of God? Were not theire wordes holden for Lawes? Were there any others better, or better learned, or at al any other Doctours in the Churche? Of the Schoole Doctours, was

not one called Subtilis, an other Solennis, an other Irrefragabilis, an other Angelicus, an other Seraphicus? What warrante had we then of the Faithe of Christe, what Doctrine, what Sacramentes, what Discipline, what Correction, what Order, what Comforte, but at theire handes? Howe coulde any Confessore be holden, howe coulde any man recouer his righte, howe coulde the Pope him selfe maintaine his Vniuersal power, and his Triple Crowne, but onely by them?

And yet wil M. Hardinge suddainely condemne them al, euery one, by one Sentence, Abbates, Bishoppes, Archebishoppes, Decrees, Decretalles, Cardinalles, Sainctes, and Popes, and al togeather? Wil he make them al vnhable to beare witnesse? Will he thus despise them, and calle them Gewgawes, as if they were al Tinkers, and Coblers, and no better?

I trowe M. Hardinge was not very wel informed, when he suffered theise thinges, so vnaduisedly to passe from him. Otherwise, to seke reuenge vpon his Aduersaries, he would not so sturdily haue plaide Samsons part, and so rashly haue crushte the Pillers, whereby he leaned, and haue shaken downe the whole house vpon him selfe. For I beseche the, aske M. Hardinge, what hathe the Pope to stande vnto, when the Schoole Doctours, and Canonistes be gonne from him? What Olde Father, what Auncient Doctour, what Councel, what Scripture is there leafte him? What wil he saie to the Doctoures of oure side, that so peremptorily, and scornefully despiseth his owne, and calleth them Gewgawes? It might haue pleased him to haue suffered them, as Witnesses, quietly to haue tolde theire tales, specially in suche cases, as no other man could knowe, so wel, as they. For by them, and by them onely, and by none els, we made se that greate, and horrible blindenesse, and miserie, that Satan had brought into the Churche of God. For although it be nowe remoued from our eies, yet in these Canonistes, and Doctours Bookes, as in Publique Recordes, it remaineth stil. Goddes holy name be praised for euer, that of his greate mercie hathe deliuered vs by the clearenesse, and glorie of his Gospel.

Verily S. Paule, to auance the Truthe of God, and to confounde his enimies, thought it no reproche, to take witnesse of the Heathen Poetes, Menander, Epimenedes, and Aratus. The Learned Fathers, Tertullian, Clemens, Eusebius, Arnobius take witnesse of the Godlesse Philosophers: S. Augustine of the Sibylles: Lactantius of Apolloes Oracles. Yea, M. Hardinge him selfe, when he is hable, & when nede so requireth, is contented to take witnesse of Leontius, of Abdias, of Amphilochius, of Homere the Greke Poete, of Priscian, the poore Grammarian, of Scholastical Doctours, of Canonistes, of Decrees, of Decretals, of Glosses, and Margines, and spareth nothinge. Yet now muste they be despised altogether, and goe for Gewgawes, for children to plaie withal.

But we must pardon M. Hardinge. He dealeth indifferently: and is nothing partial. For euen with like reuerence he vseth also the Ancient Doctours of the Churche, and others of later time, that fighte of his side, and are allied vnto him. *Tertullian* (he saithe) was an Heretique, and wrote this, and that, in defense of his Heresie. *S. Cyprian* (he saithe) stoode in an il Cause, and defended a falsehoode, and was driuen to the very same shiftes, whereunto al Heretiques are driuen. Againe he saithe, VVe neuer tooke oure selues bounde to any priuate opinion of what so euer Doctoure. If in a secrete pointe of Learning S. Augustine, or S. Cyprian teache singularely, wee folowe them not. It seemethe (saithe he) S. Hierome was deceiued by a rumoure, As beinge farre from the places, where the truthe might be knowen. VVe binde not our selues (saithe he) to mainteine, what so euer Albertus Pighius hathe written. Cardinal Caietanus (saithe he) hathe his errours: Erasmus, and Agrippa be men of smal credite: Alphonsus de Castro, Beatus Rhenanus, Platina, Appendix Concilij Basilienſis, are stuffe litle woorthe. Againe Iohannes Gerson, the greatest Learned man of his time, and the onely Directoure, and Leader of the Councel of Constance, whom Trithemius calleth Theologorum sui temporis longè Principem, is no better, then good plaine Father Gerson. To be shorte, Nilus a Greke Writer, and the Archebishop of Thessalonica, if it like M. Hardinge, muste beare the bable.

M. Hardinge Detect. 238. 239. *Detect.* 271. *b* *Confu.* 232. *b.* *Confu.* 285. *b.* *Confu.* 232. *b.* *Detect.* 307. *b* *Detect.* 307. *a* *Confut.* 206. *Detect.* 225. *b*

Thus

Thus wée sée, M. Hardinge hath a commission, to controlle al maner of Doctours, what so euer, Greekes, Latines, Olde, Newe, his owne, and others, if they comme not readily to his pourpose. Nicolaus Cusanus saithe, Papa Eugenius dicit, hoc verum esse, si ipse velit, & non aliter: Pope Eugenius *tellethe vs, this thinge is true, if his Holinesse wil haue it true: And that otherwise it is not true.* Sutche a power, I trowe, M. Hardinge woulde claime vnto him selfe, that nothinge maie be taken for true, or false without his Likinge. Marcolphus wil not lightly finde a fit tree to hange him selfe on. *Nicol. Cusan. de Concordan. Li. 2. Cap. 22.*

But M. Hardinge saithe, I allege greate troupes of Doctours, and other VVriters: But vse no manner discourse of witte, as he him selfe doothe, to enlarge my maters: As though, who so hathe moste wordes, spake alwaies beste to pourpose. The Learned Father Tertullian saide sommetime vpon like occasion: Rhetoricari quoq; nos prouocant Hæretici: *Theise Heretiques woulde haue vs plaie the Rhetoricians, to emboſſe out oure maters with ſhewe of woordes*, and of a Molhil to make a Mountaine, as they do. As for M. Hardinge, what discourses he vseth, it maie easily appeare, by that in his laste Detection, he hath discoursed vs two hundred, and fiue whole sides of paper onely in Perambles, and Prefaces, before he ones stepte into his mater. And good reason is it, that, when Scriptures, and Doctours wil not serue, then discourse of Witte shoulde holde the Ploughe. Although M. Hardinge wante weighte of mater, yet at leaste he hathe wordes at wil. They coste him but litle. Vesselles neuer geue so great a sounde, as when they be emptie. A Courthegiane of Rome wil prancke her selfe more trimly, then a Vertuous Lady. It is an easie mater, with Maskes, and Visardes, and longe Discourses, to feaie the simple. The poore Asse wil roare out sommetimes like a Lion. *Tertul. de Resurrectione Carnis.*

I goe directly, and shortely to the mater, I delite not, as M. Hardinge doothe, to set my wordes to sale by discourse of speache: But thinke it sufficient onely to alleage the wordes, and Authorities of the Ancient Fathers. Of the other side, M. Hardinge out of the Ancients Fathers allegeth either nothinge at al, or very litle, or litle to the pourpose: but feedeth vs with wordes penaughe of his owne, that is to saie (and let him pardon my plainenesse) not with the beste, or wiseste wordes, that might be spoken.

The Protestantes (saithe he) are diuided, and scattered into Sectes, and factions, not one of them agreeinge with the other. They haue twentie sundrie opinions touchinge Iustification: They haue sixe and thirtie opinions touchinge the Communion in bothe kindes. So precisely M. Hardinge keapeth his recheninges. And yet perhaps if he were called suddainely to an Audite, of al theise sixe & fiftie sundrie opinions, he were not hable to recken foure. But M. Hardinge maie lawfully discourse at pleasure, as a man likinge wel his owne witte, and in respecte thereof misliskinge al others. *Detect. fol. 35. a.*

7.

Againe he saithe, The Protestantes haue forsaken Christe: The Protestantes are becomme Iewes: The Protestantes wil be circumcised accordinge to Moses Lawe: The Protestantes require to haue the Paschal Lambe: The Protestantes telle theire people, there is no Helle at al: The Protestantes teache vs, that God is bounde to obeie the Diuel: The Protestantes at theire nexte proceedinge wil vtterly denie God. So like wise saithe Cardinal Poole, a man, that woulde highly be commended for his modestie: The Protestantes (saithe he) wil shortely denie, that Christe is *Messias*, the annointed of God. An other of them saithe with like discretion, The Protestantes denie, that Christe euer appeared in the Fleashe. And againe he saithe, *Peter Martyr* denied, that Christe is our Intercessoure. There is no tale so vnlikely, but by sutche preaty discourses it maie be proued. *Detection fol. 34. a. Detect. 33. b. Detect. 82. b. Detec. 139. a. Ad Henricum 8. lib. 3. Copus Dial. 6. Pag. 878. Copus Dial. 3. Pag. 331.*

8.

Againe throughout the whole discourse of al his Bookes: he telleth vs, that the Blessed Succession of Peter shal neuer faile. That the Popes Chaire is the very knot of Christian Vnitie: That the Churche of Rome is the Vniuersal Churche of God: That the Pope is the onely Vniuersal Gouernoure of al the worlde: That the Pope maie not be controlled, or iudged by any power: That the Pope is aboue al General Councelles: That the Pope hathe Authorine ouer the Soules in Purgatorie: And ouer the Angelles of God: That S. Augustine, S. Hierome, S. Ambrose,

S. Chryſoſtome, and al other the Doctours, and Holy Fathers mighte erre: But the Pope onely can neuer erre.

9. If thou telle him, that many Popes haue erred, and shamefully erred, as it is euidente, and eaſie to proue, he wil answeare thée, They erred onely as menne, but not as Popes. For the Pope hathe sundrie Capacities in one person: Sommetimes wée muſte take him, as a man, and Sommetimes as no man.

If thou telle him, that Popes haue erred, euen as they were Popes, then wil he answeare thée, that the Pope maie erre, and hathe erred in somme certaine particulare cauſe, or queſtion: But in Faithe, or Doctrine he cannot erre.

If thou telle him, that sundrie Popes haue mainteined open, and knowen Hereſies, and therefore haue vndoubtedly erred in Faithe, and Doctrine, then wil he telle thée, that they mainteined ſuche Hereſies, onely as theire owne priuate opinions, but not as Doctrine for the Churche. Againe if thou telle him, that certaine Popes haue published, and preached, and taught Hereſies, and ſente abroade Preachers, to confirme the ſame, Then wil he telle thée, that although they preached, and confirmed Hereſies, yet they neuer confirmed them by Publique Decree, and open Sentence in their Conſiſtories: As if the Popes Conſiſtorie were of greater weight in mater of Doctrine, then his Pulpite.

Thus M. Hardinge diſcourſeth aboute the fieldes, A Primo ad Vltimum, from Errour, to Man: from Man, to Pope: from Pope, to Iudgemente: from Iudgemente, to Faithe: from Faithe, to Opinion: from Opinion, to Preachinge: from Preachinge, to Decrée: And ſo from one thinge to an other: And where as one thinge wil not ſerue, by diſcourſe of witte he ſéketh a better.

Al theſe Songes he ſange vs before, in his Anſweare, in his Reioinder, and in his Confutation. And nowe, when al is donne, as a ſely Minſtrel, is faine to falle to Diſcourſinge, and to ſinge the ſame aboute againe. Otherwiſe he ſhoulde lacke worke for his Printer.

Quibuſcunq; Potentibus. *Quibuſcunq; Potentibus.* τινῶν αἰτούντων. *Pagin.* 123.

To ſhadowe the notorious Ambition of the Churche of Rome, openly condemned in the greate Councel of Aphrica, and called the ſmoky pompe of the worlde, either ignorantly, or guilefully he corrupteth the plaine Texte, and turneth Petentes, into Potentes, that is to ſaie, he turneth poore Suiters, into Princes. Good Reader, turne to the place, and conſider the Anſweare, that I haue made hereto: and then aſke of M. Hardinge, what Diſcourſe, or what witte was this, to corrupte his Tranſlation, to falſifie the ſenſe, to turne, Pe, into Po, and one worde into an other: Aſke of him, what he meante, with ſo ſenſible forgerie to ſéke, to mocke thée.

Baſil. in Epiſt. ad Athanaſium. *M. Har. Detect.* 179. *b.* *Defenſe.* 129. Vt Conſideret res noſtras. Vt det Conſilium.

Againe, where as S. Baſile writeth thus vnto Athanaſius the Patriarke of Alexandria, Viſum eſt vtile, vt ſcribatur ad Epiſcopum Romanum, vt conſideret res noſtras, & det Conſilium: *It ſeemeth good wee write to the Biſhop of Rome, that he conſider of our caſe, and geeue vs Counſel,* M. Harding by his proper diſcourſinges hath thought it better, thus to Engliſhe the ſame wordes, It hath ſeemed good, that wee write to the Biſhop of Rome, that he viſite vs, and determine the mater by his Sentence. *That the Biſhop of Rome conſider our caſe,* ſaithe S. Baſile: That the Biſhop of Rome viſite vs, ſaithe M. Hardinge: *That the Biſhop of Rome geeue vs Counſel, what wee maie doo,* ſaithe S. Baſile; That the Biſhop of Rome determine the mater by his Sentence, ſaithe M. Hardinge. Thus by his diſcourſinge he hathe changed, Conſideringe, into Viſitinge, and Geeuinge of Counſel, into Sentence in Iudgemente.

But aſke him, I praie thée, what diſcourſe of witte moued him to change al the Latine Tranſlations of S. Baſile, that euer he ſawe, and to forge vs a newe Tranſlation of his owne. Aſke him wherefore this Greke worde, Ἐπισκέπτομαι, maie not wel be Engliſhed, To conſider. Aſke him, wherefore theſe Greke wordes, Δοῦναι γνώμην, maie not wel be Engliſhed, To geue Counſel. Aſke him, where he euer reade, in any allowed Greke Writer, theſe wordes, Δοῦναι γνώμην, vſed for a Decree, or Sentence in Iudgemente. Aſke him, what made him ſo bolde,

to

to shape vs newe Greeke wordes of his owne, suche as no Grecian euer heard before. Επισκέψαι, saithe M. Hardinge, and againe, Επισκέψαι, twise together in one place. But bid him, leaue his longe discourses, & shewes of witte, and plainely to telle thee, euen as he wil be counted a Grecian, in what Historiographer, in what Oratour, in what Philosopher, in what Poete, he euer heard of this worde Επισκέψαι. Telle him, good Reader, telle him, This Verbe is not Επισκέπτω, as he imagineth, but Επισκέπτομαι. And bid him, not to truste to his Dictionarie, for it wil deceiue him. Επισκέπτομαι, I saie, is the Original Verbe, and not, Επισκέπτω. And therefore the firste Indefinite is not Επισκέψαι, as M. Hardinge telleth thee, but Επισκέψασθαι. It was sufficient for him, to mocke thee with Latine, & Englishe. But of him selfe to diuise newe Greeke wordes, and newe Grammares, wherewith to mocke thee, it was too mutche.

By his discourses he is hable to defende these wordes of Hostiensis, Deus, & Papa faciunt vnum Consistorium: Excepto Peccato, Papa potest quasi omnia facere, quæ potest Deus: *God, and the Pope haue one Iudgements Seate: And, Sinne onely excepted, the Pope can doo in a manner al things, that God can doo.* Whereby, I trowe, is meante, that, as God is omnipotent, so in a manner is the Pope. *Detection. 67. Defense.*

By his discourses he is hable, to defende that moste horrible, and blasphemous Prayer, diuised, & vsed in the Churche of Rome, Tu per Thomæ Sanguinem &c. to the manifest prejudice, and derogation of the Bloude of Christe. By his Discourses, he is hable to defende theise wordes of Catharinus, lately pronounced in the Councel of Tridente, *Our Lady is Christes moste faithful fellowe*, makinge a Creature Equal, and felowe with Christe the Creatour, which is God blessed for euer. *Detection. 358*

To be shorte, by his Discourses, he is wel hable, to defende theise moste vile, and filthy wordes, touchinge Priestes Concubines, vttered to moste vile, and filthy purpose, Si non castè, tamen cautè: *If they cannot liue chastely, yet let them deale charily.* The circumstance considered (saithe M. Hardinge) al this maie seeme, to be wel, and discretely (and chastely) saide, and to geeue vs very good counsel. O merciful God, whither wil M. Hardinge leade vs at laste with his Discourses? Suche discrete, and wholesome counsel he might haue learned of Mitio in the Heathen Comedie, for thus he saithe, Non est flagitium, mihi crede, adolescentem Scortari. *Detection. fol. 399. b. 400.*

Yet further to proue, that he hathe a ready witte to course at pleasure, he saith vnto vs frankly, and by waie of graunte, What if somme haue written, that Poison was ministred in the Blessed Sacramente? What if the Pope suffred Franciscus Dandalus, the Venetians Embassadour, to lie vnder his Table like a dogge, while he was at dinner? What if Popes haue suffred greate Princes, and Monarkes, to kisse their feete, to holde their stirropes, and to leade their horses? What if Pope Alexander vsed Frederike the Emperoure more prowdely, then became a man of his callinge, treadinge him downe to the grounde, and settinge his foote on his necke? Be theise thinges neuer so true, neuer so Tyrannical, and neuer so horrible, yet if M. Hardinge once saie, What if, by Discourse of his witte they maie sone be salued. *M. Hardinge in his Preface to the Reader.*

By suche Discourses he is hable to proue his Priuate Masses, his Dimi Communions, his Primacies, his Pardones, his Purgatories, and what thinge so euer shal come to hande. When Scriptures faile, then Discourse of wit must come in place: And when Witte, and discourse wil not serue, then good plaine rounde Railinge must serue the turne. Then, (saith he) Yee are prowde, ye are Luciferlike, ye serue the Deuil. Then he telleth the worlde, M. Iewel is woorse then Ananias, that condemned S. Paule: M. Iewel plaieth the parte of Antichriste: M. Iewel is the open enimie of the Churche: M. Iewel is the enimie of God: M. Iewel honoureth that Idole Caluine more then Iesus Christe: M. Iewel is Messias: M. Iewel is Christe: M. Iewel is better, then Christe. Then he discourseth, and singeth nowe at his Lutheranes: nowe at his Huguenotes: nowe at Browne: nowe at the Puritanes: nowe at Bale: nowe at Illyricus. *M. Hardinge Detect. 39. b. Detecti. 210. 245. Detect. 40. Detect. 359. Detect. 210. Detect. 212.*

Thus he iumpeth, and courseth, this waie, and that waie, as a man roauinge

without a marke, or a Ship sayling without a Rither. Thus he sheweth vs a Mountaine of wordes without substance, and a House ful of smoke without fire: and imagineth, that his litle Cider Pipe, by discourse of witte, wil resemble the sounde of a double Canon. When al is donne, we maie saie of him, as the pore man saide, that shoare his Sowe, Here is greate crie, and litle woulle.

Good Reader, Truthe is plaine, and homely, and hathe no nede of theise Habilementes. But who so wil take vpon him to maintaine Untruthe, muste nedes be forced to discourse aboute with longe Vagaries, to leade his Reader from the pourpose, to fede him with wordes, for wante of matter, and briefly to do, euen as here M. Hardinge dothe.

I cannot imagine, that any my pore labours shalbe hable to ende theise quarrelles. For a contentious man wil neuer lacke wordes. Notwithstandinge in this Augmentation I haue endeuoured for my simple parte, to saie so muche, as to a reasonable man maie seeme sufficiente. I haue cleared sutche places, as seemed darke: I haue supplied sutche thinges, as seemed to wante: I haue reformed so muche, as reason required: Briefly I haue answeared the substance of al M. Hardinges longe Discourses. If any thinge be leafte vnanswearedd, either it was nothinge, or nothinge worthe.

Wate it please thee, good Christian Reader, to peruse bothe, and to iudge vprightly. Endeuour thoroughly to knowe the cause. An ignorante Iudge was neuer indifferente. M. Hardinge woulde haue thee onely to folowe the example of thy late deceiued Fathers, and further to searche, and knowe nothinge. And oftentimes thine ignorance maketh him bolde. He leadeth thee into the darkenesse of Deathe: and yet woulde haue thee beleue, thou arte in Paradise. The Blinde man is leadde, he knoweth not, whither. But searche thou the Scriptures, as Christe him selfe biddeth thee: Learne to knowe the wil of God, as S. Paule aduised thee: Haue pleasure in Goddes Holy worde, as the Prophete Dauid warneth thee: And thou shalte neuer be deceiued. Whereas buildinge vpon the sande of wittie Discourses, and the variable weakenesse of mennes iudgementes, sommetimes allowed, and sommetimes reproued, thy House muste nedes comme to grounde.

Telle M. Hardinge, It shal be harde for him, to kike stil againste the spurre. God hathe sowed the sede of Life. No power is hable to rote it out. God hathe disclosed the man of Sinne: No Cloke is hable to hide him Lenger. Heauen, and Earthe shal passe: But Goddes worde shal neuer passe. God open the eies of thy Harte, that thou maiste haue comforte in his Lighte, and reioise in his Mercies, and patiently waite for that Blessed Hope, that is laide vp for thee, and continue Faithefull vnto the ende. Amen.

From Sarisburie. 11. Decemb. 1569.

I. S.

¶ Good Chriſtian Reader, I haue here ſette before thee certaine principal flowers of M. Hardinges modeſte ſpeache. Taſte no more, then maie wel like thée. And iudge therof, as thou ſhalt ſée cauſe.

M. Hardinge, in the Preface before his Confutation of the Apologie.

The manner of writinge, whiche I haue here vſed, in compariſon of our Aduerſaries, is ſober, ſofte, and gentle, &c. And in reſpecte of their heate, bitterneſſe, and railinge, as many telle mée, ouer colde, ſwéete, and milde.

Againe, in the ſame Confutation.

There is no man of Wiſedome, or honeſtie, that would with ſo immoderate vpbraidinges, empaire the eſtimation of his modeſtie. Fol. 300. b.

M. Hardinge.

Your Diuellishe ſpite. Reioinder. fol. 18. b
Youre Diuellishe vvickednesse. Reioinder, Preface to the Reader.
Youre Diuellishe Villanie. Confuta. fol. 256. b.
Youre railinge vvoordes of Sathans prompting. Reioinder. 67. a.
You are ioined to Sathan, Sathan your Schoolmaiſter, Reioin. 12. b.
Yee are mooued by the inſtincte of Sathan. Confuta. 43. b. 255. a.
Youre Father the Diuel. Confut. 1 a.
Your Babylonical Tovvér. Confut. 42. a.
Youre Nevve Churche ſette vp by Sathan. Confu. 42. a
The Diuel hathe you faſte bounde. Con. 24. a.
Yee are of the Schole of Sathan. Con. 69. b.
Your Sathanical Spirite. Confuta. 11. b.
Yee are the Children of the Diuel. Con. 115. a.
A Page, a Slaue, a Clavvebacke of the Diuel. Confuta. 131. a.
Yee are the Limmes of Antichriſte. Con. 102. a.
Yee are the practiſed Miniſters of Antichriſte. Confuta. 195. b.
Yee haue taken a paterne frō Sathan. Con. 313. b.
Your reprobate Congregation. Con. 338. a.
Youre Synagoge of Sathan. Con. 341. b.
Your confuſe tentes of Sathan. Con. 334.
Youre Synagoge of Antichriſte, and Lucifer. Confuta. 212. b.
The Hearde of Antichriſte. Confu. 48. a.
The Nouice of the Diuel. Confu.
The Diuel, and his Miniſters. 116. b.
Yee haue learned of the Diuel. Confu. 118. b.
Your Father the Diuel. Confut. 348. b.
Sathan your Maiſter. Confuta. 348. b.
Sathans broode. Con. 348.
He hathe conceiued hatred by the inſpiration of Sathan. Con. 288. b.
Sathan holdeth you captiue, Con. 342. b.
The Spirite of Sathan is in you. 172. a.
Yee are faſte bounde in Sathans fetters. Con. 68. a.
Yee are enimies of Vnitie. Con. 55. b.
Enimies of the Sacrifice. Confut. 67. a.
Yee are looſe Apoſtates. Con. 333.
Sacrilegious Churcherobbers. 333.
Theeues. Con. 155. b.
Abominable, Con 171 a.
Lecherous Lourdaines. 75. b
Profane Helhoundes. Confuta. 114. b.
Deſpiſers of God. Cō. 131. b
Your vvicked, and blaſphemous Spirite.
Your darke, and malitious Soule, Reioinder. 104.
Your Hereſies, blaſphemies, Sathaniſmies.
Your filthy railinge rabble. Con. 71. b
Caluiniſtes, Sathaniſtes. Confu. 81. b.
Your vvicked Chams brood 114. b.
Your profane malice. c. 119. b
Your vileneſſe. 135. a.
Your damnable fide. 135. a.
Your blaſphemous tongues your deteſtable blaſphemies
Your Diuelliſh rabble. 109. b
Your Turkish Huguenotes, vvoorſe then infidels. 111. b
Your Malignant Churche,
Your Congregation of Reprobates. Con. 169. b.
Youre vile Hereſies. 339. a.
Your Diuellishe ſtoutenesſe of harte.
Your Turkishe, and Heathenishe harte. 195. b
Your Turkish doctrine, ibid
Ye bragge Luciferlike. 173. b
Yee ſpeake villanie.
Youre quarrel is againſte Chriſte. Con. 178. b.
Yee vvould ſaie, if ye durſt, that Chriſte is the Abomination of Deſolation, and Antichriſte is the True God. 194. a.
VVhen vvere there euer ſuche Theeues in the Churche of God? 261. a.

Your Doctrine is Heresie, your life is iniquitie.271.b
As crafty knaues in a Comedie. Reioind.22.a.
Vaine bragginge, Vanitie, Scurrilitie, extreme impudencie, passinge madnesse, proude vauntinge Goliathlike. Re. in pre.a.
He is a foole.186.
Reasonlesse, vvitlesse. Reioind.191.a.
Foolishe Negatiues. R.pre:
Thei are Apes.
Thei are Asses. & Con.1.b.
Any soule vvould be ashamed to make suche argumentes. Con.51.b.
He hath on his fooles coate if he plaie the Vise vvel, and Verlelike. Re.251.b.
The canker of this false doctrine. Reioind.prefa.
False Gospellers. Re.pre.
Vnshamefaste.94.a.
Impious: Impudente.113.a.
Yee are paste al shame.186.a
A greate Lier.
Boldenesse in Lieinge
Yee Lie for a vantage.
Your schoole of Lieinge.
Yee professe Lieinge.
False Lies.
Impudente Lies.
Vaine Lies. Bolde Lies.
Lovvde Lies. Fovvle Lies.
Shameleste Lies.
Railinge Lies.
Manifeste Lies.
Notorious Lies.
Sclanderous Lies.
Horrible Lies.
VVee vvil proclaime you a Lier.258.b.
Your Libertie of lieinge.
Your Arte of lieinge.218.b.
Your Figure of Impudente Lieinge.253.a.
Yee be desperate in youre Lieinge.277.b.
You Lie in the plural number.303.a.
And vvhat shal I saie more but al is Lies.255 b.
Leave your Railinge. Re.
VVe like not your Railing.20.a.
I leave your vile eloquence to your selfe.111.b.
Your Railinge termes.
Your vile eloqnence.
Your scoldinge tale.
Your spiteful vvoordes. Con.149 b.
Your rancoure. Your spite.
Your filthy Railinges.
Your vile vpbraidinges. Con.175.
Your Malitious Railinge. 184.b.
Your false cankered sclaunders.184.b
Cease youre barkinge. Reioind.prefa.to the Read.
The poison of your tongue Reioind.Prefa.
Your droppe of poison.
Your Serpentine tongue. Reioind.67.a.
Suche crakinge Chalengers. Re.prefa.
Your Railinge Sprite.
Spit out your Malice.
Spit out your poison. Reioind.prefa.
Your hote raginge Sprite. Con.3.a
Spit foorthe youre Galle. Confu.13.a.
Youre Heresies, and Villanies. Con.10.b.
Your vaine boaste in vvickednesse, vvroughte by the povver of Sathā.19.b.
Your filthy railinge rabble. 71.b.
It liketh your filthy Sprite. 101.a.
Ye cursed Chananees.111.b.
VVhat crake yee?118.b.
The Diuel the Schoolemaister of your Malice.168.a
Your Bavvdy Bale.168.b.
Luther, that filthy Freere. 190.a.
Bremius, that shameleste railinge Heretique.188.a.
Cough vp the cromme of your Heresie. Re.167.b.
Cough out that vile poison. Re.80.
Youre Diuellish Blasphemie, and Villanie.256.b.
A blaste of your railinge Sprite.166.b.
Luthers stinking sinke.42.b
Zuinglius rabble.42.b
Your vile, spiteful, blasphemous talke. Re.prefa.
If there vvere any spanke of shame in you.94.a.
The stinking breath of your vile vvoordes.111.b.
This Defēder is like a mad Dogge.107.b.
Your vile, venemous, and lothesome stuffe.246.b.
I vvold I could plucke malice from youre blasphemous harte.191.b.
VVith suche spitefulnesse of vvoordes, as the Diuel hathe enspired thē vvithal. Con.342.b.
It spiteth you, and the Diuel.279.a.
Raile, and reuel vvhile yee vvil.154.a.
Yee raue, and crie out.177.b.
The sindes of Hel vvere not yet let loose, that begate Lutherians, and Calumistes. Confu.183.b.
The Diuel comminge from Helle, hathe carried you avvaie.225.b.
In youre harres the Diuel hath made his shop.131.a.
Yee shalbe bounde hande and foote vvith the cordes of the Diuels clevve. 251.a.
The Diuel possesseth you, and rideth you.255.a.
The Sprite of the Diuel is vvithin you.255.
Ye boile in rancoure, and malice.269.b.
Stampe, and rage. Sturdy dogge eloquence.41.b.
Stinte your barking. R.pre.
The Diuel reigneth in your harres.87.b.
Maugre the malice of the diuel, and of al the Sacramentaries.55.b.
Youre Malice seemeth to passe the malice of the Diuel. Re.prefa.
Yee barke vvith vvoordes more vile, then the barkinge of a dogge. Re.
Raile vntil youre tongues burne in your headdes in Helle fire.111.a.
Barke vntil yourbellies breake, yee Helhoundes of Zvvinglius and Luthers litioure.178.b.
VVithout al vvitte, and modestie, Con.170.b.

Cunerus Petri de Brouwershauen, Pastor. S. Petri Louanij indignus approbauit.
Anno 1565. 10. Aprilis.

M. Hardinge, in his Preface to M. Iewel before the Reioinder.

VVee ſpare your woorſhippes, and put you in minde of your outrage with more Courteous language. Againe, I ſeeme to menne of right good diſcretion, rather to offende of lenitie, and ſoftenesſe. And many doo wiſhe, I had tempered mine inke with ſharper ingredience.

Thus mutche onely out of the Heape. For to late for the al, it were to make an other Booke.

One demaunded this Queſtion of Zoilus the Railer:

Why takeſte thou ſotche pleaſure in ſpeakinge il?

Zoilus made Anſweare.

Bicauſe, whereas I wouldе rather doo il, I am not hable.

Scoffes, and Scornes.

M. Hardinge hereof thus reproueth his Aduerſarie.

Your ſcornful ſcoffes. Re. prefa.
Your Loathesome ſcoffes. Re. prefa
Your ſcoffinge Sprite. Confu. 19.
Your inkeſome cuttes. Re. prefa.
Your arte of ſcoffinge. Re. prefa.
Your ſcoffinge heade. 124. a.
Ye ſauce your vvordes vvith ſcoffes. 29. 76.
Yee plaie Hickſcorner. Re. prefa.
Yee plaie the Vice in an Enterlude. Re. pre
Your boieiſhe and Childiſhe diſpoſition 314. b.
Your boieiſhe ſcoffes. 300. a.
Your boieiſhe mockeries. 149. a.
Your bitter tvvitinges. ibidem.

M. Hardinge of him ſelfe.

Sutche grace in writinge I neither vſe, nor couete: nor haue I it: nor if I had it, ſhould I thinke it meete to vſe. The Truthe of God would not be ſette foorth with ſcoffes. VVhoſe deſire to vnderſtand the Truthe is colde, the ſame is to be ſturred vp rather with graue and earneſt exhortations, then with ſcornes, and mockes. Reioind. In the Preface to the Reader.

M. Hardinges performance of the ſame.

His Miniſterlike talke: vvith ſomme ſadde Hypocriſie. Re. prefa.
His Euangelical meekeneſſe. Ful coldely, and demurely he promiſeth. Re. 18 b.
His ſolemne Praier proteſtantelike. Re 18. b.
His Rhetorical perſuaſions in pulpite: vvith holy holdinge vp of handes, and caſting vp of eies to Heauen. Re. prefa.
His Miniſtringe vvoordes. Re. 135.
His pulpite buzzing. R. pre.
His holy Companions. 170 b
This bleſſed Brotherhoode. Confu. 13. b
Ye ſpeake like a liberal gentleman Con 124 a
This gaie Rhetorician. Reioind. prefa.
This ioilly felovve. 9. a.
This ioily Defender. 53. b.
This vvoorthy Captaine. Re. 31. b.
This ſubſtantial Doctoure. Cuckovvlike.
His glorious Sermon. prefa.
His vvorthy courage. R. pr.
He proueth it like a clerk 115
VVel, and Clerkely reaſoned forſoothe. 219. a.
His foreſaide vvoorſhipful reaſons 276. a.
His Clerkely prouves. 149. b
Like propre gētlemen. 140. a
Thei haue tried them ſelues like proper menne. 139. b.
Luther your Radix Ieſſe. Con 42. b.
Caluine your Patriarke 10 a
Your greate Rabbine Peter Martyr, Con. 82. a.
Novve come in theſe reuerende Fathers of our nevv Clergie, Re. 135. a.
Our miniſtring clergi. 146. a
Our miniſtring prelates 63. a
Our nevve Goſpel Prelates.
Our M. Iohn of Sariſburie. 151. b.
Hovve ſaie you Sir Miniſter Biſhop? 56 b.
The confuſion of your Goliathſhip. Re. prefa.
Yee ſpeake mutche of your Miniſterſhippes goodneſſe, 170. b.
This is falſe, ſauinge youre Miniſterſhips. Con. 347. b.
Your Superintendentes ſhippes. 235. b.
Your Maiſterſhips. Re. pre.
Your Maſſhippes. 247. a.

M. Hardinge. Confuta. fol. 109. b.

Thus wee comme within you Defenders, as it were: and claſpinge with you, wringe your weapon out of your hande: and with the other ende of it ſtrike you downe: As it is not harde to vs, by learninge to ouerthrowe you. &c.

To the Christian Reader.

IT pitieth mee in thy behalfe, good Christian Reader, to sée thy conscience thus assaulted this daie with so contrarie Doctrines of Religion: and specially if thou haue a zeale to followe, and seeste not, what: and wouldeste faine please God, and knowest not, howe: nor findeste thée selfe sufficiently armed with Goddes Holy Spirite: nor hable either to discerne thy meate from poison, or to vnwinde thée self out of the snares. *For Satan transformeth himselfe into an Angel of Light:* The wicked is more watchefull, and vehemente, then the Godly: and Falsehed is oftentimes painted, and beautified, and shineth more glorious then the Truthe. 2.Corin.11.

These be the thinges, that, as S. Paule saithe, *worke the subuersion of the Hearers:* and by meane whereof as Christe saithe, *If it were possible, the very Electe of God shoulde be deceiued.* Howe be it, *God knoweth his owne, and no Power can pulle them out of his hande.* God is hable to worke comforte out of confusion, and to force his Lighte to shine out of darkenesse. *All thinges worke vnto good, vnto them, that be in Christe Jesu.* Be Falsehedde neuer so rashely coloured, yet in the ende the Truthe wil conquere. 2.Tim.2. Matthæ.24. 2.Tim.2. Johan.10. Roman.8.

Notwithstandinge, God in these daies hath so amazed the Aduersaries of his Gospel, and hath caused them so openly, and so grossely to laie abroad their folies, to the sight, and face of al the worlde, that noman nowe, be he neuer so ignorant, can thinke, he maie iustely be excused. They deale not nowe so suttlely, as other Heretiques in old times were wont to do: thei hide not the lothsomnesse of their errours: they cloke not them selues in Sheepeskinnes: they dissemble nothinge: they excuse nothinge: but, without either shame of man, or feare of God, thei rake vp those thinges, that before were buried, that them selues had forsaken, the wise had abhorred, the worlde had lothed. It had benne more policie for them, to haue pelded in sommewhat, and to haue staied in the reste. So there might haue appeared sommewhat plainenesse in their dealinges.

But this is Goddes iuste iudgemente, that they, that wilfully withstande the Truthe, shoulde be geuen ouer to mainteine lies, as beinge the *Children of Vntruthe, Children, that wil not heare the Lawe of God.* Esai.30.

For trial whereof, I beséche thée, good Reader, aduisedly to peruse these fewe notes truely taken out of M. Hardinges late Confutation. Judge thereof, as thou shalt sée cause. Let no affection, or fantastic cause thinges to séeme otherwise, then they be.

The two principal Groundes of this whole Worke are these: First, *That the Pope, although he maie erre by personal errours, in his owne Priuate Judgemente, as a man, and as a particulare Doctour in his owne opinion: yet as he is Pope, as he is the Successour of Peter, as he is the Vicare of Christe in Earthe, and as he is the Sheepeheard of the Vniuersal Church, in Publique Judgement, in deliberation, and definitiue Sentence, he neuer erreth, nor neuer erred, nor neuer can erre.* As if he would saie, The Pope walkinge in his Galleric is one man: and sittinge in his Consistorie, or in Judgement, is an other: Which thinge to hold, Alphonsus de Castro saith, it is mere folie. Yet is this M. Hardinges chiefest, or rather, as I might in manner saie, his onely grounde. M.Harding. fol.334.b. Alphons.lib.1 cap.4.

The Seconde is this, *The Churche of Rome is the whole, and onely Catholique Churche of God: and, who so euer is not obediente vnto the same, muste be iudged an Heretique.* These two groundes beinge once wel, and surely laide, he maie builde at pleasure, what him listeth. Confu fol.16.b fol.261.b.

As for the Pope, the better to countenance his estate, he saithe, that Peter receiued Power Ordinarie, to him selfe, and to his Successours for euer: but his Felowes had power onely by Dispensation: *That Peter was the Sheepeheard, and the Apostles* Cõfu fol.48.b Cõfu fo 333.a & 48.b.

Apostles the Sheepe: and, that the Apostles were subiect vnto Peter, as the Sheepe are subiect to ỹ Shepeheard: And that *Iames the Apostle was a Member of Peter.* For better warrant wherof Pope Leo saithe, Petrum Christus in Consortium Individuæ Vnitatis assumptum, id, quod ipse erat, voluit nominari: *Christ receiuing Peter into the Companie of the Indiuisible Vnitie, woulde him to be called the same, that he was him selfe.* *Confut. Fol. 282. a.* *Leo Epist. 89.*

Vpon affiance, and truste of these wordes, M. Hardinge endoweth the Pope with Christes onely Prerogatiue, and calletbe him by Christes principal Title, The Prince of Pastours. And further he saithe, Of the Pope hangeth the safetie of the whole Churche of God: That vnto the Pope is geuen al manner of power, as wel in Heauen, as in Earthe: And that, if any man saie, The Pope hath Authoritie to commaunde the Angels, and Archangels of God to comme, to goe, to waite, to renne, to carrie, to fetche, *wee maie not be scrupulous,* (for these be his wordes) *in any such like maters:* That neither Kinge, nor Emperoure, nor Clergie, nor Councel, nor any Power alive can haue Authoritie to iudge the Pope, be his Life neuer so vile: That the Pope is endewed with a Diuine, or a Godly Power, and that by the same he is hable to Depose Kinges: That the Pope, euen by the Institution of Christe, is a Temporal Prince, and hathe the Right, and Interest of bothe Swerdes, as wel Temporal, as Spiritual: That al Kinges, and Emperours, by the Commaundements of Christe, receiue theire whole Power, and Authoritie from the Pope: That the Pope in a right good sense maie be called the King of Kinges, and Lorde of Lordes: Like as also in some good sense, he maie be called Our Lorde, and God: (And therefore one of M. Hardinges felowes saithe, *The Pope is the Heade, and Kinges and Princes are the Feete*): That the Pope, what so euer he be, is alwaies a Christian man, *by the Nature of his Office:* And therefore an other of them saithe, Iudãsne sit, an Petrus, an Paulus, Deus attendi non vult: sed solum hoc, quòd sedet in Cathedra Petri: *Whether the Pope be* Iudas (the Traitoure) *or* Peter, *or* Paule, *therof God neuer bade vs be careful. This onely is sufficient for vs, that he sitteth in Peters Chaire.* Likewise M. Hardinge saithe, *It shalbe sufficiente for vs to doo, as Peters Successours bid vs to doo:* Christe (saithe M. Hardinge) *nowe requireth not of vs to obeie* Peter, *or* Paule, *but him, that sitteth in theire Chaire.*

Confut. Fol. 50. b *Confut. 204. b* *Confut. 248. b* *Confut. 250. a.* *Confut. 248. b* *Confut. 182. a.* *Confut. 247. b & 305. b.* *Confut. 180. b. & 248. b.* *Confut. 250. a.* *Confut. 249. b* *Dorman. pag. 15.* *Confut. 312. b.* *Hosius in Cõfessione Petricouien. ca. 29.* *Confut. 192. a.*

Againe he saithe, The whole Churche of God is the Popes Vineyarde: The Pope is the Heade, and al the *Faithefol of Christe be his Members:* The preseruation of the whole Churche standeth in the Vnitie of the Pope: And therefore Hosius saithe, Absque Vno (Papa) Ecclesia Vna esse non potest: *Without One Pope the Churche of God cannot be One.* To conclude, M. Hardinge saithe, *Without the obedience of the Pope, there is no hope of Saluation.* Thus mutche hath M. Harding taughte vs, as moste sounde, and moste Catholique Doctrine, touchinge the Authoritie of the Pope.

Confut. 192. b. *Confut. 283. b.* *Confut. 284. a. & 283. b.* *Confut. 212. b.* *Hosius in Cõfessione Petricouien. ca. 27.*

Of the other side he saithe, *The Church of Rome is the Vniuersal, And onely Church of God:* and that, what so euer Doctrine hathe benne taughte in the same, ought to be taken, as godly, and Catholique: And, that al other Churches of the other Apostles might erre, and faile: but the Churche of Rome, euen by Goddes especial Promisse, what so euer thẽ teache, can neuer erre.

Confut. 306. b. *Confut. 16. b.* *262. b.* *Confut. 196. a.*

He fighteth as frekly for his Pardonnes, and Purgatories, as he coulde doo for the Faithe of the Holy Trinitie. Nathan saide vnto Dauid, *Our Lorde hathe put awaie thy sinne: Thou shalt not die:* Againe S. Paule saithe, *Beare one of you an others burthens: Hereby* (saithe M. Hardinge) *it is plaine, that the Pope hathe Power to geue Pardonnes. And Christe gaue S. Peter special Authoritie to bestowe the same.* *2. Regum. 12.* *Galat. 6.* *Confut. 251. a. & b.*

But the Determination, and ful discussion of these greate maters, of Pardonnes, and Purgatorie, he saithe, is very harde, and maruelous intricate. *Confut. 180. b.* *Confut. 252. b.*

Whereas they, not without manifeste Blasphemie, haue vniuersally taughte the people, thus to calle vpon the Blessed Virgine, the Mother of Christe, *Thou art the Lady of Angels: Thou art the Queene of Heauen: Geue commandement vnto thy sonne: Let him knowe, thou arte the Moother:* Where as also an other of them saithe, *Our*

Lady

Conc̃il. Trident: Sessio. 2 Confu. 123. a.

Lady is Goddes moste Faithful Felowe, Fidelissima eius socia, thus makinge a Creature equal in felowshyp vnto God: *All this* (saithe M. Hardinge) *is nothinge els, but a* (preaty kind of) *Spirituall dalliance: and he is moste impious, and impudente, that findeth faulte with it.*

Jacob. Nanclantus in Epist. ad Rom. Cap. 1. Jaco. Payna, Lib. 9. Polydor. de Jnuentorib. Lib. 6. Cap. 13. Hæc pars Pietatis differt non multum ab Jmpietate. Cõfu. fo. 292. b

And notwithstandinge euen nowe they teache the people to falle downe, and to worshyp the Image of Christ, not, as they were wonte before to saie, geuinge the whole honour vnto Christe, that is signified by the Jmage, but euen with the selfe same honoure, that is due to Christe him selfe, and that without any scruple, or doubte of Conscience: notwithstandinge also somme of his owne companie saie, *The selfe same kinde of Deuotion, that is nowe donne to Jmages, differeth but litle from open wickednesse:* Yet M. Hardinge saithe, We knowe no kinde of Jdolatrie euer vsed in the Churche of Rome: Neither is there any Jdolatrie committed by vs, in VVoorshippinge of Sainctes, in Praieinge to them, or in the Reuerence, we exhibite vnto theire Images. Notwithstandinge sundrie others the beste learned, and wiseste of his side, haue plainely confessed diuerse greate errours, and deformities in theire Churche: Notwithstandinge the Pope, his Cardinalles, and his Bisshoppes slugge, and slepe, and do nothinge: Notwithstandinge Goddes Euerlastinge Light, as muche as in them lieth, be hidde vnder the bussheI: Notwithstandinge the Watchemenne be blinde: the Dogges be doumbe: the Salte be vnsauery: the people of God sitte in darkenesse, and in the shadowe of deathe, knowe neither theire owne profession, nor the vse, and meaninge of theire Sacramentes, nor what they Beleeue, nor what they Hope, nor what they Worshyp, nor what they Praie: (As for his offeringe vp of Fourmes, and Accidentes in a Sacrifice vnto God, for so fondely he writethe, I trowe, to reliue bothe the Quicke, and the Deade, with other errours of greater importance, wherewith he maie more easily astonne the people, I wil saie nothinge) All this notwithstandinge, M. Hardinge doubteth not to saie, *If Christe him selfe, or his Apostles were aliue againe, the Woorde, that is to saie, the Doctrine of our Beliefe, nowe preached, and receiued in the Catholique Churche* (of Rome) *neither shoulde be altered, nor coulde be bettered.*

Reioin. f. 23. b

Confu. 254. a.

And therefore, he saithe further, *Sutche wicked changes in Religion, as ye haue made, it is lawful to make, neither with a Councel, nor without a Councel:* Againe, *our Doctrine hathe benne too longe approued, to be put in daieinge in these daies:* And therefore againe, for a final conclusion he saithe thus, *Sette your hartes at reaste: It shal not be so.*

Confu. 274. a Confu. 271. Confu. 331. a.

These be the special Contentes, and Jmplementes of M. Hardinges whole Booke of Confutation: whiche he wisheth vs to receiue, vnder his warrante, as the whole, and onely Catholique Faithe of Christe: by force whereof he thinketh him selfe hable to subdewe, and binde the whole worlde. If the thinges, that he maintaineth, be so fonde, what maie we then thinke of other thinges, that he denieth?

Nowe, what substance of Learninge, out of the Scriptures, Councelles, and Doctours truely alleged, he hathe brought vs forthe for better furniture of the same, I leaue it wholy to be weighed by others. Verily, vtterance, and eloquence, and founde of wordes, and boldenesse of speache he wanteth none. Howe be it, ofttentimes in the faireste rose thou maiste soneste finde a canker.

But here, good Christian Reader, Our Bokes thus laide in the middes before thée, I beseeche thee to consider, with what indifferente Judgemente M. Hardinge woulde haue thée to passe betweene vs.

Reioind. In the Preface to the Reader. *iij. b. *iij. a. *iij. b. **y. a.

First he saithe, *What shoulde wee seeke for Truthe? Let vs onely beholde the customs of the Churche.* Againe, *What Argumentes, what Allegations, what shewe of discourse so euer he bringe againste these thinges, wee ought to make smal accounpte thereof.* Againe, *I would blesse mee selfe from him, as from the Minister of Satan, and as from the Disciple of Antichriste, and as from Goddes open, and professed enimie.* Againe, *M. Jewelles Replie, and other like Heretical Bookes, are vnlawful to be readde, by order of the Churche, without special licence: and are vtterly forebidden to be readde, or keapte, vnder paine of Excommuni-*

communication. And againe, *As for the Replie, none other waie will serue, but to throwe al into the fire.* *Reioind. in the Preface to M. Iewel. A.i.*

Of the other side, touchinge the VVoorde of God, with moste terrible woordes he fraieth thée from it, and biddeth thée to consider of other thinges, and to behold, I knowe not, what. *Yee prostitute the Scriptures* (he saithe) *as Baudes doo theire Harlottes, to the Vngodly, Vnlearned, Rascal people:* Againe, *Prentises, Light Personnes, and the rifferaffe of the people:* And againe, *The Vnlearned people were keapte from the Readinge of the Scriptures by the special prouidence of God, that precious stoanes should not be throwen before Swine.* *Confu. 213.A. Reioind. in the Preface to the Reader.* In suche regarde these menne haue, as wel the Holy Scriptures, as also the People of God. The Scriptures they resemble to common Harlottes, and the vilest creatures of the stewes: The people of God they calle, Vngodly, Rascalles, Risseraffe, and Filthy Swine. *M. Hard. in his Answeare, Artic. 15. Diui 7.*

Thus he suffereth thée not to reade, either my poore Booke, whereof thou shouldest Iudge: or the Holy VVoorde of God, whereby thou mightest be able to Iudge: but onely biddeth thée to folowe him, and to saie, as he saithe: and al is safe. Thus, firste he blindeth thine eies, and then willeth thée to looke about, and to condemne the thinge, thou never kneweste. So saithe S. Hierome, Isti tantam sibi assumunt Authoritatem, vt siue dextra doceant, siue sinistra, id est, siue bona, siue mala, nolint Discipulos ratione discutere, sed se Præcessores sequi: *These menne take so muche vpon them selues, that, whether they teache with the Righte hande, or with the Lefte, that is to saie, whether they teache good thinges, or badde, they wil not haue their Hearers, or Learners, to enquire causes, wherefore they shoulde doo this, or that: but onely to folowe them, beinge theire Leaders.* *Hieron. in Esaiam. Lib. 9. Cap. 30.*

But beware, I beséeche thée, good Christian Reader. A simple eie is soone beguiled. It is very course Woulle, that wil take no colour. It is a desperate cause, that with woordes, & eloquence maie not be smothed. Be not deceiued. Remember, of what maters, and with what Aduersaries thou haste to deale. With feare, and reuerence be careful of thine owne Saluation. Laie downe al affection, and fauoure of parties. Iudge iustely of that shalbe alleged. Onlesse thou knowe, thou canste not Iudge: Onlesse thou heare bothe sides, thou canste not knowe. If thou like ought, knowe, why thou likest it. A wise man in eche thinge wil searche the cause. He that cannot iudge Golde by sounde, or in sighte, yet maie trie it by the Poise. If thou canste not weigh these maters, for wante of Learninge, yet, so sensible, and so grosse they are, thou maiste séele them with thy fingers. Thou maiste soone finde a differences betwéene Golde, and Brasse: betwéene Iacob, and Esau: betwéene a Face, and a Visarde: betwéene a fulle Body, and an emptie Shadowe.

Staie not, thou arte settled in thy Beleife, before thou knowe it. Vaine Faithe, is no Faithe. S. Augustines counsel is good: *Beleeue no more of Christe, then Christe hathe willed thee to beleeue:* Nemo de Christo credat, nisi, quod de se credi voluit Christus. Likewise he saithe, Fides stulta non prodest, sed obest: *Fonde Faithe is hurteful, and doothe no good.* S. Hilarie saithe, Non minus est, Deum fingere, quàm negare: *To deuise fansies of God, it is as horrible, as to saie, There is no God.* The Ancient Father Tertullian, speakinge of the Enimies of the Crosse of Christe, that disdeigned to submitte their willes to the wil of God, saith thus: Amant ignorare, cùm alij gaudeant cognouisse. Malunt nescire, quod iam oderunt. Adeò quod nesciunt, præiudicant id esse, quod, si scirent, odisse non possent: *They desire to be ignorante, whereas other folkes desire to knowe. They woulde not knowe the Truthe, because thei hate it. (What so euer it be) they imagine it to be the same thinge, that they hate. But if they knewe it in deede, they coulde not hate it.* Let Reason leade thée: let Authoritie moue thée: let Truthe enforce thée. The VViseman saithe, *Who so feareth the Lorde, wil not be wilful againste his Woorde.* God of his mercie confounde al Errours: geue the Victorie to his Truthe: and Glorie to his Holy name. Amen. *Augustin. de Tempore, Sermon. 145. Augu in quæstion. Veter. Testament. quæst. 43. Hilar. in Psal. 1. Tertull. in Apologetico. Eccle. 2.*

From London. 17. Octobris. 1567.

A Table of the principal maters *Conteined in this Booke.*

A.

Abas Ioachimus. 490.
Abiathar deposed by Salomon. 628.
Absolution of a man in Phrenesie, or against his vil. 173.
Absolution of a deade man. 174.
The Manicheis glutenous Abstinence. 7.
Abuses confessed. 17.
Abuses wilfully maintained. 17.
The Abuse of Confession. 188.
Abuses in the Masse. 487.
Christe came to saue Accidentes. 298.
Accidentes M. Hardinge calleth thinges material. 320.
Adoration of the Sacrament. 311.
Adoration of Images. 740.
Aeneas Syluius. 47.
Affiance in Ceremonies. 583.
Agreemente againste God. 661.
Al, vsed in steede of many. 473.
Petrus Aloisius. 410.
S. Ambrose place expounded. 289.
Anabaptistes. 31.
Anacletus for Calixtus. 270.271.
Angelles, Archangelles, Powers, Dominions. 105.
The Pope condemneth the Angelles of God. 372.
Anselmus. 343.
Antichriste. 249.431.
Antichriste shall sitte in the Churche of Christe. 113.
Antichristes power. 439.
Antichriste, Latinus. 465.
Antichriste in the See of Rome. 462.490.
Antichriste the Vniuersal Bishop. 465.
Antichriste the Abomination of desolation, Antichriste is the Deuil. 479.
Antichriste in the Churche of God. 496.
The Pope Antichriste. 570.
Antiquitie. 518.519.523.
Antiquitie pretensed. 523.
The Apologie not subscribed. 30.
Apostates. 152.
The Apostles without Authoritie. 113.
The Apostles equal vnto Peter. 113.114.
The Apostles and Martyrs of Christe in Purgatorie. 340.
Apparel Ecclesiastical. 344.
Monkes Apparel. 652.653.
Holinesse in Apparel. 583, 584.
Choise of Apparel. 585.
Appeales to the Pope. 124.
Appeales to Rome. 471.
Arabici the Heretiques. 644.
Archidamus the Successoure of Hercules. 749.
The Arians had moe Councelles, then the Christians. 515.
Balaams Asse hable to speake. 3.
An Asse ietting in a Lions skin. 3.
An Asse vvoorshipped as God. 4.
Atheoes not raised. 414.
Augustine the blacke Monke. 13.
S. Augustine condemned by the Pope. 120.
S. Augustine condemned at Louaine, as the Minister of the Diuel. 207.
S. Augustine condemned by Pighius. 526.
S. Augustine doubteth of Purgatorie. 343.
S. Augustine denieth the Purgatorie. 344.345.
Augustine the Italian Monke. 519.
Aultars. 373.374.
Aurea legenda. 161.
Auriculare Confession, seldome, or neuer readde in the Auncient Fathers. 181.187.188.

B.

Rome vnder the name of Babylon. 746.747.
Roger Bacon. 486.
The Fourme of Baptisme altered. 244
Baptisme, the Faithe of the Parentes, &c. 257.258.
In Baptisme vvee are made Partakers of Christes Diuine Substance. 262.
Baptisme the power of Resurrection. 265.
By the Sacrament of Baptisme. 67
S. Basile fowly corrupted. 115.
Becket. 665.
Thomas Becketh betraieth his Princes right to the Pope. 350.
Thomas Becket a Defender of manifeste wickednesse. 350.
Beda corrupted. 510.
To Beleeue in God. 86.
Pluralitie of Benefices. 554.
Bernardes Authoritie. 502.
Bigamine. 211.
In Bindinge and Loosinge, the Priest maie be a Iudge, although he neuer heare Priuate Confessions. 185.186.188.
Power to Binde or Loose. 186.
187.189.170.
In Bindinge and Loosinge, the iudgemente of Man goethe before the iudgement of God 187.188.189.
In Bindinge and Loosinge, the Priest hathe power ouer the Prince. 187.
The Popes singulare power in Bindinge and Loosinge. 189.
The Priest in Bindinge and Loosinge hath no Power. 190.
The Pope Bindeth and Looseth by a deputie. 193.
Bishop and Priest al one. 117.
205.239.
One Bishop, One Bishoprike. 114.115.117.
A Bishop, no Bishop. 130.
Euery Bishop the Highest Bishop. 136.
Al Bishoppes are bounde, and haue Authoritie to healpe others. 117.
The Pope aboue other Bishoppes onely by richesse. 117.
Al Bishoppes equal with the Pope. 115.116.117.118.
The Pope maie make a Bishop by his bare vvoorde. 147.
No Bishop maie be without the Popes consente. 148.
The Popes Confirmation of Bishoppes. 148.149.150.
Al Bishoppes are in the Pope, and receiue of his fulnesse. 559.
Bishoppes sworne to the Pope. 655.
The Calendare of Bishoppes names. 412.413.
Councelles of Bishoppes. 704
Certaine Bishoppes Entituled with speciall Names of Honoure. 468.
Bishoppes conuented before the Prince. 654.665.666.667.668.
The Bishoppes at the Councel of Tridente. 628.
Onely fourtie Bishoppes in the Councel of Tridente. 736.
The Emperoure in Summoninge of Councelles directed by the Bishoppes. 697.
Councelles of quarrellinge Bishoppes. 738.
Constantine sitteth beneathe the Bishoppes. 710.
Kinges annointed by Bishoppes. 726.

Bishops

The Table.

Bishoppes bounde to preach. 554.
Good Bishoppes reckened as no Bishoppes. 738.
Bishoppes Married. 199.200,200. 201.224.
Bishoppes deceiuers, Pilates, Diuelles, and the Darkenesse of the worlde. 491.493.494.
The pride of Bishoppes. 444.627.
Blinde Prophecies, the Christians shal haue an ende. 25.26.
The Bloude of the Grape, of the Soule, of the Earthe. 308.
Eatinge of Bloude. 310.
The Sacramente is one thinge, and Christes Body is an other thinge. 247.248.
The wicked Eate not the Body of Christe. 251.284.315.
This is my Body, expounded. 508.509.
Christes Body is Eaten by Faithe. 264.267.
Christes Body is Eaten by Faithe onely. 277.278.279.284.309. 313.314.316.317.
Christes Body entreth not into our Bodies. 265.
The Body of Christe Eaten by Infidelles. 609.610.
Iudas Eateth the Body of Christ. 609.610.
Guilty of the Body and Bloude, &c. 609.610.
Christes Body in the Communion vessels. 252.
Christes Body in one place. 277. 317.319.
VVee Eate Christes Body sittinge in Heauen aboue. 312.319.
The Breade consumed into nothinge. 292.293.
The Breade changed into a Diuine Substance. 296.297.
The Breade is changed in the Sacramente, and yet remaineth. 290.304.306.307.
Pope Iulius of dippinge the Breade. 551.
Drinkinge of Breade. 310.
The nature of Breade, and VVine remaineth stil. 293.302.
The Breade and VVine remaine stil. 289. And the place of S. Ambrose touchinge the same, expounded. 289,290.
Britannie had receiued the Faith longe before the commynge of Augustine. 12.13.
Eleutherius the Apostle of Britannie. 12.
Paule in Britannie 12.13.
Simon Zelotes in Britannie. 13.
Brunichildis the Queene, 666.

C.

Caiaphas had the Sprite of God. 651.
The Calendare of Bishoppes Names. 412.413.
Calixtus for Anacletus. 269.270.
Camotensis. 646.647.
Canonistes & Schoole Doctours. 377.
Cardinalles like vnto Kinges. 579.
Cardinalles proued by the Scriptures. 524.525.
Cardinal Poole, 18.
Cardinalles and Bishoppes, nor thing els but Laie Princes. 673
Sixe Cardinalles drowned by Pope Vrbanus. 642.
Pope Pius complaineth of his Cardinalles. 44.45.
Carrieinge about of the Sacrament. 332.333.
Io. Casa. 419.420.
Simon Casté, tamen Cauté. 400.
Catharinus against Sotus. 661.
The Catholique Church in twoo persounes. 96.97.
Catholiques, false Catholiques. 27
The Catholiques haue forsaken the Auncient Traditions of the Church. 24.
The Catholiques fowly abuse the Scriptures. 60.
Catholiques charged with the name of Heretiques. 658.
M. Hardinges Catholique Faithe is doubtful, and changeable. 386.387.
Errours emongest the Catholique Fathers. 391.
The Catholiques wil suffer no Reformation. 653.655,656.
Errours and abuses confessed by Catholiques. 655
The Catholiques refuse to be tried by the Scriptures. 495.
The Catholiques wil yeelde to nothing. 614.
The Catholiques haue yeelded to them, whom they cal Heretiques. 45.
The Catholiques triumphe of their Learning. 397.
The Learninge of the Catholiques and Protestantes. 398.
The Catholiques condemne before they knowe. 44.45.
Corruption of the Church confessed by the Catholiques. 655.
The Catholiques write in contempte of Princes. 613.614.
Catholique Tragedies. 82
Ceremonies maie be abolished & howe. 347.
Assuace in Ceremonies. 582
Ceremonies borowed of the Heathens. 24.
Ceremonies condemned by S. Augustine. 346.
Heathen Ceremonies broughte into the Churche of God. 334.
Ceremonies more regarded, then the Commaundementes of God. 346.
Certaintie of Saluation. 78.
The Councel of Chalcedon reproued by Leo. 58.
The Pope is Goddes Chauncellare. 561.
The Readinge of Chapters in the Churche. 630.631.
Chastitie is the gifte of God. 205.
Vnchaste Chastitie. 511.
Antichriste a professour of Chastitie. 511.
Heretiques make boaste of their Chastitie. 511.
The Vowe of Chastitie annexed to Priesthoode. 543.
The Cheaste of the Popes bosome. 512.
Chilperichus deposed. 438.440.
Christes Ascension. 87.
Christes Body laide vpon the Communion Table, in what sense. 374.
Christes Body Crusshed with teethe. 328.
The Eatinge of Christes Body, is Spiritual. 314.315.321.324. 327.329.
Christes Body muste be in one place. 88.89.93.
Christes Body without Fourme or proportion. 88.
Christes Body Eaten by Faithe onely. 277.278.284.308.313. 314.316.
Vehemente Extraordinarie speeches, touchinge the Eatinge of Christes Body. 284.285.286. 288.292.316.
Christes Body Eaten by Mouse, or Dogge. 328.
The Sacramente is one thinge, and Christes Body an other thinge. 247.265.
Christes Body in one place. 277. 318.
Christes Body presente. 313.
Christes Body entreth not into our Bodies. 255.

The Table.

The wicked receiue not Christes Body. 284.315.252.
The truthe of Christes Body the Remission of Sinnes. 396.
The appleinge of the deathe of Christe for Sinne. 335.
The Deathe of Christ auaileable onely for Sinne committed before Baptisme. 337.
Marie is Christes felowe. 737.
Christes Godheade is not Eaten. 282.283.284.
Christe as presente in Baptisme, as in the Sacramente of his Body. 314.
Christe dranke his owne Blonde, and nowe drinketh the same beinge in Heauen. 306.
To see, and touche Christe in the Sacramente. 314.315.
To receiue, or see, or holde, or to beare Christe. 316.319.
The receiuinge of Christe. 319.
Christe was a Kinge. 624
Christes promesses made to the Church. 427.
Christe is the onely Sacrifice for Sinne. 354.
The Eatinge of Christes Fleash, the cause of Resurrection. 365.
Christe is not the onely Heade of the Church. 170.
The Christians persequuted. 376.
The Authoritie of the Church. 2.
The Pope the Bridegrome of the Churche. 56.
The Churche cannot erre. 35. 527.528.589.590.
Corruption of the Churche confessed by Catholiques. 655
In what cases we are not bounde to beleeue the Churche. 22.
The Churche endureth for euer, 25.
The Churche folowyeth not the Scriptures. 61.
The Readinge of Chapters in the Churche. 580.581
The Church knowen by Goddes VVoorde. 3.
The Scriptures of God, take Authoritie of the Churche. 469. 470.504.525.527.
The Churche aboue the woorde of God. 586.587.
The name of the Churche, abused againste the Church. 2.
The whole Vniuersal Churche conueighed into the Church of Rome. 2.
The Church better gouerned by the Pope then by Christe. 579.
The Pope is the whole Churche, 586.
The whole Churche dependeth of the Pope. 59.
The Churche standeth in the Vnitie of the Pope. 496.
The Churche without the Pope is no Churche. 497.498
The Churche gouerned by al Bishoppes togeather. 117.
The Pope not Heade of the Churche. 558.711.
The Pope ruler ouer parte of the Churche, not ouer the whole. 459
The Churche dependinge of one man, muste needes falle. 482. 483.484.
A Churche standinge onely of three Laie menne: 153.
The Churche of God in a feare. 598.
The Churche is the Popes Vines yarde. 631.
A Church Coniectural. 418.
The Church Corrupted. 369.485 494.
The Churche of God maie be dusked with Errour. 470. 471.
The Churche increased in wealth abated in vertue. 475.
Antichriste in the Churche of God. 479.480.
The Churche of God in woorse case, then the Synagoge of the Iewes. 345.
The Churche reformed by little and little. 40.41.42.
Churches reformed by prouincial Councelles. 736.
God can reforme his Churche without Councelles. 742.
The Churche reformed by the Scriptures. 743.
The Churche broughte into a feare. 475.476
The Churche onely in our Lady. 476.
The Churche a Stranger in this woorlde. 9.
The Churche Inuisible. 417.
Markes whereby to knowe the Churche. 494.495.
The Vnitie of the Churche standeth in Christe. 498.
A true Churche not shewed in the Scriptures. 496.
The true Churche is knowen onely by the Scriptures. 496. 497.249.
The Churche aboue the Scriptures, 242.
The Scriptures folowe the Churche. 705.706.707.
The Decree of the Churche is the expresse woorde of God. 241.
Onely the Canonical Scriptures to be readde in the Churche. 548.549.
Dreames and Fables, readde openly in Churches. 549.
The Heade of the Church. 677.
The Heade of Churches. 722.
The paterne of the Olde Churche for reformynge of Errours. 730.731.
Images Painted in Churche-walles. 531.
The Popes ambitious Claimes, 557.
The Clergie exempted from the Iurisdiction of the Prince. 672.677.
The looseneſſe of the Clergie of Englande. 350.
Cobylon. 751.
Cœlestinus Pope, an Arian Heretique. 18.
Comforte in affliction. 11
VVilfull breakinge of Goddes Commaundementes. 370.
The Communion vnder bothe Kindes. 272.273.274.
Communion vnder One Kinde. 553.554.
The Communion vnder One Kinde, and the causes thereof. 359.370.
A Concubine. 338.
Priestes Concubines. 400.403.404
A Priestе keeping a Concubine, ought not to be esteemed in his Seruice. 406.
Priestes keeping Concubines not refused in their Ministerie. 538. 539.
Cõcupiscence is sinne. 197.259.260
Confession, and three kindes therof. 168.
Confession Sacramental. 168.
No Priuate Confession in Chrysostomes Church. 167.
Priuate Confession not necessarie. 167.176.187.188.
Priuate Confession not Commanded by the Scriptures. 168.183.
Priuate Confession set at liberte. 177.186.
Open or publique Confession. 168. 174.175.181.185.
Confession made by a Bille of hande. 172.
Confession to God alone. 174.
The Priestе heatinge Confession,

The Table.

is a doubtful Iudge. 174.184.
The abuse of Confession. 128.
Confirmation of Councels. 631.
In confirminge of Councels the Popes authoritie. 695.696.
Conjurers. 523.
Consecration wherin it standeth. 249.250.
Intention to Consecrate. 251.
Consecratiō of a Bishop, by three other Bishoppes. 148.152.
Before Consecration the Sacramente a Figure. 511.
Constantines Donation. 437.
Constantine in the Councel of of Nice. 710.
Constantine sitteth beneathe the Bishoppes. 710.
Cornelius the Bishop of Bitonto. 648.
The Sacramente is a Creature. 274.275.
No Creature maie iudge the Pope. 563.
The Creede, or Articles of the Christian Faithe. 83.84.
The Creede in diuers and sundrie fourmes. 85.
Cusanus. 705.
The Authoritie of Councelles. 22.56.
A Counce General. 740.
The allowinge of Councelles. 56. 631.
Councelles allowed whether the Pope wil, or no. 59.
Voice definitiue in Councelles. 47.48.
The Pope aboue general Councelles. 47.48.
The Councel hangethe of the Pope. 515.
The Popes Authoritie to calle Councelles. 557.558.
The Pope aboue the Councel. 632.633.
Theodosius in the Councel. 712.
Courteghians of Rome. 408.
Cyprian had power ouer al the worlde. 150.
Cyprian condemned for a Schister by M. Hardinge. 166.
S. Cyprian reproued the Pope. 733.
S. Cyprian manifestly corrupted by M. Hardinge. 376.

D.

Damasus of Priestes sonnes. 200.
Francis. Dandalus. 448.
Dauid George. 32.
The Deathe of Christe applied to vs not by Sacramentes, but by Faithe. 336.
The applieinge of the Deathe of Christe for sinne. 336.
The Deathe of Christe auailable, openly for sinne committed before Baptisme. 337.
Deceiuers of the people vehemently reproued. 2.
The Popes Decrees of what Authoritie. 58.
The Decree of the Church is the expresse woorde of God. 241.
Decretal Epistles forged. 567.
The Definition of Heresie. 49.
Departinge from the Pope. 592. 593.594.595.598.599.600.601. 143.244.
Departinge from the Churche of Rome. 460.461.433.728.
The Pope bindeth and looseth the by a Deputie. 115.
Vaine Deuotions 332.333.
Io. Diazius. 419.421.
The whole worlde is the Popes Diocese. 558.
Dioscorus and Iuuenalis cōdemned. 714.
Pope Iulius of Dipping the bread 551.
Disputation. 45.
Dissension in Religion. 377.378.
The Ancient Fathers Dissentinge in Faithe. 378.
Dissensions in the Churche of Rome. 381.389.
Heresie to Dissent from Thomas of Aquine. 380.
Dissention offendeth the Hartes of the weake, & chaseth them from the Gospel. 379.
The Diuel imagineth Dissensions where none be. 381.
Antichrist is the Diuel. 478.479.
Diuersitie of tongues in Vnitie of Faithe. 548.
The Diuidinge of the Sacrament into three pieces, and the Mysteries therof. 551.
The Authoritie of the Doctours. 22.62.64.65.
The Authoritie of the Holy Doctours. 55.59.72.
Schoole Doctours Despised. 23.
Doctours alleged by Heretiques 63.
The Doctours founded vpon the Scriptures. 72.73.
Catholique Doctrine. 96.97.
The Doctrine of Rome not Catholique. 97.
The Donatistes. 34.
Dreames, and Fables read openly in the Churche. 549

E.

Kinges, and Princes dealinge in Ecclesiastical causes. 662.663. 664.665.667.668.676.678.711. 712.714.720.721.722.723.
The Emperoure disputeth with Ecclesiastical Lawes. 720.721.
The Emperour maketh Ecclesiastical lawes againste the Popes wil. 721.
Eleutherius the Apostle of Britaine. 22.
Princes Embassadours in Councelles. 681.
The Emperoure is aboue the Pope. 457.
The Emperoure appointeth Patriarkal Sees. 721.
The Emperoure alloweth the Popes Lawes. 723.
The Emperoures Authoritie in Councelles. 710.
The Emperour is the Lord of al the worlde. 709
The Emperours power is onely of man. 725.
Emperours make Lawes touchinge Religion. 720.721
The Patriarkal Sees allowed by the Emperour. 138.
The Pope calleth the Emperoure his Lorde and Maister. 456.
The Emperoure commaundethe the Pope. 721.
The Pope subiecte to the Emperour. 725.564.
The Pope conuented before the Emperour. 671.
The Pope the Emperours Priest. 658.
The Emperoure hathe power to Depose Popes. 439.440.
The Emperoure deprinethe the Pope. 723.724.
Councelles summoned by the Emperoure, not by the Pope 62.691.694.697.700.701.
The Emperoure summoned the Pope to come to the Councel. 694.698.
The Emperour dispensethe with Ecclesiastical Lawes. 721.
The Emperoure in summoninge of Councelles directed by the Bishoppes. 697.
By the Emperours VVarrant the Pope summoneth the Councels. 694.
The Pope hathe nothinge but from the Emperour. 564. 565.

The Table.

The Emperour geueth the Pope his Authoritie. 722.
The Emperoures dewties towardes the Pope. 446.
The Emperour hath al his power of the Pope. 435.
The Emperoure inferioure to the Priefte, and howe. 187.
The Pope feuentie and seuen times greater then the Emperoure. 566.
The Pope ſtriketh of the Emperours Crowne with his foote. 451.
The Pope treadeth on the Emperours necke. 454.
The Emperoure placed at the Popes feete. 682.
The Emperoure the loweſt Seruante of the Church. 573.
The Emperoure the Popes man. 447.565.
The Emperoure ſummoneth Councelles, by the warrante of the Pope. 694.
The Pope alloweth the Emperours Lawes. 723.
Henrie the Emperour depoſed by his Sonne. 452.
Henrie the Emperour poiſoned in the Sacramente. 443.
The Empiere diſſolued. 20.
The Kinge of Englande poiſoned. 443.
The Popes pride, and diſdeineful tyrannie towardes the Kinges of Englande. 755.
The looſeneſſe of the Clergie of Englande. 350.
Enim, leaſt out. 146.
Epiphanius refuſed by M. Hardinge. 535.
Decretal Epiſtles forged 567
The Keie of Errour. 191.
An Errour in a Storie. 449.
Errours emongeſt the Catholique Fathers. 391.
Eupſychius. 541
Eupſychius beinge a Biſhop married a wife. 214.215.
Excommunication vniuſte. 45.
The Popes Excommunicatio. 607
The Popes intolerable Exactions, and thirſte of Manie. 357.

F.

Chriſtian Faith called Hereſie. 54
Faithe vvithout Faithe. 86.
Faithe onely. 77.362. And S. Paule, and S. Iames agreed vpon the ſame. 78.
Fooliſhe Faithe vnprofitable 331.
Fooliſhe Faithe hurteth. 571.
Faithe without vvoorkes. 359.360
True Faithe in Infidelles. 358.
Faithe enkendeled by ſundrie meanes. 337.
The Paterne of the Faithe. 730.
The Romaine Faithe hearde of throughout the whole vvorld. 402.
The Churche of Rome is not the onely Standerde of the Faithe. 698.
Iudas had but a meane Faith. 315.
The Faithe of Parentes, &c. in Baptiſme. 258.
Chriſtes Bodye is Eaten by Faithe. 264.267.
Chriſtes Body is Eaten by Faithe onely. 277.278.279.284.308. 313.314.315.
Euery Faitheful Chriſtian is a Prieſte, in vvhat ſenſe. 154
Al the Faithful of God be parte, and members of the Popes Body. 632.
Falſeheade vnder the name of Truthe. 9.
Truthe deuoureth vp Falſeheade. 609.
Superſtitious Faſte. 512.513.
Monkes Faſtinge. 652.653.
The Ancient Fathers diſſentinge in Faithe. 578.
Feede my Sheepe. 21.107.
Feedinge is gouerninge. 108.
Feede my Sheepe, ſpoken onely to Peter. 115.
The Pope Feedeth not. 108.
Feined Miracles. 39.40.
Figure, or Token. 16.
A Figure of Chriſtes Body. 76.
A Figure is not the Truthe. 245.
The Sacramente is a Figure, &c. and howe. 311.
The Sacramente a Figure before Conſecration. 311.
A Figure of Chriſtes deathe, not of his Body. 311.
Straunge Figures diuiſed by M. Hardinge. 312.
Double Fire, and double Purgatorie. 343.
Flamines, Archiflamines, Protoflamines. 136.
The Popes Flatterers. 80.110. 138.160.558.371.572.647.634.
Flatteringe of Princes. 614.
Reſurrection of the Fleaſhe. 302.
Faſtinge from Fleaſhe. 17.
Manie Fonde thinges had in Reuerence, for that they haue beene vſed in the Churche of Rome. 584.585.586.
Fornication allowed, and Matriage forebidden. 7.
A Prieſte liuinge in Fornication, is no Prieſte. 11.
Fornication better then Matriage. 406.407.
Fornication defended. 400.401.
Simple Fornication no Sinne. 357.402.
A Prieſt maie not be depoſed for Fornication. 403.405.
Fourme, and Subſtance. 30. 31. 32.
The Councel of Franckfourde. 740.
Free vvil. 15.
The Frenche Kinge Phillip depoſed by the Pope. 441.
VVilful Frowardneſſe. 407.
The Fruite of the Vine. 306.307.
Difference betweene Fruite and Generation. 308.
The Pope hathe the Fulneſſe of power. 512.
Al Biſhoppes are in the Pope, and receiue of his Fulneſſe. 513.

G.

Gerſon. 485.
The Church knowen by Goddes VVoorde. 3.
God ought to obeie the Diuel. 11.
The Godheade of Chriſte is not Eaten. 282.283.284.
Nazareth the beginninge of the Goſpel. 37.
Princes Courtes receiue the Goſpel. 37.
The Goſpel ſprange firſte from ſimple places. 417.
The Goſpel cauſe of true obedience. 429.430.
The Goſpel forebiddeth not a Chriſtian man to be a Kinge. 430.431.
The Profeſſours of the Goſpel charged vvith treaſon. 424. 425.
M. Hardinges felowes late profeſſoures of the Goſpel. 753. 754.
The Goſpel ſclaundered. 505.
The Goſpel qualified. 514.
Goſpel groſſe and ſenſual. 54.
Grace is not tied to the Sacramente. 258.
Sacramentes conteine Grace, in what ſenſe. 245.
Popes ignorante of their Grammare. 187.
Gratian, Craſsian, neuer allowed by Publique Authoritie. 50.

The Table.

The Churche of Rome receiued the Faithe out of Graecia. 601. 602.
The Græcians condemne the Churche of Rome. 39.
The Græcians abhorre the Bishop of Rome. 488.
The Græcians neuer beleeued Purgatorie. 340.
The Græcians neuer receiued Purgatorie. 604.
The Græcians be Heretiques. 488
Priuate Masse in Græcia. 605.
The Greeke Churche lesse corrupted, then the Latine. 602.
Guilty of the Body, and Bloude &c. 610. 611.

H

M. Hardinge allegeth the eight Booke of Socrates, where as Socrates neuer wrote but seuen. 708.
M. Hardinge abuseth the Scripture without sense. 515.
M. Harding corrupteth the coūcel of Aphrica, puttinge Potentibus, in steede of Petentibus. 119
M. Hardinge corrupteth S. Basile. 115.
M. Hard. corrupteth the Counsel of Nice. 119.
M. Hard. corrupteth the woordes of Christe, Hoc facile, make this. 250. 251.
M Har. corrupteth the woordes of S. Paule. 247. 248.
M. Hardinge corrupteth S. Hierome. 555
M. Hardinges vntrue reportes of Hosius. 695
M. Hardinge refuseth Epiphanius. 531.
M. Har. corrupteth the woordes of Cyprian. 251. 377.
M. Hardinge abuseth the Scriptures, Christe came to saue Accidentes. 298. 299.
M. Hardinge refuseth S. Hieromes witnesse. 640
M. Hardinge disagreeinge with him selfe. 555.
M. Hardinge contrarie to him selfe. 694.
M. Hardinge presumeth before he knowe. 133.
M. Harding mistaketh Iosua for Ozee. 102 106.
M. Hardinge defendeth this saieinge, Si non Casté, tamen Cauté, and calleth it good & wholesome counsel. 400. 401.
M. Hardinge saith it is presumption to folowe the example of Christe. 600.
M. Hardinge saieth, the Pope is a Kinge. 682. 784.
M. Hardinge cannot telle who firste saide Priuate Masse. 156.
M. Hardinge reasoneth from Pope to Pope. 155.
M. Harding condemneth S. Cyprian for a shifter. 166.
M. Hardinges felowes condemne S. Augustine, as a Minister of the Diuel. 207.
M. Hardinges felowes condemne Sozomenus, and Socrates touchinge the Storie of Paphnutius. 211.
M. Hardinges Catholique Faith is doubteful, and changeable. 387.
M. Hardinges weake Arguments 630.
M. Harding recanteth his errour touchinge S. Hierome. 484.
One Heade. 376 377.
Peter the Heade of the Apostles. 114.
The Heade of the Churche, of the People, of Nations. 98.
The Heade of the Prophetes, the Heade of Nations. 114.
The Heade of the Churche. 677.
The Heade of Churches. 722.
The Pope not Heade of the Churche. 558. 721.
Peters charge ouer the Heathens 146 147.
Heathen Ceremonies broughte into the Churche of God. 334.
Henrie the Emperour deposed by his Sonne. 451. 452.
Henrie the Emperour poisoned in the Sacrament. 443.
The definition of Heresie. 51.
Heresie to denie the Supremacie of the Church of Rome. 2.
Christian Faith called Heresie. 54
Light maters accompted Heresie 51.
Heresie to dissent from Thomas of Aquine. 380
Heresies growe vp togeather with the Gospel. 375.
An olde Heresie standinge in the honouringe of our Lady. 353.
Heresie vsed in good parte. 53.
VVhat thinge maketh Heresie. 50. 51.
Heresie maie not be dissebled. 50
Heretiques allege the Doctours. 63.
Heretiques allege the Scriptures 75. 498.
Heretiques holde by Tradition. 240.
Heretiques make their boast of Chastitie. 511.
Heretiques boasting them selues to knowe more then Paule, or Christe. 504.
Heretiques claimed the name of the Church. 464. 466.
Heretiques vnder the name of Catholiques. 464. 466.
popes Heretiques. 161. 162. 483.
An Heretique maie be a Pope, but a Pope maie not be an Heretique. 642.
Pope Honorius an Heretique. 162.
Heretiques refusinge the Scriptures. 504. 510.
Al ancient Heretiques condemned by the Protestantes. 373. 374.
Heretiques condemned to death 513.
Archadamus the Successour of Hercules. 749.
Herode burnte the Genealogies. 511.
S. Hierome corrupted by M. Hardinge. 555.
S. Hilarie married. 198.
Hildebrande Pope. 453.
Pope Hildebrande an Heretique. 162.
Pope Hildebrand caused the Emperour, to waite vpon him bare legged. 162.
Holinesse, and vertue by Succession. 142. 143.
Holinesse in Apparel. 384. 385.
The Pope Holy by his office. 143
The Holy Ghoste is God. 95.
Holy orders, and vses, and abuses thereof. 100. 101.
Holy water to purge Sinne. 25.
Pope Honorius deposed them for Heretiques, whose errours he fauoured with his harte. 162.
Hosius of Cordub. 696.
Hosius mistaken, and answeared. 502. 503.
vntrue reportes of Hosius by M. Hardinge. 696.
Hulderichus Augustanus. 117.
Husse. 10.

I.

Iames the ruler of al Churches throughout the vvorlde. 98.

The Table.

S. Iames Epistle. 234.235.
S. Iames aboue Peter. 631.
Idolatrie. 532.
Idolatrie in the church of Rome. 656.
Idolatrie the better it is tried, the better it is condemned. 753.
Iesting at the Sprite of God. 619. 930.
Ignorance excuseth. 55.
Ignorance highly pleaseth God, and is sufficiente to Saluation. 469.
Ignorance is the greatest maintenance of the Pope. 727.
Images painted in Churche walles. 530.532.
The Adoration of Images. 40.
Easte and VVeaste India. 40.
The Body of Christe Eaten by Infideles. 610.
By the Inspiration of Peter, 121.
Intention to Consecrate. 251.
Ioachimus Abbas. 490.
Iohane the woman Pope. 412.
Iohn Kinge of Englande poisoned. 443.
The sixthe Chapter of S. Iohn perteineth nothinge directly to the Sacramente. 510.
Pope Iohns Heresie. 640.641.642.
Pope Iohn elected by him selfe. 641.
Pope Iohns treasure. 642.
Irenæus reproued the Pope. 733.
Israel & Iuda shal make to them selues one Heade. 107.
Iudas had but a meane Faithe. 315.
Iudas eateth the Body of Christ. 610.
The Pope Iudge of him selfe. 631.
The Pope Iudge in his owne cause. 661.
Pope Iulius of dippinge the Breade. 551.
Iustification. 357.358.559.361.
Iustinus Martyr conuerted. 376.
Iuuenalis and Dioscorus cõdemned. 714.

K.

The Keies of the Churche, and vse of them. 170.171.
The Keies are the woordes of God. 172.173.178.179.184.
A Laie man maie haue the Keis, and maie binde and loose. 171.172.
The Popes Keies equal to others. 192.193.194.
Al Priestes haue not the Keies. 171.178.
Multiplication of Keies. 178. 179.191.
Knowledge is not the Keie. 184
The Keie of power without knowledge. 178.
The Keie of errour. 191.
The Popes Keies doo not open, but shutte. 177
The Kinges Authoritie in cases of Religion. 14.
Kinges and Princes Authoritie in General Councelles. 662.
Kinges and Princes dealinge in Ecclesiastical causes. 662.663. 664.665.667.668.676.690.698. 711.712.714.720.721.722.723.
The Kinge hathe charge ouer meanes Soules. 725.
The Kinge was commaunded to write out a Copie of the Law. 681.682.
The Kinge is the Supreame Head of the Churche. 677.
Christ was a Kinge. 684.685.
Kinges annointed by Bishoppes. 726.
Kinges take al theire Authoritie of the Pope. 565.
The Pope is a Kinge. 683.684. 685.
The Kinge was a Priestе. 683.
Kinges are Kinges by the Pope. 562.
The Kinge inferiour to a Priestе, in what sense. 433.
The Kinge inferiour to a Priest. 681.
The Popes pride and disdeignful tyrannie towardes the Kinges of Englande. 756.
Kissinge the Popes feete. 444.

L.

A Churche standinge onely of three Laie men. 153.
The Churche onely in our Lady. 475.
The Lambe laide vpon the table: 323.324.
The Mystical Latine tongue. 547.
The Latine Churche more corrupted, then the Greeke. 602.
No man hable to reforme the Lawe of God. 355.
Al Lawe is in the Popes breaste. 570.571.
The Learning of the catholiques and the Protestantes. 598.
The Popes Legates placed in Councelles. 696.
Lente, and Lenten faste not deliuered by the Apostles: 233.
Lente, and Lenten meates. 312.
Pope Leo the fiftе, and his Authoritie. 199.210.211.212.213.
Pope Leo an Arian Heretique. 261.
Leo reproued the Councel of Chalcedon. 58.
Letters communicatorie betweene Bishoppes. 151.
Libanius saith, the Scriptures are but toies in comparison of Iulianus. 317.
Liberius Pope an Arian Heretique. 137.640.
Libertines. 873.
A Lier pretendeth most truth. 6
The Life of the Professoures of the Gospel. 394.
The Life of the clergie of Rome 387.
The readinge of the Scriptures breedeth good Life. 376.
Lightes in the Church. 24.
The Pope is that Lighte that is comme into the worlde. 737.
Liturgia. 540.
The Cittie of London burnte. 350.
The Looseneste of Priestes single Life. 406.407
The Looseneste of the Cittie of Rome. 420.421.
The Looseneste of the Clergie of Englande. 330.
Luther. 534
The Church was before Luther. 96.
Lutheranes and Zuinglianes. 392.
Reconciliatiõ betweene the Lutheranes and the Zuinglianes 392.

M

The Booke of the Machabees not Canonical. 233. 425.426.
Madde menne, and Madneste. 82.
An euil Man succeedeth a good Man. 369.
The Manicheis forebade Marriage, and allowed Fornication. 70
The Manicheis ministred the Sacramente vnder one Kinde 8.
The Manicheis saide, the Scriptures were falsified, and ful of errours. 8
Manners, and liues compared togeather. 57.
Many. 282.

Pope

The Table.

Pope Marcellinus condemned. 137.
Marie the Virgine, our Lady and Goddesse. 636.
Marie is Christes felowe. 737.
Marie the Virgine sette in place of Christe. 353.
The Virgine Marie not saued by Christe. 353.
Marie the Virgine wickedly called, our Lady and Goddesse, and Goddes felowe. 352.
Marie the Virgine more blessed for beleeuinge in Christe, then for bearinge of Christ. 353.
Fornication better then Marriage. 406.407.
Marriage hindreth praier. 210.211.
Marriage of Priestes forebidden. 202.
Marriage after a Vowe vvoorse then Aduoutrie, in vvhat sense. 208.
Seconde Marriage condemned. 198.
Marriage is not sinne, but a burthen. 197.198.
Marriage hindreth not. 218. 219.
The forbiddinge of Marriage, the cause of mutch il. 223.224.
The fruites of the forebiddinge of Marriage. 227.228.
Priestes Marriage not forebidden by God. 29.
Marriage within Holy Orders. 213.214.215.216.541.544.
Marriage after a Vowe. 204.205. 206.207.230.
The Apostles doctrine touchinge the Marriage of Priestes. 225. 226.
Marriage within Holy Orders emongest the Priestes of Grecia. 543.544.
Married Bishoppes. 200.226. 198.199.
Married Popes. 201.202.
Martyrs. 31
One Masse in one daie. 553.
Priuate Masse in Grecia. 602.603.
The Masse is good bicause the Pope saith it is good. 145.
The sale of Masses. 332.
Matrimonie forebidden and condemned. 195.196.197.210.223.224
Matrimonie chaste and holy. 539.
Mediatoure of Saluation and Intercession. 348.
Sainctes Mediatoures of Saluation. 349.351.
Mediatours vnto God not needeful. 354.
Mercie and Merite. 358.359. 360.361.
Metropolitanes. 117.118.
Miracles, or tokens of true doctrine. 729.
Feined Miracles. 40.
Miscetur quodammodo. 285. 289.
Monasteries suppressed. 624.537.
The foundation of Monkes. 71.
Christe and the Apostles were Monkes. 71.
Monkes bounde to bodily laboure. 535.536.537.
Monkes Goddes seruantes. 536.
Monkes ministringe the Sacramentes. 536
Monkes Hypocrisie. 633.
Moses was a Priestes. 682.683.
To reioice in multitude & number of persones. 42.
Multitude maketh smal proufe of truthe. 32.
Multitude or scarcitie of beleeuers. 252.

N.

Nature, for qualitie. 291.292.
Natural reason howe farre it is hable to knowe God. 40.41.
Nazareth the beginninge of the Gospel. 37.
Nazianzenes Father a Married Bishop. 199.
Nazianzene not hindred by his VVife. 218 219.
Negatiues. 604.
Nestorius and his Heresie. 310.
The seconde Councel of Nice. 531
Pope Syluester deade before the Councel of Nice. 656.
Noble menne in the Lawe were called Priestes. 683.684
Nouatus. 189.
Nouelrie in Religion. 518.519.

O.

True Obedience caused by the Gospel. 429.430.
Obedience without reason. 706.
Obedience vnto man for religions sake. 385.
Howe farre the Pope is to be Obeied. 44.
VVee are not bounde to Obeie Peter or Paule, but onely the Pope. 462.
Oile halowed. 77.
Oile superstitiously abused. 233.
Opus Operatum. 336.
Origine mangled. 518.
Our God, our Lorde. 433.

P.

Palladium. 465.
Paphoutius. 211.
Pardonnes. 575.576.
Pardonnes greeue out of Purgatorie. 577.
Parentes. 199.
The Parlamente. 619.
Parleamentes without Archebishoppes and Bishoppes. 614.
Parlamentes contrarie to the Popes decrees. 620.
Actes of Parlamente concerninge Religion. 620.621
The foure Patriarkes. 118.
The Popes rule ouer the other Patriarkes. 568.569.
The Popes imaginarie Patriarkes. 569.
Patriarkes of the Popes owne makinge. 741.
S. Paule accused of sedition and tumulte. 5
S. Paule if he were alive vvoulde be counted an Heretique. 488.
Paule the ruler of al the vvorlde. 101.113.
Paule had the charge of al the vvorlde. 98.139.
Paule vveote vp to Hierusalem to visite Peter. 631.
S. Paule had a vvife. 200.
Pauperes à Lugduno. 486.
The name of Peace. 763.
Sundrie sortes of Perfection. 355. 356.
Persequution. 27
To Persequute and to kille for loue. 28
The crueltie of Persequution. 33.
Persequution encreasethe the Churche of God. 23.24
Persequution for loue. 28.
The vvicked complaine of Persequution. 682.
The Persequution of the Christians. 376.583.
Persequution of the Faithful. 583.
Persona, and Substantia, and other vvoordes not vsed in the Scriptures. 241.
Scriptures not meete for the People. 613
Peter the ruler of al the vvorlde. 97.108.109.
Peter Christes Vicare. 108
Peter gaue Authoritie to the Apostles. 112.
Peter had ordinarie power ouer the Apostles. Christe had ouer them power Extraordinarie. 111.

The Table.

S. Peter euen nowe heareth causes, and maketh Lawes. 113.
Pope Paulus the thirde, leaueth out Christe, and putteth Peter in his roume. 737.
By the inspiration of Peter. 112.
Peter auaunced aboue measure. 112.
Peter not the heade. 58.
Peter blamed for settinge him selfe before the reste. 114.
Peter is the Rocke no more then Paule. 112.
Peter hadde the charge of al the whole Churche, and so had Paule. 139.
Peters charge ouer the heathens. 145.146.
The Pope before S. Peter. 113.
VVherein the Pope succeedethe Peter. 751.752.
The Pope vnlike vnto S. Peter. 752.
VVhat thinges S. Peter didde in Rome. 751.
S. Peter correcteth the Pope Leoes Epistle. 113.
Peter denied Christe, but not the Faithe. 640.
Pharisees sitting on Moses chaire 461.462.
Philip the French Kinge deposed by the Pope. 441.
Pope Pius complaineth of his Cardinalles. 45.
Pius Secundus, Pope. 47.48.
Pluralitie of benefices. 554.
Pope Victor poisoned in the chalice. 443.
Polycrates a Bishop married. 199.
Pontificuli. 103.
The Pope hathe bothe Swerdes. 18.552.557.
The Pope ouer al. 21.138.
The Pope aboue General Councelles. 47.628.632.633.635.
The Pope aboue the Scriptures of God. 57
The Pope more then God. 57.433.
The Pope is aboue al the church 69.70
The Pope aboue al the powers of Heauen. 117.
The Pope aboue al Kinges. 434.435.
The Pope is Peter, the Pope is Christe. 112.
The Pope is Christe. 493.501
The Pope is the whole Churche. 477.586.
The Pope is the life of the world. 645.
The Pope Lorde and God. 570.
The Pope is God. 565.
The Popes diuine power. 438. 439.
The Popes Power increased. 438. 439.
The Pope is not a mere natural man. 571.
The Pope the springe of Lawes. 571.
The Popes power ouer purgatorie. 571
The Pope holy by his office. 143.
The Pope hathe a supernatural power. 725.
The pope succeedeth Christe in al his substance. 110.
The whole worlde is the Popes Diocese. 559.
The Pope hathe al power, bothe in Heauen, and in Earthe. 539.
The Pope can doo, whatsoeuer God can doo. 560.
The Pope ruleth in Earthe, and Christe in Heauen. 579
The Pope the righte Lorde of al temporal possessions. 565
It were good that the temporalties of the worlde were vnder the Pope alone. 566.
The Pope the Seruante of Seruantes, 573.
The Pope the Lorde of Lordes. 573.
The Pope commaundeth the Angelles of God. 572.
The Pope, Summus Sacerdos, & Vniuersalis Episcopus. 535.
The Pope gouerneth the church in as good order, as the Apostles of Christe. 579.
The Pope is Doctoure of bothe Lawes. 512.
Al Lawe is in the Popes breaste. 570.571.
The Pope is euer holy. 455.
VVithout the Pope there is no Vnitie. 104.111.
The authoritie of the Popes Decrees. 58.
The truthe is tied to the Popes Chaire. 59.704
The whole Church dependeth of the Pope. 59.
The Pope is liable of nothing to make sommethinge. 60.
The true Church standeth in the vnitie of the Pope. 456.
The Pope nothinge els but a Prince. 673.
The Pope is the Bridegroome of the Churche. 95.
The Popes authoritie in Councelles. 695.
The Popes authoritie in confirminge of Councelles. 695
The Pope is the Lighte that is comme into the VVorlde. 737.
The Pope is the Lorde of al temporal goodes. 735.
The Popes resolution in doubteful cases. 733.
The Pope maie dispense againste Goddes vvoorde. 571
By the Popes warrant the Emperour summoneth Councelles. 649.
The Pope allowethe the Emperours Lawes. 721.
The Popes Porphirie stoole. 444
Reasons to proone the Popes Supremacie. 494.
The Pope cannot commit Simonie. 588.589.590.
The Pope cannot erre. 57.58.637. 639.
The Pope hathe many eies, and many handes. 731.
The Pope hathe twoo capacities, by the one he may erre, by the other he cannot erre. 730
The Popes immoderate claimes. 47.56.57.80.99.
The Popes ambitious claimes. 557.
The Popes flatterers. 80.110.138. 150.538.571.572.647.634.
The Popes impudente Parasites. 455.512.
VVee muste beleeue the Pope, although he telle vs, our righte hande is our leafte. 586.
The Pope geeueth reuerence to no man aliue. 443.
The Pope maie not be iudged by any Creature. 563.
The Pope iudge in his owne cause. 110 661.
Departing from the Pope. 591.593 594.595.598.599.600.601.143.144
The Pope disioined, & by whom. 33.
The Pope, an Vniuersal Bishop, a prowde name. 132.
The Pope the forerunner of Antichriste. 136.
The Pope Antichriste. 570.
The Pope the roote of al il. 482.
The Popes holinesse abated. 19.
Al il flowinge from the Pope. 27.
The Popes ambition. 105.

The

The Table.

The Popes ambition complained of. 119.132.139.
The Pope claimeth to be called the vniuerſal Biſhop. 140.
The Pope maie not be called the Vniuerſal Biſhop. 135.
The Popes power limited within certaine bounder. 151.
The Pope equal with other Patriarkes. 58.63.127.139.140.
The Pope litle regarded before the Councel of Nice. 128.
The Pope no Biſhop, onleſſe he doo the office of a Biſhop. 118.119.145.
The Pope placed before others, and wherefore. 118.119.
The Pope ſummoned by the emperoure to appeare in Councel. 62.
The Popes keies equal to others. 192.193.194.
The Pope hath a ſuperioure euen in ſpiritual cauſes. 456.457.
The Pope inferioure to the Prince. 457.
The Pope commaunded by the Empetoure. 721.
The Pope ſubiecte to the Emperoure. 564.
The Pope hath nothinge but frō the Emperoure. 564.
The Pope not Heade of the Churche. 558.711.
The Pope not Heade, nor ſiſte, nor chiefe. 380.
The Pope hath no vniuerſal authoritie ouer al the worlde. 559.
The Pope vvoulde not be called the vniuerſal Biſhop. 484.
The Pope had no power ſufficient to ſummone Councelles. 633.
The Pope ſummoneth Councelles by the Emperours warrante. 694.
The Emperoure allowethe the Popes Lawes. 722.
The Pope receiueth his authoritie of the Emperoure. 722.
The Pope ſummoned by the emperoure, to comme to the Councel. 694.695.
The Pope him ſelfe ſummoned to Councelles. 558.
The Pope not preſident in Councelles. 699.
The Popes Legates placed in Councelles. 695.
A ſimple poore man ought to be beleeued before the Pope. 634
The Pope deprined by the Emperoure. 723.
Howe farre the Pope is to be obeied. 44.
The Popes ſaieinges are to be taken for truthe, in what caſes. 72.
The Pope abuſeth the ignorance of Princes to keepe them vnder. 727.
The Popes pride and diſdeigneful tyrannie towardes the Kinges of Englande. 755.
The Popes intolerable exactions, and thirſte of moonie. 757.
Popes inflamers of vvarre. 18.
The Pope is a Chriſtian man by the nature of his office. 704.
The Pope ſucceedeth not Peter, but Nero. 612.
VVherein the Pope ſucceedeth Peter. 751.752.
The Pope vnlike vnto S. Peter. 752.
The Pope condemneth S. Auguſtine. 120.
The Pope iudgeth before he knoweth the cauſe. 115.
The Pope reproued by others. 120.144.145.
The Pope reproued by Irenæus, and by S Cyprian. 733.
Popes diſagreeinge emong them ſelues. 495.
The Pope by S. Bernarde called a VVoulfe, a Traitoure, a Diuel. 492.
Popes Heretiques. 483.527.
Popes vnlearned. 637.733.
Popes ignorante of their Grammare. 100.
The euill life of Popes. 358.359. 495.
The Pope ridinge in his Pontificalibus. 333.
Pope Iohane the woman. 412.
Two Popes in one perſon. 635.
The Popes rule ouer the other Patriarkes. 508.569.
Popes imaginarie Patriarkes. 569.
The Pope hathe a priuiledge to doo il. 563.
The Pope threwe the Sacrament into the fiere. 183.
The Popes Keies doo not open but ſhutte. 177.
The Pope deceiueth bothe him ſelfe, and them that heare him. 552.
The Pope diſdeigfully abuſeth Princes. 431.432.
The Pope teacheth diſobedience againſte the Prince. 432.
The Popes Policie increaſed the power of the Turke. 438.
The Popes Legates. 437.
Popes married. 201 202.
The Popes Pardoners. 576.
The Popes Excōmunication. 632
Parliamentes contrarie to the Popes decrees. 620.
To appeale from the Pope. 635.
The Pope cannot enter into the harte of man. 679.
Vnder what condition a man maie be reconciled to the Pope. 748.752.
The Popes ſafeconducte. 660.
Cyrillus repreſenteth the Popes perſone. 659.
The Popes Recantation. 48.
The Power of Antichriſte. 439.
The Popes Diuine Power. 438. 439.
Praier without knowlege of the Scriptures is barren. 237.
Marriage hindreth Praier. 210.
Praier in an vnknowen tongue without profite. 545.546.
I haue Praied for thee Peter. 462 467.477.483.639.663.
Praier vnto Sainctes. 349.
The Emperour Preſident of the Councel. 711.
Preſumption. 60.
Preſumption in errour. 56.
It is Preſumption, ſaith M. Hardinge, to ſolowe the example of Chriſte. 600.
The Pride of Biſhoppes. 444.628
Prieſte and Biſhop al one. 117.118 239.
The Prieſt hath the ſame power that Chriſte had. 172.
The Emperour inferioure to the Prieſte, and howe. 187.
The Prieſt in Binding, and Loo-ſinge hathe no Power. 190.
The Prieſte hearinge confeſſion is a doubtful iudge. 174.184.
Al Prieſtes haue not the Keies. 171.178.
Prieſtes vnlearned. 184.202.615. 616.
The looſeneſſe of Prieſtes ſingle life. 406.
Prieſtes keepinge Concubines not refuſed in their Miniſterie. 538.539.
A Prieſte keepinge a Concubine ought not to be eſchewed in his ſeruice. 406.
Prieſtes Concubines. 400.403.
Damaſus of prieſtes ſonnes. 201.

Prieſtes of Englande neuer votaries, 203.
The Prieſtes of Græcia marrie within holy orders. 542. 544
Prieſtes marriage forebidden. 202.
Prieſtes marriage not forebidden by God. 209.
A Prieſte the Husbande of one wife, 211.212.
A Prieſte liuinge in fornication, is no Prieſte, 10.
The Prince is the executioner of the Prieſtes will, ſaithe M. Hardinge. 682.691.694.
The Prieſte inferioure to the Prince. 691.
Primacie in earthe, confuſion in Heauen, 132.
Primates. 117.
The time of the Primitiue Churche purer then the times folowinge. 35.
The Primitiue Churche, and the Churche of Rome are al one. 597.
Princes courtes receiue the Goſpel. 38.
The Prince hathe a voice in the Councel. 714.715.716. 717.118.
The Pope abuſeth the ignorance of Princes, to keepe them vnder. 727.
The Prince of Prieſtes, of the Apoſtles, of the people. 556.
Priuate confeſsion ſet at libertie, 177.186.
Priuate confeſsion not neceſſarie. 168.177.187.
No Priuate confeſsion in Chryſoſtomes Churche, 168.
Priuate Confeſsion not commaunded by the Scriptures, 169.183.
Priuate Maſſe in Græcia. 604. 605.
Priuate Maſſe continued from the Apoſtles ſaithe M. Hardinge. 155.
The Pope hath a Priuiledge to doo il. 563.
The Proteſtantes doctrine is old and Catholique. 56.
The Proteſtantes not allowed to ſpeake in Councel. 48.49.
Proteſtantes had no place in the Councel of Tridente. 653. 654.655.658.659.
The Proteſtantes learninge and the Catholiques. 589.
The Churches of the Proteſtantes and the Papiſtes compared togeather. 633.634.
The Proteſtantes departures reuiued the Churche of Rome. 599.600.
The Proteſtantes condemne al the anciente Heretiques. 373. 375.
Purgatorie proued by natural reaſon. 505.
Purgatorie founded vpon Pardonnes. 345.
No water in Purgatorie. 344.
Double fiere, and double Purgatorie. 343.
Praier for the deade proueth no Purgatorie. 339.
Scriptures fondely applied to proue Purgatorie, 339.
Purgatorie the Popes peculiare. 338.
Purgatorie an anciente errour. 338.
The paper walles of Purgatorie. 338.
The Apoſtles and Martyrs of Chriſte in Purgatorie. 339.
The Popes power ouer Purgatorie. 571.
Pardonnes greeue out of Purgatorie, 577.
Purgatorie neuer beleeued of the Græcians. 540.541.
Purgatorie neuer receiued of the Græcians, 604.
S. Auguſtine doubteth of Purgatorie. 342.
S. Auguſtine denieth Purgatorie. 344.345.
There is no Purgatorie. 543.

Q.

Quodammodo miſcetur. 285. 289.

R.

Realles and Nominalles. 583.
Real preſence. 262.263.
Readinge of the Scriptures. 533.
The Readinge of the Scriptures in the Churche is by M. Hardinges iudgement the worke of Sathan. 582.
The Readinge of Chapters in the Churche. 620.
Natural Reaſon howe farre it is hable to knowe God. 41.
Rebellion in defenſe of the faith. 18.19.
The Popes Recantation. 48.
The Receiuinge of Chriſte. 519.
Receiuinge without comforte. 279.
Vnder what conditions a man maie be Reconciled to the Pope. 742.752.
Reconciliation betweene the Lutheranes and the Zuinglianes. 392.
Reformation to be hopen for in Councelles. 737.
Diſſention in Religion. 378. 380.
Noueltie in Religion. 518.519.
Repreſentare. 251.
The Repreſentation of the Sacramentes in feedinge, &c. 145.
Reſurrection of the fleash. 562.563.
The cauſes of our Reſurrection. 563.566.
Peter is the Rocke no more then Paule. 111.
Rome the Mother Churche. 760.
The Churche of Rome is the Vniuerſal Churche. 38.39.60.
No ſaluation without the Church of Rome. 39.43.
The Churche of Rome not bounde to folowe the Scriptures. 81.
The holy Scriptures take Authoritie of the Churche of Rome. 469.470.503.504.517.
The Churche of Rome reliued by the departures of the Proteſtantes. 599.
The whole Churche conuerted into the Churche of Rome. 2.
The Churche of Rome cannot erre. 467.477.
The Churche of Rome decaied in faithe. 39.
The Churche of Rome voide of the Grace of God. 105.
The diſordred Churche of Rome. 694.695.538.
The Churche of Rome is ſciſmatical. 602.
Rome the mother of Idolatrie and Fornication. 396.
The Churche of Rome holdeth by moonie. 761.
The Churche of Rome a bough broken from the tree. 752.
The Churche of Rome is not the onely ſtanderde of the Faithe, 658.
The ritches and braueric of the Churche of Rome. 674.675.
The fonde ſeruice of the Church of Rome. 582.
The life of the Clergie of Rome 395.
Steeves in Rome. 409.
The Church of Rome maie faile. 746.

The Table.

Departinge from the Churche of Rome. 450.461.463.728.
The Church of Rome maie erre 477.478.
Rome an Vniuersitie. 415.416.
VVhat thinges S. Peter did at Rome. 751.
The Churche of Rome litle regarded before the Councel of Nice. 692.
The Church of Rome hathe forsaken the Grecians. 602.
The Grecians abhorre the Bishop of Rome. 488.
Recourse vnto the Churche of Rome. 380.
Ruffinus an Heretique. 702.

S.

Sacramentes, Sigoes, Representations. 241.
The Sacramente is a Creature. 274.276.
The Sacrament is one thinge, & the thing signified is an other thinge. 289.303.324.
VVee maie not beholde the Sacramentes, but the power, & vertue of the Sacramentes. 298
Sacramentes, and Ceremonies without vnderstanding. 244.
The Sacramentes of the old and newe Lawe, and theire difference. 246.247.
Sacramentes without Faithe. 336
The Sacrament of Christes body in what sense. 301.
To see and touche Christe in the Sacramente. 314.315.
The representation of the Sacramentes in feedinge &c. 246.
the vertue of the Sacrament. 247
Sacramentes forgeue sinnes, and howe. 178.
Sacramentes doo not iustifie. 334
Sacramentes necessarie. 182.
Onely two Sacramentes. 244.253 254.255.
Christe as present in Baptisme, as in the Sacrament of his body. 313 314.
the Sacrament in one kinde. 510.
In the Sacramente the breade is changed, and yet remaineth. 290.304.306.318.
The woorke of God in the Sacrament. 287.288.291.298.
In the Sacramente the change standeth in Accident, and not in Substance. 300.301.
The diuidinge of the Sacrament into three pieces, and the mysteries thereof. 551.
The Pope threwe the Sacrament into the fire. 163.
The Sacramente geuen to the deade. 358.
The carieinge about of the Sacramente. 332.333.334.
Disdeigneful speeches of the Sacramente. 311.
Sacramental Confession. 187.
Sacerdos Summus. 555 556.
Sacrifice. 154.157.
The Sacrifice wherin it standeth. 166.
Sainctes Mediatours of Saluatiō, 349.351.
The Sainctes of God vsed as Idolles. 351.352.
Sainctes appointed to seueral offices. 352.
The Duke of Sauoie spoiled. 422
Scottishe Queene. 19.20.
Scottishe Kinge Slaine. 20
The Scotistes againste the Thomistes &c. 733.
The Scriptures accused of contrarietie. 5.
the Scriptures folow the church 61.81.705.706.
The Scriptures expouded by the sense of the Church of Rome. 80.106.107.
The Scriptures coot be expouded without tradition. 81.
The Scriptures of God take Authoritie of the Churche. 584.
The Scriptures changeable, 706. 707.273.
Traditions equal vvith the Scriptures. 237.
The Scriptures vvithout Authoritie of them selues. 504.
The Scriptures changed according to the change of times. 469.
The Holy Scriptures take Authoritie of the Churche of Rome. 470.504.
Scriptures fowly abused. 499.576
The Scriptures disdeignefully scorned. 236.
The Scriptures scornefully defaced. 504
The Scripture burnte. 505.506. 507.
Scriptures forged. 241.
The Scriptures fowly abused by M. Hard. Christe came to saue Accidentes. 299.
Scriptures fondely applied to proue Purgatorie, 339.
Scriptures misconstrued. 60.
The Scriptures corrupted by M. Hardinge. 71.76.106.107
Howe knowe you the Scriptures to be Scriptures. 241.
Scriptures harde, and not meete for the people. 611.613.
The Scriptures euerlastinge, in what sense. 236.
Reuerence towardes the Scriptures. 507.
Besides the Scriptures nothinge oughte to be beleued. 516.
Praier without knowledg of the Scriptures is barren. 236?
Readinge of the Scriptures. 533.
It is lawful for the people to reade the Scriptures. 611. 613.
Comforte in readinge the Scriptures. 236.237
The readinge of the Scriptures breedeth good life. 376.
The Scriptures in the vulgare tongues. 611.
The Scriptures by circumstance and conference expounde the selfe. 64.
The Scripture standethe not in the vvoorde, but in the meaninge. 75.
The Scriptures in the hartes of meone. 238.
The Churche reformed by the Scriptures. 743.
Heretiques confounded by the Scriptures. 64.65.66.69.
The Scripture reprouethe al errour. 511.
the Church knowen by the Scriptures. 67.69.
The Scriptures preserued by the enimies thereof. 218.
Second mariage condemned. 198.
Seruetus. 32.
Simonie is a moste godly vertue. 581.
The Pope cannot commit Simonie. 588.589.590.
Simple and Solemne vovve. 517.
No man liuethe vvithout Sinne. 354.
The loosenesse of the Priestes Single life. 406.
The Sheepe persecute not the VVoulfe. 27.28.
One Shepheard, one flock, 306.107
VVhereas Socrates neuer wrote but seuen Bookes, M. Hard, allegethe the eighte Booke of Socrates. 708.
Sophocles. 81.
Sozomenus and Socrates condemned at Louaine touchinge the storie of Paphnutius. 211.

Sayst Sozomenus. 232, 233.

The Pope had Authoritie ouer Spaine, so had S. Cyprian. 107.
Speeches disdeignful of the Sacramente. 310.311.
Speeches vehemente and extraordinarie touchinge the Eatinge of Christes Body. 284. 285.286.288.289.325.
Speeches vnseemely and vile of the receiuinge of Christes Body by Misse. &c. 303.304
The Spirite of Counselles. 630.
The eatinge of Christes Body is Spirituall. 313.314.
Pope Steuin vnburied and defaced his predecessours carkesse. 103.104.
Stewes allowed. 7.
Stewes in Rome. 409.
An errour in Storie. 448.449.
Substance. 295.
Substance for Accidence. 296.
Succession. 142.709.
Succession of Doctrine. 144.
Succession of place and Doctrine. 164.165.166.
Vertue and holinesse by Succession. 142.
Christe had no Succession. 143.
The Catholiques haue no Succession. 144.145.
The Succession of Popes. 137.
The Pharisees Succession from Aaron and Moses, and when they began. 142.143.
Succession in Peters Chaire. 43.
Euerie Pope is not Peters Successoure. 43.
VVherein the Pope Succeedeth Peter. 752.
An euil man Succeedeth a good man. 749.
Superintendents. 621.622.
The originalles of Superstition. 156.
Superstitious faste. 312. 313.
Heresie to denie the Supremacie of the Churche of Rome. 2.
Reasons to proue the Popes Supremacie. 103.104.105.107.109. 110.
Surſum corda. 317.
Syluerius deposed. 723.
Pope Sylvester Christened Constantinus. 700.
Pope Sylvester deade before the Councel of Nice. 497.

T.

The Pope is the Lord of al Temporal goodes. 757.
Temples. 363.
Tenne menne make a people. 188
Terel the Pardoner. 57.
The Theefe, the woulfe. 120.
Theodosius in the Councel. 712.
Theophylactus of Transubstantiation. 282.286.287.288 289.
Theophylactus corrupted by Oecolāpadius, a slaunder. 285.
The Thomistes against the Scotistes aboute the Conception of our Ladie. 733.
Token or figure. 16.
Diuersitie of Tongues in vnitie in Faithe. 548.
A barbarous Tongue. 147.
Traditions. 155.
Traditions equal with the Scriptures. 237.240.
Traditions signifie the woorde of God. 236.237.
Heretiques holde by Tradition. 240.
Traditions abused. 71.
Traditions reproued by Gods woorde. 70.71.
Traditions broken. 237.
Olde Traditions abolished and newe diuised. 579 583.
The Catholiques haue forsaken the ancient Traditions of the Churche. 24.
Traditions roted out by the woorde of God. 70.
Catholique Tragedies. 82.
Againste Transubstantiation. 274.275.290.
Transubstantiation a newe vntertaine faetasie, and no article of the Faithe. 280.281.
The Councel of Tridente. 621.
In the Councel of Tridente onely fourtie Bishoppes. 736.
The Councel of Tridente was not General. 740.
Truthe preuaileth. 368.369.
Truthe sheweth it selfe by litle and litle. 368.
Truthe a straūger in this vvorld, and subiecte to slaunder. 4.
Al Truthe is to be tried by the Scriptures. 166.167.
Truthe mingled with falsehead and Traditions. 6.
The Truth fastened to the Popes chaire. 59.704.
Truthe is Truthe if it please the Pope, and not otherwise. 630.
The Truthe of God hangeth not of menne. 618.
Truthe denoureth vp falsehed. 609.
The Turkes power increased by the Popes policie. 432.

V.

Vaine deuotion. 333.333.
Valdo. 30.
Venial sinnes. 283.
Peter Christes Vicare. 368.
Christ Peters Vicare. 113.
The Vicious life of Popes. 414.
Victor the Pope poisoned in the Chalice. 443
Victoria proined. 588.
Vigilantius. 15
Vigilius deposed. 714.
The Churche is the Popes Vineyarde. 632
The perpetual Virginitie of our Lady. 241.
Voto the Romaines, Vnfaithfulnesse can haue no accesse. 471
Vnitie in Truthe. 389.390.391.
Vnitie in Falsehed. 383.390.391
Vnitie cānot be preserued without the Pope. 110.
The Vnitie of the Pope is the Vnitie of the Churche. 467.468.
The Vnitie of the Church standeth in Christe. 498.
In Vnitie of Faithe diuersitie of tongues. 548.
Vniuersal Bishoppe, a prowde name. 132.133.
The Vniuersal Bishop, the onely Bishop. 104.482.483.
The Pope vvoulde not be called the Vniuersal Bishop. 484.
Vniuersitie in Rome. 415.416.
An Vnknowen tongue to cause the people more to vvoonder. 547.
Praier in an Vnknowen tongue without profite. 546.
Vnlearned Priestes. 176.184.201.
Vnlearned Popes. 637.733.
A Voice is a body. 80.81.
Priestes of Englande neuer Votaries. 203.
Vowe simple, and solemne. 527.
The Vowe of Chastitie annexed to Priesthoode. 543.
The Vowe of chastitie annexed to Orders. 203.
After a Vowe marriage. 204.205. 206.207.230.
Pope Vrbanus drowneth fiue Cardinalles. 641.

VV.

VVakes, or night VVatches. 13.
Popes inflamers of VVarres. 18.
No VVater in Purgatorie. 343.
Holy vvater putteth awaie sinnes 582.
VVeemen disguised in menne apparel.

The Table.

apparel. 113.
The VVicked eate not the Body Christe. 251.284.315.
The VVicked complaine of persecution. 753.
The vvicked cannot preuaile againste God. 757.
VVicked Counceller. 527.
VVicklefe. 10.
VVittemberg. 37.
The Authoritie of Gods VVord 463.
The VVoordes of God are the keies of the Churche. 172.173. 177.178.184.
Traditions rooted out by the VVoorde of God. 70.
VVoordes not vsed in the Scriptures. 240.
Faithe without VVoorkes. 358. 359.
Good VVoorkes haue theire reward. 360.
The whole VVorlde is the Popes Dioccle. 538.
The Emperour is the Lord of al the VVorlde. 699.
The VVoulfe, the Theefe. 107.

Z.

Pope Zozimus corrupted the Councel of Nice. 137.138.646. 647.
Pope Zozimus allegeth the Coũcel of Sardica for the Councel of Nice. 645.646.
Zoenkfeldius. 33.
Zuinglius. 53.
Zuinglians, and Lutherans. 392.

FINIS.

The Table.

FINIS.

AN ANSWEARE TO A CERtaine Booke lately set foorth by M. Hardinge, *and entituled, A Confutation of the Apologie of the Churche of Englande.*

The Title of the Apologie.

AN Apologie, or answeare in defense of the Churche of Englande, with a briefe, and plaine declaration of the true Religion professed, and vsed in the same.

The Confutation by M. Hardinge.

VVhereas these defenders take vpon them the name of the Churche of Englande, setting forth thereby a face of auctoritie, they do much like the Asse that Esope telleth of, whiche, to make the beastes afrayed, had put on him a Lions skinne, and therewith ietted abroade terribly. For as the Lions skinne was but lapped about him, and grewe not to his bodie: so they beyng in deede no liuely members nor parte of the Church, couer them selues vnder the title and name of the Church, the rather to begile the simple. And verely herein they folow the woonte of al Heretikes. For neuer was there any secte of Heretikes hitherto, which hath not claymed to be accompted and called the Church. For which cause, of certaine auncient Fathers, they haue bene likened to Apes, whose propertie is, though they be Apes, yet to counterfeit men, and to couet to seeme men. Nouatianus, as saithe S. Cyprian, after the manner of Apes, would chalenge to him selfe the auctoritie of the Catholike Church. And where as him selfe was not in the Church, but contrariwise a rebell against the Churche, tooke vpon him to affirme, that all other were Heretikes, and presumed to vpholde, the Church was on his side. Irenæus and Tertullian, who were before him, write, that Heretikes made so much adoo to perswade, that the Churche was amonge them selues onely, that they feared not to call the right beleuinge and Catholike Churche, Hereticall and Schismaticall. S. Hilary declaringe how paciently he demeaned him selfe towardes the Arians his enemies, by whome he was banished, writeth, that in fiue yeares space, whiles he liued in banishment, he neuer spake nor wrote euill woorde against them, whiche falsely saide them selues to be the Church of Christ, and were the Synagoge of Antichrist. The Donatistes, against whome S. Augustine wrote much, saide, that the Christianitie was quite loste and gone out of so many nations that be in the worlde, and remained onely in Aphrike, and that the Churche was onely there. In S. Bernardes time also the Heretikes who would be called Apostolikes, as they of our time call them selues Gospellers, saide that they were the Churche.

In Epist. ad Iubaianũ de Hæreticis baptizandis.
De præscript. hær.
Cõtra Cõstantium.
Aug. contra epist. Parmen. li. 2. ca. 1.
Bernard. in cant. Sermo. 66.

But what meane all Heretikes (may we iudge) by couetinge so much to be seene that which they are not? Forsooth they meane none other thinge, then their Father the Deuil meaneth, when he goeth about to begyle man. For then what dothe he? vseth he not this policie, to chaunge his owggly hewe, and put him selfe in goodly shape of an Angell of light? For he is not vnwittinge, that if he shewed him self in his owne forme, such as he is, that euery one would flie frõ him, and none lightly would be deceiued by him. Heretikes doo the like. Although they hate the Church neuer so deadly, yet to haue the more oportunitie to hurte it, pretende themselues to be of the Churche. For they be not ignorant, how great the auctoritie of the Churche is. Of whose gouernours Christe saide, he that heareth you, heareth me: and he that despiseth you, despiseth me. And againe, Tell the Church. They consider in what credite the Church is with all Christen people: how they slaye them selues by it, as being the pillour and grounde of the truthe: how they Loue her, euen as their common Mother, how they honour it, as the Body and fulnes of Christ, as the spouse of Christe through Faithe, accordinge to that is written, I will despouse thee to me in faith: As the true Syon, which our Lorde hath chosen to be his habitation, and his restinge place for euer: As the safe Arke to keepe vs from drowninge in the dangerous Seas of this world, out of whiche noe esse then once out of the Arke of Noe, is no saluation. Againe they know the Church must needes be greatly esteemed amonge all the godly, for the singular promises Christ hath made to it, that he would be with it al daies to the ende of the world: That he would pray to his father for the holy Ghost to be giuen to it, the spirite of truth to remaine with it for euer. But as Heretikes impugne the lawe by the woordes of the lawe, as S. Ambrose saithe, so to ouerthrowe the Churche, they presume to take vnto them the name of the Churche. But what doo Heretikes when they are vrged and wroonge, when by force of argumentes they are straighted, and as it were driuen to the walle? when it is plainely proued to their face, which is sone done, that they be not in, nor of the Churche, specially beinge of Heresie openly denounced, and by iuste Excommunication cutte of from the Church? In this case the practise of the Gospellers is, vtterly to sette the Churche at naught, and with a hote raginge spirite to defie it, and to saie, that them selues be the

Lucæ. 10.
Matth. 18.
1. Tim. 3.
Ephes. 1.
Osee. 2.
Psal. 131.
Genes. 7.

In comment. in epist. ad Tit. cap. 3.
The woonte of the Go-

Catholike Churche, and that the Catholikes be the Papisticall Church, the Churche of Antichriſt, the whore of Babylon, a denne of Theeues, and I can not tell what. ſpellen being excommunicate out of the Churche.

The Anſweare by the Biſhop of Sarisburie.

TO anſweare M. Hardinge to euery parcel of his Booke, beinge ſo longe, it would be to tedious. Wherefore leauinge many his impertinent ſpeeches, and other vnneceſſarie and waſte wordes, which ſundrie his friendes thinke, he might better haue ſpared, I wil touche onely ſo mutche thereof, as ſhal beare ſomme ſhewe of ſubſtance, and may any way ſeeme worthy to be anſweared.

First touchinge the Churche of God, we beleeue, and confeſſe al that M. Hardinge hath here ſaide, or otherwiſe can be ſaide. It is the Piller of the Truthe, the Body, the Fulneſſe, and Spouſe of Chriſte. Al theſe wordes are vndoubtedly true and certaine. And therefore, M. Hardinge, you are the more blameworthy, that of the Houſe of God, being ſo glorious, haue made a caue of Theeues: and haue turned the beautie of Sion into the confuſion of Babylon.

1. Tim 3. Epheſ. 1.

Leue it is, that Hereticques haue euermore appatelled them ſelues with the name of the Churche: as Antichriſte alſo ſhal procure him ſelfe credite vnder the name of Chriſte. Thus did your Fathers, M. Harding, long agoe. They ſaide then, euen as you ſaie nowe, *Wee are the Children of Abraham: wee are the Enheretours of Goddes promiſes: Wee haue the Temple of God, the Temple of God. The Lawe ſhal neuer paſſe from the Prieſte, nor counſel from the wiſe, nor the woorde from the Prophete.* Thus continuinge wilfully in the open breache of Goddes commaundement, neuertheleſſe they cheariſhed them ſelues then, as you do nowe, onely with the bare title of the Churche: in whoſe name what ſo euer credite yet can any wiſe winne, your meaninge is, ſkilfully to conueigh the ſame ouer wholy to the Churche of Rome: as if that Churche onely were the Church of God, and without that, there were no hope of Saluation. And therefore you defende, and holde for trueth, that your Churche hath authoritie aboue Goddes Worde. And Pope Nicolas ſaithe, *Who ſo denieth the Priuiledge, and Supremacie of the See of Rome, hath renounced the Faithe, and is an Heretique.* And thus, as Leo ſaithe, Eccleſiæ nomine armamini, & contra Eccleſiam dimicatis: *Ye arme your ſelues with the name of the Churche, and yet yee fight againſt the Churche.* Likewiſe ſaithe S. Cyprian: Diabolus excogitauit nouam fraudem, vt ſub ipſo nominis Chriſtiani titulo fallat incautos: *The Diuel hath diuiſed a newe kinde of policie, vnder the very title of the name of Chriſte to deceiue the ſimple.*

Iohan. 8. Hierem. 7. Hierem. 18.

De Maior. & Obedi. Vnam Sanctam. Diſt. 22. Omnes. Leo Epiſt 83. Ad Paleſtinos. Cypri. De Simplicitate prælat.

Now concerninge that hote raginge Spirite, wherewith M. Harding ſaithe, the Goſpellers defie the Churche and ſet it at naught, verily I thinke it a harde mater for any Goſpeller, be he neuer ſo hote, in ſutche kinde of eloquence to matche M. Hardinge. Neither yet may he wel condemne al ſutche, as in the like caſes haue bene hote, and earneſt. Eſay the Prophete ſaithe, *O ye Princes of Sodome, and ye people of Gomorrha:* Iohn the Baptiſt ſaithe to the Scribes, and Phariſeis, *O ye Serpentes, ye generation of Vipers, and Adders:* Chriſte ſaithe vnto them, *Woe be vnto you, ye Scribes, and Phariſeis, ye Hypocrites: Ye are of your Father the Diuel.* In theſe examples we ſee, the Spirite of God can ſometimes be hote and earneſt againſt the deceiuers of the people, and the profeſſed enimies of the Croſſe of Chriſte. Neither did either Eſay the Prophete, or Iohn the Baptiſte, or Chriſte, defie the Churche of God, and ſet it at naught, as M. Harding imagineth of vs: but rather by theſe feruent ſpeaches vttered the vehement zele, and iuſte gricke, they had conceiued againſt them, that vnder the name of the Churche abuſed Goddes people, and defaced the Churche.

Eſai 1. Matth. 3. Matth 23. Iohan. 8.

For they are not al Hereticques, M. Hardinge, that this daie eſpie your groſſe, and palpable errours, and mourne to God for reformation. S. Auguſtine ſaith, Non debet Ouis pellem ſuam deponere, quòd Lupi aliquando ſe ea contegant: *It is no reaſon, the Sheepe ſhould therefore leaue of his fliece, for that he ſeeth the Woulfe ſometime in the ſame*

Auguſt. Lib. 2. De Sermon. Domi in monte.

ſame apparel. Likewiſe, it is no reaſon, that we ſhould therefore geue ouer the right, and enheritance, we haue in the Churche of God, for that you by intruſion, and vniuſt meanes haue intituled your ſelues vnto the ſame. It behoueth vs rather to ſearche the Scriptures, as Chriſte hath adviſed vs, and thereby to aſſure our ſelues of the Churche of God. For by this trial onely, & by none other, it maie be knowen. Therefore S. Paule calleth the Churche the Spouſe of Chriſte, for that ſhe ought in al thinges to geue eare to the voice of the Bridegroome. Likewiſe he calleth the Church the Piller of the Truthe, for that ſhe ſtaieth her ſelfe onely by the Worde of God: Without which Worde the Churche, were it neuer ſo bewtiful, ſhould be no Churche. The Ancient Father Irenæus ſaith, Columna, & firmamentum Eccleſiæ eſt Euangelium, & Spiritus vitæ: *The Piller and buttreſſe of the Churche is the Goſpel, and the Sprite of life.* S. Auguſtine ſaith, Sunt certi Libri Dominici, quorum authoritati vtriq; cõſentimus. Ibi quæramus Eccleſiam: ibi diſcutiamus cauſam noſtram: *There be certaine Bookes of our Lorde, vnto the authoritie whereof eche parte agreeth: There let vs ſeeke for the Churche: thereby lette vs examine and trie our maters.* And againe, Nolo humanis documentis, ſed Diuinis oraculis ſanctam Eccleſiam demonſtrari: *I will, yee ſhewe me the holy Churche, not by decrees of menne, but by the woorde of God.* Likewiſe ſaith Chryſoſtome, Nullo modo cognoſcitur, quę ſit vera Eccleſia Chriſti, niſi tantummodo per Scripturas: *It can no waye be knowen, what is the Churche, but onely by the Scriptures.* And againe, Chriſtus mandat, vt volentes firmitatem accipere Veræ Fidei, ad nullam rem fugiant, niſi ad Scripturas. Alioqui ſi ad alia reſpexerint. Scandalizabuntur, & peribunt, non intelligentes, quæ ſit vera Eccleſia. Et per hoc incident in Abominationem Deſolationis, quæ ſtat in Locis Sanctis Eccleſiæ: *Chriſte commaundeth, that who ſo wil haue the aſſurance of True Faithe ſeeke to nothing els, but vnto the Scriptures. Otherwiſe, if they looke to any thinge els, they ſhalbe offended, and ſhal periſhe, not vnderſtandinge, whiche is the True Churche. And by meane hereof they ſhal fal into the Abomination of Deſolation, whiche ſtandeth in the Holy Places of the Churche.*

Irenæ. Lib. 3. Cap. 11.
Auguſt. De vita Eccle. Cap. 3.
Auguſt. in eodē Cap.
Chryſoſtom. In Opere Imperfecto, Homil. 49.
Chryſoſtom. in eadem Homilia.

By theſe Ancient learned Fathers it is plaine, that the Churche of God is knowen by Goddes Worde onely, and none otherwiſe. And therefore M. Harding, you ſo carefully flée the ſame, and condemne it for Hereſie, and often burne it, leſte thereby the deformities of your Churche ſhould be knowen. For the il doer feeth the light.

Iohan. 3.

Nowe, whereas it ſo wel liketh M. Hardinge to cal vs al Heretiques, and for his pleaſures ſake to liken vs to Apes, to Aſſes, and to the Diuel, notwithſtanding we might ſafely returne the ſame whole, from whence it came, yet I thinke it not ſeemely, nor greatly to purpoſe to anſweare al ſuche intemperate humours. Salomons aduiſe is good, Anſweare not folie with like folie. Notwithſtandinge, the poore ſimple Aſſe, vnto whome we are compared, was hable ſometime to ſée the Angel of God, and to open his mouth, and to ſpeake, and to reproue the lewde attempt of Balaam the falſe Prophete. What ſo euer accompt it pleaſeth M. Hardinge to make of vs, by the grace of God we are that we are. If we be hable to beare Chriſt with his Croſſe, it is ſufficient.

Prouerb. 26.
Numer. 22.

But who they be, that haue of longe time ſetted ſo terribly vnder the Lions ſkinne, and onely with a painted Viſarde, or emptie name of the Churche, haue feared al the cattel of the fielde, it is needeleſſe to ſpeake it: the worlde now ſeeth it: it can no longer be diſſembled. Euen he, that lately bare him ſelfe as the Lion of the tribe of Juda, and called him ſelfe [a] Kinge of Kinges, and [b] ſaide, he had power ouer the Angels of God, & amaſed the hartes of the ſimple with the terroor of his Lions pelte, onely for that he ſate in Peters Chaire, is now reuiſed and better knowen, and eſtéemed as he is worthy: he may nowe ſette vp and downe with more eaſe, and leſſe terrour. And why ſo? Theſe poore Aſſes, whome M. Harding ſo mutche diſdaigneth, haue ſtripte of his counterfeite ſkinne, that made him ſo hardy, and haue cauſed him to appeare euen as he is.

[a] Auguſtinus Steuchus, de primatu.
[b] See the fifthe parte hereof, the 6. Cap. and 15. Diuiſion.

The Apologie, Cap. 1. Diuiſion. 1.

It hath bene an olde complainte, euen from the firſte time of the

Patriarkes and Prophetes, and confirmed by the writinges and testimonies of euery age, that the Truth wandereth here and there as a straunger in the worlde, and dothe readily finde enimies and sclaunderers amongst those, that knowe her not. Albeit perchaunce this may seeme vnto some a thinge harde to be beleeued, I meane to sutche as haue scante wel and narowly taken heede therunto, specially seing al mankinde of natures very motion without a teacher doth coueite the Truthe of their owne accorde: and seinge our Sauiour Christe him selfe, when he was on earth, would be called the Truthe, as by a name moste fitte to expresse al his diuine power. Yet wee, whiche haue bene exercised in the holy Scriptures, and which haue both readde & seene, what hath happened to al godly menne commonly at al times, what to the Prophetes, to the Apostles, to the Holy Martyres, and what to Christe him selfe: with what rebukes, reuilinges, and despites, they were continually vexed, whiles they here liued, and that onely for the Truthes sake: Wee (I saie) doo see, that this is not onely no newe thinge, or harde to be beleeued, but that it is a thinge already receiued, and commonly vsed from age to age. Nay truely, this might seeme much rather a meruelle, and beyonde al beliefe, if the Diuel, who is the Father of lies, and enimie to al Truthe, woulde nowe vpon a suddaine chaunge his nature, and hope, that Truth might otherwise be suppressed, then by beleeing it: Or that he would beginne to establish his owne kingdome by vsinge nowe any other practises, then the same, whiche he hath euer vsed from the beginninge. For since any mans remembrance, wee can skante finde one time, either when Religion did firste growe, or when it was setled, or when it did afreshe springe vp againe, wherein Truthe and Innocencie were not by al vnwoorthy meanes, and most despitefully intreated. Doubtles the Diuel wel seeth, that so longe as truthe is in good saferie, him selfe cannot be safe, nor yet maintaine his owne estate.

Tertull. in Apologetico.

Iohan. 8.

For, letting passe the auncient Patriarkes and Prophetes, who, as wee haue saide, had no parte of their life free from contumelies and sclaunders: We knowe, there were certaine in times paste, which saide and commonly preached, that the olde auncient Iewes (of whome we make no doubte but they were the woorshippers of the onely and true God) did worship either a Sowe, or an Asse in Goddes steede, and that al the same Religion was nothinge els, but sacrilege, and a plaine contempt of al godlines. We know also, that the Sonne of God, our Sauiour Iesus Christe, when he taught the Truthe, was coumpted a Sorcerer and an Enchaunter, a Samaritane, Belzebub, a deceiuer of the People, a Drunkarde, and a Glutton. Againe, who woteth not, what woordes were spoken against S. Paule, the most earnest and vehement Preacher, and maintainer of the Truthe? Sometime, that he was a seditious and busie man, a raiser of tumultes, a causer of rebellion: sometime againe, that he was an Heretique: sometime, that he was mad: sometime, that onely vpon strife and stomake he was both a blasphemer of Gods lawe, and a despiser of the Fathers ordinances. Further who knoweth not, how S. Steuin, after he had throughly

Cornel. Tacitus, Annali. li. 11. Tertull. in Apologetico.

and

and ſincerely embraced the truthe, and beganne frankly and ſtoutly to preache and ſet forth the ſame, as he ought to doo, was immediatly called to anſweare for his life, as one that had wickedly vttered diſdainful and haynous woordes againſte the Lawe, againſte Moyſes, againſt the Temple, and againſt God. Or who is ignorant, that in tymes paſt there were ſome, whiche reproued the holy Scriptures of falſehed, ſayinge, they conteined thinges bothe contrary, and quite one againſt an other: and howe that the Apoſtles of Chriſte did ſeuerally diſagree betwixt them ſelues, and that S. Paule did varie from them al? And not to make rehersal of al, for that were an endles labour, who knoweth not, after what ſorte our Fathers were railed vpon in tymes paſte, whiche firſt began to acknowledge and profeſſe the name of Chriſte: how they made priuate conſpiracies, diuiſed ſecrete Counſels againſt the common wealth, and to that ende made early and priuie meetinges in the darke, killed ponge Babes, fedde them ſelues with mens fleaſh, and like ſauage and brute beaſtes, did drinke their Blonde? In concluſion, howe that after they had put out the candels, they committed Adulterie betwene them ſelues, and without regarde wrought inceſt one with an other: that Brethern laie with their Siſters, Sonnes with their Mothers, without any reuerence of nature or kinne, without ſhame, without difference: and that they were wicked men without al care of Religion, and without any opinion of God, being the very enimies of mankinde, vnworthy to be ſuffered in the worlde, and vnworthy of life?

Hiero. in Praemio in epiſt. ad Galat.

Hieron in Matthæ. li. 1. ca. 1.

Tertull. Contrá Marcion. Lib. 1. & Lib. 4.

Li. 5. ca. 2. Lactant.

Euſeb. Li. 5. C. 11.

Tertul. in Apologe.

All theſe thinges were ſpoken in thoſe daies againſt the people of God, againſt Chriſte Jeſus, againſt Paule, againſt Steuin, and againſt al them, whoſoeuer they were, whiche at the firſte beginninge imbraced the truth of the Goſpel, and were contented to be called by the name of Chriſtians: which was then an hateful name among the common people. And although the thinges which they laide, were not true, yet the Diuel thought it ſhoulde be ſufficient for him, if at the leaſt he coulde bringe it ſo to paſſe, as they might be beleued for true: & that the Chriſtians might be brought into a common hatred of euery bodie, & haue their death and deſtruction ſought of al ſortes. Hereupon Kinges and Princes beinge ledde then by ſuch perſuaſions, killed al the Prophetes of God, ſuffringe none eſcape: Eſay with a Sawe, Jeremie with ſtones, Daniel with Lions, Amos with an iron barre, Paule with the ſworde, and Chriſte vpon the Croſſe: and condemned al Chriſtians to impriſonmentes, to tormentes, to the pikes, to be throwne downe headlong from rockes and ſteepe places, to be caſt to wilde beaſtes, & to be burnt: and made great fiers of their quicke bodies, for the onely purpoſe to giue light by night, and for a very ſcorne and mockinge ſtocke: and did counpt them no better, then the vileſt filthe, the offcrouringes & laughinge gaines of the whole worlde. Thus (as ye ſee) haue the Authours and profeſſours of the truthe euer bene entreated.

Tertull. in Apolo.

Suetonius Tranquil. in Nerone.

M. Hardinge.

VVho would not thinke, that theſe defenders were true men, that in the beginninge of their Apologie ſpeake ſo muche of the truthe? Yet who knoweth not, that oftentimes euil meaninge is hidde vnder good woordes? VVho hath not hearde, that filthy queanes in time and place vſe the ho-

neſt talke of chaſte matrones? The theeſe commendeth iuſte dealinges, and many times ſheweth a ſtomake againſt falſe harlottes, no man more. Amonge al, none pretende truthe in woordes ſo much as Heretiques. I feare me, ſaithe S. Paule, leſt, as the Serpente beguiled Eue by his ſutteltie, ſo your 2. Cor. 11.
wittes be corrupted, and fallen away from that plainenes, whiche is in Chriſte. The Apoſtle feared becauſe of the craftie Iewes: who the rather to deceiue, mingled Scriptures with their owne traditions, and truthe with falſhead. So bringeth the Heretique his hearer to errour in faith by colour and pretence of truthe.

They are much like to the Manicheis, who promiſed their hearers to diſcuſſe, and ſet forthe the truth moſt euidently vnto them, and to deliuer them from all maner of errours. By which faire promiſes, S. Auguſtine was allured to be a diligent ſcholar of theirs for the ſpace of nine yeares. De Vtilit. Credēdi ad Honorati. Li. 1. Ca. 1.

Chriſte gaue vs a leſſon how to diſcerne them. By their fruites ye ſhall knowe them, ſaithe he. And now to you Sirs. Euen in the beginninge, and as I may ſaie, in the foreheade of your Apologie, whiles I examine it diligently, I finde two foule faultes: the one in your Rhetorike, the other in your Logike. By whiche two faultes bothe the vnskill of your Secretarie, and the weakenes of your mater maie be eſpied, as the Aſſe, I ſpake of right now, was by his two eares ſtaringe out vnder the Lions ſkinne. Your diuinitie is nothing els in groſſe, but a lumpe of lies, errours, and Hereſies. Confeſſ. l. 3. cap. 4. Math. 7.

Firſt touchinge your Rhetorike, emongſt many faultie procmes, one of the woorſt is that, which is ſuche, as the aduerſarie may vſe: whiche by them is called *Exordium commune*, that is to witte, ſuche a beginninge, as will ſerue the Defendant, no leſſe then the Plaintiſe, or contrariwiſe. Of that ſorte is the beginninge of your Apologie. For declaringe at large, that truthe hath euer benne perſecuted, what ſaithe it therein (the faultes amended) that we may not ſaie the ſame? That Shipmaiſter is accounpted very [illegible]ad, who at the ſettinge out of the hauen driueth the Ship on the rocke.

Alleaginge Ter[illegible]lian to healpe your cauſe, ye iniurie the Doctor by alteringe his woordes. Yee were not wiſe, by fal[illegible]ng the firſt ſentence, ſo much to impaire your credite. Tertullian ſaithe not, that truthe readily findeth enimies and ſclaunderers amongſt thoſe, that knowe her not: but that truth ſone findeth enimies *inter extraneos*, amongſt aliantes and ſtrangers. Now the Chriſtian Catholikes, whom ye cal Papiſtes, be not in reſpect of the truthe, aliantes, and ſtrangers. For your ſelues in ſundry places of your Booke, reproue them for reſiſtinge the truthe whiche they knowe.

You haue geuen Tertullian a newe liuerie with your owne badge, and haue made exchaunge of *Extraneos* with *Ignotos*. Tertullian meante by aliantes no other then Infidels, and Paynimes: emonge whom Chriſten people then liued, and were dayly perſecuted. But after the Goſpell had benne ſounded abroade by the Apoſtles, and their ſucceſſours through all the earth, after that the Emperours them ſelues, and all the people euery where had receiued the faithe, then was the truth no more a wanderer, ſtranger, or Pilgrime in the earthe.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Touchinge this comparison of Whores, and Theues, and other like, M. Pardinges vngentle ſpeches, as I haue before proteſted, I wil ſaie nothinge. He is very doumbe, and can ſpeake but little, that cannot ſpeake ill.

It is true, M. Pardinge, that you ſaie: Moſt Lyers oftentimes pretende moſt Truthe: as, if there were none other example, maie ſone appeare by the whole tenour and ſubſtance of your Bookes. The Diuel him ſelfe, the better to founde his Lyes, beareth him ſelfe oftentimes as the Angel of Truthe.

But the example, that ye bringe of the Iewes, who, as you ſaie, the rather to deceiue, mingled Scripture with their owne Traditions, and Truthe with falſehed, maketh moſt plainely againſt your ſelf. For you knowe, that this is the generall complainte of al the Godly this day throughout the whole Church of God, that you haue mingled your Leade with the Lordes Coulde, and haue filled the Lordes Parneſt ful of your Darnel: that you haue broken Goddes manifeſt commaundements, to vpholde, and mainteine your owne Traditions: That you haue dammed vp the Springes of the Water of Life, and haue broken vp puddles of your owne, ſuche as be hable to holde no water: That for your dreames ſake, you haue cauſed the people to forgeat the name of God, and haue ledde them from that ſimplicitie, that is in Chriſte Ieſu. This is the minglinge of Traditions with the Scriptures of God. I maruelle, ye coulde ſo frayly bitter ſo mutche, and ſo directly againſt your ſelfe.

2. Corinth. 11.

Matth. 15.

Hierem. 2.

Hierem. 3.

2. Corinth. 11.

See what is anſwered in the fourth parte herof. Ca. 1. Diſ. 1. In quæſt. in Nouum Teſta. q. 72.

As for the example of the Manicheis, it was vtterly impertinent, and from the pourpoſe. Yet (good Reader) that thou maiſt vnderſtande, what manner of Heretiques theſe Manicheis were, and what errours they defended: firſt they forbade Lawful Marriage, and allowed fornication, as M. Pardinges Catholiques do now. So ſaithe S. Auguſtine of them, Nuptiarum aditus intercludunt: & promiſcuè conuenire hortantur.

Addition.

Addition. ☞ Hereunto M. Hardinge saithe, You slaunder vs M. Iewel, moste vniustly and impudently. The Catholiques neuer forbade lawful Marriage. And it is knowen to al the worlde, that Fornication was neuer allowed in the Catholique Churche at any time or age. And the Manicheis by your pretensed prouse out of S. Augustine excluded al men frō Marriage generally. M. Hard. fo. 81. a M. Hard. fo. 81. b

1. 2. 3.

1. *The Answeare.* To the first parte hereof, I graunt: Lawful Marriage was neuer forbidden in the Catholique Churche, that is to saie, in the whole Vniuersal Churche throughout the worlde. For it is knowen, that the Priestes in India, Aethiopia, Aphrica, Asia, Græcia &c. haue continued stil in Lawful Marriage, from the beginninge, vnto this daie, without any restraint, or force to the contrarie. But in the Churche of Rome, the Marriage of Priestes, hathe benne, and is forbidden. And the same in al other Churches is iudged lawful, as it was also in the Patriarkes, Prophetes, Apostles, Martyres, and other Holy Fathers, & generally in the whole Primitiue Churche of Christe. Neither is it Marriage, but the vnlawful restrainte of Marriage, that S. Paule calleth the Doctrine of Deuilles. 1. *Timoth.* 4.

2. Secondly, notwithstandinge M. Hardinge saie, Fornication was neuer allowed in the Catholique Churche, yet verily in the Churche of Rome, it hath benne allowed, as by good recorde, and general practise it maie appeare. M. Hardinge him selfe calleth the open Stewes in Rome, A necessarie il, for auoiding of other disorders, that would be greater: and so farre forthe, he maketh them allowable by waie of Necessitie. And further, to this pourpose, in defense herof, vnaduisedly he allegeth these wordes of S. Augustine: *Take Harlottes awaie from emonge mennе, and yee fille al the countrie with ribaudrie, and villanie.* Vnaduisedly, I saie, he allegeth theise wordes. For when Augustine wrote the same, he was neither Sainct, nor Bishop, nor Priestе, nor Christian man. In the conclusion, he saithe vnto vs, In good sooth, Maisters, yee are too yonge to controlle the Cittie of Rome in her doinges. Here M. Hardinge, I praie you, tel vs, wherefore maie we not controlle the Cittie of Rome in her open filthinesse, onlesse in somme special respectes you thinke it lawful? In fewe wordes, touchinge the allowance, and smothinge of Fornication, the practise of the Churche of Rome is this. Etsi notoria sit Fornicatio Presbyterorum, tamen non propter eam abstinendum est ab officijs illorū: *Yea, although the Fornication of the Priestе be notorious, yet maie no man therefore refraine from his seruice.* That thinge is notorious, saithe the Lawe, that needeth neither Accuser, nor Iudge, but is cleare and manifest of it selfe. And notwithstanding somme of the Canonistes haue written otherwise of Fornication, yet by these wordes it is passed, as a mater allowable. M. Hard. Confutation. fol 162. b M. Hard. Confutation fol. 162. a *Augustin. de ordine. Li. 2. ca. 4.* M. Hard. Confuta. fol. 163. a Dist. 32. Nullus. Ioan. Andrea.

3. Thirdely, whereas M. Hardinge saithe, The Manicheis excluded not onely theire Priestes and Clergie, but also generally al manner of men from the vse of Marriage, as thinking it in al men to be vnlawful. S. Augustines manifeste wordes to the contrarie, are able both to cleare the pore Manicheis in this behalfe, and also to reproue his open Errour. These be his wordes: Hic non dubito vos esse clamaturos, inuidiamq; facturos, perfectam Castitatem vos vehementer commendare, non tamen Nuptias prohibere. Quandoquidem Auditores vestri, quorum apud vos secundus est gradus, ducere, atque habere non prohibentur Vxores: *Here, I doubte not, but you, Manicheis, wil make outcries vpon vs, and procure vs displeasure. For you wil saie, yee greatly commende perfite Chastitie, and yet, for al that forbidde not Marriage. For, your Hearers, whiche are an inferiour, or seconde degree emongeste you, are not forbidden to Marrie, and haue Wiues.* Like wise he writeth in an Epistle vnto Deuterius: Auditores, qui appellantur apud eos, & carnibus vescuntur, & agros colunt, &, si Voluerint, Vxores habent: quorum nihil faciunt illi, qui vocantur Electi: *They, that emonge them be called the Hearers, doo both eate flesshe, and tille their grounde, and, if they liste, Marrie Wiues: of al which thinges, they that be called Electi, doo nothinge.* M. Hard. fo. 81. b *Augustin. De Moribus Manich. Lib. 2. Cap. 18.* *Augustin. Epist. 74*

Nowe, good Reader, examine thou a litle these witnesses, and compare them together. M. Hardinge saithe, The Manicheis forbade al men from Marriage generally without exception. S. Augustine saithe, *The* Manicheis *forbade not their Hearers, which were of their Laitie, to be Married, nor thought it vnlawful for them to haue Wiues.* Thei thought Marriage vnlawful onely in theire Priestes, and Ministers, whiche emonge them were called Electi. And euen so, as I said, doo this daie M. Hardinges Catholiques. M. Hard. fo. 81. b

Wherefore hauinge him selfe misreported bothe S. Augustine, and the Manicheis, & also vttering so many vntruthes in one place, there was no cause, why he should vse this pitiful outcrie in the end: Behold Reader, how immoderatly M. Iewel sclaundereth vs. For, as it maie hereby appeare, it is the truthe: it is no sclaunder.

Leo Serm 4. De Quadragesima. Augus. Epist 19. Augu. con. Faustum. Li. 32. ca. 19 M. Har. fo. 220. b

Secondly they receiued, & ministred the Holy Mysteries vnder one kinde, contrarie to the generall order of the Catholique Churche. And so dothe M. Hardinge nowe. Thirdly they preiudged more credite to their owne diuises, then to Gods Holy Worde. And where as the Scriptures were plaine againste them, they saide, euen as M. Hardinge saithe, The Scriptures were falsified, and ful of Erroures.

Addition. Albeit in deede he dareth not so boldly by expresse wordes to chalenge the Scriptures: he thinketh it better shil rather to laie the faulte in vulgare Translations. And yet the worste Translation, that this date is commonly vsed, either in the Englishe, or in the Frenche, or in the Duitche tongue, as he him selfe wel knoweth, is farre better, and truer, then the olde common Translation in the Latin. Addition

Aug. de Maiorib Manichæ. Lib. 2. Cap. 15. Peregrinas & exquisitas fruges multis fere oculis variatas. Aug. de Maiorib Manichæ. Li. 2. Cap 13.

Fourthly they abstained from fleashe: and yet in their fast, they had and vsed al manner delicate and strange fruites, with sundrie sortes of Spices in great aboundaunce: They abstained from Wine, and yet vsed other liquours more deintie, and pretious, then any Wine, and thereof dranke while their bellies would holde. S. Augustines wordes thereof be these: Distenti, & crepantes. I leaue the rest. Nowe iudge thou, gentle Reader, whether partie semeth to resemble the Manicheis.

But whereas he thus vpbraideth vs, By their fruites ye shal knowe them. Verily whiles the Bishop of Rome euen in the Cittie of Rome maintaineth his houses of Ribaudrie, and open Stewes, and M. Harding is ready, and able by his eloquence and Diuinitie to defende the same, they haue no iuste cause, greatly to boaste them selues of their fruites. How be it, it maie be thought, Christ gaue vs this lesson, not therby to trie the true Doctrine from the false, but a true professour from an Hypocrite. Otherwise our liues must be tried by the Gospel, not the Gospel by our liues.

Nowe let vs examine that horrible Heresie, that M. Hardinge hath espied in the Rules of Rhetorique, by whiche, saithe he, the Secretaries vnskil is betraied, euen in the forefronte of our Booke. This entrie, saithe M. Hardinge, touchinge the complaint of Truthe, is so indifferent and common to both the parties, that either maie vse it as wel as other. Whiche kinde of beginninge, saithe he, is called Exordium commune, & by the learned in Rhetorique is misliked as faultie. First of al, M. Hardinge, this semeth to me a straunge kinde of beginninge, in so deepe a disputation of Diuinitie, to make your first quarrel vnto Rhetorique. Belike for lacke of better Entrie, ye thought it good to rushe in as you might. In deede either of vs maie seeme to stande in Defense of Truthe. I denie it not. For as we haue the substance, and Truthe it selfe, so are you content to claime the name. And so farre forth Truthe is common to vs both. So the wicked Heathens Celsus, and Antiphon, notwithstandinge they published their Bookes againste the Truthe, yet they entituled the same ἀληθολόγον, the Booke of Truthe. S. Hierome saith. Mendacium semper imitatur Veritatem: *Falshed euermore beareth a shewe of Truthe.* In this sorte Truthe is common to either partie. Origen saithe, Veritas Christus: simulata Veritas Antichristus: *Christe is the Truthe it selfe: Antichriste is the Truthe counterfeite.* Al this notwithstandinge, Christe refused not to vse the same kinde of Entrie, that M. Harding so much misliketh: but saide vnto the Pharisees, *Ye seeke to murder me, a man that haue tolde you the Truthe:* And S. Paule to the Romaines saithe, *They haue turned the Truthe of God into falshed.* The like might I laie of Tertullian, Cyprian, and other Fathers. Yet, I trowe, M. Hardinge wil not therefore, reproue either Christe, or Paule, or Tertullian, or Cyprian: nor saie, they vsed suche a Beginninge, as their aduersaries might haue vsed as wel as they, and had forgotten their Rules of Rhetorique.

Origen contra Celsum. Lib. 3. & Lib 4 In Hierem. ca 23 Origen in Matthæ. Tractat 27.

Iohan. 8. Roman. 1.

Lothe I am so longe to stande in so light a mater. But I marueile muche, that M. Hardinge beinge so greate an Artificer in so smal cases, had no better eie to his owne Entrie. For if in writinge the Defense of Truthe, it be a fault in Rhetorique to be-

to beginne with the ill intreatinge, and complaintes of Truthe, what then maie we thinke it to be in the Defence of manifeste and knowen errours, to beginne, as M. Hardinge doth, with Whores, with Theeues, with Apes, with Asses, with Children of the Diuel, and with many other like vnsemely scoffes, and scornes? What Rhetorique, what Eloquence, what Arte, what Skill is this? What Orator euer vsed it? what Rhetorician, what Sophiste, Greke, or Latine euer taught it? Verily this was sommetime accounpted an olde rule in Rhetorique, which it seemeth M. Hardinge hath quite forgotten: Scurrilis Oratori dicacitas magnopere fugienda est. This Secretaries Beginninge, by M. Hardinges owne confession is suche, as either partie indifferently might wel haue vsed. But M. Hardinges Beginninge is suche, as neither partie, with any modestie, might haue vsed. Cic. De Orator. Lib. 2.

M. Hardinge also might haue remembred, that the skilful in Rhetorique, as they mislike Exordium Commune, so thy also mislike Commune Argumentum, that is a Reason, or Proofe so Common, that it maie indifferently serue both parties. Which kinde of proofes if M. Hardinge would haue worded out of his Bookes, he shoulde haue leafte very litle to trouble the Printer. Cicer. Lib. 1. De Inuentione: Argumentum commune vitiosum est.

Where he saithe in grosse, that oure Apologie is nothinge els, but a lumpe of Lies: the Truthe therof, I truste, shal appeare by this Treatie. In the meane season, good Christian Reader, it maie please the to consider, that M. Hardinges mouth is no iuste measure in this behalfe. For somme men thinke, it wil oftentimes vtter Untruthe without measure. But he saithe, we haue falsified Tertullians meaninge, placinge this worde Ignotos, in steade of Extraneos, and so at our pleasure makinge exchange of wordes, and geuinge the olde Father a newe Liuerie, and thereby empairinge our whole credite. A greate outcrie in so smal a mater. This greate exchange of wordes is nothinge so hainous as it is pretended. For bothe Ignotus is Extraneus, and Extraneus also in Tertullians meaninge is Ignotus. And M. Hardinge wel knoweth, that Tertullian speaketh namely, and onely of suche Aliens and Strangers, as knewe not the Truthe of God. Whether of these two wordes it shal like him to leaue vs, the sense is al one: it forceth nothinge. If he will needes refuse this worde, Ignotus, so that he receiue the other worde, Extraneus, I graunt, that he and his felowes be Strangers, to Goddes Truthe, it shalbe sufficiente.

Howe be it he addeth further, that they of his side are nowe no Strangers, but knowe God, and his deare frindes, and kinsfolke. Euen so said the Phariseis of them selues, Nunquid & nos Cæci sumus? *What be we blinde too?* But Christe answered them, *If ye were blinde, then had ye no sinne. Nowe ye saie, that ye see: Therefore your sinne remaineth ful.* And againe, *I am come to Iudgement into the worlde, that they that see, maie be made blinde.* And againe, *The Children of the kingedome shalbe throwen foorthe into vtter darkenesse.* Iohan. 9. Iohan. 9. Matthe. 8.

Yet further M. Hardinge saithe, After that the Gospel had ben sounded abroade by the Apostles, and theire Successoures, then was the Truthe no more a Stranger, or a Pilgrime in Earthe. Whereby he woulde closely conclude, that his Church of Rome can neuer erre. But this is to vaine a Paradise. For Daniel speakinge of the later daies saithe, Veritas prosternetur in Terra: *The Truthe shalbe ouerthrowen in Earthe.* Chrysostome saithe, Abominatio Desolationis stabit in Sanctis Locis Ecclesiæ: *The Abomination of Desolation shal stande in the Holy Places of the Churche.* S. Augustine saithe, Vsque ad huius sæculi finem, inter persecutiones mundi, & consolationes Dei peregrinando procurrit Ecclesia: *Until the worldes ende, the Churche goeth forwarde, as it were in a Pilgrimage, betweene the persecutions of the worlde, and the comforte of God.* And againe, Tota Ciuitas Dei peregrinatur in Terris: *The whole Cittie of God (whiche is the Churche) is a Stranger, and a Pilgrime in the Earthe.* Verily as longe as Satan the Prince of darkenesse is Prince of this worlde, so longe the Truthe of God passeth in this worlde as a Stranger: and beinge emonge Strangers, as Tertullian saithe, easily findeth enimies, and is ill intreated. He saithe further, Cæterum vnum hoc gestit, ne ignorata damnetur: *This onely thinge Truthe desireth, that no man condemne her, before he knowe her.* Daniel 8. Chryso. in Opere Imperfecto. Homil. 49. August. de Ciuita Dei. Li. 18. Cap 51. De Ciuit Lib. 19 Cap 27. Tertullian. in Apologetico.

The

Wherfore we ought the more quietly, which haue taken vpon vs to profesſe the Goſpel of Chriſte, if wee for the ſame cauſe be handled after the ſame ſorte: and if we, as our Forefathers were longe agoe, be likewiſe at this daie tormented, and baited with raylinges, with ſpiteful dealinges, and with Lies: and that for no deſerte of oure owne, but onely becauſe we teache and acknowledge the Truthe.

M. Hardinge.

O bleſſed ſolowers of the Patriarkes, Prophetes, Apoſtles, Martyres, and Chriſte him ſelfe, that ſuffer ſo much perſecution in your innocencie, hauinge deſerued nothinge at al, and onely becauſe ye acknowledge, and teache the Truthe. But Sirs, by your leaue, howe ſoloweth this (VVherefore) of your former common place ſo largely treated? This is your fowle faulte, whiche you make in youre Logike. Howe proue ye this argumente: The Truthe is perſecuted, and the profeſſours of the Truth haue euer benne euil treated: wherefore wee oughte to beare it quietly beinge likewiſe handled for the ſame cauſe, &c. If you make this argumente, whiche ye ſeeme priuely to make, leauinge out the Minor, The profeſſours of the Truthe be perſecuted for the Truthes ſake: wee be profeſſours of the Truthe: Therefore wee ſuffer perſecution for the Truthes ſake: If ye ſaie thus, wee embarre you from youre Concluſion, by denyinge your Minor, whiche ye can neuer proue.

And if ye reaſon thus, whiche waie alſo ye ſeeme to vſe: The profeſſours of the Truthe ſuffer perſecution: VVe ſuffer perſecution. Ergo, we are profeſſours of the Truthe. VVee graunte your Minor is true. But your Argument is naught. So might al Heretikes ſaie, and by that argument proue them ſelues right beleeuers. VVherefore vntil ye proue, that ye ſuccede the Patriarkes, Prophetes, Apoſtles, Martyres, and Chriſte him ſelfe in profeſſinge the Truthe, bouſte not, as ye doo, of your Forefathers. For not they whom ye name in your Proeme, but Hus, VVickleffe, Peter Bruſe, Berẽgarius, VValdenſes, Albigenſes, Donatiſtes, Aerians, Manicheis, and ſuche the like Heretikes, iuſtly condemned of the Churche, were your Forefathers.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

M. Hardinge pretendeth Logique, and endeth in Sophiſtrie. The Argumente, wee make, wherewith he plaieth ſo pleaſantly, is founded vpon theſe wordes of Chriſte: *The Scholare is not aboue his Maiſter, nor the Seruaunte aboue his Lorde: If they haue perſecuted me, they wil perſecute you. Al theſe thinges ſhal they doo vnto you for my names ſake, becauſe they knowe neither my Father, nor me.* **The** Minor **is this, wee ſuccede the Apoſtles, and Martyres, and are the profeſſours of the Truthe. Whiche** Minor, **by M. Hardinges iudgement, wee can neuer proue. But Goddes holy name be bleſſed for euer: The greateſte parte of Chriſtendome this daie ſeeth this** Minor **is true, and that bothe we are the profeſſours of Goddes knowen Truthe, and you the profeſſours of manifeſte falſehed. Touchinge the** Donatiſtes, **and Manicheis, and al other like condemned Heretiques, and Hereſies, wee vtterly abhorre them, euen as the gates of Helle. As for** Iohn VVickleffe, Iohn Huſſe, Valdo, **and the reſte, for ought we knowe, and I beleue, ſettinge malice aſide, for ought you knowe, they were Godly menne. Their greateſt Hereſie was this, that they complained of the diſſolute, and vitious liues of the Clergie, of worſhippinge of Images, of feined Myracles, of the tyrannical pride of the Pope, of Monkes, Freers, Pardons, Pilgrimages, and Purgatorie, and other like deceiuinge, and mockinge of the people, and that they wiſhed a reformation of the Churche. Wee ſuccede not them, nor beare theire names. Wee ſuccede him, whoſe worde we profeſſe: whoſe worde, M. Hardinge, thei of your ſide haue ſo often condemned, & vnder a coloure of falſe Tranſlation haue burnte for Hereſie.**

Matth. 10. Iohan. 15.

Alphonſus de Hæreſibus.

Bartholome. Abramus in conſil Ferrarien.

M. Hard fo. 81. b

Addition. ☞ **Here M. Hardinge addeth further, VVickleffe helde, that a** Biſhop **beinge in deadly ſinne is no Biſhop: That God ought to obeie the Diuel, &c. Theſe and other like errours were alleged againſte him, fourtie yeres after he was drade, and coulde not be preſent to make his anſweare.** Addition ☞

As touchinge the former of theſe two Errours, wee defende it not. But if it be an Hereſie, and an hereſie ſo grieuous as M. Hardinge maketh it, why then is not Pope Zacharie **charged alſo with like Hereſie? For thus he writeth, as it may ſeeme to none other pourpoſe then VVickleffe did:** Quis ſapiens iudicabit eos eſſe Sacerdotes, qui nec à Fornicationibus abſtinent? *What wiſe man wil recken them to be Prieſtes, that abſtaine not ſo muche as from Fornication?* **This ſaieinge is no leſſe preiudicial,**

Conc. Tom. 2. Epiſt. Zachariæ ad Bonifacium Pag. 454.

nor

nor lesse maime to the Clergie of Rome, then the other of VVickleffe. For it is recorded for mater of truthe, Pauci ſſne illo vitio inueniuntur: *There are fewe Prieſtes founde without that faulte.* And ſo by the iudgement of the Pope him ſelfe, in the whole multitude of the Romaine Clergie we maie happen to finde not many Prieſtes. If this Hereſie be ſo horrible in the one, why is it ſo eaſily diſſembled in the other? Diſt. 81. Maximianus in glo.

The ſecond Errour, that here is noted, That God ought to obeie the Diuel, hath neither colour, nor ſauour of any truthe. It importeth, that God is weake, & the Diuel Omnipotent: or rather, that God is a Creature, & the Diuel is God. Which blaſphemie the Diuel him ſelf would neuer haue vttered. God be thanked: M. Harding can allege no ſuche wordes out of any Booke written by VVickleffe, although he wrote many. The report of an enimie maketh no proufe. Neither is there any enimie ſo malitious, no not M. Hardinge him ſelfe, if he beholde his owne conſcience, that wil beleue it. But alas, good Chriſtian Reader, were theſe the Errours, that ſo troubled the worlde, & cauſed ſo many Archebiſhoppes, Biſhoppes, Abbates, and Freres, to the number of one thouſande and three hundred, to mete togeather in Generall Councel? No certainely, there were other greater Hereſies, that vexed them more. They ſaide, that the Pope, and his Clergie, by theſe Newe Articles of Tranſubſtantiation, and other like fantaſies, had detained the people. They ſaide, that in the Holy Sacrament, after the conſecration, there remaineth ſtil, the very Material Subſtance, of Breade and Wine, as the Ancient Catholique learned Fathers S. Auguſtine, S. Chryſoſtome, Theodoretus, and others haue ſaid before them. They ſaide, Chriſte is not in the Sacramente Really, or in Fleſhly manner, or by the Naturall preſence of his Body. They ſaide, as the Olde learned Fathers ſaie, That the Sacrament by Nature is very Breade, and that the ſame by waie of a Figure is Chriſtes Body: And that vndoubtedly theſe wordes, This is my Body, implie a Figure, as wel as theſe wordes, Iohn Baptiſte is Elias. Concil. Conſtan. tien. Concil. Conſtanc. Seſſio. 13. Artic. 1 Articul. 3. Artic. Ioh. Hus.

They ſaide, It cannot be proued by the Goſpel, that Chriſte euer ordeined the Maſſe, as then it was vſed. They ſaid, that a Biſhop Excommunicating a Clerke, appealing either to the Kinge, or to the Parliament, is a traitour both to the Kinge, and his Countrie. They ſaide, It was greate folie to put affiance in Popes Pardons. They ſaide, It is not neceſſarie to ſaluation, to beleue, that the Churche of Rome is the Heade of al other Churches, And that the Pope, is not the nexte, and immediate Vicare of Chriſte. Articul. VVickleffe 5. Articul. 12. Artic. 42. Articul 41.

Theſe were the cauſes, that enflamed the Biſhoppes to ſo cruel diſpleaſure, to burne Iohn Huſſe at the Councel of Conſtance, contrarie to the Emperoures ſafe Conduite, and their owne ſpecial promiſſe: and contrarie to al humanitie, and ſenſe of Nature, to digge vp, and to burne the body of Iohn VVickleffe fourtie yeres after he had benne buried.

Hereof we forme our argument in this ſorte: Chriſte the Sonne of God was perſecuted, & carried as a Lamme vnto the Slauterhouſe for ſpeaking the Truthe: Therefore it behoueth vs for the ſame cauſe ſufferinge the like, to take it with patience. So ſaithe S. Peter, *Chriſte died for vs, leauinge vs an example, that we ſhoulde follow his ſteppes. If we ſuffer patiently for doinge wel, this thinge is thanke worthy before God.* So the Holy Father and Martyr Ignatius comforted him ſelfe, when he was in the middes of his tormentes: Iam incipio eſſe Diſcipulus Chriſti: *Nowe beginne I to be Chriſtes Diſciple.* So Tertullian: Quid debeo, niſi ſanguinem, quem pro me fudit Filius Dei? *What thinge owe I els, but the Blonde, whiche the Sonne of God hathe ſhedde for me?* The like comforte in like caſes Chriſte geueth to his Diſciples, *Reioyce yee (ſaith he) and be gladde, for youre rewarde is greate in Heauen. For thus haue they perſecuted the Prophetes, that were before you.* 1. Pet. 2. Euſeb. li 3. ca 36 Tertul. de Fuga. in perſecutione. Matth. 5.

The Apologie, Cap. 2. Diuiſion. 2.

They crie out vpon vs at this preſente euery where, that wee are al Heretiques, & haue forſaken the Faithe, & haue with newe perſuaſions and wicked learninge vtterly diſſolued the concorde of the Churche.

M.

M. Hardinge.

Vntruthe. Yf ye haue forsaken the Faithe, ye were Baptized ſti, if ye be gonne from the Faithe, whiche S. Eleutherius Pope and Martyre the firſte Apoſtle of Britaine preached in this lande, by Damianus and Fuganus within fulle more then one hundred yeres after Chriſtes deathe, if ye refuſe the Faithe whiche Gregorie the Greate that holy Pope cauſed to be preached to our Auncetours the Engliſhe nation by Auguſtinus, Melitus, and other holy Prieſtes, and haue thereby diſſolued the vnitie of the Catholique Churche, and leaue not to maintaine the Doctrine, whereby the ſame vnitie is diſſolued. al this preſuppoſed, wee ſee not but that this crie made vpon you is true: For then are ye Heretikes in deede. Damianus and Fuganius firſte Apoſtles of the Britons. Auguſtine and Melit of the Engliſhe.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

As wel this repoꝛte of Eleutherius, as alſo the other noted in the margin of Auguſtine, that the one was the firſte Apoſtle of the Bꝛitannes, the other of the Engliſhe, are bothe vntrue. Foꝛ it is certaine, that the Churche of Bꝛitannie, nowe called Englande, receiued not firſt the Faithe from Rome. Lucius the kinge of this Countrie had receiued the Goſpel of Chꝛiſte, and was Baptized welneare one hundꝛed and fiftie yeres befoꝛe the Emperour Conſtantine: and the ſame Conſtantine the firſte Chꝛiſtened Emperour was boꝛne in this Ilande. And notwithſtanding Eleutherius the Biſhop of Rome, at the kinges ſpecial requeſt, ſente hither Fugatius, and Damianus, to encourme the Biſhoppes and Clergie, and to bꝛinge thinges to better oꝛdeꝛ, yet vndoubtedly the Churche and Faithe of Chꝛiſte had benne planted here a longe while befoꝛe they came, either by Ioſeph of Arimathæa: oꝛ (as Theodoretus wꝛiteth) by S. Paule the Apoſtle paſſinge this waie into Spaine: oꝛ (as Nicephorus ſaithe) by Simon Zelotes: oꝛ by the Greekes: oꝛ by ſomme others.

Gildas. Polydorus. Theodoret. De Curandis Græcorũ affectibus. Niceph. li. 2. c. 4.

M. Har. fo. 83. b. *Addition.* ☞ Here M. Iewel (ſaithe M. Hardinge) extremely belieth Theoretus, and Nicephorus. *The Anſweare.* The extremitie of theſe ſo hoꝛrible Lies, ſtandeth onely in that I ſaie, Paule the Apoſtle, and Simon Zelotes were in perſon within this Ilande, and preached the Goſpel: which thing, whether it be true, oꝛ no, it weigheth not greatly, I diuiſed it not. It is alleged by Flacius Illyricus, Iohannes Vigandus, & Matthæus Iudex, and auouched by the Authoꝛitie of Theodoretus, and Sophronius the Patriarke of Hieruſalem. Their woꝛdes be theſe: Theodoretus lib 9 De curandis Græcorum affectibus indicat, Paulum è priori Captiuitate Roma dimiſſum Britannis, & alijs in Occidente, Euangelium prædicaſſe. Idem ferè tradit Sophronius Hieroſolimitanus Patriarcha. This therefoꝛe, good Reader, is not ſo greate extremitie of Lieinge, ſauinge that it liketh M. Hardinge ſo to calle it. I allege mine Authoures, and ſhewe the places. What Copies theſe Learned menne folowed, I haue not to anſweare. Addition ☞

Centuria 1. Li. 2 Cap. 2.

Againe, where I ſaie, Simon Zelotes arriued once into this Ilande, & here planted the Goſpel, foꝛ pꝛoufe thereof alleginge the Authoꝛitie of Nicephorus, al this M. Hardinge hathe likewiſe condemned foꝛ an other extreme Lie. Wherein whether of vs two is moꝛe extremely deceiued, I am contente him ſelfe ſhal be the Iudge. The woꝛdes of Nicephorus are theſe: Simon Zelotes Doctrinam Euangelij ad Occidentalium Oceanum, Inſulaſque Britannicas perfert: Simon Zelotes *carried the Doctrine of the Goſpel into the Weaſte Ocean Sea, and into the Ilandes of Britannie.* If M. Hardinge had weighed the mater better, he would not haue benne ſo readie in dealinge of Lies. ☞

Nicepher. lib. 2. cap. 40.

As foꝛ our Auguſtine of Englande, foꝛ it was not S. Auguſtine the learned Doctour, neither was he ſo godly a man, as M. Hardinge maketh him: foꝛ as it maie appeare by that Galfridus wꝛiteth of him, he was cruel, diſdeigneful, pꝛowde, & arrogante, and no waie meete to be called an Apoſtle.

Galfridus Li. 8. Cap. 4.

Addition. ☞ Here M. Hardinge ſaith, I haue vnder the name of Galfridus, immoderately ſclaunderd that Bleſſed Apoſtle, foꝛ ſo he nameth him. Addition ☞

The Anſweare. But howe Bleſſed he was, & howe like vnto one of Chꝛiſtes Apoſtles, it maie appeare. In deede al theſe woꝛdes are not expꝛeſſely vttered neither by Galfridus, noꝛ by Beda. Howe be it, the whole effecte thereof maie ſone be founde. Firſt, his pꝛide was apparant in that, he, beinge a mere ſtranger, lately aꝛriued, & vnacquainted, diſdeigned to ſtand vp from his Chaire, oꝛ to ſhew any kind of

Beda li. 2. cap. 2.

courteſie

courteſie to the Biſhops of this Realme, appearinge before him at a Synode: which thinge, as Beda witneſſeth, they iudged to proceede of immoderate ſtatelineſſe, and in contempte of them. Againe he ſhewed his crueltie, in that, as it is written in Frenche by Thomas Graie, an olde Chronicler, beinge refuſed of the Chriſtian Britaines, he enflamed Ethelbertus the kinge of Kent, to leade his power, and to warre againſt them, him ſelfe alſo beinge in companie, as in the Olde Abſtracte of Chronicles it is recorded, and marchinge with him towardes the ſlaughter. Of the bloudy crueltie, & extremitie, that there was ſhewed, Thomas Graie ſaith thus, *They had no more regard of mercie, then a wouſſe hath vpon a Shepe.* Of ỹ innocent Chriſtian Bowthes, that there were ſlaine, Galfridus ſaith thus, Mille ducenti eorum in ipſa die Martyrio decorati, regni cœleſtis adepti ſunt ſedem: *A thouſand and two hundred of them being that daie honoured with Martyredome, obteined a ſeate in the Kingedome of Heauen.* Nowe M. Hardinge if they were Saintes, & Martyrs, that ſo were murthered, what Saincte then was your Auguſtine, that was the Raiſer, & procurer of that murther?

Thomas Graie.

The Abſtracte of Chronicles.

Galfridus. Li 8. Cap. 4.

Neither was he the firſte planter of the Faithe within this Iſlande. For the Faithe was planted here many hundred yeres before his commynge. Tertullian ſaithe of his time, Britannorum inacceſſa Romanis loca ſubduntur Chriſto: Origen ſaith of his time, Terra Britanniæ conſenſit in Religionem Chriſti: Athanaſius of his time ſaithe, Epiſcopi Aphricæ vniuerſæ, Siciliæ, Sardiniæ, Hiſpaniarum, Galliarum, Britanniarum ſeſe ad Concilium contulerunt: Conſtantinus the Emperour in his time maketh mention of the Chriſtian Churches in Britannie. S. Hilarie in his time intituled his Letter in this wiſe: Clericis Toloſanis, & Prouinciarum Britannicarum Epiſcopis: Chryſoſtome of his time ſaithe, Et Inſulæ Britannicæ extra hoc mare ſitæ, & in ipſo Oceano poſitæ ſenſerunt virtutem Verbi Dei: Theodoretus of the time of the Emperour Iouinian ſaith thus, Huic Fidei conſenſerunt omnes Eccleſiæ, quæque in Hiſpania ſunt, quæque in Britannia:

An. Dñi. 210. Tertullian contra Iudeos.

Anno 212. Origen in Ezechiel. Homil. 4

Anno 324. Athanaſi. Apologia ſecunda.

Anno 330. Theodoret. Hiſt. Eccle. Li. 1 Ca. 10

Anno 360. Hilarius De Synodis.

Anno 400. Chryſoſt. in Homilia. Quod Chriſtus ſit Deus

Anno 367. Theodoret. Hiſt. Eccl. Li 4. Ca. 3.

The Faithe of his time, Britannorum inacceſſa Romanis loca ſubduntur Chriſto. The countries of Britannie, which the Romaines coulde neuer attaine vnto, are nowe ſubiecte to Chriſte. *Origen. The Land of Britannie hathe agreed to Chriſtes Religion.* *Athanaſius. Epiſcopi Aphricæ vniuerſæ, Siciliæ, Sardiniæ, Hiſpaniarum, Galliarum, Britanniarum ſeſe ad Concilium contulerunt: The Biſhoppes of al Aphrica, Sicilia, Sardinia, Spaine, Fraunce, and Britannie came thither to the Councel, (holden at Sardica.)* *Conſtantinus. Britannicæ.* *Hilarius. Britannicarum Epiſcopis: To the Clergie of Toloſe, and to the Biſhoppes of Britannie.* *Chryſoſtome. Et Inſulæ Britannicæ extra hoc mare ſitæ, & in ipſo Oceano poſitæ ſenſerunt virtutem Verbi Dei: The Flandes of Britannie beinge in the very Ocean, farre out of this our Sea, haue felte the power of Goddes Woorde.* *Theodoretus. Huic Fidei conſenſerunt omnes Eccleſiæ, quæque in Hiſpania ſunt, quæque in Britannia: To this Faithe haue agreed al the Churches, bothe of Spaine and of Britannie.* These recordes maie ſeeme ſufficient, if it pleaſe M. Hardinge to receiue them. And al, & euery of theſe liued ſundrie hundred yeres before the arriual of Melitus, and Auguſtine.

If any man ſhal happen to replie, The Faithe was then vtterly rooted out by the inuaſion of the Engliſhe menne beinge Heathens, that matter is already anſweared in my former Replie to M. Hardinge. Certainely Beda ſaithe, the Queene of England was then Chriſtened, and that there were then in this Realme ſeuen Biſhoppes, and one Archebiſhop, with other moe greate learned Chriſtian menne.

Art. 3. Diuiſ. 24. Beda. Li 1 Ca. 26

Beda. Li 2. ca. 2.

As touchinge this Auguſtine, we are not bounde to al his doinges. Although M. Hardinge allowe him Apoſtlelike authoritie, yet al his deades were not Goſpel. The Churche in his time was growen to mutch corruption, as it maie many waies appeare by ſundrie places of S. Gregorie. Verily Beda ſaithe, The Biſhoppes, and learned Chriſtians of this Countrie vtterly refuſed to receiue this newe Apoſtle with his Newe Religion. And yet were they right Catholique, and Godly menne.

Beda. li 2. ca. 26

And Galfridus ſaithe, Erant ſeptem Epiſcopatus, & Archiepiſcopatus Religioſiſſimis Præſulibus muniti, & Abbatiæ complures, in quibus grex Domini rectum ordinem tenebat: *There were then in Englande ſeuen Biſhoprikes, and one Archebiſhoprike poſſeſſed with very godly Prelates, and many Abbies, in which the Lordes flocke helde the right Religion.*

Galfridus Li 8. Cap. 4.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ Here (ſaithe M. Hardinge) M. Iewel belieth Beda twiſe. Firſte he applieth that to the Engliſhe men, whiche he ſpake of the Britaines, namely of ſeuen Biſhoppes, and one Archebiſhop &c. *The Anſweare.* If there had benne ſomme errour herein, yet M. Hardinge might haue vttered it in more courteous manner. Howe be it in deede it is not ſo. I ſpeake not one worde of Engliſhe Biſhoppes, but onely of the

M. Hard fo. 83 b

Bishoppes of the Britaines, who, as M. Hardinge wel knoweth, and as it maie also appeare by Galfridus, and Beda, were then the Bishoppes, and the onely Bishoppes of this Countrie.

M. Hard. fo. 84. a

Yet is there here (saith M. Hardinge) an other Lie. For they refused to obey him as their Archbishop: They refused not his Religion. Certainely, good Reader, the wordes of Beda seme plaine to the contrarie.

Beda. lib. 2. ca. 2. *Priscis abdicare moribus, deserere suas traditiones.*

The Britaines (saithe he) *made answeare, that they could not leaue theire Ancient vsages without the consente of their Felowes.* They came to an Holy man, and demaunded his aduise, whether at this Augustines requeste, they shoulde forsake, and geue ouer their olde Traditions. He answeared them, If he be a prowde man it is certaine, he is not of God, neither ought we to care for his Worde. In the ende he saithe, Cunctis, quæ dicebat, contradicere laborabant: *They withstoode him in al that euer he saide.* I trowe, he saide some what els, besides his Archebishoprike, and his palle: otherwise his heade had benne very ambitious.

M. Har. fo. 83. b.

But M. Hardinge addeth further, It is wel knowen that I haue seene a certaine Booke, whiche he calleth the Returne of Vntruthes, and that one of the same was presented vnto me at Oxforde, at what time the Quenes Maiestie was there in Progresse. Howe wel M. Hardinge is assured hereof, I cannot saie. It maie passe in companie with the reste of his Truthes. I assure thee, good Reader, there was neuer such Booke offered to me, neither at Oxforde, nor elswhere, neither did I euer reade one line thereof in al my life.

The Apologie, Cap. 2. Diuision. 3.

That wee renewe, and, as it were, fetche againe from Hel the Olde & many a date condemned Heresies: that we sowe abroade newe sectes, and suche broyles as neuer earste were hearde of: also that wee are already diuided into contrarie partes and opinions, and coulde yet by no meanes agree wel amonge our selues.

M. Hardinge.

That thei Defenders be renewers of olde Heresies.

Sithe that yee raise vp againe the Heresie of Aërius in denyinge praier for the deade, who was for the same accompted an Heretike eleuen hundreth yeeres paste: sith that ye raise vp the Heresie of Manichæus that liued before him, in takinge awaie Free wil: sithe that yee raise vp the Heresie of Vigilantius, in refusinge to praie to Sainctes, and to honoure theire holy Reliques, and to keepe Lightes in Churches to the honour of God, and many other Heresies beside of old time condemned: sith that yee raise vp the Heresies of Berengarius in denyinge the presence of Christes very Body in the blessed Sacrament of the Aultar: and sith that ye adde to those moe Heresies of your owne, as the appointing of the supreme Pastorship or regiment of the Churche in al thinges and causes spiritual to a laie Magistrate, the denyinge of the external Sacrifice of the Churche, whiche wee cal the Masse, the maintenance of the breach of Vowes, of Pouertie, Chastitie, and Obedience: Againe sith that your Diuision into sundrie sectes can neither be dissembled nor defended, whereof wee shal speake hereafter more largely: al these thinges beside sundrie other of like enormitie beinge true, as they be moste true, this other crie made vpon you is true.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Artic. 5. Diui. 6.

This heape is greate in shewe, and light in substance. Touchinge Berengarius, gentle Reader, for shortnesse sake I muste referre thee to my Former Replie to M. Hardinge. Aërius the Arian Heretique, the Wreache of Vowes, the Dissension of Iudgementes in Religion, shalbe answeared (God willinge) hereafter, eche mater seuerally in his place. We flatter not our Prince with any newe imagined extraordinarie power, but onely geue him that Prerogatiue and Dignitie, that euermore hath benne dewe vnto him by the ordinance, & Worde of God: that is to saie, to be the Nource of Gods Religion: to make Lawes for the Churche: to heare & take vp cases, and questions of the Faithe, if he be able: or otherwise to commit them ouer by his authoritie vnto the learned: to commande the Bishops & Priestes to dw their dewties, and to punishe suche as be offenders. Thus the godly Emperour Constantinus sate in Iudgement in a cause Ecclesiastical, betweene Cecilianus, and Donatus à Casis Nigris, and in the ende him selfe pronounced Sentence. Greater authoritie then Constantinus the Emperour had and vsed, our Princes require none. This, I truste, hitherto is no greate Heresie.

Esaie. 49.

Augustf. contra Cresc. li. 3. ca. 71

S. Hierome reproued Vigilantius, for that he founde faulte with the Vigils, or

night

night wakes, that then were vsed, with Prayenge to Saintes, with Worshipping of Reliques, with Lightes, and other suche like weightie maters. Touching which whole controuersis, Erasmus geueth this Judgemente: In hunc ita conuitijs debacchatur Hieronymus, vt plusculum in eo modestię cogar desiderare. Vtinam argumentis tantùm egisset, & à conuitijs temperasset: *Against this* Vigilantius S. Hierome *so raileth, that I wante in him summe peece of sobrietie. I woulde rather, he had dealte with argumentes, and had spared his railinge.* *Erasm. in præfatio in Epistolam Hieronimi contra Vigilan.*

Of praier to Saintes, and Lightes, wé shal speake hereafter. Night wakes afterwarde were condemned, as I remember, in the Councel of Carthage, & so Sentence geuen by the Churche with this greate Heretique Vigilantius against S. Hierome. Verily the Fathers in a former Councel holden at Eliberis in Spaine decreed thus: Placuit prohiberi ne fœminæ in cœmiterio pervigilent: quia sæpe sub obtentu orationis scelera latenter committunt: *It liketh vs that Women be forbidden to watche at the places of burial: For often vnder pretense of praier, priuily they committe Wickednesse.* So be shorte, if Vigilantius were an Heretique for reprouinge of Night Watches, why hathe the Churche of Rome so longe sithence condemned & abolished the same Watches, agreeably to Vigilantius, and contrarie to the Judgemente of S. Hierome? *Concil. Elibert. Cap. 35.*

Reliques were subiecte to muche villanie, and are welneare worne out of them selfe.

The Manicheis emonge other their fantastical errours were wont to saie, that the body of Man was made, not by God, but by the Angels of the Diuel, which they called Gentem tenebrarum: and that in Man there be two soules of contrarie natures: the one of the substance of God: the other of the substance of the Diuel: and that either soule continueth stil as it is, and cannot alter: That is to saie, that the good soule can neuer be il: and that the il soule can neuer be good. And in this sense they saide, that Man hathe no Free wil. *Augustl. de continent cap. 9. Augustl. contra duas epist. pelagian. Li 2. cap. 2 Augustl ad Quod vultdeum*

Al these, and other like errours wé abhorre & detest, as frantique furies. Wé saie, that the soule of Man is not the substance, but the Creature of God: and that it maie be changed from good to il: from il to good: that Dauid maie fal: that Paule maie rise: that God geueth vs a newe harte, and a newe Spirite within our breastes.

But as touchinge the fredome of wil, & power of our selues, wé saie with S. Augustine, O malum Liberum Arbitrium sine Deo: *O euil is Free Wil without God.* Againe, Libero Arbitrio malè vtens homo, & se perdidit, & Arbitrium: *Man misusinge his Free Wil, spilte bothe him selfe, and his Wil.* Againe, Quid tantum de Naturæ possibilitate præsumitur? Vulnerata, saucia, vexata, perdita est. Vera confessione, non falsa defensione opus habet: *What doo menne so mutche presume of the Possibilitie of Nature? It is wounded, it is mangled, it is troubled, it is lost. It behoueth vs rather truely to confesse it, then falsely to defende it.* Againe, Liberum Arbitrium captiuatum, non nisi ad peccatum valet: *Free wil once made thralle, auaileth nowe nothinge but to sinne.* Againe, Quòd benè viuimus, quòd rectè intelligimus, Deo debemus. Nostrum nihil est, nisi peccatum, quod habemus: *That wee liue wel, that wee vnderstande aright, wee haue it of God. Of our selues wee haue nothinge, but onely sinne, that is within vs.* *Augustl. de Verb. Apostol. Serm. 11 Augustl. in Enchiridio. cap. 30 Augustl. De Natura & Gratia cap. 53. Augu. ad Bonifaci. Li 3. cap. 8. Augustl. de Verbis Apost. Ser. 10*

The better to cleare this whole case, I thoughte it good to vse the more wordes. Thus maie wé learne to knowe our selues, and humbly to confesse our imperfection, and to geue the whole glorie vnto God.

Therefore to conclude, S Augustine saithe, Nos volumus: Sed Deus in nobis operatur velle. Nos operamur: Sed Deus in nobis operatur & operari pro bona sua voluntate. Hoc nobis expedit & credere & dicere. Hoc est pium: hoc est verum: vt sit humilis, & submissa Confessio, & detur totum Deo. Tutiores viuimus, si totum Deo damus, non autem nos illi ex parte, & nobis ex parte committimus: *Wee wil: but it is God, that woorketh in vs to wil. Wee woorke: but it is God, that woorketh in vs to woorke, according to his good pleasure. This is behooueful for vs both to beleue, and to Speake: This is a Godly, this is a True Doctrine, that our Confession maie be humble, and lowly, and that God maie haue the whole. Wee liue in more safetie, if wee geue al vnto God, rather then if wee committe oure selues partly to our selues, and partly to him.* *Augustl. De Bono perseueran. c. 13. Cap. 6.*

Faſtinge vvith Fleashe.

The Apologie, Cap. 2. Diuiſion. 4.

That wee be accurſed Creatures, and like the Gyantes doo warre againſte God him ſelfe, and liue cleane without any regarde or Woorſhippinge of God.

M. Hardinge.

VVhat yee be, God knoweth, and your owne conſcience ſhoulde knowe. Our Lorde amende bothe you and vs. But to ſaie ſomewhat to that your gilue minde imagineth the VVorlde to reporte of you, Ethey whiche take away and abhorre the external Sacrifice, wherein Chriſte according to his owne Inſtitution, is offered to his Father, make no warre againſte God: if they whiche make Chriſte a Miniſter of Shadowes, Signes, Toc ens, and Figures: they, whiche feare not to breake their ſolemne Vowes made to God, and defende the ſame as wel done: they, whiche aſſure them ſelues of their Saluation, and therefore liue diſſolutely without due care and feare of God: If (I ſaie) they be not curſed Creatures, and like Gyauntes that warre againſte God, then are ye cleare of this charge. Luc. 22. 1. Cor. 11.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

To anſweare Ifs with Ifs, and Wordes with Wordes, it were greate folie. Therfore leauinge the anſweare of Vowes, and aſſurance of Saluation to their ſeuerall places, firſt wee denie not the Sacrifice of Chriſt. Chriſt onely vpon his Croſſe is our whole and onely Sacrifice for ſinne, & beſide him wee haue none other. Howe be it, I haue ſpoken hereof more at large in my Former Replie to M. Hardinge. In the 17. Artic.

Neither make wee Chriſte, as it liketh M. Hardinge to ſaie, a Miniſter of Signes and Figures. Wee knowe, that Chriſt is the Fulfillinge & Perfection of the Lawe, and that Grace, and Truthe are wrought by him. Yet neuertheleſſe wee ſaie, that the Sacramentes of the Newe Teſtamente are Signes, and Figures. The Olde Father Tertullian expoundeth Chriſtes wordes in this ſorte, Hoc eſt Corpus meum, Hoc eſt, Figura Corporis mei: *This is my Body, that is to ſaie, This is a Figure of my Body.* S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Chriſtus adhibuit Iudam ad Conuiuium, in quo Corporis & Sanguinis ſui Figuram Diſcipulis ſuis commendauit, & tradidit: *Chriſte receiued Iudas vnto his Banket, whereat he deliuered to his Diſciples the Figure of his Body, and Blonde.* And againe, Non dubitauit Dominus dicere, Hoc eſt Corpus meum, cum daret Signum Corporis ſui: *Chriſte doubted not to ſaie, This is my Body, whereas he gaue a Token of his Body.* Ioban. 1. Tertul. contra Martion. Lib. 4. Auguſtin. Pſal. 3. Auguſt. contra Adimantum. Cap. 12.

I leaue other Holy Fathers of like Wordes and ſenſe welneare innumerable. Yet were thei neither Gyantes, nor Rebelles againſt God, nor accurſed Creatures. If they had neuer vſed theiſe Wordes, nor called the Sacramente the Figure, or Token of Chriſtes Body, then might M. Hardinge haue benne bolde to ſaie ſommewhat, and to leade awaie his Reader with a Tragical exclamation of Signes, and Figures. Howe be it, be him ſelfe, as I haue ſhewed in my Former Anſweare, in the Expoſition of theiſe wordes of Chriſte, *This is my Body*, and other like Phraſes incident vnto the ſame, to auoide one vſual and common Figure, is forced to ſhifte him ſelfe into thirtie other vnneceſſarie and childiſhe Figures: as knowing that not ſo muche as his open Vntruthes can wel ſtande without Figures. Artic. 12. Diuiſ. 16

The Apologie, Cap. 2. Diuiſion. 6.

That wee deſpiſe al good deedes: that wee vſe no diſcipline of Vertue, no Lawes, no Cuſtomes: that wee eſteeme neither right, nor order, nor equitie, nor Juſtice: that wee geue the bridel to al naughtineſſe, and prouoke the people to al licentiouſneſſe and luſte.

M. Hardinge.

Ye teache men to faſte for policie, not for Religion. And by your Statute of VVedneſdaies faſte, who ſo euer ſhal write or ſaie that forbearinge of Fleaſhe is a Seruice of God, otherwiſe then as other politike lawes are, they ſhal be puniſhed as ſpreaders of falſe Newes are and ought to be: VVhen yee Preache onely Faithe not to remoue the merite of woorkes before Baptiſme, as S. Paule meant it, but alſo after Baptiſme: VVhen ye take awaie the Sacramente of Confeſſion and Abſolution, geue ye not the brydel to al naughtineſſe? Doo not ſome of your Goſpellinge maides of London refuſe to ſerue, excepte they may haue libertie to heare a Sermon before noone, and a Plaie at after noone? Faſte for policie. fol. Pag. 2. Epiſt. ad Roman. Bridle geue to lewde by this ye Goſpel.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

I thoughte M. Hardinge had knowen a difference bitweene Faſtinge, and Abſtinence, or choiſe of meates. True Faſtinge is a Religious worke, ordeined to teſtifie

Faſtinge vvith Fleaſhe.

ſtific oure humilitie, and to make the Fleaſhe the more obediente vnto the Spirite, that we maie be the quicker to Prayer, & to al good Workes. But Abſtinence from this or that meate with opinion of Holineſſe, Superſtitious it maie eaſily make a man, but Holy it can not. S. Paule ſaithe, Cibus nos non commendat Deo: *It is not meate that maketh vs acceptable vnto God.* Againe, *It is good to confirme the harte with Grace, and not with meates: Wherein they that haue walked, haue founde no profite. The meate ſerueth for the Belly, and the Belly for the meate: The Lorde wil deſtroie them bothe.* And againe, *The Kingedome of God is not Meate, and Drinke.* Likewiſe Chriſte ſaithe, *The thinge that entereth into the mouthe, defileth not the man.*

1. Cor. 14. Hebr. 13. 1. Cor 6. Rom. 14 Matth. 15.

Hereby it is eaſie to ſee, that Faſtinge is one thing, and Abſtinence from Fleaſh is an other. The Nazaries in the Olde Teſtament abſteined not from Fleaſhe, and yet they Faſted. Elias was feadde with Fleaſhe, Iohn the Baptiſte eate the Fleaſh of Locuſtes, and yet they bothe faſted. Socrates ſaithe, That many Chriſtians in the Lente ſeaſon did eate Fiſhe, and Birdes: many abſtained vntil three of the cloche in the after noone, & then receiued al kindes of meate, either Fiſhe, or Fleaſh, without difference. Likewiſe Epiphanius ſaithe, *Some eate al kindes of Birdes, or Fowle, abſtaining onely from the Fleaſhe of fower footed beaſtes.* And yet thei kept their Lente truely, & faſted as wel as any others. Wherfore Abſtinence from any one certaine kind of meate is not of it ſelfe a worke of Religion to pleaſe God, but onely a mere politique policie. S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Non quæro quo Veſcaris, ſed quo Delecteris: *I demaunde not, What thou Eateſt, but wherein thou haſte Pleaſure.* And S. Hierome ſaithe of the Manicheis, Ieiunant illi quidem: Sed illorum Ieiunium eſt ſaturitate deterius: *They Faſte in deede: but their Faſtinge is woorſe, then if they filled their Bellies.*

Socra. lib. 5 ca. 22 Caſſiodor. Lib. 9 Cap. 38. Epipha. de Hæreſ. Lib. 3. in Oratione de fide Catholica. οἱ μὲν τετραπόδων μόνων ἀπέχονται, λαμβάνουσι δὲ ἐρίφων. Auguſtin. Hieronim. In Ioelem cap 1.

Of onely Faithe, and Confeſſion, wee ſhal ſpeake hereafter.

The Apologie, Cap. 2. Diuiſion. 7.

That wee laboure and ſeeke to ouerthrowe the ſtate of Monarchies and Kingedomes, and to bringe al thinges vnder the rule of the raſhe inconſtant People, and vnlearned multitude.

M. Hardinge.

Can Monarkes and Princes ſeeme to be mainteined by your ſectes, who teache the people to rebel for pretenſed Religion? Allowe ye the Monarchie of the Romaine Empire, who ſo muche complaine in youre Apologie, that the Pope made Charlemaigne Emperoure of the VVeſte? Hathe the Queene of Scotlande cauſe to praiſe the procedinges of your Goſpel, through occaſion whereof ſhee ruleth not her Subiectes, but is rather ruled of her Subiectes?

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Here is an other greate Untruthe emonge the reſte. For M. Hardinge righte wel knoweth, that wee neuer armed the people, nor taught them to rebel for Religion againſte the Prince. If any thinge haue at any time happened otherwiſe, it was either ſomme wilful rage, or ſomme fatal furie: It was not our Counſel: it was not our Doctrine. Wee teache the people, as S. Paule doothe, to be ſubiecte to the higher powers, not onely for feare, but alſo for conſcience. Wee teache them, that who ſo ſtriketh with the Swerde by Priuate authoritie, ſhal periſhe with the Swerde. If the Prince happen to be wicked, or cruel, or burthenous, wee teache them to ſaie, with S. Ambroſe, Arma noſtra ſunt Preces, & Lachrymæ: *Teares, and Praiers be oure Weapons.* Notwithſtandinge, what rebellion hathe benne moued in Englande by ſomme of your ſide, in the late Raignes of King Henrie the eight, & King Edwarde the firſte in defenſe of your Religion, ye maie wel remember.

Roman. 13. Matthæ. 26. Ambroſius.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ Here M. Hardinge hathe shortly shuffled tograther a whole trowpe of wordes, written, or ſpoken by Luther, Melanchton, or others, in ſomme parte true, in moſte parte falſe, and quite rachte from theire meaninge: but in no parte touchinge any parte of our Doctrine. Neither doothe any of al theſe teache the people to rebelle againſte theire Prince, but onely to defende them ſelues by al lawful meanes againſte oppreſſion, as did Dauid againſte King Saule. So do the Nobles in France at this daie. They ſeeke not to kille, but to ſaue theire owne liues, as they haue openly proteſted by publike writinge vnto the worlde.

M. Hard. fo. 84. b

As for vs, we are ſtrangers vnto their cases. They them ſelues are beſte acquainted with the Lawes, and Conſtitutions of theire Countrie: and therefore are beſte hable to yelde accoumpte of the grounde, and reaſons of their doinges. But let M. Hardinge ſhewe vs, in ſo many Kingedomes, and Countries, that haue withdrawen them ſelues from the obedience of the Pope, what one Prince hath there euer benne remoued for Religions ſake by the Profeſſoures of the Goſpel. There maie he finde the very paterne, and practiſe of our Doctrine. Perhappes many good Princes maie be founde, that haue benne remoued by the Pope, and by others of his deuotion.

I will not ſpeake of enterpriſes attempted within this Countrie. And yet is it knowen what hathe benne donne, and at whoſe becke, and in whoſe behalfe.

M. Hard. fo. 87. a

But, for as mutche as you ſaie, VVee openly proteſte before God, and the worlde, that wee condemne, and defie al ſuche attemptes. I meane that any ſubiecte, or ſubiectes, whatſoeuer of theire owne priuate Authoritie ſhould take Armes againſte theire Prince for matters of Religion: Fabian. part. 7.

Howe like you then the attemptes of Thomas Arundel the Archebiſhop of Canturburie, againſte Richarde 2. Kinge of Englande? you wil ſaie, It was no Matter of Religion: yet can you not ſaie, but the ſaide Archbiſhop was a Subiecte, and Kinge Richarde was his Prince. How like you the late Inſurrection in the North, in the time of Kinge Henrie 8. who kindled that fire? who raiſed that tempeſte? whoſe right was attempted? whoſe crowne was aſſaulted? had Proteſtantes the leadinge of thoſe bandes? Was VViate the General of that fielde? howe like you the Counſel of Cardinal Poole, in his imagined Oration to Charles the Emperoure, callinge backe his Maieſtie from the Turke, to leaue al other affaires, and to bende his banners againſte Englande, and encouraginge the Subiectes of this Realme boldely to rebelle againſte their Prince? *There be in Englande* (ſaithe he) *whole Legions of men,* Reginaldus Polus Lib. 3. *that haue not bowed theire knee to Baal. If thou once arriue there, ô Emperour, God wil bringe them to thy hande. Engliſhe menne are a people that oftentimes haue depoſed theire Kinges for lighter cauſes &c. They haue ſtil the ſame courage &c. Nothinge ſtaieth them from reuenging ſo greate wronges by theire Kinge committed, but onely the waitinge for your Maieſtie &c.* The Booke is abroade in printe, and maie be ſéene. I ſhewe you onely a fewe examples out of the heape, and, for that thei be odious, I haue rather touched them ſhortly, then laide them open.

Nicol. Machiauellus Florentinus.

Nicolas Machiauel, in his Italian Hiſtorie ſaithe, that the Biſhoppes of Rome them ſelues through their Ambition, and cruelitie, haue raiſed ſuche deadly diſcord, and bloudy warres betwéene Chriſtian Princes, as fewe the like haue benne ſéene in Chriſtendome theſe many yéares. Yet wil you proteſt openly againſte them al? Againſte your Archebiſhoppes, againſte your Cardinalles, and againſte the Pope him ſelfe, the Succeſſour of Peter, and the Vicare of Chriſte? Wil you condemne, and defie their attemptes before God, and before the worlde? How then if the Pope this daie, to recouer his loſſes, would releaſe the Natural Subiectes of this Realme, from their Othe, and allegeance to the Quéenes Maieſtie, as he hathe often donne, as wel here, as in other Countries, and ſaithe, He maie iuſtly doo it by the right of his Office: what woulde you then doo your ſelfe, M. Hardinge? or what woulde you aduiſe your frendes to do? why ſhoulde you diſſemble? you woulde doo euen as your Fathers haue done before you.

15 q. 6. Nos Sanctorum Ead. Alius.

But what meane you to deale ſo nicely in this mater? you ſaie, You proteſte before God, and the worlde: you condemne and defie al ſuche attemptes. A man woulde thinke, ye ſpake in earneſt. Wherefore then haue you ſet ſo fauourable a conſtruction to theiſe wordes? I meane (ſaie you) that any Subiecte, or Subiectes what ſo euer, of their owne Priuate authoritie, ſhoulde take armes againſt their Prince for maters of Religion. Wherefore excepte you onely the caſe of Religion? It is lawful, by your iudgemente, for the Subiecte in any other caſe, either of Life, or of Gouernemente, to arme him ſelfe againſte his Prince? and woulde you thus perſwade the people? is this your Religion? is this your Doctrine?

M. Har. fol. 87. a

Or what meane you, By their owne Priuate Authoritie? maie then the Subiecte arme

arme him selfe against his Prince, by the Common aduise, and by the Publique Authoritie of the Realme? If so, wherefore then blame you the Nobles of Scotlande? For what soeuer was donne there, a fewe onely excepted, was donne by the Consente, & agreement of the whole. But perhaps by Priuate Authoritie, you meane, what soeuer is attempted in this behalfe, without the Authoritie of the Pope: to whome you haue geuen the righte, and Authoritie of Bothe Swerdes, Spirituall, and Temporal: and from whome, you saie, the Kinges, and Princes of the worlde haue receiued their Power. Verily the Pope him selfe saith, Materialis gladius stringendus est manu Regum, & Militum, sed ad nutum, & patientiam Sacerdotis? *The Material, or Temporal Swerde muste be drawen by the handes of Kinges, and Souldiers* (how be it, not by the Princes owne Authoritie, but) *at the becke, and patience of the Prieste:* by which Prieste, is meante the Pope. And what soeuer is donne at his beche, hath Authoritie sufficient, & is wel donne. But greate was the patience of the Princes, and Powers of the worlde, that coulde so longe, and so quietly beare his beckinge. M. Hard. Confut. fol. 247. b. 248. b. De Maiorit. & Obedient Vnam sanctam.

Now M. Hardinge, if you thinke it lawful for Subiectes to drawe the Swerde in Defense of the Pope, why maie you not also thinke it lawful for them, to defende them selues in Defense of Christe? ☞

The displacinge of the Emperoure of Constantinople, and the placinge of Charlemaigne the *Frenche* Kinge, serueth M. Hardinge to smal purpose: onelesse it be to disclose the Popes conspiracie against the Emperour. Certainely, as any man maie sensibly see, it was the aduauncinge of the Pope, the strengtheninge of the Saracenes, and after of the Turkes, and the Diuision, and dissolution of the state of Christendome. Platina saithe: Ab hoc tempore perijt & potestas Imperatorum, & virtus Pontificum: *After this time the power of the Emperours, and the Holinesse of the Pope were bothe loste.* Platina in Adriano. 2.

Touchinge the Queene of Scotlande, I wil saie nothinge: The Kingedomes, and states of the Worlde haue sundrie agreementes, and compositions. The Nobles, and Commons there, neither drewe the Swerde, nor attempted force against the Prince. They sought onely the continuance of Goddes vndoubted Truthe, and the Defense of theire owne liues against your Barbarous & cruel inuasions. They remembred, bisides al other warninges, your late dealing at Vassei, where as great numbers of theire Brethren were suddainely murthered, beinge togeather at their Praiers in the Churche, and holdinge vp theire Innocente handes to Heauen, and callinge vpon the name of God. Achab saide sometime to the Prophete Elia: *Thou arte he, that troublest the whole Countrie of Israel.* But Elias made him answeare, *It is not I, that trouble the Countrie: It is thou, and thy Fathers house, whiche haue forsaken the commaundementes of the Lorde, and haue followed after* Baalim. At Vassei, Anno. 1562. 3 Regum. 17.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* VVhat is a Lie, (saithe M. Hardinge) if this be none? *The Answeare.* In dede the Nobles, and Commones of Scotlande were in the fielde: we denie it not. So was Dauid in the fielde againste Kinge Saul. They stode in armoure, not to inuade, or attempte force against their Prince, but onely to defende them selues, as by waie of retiere. And therefore they withdrewe them selues with theire power into the Marches of England, not for wante of strength, or courrage, (for they had then double moe men in the fielde, then came againste them) but onely for reuerence of theire Prince, that came vpon them: leste they should be forced by rage of theire enimies, and furie of warre to strike the Annointed of the Lorde. Suche broiles haue often happened, in many Countries, as by sundrie Stories it maie appeare. ☞

The Subiecte is bounde to obey his Prince: how be it not in al thinges without exception: but so far as Goddes glorie is not touched. These Nobles had learned of S. Peter, *It is better to obey God, then man:* And of the Prophete Dauid, *Better it is to truste to God, then to truste in Princes.* For they are mortal, and shal die: theire Spirite shalbe taken from them, and then shal they returne into the Earth. Neither maie a godly Prince take it as any dishonour to his estate, to see God obeied before him. For he is not God, but the Minister of God. Leo saithe, Christus qui Dei sunt, Deo, Actor. 5. Psal. 118. Psal. 146.

Leo De Passione Domi. Serm. 10. Deo, quæ Cæsaris sunt, Cæsari reddenda constituit, &c. Hoc est verè non impugnare Cæsarem, sed iuuare: *Christe commaunded, that is dewe vnto God, to be genen to God: that is dewe vnto Cæsar, to be genen to Cæsar. Verily this is not to rebel againste, but to helpe Cæsar.*

Ambros. Lib. 5. Epist. 33. Likewise S. Ambrose, beinge him selfe in manner a Capitaine vnto the people in Goddes quarrel against Valentinian the Emperoure: Quid præsentius dici potuit à Christianis viris, quàm id, quod hodiè in nobis Spiritus Sanctus loquutus est? Rogamus, Auguste, non pugnamus: Non timemus, sed Rogamus? *What coulde be more boldely spoken of Christian menne, then that the holy Ghoste spake in you this daie? (Thus ye saide) Wee beseeche thee Noble Emperour, wee fight not. Wee feare thee not, but wee beseeche thee.*

To conclude, the Queene of Scotlande is stil in quiet possession of her estate: and is obeied of her Subiectes, so far as is conuenient for godly people to obeie their Prince.

Addition. ☞ Here (saithe M. Hardinge) what wil you sticke to saie, or write, which doe saie, write, and sette out in Printe suche a palpable, and manifest falsehoode: suche, I saie, as euen the Tankerdebearers in London can witnesse against you? *The Answeare.* Addition ☞

At the time of the writinge, and firste entrie into the printinge of my Booke, theise wordes were true. For then was the Queene of Scotlande in the ful possession of her estate. Neither coulde I Prophesie, what thinges would folowe. Shortly afterwarde the whole case was altered, as it is knowen. In the ende of the Printe, by forgetfulnesse, this place escapte my handes without correction, and so slipte awaie vnwares, as it was printed at the firste. In deede as I could not foresee the restraint of the saide Queenes libertie whiche folowed, but wrote of her state, as it then presently was, as in deede doinge, truelie I coulde do none other: so could I not foresee the causes that occasioned that alteration. For that the Kinge should shortlie after the time of my writinge be so murthered, & the house where he lodged blowen vp with powder, that a wicked man, accompted the certaine Authour of that Paricidial murther, hauinge him selfe a wife yet liuinge, should atteine to the Mariage of the same Queene, whose husbande he had so traiterously slaine, were thinges vnknowen vnto me, and vnto al men also when I did write this: and what way, the Nobles and bodie of the Realme, woulde take for the safetie of the yonge Prince, who séemed to all men to be in greate daunger, was likewise vnknowen vnto me. And M. Hardinge knoweth right wel, that these were the occasions of the alteration of the state, from that it was when I did write, and not Religion, whiche might wel be knowen by that, that many, of the saide Queenes Religion were against her, and many Protestantes were and are her friendes. And it séemeth, that M. Hardinge so openly protestinge before God, and the world, that they condemne and defie suche attemptes, that any subiectes should of their owne Priuate Auctoritie, take armes against their Prince, by his exceptinge of maters of Religion onely, shoulde thinke it reason that Paracides, Murthers, and shedding of bloude, specially bloude Royal, Rapes, Incestes, and suche like, shoulde not passe without al controlment. Surely God hath not suffered suche great faultes to escape vnpunished euen in Princes, as doeth, wel apeare by the examples of Quéene Iesabel in Israel, Quéene Iohanne in Napels, Kinge Tarquine in Rome: whome for theire great wickednes, God, by stirringe their owne subiectes against them, depriued of their Princely estates. For Princes also are Goddes subiectes, against whome, for their offences against his Maiestie, he proceadeth aswel, as against the baseste sortes of men, by suche waies, as to his heauenly wisedome it séemeth good. ☞

The Apologie, Cap. 2. Diuision 7.

That wee haue seditiously fallen from the Catholique Churche, and by a wicked schisme and diuision haue shaken the whole worlde, and troubled the common peace and vniuersal quiet of the Churche: & that, as Dathan and Abiron conspired in times paste against Moyses & Aaron, euen so wee at this daie haue renounced the Bishop of Rome, without any cause reasonable.

M. Har-

M. Hardinge.

Before Luthers time all Christen people came togeather peaceably into one Churche, vnder one Heade, as Sheepe into one folde vnder one Shepeherd, and so liued *Vnanimes in domo*, in one accorde: But after that Sathan, who at the beginninge begyled Eue, had persuaded some to taste of the poysoned apple of Luthers Newe Doctrine: they went out from vs, who were not of vs (for if they had beene of vs, they had remained with vs) forsooke the Catholike Churche of Christe, sorted them selues into Synagoges of Antichriste, withdrewe them selues from obedience towarde their Pastour and Iudge, and sundred them selues into diuerse Sectes. This schisme, diuision, and conspiracie against the Head Shepherd, is noletse wicked, then that of Dathan and Abiron against Moyses and Aaron was. For as God commanded Moyses and Aaron to be obeyed of the children of Israel, so Christ commaunded al his Shepe to obey and heare the voice of him, whome in Peter, and succedinge Peter, he made Shepeherde ouer his whole flocke.

Diuision & Schisme followed vpō Luthers Preaching. 1. Iohan. 2. Numer. 6. Greate Vntruthes. Iohan. 21.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Before the time that Goddes holy will was, that Doctour Luther should begin after so longe time of ignorance, to publishe the Gospel of Christe, there was a generall quietnesse: I graunte: suche as in the nighte season, when folke be aslepe. Yet, I thinke, to continewe suche quietnesse, no wise man wil wishe to slepe still.

Ye say, They haue forsaken the Catholique Churche: They went from vs, who were not of vs.

Nay rather, M. Hardinge, we are returned to the Catholique Churche of Christe: and haue forsaken you, because you haue manifestly forsaken the waies of God. But what if a man would a litle put you friendly in remembrance? Sir, it is not so longe sithence your selfe were out of your owne Catholique Churche: and so were gonne out from your selfe: because your selfe were not of your selfe. For if your selfe had beene of your selfe, you would haue remained better with your selfe. It is no wisedome, in carpinge others, to offer occasion against your selfe. I beseche God to geue you grace, that you may Redire ad cor, and returne againe to your selfe. But here you bringe in a greate many Untruthes in a throngе togeather. You saie, that as God commaunded the people of Israel to obey Aaron, so Christe commaunded al his Shepe to obey the Pope succedinge Peter: You saie, Christe made the Pope Shepheard ouer his whole flocke: You cal him Our Pastour, and our Iudge: you cal him the head Shepheard: and for proufe hereof, for some countenance of Truthe, ye allege the one and twentith Chapter of S. Iohn, in whiche whole Chapter notwithstandinge, ye are not able to finde, neither any suche commaundement of Christe: nor any mention of Peters Successour: nor Al his Shepe: nor Shepheard ouer his whole Flocke: nor Our Pastour: nor Our Iudge: nor Our Headshepheard. It is mutche to reporte Untruthe of a man. But to reporte Untruthe of Christe, and of his Holy Worde, and that willingly, and wittingly, and without feare, some menne thinke it to be the Sinne against the Holy Ghoste.

As for these wordes, *Feede my Sheepe, Feede my Lammes*, **they perteine as wel to other the Apostles, as to Peter. Christe saide generally to al his Disciples,** *Goe yee into al the Worlde, and preache the Gospel.* **And Paule saithe of him selfe,** Ego plus omnibus laboraui: *I haue taken more paines* **(and more feede the flocke)** *then al the rest.* **Surely me thinketh it is a weake kinde of reasoninge, to saie thus, Christe bade Peter feede his shepe, Ergo, he made him headshepheard ouer al the worlde.** Matthe. 28. 1. Corinth. 15.

But if this whole Prerogatiue hange of Feedinge the Flocke, what then if the Pope feede not? What if he neuer minde to feede, as thinkinge it no parte of his office? To conclude, what if he be vtterly ignorant, as many haue beene, and cannot feede? Yet muste he needes be the headshepheard ouer the whole flocke? and must al the shepe obey him, and heare his voice, that cannot speake? Verily S. Augustine saithe, Qui hoc animo pascunt oues Christi, vt suas velint esse, non Christi, se conuincuntur amare, non Christum, vel gloriandi, vel dominandi, vel acquirendi cupiditate: *Who so euer they be, that Feede the sheepe to the ende to make them theirs, and not Christes, they loue them selues, and not Christe, for desire either of glorie, or of rule, or of gaine.* Augustin. in Ioan. Tract. 123.

The Apologie, Cap. 2. Diuision. 8.

That wee set naught by the authoritie of the Auncient Fathers and Councels of olde time: that wee haue rashly and presumptuously disanulled

disanulled the olde Ceremonies, which haue benne wel allowed by our Fathers and Forefathers many hundred yeeres paste, both by good customes, and also in ages of more puritie: and that wee haue by our owne priuate head without the authoritie of any Sacred and General Councel brought Newe Traditions into the Churche: and haue donne al these thinges not for Religions sake, but onely vpon a desire of contention and strife. But that they for theire parte haue chaunged no maner of thinge, but haue helde and kept stil suche a number of yeres to this very date al thinges, as they were deliuered from the Apostles, and wel approued by the most Auncient Fathers.

M. Hardinge.

The auncient Fathers are but men, if they please you not. But if ye finde any colour of aduantage but in the newe Schoolemen, ye make muche of it. So that your owne opinion is the rule to esteeme them, or despise them. Councels ye admitte as your phansie and pleasure leadeth, sometimes three, sometimes foure, sometimes fiue or sixe. But al ye would neuer admitte: and yet so many, as are general and haue benne confirmed by the See Apostolike, they are al of like authoritie. Concerninge Ceremonies, if ye shewe vs not the vse of Chrisme in your Churches, if the signe of the Crosse be not borne before you in Processions, and otherwheres vsed, if Holy Water be abolished, if lightes at the Gospel and Communion be not had, if peculiar Vestimentes for Deacons, Priestes, Bishoppes be taken awaie, and many suche other the like: iudge ye, whether ye haue duely kepte the olde Ceremonies of the Churche.

Councels.

Ceremonies of the Church Abolished by the Gospelles.

As for your newe Traditions, Rites and Ceremonies, I can not tel, what to make of them, nor whether I maie so terme them.

No manner of thinge haue wee changed, that is of necessitie either to be beleued, or to be obserued.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

We allow the Auncient Fathers the same credite, that they them selues haue euer desired. S. Augustine **hereof writeth thus:** Neque quorumuis Disputationes, quantumuis Catholicorum, & laudatorum hominum, velut Scripturas Canonicas habere debemus, vt nobis non liceat, salua reuerentia, quæ illis debetur, aliquid in illorum Scriptis improbare, aut respuere, si forte inuenerimus, quòd aliter senserint, quam Veritas habet. Talis sum ego in scriptis aliorum: tales volo esse intellectores meorum: *Wee receiue not the Disputations or Writinges of any menne, be they neuer so Catholique, or praiseworthy, as wee receiue the Canonical Scriptures: but that, sauinge the reuerence dewe vnto them, wee maie wel reproue or refuse some thinges in theire writinges, if it happen wee finde, they haue otherwise thought, then the Truthe maie beare them. Suche am I in the writinges of others: and suche would I wisshe others to be in mine.* **Likewise he writeth to** S. Hierome, Non puto, Frater, te velle Libros tuos legi, tanquam Apostolorum, aut Prophetarum: *I recken not, my Brother, that ye woulde haue vs so to reade your Bookes, as if they were written by the Apostles, or Prophetes.* **It is certaine,** Tertullian, Cyprian, Clemens Alexandrinus, Papias, Irenæus, Victorinus, Lactantius, Hilarius, **and other Ancient Fathers were oftentimes mutche deceiued.** S. Hierome **scoffeth at** S. Ambroses **Commentaries** vpon Luke, **and calleth them,** Nugas, **Trifles, & nicknameth** S. Ambrose, **sometime callinge him** Coruus, **sometime** Cornicula. **Likewise** S. Augustine **saithe,** Ecclesiastici Iudices, vt homines, plærunque falluntur: *The Iudges, or Doctours of the Churche, as beinge menne, are often deceiued.* **And** Thomas **of** Aquine **saithe,** Non tenemur de necessitate Salutis, credere non solùm Doctoribus Ecclesiæ, vt Hieronymo, aut Augustino, sed ne ipsi quidem Ecclesiæ, nisi in his quæ pertinent ad substantiam Fidei: *Wee are not bounde vpon the necessitie of Saluation to beleeue not onely the Doctours of the Churche, as Hierome, or Augustine, but also neither the Churche it selfe, sauinge onely in maters concerninge the Substance of Faithe.*

August. ad Fortunatianum. Epist. III.

August. ad Hieronym. Epist. 19.

Picus Mirandula in Apologia.

August. contra Cresconium, Li. 2. Cap 2.

Picus Mirandula in Apologia.

Thomas in Quodlibet. 9. Artl. Vltimo.

Touchinge the authoritie of Councels, S. Augustine **saithe,** Ipsa plenaria Concilia sæpè priora à posterioribus emendantur, cum aliquo experimento aperitur, quod clausum erat: *The very General Councels are often corrected, the former by the later, as often as by trial and experience the thinge is opened, that before was shut.* **Likewise** Panormitane **saithe,** Plus credendum est vni priuato fideli, quàm toti Concilio, & Papæ,

August. contra Donatist. lib. 2. Cap. 3.

Abb. Panormit.

si

si meliorem habeat authoritatem, vel rationem: *Wee ought to geue more credite to one priuate Laye man, then to the Whole Councel, and to the Pope, if he bringe better authoritie, and more reason.* If the Councel be wicked, & carried with malice, as many haue benne, specially within these fewe late hundred yeres, We saie, as the Prophete Esai saithe, Inite Consilium, & dissipabitur: Loquimini verbum, & non stabit: quia nobiscum est Dominus: *Take Counsel together, and it shalbe broken: Speake the woorde, and it shal not holde: For the Lorde is with vs.* De Electio. & Electi Potest. Cap. Significasti. Esai. 8.

As for the late Schole Doctours, your selues weighe them as litle, as noman lesse. You saie in your common talkes, Bernardus non vidit omnia: You haue controlled your Doctour of al Doctours, Peter Lombard, with this common Caueat in the Margine, Hic Magister non tenetur: Here our Doctour is no Doctour. You your selfe M. Hardinge, in this your very Booke against our Apologie saie, that your Doctour Gratian was deceiued, and in stede of Anacletus alleged Calixtus. You your selfe againe saie, If in a secrete pointe of learninge S. Augustine, or S. Cyprian teache singularely, wee folowe them not: muche lesse do wee binde our selues to beleue, what soeuer Albertus Pighius hath written. And againe, We binde our selues neither to the woordes of Syluester, nor of Pighius. And againe, We take not vpon vs to defende al that the Canonistes, or Scholemen saie, or write. And an other of your companie saithe, that your Doctour Gratian hath published greate vntruthes, and wilfully falsified the Generall Councel. Nomen vniuersalis, saithe he, assutum est à Gratiano. Thus M. Hardinge, ye vse your Doctours, euen as the Marchante vseth his Counters: sometime to stande for an hundred pounde, sometime for a penie. M. Hardinge. Fol. 92. b. M. Hardinge. Fol. 232. b. M. Hardinge. Fol. 258. Copus. Dialogo. 1. Pag. 33.

But nowe let vs a litle examine the particulars of your bil. Ye come in with Processions, with Lightes, with Torches, with Tapers, with Chrisme, with Oile, with Tanicles, and Chesibles, with Holy Water, and holy Breade, and I knowe not, what els: as if al these thinges had descended directly from the Apostles, and without the same the Churche of God were no Churche.

Verily, M. Hardinge, we hate not any of al these thinges. For we knowe, they are the Creatures of God. But you haue so misused them, or rather so defiled, and beraied them with your superstitions, and so haue with the same mocked, and deceiued Goddes people, that we can no longer continue them without greate conscience. I wil passe ouer the rest, and speake onely of your Oile, wherein you seeme to make moste accoumpte. In your Pontifical thus are ye taught to blesse your Oile: Fiat Domine hoc Oleum te benedicente, vnctio Spiritualis ad purificationem Mentis, & Corporis: *O Lorde, let this Oile by thy blessinge, be made a Spiritual Ointement to purifie bothe Soule and Body.* And againe, Emitte quæsumus, Sancte Pater, Spiritum Sanctum Paracletum tuum de Cœlis in hanc pinguedinem Oliuæ, ad refectionem Corporum, & Sanationem animarum: *O holy Father, wee beseeche thee sende downe thy holy Sprite the Comforter from Heauen into this fatnesse of the Oliue, to the refreshinge of Body and Soule.* In like sorte ye are taught to praie ouer the sicke: Per hanc Sanctam vnctionem, & suam pijssimam misericordiam ignoscat tibi Deus, vt per hanc vnctionem habeas Remissionem omnium peccatorum: *By this holy enointing, and by his greate Mercie God pardone thee, that by this enointinge thou maiste haue Remission of al thy sinnes.* These thinges cannot be denied: they are written in al your Manuals, vsed and practised in al your Churches. Ye cal it Holy Oile, and Oile of Saluation: Ye beare the people in hande, that thereby they shal haue healthe of Body and Soule: And yet in deede ye haue no Chrisme at al. For Pope Innocentius saithe, Chrisma conficitur ex Oleo, & Balsamo: *The Chrisme is made of Oile and Balsame.* And to the makinge thereof the Balsame is as necessarie, as the Oile. But these many hundred yeres ye haue had no Balsame, nor hath there benne any to be had: Therefore ye haue had no Chrisme this longe while, but haue deceiued the people with quid pro quo, geuinge them one thinge for an other. De Consec. Oleï. Extra. De Sacra vnctione.

Now that your Oile came not from the Apostles, your owne Doctour Panormitane is witnesse. For thus he writeth, Apostoli olim conferebant Spiritum Sanctum sola manus impositione. Et quia hodie Prælati non sunt ita beati, fuit institutum, Panormitan. De Consuetud. ca. 5.

tum, vt illi conferrent hoc Sacramentum cum Chrismate: *The Apostles in olde time gaue the Holy Ghoste onely by laieinge on of handes. But nowe a daies bicause Bishoppes be not so Holy order hath benne taken, that they shoulde geue this Sacramente with Chrisme.*

Neither is this mater so thorowly approued by al Antiquitie, as M. Hardinge imagineth. For Pope Innocentius is witnesse, that in olde times there were some, that founde faulte with these doinges. These be his wordes: Non Iudaizat Ecclesia, cùm vnctionis celebrat Sacramentum, sicut Antiqui mentiuntur: *The Churche is not Iewishe in solemnizinge the Sacramente of Vnction, as the Elders haue misreported.*

Extra De Sacra vnction. Vagitur.

Touchinge your Lightes, and Tapers, Beatus Rhenanus a man of greate learninge, and iudgement, doubteth not, but ye borowed the vse thereof from the Heathens. I graunte, the Christians in olde time had Lightes in their Churches, when they mette togeather at their common Praiers. But it appeareth by the Ancient Fathers, that the same Lightes serued to solace them against the darke, and not for any vse of Religion. S. Augustine saithe, Vouent alius Oleum, alius Ceram ad luminaria noctis: *They promise (to the Church) one Oile, an other waxe, for the night Lightes.* Like wise saithe Eusebius, καθαρὸν φῶς, ὅσον ἐξαρκέσαι πρὸς ὕλαιν τῶν ἐγχωρίων. Ignis purus, quantum satis esset ad præbendum lumen precantibus: *A cleare Light, so much as might suffice the people at their Praiers.* So like wise saith S. Hierome, Cereos non clara luce accendimus, sed vt noctis tenebras hoc solatio temperemus: *Wee light not our Tapers at midde daie, but onely by this comforte to ease the darkenesse of the nighte.* Therefore, M. Hardinge, vnto you, that set vp Lightes in your Churches, as your selfe saie, to the Honour of God, the Auncient Father Lactantius saithe thus, Num mentis suæ compos putandus est, qui Authori, & Datori Luminis Candelarum, & Cerarum lumen offert pro munere? *What, maie wee thinke, he is wel in his witte, that vnto God the Maker and Geuer of Light wil offer vp Candels, and Tapers for a present?* Verily Tertullian saithe, Accendant quotidiè lucernas, quibus lux nulla est, &c. Illis competunt & Testimonia tenebrarum, & auspicia pœnarum: *Let them that haue no lighte (of God) set vp their Tapers euery daie, &c. To them belongeth bothe the Testimonie of darkenesse, and the beginninge of Paine.*

Euseb. de vita Constan. Orat. 3.

Hieron. aduer. Vigilantium.

M. Hardinge. fol. 7. b.

Lact. li. 6. ca. 2.

Tertul. de Idololatria.

But what shal I saie of your Holy Water? No doubte it must nedes serue, as your Oile dothe, to the saluation of body, and soule. Augustinus Steuchus, a principal Doctour of your side saithe, Non inane institutum est, quod Aquas sale & Orationibus sanctificamus, vt ad eorum aspersum delicta nostra deleantur: *It is no vaine inuention, that wee hallowe Water with Salte and Praiers, that by the sprinkelinge thereof our sinnes maie be forgeuen.* Thus prophanely, & Heathenlike he writeth, as if the Bloude of Christe were quite dried vp.

Aug. Steuchus in librum num. Cap. 19.

Besides al this, one of your Doctours of Louaine telleth vs in good sadnesse, by reporte of one of the Iesuites, that in India Holy Water is very wholesome to driue awaie Mise, and to make barren Wemen to conceiue. I faine not this mater: The place maie be seene. O M. Hardinge, I moste nedes saie of your companie, that one saide sometime of the Grecians, *Theise that cal them selues Catholiques, are euer Children.*

Copus Dialo. 1. Pa. 18. b.

Ἕλληνες ὑμεῖς ἀεὶ παῖδες ἐστέ: Plato in Timæo: & Theodoret. De curandis Græcorum affectibus. Lib. 1.

Yet saie, ye haue chaunged nothinge, that is of necessitie either to be beleeued, or to be obserued. What necessitie ye meane, I can not wel coniecture. For when you liste, your Holy Water, and Holy Bread must nedes be of necessitie. But in deede of the ancient Godly orders of the Church ye haue in a maner leafte nothing, onlesse it be suche as ye might beste haue spared: and the same ye haue so defaced with superstition, that it hath nowe quite loste his former vse, and is not the same it was before. Certainely if you had changed nothinge, then should you haue nowe no Priuate Masse.

Therefore wee maie iustly saie to you, as Tertullian saide in like case vnto the Romaine Heathens: Vbi Religio? vbi veneratio Maioribus debita? Habitu, victu, instructu, sensu, ipso denique sermone Proauis renuntiastis. Laudatis semper Antiquitatem: nouè de die viuitis. Per quod ostenditur, dum à bonis Maiorum institutis deceditis, ea vos retinere & custodire, quæ non debuistis: cùm quæ debuistis, non custoditis: *Where is your Religion? Where is the reuerence deewe to your forefathers? You haue*

Tertull. in Apologetico.

forsaken

forſaken them in your apparel, in your diet, in your order, in your meaninge, and in your ſpeeche. Yet change your liſt daiely: Yet yee praiſe Antiquitie. Whereby it appeareth, while yee leane the good orders of your Elders, that yee keepe the thinges, yee ſhoulde not keepe: ſeeinge yee keepe not the thinges, yee ſhoulde keepe.

The Apologie, Cap. 2. Diuiſion. 13.

And that this mater ſhoulde not ſeeme to be donne but vpon priuie ſclaunder, and to be toſſed to and fro in a cozner onely to ſpite vs, there haue beene beſides wilily procured by the Biſhop of Rome certaine perſons of eloquence enoughe, & not vnlearned neither: whiche ſhould put their healpe to this cauſe nowe almoſte deſpaired of, and ſhoulde poliſhe and ſet foozthe the ſame, bothe in bookes and with longe tales, to the ende, that, when the mater was trimly and eloquently handled, ignozant and vnſkilful perſons mighte ſuſpecte there was ſome great thinge in it. In deede they perceiued, that their owne cauſe did euery where go to wzacke, that theire ſleightes were nowe eſpied and leſſe eſteemed, and that theire healpes did daylie faile them, and that theire mater ſtoode altogeather in greate neede of a cunninge ſpokeſman.

M. Hardinge.

Cõfidence of Catholikes touching their cauſe. Luce. 21. Matthæ. 28 Iohan. 14. The Catholike Church aſſuredly defended. Epheſ. 4.

VVee cannot deſpaire of this cauſe, onleſſe wee woulde forſake our Faithe, as ye haue. For beleuinge Chriſte, which our faithe leadeth vs vnto, wee cannot miſtruſt the continuance of this cauſe. Heauen and Earthe ſhal paſſe, but my woordes ſhal not paſſe, ſaithe Truthe it ſelfe. And his woordes tel vs, that he wil be with his Churche al daies to the worldes ende: And that he hathe beſoughte his Father to geue to it the Sprite of Truthe to remaine with it for euer. Then be wee moſt aſſured of this cauſe. VVee tel you therefore, it ſtandeth, and ſhal ſtande by Chriſtes preſence, and by the Holy Ghoſtes aſſiſtance, to the ende. Your cauſe yet ſtandeth not, but wauereth and tottereth, as that whiche S. Paule termeth a puffe of doctrine, and doubtleſſe ſhortely ſal it ſhal, as al Hereſies haue fallen.

The authours and profeſſours of them be dead and rotten, in Hel fire with weepinge and grinninge of teeth. The like iudgemente looke yee and your felowes to haue, if yee repente not, and reuoke your Hereſies by time.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

VVee cannot deſpaire, ſaithe **M. Hardinge**, of the continuance of our cauſe. For Heauen and Earthe ſhal paſſe: but Chriſtes VVoorde ſhal not paſſe. He wil be with vs al daies to the worldes ende, &c. **Theſe Woꝛdes, M. Hardinge, be true and certaine: and theꝛefoꝛe our hope is the ſtirmer. Chriſte hath pꝛomiſed that the Spꝛite of Truthe ſhal remaine foꝛ euer, but not in the Pope and his Cardinalles. Foꝛ theꝛeof he made no pꝛomiſe. Haie rather the Pꝛophete** Eſai ſaithe, **The Spꝛite of God ſhal reſt vpon the pꝛoꝛe, and mãke harted, that tremblieth at the Woꝛde of the Loꝛde.** *Eſaie. 66.*

The Churche of God ſhal ſtande ſtil, yea though Rome **were poſſeſſed with** Antichriſte. **It is true that** Chriſte ſaithe, *Euery plante, whiche my Heauenly Father hath not planted, ſhal be rooted vp:* **Upon whiche woꝛdes** S. Hilarie ſaithe, Significat, Traditionem hominum eruendam eſſe, cuius fauore tranſgreſſi ſunt Præcepta Legis: *He meaneth, that the Tradition of man, for whiche Traditions ſake they haue broken the Lawe of God, ſhal be taken vp by the rootes.* **Heauen and Earthe ſhal paſſe: and your fantaſies, and diuiſes, M. Hardinge, ſhal paſſe: the Loꝛde hath ſpoken it: But the Woꝛde of God, and his Churche ſhal endure foꝛ euer.** *Matthæ. 15. Hilar. in Ca. 15. Matthæi.*

But M. Hardinges Almanake ſaith, Our Doctrine ſhal fal, & that very ſhoꝛtly. Herein I pꝛofeſſe, I haue no ſkil. Goddes wil be donne. It is his cauſe: what ſo euer ſhal happen, his name be bleſſed foꝛ euer. In like ſoꝛte the Heathens in olde times, as S. Auguſtine ſaithe, **vaunted them ſelues againſte the Faithe of Chriſte:** Ad certum tempus ſunt Chriſtiani: poſtea peribunt, & redibunt Idola: redibit quod erat antea. Verùm tu, cum expectas, miſer Infidelis, vt tranſeant Chriſtiani, tranſis ipſe ſine Chriſtianis: *Theſe Chriſtians are but for a while: Fal they ſhal, and that ſhortely. Then ſhal our Idols come againe, and it ſhalbe as it was before. But, O thou miſerable Infidel, while thou looke ſt that the Chriſtians ſhoulde paſſe, thou paſſeſt awaie thee ſelfe without the Chriſtians.* *Auguſt. In Pſal. 70.*

August. in eundem Psalmum.

Againe he saithe, Ecce veniet tempus vt finiantur, & non sint Christiani. Sicut cœperunt ad aliquo tempore, ita vsque ad certum tempus erunt. Sed cùm ista dicunt, sine fine moriuntur, & permanet Ecclesia prædicans brachium Domini omni generationi venturæ: *They saie, beholde, the daie wil come, when al these Christians shal haue an ende. As they had a time to beginne, so shal they haue a time to continewe. But while they make these crakes, they them selues die without ende. But the Churche contineweth stil praysinge the almighty arme of God to euery generation that is to come.*

But yée saie, The Authours and Professours of our Doctrine be damned in Hel fiere, and crie, Peccaui. This is a very terrible kinde of talke. But it is a rashe parte for you, M. Hardinge, so suddainely to skip into Goddes Chaire, and there to pronounce your Sentence Definitiue like a Iudge. But God wil iudge of your iudgement. S. Augustine saithe, Aha est Sella terrena, aliud Tribunal Cœlorum: Ab inferiori Sententia accipitur, à superiori Corona: *The earthly Chaire is one thinge: the Iudgemente seate in Heauen is an other. From the one wee receiue Sentence from the other we receiue a Crowne.*

August. in Psal. 36. par. 3.

O M. Hardinge, God graunt you mate once crie, Peccaui: leaſt the time come that ye shal crie out, as it is written in the Booke of VVisedome: *These are they whome wee sometime had in derision, and in a parable of reproche. We fooles thoughte their life madnesse, and their ende without honoure. But nowe are they counpted emonge the Children of God, and their portion is emonge the Saintes.*

Sapien. 5.

The Apologie, Cap. 3. Division. 2.

Nowe as for those thinges whiche by them haue benne laide against vs, in parte they be manifestly false and condemned so by their owne iudgementes, whiche spake them: partely againe, though they be as false too in deede, yet beare they a certaine shewe and colour of truthe, so as the Reader (if he take not good heede) maie easily be tripped and brought into errour by them, specially when their fine and cunninge tale is added thereunto: And parte of them be of suche sorte, as wee ought not to shunne them as crimes or faultes, but to acknowledge and confesse them as thinges wel donne, and vpon very good reason. For shortely to saie the truthe, these folke falsely accuse and sclaunder al our doinges, yea the same thinges, whiche they them selues cannot denie but to be rightly and orderly donne: and for malice doo so misconstrue and depraue al our saieinges & doinges, as though it were impossible, that any thinge coulde be rightly spoken or donne by vs. They shoulde more plainely and sincerely haue gonne to woorke, if they woulde haue dealte truely: But nowe they neither truely nor sincerely, nor yet Christianly, but darkely and craftily charge and batter vs with lies, and doo abuse the blindenesse and fondenesse of the people, together with the ignorance of Princes, to cause vs to be hated, and the Truthe to be suppressed.

This, lo ye, is the power of darkenesse, & of men, whiche leane more to the amased wonderinge of the rude multitude, & to darkenesse, then they doo to Truthe and Light: and as S. Hierome saithe, doo openly gainesaie the Truthe, closinge vp their eies, & wil not see for the nonce. But we geue thankes to the most good and mighty God, that suche is our cause, where againste (when they would faineſt) they were hable to vtter no despite, but the same, which might as wel be wreasted against the Holy Fathers, againste the Prophetes, againste the Apostles, againste Peter, against Paule, and against Christe him selfe.

Hieron. aduersus Rufinum.

M. Hardinge.

The Catholikes doo not burden you with ought, wherein by their owne iudgementes they condemne

condemne them ſelues, as ye ſclaunder them, not onely here, but oftentimes in your Booke. For if they iudged otherwiſe, they woulde not wittingly doo againſt their iudgemente. That is the ſpecial
1. Tim. 1. properte of an Heretike, whome S. Paule biddeth al men to auoide, knowinge that he that is ſuche, is peruerted, and ſeemeth euen condemned by his owne iudgement.

They ſhewe bothe your blaſphemous Hereſies, and your wicked actes. Luther, ye know, powred out his Hereſies and villanies, &c. Your robbinge of Churches, perſecuting of men for ſtandinge ſtedfaſtly in the faithe of the Holy Forefathers, your inceſtuous mariages of Monkes, Friers, and Nonnes, your breache of ſolemne vowes for fleaſhly pleaſure, your prophaninge and abandoninge of Holy Sacramentes, your contempt of auncient and godly ordinaunces and diſcipline of the Churche, and ſuche other thinges of like eſtimation.

For in deede the Catholikes doo perſecute you, (if ſuche deſerued entreatinge of euill perſons maye be called perſecution) and al good folke beſides, wee graunt, and ſhal ſo doo, ſo longe as they loue the Truthe, and keepe them in the vnitie of the Churche. Yet with no other minde doo they
Geneſ. 16. perſecute you, then Sara did Agar. then Chriſte the Iewes, whome he whipt out of the Temple: then
Iohan. 2. Peter did Simon Magus.
Ignippus.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Pewis, M. Hardinge, it might pleaſe you to remember, that Bartholomæus Latomus a Doctour of your ſide confeſſeth in writinge to al the worlde, that our requeſt touchinge the Holy Miniſtration vnder Bothe Kindes, accordinge Chriſtes firſte Inſtitution, is iuſte and reaſonable:

Bar. Latomus aduerſus Bucerii

That Gerardus Lorichius an other of your owne ſide ſaithe, Pſeudocatholici, qui Reformationem Eccleſiæ quoquo modo remorari non verentur: *They be falſe Catholiques* (and this, M. Hardinge, he ſpeaketh of you, beinge one of your owne) *they be Falſe Catholiques, that hinder the Reformation of the Churche by al meanes they be hable.* He ſaithe, you be falſe Catholiques, far contrarie to the common opinion: and concludeth in the ende, that the wilful maintenance and ſequel of your Doctrine in this pointe, is, as he calleth it, Hæreſis, & Blaſphemia peſtilens, & execrabilis: *An Hereſie, and a Blaſphemie againſt God, Peſtilent and Curſed:*

Cerar. Lorichius De Miſſa prorogãda. In 7. par. Canonis.

That others of your ſide confeſſe, that this your vſe of Miniſtration vnder One Kinde, whiche nowe ye cal Catholique, began firſte, not of Chriſte, or his Apoſtles, or any Ancient Learned Father: but onely of the errour, or, as he better termeth it, of the ſimple Deuotion of the People:

Struin Gard. in the Diuels ſophiſtrie.

That Albertus Pighius, the ſtoutest gallante of al your Campe, graunteth there haue benne, and be many Abuſes in your Maſſe, notwithſtandinge ye haue tolde vs far otherwiſe:

Albertus Pighius De Miſſa Priuata.

That Pope Pius oftentimes graunted, and bled commonly to ſaie, He ſawe greate cauſes, why Prieſtes ſhoulde be reſtoared to the libertie of Marriage: That Pope Adrian by his Legate Cheregatus confeſſed openly at Norenberg in the Generall Diet of al the Princes of Germanie, that al the ill of the Churche came firſte à culmine Pontificio, *From the toppe Caſtle of the Pope:*

Platina in Pio. 2. Io. Sleidanus. Lib. 4.

And to be ſhort. M. Hardinge, it might haue pleaſed you to remember, that your ſelfe in your firſte Booke, in the Defence of your Priuate Maſſe, haue written thus:
Mary, I denie not, but that it were more commendable, and more Godly on the Churches parte, if many wel diſpoſed, and examined, woulde be partakers of the bleſſed Sacramente with the Prieſte. *M. Hard. fo. 22 b*

Al theſe thinges, M. Hardinge, be they Vſes, or Abuſes: Reaſonable, or Vnreaſonable: Right, or Wronge: Better or worſe: We they neuer ſo wicked, neuer ſo Blaſphemous, neuer ſo curſed, yet be they ſtoutely defended ſtil, and no hope offered of amendement: With what Conſcience of your parte, he onely ſeeth, that ſeeth the Conſcience. You graunte, ye perſecute your brethren, where ye haue the Sworde, and maie perſecute: but as Sara did Agar: as Chriſte did the Iewes: and not otherwiſe. Verily, M. Hardinge, that Chriſte or Sara were perſecutours, I haue not greatly bearde. But I remember Chryſoſtome ſaithe thus: Nunquid Ouis Lupum perſequitur aliquando? Non, ſed Lupus ouem. Sic enim Caim perſequutus eſt Abel: non Abel Caim. Sic Iſmael perſequutus eſt Iſaac, non Iſaac Iſmael: Sic Iudæi Chriſtum, non Chriſtus Iudæos: Hæretici Chriſtianos, non Chriſtiani Hæreticos. Ergo ex fructibus eorum cognoſcetis eos: *What, doothe the Sheepe perſecute the Woulfe at any time? No, but the Woulfe doothe perſecute the Sheepe. For ſo Caim perſecuted Abel, not*

Gene. 16. Iohn. 2.

Chryſo. in Matthæ. Homil. 19.

Perſequution for Loue.

Abel Caim: So Iſmael perſecuted Iſaac, not Iſaac Iſmael: So the Iewes perſecuted Chriſte, not Chriſte the Iewes: So the Heretiques perſequute the Chriſtians, not the Chriſtians the Heretiques. Therefore ye ſhal knowe them by their Fruites.

S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Non eo modo perſecutionem paſsi ſunt Pſeudoprophetæ ab Elia, quomodo ipſe Elias à Rege nequiſsimo: *Neither were the Falſe Prophetes ſo perſecuted by Elias, as Elias was perſecuted by the wicked Kinge.* Surely Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Quem videris in ſanguine perſequutionis gaudentem, Lupus eſt: *Whome ſo euer ye ſee reioicinge in the Bloudde of perſequution, he is the Woulfe.*

Auguſt. contra Liter. Petiliæ. Lib. 2. Cap. 19.

Chryſoſt. in Opere Imperfecto in Matthæ. Homil. 19.

In veſpis.

But yee pretende greate good wil, and ſaie, Ye perſecute and murder your Brethren for Loue, as Chriſte perſequuted the Iewes. So I trowe, Ariſtophanes ſaith, Philippides **toke a cudgel, and beatte his Father, and al for loue. Howe be it, M. Hardinge, neither are you armed, as** Chriſte **was armed: nor was** Chriſte armed, **as you are armed. I muſt ſaie to you, as** S. Auguſtine ſaithe vnto the Heretiques the Donatiſtes: Hanc formam ne ab ipſis quidem Iudæis perſecutoribus accepiſtis. Illi enim perſequuti ſunt Carnem ambulantis in terra: Vos Euangelium ſedentis in Cœlo: *Ye learned not this fourme of perſequution, no not of the Iewes. For they perſequuted the Fleaſhe of Chriſte walkinge in the Earthe: You perſequute the Goſpel of Chriſte ſittinge in Heauen.* Robert Holcote emonge other his doubtes moueth this queſtion, An Amor ſit odium: *Whether Loue be hatred, or no.* **If he were nowe aliue, and ſawe your dealinge, and the kindneſſe of your Loue, I beleue, he woulde put the mater out of queſtion, and ſaie, vndoubtedly your Loue is hatred, it is no Loue. So** Moſes ſaith, *Iſmael plaied or ſported with Iſaac.* **But** S. Paule ſaithe, **The ſame plaieinge and ſportinge was perſecution. For thus he writeth:** *He, that was after the Fleaſhe, perſequuted him, that was after the Sprite.*

Holcote. In. 1. Sétен. Queſt. 3. Arti. 8. Dubi. 2.

Orig. in Geneſ. Homil. 7.

Gene. 21.

Galat. 4.

Iohan. 16.

I doubte not, but you thinke, of your parte it is wel done. For ſo Chriſte ſaith, *Who ſo euer ſhal Murder you, ſhal thinke he offereth a Sacrifice vnto God.* **And your ſelues haue ſette to this note in greate Letters in the Margine of your Decrees:** Iudæi mortaliter peccaſſent, ſi Chriſtum non Crucifixiſſent: *The Iewes had Sinned deadly, if they had not hanged Chriſte vpon the Croſſe.* Benedictus Deus, qui nõ dedit nos in captionem Dentibus eorum: *Bleſſed be God, that hath not geuen vs to be a Praie vnto their Teeth.*

Diſt. 17. Item. In Margine.

To al the reſte it is ſufficiente for M. Hardinge to ſaie, They be Blaſphemous Hereſies: wicked Actes: Luthers Hereſies, and Villanies: Robbinge of Churches: Breaches of Vowes: Fleaſhely pleaſures: Abandoninge of the Holy Sacramentes: Malices, Sclaunders, and Lies. **And beſides theſe thinges, in effecte he anſweareth nothinge. Now to anſweare nothinge with ſome thinge, it were worthe nothinge.**

The Apologie, Cap. 3. Diuiſion. 5.

Nowe therefore, if it be leeful for the ſoldes to be eloquent & ſinetongued in ſpeakinge euil, ſurely it becommeth not vs in our cauſe, beinge ſo very good, to be doumbe in anſweringe truely. For, menne to bee careleſſe, what is ſpoken by them and theire owne mater, be it neuer ſo falſely & ſclaunderouſely ſpoken, (eſpecially when it is ſuche, that the Maieſtie of God, & the cauſe of Religion maie thereby be dammaged) is the parte doubtleſſe of diſſolute and retcheleſſe perſons, and of them, whiche wickedly winke at the iniuries donne vnto the Name of God. For although other wronges, yee oftentimes greate, maie be borne & diſſembled of a milde and Chriſtian man: yet he that goeth ſmoothely awaie and diſſembleth the mater when he is noted of Hereſie, Ruffinus was woont to denie, that man to be a Chriſtian. Wee therefore wil doo the ſame thinge, whiche al Lawes, which natures owne voice doothe commaunde to be donne, and whiche Chriſte him ſelfe did in like caſe when he was checked and reuiled: to the intente wee maie put of from vs theſe mennes ſclaunderous accuſations, and maie defende ſoberly and truely our owne cauſe and innocencie.

M.

M. Hardinge.

Yee haue not proued, the Truthe to be of your side, nor euer shal be able to proue, mainteininge the Doctrine of the Lutherans, Zwinglians, and Caluinistes, as ye doo. Nowe al dependeth of that pointe. And bicause yee haue not the Truthe, what so euer ye saie, it is soone confuted: and what so euer ye bringe, it is to no purpose.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

This is the very issue of the case: Whether the Doctrine that we professe, be the Truthe, or no. Whiche thinge through Goddes Grace, by this our conference, in parte maie appeare. I beseeche God the Authour of al Truthe, and the Father of Light, so to open our hartes, that the thinge that is the Truthe in deede, maie appeace to vs to be the Truthe.

The Apologie, Cap. 4. Diuision. 2.

For Christe verily, when the Phariseis charged him with Sorcery, as one that had some familiare Spirites, and wrought many thinges by theire helpe: I, saide he, haue not the Diuel, but doo glorifie my Father: but it is you, that haue dishonoured me, and put me to rebuke and shame. And S. Paule, when Festus the Lieutenaunt scorned him, as a mad man: I (saide he) moste deere Festus, am not mad, as thou thinkest, but I speake the woordes of Truthe and sobrenesse. And the ancient Christians, when they were sclaundered to the people for mankillers, for Idulterers, for committers of incest, for disturbers of the common Weales, and did perceiue, that by suche sclaunderous accusations the Religion whiche they professed, might be brought in question, namely if they shoulde seeme to holde their peace, and in manner confesse the faulte: least this might hinder the free course of the Gospel, they made Orations, they put vp Supplications, and made meanes to Emperours, and Princes, that they might defende them selues and theire Felowes in open Audience.

M. Hardinge.

VVhen ye prooue, that ye haue the Truthe, then maye ye be admitted, in your Defense to alleage the example of Christe, of S. Paule, and of the firste Christians. But nowe wee tel you, beinge as you are, these examples serue you to no purpose. And for ought yee haue saide hitherto, the Anabaptistes, Libertines, Zwenkfeldians, Nestorians, Eunomians, Arians, and al other pestiferous Heretikes might saye the same aswel as ye. Christe was charged of the Iewes with vsinge the power of impure Sprites, blasphemously: Paule was scorned of Festus, as a mad man, without cause: the Ancient Christians were accused by the Infidels of hainous crimes, falsely. But ye are accused of Heresies and sundrie Impieties, by Godly, VVise, and Faithful men, vpon Zeale, by good aduise, and truely. And as for those Auncient Christians, when they made Apologies or Orations in the Defense of the Christen Faithe, they did it so as became Christen men, plainely and openly. Either they offered them to the Emperours with their owne handes, or put to their names, and signified to whome they gaue the same. As S. Hilary deliuered a Booke in Defense of the Catholique Faithe against the Arians to Constantius. Melito and Apollinaris wrote their Apologies to the Emperours. S. Iustine the Philosopher and Martyr gaue his firste Apologie for the Christians to the Senate of the Romaines, the seconde to Antonius Pius Emperoure: Tertullian to the Romaines. S. Apollonius the Romaine Senatour and Martyr, did Reade his Booke openly in the Senate house, which he had made in Defense of the Christian Faithe. But ye doo your thinges that ought to be donne openly, in Hucker Mucker. Ye set foorth your Apologie in the name of the Churche of Englande, before any meane parte of the Churche were priuie to it, and so as though either ye were ashamed of it, or afraide to abide by it. The inscription of it is directed neither to Pope nor Emperoure, nor to any Prince, nor to the Churche, nor to the general Councel then beinge when ye wrote it, as it was moste conuenient. There is no mans name set to it: It is Printed without Priuilege of the Prince, contrary to the Lawe in that behalfe made: allowed neither by Parlament, nor by Proclamation, nor agreed vpon by the Clergie in Publike and lawful Synode. This packinge becommeth you: it becommeth not the vpright Professours of the Truthe. VVherefore your vnlawful Booke, as it is, so it maie be called an Inuective, or rather a Famous Libel, and sclaunderous VVrite, as that whiche seemeth to haue benne made in a corner, and caste abroade in the streetes, the Authours whereof the Ciuil Lawe punisheth sharpely.

Luke. 11. Act. 26. Tertul. in Apolog. The Apologies of the old Fathers were lawfully published. Eccle. Hist. Lib. 4. Ca. 26. Eccle. Hist. li. 5. ca. 21. The Apologie a famous Libel. Vntruthe.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Howe farre forthe these examples maie serue vs, we remit the iudgemente therof to the discrete Christian Reader. It is not ynough thus to crie out, Impieties, and Heresies. M. Hardinges bare Worde in this behalfe is not sufficient to warrant an euidence. Certainely emonge other greate comfortes, that we haue in Goddes mercies, this is one, and not the leaste, that touchinge the Innocencie, and right of oure cause, we maie saie to you, as Christe saide to the Phariseis, *Wee haue not the Diuel, but wee glorifie our Father:* Or, as S. Paule saide vnto Festus, *Wee are not madde* (M. Hardinge) *as ye reporte of vs: but wee vtter vnto you the Woordes of Truthe and Sobrietie.*

Iohan. 8.

Act. 6.

But this is a piteous faulte: The names of al the Bishoppes, Deanes, Archedeacons, Personnes, Vicares, and Curates of Englande are not set to our Apologie. It is directed neither to the Emperoure, nor to the Pope, nor to the Councel. Neither is it Printed with Priuilege of the Prince. This laste clause is a manifeste Untruthe, and maie easily be reproued by the Printer. Hereof ye conclude, It is a slaunderous Libel, and was written vnder a Hedge, and, as you saie, in Hucker Mucker.

Firste, were it graunted, that al ye saie of Hilarie, Melito, Iustinus, Tertullian, and Apollonius were true: Yet muste it nedes followe, that al Bookes, that are not Subscribed with the Authoures names, were written in a corner? Firste to beginne with the Scriptures. tel vs, M. Hardinge, who wrote the Bookes of Genesis, of Exodus, of Leuiticus, of Numeri, of Deuteronomium, of Iosue, of the Iudges, of the Kinges, of the Chronicles, of Iob, &c. Who wrote these Bookes? I saie: Who Authorized them? Who Subscribed his name? Who sette to his Seale? The Booke of VVisedome by some is Fathered vpon Philo, by some vpon Salomon. The Epistle vnto the Hebrewes, some saie, was written by S. Paule: Some, by Clemens: Some, by Barnabas: Some, by some other: and so are we vncertaine of the Authours name. S. Marke, S. Luke, S. Iohn, neuer once named them selues in their Gospels. The Apostles Creede, the Canons of the Apostles, by what names are they Subscribed? Howe are they authorized? To what Pope, to what Emperoure were they offered? To leaue others the Auncient Doctours of the Churche, whiche, as you knowe, are often misnamed, Ambrose for Augustine, Greeke for Latine, Newe for Olde: your Doctour of Doctours, the faireste flower, and croppe of your garlande Gratianus, is so wel knowen by his name, that wise menne can not wel tel, what name to geue him. Erasmus saith of him thus, Quisquis fuit, siue Gratianus, siue Crasianus: *What so euer name wee maie geue him: be it* Gratianus, *or* Crasianus. And againe he saithe, Eruditi negant, illam Gratiani, nescio cuius, congeriem vlla vnquam Publica Ecclesiæ authoritate fuisse comprobatam: *The learned saie, that* Gratians *Collection, or heape of maters, was neuer allowed by any Publique Authoritie of the Churche.* And againe, Non constat vllis argumentis, quis fuerit Gratianus, quo tempore opus suum exhibuerit, cuius Pontificis, cuius Concilij fuerit Authoritate comprobatum: *It cannot appeare by any tokens of recorde, neither what this* Gratian *was: nor at what time he offered vp his Booke: nor what Councel, nor what Pope allowed it.*

Erasm. In Præfat. in tertiam Seriem quarti. Tom. Hieronymi.

Eras. in Præfatione in 4. Tom. Hieronymi.

Who subscribed the late Councel of Colaine? Who subscribed the Booke not longe sithence set abroade vnder the name of the Churche of Colaine, and named Antididagma? To be shorte, who subscribed your owne late Booke intituled the Apologie of Priuate Masse? Where were they written? Where were they Subscribed? By what authoritie, and vnder what names were they allowed? I wil saie nothinge of your late Famouse Volume bearinge the name of Marcus Antonius Constantius. This Booke, as you se, bathe three greate names: Notwithstandinge the Authour him selfe had but two: and yet not one of al these three. VVhat, M. Hardinge, would you make your Brethren beleeue, that al these be but slaunderous Writers, diuised onely in Hucker Mucker, and vnder a Hedge?

The Decree, the Apostles made in the fiftenthe Chapter of the Actes, it appeareth not, it was so curiously subscribed with al their names. The Protestation

Actor. 15.

of the

of the Bohemiens in the Councel of Basile, the Confession of the Churches of Geneua and Heluetia, for ought that I knowe, haue no suche Publique Subscriptions. Neither is it necessarie, nor commonly vsed, to ioyne Priuate mennes names to Publique maters: neither in so mightie and ample a Realme, vpon al incident occasions is it so easy to be done. Briefly, our Apologie is confirmed by as many names, as the highe Courte of Parlamente of Englande is confirmed.

Neither was the same conceiued in so darke a corner, as M. Harding imagineth. For it was afterwarde imprinted in Latine at Parise: and hath bene sithence Translated into the Frenche, the Italian, the Duitche, and the Spanishe tongues: and hathe benne sente, & borne abroade into France, Flaunders, Germanie, Spaine, Poole, Hungarie, Denmarke, Sueuelande, Scotlande, Italie, Naples, and Rome it selfe, to the iudgement, and trial of the whole Churche of God. Yea it was Readde, and sharply considered in your late Couent at Trident, and greate threates made there, that it shoulde be answeared, and the mater by two Notable learned Bishoppes taken in hande, the one a Spaniarde, the other an Italian: Whiche two notwithstandinge, these fiue whole yeres haue yet donne nothinge, nor, I beleue, intende any thinge to do. In deede certaine of your Brethren haue bene often gnawinge at it: but suche as care nothinge, nor is cared, what they write.

But if names be so necessarie, we haue the names of the whole Clergie of Englande, to confirme the Faithe of our Doctrine, and your name M. Hardinge, as you can wel remember emongst the reste: onlesse, as ye haue already denied your Faith, so ye wil nowe also denie your name.

To conclude, it is greater modestie to publishe our owne Booke, without Name, then, as you do, to publishe other mennes Bookes in your owne Names. For in deede, M. Hardinge, the Bookes ye sende so thicke ouer, are not yours. Ye are but Translatours: ye are no Authours. If euery birde shoulde fetche againe his owne Feathers, alas your poore Chickens woulde die for colde.

But you saie, We offered not our Booke to the Pope. No, neither ought we so to do. He is not our Bishop: He is not our Iudge. We maie saie vnto him, as the Emperour Constantius said sometime to Pope Liberius, Quota es tu pars Orbis terrarum? *What greate portion arte thou of the Whole Worlde?* As for your Councel of Trident, God wote, it was a sely Couent, for ought that maie appeare by their Conclusions. *Theodoret. in Hist. Ecclesiast.*

We offered the Defense, and profession of our Doctrine vnto the whole Church of God: and so vnto the Pope, and to the Councel to, if thei be any parte, or member of the Churche: and by Goddes mercie, shal euer be hable in al places bothe with our handes, and with our Bodies to selde an accoumpte of the hope we haue in Iesus Christe. Whereas it liketh you to terme our Apologie a Sclaunderous Libel, I doubte not, but who so euer shal indifferently consider your Booke, shal thinke M. Hardinges tongue wanteth no sclaunder.

The Apologie, Cap. 4. Diuision. 3.

But wee truely, seeinge that so many thousandes of our brethren in these laste twentie yeeres haue borne witnesse vnto the Truthe, in the middes of moste paineful tormentes, that coulde be deuised: and when Princes desirous to restraine the Gospel, sought many waies, but preuailed nothinge, and that now almoste the whole worlde doeth beginne to open their eies to beholde the lighte: wee take it, that our cause hathe already bene sufficiently declared and defended, and thinke it not needful to make many woordes, seeinge the mater saithe ynoughe for it selfe.

M. Hardinge.

The reasons and examples ye bringe for it, conclude nothinge. Bicause lackinge Truthe, ye builde vpon a false grounde, what so euer ye set vp, eftsones it falleth, beinge staied by no iuste prouse. Here ye goe foorthe, and faine woulde ye proppe vp that mater: but youre Reasons be as weake as before.

There haue not ſo many thouſandes of your Brethren benne burnte for Hereſie in theſe laſte twentie yeeres, as ye pretende. But when ye come to boaſtinge, then haue yea greate grace in vſinge the Figure Hyperbole. Then Scores be Hundreds: Hundreds be thouſandes: Thouſandes be Millions.

But what was Michael Seruetus the Arian, who was burnte at Geneua by procurement of Caluine, a Brother of yours? Dauid George that tooke vpon him to be Chriſte, who was taken vp after he was buried and burnte at Baſile, was he your Brother? To come neare home, Ioan of Kente that filthe, who tooke foorth a leſſon further then you taught her (I mowe) ot yet Preache, was ſhe a ſiſter of yours? So many Adamites, ſo many Zwenckfeldians, ſo many hundreds of Anabaptiſtes and Libertines, as haue within your twentie yeeres benne ridde out of their liues by fire, ſworde, and water, in ſundrie partes of Chriſtendome, were they al of your bleſſed Brotherhed?

Seruetus burnte for Hereſie at Geneua. Dauid George. Ioan of Kente.

And this is the chiefe argumente yee make in al that Huge Dungehil of your ſtinking Martyres, whiche yee haue intituled Actes and Monumentes. But we tel you, It is not deathe that iuſtifieth the cauſe of dyinge: But it is the cauſe of dyinge that iuſtifieth the Deathe.

Actes and Monumentes.

Princes (yee ſaie) were deſirous to reſtraine your Goſpel, and though they went about it by many waies, yet preuailed they nothinge. Therefore your Doctrine muſt needes be the true Goſpel. As good an Argumente as this is, maie Theeues make in their defenſe. For Princes be deſirous to keepe their Dominions from Robbinge, and haue euer diuiſed ſtraight Lawes and puniſhmentes for reſtraint of Theeues: yet be Theeues euery where, and thefte is daily committed.

meanes. A weake argument of Truthe.

And whereas your Goſpel is a groſſe Goſpel, a Carnal Goſpel, a Belly Goſpel: wonder it is not, if thoſe people be not wholy withdrawen from aſſenting to the ſame, who be not of the fineſt wittes, and be muche geuen to the Seruice of the Belly, and of the thinges beneath the Belly. Yet where the Princes haue vſed moſte diligence, and beſte meanes to ſtoppe the courſe of youre Hereſies, there the people remaine moſte Catholike: As euery man maie iudge by vewe of Italy, Spaine, Baſe Almaine, and Fraunce, before that weighty Sceptre by Goddes ſecrete prouidence for puniſhment of ſinne, was committed to feeble handes, that for tender age were not able to beare it.

This Carnal Goſpel ſoone taketh place amonge carnal hearers.

Your other argument, whereby ye woulde perſuade your Goſpel to be the Truthe, is, that now (as ye crake) almoſte the whole worlde dooth beginne to open their eies to beholde the light. This argumente ſeruieth maruelous wel for Antichriſte. And truely, if he be not already come, yee maie very wel ſeeme to be his foreronners. Nay Sirs, if it be true that ye ſaie, that almoſte the whole world looketh that waie, knowinge that in the latter daies, and towarde the ende of the worlde, iniquitie ſhal abounde, and the Charitie of the more parte ſhal waxe colde: VVee maie rather make a contrarie argument, and iudge your Goſpel to be erroneous and falſe, becauſe the multitude is ſo ready to receiue it. Againe, Chriſte hathe not loued his Churche ſo litle, as that the worlde ſhould nowe beginne to open their eies to beholde the light. For the ſame cauſe preſuppoſeth a former general darkeneſſe. It ſtandeth not with Chriſtes promiſſes made to the Churche, touchinge his beinge with the Churche al daies to the worldes ende, and the Holy Ghoſtes remaininge with it the Sprite of Truthe for euer, that he ſhoulde ſuffer his Churche, to continewe in darkeneſſe and lacke of Truthe, theſe thouſande yeeres paſte, and nowe at the latter daies to reuele the Truthe of his Goſpel by Apoſtates, Vowebreakers, Churcherobbers, and ſuche other moſte valike to the Apoſtles.

The argument of the defenders ſeruinge wel for Antichriſt. Matth. 24. The argument of multitude returned vpon the defenders to aduerſy concluſion. Matth. 28. Ioan. 14.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

What ſo euer wée ſaie, here appeareth ſmal weight in M. Hardinges ſaieinges. Wée make no boaſte of the numbers, and multitudes of our Partyes. And yet, as 2. Cor. 11. S. Paule ſaithe, **if wée ſhoulde néedes boaſte, wée ſhoulde chiefly boaſte of ſuche oure infirmities. But wée reioiſe with them, and geue God thankes in their behalfe, for that it hathe pleaſed him to prepare their hartes vnto temptation, to trie and purifie them as Golde in Fornace, and to keepe them faithful vnto the ende.**

As for Dauid George, **and** Seruete **the** Arian, **and ſuche other the like, they were yours, M. Hardinge, they were not of vs: You brought them vp, the one in** Spaine, **the other in** Flaunders. **Wée detected theire Hereſies, and not you: Wée araigned them: Wée condemned them: Wée put them to the Execution of the Lawes. It ſeemeth very muche to cal them our Brothers, becauſe wée burnte them. It is knowen to Children, it is not the deathe, but the cauſe of the deathe that maketh a Partye.**

August. in Pſal. 34. Par. 2. S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Tres erant in Cruce: Vnus Saluator: Alter Saluandus: Tertius Damnandus. Omnium par Pœna, ſed diſpar cauſa: *There were three hanginge on the Croſſe: The firſte was the Sauioure: The ſeconde to be ſaued: The thirde to be damned. The Paine of al three was one, but the cauſe was diuerſe.*

Your Anabaptiſtes **and** Zuenkfeldians, **wée knowe not. They finde Harbour emongſt you in** Auſtria, Sleſia, Morauia, **and in ſuche other Countries, and Cities, where the Goſpel of Chriſte is ſuppreſſed: but they haue no acquaintance with vs, neither in** Englande, **nor in** Germanie, **nor in** Fraunce, **nor in** Scotlande, **nor in** Denmarke, **nor in** Sueden, **nor in any place els, where the Goſpel of Chriſte is clearely preached. But it hathe benne your greate Policie theſe many late yéeres, when wée**

murdered

murdered the Saintes of God, firſte to rote out their Tongues, for feare of ſpeakinge: and then afterwarde to tel the people, they were Anabaptiſtes, or Arians, or what ye liſted. With ſuche policie Nero ſommetime that Bloudy Tyranne burnte the Chriſtians in heapes together, and made open Proclamations, that they were Traitours, and Rebelles, and had fired the Cittie of Rome.

Suetonius. Tacitus. Quillus. Antonine.

It pleaſeth you for lacke of other Cauſion, to cal the Storie of Martyres a Dunghil of Lies. But theſe Lies ſhal remaine in Recorde for euer, to teſtifie, and to condemne your Bloudy dedinges. Ye haue impriſoned your Brethren, ye haue ſtripte them naked, ye haue ſcourged them with Roddes, ye haue burnte their handes and armes with flaminge Torches, ye haue famiſhed them, ye haue drowned them, ye haue ſummoned them beinge deade, to appeare before you out of theire graues, ye haue ripte vp their buried Carkeſſes, ye haue burnte them, ye haue throwen them out into the Dunghil: ye toke a poore Babe ſallinge from his Mothers Wombe, & in moſte cruel, and Barbarous maner threwe him into the fiere.

All theſe thinges, M. Hardinge, are true: they are no Lies: The cries, and conſcience of many thouſandes can witneſſe your dedinges. The Blond of innocent Abel crieth to God from the earthe: and vndoubtedly he wil require it at your handes. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, as it is alleged before, Quem videris in Sanguine perſecutionis gaudentem, is Lupus eſt: *Who ſo euer hathe pleaſure in the Blonde of perſecution, the ſame is a Wolfe.* Ye ſlewe your Brethren ſo cruelly, not for Murder, or Robberie, or any other grieuous crime, they had committed, but onely for that they truſted in the Liuinge God. Howe be it, we maie ſale with the Olde Father Tertullian, Crudelitas veſtra noſtra gloria eſt: *Your cruelties is our glorie.*

Chryſoſt. in Matth. Homi. 19

Tertul. ad ſcapulam.

Whereas we auouche the Power, and Authoritie of Goddes Holy worde, for that the more it is trodden downe, the more it groweth, & for that the Kinges, and Princes of this worlde with al their puiſſance, and policie were neuer hable to rote it out, your anſweare is, that this reaſon maie ſerue Chriſtes, as wel as vs. To diſſemble youre odious compariſons, howe lightly ſo euer it ſhal pleaſe you to weighe this reaſon, yet your Forefathers the Phariſeis in olde time ſeemed to make ſomme accompte of it. For thus they murmured, and miſliked emonge them ſelues: Videtis, nos nihil proficere, Ecce Mundus totus poſt eum abijt: *Ye ſee, we can doo no good. Lo the whole worlde (for al that we can do) is gonne after him.* Tertullian likewiſe ſaithe, Exquiſitior quæque crudelitas veſtra illecebra magis eſt Sectæ. Plures efficimur quoties metimur à vobis. Semen eſt Sanguis Chriſtianorum: *The greateſt cruelties that ye can diuiſe, is an entiſement to our Selte. Howe many of vs ſo euer ye murder, when ye comme to the viewe, ye finde vs moe and moe. The Seede of this encreaſe is Chriſtian Blonde.* So S. Auguſtine, Ligabantur, includebantur, cædebantur, torquebantur, vrebantur: & multiplicabantur: *They were fettered, they were impriſoned, they were beaten, they were racke, they were burnte: and yet they multiplied.* S. Cyprian ſaithe, Sacerdos Dei Euangelium tenens, & Chriſti præcepta cuſtodiens, occidi poteſt, vinci non poteſt: *The Prieſte of God holdinge the Teſtamente in his handes, killed he maie be, but ouercomme he can not be.* So likewiſe Nazianzene, Morte viuit: vulnere naſcitur: depaſtum augetur: *By deathe it liueth: by woundinge it ſpringeth: by diminiſhinge it encreaſeth.*

Iohan. 12.

Tertul. in Apologetico.

Auguſt. de Ciui. lib. 22. cap. 6.

Cyprian. Lib. 1. Epiſt. 3

Gregorius. Nazianzen. in reditum ſuum ex agro.

θανάτῳ ζῇ, καὶ τραυματι φύεται, καὶ ἀύξεται διαπανώμενος.

Euſeb. li. 4 ca. 8.

Thus theſe Holy Fathers, when they ſawe, the Goſpel of Chriſt encreaſed and grewe by perſecution, contrarie to al iudgement of reaſon, and worldly policie, they were enforced, contrarie to M. Hardinges iudgement, therein to acknowledge the mightie power, and hande of God, and an vndoubted teſtimonie of the Truthe. Iuſtinus a Godly Learned Father, and Martyre ſaithe thus of him ſelfe, Cùm audirem Chriſtianos publicè traduci, & exagitari ab omnibus, viderem autem eos ad mortem, & ad omnia, quæ ad terrorem excogitari poſſent, eſſe intrepidos, cogitabam, nullo modo poſſe fieri, vt illi in aliquo ſcelere viuerent: *When I (beinge an Heathen, and one of Platoes Scolars) heard that the Chriſtians were accuſed, and reuiled of al menne, and yet ſawe them goe to theire deathe: and to al manner terible, and cruel tormentes, quietly, and without feare, I thought with mee ſelfe, it was not poſſible, that ſuche menne ſhoulde liue in any wickednieſſe.* The like writeth Sozomenus of ye Chriſtians in the Primitiue Church:

Nec

Sozom. lib. 1. ca. 1. Ἄλλου πάσου ὑποπτεύσαι, ὡς ὑπὲρ μεγίστων ἄθλων τὸν ἀγῶνα ὑπομένοντι.

Nec adulatione victi, nec minis perterriti, magnum omnibus argumentum dabant, sese de maximis præmijs in certamen descendere: *The Christians neither relentinge by faire meanes, nor shrinkinge for threates, made it well appeare to euery man, that it was for some greate reward, they suffered suche trouble.*

Psal. 2. Prouerb. 21.

These learned Fathers therefore saiwe, that M. Hardinge coulde not see, the encreasinge of the Gospel through deathe, & persecution, maugre the might of worldly Princes, is an euident token of the Truthe. The Prophete Dauid saithe, *The Princes come, and consulted togeather against God, and against his Christe. But he that dwelleth in Heauen, wil laughe them to scorne.* There is no wisedome, there is no policie, there is no counsel against the Lorde.

Further you saie, Our Gospel is grosse, and the people dulle, and sensual, and geuen to their belly, and beastly pleasure, and therefore the apter, and readier to receiue the same. O M. Hardinge, what a desperate cause is this, that cannot stande without suche manifeste blasphemie of the Gospel of Christe, and dispiteful reproche of Goddes people? Certainely S. Paule saith, *The Gospel is the power of God vnto Saluation.* And the Prophete Dauid saithe, *The people is Christes inheritance.* What hath ỳ people so muche offended you, that you should either in this place, so scornefully, and so reprochefully reporte of them, or in youre former Booke so disdeignefully cal them Swiene, and Dogges: Yet is it not so longe sithence your selfe were an earnest professour of the same Gospel, were it neuer so grosse. Where was then youre fineneſſe, and sharpeneſſe of witte? Where was your belly? Where was the reste? You should not so soone haue forgotten your owne selfe.

Rom. 1. Psalm. 2. M. Har. fo. 115. b.

Surely, M. Hardinge, neither wil the sensual man, drowned in filthy, & beastly pleasures, take vp his Crosse, and folowe Christe, & yelde his necke to your swerde, or his body to your fiere: neither is it a grosse, or sensual Gospel, that wil leade him to the same.

You saie, it standeth not with Goddes promisse, to forsake his Churche a thousande yeres. It is mutche for you, M. Hardinge, openly to breake Goddes Commaundementes, to defile his Holy Sanctuarie, to turne Lighte into darkenesse, and darkenesse into light: and yet neuertheleſſe to binde him to his promisse. Al menne be liers, but God onely is true, and prevaileth, when he is iudged. God knoweth his owne. Christ wil be euermore with his Church, yea although the whole Church of Rome conspire against him.

Psalm. 50. 2. Tim. 2.

M. Hard. 90. b. *Addition.* ☞ Here M. Hardinge saithe, We succeede the Donatistes, and renewe their wretched obiection against the Churche &c. Howe be it, we are no Donatistes, as his owne conscience wel knoweth. The Donatistes enclosed the Churche of God within the bandes of one Countrie, and saide there was no Church, but onely their owne, whiche was in Aphrica. In like sorte, and with like Truthe, M. Hardinge so often, and so constantly telleth vs this daie, There is no Church, nor Saluation, but vnder the obedience of the See of Rome. It is easie therfore to see, who are the children of those Fathers. We saie, as al the Holy, and Learned Doctoures haue saide: The Churche of God hathe bene euer from the beginninge, and shal continewe vnto the ende, and ouerspreadeth al the partes of the worlde, without limitation of time or place. Notwithstandinge, sommetimes by care, and diligence she is kepte neate, and cleane: sommetimes by negligence she is laide waste, and ouergrowen with weedes: and therefore she is compared vnto a gardine. Sommetimes her light is cleare, and beautiful: sommetimes she waneth, & groweth darke: And therefore she is compared vnto the Mone. Addition ☞

Cantic. 4. Cantic. 6.

M. Hard. fo. 89. The Churche, you saie, hangeth not of your wel dowinge. Goddes name therfore be blessed. For if it honge of you, it coulde not stande: It hangeth onely of the assurance of Gods Promisse: And the same Promisse God extended as wel to Hierusalem, and Antioche, as he did to the See of Rome. But nowe Antioche, where Peter had his firste Apostolique seate, and Hierusalem, where Christe him selfe first planted his Gospel, are bothe forsaken, and leaste vtterly without Faithe, and knowledge of God. Notwithstanding, God is true in al his wordes, yet vnto the wicked he saithe,

he saithe, Non est mihi voluntas in vobis: *I haue no wil, nor pleasure in you. I will receiue no Sacrifice at your handes.* Malach. 1.

And S. Paule saithe to the Churche of Rome, euen to the same Churche, wherein you so inmoderately glorie, and assure your selfe, it cannot erre, Noli autem sapere, Sed time: *Presume not, but stande in awe. For if God haue not spared his owne people of Israel, and Hierusalem (vnto whom he made his Promisse, that his name shoulde dwel there for euer,) howe mutche lesse wil he spare thee? Marke wel the mercie, and sharpenesse of God. His sharpenesse against them, that are fallen from him: but his mercie towardes thee, (ô thou Churche of Rome) if thou continewe stil in his mercie. Otherwise euen thou shalte likewise be hewen downe.* Rom. 1.

Thus, M. Hardinge, S. Paule aduiseth the Churche of Rome to walke in awe, with feare and reuerence: And not to presume of her selfe, that she cannot erre.

The Argumente that you fourme thereof, taken, as you saie, out of the Scriptures, is very simple. For thus it standeth: Christe hathe promised to be with his Disciples, & with his Faithful for euer vnto the ende of the worlde, Ergo, the Church of Rome can neuer erre in mater of Faithe.

The Prophete Hieremie aduiseth you better: *Saie not* (saithe he) *The Temple of God, The Temple of God.* We haue his Temple, We haue his Worde, We haue his Promisse. *Put no confidence in suche woordes. They be woordes of Lieinge, and Vanite,* saith the Prophete: They wil deceiue you. Hierem. 7.

So saithe the Prophete Micheas of the Priestes, that deceiued the people: Super Dominum requieſcunt, dicentes, Nónne est Iehoua in medio nostri? ideo non veniet super nos malum. Idcirco propter vos Sion, vt ager arabitur, & Hierusalem erit in aceruum, & Mons Domus in excelsa syluæ: *They reaste them selues quietly vpon the Lorde,* that is to saie, they embolden them selues vpon his promisses. *Beholde,* saie they, *is not the Lorde in the middeste emongest vs? Therefore none il shal happen to vs. Euen therefore* (saithe the Prophete) *shal the Castle of Sion be ploughed vp, as the corne fielde, and Hierusalem shal lie as a heape of stoanes, and the Mounte of the Temple, shal stande waste as a firesse.* Micha. 3.

But why do you so muche abate your reckeninge? Why make you not by your ful accoumpte of your fiftiene hundred threscoare & fire yéres, as yé were wonte to do? Ye haue here liberally, and of youre selfe quite striken of fiue hundred threscore and fire yéres, that is to saie, the whole time, wherein the Apostles of Christe, and Holy Martyres, and other Learned Fathers, and Doctoures liued: in whiche whole time, it appeareth by your owne secrete Confession, the Church of God might wel stande bothe without youre Priuate Masse (for then was there none) and also without many other your like fantasies. Neither ought you, M. Harding, so dárpely to be gréued, and to cal vs Apostates, and Heretiques, for that wé haue reformed either our Churches to the Paterne of that Churche, or our selues to the example of those Fathers. Verily in the iudgemente of the Godly, fiue hundred of those firste yéres are more worthe, then the whole thousande yéres that folowed afterwarde. M. Har. fo. 94. b.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ This (saithe M. Hardinge) is a manifest Blasphemie, and litle becommeth a Christian man. But wherefore, I beare smal reason. The Primitiue Church, whiche was vnder the Apostles, and Martyres, hath euermore benne coumpted the pureſt of al others without exception. And therefore the Ancient Fathers oftentimes appeale to the iudgemente thereof, as vnto the infallible standerde and measure of Truthe. S. Chrysostome speakinge hereof, althoughe not specially to this pourpose, saithe, Verè tum Cœlum Ecclesia fuit, Spiritu cuncta administrante, cuncta Ecclesiæ capita moderante, &c. Nunc verò vestigia tantùm rerum illarum tenemus: *Then verily the Churche was a Heauen, the Sprite of God orderinge al thinges, and directinge al the heades of the Churche. But nowe we scarcely haue the steppes and tokens of those thinges.* And immediately after he saith further, The Church now maie be likened to a woman, that hathe loste her olde modestie, hauinge onely certaine tokens and shewes of her former felicitie, as the cheastes, and forceres of pretious thinges, beinge vtterly voide of the Treasure. Thus saide S. Chrysostome, touchinge the decaie of the Churche: and yet he thoughte, his wordes imported no Blasphemie. If Chrysost. 1. Cor. Homil. 36.

the

the fourme of the Church were so much altered in Chrysostomes daies, that is aboue eleuen hundred yeres paste, What maie we then thinke of the times of Darkenesse, that haue folowed sithence? It was no Blasphemie therefore M. Hardinge, to saie, as we saie, The first fiue hundred yeres of the Churche are moze worthe, then the whole thousande, that folowed afterwarde. This rather is open Blasphemie, to compare the Churche of Rome, that nowe is, to a perfite man, as you do, and the Primitiue Churche of the Apostles, and holy Martyzes, vnto an Infante. This surely is Blasphemie against God.

Hieron. ad Pammachium & Oceanum.

Therefore I wil answeare you with the wordes of S. Hierome: Quisquis es assertor nouorum Dogmatum, quæso te, vt parcas Romanis auribus: parcas Fidei, quæ Apostolico ore laudatur. Cur post quadringentos annos docere nos niteris, quod antea nesciuimus? Cur profers in medium, quod Petrus, & Paulus edere noluerunt? Vsque ad hunc diem sine ista Doctrina Mundus Christianus fuit: *Thou, that arte a Mainteiner of newe Doctrine, what so euer thou be, I praie thee, spare the Romaine eares: spare the Faithe, that is commended by the Apostles mouthe. Why goest thou about nowe after foure hundred yeeres to teache vs that Faithe, which before we neuer knewe? Why bringest thou vs forth that thinge, that* Peter, *and* Paule *neuer vttered? Euermore vntil this date the Christian worlde hathe benne without this Doctrine.*

The Apologie, Cap. 4. Diuision. 7.

For if the Popes woulde, or els if they coulde weighe with theire owne selues the whole mater, & also the beginninges and proceedinges of our Religion, howe in a manner al theire trauaile hathe comme to naughte, no body diuinge it forewarde, and without any worldely healpe: and howe on the other side, oure cause, against the wil of Emperoures from the beginninge, against the willes of so many Kinges, in spite of the Popes, and almoste maugre the heade of al menne, hathe taken encrease, and by litle and litle spreadde ouer into al Countries, and is comme at lengthe into Kinges Courtes and Pallaces: Theise same thinges me thinketh might be tokens greate ynoughe to them, that God him selfe doothe strongely fighte in oure quarrel, and doothe from Heauen laugh at their enterpuses: and that the force of the Truth is suche, as neither Mannes Power, nor yet Helle gates are hable to roote it out.

M. Hardinge.

It is wel, that ye vse the terme of the beginninge and proceedinges of your Religion. For in deede of late yeeres it beganne, not at Ierusalem, but at VVittenberg. Neither was it firste deliuered vnto you by an Apostle, but by an Apostata. Stil it proceedeth, and the farther of from the ende. And wel maie ye name it your Proceedinges, for there is no staie in it. VVhat liketh to daie, misliketh to morowe. The seely beguiled soules that folowe it, be as S. Paule saithe, euer learninge, and neuer reachinge to the knowledge of the Truthe. 2. Tim. 3.

Vatruthe.

Did not your Religion beginne firste of Couetise, and grewe it not afterwarde of rancoure and malice, whiche Martin Luther conceiued against the Dominican Friers in Saxonie, because Albert the Archbishop of Mentz and Electour of the Empire, had admitted them to be Preachers of the Pardon of a Croisade against the Turkes, contrary to an Anciente custome, whereby the Augustine Friers, of whom Luther was one, had of longe time benne in possession of that prefermente. Is it not wel knowen what a stirre Frier Luther made against Iohn Tetzet the Frier of S. Dominikes order, for that the saide Tetzet was made chiefe Preacher of a pardon, wherein was greate gaine, and thereby him selfe was bereste of that sweete Morsel, whiche in hope he had almoste swallowed downe. The firste beginning of this new Gospel, & the occasio that firste moued Luther to hereste.

VVhere you saie, your Religion is spreadde abroade, and hathe taken so muche encrease against the willes of Princes, and almoste maugre the heade of al men: that is as false, as your Religion is.

Did not the greate slaughter of youre hundred thousande Boures of Germanie signifie to the worlde, your cause to haue had the helpe of man? VVhat maie we iudge of the greate League of Germaine Princes made at the diete of Smalcalde, for defense of your Lutheran Gospel? The diete of Smalcalde.

The troubles and tumultes of Fraunce raised by your Brethren the Huguenotes, and the lamentable outrages committed there for your Gospels sake, be they not a witnesse of freshe memorie, that your Religion is mainteined, sette foorthe, and defended with power and helpe of menne. The Huguenots of Fraunce.

That

That it is nowe at lengthe come euen into Kinges Courtes and Palaices, it moueth wise men no lesse to suspecte it, then to praise it.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Ye make youre selfe game, M. Hardinge, for that the Preachinge of the Gospel issued firste out of VVittenberg, and not from Rome: Notwithstandinge VVittenberg is a noble, & a Famous Vniuersitie, so generally frequented out of al forcine Countries, and so mutche commended for al kindes of tongues, and liberal knowledge, as not many the like this daie in Christendome.

But be it, that VVittenberg were so simple a Burrough, as M. Hardinge imagineth. Yet were it not more simple, then was the towne of Nazareth: in whiche poore Towne notwithstandinge, firste appeared the meste glorious, & greatest Light of the worlde. Christian modestie would not disdeigne the Truthe of God in respect of place. That rather becommeth the Proude Lokes of the Scribes, and Pharisees. Thei despised Christe and his Disciples, and called them Nazarenes, in despite of his Countrie. And there hence, it is likely, firste grewe that scorneful question vsed by Nathanael, Nunquid ex Nazareth potest aliquid esse boni? *Can any good thinge comme from Nazareth,* so poore a Towne? So Celsus the Heathen dispised the Religion of Christe, bicause it came (not from Rome, or Athens, but) from the Barbarous Iewes. For thus Origen reporteth of him: Dogma Christianum affirmat à Barbaris cepisse ortum, hoc est, à Iudæis: *He saithe, the Doctrine of the Christians had his beginninge onely from a Barbarous Nation, that is to saie, from the Iewes.* Iohan. 1. Origen. contrà Celsum. Lib. 1.

But this is the mightie hande and power of God. He chuseth the weake thinges of the worlde, to confounde the stronge: and the foolishe thinges of the worlde, to confounde the wise. He ouerthroweth the greate Goliath with a sely Slinge, and bloweth downe Antichriste in al his glorie with the breathe of his mouthe. I thanke thee, O Father, saithe Christe: for that thou haste hidde these thinges from the wise, and Politique: and haste reueled the same vnto the simple. The Faithe of Christe is not bounde to place. The whole Earthe is the Lordes, and al the fulnesse of the same. There is nowe no distinction of Greeke, and Barbarous: We are al one in Christe Iesu. 1. Corinth. 1. 1. Reg. 17. 2. Thess. 2. Matthæ. 11. Psalm. 24. Galat. 3.

Notwithstandinge, the Gospel of Christe that we professe, neither had his beginninge from that Learned Father Doctour Luther, nor came firste from VVittenberg. It is the same Gospel, wherevpon it is written by the Prophete, *The Lawe shal come out of Sion, and the Woorde of God out of Hierusalem.* Mich. 4.

Touchinge youre longe tale of Doctour Luthers auarice, & sale of Pardonnes, I minde not, nor neede not to answeare you. It is a simple stale sclaunder. Yet it often serueth youre turne of course, when other thinges beginne to faile. In deede Frere Tecel the Pardoner made his Proclamations vnto the people openly in the Churches in this sorte: Althoughe a man had laine with oure Lady the Mother of Christe, and had begotten her with Childe, yet were he able by the Popes power to Pardonne the faulte. Againste this, and other like foule Blasphemies Doctour Luther firste beganne to speake. Nowe whether this occasion were sufficiente, or no, let M. Hardinge him selfe be the Iudge. Iohan. Sleidan. lib. 13.

We graunte, the Princes, and Estates of the worlde haue nowe laide their power to assiste the Gospel. Goddes Holy Name therefore be blessed. Howe be it, the Gospel came not firste from them. It sprange vp, and grewe by them many wheres againste their willes.

Neither is the Gospel therefore the more to be suspected, bicause it hathe entered into Princes Courtes. Daniel was in Kinge Nabuchodonosors Palaice, & taught him to knowe the Liuinge God. S. Paule reioiced, and toke comfort in his bandes, for that there were some euen in Neroes Court, that began to harken to the Gospel. And Eusebius saithe, Valeriani Aula erat iam Ecclesia Dei: *Valerian the Emperours Courte was nowe become the Churche of God.* Athanasius saithe vnto the Emperoure Iouinian, Conueniens est Pio Principi, &c. *The Studie and loue of Godly thinges, is very meete for a Godly Prince. For so shal you surely haue youre harte euermore in the hande of God.* Philip. 1. Theod. li 4. ca. 3

Cyrill. in Epiſt. ad Theodoſ. & Valentinian.

Likewiſe ſaithe S. Cyril to the Emperours Theodoſius, and Valentinian: Ab ea, quę erga Deum eſt, pietate Reipub. veſtræ ſtatus pendet: *The ſtate, and aſſurance of youre Empire hangeth of your Religion towardes God.*

Sozom. li. 9. ca. 3

So likewiſe ſaithe Sozomenus of the Emperour Arcadius, Μόνη ἡ Εὐσέβεια αρκεῖ πρὸς σωτηρίαν τοῖς βασιλεύσι μᾶλλον ἢ τὰ στρατεύματα.

Therfore it behoueth Princes to vnderſtande the cauſes of Goddes Religion, & to receiue Chriſte with his Goſpel into their Courtes. For God hath ordeined Kinges, as the Prophete Dauid ſaithe, to ſerue the Lorde: and, as Eſaie ſaithe, to be Nources vnto his Churche.

Pſalm 2.
Eſaie. 49.

If there be occaſions of vanities, or wickednelle in Princes Courtes, yet is there no Courte therein comparable to the Courte of Rome. For there, S. Bernarde ſaith, Mali proficiunt: Boni deficiunt: *The Wicked waxe: the Godly wane.*

Ye ſtriue in vaine, M. Hardinge: This Councel is not of Man: it is of God. If Princes with their powers coulde not ſtaie it, mutche leſſe can you ſtaie it with vntruthes and fables. The poore beguiled ſoules, of whom ye ſpeake, are neither ſo ſelly, nor ſo ſimple, but they are hable to eſpie youre lolies. The Truthe of God wil ſtande: Vanitie wil falle of it ſelfe. Remember the Counſel of Gamaliel: Fight not againſte the Spirite of God.

Act. 5.

The Apologie, Cap. 5. Diuiſion. 3.

For they be not al madde at this daie, ſo many Free Citties, ſo many Kinges, ſo many Princes, which haue fallen awaie from the Seate of Rome, and haue rather ioyned them ſelues to the Goſpel of Chriſte.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

M. Hardinges anſweare hereto is longe: the effecte thereof in ſhorte is this:

The Faithe of the Holy Romaine Churche, is the very Catholique Faithe, which who ſo forſake, ſhalbe companions with Diuelles in euerlaſtinge fiere.

And where ye ſaie, ſo many Free Citties, ſo many Kinges, I praie you, howe many free Citties can you name, that haue receiued your Sacramentarie Religion? Nay the free Citties of Germanie, as many as haue forſaken the Catholique Churche, doo they not perſecute you the Sacramentaries? But, ſaie ye, they be fallen from the Seate of Rome. So be the Greekes alſo in a pointe or twoo: yet condemne they you for Heretikes.

Neither be al the Free Citties in al the Countrie of Germanie fallen from the See Apoſtolike. Of fiue partes of that greate Countrie, at leaſte twoo remaine Catholique.

Let vs ſee, howe make ye vp the number of ſo many Kinges ye ſpeake of? The Realme of Englande, and Scotland, becauſe by Goddes prouidence the gouernement of them is deuolued to VVomen, for as muche as they be no Kinges, though they haue the ful right of Kinges, of them I ſpeake not. Nowe onely two Chriſtened Kinges remaine, the Kinge of Denmarke, and the King of Sweden. Geate you nowe vp into youre Pulpites like bragginge cockes on the rowſte: Flappe youre whinges, and crowe out aloude, So many Free Citties, ſo many Kinges.

But what thinke you of al the worlde before this daie? VVere al Citties, and Prouinces, al Countries, al Kinges, al Princes &c. til Frier Luther came, and with his Nunne tolde vs a newe Doctrine, and controlled al the olde, were al theſe madde?

The Vertuous menne of the Societie of Ieſus, haue they not broughte many Countries, many Kinges, many Princes to the Faithe of Chriſte by preaching the Doctrine of the Catholique Church? VVee wil not folowe your fooliſhneſſe in boaſtinge &c. The Faithe profeſſed in the Holy Rommaine Churche, is is nowe preached in Peru in the Kingedome of Ignamban, in the Kingedome of Monopotapa, in Cambaia, in Giapan, in Cina, in Tartaio, in Baſnaga, in Taprobana, in Ormuz, in Ceilon, in Zimor, in Bacian, in Macazar.

The Miracles wrought by theſe Holy Fathers whiche converted theſe Countries, I trowe, ye wil not accompte to be madneſſe. Thus your vaine boaſte in wickednelſe wrought by the power of Satan is put to ſilence &c.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

The Faithe of the Romaine Churche (ſaithe M. Hardinge) is the very Catholique Faithe of Chriſte: whiche who ſo forſaketh, be he Kinge, or Emperour, he ſhalbe Companion with Diuelles in euerlaſtinge fiere. Thus mutche, I trowe, M. Hardinge learned of the counterfeite Decree of Anacletus. For thus it pleaſeth him to gloſe, and interlace the wordes of Chriſte: Super hanc Petram, id eſt, Super Eccleſiam Romanam, ædificabo Eccleſiam meam: *Upon this Rocke, that is to ſaie, Vpon the Churche of Rome, I wil builde my Churche.* And therefore Pope Bonifacius, for a ful reſolution of the mater ſaithe thus: Subeſſe Romano Pontifici, omni humanæ creaturæ

Anaclet. Epiſt. 1.

Extra De Maior. & Obedien. Vnam Sanctam.

turæ

ture declaramus, dicimus, definimus, & pronuntiamus, omnino esse de necessitate salutis: *Wee declare, saie, determine, and pronounce, that it is of the necessitie of Saluation for euery mortal creature to be subiecte vnto the Bishop of Rome.* And the Glose likewise vpon the same, Quicquid saluatur, est sub Summo Pontifice: *What so euer creature is saued, is vnder the Highest Bishop.* Here is no mention neither of Christe, nor of his Gospel. Saluation, and Damnation hangeth onely of the Bishop of Rome. This thinge once graunted, the case is cleare: The Pope him selfe hathe resolued the doubte. What shoulde wee nede a better triall? Notwithstandinge Cornelius the Bishop of Bitonto in the late Chapter at Tridente, of the Bishop, and Holy See of Rome, saithe thus, Vtinam à Religione ad Superstitionem, à Fide ad Infidelitatem, à Christo ad Antichristum, à Deo ad Epicurum, velut prorsus vnanimes non declinassent, dicentes in corde impio, & ore impudico, Non est Deus: *O woulde God (the Pope and al his Cardinalles) had not fallen with common consente, and altogeather, from true Religion to Superstition, from Faithe to Infidelitie, from Christe to Antichriste, from God to Epicure, saieinge with wicked harte, and shameleſſe mouthe, There is no God.* In like sense of the same Bishoppes, and See of Rome, S. Bernarde saithe, Serui Christi seruiunt Antichristo: *The Seruauntes of Christe serue Antichriste.* Cornelius saithe, The Bishops of Rome are fallen to Superstition, to Infidelitie, to Antichriste, to Epicure: and are not ashamed to saie, There is no God. Yet, saithe M. Hardinge, the Faithe of Rome is the Catholique Faithe: and who so departeth from the same, be he kinge or Emperoure, he shalbe companion with the Diuel in Hel fiere. And thus to saie, is no mere madnesse.

Gloſſa in eodem Cap.

Cornelius Epiſc. Bitont. in Conc. Tridentino.

Pſalm. 14.

Bernard. in Cant. Canticor.

That the Princes, and free Citties of Germanie euer persecuted vs, it is vtterly vntrue, and like the reste of your tales. Notwithstandinge somme of them haue dealte sharpely with certaine of this side, in consideration either of Conscience, as they thought, or of the state, and quietnesse of their Subiectes, yet in open Consultation and publique Diete, thei never suffered this Doctrine to be condemned. Thei reioice in God in our behalfe: and beinge there, they receiued vs vnder theire protection, and offered vs suche fredome, and courtesie, as they seldome haue offered the like to any Nation. Certaine of them by your owne Confession, haue already agreed to al the pointes of oure Doctrine. But none of them al, no not one woulde euer suffer the same Doctrine of oures to be condemned in open assemblie, and to be iudged for Heresie.

What the Grecians this daie thinke of vs, I cannot tel. Notwithstandinge, it appeareth by their letters written pourposely to the Churches of Bohemia, that thei allowe wel of our Doctrine, and vtterly condemne yours. For thus they write vnto them: Ὅυκουν ποθεύντα τοι ἀδελφοὶ καὶ υἱοὶ ἕτω εἶεν, ὡς εὐχόμεθα, καὶ ἐλπίζομεν, ἐντὸς σπεύσατε τὴν μεθ' ἡμῶν ἕνωσιν: *Wherefore, louinge Brethren, and Children, if it be so as wee heare, and hope, make haste, that wee maie ioine together in Vnitie.*

Epiſt. Eccleſiæ Conſtantinopo. litanæ ad Eccleſiã Pragenſem.

And againe, thus it is recorded in the late Councel of Laterane, Græci in tantum cœperunt abominari Latinos, vt si quando Sacerdotes Latini super eorum Altaria celebrassent, ipsi non vellent priùs in illis Sacrificare, quàm ea, tanquam per hoc inquinata fuissent: *The Greekes beganne so mutche to abhorre the Latines, that, if it had happened the Latine Priestes had Ministred vpon their Aultars, they woulde not afterwarde make Oblation vpon the same, before they had washed them: as thinkinge theire Aultars defiled by the Latines handelinge.* Wherefore, M. Hardinge, what so euer the Grecians thinke of vs, it appeareth hereby, they vtterly refuse youre Communion, and condemne you for Heretiques.

In Concil. Lateranen. cap. 4.

But who woulde haue thought, M. Hardinge had beene so skilful in proportions? The whole Countrie of Germanie, saithe he, beinge diuided in equal portions, two of fiue remaine stil in the obedience of the See of Rome. Wee geue God thankes, it is, as it is. In dede certaine townes subiecte to the Bishoppes, in outwarde shape of theire Churches, remaine stil, as they were before. Yet neuertheleſſe, in most places where ỹ Churches are Popish, the people of al sortes are Protestantes, and loue the Truthe, and are mutche ashamed of youre follies. It was Goddes se-

crete prouidence, that certaine of youres shoulde remaine emongst vs a season, as the Cananites remained emongst the people of Israel. Otherwise within few yeres ye woulde denie, that euer your disorders had benne so greate.

It is very harde, and in manner not possible, to conuerte the whole people of so greate a Countrie al at once. The Heares of a mannes Bearde, or Heade, neuer ware white al togeather. Christe compareth the Kingedome of God vnto Leauen, whiche the woman taketh, and laieth in a lumpe of dowgh. It worketh, and laboureth by litle, and litle, vntil it haue Leauened al the whole. In this sorte Eusebius seemeth to compare the two partes of the Romaine Empire dissentinge in Judgemente of Religion: the Easte parte to the Night, and the Weaste to the Daie. But Christe wil drawe al vnto him selfe: and then shal God be al in al.

Luc. 13.

Eusebius.

Iohan. 12.

But here to matche youre so many Kinges, and so many Princes, M. Hardinge hathe brought vs a many of newes out of Ignamban, Monopotapa, Cambaia, Giapan, Bisnaga, Ormuz, and other strange, and farre Countries. There, he saithe, so many, and so many Kinges, and Princes are lately Conuerted, and brought to the obedience of the See of Rome. I marueile, he saithe not, the Pan in the Pwne was likewise newly Christened, to make vp the Muster.

1. Cor. 15.

Howe be it, al these thinges must nedes be true. For Christes owne Felowes, or, as M. Hardinge vttereth it in better wise, the Holy Fathers of the Societie of Jesus, haue sente home wordes as wel hereof, as also of sundrie Myracles wroughte by the same Holy Fathers. Verily, so the name of Christe be published, whether it be by them, or by vs, by Light, or by Darkenesse, Goddes Holy name be blessed. But of many their Myracles I haue no skil. For thus these Holy Fathers write, as it is saide before, that with Holy Water they haue driuen Mise out of the Countrie, and made Barren Women to beare Children, and suche other the like marueilous Miracles. Neither are we bounde of necessitie to beleue al suche Miracles what so euer, without exception. Alexander of Hales saithe, In Sacramento apparet Caro, interdum Humana procuratione, interdum operatione Diabolica: *In the Sacrament it selfe there appeareth Fleashe, sometime by the conueiance of Men, sometime by the woorkinge of the Diuel.* Likewise saithe Nicolas Lyra, Aliquando in Ecclesia fit maxima deceptio Populi in Miraculis fictis à Sacerdotibus, vel eis adhærentibus, propter lucrum: *Sometime euen in the Churche the People is shamefully deceiued with feined Miracles wroughte either by the Priestes, or els by their companions for lukers sake.* Miracles be not euermore vndoubted prowes of true Doctrine. Therefore S. Augustine saithe vnto Faustus the Manichee: Miracula non facitis: quæ si faceretis, tamen ipsa in vobis caueremus: *Yet woorke no Miracles: and yet if ye wrought any, at your handes wee woulde take heede of them.* The Prophete Ieremie saithe, Seduxerunt Populum meum in mendacijs suis, & in Miraculis suis: *They haue deceiued my People by their Lies, and by theire Miracles.*

Corpus Dialo. 1. Pag. 18.

Alexander de Hales. par. 4. qua. 53. mem. 4. Ar. 3. solut. 2.

Nicola. Lyra. in Daniel. ca 14.

Augusti contra Faust. Lib. 13.

Hieremi. 23.

Touchinge the Conuersion of the Easte India, Vesputius writeth, there were many Godly Bishoppes there, and sundrie whole Countries Conuerted, and Christened, longe before that either the Portugales, or the Iesuites came thither: and yet had neuer hearde of the name of the Bishop of Rome.

Vesputius.

As for the reste of the Weaste Spanishe Indies, the People there liued not onely without al manner knowledge of God, but also wilde, & naked, without any Ciuile gouernement, offeringe vp mennes bodies in Sacrifice, drinking mens bloude, and eatinge mennes fleashe. Some of them worshipped the Sunne, and the Mone: somme, an ancient olde Trée: somme, what so euer they sawe firste in the morninge, they thoughte the same for that daie to be their God. Somme worshipped certaine familiare Diuelles, and vnto them Sacrificed ponge boyes, and girles.

Petr. Martyr Mediolanen.

Beinge in this miserable state, and naturally by the very sense, & iudgemente of common reason abhorringe, and lothinge theire owne blindnesse, what marueile is it, if they were easie to be leadde into any Religion, specially carricinge suche a shewe of apparel, and Holy Ceremonies.

Addition. ☞ Here (saithe M. Hardinge) M. Iewel attributeth the glorious conuersion of the Indians to the leadinge of natural reason. This (saithe he) is his Heathenishe harte. ☞ Addition

M. Har. fo. 96 b.

VVhat

VVhat could Porphyrie, or Iulius, or Celsus saie more? And what maketh you, M. Hardinge, to be so vehemente? Is Nature so blinde, that she can no waie discerne, what is likely or unlikely in any parte of Religion? Wherefore then dothe S. Paule saie, speakinge onely of Natural menne, and of the lighte of Nature, *That thinge, that maie be knowen of God, is opened unto them. The invisible thinges of God are knowen* (Naturally) *by the Creatures of the worlde: euen the euerlastinge power of God, and his Diuinitie?* Rom. 1. Or why saithe he, *The Heathens, that haue not the Lawe of God, yet by Nature doo the thinges, that perteine to the Lawe: and hauinge no Lawe, they are a Lawe to them selues, and shewe foorthe the woorke, or effecte of the Lawe written within* (by Nature) *in their hartes?* Rom. 2. S. Ambrose addeth further, Gentilis, duce Natura, credit in Christum: Gentilis per Solam Naturam intellexit Authorem: *The Heathen by the leadinge of Nature beleeueth in Christe. The Heathen onely by Nature hathe knowen God, the maker of the worlde.* Ambrof. ad Roma cap. 2. In the shorte Commentaries, that beare the name of S. Hierome, it is written thus, Cognouerunt Deum, siue per Naturam, siue per facturam, & Rationem: *The Heathens knewe God, either by Nature, or by Creation, and waie of Reason.* Hieron. in ad Roma cap 1. And againe, Homo Naturaliter potest scire de Deo, & quod sit, & quod iustus sit: *Man maie by Nature knowe of God, bothe that he is, and that he is iuste.* If theise saieinges be so Heathenishe, and Jewishe in vs, why are they suffered in S. Paule, in S. Hierome, in S. Ambrose, and in other Holy Fathers?

I saie not, that Nature alone is hable to leade vs into the perfection of Faithe, or to endewe our hartes with the Spirite of God. But thus I saie, Nature of her selfe is oftentimes hable to discerne betweene Truthe and falsehode. Cicero saithe onely of the habilitie, and force of Nature, Vtinam tam facilè vera inuenire possem, quàm falsa conuincere. By whiche confession it appeareth, although he were not hable by skil of Nature to finde the Truthe, yet was he hable by the same to reprone the Falsehode. And therefore speakinge of the vanitie of his owne Heathen Religion, he saithe, Quid negotij est hæc Poëtarum, & Pictorum portenta conuincere? *What maisterie is it* (euen onely by the light of Natural wisedome) *to reprone the fabulous woonders of Painters and Poëtes.* De Natura Deorum. lib. 1. Tusculd. 1.

The harte of man is Naturally inclined to Religion: notwithstandinge beinge blinded with Original sinne, in the choise thereof it oftentimes falleth into horrible Errours. When the Christians in Rome had chosen a voide platte in the Cittie, and therein had builded them selues a Churche for the seruice of Christe, and the Taverners, or Vitulers there, had laide claime to the same platte, for that it seemed to stande commodiously for their vttерance, Alexander Seuerus the Emperoure, beinge an Heathen, and voide of Faithe, and leadde onely by the guiding of Nature, hauinge the hearinge of the mater, answeared the Taverners in this sorte: *It is better that God be any waie woorshipped in that place, then you shoulde haue it.* Ælius Lampridius in Alexandro. The Tartarions of late yeres, hauinge no certaine Religion of their owne, submitted them selues to the Religion of the Turkes. Nature taughte them, it was better to haue the Turkishe Religion, then none at al. Vossius in Nouo Orbe, fol. 485.

This therefore is it, that I saie, M. Hardinge: The poore Indians, liuinge by mannes fleashe, goinge naked, hauinge no manner sense, or knowledge of God, but fallinge downe either before an olde Tree, or before the Sunne, and the Mone, or what so euer thinge they sawe firste in the morninge, when they sawe the Religion of Rome, with so many Ceremonies, and shewes of Holinesse, verie Nature taught them, to thinke the same farre better, then their own. What Heathenish Infidelitie finde you herein, or what Blasphemie against ỹ power of God? As blind as your Indians are this date, if they might see bothe your, & our Religion sette open before them, I doubte not, but Nature her selfe woulde leade them to iudge, that ours is the Lighte, and yours Darkenesse. S. Paule speakinge of the Disorder of praieinge vnto God, that he sawe emong the Corinthians, saithe thus, Nónne Natura ipsa docet vos? *Doothe not very Nature teache you this thinge?* 1. Corinth. 11.

Al this notwithstandinge, I saie not, that Nature is hable to leade vs into al the Secresies, and Mysteries of Christes Gospel: Christe him selfe saithe, *God often-*

Matthæ 11. Iohan.14. Iohan.6. Matthæ.16. *times hideth theiſe thinges from the (*natural*) wiſe, and greate learned menne, and reuealeth the ſame vnto babes.* And againe, *Noman commeth to my Father, but by mee:* And *Noman commeth to mee, onleſſe he be drawen by my Father.* And vnto Peter he ſaithe, *Fleaſh, and Blonde hathe not reuealed theiſe thinges to thee, but the Sprite of my Father* whiche *is in Heauen.*

As for the Conuerſion of the wilde Indians, whiche you cal ſo Gloryous, I praie God, it maie not iuſtly be laide vnto you, that Chriſte laide vnto the Phariſeis, *Yee* Matthæ.23. *ſeeke aboute by ſea, and by lande, to finde one Nouice: And* when *yee haue gotten him, yee make him the childe of Helle, double woorſe, then your ſelues.*

And what if God woulde vſe this meane for the time, afterwarde the better to leade the ſaide nations to the cleare Light of the Goſpel, as S. Auguſtine ſaithe, the ſhomaker vſeth his bristle not to ſewe withal, but to drawe in his threde? No doubt M. Harding, if your Doctrine, and ours were laid togeather, the very Indians them ſelues, be they neuer ſo rude, woulde be hable to ſée a greate difference.

But let the Biſhop of Rome winne abroade, and loſe at home. You remember the olde Prouerbe, Dionyſius Corinthi, Dionyſius when he had loſte his Kingedome at home at Syracuſæ, he gotte him ſelfe to Corinthe, and there became a Schoolemaiſter, and ſo ſéemed to continue a Kingedome ſtil.

We make no boaſte, M. Harding, nor geate vs to rowſte, as ye ſaie, nor clappe our winges in the behalfe of theſe Princes, and Countries, ſo many, and ſo many, as it pleaſeth you to ſporte, that haue ſubmitted them ſelues to the Goſpel of Chriſt. Neither are the ſame, ſo many, and ſo many, ſo fewe as you woulde ſéeme to make them. The Kingedome of Englande, the Kingedome of Scotlande, the Kingedome of Denmarke, the Kingdome of Sweden, the Dukes of Saxonie, the Duke of Brunſwike, the Palſgrave of Rhene, the Duke of VVittenberg, the Lantgraue of Heſsia, the Marques of Brandeburg, the Prince of Ruſsia, al other the Earles, and Noble men, and greate Cittles throughe the whole Countrie of Germanie, the mightie common weales of Heluetia, Rhetia, Vallis Tellina, with ſo many hundred thouſandes beſides in Fraunce, Italie, Spaine, Hungarie, and in the Kingedome of Poole: Certainely al theſe wel reckened cannot ſéeme ſo fewe, as ye woulde haue it. Peraduenture, M. Harding it greeueth you ful ſore, they are ſo many. If God of his mercie bleſſe thoſe thinges, that he hath mercifully begonne, it wilbe highe time for you ſhortly to ſéeke a newe refuge.

We boaſte not oure ſelues of theiſe thinges. There is no cauſe. It is not the worke of man: it is the onely hande of God. Dauid ſaithe, *Let the Heauens reioice: let* Pſal.19. *the Earthe be gladde: The voice (*of the Apoſtles*) is ſounded abroade into al the worlde:* The Luc.2. Angelles of God ſange, *Glorie be to God on highe:* The Angel in the Apocalyps crieth Apocalyp.19. aloude, Cecidit, cecidit Babylon illa magna: *Downe, downe is fallen that greate Babylon.* Tertullian ſaithe, Parthi, Medi, Elamitæ, &c. *The Parthians, the Medians, the Elamites,* Tertul contra Iudeos. *the people of Meſopotamia, of Armenia, of Phrygia, of Cappadocia, of Pontus, of Aſia, of Pamphilia, of Ægypte, of Aphrica, of Rome, of Hieruſalem, of Getulia, of Mauritania, of Spaine, of Fraunce, of Britannie, of Sarmatia, of Dacia, of Germanie, of Scythia, and many other nations, and Prouinces, knowen, and vnknowen haue receiued the Goſpel of Chriſte.* Thus ſaide they, the Angelles, and Prophetes of God, and Holy Fathers, and yet without boaſtinge, or ſláringe to rowſte, or clappinge of winges. Geue vs leaue therefore, M. Harding, in the like caſe to ſolace our ſelues with the conſideration of Gods mightie, and merciful workes, and humbly to reioice at the triumphe of the Croſſe of Chriſte.

Arnobius contra Gentes, li. 8. Arnobius ſaithe vnto the Heathens: Ne nobis de noſtra frequentia blandiamur. Multi nobis videmur: ſed Deo admodum pauci ſumus. Nos gentes, nationes, diſtinguimus: Deo vna Domus eſt mundus hic totus: *Let vs not flatter our ſelues of oure greate multitudes. Vnto our ſelues we ſeeme many: but vnto God wee are but fewe. Wee put difference betweene Nation, and Nation: But vnto God this whole worlde is but one houſe.* This counſel, M. Harding, is wholeſome for either parte to folowe, that who ſo will reioice, maie reioice in the Lorde.

The

The Apologie, Cap. 5. Diuision. 4.

And although the Popes had neuer hitherunto leasure to consider diligently and earnestly of these maters, or though somme other cares doo nowe let them, and diuers wates pulle them, or thoughe they counpt these to be but common and trifelinge studies, and nothinge to appertaine to the Popes woorthinesse, this maketh not why our mater ought to seeme the woorse. Or if they perchaunce wil not see that, whiche they see in deede, but rather wil withstande the knowen Truth, ought wee therefore by and by to be countped Heretiques, bicause wee obeie not theire wil and pleasure?

M. Hardinge.

Sith Christe hath geuen to the Pope in Peter, whose lawfull successour he is, commission to
Iohan. 21. feede his Sheepe: Holesome feedinge beinge thend of that commission, it is not to be doubted, but he that ordeined thend, hath also ordeined meanes belonginge to thend. Therefore it is not the dutie of a good and humble sheepe, to geue foorthe a malicious surmise, that the sheepheard wil not see that he seeth in deede, but rather wil withstande the knowen Truthe. And what so euer sheepe be disobedient, and refuse to heare the voice of their sheepeheard, whom Christe hath made ouer them, the same be not of Christes folde. And mainteininge contrarie Doctrine to their shepeheardes true Doctrine, iustly may they be accounpted Heretikes.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

To be Peters lawful Successour, it is not sufficient to leape into Peters stalle. Lawful Succession standeth not onely in possession of place, but also, and mutche rather in Doctrine and Diligence. Yet the Bishoppes of Rome, as if there were nothinge els required, euermoze put vs in minde, and tel vs many gaie tales of theire Succession. Pope Symmachus **saithe,** In Papa si desint bona acquisita per meritum, sufficiunt quæ à loci Prædecessore præstantur: *If the Pope wante vertues, and goodnesse of his owne, yet the vertues that are geuen him by (Peter) his predecessour, are sufficient.* **And** the Glose **vpon the same:** Petrus fecit Papam hæredem bonitatis suæ: *Peter hath made the Pope Heire of his goodnesse.*

Distin. 40. Non nos.

Glosa ibid. in verb. Cum Hæreditatem.

But S. Hierome **saithe farre otherwise:** Non Sanctorum filij sunt, qui tenent loca sanctorum: *They be not euermore Holy menne's Children, that sitte in the roumes of Holy menne.* **Likewise saithe** Alphonsus de Castro, **a special assistante of that side,** Quamuis teneamur ex Fide credere, verum Petri Successorem esse Supremum totius Ecclesiæ Pastorem, tamen non tenemur eadem Fide credere, Leonem, aut Clementem esse verum Petri Successorem: *Notwithstandinge wee be bounde by Faithe to beleue, that the true Successour of Peter is the highest Shepeheard of the whole Churche: yet are wee not bounde by the same Faithe to beleue, that Leo, or Clement (beinge Bishoppes of Rome) are the true Successours of Peter.*

Dist. 40. Non est facile.

Alphonsus contra. Hæres. Lib. 1. Cap. 9.

The woordes, that Christe **spake vnto** Peter, **impoze no Soueraintie, but were common to al the reste.** S. Cyprian **saithe,** Hoc erant vtique cæteri Apostoli, quod fuit Petrus, pari consortio præditi & Honoris, & Potestatis: *The reste of the Apostles were euen the same, that Peter was, al endewed with like fellowship bothe of Honour, and of Power.* **What special priuilege then can the Pope claime by the Succession of** S. Peter? **Or what talketh he of fædinge the whole flocke of Christe, that neuer fedeth any parte therof, wherein is the Pope like** S. Peter? **or wherein euer was** S. Peter **like the Pope?**

Iohn. 21. Cyprian. de simplicita. prælato.

Yet M. Hardinge **doubteth not to geue his Definitiue Sentence,** Whatsoeuer
Sheepe is not obedient to the Headshepheard, is not of the flocke of Christe. **The** Pope **also him selfe boldely warranteth the same. Thus he saithe of him selfe,** Quicunque præceptis nostris non obedierit, peccatum Idololatriæ, & Paganitatis incurrit: *Who so euer obeieth not our commaundementes, falleth into the sinne of Idolatrie, and Infidelitie.* **And therefore Pope** Steuin **thus anaunceth the authoritie of his owne See:** Sacrosancta Domina nostra Romana Ecclesia: *Our Holy Lady the Churche of Rome.*

Dist. 81. Si qui sunt: In glosa.

Dist. 79. Oportebat.

But Christe **speakinge of him selfe saithe,** *I am the True Sheepheard:* **And,** *Who so heareth these woordes of mine, and doeth the same, I wil liken him to a wise man.* S. Paule

Iohan. 10. Luc. 6.

Galat. 2.

beinge but one of the shepe, saithe thus, *I withstoode Peter* (as M. Hardinge saithe, the Headshepheard) *euen vnto his face, for that he walked not vprightly to the Gospel of Christe*. Yet was he a shepe of the flocke of Christe, Hostiensis in this case fermeth reasonable: His wordes be these: Omnes debent obedire Papæ, quicquid præcipiat: nisi sequi posit peccatum: *All men muste obeie the Pope, what so euer he commaunde, so there folowe no sinne of his commaundement*. Likewise Felinus a notable Canonister: Non obstante Plenitudine Potestatis, quæ est in Papa, non est obediendum ei, peccato imminente: *Notwithstandinge the fulnesse of power, that is in the Pope, when sinne shal folowe his biddinge, wee maie not obeie him.*

De Cõcess. præbend. Proposuit. Hostien. De Rescriptis. Si quando. ver. Sed nunquid.

If the Pope wil claime the Headpastourship ouer the whole flocke of Christe, or rather if he wilbe taken for any Pastour at al, let him then fede the Flocke: Let him breake the breade of Life, without Leauen: Let him speake the worde of God truely, without fables: and wee wil heare him. Otherwise S. Augustine hath warned vs: Sua si docere velint, nolite audire, nolite facere. Certè enim tales sua quærunt: non quæ sunt Iesu Christi: *If they wil teache you Doctrines of their owne, see, yee heare them not:* (and what so euer such thinge they commaunde you) *see, yee doo it not. For vndoubtedly such men seeke for their owne maters: and not the things that perteine to Iesus Christe.*

August. in Iohan. tract. 46.

The Apologie, Cap. 5. Diuision. 6.

If so be that Pope Pius were the man (wee saie not, whiche he woulde so gladly be called) but if he were in deede a man, that either woulde accoumpt vs for his brethren, or at least woulde take vs to be menne, he would first diligently haue examined our reasons, and would haue seene, what mighte be saide with vs, what against vs: and would not in his Bul, whereby he lately pretended a Councel, so rashly haue condemned so greate a parte of the worlde, so many Learned and Godly men, so many common wealthes, so many Kinges, & so many Princes, onely vpon his owne blinde prejudices, and foredeterminations, and that without hearinge of them speake, or, without shewinge cause why.

M. Hardinge.

Speake of Pope Pius, what yee wil, and what ye can. Neither your praise can aduaunce his estimation, nor your dispraise abase it. His singular vertues be wel knowen. God is highly to be praised, for that he hath prouided for his flocke so good a Shepheard. As for you, as he taketh you to be men, so not his brethren, bicause yee haue cut of your selues from the Catholike Churche. Your reasons haue bene diligently and exactly examined already. In respect of your reasons, Learninge, and Holy Scriptures whiche yee bringe, yee are founde suche as Balsasar Kinge of Babylon was signified by the hande, that appeared writinge before him in the walle.

A comparison betweene the Defender and Balsasar King of Babylon.

VVhat it is, Heretikes to be admitted to reasoninge, it is and hath bene euermore too wel knowen. Be they neuer so throughly confuted, they yeelde not. Ouercome they may be, reformed they wil not be. Therein no good lightly is done.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

If Pope Pius were so good a man, and so fit and worthie a Pastour for the Churche of God, why then did his Cardinalles of late labour so earnestly by treason, and conspiracie to depose him, beinge, as you saie, so good a man? Or if it were not so, why then did he him selfe complaine thereof so bitterly in an Oration pronounced openly in Rome in the Consistorie? Is it not lawful for so good a man to liue in Rome? Is the same Proclamation nowe practised emonge the Cardinalles in Rome, that was sometime vsed in the Councel house at Ephesus, Nemo nostrum frugi esto: *Let no good man be emongst vs?* This Oration is abroade in printe. If you doubte the authoritie thereof, wee wrote it not: it is none of ours.

Oratio Pij Papæ.

ἡμῶν μὴ εἷς ἀγαθὸς ἔστω.

Pax saie, Pope Pius woulde not vouchesaue to cal vs his Brethren. No marueile, saeinge his owne dere, and firste begotten Children the Cardinalles woulde no lenger haue him to be theire Father. It is sufficient for vs, that Christe the Sonne of God is contente to cal vs his Brethren.

Matthæ. 28. Iohan. 20.

Pax

Yée haue Excommunicate vs, as the Phariſeis did the Apoſtles, bicauſe wée ſpeake vnto you in the name of Chriſte. But your owne Lawe ſaithe, Excommunicatus non poteſt Excommunicare: *He that is Excommunicate him ſelfe, cannot geue Sentence to Excommunicate others.* And your owne Gelaſius ſaithe, Neminem ligare debet iniqua Sententia: *A wicked Sentence (of Excommunication) bindeth noman.* But before al others God him ſelfe ſaithe, Ego Benedicam Maledictionibus veſtris: *I wil Bleſſe, that you Curſe,* ſaithe the Lorde. You ſaie, you haue weighed our Reaſons, and haue founde them to light. Howe farcely that is a good Light anſweare. Euen in ſuche Light ſorte Iulianus the Apoſtata wrote ſometime vnto the Chriſtian Biſhoppes: Ἀνέγνων, ἔγνων, κατέγνων: *I haue readde your reaſons: I knowe them wel enough: and therefore I haue condemned them.* But the ſame Chriſtian Biſhoppes anſweared him againe, Ἀνέγνως: ἀλλὰ οὐκ ἔγνως: εἰ γὰρ ἔγνως, οὐκ ἂν κατέγνως. *It maie be, ye haue readde our reaſons: but yee vnderſtoode them not. For if yee vnderſtoode them, yee woulde not condemne them.* S. Paule alſo like wiſe ſaithe, Nam ſi cognouiſſent, nunquàm Dominum Gloriæ crucifixiſſent: *If they had knowen, they woulde neuer haue Crucified the Lorde of Glorie.*

Iohan. 9. 12. 16. 24. q. 1. Audiuimus. 11. Quæ. 3. Cui eſt illata. Mala. 2. Sozomen. lib. 3. Cap. 18. 1. Corinth. 2.

But vnto many of your ſide, M. Harding, I feare me wée maie ouer truely ſaie as S. Hilarie ſaithe vnto the Arian Heretiques: Verè Deum neſciunt: atque vtinam neſcirent: Cum procliuiori enim venia ignorarent: *In deede they knowe not God: and would God they knewe him not: Then theire ignorance were the eaſier to be pardoned.*

Hilar. De Synodis aduerſus Arianos.

You ſaie, There is no Diſputation to be had with Heretiques. Yet your Fathers in the Councel of Baſile, and your Frendes in the laſte Councel of Trident, I wil not ſaie, had Diſputations, but certainely yéelded, and gaue place vnto the Bohemiens, and vnto ſuche others, as you cal Heretiques.

In Appendice Con. Baſili. Hæc Sanctus. Concil. Trident. Seſſion. 6.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ This Lie, ſaithe M. Hardinge, is ſo cleare, and euidente, that our Confutation is needeleſſe. Neither is it tolde, wherein theſe Councelles ſhould yeelde, not where that yeeldinge ſhoulde be founde. *The Anſweare.* So cleare, ſaithe M. Hardinge, is this Lie. How be it, if he had better conſidered his bookes, he mought haue founde, that this ſo cleare a Lie, is an euident Truthe. Firſte the Councel of Baſile, contrarie to the order of the Romaine Churche, yéelded vnto the Bohemians, the Holy Communion in Bothe Kindes: And yet the ſame Bohemians they called Heretiques. The wordes there emonge others are theſe: Indultum liberationis Communionis ſub vtraque Specie. The like might you haue founde in Cardinal Cuſanus, if yée had wel ſought it. Thus he writeth vnto the Prieſtes of Bohemia: Neque ita eſt, vt ſcribitis, nos compactiones ignorare. Nam illæ aliquam correctionem, nobis tunc preſidentibus in Natione Germanica, receperunt: maximè in capite de Libertate Communionis: Vbi apponi fecimus, facultatem in euentum dari Sacerdotibus, poſſe Communicare populum modo, qui ibi ponitur: *Neither is it ſo, as you write, that wee knowe not the Agreement, or compoſition. For the ſame Compoſition was corrected, when I was preſidente in Germanie, ſpecially in that Article, that toucheth the Libertie of the Communion. Whereunto I cauſed to be added, that vpon a further proufe, the Prieſtes ſhoulde haue Libertie to Communicate the people in that ſorte, that there is mentioned.* Here haue you that thing, whiche, you ſaie, is not poſſible to be founde: And you haue it confirmed, and auouched by a Cardinal of the Churche of Rome. Touchinge the ſame Article, the late Councel of Tridente hath likewiſe yéelded, how be it, with many longe and ſolemne proteſtations. The wordes beginne thus: Vt ſub vtraque ſpecie Communicare volentes &c. *Wee ordaine, that what ſo euer Churche, or Nation wil Receiue the Communion vnder Bothe Kindes, firſte they agree bothe in harte, and woorde, with al the ordinances of the Churche of Rome. Secondly that they ſhalbe ſubiecte, and obediente vnto the Pope, as reuerente Children vnto theire Father, &c.*

Concil. tom. 3. in Appendice Concil Baſil. pag. 243. Hæc Sanctus. Nicol. Cuſanus ad Bohemos Epiſ. 6. De Libertate Communionis. Poſſe Communicare populum. Concil. Trident. Seſſione. 6.

Thus, M. Hardinge, haue your Councelles yéelded euen vnto them, that they them ſelues haue condemned for Heretiques. Now haue I tolde you, bothe wherein theſe two Councelles haue yéelded, & alſo where this yéeldinge maie be founde. Therefore I reade you henceforthe, not to be ſo ready in dealinge of Lies. ☜

But yée haue reaſon: yée can forgée your beſte aduantage. It were the readieſt waie

waie to disclose your shame. You neuer yet came to Disputation, but some of your companie shranke awaie from you. As I before haue reported out of Tertullian: Veritas nihil veretur, nisi abscondi: *Truthe feareth nothinge, but least shee be hid.* If the God of Israel come into the Temple, the Idole of Dagon must nedes fal downe.

Tertull. in Apologetico.

1. Regum. 5.

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuision. 1.

But bicause he hath already so noted vs openly, least by holdinge our peace wee should seeme to graunt a fault, and specially bicause wee can by no meanes haue audience in the Publike assemblie of the Generall Councel, wherein he would no creature should haue power to geue his voice, or to declare his opinion, excepte he were swoorne, & straightly bounde to mainteine his Authoritie: For wee haue had good experience hereof, in the laste Conference at the Councel of Trident: where the Embassadours and Diuines of the Princes of Germanie, and of the free Cities, were quite shut out from theire companie. Neither can wee yet forgeate, howe Julius the thirde, aboue tenne yeeres past, prouided warely by his writte, that none of our sorte shoulde be suffered to speake in the Councel, excepte that there were some man peraduenture, that woulde recante, and chaunge his opinion. For this cause chiefly wee thought it good, to yeelde vp an accoumpte of our Faithe in writinge, and truely and openly to make answeare to those thinges, wherewith wee haue benne openly charged: to the ende the worlde maie see the partes and fundations of that Doctrine, in the behalfe whereof, so many good men haue litle regarded their owne liues. And that al men maie vnderstande what manner of people they be, and what opinion they haue of God and of Religion, whome the Bishop of Rome, before they were called to tel their tale, hath condemned for Heretiques, without any good consideration, without any example, & vtterly without Lawe or right: onely bicause he heard tel, that they did dissente from him and his in some pointe of Religion.

M. Hardinge.

Two causes of makinge the Apologie. In Councelles any man maye shewe his opinion, but none may geue a voice, or suffrage, and Sentence Definitiue, but onely Bishoppes.

Yee alleage twoo causes, The firste is, lest by holdinge your peace, ye shoulde seeme to graunte a faulte. The seconde, whiche ye make more special, is because by no meanes ye could haue audience in the late general Councel. Your seconde cause is false, as hereafter it shalbe shewed. Your firste is naught, as that whiche sheweth your pride, vaine glorie, and pertinacie. VVel, yee doo but as Heretikes before you haue euer done. It must not be looked for at your handes, that ye acknowlege any faulte. For that were Humilitie, whiche vertue al Heretikes be farre from, &c. To geue a voice or suffrage, and vtter Sentence definitiue it perteineth onely to Bishoppes. Nowe yee be no Bishoppes, but some of you mere laie men, and most of you Apostates.

VVhether the Ambassadours and Diuines of the Princes of Germanie and of the free Cities there, were at any time vpon any consideration of their misliked demeanour, or for any other iuste cause restrained from the companie of the Fathers in the late general Councel at Trente: Againe whether Pope Iulius the thirde prouided by any write, that none of your sorte shoulde be suffred to speake in the Councel, the cause of recantation excepted: what ye saie touchinge this matter, because ye say it without proufe, wee haue founde you in so many other pointes of greater importance, so farre to steppe aside from truthe, that for this wee cannot beleue you. But that your selues by no meanes coulde haue audience in the Councel at Trent, and that the Ambassadours and Diuines of the Princes and free Cities of Germanie were from thence quite shutte out: howe true that is, I reporte me to the three safe conductes, whiche the three Popes, vnder whome that Councel was holden, graunted forth and confirmed in that behalfe. VVherefore belie the Councel nomore, complayninge that yee coulde not there haue audience and be heard.

Yee yelde vp an accoumpt of your faithe in writinge, yee say. But to whome doo ye yelde it vp? and by whome is it yelded? from whome commeth the same? Do ye acknowlege no lauful iudge, no lauful consistorie in the whole worlde? Committe ye your whole mater to the temeritie of the people? VVhy haue ye not set your names to the Booke, that conteineth the profession of your faithe, and of your whole conscience?

The

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Here, M. Hardinge thought it answeare sufficient, to vpbraide vs with suspicion of Untruthe. How be it I haue no doubte, but bothe the Truthe, and the Untruthe by the particulares wil seme appeare.

Firste, that al Bishoppes, hauinge voice Definitiue, & interest in Councelles, are solemnely sworne in at theire Decrees, and Canons to vpholde the Authoritie of the Pope, he thought it the wisest waie to dissemble it. For it had benne greate waste of modestie, to denie it. The fourme of the Othe recorded in the Popes owne Decretailes, is this: Ego N. &c. Papatum Romanæ Ecclesiæ, & regulas Sanctorum Patrum adiutor ero ad defendendum, & retinendum, saluo ordine meo, contra omnes homines: *I N. sweare, that I wilbe an helper, to defende, and maintaine the Papacie of the Churche of Rome, and the Rules of the Holy Fathers* (the Popes) *mine owne order saued, against al men aliue.* But these Rules, & Priuileges of the Holy Fathers the Popes, are these: [a] That the Pope is aboue al Generall Councelles: [b] That his bare wil must be holden as a lawe: [c] That, what so euer he do, noman maie saie vnto him, why do you thus: [d] That his iudgement is more certaine, then the iudgement of al the worlde: [e] That if the whole worlde geue Sentence in any mater contrarie to the Popes pleasure, yet it semeth, we are bounde to stande to the Iudgement of the Pope: and, [f] as M. Hardinge saithe, That the Pope, what so euer he saie, or do, as beinge Pope, can neuer erre. These, and other the like be the Priuileges, that the Pope claimeth vnto him selfe. Al whiche the Bishoppes are bounde by Othe, and by theire allegeance to defende againste al menne aliue.

Extra. De Iureiurando. Ego N.

[a] Extra de Elect. & Elect. potest. Significasti.

[b] Extra. de translat. Episcopi. Quanto. In gloss.

[c] Extra. de Concess. Praben. Proposuit. In gloss.

[d] Eighius. Li. 6. Cap. 13.

[e] 9. q. 3. Nemo. In glossa.

[f] M. Hard. fol. 334. b.

Nowe, where you saie, that Bishoppes onely haue Sentence Definitiue in the Councel, you seme willingly, and without cause to reporte Untruthe. For Aeneas Syluius, beinge him selfe afterwarde Pope, and named Pius Secundus, woulde haue tolde you the contrarie. These be his wordes: Apparet, alios, quàm Episcopos, in Concilijs habuisse vocem decidentem: *It is plaine, that certaine others, beside Bishoppes, had voice Definitiue in the Councelles.*

Æneas Sylui. de gestis Concil. Basilien. Li. 1.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ In the reporte hereof, M. Hardinge hath founde greate aduantage. For when he wrote that Booke, (saithe he) he was Aeneas Syluius Picolomineus, not Pius Secundus. And afterwarde beinge Pope, he recanted that errour. Thus, good Reader, thou seest, the man is al one: but his name is changed. Yet here is mater sufficiente to raise a Tragedie. Firste, touchinge his name, it forceth not greatly. Neither was Paule an Apostle, when he was borne at Tharsus in Cilicia. Yet notwithstandinge S. Augustine saithe, Dicimus Paulum Apostolum in Tharso Ciliciæ fuisse natum: *Wee saie that Paule the Apostle was borne in the Countrie of* Cilicia, *and in the Cittie of* Tharsus. Suche quarelles are scarcely mete for children.

M. Hard. 99. b.

Augustl. De Consensu Euang. Li. 2. Ca. 17.

But afterwarde (saithe M. Hardinge) beinge Pope, he recanted this errour. No doubte, vpon greate deliberation and good aduise. For beinge one of the Councel of Basile, he saide, *The Councel is aboue the Pope.* Afterwarde being Pope him selfe, he was better instructed. *I see* (saide he) *before I was mutche deceiued. Nowe the Pope is aboue the Councel.* Suche a thinge it is to be rapte vp suddainely into the thirde Heauens.

But for as mutche as M. Hardinge saithe, al this that I haue here alleged out of Pius Secundus, and Iohannes Gerson, is Litle woorthe stuffe, for so he calleth it, and that I haue added to theise wordes, In Concilijs, of mine owne, whiche wordes, he saithe, are not founde in the Authour, and that this is, Lieinge for aduantage, for this is the ordinarie modestie of his speeche, I haue thought it good to laie forthe somme parte of the saide wordes more at large.

M. Har. fo. 100. a

Thus therefore saithe Aeneas Syluius, who afterwarde was named Pius Secundus: Nec in Concilijs dignitas Patrum, sed ratio sectanda est &c. Nec ego cuiusuis Episcopi mendatium, quamuis ditissimi, veritati præponam pauperis Presbyteri &c. *In Councelles, Reason, or Truthe is to be considered more, then the dignitie of the Prelates. Neither wil I more esteeme a Lie pronounced by a Bishop, be he neuer so ritche, then the Truthe vttered by a poore simple Priestе. Nor should a Bishop disdeigne, beinge rude, and vnlearned, if the people be not ready to folowe after him. Nor doo you that the Bishoppes, despise*

De Gestis Concil. Basilien. li. 1. in Oratio. Arelaten. In Concilijs. 4

your

your inferiours. The firſte man, that died for Chriſte, and ſhewed the waie vnto Martyrdome, was not a Biſhop, but a Leuite &c. And, to reporte vnto you ſomme examples of Olde Councelles. *wee ſhal finde in them al, that the Biſhoppes were there togeather with theire inferiours &c. In the Actes of the Apoſtles thus it is written: It hath ſeemed good to the Holy Ghoſte, and to vs. To vs, that is to ſaie, to the Apoſtles, and Elders. Neither doothe this woorde, Viſum eſt, ſignifie a conſultation, but a fulle diſcuſſinge, and deciſion of the mater. Therefore it appeareth, that certaine others, beſides Biſhoppes, had a voice Definitiue in the Councel. And in the Actes, when the Apoſtles had any greate mater to determine, they durſte not to diſcuſſe it by them ſelues alone, but called the multitude to ſitte with them &c. It appeareth, that the Apoſtles gaue vs an Example, that in greate weighty matters, wee ſhoulde calle ſomme others to vs. And therefore in the Councelles, that were holden afterwarde, wee finde, that inferiour Prieſtes, ſate togeather with the Biſhoppes, &c.*

Et nobis.

In Concilio.

In Concilijs.

But here M. Hardinge findeth faulte, that I haue corrupted mine Authoure, and thruſte in theire woordes, In Concilijs, of mine owne. And yet in the very ſame place, he might haue founde theſe very woordes: Concilium, Conciliorum, In Concilio, In Concilijs, vſed ſundrie times altogeather. And in deede, the whole ſpeach there, is onely of Councelles.

Theſe, good Reader, and other like, be the Errours, that Pius, beinge once Pope, would needes recante: Then he ſawe, That in his Councelles the dignitie of the Prelates, is more to be weighed then the Truthe. Then he ſawe, That a Lie pronounced by a Biſhop, beinge ritche, is more to be eſteemed, then the truthe, vttered by a ſimple Prieſte. Then he ſawe, That a Prieſte beinge him ſelfe vnlearned, and ignoraunte, ought to diſdeigne, if the people be not ready to folowe after him. Theſe be the thinges, that he recanted.

The Popes Recantation.

How be it, M. Hardinge telleth vs, theſe are not the woordes of Aeneas Syluius, but of one Ludouicus the Cardinal of Arles. And this he reckeneth for a greate maine Lie. Here maie I eaſily anſweare M. Hardinge: If this were not Aeneas Syluius owne ſaieinge. Why then did he, as you haue confeſſed, recante it afterwarde?

M. Hard. 100. a.

M. Har. fo. 99 b

If he did afterwarde recante it, howe maie it appeare, it was not his owne? Are Popes ſo ful of humilitie, that they wil recante woordes they neuer ſpake? ☜ ☜

Io. Gerſon. Quæ veritates ſint Credēdæ. Corol. 4.

Likewiſe ſaithe Gerſon, Etiam ad Laicos hoc poteſt extendi: & plus aliquando, quàm ad multos Clericorum: *This* (Priuilege of geuinge Sentence in Councel) *maie be extended euen vnto the laie ſorte: yea and that oftentimes better then vnto many Prieſtes.* But hereafter more at large.

M. Hard. 100. b.

Addition. ☞ Hereto, ſaithe M. Hardinge, you falſely, impudently, and fowly, belie Gerſon, for Gerſon in this place ſpeaketh not of the Authoritie of geuinge Sentence Definitiue in General Councel. *The Anſweare.* It is reaſon, that M. Hardinge make boale of Lies at his pleaſure. Verily thus muche at leaſt Gerſon ſaithe: *The deliberation, or conference, and knowledge of maters of Faithe maie belonge to the Laie people, and vnto them muche more, and better ſommetime, then to many Prieſtes.* This M. Hardinge is as muche as I either ſaie, or can require, and this is enough: onleſſe ye thinke, your Prieſtes haue Authoritie to iudge, and conclude without knowledge, for ſo ſeemeth Gerſon, by his Diuiſion, to allowe Concluſion and Iudgemente, to the Prieſtes: and Deliberation, and knowledge, to the people. ☜ ☜ Addition ☞

Salluſt. in bello Catilin.

Concil. Trident. ſub Paulo. 3.

But whether we be Biſhoppes or no, M. Hardinge is no competent, nor indifferent Iudge. For who ſo wil Iudge vprightly, muſte be voide of anger, hatred, loue, enuie, and other like affections. Whiche Sentence beinge otherwiſe profane, is vſed and halowed by the Apoſtolique Legates in the Councel of Trident: Surely the Godly ſaie, that as your Biſhoppes be no parte of Biſhoppes dewtie, and therefore in deede are no Biſhoppes at al: ſo your late Couente at Trident, what ſo euer glorious name it pleaſeth you to geue it, yet notwithſtandinge, in deede, and verily was no Councel.

Whether Pope Iulius by his Bulle vtterly embarred the Diuines, and Embaſſadours of the Princes, and free Cities of Germanie from al audience, and Diſputation in the Councel, or no, I repoſe me to Pope Iulius owne Bulle touchinge the ſame.

Counceil of Trident.

Brian. li. ij. Citatur a Caluino.

same. His wordes be these, Erit Concilium, vt qui temerè loquuti sunt, aut dicta recantaturi veniant, aut eorum inaudita causa, in executionem iam ordinatarum Constitutionum Hæretici declarentur, & condemnentur: *There shalbe a Councel, that they that haue spoken rashly, either maie recante theire saiesinges, or els without further hearinge, or reasoninge of the matter, they maie be denounced and condemned for Heretiques, accordinge to the Constitutions already made.*

Likewise saithe Iohn Sleidane, touchinge the Conference had sometime at Augusta: In Colloquio frequenter ad initium actionis hoc dicebant: nolle se vel tantillum de Opinione, & Doctrina sua decedere: sed quicquid facerent, eò fieri, vt in sententiam suam nos adducerent: *In the Conference that was had betwene vs, and them, they tolde vs at the firste, that they woulde not yeelde one whit, from theire Opinion, and Doctrine: But that, what so euer they did, they did it onely to the intent, to bringe vs to their Iudgement.*

Iohan. Sleidan. Lib. 13.

I could farther allege Matthias Flacius Illyricus, Iohannes Fabritius Montanus, Petrus Paulus Vergerius the Bishop of Iustinopolis, to like pourpose. But perhaps M. Hardinge woulo refuse theire Authorities, and cal them partial. Yet in a matter so euident, and so openly knowen, it had benne greate folie for them to dissemble. Illyricus saithe, Nostri audiri non potuerunt, quamuis id Amplissimi Cæsaris Legati Orarent: *Our Diuines, And Oratours coulde in no wise bee hearde, notwithstandinge the Emperours moste worthie Embassadours had desired it.* Iohannes Fabritius saithe, Fateor extensionem factam esse ad alias nationes: Sed tamen additur, eam formam non nisi ad illos pertinere, qui resipiscere, & ad Ecclesiæ gremium redire velint: *I graunt, the Saueconduite was extended to other Nations: But it is added withal, that the same fourme, or libertie should perteine to none others, but onely to them, that woulde repente, and returne to the bosome of the Churche.* And againe he saithe, Tantùm aberant ab Arce Disputationum, vt ne ad vestibulum quidem accedere potuerint: *The Diuines of the Princes of Germanie were kepte so far off from the highe Castel of Disputation, that they could not be suffered to approche to the entrie.* Petrus Paulus Vergerius saithe, that the Bishop of Vegla in Dalmatia was soare shaken vp in the same Councel, and threatened with Deputation, and other extremities, onely for a litle inklinge of the Truthe.

Illyr. in Recuſatione Conc. Tridentini.

Iohan. Fabritii.

Petr. Paulus Vergerius de Concil. Trident.

How be it, what neede we moe Authorities? Noman is herein so plaine, and peremptorie, as M. Hardinge him selfe. This is his determinate answeare, and full resolution in the case: Your reasons are nomore to be heard, onlesse yee repent, and reuoke your errours. Againe, Our Doctrine hath bene approued too longe, to be put a dayinge in these daies. Againe, Such wicked changes, as ye haue made, it is lawful to make, neither with Councel, nor without Councel. Againe, VVe tel you, that your change of Religion, and manifolde Heresies, ought not to haue benne attempted, not without the Bishop of Romes commaundement, nor with his commaundement. These be pour wordes, M. Hardinge: This you saie, pou tel vs plainely, and therfore, I trowe, we muste beleue pou. And se ye seme to conclude with the wordes written in the Prophete Hieremie: Non audiemus Verbum, quod loquutus es nobis in nomine Domini: Sed faciendo faciemus omne verbum, quod egredietur ex ore nostro: *Wee wil not heare the Woorde, that thou haste spoken to vs in the name of the Lorde: But we wil doo euery Woorde, that shal come from our owne mouthe.*

M. Hard. fol. 2. b. M. H. fol. 270. b. M. H. fol. 274. b. M. H. fol. 333. b.

Hieremi. 44.

We maie therefore saie of pou, as S. Augustine sometimes saide of the Heretiques the Donatistes: Cùm omnis anima suspensa expectaret, in tanta collectione quid ageretur, illi vehementer instabant, vt nihil ageretur. Quare hoc? nisi quia causam suam malam sciebant, & facillimè se posse conuinci, si ageretur, dubitare non poterant? *When euery body was lookinge carefully, what shoulde be donne in so greate Assemblie, they (the Donatistes Heretiques) laboured what they coulde, that nothinge vtterly should be donne. And why so? They knewe, theire cause was naught: and coulde not doubte, but that if any conference, or Disputation should be had, they shoulde soone be reproued.*

Augustin. Epistula. 152.

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuision. 2.

And although S. Hierome woulde haue no bodie to be patient when he is suspected of Heresie, yet we wil deale herein neither bitterly, nor brablingly, nor yet be carried awaie with angre & heate: though

he ought to be reckened neither bitter, nor brabler that speaketh the Truthe. Wee willingly leaue this kinde of eloquence to our Aduersaries, who, what so euer they saie againste vs, be it neuer so shrewdly or despitefully saide, yet thinke, it is saide modestly and comely enough, and care nothinge whether it be true, or false. Wee neede none of these shiftes, whiche doo maintaine the Truthe. Further, if wee doo shewe it plainely that Gods Holy Gospel, the Auncient Bishoppes, and the Primitiue Churche doo make on our side, and that wee haue not without iuste cause leste these menne, and rather haue returned to the Apostles and olde Catholique Fathers: And if wee shalbe founde to doo the same, not colourably or craftily, but in good Faith before God, Truely, Honestly, Cleerely, and Plainely: and if they them selues which flie our Doctrine, and woulde bee called Catholiques, shal manifestly see, how al these titles of Antiquitie, whereof they boaste so mutche, are quite shaken out of their handes, and that there is more pithe in this our cause, then they thought for: we then hope and truste that none of them wil be so negligent and careleste of his owne Saluation, but he wil at length studie and bethinke him selfe, to whether parte he were beste to ioyne him. Undoubtedly excepte one wil altogeather harden his harte, and refuse to heare, he shal not repent him to geue good heede to this our Defense, and to marke wel, what wee saie, and how truely and iustly it agreeth with Christian Religion.

M. Hardinge.

I see wel, we must looke to your fingers. Yee spit foorth your gal, and cholar, by and by at the first. Through your whole Booke in woorde ye pretende Truth, zeale, plainnesse, and sober dealing: But in deede power out little other then Lieinge, Spite, Scoffes, and immoderate railinge. The effecte of the reste is this: Ye haue ioined youre selues to the Synagog of Antichriste. Ye serue the stage, ye haue begonne to plaie your Tragedie on falsely, shamefully, darkely, and guilefully: your bragges, and promises, your crakes of Goddes Holy woorde, your errours, your Heresies, your contagious poison, your sclaunders, your newe Clergies Doctrine, &c.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

The Saieinge of S. Hierome is auouched by the like Saieinge of Ruffinus an Auncient Writer. Thus he saithe, Vnam notam Hæreseos qui dissimulat, non est Christianus: *Who so dissembleth, when he is called Heretique, is no Christian man.* For the rest blame me not, good Christian Reader, if I vse no more woordes, then nede requireth. If I thoughte it worthy the while, I coulde answeare al these thinges more at large. I truste, in our whole Apologie there appeareth no suche immoderate kinde of railinge. But if I should folowe M. Hardinges humour, and write but the one halfe of that he writeth, then perhappes I might worthily be called a railer.

The Apologie, Cap. 7. Diuision. 2.

For where they calle vs Heretiques, it is a crime so hainous, that vnlesse it maie be seene, vnlesse it maie be felte, and in manner maie be holden with handes & fingers, it oughte not lightly to be iudged or beleued, when it is laide to the charge of any Christian. For Heresie is a forsakinge of Saluation, a renouncinge of Goddes Grace, a departing from the Body and Spirite of Christe.

M. Hardinge.

The Definition ye seeme to make of Heresie, is not sufficient. For as ye define it, so euery deadly sinne is Heresie. For euery deadly sinne, is a forsakinge of Saluation, a renouncinge of Gods Grace, a departinge from the Body and Spirite of Christe. Heresie is a false Doctrine againste the right beleefe, by him that professeth the Faithe stubbournly, either auouched or called in doubte. In whiche Definition, this woorde, stubbournly, is added, bicause it is not errour onely in those thinges that be of Faithe, The true

The defenders Definition of Heresie founde insufficient.

Definition of Heresie. Lib.12. De Ciuit. Dei, Cap.51.

Faithe, but ſtubbournes in errour, that maſeth an Heretike, as S. Auguſtine teacheth. VVho (ſaithe he) in the Churche of Chriſte, ſauer any thinge that is vnholeſome and crooked, if beinge ſharply admoniſhed to ſauer that is hole and righte, they reſiſte ſtubbournly, and wil not amende their venemous and deadly Doctrines, but ſtande to defende them, they be Heretikes. But now the lawe of vpright dealinge, ſpecially in Gods cauſe ſo requiringe, yee muſt pardon vs, if, as amonge huſbandmen wee cal a rake, a rake, a ſpade, a ſpade, a mattocke, a mattocke: ſo amonge Diuines, wee cal Hereſie, Hereſie, and likewiſe, falſehed, lieinge, ſclaundering, crafte, hypocriſie, Apoſtaſie, malice, blaſphemie, euery ſuche crime, by his proper name without al gloſinge.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Ye ſaie, This is not the right Definition of Hereſie. Verily, M. Hardinge, this is but a ſimple quarrel. It was not my minde in this place to vtter any Definition of Hereſie, either right, or wronge. You knowe right wel, that ſuche curioſitie in this kinde of writinge is not needeful. It is ſufficient, our wordes be true, although they include no Definition.

For iuſte proufe of Hereſie three thinges neceſſarily are required: Firſte, that it be an errour: Secondly, that it be an errour againſte the Truthe of Goddes Worde: For other wiſe euery errour maketh not an Hereſie. Thirdly, that it be ſtoutly and wilfully maineteined. Other wiſe an errour in Goddes Truthe without wilful maintenance, is not an Hereſie. S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Errare poſſum, Hæreticus eſſe non poſſum: *In an errour I maie be: but an Heretique I cannot be.* Auguſtinus.

It was not ſo neceſſarie in this mater, ſo preciſely to ſeeke vp Definitions. I thought it ſufficient, onely to declare the horrour of Hereſie. For as touchinge the Definition, S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Quid ſit Hæreſis, regulari quadam Definitione comprehendi, ſicut ego exiſtimo, aut omninò non poteſt, aut difficillimè poteſt: *To expreſſe by orderly Definition, what thinge maketh an Heretique, as I iudge, it is either impoſſible, or very harde.* Auguſtin. ad Quod vultis.

Therefore you, M. Hardinge, and your felowes are the more blame worthy, for that of euery your fantaſies ye haue made an Hereſie. Ludouicus Viues one of your owne Schole thus complaineth thereof: Hæreſis nomen rebus leuiſſimis impingitur: Idem facerent Scotiſtæ de Thomiſtis, niſi Scholarum conſuetudo aures emolliuiſſet: *The name of Hereſie is laide vpon euery light mater. So would the Scotiſtes handle the Thomiſtes: ſauinge that the cuſtome of the Schooles hath brought theire eares in vre.* Ludouicus Viues. De Corrupt. Artib.

Thus Pope Nicolas ſaithe, Qui Romanæ Eccleſiæ Priuilegium auferre conatur, hic proculdubio labitur in Hæreſim: *Who ſo euer goeth aboute to abrogate the Priuilege of the Churche of Rome, he no doubte is an Heretique.* Diſt. 22. Omnes.

That ye ſpeake of ſtubbornneſſe in defenſe of Hereſie, I praie God, M. Hardinge, it do not ouer neare touche your ſelfe. I praie God, you do not wilfully defende that thinge, wherein you knowe, and ſee manifeſt, and open errour. Verily S. Hierome ſaithe: Quicunque aliter Scripturam intelligit, quàm ſenſus Spiritus Sancti flagitat, quo ſcripta eſt, licet ab Eccleſia non receſſerit, tamen Hæreticus appellari poteſt: *Who ſo euer expoundeth the Scriptures otherwiſe, then the ſenſe of the Holy Ghoſte, by whome they were written, doth require, although he be not yet departed from the Churche, yet maie he wel be called an Heretique.* 24. Quæſt. 3. Hæreſis eſt.

Likewiſe the olde Father Tertullian ſaithe: Quicquid contra veritatem ſapit, Hæreſis eſt, etiam vetus Conſuetudo: *What ſo euer thinge ſauoureth againſte the Truthe, it is an Hereſie, be it neuer ſo mutche an olde cuſtome.* Tertull. de virginib. velandis.

Likewiſe your Tirannical, and filthy reſtrainge of Prieſtes lawful Mariage, Vdalricus **the Biſhop of Auguſta calleth,** Periculoſum Hæreſis Decretum: *A dangerous Decree of Hereſie.* Vdalricus Auguſtanus Epiſcopus ad Nicol. Papam.

Nowe touchinge ſimple errour, and wilful defenſe, S. Hilarie ſaithe, Illis in eo, quod neſciunt, poteſt adhuc in tuto eſſe ſalus, ſi credant: Tibi verò iam omnia ad ſalutem clauſa ſunt, qui negas, quod iam ignorare non potes: *They, for ſo mutche as they knowe not the Truthe, maie haue theire ſaluation in ſafetie, if afterwarde they beleeue: But al hope of healthe is ſhut from thee, for as mutche as thou denieſt that thinge, that thou canſte not chuſe but knowe.* Hilarii, de Trinitate, Lib. 6.

To conclude, vnto you, M. Hardinge, who oftentimes of ſmal errours, oftentimes of vndoubted, and knowen Truthes, without regarde of Definition, haue fained great, and horrible Hereſies, Alphonſus de Caſtro a **Doctour of your owne**

 faithe

Alphonsus de Castro de Hæres. Li.1.Ca.7.

saithe thus: Idcirco fit, vt hi, qui tam leuiter de Hæresi pronunciant, non expendentes de qua re loquantur, sæpe sua ipsorum sagitta feriantur, incidantque in eam foueam, quam alijs parabant. Nam velle humanas Scripturas in Diuinarum ordinem connumerare, hoc verius ego dixerim Hæresim: quod faciunt hi, qui humanis Scriptis dissentire impium autumant, perinde ac Diuinis: *Therefore it happeneth, that they, that so rashly pronounce, and cal euery thinge Heresie, not considering whereof they speake, be often striken with their owne darte, and fal into the same pit, that them selues haue digged for others. For this woulde I rather cal Heresie, to accounpt mennes writinges emonges the Scriptures of God. So doo they, that thinke it a wicked mater to dissent from the writinges of man, yoleſſe, then if it were the Judgement of God.*

The Apologie, Cap.7. Diuision.3.

But this was euer an olde and solemne property with them and their Forefathers: if any did complaine of theire errours and faultes, and desired to haue true Religion restored, streight waie to condemne suche for Heretiques, as men newe fangled, and factious. Christe for no other cause was called a Samaritane, but onely for that he was thought to haue fallen to a certaine newe Religion, and to be the au-

Acter.24.

thour of a newe secte. And Paule the Apostle of Christe, was called before the Judges, to make answeare to a mater of Heresie: and therefore he saide: Accordinge to this waie, whiche they cal Heresie, I doo worship the God of my Fathers, beleeuinge al thinges whiche be written in the Lawe, and in the Prophetes.

M. Hardinge.

If yee meane Hus, Hierome of Prague, VVickleſſe, Almaricke, Abailard, the Apostolikes, Peterbrusians, Berengarians, VValdenses, Albingenses, Imagebreakers, or suche like, whiche euer founde faulte with the Churche in their time, and cried for a restoringe of Religion, as though it had benne quite loste, and would them selues haue the glory of it, by bringinge in their Heresie in place of the Catholique Doctrine, vnder the name of Goddes woorde, whiche hath alwaies bene the propertie of al Heretikes: if, I saie, ye meane these, or any of these: wee also cal them Heretikes, and for suche wee condemne them. The Defenders proceadinge.

But Sirs ye forget your selues fouly. How agreeth this with that ye saie hereafter oftentimes, that the Light of the Truthe was quite put out, and that Luther and Zuinglius firste brought the Gospel abroade into the worlde? Conuincth saide in the Defender.

VVere it true that Christe was called a Samaritane for the cause ye assigne, thereof what conclude ye? VVe see where about ye goe. Ye woulde seeme to ioine with Christe, with Paule, and with the first Christians. But truely they refuse your companie.

But wee tel you, Christe was the true Samaritane in deede, that is to say, the Keeper, as he that is Keeper of mankinde: and therefore he shunned not the name. Yet was he not a Samaritane as the Iewes meant. Paule likewise, (who was not as yee saye, to speake properly, called before the Iudges to make answeare to a mater of Heresie) beinge accused to Felix by Tertullus that he was of the secte, or Heresie of the Nazarens (so were the Christians firste called) did not onely not denie, but openly confessed, that accordinge to that way or state of life, whiche the Iewes called a secte or Heresie, he worshipped God. For it is to be considered, that in those times the name of Heresie was not so infamous, as it may be iudged by the place of the Actes, cap.5. onleſſe somewhat be added whereby it may be vnderstanded to be taken in rate of a vice, as, 1.Cor.11. Galat.5. So the woorde was then indifferent, and might be taken in good parte, or euil parte. Tertullian vseth it in good parte, where speakinge of the Christians, he calleth them *Sectam*, a Secte, into whiche Latine woorde, the Greeke woorde *Heresis* is turned. Nowe these examples of Christe, Paule, and the first Christians serue not your defense. Christe was called of the Iewes a Samaritane, vnwoorthely after the sense of their thought: Ye are called Heretikes, woorthely. Paule burdened with the name of Heresie, for as much as thereby was signified the kinde of life of those that beleeued in Christe, the woorde beinge indifferent, was honoured rather then reuiled. And Tertullian calleth the Christian people, a Secte (as he mighte) without blemisshe or note of any euil. Your case is not like: For yee are charged with Heresie, as it is taken in the woorste parte. Samaritane. Iohan.8. Act.24. Heresie. Apologet Ca.21.& cta.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

O howe many waste woordes hath M. Hardinge to spare? Here once againe he commeth in with Hus, Hierome of Prage, VVickleſſe, Almarik, Abailard, Apostoliques, Peterbrusians, Berengarians, VValdenses, Albingenses, Imagebreakers, to frate

his

his simple Reader with a terrour of strange names. We saie, Luther and Zuinglius were the firste Publishers of the Gospel: and yet againe we saie, the same Luther and Zuinglius were not the first: We have forgotten our selues foulye: We write contradiction againste our selues: We woulde seme to joine with Christe & Paule, but truely they refuse our companie: And so forthe, I knowe not what.

Verily, M. Hardinge, we neuer saide, Luther, and Zuinglius were the firste Publishers of the Gospel. If we shoulde so saie, we shoulde reporte vntruthe, as you do often. Christe, and his Apostles were the firste.

Addition. ☞ M. Hardinge, A greate Vntruthe. You saie no lesse, Pag. 17. thus Doctour Luther began to preache the Gospel of Christe. If he that beginneth to Publishe, be the firste Publisher, then you saide, that Luther was the firste Publisher. *The Answeare.* It is a great losse of time, M. Hardinge, to quarrel at wordes, your selfe beinge assured of the meaninge. You knowe wel, I meante not, that Doctour Luther was the firste man, that euer preached the Gospel of Christe. For Christe him selfe, and his Apostels were before him. But thus I saie, In this later age, after your so longe Darkenesse, he was the firste. But I haue saide, Doctour Luther began to publishe the Gospel: There you saie, by mine owne Confession, Doctour Luther was the firste Publisher of the Gospel. Graunte, M. Hardinge, and sober dealinge would become you better. I saie, he began: Ergo, saie you, he was the firste. How followeth this Conclusion of theise Premisses? That you maie vnderstande your errour by the like, S. Peter saithe, Incipiam vos commonere: *I will beginne to aduertise you*. Will you conclude hereof, that S. Peter aduertised them neuer before? or, That noman euer gaue them aduertisement before S. Peter? In the Actes of the Apostles it is written thus, Peter *and* Iohn *were beginninge to enter into the Temple*. Will you therfore tel vs, that Peter and Iohn were neuer in the Temple before that date? Or, that noman euer came there before them? This is not that Graunte, M. Hardinge, that you haue professed vnto the worlde. Haueinge respecte to theise later dates, Doctour Luther was the firste, that preached the Gospel. But haueinge respecte to the Gospel it selfe, so Doctour Luther was not the firste. For it had benne preached by Christe, and his Apostles, and by infinite other Holy Fathers, many hundred yeres before Luther was borne. ☜

M. Har. fo. 101. b

1. Pet. 1.

Actor. 3. *Incipientes introire in Templum.*

Theise worthy, and Learned Fathers, Luther, and Zuinglius, and other like Godly and zelous menne, were appointed of God, not to erect a newe Churche, but to reforme the olde, wherein you had made a Caue of Theues: to kendle againe the Light, that you had quenched: and to beare witnesse to the Truthe of God.

You saie, Christe, and Paule wil none of our companie: as if you were priuie of their counsel. But perhappes, M. Hardinge, this is Clauis errans, and therefore can neither open, nor shut: Or, as S. Hierome saithe, Pars aliqua supercilij Pharisaici: *Some parte of the highe lookes of the Pharisees*. Christe him selfe hath saide, *Who so loueth me, wil keepe my woorde: and my Father loueth him; And my Father, and I wil come to him, and dwel with him*. S. Peter saithe, *Who so trusteth in him, shal not be confounded*.

Hieronym. in 16. Cap. Matthæi. Iohan. 14. 1. Pet. 2.

Of Abailarde, and Almarike, & certaine other your strange names, if they haue taught any thinge contrarie to the Truthe of God, we haue no skil: They are none of ours. Of Iohn Hus, Hierome of Prage, and Berengarius, and other like vertuous Learned menne, we haue no cause to be ashamed. Their Doctrine standeth stil, and encreaseth daiely: bicause it is of God. But as for yours, bicause it is onely of your selues, (for it is knowen for the moste parte, at what time, & vnder what Pope eche thinge first began, as your Transubstantiation vnder Pope Innocentius the thirde, anno. 1214. &c.) therefore it falleth daiely, and is nowe forsaken the worlde throughout.

Addition. ☞ Here M. Hardinge crieth out impatiently, The more is your shame if any sparke of shame be leaft in you? Neither the VVhoore taketh shame of her filthinesse: Thou haste gotten thee a VVhoores foreheade. Passhame wretches. ☜

M. Hard. fol. 103. a.

You saie, that the simple name of Secte, or Hereste, wherewith S. Paule was charged, was not so infamous, or odious in those dates: & that Tertullian called the Religion of Christe a Secte, or Hereste, without any manner blemmishe or note of euil.

Christian Faith called Heresie.

It was needelesse for M. Harding, to auouche vntruthe so earnestly without cause.

I graunte the name of Heresie, or Secte emong the Philosophers was not infamous. Cicero saithe, Cato in ea Heresi est, quæ nullum sequitur florem Orationis. But in case of Religion it was euermore emongst al men ꝛe taken in il parte, and condemned, and coumpted odious. Touchinge S. Paule, in howe good parte the Iewes called him Heretique, it maie easily appeare by the wordes of Tertullus his accuser: Inuenimus hunc virum pestilentem, & mouentem seditionem omnibus Iudæis per vniuersum orbem, ac Principem Sectæ Nazaræorum: *Wee haue founde this man to be a Pestilent, and a wicked fellowe, moninge sedition, emonge the Iewes throughout the whole worlde, and a Capitaine of the Heresie of the Nazareines.* In lutche good parte they laide vnto Christe: Arte thou greater then was our Father Abraham? Thou arte a false Prophete, and deceiuest the People: Thou arte a Samaritane, and haste the Diuel.

Cicer. in Paradox.

Actor. 24.

Iohan. 7.

Iohan. 8.

The like good parte Christe promised afore hande to his Disciples: They shal caste you out of theire Synagoges: Ye shalbe hated of al men for my names sake. In lutch good parte & meaninge was S. Paule called an Heretique. And so, M. Harding, besides others, your owne Doctour Nicolaus Lyra woulde sone haue tolde you.

Iohan. 16.

Matth. 10.

Nicola. Lyra in 24. Cap. Actor.

But mutche more I maruelle, ye shoulde so vnaduisedly, saie, that Tertullian called the Christian people a Secte, or Heresie in good parte, and, as you saie, without any blemishe, or note of euil. For the same Tertullian in the same Apologie saithe, the Heathens commonly called the Christians, Incestos, Homicidas, Infanticidas, Sacrilegos, Pessimos, Nocentissimos, Publicum odium, Hostes humani generis, Omnium Scelerum reos: Deorum, Imperatorum, Legum, Morum, Naturæ totius inimicos: *Aduouterous againste kinde, Mankillers, killers of Children, Churcherobbers, moste wicked, most hurteful, the publique hatred, the enemies of Mankinde, guiltie of al kinde of wickednesse: Enimies againste the Goddes, againste the Emperours, againste the Lawes, againste good order, against Nature it selfe.* Where so euer they sawe them, they made an outcrie vpon them, Christianos ad Leonem: Non licet esse Christianos: *Haue theise Christians to the Lion: It is not Lawful, theise Christians shoulde liue.* So S. Augustine saithe, Factum est vulgi Prouerbium, Pluuia defecit causa Christianorum: *It is nowe become a common Prouerbe emonge the people, Our raine faileth vs, bicause of theise Christians.* So Eusebius saithe, the Religion of Christe was called Impiorum Christianorum Hæresis: *The Heresie of the Godlesse Christians.* Theise wordes, M. Harding, I trowe, were neuer vttered without al manner blemishe, and note of euil. S. Hierome saithe, Quod magis mirum sit, etiam illud de Actibus Apostolorum videtur esse relegendum, Fidem nostram in Christum, & Ecclesiasticam Disciplinam iam tunc à peruersis hominibus Hæresim nuncupatam: *And that wee maie the more maruelle, wee maie once againe reade this place of the Actes of the Apostles: where wee finde, that the Christian Faithe, and Ecclesiastical Discipline was euen then of wicked menne called an Heresie.*

Tertull. in Apologetico.

Tertull. in Apologetico.

August. De Ciuitate. li. 2. ca. 2.

Euseb. li. 4. ca. 18

Hieronym. in Epist. ad Titum. Cap. 3.

Euen as rightly, M. Harding, and vpon as good grounde, you haue againe this daie condemned the same Gospel of Christe, and in as good parte, and meaninge haue called it Heresie. But wee maie truely, and simplie saie with S. Paule, *Accordinge to this Secte, whiche you calle Heresie, wee worshippe the God of our Fathers, whiche is the Father of our Lorde Iesus Christe.*

Actor. 24.

The Apologie, Cap. 8. Diuision. 1.

But the more sore, and outragious a crime Heresie is, the more it ought to be proued by plaine and strong argumentes, especially in this time, when menne beginne to geue lesse credite to their woordes, and to make more diligent searche of their Doctrine, then they were wonte to do. For the people of God are otherwise instructednow, then they were in times paste, when al the Bishoppes of Romes Sayinges were allowed for Gospel, and when al Religion did depende onely vpon theire Authoritie. Nowe a daies the Holy Scripture is abroade, the

the writinges of the Apoſtles and Prophetes are in Prinᵗe: whereby al Truthe and Catholique Doctrine maie be prᵒued, and al Hereſie maie be diſprᵒued and confuted.

M. Hardinge.

The defenders Hereſies ſufficiently and fully cõfuted already by ſundrie graue Clerkes. Lanfranc. Guimund. Petrus Cluniacenſis. Thomas Walden. B. Fiſher.

VVhere ye require your Hereſie, for ſo muche as it is ſo hainous a crime, by plaine and ſtrong argumentes to be proued: it is not vnknowen howe ſufficiently and ſubſtantially that is performed already by menne of excellent learninge, as wel of this age, as of times paſte. VVas not Berengarius, the firſte Authour of your Sacramentarie Hereſie, by moſte plaine and ſtronge argumentes confuted of Lanfrancus Biſhop of Canturburie, and Guimundus Biſhop of Auerſa? VVere not the Peterbruſians ſo, whoſe Hereſie ye holde againſte the bleſſed Sacrifice of the Maſſe, of the learned Abbot Petrus Cluniacenſis? VVas not VVickleffe ſo of Thomas VValden, a learned man of England? hath not Luther and Oecolampadius benne ſo confuted in our time, of that Holy and learned Father Biſhop Fiſher?

But what ſhal I ſpeake of particular men, were they neuer ſo excellent, by whom they haue bene confuted ſith by Publike ſentence of the Churche they haue benne condemned, both in general and Prouincial Councelles? Therefore we thinke it not needeful nowe againe to proue your doctrine, ſo ſufficiently condemned, to be Hereſie. That the people be nowe otherwiſe inſtructed, then they were in times paſt, we confeſſe. But whether better nowe, then in our Forefathers daies, they that can conſider the liues of them nowe, and of them that were then, maie eaſily iudge.

In what caſe the Popes ſaiinges are to be taken for Truth. Luc. 22.

The ſaieinges of the Biſhop of Rome were neuer allowed for the Goſpel. His priuate ſaieinges and common talke might be erroneus, no leſſe then other mennes. But what he ſaide by waie of iudgement and ſentence definitiue in doubtful pointes touchinge Religion, ſuche ſaieinges of Peters Succeſſoure (for whom Chriſte praied, that his Faithe might not faile, and who was commaunded by Chriſte to ſtrengthen his Brethren) we take for Truthe, and the ſame obediently receiue. So the Fathers aſſembled in Councel at Chalcedon, receiued and agreed to the ſaieinge and writinge of Pope Leo, no leſſe then if Peter the Apoſtle and firſte Biſhop of Rome him ſelfe had ſpoken. The Popes authoritie we acknowledge Supreme abone al other authoritie in Earthe, touchinge the gouernmente of the Churche: yet was it neuer ſaide, ne thoughte by the Catholiques, that al Religion depended onely thereon, as your ſclaunderous reporte beareth men in hande. &

Vntruthe.

Vntruthe.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Lanfrancus, Guimundus, Abbas Clumacenſis, Thomas VValdenſis, Iohn Fiſher, and other pour like Doctoures, M. Hardinge, are ouer ponge, al within the ſpace of theſe laſte fiue hundred yeres, farre vnlike S. Auguſtine, S. Hierome, S. Ambroſe, S. Chryſoſtome, and others the Ancient Learned Fathers, & Doctours of the Churche. Neither is there any ſufficiente cauſe ᵇy the contrarie, but that Berengarius, Iohn VVickleffe, Iohn Hus, Doctour Luther, Zuinglius, Oecolampadius, & others, either for Learninge, or for Truthe, or for Iudgemente in the Scriptures, or for Antiquitie maie wel and ſafely be compared with them. At the leaſte I hope we maie ſaie of them, as S. Auguſtine once ſaide of the Doctours, and Fathers of his time: Neque quorumlibet Diſputationes, quamuis Catholicorum, & Laudatorum hominum, velut Scripturas Canonicas habere debemus: vt nobis non liceat, ſalua honorificentia, quæ illis debetur, aliquid in eorum Scriptis improbare, aut reſpuere: ſi forte inuenerimus, quod aliter ſenſerint, quam Veritas habet: *Neither weighe we the Writinges of al menne, be they neuer ſo worthy, and Catholique, as wee weighe the Canonical Scriptures: but that, ſauinge the reuerence that is dewe vnto them, wee maie miſlike, and refuſe ſomewhat in theire Writinges, if wee happen to finde, that they haue thought otherwiſe, then the Truthe maie beare.*

Aug. ad Fortunatian. Epiſt. III.

Likewiſe the Councelles, ye meane, are very Newe, and therefore beare the leſſe authoritie, for that they be ſo many waies contrarie to the Olde. Herof hereafter more at large. Certainely, there is none of your errᵒures ſo groſſe and palpable, but he ſomme of your late Councelles it hathe benne confirmed.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ This talke, (ſaithe M. Hardinge) is Luciferlike, and ſaucy, and malepert. For wherein (ſaithe he) are the late Councelles, ſo many waies contrarie to the Olde.

M. Hard. fo. m. b

The Anſweare. He might as wel haue demaunded, wherein is Darkeneſſe ſo many waies, contrarie to the Light. For he is ſo greate a ſtranger in theſe caſes: I doubt not, but he doth wel remember, It was decreed in ᵗ Olde Councel of Aphrica, that no Prieſte ſhoulde appeale out of that Countrie to the Biſhop of Rome. Likewiſe it is concluded in the Olde Councels holden at Tela, Hippo, & Mileuetum, That no Prieſte ſhoulde appeale, but onely to the Councelles holden in Aphrica. But the later Newe Councelles haue made it lawful, to appeale to the Pope,

Concil. Aphrican. cap. 92. Concil. Telen. Cap. 87.

from the furthest endes of the worlde. And Pope Pius 2. and Pope Iulius 2. haue solemnly determined, that who so appealeth from the Pope to a Councel, shalbe iudged an Heretique.

In bulla Leonis 10.

The olde Councel of Nice, alloweth the Bishop of Rome equal power with the other three Patriarkes, makinge euery of them, within theire owne Prouinces in Iurisdiction, and Authoritie like vnto other. But the later Newe Councelles haue made the same Bishop of Rome Heade, and Prince ouer al Primates, and Patriarkes throughout the worlde. And M. Hardinge saithe, The saide Patriarkes were onely the Popes Deputies, that is to saie, serued him at commaundement, as his men. And in the late Newe Councel of Laterane vnder Pope Leo, these wordes are openly pronounced, & wel allowed of, In Papa est omnis potestas supra omnes potestates, tam Cœli, quàm Terræ: *In the Pope there is al power aboue al powers, as wel of Heauen, as of Earthe.* The like might be saide of Priuate Masse, of the halfe Communion, of Transubstantiation, and of the reste. But by these fewe we may easily see, howe neare the Newe Councelles resemble the Olde.

Raffinus. 1. ca. 6

M Hard. in his Answere. Artic. 4. fo. 86. b.

Concil. Lateran. sub Leone 10. Session. 10.

Therefore we may iustly saie to you, as S. Augustine sometime saide to Maximinus the Arian Heretique, Nec ego Nicenam Synodum tibi, nec tu mihi Ariminensem debes, tanquam præiudicaturus, obijcere. Scripturarum Authoritatibus, res cum re, causa cum causa, ratio cum ratione concertet: *Neither maie I laie to thee the Councel of Nice, nor maiste thou laie to mee the Councel of Ariminum, either of vs thinkinge thereby to finde preiudice againste the other. But let vs laie mater to mater, cause to cause, and reason to reason, by the Authoritie of the Scriptures.*

August. contra Maximin. Li. 3. Cap. 14.

Yet we saie not, as you, M. Hardinge woulde faine gather, that S. Augustine by these wordes despised the authoritie of the Nicene Councel. For certainely he had it euer, as we also haue it, in greate reuerence. But thus we saie, S. Augustine disputinge with an Heretique, as we do with you, and saieinge, That Councelles might be alleged againste Councelles, as the Councel of Ariminum againste the Councel of Nice, was therefore contented, not to vse the Authoritie of any Councel at al, but, as him selfe saithe, by the Authoritie of the Scriptures, to laie mater to mater, and cause to cause.

M. Har. fo. 112. b.

Addition. The Councel of Ariminum, though there were at it eighte hundred Bishoppes, yet was it allowed for no Councel (saithe M. Hardinge) for waute of Damasus the Popes confirmation, as Sozomenus, and Theodoretus haue witnessed. Addition

The Answeare. Here M. Hardinge, you haue conueighed in a prety Fittonne vnder somme colourc of Truthe: But the Theodoretus, and Sozomenus wil reproue you. For the Councel of Ariminum was misliked, not onely for that it was not confirmed by the Pope, as ye woulde seeme to telle vs, but also for that it lacked the Confirmation of sundrie others. Sozomenus saithe thus, *They allowe not the Decrees of the Councel of* Ariminum, *for that neither the Bishop of Rome, nor other Bishoppes had consented vnto it, and for that the saide Decrees had misliked many, that were there assembled.* To like pourpose writeth also Theodoretus, & in manner with like wordes. I graunte, the Bishop of Rome was the chiefe. Yet his onely authoritie was not sufficient to allowe, or disallowe Generall Councelles. For, as it appeareth by youre owne Authours, the consente of others, was required thereto, as wel, as his. Thus M. Hardinge, ye seeke vndewly to beguile the simple by vntrue reporte.

Sozom. Lib. 6. Cap. 23.

Theodoret us. Lib. 2. cap. 21.

Ye graunte, there is more lighte and knowledge nowe, then was before. The greater is either youre faulte, or your folie, M. Hardinge, that in the broade daie, & open lighte so busily sette forthe the workes of Darkenesse. S. Chrysostome saithe, Hic est multò impudentior. Ex furibus enim leges eos grauius puniunt, qui interdiu furantur: *He is very shameleſſe, that worketh deceite in the open Lighte: For of al theeues the Lawe moste sharpely punisheth them, that robbe in the daie time.* Therefore S. Cyprian saithe vnto you: Ignosci potuit simpliciter erranti. Post inspirationem verò & reuelationem factam, qui in eo, quod errauerat, perseuerat prudens, & sciens, sine venia ignorantiæ peccat. Præsumptione enim, atque obstinatione superatur: *He that is deceiued, and erreth of simplicitie, maie be pardoned. But after that the Truthe is once reueled,* who

Chrysost. in Psalm. 9.

Cyprian ad Iubaianum.

Pope aboue Goddes VVoorde

who ſo continueth neuertheleſſe in his former errour wittingly and willingly, ſinneth without pardonne of ignorance, as beinge ouercomme by preſumption, and wilfulneſſe.

You ſaie, notwithſtandinge al this greate Light wee talke of, yet our liues are nothinge comparable to the liues of them that haue benne before vs. This, M. Hardinge, hathe euer benne an olde complainte in al ages, as maie appeare by S. Cyprian, S. Auguſtine, and other Anciente Fathers: It was a common Prouerbe in olde times, τὰ πρῶτα βέλτια: Thinges a peere paſt are euermore better, then thinges preſente. For euery thinge to vs ſemeth the greater, as it ſemeth neareſt to touche our ſences. And bicauſe wee take not our Fathers cuſtiles, therefore wee imagine, they had no euil at al. The VViſeman ſaithe, Ne dixeris, quæ cauſa eſt, quòd priora tempora meliora fuerint, quàm præſentia. Stulta enim eſt huiuſmodi interrogatio: *Neuer demaunde wherefore the times paſte, were better then the times preſent. For in deede it is a fooliſhe queſtion.*

Cyprian ad Demetrianum. Auguſt. De Ciuitat. Dei. Eccleſiaſtes. 7.

But, M. Hardinge, wherefore dw you thus condemne our liues in reſpect of our Fathers? Certainely you muſte nedes confeſſe, there are fewer Blaſphemies, fewer Othes, fewer breaches of Patrimonie, fewer Stewes, fewer Concubines, fewer Fraies, fewer Murthers emongſt vs this daie, then commonly were at any time emong our Fathers. Howe be it, to let our Fathers paſſe, if it ſhal pleaſe you to laie our liues to your liues, although wee acknowledge many our imperfections, yet Goddes name be bleſſed, wee haue no cauſe to feare the compariſon.

The Popes wordes, you ſaie, were neuer taken for Goſpel. Yes, M. Hardinge, and ſomme what alſo aboue the Goſpel. For proofe whereof it maie pleaſe you to remember the wordes of certaine youre late Doctours. Syluester Prieriâs late Maiſter of Pope Leoes Palaice, writeth thus: Indulgentiæ authoritate Scripturæ non innotuere nobis: ſed authoritate Eccleſiæ Romanæ, Romanorumque Pontificum, quæ maior eſt: *Pardonnes are not warranted vnto vs by the authoritie of Goddes Woorde: but by the authoritie of the Romaine Church, and of the Biſhoppes of Rome, which is more then Goddes Woorde.* If this be not ſufficient, he addeth further: A Doctrina Romanæ Eccleſiæ, & Romani Pontificis Sacra Scriptura robur, & authoritatem trahit: *The Holy Scripture taketh ſtrength, and authoritie of the Doctrine of the Biſhop and Churche of Rome.*

Syluester Prierias contra Lutheram.

Your greateſt Doctoure Albertus Pighius ſaithe, Apoſtoli quædam conſcripſerunt, non vt ſcripta illa præeſſent Fidei & Religioni noſtræ, ſed potiùs vt ſubeſſent: *The Apoſtles wrote certaine thinges, not to the ende that ſutche writinges ſhoulde be ouer oure Faithe, and Religion: but rather, that they ſhoulde be vnder.* Your Canoniſtes ſaie, [a] Papa poteſt diſpenſare contra Ius Diuinum: *The Pope maie diſpenſe againſte the Lawe of God:* [b] Papa poteſt diſpenſare contra Ius Naturæ: *The Pope maie diſpenſe againſte the Lawe of Nature:* [c] Papa poteſt diſpenſare contra Apoſtoloruim: *The Pope maie diſpenſe againſt S. Paule the Apoſtle:* [d] Papa poteſt diſpenſare contra Nouum Teſtamentum: *The Pope maie diſpenſe againſte the Newe Teſtamente:* [e] Papa poteſt diſpenſare de omnibus præceptis veteris, & Noui Teſtamenti: *The Pope maie diſpenſe with al the Commaundementes, bothe of the Olde, and alſo of the Newe Teſtamente.* Hereof more hereafter, as farther occaſion ſhalbe offered.

Albert. Pighius Hierarch. Lib. 1. Cap. 2.

[a] 16. q. 1. Quæ cunq; in Gloſſa.

[b] 15. q. 6. Authoritate. In Gloſſa.

[c] Diſt. 34. Lector & Diſt. 82. Preſbyter.

[d] Abbas Panor. Extra. De Diuortijs, ca. fin.

[e] Summa Angel. in Dictione Papa.

These be your owne Doctours wordes, M. Hardinge: they be truely reported: they be no ſclaunders. And therefore Franciſcus Zabarella a Cardinal of Rome ſaith thus: [f] Perſuaſerunt Pontificibus, quòd omnia poſſent, & ſic quòd facerent, quicquid liberet etiam illicita, & ſint pluſquam Deus: *They haue made the Popes beleue, that they might doo al thinges, what ſo euer they liſted, yea notwithſtandinge they were thinges vnlawful: and thus haue they made them more then God.*

[f] Franciſcus Zabarella.

You ſaie, The Pope in his common talke maie be deceiued, and erre, as other menne maie: but in his Iudgement Seate, and Sentence Definitiue of Religion he cannot erre: as if we would ſaie, The Pope hathe one Spirite in the Conſiſtorie, and an other at home: matche like, as one ſaide ſommetimes vnto Cicero in reproche of his inconſtancie, Aliud ſtans, aliud ſedens de Republica loqueris: *Touchinge the Commen Weale, ye haue one minde ſittinge, and an other ſtandinge.*

Saluſt. in Ciceronem.

But Chriſte ſaide vnto Peter, *I haue praied for thee, that thy Faithe ſhoulde not faile:* Therefore

Luca. 22.

Therfore, saie you, We receiue obediently, what so euer the Pope speaketh in place of Iudgemente. Hereby ye seme to geue vs secretely to vnderstande, that Christes Prayers were available for the Pope, to kepe him from errour, not in the Churche, or Pulpite, or Closet, or any other Common, or Priuate place, but onely in the Consistorie, and Councel, in debatinge doubtful cases of Religion.

But howe holdeth this Argumente? Christe prayed for Peter, that his Faithe shoulde not faile: Ergo, the Pope cannot erre. Verily S. Augustine saithe, Nunquid pro Petro rogabat: pro Iohanne, & Iacobo non rogabat? Vt de cæteris taceamus: *What did Christe praie for* Peter: *and did he not praie for* Iohn, *and* Iames? *I wil not speake of the reste.* Neither did Christe praie for Peter onely, or for the Apostles, but, for al the Faithful, that euer shoulde be: as him selfe saithe, I praie not onely for them, but also for al them, that throughe their preachinge shal beleue in me.

Augustin in Qu. Noui Test q. 75. Iohan. 17.

Howe be it, what, saithe M. Hardinge, be so obediently receiueth the Popes Decrees? Yewis, the Popes them selues wil not so receiue them. Platyna saith, Acta Priorum Pontificum sequentes Pontifices aut infringunt, aut omnino tollunt. Nihil enim aliud isti Pontificuli cogitabant, quàm vt nomen, & dignitatem maiorum suorum extingueren: *The nexte Pope either breaketh, or vtterly repealeth his Predecessores Decrees. For these little petie Popes, had none other studie to busie them selues withal, but onely to deface the name, and dignitie of the Former Popes.*

Platyna in Stephano, & in Romano.

Where you saie, The whole Councel of Chalcedon so estéemed the voice of Pope Leo, as if it had benne the voice of Peter him selfe, this, M. Hardinge, is a manifeste Untruthe, as it shal sone appeare. I graunte the name of Leo, for his greate Learninge, and grauitie was mutche regarded. So S. Ambrose for the like cause was called, Orbis terrarum oculus, Sacerdotum Archisacerdos, & Fundamentum Fidei: *The eie of the worlde, the heade Prieste of al Priestes, and the Fundation of the Faithe.* So Paphnutius, beinge no Pope, was hearde against al the reste of the Councel of Nice: So S. Hierome beinge neither Pope, nor Bishop, was receiued againste this whole Councel of Chalcedon.

Athanas. ad Hieronem. Sozom. li. 1. ca. 33 36. Quæst. 2. Quia legitima.

Neither did the Councel folowe Leo alone, as the Universal Bishop, & Heade of the Churche, but ioined him togeather with others, as estéeminge them of equal Authoritie. For thus they made their general shoute: Omnes ita credimus: Leo Papa ita credit: Cyrillus ita credit: Leo, & Anatolius ita credunt: *Thus wee al beleue: Thus* Pope Leo *beleueth:* Cyrillus *thus beleueth:* Leo, *and* Anatolius *thus belene.*

Concil. Chalcedon. Actio. 2.

And with what credite can M. Hardinge saie, The whole Councel of Chalcedon párded vnto Pope Leo, as if it had benne vnto Peter him selfe? For it is certaine, that the same whole Councel decreed againste Leo: and likewise Leo againste the Councel. For the Councel decreed, contrary to the olde Canons, that the Bishop of Constantinople, emonge the foure Patriaches, shoulde be the seconde in dignitie, and that the same Bishop of Constantinople, should haue and enioie one Authoritie, and like Priuileges with the Bishop of Rome. The wordes be these, Aequa Sanctissimæ Sedi Nouæ Romæ Priuilegia tribuerunt, rationabile iudicantes, Vrbem eam ornatam iam Imperio, & Senatu, æquis Senioris Regiæ Romæ Priuilegijs frui, & in Ecclesiasticis, sicut illa habet, Maiestatem habere negotijs: *The Fathers gaue equal Priuileges vnto the Holy See of Newe Rome (* whiche was Constantinople) *thinkinge it to be reasonable, that the same Cittie of* Constantinople, *beinge nowe furnished with Empire, and Councel, shoulde enioie equal Priuileges with the Princely Cittie of the Olde Rome, and in al Ecclesiastical affaires, shoulde beare the same Maiestie, that Rome beareth.* This thinge Pope Leo mutche misliked, and founde greate faulte with the Councel, and woulde in no wise consente vnto it. Thus he writeth, Quæ per occasionem Synodi malè sunt attentata reprehenderam: *I reproued those thinges that were euil attempted by the Councel of* Chalcedon. And againe, Nullum vnquam potuerunt nostrum obtinere consensum: *They were neuer hable to geate our consente.*

Concil. Chalcedon. Actio. 16. Pag. 936.

Leo. Epist. 58.

Leo. Epist. 53.

And when these maters were passe by the consente of al the Bishoppes, Lucentius Pope Leoes Legate, came whining in, and besought the Councel, that the whole mater might be repealed. The wordes written in the Councel be these: Lucen-

tius

Churche depēdeth of the Pope.

tius dixit: Sedes Apostolica, quæ nobis præcepit, præsentibus humiliari non debet. Et ideo quæcunque in præiudicium Canonum hesterna die gesta sunt, nobis absentibus, sublimitatem vestram petimus, vt circunduci iubeatis. Viri illustrissimi Iudices dixerunt, Quod interloquuti sumus, tota Synodus approbauit: Lucentius the Popes Legate saide, *The Apostolique See of Rome, whose commission wee haue, maie not by any theise doinges be defaced. Therefore wee beseeche your honours, that what so euer was concluded here yesterdaie in our absence, in preiudice of the Canons, yee wil commaunde the same to be blotted out. The honourable Iudges made him answeare: That wee haue talkte of, the same the whole Councel hathe allowed.*

Thus manie waies, M. Hardinge, the Untruthe of your tale plainely appeareth. For the Councel of Chalcedon estæmed not the voice of Leo, as if it had benne the voice of Peter, as you saie: but rather contrariwise made lighte of it, and weighed it none otherwise, then they sawe cause. *Concil. Chalcedon. Actio. 16.*

Therefore Liberatus saithe thus, touchinge the same: Cùm Anatolius, consentiente Concilio, Primatum obtinuisset, Legati verò Romani Episcopi contradicerent, à Iudicibus, & Episcopis, omnibus illa contradictio susceptа non est. Et licet Sedes Apostolica nunc vsque contradicat, tamen, quòd à Synodo firmatum est, Imperatorio Patrocinio permanet, quodammodò: *When* Anatolius (the Bishop of Constantinople) *by consente of the Councel, had obteined the Primacie, notwithstandinge, the Bishop of Romes Legates stoode againste it, yet theire gainesaieinge coulde not be receiued, neither of the Iudges, nor of the Bishoppes: And albeit, the Apostolique See of Rome withstande it stil, yet the Decree of the Councel by the Emperours warrante, after a sorte continueth in force.* *Liberatus. ca. 13*

But you neuer taught vs, ye saie, that the whole state of the Churche dependeth of the Pope. It is not your Doctrine: you neuer spake it. And therefore wee are raylers, and sclaunderers, that so reporte you. If it be so in deede, M. Hardinge, as you saie, wherefore then suffer you Cardinal Cusanus to write thus, Veritas adhæret Cathedræ. Quare membra Cathedræ vnita, & Pontifici connuncta, efficiunt Ecclesiam: *The Truthe cleaueth faste to the (Popes) Chaire. Therefore the members vnited to the Chaire, and ioined to the Pope, make the Churche.* Wherefore suffer you Iohannes de Parisijs, one of your Catholique Doctours, to write thus: Fiet vnum Ouile, & vnus Pastor. Quod quidem de Christo intelligi non potest: Sed de aliquo alio Ministro, qui præsit loco eius: *There shalbe one Flocke, and one Sheepeheard. Whiche thinge cannot be meant of Christe: Wee muste needes vnderstande it of some other Minister, that ruleth in his stede.* *Nicolaus Cusanus ad Bohemos Epist. 2.* *Iohan. de Parisijs. de Potestate Regia & Papali. cap. 3.*

Wherefore sutter you Hosius your Grande Captaine to write thus: Vnum toti præesse Ecclesiæ vsque adeò est necessarium, vt absque hoc, Ecclesia vna esse non possit: *It is so necessarie a thinge, that one onely man ouerrule the whle Churche, that without the same the Churche cannot be one.* Wherefore suffer you your Canonistes to saie, Constat Ecclesiam ideò esse vnam, quia in Vniuersali Ecclesia vnum est Caput Supremum, Scilicet Papa: *It is plaine, that therefore the Churche is one, bicause that in the whole Vniuersal Churche there is one Supreme Heade, that is the Pope.* *Hosius in Confessione Petricou. Cap. 17.* *Clemen. Lib. 5. Ad nostrum: In Glossa.*

To be shorte, why do you your selfe, M. Hardinge, allege S. Hieromes wordes diuerslie, as ye woulde haue vs beleue, to this yourpose? Ecclesiæ salus à Summi Sacerdotis dignitate pendet: Whiche wordes into Englishe wee haue turned thus: *The safetie of the Churche, hangeth of the worship of the Highe Prieste. He meaneth the Pope Peters Successour.* In which laste clause, ye misconstrue, and racke S. Hieromes wordes farre contrarie to his meaninge. For S. Hierome meante not herby the Bishop of Rome, but euery seuerall Bishop within his owne Charge: euery whiche Bishop, he calleth the Highest Prieste, as in my Former Replie it is declared more at large. *M. Hard fo. 80. b* *Hierony. contra Luciferianos.* *Artic. 4 Diuis. 15.*

If these thinges be true, why are they now denied? if they be false, why are they not condemned? I truste it maie appeare by these fewe, that wee report the Truth truelie, and are no sclaunderers.

The Apologie, Cap. 8. Diuision. 2.

Sithence then they bringe foorthe none of these for them selues, and cal

cal vs neuertheleſſe Heretiques, which haue neither fallen from Chriſt, nor from the Apoſtles, nor yet from the Prophetes, this is an iniurious and a very ſpiteful dealinge.

M. Hardinge.

Nay Sirs, ye ſhal not ſo carie awaie the Concluſion with a Lie. But contrariwiſe, ſithens we bring foorthe many Scriptures for the Truthe, which ye impugne, as your ſelues ſhal ſee, when we come to confute your Doctrine, whiche here foloweth: and ſithens notwithſtandinge that ye wil not yeelde to the Scriptures, but peruerte the True meaninge of them, with Gloſes and Interpretations of youre owne Heades, frame newe opinions contrarie to that ye haue receiued, and that the Church hathe euer taught: the Catholikes wil ſtil cal you Heretikes, and the Church wil condemne you for Heretikes and ſo accoumpte you, vntil ye recante, and repente.

Vntruthe.

But ye haue not fallen from Chriſte, ye ſaie, nor from the Apoſtles, nor yet from the Prophetes. As though they that departe from the Romaine Churche, whiche is the Catholike Churche, whiche diuerſe times in the Apologie ye confeſſe, ſet not from Chriſte, and conſequently from the Apoſtles, and Prophetes. Saith not Chriſte in the Goſpel: He that heareth not the Churche, let him be to thee as an Heathen, and a Publicane? Saith he not alſo, He that deſpiſeth you, deſpiſeth mee?

That the Defenders be fallen frō Chriſt. Matth. 18. Luke 10.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Whether parte rightly & reuerently vſeth the Scriptures of God, and whether peruerteth them by ſhiftes, and Gloſes, I truſte, it ſhal in parte appeare by this conference. In deede, M. Hardinge, it is no greate maiſterie, by youre interpretations, and handelinges, to haue ſtoare ynough and plentie of Scriptures. For this is one ſpecial grounde of your Diuinitie, [a] Papa poteſt ex nihilo facere aliquid: & Sententiam, quæ nulla eſt, facere aliquam: *The Pope is hable of nothinge to make ſommethinge: and of no Sentence, to make ſomme Sentence:* By your Doctrine, it is lawful, & good Logique to reaſon thus: [b] An gloriabitur ſerra aduerſus eum, qui trahit illam? *Shal the ſawe boaſte againſte him, that draweth it?* [c] Non eſt Seruus ſupra Dominum: *There is no Seruaunt aboue his Lorde:* Ergo, A man may bee bold to iudge the Pope. Or thus, [d] Omnia munda mundis: Coinquinatis autem, & Infidelibus nihil eſt mundum: *All things are cleane to the cleane: but vnto the filthy, and Infidels nothinge is cleane:* Ergo, It is not lawful for Prieſtes to Marrie.

[a] Extra de tranſlatione Epiſc. Quāuis in Cloſſ.
[b] Diſt. 21. Inferiores Sedes, Eſaie 10.
[c] Matth. 10. Concil. Roman. ſub Syluestro 1.
[d] Ad Tit. 1. Diſt. 81. Propoſuiſti.

Or as you, M. Hardinge, ſometimes haue delighted to reaſon: [e] Nolite dare Sanctum Canibus: *Geue not Holy thinges to Dogges:* Ergo, It is not lawful for the Chriſtian vulgare People to Reade the Scriptures.

[e] Matthe. 7. M. Hard. *in his former Booke.* Fol. 155. b.

Thus maie you eaſily be wel ſtoared, and ful freight of Scriptures ynoughe, and, as [f] S. Hierome ſaith, maie carrie them captiue to ſerue your turne. But S. Hierome coulde alſo haue tolde you, [g] Non in verbis Scripturarum eſt Euangelium, ſed in ſenſu: *The Goſpel ſtandeth not in the bare woordes of the Scriptures, but in the meaninge:* Therefore wee maie ſaie vnto you, as S. Cyprian once ſaide to the Nouatian Heretiques: [h] Audite Nouatiani, apud quos Scripturæ Cœleſtes leguntur potiùs, quàm intelliguntur: *Hearken hereto, ye* Nouatian *Heretiques, emongeſt whom the Heauenly Scriptures are readde rather, then wel perceiued.*

[f] Hieronym. ad Pammachium: Exemplaria captiua ſeruiunt ad Victoriam.
[g] Hieronym. in 1. Ca. ad Galat.
[h] Cyprian ad Nouatianū ca. 2

You ſaie, the Churche of Rome by youre owne Confeſſion, is the Catholique Churche: whiche Churche, for as muche as wee haue forſaken, wee haue forſaken Chriſte, and his Apoſtles. For ſaithe not Chriſte in the Goſpel, ſaie you, [i] *He that heareth not the Churche, let him be vnto thee as an Heathen, and a Publicane?* And, *He that deſpiſeth you, deſpiſeth mee?*

[i] Matth. 18. Luke. 10.

Wee graunte, M. Hardinge, the name of the Churche of Rome is Catholique: but the Errours and abuſes thereof, are not Catholique. Neither is it the Churche, that wee finde faulte withal: but the greate corruptions, and foule deformities, that you haue brought into the Churche.

Howe be it, your policie herein is apparent. Your Reader, be he neuer ſo ſimple, maie ſone ſée your whole drift. Ye magnifie the Church with al maner titles of Authoritie, not for any ſpecial regarde, ye beare the Churche in deede, but onely to ſettle your ſelues in an infinite Tyrannie, and to make vs beleue, that you onely are the Churche, and to geue credite to al your fantaſies: yea although ye be the deſtroyers, and enimies of the Churche. Verily the bare name of the Churche is not ſuffi-

ente.

ente. S. Paule saithe, That Antichriſte the Man of ſinne, ſhal ſitte in the Temple of God: whereby no doubte he meante the Churche. 2. *Theſſ.* 2.

But, M. Hardinge, Heare you the voice of God: leaue your Fables: ſpeake Gods Holy Woꝛde, and ſpeake it truely: be ye faithful Miniſters of the Truthe. Then who ſo euer ſhal be founde to deſpiſe your Doctrine, be he Kinge, oꝛ Emperour, wee wil not doubte to cal him an Heathen, and Publicane. But if he be an Heathen, that wil not heare youre Churche, what is he then that wil not heare Chriſte? Aeneas Syluius, beinge afterwarde Pope him ſelfe, ſaithe thus: Si Romanus Pontifex non audiet Eccleſiam, Chriſtum quoque non audiet, & tanquam Ethnicus, & Publicanus haberi debet: *If the Biſhop of Rome wil not heare the Churche, he wil not heare Chriſte: and therefore muſte be taken as an Heathen and Publicane.* S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Oues meæ vocem meam audiunt, & ſequuntur me. Auferantur Chartæ Humanæ: ſonent voces Diuinæ: *My Sheepe heare my voice, and folowe mee. Awaie with Mannes Writinges: Let the voice of God ſounde vnto vs.* *Æneas Sylui. De Geſtis Concil. Baſilien. Paral. Vrſperg. Pag.* 411. *Aug. De Oui-bus cap.* 14.

Surely Doctour Luther him ſelfe againſte whom M. Hardinge ſo vehemently, and ſo often exclameth his choler, in humble, and reuerente maner writeth thus: Nos colimus Romanam Eccleſiam in omnibus. Tantùm illis reſiſtimus, qui pro Eccleſia obtrudunt Babyloniam: *Wee honoure the Churche of Rome in al thinges. Onely wee withſtande them, that in ſteede of the Churche, haue thruſte in the Confuſion of Babylon.* In like ſence S. Cyprian ſaithe, Non eſt pax, ſed bellum: nec Eccleſiæ iungitur, qui ab Euangelio ſeparatur: *It is not Peace: It is Warre. Neither is he ioined to the Churche, that is diuided from the Goſpel.* Nowe, howe carefully the Churche of Rome is leadde by the Goſpel of Chriſt, wee maie eaſily learne by Nicolaus Cuſanus, a Cardinal of the ſame Churche of Rome. Thus he ſaithe: Sequuntur Scripturæ Eccleſiam: & non è conuerſo: *The Scriptures of God folowe the Churche: but contrariwiſe the Churche foloweth not the Scriptures.* To conclude, wee maie ſaie vnto you, as S. Auguſtine ſaide ſommetime to Petilian the Donatian Heretique: Vtrùm nos Schiſmatici ſumus, an vos, nec ego, nec tu, ſed Chriſtus interrogetur, vt indicet Eccleſiam ſuam: *Whether of vs be Schiſmatiques, wee, or you, aſke you not mee: I wil not aſke you: Let Chriſte be aſked: that he maie ſhewe vs his owne Churche.* *Pyrrha Lutheri Pag.* 472. *Cyprian Sermone* 5. *De Lapſis.* *Nicol. Cuſanus ad Bohemos Epiſt.* 2. *Auguſt. contra Literas Petiliani. Lib.* 2. *Ca.* 85.

The Apologie, Cap. 9. *Diuiſion.* 1.

With this ſwerde did Chriſte put of the Diuel, when he was tempted of him: with theſe weapons ought al preſumption, whiche doothe auaunce it ſelfe againſte God, to be ouerthrowen and conquered. For al Scripture, ſaithe S. Paule, that commeth by the Inſpiration of God, is profitable to teache, to confute, to inſtructe, and to reproue, that the man of God may be perfite, throughly framed to euery good woorke. Thus did the Holy Fathers alwaie fight againſt the Heretiques, with none other force, then with the Holy Scriptures. 2. *Tim.* 3.

M. Hardinge.

That the Holy Fathers did euermore fighte againſte the Heretiques with none other force, then with the Holy Scriptures, that wee denie.

For what did the Fathers in the firſte General Councel holden at Nice? did they fighte againſte Arius, and the maintainers of his Hereſie, with no other force, then with the Scriptures? VVhen thoſe Heretikes refuſed the woorde Homouſion, whereby it is ſignified the Sonne of God to be of one and the ſame Subſtance with God the Father, for that it was not to be founde in the Scriptures, beſides whiche they ſtiffely denied, as ye doo, that any thinge oughte to be receiued: did not the Catholike Biſhoppes of the other ſide, flie to the Anciente Fathers? did they not appeale to the iudgementes of thoſe Fathers, which had geuen ſentence of the mater then being in controuerſie, before that Arius, and thoſe that holde of his ſide were borne?

Hiſtor. Tripart. Lib. 5. Cap. 10. In the ſecond Councel aſſembled at Conſtantinople, were not the Heretikes of ſundrie ſectes by a witnie and a godly policie contriued betwene Nectarius the Biſhop, and Theodoſius the Emperoure, through the ſuggeſtion of the greate Clerke Siſinnius, driuen to receiue the Doctours, who liued before their Hereſies were hearde of, as witneſſes of true Chriſtian Doctrine woorthy of credite?

Macedonius. Macedonius in that Councel was condemned, who therefore denied the Holy Ghoſt to be God, bicauſe the Scriptures geue not vnto him that name. But the Biſhoppes there aſſembled, as Photius that learned Biſhop writeth, declared out of the teachinge of the Fathers; and Diuines before theire

time, that the Holy Ghoste is to be adored, woorshipped, and glorified, as beinge of one nature and substance togeather with the Father, and the Sonne.

In the third Councel kept at Ephesus, the Heretike Nestorius boasted, as ye doo, of the Scriptures, sayinge: they were of his side, and woulde neither speake, nor heare ought but Scriptures, Scriptures. And allegeinge a place or twoo out of the Gospel, where Marie is called the Mother of Iesus, stoutely, finde mee in al Scripture (quoth he) where Marie is called the Mother of God. Hereto what saide that holy and learned Bishop Cyrillus, chiefe in that Councel? *Hanc nobis fidem diuini tradidere Discipuli: & licet nullam fecerint dictionis huius mentionem, ita tamen sentire à sanctis Patribus edocti sumus.* This Faithe (saithe he) the Disciples of God haue by tradition lefte vnto vs. And although they haue made no expresse mention of this woorde (*Deipara*) yet so to thinke wee haue benne taught of the Holy Fathers.

Nestorius euer called for Scripture, as the Heretikes at this daie doo, what so euer lefte they be of.

VVhen they reasoned about rules touchinge Faithe to be made, (saithe Vicentius Lirinensis writinge of that Councel) to al the Bishoppes there assembled, to the number almoste of twoo hundred, this seemed moste Catholique, moste faithful, and beste to be donne, that the sentences of the Holy Fathers shoulde be brought foorthe amonge them: to thende, that they by their consent and Decree, the Religion of the Olde Doctrine should be confirmed, and the blasphemie of the Prophane nouelti condemned. Beholde Sirs what weapons the Fathers haue vsed againste Heresies, besides the Holy Scriptures.

Epist. 1. Tom. 4.

Deipara not found in Scripture, yet receiued & kept.

In the fourthe Councel, whiche was celebrated at Chalcedon, the Heretike Eutyches, as ye and al Heretikes haue donne, craked muche of the Scriptures, and required his matter to be discussed by Scriptures. Tel me (quoth he mockingely to euery one that reasoned with him) in what Scripture lie the twoo natures?

Eutyches claimed his opinion to be tried by the Scriptures.

But let vs heare what the Learned Bishoppes of that Councel saide thereto. VVe finde in the first action of the Councel, that they cried out aloude, *Ea qua sunt Patrum teneantur:* The thinges that the Fathers haue taught, let them be kepte. Againe, when they come to the definitiue sentence, they saie: *Sequentes igitur Sanctos Patres, &c.* Folowinge the Holy Fathers, wee doo al with one accorde, teache menne to confesse one, and him selfe the Sonne our Lorde Iesus Christ, perfite him selfe in Godhead, and perfite him selfe in Manhoode. And for Authoritie of the Fathers in highe pointes of Faithe, a Bishop in that reuerende assemblie named Eudoxius, pronounced a notable sentence, saieinge thus: Euery one that consenteth not to the exposition of the Holy Fathers, dothe alienate him selfe from al Priestly Communion, and from the presence of Christe. Thus we haue alleged the foure firste General Councelles, whiche S. Gregorie honoureth as the foure Gospelles.

The chiefe of the Fathers to be kept. Actio 5.

A notable saying of a Learned Father, for the exposition of the Fathers.

But the thinge beinge so euident as it is, and so wel knowen euen to your selues, if ye be learned, the Authoritie of these chiefe Councelles maie suffice.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Here, M. Hardinge, yée haue taken in hande a néedelesse laboure. For you knowe right wel, wée despise not the Authoritie of the Holy Fathers: but rather in this selfe same place haue alleged togeather S. Augustine, S. Hierome, & S. Ambrose, three of the moste Auncient and approued Fathers: and throughout the whole discourse of this Apologie, in the Defense of the Catholique Truthe of oure Religion, nerre vnto Goddes Holy Worde, haue vsed no proufe, or Authoritie so muche, as the Expositions, and Iudgementes of the Holy Fathers. Wée despise them not therefore, but rather geue God thankes in their behalfe, for that it hath pleased him to prouide so worthy instrumentes for his Church: and therefore wée iustly reprehende you, for that so vnaduisedly, and without cause, ye haue forsaken the steppes of so Holy Fathers.

a Soto. li. 1. ca. 17

b Concil. Chalcedon. Actio 1. Fol. 748. Eodem tenore Leo vocatus est.

The foure General Councelles, wherein you dwel so longe, as they make nothinge againste vs, so in sundrie pointes they fight expresselie againste you.

Firste, they were summoned by the Emperoures, Constantinus, Theodosius 1. Theodosius 2 and Martianus: and not by any right, or authoritie of the Pope: as hereafter it shalbe shewed in place conuenient more at large. a Iulius the Bishop of Rome was summoned by the Emperours writ to appeare at the Councel of Nice, as wel as others: b And Pope Leo afterwarde was charged by like Authoritie to appeare at the Councel of Chalcedon.

c Euseb de Vita Constant. Orat 3

d Theodoretus, Lib. 1. cap. 7. Concil. Nicen. Can. 6.

e Concil. Chalcedon. Actio 16. Pag. 636.

f Liberat. cap 13

c In the Councel of Nice the Bishop of Rome was not President, but Eustathius the Bishop of Antioche. In the same d Councel of Nice, the Bishop of Rome hathe his Authoritie and Iurisdiction made equal, and leuel with the other three Patriarkes: e And in the Councel of Chalcedon the Bishop of Constantinople, is made equal in Authoritie, with the Bishop of Rome. To be shorte, f the saide Councel of Chalcedon, for this lacke, and some other like causes, Leo the Bishop of Rome would not allowe.

Doctours alleged by Heretiques.

not allowe. Whiche thinge notwithstandinge, the Councel standeth stil in force, whether the Pope wil, or no.

These be the foure firste Generall Councelles, whiche M. Harding: compareth in Authoritie with the foure Euangelistes.

But these Heretiques, Arius, Nestorius, Macedonius, and Eutyches in these foure General Councelles, vtterly despise al the Auncient Fathers, and boasted them selues (saithe M. Harding) of the Scriptures, and euermore cried out, Scriptures, Scriptures. Touchinge the Arians, that they alleged certaine doubtful, and darke places of the Scriptures, to serue theire pourpose, it is certaine, and manifest. But that either they despised, or that the Catholiques againste them auouched the Exposition and Authoritie of any Father, M. Hardinges onely worde muste be our warrante. For neither allegeth he any one Authour for proufe hereof, nor yet nameth any of al these Fathers.

Notwithstandinge, let vs graunte, these Heretiques cried out, as M. Harding saithe, Scriptures, Scriptures. Euen so did the same Heretiques likewise crie out, euen as nowe M. Harding doothe, Fathers, Fathers. Socrates saithe, Et Ariani Origenis Libros citabant in Testimonium, vt illi quidem iudicabant, sui Dogmatis: *And the* Arian *Heretiques alleged the Learned Father* Origens *Bookes, as they thoughte, for proufe, and witnesse of their Doctrine.* Socr. li. 4. ca. 26. ὡς ἔοικτο.

The Heretique Eutyches saide, Ego legi Scripta Beati Cypriani, & Sanctorum Patrum, & Sancti Athanasij: *I haue readde the Writinges of* S. Cyprian, *and of other Holy Fathers, and of* S. Athanasius. Concil. chalced Actio 2. pa. 792.

Likewise the Eutychian Heretique Carosus saide, Ego secundum expositionem trecentorum octodecim Patrum sic credo, sic Baptizatus sum. Aliud quid mihi dicas, nescio: *This is my Faithe, accordinge to the exposition of the three hundred and eightiene Fathers, (*in the Councel of Nice*) in this Faithe was I Baptized. What ye shoulde saie more to me, I cannot telle.* Concil. chalced. Actio. 4. Pa. 877

Euen so saide Eutyches him selfe, Sic à Progenitoribus meis accepi, & credidi. In hac Fide Baptizatus sum, & signatus: & vsque ad hunc diem in ea vixi, & in ea opto mori: *Thus haue I receiued of my Forefathers, and thus haue I beleeued. In this Faithe was I Baptized, and signed: and in the same haue I liued vntil this daie: and in the same I wishe to die.* Concil chalced. Actio. 1. Pa. 751.

Thus, S. Augustine saithe, the Donatian Heretique Cresconius alleged the authoritie of S. Cyprian: Thus the Nestorian Heretiques alleged the authoritie of the Councel of Nice. August. contra Cresc. li. 4. ca 17 Con. to. 1. pa. 368.

To be shorte, thus the Heretique Dioscorus cried out in the open Councel of Chalcedon: Ego habeo Testimonia Sanctorum Patrum, Athanasij, Gregorij, Cyrilli. Non transgredior in aliquo. Ego cum Patribus eijcior: Ego defendo Patrum Dogmata: Ego horum habeo testimonia, non simpliciter, aut transitorie, sed in ipsorum libris: *I haue the Testimonies of the Holy Fathers,* Athanasius, Gregorius, Cyrillus: *I alter not from them in any pointe: I am throwen foorthe, and banished with the Fathers: I defende the Fathers Doctrine: I haue their Iudgemente vttered, not by chaunce, or vnaduisedly, but remayninge expressed in their Bookes.* Concil chalced. Actio. 1. Pa. 767

I doubt not, M. Harding, but you make hereby easily see, that the Heretiques ye speake of, cried not onely Scriptures, Scriptures, as ye saie: but had leasure also sometimes to crie, as you do, Fathers, Fathers: and that as wel to pourpose, and as rightly, as you of longe time haue vsed to crie, hauinge in deede in the cases we speake of, neither Scriptures, nor Fathers.

To comme neare the mater, we saie not, that al cases of doubte are by manifest, and open wordes plainely expressed in the Scriptures. For so there shoulde neede no exposition. But we saie, There is no case in Religion so darke, and doubtful, but it make necessarily be either proued, or reproued by collection, and conference of the Scriptures.

S. Hierome saithe, Moris est Scripturarum obscuris manifesta subnectere: *It is the order of the Scriptures, after harde thinges, to ioine other thinges that be plaine.* S. Augustine likewise saithe, Solet circunstantia Scripturarum illuminare sententiam: *The Circunstance of the Scriptures is woont to geue light, and to open the meaninge.* The like rule Tertullian Hierony. in Esai. cap. 19. August. in li. 83. Quæst. q. 69.

Tertullian also geueth : Oportet secundum plura intelligi pauciora : *The fewer places must be expounded by the moe.* Therefore touchinge this woꝛde, Homousius, which M. Hardinge here moueth, and the whole contention of the Arians, Epiphanius writeth thus : Nomen Substantiæ simpliciter, & nudè in Veteri, & Nouâ Scriptura non proponitur : Sententia autem eius nominis vbique occurrit : *This woorde, Substance, plainely, and nakedly is not founde, neither in the Olde, nor in the Newe Testamente. But the sense, and meaninge of that woorde is founde euerywhere.*

Tertull. aduersus Praxeam.

Epiphani. Lib. 3 De Semiarianis. ὁ γὰρ νοῦς πανταχοῦ.

In this conference, and Iudgemente of the Holy Scriptures, wée néede oftentimes the discretion, and wisedome of Learned Fathers. Yet notwithstandinge maie wée not geue them herein greater credite, then is conueniente, oꝛ then they them selues, if it were offered, woulde receiue. Wée maie reuerently saie of them, as Seneca in the like case sommetime saide, Non sunt Domini, sed Duces nostri: *They are our Leaders, but not our Lordes.* They are not the Truthe of God it selfe, but onely witnesses vnto the Truthe.

Seneca.

Therefore S. Augustine saithe, Alios Scriptores ita lego, vt quanta libet Sanctitate, Doctrinaque præpolleant, non ideò verum putem, quòd ipsi ita senserint, sed quòd id mihi, vel per alios Authores Canonicos, vel probabili ratione persuadere potuerint: *Other Writers, or Fathers (*besides the Holy Scriptures*) I reade in this sorte, that be their Learninge, or Holinesse neuer so greate, I wil not thinke it true, bicause they haue thought so, but bicause they are hable to persuade me so, either by other Canonical Writers, or els by somme likely reason.* Likewise againe he saith, Hoc genus Literarum, non cum credendi necessitate, sed cum iudicandi libertate legendum est: *This kinde of Writinges (*of the Holy Doctours, and Fathers*) must be readde, not with necessitie to beleue eche thing, but with libertie to iudge eche thinge.* And to that ende he saithe, Ne Catholicis quidem Episcopis consentiendum est, sicubi fortè falluntur, vt contra Canonicas Dei Scripturas sentiant: *Wee maie not consente vnto the Bishoppes, notwithstandinge they be Catholique, if they iudge contraric to the Holy Canonical Scriptures.* In this authoritie and credite wée haue, and ought to haue the Holy Fathers.

Augustin. Epist. 19 ad Hieronym.

Augustin. contra Faust. Li. 11. ca. 5

Augu. de Vnita. Eccles. Cap. 10.

Nowe let vs sée, whether the Bishoppes, and others in these Councelles, confuted these Heretiques, as wée saie, by the Scriptures: oꝛ els, as M. Hardinge saieth to saie, foꝛ want, oꝛ weakenesse of the Scriptures, vsed therein the Authoritie of the Fathers. Firste, the Emperoure Constantinus in the Councel of Nice, instructinge the Bishoppes there, howe they might beste debate their quarrelles, and ende all strifes, saithe thus vnto them: Euangelicæ & Apostolicæ Literæ, & Veterum Prophetarum Oracula perspicuè nos instituunt, quid oporteat sapere de voluntate, & sensu Dei. Ponentes ergo contentionem, ex diuinitùs inspiratis oraculis quæramus solutionem eorum, quæ proponuntur: *The Euangelistes and Apostles Writinges, and the saieinges of the Olde Prophetes, doo clearely instructe vs, what iudgemente wee ought to haue of the meaninge and wil of God. Therefore laieinge aside al contention, out of those Heauenly Oracles, let vs seeke for the assoilinge of our questions.*

Theod. Li 1. ca 7

Tripart. li. 2. ca. 5 σαφῶς ἡμᾶς ἄρχῃ περὶ τοῦ θείου φρονεῖν ἐκπαιδεύουσι.

Socrates also touchinge the same Councel of Nice, saithe thus of the Arian Heretiques: Explicantes Sacrosanctas Scripturas sæpè illos euertimus: *By openinge, and expoundinge the Holy Scriptures, oftentimes wee ouerthrewe them.*

Socrat. li 1. ca. 6. καὶ ἀναπτύσσαντες τὰς θείας γραφὰς πολλάκις ἀνετρέψαμεν αὐτούς.

Likewise S. Augustine disputinge againste the same Arians, refuseth, as I haue saide before, both Councelles, and Fathers, and appealeth onely to the Scriptures: Nec ego Nicenam Synodum tibi, nec tu mihi Ariminensem debes obijcere: Scripturarum Authoritatibus, res cum re, causa cum causa, ratio cum ratione concertet: *Neither wil I allege the Councel of Nice againste you: nor shal you allege the Councel of Ariminum againste mee. By the Authoritie of the Scriptures, let vs weighe matter with matter: cause with cause: reason with reason.*

Augustin. contra Maxi. li. 3. ca. 14

Touchinge the Councel holden at Constantinople against Macedonius, and the Diuinitie of the Holy Ghoste, Athanasius saithe, Ne interroges, sed solùm ex Sacris Literis condiscas. Sufficiunt, enim Documenta, quæ in illis reperias: *Neuer moone question hereof, but onely learne of the Holy Scriptures. For the onely proufes, that yee shal there finde, are sufficiente (*to warrant the Godhead of the Holy Ghoste.*)* So likewise saithe

Athanas. ad Serapion. Spirit. Sanct. non esse Creaturam.

ſaithe Euagrius of the other two Councelles, of Epheſus, and Chalcedon: Ex Euangelicis, & Apoſtolicis, de Domino vocibus ſcimus, Viros illos Diuinos conſtituiſſe: *We knowe, that theſe Godly Fathers concluded this mater by ſuche woordes, as the the Euangeliſtes, and Apoſtles haue vttered of our Lorde.* Euagrius.

Therefore the Auncient Father Origen ſaithe, Vide quàm propè periculis illi ſint, qui negligunt exerceri in Diuinis Literis: ex quibus Solis examinationis huiuſmodi agnoſcenda diſcretio eſt: *Conſider, in what daunger they be, that haue no care to reade the Holy Scriptures. For by the ſame Scriptures, Onely the iudgemente of this trial muſte be allowed.* Orig. in cap. 16. ad Rom. Lib. 10

Euen ſo ſaithe Chryſoſtome, Etiamſi in ipſis Veris Eccleſijs, quæ Dei ſunt, dixerint, Chriſtum appariuiſſe, nolite eis credere dicentibus iſta de me. Non enim digna eſt Diuinitatis meæ hæc notitia: Oſtendens per hæc, quòd ab ipſis ſæpè Veris Eccleſijs exeunt Seductores. Propterea ne ipſis quidem credendum eſt, niſi ea vel dicant, vel faciant, quæ conuenientia ſint Scripturis: *Yea if they ſaie, that Chriſte hathe appeared in the very True Churches of God, yet beleue them not. For this is no woorthy, or ſufficient knowledge of my Godhead. By this he ſheweth, that out of the very True Churches oftentimes comme forthe Deceiuers. Therefore wee maie not beleue, no not them (* that ſpeake vnto vs in the name of the Churche) *onleſſe they ſpeake, and doo ſuche thinges, as are agreeable to the Scriptures.* Chryſoſt. in Opere imperfecto. Hom. 49.

In like manner againſt ſaithe Origen, Neceſſe nobis eſt in teſtimonium vocare Sanctas Scripturas. Senſus quippe noſtri, & enarrationes ſine ijs teſtibus, non habent Fidem: *Wee muſte needes call to witneſſe the Holy Scriptures: For our iudgementes and expoſitions without thoſe witneſſes, carrie no credite.* Orig. in Hiere. Hom. 1.

And, to leaue al other like authorities, that might be alleged, for ſhorte concluſion, S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Solis Canonicis Scripturis ſine vlla recuſatione conſenſum debeo: *I owe my conſente, without gaineſaieinge (* not vnto the Doctours, or Fathers, but) Onely *vnto the Canonical Scriptures.* Aug. de Natura & Gratia. ca. 61

But the Biſhoppes in thoſe Councelles, ſaithe M. Hardinge, brought forthe, and followed the Expoſitions of the Auncient Learned Fathers. And wherefore might they not? What man euer taught, or ſaide the contrarie? Yet notwithſtanding they alleged them, not as the Fundations, or groundes, but onely as approued, and faithful witneſſes of the Truthe. Whiche thinge if M. Hardinge happily wil denie, maie eaſily appeare, by the woordes of Cyrillus, pronounced and publiſhed openly in the Councel of Chalcedon: Gratulamur nobis mutuò, quòd & noſtræ, & veſtræ Eccleſiæ Fidem habent conſentientem, & diuinitùs adſpiratis Scripturis, & Traditionibus Sanctorum Patrum: *We reioice together, eche of vs in others behalfe, for that the Faithe bothe of our Churches, and alſo of yours, is agreeable bothe vnto the Heauenly inſpired Scriptures, and alſo to the Tradition, and expoſition of our Fathers.* Euagrius. lib. 3. Cap. 18. ταῖς θεοπνεύστοις γραφαῖς. Whiche woordes of Cyrillus beinge hearde, and the conſente of the Fathers beinge knowen, the whole Councel for ioie made a ſhoute togeather, Omnes ita credimus, Papa Leo ita credit, &c. *Thus wee al beleeue: Pope* Leo *thus beleueth: Thus beleueth* Leo, *and* Anatolius: *Thus* Cyrillus *beleueth: This is the Faithe of our Fathers: This is the Faithe of the Apoſtles: Thus haue the Apoſtles taughte.* Concil. Chalcedon. Action. 2.

Thus maie you ſe, M. Hardinge, (wee ſaie not to you, as you do to vs, If you be Learned, for therof wee haue no doubte: God graunte, ye maie dirrete your Learninge to his glorie) but thus maie you ſe, to what ende the Biſhoppes in the Councelles, ye ſpeake of, alleged the Expoſitions of the Ancient Fathers, and howe farre they weighed them vnder the Authorities of the Scriptures. In like ſorte do wee alſo this daie allege againſte you the manifeſt, and vndoubted, and agreeable iudgementes of the moſte Ancient Learned Holy Fathers: and thereby, as by approued, and faithful witneſſes, wee diſcloſe the infinite folies, and errours of your Doctrine. And ſeinge you haue forſaken the felowſhip of the ſaide Holy Fathers, as hereafter, that more fully appeare, wee ſaie, vnto you, as Eudoxius ſaide vnto the Heretique Abbate Eutyches in the Councel of Chalcedon: *Yee haue removed your ſelues, bothe from al Prieſtly Communion, and alſo from the preſence of Chriſte.*

The Apologie, Cap. 9. Diuiſion. 2.

S. Auguſtine, when he diſputed againſte Petilian the Donatian Heretique: De Vnitate Eccle. ca. 3. Et con-

Heretique: Let not theise woordes, quod he, be heard betweene vs: I saie, or, you saie: Lette vs rather speake in this wise: Thus saithe the Lorde. There let vs seeke the Churche: there let vs bould out the cause.

M. Hardinge.

Contra Maximinū Arianorū Epis. Li. 3. Cap. 14.

Concerninge this place of S. Augustine, it ought not to be stretched to al maters in general, that be in question, as though wee might not vse the Testimonies and Authorities of the Fathers against Heretikes: but it perteineth onely to the question in that Booke *De Vnitate Ecclesiæ*, treated of, whiche is, where the Churche is. Petilian the Donatiste, and the mainteiners of that Heresie contended the Churche to be onely in Aphrike, or at the furthest, *in parte Donati*, amonge them onely that holde with Donatus. The same Heresie weute they aboute to proue by Scriptures. But when S. Augustine sawe howe weake their prouses were, whiche they brought out of the Scriptures, he prouoked them, the better to ouerthrowe them, to comme to the trial of the Scriptures. And in deede where the Scriptures be manifest for prouse of any matter, what neede is there of Doctours? But where the sence of the Scriptures is obscure, and male be wrested by euil witted, to the maintenaunce of an Heresie, there the expositions of the Fathers by al Olde VVriters haue benne taken of necessitie, to supplie the Scriptures obscuritie, and to declare the sence of the Churche, whiche the Holy Ghoste hathe prompted. And in suche cases S. Augustine him selfe vseth the Testimonies of the Fathers not seldome, namely against Iulian the Pelagian; VVhere beside Scripture, touching Original sinne, he allegeth againste the Pelagians a greate number of Fathers, and at length in one place speaking of the Authorine, reuerence, and credite he had in them, he saithe thus: *Quod credunt, credo, &c.* VVhat they beleue, I beleue: what they hold, I hold: what they theache, I teache: what they preach, I preache. From the special to the generall negatiuely, the argument holdeth not, ye knowe, if ye haue not forgotten your Logike.

Manifest Vntruthe.

Contra Iulianū Pelagian. Lib.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

M. Hardinge, as wel here, as els where, thinketh it an easie mater, with a bolde Asseueration to snowthe his vnlearned simple Reader, specially suche a one, as hath no eies to loke after him. Theise woordes of S. Augustine, saithe he, perteine onely vnto the mater he had then in hande, and therefore male not be forced to any other. And here he remembreth vs of a profounde point in Logique, that a Negatiue Conclusion from the Special to the Generall, cannot holde. Here it were a mater worthy the hearinge: firste, howe M. Hardinge coulde enter so deepely, so knowe so matche of S. Augustines meaninge: nexte, for as matche as in respecte of him selfe, he euermore confesseth vs to be vnlearned, howe he were able to teache vs to knowe the same. He asserteth vs vpon his woorde, that theise woordes of S. Augustine must needes be bounded, and restrained to that onely mater, and male not in any wise be stretched farther: and this, he imagineth, was S. Augustines meaninge. Thus, good Reader, by M. Hardinges handelinge, thou haste here a meaninge of S. Augustines, that S. Augustine him selfe neuer meante. For S. Augustine in the same mater, and againste the same Heretique Petilian, although not in the same Booke, writeth thus: Siue de Christo, siue de eius Ecclesia, siue de quacunque re alia, quæ pertinet ad Fidem, vitamq; nostram nomicam, Si Nos, Sed, si Angelus de Cœlo nobis annunciauerit, præterquam quod in Scripturis Legalibus, & Euangelicis accepistis, Anathema sit: *Whether it be of Christe, or of his Churche, or of any thinge els what so euer, perteininge either to our life, or to our Faithe, I wil not saie, If I mee selfe, but if an Angel from Heauen shal teache vs otherwise, then wee haue receiued in the Bookes of the Lawe, and in the Gospelles, holde him accursed.*

Augusti. contra Liter. Petilian. Lib. 3. Cap. 6.

Galat. 1.

M. Hardinge saithe, S. Augustine meante onely of one mater: S. Augustine him selfe saithe, he meante of al manner maters, touchinge either faithe, or Life.

M. Hardinge saithe, S. Augustine meante this onely of him selfe: S. Augustine him selfe saithe, he meante it of any other, yea euen of the Angelles of God. And shal wee thinke, M. Hardinge knoweth S. Augustines meaninge, and S. Augustine him selfe knewe it not?

De quacunque re. Si Angelus de Cœlo.

Verily S. Augustine in an other case concerninge the Arians, as I haue touched twise before, likewise refuseth the Determinations of al Counceles, and Fathers, and standeth onely to the Scriptures: Neither wil I, saithe he, allege againste thee, the Counce of Nice: nor shalt thou allege against me, the Counce of Ariminum, &c.

Augusti. contra Maxi. li. 3 ca. 14

Neither doothe S. Augustine onely saie thus, but also yeldeth a reason, why he

saithe

Scriptures and Doctours.

saithe it. These be his wordes: Auferantur de medio, quæ aduersus nos inuicem, non ex Diuinis Canonicis Libris, sed aliundè recitamus. Quæret fortasse aliquis, Cur vis ista auferri de medio? Quia nolo humanis Documentis, sed Diuinis Oraculis Ecclesiam Sanctam demonstrari: *Haue awaie al those Authorities, that either of vs alleageth against the other, sauinge suche onely, as be taken out of the Heauenly Canonical Scriptures. But perhaps somme man wil aske me, Wherefore woulde yee haue al suche other Authorities put awaie? I answeare, Bicause I would haue the Holy Churche to be proued, not by the Doctrine of meane, but by the Woorde of God.*

Aug. De vera. Eccle. cõtra Petilian. Cap. 3.

So saithe S. Augustine vnto other the Donatistes: Auferantur de medio Chartæ nostræ: procedat in medium Codex Dei. Audi Christum dicentem: audi Veritatem loquentem: *Take awaie from emonest vs any our owne Bookes: Let the Booke of God come emonest vs. Heare what Christe saithe: Herken, what the Truthe speaketh.* Againe he saithe, Audi, dicit Dominus: Non, dicit Donatus, aut Rogatus, aut Vincentius, aut Hilarius, aut Ambrosius, aut Augustinus: sed, dicit Dominus: *Heare this: The Lorde saithe. Heare not this,* Donatus *saithe,* Rogatus *saithe,* Vincentius *saithe,* Hilarius *saithe,* Ambrose *saithe,* Augustine *saithe: But herken to this, The Lorde saithe.*

Aug. in Psa. 57.

Aug. in Epi. 48

In like fourme of wordes saithe S. Ambrose: Nolo nobis credatur: Scriptura recitetur. Non ego dico à me, In principio erat Verbum, sed audio. Non ego effingo sed lego: *I would not, yee should beleeue vs: But reade the Scriptures: I saie not of mee selfe, In the beginninge was the Woorde: But I heare it. I make it not: but I reade it.*

Ambros. De Incarnat. Domin. Sacramen. ca. 3.

Likewise saithe Chrysostome, Oro vos omnes, vt relinquatis, quid huic, aut illi videatur: & de his à Scripturis hæc omnia inquirite: *I beseeche you al, weighe not, what this man, or that man thinketh: but touchinge al these thinges searche the Scriptures.*

Chrysost. in 2. ad Corinth. Hom. 3.

Nowe, where as it pleaseth M. Hardinge, to telle vs of an Argumente Negatiue from Special to General, and so to cal vs to the remembrance of our Logique: pleaseth it him also to remember, that the Argument, that wee grounde of S. Augustines wordes, holdeth not, as it is here imagined, from Special to General: but from the imperfection, and weakenesse of the wisedome of man, to the stabilitie, and certainetie of Goddes Holy Woorde. And therefore the Olde Learned Father Origen saithe, as it is alleged before, Sensus nostri, & Enarrationes sine his testibus non habent fidem: *Our iudgementes, and Expositions without these witnesses* (of the Scriptures) *haue no credite.* In like sorte S. Hierome, Quamuis Sanctus sit aliquis post Apostolos, quamuis disertus sit, non habet Authoritatem: *After the Apostles of Christe, notwithstandinge somme man be Holy, notwithstandinge he be eloquente, yet he wanteth Authoritie.* Therefore S. Augustine saithe, Cedamus, & consentiamus Scripturæ Sacræ, quæ nec falli potest, nec fallere: *Let vs yeelde, and consente to the Holy Scripture, whiche can neither deceiue, nor be deceiued.* For this cause, M. Hardinge, S. Augustine not onely in the mater that late bitwæne him and Petilianus, but also in al other maters what so euer, so often appeled from al Fathers, and Councelles vnto the Scriptures.

Origen. In Hieremi. Homil. 1. Hiero. in Psa. 86

August. De Peccator. Merit. & Remiss. li. 1. ca. 22

The Apologie, Cap. 9. Diuision. 3.

Likewise S. Hierome: Al those thinges (saithe he) whiche without the Testimonie of the Scriptures, are holden, as deliuered from the Apostles, be throughly smitten downe by the Swerde of Goddes Woorde.

M. Hardinge.

Yee would faine remoue vs from a good holde, I see wel, whiche is the Authoritie of the Holy Fathers, of Ancient Traditions, and of the Vniuersal Churche. Al these would yee to be of no force against Heretiques. For ye know the Fathers and the Churche to be against you, and that so longe as they are beleued, your Doctrine shal not be receiued, as alwaies founde to be newe, and of priuate deuise. If we were driuen from these, ye doubt not, but to matche vs wel yenough in the Scriptures. And as ye would handle the mater, I thinke so my selfe verely. For when al Authoritie and iudgemente of the Fathers and of the Churche, is shaken quite of in any controuersie, by whome shal wee be tried? By the Scriptures ye saie. But when bothe ye and wee alleage Scriptures to a contrary purpose, and when we vary aboute the sense of the Scriptures, by whome then shal we be iudged? Perhaps ye wil referre the iudgement of doubtful maters, to the Holy Ghoste. VVee refuse not tharbitre-

ment and Vmpiestship of the Holy Ghoste. For the same hath bene promised by Christe to the Churche, to remaine with the Churche for euer, to teache what thinges so euer he saide, to leade men into al Truthe.

And thus for iudgements and trial of Truthe, wee shalbe retourned to the Churche and to the Fathers, by whome the Holy Ghoste speaketh vnto vs, whose Authoritie and due estimation ye goe aboute to remoue from vs.

But let vs see, what force ye bringe to driue vs from this holde. Makinge your batterie against it, what shoote ye of, but VVinde and Paper? Your Artillerie maketh a noyes, but it geueth no blowe. As in the laste allegation ye falsified the sence of S. Augustine, so in this ye falsifie bothe the sence and woordes of S. Hierome. The woordes, as ye allege them, seeme to be spoken againste what so euer Traditions of the Apostles. VVhiche woordes, or any the like to suche pourpose, were neuer vttered by any Catholike Doctour of the Churche, much lesse by S. Hierome. Looke ye againe and vewe better the place, ye shal saie your selues, that I finde the faulte of falsifynge in you not without cause.

S. Hierome in his Commentaries vpon those woordes of the Prophete Aggæus, *Et vocaui siccitatem super terram, & super Montes:* I haue called the drought to come vpon the Earthe, and vpon the Hilles, &c. Firste, shewinge the literal sense accordingly as the Hebrewe woorde there by him noted, signifieth *Siccitatem*, drought, then treatinge Mystically, as the seuenty Interpreters haue turned that woorde into Romphæam, that is a Swerde, and vnderstandinge by the Swerde, the VVoorde of God: thereof taketh occasion briefly to saie, what this swerde doothe, how it destroieth the negligent Soule, whiche is expounded to be drie earthe, and howe it plagueth Mountaines that liste vp them selues againste the knowledge of God, whereby he meaneth Heretikes. Of whome he telleth, how they flatter the deceiued people with theire Breade, VVine, and Oile, (by whiche he meaneth their Heresies) as it were with meates, and drinkes, and refection. Aggæus. Gladius.

Their Breade (saithe he) any man maie very aptly cal it, the Breade of VVaylinge, and theire VVine, the madnesse of Dragons, and the madnesse of Serpentes incurable: And theire Oile, the promisinge of Heauenly thinges, wherewith they doo as it were anointe theire Disciples, and promise them rewardes of theire labours: whiche the Prophete detesteth sayinge, the Oile of the sinner shal not anointe my head. After this folowe the woordes of S. Hierome, whiche ye haue falsified to the intent they might seeme to serue your false meaninge. *Sed & alia quæ absq; Authoritate & Testimoniis Scripturarum, quasi Traditione Apostolica reperiunt, atque confingunt, percutit Gladius Dei.* But the Swerde of God striketh also other thinges, whiche the Heretiques (for of them he speaketh) deuise and faine of their owne heades, without the Authoritie and witnesses of the Scriptures, as though they came by Tradition from the Apostles. He that compareth this place with your falsified allegation, maie soone espie greate oddes betwene them. For ye make S. Hierome to saie, that al those thinges, whiche without the Testimonies of Scriptures are holden (so your allowed interpreter tourneth, *Asseruntur,*) as deliuered from the Apostles, be throughly smitten downe by the Swerde of Goddes VVoorde. By this Swerde of your Goddes VVoorde, yet woulde quite smite downe al Apostolike Traditions at a blowe. But thanked be God, that your Swerde is a forged Swerde, a paper Swerde, a Swerde that neither with Edge cutteth, nor with weight beareth downe. S. Hierome putteth not al thinges, whiche we haue by Tradition from the Apostles without the expresse Scriptures, to the Swerde of Goddes VVoorde. He speaketh not Generally. His woorde is, *Alia*, other thinges: and ye make it, *Omnia*, al thinges. Againe he speaketh of suche thinges as be deuised and fained by Heretikes, of their owne braine, without Authoritie and Testimonies of the Scriptures: vnto whiche they geue Estimation, as though they came by Tradition from the Apostles. These circumstances and exaggerations doo ye omitte, and saie, that S. Hierome putteth al Apostolike Traditions to that dreadful Swerde of Goddes VVoorde. Nowe what S. Hierome saithe, wee holde with it, and allowe it wel. But your saieinge we refuse, as falsely fathered vpon S. Hierome. VVhat he condemneth, we condemne. Neither can that place be iustely alleaged against vs: For we inuente not, ne faine not any thinges of our owne accorde, or of our owne heades, as though they were deliuered by the Apostles besides the Scriptures: that is the parte of Heretikes, specially of the Tatians, as in that place S. Hierome saithe. VVe finde, deuise, and faine nothinge in the Catholike Religion. VVee doo but keepe and mainteine thinges Deuised by the Holy Ghoste, and leafte to the Churche by the Apostles, or by Apostolike menne, or by the General Councelles, whose Authoritie is in the Churche most healthful, saithe S. Augustine. But concerninge the force whiche the consent of the Fathers had in the iudgement of S. Hierome, it appeareth in his Epistle to Euagrius: where, by the Authoritie of the Auncient Doctours before his time, he proueth against an Heretike, that Melchisedech was a man of the Lande of Chanaan, and not the Holy Ghoste.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Faine woulde M. Hardinge haue vs Reader beléeue, that wée vtterly despise al Holy Fathers. But wée despise them not, M. Hardinge, as maie partely appeare, by that wée haue alreadie saide. Wée reade theire woorkes: wée reuerence them: wée geue God thankes for them: wée calle them the Pillers, the Lightes, the Fathers of Goddes Churche: wée despise them not. This thinge onely we saie: Were theire Learninge, and Holinesse neuer so greate, yet be they not equal in credite

credite with the Scriptures of God.

Thus also saithe S. Augustine, Nos nullam Cypriano facimus iniuriam, cùm eius quaslibet literas, à Canonica Diuinarum Scripturarum Authoritate distinguimus: *We offer no wronge to* S. Cyprian, *when wee seuer any his Letters, or Writinges, from the Canonical Authoritie of the Holy Scriptures.* And againe, ioininge al the Doctours, and Fathers togeather, he saithe thus: Ipse mihi pro his omnibus, imò supra hos omnes Apostolus Paulus occurrit. Ad ipsum confugio: ad ipsum ab omnibus, qui aliter sentiunt, literarum tractatoribus prouoco: *In steede of al these Learned Fathers, or rather aboue them al,* Paule *the Apostle commeth to my minde. To him I renne: To him I appeale from al manner Writers* (Doctours, and Fathers) *that thinke otherwise.*

August. contra Cresconi. Gram. Lib. 2. Cap. 32.

August. ad Hieron. Epist. 19.

So likewise S. Hierome, Ego Origenem propter eruditionem sic interdum legendum arbitror, quomodo Tertullianum, Nouatum, Arnobium, Apollinarium, & nonnullos Ecclesiasticos Scriptores Græcos pariter, & Latinos: vt bona eorum eligamus, vitemúsque contraria: *I thinke, that the Auncient Father* Origen, *in respecte of his Learninge, maie be readde sometimes, as* Tertullian, Nouatus, Arnobius, Apollinarius, *and sundrie other Ecclesiastical Writers, as wel Greekes, as Latines, that in them wee maie take the good, and flee the contrarie.* Of this iudgemente were S. Augustine, S. Hierome, and sundrie others: whose woordes for shortnesse I passe ouer: yet were they not therefore condemned, as despisers of the Holy Learned Fathers. Wel remoue you not, as you saie, from your holde, M. Hardinge. This is nothinge els, but a courtage of your countenaunce. The Fathers, ye speake of, are againste you. I truste, it appeareth already by your former writinges, that in the Special cases, that lie betwéene vs, ye haue but fewe Fathers to holde by.

Hiero. ad Tranquillium. To. 2.

Ye saie, Wee euermore cal you to the Scriptures. This faulte, I hope, is not so hainous. Christe hath commaunded vs so to do: *Searche ye,* saithe Christe, *the Scriptures.* And S. Hilarie saithe vnto the Emperoure Constantius, Fidem, Imperator, quæris? Audi eam, non de nouis chartulis, sed de Dei Libris: *Doethe your Maiestie seeke the Faithe? Heare it then, not out of any newe scrolles, but out of the Bookes of God.* Ye is rather to be suspected, that fleeth the light, and wil not be iudged by the Scriptures.

Iohan. 5.

Hilarius ad Imper. Constantium

When the Scriptures be darke, and doubtful, and are alleged of bothe partes, then ye saie, ye refuse not the Umpercship, and iudgemente of the Holy Ghoste. But ye adde farther, The Holy Ghost is promised onely to the Churche. Nowe by your opinion there is no Churche, but the Churche of Rome. And the Churche of Rome is no Churche without the Pope: For one of your greate Doctours saithe, Potestas Papæ solius excedit potestatem totius residuæ Ecclesiæ: *The Popes onely power passeth al the power of the whole Churche besides:* And an other like Doctour saithe, Papa virtualiter est tota Ecclesia: *The Pope by power, and vertue is the whole Churche:* And thus your reason goeth rounde aboute, à Primo ad vltimum: Ergo, There is neither Holy Ghoste, nor Interpretation, or sense of the Scriptures, but onely in the Pope. This is, Summa Summarum: whiche thinge beinge graunted, what shoulde a man saie any farther? The whole mater is at an ende.

Petrus De Palude. De potestate Papæ. Art. 4. Hermæus de potest. Papæ. His præmissis.

It is true, As the Scriptures were written by the Spirite of God, so muste they be expounded by the same. For without that Spirite, wee haue neither eares to heare, nor eies to see. It is that Spirite, that openeth, and noman shutteth: the same shutteth, & noman openeth: The same Spirite prepared and opened the Silke woomans harte, that shee should geue care to, and consider the thinges, that were spoken by S. Paule. And in respecte of this Spirite, the Prophete Esai saith, Erunt omnes docti à Deo: *They shalbe al taught of God.*

2. Petri. 1. Matth. 11. Apoc. 3. Actor. 16.

Iohan. 6.

But God hath not bounde him selfe, that this Spirite should euermore dwel in Rome: but vpon the lowly, & humble hartes, that trembleth at the Woorde of God. Chrysostome saithe: Qui propria loquuntur, falso prætendunt Spiritum Sanctum: *They that speake of them selues, falsely pretende the Holy Ghoste.* And againe, Si quid præter Euangelium sub titulo Spiritus obtrudatur, ne credamus. Quia sicut Christus Legis, & Prophetarum impletio est, ita est Spiritus Euangelij: *If any thinge be brought vnto vs vnder the name of the Holy Ghost, besides the Gospel, let vs not beleue it. For as Christe is the*

Esai. 66.

Chrysostom. De Sancto & Adorando Spiritu.

Interpretation of the Scriptures.

is the fulfillinge of the Lawe and the Prophetes: so is the Holy Ghoste the fulfillinge of the Gospel.

Nowe, with what spirite the Bishoppes of Rome haue expounded vnto vs the Holy Scriptures of God, we shal shewe it hereafter, as fitter occasion shal require. Here, you saie, we haue corrupted bothe the wordes, and the sence of S. Hierome: That we haue taken, Omnia, in stede of, Alia: And that you haue diuised, and made nothinge of your selues: that S. Hierome meante not hereby the Traditions of the Apostles, but onely the fonde fantasies, and dreames of the Heretiques called Tatians.

Of al these thinges, we muste nedes confesse, one thinge is true. In dede we toke, Omnia, in stede of, Alia: and so by ouersight gaue somme occasion vnto the quareler. Howe be it, I doubt not, but the indifferent gentle Reader wil some pardonne that faulte. It proceded onely of negligence, and not of malice. Notwithstandinge this wante maie easily be supplied by a sufficient Commentarie. For Christe saithe, Omnis plantatio, quam non plantauerit Pater meus Cœlestis, eradicabitur. *Euery plante, that my heauenly Father hath not planted, shalbe rooted out.* Here, M. Hardinge, ye maie borrowe, Omnia, to healpe S. Hierome.

Matth. 15. Omnis.

Or, if this like you not, S. Cyprian maie telle you, Adulterum est, Impium est, Sacrilegum est, quodcunque humano furore instituitur, vt Dispositio Diuina violetur: *It is aduouterous, it is wicked, it is abominable, what so euer is ordered by the rashnesse of man, that Goddes order shoulde be broken.*

Cyprian. Lib. 1. Epist. 8. Quodcunq.

It is true, S. Hierome speaketh not these wordes of the Traditions of the Apostles: It is true. Yet, M. Hardinge, he speaketh these wordes of suche fantasies, as were brought into the Churche of God, and magnified vnder the name and colour of the Traditions of the Apostles. So Eusebius saithe, The Heretique Cerinthus brought vs in his owne Monstruous Diuises, vnder the pretence of Reuelations, as written by some greate Apostle.

Euseb. li. 3. ca. 28 δι ἀποκαλύψεων, ὡς ὑπὸ Ἀποστόλου γεγραμμένων.

Suche, M. Hardinge, be your Inuentions, wherewith ye haue of longe time deceiued the worlde. One of your companions the Suffragane of Sidon, at the late dicte at Augusta, in the presence of the whole Empiere, doubted not to saie, that your whole Canon worde by worde, euen as it is nowe vsed in your Masses, came directly from the Apostles. Your Hosius of Polonia saithe, that the Apostles appointed your orders of Monkes. An other of your side saithe, Christus Dux, & Signifer Vitæ Monasticæ: *Christe was the Captaine, and Standerd bearer of Monkes life:* Imagininge, I trowe, that Christe was an Abbate. And yet afterwarde the same Doctour, either by some oblision, or els vpon somme better remembrance, saithe thus: Elias, & Elizæus Duces Instituti Benedictini: Elias, *and* Elizæus *were the firste Captaines of S. Benettes Order.* And you, M. Hardinge, haue tolde vs often, that ye haue your Priuate Masse, your halfe Communion, and I know not what els al from the Apostles. And al this ye prowe, God wote, by ful simple conjectures, bicause Christe saithe to his Apostles, *I haue many thinges to saie vnto you: but yee are not hable to beare them yet:* And bicause S. Paule saithe to the Corinthians, *I wil order the reste, when I comme.* Hereby ye beare vs in hande, that al your moste trifling Vanities were brought vnto you by S. Paule euen from the thirde Heauens.

Illyricus de sect. Pag. 89. In Confe. Petricouien. De Ceremonijs. Pag. 289 Copus Angl. Dial. 2. Pag. 194 Copus Angl. Dial. 2. Pag. 284 Iohan. 16. 1. Cor. 11.

And although it were true, that ye saie, ye haue not diuised these thinges of your selues, but haue receiued them al from the Apostles, and Holy Fathers, which thinge your conscience knoweth to be moste vntrue, yet notwithstanding the same thinges so receiued, ye haue sithence foully defaced with sundrie your superstitions. Ye haue made them necessarie to Saluation: ye haue bounde the people to them no lesse then to the Lawe of God: and so haue ye made them snares of Christian consciences. Although the thinge it selfe came from the Fathers, yet the abuse thereof came from your selues: and for the same ye haue taught the people to breake Goddes expresse commaundement. Thus haue you blended Goddes heauenly wine with your puddle water: Thus haue ye strained gnattes, and swalowed Camelles. This is the very Leauen of the Scribes, and Phariseis, whiche Christe calleth Hypocrisie. Therefore al be it the thinge it selfe, ye haue thus receiued, in respecte of substance

Esai. 1. Matth. 3. Matth. 16.

ſtance be al one: yet now, beinge thus abuſed, in reſpecte of your Superſtitions, and deſyrmities, it is not one.

The Apoſtles, and Holy Fathers, vſed Oile: yet they vſed it not, as ye do, for the Saluation of Body and Soule.

Moſes erected vp the Brazen Serpent in the wildernesſe: Yet not to be adoured with Godly honoure, as it folowed afterwarde. Num. 21. Iohan. 5.

God commaunded the people to faſte: yet not with Hypocriſie, as the wicked faſted. And therefore God ſaithe vnto them, Non eſt hoc Ieiunium, quod ego elegi: *This is not the faſtinge, that I haue choſen.* Ioel. cap. 2. Eſai. c.

God commaunded the people to kepe the Calendes, and Newe Moones: Yet not with ſutche Superſtition, and Abuſes, as the people kepte them. And therefore God ſaide vnto them, *Who required theſe thinges at your handes?* Eſai. 1.

God commaunded ſundrie Bathinges, and Waſhinges: yet vnto them, that moſte preciſely vſed the ſame, Chriſte ſaide: *Woe be vnto you yee Scribes, and Phariſies: in vaine they worſhip mee, teachinge the Commaundementes and Doctrines of menne.* Matth. 23.

Yet you, M. Harding, haue inkeſted the Apoſtles of Chriſte, not onely with the ſubſtance of the thinges, whiche, ye ſaie, ye haue receiued by Tradition, but alſo with al your Abuſes, Superſtitions, Corruptions, & Idolatries: whiche ye haue diuiſed of your ſelues. And therein ye wel reſemble the Tatian Heretiques, of whome onely, ye ſaie, S. Hierome ſpeaketh. But whether S. Hierome meante onely, I know not what fantaſtical dreames of the Tatians, (as you imagine onely of your ſelfe, without proufe, in particulare naminge nothinge) or els alſo al ſutch Superſtitious Vanities, as we haue often, & iuſtly reproued in you, it maie ſone appeare by theſe wordes immediately folowinge: Omnem laborem manuum, & Ieiunia eorum, & obſeruationes varias, & χαμευνίας, id eſt, humi dormitiones: *Al theire handa Labour, and their Faſtinges, and theire Obſeruations, and Vſages, and harde Sleepinge on the grounde.* Theſe and ſutche other like be the thinges, whiche, menne imagine, came from the Apoſtles, and are ſtriken and conſumed with the Swerde of Goddes Worde. Hieronym. In Aggæ. Cap. 1.

This, M. Hardinge, notwithſtandinge your longe Gloſe biſide the Texte, ſeemeth to be the very meaninge of S. Hierome.

If ye wil yet force the contrarie, and turne al from your ſelues to the Tatians, as you do, the very two lines nexte folowing muſt nedes make you bluſhe at your owne errour. The wordes are theſe, Hæc autem vniuerſa, quæ dixi, poſſunt de Eccleſiæ Rectoribus intelligi: *Al theſe thinges, that I haue ſpoken, maie be vnderſtanded of the Rulers of the Churche.* Tel vs nowe therefore, M. Hardinge, of your Tatians. For S. Hierome him ſelfe telleth you, he meante not onely them, but alſo the Biſhoppes, and Rulers of the Churche. And a litle before he ſaithe, Infertur Gladius ſuper Montes eleuantes ſe aduerſus ſcientiam Dei: *The Swerde of Godde Woorde is laide vpon the Mountaines, that lifte them ſelues vp againſte the knowledge of God.*

In this ſenſe writeth S. Cyprian: Si ad Diuinæ Traditionis Caput, & Originem reuertamur, ceſſat omnis error humanus: *If wee returne to the Heade, and beginninge of our Lordes Tradition, al errour of Man muſte needes geue place.* Cyprian. Ad Pompeium.

In like ſenſe alſo writeth Tertullian: Ipſa Doctrina Hæreticorum cum Apoſtolica comparata, ex diuerſitate, & contrarietate ſua pronuntiabit, neque Apoſtoli alicuius Authoris eſſe, neque Apoſtolici: *The very Doctrine of Heretiques compared with the Apoſtles Doctrine, by the diuerſitie and contrarietie, that is betwene that, and the other, will ſome pronounce ſentence of it ſelfe, that neither Apoſtle, nor Apoſtolique man was authour of it.* Tertul. de Præſcript. Hære.

Euen thus it fareth, M. Hardinge, with a greate heape of your Doctrine. We ſaie, we haue it by Tradition from the Apoſtles. Yet is it vtterly voide of al authoritie, or teſtimonie of the Scriptures. And therefore, as S. Hierome ſaithe, it is conſumed and ſtriken downe in the Conſcience of the Godly, by the onely Swerde of Goddes Holy Worde, as our eies ſe this daie: and beinge compared with the Apoſtles Doctrine (the difference, and contrarietie is ſo greate) it eaſily bewraieth it ſelfe, as Tertullian ſaithe, that it neuer came from any Apoſtle, nor from any other Apoſtolique Doctour of the Churche.

The

The Apologie, Cap. 9. Diuision 4.

S. Ambrose also to Gratian the Emperour: Let the Scripture (saithe he) be asked the question, let the Prophetes be asked, and let Christe be asked. For at that time made the Catholique Fathers and Bishoppes no doubte, but that our Religion mighte be prooued out of the Holy Scriptures. Neither were they euer so hardie to take any for an Heretique, whose errour they coulde not euidently and apparantly reprooue by the selfe same Scriptures. And wee verily doo make answeare on this wise, as S. Paule did: Accordinge to this waie whiche they calle Heresie, wee doo woorship God, and the Father of our Lorde Jesus Christe: and doo allowe al thinges whiche haue benne written either in the Lawe, or in the Prophetes, or in the Apostles woorkes.

M. Hardinge.

Gratian the Emperoure bucklinge him selfe as it were to encounter with the Heretikes, at the firste he geueth warninge to al to beware of him, for that he endeuoureth to prooue his false Doctrine, (namely for the firste pointe, that the Sonne is vnlike the Father) *Versutis disputationibus*, VVith suttel and craftie reasoninges. He allegeth to that purpose S. Paule to the Collosians, Cap. 2. *Cauete ne quis vos depraedetur per Philosophiam:* Beware that no man spoile you through Philosophie, and vaine deceite, &c. For (saithe he) these Heretikes put al the force of their poisons in Logike, or Dialectical disputation, which by the opinion of Philosophers is defined, not to haue power to prooue, but an earnest desire to destroie and disprooue. Hauinge geuen this holesome warninge, Ambros. De Fid. li. 1. Cap. 4. lest him selfe might seeme to vse that, whiche he counselleth others to beware of: to withdrawe the Emperoure and other from the guileful Logike of Arius, at his firste entrie he saithe: I wil not, that thou geue credite, Holy Emperoure, to argumente, and to our disputation, (then folow the woordes, whereof the Defenders take holde,) *Scripturas interrogemus, &c.* Let vs aske the Scriptures, let vs aske the Apostles, let vs aske the Prophetes, let vs aske Christe. VVhat neede many woordes? let vs aske the Father, &c.

And to this pointe of our beleefe, whiche is very highe and secrete, is that sayinge of S. Ambrose to be strained. But that for confirmation of the Truthe in pointes whiche be nearer to common sence, and for confutation of those Heresies whiche be of lesse subtelte, of whiche sorte, these Gospellers grosse errours be, to this ende, that we ought not to vse the Testimonies of the Holy Fathers
Vntruthe. againste Heretikes, (for whiche purpose they alleage this place:) S. Ambrose neither in al that Booke, neither in al his woorkes speaketh so muche as one woorde.

But contrariwise in sundry places of that woorke, he allegeth the auctoritie of the Nicene Councel, as a Testimonie of good force againste the Arians, and declareth a diuine Mysterie to haue benne signified by suche special number of the Fathers there assembled: Saieinge *Sic nempe nostri secundum Scripturas dixerunt Patres:* Euen thus, accordinge to the Scriptures, haue the Fathers saide. *Seruemus Praecepta maiorum, &c.* Let vs keepe the Precepses of our Forefathers, neither with Temeritie of rude boldnes let vs breake the Hereditarie Seales, (he meaneth the Doctrine sealed by the Fathers, and left to the posteritie as it were by Heritage). VVhiche of *vs* wil be so hardy, as to vnseale the Priestly Booke, sealed by the Confessours, and nowe consecrated with the Martyrdome of many
*Nothinge. a one? Lo heare ye not Sirs * howe muche S. Ambrose is against you?

And though he saie, touchinge this Mysterie, Let vs aske the Scriptures, Apostles, Prophetes, and Christe: yet thereby dothe he not quite exclude the Fathers. He saithe not, let vs reiecte the Fathers. The Scriptures and the Fathers be not contrarie: and therefore th'allowinge of them, is not the dis-
*Vntruthe. allowinge of these. VVho so euer maketh this argumente, * whiche in your woorde is implied, The Scriptures are to be asked, Ergo, the Holy Fathers are not to be asked, maketh a foolishe argumeat.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

The greatest force hereof is answeared alreadie. S. Ambrose, yée saie, by this appeale to the Scriptures, excludeth not the iudgement of the Learned Fathers, but onely the cauillations, subtleties of Philosophers & Sophisters. For S. Ambrose him selfe in the same treatie often allegeth the Authorities of the Fathers. All this, M. Hardinge, is true in deede: Notwithstandinge there is a certaine secrete Untruthe lapped in it. For S. Ambrose allegeth the Fathers, not as Groundes, or Principles, or Fundations of the Faithe: but onely as Interpreters, or Witnesses, or Consenters vnto the Faithe: Whiche thinge of our parte was neuer denied. Now, whether S. Ambrose meante thus, or no, let S. Ambrose him selfe be y Iudge.

This

Scriptures and Doctours.

His wordes be these, Sic nempe nostri secundum Scripturas dixerunt Patres: *Thus haue our Fathers saide* (**not of them selues, but**) *according to the Scriptures*. **He alleggeth the Fathers, not as hauinge sufficient credite and substance in them selues, but onely as Expounders, and Interpreters of the Scriptures.**

So saithe the godly Father Athanasius: Nos ista hausimus à Magistris diuinitùs afflatis, qui Sacros Libros euoluerunt: *These thinges haue wee learned of our Maisters* (**or Fathers**) *inspired from Heauen, whiche haue read and perused the Holy Scriptures*. **For** S. Augustine **very wel saithe**, Secundum hos Libros de cæteris Literis, vel Fidelium, vel Infidelium liberè iudicamus: *Accordinge to those Bookes of the Scriptures, wee iudge frankely of al other writinges, whether they be of the Faithful, or of the Unfaithful*. **Therefore** S. Hierome **saithe**, Omni studio legendæ nobis sunt Scripturæ, & in Lege Domini meditandum die ac nocte: vt probati trapezitæ sciamus, quis numus probus sit, quis adulterinus: *Wee muste Reade the Scriptures with al diligence, and muste bee occupied in the Lawe of our Lorde bothe daie and nighte: that wee maie become perfite exchangers, and be hable rightly to discerne, what monie is lawful, and what is counterfaite*. S. Hilarie **saithe**, Hoc proprium est Apostolicæ Doctrinæ, Deum ex Lege, ac Prophetis in Euangelijs prædicare: *This is the very order of the Apostles Doctrine, in the Gospel to Preache God out of the Lawe and the Prophetes*.

Ambr. ad Gratia. De Fide, li. 1.

Athanas. De Humanitate Verbi.

August. Contra Cresconi. Grammat. Li. 2. Ca. 39.

Hieronym. in Epistol. ad Ephes. Lib. 3. Cap. 5.

Hilari. in Psal. 65.

Otherwise, touchinge the discourse of natural reason, S. Ambrose **saithe**, **No Creature either in Earthe, or in Heauen, is hable to reache the deapthe of these thinges. Thus he saithe**, Mens deficit: Vox silet, non mea tantùm, sed Angelorum. Supra potestates, supra Angelos, supra Cherubim, supra Seraphim, supra omnem sensum est: *The minde is astonned: the voice faileth, not onely mine, but also of the Angelles. It is aboue the powers, aboue the Angelles, aboue the Cherubins, aboue the Seraphins, and aboue al maner vnderstandinge*. **And therefore he saithe**, as it is alleged once before, Nolo nobis credatur: Scriptura recitetur: Non ego dico à me, In principio erat Verbum, Sed audio: *I woulde not, yee shoulde beleeue mee: Lette the Scriptures be readde: I saie not of mee selfe*, In the beginninge was the VVoorde: *but I heare it spoken*. **And againe he saithe in the same Booke, vnto the Emperoure** Gratian: Faceßat nostra Sententia: Paulum interrogemus: *Let our Iudgemente stande aparte: and let vs aske S. Paule the question*. **But M. Hardinge saithe**, VVho so euer maketh this argumente, whiche in your VVoorde is implied, The Scriptures are to be asked. *Ergo*, the Holy Fathers are not to be asked, maketh a foolishe argumente.

Ambro. ad Gratianum de Fide. Lib. 1. Cap. 5.

Ambros. De Incarnationis Dominicæ Sacramen. Ca. 3.

Ambr. ad Gratian. Imperator. Lib. 1. Cap. 7.

It seemeth no greate pointe of Wisedome, M. Hardinge, to vpbraide others with folie without cause: God encrease bothe you and vs in al wisedome, and vnderstandinge in Christe Iesu. Howe be it, our Argumente, howe so euer it hath pleased you to fashion, and to handle it, as we meante it, and made it, had no suche Folie. Wherefore, what so euer Folie is nowe come to it, it is your owne: it is not ours. For wee denie not the Learned Fathers expositions, and iudgementes in doubtefol cases of the Scriptures. Wee reade them our selues: Wee folow them: Wee embrace them: and, as I saide before, wee moste humbly thanke God for them. But thus wee saie, The same Fathers opinions, and iudgementes, for as mutche as they are sometimes disagreable one from an other, and sometimes implie contrarieties, and contradictions, therefore alone, and of them selues, without farther authoritie, and guidinge of Goddes Worde, are not alwaies sufficient Warrantes to charge our Faithe. And thus the Learned Catholique Fathers them selues haue euermore taught vs to esteeme, and to weighe the Fathers.

Orig. in Epist. ad Rom. li. 10. ca. 16

The Ancient Father Origen **saithe thus, as it is reported before**: Ex Solis Scripturis examinationis nostræ discretio petenda est: *The discussinge of our Iudgemente, muste be taken* Onely *of the Scriptures*. **And againe**, Sensus nostri, & enarrationes sine Scripturis testibus non habent fidem: *Our Iudgementes, and Expositions without witnesse of the Scriptures haue no credite*. **Likewise** S. Augustine, Ego Solis Canonicis Scripturis debeo sine vlla recusatione consensum: *My consent without exception I owe* (**not vnto any Father, were he neuer so wel learned, but**) Onely *to the Holy Canonical Scriptures*.

Ex Solis. Origen. in Hieremi. Homil. 1.

August. De Natura & Gratia Ca. 61.

Augustin. in Iohan. Tract. 96.

His reason is this: Nam cùm Dominus tacuerit, quis nostrum dicat, Illa, vel illa sunt? Aut si dicere audet, vnde probat? *For where as the Lorde him selfe hath not spoken, who of vs can saie, It is this, or that? Or if he dare saie so, howe can he proue it?*

August. De Pastorib. Ca. 14.

And therefore he concludeth directly and in like wordes with S. Ambrose: Ego vocem Pastoris inquiro. Lege hoc mihi de Propheta: Lege de Psalmo: Recita de Lege: Recita de Euangelio: Recita de Apostolo: *I require the voice of the Shepheарde: Reade me this mater out of the Prophete: Reade it mee out of the Psalmes: Reade it out of the Lawe: Reade it out of the Gospel: Reade it out of the Apostles.*

The Apologie, Cap. 10. Diuision. 1.

Wherefore if wee be Heretiques, and they (as they woulde faine be called) be Catholiques, why doo they not, as they see the Fathers, whiche were Catholique men, haue alwaies donne? Why doo they not conuince and maister vs by the Diuine Scriptures? Why doo they not calle vs againe to be tried by them? Why doo they not laie before vs, howe wee haue gonne awaie from Christe, from the Prophetes, from the Apostles, and from the holy Fathers? Why sticke they to doo it? Why are they afraide of it? It is Goddes cause: Why are they doubtful to commit it to the trial of Goddes Woorde? If wee be Heretiques, whiche referre al our controuersies vnto the holy Scriptures, and reporte vs to the selfe same Woordes, whiche wee knowe were sealed by God him selfe, and in comparison of them, sette litle by al other thinges, what so euer maie be diuised by menne, howe shal wee saie to these folke, I praie you: what manner of men be they, and howe is it meete to calle them, whiche feare the iudgement of the holy Scriptures, that is to saie, the Iudgement of God him selfe, and doo preferre before them theire owne dreames, and ful colde inuentions: and to maintaine their owne Traditions, haue defaced and corrupted nowe these many hundred yeeres the ordinances of Christe, and of the Apostles?

M. Hardinge.

VVee doo so. For they condemne those that went against the Tradition of the Fathers, and so doo wee. The Scriptures consiste not in Inke and Paper, but in the sense. VVhiche sense the Holy Ghoste by Christes promise hath taught the Churche. Iohan. 14.

Epiphanius refutinge the Heretikes whiche named them selues Apostolikes, saithe, that the Scriptures haue neede of Speculation (that is to witte, to be wel studied and considered) to the ende the force and power of euery argument maie be knowen. It behoueth vs also (saithe he) to vse the Tradition: For wee can not haue al thinges of the Holy Scripture. Thus Epiphanius. By Tradition without doubte he meaneth the sense and vnderstandinge receiued of the Fathers. For that is the Keie of the VVoorde of God, as S. Peter taught, by report of S. Clement. This sense and vnderstandinge of the Lawe had the Ministers of the Lawe, to whome the Traditions of Moses and of the Elders came as it were by handes. Nowe wee require you to admitte this Tradition, that is to saie, the Catholike sense and vnderstandinge of the Scriptures, whiche hath benne deliuered vnto vs by the Holy Fathers of al Ages, and of al Countries, where the Faithe hath benne receiued. And then wee wil calle you againe to be tried by the Scriptures. Hæres. 61. Scripture needeth speculatiõ. Tradition necessarie, bicause Scripture hath not al thinges. Recognitiõ. Li. 10.

This haue the Catholikes laide before you oftentimes, and this doo we shewe you in this Confutation. He that despiseth you, despiseth mee, saithe Christe of his Churche. Ye despise the Catholike Churche, and therefore you despise Christe. Luc. 10.

VVhat neede so many questions Sirs? Your hote Rhetorike sheweth more courage in woorde, then Victorie in deede. Yee calle vs foorthe to the Scriptures, as it were to the fielde. Yee strike vs downe with woordes, before ye come to encounter. To shewe your brauerie in the moustre, ye referre your controuersies to the Holy Scriptures, ye reporte you vnto the woordes sealed by God him selfe: but we the Catholikes, as ye pretende, sticke at it: we be afraide of it, we doubte of the mater, we feare the Iudgemente of Holy Scriptures, wee preferre our owne dreames and colde inuentions. VVel, nowe that ye haue tolde your lusty tale, heare our sober answeare. Oftentimes the true Scriptures are stretched foorthe to serue euil and false purposes. The Iewes wente aboute by the Scriptures to prooue, that Christe was not so much as a Prophete. For they saide, *Searche the Scriptures, and see, that a Prophete riseth not out of Galilee. By the Scriptures they woulde needes shewe him woorthy

Greate bragges made by the Defenders, of the assurice of the Scriptures. Iohan. 7.

*Vntruthe. For thewoordes are otherwise.

Iohan. 19. Matth. 4. De Fide, lib. 2. cap. 1. Marke. 10. woorthy to die. VVee haue a Lawe, quod they, and by our Lawe he ought to die, becauſe he hath made him ſelfe the Sonne of God. The Diuel by alleaginge Scripture, woulde haue deceiued our Sauiour him ſelfe, and ſaide vnto him: *Scriptum eſt*, It is written. The Arians were ful of the Scriptures, and by the ſame, as S. Ambroſe writeth, wente aboute to prooue, that Chriſte the author of al goodneſſe was not good. It is written, quoth they, *Nemo bonus niſi vnus Deus*, None is good, but onely God. Likewiſe the Macedonians, the Neſtorians, the Eutychians.

Nowe in this caſe, your ſelues doinge the like, what may wee doo better, then honour the Scriptures, and ſeeke for their right Senſe and vnderſtandinge? *Scriptum eſt*, It is Scripture (ſaithe S. Ambroſe to the allegation of the Arians) I acknowlege, but the letter hath not the errour: woulde God the Arians interpretation had not. *Apices ſine crimine ſunt ſenſus in crimine*. The letters be without crime: the ſenſe is in crime. From the vnderſtandinge cometh Hereſie, nor from the Scripture: the ſenſe, not the woorde, becommeth to be a crime, ſaithe S. Hilary. Sithens then al ſtandeth in the ſenſe, let vs agree firſte vpon the ſenſe and interpretation of the Scriptures: and then if wee be not as ready as ye, come foorth when ye liſte, vpbraide vs hardely, and ſaie luſtely, as here ye doo, why ſticke they to doo it? why are they afraide of it?

Hilari. De Trinita. Lib. 2.

As for the true ſenſe and interpretation of the Scriptures, where ſhal we finde it, but, as before wee ſaide, in the Catholike Churche? The Churche hauinge Chriſte remaininge with it al daies to the ende of the worlde, hauinge by promiſe of Chriſte the Sprite of truthe, remaininge in it for euer, hauinge by Goddes owne ancient promiſe bothe the woordes, whiche the Father hath put in the mouthe of Chriſte, and the Sprite whiche he put in him, whereby it may vnderſtande the meaninge of Goddes woordes? wee maie not now ſeeke for the true ſenſe, vnderſtandinge, and interpretation of the Scriptures any where, but in the Churche. Your owne Doctour Iohn Caluine him ſelfe, whom ye folow and eſteeme ſo muche, admoniſheth very wel, and ſaithe, it is ſpecially to be noted, that out of the Churche there is no light of the ſounde vnderſtandinge of the Scriptures. This grounde beinge laide, on whiche eche parte muſt ſtande and be tried in, crowe no more againſt vs, boaſte your ſelues no more: VVee feare not the iudgement of the Holy Scriptures. Nay it is your ſelues, that feare this iudgement. For your owne conſcience telleth you that on this grounde ye are the weaker ſide. Yf ye ſtande with vs on this grounde, ye ſhal neuer be able to defende your Maiſter Iohn Caluines doctrine touchinge Baptiſme, whiche he maketh to be of ſo litle force, againſte the maniſeſt Scripture: Let euery one of you (ſaithe S. Peter) be Baptized in the name of Ieſus Chriſte, to Remiſſion of Sinnes. Keepinge this grounde * ye ſhalbe borne from your Doctrine touchinge Abſolution, denyinge the Prieſte to haue power to abſolue penitentes by his Prieſtly Auctoritie, but by Preachinge the Goſpel to them, contrarie to the plaine Scripture: VVhoſe Sinnes yee forgeue, they are forgeuen to them: VVhoſe ye retaine, they are retained. Yf ye refuſe not this grounde, ye ſhal be forced to reſtore the Sacrament of extreame Vnction, and the vſe of Holy Oile againe, whiche ye haue abandoned. For what haue ye to ſaie againſte the Scripture, Is any ſicke amonge you? Let him cauſe the Prieſtes of the Churche to come in to him, anointinge him with Oile, in the name of our Lorde? Abidinge in this grounde, ye ſhal be driuen to forſake your Zwinglian doctrine, whiche putteth Signes and Figures 1 onely in the Sacrament of the Aultar, for the True and Real Body of Chriſte there 2 preſent, contrarie to the 3 cleare Scripture, *This is my Bodie*. Beinge on this grounde, ye ſhal ſoone geue ouer the maintenance of the Doctrine of your ſpecial Faithe, and of your Iuſtification by Faithe onely, as beinge contrary to the plaine Scripture, Man is iuſtified by woorkes, and not by Faithe onely. To couclude (for, to ſhewe in how many pointes ye maie be confuted by euident Scriptures, it were in maner infinite) if ye wil admitte this for a good grounde, as ye muſte needes admitte: then ſhal ye not maintaine the Preſumptuous Doctrine of your certaintie of Grace and Saluation, contrary to that S. Paule councelleth, VVith feare and tremblinge woorke your Saluation.

In Epiſt. ad Hebreos.

Vntruthe.

Vntruthe. For he debaſeth not the Sacrament of Baptiſme.

*Vntruthe.

Three euident Vntruthes.

Iacob. 5.

Iacob. 2.

Philip. 2.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Wherras wee make reaſonable requeſt, that God maie be vmpeare in his owne cauſe, and that al our controuerſies maie be iudged, and tried by the Holy Scriptures, M. Hardinge thereto anſweareth thus: The Scripture ſtandeth not in the Wordes, but in the Senſe, and the ſame Senſe is continued by Tradition in the Churche. Otherwiſe, he ſaithe, the Iewes, the Arians, the Neſtorians, the Eutychians, and al other Heretiques, were alwaies hable to claime by the Scriptures. To conclude, he maketh vp a great emptie heape, of the force of Baptiſme, of holy Oile, of Extreme Unction, of Abſolution, of Signes, of Figures, of Onely Faithe, and, as it liketh him to calle it, of the Preſumptuous Doctrine of the Certainetie of Saluation: in euery of whiche thinges, he ſaithe, the Scriptures are cleare of his ſide, and direcly againſt vs.

To anſweare al theſe pointes in particulare, it would require an other Booke. But briefely to touche ſo muche onely, as ſhalbe nedeful. Firſte, that the Subſtance of the Scriptures ſtandeth in the right Senſe, and Meaninge, and not onely in the naked, and bare wordes, it is true, and generally graunted without er-

ception, and nédeth no farther prouke. S. Hierome saithe, Non in Legendo, sed in Intelligendo Scripturæ consistunt: *The Scriptures stande, not in the Readinge, but in the Understandinge.* And S. Hilarie, Non Diuinorum dictorum, sed intelligentiæ nostræ à nobis ratio præstanda est: *Wee muste yeelde an accoumpte, not of Goddes Diuine Woordes, but of our owne Expositions.*

Hieron. contra Luciferian.

Hilari. De Trinitate. Lib. 4.

But if that onely be the righte Meaninge, and Sense of the Scriptures, that within these fewe late hundred yéres is cropen into the Churche of Rome: and if it be al Gospel, what so euer it be, that acloueth from thence: and if they be al Heretiques, and Schismatiques, and Despisers of Christ, and of the Apostles, and of the Uniuersal Churche, that make stale at it, or cannot receiue it, then is the whole mater already concluded: wé shal néde no more adw.

Ye saie, the Iewes, the Arians, the Nestorians, and other Heretiques alleged the Scriptures. Yea verily, M. Hardinge, and that euen with like Faithe, and in like Sense, and to like pourpose as you allege them nowe: as hereafter, I truste, it shal appeare. By the waie, for example hereof, in this very place, where you allege the wordes of the Pharisens auouchinge the Scriptures, it maie please you to remember, that either wittingly, or of some errour, and ouersight, ye haue manifestly corrupted the Scriptures. For, whereas you haue translated the place thus, Searche the Scriptures: the Pharisens saide nothinge els, but Scutare, & Vide, *Searche, and See:* and spake not one worde of the Scriptures. And although the mater importe not muche, yet to charge you with your owne rule, whiche muste nédes be good against your selfe, any smal faulte in Goddes Worde must be coumpted greate. In déde S. Chrysostome, and S. Augustine séme to supplie this worde, Scriptures, although it were not in the Texte.

Iohan. 7.
Ἐρεύνησον, καὶ ἰδὲ, ὅτι προφήτης ἐκ τῆς Γαλιλαίας οὐκ ἐγήγερται.
Chrysostom.
Augustinus.

Touchinge the mater it selfe, Nicolaus Lyra saithe, Hoc Verbum eorum simpliciter falsum est. Quia, si intelligatur de Prophetis generaliter, aliqui fuerunt nati de Galilæa: videlicet, Elizæus, Tobias, & Debora Prophetissa, & forte plures alij: *This woorde of the Pharisens is plainely false. For if it taken generally of al Prophetes, then were there certaine of them borne in Galilei, namely* Elizæus, Tobias, Debora, *and perchaunce others moe.* In suche sorte, M. Hardinge, euen with the like Faithe and credite, you also haue vsed, to allege the Scriptures.

Nicol. Lyra in 7. Cap. Iohan.

But whereto driue you al this longe tale? wil you in the ende conclude thus: The Iewes, & Heretiques alleged the Scriptures: Ergo, Faithful Christians maie not allege them? Or thus, Théues haue sometimes armed them selues: Ergo, True menne maie not be armed? Nay, wé maie rather saie thus vnto you: The Iewes, and Heretiques alleged the Scriptures: What accoumpte then maie wé make of you, that flée, and condemne, and burne the Scriptures?

Certainely, notwithstandinge Pharisens, and Heretiques wickedly misalleged the Scriptures, as ye sometimes dw to serue your pourpose, yet for al that, Christe saide vnto them, Scrutamini Scripturas: *Searche the Scriptures:* And, as it is saide before, the Catholique learned Fathers in al their cases, and controuersies appealed euermore to the Scriptures.

Iohan. 5.

Cap. 9. Diuisi. 1.

Where you saie, The Scriptures are so cleare of your side, and make so directly against vs: woulde God ye woulde in déde, and vnfainedly stande to that trial. Your fansies, and folies woulde sone come to grounde.

Touchinge your greate heape of examples, of the Sacramente of Baptisme defaced, as you saie, by M. Caluine: of Absolution, of extreme Unction, of Holy Oile, of Signes, of Figures, of Onely Faithe, and of the certaintie of Saluation, whiche you calle Presumptuous: Firste of the Sacramente of Baptisme, M. Caluine euery where writeth with al manner reuerence, callinge it a Diuine, & an Heauenly Mysterie, and the Sacrament of our Redemption: wherein also sometimes he fully reproueth you, for that ye haue so many waies, so profanely, & so vnreuerently abused the same. Of Absolution wé shal haue occasion to saie more hereafter.

Touchinge youre Oile, in déde in shewe of wordes, S. Iames séemeth to make somewhat for you. Notwithstandinge, neither dothe he calle it Holy Oile, as ye dw.

Faithe. dō, neither dothe he calle it a Sacramente of the Churche: nor dothe he saie, as ye saie, it shoulde serue for the Saluation of Body, and Soule: nor dothe he teache you to salute it, and to speake vnto it, as to a liuely, and reasonable Creature, Aue Sanctum Oleum: *Albaile Holy Oile:* nor with these wordes to minister it vnto the sicke: Per hanc Sanctam Vnctionem, & suam pijssimam Misericordiam, ignoscat tibi Deus: *By this Holy enointinge, and his deere mercie, God Pardonne thee.* To be shorte, it was a miraculous gifte of Healinge, lastinge onely, as other like Miracles did, for the time: not a necessarie Sacramente of the Churche to continewe for euer.

As for the Obiection of Signes, and Figures, for shortnesse of time, I muste referre that, gentle Reader, vnto my Former Replie to M. Hardinge. The wordes of Christe, whiche are thought to be so plaine, the Ancient Learned Father Tertullian expoundeth thus: Hoc est Corpus meum: Hoc est, Figura Corporis mei: *This is my Body: that is to saie, This is a Figure of my Body.* Likewise S. Augustine, Non dubitauit Dominus dicere, Hoc est Corpus meum, cùm daret Signum Corporis sui: *Our Lorde doubted not to saie, This is my Body, when he gaue a Signe of his Body.* *The. 12. Article.* *Tertullian. contra Marcion. Lib. 4.* Figure. Signe.

To rehearse al other like Ancient Authorities, it were to longe. O what triumphes woulde M. Hardinge make, if none of al the Olde Learned Fathers coulde be founde, that euer had called the Sacramente, the Signe, and Figure of Christes Bodie? But, as before he alleged an imagined Sense of the Scriptures without wordes, so nowe he allegeth the wordes alone without sense. He should haue remembred better, that S. Hierome saithe, Ne putemus, in Verbis Scripturarum esse Euangelium, sed in Sensu: *Let vs not thinke, the Gospel standeth in the Woordes of the Scriptures, but in the Meaninge.* *Hieronym. in Epist. ad Galat. Cap. 2.*

Two other greate quarrelles M. Hardinge moueth: the one of Onely Faithe: the other, as he calleth it, of the Presumptuous Certainetie of Saluation. Wherein iudge thou vprightly, good Christian Reader, how iuste cause he hath to rayse our Doctrine.

As for the firste hereof, S. Paule saithe, Iustificamur Gratis ex Gratia ipsius: *Roman. 3.* *We be Iustified Freely of his Grace: Wee Iudge that a man is Iustified by Faithe, without the Woorkes of the Lawe: Wee knowe, that a man is not Iustified by the Woorkes of the Lawe, but by the Faithe of Christe.* M. Hardinge wil saie, yet hitherto of, Sola Fides, that is, of Onely Faithe, we heare nothinge. Notwithstandinge, when S. Paule excludeth al manner Woorkes besides Onely Faithe, what els then leaueth he, but Faithe alone?

Howe be it, if it be so horrible an Heresie, to saie, Wee be Iustified before God by Onely Faithe, that is to saie, Onely by the Merites and Crosse of Christe, let vs se, what the Holy Learned Fathers of the Churche so many hundred yeres agoe, haue taught vs therof.

S. Ambrose saithe, Iustificati sunt Gratis, quia nihil Operantes, neque vicem reddentes, Sola Fide Iustificati sunt dono Dei: *They are Iustified Freely: Bicause woorkinge nothinge, and requitinge nothinge, they are Iustified by Onely Faithe through the gifte of God.* *Ambr. in Epist. ad Roma. Ca. 4.* Againe, Sic decretum est à Deo, vt, cessante Lege, Solam Fidem Gratia Dei poscret ad Salutem: *This was Goddes determination, that, the Lawe ceasinge, the Grace of God shoulde require Onely Faithe vnto Saluation.* *Ambrose. Redem loco.* And againe, Sola Fides posita est ad Salutem: *Onely Faithe is laide, or appointed vnto Saluation.* *Ambr. in Epist. ad Roma. Ca. 9.* S. Basile saithe, Nouit se esse inopem Veræ Iustitiæ: Sola autem Fide in Christum esse Iustificatum: *He knoweth him selfe to be voide of True Righteousnes, and to be Iustified by Onely Faithe in Christe.* *Basil. De Humilitate.* Πίστει δὲ μόνῃ τῇ εἰς Χριστὸν δικαιωμένου.

Theodoretus saithe, Non vllis Operibus nostris, sed per Solam Fidem Mystica bona consequuti sumus: *Not by any Woorkes of ours, but by Onely Faithe wee haue gotten the Mystical good thinges.* *Theodor. De Curandis Graecorū affectibus, Li. 7.*

Nazianzenus saithe, Δικαιοσύνη καὶ τὸ πιστεῦσαι μόνον: Credere solum est Iustitia: *Onely Beleeuinge is Righteousnesse.* *Nazian. περὶ ὑποταξίας.*

Origen saithe, Vbi est gloriatio tua? Exclusa est. Dicit sufficere Solius Fidei Iustificationem: ita vt credens quis Tantummodò Iustificetur, etiamsi nihil boni Operis fecerit: *Where nowe is thy boastinge (of thy good Woorkes) it is shutte out.* Paule *saith, that the Iustification of Onely Faithe is Sufficiente: So that a man Onely Beleeuinge maie be* *Orig in Epist. ad Rom. Ca. 3. Li. 3.*

Iustified, although he haue donne no good Woorke at al.

Hesychius saithe, Gratia ex Misericordia, atque Compassione præbetur, & Fide comprehenditur Sola: *The Grace of God is genen onely of Mercie, and Fauoure: and is embraced, and receiued by Onely Faithe.*

Hesychi. in Leuit. Lib. 4.

I leaue a greate numoer of others, that haue written the like, as wel Grekes, as Latines. In steade of them al, S. Chrysostome saithe thus: Illi dicebant, Qui Sola Fide nititur, Execrabilis est: Hic contrà demonstrat, eum, qui Sola Fide nititur, Benedictum esse: *They saide, who so staieth him selfe by onely Faithe, is accursed: Contrariwise* S. Paule *prooueth, that who so staieth him selfe by Onely Faithe, he is Blessed.*

Chryso. in epist. ad Galat. Cap. 3

Touchinge the woroes of S. Iames, if M. Hardinge wel conoered the Equiuocation, or double vnderstandinge of this woroe, Iustification, he might sone, and easily haue espied his owne errour. For when S. Paule saithe, Abraham *was Iustified by Faithe without Woorkes of the Lawe*, he teacheth vs, howe Abraham was receiued into fauour, and Iustified before God: Of the other side, S. Iames, when he saith, Abraham *was Iustified by Woorkes, and not by Faithe Onely*, he speaketh of the woorkes that followe Iustification, and of the Fruites of Faithe: Without whiche Fruites, Abrahams Faithe had benne no Faithe.

Roman. 4.

S. Augustine saithe, Non sunt contrariæ duorum Apostolorum Sententiæ, Pauli, & Iacobi: Cùm dicit Paulus, Iustificari hominem sine Operibus: & Iacobus dicit, inanem esse Fidem sine Operibus. Quia Paulus loquitur de Operibus, quæ Fidem præcedunt: Iacobus de ijs, quę Fidem sequuntur: *The saieinges of the two Apostles*, Paule, *and* Iames *are not contrarie, where as* Paule *saithe, A man is Iustified without Woorkes, and* Iames *saithe, Faithe without Woorkes is in vaine: For* Paule *speaketh of the Woorkes that goe before Faithe:* Iames *speaketh of the Woorkes, that followe after Faithe.*

Augu. in Li. 83. quæ. Quæ. 76. Iacob. 5.

If M. Hardinge shal thinke, S. Augustines authoritie herein is not sufficient, Thomas of Aquine wil auouche the same. His woroes be these: Iacobus hîc loquitur de Operibus sequentibus Fidem: quæ dicuntur Iustificare, non secundum quod Iustificare dicitur Iustitiæ infusio: sed secundum quod dicitur Iustitiæ Exercitatio, vel Ostensio, vel Consummatio. Res enim dicitur fieri, quando perficitur, vel innotescit: Iames *in this place speaketh of sutche woorkes, as followe Faithe: whiche woorkes are saide to Iustifie, not as Iustification is the procuringe of Righteousnesse: but in that it is an Exercise, or a Shewinge, or a Perfitinge of Righteousnesse. For wee saie, A thinge is donne, when it is perfited, or knowen to be donne.*

Thomas Aquin. in Epist. Iacobi. Cap. 5.

Nowe concerninge the assurance, or Certaintie of Saluation, the Scriptures are fulle. S. Paule saithe, *There is no damnation to them that be in Christe Iesu: The Sprite of God beareth witnesse to our Sprite, that wee are the Children of God: I knowe, that neither Deathe, nor Life, nor Angels, nor Powers, nor Principalities, nor thinges presente, nor thinges to come, nor Highth, nor Deapth, nor any Creature els, shalbe hable to remoue me from that Loue, that God beareth towardes mee in Christe Iesu our Lorde.*

Roman. 8.

But for as mutche as these woroes perhappes haue not the Sense of the Churche of Rome, without whiche, in M. Hardinges iudgemente, the Scripture of God is no Scripture, let vs see the Sense, and Exposition of the Holy Fathers.

Tertullian saithe, Vt certum esset, nos esse Filios Dei, misit Spiritum suum in corda nostra clamantem, Abba, Pater. *That wee might be certified, that wee be the Children of God, he hath sente the Holy Ghoste into our hartes, crieinge,* Abba, *Father.*

Tertull. Contra Marcion. Lib. 5.

Clemens Alexandrinus saithe, Re vera Sanguis Fidei est Spes, in qua continetur, vt Fides in anima. Cùm autem Spes expirauerit, perinde acsi sanguis effluxerit, vitalis Fidei facultas dissoluitur: *In deede Hope is, as it were, the Blonde of Faithe: in which Faithe, Hope is conteined, euen as Faithe is conteined in the Soule. And when Hope is gonne, then is al the Liuely power of Faithe dissolued, as if the Blonde were sheadde out of the Body.*

Clemens in Pædagogi. Lib. 1. ca 6

S. Cyprian saithe, Et tu dubitas, & fluctuas? Hoc est Deum omninò non nosse: Hoc est Christum Credentium Magistrum peccato incredulitatis offendere: Hoc est, in Ecclesia constitutum, Fidem in Domo Fidei non habere: *And doest thou stagger, and stande in doubte (of thy Saluation)? That were as mutche as not to knowe God: that were as mutche as with the Sinne of vnbeliefe, to offende Christ the Maister of Beleeuers: That were as*

Cyprian. De Mortalita. Sermon. 4.

mutche

matche as beinge in the Churche, in the House of Faithe, to haue no Faithe.

Prosper saithe, Securi diem Iudicij expectant, quibus in Cruce Domini gloriantibus mundus Crucifixus est, & ipsi Mundo: *They, vnto whome the Worlde is Crucified and are Crucified vnto the Worlde, waite for the daie of Iudgemente without feare.* Prosper. De Promiss & Predict. Dei. Par. 1. cap. 16.

But to leaue the Ancient Fathers of olde time, and to put the mater quite out of doubt, one Antonius Marinarius in the late Councel of Tridente in open audience saide thus: Si Cœlum ruat, si Terra euanescat, si Orbis illabatur præceps, ego in eum erectus ero. Si Angelus de Cœlo aliud mihi persuadere contendat, dicam illi Anathema. O Fœlicem Christiani pectoris fiduciam: *If the Heauen shoulde fal, if the Earthe shoulde vanishe, if the whole Worlde shoulde come downe headlonge, yet would I stande preste, and bolde before God. If an Angel from Heauen woulde telle me otherwise, I woulde accurse him. O the Blessed truste* (and certaintie) *of a Christian Harte.* Concil. Trident. Act. 1. An. 1546.

Certainely, M. Hardinge, it were a very Presumptuous parte, to saie, that these Fathers, Greekes, Latines, Newe, Olde, your owne, & ours, were al Presumptuous. If it be so Presumptuous a matee to put affiance in the Merites of Christe, what is it then, to put affiance in our own Merites? S. Paule hathe taught vs to saie, *God forbidde that I shoulde glorie, but onely in the Crosse of Christe.* Galat. 6. S. Basile saithe, Qui non fidit suis Meritis, nec expectat ex Operibus Iustificari, Vnam, & Solam spem habet salutis suæ, Misericordias Domini: *Who so trusteth not in his owne Merites, nor looketh to be Iustified by his owne Woorkes, hathe his onely hope of Saluation in the Mercies of our Lorde.* Basil. in Psal. 32. μόνην ἔχει τὴν ἐλπίδα τοῦς ἐλεημοσύς τοῦ θεοῦ.

So saithe Iob in al his miseries, Etiamsi me occiderit, sperabo in eum. Veruntamen vias meas in conspectu eius arguam: *Although he kille me, yet wil I put my truste in him: Notwithstandinge I wil reproue my Waies before his sighte.* So the Prophete Dauid, *In thee O Lorde haue I trusted: I wil neuer be confounded.* This is no Presumption, but a patient, and an humble waitinge for the Redemption of the Children of God. Iob. 13. Psalm. 70.

It is moste true, that S. Paule saithe, *Wee muste woorke our owne Saluation with feare and tremblinge.* But this feare riseth in consideration of our owne weakenesse, and vnworthinesse: not of any distruste, or doubte in Goddes mercie. But rather the lesse cause wee finde to truste in our selues, the more cause wee haue to truste in God. Philip. 2.

Therefore S. Augustine saithe, Præsume, non de Operatione tua, sed de Christi Gratia. Gratia enim saluati estis, inquit Apostolus. Non ergo hic Arrogantia est, sed Fides. Prædicare quod acceperis, non est Superbia, sed Deuotio: *Presume thou, not of thine owne woorkinge, but of the Grace of Christe: For the Apostle saithe, Yee are saued by Grace. Here therefore is not Presumption, but Faithe. To proclaime that thou haste receiued, it is no Pride, it is Deuotion.* Aug. De Verbis Domi. Serm. 28

Againe he saithe, Non mea Præsumptione, sed ipsius Promissione in iudicium non venio: *It is not of my Presumption, but of his Promisse, that I shal not comme into Iudgemente.* S. Basile saithe, Paulus Gloriatur de contemptione Iustitiæ suæ: Paule (preiudiceth, and) *boasteth of the contempte of his owne Righteousnesse.* So saithe S. Ambrose: Non gloriabor, quia iustus sum: sed quia redemptus sum, gloriabor: Non quia vacuus sum à peccatis, sed quia mihi remissa sunt peccata. Non gloriabor, quia profui, neque quia profuit mihi quisquam: sed quia pro me Aduocatus apud Patrem Christus est: sed quia pro me Christi Sanguis effusus est: *I wil not glorie for that I am a iuste man: But for that I am redeemed, therefore wil I glorie: Not for that I am voide of sinne: but for that my sinnes be forgeeuen mee. I wil not glorie, for that I haue donne good to any man, nor for that any man hathe donne good to mee: but for that Christe is my Aduocate with the Father, and for that Christes Blonde was sheadde for mee.* August. in Iohan. Tract. 22. Basil. De humilitate: Καυχᾶται Παῦλος ἐπὶ τὸ κατα-φρονῆσαι τῆς ἑαυτοῦ δικαιοσύνης. Ambros. de Iacobo & vita Beata August. Confess. Lib. 11. Cap. 7.

Therefore S. Augustine saithe, Quid retribuam Domino, quòd recolit hæc memoria mea, & anima mea non metuit inde? *What shal I render vnto our Lorde for that I calle to remembrance al these my Sinnes, and yet my Soule thereof is not afraide.*

To be shorte, thus saithe S. Bernarde: Vbi tuta firmaque infirmis securitas, & requies, nisi in vulneribus Saluatoris? Tantò illic securior habito, quantò ille potentior est ad saluandum, &c. Peccaui peccatum grande: turbatur conscientia, sed non perturbabitur: Quoniam vulnerum Domini recordabor. Nempe vulneratus est propter iniquitates nostras: *What sife reste or suretie can the weake Soule finde, but in the woundes of* Bernard. in Cãt. in Cantic. Serm. 61.

Esaie.53.

oure Sauioure? A: he is mightier to saue,so dwel I there with more safetie,&c. I haue committed a greate Sinne: My conscience is troubled: yet shal it not be shaken downe: bicause I wil remember my Lordes Woundes. For he was wounded for our Sinnes.

Thus,M. Hardinge,to be assured of our Saluation,S. Augustine saithe,it is no arrogant stoutnesse: It is our Faithe. It is no Pride: It is Deuotion. It is no Presumption: It is Goddes Promisse.

Cyprian. De Simpli. Præla.

But youre whole Doctrine of the truste in Pennes Perites leadeth direatly to Desperation. And therefore S. Cyprian saithe wel of you: Asserunt Noctem pro Die: Interitum, pro Salute: Desperationem, sub obtentu Spei: Perfidiam, sub prætextu Fidei: Antichristum sub vocabulo Christi: *They teache vs Nighte in steede of Daie: Destruction in steede of Healthe: Desperation vnder the colour of Hope: Infidelitie vnder the pretense of Faithe: Antichriste vnder the name of Christe.*

Nowe a litle to viewe the groundes of M. Hardinges longe discourse: whereas he so often, and so earnestly telleth vs of the Sense of the Scriptures, as if we had Scriptures without Sense, his meaninge thereby is onely to leade vs awaie to the Sense of the Churche of Rome: whiche Sense, Albertus Pighius saithe, Is the Infallible, and inflexible Rule of Truthe. Eckius saithe, Scriptura, nisi Ecclesiæ Authoritate, non est Authentica: *The Scriptures of God are not Authentical, or of credite, but onely by the warrante and Authoritie of the Churche.* And Hosius in like manner, Apostoli, cum Symbolum traderent, nunquam dixerunt, Credo Sancta Biblia, aut Sanctum Euangelium: sed dixerunt, Credo Sanctam Ecclesiam: *The Apostles, when they deliuered the Creede, they neuer saide, I beleeue the Holy Bible, or the Holy Gospel: but they saide, I beleue the Holy Churche.* Thus nowe the mater is sure pendugo for euer. We haue neither Scriptures, nor Sense of Scriptures, but onely from Rome.

Albertus Pigghius Hierar. li. 1. ca. 4
Eckius De Ecclesia.
Hosius in Confessione Petricouien. Cap. 82.

I wil not here repoorte the vnlauerie Senses, that they haue imagined of the Scriptures. One example, or two for a taste maie be sufficient. Pope Boniface saith thus, Ecce duo Gladij hic: *Beholde here are twoo Swerdes: That is to saie, The Pope hathe the power bothe of the Spiritual Swerde, and of the Temporal.*

De Maior. & Obedien. Vnam Sanctam. Psalm. 8. Antonin. in Summa. Par. 3. Titu. 22. Cap. 5. Hebræo. 2.

An other saithe: Omnia subiecisti sub pedibus eius, id est, Papæ: Pecora campi, id est, homines viuentes in terra: Pisces maris, id est, animas in Purgatorio: Volucres Cœli, id est, animas Beatorum: These woordes S. Paule applieth onely vnto Christe, meaninge thereby, that God hathe auaunced him aboue al Powers, and Dominions, & that al thinges are subiecte vnto him. But the Romaine Sense is farre otherwise: *Thou haste made al thinges subiecte vnto him, that is to saie, to the Pope: The Cattaile of the Fielde, that is to saie, Menne liuinge in the Earthe: The Fishes of the Sea, that is to saie, the Soules in Purgatorie: The Birdes of the Heauens, that is to saie, the Soules of the Blessed in Heauen.* I leaue M. Hardinges owne peculiare Expositions, Drinke ye al of this, that is to saie, as he gathereth in Conclusion, Drinke ye not al of this: It is the Substance, that is to saie, It is the Accidens.

M. Hard. in his former Answere. Artic. 2. M. Hard. Artic. 2. & 10.

By suche pretie Senses, I wil not saie, as S. Hierome saithe, De Euangelio Christi, facitis hominis Euangelium, aut, quid peius est, Diaboli: *Of the Gospel of Christ, ye make the Gospel of a Man: or, that is woorse, the Gospel of the Diuel.* I wil not so saie, But thus maie I saie with the Prophete Esaie, *Yee make Light Darkenesse: and Darkenesse Lighte.*

Hierom. in Epist. ad Galat. cap. 1. Esaie 5.

Yet muste we nedes beleue, vpon M. Hardinges Worde, that the Scripture without the Sense of the Churche of Rome is no Scripture. And therefore Hosius saithe, Si quis habeat interpretationem Ecclesiæ Romanæ de loco aliquo Scripturæ, etiamsi nec sciat, nec intelligat, an, & quomodo cum Scripturæ verbis conueniat, tamen habet ipsissimum Verbum Dei: *If a man haue the Exposition of the Churche of Rome, touchinge any place of the Scriptures, althoughe he neither knowe, nor vnderstande, whether, and howe it agreeth with the woordes of the Scripture, yet he hathe the very Woorde of God.* So saithe Rabbi Abraham Hispanus, speakinge of the Expositions of the Rabbines, Licet videantur nobis verba nostra esse vera, & recta, nobis tamen Veritas abijcienda est in terram: quia Veritas cum illis est: *Notwithstandinge our Expositions seeme to vs neuer so True, and right, yet muste wee throwe our Truthe to the grounde: For the Truthe in deede is*

Hosius de expresso Verbo Dei.

Rabbi Abrahã.

with them. Lyra likewise reporteth the common opinion the Iewes had of theire Rabbines: Recipiendum est, quicquid hoc modo proponatur, etiamsi dicant Dextram esse Sinistram: *We muste needes receiue, what so euer they laie vnto vs, yea although they telle vs, The Right hande is the Lefte.* Lyra in Deuteron. Cap. 17.

Nowe, gentle Reader, that thou maist the better see the constancie, and certaintie of these Senses, and Expositions, whereunto M. Hardinge laboureth so earnestly to haue thē bounde, it maie please thē to consider theise wordes of Nicolaus Cusanus sometime Cardinal in the Churche of Rome: Non est mirum, si Praxis Ecclesiæ vno tempore interpretatur Scripturam vno modo: & alio tempore, alio modo. Nam Intellectus currit cum Praxi. Intellectus enim, qui cum Praxi concurrit, est Spiritus Viuificans. Sequuntur ergo Scripturæ Ecclesiam: & non è conuerso: *It is no marueile, though the Practise of the Churche expounde the Scriptures at one time one waie, and at an other time an other waie. For the vnderstandinge, or Sense of the Scriptures renneth with the Practise: and that sense so agreeinge with the Practise is the quickeninge Sprite. And therefore the Scriptures folowe the Churche: but contrariwise the Church followeth not the Scriptures.* Nicol. Cusanus ad Bohemos Epist. 7.

For suche kindes of Expositions of the Scriptures, S. Hilarie said sommetime vnto the Arians, Fides ergo temporum magis est, quàm Euangeliorum: *The Faithe therefore followeth the time, and not the Gospel.* Hilar. ad Constantium Aug.

This is the Sense of the Churche of Rome, whereby onely M. Hardinge willeth vs to measure, and to weighe the Worde of God. But the Ancient Father Origen saith, Sicut omne Aurum, quodcunque fuerit extra Templum, non est Sanctificatum: sic omnis Sensus, qui fuerit extra Diuinam Scripturam, quamuis admirabilis videatur quibusdam, non est Sanctus, quia non continetur à Sensu Scripturæ: *As what so euer Golde is without the Temple, is not Sanctified: so what so euer Sense is without the Holy Scripture, although vnto somme it seeme woonderful, yet is it not Holy, bicause it is not conteined in the Sense of the Scripture.* Origen in Matthæ. Homil. 25.

To conclude, whereas M. Hardinge saithe, We cannot vnderstande the Scriptures without Tradition, the Ancient Father Irenæus saithe, This is one special marke, whereby we maie knowe an Heretique: These be his wordes: Hæretici, cùm arguuntur ex Scripturis, in accusationem Scripturarum conuertuntur, quasi non recte habeant, nec sint ex authoritate, & quòd variè sint dictæ, & quòd ex his non possit inueniri Veritas ab illis, qui Traditionem nesciunt: *Heretiques, when they be reproued by the Scriptures, they fal to the accusinge of the Scriptures, as though either they were not wel and perfite, or wanted authoritie, or were doubtfully vttered: or that they that knewe not the Tradition, were neuer hable by the Scriptures to finde out the Truthe.* Irene. Li. 3. ca. 2

The Apologie, Cap. 10. Diuision. 2.

When saie, that Sophocles the Tragical Poete, when in his olde daies he was by his owne Sonnes accused before the Iudges, for a dotinge and sottishe man, as one that fondly wasted his owne Substance, and seemed to neede a gouernour, to see vnto him: to the intent he mighte cleare him selfe of the faulte, he came into the place of Iudgemente, and wen he had rehearsed before them his Tragedie called Oedipus Colonæus, whiche he had written at the very time of his accusation, maruelous exactely and cunningly, did aske the Iudges in his owne behalfe, whether they thought any sottishe or dotinge man coulde doo the like peece of Woorke. In like manner, bicause these menne take vs to be madde, and appeache vs for Heretiques, as menne whiche haue nothinge to doo, neither with Christe, nor with the Churche of God, wee haue iudged it shoulde be to good pourpose, and not vnprofitable, if wee doo openly and frakely set foorthe our Faithe wherein wee stande, and shewe al that confidence whiche wee haue in Christe Jesu: to the intent al menne maie see, what is our Iudgement of euery parte of Chri-

stian

stian Religion: and maie resolue with them selues, whether the Faithe whiche they shal see confirmed by the Woordes of Christe, by the Writinges of the Apostles, by the Testimonies of the Catholique Fathers, and by the examples of many ages, be but a certaine rage of Furious and madde menne, and a conspiracie of Heretiques. This therefore is our beliefe.

M. Hardinge.

The comparison whiche ye make betwene your selues and Sophocles, gladly we admit. Yet we acknowledge, that as in many respectes ye are like, so in some vnlike. Sophocles was a Poete, that is to saie, a fainer, and diuiser of thinges, that be not true, but fabulous: Ye also are fainers, and deuisers of nouelties, and folowers of Newe deuises, that be false. Sophocles, was a Tragical Poete: ye are Tragical Diuines. A Tragedie setteth foorth th'ouerthrowes of Kingdomes, Murder of Noble Personages, and other greate troubles, and endeth in woful lamentations. Youre Gospel inuadeth Christes Heauenly Kingdome the Churche, it murdereth soules bought with a moste deere price, it causeth a hellishe garboile in mens consciences, in the ende it bringeth to euerlasting weepinge and gnasshinge of teethe. VVe take you not to be madde. VVould God ye were not worse then madde. VVere ye mad, ye shoulde be tied vp. Els were ye suffered to goe abroade, for feare folke woulde flie from you. And then should ye doo little hurte. Now whiles ye offer venemous kisses with sugred lippes, whiles ye couer woluish cruelties vnder Lambes Skinnes, whiles ye hurt vnder pretence of benefite, wounde vnder colour of a medicine, begyle vnstable Soules with resemblance of Truthe: neither stinte ye to woorke mischiefe, nor others can beware of you.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

O M. Hardinge, Sophocles him selfe, if he were aliue, were not hable with al his eloquence to expresse the Tragical dealinges of your companie. Youre whole life, and Religion is nothinge els, but a Tragedie. You haue ripte vp the graues, & digged out the deade, and practised your cruelties vpon the poore innocent carkesses.

Martil. Bucerus, Paul. Phagius,

Your Pope Stephanus toke vp Formosus his Predecessours Body, chopte of his forefingers, cut of his heade, and threwe out the naked carkesse into Tiber.

Platina in Stephano. 6. Sabellicus. Enneade. 9. Lib. 2.

Your Pope Iohn the twelfth cut of one of his Cardinalles righte hande, and an others nose.

Sabellicus. Enneade. 9. Lib. 9. Beno Cardinalis

Youre Pope Vrbanus the firth thruste fiue of his Cardinalles aliue into sackes, and threwe them out into the Sea.

Your Pope Hildebrande poisoned fiue other Popes his Predecessours, to make him selfe roume to the Holy Seate. They are so skilful there, in theise feates, that noman can telle, neither what to flie, nor what to take: nor whome to doubte, nor whom to trust. They haue conueighed their poison, I wil not saie into their meates, or drinkes, for that is ouer grosse, and Common, but euen into their Masse Bokes, into the Sacramente, into the Chalice. Camotensis one of their owne side saithe wel of them: Sine Sanguinis effusione non ingrediuntur in Sancta Sanctorum: *Without sheadinge of Bloude they enter not into that Holy Place, the Holy of Holies.*

Heb. 9. Agrippa. De Vani. Scientiarum.

Howe be it, what spende I theise woordes? It is not possible to saie al, that maie be saide. They haue inflamed Warres: They haue raised the Subiectes against their Princes: They haue armed the Sonne against the Father: They haue ouerthrowen Cities, and Countries: They haue deposed Kinges: They haue sette theire fote on Emperours neckes.

Theise maters, M. Hardinge, be Tragical in deede. And herein standeth the whole practise, and Policie of your Churche of Rome.

Where you thinke your selfe a sober man, in that you can so easily cal vs madde, and worse then madde, you maie remember that this kinde of eloquence emongest you is Ancient, and Catholique, and maie wel stande with your Religion. For so the false Prophete Semeias saide, that Hieremie the Prophete of God raued, & was starke madde. So the wicked saide vnto Iehu, of Elizeus the Prophete, What hathe this madde Bedlem Body to do with thee? Euen so they saide of Christe, That he was madde, and spake in furie, he knewe not what. S. Augustine saithe of S. Paule: Incidit in istorum sacrilegam dicacitatem: & ab eis, qui sanari nolunt, vocatur insanus: S. Paule *is fallen into their cursed railinge: and of them, that wil neuer be made sober, is called a madde*

Hierem. 29. 4. Reg. 19. Marci. 3. Aug. in Psal. 6.

a madde man. So ſaithe the Ancient Father Origen, of Celſus the wicked Heathen: Videamus igitur nos, qui iuxta hunc inſanimus: *Let vs therefore conſider hereof, that in this maynes Iudgemente are ſtarke madde.* Origen contra Celſum, Lib. 4.

But, M. Hardinge, wherein are wee ſo madde? or what tokens of madneſſe haue wee shewed? Can noman either ſpeake the Truth, or diſcloſe your errours, without madneſſe? But, I trowe, it is euen as S. Hierome ſaide ſometime, Deliberat, ſcilicet, qui in tuo Regno contra tuam ſententiam loquebatur: *He raued, and was madde, no doubte, that within thy Dominion ſpake any thinge againſte thy minde.* So ſaithe Leo, Inſanis Magiſtris Veritas ſcandalum eſt, & Cœcis Doctoribus fit caligo quod lumen eſt: *Vnto Frantique Maiſters the Truthe is a ſclaunder: and vnto Blinde Doctours the lighte is becomme Darkeneſſe.* Hieronym. ad Pammachi. contra errores Iohan. Hieroſolymit. Leo in Epiphan. Sermo. 5.

So ſaithe S. Auguſtine of Kinge Dauid: Inſanire videbatur: Sed Regi Achis inſanire videbatur, id eſt, ſtultis, & ignorantibus: Dauid *ſeemed madde: But vnto Kinge* Achis *he ſeemed madde, that is to ſaie, vnto fooles, and idiotes.* Augu. in

As for our parte, wee remember, what anſweare S. Paule made vnto Feſtus in the like caſe: *O good* Feſtus, *I am not madde: but I vtter vnto thee, the woordes of Truthe, and Sobrietie.* Actor. 26.

Therefore wee maie comforte our ſelues as the Vertuous Gentlewoman Paula did, when ſhee was likewiſe ſuppoſed to be madde: Nos ſtulti propter Chriſtum: Sed ſtultum Dei ſapientius eſt hominibus: *Wee are iudged fooles (and madde folkes) for Chriſtes ſake: But the fooliſhneſſe of God is wiſer then menne.* Hierony. in Epitaphio Paule.

But, M. Hardinge, S. Cyprian wil tel you thus: Hæc eſt, Frater, Vera dementia, non cogitare, nec ſcire, quòd mendacia non diu fallant: noctem tam diu eſſe, quàm diu illuceſcat dies: *O my Brother, this is madneſſe in deede, not to thinke, or knowe, that (your) Lies cannot longe deceiue vs, and that it is Night no longer, but vntil the daie ſpringe. This in deede is very madneſſe.* Cyprian ad Cornelium.

And therefore Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Qui in manifeſtam foueam cadit, non negligens dicitur: ſed inſanus: *Who ſo falleth into a pitte, that lieth wide open, is not ſaide to be negligent, but ſtarke madde.*

The ende of the Firſte Parte.

The Seconde Parte.

The Apologie, the firſte Chapter, Diuiſion. 1.

WEe beleeue, that there is one certaine Nature and Diuine Power, whiche wee calle God: and that the ſame is diuided into Three equal Perſones, into the Father, into the Sonne, and into the Holy Ghoſte: and that thei al be of one Power, of one Maieſtie, of one Eternitie, of one Godhead, & of one Subſtance. And although theiſe Three Perſons be ſo diuided, that neither the Father is the Sonne, nor the Sonne is the Holy Ghoſt, or the Father: yet neuertheleſſe wee beleeue, that there is but one very God: And that the ſame one God hathe created Heauen, and Earthe, and al thinges conteined vnder Heauen.

Wee beleeue, that Jeſus Chriſte the onely Sonne of the Eternal Father (as longe before it was determined, before al beginninges) when the fulneſſe of time was comme, did take of that Bleſſed, and Pure Virgine, both fleaſhe, and al the Nature of Man, that he might declare to the

the worlde the secrete and hid Wil of his Father: whiche wil had benne laide vp from before al Ages, and Generations: And that he might ful finisshe in his Humaine Body the Mysterie of oure Redemption: and might fasten our sinnes to the Crosse, & also that Handwritinge, which was made againste vs.

Wee beleeue, that for our sakes he died, and was buried, descended into Hel, the thirde daie by the Power of his Godhed returned to life & rose againe, and that the fourteth daie after his Resurrection, whiles his Disciples beheilde and looked vpon him, he Ascended into Heauen, to fulfil al thinges, and did place in Maiestie, and Glorie the selfe same Body, where with he was borne, wherein he liued on Earthe, wherein he was iested at, wherein he had suffered moste paineful tormentes, and cruel kinde of deathe, wherein he rose againe, and wherein he ascended to the Righte Hande of the Father, aboue al Rule, aboue al Power, al Force, al Dominion, and aboue euery name, that is named, not onely in this worlde, but also in the worlde to comme: And that there he now sitteth, and shal sitte, til al thinges be ful perfited. And althoughe the Maiestie, and Godhed of Christ be everywhere abundantly dispersed, yet wee beleeue, that this Body, as S. Augustine saithe, muste needes be stil in one place: and that Christe hathe geuen Maiestie vnto his Body, but yet hathe not taken awaie from it the Nature of a Body: and that wee muste not so affirme Christe to be God, that wee denie him to be Man: and, as the Martyr Vigilius saithe, that Christe hathe lefte vs as touchinge his Humaine Nature, but hathe not lefte vs as touchinge his Diuine Nature: And that the same Christe, thoughe he be Absent from vs concerninge his Manhed, yet is euer Present with vs concerninge his Godded.

Augu. Tract. 50. in Iohan.

Actor. 3.

In Epist. ad Dardanum. Contra Eutychem. Lib. 1.

Fulgent. ad Thrasymundum

From that place also wee beleue that Christe shal comme againe to execute that General Judgemente, as wel of them whome he shal then finde aliue in the Body, as of them that shal be already deade.

M. Hardinge.

In our Fathers daies before any change in Religion was thought vpon, Christen people liued togeather in perfite vnitie. If accoumpte of beleefe had benne demaunded, (a) none was ashamed of the common Apostles Creede. Euery one constantly confessed, I beleue in God the Father Almighty Maker of Heauen and Earth, and in Iesus Christe, and so foorthe. But sithens Luther brought a (b) Newe Gospel into the worlde, wee haue seene greate diuersitie amonge men, not onely of Ceremonies, and Administration of the Sacramentes, but also of the Publike Confession of the Faithe. For as sundre Rulers, Countries, and common VVeales receiued that new Doctrine: (c) so their Preachers and Ministers haue sette foorthe sundrie Creedes, and Confessions of their Faithe.

(a) Neither is any man nowe ashamed of the Apostles Crede.
(b) Vntruthe. It was the Olde.
(c) Manifest vntruthe: For wee keepe al one Creede.

S. Hilarie in his time complaininge thereof, Nowe a daies there be (saithe he) so many Faithes, as there be willes? so many Doctrines, as there be maners: so many causes of blasphemies springe vp, as there be vices: whiles Faithes either are so written as wee liste, or so vnderstanded as wee liste. And where as there is but one God, one Lorde, one Baptisme, and according thereto one Faithe, we steppe aside from that whiche is the onely Faithe: and whiles moe Faithes be made, they beginne to come to that pointe, that there be no Faithe at al.

S. Hilarie complaint of many Faithes. One God, one Faith.

But the manner of the vtterance of youre Faithe is strange to Christen eares, who haue benne accustomed to heare, *Credo in Deum, Credo in Iesum Christum, Credo in Spiritum Sanctum*: I beleue in God, I beleue in Iesus Christe, I beleue in the Holy Ghoste. That other forme of woordes, which you vse, soundeth not so Christianlike. I beleue there is a God, I beleue that Iesus Christe is the Sonne of the Father, I beleue that the Holy Ghoste is God. Although this forme of woordes doo expresse a right Faithe, yet beinge suche as maie be vttered by Deuilles, and hath (d) alwaies benne vttered by Heretikes their Ministers: the Ancient and Holy Fathers haue liked better the Olde forme and maner: after whiche euery Christen man saithe, I beleue in God, I beleue in Iesus Christe, I beleue in the Holy Ghost. For this importeth a signification of Faith with hope and charitie: that other of Faith onely, which the Diuelles haue and tremble, as S. Iames saith: wherein as in many other thinges these Defenders

(d) Vntruth. For the Heretiques saide, I beleue in God, as wel as did the Catholiques.

The manner of the vtterance of the Defenders saide strange in Christes eares.

Iacob. 2.

Defenders assemble them S. Augustine in sundrie places puttinge a difference betweene these two formes of woordes, vpon S. Iohn alleginge S. Paules woordes. To one that beleueth in him who iustifieth the wicked, his Faithe is imputed to righteousnesse, demaundeth, what is it to beleue in him? It is by his answeare: *Credendo amare, Credendo diligere, Credendo in eum ire, & eius membris incorporari.* With beleuinge to loue him, with beleuinge to goe into him, and to be incorporate in his members, that is, to be made a member of his Body.

The Article of Christes ascension much gra-ued vpo by the Defen-ders to euil purpose. In Iohan. Tract. 30. Oportet for Potest.

As the Defender procedeth in declaringe the beliefe of his newe Englishe Churche, he graueth mutche vpon the Article of Christes Ascention, as the manner is of al Zwinglians to doo. For theue minde geueth them, thereby they shal be able to bringe at leaste many of the simpler sorte to theire Sacramentarie Heresie, and to thinke, that the Body of Christ, wherein he ascended into Heauen, and sitteth at the right hande of the Father, is so absent from Earthe, as it maie not be beleued to be liefe present in the Sacramente of the Aultar. Thereto he alleageth S. Augustine, makinge him to saie, that Christes Body wherein he rose againe, must needes be sitl in one place. In which treatise that Holy Father hathe not the woorde, *Oportet*, that is, muste needes, as this Defender alleageth, but this woorde, *Potest*, that is, maie, as the bookes haue that be not corrupted by the mainteiners of that Heresie. And where as he saithe, *Ad Dardanum*, alleged by this Defender, thoughe Christe hathe geuen Maiestie vnto his Body, yet he hathe not taken awaie from it the Nature of a Body: this is not to be stretched to Christes Body in the Sacramente, where it is not after condition of Nature, but by the almightie power of his woorde. And althoughe he hath not taken awaie from his Body the Nature of a very Body, yet maie it please him to doo with his Body, beinge God moleste then Man, that, whiche is besides and aboue the Nature of a Body. So it pleased him to doo, when he said, This is my Body. And so it pleaseth him to be donne, when so euer the same Body is offered in the daily Sacrifice of the Churche accordinge to his commaundement and institution. That Vigilius saithe, Christ hathe leafte vs touchinge his Humaine Nature, but hath not leafte vs as touchinge his Diuine Nature: it is to be vnderstanded of his visible shape, in whiche he shewed his Humaine Nature, when he walked here on Earth, when he was so conuersant with men sensibly, that as S. Iohn writeth they heard him with their eares, they sawe him with their eies, they beheld him, and touched him with their handes. As touching his Humaine Nature in this sensible wise, Christ hath left vs, after which S. Augustine saith, *Iam non inuenis Christum loqui in Terra:* Nowe thou findest not Christe to speake on the Earthe. This manner of Christes Humaine Nature beinge taken from vs withstandeth not, but that wee maie haue the Substance of his Natural Body and Bloude presente in the Blessed Sacramente in a Mysterie by the almightie power of his woorde: whiche Faithe these Defenders trauaile to impugne. And (as God woulde) the Penneman of this Apologie bringeth vnwares, as it seemeth, for confirmation of his Sacramentarie Doctrine, that out of Fulgentius, whiche ouerthroweth al that he wente aboute to builde againste the real presence. That Father, as he is by him alleged, saithe, *Christum cùm absit à nobis per Formam Serui, tamen semper esse nobiscum per Formam Dei:* That where as Christe is absent from vs according to the Forme of a Seruaunt, yet he is euer presente with vs accordinge to the Forme of God. Whereby he meaneth, that Christe is nomore here among menne, as he was before his deathe, in Forme and shape of Man, in suche wise as we see menne liue on the Earthe. Which woordes because they seeme to dashe their whole purpose, the Prelates of this newe Englishe Churche haue altered the sense of them, by shifting in this woorde (manhed) in steede of the Forme or shape of a Seruaunt) whiche the Latine hathe, and this woorde (Godhed) in steede of (the Forme of God).

Mark. 16. Contra Eutych. Li. 1 How christ hath left vs be nowe in Earthe. 1 Iohan. 1. Expositionis in Epist. Iohan. Tract 10.

Ad Thrasymundum Regem.

Vntruthe. For S. Augustines woorde is, *Oportet*, and S. Augustine knewe no such Body in the Sacramente.

Vntruth. There is neither in the Institution, nor in the commaundement.

Vntruthe. For Fourme and Substance are bothe one.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

I marueile, M. Hardinge, that yée can publishe so manifest Vntruthe without blushinge. Ye saie, that before these fewe late yeres, there was but one Fourme of Faithe throughout the worlde. Yet beinge learned, & hauinge trauailed through the Ancient Writers, you muste needes haue seene the Apostles Creede: the Nicene Creede: S. Basiles Creede: Damasus Creede: S. Hieromes Creede: S. Cyprians, or Rufines Creede: Gregorius Creede: the Creede called, Quicunque vult, written, as somme thinke, by Athanasius, as somme others, by Eusebius Vercellensis: the Creede conteined in the Hymne, called, Te Deum, whether it were written by S. Augustine, or by S. Ambrose: euery of theise vnder seuerall, and sundrie fourmes. You knowe, that in diuers of the Moste Councelles, as occasion was offered, so somme-what was either added to the Creede, or diminished, or altered: as it maie appeare by Eusebius, Socrates, Theodoretus, Sozomenus, Euagrius, Nicephorus, and others. You know, that S. Augustine vnto Laurentius, S. Hierome vnto Cyrillus, S. Ambrose vnto the Emperoure Gratianus, and others moe in declaration of the Christian Faithe, haue not alwaies vsed one precise fourme of woordes: and that the Emperour Constantine maketh open Protestation of his Faithe, as it is recorded in the Counterfeite Donation, in Sense, and Substance agreinge with al others, that

To beleue in God.

were Catholique: but in wordes, farre disagreinge from al others, and peculiare onely to him selfe. To be shorte, you knowe, that betweene your Olde Crede, and the peoples Common Crede, as touchinge the wordes, there was great difference. It were to longe, to rehearse al. Neither was it necessarie, to sale so muche, sauing onely to shewe the manifest vanitie of youre talke. To expresse one Substance of Faithe in sundrie Fourmes of Wordes, I neuer hearde, it was forbidden, sauinge onely nowe at the laste by this late Decree of M. Hardinge.

Where you sale, the whole people before these fewe late péres, had one Faithe, ye shoulde rather haue saide, they were al taughte by you in a straunge vnknowen Tongue, to pronounce, as they coulde, a straunge vnknowen Fourme of Faithe. For, God knoweth, they vnderstoode not one worde, what they saide, nor scarcely one Article of their beléeue. S. Hilarie saithe, of the people deceiued by the Arians, as these haue benne by you, Credunt, quod non credunt: Intelligunt, quod non intelligunt: *They Beleeue that, whiche they Beleeue not: They Vnderstande that, whiche they Understande not.* Cardinal Ascanius had a Popiniay, that was taught to sale distinctly al the Articles of the Crede, from the beginninge to the ende. Yet, I trowe, ye wil not sale, the same Popiniay beleued in God, or vnderstoode the Christian Faithe. For Faithe is in the Harte, not in the Tongue. S. Augustine saithe, Fieri potest, vt integra quis teneat Verba Symboli, & tamen non rectè credat: *It is possible, that a man maie pronounce the whole wordes of the Creede: and yet not haue the right Faithe.* In deede S. Hilarie, of whom ye speake, worthily reproued the Arian Heretiques, for that they had altered the whole Faithe of Christe, not onely in wordes, but also in Substance. But we hauinge published sundrie Confessions of our Religion, as the multitudes of your Abuses & Errours offered occasion, and that in sundrie Countries, and Kingedomes, in suche distance of places, and diuersitie of Speaches, yet not withstandinge in the Substance, and groundes of the Truthe haue euermore ioined togeather, and neuer altered.

Hilar. ad Constantium Imperatorem. Cœlius Rhodigin. Antiquita. Lib. 3. Cap. 32. Augusti. De Baptismo contra Donatist. Li. 3. Cap. 14.

Where we saie, We beleue there is one God, M. Hardinge answeareth, he cannot wel allowe this Fourme of Speache. We shoulde rather haue saide, saithe he, we beléeue In God. Were not this Controller so importune, suche simple petite quarrelles shoulde not be answeared. I coulde neuer haue thought, it had benne so greate a sinne, to Beléeue, that God is God. Verily, M. Hardinge, if euery of your Popes, and Cardinalles had beléeued so muche, I trowe, Cornelius the Bishop of Bitonto in your late Councel at Trident would not so bitterly, & in so open sort haue cried out of them, Vtinam non à Fide ad Infidelitatem, à Deo ad Epicurum, velut prorsus vnanimes declinassent, dicentes in corde impio, & ore impudico, Non est Deus: *Woulde God they were not gonne, as it were with one consente, from the Faithe to Infidelitie, from God to Epicure, saieinge with wicked harte, and shameleste mouthe, There is no God.*

Cornelius Bitontinus in Concil. Trident.

If no Catholique Writter had euer vsed the selfe same Fourme of speache before, then mighte M. Hardinges quarrel séeme to haue somme reasonable grounde. But bothe S. Paule, and also many other Catholique Fathers haue often vsed it. S. Paule saithe, Accedentem ad Deum oportet Credere, Deum esse: *He that commeth to God, muste beleue, that there is a God.* And Hermes, S Paules Scholar, commonly called Pastor Nuntius, Ante omnia crede Vnum Deum esse, qui condidit omnia: *Before al other thinges beleue that there is One God, that hathe made al.* Origen saithe, Primùm credendus est Deus, qui omnia creauit: *Firste wee muste beleeue there is a God, that hathe created al thinges.* S. Hilarie saithe, In absoluto nobis, & facilis est Aeternitas, Iesum Christum à mortuis suscitatum Credere: *Our euerlastinge life is ready, and easie, to beleeue, that Iesus Christe is risen againe from the deade.* Like wise Charles the Greate in the Crede published in his name, Prædicandum est omnibus, vt credant, Patrem, Filium, & Spiritum Sanctum Vnum esse Deum Omnipotentem: *The Gospel muste be preached vnto al, to the ende they maie knowe, that the Father, the Sonne, and the Holy Ghoste is One God Almightie.* To be shorte, euen in our late Fathers daies, this was counted a Catholique Fourme of Faithe, and was commonly taught in al Schooles, Vnum Crede Deum: *Beleue, that there is One God.* If this were then wel spoken, & vniuersally

Hebræ. 11.

Pastor Nuntius. Origen. Περὶ Ἀρχῶν. In præfatio. Hilari. De Trinitat. Lib. 10. Symbolum Caroli Magni.

To beleue In God. Christes Ascension

nerſally vſed, euen in the Churche of Rome, without rebuke, I truſte, M. Hardinge of his Courteſie wil nomore blame vs for ſpeakinge wel. As for theſe Phrases (*I beleue in God, I beleue in Christe*) although in worde they be better, and more effectual, and carrie more force then the other, yet are they not, neither ſo peculiare, and ſpecial to God alone, nor ſo precisely vſed, as M. Hardinge imagineth. For it is written in the Exodus, as it is noted by the skilful in the Hebrewe tõgue, Populus credidit In Deum, & In Moſen: *The People beleued In God, and In Moſes.* And God himſelfe ſaide vnto Moſes, as it is likewiſe noted in the Hebrewe: Deſcendam, vt populus In te credat: *I wil goe downe, that the people maie beleue In thee.* S. Baſile ſaithe, Baptizati ſunt In Moſen, & crediderunt In illum: *They were Baptized In* Moſes, *and beleued In him.* And Hoſius ſaithe, Quid ſi In Sanctos quoque rectè credi docet Paulus? *What if* Paule *teache vs, that wee maie alſo wel beleeue In Sainctes?* And they of M. Hardinges ſide haue euermore wel liked this Fourme of Speache, Credo In Sanctam Eccleſiam: *I beleeue In the Holy Churche.* Wherein alſo perhaps they wil allege theſe wordes of Socrates, and of ſomme others, Credo In Vnam Catholicam Eccleſiam: *I beleeue In One Catholique Churche.* Notwithſtandinge beſide S. Auguſtine, & others, Paſchaſius ſaithe, Credimus Eccleſiam, quaſi Regenerationis Matrem: non Credimus In Eccleſiam, quaſi Regenerationis Authorem. Recede ergo ab hac perſuaſione blaſphemiæ. Non enim licet, nec In Angelum Credere: *Wee beleeue the Holy Churche, as the Mother of Regeneration: But wee beleeue not In the Churche, as the Authour of Regeneration. Leaue therefore this perſuaſion of Blaſphemie. For it is not lawful to beleeue, no not In an Angel.* Likewiſe S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Credimus Paulo, non credimus In Paulum: Credimus Petro, non credimus In Petrum: *Wee beleeue* Paule, *but wee beleeue not In* Paule: *Wee beleeue* Peter, *but wee beleeue not In* Peter.

Exod. 4. Exod. 19. Baſilius de ſpir. ſanct. cap. 14. εἰς μωσῆν ἐβαπτίσθησαν, καὶ ἐπίστευσαν εἰς αὐτόν. Hoſius in Confeſſ. Petricouien. Cap. 58. Socra. li. 1. ca. 25. Paſchaſi. Li. 1. de Spiritu Sancto.

Hereby wee maie ſee, that whether wee ſaie, *Wee beleeue that God is God*, or, *Wee beleeue in God*, bothe theſe phraſes are vſed of the godly, and are therefore bothe good, and Catholique. If M. Hardinge finde any wante, or imperfection in our wordes, let him ſupplie it with good fauour: ſo he condemne not either S. Paule, or Hermes, or Origen, or Hilarie, or Charles the Greate, or other Catholique, and godly Writers, as wel Greekes, as Latines: who, as I haue ſhewed, haue vſed the like. Certainely the General Confeſſion of al our people, and of our whole Churche, is this: *Wee beleeue In God: Wee beleeue In Christe: Wee beleeue In the Holy Ghoſte.*

Auguſtin. in Iohan. tract. 29.

But M. Hardinge ſaithe, wee grate ouer buſily vpon the Article of Chriſtes Aſcenſion into Heauen. What theare ſhould wee haue leaft it out? Verily that would haue bene ſome good countenance to your cauſe. And therefore when Pope Nicolas would haue brought vs your newe Article of Tranſubſtantiation into the Crede, he ſhould firſte haue vtterly remoued this whole Article of Chriſtes Aſcenſion. For theſe two Articles maie not wel ſtand togeather by any conſtruction in one Crede. As for vs, wee haue ſaide nothinge herein, but that hathe often bene ſaide, & auouched by the Holy Learned Fathers. Damaſus the Biſhop of Rome, in his Crede grateth hereon as muche, as wee. His wordes be theſe: Deuicto mortis imperio, cum ea Carne, in qua natus, & paſſus, & mortuus fuerat, & reſurrexit, Aſcendit ad Patrem, ſedetque ad dextram eius in Gloria: *Hauinge ouercome the empiere of deathe, with the ſame Fleaſhe, wherein he was borne, and ſuffered, and died, and roſe againe, he Aſcended vnto the Father, and ſitteth at his Right hande in Glorie.* Whiche wordes S. Hierome in larger manner expoundeth thus: Aſcendit ad Cœlum, Sedet ad Dextram Dei Patris, manente ea Natura Carnis, in qua natus, & paſſus eſt, & in qua reſurrexit. Non enim exinanita eſt Humanitatis Subſtantia, ſed glorificata: *Chriſte Aſcended into Heauen, and ſitteth at the Right hande of the Father, the ſame Nature of Fleaſhe, wherein he was borne, and ſuffered, and roſe againe remaininge ſtil. For the Subſtance of his Humaine Nature was not donne awaie, but glorified.* Howe be it, gentle Reader, for thy better ſatisfaction herein, I muſte referre thee ouer to my Former Replie to M. Hardinge.

Symbolum Damaſi, apud Hieronym. Tom. 4.

Hieronym. in Explicatione Symboli. Tom. 4.

In the ſixthe Article.

Here foloweth a piteous outerie, that wee haue ſhamefully corrupted S. Auguſtines wordes, ſhiftinge in Oportet, in ſtede of, Poteſt. What newe fanſie is ſuddainely fallen into M. Hardinges head, I cannot tel. S. Auguſtines wordes, as they

be alleged by Gratian, are these, Corpus, in quo Resurrexit, in Vno loco esse Oportet: *The Body, wherein Christe rose againe, muste needes be in* One place. Here is not Oportet in steade of Potest, as M. Hardinge saithe: but, Oportet, as it shoulde be, for Oportet. If there haue benne any corruption wrought herein, it hathe benne wroughte by Gratian welneare foure hundred yeres agoe, and not by vs. Yet is Gratian one of the highest Doctoures of M. Hardinges side. And wil M. Hardinge make vs beleue, that his owne Catholique Doctoures woulde be so bolde, to corrupte S. Augustine?

De Consecra. Dist. 1. Prima. Oportet. Potest.

As for this Verbe, Oportet, if it were wantinge in the place alleged, yet might it wel, and easily be supplied of other places. S. Peter saithe, Oportet illum Cœlos capere vsque ad tempora restitutionis omnium: *The Heauens muste conteine, or holde him, vntil the time that al thinges be restoared.* So saithe Cyrillus, Christus non poterat cum Apostolis versari in Carne, postquàm Ascendisset ad Patrem: *Christe coulde not be conuersante with his Apostles in the Fleashe, after he had Ascended vnto the Father.* Likewise saithe S. Augustine, Christus secundum Præsentiam Corporalem in Sole, in Luna, & in Cruce simul esse non potuit: *Christe, accordinge to the Presence of his Body, coulde not be in the Sunne, in the Moone, and on the Crosse at one time.* And againe, Ne dubites, Christum esse in aliquo loco Cœli, propter Veri Corporis modum: *Doubte not, but Christe is in semme One Place of Heauen, bicause of the measure or fourme of a very Body.* Therefore the Olde Learned Father Origen saithe, Non est Homo, qui est vbicunq; duo vel tres in eius nomine fuerint congregati: neque Homo nobiscum est omnibus diebus vsque ad consummationem sæculi: neque congregatis vbique fidelibus Homo est præsens: sed Virtus Diuina, quæ erat in Christo: *It is not Christe, as beinge Man, that is where so euer twoo or three be gathered togeather in his name: neither Christ, as beinge Man, is with vs al daies vnto the worldes ende: nor Christe, as beinge Man, is Present with the Faithful euerywhere gathered togeather: but that Diuine power (or Nature) that was in Christe.* And for that cause S. Augustine saithe, Videte Ascendentem: Credite in Absentem: Sperate Venientem: Sed tamen per Misericordiam occultam etiam sentite Præsentem: *See you Christe Ascendinge into Heauen: Beleeue in him beinge Absente: Truste in Christe, that is to comme: And yet by his secrete Mercie feele him Presente.* Thus, M. Hardinge, thus haue the Olde Catholique Learned Fathers vsed to grate, as yée terme it, vpon the Article of Christes Ascension.

Actor. 3.

Cyril. in Iohan. Lib. 11. Ca. 3.

Augustin. contra Faustum. Li. 20. Ca. 11.

August. ad Dardan. Epist. 57.

Origen in Matthe. Tract. 32.

Augustin. in Psalm. 46.

You say, S. Augustine in his Epistle to Dardanus, spake not of Christes Body, as it is nowe Present in the Sacrament. No maruele. For S. Augustine neuer vnderstoode any suche kinde of Presence. And who taughte you, M. Hardinge, that Christe hathe suche change of diuers Bodies: of one manner in the Sacrament, and of an other manner in Heauen? Christes Blessed Body, when it was borne of the Virgine, when it died, when it rose againe, when it Ascended into Heauen, was one, and vniforme. Howe became it afterwarde so diuerse, and so vnlike it selfe? If either Christe, or the Apostles, or the Ancient Fathers haue thus taughte you, why are they not alleged? If they haue not thus taughte you, howe came ye by this knowledge? Or if ye saie, ye knowe, that they knewe not, who wil beleue you?

Ye telle vs, that the Body of Christe in Heauen hathe the whole Stature, and Fourme, and Proportion of a Man. This is true: It is the Doctrine of the Apostles, and of the Ancient Doctoures of the Churche. But ye tel vs farther of your selfe, that the Body of Christ in the Sacrament is vtterly voide of al manner either Stature, or Fourme, or Proportion: that is to saie, is neither longe, nor shorte: nor bigge, nor lowe: nor thicke, nor thinne: and, beinge, as you saie, a very Natural Body, yet hathe neither likenesse, nor shape of a Body. This is your Doctrine, M. Hardinge: and the more vnlikely to be true, the more likely to be yours.

Suche fantastical imaginations the Arian Heretiques sommetime had of the Godhed of Christe. For thus they wrote thereof, as saithe Athanasius: Creatura est: sed non vt vlla ex rebus creatis: Opus est: sed non vt vllum ex Operibus: Res condita est: sed non vt vlla ex rebus conditis: *It is a Creature: but not as any other of thinges created: It is a thinge wrought: but not as any other thinge, that euer was wrought: &c.*

Athanas. contra Arianos Sermone. 3.

But

Fourme and Substance.

But what saithe Athanasius him selfe to al these fantasies? his answeare is this: Iam videtis vafritiem, & dolos istius Hæreseos, quæ non ignara, quam amarulenta sit ista sua malitia, fucos quærit, & lenocinium sibi mutuat ex verborum disertitudine: *Nowe yee see the crookednesse, and subtletie of this Heresie: whiche knowinge her owne malice howe bitter it is, borroweth somme hewe, and colour, by sleighte of woordes.*

Thus Flauianus reproueth the Heretique Eutyches, Adiecit & aliam impietatem, dicens, Corpus Domini, quod ex Maria factum est, non esse nostræ Substantiæ: *He added hereto an other wickednesse, saieinge, that the Body of Christe, that was borne of Maria, is not nowe of our Substance.* *Epistola Flauiani ad Leon. inter Leon. Epistolas.*

Leo resolueth the mater thus, Caro Christi ipsa est per Essentiam: non ipsa per Gloriam: *The Fleashe of Christe in Substance is nowe the same, it was before: but in Glorie it is not the same.* *Leo De Resurrect. Domini, Sermone. 1.*

Noman hereof writeth either more plainely, or more directly, then S. Augustine. His woordes be theise, Christus sic venturus est, quemadmodum ire visus est in Cœlum, id est, in eadem Carnis Forma, atq; Substantia: Cui profectò immortalitatem dedit, Naturam non abstulit. Secundum hanc Formam non est putandus vbique diffusus. Cauendum est enim, ne ita Diuinitatem astruamus Hominis, vt Veritatem Corporis auferamus: *Christe shal come againe (to Iudge) euen as he was seene goinge into Heauen, that is to saie, in the selfe same Fourme, and Substance of his Fleashe: Vnto whiche Fleashe vndoubtedly he hathe geuen Immortalitie: but he hathe not taken from it the Nature of Fleash. For wee muste take heede, wee doo not so maineteine the Godhead of Christe as Humanitie, that wee denie the Truthe of his Body.* *Augustin. ad Dardanum Epistola. 57.*

And where ye fantasie, that the Body of Christe in the Sacramente hathe in it selfe neither Fourme, nor Proportion, nor Limitation of place, nor Distinction of partes, S. Augustine telleth you, Spatia locorum tolle Corporibus, & nusquam erunt: & quia nusquam erunt, nec erunt. Tolle ipsa Corpora qualitatibus Corporum, non erit, vbi sint: & ideò necesse est, vt non sint: *Take awaie from Bodies Limitation of place, and the Bodies wil be nowhere: and bicause they be nowhere, they wil be nothinge. Take awaie from Bodies the qualities of Bodies, there wil bee no place for them to be in: and therefore the same Bodies muste needes be no Bodies at al.* Hereof wee maie conclude, that the Body of Christe, which you haue imagined to be contained Grossely, and Carnally in the Sacrament, for as mutche as, by your owne Confession, it hath neither Qualitie, nor Quantitie, nor Fourme, nor Place, nor Proportion of Body, therefore, by S. Augustines Doctrine, it is no Body. *Augustin. in cad. Epist. ad Dardanum.*

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ Here M. Hardinge answeareth: Bodies doubtlesse lefte to their own common Nature, haue alwaies the state, that S. Augustine speaketh of in his Epistle to Dardanus. But the pretious Body of Christe made present in the Sacrament, is not bounde to that state or condition. *M. Hardinge, Pag. 117.*

The Answeare. O M. Hardinge, when wil you learne to deale plainely? What speake you so vainely of Bodies leafte to their owne common Nature? Dothe not S. Augustine in the same his Epistle vnto Dardanus speake namely, and specially of the Body of Christe? I meane, of that moste glorious Body, that is nowe in Heauen, aboue al Powers, and Dominions at the right hande of the Father? Dothe not S. Augustine saie of the selfe same Body, Huic Corpori Immortalitatem dedit: Naturam non abstulit: Secundum hanc Formam Christus non est putandus vbique diffusus? *Vnto that same Body of Christe, God hathe geuen Immortalitie: yet hath he not taken from it the very Nature of a Body. After this fourme, or proportion of Body, we maie not thinke that Christe is extended, or spreadde into al places?* Doth not S. Augustine in the selfe same place saie, of the selfe same moste glorious Body of Christe, Christus Iesus vbique est per id, quod Deus: in Cœlo autem per id, quod Homo? *Christe Iesus is euerywhere, and in al places by waie of his Godhead: and in Heauen by waie of his Manhead?* Or dothe not S. Augustine saie of the selfe same Body, as he is alleged by Gratian, Corpus Christi, in quo resurrexit, in vno loco esse oportet? *The Body of Christe, wherein he rose againe muste needes be in One place?* Is not this that Body, whereof Dardanus moued his question? Is not this that Body, whereof S. Augustine maketh his answeare? Or had he any cause to speake of any other Body, but onely of this? *August ad Dardanum Epist.* *De Consecra. Dis. 2. Prima.*

Fourme and Substance.

But (you saie) The precious Body of Christe, made present in the Sacrament, is not bounde to that condition: These be your owne phantasies, M. Hardinge, not the woordes of S. Augustine. For S. Augustine neuer telde you of Christes Body made presente in the Sacramente. But thinke you, or woulde you haue your Reader to thinke, that Christe hathe suche change of Bodies, the one precious, the other not precious? Or that the Blessed Body of Christe is more precious, and glorious in the Sacrament, then it is in Heauen at the right hande of God? O howe matche better were it for you to speake the Truthe, and to leaue these Fables? Christes Body doubtlesse is nowe moste glorious, as beinge the Body of the Sonne of God, endewed with immortalitie, and ful of glorie: yet notwithstandinge it is a Body, and therfore in one place, as S. Augustine saithe, and not in many.

Here it is a woonder to see, what pretie sporte M. Hardinge maketh him selfe with the poore Penneman of this Apologie. As God woulde, the Simple Body vnwares alleged Fulgentius cleane against him selfe. For the woordes of Fulgentius be these: Christus, cum Absit à nobis per Formam Serui, tamen semper est nobiscum per Formam Dei: *Whereas Christe is Absent from vs by the Fourme of a Seruaunt, yet is he euermore Present with vs by the Fourme of God.* Whereby, saithe M. Hardinges Commentarie, he meaneth that Christe is no more here emong vs, in Fourme, and Shape of Man, in suche wise, as we see menne liue in the Earthe. And these woordes (saithe he) dashe their whole purpose: and therefore the Prelates of this newe Englishe Church, haue altered the sense of them, by shiftinge in this woorde (*Manheade*) in steede of (*the Fourme of a Seruaunte*) and this woorde (*Godhead*) in steede of (*the Fourme of God*).

I beseeche thee, Gentle Reader, spare me a litle thinc indifferente care, leaste in theese misty cloudes of M. Hardinges Distinctions, thou happen to wander, & lose thy waie. All this greate ado riseth onely of some notable difference, that is fansied to be betweene these two woordes, Fourme, and Substance. For M. Hardinge would faine haue thee beleeue, that the Substance of Christes Body is in many places: but the Fourme of the same Body can be onely in one place, and not in many.

If I shoulde demaunde M. Hardinge this question by the waie, wherefore Christes Body in Fourme maie not as wel be in many places togeather, as the same in Substance: or how he knoweth it: or what Doctour, or Father euer taught it: or how we maie be wel assured of it: perhappes he woulde take a daie, to consider it better. For thus a man might put him in minde of the groundes of his Religion: Sir, ye knowe, God is Omnipotent, and his power Infinite. Ye maie not make him thral, and subiecte to your senses. That were Natural Reason: that were Infidelitie. Christe is as wel hable to dispose of the Fourme of his Body, as of the Substance: and can as wel present the one in many places, as the other. Howe be it, thus muche onely by the waie.

M. Hardinge, Pag. 118. a.

Addition. To reporte al that maie be spoken in this behalfe, M. Hardinge thus frameth his newe obiection: The voice that is one in the Originie, pronounced by one man, if you wil beleeue Priscian that Anciente learned Grammarian, is a very Body. And yet the selfe same one voice is driuen into the eares of a thousand persons at once, as experience teacheth you by the common course of Nature. And yet you wil needes appointe the omnipotente power of God suche limites, as please you. *The Answeare.* Here, M. Hardinge, ye haue broken S. Augustines heade in fauour of Priscian. But alas, what harde shifte is this? What shoulde this poore sely Grammarian be brought for the, as a Champion, to proue matters in Diuinitie. Puste S. Augustine, S. Hierome, and S. Ambrose stande backe, and geue place vnto Priscian? Or if Priscian telle you, that a voice is a Body, wil you beleeue him? Certainely, M. Hardinge, as the voice of a man is a Body, so the Lighte in the ayre, and the chirpinge of a Sparrowe, and the bleatinge of a Sheepe is a Body, and your face in a glasse is likewise a Body. But Aristotle would haue tolde you, Sonus est qualitas sensibilis aëris: *A voice, or sounde, is a sensible qualitie of the ayre.* It is an Accidente, saithe Aristotle, and not a Body: In the Predicamente of Qualitie, and not of Substance. Thus ye confounde Nature, M. Hardinge, and builde vpon sande.

Addition

But

Fourme and Substance.

But you saie, Yee muste sende M. Iewel, beinge destitute of Faithe, vnto Aristotle, to learne witte of him. God encrease our Faithe, M. Hardinge, and supplie, that wanteth. I am not ashamed to learne witte, either of Aristotle, or of any the meanest of Goddes Creatures. Balaam might haue learned witte of his Asse. But if your selfe would goe to Aristotle, and telle him, that a voice is a Body, that is to saie, that an Accidente is a Substance, I trowe he would not greately commende your wisedome.

Howe be it, let a voice be a Body, and, to please your Priscian, let vs refuse no absurditie, nor repugnance in Nature. Yet is your purpose neuer the neare. For the Natural order of hearinge standeth thus, as it is agreed by al Philosophers, Firste the voice is a strikinge, or beatinge of the aire. Then the aire so striken, and procedinge from one mouthe, as from the Original, is multiplied forewarde by sundrie Circles, as wee se ringes multiplied in the water, at the castinge in of a stoane, and by meane of the saide Circles, the saide voice is driuen, and falleth into the eares of the hearers, and beinge but one at the firste, by multiplication is made many. And to this purpose S. Augustine saithe, Sonus per moras temporum tendi, & diuidi potest: *The sounde, or voice by leasure of time maie be extended a longe, and diuided into partes*, that is, to satisfie the sense of euery hearer. Therefore M. Hardinge, the voice, beinge one at the firste, and afterwarde by multiplication encreasinge, and fallinge into a thousande eares, is no more one voice in the ende, then a thousande eares are one eare. For euery eare receiueth seuerally his particuler voice: and as many as be the eares hearinge, so many in number be the voices.

These thinges, gentle Reader, are true, and certaine: Although perhaps vnsauery, and darke vnto the simple. But let M. Hardinge beare the blame hereof: For thus it pleased him to laie forthe his Philosophie out of Grammarians, and to teache thee, that a voice is a Body. And to sende vs to Aristotle to learne witte. Verily it is but a simple kinde of argueinge to reason thus:

One voice maie falle into many eares:

Ergo, the Body of Christe hath not the proportion of a Body.

But nowe, what if al this greate imagined Difference be no Difference? What if these two wordes, Fourme, and Substance, as they be vsed by Fulgentius, be al one? What then wil M. Hardinge do with his pretty Glose?

Verily Athanasius saithe thus: [a] Natura, Essentia, Genus, Forma Vnum sunt: *Nature, Substance, Kinde, and Fourme be al One thinge*. Leo saithe, [b] Quid est, In Forma Dei? In Natura Dei: *What is it, To be in the Fourme of God?* He answereth, *It is, To be in the Nature of God*. Chrysostome saithe, [c] Forma Dei, Natura Dei est: *The Fourme of God, is the Nature of God*. S. Augustine saithe, [d] Secundum Formam Dei Christus ipse de se loquitur: Ego & Pater Vnum sumus: *As concerninge the Fourme of God, Christe him selfe saithe of him selfe, I and my Father are bothe One*. [e] Likewise againe he saithe, Vna est Forma, quia vna est Diuinitas: *The Fourme is One, because the Godhed is One*.

In like sorte of the Fourme of a Seruant, [f] Leo saithe, Quæro quid sit Formam Serui accipere? Sine dubio Perfectionem Naturæ, & Conditionis Humanæ: *What is it, To take the Fourme of a Seruant?* He answereth, *Doubtlesse it is, To take the perfection of Nature, and state of man*. [g] Chrysostome saithe, Forma Serui Omnino est Natura Serui: *The Fourme of a Seruant verily is the Nature of a Seruant*. [h] S. Augustine saithe, Quando de Forma Serui in Christo cogitas, Humanam Effigiem cogita, si est in te Fides: *When thou thinkest of the Fourme of a Seruant in Christe, thinke of the Shape of a man, if there be any Faithe in thee*. [i] Againe, Christum secundum Humanitatem, Visibilem, Corporeum, Localem, atque omnia membra Humana veraciter habentem credere conuenit, & confiteri: *Wee muste beleeue, and confesse, that Christe accordinge to his Humanitie, is Visible, hath the Substance and Properties of a Body, is contained in Place, and verily hath al the members, and the whole Proportion of a man*. To leaue al others, [k] Haimo saith, Formam Serui accepit, id est, In Veritate Hominem accepit: *He tooke the Fourme of a Seruant, that is to saie, In very Truthe he tooke Man*.

Se ye, M. Hardinge, by these Testimonies of the Ancient Learned Fathers,

a Athanas. De Definitionib.
b Leo Epistle. 97 Cap. 3.
c Chrysostom. ad Philippen. Homil. 6.
d Augustin. De Tempor. Sermo. 177. De Ascensio. Sermo. 4.
e August. Epist. 177.
f Leo Epist. 97. Cap. 3.
g Chrysostom. ad Philip. Homil. 6.
h Augustin. in Iohan. Tract. 40
i Augustin. De Essentia Diuinitatis.
k Haimo. in Epist. ad Philip. Cap. 2.

farre contrarie to your vaine Distinction, that the Fourme of God is nothinge els, but God: and the Fourme of Man is nothinge els but Man. Wherefore then haue you thus diuised vs this newe Difference? Wherefore fate you of your owne head, that Fourme, and Substance be so contrarie, seinge the Catholique Fathers fate, they be bothe One? Or wherefore be you so buste, to trouble the Penneman without cause? Certainely S. Augustine ioineth Fourme and Substance bothe togeather, and by the one expounderh the other: In eadem Forma, atque Substantia: *In the same Fourme, and Substance:* and againe expounderh the same Fourme, Veritatem Corporis: *The truthe of a Body.*

Augustad Dardan. Epist. 57.

By these it is plaine, that when Fulgentius saithe, the Fourme of God, he meaneth thereby the Substance, the Nature, and the Diuinitie of God: And when he saithe, the Fourme of a Seruaunt, he meaneth likewise, the Nature, the Substance, the Truthe, the Perfection, and the Very Manhoode of a Man. And the whole drifte of his discourse is this, that Christe beinge bothe God, and Man, by the Nature, and Substance of his Godhead is everywhere: but by the Nature, and Substance of his Manhoode, and Truthe of his Body, is onely in one place, and not in more: agreinge therein with these wordes of S. Augustine before rehearsed, Corpus, in quo Resurrexit, in vno Loco esse Oportet: *The Body, wherein he rose againe, must needes be in one Place.* As for Real, or Bodily presence of Christes Body in the Sacramente, or the Body of Christe without Fourme, or Proportion of a Body, this Learned Father Fulgentius writeth nothinge. Neither was there any suche phantasie in those daies in the Churche of God.

De Consecra. Dist. 2. Prima.

Here we are terribly charged with guileful dealinge, with a special note also in the Margine, Fulgentius fowly falsified. We haue shifted in this worde, Manhed, in stede of, the Fourme of a Seruaunt: & this worde, Godhed, in stede of, the Fourme of God. And therefore both the Penneman, and the Prelates of our Newe Clergie muste nedes be brought for the before the barre.

I wil not here telle you, M. Hardinge, howe lewdely ye haue demeaned youre selfe towardes her, whom it liketh you so often, and so scornefully to calle the Lady Interpreter: a Lady, I wil not saie, of what Learninge, vertue, and grauitie: but certainely as far from al vnwomanly Presumption, wherewith ye so rudely touch her, as you are from al manly modestie: and for oughte, that maie appeare by theise toies, and trifles, ye haue sente vs ouer, as ful of wisedome, as you of folie.

But the Prelates of this Newe Clergie (you saie) haue foulp falsified both the wordes, & the sense of Fulgentius. And wherein, M. Hardinge? Forsothe in stede of these wordes, The Fourme of Man, &, the Fourme of God, for the better vnderstandinge of the vnlearned, they haue vsed theise wordes, as more commonly knowen, Godhed, and Manhed. If this be so foule a faulte, wherefore then is the Olde Father, & Martyr Vigilius suffered thus to saie, Dei Filius secundum Humanitatem suam recessit à nobis: Secundum Diuinitatem suam semper est nobiscum: *The Sonne of God accordinge to his Manhed is departed from vs: accordinge to his Godhed is euer with vs?* Or againe, Christus est vbiq; secundum Naturam Diuinitatis suæ: & loco continetur secundum Naturam Humanitatis suæ: *Christe is in al places accordinge to the Nature of his Godhed: and is conteined in One place, accordinge to the Nature of his Manhed.*

Vigilius Lib. 1. Contra Eutychetem.

Wherefore dothe Cyrillus saie, Secundum Carnem Solam abiturus erat: Adest autem semper virtute Deitatis: *Accordinge to the Fleashe Onely he woulde departe: But by the power of his Godhed he is euer presente.* Wherefore dothe Gregorie saie, Verbum Incarnatum Manet, & Recedit: Manet Diuinitate, Recedit Corpore: *The worde Incarnate both abideth with vs, and departeth from vs. It abideth with vs by the Godhed: It departeth from vs by the Body (or Manhed?)* Wherefore dothe S. Augustine saie, Ibat per id, quod Homo erat: Manebat per id, quod Deus erat. Ibat per id, quod Vno Loco erat: Manebat per id, quod vbique erat: *Christe departed by that he was Man: and aboade by that he was God. He departed by that, that was in* One Place: *He aboade by that, that is in al Places.*

Cyril. in Iohan. Lib 9. cap. 21.

Gregor. de Pascha Homil. 30.

Augustin. in Iohan. Tract. 78

If ye wil yet stande in doubte, what theise Holy Fathers meante by the Manhed of

hed of Christe, that departed from vs, let S. Augustine open bothe his owne, and theis meaninges. Thus he writeth in expresse and plaine wordes touchinge the same: Secundum Carnem, quam Verbum assumpsit: secundum id, quòd de Virgine natus est: Secundum id, quòd à Iudæis prehensus est: quòd ligno confixus: quod de Cruce depositus: quòd linteis inuolutus: quod in sepulchro conditus: quod in Resurrectione manifestatus, me non semper habebitis vobiscum: *Accordinge to the Fleashe, that the Woorde receiued: accordinge to that, he was borne of the Virgine: accordinge to that, he was taken of the Iewes: Accordinge to that, he was nailed to the Tree, taken downe from the Crosse, lapte in a sheete, laide in the graue, and was declared in his Resurrection* (these wordes are true) *Ye shal not haue me alwaies with you*. Likewise againe he saithe, Dominus noster absentauit se Corpore ab omni Ecclesia, & Ascendit in Cœlum: *Our Lorde, as touchinge his Body, Absented him selfe from his whole Churche, and Ascended into Heauen*.

Augustin in Iohan. tracta. 50.

Augustin. in Sermo. in feri. 2. Paschat.

To be shorte, if it be so hainous an errour in this case to vse these wordes, Godhed, and Manhed, wherefore is not Fulgentius him selfe reproued for so often vsinge the same? These be his wordes, Secundum Humanitatem suam, Localiter erat in Terra: Secundū Diuinitatem, & Cœlum impleuit, & Terram. Vera Humanitas Christi Localis est: Vera Diuinitas semper immensa est. Caro Christi absque dubitatione Localis est: Diuinitas tamen eius vbique semper est. Permansit in Christo Immensa Diuinitas: Suscepta est ab eo Localis Humanitas. Quomodo Ascendit in Cœlum, nisi quia Localis, & Verus est Homo? Quomodo adest Fidelibus, nisi quia idem Immensus, & Verus est Deus? *Christe accordinge to his Manhoode, was placed in Earthe: but accordinge to his Godhed he filled bothe Heauen, and Earthe. The Manhoode of Christe is conteined in Place: The Godhed of Christe is Infinite, and in al places. The Fleashe of Christe is doubteleſſe in (One) place: The Godhead of Christe is for euer in euery place. There remained stil in Christe the Infinite Godhead: There was receiued of him a Local Manhoode. Howe Ascended he into Heauen, sauinge that he is very Man conteined in Place? Howe is he present with the Faithful, sauinge that he is Infinite, and True God?* Lastly of al he saithe, Vnus idemq; Christus, Secundum Humanam Substantiam, aberat Cœlo, cùm esset in Terra: & dereliquit Terram, cùm Ascendisset in Cœlum: *Christe beinge One, accordinge to the Substance of his Manhoode, was absent from Heauen, when he was in Earthe: and forsoke the Earthe, when he Ascended into Heauen*.

Fulgentius ad Regem Thrasymun. Li. 2.

Thus many times, M. Hardinge, we haue these wordes in one place togeather in Fulgentius him selfe: The Godhed: the Manhoode: very God: very Man: The Fleashe of Christe: The Substance of the Manhoode. And these be the selfe same wordes that you reproue.

Blotte out therefore for shame that vnaduised note in your Margine: Looke better to your Booke: Worke hereafter more discretely: and trouble not, neither Pennemenne, nor others, without cause. Otherwise the Penneman wil tel you, what birde bare the feather, that made you a Penne.

The Apologie, Cap. 1. Diuision. 2.

Wee beleeue that the Holy Ghoste, who is the thirde Person in the Holy Trinitie, is very God: not made, not created, not begotten, but proceedinge from bothe the Father, & the Sonne, by a certaine meane vnknowen vnto man, and vnspeakeable: and that it is his propertie to mollifie, and soften the hardnesse of mannes harte, when he is once receiued thereinto, either by the holesome preachinge of the Gospel, or by any other waie: that he doth geue menne light, and guide them vnto the knowledge of God: to al waie of Truthe: to newnesse of the whole life: and to euerlastinge hope of Saluation.

M. Hardinge.

As wee acknowledge this article to be true and Catholike, so wee demaunde of these Defenders, howe they can proue the same. Haue they either expresse Scripture for it, or any of the firste foure General Councels, whiche be esteemed of moste Authoritie? * VVe are sure they haue not. Therefore

*Vntruthe. As shal appeare.

The Holy Ghoste is God.

Therefore wee doo them to vnderstande, and if they heare vs not, wee aduertise the Readers, that feare God, and loue his truthe, that al truthe necessarily to be beleued is not * expressed in the Scripture: and that * other Councels be to be receiued besides the foure firste, whiche are allowed in Englande by Parlament.

*O folie. VVho euer said otherwise?

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Consider, M. Hardinge, notwithstandinge ye euermore tel vs of Fathers, Fathers, yet how contrarie oftentimes ye are in iudgement to the same Fathers. You saie, as here wee maie geather by your wordes, that the Godhed of the Holy Ghost cannot be proued by expresse Wordes of the Scriptures: and thereof, ye saie, ye are right sure. Yet S. Augustine nothinge doubteth, but it maie wel be proued by plaine Scriptures. Thus he saithe, Spiritus Sanctus est Deus. Vnde Petrus, cùm dixisset, Ausus es mentiri Spiritui Sancto, continuò sequutus adiunxit, quid esset Spiritus Sanctus, & ait, Non es mentitus Hominibus, sed Deo: *The Holy Ghost is God. Therefore* Peter *when he had saide* (vnto Ananias) *thou haste enterprised to lie to the Holy Ghoste, he followed readily, and tolde him, what was the Holy Ghoste: and saide, Thou haste not lied vnto Man, but vnto God.*

Augustin, contra Literas Petiliani, Li. 3. Ca. 48.

Againe he saithe, Ostendit Paulus, Deum esse Spiritum Sanctum, & ideò non esse Creaturam: S. Paule *sheweth vs, that the Holy Ghoste is God: and therefore is no Creature.* Likewise againe he saithe, Ne quisquam Spiritum Sanctum negaret Deum, continuò sequutus ait, Glorificate, & portate Deum in Corpore vestro: *Least any man shoulde denie, that the Holy Ghoste is God*, Paule *added immediately these woordes: Glorifie you therefore, and beare God in your Body.* Here haue wee S. Augustines Yea, and M. Hardinges Nay. S. Augustine assureth vs, he hath Scriptures, to proue the Godhed of the Holy Ghoste: M. Hardinge saithe, wee are sure, he hath none at al. Iudge thou nowe, Gentle Reader, whether of these Doctours thou wilt beleeue.

Augustin. De Morib. Eccle. Catholi. Li. 1. Cap. 16.

Augustin. Epistol. 174.

But what a vaine vanitie, and folie is this? wil M. Hardinge haue vs beleeue, that God cannot be God, onlesse he be allowed by the Churche of Rome, and by the Pope? Then are wee come againe to that, that Tertullian writeth merily of the Heathens: Nisi Homini Deus placuerit, Deus non erit: Homo iam Deo propitius esse debebit: *Onlesse God please Man wel* (though he be God) *he shal be no God. And so vnwe Man muste be friendly, and fauourable vnto God.*

Tertull. in Apologetico.

Wee beleeue, M. Hardinge, that the Holy Ghost is very God in deede, not vpon the Popes, or his Clergies credite, but, as S. Augustine saithe, vpon the special warrante of the Worde of God.

And therefore Nazianzene saithe, Dicet aliquis, non esse scriptum, Spiritum Sanctum esse Deum. Atqui proponetur tibi examen Testimoniorum, ex quibus ostendetur, Diuinitatem Sancti Spiritus testatam esse in Sacris Literis: nisi quis valde insulsus sit, & alienus à Spiritu Sancto: *Somme Man wil saie, It is not written, that the Holy Ghost is God. I wil bringe thee foorthe a whole Swarme of Authorities, whereby it shal wel appeare, that the Godhed of the Holy Ghoste is plainely witnessed in the Holy Scriptures: Onlesse a Man be very dul, and vtterly voide of the Holy Ghoste.*

Nazianzen. De Spiritu sancto. ὅτι καὶ λέγη ἔγγραφος ἡ τοῦ πνεύματος θεότης ἐκ πολλῶν δείξω σοι.

The Apologie, Cap. 2. Diuision. 1.

Wee beleeue, that there is one Churche of God, and that the same is not shutte vp (as in times paste emong the Iewes) into some One corner or Kingdome, but that it is Catholique, and Vniuersal, and dispersed throughout the whole worlde. So that there is nowe no Nation, whiche maie truely complaine, that they be shutte foorthe, and maie not be one of the Churche and people of God: and that this Churche is the Kingdome, the Body, and the Spouse of Christe: that Christe alone is the Prince of this Kingdome: that Christe alone is the Heade of this Body: and that Christe alone is the Bridegroome of this Spouse.

M. Hardinge.

It is a worlde to see these Defenders: They, whiche haue not kepte Vnitie of Spirite in the bande of Charitie, whiche S. Paule requireth, but haue seuered them selues from the Body of the Churche, tel vs nowe forsouthe, they beleeue, that there is one Churche of God. But what maie wee thinke Ephes. 4.

thinke this one Churche to be? Can they seeme to meane any other (what so euer they pretende) then this newe Churche of late yeeres, set vp by Sathan, through the ministerie of Martine Luther and those other Apostates his companions, if it maie be named a Churche, and not rather a Babylonical Tower? For as touchinge that Churche, whereof (a) al Christen people hath euer taken the Successour of Peter to be the Heade vnder Christe, whiche is the true Catholike Churche, in their Apologie they sticke not to saie plainely, that it is cleane fallen downe longe agone. And therefore the beginninge of Luthers Sedicions, and Heretical preachinge they cal Herbam, as muche to saie, as the greene Grasse, or firste springe (this interpreter nameth it the very firste appearinge) of the Gospel, leafe. F. 7. And in the leafe. F. 8. they saie that fortie yeeres agone and vpwarde, that is at the firste settinge foorth of Luther and Zuinglius, the Truthe was vnknowen an vnheard of, and that they firste came to the knowledge and preachinge of the Gospel. Likewise in an other place they graunt, that certaine and very strange sectes haue benne stirringe in the worlde euer since the Gospel did springe, meaninge the time when Luther firste brooched to Germanie the poysoned Cuppe of his Heresies, Blasphemies, and Sathanismes.

(a) Vntruth. For the Fathers in the Primitiue Churche neuer toke him so.

Looke in the leafe H. 7. b.

Leafe L. 2. In Latine they terme it, eorum Euangelij.

Thus hauinge condemned the Churche of God, which was before Luthers time, and allowinge that for the true Churche, the Gospel whereof firste sprange out of Luther: howe can they auoouche their beleefe, and by what reason and learninge can they make good, that there is one Churche of God? VVee woulde faine knowe, whiche and where it is, Is Luther and his Congregation that one Churche of God, or Zuinglius and his rable, or Osiander and his sorte, or Zuenckfeldius and his secte, or Stancarus and his bande, or Balthasar Pacimontane and his rancke? For al these, and certaine other sectes haue (b) Luther for their founder, and for their Radix Iesse, as it were, from whence they springe. And in deede euery learned man easely seeth, how the gutters of their Doctrines runne out of Luthers sincke. Of al these there is none, but stoutly claimeth the name of the Churche.

(b) Vntruth. As shal appeare.

Then howe saie ye, Defenders, whiche Churche be ye? name the Childe. If ye name one, wee sette the others againste you. &c.

Howe often in his Bookes putteth Luther you, and your Captaines in the rolle of those, that he vtterly condemneth, naminge roundly togeather, Infideles, Turkes, Epicures, Heretikes, Papistes, Sacramentaries? And nowe if he should heare you chalenge the name of the one Churche of God to you, and denie him and his followers that claimed title: would he not (thinke yee) stampe and rage, would he not wheete his dogge eloquence vpon you, and cal you woorse then these aboue reckened, yea and if he wist howe, woorse then some of you be your selues? The like courtesie maie yee looke for at those other sectes, of whiche euery one claimeth the name of this one Churche of God.

But ye saie, that this One Churche is not shutte vp into some one corner, or Kingedome, but that it is Catholike, and Vniuersal, and dispersed through out the whole worlde. True it is, that ye saie, what so euer ye thinke. But the Holy learned and auncient Fathers, where they cal and beleeue the Catholike Churche, they meane (as Vincentius Lirinensis declareth) the Churche to be Catholike, that is to saie, Vniuersal, (for so the woorde signifieth) in respecte of a threefolde Vniuersalitie: of places, whiche this Defender here toucheth: of times, and of men, whiche he toucheth not. In the Catholike Churche wee muste haue a greate care (saithe he,) that wee holde that, whiche hath euerywhere, euermore, and of al Persons beene beleeued. If these Defenders proue not the Churche, they professe them selues to be of, to haue this threefolde Vniuersalitie, then is their Congregation not this one Churche, nor of this one Churche of God, but the Synagog of Antichriste.

Catholike Churche. Why is the Churche called Catholike.

And although the Authours of this Apologie crake of the greate increase, and spreddinge abroade of their Gospel, and nowe glorie in the number of Kingedomes, Dukedomes, Countries, common VVeales, and Free Cities: Yet hath it not gone so farre abroade as the Arians heresie did by three partes of foure: VVhiche was at length vtterly extinguished, as this shal be.

That the Catholike Churche is the Kingdome, the Body and the Spouse of Christe, we acknowledge. Of the same Kingdome wee confesse and beleeue Christe to be Prince alone, so as he is Heade of this Body alone, and so as he is Bridegrome of this Spouse alone. For Heade and Spouse alone he is in one respect, not alone in an other respect. Accordinge to the inwarde influence of Grace, Christ properly and onely is Heade of his Mystical Body the Churche: But as touchinge the outwarde Gouernment, the beinge of a Head is common to Christe with others. For in this respect certaine others maie be called Heads of the Churche, as in Amos the Prophete, the * greate States be called the Heads of the People. So the Scripture speaketh of Kinge Saule, VVhen thou were a litle one in thine owne eies, thou waste made Head emonge the Tribes of Israel. So Dauid saithe of him selfe, he hath made me Head of Nations.

Christe alone Prince, Heade, Bridegrom, Spouse of the Church

*Amos. 6.

1. Reg. 15. Psal. 17.

Men be called Heades, in as muche as they be in steede of Christe, and vnder Christe after which meaninge S. Paule saithe to the Corinthians, For if I forgaue any thinge, to whome I forgaue it, for your sakes forgaue I it, *In persona Christi*, In the Person of Christe. And in an other place, VVee are Ambassadours in steede of Christe, euen as though God did exhorte you through vs. To conclude in fewe, accordinge to inwarde influence of grace into euery faithful member, Christe onely is Head of the Churche: accordinge to outwarde gouerninge, the (c) Pope vnder Christe and in steede of Christe is Head of the same.

2. Cor. 2.

(c) Vntruthe. VVhat Scripture, or Doctour euer saide so?

As touchinge the Bridegromeship, wee saie and beleeue, that if wee woulde speake properly, Christe is the onely Bridegrome of the Churche his Spouse, of whome it is saide, he that hath a Spouse, is a Bridegrome. For from out of the Churche he begetteth children to him selfe. But others are called Bridegromes woorkinge togeather with Christe outwardly to the begettinge of spiritual children,

2. Cor. 3. Christ the true Bridegrome, the Ephes.

Catholique in many, or fewe.

children, whome neuertheleſſe they begette not to them ſelues, but to Chriſte. And ſuche are called the miniſters of the Bridegrome, in as muche as they doo his ſteede. And therefore the Pope, who is in ſteede of Chriſte the Bridegrome of the whole Churche, is (d) called alſo the Bridegrome of the vniuerſal Churche: a man maie terme him the vicegerent Bridegrome.

Pope vnder bridegrome of the Churche. Ioan. 3.

(d) Vanuth. For the Auncient Fathers neuer called him ſo.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie:

I truſte, Gentle Reader, thou wilt not looke, I ſhoulde anſweare al M. Hardinges ordinarie idle talke. So ſhould I loſe good time without cauſe, and be ouer troubleſome to thine eares. O, ſaithe he, What a worlde it is, to ſee theſe Defenders? They, which haue not kepte the vnitie of the Sprite, in the bande of Charitie, which S. Paule requireth, but haue ſeuered them ſelues from the Body of the Churche, tel vs nowe forſooths, that they beleeue, that there is one Churche of God. M. Hardinge, if we haue herein laide il, then beare witneſſe of the il: If we haue ſaide wel, wherefore make you theſe bitter outcries? What ſo euer ye haue conceiued vs to be, yet might ye ſuffer vs quietly to ſaie the Truthe, ſpecially ſuche Truthe, as you imagine maketh ſo muche for your ſelfe.

Ye ſaie, we confeſſe, that our Churche beganne onely aboute fourtie yeres ſithence, and was neuer before. No, M. Hardinge, we confeſſe it not: and you your ſelfe wel knowe, we confeſſe it not. It is your tale: it is not ours. We ſaie, and haue ſufficiently proued, and you knowe it right wel, if ye would be knowen of that ye knowe, that our Doctrine is the Olde, and yours is the Newe. If ye will needes force your ſelfe to the denial, it maie eaſily be proued, and that by ſuche Authorities, as your ſelfe may not wel denie: onleſſe ye wil once againe do nowe, as ye haue twiſe done before.

We ſaie, that our Doctrine, and the order of our Churches is elder then yours by fiue hundred whole yeres and more. If ye wil not beleeue vs, yet beleeue M. Hardinge: he wil tel you euen the ſame. Marke wel his wordes: Theſe they be:

M. Har. fol. 15. a

It ſtandeth not with Chriſte his promiſes made to the Churche, that he ſhould ſuffer his Churche to continue in darkeneſſe theſe thouſande yeeres paſte.

And thus by ſecrete confeſſion, he teacheth vs fiue hundred threſcore and ſixe whole yeres at the leaſt: that is to ſaie, the whole time of Chriſte, of his Apoſtles, and of al the Godly Learned Doctours, and Fathers of the Primitiue Churche. Whiche time notwithſtandinge is thought a great deale better, and purer, then al the time, that hath followed afterwarde. In this Diotiſion M. Hardinge beinge attente, and eger vpon his cauſe, and claiminge as muche, as he thought with any modeſtie he might be hable, hath claimed to him ſelfe onely a thouſande yeres of the night: and hath leafte vs welneare fiue hundred yeres of the daie.

This is your owne witneſſe, M. Hardinge: Conſider wel of it. It is your owne. Therefore ye do your ſelfe greate wronge, and muche defface your owne credite, to ſuddainely to ſaie, our Doctrine is Newe. Gods name be bleſſed, it hath the Teſtimonie, not onely of Chriſte, and his Apoſtles, but alſo of the olde Learned Catholique Fathers of the Churche. And this is it, that ſo muche greeueth you, that we reſtourine our Churches nowe accordinge to the paterne, or ſamplar of Chriſtes, and his Apoſtles firſte Inſtitution. For thereby the diſorder, and deformitie of your Churches the more appeareth.

Vincentius Lirinenſis.

Lirinenſis ſaithe, *That thinge muſte be holden for Catholique, that euerywhere, euermore, and of al menne hath benne beleeued.* Theſe general notes muſte be limited with this ſpecial reſtrainte: Where as the Churches were not corrupted. For otherwiſe there was neuer any Doctrine ſo Catholique, no not the Confeſſed Doctrine of Chriſte him ſelfe, that hath benne receiued, Euermore, and, Euerywhere, and of al menne without any exception. For the Turkes receiue it not, and the Iewes abhorre it. And ſo the very Goſpel of Chriſte it ſelfe by this rule ſhould not be Catholique. But, M. Hardinge, theſe ſelfe ſame notes of Lirinenſis vtterly ouerthrowe the greateſt parte of that whole Doctrine, that you would ſo faine haue counted Catholique. For neither reacheth it within fiue hundred yeres of the Apoſtles time: nor hath it that Antiquitie in deede, that in face, and countenaunce is pretended, as it is plaine by your owne former Confeſſion: nor was it euer vniuerſally receiued, as hereafter by Particulares it ſhal be proued. It had neuer that vniuerſalitie,

neither

Catholique in many, or fewe.

neither of al times, and ages: nor of al places, and countries: nor was it euer vniuersally receiued and allowed of al men. Therefore, what so euer ye cal it, ye cannot by your owne Definition cal it Catholique.

The Catholique Churche of God standeth not in multitude of Persones, but in weight of Truthe. Otherwise Christe him selfe, and his Apostles had not bene Catholique. For his flocke was very litle: and the Catholique, or Vniuersal consente of the World stoode against it. The Churche of God is compared to the Mone: for that she wareth, and waneth, as the Mone dothe, and sometime is ful, sometime is emptie: and therefore, as S. Augustine saithe, is called Catholica, quia Vniuersaliter perfecta est, & in nullo claudicat, & per totum Orbem diffusa est: *Because she is Vniuersally perfite, and halteth in nothinge, and is* (not now shut vp in one onely Countrie, as was the Churche of the Iewes, but) *powred throughout the whole Worlde.* Though the factes of menne haue often changes, yet Gods Truthe is euermore one: and, be it in many, or in fewe, is euer Catholique. Thus, M. Hardinge, it is written by one of your owne sort: Etsi non nisi duo viri fideles remanerent in Mundo, tamen in eis saluare tur Ecclesia, quæ est Vnitas Fidelium: *Although there were but two Faithefull menne remaininge in the worlde, yet euen in them twoo the Churche, whiche is the Vnitie of the Faithfull, shoulde be saued.*

Augustin. de Genes. ad litter. Cap. 1.

Fortalitium Fidei, Li. 5.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ Some saie, that at the time of Christes Passion, the whole Faithe remained onely in the Blessed Virgine our Ladie: and that euen nowe the same Faithe maie be so streited, that it maie reste onely in one poore olde woman. Whiche thinge if it shoulde happen, yet should not Goddes Truthe therefore wander aboute the worlde, as it liketh you to ieste, Tanquam Accidens sine Subiecto. The Prophete Osee saithe, *There is no Truthe, there is no mercie, there is no knowledge of God in the Earthe.* Yet notwithstandinge the Prophete Dauid saithe, *The Truthe of God endureth for euer. God is True, though al menne be false. His Truthe is a Substance, and standeth mightily as the Heauens: it wandereth not vainely, as an Accidente.* ☜

Æneas Syluius De gestis Concilij Basiliensis, lib. 1. M. Har. pag. 126. a Osee. 4. Psalm. 116. Rom. 3.

Luthers dogge eloquence, for so, M. Hardinge, it liketh you of your modestie to cal it, were it neuer so roughe, and vehement, the iuste zeale of Gods glorie, and of his Holy Temple, whiche you so miserablie had defaced, so enforcinge him, yet was it neuer any thinge comparable to your eloquence. For, I beseeche you, if ye maie haue leasure, harken a litle, and heare your selfe talke. Beholde your owne wordes, so many, so vaine, so bitter, so fierie, so furious, al togeather in one place: This newe Churche, ye saie, set vp by Sathan: Martine Luther, and other Apostates his companions: This Babylonical Tower: Luthers seditious, and Heretical preachinge: Luther brinced to Germanie the poisoned Cuppe of his Heresies, Blasphemies, and Sathanismes: Zuinglius, and his rable: The gutters of this Doctrine runne out of Luthers sinche: Luther woulde stampe, and rage, and whette his dogge eloquence vpon you: You are the Synagog of Antichriste: These be the Figures, & Flowers of your speache. Yet muste we thinke, that ye can neither stampe, nor rage: but vse onely Angelles eloquence. Howe be it, I truste, no wise man wil iudge our cause the worse, for that your tongue can so readily serue to speake il.

To the mater, ye saie, that, touchinge the influence of Grace, Christe is the Head of the Churche: but touchinge Direction, and Gouernment, the Pope onely is the Heade. Al this is but your owne tale, M. Hardinge: Ye speake it onely of your selfe. Other Authoritie of Scripture, or Doctour ye bringe vs none.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ Here M. Hardinge allegeth sundrie Authorities to proue the Vniuersal Supremacie of the Pope. Chrysostome, saithe he, writeth thus, Peter, *beinge a Fisher, is the Head, and Feeder of the Churche.* And againe, Peter *was the Maister of the Worlde.* And againe, *Christe made Peter Ruler ouer al the Worlde.* In the ende, he concludeth with good likinge of his case, and saithe: Howe saie you, are ye contented nowe?

M. Har. pa 131. a Chrysost in Mat. Homil. 87. In Matthæ. Homil. 55.

The Answeare. No doubte, M. Hardinge: Otherwise, I trowe I were to blame. For here haue you brought vs greate, and worthy speeches of S. Peter: of whose Authoritie we moued no question. But pe bringe vs not one worde of the Pope. If euery worde spoken to Peter, should be applied vnto the Pope, then should the Pope be called Satan: for so Christe called Peter.

Matthæ. 16.

Neither do theise wordes here alleged, proue of necessitie, that Peter him selfe was the Head, and Ruler of al the worlde. For you maie finde the same wordes applied as wel to S. Iames, to S. Paule, and to sundrie other Holy Fathers. Clemens saithe thus, *Clemens epist. 1.* *I sende greetinge vnto* Iames, *the brother of our Lorde, And the Bishop of Bishoppes, Governour of the Holy Churche of the Iewes at* Hierusalem, *and also of al the Churches that by Goddes providence are euery where founded.* Here S. Iames is Head of al Churches what so euer. Likewise Chrysostome writeth of S. Paule: *Chrysost. in Act. Homi. 3.* *The Nation of the Iewes, was committed to* Michael. *But bothe Landes, and Sea, and the habitation of al the worlde, is committed to* S. Paule. Likewise S. Gregorie saithe, Paule *had the Princehood of al the whole Churche.* So S. Hierome calleth Origen, Magistrum Ecclesiarum: *Gregor. in 1. Reg. Li 4. ca. 4.* *The Maister, and Teacher of the Churches.* And in like maner Theodoretus calleth S. Chrysostome, Doctorem orbis terrarum, *Hieronym. De locis Hebraicis.* *The Teacher, and Instructer of al the worlde.* Yet neither Iames, nor Paule, nor Origene, nor Chrysostome, were Bishoppes of Rome, nor had they that power, that by theise wordes is pretended. *Theodoret. Li. 5. Cap. 32.*

It is greate folie, to claime the Popes Authoritie by suche general wordes, as maie be common to so manie.

Ye saie, S. Paule saithe, *2. Corinth. 2.* *Yf I forgaue any thinge, for your sakes I forgaue it, in the persone of Christe: VVe are Embassadours in the steede of Christ, euen as though God did exhorte you through vs.* *2. Corinth. 5.* Hereof ye conclude, Ergo, The Pope vnder Christe, and in steede of Christe is Heade of the Churche. Yf ye conclude not thus, ye wander idely, and speake in vaine, and conclude nothinge. Theise wordes of S. Paule nothinge touche the Pope, but onely the faithful, and zelous Preacher of the Gospel. For wherein dothe the Pope resemble S. Paule? Wherein dothe he represente the Persone of Christe? What exhorteth he? What teacheth he? What saithe he? What dothe he? And yet if he would do anie one parte of his whole dutie, how might this Argument stande for good? S. Paule beinge at the Cittie of Philippi in Macedonia, exhorted the Corinthians, as in the Persone of Christe: Ergo, the Pope beinge at Rome in Italie, although he neither exhorte, nor preache, yet is he the Head of the Vniuersal Churche? Although Diuinitie goe harde with you, yet ye shoulde haue seene better to your Logique.

I graunte, Bishoppes maie be called the Heades of theire seuerall Churches. So Chrysostome calleth [a] Elias, Caput Prophetarum, *The Heade of the Prophetes:* So Amos saithe, [b] *The Princes are the Heades of the people:* So Saule is called [c] *The Heade of the Tribes of* Israel: So Dauid was made [d] Caput Gentium, *The Heade of Nations.* Sundrie suche other like examples, I alleged in my Former [e] Replie to M. Hardinge: As that Cyrillus the Bishop of Alexandria, in the Councel of Ephesus was called [f] Caput Episcoporum congregatorum, *The Head of the Bishoppes, that there were assembled:* That S Gregorie saithe, [g] Paulus ad Christum conuersus, Caput effectus est Nationum: Paule *beinge once conuerted to Christe, was made the Head of Nations:* That Prudentius saithe, [h] Sancta Bethlem Caput est orbis: *Holy* Bethlem *is the Heade of the worlde.* In this sense Optatus saithe, [i] *There be foure sortes of Heades in the Churche, the Bishoppes, the Priestes, the Deacons, the Faithful.* And al this onely in a certaine kinde of phrase, and maner of speache. But in deede and verily S. Augustine saithe, [k] Paulus ipse non poterat Caput esse eorum, quos plantauerat: Paule *him selfe coulde not be the Head of them, whome he had planted.* Therefore Gregorie saithe, [l] Petrus Apostolus Primum Membrum Sanctæ & Vniuersalis Ecclesiæ est. Paulus, Andreas, Iohannes, quid aliud, quàm singularium sunt plebium Capita? Tamen sub Vno Capite, omnes Membra sunt Ecclesiæ. Atque vt cuncta breui cingulo loquutionis astringam, Sancti ante Legem, Sancti in Lege, Sancti sub Gratia: Omnes hi perficientes Corpus Domini in Membris sunt Ecclesiæ constituti. Et nemo se vnquam Vniuersalem vocari voluit: Peter *the Apostle is* (not the Head, but) *the chiefe Member of the Holy Vniuersal Churche. Paule, Andrewe, and Iohn, what are they els, but the Heades of seuerall Nations? Yet notwithstandinge vnder one Head* (Christe) *they are al Members of the Churche. And to speake shortely, the Sainctes before the Lawe, the Sainctes in the Lawe, the Sainctes in the time of Grace, al accomplishinge the Lordes Body, are placed emonge the Members of the Churche. And there was neuer yet one, that woulde haue him selfe called the*

a *Chrysostom. in Epist. ad Roma. hom. 18.*
b *Amos. 6.*
c *1. Regum. 15.*
d *Psalm. 17.*
e *Articul. 4. Diui. 32.*
f *Cyril. tomo. 4. Epist. 5.*
g *Gregor. in 1. Reg. li. 4. ca. 4.*
h *Prudentius in Encheridio.*
i *Optatus Lib. 1 & 2.*
k *Augustl. contra Liter. Petil. Lib. 1. Ca. 5.*
l *Gregor. Lib. 4. Epist. 38.*
Peter was a Member of the Churche but not the Heade.

Vniuersal

Vniuerſal Biſhop. Therefore, where as M. Hardinge ſaithe, Al Chriſtian People haue euer taken the Succeſſour of Peter to be the Heade of the Catholique Courche vnder Chriſte, he ſpeaketh it onely of him ſelfe. And though the compariſon be odious, yet Chriſte ſaithe, Cùm loquitur mendacium, ex propriis loquitur: *When he ſpeaketh Vntruthe, he ſpeaketh it of his owne*. S. Gregorie ſaithe, Peter *was the chiefe Member of the Churche of Chriſte:* but not the Heade. Iohan. 8.

But the Biſhop of Rome, and his hired Proctours, haue taught vs far otherwiſe. Panormitane ſaithe: Chriſtus & Papa faciunt vnum Conſiſtorium: &, excepto peccato, poteſt Papa quaſi omnia facere, quæ poteſt Deus: *Chriſte, and the Pope make one Conſiſtorie, and keepe one Courte: And, ſinne onely excepted, the Pope in a maner can doo al things, that God can doo*. This, I trowe, is that Heade of Direction, and Gouernemente, that M. Hardinge meaneth. De Electione, Ca. Licet. Abb.

As for the reſte, that the Churche is the Kingedome of Chriſte, and the Pope the Prince thereof, M. Hardinge in ſpecial wordes anſweareth nothinge. Notwithſtandinge, ſomme others haue ſaide, Petro & Cœleſtis, & Terreni Imperij iura commiſſa ſunt: *Vnto* Peter *was committed the right bothe of the Heauenly, and alſo of the Earthly Empire*. Extra. Nouit ille, in gloſſ.

Laſt of al he doubteth not, but the Pope maie be called the Spouſe, or Bridegrome of the Vniuerſal Churche: and yet the ſame without the Authoritie of any Doctour. He allegeth onely S. Bernarde: But the ſame S. Bernarde in the ſelfe ſame place ſaithe, and that by M. Hardinges owne confeſſion, that the Pope is not the Bridegrome of the Churche. And therefore he was faine to expounde his meaninge, and to weighe him downe of the other ſide with his prette Gloſe. But S. Bernarde, without Gloſe ſaithe plainely, Non ſunt omnes amici Sponſi, qui hodiè ſunt Sponſi Eccleſiæ: *They be not al the Bridegromes friendes, that are this daie the Spouſes of the Churche*. O miſerandam Sponſam talibus creditam Paranymphis. Non amici Sponſi, ſed æmuli ſunt: *O miſerable is that Spouſe, that is committed to ſuche Leaders. They are not the friendes, they are the enimies of the Bridegrome*. Bernard. In Concil. Remenſi. Bernard. ad Eugeni. de Conſidera. Li. 3.

Holde it, we neede not greatly to reche, what ſtiles, and titles the Pope can vouchſafe to allowe him ſelfe. As he maie be called the Heade, the Prince, and the Spouſe: euen ſo, and by like authoritie, and truthe, maie he be called the Light, the Life, the Sauiour, and the God of the Churche.

God geue him an harte to vnderſtande, that he maie be, although not the Heade, yet a Member of that Body, although not the Prince, yet a Subiect in that Kingedome: although not the Bridegrome, yet a Childe of the Churche of God.

The Apologie, Cap. 3. Diuiſion. 1.

Furthermore (wee Beleue) that there be diuerſe degrees of Miniſters in the Churche: whereof ſome be Deacons, ſome Prieſtes, ſome Biſhoppes: to whome is committed the office to inſtructe the people, and the whole charge, and ſettinge foorthe of Religion.

M. Hardinge.

Here it had benne your parte to haue declared your faithe touchinge the Holy Sacrament of Order, agreable to the faithe of the Catholike Churche: That there be ſeuen orders in the Churche, foure leſſer, and three greater: for ſo by good reaſon they are called. And as for the inſtitution, auctoritie, and eſtimation of the greater, ſpecially of Prieſtehoode and Deaconſhip, ye might haue alleged the Scriptures: ſo for the Leſſer the example of Chriſte, the Tradition of the Apoſtles, and the teſtimonies written of the Apoſtles ſcollers, of thoſe that bothe next, and ſoone after followed them, namely, *Dionyſ. cap. 3. Hierarch. Eccleſiaſt. Ignatius epiſt. 8. ad Eccleſiam Antiochenam, Tertullian in preſcript. aduerſus Hereticos*. Gaius Pope and Martyr in Diocletians time, Sozimus in S. Auguſtines time, Iſichius, Euſebius Cæſarienſis in his Eccleſiaſtical hiſtorie, and Epiphanius in the ende of his Booke contra Hæreſes.

Sacrament of Order. By good Reaſon.

Vntruthes boldely preſumed, as by the anſweare it maie appeare.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Gentle Reader, if I ſhoulde leaue theſe, and other like M. Hardinges wordes vnanſweared, thou mighteſt happily thinke, he had ſaide ſomewhat. Here he ſaithe, it had benne our Parte to haue tolde thée of Seuen Ordres in the Churche,

thre Greater, and foure Lesse: Hauinge in deede him selfe cleane forgotten his owne Parte. For notwithstandinge this controlment, and accoumpt of so many Orders, yet he nameth no moe Orders, then we haue named. And verily, if he woulde haue folowed his owne Authorities, it had benne harde for him, in any good Order to haue made vp his owne accoumpte.

For his owne Anacletus saithe, I cal him his owne, for that it is onely a forged Pamflet, neuer written by that Holy Father Anacletus, as it is easie to be seene. But what so euer he were, thus he saithe: Amplius, quàm isti Duo Ordines Sacerdotum, (Episcopi, & Presbyteri) nec nobis à Deo collati sunt, nec Apostoli docuerunt: *More then these twoo Orders of Priestes (Bishoppes, and Elders) neither hath God appointed vs, nor haue the Apostles taught vs.* And yet of these same two seuerall Orders S. Hierome seemeth to make onely One Order. For thus he writeth, Audio, quendam in tantam erupisse vecordiam, vt Diaconos Presbyteris, id est, Episcopis anteferret: *I heare saie, there is a man broken out vnto suche wilful furie, that he placeth Deacons before Priestes, that is to saie, before Bishoppes.* And againe, Apostolus præcipuè docet, eosdem esse Presbyteros, quos Episcopos: *The Apostle,* Paule, *specially teacheth vs, that Priestes, and Bishoppes be al one.* The same S. Hierome writinge vpon the Prophete Esaie, reckeneth onely fiue Orders, or Degrées in the whole Churche: The Bishoppes, the Priestes, the Deacons, the Entrers, or Beginners, and the Faithful. And other Order of the Churche he knoweth none.

Anacletus Epistola. 3.

Hieronym. ad Euagrium. Hieronym. in eadem Epistola. Hieronym. in Esai. Cap. 19. Catechumeni.

Addition. As for M. Hardinges prætie imaginations of Termes Generall, and Termes Special, they are mere Vanities, not worthe the hearinge. For S. Hieromes wordes be plaine ynough: *A Priestе, and a Bishop is al one thinge: And before that, by the woorkinge of the Diuel, parties were taken in Religion, and somme saide, I holde of* Paule, *somme, I holde of* Appollo, *and somme others, I holde of* Peter, *the Churches were gouerned by the common Councel of the Priestes.*

Addition

Hieronym. ad Titum. Cap. 1.

Clemens saithe, Tribus gradibus commissa sunt Sacramenta Diuinorum Secretorum, id est, Presbytero, Diacono, & Ministro: *The Mysteries of the Holy Secresies be committed vnto three Orders: that is, vnto the Priestes, vnto the Deacons, and vnto the Ministers:* And yet Deacons, and Ministers, as touchinge the name, are al one.

Clemens Epist. 2 De Conc. Dist. 3 Tribus gradib.

Dionysius likewise hathe thre Orders, but not the same: For he reckeneth Bishoppes, Priestes, and Deacons. And whereas M. Hardinge maketh his accoumpt of Foure, of the Lesse, or Inferiour Orders, meaninge thereby, Ostiarios, Lectores, Exorcistas, Acoluthos: *The Doore keepers, the Readers, the Coniurers, and the Waiters, or Folowers:* His owne Ignatius addeth thereto thre other Orders: Cantores, Laboratores, Confitentes: *The Chaunters or Singers, the Labourers, and the Confessours.* Clemens addeth thereto, Catechistas, *The Instiurmers, or Teachers* of them that were entringe into the Faithe. A little vaine Booke, bearinge the name of S. Hierome, De Septem Ordinibus Ecclesiæ, addeth yet an other Order, and calleth them Fossarios, that is, The Sextines, or Ouerseers of the Graues. And, leaste you shoulde thinke he reckeneth this Order, as emongst other necessarie offices to serue the people, and not as any parte of the Clergie, his wordes be these, Primus in Clericis Fossariorum Ordo est: qui in similitudinem Tobiæ Sancti sepelire mortuos admonent: *The Firste Order of the Clergie, is the Order of the Sextines: whiche, as Holy* Tobie *was woonte to doo, cal vpon the people for the burial of the deade.*

Dionysi. Eccles. Hierar. Cap. 5. Ignatius ad Antiochen. ψάλτας καὶ πιῶντας ἐξορκίσας ὁμολογητάς. Clemens Epist. 1. Hieronym. De 7. Ordinibus Eccl.

Likewise to the thre greatter Orders Isidorus addeth an other distincte and seuerall Order of Bishoppes: vnto whome agreeth Gulielmus Altisiodorensis, and Gottofredus Pictauiensis, as appeareth by Iohannes Scotus. Againe of the other Inferiour Orders, S. Hierome leaueth out the Coniurers, & VVaiters: S. Ambrose leaueth out the VVaiters, and Doore Keepers: The Canons of the Apostles leaue out Coniurers, VVaiters, and Doore Keepers, al thre togeather.

Isidor. Etymolog. lib. 1. ca. 12. Scotus in 4. Sen. Dist. 24. Quæ. 1. Ambr. in Epist. Ad Ephe. Cap. 4.

In this so greate dissension, and darkenes, what waie wil M. Hardinge take, to folowe? By Anacletus, there be Two Orders: by Clemens, and S. Hierome, Thre: by Hierome Countrefeite, Seuen: by others Eight, by others Nine, by others Tenne.

Al

Al this notwithstandinge, he telleth vs, our parte had benne, to haue shewed, that there be iuste Seuen Orders in the Churche, Their Greate, and Some Lesse, without doubt, or question.

Here, gentle Reader, it had benne M. Hardinges parte to haue shewed vs the Reasons, and Grounders of this Diuinitie: These they be, as they are alleged by the beste of that side: Christe saithe, *I am the Doore*: Ergo, *there muste be in the Churche an Order of Doore Keepers*. Christe saithe, *I am the Light of the Worlde*: Hereupon haue they founded the Order of Acolutes, to carrie Tapers. And so for the reste. Thus muche maie serue for a taste. Petrus Lombar. sen. li. 4. Dist. 24

Nowe let vs consider, what these Orders haue to do, and with howe Holy, and weighty offices they stande charged in the Churche of God. First Clemens (of whoes Authoritie M. Hardinge maketh no smal accompte, for he calleth him the Apostles fellowe) writeth thus: Vnus Hypodiaconus det aquam manibus Sacerdotum: Duo Diaconi ex vtraque parte Altaris teneant flabellum confectum ex tenuibus membranis, vel ex Pauonum pennis, quibus leuiter abigant præteruolantes bestiolas, ne in Pocula incidant: *Let one of the Subdeacons geue Water to the Priestes handes: Let twoo Deacons standde at the two endes of the Aultare: either of them with a fanne made of fine Parchement, or of Peacockes tailes, therewith softely to chase awaie the flies, that they fal not into the Communion Cuppes*. Clemens Consti. Apost. li. 8. ca. 15

The offices of other Inferioure Orders be toste, as they be noted by one of M. Hardinges owne side: Ad Minores Ordines hæc spectant: Portare Cereos, & Vrceolum: & Canes expellere de Ecclesia: *To the lesse Orders these thinges belonge: to carrie Tapers, and Holy Water stockes: and to driue Dogges out of the Churche*. Aureum speculum Papæ.

These, I trowe, be the Mystical Holy Orders, whereof M. Hardinge saithe, *Our parte had benne, to haue made some longe discourse*: beinge him selfe ashamed, as it maie appeare by his silence, either to name them in particulare, or to open the Secretes of their offices.

How be it in deede, good Christian Reader, sundrie of these offices in the Primitiue Churche were appointed to very good, and sober purposes: The Doore keepers office was then, to kepe out Excommunicate personnes, that they shoulde not presse in emonge the Faithfull: The Psalmistes, or Singers office was, to singe the Psalmes, thereby to moue the peoples hartes to deuotion: The Exorcistes office was, by a special gifte of God, seruinge onely for that time, to cal forthe foule Spirites out of the Bodies of them, that were possessed. The Readers office was, openly, and plainely, and distinctly to pronounce the Scriptures vnto the people: and to this vse the Bishop deliuered vnto him a Booke with this charge: Accipe, & esto relator Verbi Dei: *Take thou this Booke, and be thou a Pronouncer of the Woorde of God*. And therefore Isidorus saithe, Tanta, & tam clara erit eius vox, vt quamuis longe positorum aures adimpleat: *The Readers voice must be so lowde, and so cleare, that it maie be hable to fille the eares of them, that standde far of*. The Acoluthes, or VVaiters office was, to attende vpon the Bishop, as a witnesse of his conuersation. Dist. 23. Lector. Dist. 21. Clerus.

To suche good vses these offices then serued in the Churche of God. But nowe there is nothinge leafte, sauinge the bare name onely, without any maner vse, or Office. For neither doth the Ostiarius kepe out the Excommunicates: Nor doth the Acoluthus waite vpon the Bishop: Nor doth the Exorciste cast forth Diuels: Nor doth the Psalmiste singe Psalmes: Nor doth the Reader openly pronounce the Scriptures: (I might yet steppe a litle farther, to open the whole bewtie of the Clergie of Rome) nor doth the Deacon make prouision for the poore: nor doth the Bishop preache the Woorde of God.

This had benne our parte to haue opened at large: And for leauinge of the same, we were worthy by M. Hardinges iudgement, to be reproued.

The Apologie, Cap. 3. Division. 2.

Yet notwithstandinge, wee saie, that there neither is, nor can be any one man, whiche maie haue the whole Superioritie in this Vniuersal state: for that Christe is euer present to assiste his Churche, and

neadeth not any man, to supplie his roome, as his onely heire to al his Substance, and that there can be no one mortal creature, whiche is hable to comprehende, or conceiue in his minde the Vniuersal Churche, that is to wite, al the partes of the worlde, mutche lesse hable rightly, and duely to put them in order, and to Gouerne them.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

M. Hardinges answeare hereto is longe, and tedious. The Substance thereof in shorte is this: Where wee saie, No one Mortal Man is hable to weelde the burthen of the whole Churche of God, M. Hardinge answeareth: VVhere any thinge is in deede, there whether it maie be, or no, to discusse, it is needelesse. Therefore whether any one man can be superioure, and chiefe ouer the whole Churche, wee leaue to speake: that so it is, thus wee proue: Euery Parrishe hath his seueral Vicare, or Personne: And euery Dioces his owne Bishop. *Ergo*, what reason is it, there be not one Chiefe Gouernoure of the whole Christen people? 1.

VVhen questions be moued in maters of Faithe, through diuersities of Iudgements the Churche should be diuided, onlesse by Authoritie of One it were kepte in Vnitie. 2.

They, that saie otherwise, take from Christe the Glorie of his prouidence, and the praise of his greate loue towardes his Churche. 3.

The Peace of the Churche is more conueniently procured by one, then by many. 4.

It is moste meete, that the Churche Militante, touchinge Gouernement, resemble the Churche Triumphante. But in the Triumphante Churche one is Gouernoure ouer the whole, that is God. Therefore in the Churche Militant order requireth, that one beare rule ouer al: accordinge to that the Holy Captaine Iosue seemeth to speake, The Children of Iuda, and the Children of Israel shal assemble togeather, and they shal make to them selues one Heade: Thereof our Lorde saithe in S. Iohn, There shalbe One Folde, and one Shepheard. 5. Iosue. 1. Iohan. 10.

A greate ouersight: For these be the woords, not of the Captaine Iosua, but of the Prophete Osee.

In deede Christe is Head of his Body. Yet ne doth he, for as muche as Christe nowe dwelleth not with vs in Visible Presence, his Churche haue one Man to doo his steede of outwarde rulinge in Earthe: And therefore he saide vnto Peter, Feede my Flocke: Confirme thy Brethren.

Thus wee see these Defenders Negatiue Doctrine, That no One Man maie haue the Superioritie ouer the whole state of the Churche, disproued, as vtterly false.

To their seconde reason, wee graunte, Christe needeth not any man to supplie his roome, that shoulde succede in his whole Substance. Neither is man of Capacitie of suche succession: * neither hath there any suche fonde saieinge benne vttered by the Diuines.

* Vntruthe. For Panormitane saithe, *Papa potest quasi omnia facere, quæ potest Deus.*

But bicause Christe sawe the knot of Vnitie should be moste surely kept knit by Gouernment of one, he * committed the regiment of the whole Churche vnto One: whoes Visible Ministerie he might vse in steede of him selfe.

* Vntruthe.

To the Thirde we saie, that man is not onely hable to comprehende in his minde, and conceiue the Vniuersal Churche, but also to put it in order, and to Gouerne it so farre as is expedient.

Laste of al, who so euer wil not be fedde nor ruled by his owne Shepheard, and breaketh out of this one folde, he is not of the Flocke of Christe, but of the Hearde of Antichristе.

Here, Gentle Reader, M. Hardinge hath brought thee, not the Authoritie of any one Catholique Doctour, or Learned Father, but onely a fewe colde Reasons of his owne, with certaine Scriptures vnaduisedly alleged, and violently forced from their meaninge, as shal soone appeare.

1. His firste Reason concludeth very weakely: Euery parishe is gouerned by One Vicare, or Personne: and euery Diocese is gouerned by One seueral Bishop: Ergo, there is One Universal Gouernoure ouer the whole Churche of Christe. Here is neither order in Reason, nor sequele in nature. Therefore if any man would denie the Argument, M. Hardinge were neuer hable make it good. He might as wel, and in as good order reason thus: Euery Kingedome, or Common Weale hathe One Prince, or Magistrate to rule ouer it: Ergo, There muste be One Universal Prince, to rule ouer the whole worlde. Or thus, Euery Flocke of Sheepe hathe One Seueral Shephearde to ouersee them: Ergo, al the Flockes through the worlde ought to be ouersene by One General Shepheard. Otherwise, M. Hardinge imagineth, this foule absurditie muste nedes folowe, that the parte is better Gouerned, then the whole.

Addition. ☞ Here M. Hardinge answeareth thus, I see no absurditie in this cõclusion. And perhaps, when the mater is wel weighed, it maie seeme, the world was neuer in better state, then when it was gouerned by one good Emperour. *The Answeare.* O M. Hardinge why shoulde you so bainely auouche vntruthe? What one Emperoure had euer the

M. Har. pa. 137. a

Addition ☞

Vnitie by one Pope.

the regiment of al the worlde? Where stode his Palace? What was his name? Why telle you suche tales of those thinges, that neuer were: and you Certainely knowe, they neuer were?

In deede the Emperoures of Rome, after the time of Augustus Cæsar, had a greate parte of the worlde vnder their handes. But the whole worlde, you knowe, they neuer had: no, Neither the halfe deale, nor the thirde, nor the fourthe parte of the worlde. Yet hauinge onely that they had, they grewe so Tyrannical, and so intolerable ouer their Subiectes, and so licenceous, and monstrous in their liues, that onlesse it be onely emonge the Popes, it is not possible to finde so many the like Examples of horroure in any State, or Kingedome of the worlde. From the deathe of Augustus Cæsar, vnto Theodosius, within the space of lesse then foure hundred yeres, moe then fourtie Emperoures were slaine with violence, one of them seekinge Traytorous meanes to murder an other. When the Princes estate was so vncertaine, and miserable, what mate we thinke, was then the miserie of the people? Yet, saithe M. Hardinge, The worlde was neuer in better state.

2. 3. 4. *In the Fourthe Article, and in the* 18. *and* 19. *Diuisions. De Maior. & Obedien. Vnam Sanctam. In Glossa.*

The other three Reasons, touchinge the Prouidence of God, the Debatinge of questions in Faithe, and conseruinge of Peace, and Unitie in the Churche, are answeared alreadie in my former Replie to M. Hardinge. In deede, I remember, to auouche al that M. Hardinge hathe here saide, one sometimes wel inclined to that side, saide thus: Non videretur Dominus discretus fuisse (vt cum reuerentia eius loquar) nisi Vnicum post se talem Vicarium reliquisset, qui hæc omnia posset: *Christe our Lorde shoulde not haue seemed to haue dealt discretly (to speake it with reuerence) onlesse he had leafte One suche Vicare behinde him, that might haue donne al these thinges.*

I graunte, Dissension, and quarrelles be the sonner ended, when al thinges be put ouer to one Man: So that the same one Man mate liue for euer, and stil continewe in one minde, and neuer alter. But oftentimes one Pope is founde contrarie to an other: and sometimes one Pope hathe benne founde contrarie to him selfe. Pope Sabinianus woulde haue burnte al Pope Gregories Bookes: And, as it is saide before, Pope Romanus vtterly abolished al the Acte of his Predecessoure Pope Steuin: The same Pope Steuin vnburied his Predecessour Pope Formosus, and defaced, and mangled his naked carkesse, and vtterly condemned al, that had benne donne by him before: And Platyna geueth this general iudgement of them, Nihil aliud isti Pontificuli cogitabant, quàm vt Nomen, & Dignitatem Maiorum suorum extinguerent: *These litle Petite Popes had none other care in the Worlde, but howe to deface the Name, and Estimation of other Popes, that had benne before them.* And thus, that one Pope liketh, an other misliketh: that one alloweth, an other condemneth. And yet by M. Hardinges iudgemente, we haue none other rule to state by in doubtful cases, but onely the Wil, and Pleasure of the Pope.

Platyna in Sabinian. Sabellicus Enneade. 9. *Lib.* 1. *Platyna in Stephano Sexto. Platyna in Romano.* 1.

Addition. Here M. Hardinge findeth greate faulte, for that I saide, Pope Steuin defaced, and mangled Formosus his Predecessoures naked carkesse. The Storie (saithe he) maketh no mention of any suche manglinge. For proufe whereof he alleageth Sabellicus. *The Answeare.* For triall hereof, I repaire me to Platyna. His wordes be these: Hinc odium ortum est, &c. *Hereof grewe that hatred, that caused Pope* Stephanus *to practise suche crueltie vpon the deade Body of Pope* Formosus, *for that in his life time he had hindred him from the obteininge of the Popedome.* Martinus saithe, that Pope Stephanus was so wode, and so raged againste Formosus, that he haled his deade carkesse out of the graue, and caused it to be laide before him selfe, and others in the Councel, and choppe of the two forefingers of his righte hande, and threwe them out into the streame.

M. Har. pa. 139. b

Platyna in Stephano. 6.

Stephanum tanta rabie defæuisse.

Matthæus Palmerius Florentinus recordeth the same by these wordes: Stephanus, Formosi corpus Pontificalibus insignibus exuit? Deinde illud dilanians, omnibus afficiens dedecore, manus eius proiecit in Tiberim: *Pope* Stephanus *spoiled and stripte* Formosus *his Predecessours Body out of his Pontifical robes: and after he had torne, and rente the same Body, and abused it with al kinde of villanie, he choppe of bothe his handes, and threwe them foorthe into Tiber.*

Palmerius.

Dilanians.

Abbas Vrsperg. Abbas Vrspergensis saithe further, Pope Stephanus commaunded the Carkesse of Pope Formosus to be beheaded. And the same Body stript out of his Holy Robes, and spoiled of three fingers, to be throwen forthe into the streame. The same Storie touching the drowning of ỹ carkesse, is recorded also by Luitprandus Ticinensis. In an olde Chronicle written in Parchemente, intituled, Memoriale Historiarum, whiche I haue to shewe, there is added further: Quædam dictu horribilia in illum fecit: *Pope* Stephanus *Practised certaine thinges vpon Pope* Formosus, *that are horrible to be spoken.*

Decollari præcepit. Luitprandus Memoriale Historiarum.

But perhappes M. Hardinge wil refuse the Authoritie of these Writers, and of al others what so euer, and wil rather geue credite to Sabellicus, whom also he hathe noted in his Margine. Let vs therefore se the reporte of Sabellicus. Thus he saithe, Stephanus Formosi cadauer iterum refossum, tanquam sic quoque Pati aliquid atrocius posset, securi subiecit, corpus in Tiberim proijci iussit, vt sepultura, & omni Humano honore careret: *Pope* Stephanus *digged vp Pope* Formosus *his Predecessours Body, and beheaded it, as mindinge to make it to feele more villanie, and threwe out his carkesse into the Tiber, that he might bereue him of his Graue, and of al other Honour dewe to a man.*

Sabellicus Ennead. 9. Lib. 1.

Al this notwithstandinge, M. Hardinge can diuise, howe to cut of the Popes Heade, howe to choppe of his handes, and fingers, howe to hale out his naked carkesse from the graue, howe to spoile it, and trare it, and to abuse it with sutche villanie, as maie not be spoken, and how to throwe the same out into a renninge streame to be deuoured and swallowed of the Fisshes, and al this to doo gently, and in good order, without any manner defacinge, or manglinge of his Body. And therefore he concludeth, as his maner is, in this friendly sorte, Leaue, leaue that il propertie for shame, M. Iewel: adde not, diminisshe not, &c.

Howe be it, this, I trowe, is not the readiest waie to procure Peace, and to maintaine Vnitie in the Churche. And therefore Gregorie saithe of Iohn the Bishop of Constantinople, that claimed to him selfe this Vniuersal Power, Si hanc causam æquanimiter portamus, totius Ecclesiæ Fidem corrumpimus: Corruit Vniuersa Ecclesia à statu suo, si is, qui vniuersalis dicitur, cadit: *If wee quietly suffer this mater thus to proceede* (that one Man shal be called the Vniuersal Bishop, wee seeke not waies to maintaine Vnitie, but) *wee ouerthrowe the Faithe of the whole Churche: If he, that is called the Vniuersal Bishop, happen to fal, the whole Churche falleth from her state.* Thus therefore, to allowe any one Man Vniuersal Authoritie ouer the whole Churche, is a mater not behoueful, and profitable, as M. Hardinge fansieth, but, as Gregorie saithe, doubtful, and dangerous to the Churche. For although al the worlde either woulde, or coulde geue care, and credite to one Man, yet were not that therefore alwaies Christian Vnitie. S. Augustine saithe, Habet & Superbia appetitum quendam Vnitatis, & Omnipotentiæ: *Pride it selfe hathe a certaine desire of Vnitie, and of Vniuersal Power.*

Gregor. Lib. 4. Epist. 34. 38. Gregor. Lib. 4. Epist. 76.

Augustl. De Vera Religione ca. 45

Addition. But M. Hardinge saithe, Iohn the Bishop of Constantinople by this Title Vniuersal Bishop, meante to make him selfe the onely Bishop of al the whole worlde, that there shoulde be no Bishop, but him selfe alone. *The Answeare.* This answeare were somme what, if any Olde Writer might be founde to saie the same? But poure bare fantasie, M. Hardinge, as it maie appeare, oftentimes wanteth weighte. And howe can you thinke it likely, that the Bishop of Constantinople, were he neuer so proude a man, woulde suffer noman to be a Bishop, that is to saie, Neither to ordaine Priestes, nor to Excommunicate, nor to Absolue, nor to sitte in Councel, but him selfe alone? By what Euidence, by what recorde, by what practise of his parte, can you proue it? O what pretty tales ye woulde tel vs, if we woulde beleue you?

M. Har pa. 141. a

Addition

In deede the Bishop of Constantinople, although he were ambitious aboue measure, yet he neuer, neither vsurped, nor claimed any other Authoritie in the Church, then that sithence hathe benne vsurped, and claimed by the Pope. For thus it is written welneare by al that haue recorded the Storie of Pope Boniface 3. Institutum fuit, vt Ecclesia Romana esset Caput omnium Ecclesiarum: cùm prius Constantinopolitana Ecclesia id vsurpare tentasset: *It was then ordained, that the Church of Rome*

Palmerius Vrspergensis.

shoulde

Vnitie by one Pope.

ſhoulde be the heade of al Churches: where as before the Churche of Conſtantinople *had claimed that title vnto her ſelfe.* So ſaithe Sabellicus, *Græci illud decus ad ſe trahebant: The Greekes claimed the ſame Dignitie to them ſelues.* The ſame Dignitie, he ſaithe, that nowe is claimed by the Pope and none other. Sabellicus Ennead. 8. Lib. 6.

Therefore, M. Hardinge, al that you telle vs of One onely Biſhop throughout the whole worlde, excludinge al other Biſhoppes, ſauinge him ſelfe alone, is but a fable without face, or likelihode of any truthe.

An other of M. Hardinges Reaſons is this: The Churche Labouringe here in Earthe muſte reſemble the Churche of the Sainctes Triumphinge in Heauen. But in Heauen God onely is the Gouernour ouer the whole: Therefore, in the Churche beneath, the Pope likewiſe muſte nedes be Gouernour ouer the whole. Thus God muſte be rated to Gouerne aboue, and the Pope beneath: and ſo, as one ſommetime ſaide, Diuiſum Imperium cum Ioue Cæſar habet.

This is a valiant kinde of Argument. It holdeth from Heauen to Earthe: from Angelles to Penne: from God to the Pope.

But howe knoweth M. Hardinge, what Orders of Angelles, and Archangelles there be in Heauen? what they do: howe they deale: who ruleth: who are ruled: what Lawes, and Policies they haue emongſt them? They ſaie, they would frame their Churche accordinge to the Samplar: And yet good menne they neuer knewe, nor ſawe the Samplar. But onely of them ſelues they imagine Common Weales, and Orders in Heauen: and accordinge to the ſame, they woulde ſhape, and faſhon their owne Churche in Earthe.

Addition. ☞ Forſoothe (ſaithe M. Hardinge) I maie eaſily knowe that, whiche is euident. For in the Forth of Matthewe, Angelles waite on Chriſte: And in the 12. to the Hebrewes, there is mention made of thouſandes of Angelles. *The Anſweare.* Al this, M. Hardinge, we graunte: And Daniel ſaithe further, *Thouſande thouſandes of Angelles Miniſtred vnto God, and tenne thouſande thouſandes ſtoode before him.* But what is al this to proue your Orders? You ſaie, S. Paule nameth Thrones, Dominions, Principates, and Powers. You might haue added Archangelles, Cherubins, and Seraphins. But howe knowe you hereby, which Angel is highest in Order, and hathe Authoritie, and Gouernement ouer al the reſte, that you maie applie this Heauenly Paterne vnto the Pope. Onleſſe you ſhewe vs this, you ſhewe vs nothinge, And caſte faire coloures without a grounde. S. Auguſtine in this caſe, ſpeaketh modeſtly of him ſelfe: Quid inter ſe diſtent quatuor illa vocabula, Throni, Dominationes, Principatus, Poteſtates, dicant, qui poſſunt, ſi tamen poſſunt probare quod dicunt. Ego me iſta ignorare confiteor: *What difference there is betweene theſe foure woordes, Thrones, Dominions, Principates, and Powers, let them tel vs, that be hable, ſo that they can proue, that they tel vs. For my parte, I confeſſe, I knowe it not.* If S. Auguſtine confeſſe, he knoweth it not, Maie we ſafely learne it of M. Hardinge?

M. Hard. *fol.* 142

Daniel. 7.

Coloſſ. 1.

Auguſt. in Enchirid. Cap. 58.

Howe be it, as litle, as we knowe, or can knowe in theſe caſes, yet hereof muſt we be taught to learne our Obedience, and Subiection to the Pope: That, as God alone ruleth ouer, and ouer al the Heauens, ſo oughte the Pope alone to rule ouer, and ouer the whole Earth: And that, as al the Powers of Heauen caſt of their Crownes, and crie, Holy, Holy, Holy, vnto God, ſo oughte the Powers, and States of the Earthe likewiſe to falle downe, and ſubmitte them ſelues, and to yelde al Honoure vnto the Pope. If this be not youre meaninge, M. Hardinge, then telle youre tale plainely, that we maie knowe it.

The better waie, M. Harding, had benne, ſeinge the whole matter hangeth onely vpon your fantaſies, to ſaie, that God hathe appointed one Principal Archangel to be Pope in Heauen: and al other Powers, Angels, and Dominions to be Subiectes. Thus might you eaſily haue made youre Frame to agree with your Paterne, and the one of your fanſies to anſweare the other.

For to ſaie, as you ſaie, God ruleth al in Heauen aboue: Therefore the Pope muſte rule al in the worlde beneath, it is but a ſclender kinde of reaſoninge. S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Quid aliud in Pompa huius mundi homo appetit, niſi Solus eſſe, ſi fieri poſſit

Augu. De Vera Religione. ca. 45

posit, cui multa subiecta sint: Peruersa, scilicet, imitatione Omnipotentis Dei? *In the Vaine Pompe of this worlde what thinge els is it, that a man doothe desire, but if it were possible, to make him selfe alone sutche a one, vnto whom many thinges maie be obedient: and that by a peeuishe counterfeitinge of God Omnipotent.*

Gregori. Lib. 4. Epist. 78.

And this is it, that Gregorie saithe of Iohn the Bishop of Constantinople: Illum, videlicet, imitatur, qui spreta Angelorum societate, ascendere conatus est ad culmen Singularitatis: *He followeth Lucifer, who despisinge the fellowship of the Angelles, laboured to geate vp to the toppe of Singularitie, and saide, I wil mounte vp aboue the Northe, and wilbe like vnto the Highest.*

Uerily, Dionysius writinge pourpoſely of the Policie, and Gouernement of the Churche, and Comparinge the same with the Glorious Gouernment of the Angels and powers in Heauen, yet neuer vttered one worde of the Vniuersal Gouernment of the Pope. Nay rather in a litle Treatie ioined to the Councel of Laterane, out of this very place is Fourmed an Argument to the contrarie: In Cœlesti Hierarchia tota Congregatio Angelorum non habet Caput Vnum, præter solum Deum: Ergo, à Simili, in Ecclesiastica Hierarchia Hominum non debet esse Vnum Caput, præter Solum Deum: *In the Heauenly Gouernment the whole Companie of the Angelles hath none other One Heade, but onely God: Therefore of the like, in the Ecclesiastical Gouernemente emongest Men, there ought not to be any One Heade, but onely God.*

In Opere Tripart. Li. 2. ca. 5

M. Har. fo. 144 a

Addition. ☞ Here, saithe M. Hardinge, I marueile, ye had the face to bring this foorthe. You shewe your selfe to be shameleſſe. *The Answeare.* And why so impatently, M. Hardinge? Mary (saie you) is it not there set foorthe for an obiection against the Truthe? Neither do I saie so: nor do I vse it, as an Argument taken against the Truthe. It is laide forthe onely, as an Obiection againste the Pope. Betweene the Pope, and Truthe there maie be a difference, as you knowe, & as it is euident vnto the worlde. But you saie, It is answeared in the next Chapter. I graunt you, it is answeared in deede: but God wote full slenderly, as the rest. Yet neuertheleſſe my saieinge is true. For thus I saie, Out of this place is fourmed an Argumente to the Contrarie, that is against the Supremacie of the Pope. Beholde my wordes better, M. Hardinge. This onely I saie: I saie no more. And that I saie, you knowe, is true. Ye were to blame therefore, thus without cause, and out of season, to waste your choler. ☜

Addition ☞

☜

Neuertheleſſe M. Hardinge is wel hable to fortifie al theise thinges by the Authoritie of the Scriptures. And here in steede of the first Chapter of the Prophete Osee, he alleageth the firste Chapter of the Booke of Iosua. And leaſte thou shouldeſt thinke, it were onely a Marginal errour, brought in by some ouersight of the Printer, as he vseth sommetimes to erreſe, and to shifte the mater, he hathe thus laide it wide open in his owne terte, Hereof the Holy Captaine Iosue seemeth to speake. Howe be it, one errour maie the better be dissembled emongest so many. Neither woulde I haue noted this ouersighte, were not M. Hardinge so immoderate in blaminge others.

Iosua for Osee.

In deede the Prophete Osee, and not the Holy Captaine Iosua, speaketh theise wordes: but not, as M. Hardinge imagineth, of the state of al Christendoome vnder One Pope, but of that Vnitie, and consent, that al the Faithful of the worlde, as wel Iewes, as Gentiles shoulde haue vnder One Christe: as it is moſt euidente by the whole discourſe of the Terte.

Osee. 1. cap. 1.

Thus lie the wordes: *The number of the Children of Israel shalbe as the Sande of the Sea shoare, that cannot be numbred: And it shal comme to passe in the place, where it was saide vnto them, Yee are no people of mine, There shal it be saide vnto them, Yee are the Children of the Liuinge God. And the Children of* Iuda, *and the Children of* Israel *shal assemble togeather, and shal appointe vnto them selues One Heade.* Upon whiche wordes S. Hierome writeth thus: Hæc omnia fient, quia magnus est Dies Seminis Dei, qui interpretatur Christus: *All theſe thinges shal come to passe, bicause it is the greate Daie of the Seede of God, whiche Seede is expounded (not the Pope, but) Christe.* Likewise Nicolaus Lyra, Congregabuntur Filij Iuda, id est, Apostoli: & Filij Israel, id est, Gentiles conuersi: Pariter, id est, in Vna Ecclesia: & ponent sibi Caput Vnum, id est, Christum: *There shal assemble togeather*

Hieronym. in Osee. cap. 1.

Nicol. Lyra in Osee. cap. 1.

gether the Children of Iuda, *that is to saie, the Apostles: and the Children of* Israel, *that is to saie, the Heathens converted:* Togeather, *that is to saie, in One Churche: and shal appoint vnto them selues* One Heade, *that is to saie,* (not one Pope, as M. Hardinge wouldo haue it, but) *One Christe.* S. Augustine erpoundinge the laine wordes laithe thus: Recolatur Lapis ille Angularis, & duo illi parietes, vnus ex Iudæis, & alter ex Gentibus: *Let vs remember that Corner Stoane* (that is Christe, and not the Pope) *and the twoo Walles, the one of the Iewes, the other of the Heathens.* Augu. De Ciuitate. Li. 18. ca. 18.

The other wordes, whiche M. Hardinge allegeth out of S. Iohn, Christe him selfe erpoundeth, not of the Pope, but of him selfe: *I am the good Sheepeheard: I yeelde my life for my Sheepe: I knowe my Sheepe, and am knowen of them: I haue other Sheepe, that be not of this Flocke. Them I muste bringe, that they maie heare my Voice: and so shal there be one Sheepeheard, and one Flocke.* These wordes Chrysostome erpounded by the wordes of S. Paule: Vt duos conderet in Semetipso in Vnum Nouum Hominem: *That he might worke twoo people into One Newe Man* (not in the Pope, but) *in him selfe.* Iohan. 10. Epheſ. 2. Chryſoſt. in Ioo han. Homil. 59.

S. Augustine erpoundinge the same laithe thus, Duobus istis Gregibus, tanquam duobus Parietibus, Christus factus est Lapis Angularis: *Vnto these twoo Flockes, as vnto twoo Walles* (not the Pope, but) *Christe was made the Corner Stoane.* Augu. in Iohan. Tractat. 47.

And what shoulde I allege any other the Olde Fathers? Nicolaus Lyra, as simplean Interpreter, as he was, yet he likewise laithe the same: Fiet Vnus Pastor, id est, Christus: *There shalbe One Sheepeheard, that is to saie,* (not the Pope, but) *Christe.* Neither is M. Hardinge hable to shewe vs any Learned allowed Interpreter, Olde, or Newe, that hathe erpounded this place otherwise. Nicolaus Lyra in Iohan. Ca. 10.

Al these thinges notwithstandinge, as wel these wordes of Christe, as also the other of the Prophete Osee, M. Hardinge applieth onely to the Pope. *The Pope muste be the Heade: The Pope muste be the Sheepeheard.* Both Christe, and Osee Prophesied these thinges of the Glorie, and Kingedome of the Pope. Iuda and Israel shal chuse Christe to be their Heade: Al the Faithful through the worlde are one Flocke, and Christe is the Shepehearde: Ergo, the Pope is the General Heade of the Vniuersal Churche of God.

Suche Logique M. Hardinge is hable to teache vs: and with suche feare, and reuerence can he vse Goddes Holy Worde. And like as the Emperoure Caligula sometimes toke of the Heade of his greate God Iuppiter, and set on an other Heade of his owne: Euen so by these Interpretations, and Gloses, M. Hardinge smiteth of Christe, the Onely Heade of the Churche, and setteth on the Pope. For Iohannes de Parisijs (out of whom, or somme other the like, he hathe borowed this whole matter) nothinge doubteth to telle vs, that Christe is not, nor cannot be the Heade of this Body, or the Shepehearde of this Flocke. And, leaste M. Hardinge should charge me with vntrue reporte, his wordes be these: Congregabuntur Filij Iuda, & Filij Israel, vt ponant sibi Caput Vnum: Et Iohan. 10. Fiet Vnum Ouile, & Vnus Pastor. Quod quidem de Christo intelligi non potest: sed de alio aliquo Ministro, qui præsit loco eius: *The Children of* Iuda, *and the Children of* Israel *shal assemble togeather, to appoint vnto them selues One Heade: And in the tenth of* Iohn, *There shalbe made One Folde, and One Sheepeheard: Whiche thinge doubtlesse cannot be expounded of Christe: but muste be taken of somme other Minister, that maie rule in his steede.* Sutton Tranquil. in Caligula. Iohan. De Parisijs, de potestate regia, & Papali. Cap. 3.

Thus we are taughte, that Christe is neither the Heade of his owne Body, the Churche: nor the Shepehearde of his owne Flocke, but onely the Pope. For consider wel these laste wordes of Iohannes de Parisijs, *Doubtlesse* (laithe he) *Christe cannot be this One Sheepeheard. It muste needes be somme other Minister* (that is the Pope) *that maie rule in steede of Christe.* This One Shepehearde, laithe he, cannot be Christe. Then muste it Onely be the Pope. And yet Chrysostome laithe, Qui non vtitur Sacra Scriptura, sed ascendit aliunde, id est, non concessa via, hic non Pastor est, sed Fur: *Who so euer vseth not the Holy Scripture, but commeth in an other waie that is not lawful,* (whiche is by Faise Gloses, and Corruptions, so dothe the Bishop of Rome, and by suche meanes hathe wonne his Vniuersal Authoritie, as it is easie to be proued) *he is not the Sheepeheard of the Flocke: he is the Theefe.* Chryſoſt. in Iohan. Homil. 58.

So saithe S. Augustine, Ipsum characterem multi & Lupi, & Lupis imprimunt: *The note, or marke of a Bishop many gene vnto Wolues, and be Wolues themselues.*

August. contra Donatist. Li. 6.

M. Harding saithe further, For as muche as Christe is Ascended into Heauen, and is nowe nomore conuersante emongst vs in Visible Fourme, as he was before, it behoued some one man to be put in Commission for bearinge the charge, and takinge care of the whole Churche. Therefore he saith vnto Peter, *Feede my Flocke: Confirme thy Brethren.* First, what Auncient Learned Father euer thus scanned the wordes of the Popes Commission? Or why dothe M. Harding auouche so greate a matter of him selfe onely, without further Authoritie? And if this so large Commission be to Feede, and to Feede so many, why then doethe the Pope Feede so little? Or rather, why Feedeth he nothinge at al? Or howe can he claime by Feedinge, that neuer Feedeth?

1. Q. 3. Vocantur Canes.

M. Har. fo. 147. b

Addition. Here M. Harding hathe taken occasion of sundrie answeares. First he saithe, *Pascere*, is not a woord, that signifieth to Feede onely, as you knowe, but also to rule, and gouerne. And there for *Homere* calleth Kinge *Agamemnon*, ποιμένα λαῶν, that is to saie, the ruler of the people. *The Answeare.* Whether Christe by this woord, Pascere, meante Feedinge, or Gouerninge, it forceth not greatly. To quarrel for woordes, I haue no skil. But why is Homere the blinde Heathen Poete here alleged as an Interpreter of Christes meaninge? Or why is Kinge Agamemnon Feedinge, or leadinge of his Subiectes brought in, to proue the Feedinge of the Pope? Certainely Christe saithe to Peter, and to other his Disciples, *Kinges haue power, and gouernment ouer their Nations. But it shal not be so emonge you.* The Feedinge that Christe meant, stoode not in Sworde, or Sceptre, But in woorde, and Doctrine. Therefore he saide to his Disciples, *Goe into al the worlde, and preache the Gospel to euery creature.* S. Paule saithe, *Let a man so esteeme vs, as the Seruantes of Christ, and the Stewardes of Goddes Mysteries.* And Christe him selfe saith, *My Sheepe heare my voice, and folowe mee. He that is of God, heareth the Woorde of God.* The manner of this Feedinge, S. Augustine expresseth thus: Non te pascere cogita, sed oues meas: Sicut meas pasce, non sicut tuas: Gloriam meam in illis quære, non tuam: Dominium meum, non tuum: Lucra mea, non tua: *Thinke not to Feede thee selfe: Feede my Sheepe: Feede them as my Sheepe, not as thine owne: Seeke my Honour in them, seeke not thine: Seeke my ownership, and not thine: Seeke my gaines, and not thine owne.* This is likely to be the Feedinge, that Christe spake of.

Addition. A.

Matthæ. 20.

Marke. 16.

1. Cor. 4.

Iohan. 10.

Iohan. 8.

Augu. in Iohan. Tractat. 123.

M. Har. fo. 147. b

Howe be it, as it maie appeare by M. Harding, the Pope is not bounde to this kinde of Feedinge. It is sufficiente for him to be as Agamemnon was, that is, a Prince, and a Ruler of the people. God graunt, the woordes of the Prophete Ezechiel be not founde true in his Feedinge: *Woe be to the Shepheardes of Israel that Feede them selues.* The Prophete Hieremie saithe, Omnes Pastores tuos pascet ventus: *Winde, and vanitie shal Feede al thy Feeders.* The Apostle Iudas saithe, *They Feede them selues: They are Clowdes without water.*

Ezech. 34.

Hierem. 22.

Iudas.

M. Har. fo. 147. b

But M. Harding hathe here brought in Chrysostome, Ambrose, Arnobius, Pope Leo, and Pope Gregorie, to proue the Authoritie of the Pope. The place of Chrysostome is alleged, and aunswered once before. His woordes be these: *The charge to rule the whole Churche was giuen to* Peter. S. Ambrose saithe, Christus Petrum Amoris sui velut vicarium reliquebat: *Christe leafte* S. Peter *as the Vicare of his Loue.* To what purpose these later woordes of S. Ambrose are alleged, I cannot telle. For it were harder for M. Harding to reason thus, Christe made Peter the Vicare of his Loue: Ergo, the Pope is Lorde, and Father of al the worlde. Undoubtedly S. Ambrose in that whole place hathe not one woorde, neither of one Generall Father, nor of Peters Successours, nor of the Pope: Therefore M. Harding doethe wel, thus to qualifie the weakenesse of his euidence, for thus he saithe, S. Ambrose, saithe in effecte, as muche as I saide. And what is that? Verily, good Reader, in effecte it is as muche as nothinge. S. Paule saithe of him selfe, and others, Legatione pro Christo fungimur: *Wee are Embassadours, or Messengers for Christe*, that is to saie, We are his Vicares: And Christe saithe to his Disciples altogether, *As my louinge Father sente mee, euen so doo I sende you*, that is to saie, *you are the Vicares of my Loue.* Shal we therefore

Chrysostom. in Matth. Hom. 55.

Ambros. in Lucam. cap. 24.

M. Har. fo. 148. a

2 Corinth. 5.

Iohan. 6.

therefore hereof conclude, that Paule, and euery of al the Disciples had Vniuersal Power ouer the whole Churche of God? O, M. Hardinge, howe so euer the Pope fede the people, you should not fede vs with suche vanities. But Chrysostome, you saie, saithe thus: The charge to Rule the whole Churche was geuen to Peter. These wordes are pregnant, and proue the ponrpose. But as I haue told you, Theodoretus hathe written the like wordes of Chrysostome him selfe, Chrysostomus Doctor Orbis terrarum: Chrysostome *the Doctour or Maister of the Worlde*. M. Har. fo 147. b. Theodoret. Li 5. Cap. 32.

Yet was not Chrysostome therefore, neither Vniuersal Bishop, nor Heade of the Churche.

Nowe for as mutche as you haue many times in one place alleged theise selfe same wordes by Chrysostome spoken of Peter, as hauinge somme special affiance in the weight of them, maie it please you therefore to consider, what wordes the same Chrysostome hathe likewise vttered of S. Paule. M. Har. pa. 145. b. 147. b. 151. b. 152. a

Thus therefore he saithe, Hoc docet nos Paulus Magister Orbis: *This thing doothe Paule teache vs beeinge the Maister of the Worlde*. Againe, Paulo tribuitur cura omnium Ecclesiarum: non vnius, vel duarum, vel trium, sed omnium, quæ sunt in toto Orbe: *Vnto* Paule *the charge of al Churches is committed: not of one, or twoo, or three Churches, but of al the Churches, that be in al the Worlde*. Chrysost. in Genesin. Homil. 7. In Gene. Hom. 11 In Iohan. Hom. 11 In Acta hom. 33.

Againe, Paule *beinge a Persecutour, and a Blasphemer is made the Preacher of al Countries, and ruleth the Churche throughout al the Worlde*. De Laudib. Pauli.

Paule *gouerneth and ruleth the whole Worlde*: Paule *was the Apostle of the whole compasse of the Earthe*: *All the Worlde was committed to* Paule: Paule *had the ouersighte*: Paule *was the Wardeine of al the Worlde*. In 1. Cor. hom. 11 In Sermon. De Eleemosyna. De prouid. Li. 2. Contra Iudæos Orat. 5.

I passe ouer a greate number of other like Sentences of Chrysostome, and others, whereof somme parte I haue touched somme otherwhere. And, what wil you conclude hereof, M. Hardinge? That Paule was the Heade of the Vniuersal Churche? Doubtlesse theise wordes, thus vttered of him, importe no lesse. But what wil you then do with S. Peter? for to sette two Heades vpon one Body, it were ouer mutche.

But to passe by, and to dissemble al that maie be spoken of Paule and Peter, what if the Pope him selfe geue the same Stile, and Title vnto sundrie others inferioure Bishoppes? what if they be called the Ouerseers of the whole Vniuersal Churche, and that euen by the mouthe of the Pope him selfe? Marke therefore what Pope Eleutherius writeth to the Bishoppes of France: Vniuersalis vobis à Christo Ecclesia commissa est: *The Vniuersal Churche is committed to you by Christe*: Wil you therefore telle vs, M. Hardinge, that the Bishoppes of France are the Popes of Rome? or, that they haue Vniuersal power ouer al the Worlde? Thus you se, how vainely ye buse your selfe, withdrawinge the good saiinges, and sentences of the Holy Fathers from their meaninge. Epist. Eleuth. ad Episcop. Gallie.

Further you saie, Christe leafte not onely Peter to be the Successoure of his Loue for his owne life onely, but also Peters Successours for euer, that is to saie, the Popes: for other Peters Successours, (you saie) wee knowe not. And are you wel assured, M. Hardinge, that euery Pope is the Successoure, and Heire of Christes Loue without exception? Woulde God they were. The Worlde shoulde haue lesse cause to be offended. But Christes Loue passeth not by Enheritance, or Succession of Sées. Who so euer is ready to geue him selfe for the Flocke of Christe, be he Pope, or Bishop, or inferioure Priestе, he is the Vicare of Christes Loue. In the ende hereof M. Hardinge of his modestie chargeth vs with boastinge chalenges, and bold talkes, and prating in Pulpites. M. Har. fo 148. b

Againe, where learned M. Hardinge to reason thus? Christe is Ascended into Heauen: Ergo, the Pope is Heade of the whole worlde? Or thus, Christe saide to Peter, Fede my Flocke: Ergo, the Pope hathe Vniuersal Power ouer the whole Churche of God? Howe can he make theise Argumentes to holde, I wil not saie by Diuinitie, but by any reasonable shifte of Logique?

But ye saie, God speaketh not nowe vnto vs mouthe to mouthe: nor sendeth

vs downe his Angelles from Heauen: nor instructeth vs nowe by Visions, as he did others in the Olde times. What of that? wil it therefore folowe, that al the worlde muste geue care to the Pope? Nay, M. Hardinge, Chrysostome saithe muche better: Bicause God speaketh not nowe vnto vs in suche familiare sorte, *Ergo*, Suam erga Homines amicitiam innouare volens, quasi longè absentibus literas mittit, conciliaturus sibi Vniuersam Hominum Naturam: *Therefore, God mindinge to renewe his fauour towardes Man, sente (his Holy Scriptures, as it were) his Letters, thereby to reconcile to him selfe al Mankinde.* God speaketh not nowe vnto vs by his Angelles: but he hath already spoken vnto vs, as S. Paule saithe, by the mouthe, and presence of his Onely Sonne. And therefore he saithe againe, *If an Angel from Heauen woulde nowe Preache vnto vs otherwise, then wee haue receiued, wee shoulde holde him accursed.*

Chrysost. in Genesin. Homil. 2.

Hebre. 1.

Galat. 1.

But for the Vnitie, and quiet gouernment of the Churche of God, S. Paule saith, *Christe Ascendinge aboue al the Heauens hathe geuen* (not One Vniuersal Pope to rule the whole, but) *some Apostles, some Prophetes, some Euangelistes, some Pastours, some Doctours, for the perfitinge of the Sainctes, for the woorke of the Ministerie, for the building vp of the Body of Christe, that wee maie al comme into the Vnitie of Faithe, and of the knowledge of the Sonne of God.* By these meanes God thought it sufficiente, to preserue his Churche in Vnitie, and neuer made mention of One Vniuersal Pope.

Ephes. 4.

Therefore S. Cyprian saithe, Vnus est Episcopatus, cuius à singulis in solidum pars tenetur: *There is but One Bishoprike, parte whereof of euery seueral Bishop is holden in whole.* And againe, Ideò plures sunt in Ecclesia Sacerdotes, vt, vno Hæresim facente, cæteri subueniant: *Therefore are there many Bishoppes in the Churche, that if one fal into Heresie, the reste maie healpe.* Thus, when Peter walked not vprightly to the Gospel, Paule came with healpe, and reproued him openly euen to his face: Thus Irenæus reproued Pope Victor: thus sundrie godly Fathers, haue reproued others. Therefore S. Augustine saith, Deus docuit Petrum per posteriorem Paulum. A quocunque enim Verum dicitur, illo donante, dicitur, qui est ipsa Veritas: *Thus God instructed Peter by Paule his punee, that was called after him. For by whom so euer the Truthe is spoken, it is spoken by his guifte, that is Truthe it selfe.*

Cyprian De Simplicit. Prælatorum.

Cyprian. Lib. 3. Epist. 13.

Galat. 2.

Euseb li. 5. ca. 26

August Epist. 28

Ye saie, the Pope succéedeth not Christe in al his Substance, that is to saie, in al his Power: neither hathe there any suche fonde saieinge benne vttered (saie you) at any time by the Diuines. If this be true, wherefore then be these woordes written, so wel allowed of in the Councel of Laterane, Tibi data est Omnis Potestas, in Cœlo, & in Terra: *Vnto your Holinesse al Power is geuen as wel in Heauen, as in Earthe.* Wherefore is Bernarde so wel allowed to forze the same farther with these woordes: Qui totum dedit, nihil excludit: *He that hath geuen thee Al, hathe excepted Nothinge.* Wherefore is Panormitane allowed to saie, Papa potest omnia, quæ Deus ipse potest? *The Pope is liable by his Power to doo, what so euer God him selfe can doo.*

In Concil. Lateran. sub Iulio.

In Concil. Lateran. sub Leone.

In Oratione Stephani Patriarchæ Panormitan. De Electi. Ca. Licet.

For the reste, M. Hardinge saithe, One kinge is liable to rule One kingedome: Ergo, One Pope is liable to rule the whole Churche. This Reason is very simple, and is answered before. Of the Gouernmente of Princes we haue daily Practise: But of Popes, that euer exercised this Vniuersal Dominion ouer the whole Churche of God, M. Hardinge is not liable to shewe vs One. Or if he be liable to saie with One, let him shewe him for his Creedes sake. If there be not One suche Example to be founde from the Ascension of Christe vnto this daie, then although the Pope had it in claime by Charter, yet hath he lost it by Non vsure. Wel were it with him, if he were but a Member of Christes Body, and a Shape of his Flesche. S. Gregorie saithe sometime to Iohn the Bishop of Constantinople, claiminge vnto him selfe the same Title, and thirdinge him selfe liable ynoughe to rule the whole, Quid tu Christo Vniuersalis Ecclesiæ Capiti in Extremi Iudicij responsurus es examine, qui cuncta eius Membra tibimet conaris Vniuersalis appellatione supponere? *What answeare wilt thou make in the triall of the Laste Iudgemente, vnto Christe the Heade of his Vniuersal Churche, that thou by the name of Vniuersal Bishop, seekest to bringe vnder thee al the Members of his Body?*

Gregor. Lib. 4. Epist. 38.

Laste of al, M. Hardinge concludeth without Premisses: Who so euer wil not

be

to forsake the Pope.

be ruled by this Shepehearde, the Pope, is of the Heard of Antichriste. So saithe one of the Popes hired Proctours: Quicquid Saluatur, est sub Summo Pontifice: *What so euer Soule is saued, It is vnder the Pope.* This one thinge beinge graunted, M. Hardinges whole cause passeth cleare. *Dr Majorit. & Obedient. Vnam sanct. in Glossa.*

But God be thanked, it appeareth already to al them, that haue eies to see, that we haue not departed from the seruile Obedience of that See, but vpon iuste cause, and good aduise, And in suche sorte the Pope him selfe wil not denie, but it is lawful for any Churche to dissent from the Churche of Rome. Theise be his wordes, whiche must be holden for a Lawe: Quicquid sine discretione Iustitiæ contra Romanæ Ecclesiæ Disciplinam actum fuerit, ratum haberi nulla ratio permittit: *What so euer thinge is donne without discretion of Iustice, against the Order of the Churche of Rome, it maie not by any meanes be allowed.* By whiche wordes it appeareth, Ex contrario Sensu, *By an Argument of the contrarie*, that, what so euer is donne by discretion of Iustice, notwithstandinge it be against the Order of the Churche of Rome, yet ought it to be wel allowed. *Dist. 12. Non Decet.*

Addition. ☞ To this M. Hardinge answeareth, If I had seene the folie hereof, I would neuer haue Printed it for very shame. For the Glose there, whiche otherwheres he condemneth, as pelting, and beggerly, saithe thus: Here the Argument of the contrarie Sense is auoided, & taketh no place. But in deede, as it maie appeare, this poore Gloser him selfe was voide of sommewhat. For thus he concludeth, and that very wel, to M. Hardinges liking, *That without the Autheritie of the Churche of Rome we maie doo nothinge, be it neuer so iuste, and true, and neuer so muche donne by discretion of Iustice.* Yet, good Reader, Truthe is Truthe, and one for euer, whether the Churche of Rome wil allowe it, or no. Addition ☞ *M. Hard. pa. 155.*

S. Ambrose saithe, as in the same place he is alleged: Ego cùm Romam venio, Sabbatum ieiunio: cùm Mediolani sum non ieiuno: *When I comme to Rome, I faste on the Saturdaie: when I am at Millaine, I faste not.* By these wordes, that in the Churche of Millaine the Saturdaie was not fasted: And yet did they wel, and accordinge to the discretion of Iustice, and yet contrarie to the Order of the Churche of Rome. *Dist. 12. Illa.*

S. Augustine likewise in the same place saithe, *What so euer thinges are not contrarie, neither to the Catholique Faithe, nor to good maioners, they maie be taken as thinges indifferente.* Thus the Glose, that M. Hardinge so mutche commendeth, is quite contrarie to the Texte. As for the Order of the Churche of Rome, the Holy Catholique Fathers sommetimes, as it maie appeare, haue litle estemed it.

S. Hierome therof saithe thus vnto Euagrius, Quid mihi profers vnius Vrbis Consuetudinem? *What bringest thou mee the Custome of Rome, that is but one Cittie?* As if he would saie, Is that Order sufficient to binde the whole Churche of Christe? *If ye recken Authorities, the Worlde is greater then the Cittie of Rome.* This had beene prowdly, and disdeignefully spoken, had the Order of Rome beene a sufficient direction for al the worlde. *Hieronym. Ad Euagrium.*

S. Augustine saithe, Ne Catholicis quidem Episcopis consentiendum est, si cubi fortè falluntur, vt contra Canonicas Scripturas aliquid sentiant: *We maie not geue our consent vnto any Bisshoppes, be they neuer so Catholique, if they happen to be deceiued, and to determine contrarie to the Scriptures.* *August. de Vnitate Eccles. Catholicæ, cap. 10.*

And Pope Pius 2. him selfe saithe, Resistendum est quibuscunque in faciem, siue Paulus, siue Petrus sit, qui ad Veritatem non ambulat Euangelij: *We are bounde to withstande any man to the face, be it* Peter, *be it* Paule, *if he walke not to the Truthe of the Gospel.* *Abbas Vrsperg. pag. 443.*

To conclude, where the Woulfe is broken in, it is beste for the poore Sheepe, to breake out. That the Woulfe was broken in, beside the cruel spoile, and rauening of Christian Blonde, it is plaine by the wordes of S. Bernarde. For thus he speaketh therof in Open Councel, and in the presence of sundrie Bisshoppes: Non Custodiunt Gregem Dominum, sed maculant, & deuorant: *They keepe not the Lordes Flocke: but they kille it, and deuoure it.* Againe he saithe, Propterea relinquamus istos, quia non sunt Pastores, sed Traditores: *Therefore let vs leaue them: For they are not Pastoures, but Traitoures.* And therefore God thus warneth vs in the like case: *Bernardus in Concil. Remen. In eodem Concilio.*

the other Apoſtles equalvvith Peter.

Exite de medio horum hominum, ne cum illis pereatis: *Goe fourthe from the middes of thoſe Menne, leaſte yee periſhe al togeather.*

The Apologie, Cap. 3. Diuiſion. 3.

For al the Apoſtles, as Cyprian ſaithe, were of like power emonge themſelues, and the reſt were the ſame, that Peter was.

Numer. 16.

M. Hardinge.

Peters Power Ordinarie. The Apoſtles power Extraordinarie. Peter is the Shepehearde: The Apoſtles are the Sheepe. Manifeſt, and mere Vntruths. * Peter hathe Power to him, and to his Heires for euer: The Apoſtles haue Power onely for terme of Life.

Power is double, the one Ordinarie, the other by priuilege or Extraordinarie. Ordinarie Power is that whiche contineweth in one and the ſame courſe for euer. Accordinge to which Power Peter was Heade of the Churche, and his Succeſſours after him. Power by priuilege, or Extraordinarie is that whiche is geuen beſides the common courſe, by waie of diſpenſation. As where the other Apoſtles ſhoulde haue receiued Ordinarely theire Power from Peter, as who had commiſſion ouer al, bothe Lambes and Sheepe, amonge whom the Apoſtles had their place: Chriſte by ſpecial grace preuenteth ordinarie courſe, and maketh them for the time, and in their Perſons equal with Peter in the office of Apoſtleſhip. Thus conterninge ordinarie Power, Peter is Heade of the Apoſtles, and by that reaſon they are ſubiecte vnto him, as Sheepe vnto their Shepehearde. But by Priuilege true it is, as S. Cyprian ſaithe, They were of like power amonge themſelues. * Nowe what oddes there is betwixte an Ordinarie auctoritie of iudgeing geuen to any officer, for him ſelfe, and his Succeſſours in that Office for euer, and a ſpecial commiſſion for life time onely: ſo muche is betwixte Peter and the reſte of the Apoſtles.

Cyprian, De Simplicitate Prælatorum.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

S. Cyprians **wordes be plaine**: Hoc erant vtique & Cæteri Apoſtoli, quod fuit Petrus, pari conſortio præditi & Honoris, & Poteſtatis. Sed exordium ab Vnitate proficiſcitur, vt Eccleſia vna monſtretur: *The reſte of the Apoſtles were the ſame, that Peter was, al endewed with one Felowſhip bothe of Honour, and of Power. Yet the Beginninge is taken of One, to ſhewe, that the Churche is One.* **But al theſe wordes, be they neuer ſo plaine, are ſome ſhifted by a Prety Diſtinction, ſutche as neither** S. Cyprian, **nor any other Learned Father, or Doctour euer knewe.**

We are taught here to vnderſtande, that there are two Powers: The one Ordinarie, the other Extraordinarie. By Ordinarie Power, ſaithe M. Hardinge, that is to ſaie, by Order, and of Common Courſe, Peter appointed al the reſt of the Apoſtles, and gaue them Authoritie. And Chriſte alſo likewiſe gaue them Authoritie, but by Extraordinarie Power, that is to ſaie, beſides Order, and out of Courſe. Or, to vtter the matter in plainer wiſe, Peter gaue Power to the Apoſtles by his Vſual Authoritie, and by newe fourme of Lawe: But Chriſte gaue them Power, as M. Hardinge ſaithe, Onely for the time, and by waie of Diſpenſation, and beſides the Lawe. And thus Peter is the Ordinarie Heade of the Apoſtles: Chriſt is their Head too, howbeit, not in like ſorte, but Extraordinarie. For, as touchinge Order of gouernement, Peter is the Shepehearde, and the Apoſtles are the Sheepe. Al other the Apoſtles holde theire Power, as by Copie, for terme of life: Peter onely holdeth the ſame in Fee Simple, to him, and to his Heires for euer.

And, good Chriſtian Reader, leaſte thou ſhouldeſt thinke, I haue in ſcorne, and wilfully wreſted M. Hardinges wordes, which otherwiſe might be vttered by him in ſome ſober meaninge: maie it pleaſe thee by theſe fewe to conſider, what certaine others of that ſide haue vttered, and publiſhed, touchinge the ſame.

Petrus de Palude De Poteſta. Apoſtolor. Ar. 2.

Petrus de Palude **ſaithe thus**: Dico, quòd nullus Apoſtolorum, præter Petrum, factus eſt à Chriſto Epiſcopus: *I ſaie, that none of the Apoſtles, ſauinge onely* Peter, *was made Biſhop by Chriſte.* **And againe,** Videretur, in Nouo Teſtamento, quòd alij Apoſtoli à Chriſto Nullam Poteſtatem Iuriſdictionis receperunt: & per conſequens relinquitur, quòd Omnis Poteſtas Iuriſdictionis, quam habuerunt Apoſtoli, Specialiter poſt Chriſti Aſcenſum, fuit collata eis à Petro: *It woulde appeare, that in the Newe Teſtamente the reſte of the Apoſtles receiued no maner Power of Iuriſdiction at Chriſtes handes: and ſo conſequently it foloweth, that al the Power of Iuriſdiction, that the Apoſtles had, ſpecially after Chriſtes Aſcenſion, was geuen vnto them by* Peter.

Petr. De Palude In eodem Artic.

Petr. De Palude In eodem Cap. Verr. De Palude de Poteſtate Curator. Ar. 6.

Againe, he imagineth God the Father thus to ſaie vnto Chriſte: Conſtitues eos Principes, non per te, ſed per tuum Vicarium: *Thou ſhalte make the Apoſtles Gouernours ouer al the Earthe, not by thee ſelfe, but by* Peter *thy Vicare.* **And againe,** Paulus, & alij Apoſtoli à Petro, non debuerunt prædicare in Eccleſia ſpecialiter Petro commiſſa, niſi de eius licentia.

Vnde

Vnde à Christo habuerunt idoneitatem: à Petro autem Authoritatem: Paule, *and the other Apostles might not Preache in the Churche committed vnto* Peter, *but with* Peters *Licence. For of Christe they had onely Habilitie: but of* Peter *they receiued Authoritie.* In like maner writeth Pope Nicolas, Petrum in Consortium Individuæ Vnitatis assumptum, id, quod ipse erat, Dominus voluit nominari: *Our Lorde tooke* Peter *into the Felowship of the Holy Vnitie, and wouldé haue him called the same, that he was him selfe.*

The other Apostles equal vvith Peter.

Extra De Elect. & Electi potest. Fundamenta.

By sutche Amplifications, and outrage in speache, it woulde appeare, Christe were Peters Vicare: and not Peter Vicare vnto Christe. In this Sense, and meaninge M. Hardinge semeth to saie, that by Ordinarie, & common Course of Lawe, the Apostles had al their Power, not from Christe, but onely from Peter.

But here M. Hardinge vnwares falleth into a maruellous inconuenience. For, these thinges thus graunted, it must néedes folow, that during the time of Christes abeade in Earthe, the Apostles had no manner Ordinarie Power at al: neither to Preache, nor to Baptize, nor to Binde, nor to Lose. For Heruæus a Doctour of M. Hardinges side, saithe thus: Sciendum, quòd, cùm Christus conuersabatur cum hominibus, non fuit alius Papa præter ipsum: nec Petrus tunc habuit Potestatem Papalem: *Wee muste vnderstande, that while Christe was conuersante emongst vs in Earthe, there was none other Pope, but he alone: Neither then had* Peter *the Popes Authoritie.*

Heruæus de Potestate Papæ. His suppositis.

So likewise saithe Petrus de Palude: Non decebat esse simul, nisi Vnum Summum Pontificem. Vnde, Christo Ascensuro, debuit Petrus fieri Episcopus Summus, & non antè: *It was not meete there shoulde be more then One Highest Bishop at one time. Therefore when Christe was readie to Ascende into Heauen, it was conuenient to make* Peter *the Highest Bishop, and not before.*

Petr. de Palude De Potestate Apostolorum.

For so longe time, Christe coulde not geue his Apostles any Ordinarie Authoritie: for M. Hardinge telleth vs, that his Power herein was onely Extraordinarie: Of the other side, Peter coulde geue them none: for as Heruæus, and Paludensis saie, Vntil Christes Ascension he was not Pope.

But to leaue these vaine Fantasies, not worthe the hearinge, S. Paule wil soone remoue al these doubtes. Thus he writeth of him selfe: Paule *the Apostle, not of Men, nor appointed by Menne, but by Iesus Christe, and God the Father.* And S. Chrysostome hereof writeth thus, Paulus nihil opus habebat Petro, nec illius egebat voce: sed Honore Pat erat ilh. Nihil enim hic dicam amplius: Paule *had no manner of lacke of* Peter: *nor stoode in neede of his voice, or allowance: but in Honour was his Felowe. For I wil here saie nomore.* His meaninge is, He was his better.

Galat. 1.

Chryso in Epist. Ad Gala. ca. 2.

Howe be it, what nede wordes? Set contention aparte: the case is cleare: For it was not Peter, that breathed ouer the Apostles: It was not Peter, that saide vnto them, *Goe to the lost Sheepe of the house of Israel: Receiue the Holy Ghoste: Goe into al the Worlde, and Preache the Gospel.* Al this Power was geuen them by Christe alone, and not by Peter.

Iohn 20. Marc. 16.

Nowe, where as M. Hardinge teacheth vs, that Peter was the Shepeheard, and the Apostles the Sheepe, makinge them al as muche inferiour vnto Peter, as the Sheepe is inferiour vnto the Shepeheard: S. Hierome saithe, notwithstanding he graunte, that of the twelue Apostles One was chosen, that, a Heade beinge appointed, occasion of diuision might be removed, yet he saithe, Super Petrum fundatur Ecclesia: Licet ad ipsum in alio loco super Omnes Apostolos fiat, & cuncti claues Regni Cœlorum accipiant, & Ex Aequo super eos Ecclesiæ fortitudo solidetur: *For wil ye, the Churche is founded vpon Peter. Notwithstandinge in an other place the same thinge is done vpon al the Apostles: and al receiue the keies of the Kingdome of Heauen: and the strength of the Churche is founded equally vpon them al.* Like wise the Learned Father Origen saithe, Quòd si Super Vnum illum Petrum tantum existimas ædificari totam Ecclesiam, quid dicturus es de Iohanne Filio Tonitrui, & Apostolorum vnoquoque? *If thou thinke, the whole Churche was builded onely vpon* Peter, *what wilte thou then saie of* Iohn *the Sonne of the Thunder, and of euery of the Apostles?*

Hieron. Aduers. Iouinian. Lib. 1.

Origen. in Matth. Tract. 1.

Therefore S. Chrysostome of Peter saithe thus: Duplex crimen erat: tum quia repugnauit, tum quia cæteris seipsum præposuit: Peter *was in double faulte: bothe*

Chryso. in Matth. Hom. 83.

the other Apostles equalvvith Peter.

both for that he withstode Christe, and also for that he sette him selfe before the reste.

Addition. ☞ It maie be saide, These woordes are not specially spoken of the Superioritie of S. Peter. Al this I graunt, Yet by the same woordes he is blamed for settinge him selfe before the rest. But in the same Homilie Chrysostome calleth Peter, Verorem Apostolorum: *The Heade of the Apostles*, saithe M. Hardinge. So doth the same Chrysostome call Elias, Caput Prophetarum: *The Heade of the Prophetes.* Yet had not Elias therfore al other Prophetes in subiection. S. Gregorie calleth Paule, Caput Nationum: *The Heade of Nations*: And Chrysostome saithe, Paule *was in a manner the Common Father of al the Worlde.* Againe he saithe, Nullus Paulum antecedit. De ea re nemo omnium dubitat: *No man hathe place before* Paule. *And therof noman doubteth.* Yet was not Paule therefore the Bishop of Rome. ☜

Addition ☞

M. Har. fo. 157. b

Chryso. ad Roman. Homil. 18.

Gregor. 1. Reg. Lib. 4. Cap. 4.

Chryso. De Laudib. Pauli. Ho. 3.

Chryso. in Matthe. Homil. 66.

August. Epist. 86.

August. in Epist. Ad Galat. C. 2.

Gloss. Galat. 2.

S. Augustine maketh Peter Felowe, and Equal with the other Apostles: Inter se concorditèr viscerunt Petrus, & Condiscipuli eius: Peter *and his Felowes lived agreeably togaither.* And againe, Christus sine personarum acceptione hoc dedit Paulo, vt Ministraret Gentibus, quod etiam Petro dederat, vt Ministraret Iudæis: *Christe without any choise of Personnes, gaue the same (Authoritie) to* Paule, *to Minister emonge the Heathens, that he gaue to* Peter, *to Minister emonge the Iewes.* And the deep Ordinarie Glose geueth these woordes to S. Paule: Non didici ab alijs, tanquam a Maioribus: sed contuli cum illis, tanquam cum amicis, & Paribus: *I learned not of (Peter, and) others, as of my betters: but I had conference with them, as with my Equalles, and Frendes.* Likewise Paule him selfe saithe, Iacobus, Petrus, Iohannes, qui videbantur Columnæ esse, dextras dederunt mihi, & Barnabæ Societatis: Iames, Peter, *and* Iohn, *that seemed to be the Pillers, gaue vnto mee, and* Barnabas *the right handes of Felowship:* Which the Glose expoundeth thus, Societatis, id est Aequalitatis: *Of Felowship, that is to saie, of Equalitie.*

Galat. 2.

Therefore, notwithstandinge M. Hardinges Ordinarie, and Extraordinarie Distinctions, S. Cyprians woordes are plaine, and true, *The reste of the Apostles were euen the same* (in Authoritie) *that* Peter *was, al endewed with One Felowship, bothe of Honour, and of Power.*

The Apologie, Cap. 3. Division. 4.

And that it was saide indifferently to them al, Feede yee: indifferently to them al, Goe into the vvhole vvorlde: indifferently to them al, Teache yee the Gospel.

M. Hardinge.

VVee denie, that it was saide indifferently to them al, Feede yee. Yea, or that it was saide at al, Feede yee. To Peter, and none els was it saide, Feede my Lambes, Feede my Sheepe. VVhich woorde of Feedinge so singularly spoken to Peter in the preface of the other Apostles, proueth, that it was not indifferently saide to al, Feede yee. That they were sente into the whole worlde, and that they were commaunded to teache, and in that respecte also to Feede, wee confesse vnder the distinction of Ordinarie and Extraordinarie Power before mentioned.

Ioha. 21.

Marc. 16.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

It forceth not greatly, what M. Hardinge denie, or graunte, hauinge neither Reason, nor Authoritie, but onely his owne. But if Power were not geuen indifferently to al the Apostles, tel vs then, as touching Feedinge, wherein is the odes? What had Peter more? What had the others lesse? Or what Olde Doctoure, or Learned Father euer sawe this Difference?

Addition ☞

Addition. ☞ Here M. Harding onely crieth out, Impudencie, and Shame vpon vs, & therein nothinge. And no great maruele. For nothing was to be shewed. ☜

M. Har. pag. 159

Christe saide Equally vnto them al, *Receiue the Holy Ghoste: Whose Sinnes yee forgeue, they are forgeuen: Goe into the whole Worlde: Preache the Gospel to euery Creature.* These woordes pertaine equally vnto al. Peter had nomore the Holy Ghost, nomore Power to forgeue Sinnes, nomore Commission to goe into the whole Worlde, nomore Authoritie to Preache the Gospel, then others had.

John. 21. Matth. 28. Marc. 16.

M. Hardinge saithe, To the reste of the Apostles it was not saide at al, *Feede yee.* To Peter, and to none els, was it saide, *Feede my Lambes: Feede my Sheepe.*

Addition. ☞ Yet the Ancient Learned Father Origen, speakinge namely of these Addition ☞

of these woordes, *Vpon this Rocke wil I builde my Church*: And, *To thee wil I geeue the keies of the Kingedome of Heauen*, saithe thus, Hæc velut ad Petrum dicta, sunt omnium Communia: *These woordes beeinge spoken as vnto Peter, are common to al the Apostles.* These woordes saithe he, are not spoken directly, or onely vnto Peter, but, As vnto Peter. And the other Apostles haue the keies, and are the Rocke as wel as Peter. If this be true, as it is, with what good countenance then can M. Hardinge so boldely telle vs, *To Peter, and none els was it saide, Feede my Lambes, Feede my Sheepe.* Origen. *In Matthe. Tracta. 1.*

And S. Hierome saithe, as it is before alleged, *Al the Apostles receiued the Keies of the Kingdome of Heauen: and the strength of the Churche was builte* Equally *vpon them al.* Hierony. *contra Iouinian. Lib. 1.*

S. Paule saithe: *What is* Apollo, *what is* Paule, *but the Ministers of Christe, through whome ye haue beleeued? Paule hath planted.* Apollo *hath watered, He that planteth, is nothinge: He that watreth, is nothinge.* 1. Cor. 3.

Chrysostome saithe: Angeli, quamlibet magni, tamen Serui sunt, ac Ministri: *The Angels of God, be they neuer so greate, yet are they but Seruantes, and Ministers.* Therefore, to conclude, he saithe: Ne Paulo quidem obedire Oportet, si quid proprium dixerit, si quid humanum: sed Apostolo Christum in se loquentem circumferenti: *Wee maie not beleeue* Paule *him selfe, if he speake any thinge of his owne, or of worldly reason: but we muste beleeue the Apostle beeringe about Christe speakinge within him.* Chryso. *in Epist. Ad Gala. Ca. 1.* Chryso. *in Epist. ad Timoth. 2. Hom. 2.*

Addition. This is your owne badde stuffe (saithe M. Hardinge) and proueth nothinge. *The Answeare.* What stuffe it is, how mutche it weigheth, and how wel it proueth, I wil not striue: but leaue the iudgemente vnto the Reader. Thus mutche, I trowe, at least it proueth, *That the Churche was equally builte vpon al the Apostles,* as wel vpon Iames, or Iohn, as vpon S. Peter: For so saithe S. Hierome: *And that Christes woordes spoken as vnto* Peter, *were common to al.* For so saithe Origen. This M. Hardinge, was my pourpose to proue: And this, I thought, had benne sufficient. It proueth, that in the Apostleship, Peter, and Paule, and the reste of the Apostles were al one, and so one of them not so farre inferiour to an other, as is imagined. It proueth, that Peter, and Paule, as touchinge their personnes, and offices of Plantinge, and Watringe, were bothe nothinge. For so saithe S. Paule, *He that planteth is nothinge: And he that watreth, is nothinge.* And what greate difference in dignitie can you finde, M. Hardinge, betweene nothinge, and nothinge? If Peter, that chosen vessel, that planted Christes Churche, be nothinge, what then is he, that hath rooted vp al thinges, and planteth nothinge? M. Hardinge. 1. Cor. 3.

The Apologie, Cap. 3. Diuision. 5.

And, as Hierome saith, Al Bishoppes where so euer they be, be they at Rome, be they at Eugubium, be they at Constantinople, be they at Rhegium, be al of like Preeminence, and of like Priesthood. And, as Cyprian saithe, There is but one Bishoppike, and a peece thereof is perfitely and wholy holden of euery particular Bishop. Ad Euagrium. De Simpl. Prælator.

M. Hardinge.

The Interpreter, not without the wil and aduise of this Defender, hath altered the Sense of the Latine, as the Author of the Latine hath altered the woordes of S. Hierome. For neither speaketh S. Hierome of Bishoppes in the plural number, neither saith the Latine Apologie, that the Bishoppes be al of like Preeminence, whiche this Translation hath, but of the same Merite, and of the same Priesthode: With the woorde Preeminence guilefully shifted into the sentence in place of this woorde Merite, these false players thought to winne the game. That is, that al Bishoppes, after the minde of S. Hierome be of like Preeminence, and so that al be of like Power, and auctoritie, and none aboue other. Vntruth. Reade the Answeare.

Hieromes place discussed.

Concerninge the place alleged, S. Hierome in an Epistle to Eugrius speakinge against that a particular custome of the Churche of Rome shoulde Preiudicate the Auctoritie of the whole world, inuerteringe Deacons before Priestes, compareth Bishoppes of greate Cities and litle Townes together, and saithe, that as touchinge the Honour, Dignitie, and Power of Bishoply Order and Office, and of Priesthood, as good and as greate a Bishop in that respect is the One, as the other. and that the Bishop of Eugubium, and Rhegium, two litle Townes in Italie, and of Thebes an other litle Towne in Egypte, are Bishoppes and Priestes, and haue as great (a) Merite in regarde of any their Vertues, and as greate Power concerninge the order of Priesthood, as the Bishoppes of Rome, or Constantinople, or Rhegium, or Eugubium. Yet touchinge Power and Auctoritie of regiment, the Patriarkes of Constantinople, Alexandria, and Antiochia be aboue Bishoppes of other Dioceses, and the Bishop of Rome Peters Successour is (b) aboue al. For we beinge many are one Body in Christe, and euery

(a) This was no parte of the question.

(b) Vntruth. For the B. of Rome is equal with the other foure Patriarkes, as shal appeare.

man amonge our selues one an others members. This knotte requireth a mutual consente of the whole Bodie, but chiefly the concorde of Priestes: amonge whō although dignitie be not common to them al, yet order is general, as Leo writteth. For euen amonge the moste blessed Apostles (saithe he) in likenesse of Honour there was ordes of Power, And whereas the Election of them al was equal, yet to One was it geuen to be ouer the reste. Out of waighe platte rose the distinction also of Bishoppes, and with greate Prouidence it hath beene disposed, that al shoulde not take al vpon them, but that in euery prouince there shoulde be one, who as it were firste geue his sentence amonge his brethren: and againe, that in the greate Cities some should be ordeined for takinge vpon them matters of greater care, through whose the charge of the Vniuersal Churche should haue course to the one see of Peter, and that nothinge shoulde euer dissent from the Head.

Epist. 84. Amonge Bishoppes is difference of Power with likenesse of Honour.

Howe greate, and Honorable so euer the rowme is, that any Bisshoppe is placed in, be he Archbishop, Metropolitane, Primate, Patriarke, or Pope him selfe: He is no more a Bishop, then any other of those, who occupie the lowest rowme. The diuersitie consisteth in this, that they are called to parte of charge in sundry proportions, as the Bishoprikes are greater or lesse: the Pope hath committed vnto him (e) the charge of the whole Folde of Christe, and hath the fulnes of Power. For if al were of like Power, as these Defenders teache, Vnitie coulde not be maintained. VVherefore (d) by very order of Christe him selfe it hath beene ordened, that maters touchinge Faithe and Religion, at leaste suche as be weighty, be referred to that one Prince of Pastours, who sitteth in the chaire of Peter, the Highest Bishop, whiche hath (e) alwaies beene donne and obserued from the Apostles time to our daies by Catholikes, and not seldome also by Heretikes.

The diuersitie betweene Bishoppes, whereof consisteth.

(e) Vntruth: For Christe neuer gaue the Pope any suche charge.

(d) Vntruth. For Christe neuer gaue suche order.

(e) Vntruth: For it hath not alwaies beene obserued.

The sentence that this Defender alleageth out of S. Cyprian, It seemeth he vnderstoode it not. Ye saie, that a piece of that one Bishoprike is perfitely and wholy holden of euery particular Bishop. But what meane ye by that? If by this woorde, *In solidum*, perfitely and wholy holden, ye meane, that euery particular Bishop is a Bishop without dependunge of any other, then ye speake against the woordes yee bringe out of S. Cyprian. VVho saithe, that as there are many beames of one Sunne, many boughes of one roote, many Riuers of one Fountaine: so there are many Bishoppes of one Bishoprike. Therefore this Bishoprike is vnto particular Bishoppes, as the Sunne, as the Roote, as the Fountaine. (f) VVhat the Fountaine, Roote, and Sunne of this Bishoprike is, S. Cyprian declareth a litle before, shewinge that it was saide to Peter, To thee I wil geue the keies of the Kingedome of Heauen. And, Feede my Sheepe:

De Simplicitate Prælatorum.

(f) Vntruth with out any likelihoode, or regarde of truth.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Here M. Hardinge chargeth vs with two of his owne common faultes: Firste with Corruption: nexte with Ignorance. With Corruption, in the woordes, and sense of S. Hieromes: with Ignorance, in the place of S. Cyprian. But if we be able sufficiently, and truely to answeare bothe, I truste, M. Hardinge shal haue no great cause, wiselie to vaunte him selfe, either of his plaine dealinge herein, or of his knowledge.

And here, to dissemble these childishe cauillations of the altering of Numbers, the Singulare into the Plural: and of the changinge of this woorde, Merito, into this woorde, Preeminence: whiche greate faulte, if it were aue, by M. Hardinges owne Confession, proceaded onely from the Interpreter, and not from the Authour: I saie, to dissemble, and to passe by al these sely quarrels, what S. Hierome meante hereby, Erasmus a man of greate Learninge, and iudgemente, expounded thus: Hieronymus æquare videtur omnes Episcopos inter se, perinde quasi omnes ex æquo Apostolis successerint, Nec putat vllum Episcopum alio minorem esse, quòd sit humilior: aut Maiorem, quòd sit Opulentior: Nam æquat Eugubiensem Episcopum cum Romano. Deinde non putat, Episcopum quouis Presbytero præstantiorem esse, nisi quòd ius habeat Ordinandi: Hierome *seemeth to matche al Bishoppes togeather, as if they were al* equally *the Apostles Successours. And he thinketh not any Bishop to be lesse then other, for that he is poorer: or greater then other, for that he is richer. For he maketh the Bishop of* Eugubium (a **poore towne**) equal *with the Bishop of Rome. And further he thinketh, that a Bishop is no better then any Priestes, sauinge that the Bishop hath Authoritie to Order Ministers.*

Erasm. in schol. in 1. post. ad Timoth.

Addition. ☞ **Hereto M. Hardinge answeareth thus:** *Erasmus*, saithe within fiue lines following, that the Metropolitane hath a certaine Dignitie and Iurisdiction aboue other Bishoppes. Take the one, (saithe he) with the other.

Addition ☞

M. Hard. 164. a.

The Answeare. **I am contented, M. Hardinge,** Erasmus saithe, **The Metropolitane has a Dignitie aboue other Bishoppes. But he saithe not, The Bishop of Rome had Iurisdiction ouer al Bishoppes throughout the woorlde. In S. Hieromes time there were,** Metropolitanes, Archebishoppes, Archedeacons, **and others. But** Christe

Equalitie of Bishoppes.

Christe appointed not these distinctions of Orders from the beginninge. These names are not founde in al the Scriptures. This is the thinge, that wee defende. S. Hierome saithe, Sciant Episcopi &c. *Let Bishoppes understande* (whereunto wee adde further, let the Bishoppes of Rome them selues understande) *that they are in authoritie, ouer Priestes, more by custome, then by order of Goddes Truthe.* These be S. Hieromes wordes, truely translated. What he meante thereby I leaue to the iudgemente of the Reader. Hieron. in Epist. ad Titum, Ca. 1.

Erasmus likewise saithe, in the selfe same place aboue alleged: Quod Episcopo minus tribuit Dignitatis &c. *Whereas* S. Hierome *yeeldeth lesse Dignitie, and Authoritie vnto Bishoppes, then nowe a daies they seeme to haue, wee must understande, he spake of that time, wherein he lined. If he had seene our Bishoppes, that nowe be, he woulde haue saide otherwise.* For nowe the Pope clameth a power aboue al the powers in Heauen, and Earthe: as it is written in the Councel of Laterane. Against Erasmus in an other place speakinge hereof, saithe thus: Sanctus vir ingenuè fatetur, Episcopum Romanum non esse cæteris Episcopis sublimiorem Sacerdotio, sed tantùm opibus: *This Holy man* S. Hierome *saithe plainely, and freely, and as he thinketh, that the Bishoppe of Rome is aboue other Bishoppes, not by Bishopriks, but onely by Richesse.* By his Richesse onely, M. Hardinge, Erasmus saithe, the Pope is aboue other Bishoppes. By Richesse onely, (he saith) not by right of Goddes Worde: not by Vertue, not by Learninge, not by diligence in Preachinge: but onely by Richesse. Nowe it maie please you, to folowe your owne rule, and to laie the one saieinge to the other. Erasm. in schol. in Epist. ad Euagrium. Sub Leone, Sess. 10. Erasm. in Apologia ad Pium.

But S. Hieromes wordes are plaine of them selfe, and haue no neede of other Expositour. Thus he writeth: Quid facit, excepta Ordinatione, Episcopus, quod Presbyter non faciat? Nec altera Romanæ Vrbis Ecclesia, altera totius Orbis existimanda est. Et Gallia, & Britannia, & Aphrica, & Persis, & Oriens, & India, & Omnes Barbaræ Nationes Vnum Christum adorant: vnam obseruant regulam Veritatis. Si Authoritas quæritur, Orbis maior est Vrbe. Vbicunque fuerit Episcopus, siue Eugubij, siue Constantinopoli, siue Alexandriæ, siue Tanai, eiusdem Meriti, eiusdem est Sacerdotij. Potentia diuitiarum, & paupertatis humilitas, vel sublimiorem, vel Inferiorem Episcopum non facit. Cæterum omnes Apostolorum Successores sunt. Quid mihi profers Vnius Vrbis consuetudinem? *What doothe a Bishop, saiinge onely the Orderinge of Ministers, but a Priestes maie doo the same? Neither maie wee thinke, that the Churche of Rome is one, and the Churche of al the worlde beside is an other.* Fraunce, England, Aphrica, Persia, Leuante, India, *and al the Barbarous Nations woorshipp one* Christe, *and keepe one rule of the Truthe.* *If wee seeke for Authoritie, The whole worlde is greater then the Cittie of* Rome. *Where so euer there be a Bishop, be it at* Eugubium, *be it at* Rome, *be it at* Constantinople, *be it at* Rhegium, *be it at* Alexandria, *be it at* Tanais, *they are al of one woorthinesse, they are al of one Bishopriks. The Power of Richesse, and the baseneesse of Pouertie, maketh not a Bishop either Higher or Lower. For they are al the Apostles Successours. What bringe you nue the Custome of Rome,* beinge but one Cittie? Hieronym. ad Euagrium.

Addition. Here M. Hardinge findeth greate faulte, for that I haue translated these wordes, Eiusdem Sacerdotij, *Of one Bishopriks*, and not, as he would haue it, *Of one Priesthoode*. God wote a very simple quarrel. Let him take, whether he liketh better: if either other of these wordes shal serue his turne. Erasmus saithe, Id temporis idem erat Episcopus, Sacerdos, & Presbyter: *These three names at that time were al one.* Erasm. aduersus Albert. pium.

Now, if M. Hardinge wil steale awaie in the darke, as his manner is, and saie, that S. Hierome spake onely of the Merite of Life, or of the Office of Priesthoode, let some man telle him, that this was no parte, neither of the question moued, nor of the answeare of S. Hierome: And S. Hierome in plaine, and expresse wordes saithe, Si Authoritas quæritur, *If wee seeke* (not for Merite of Life, but) *for Authoritie in gouernmente, therein the whole worlde is greater then the*

Cittie

Equalitie of Bishoppes.

Cittie of Rome. M. Hardinge imagineth, S. Hierome spake onely of, I know not what: but S. Hierome him selfe saieth, he speaketh namely of Authoritie.

And whereas M. Hardinge is so bigely offended with the chaunginge of this worde, Merite, into this worde, Preeminence, and saithe further, that these False Plaiers thought thereby to winne the game, it maie please him to remember, that, how so euer the game goe, S. Hierome him selfe plainely plaide the selfe same game: I meane, that S. Hierome vsinge this worde, Merite, without question meante, Preeminence, and not Merite of Life. For thus he saithe, Potentia Diuitiarum, & Paupertatis humilitas, vel Sublimiorem, vel Inferiorem Episcopum non facit: *The Power of Richesse, and the baseneſſe of Powertie maketh not a Bishop either Higher, or Lower.* M. Hardinge might easily haue seene, that *Higher*, and *Lower*, perteine not to Merite of Life, but to Preeminence. Therefore lette him looke better vpon his Booke, before he thus lightly condemne others of corruption.

I graunt, it is true, as M. Hardinge saithe, This quarrel firste beganne aboute a particulare Custome of the Churche of Rome, where as the Deacons vaunted them selues, and would be placed aboue the Priestes. But here M. Hardinge, as his maner is, willingly dissembleth, and suppresseth somewhat. S. Augustine more liuely, and fully expresseth the same. For thereof he writeth thus: Quidam, qui nomen habet Falcidij, Duce stultitia, & Romanæ Ciuitatis Iactantia, Leuitas Sacerdotibus, & Diaconos Presbyteris coæquare contendit: *One Falcidius, Foolishneſſe, and the Pride of the Cittie of Rome leadinge him thereto, laboureth to make the Deacons Equal with the Priestes.*

Auguſt. in quæſt. Veter. & Noui Teſtam. quæſt. 101.

This lewd disorder S. Hierome controlleth by the Examples of other Churches, and saithe, that therein the Authoritie of the whole worlde is greater, then the Authoritie of the Churche of Rome: Of whiche also he seemeth to speake scornefully, and with some disdeigne. For thus he saithe, Quid mihi profers Vnius Vrbis Consuetudinem? *What bringe you me the Custome of* (Rome, beinge but) *One Cittie?* By whiche wordes it seemeth, he made smal accoumpte of the Cittie of Rome.

But M. Hardinge saithe, The Primates had Authoritie ouer other Inferiour Bishoppes. I graunte: they had so. How be it, they had it by agreement, and Custome: But neither by Christe, nor by Peter or Paule, nor by any Right of Goddes Worde. S. Hierome saithe, Nouerint Episcopi, se magis Consuetudine, quàm Dispositionis Dominicæ Veritate, Presbyteris esse Maiores, & in commune debere Ecclesiam regere: *Let Bishoppes vnderstande, that they are aboue Priestes, rather of Custome, then of any Truthe, or Right of Christes Institution: and that they ought to rule the Churche altogeather.* And againe, Idem ergo est Presbyter, qui Episcopus: Et antequam Diaboli instinctu studia in Religione fierent, & diceretur in populis, Ego sum Pauli, Ego Apollo, Ego Cephæ, Communi Presbyterorum Consilio Ecclesiæ gubernabantur: *Therefore a Priest, and a Bishop are bothe one thinge: And, before that by the inflaminge of the Diuel, parties were taken in Religion, and these woordes were vttered emonge the people, I holde of Paule, I holde of Apollo, I holde of Peter, the Churches were gouerned by the Common Aduise of the Priestes.* S. Augustine saithe, Secundum honorum vocabula, quæ iam Ecclesiæ vsus obtinuit, Episcopatus Presbyterio maior est: *The office of a Bishop is aboue the office of a Priest,* (not by Authoritie of the Scriptures, but) *after the Names of Honour, whiche the Custome of the Churche hath nowe obteined.*

Hieron. in Epiſt. ad Titum. cap. 1.

Hieronym. eod. loco.

Auguſt. Epiſt. 19

As for Pope Leo, his owne Authoritie in his owne cause cannot be greate. The Emperoure saithe, Qui Iurisdictioni præest, non debet sibi ius dicere: *No Iudge maie minister Lawe vnto himselfe.* And it is noted thus in the Decrees, Papa non debet esse Iudex in causa propria: *The Pope maie not be iudge in his owne cause.*

ff. Li. 2. De Iurisdict. omnium Iudicum.

16. q. 6. Cõsuetudo: In Margine.

Addition. And whose cause pleadeth he but his owne? It is the Churches cause, saith M. Harding. But the Churche hath euermore repined against it. Addition

M. Hard. 168. b.

ſt. S. Baſile ſaithe: Quid auxilij nobis conferet Occidentalium faſtus? *What good ſhal the Pride of the Weaſtren Churche doo vs?* Nottinge thereby, as we mate reaſonably coniecture, the immoderate Pride of the Courche of Rome. S. Bernarde in like ſorte chargeth Pope Eugenius: Ambitio per te in Eccleſia regnare molitur. Murmur loquor, & querimoniam Communem Eccleſiarum. Truncari ſe clamant, & demembrari: *Pride ſtriueth through thee to reigne in the Churche. I ſpeake of the murmuringe, and common complainte of Churches. They complaine, they be maimed, and diſmembred.* Wherfo ſo euer ſhal conſider, howe the Popes haue enriched them ſelues, by the ſpoiles of others, he ſhal eaſily iudge, whether they haue ſought their owne, or the thinges, that pertaine to Chriſte Jeſu. ☜

Basil. ad Euseb. Epiſt. 11.

Bernard. De Conſidera. Li. 3.

It is wel knowen, that the Pope hath ſought for, and claimed this Vniuerſal Authoritie theſe many hundred yeres. Pope Cœleſtinus was therefore reproued of Pride, and worldly Lordlineſſe by the whole Councel of Aphrica.

Concil. Aphrica. ca. 10. Superbum ſecuti typhum.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ Where I ſaie, Pope Cœleſtinus was reproued by the whole Councel of Aphrica of Pride, and Lordlineſſe, M. Hardinge thinketh, I vnderſtand not the place. And therefore he hath taken vpon him to open it better: but ſo, as they doo, that goe onely by gheaſſe. It ſeemeth (ſaithe he) that the Pope had ſente his Agentes, to require temporal aide of the Nobles in Aphrica. VVhiche thinge nowe is called *Implorare brachium Seculare*. And this is it, that miſliked the Councel. Therefore they ſaie to the Pope, wee beſeche you, ſende not your Clerkes, *Quibuſcunque Potentibus*, that is, to any of the great men, leaſte wee ſeeme to bringe the ſmokie ſtoutneſſe of the Temporaltie into the Churche of Chriſte. By this fauourable conſtruction he diſchargeth the Pope, and his Clergie of Pride, and Statelineſſe, and conueigheth ouer the ſame vnto the Nobles, onely vpon occaſion of theſe wordes, Quibuſcunq; Potentibus. And therefore, he ſaithe, VVhether M. Iewel vnderſtoode this place, or no, I haue good cauſe to doubte. And yet there appeareth no ſuche greate difficultie in the mater, but that a meane learned man mate vnderſtande it wel enough with ſmal ſtudie. Notwithſtandinge, M. Hardinge, whether you vnderſtande this place, or no, M. Iewel hath no cauſe to doubt. For in deede you vnderſtande it not. The ouer great fauoure, you beare the Pope, in ſmothinge his faultes, what ſo euer, and the blinde errour of Peter Crabbe, that compiled the Counceiles, hath ſowly beguiled you. For the true Copies haue not Quibuſcunque Potentibus, as you imagine: but, Quibuſcunque Petentibus: as you might haue learned by Theodorus Balſamon, printed at Pariſe, An. 1561. and by the wordes of the ſaide Epiſtle written in Greeke. For thus it is written: Ἐκεῖ βασὰς τέλνν πληρώνδυς ὑμῶν τ τῶν αἰτούντων μὴ θέλετε ἀπορίλλειν: Theſe wordes, as you knowe, ſignifie not Lordes, and Gouernours, but Supplianles, and Suiters. But, M. Hardinge, is this the grammercie, ye yelde the Prince: when ye calle vpon him for aide, and aſſiſtance, wil ye ſaie, he is proude, & ſtately, and bringeth vaine ſtoutneſſe and ſtatelineſſe into the Churche? Verily the Prince defendinge the Churche, might ſeeme to deſerue ſome greater thankes. I doubte, whether there were euer ſuche Pride, & Lordlineſſe in any Prince worldly, as hath benne founde, and ſeene in ſundrie Popes. The Pope admitteth the Emperoure of Chriſtendome to holde his Stirope, to leade his Bridle, to beare his Traine, to kiſſe his Foote. No Emperoure euer receiued ſuche ſeruice of the Pope. Doubtleſſe, M. Hardinge, the Councel of Aphrica meante the ſtoutenelſe of the Clergie, and not of the Nobles: the pride of Rome, and not of Aphrica. This ſame is it, that, as it is ſaide before, S. Baſile calleth, Occidentalium Epiſcoporum faſtum. But you, M. Hardinge, haue turned Petentes into Potentes, that is to ſaie, Poore ſuiters, into great Noble menne. And to ſhifte the Pope from note of ſtatelineſſe, ye haue imagined a longe Commentarie of your owne, peraduenture a greate waie beſide the texte. ☜

Petentibus.

Petentibus.

Τῶν αἰτούντων.

Basil. ad Eusb. Epiſt. 11.

Pope Bonifacius 2. condemned S. Auguſtine, and al the ſaide whole Councel of Aphrica, and called them al Heretiques, and Schiſmatiques, for the ſame, & ſaide, they were al * leadde by the Diuel.

Inter Decreta Bonifa. 2.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ M. Hardinge. That Pope Bonifacius 2. condemned that Bleſſed Father S. Auguſtine by name, or the Councel of Aphrica, by ſolemne ſen-

* Inſtigante Diabolo.

tence,

tence, it is an impudent lie. *The Answeare.* Theise wordes be Odinarie, M. Hardinge, and therefore moue me but litle. But what talke you of condemninge by Name, or by Solemne Sentence? I saye, Pope Boniface *the seconde condemned* S. Augustine. You adde, Name, and Sentence, of your owne. They are not mine. But whether hee condemned S. Augustine, or no, the indifferent Reader maie easily iudge. His wordes be theise, Aurelius *sometime the Bishop of Carthage, beganne with other his fellowe Bishoppes, by the Entisinge, or Leadinge of the Diuel, to be prowde and arrogant against the Churche of Rome.* Here is Aurelius condemned with his fellowes. But who were his fellowes, M. Hardinge? Who sate with him in Councel? Who were parteners of his pride against the Churche of Rome? Why carrie you this awaie so closely in a clowde? Verily you knowe right wel, and cannot chuse but know, that S. Augustine was one of that companie, togeather with Alypius Restitutus, and two hundred and fourtæne Bishoppes besides, as appeareth by theire Epistle vnto Bonifacius 1. In the subscriptions of euery of theise Counselles, of Carthage, of Mileuetum, and of Aphrica, you maie finde these wordes, Ego Augustinus Episcopus Hipponensis subscripsi.: You see therefore, that Pope Boniface 2. condemned, not onely Aurelius the Archebishop of Carthage, but also the greate learned Father S. Augustine, and two hundred, and fourtæne other his fellowe Bishoppes, that sate with him in Councel, and that aboue one hundred yeres after they were dead. But you saie, Bonifacius *condemned them not for Schismatiques.* I graunte, by any suche expresse wordes he condemneth them not. Perhappes he condemned them for good Catholiques. Certainely he diuided them from the Communion of the Churche: & for so muche he condemned them as Schismatiques. Heretiques in deede he calleth them not. And yet Pope Nicolas saithe, Qui Romanæ &c. *Who so seeketh to make voide the Priuilege of the Church of Rome, falleth into Heresie.* For he breaketh the Faith, who so euer withstandeth the Churche of Rome, that is the Mother of Faith. This M. Hardinge, is it, that Pope Bonifacius meante, when he saide, Aurelius, S. Augustine, *and two hundred other Learned, and godly Bishoppes in the Councel of* Aphrica, *were Leadde by the Diuel.*

Epist. Bonifac. 2. ad Eulalium.

Conc. Aphrican. Pag. 518.

Dist. 22. Omnes.

The prety nice difference, that M. Hardinge here imagineth betwæne Entisinge, and Leading, is not worthy of answeare. For no Pope was euer so cruell, to condemne a man for that he was entised, but onely for that he yelded and was Leadde by the Diuel.

M Hard. 172. a.

Pope Zosimus, to maintaine this claime, corrupted the Holy Councel of Nice: Hilarie, the Bishop of Vienna, and other Learned Bishoppes of France, for vsurping suche vnlawful Authoritie, charged this same Pope Leo, of whome we speake, with Pride, and Ambition. *Addition.* ☞ And therefore thus Leo complaineth of him: Ipsius quoque Beatissimi Petri reuerentiam Verbis arrogantioribus minuit: *By his arrogante woordes he abaseth the reuerence of the most Blessed* Peter *him selfe.* By this reuerence bewe vnto Peter, he meante the reuerence, that he claimed to him selfe, for doubtlesse M. Harding him selfe cannot thinke, that Hilaries quarrel was against Peter the Apostle of Christe, nowe raigninge in Heauen. It was onely againste that inordinate Ambition, and Pride of Peters Successours, that euen then sought to rule ouer the whole Church of God. ☞

Leo Epist. 89. Addition ☞

But, gentle Reader, that thou maiste the better vnderstande, what credite thou oughtest to geue to this Pope Leo, specially settinge forthe his owne Authoritie, I beseeche thee, consider, with what waightie of wordes, and howe farre aboue measure, he auanceth the Authoritie of S. Peter. Theise be his wordes: Christus Petrum in Consortium Individuæ Vnitatis assumpsit: *Christ receiued* Peter *into the Companie of the Indiuisible Vnitie.* Authoritate Domini mei Petri Apostoli: *By the Autheritie* (not of Christe, but) *of my Lorde* Peter *the Apostle:* Deo Inspirante, & Beatissimo Petro Apostolo: *By the Inspiration of God, and of* S. Peter *the Apostle:* Deus à Petro, velut à quodam Capite, dona sua velut in Corpus omne diffudit: *God from* Peter, *as from the Head, hath powred out his giftes into al the Body:* Nihil erit ligatum, aut solutum, nisi quod Petrus ligauerit, aut soluerit: *There shalbe nothinge bounde, or loosed, but that* Peter *shal binde, or loose:*

Leo Epist. 89. Leo Epist. 52. Leo Epist. 89. Leo in eadem Epist. Leo in Serm. De Natali Petri & Pauli.

er looſe: Nunc quoque Petrus paſcit Oues, & mandatum Domini Pius Paſtor exequitur: *Euen nowe Peter feedeth the Sheepe, and as a Godly ſhepheard, hee fulfilleth the commaundemente of his Maiſter.* Satche immoderate, and ambitious Dignitie Leo was contente to geue to Peter, to thende that the poſſeſſion, and fruite thereof might redounde wholely vnto him ſelfe. Leo in Serm. 3. In Anniuerſario die Aſſumptionis

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ But al theſe ſaieinges, M. Harding, you ſaie, maie wel be iuſtified. Touchinge the ſtrife, whereas Pope Leo ſaithe, Chriſt *tooke* Peter *into the felowſhip of his indiuiſible Vnitie, your anſweare is this,* Leo *meant thereby an Vnitie in Qualitie, an Vnitie in Grace, an Vnitie, that is proper to Chriſte him ſelfe. But the indiuiſible Vnitie in ſubſtance* (you ſaie) *he meane not. And yet, this* (you ſaie) *was my Diuelliſhe meaninge.* In good ſothe, M. Harding, you do me wronge: I neuer meante it. But thus I ſaie: Geue theſe woordes of Pope Leo the moſte fauourable conſtruction you can diuiſe, yet maie not the ſame reaſonably be applied to any Creature: no not vnto the Bleſſed Angelles, and Archangelles of God. You cannot ſaie, They are in the felowſhip of Chriſtes Vnitie. I graunte, Peter *is called the Rocke.* So is Iohn: So is Iames: So are the reſte. The Learned Father Origene ſaithe: Petra eſt, quiſquis eſt Diſcipulus Chriſti: *Who ſo euer is Chriſtus Diſciple, he is the Rocke.* Wil you ſaie therefore M. Harding, that Chriſt receiued Peter to be his felowe, and his felowe in Vnitie? And that in ſuche Vnitie, as might neuer be diſſolued? Wherefore then doth Chriſte immediately after calle him Sathan? For thus he ſaide vnto Peter: *Geate thee behinde me Sathan: Thou vnderſtandeſt not the thinges that are of God.* Shal we ſaie, that beeing Sathan, he was neuertheles in the felowſhip of Chriſtes Vnitie? In deed Frere Ambroſius Catharinus in his late declamation openly pronounced in the Counceil of Tridente, calleth the Bleſſed Virgine our Ladie, Fideliſſimam Chriſti Sociam: Chriſtes *moſte faitheful felowe.* And you, M. Hardinge, vpon warrante of Bernardes woordes, haue no doubte to ſaie, *The Pope by power is* Peter: *And by annointinge is* Chriſte. This, I trowe, is penough. *The Pope is* Peter: *The Pope is* Chriſte. *Yet al this* you ſaie, *is wel ſpoken, and maie be iuſtified.* M. Hard. 174. d. Origen. in Matthæ. tract. 1. Matthæ. 16. Concil. Tridentinum. M. Hard. Confutation. Fol. 210. a.

Leo ſaithe further, Chriſte *called* Peter *the Rocke, that the buildinge of the euerlaſting Temple might ſtande in the ſoundeneſſe of* Peter. Alas, M. Hardinge, and muſte this likewiſe be iuſtified as the reſte? Is this the buildinge of the Churche of God? Were builte vpon Chriſte, and not vpon Peter. Chriſte is the Rocke, that ſtandeth for euer. S. Paule ſaithe, *No man can laie other foundation, then that is already layde, whiche is* Chriſte *Ieſus.* Leo Epiſt. 89. *Vt æterni ædificatio Templi in Petri ſoliditate conſiſteret.* 1. Corinth. 10. 1. Corinth. 3.

Howe be it, I denie not, but in ſomme reaſonable kinde of ſpeache, Peter alſo maie be called the Rocke: but ſo, as Paule, and Iames, and Iohn, and al other the Apoſtles of Chriſte maie likewiſe be called, and none otherwiſe. Origene ſaithe, *The woordes of Chriſte ſpoken as vnto* Peter, *were common to al.* So likewiſe S. Hierome, notwithſtandinge he calle Peter the Heade, or Principal of the Apoſtles, yet he ſaithe, Eccleſia fundatur ſuper omnes Apoſtolos. Ex æquo ſuper eos Eccleſiæ fortitudo ſolidatur: *The Churche is builte vpon al the Apoſtles: The ſtrengthe of the Churche is founded,* (not onely vpon Peter, but) Equally *vpon them al. Vpon them al* (he ſaithe) *the Church is builte: And that* Equally, that is to ſaie, nomore vpon Peter, then vpon the reſte. What Vanitie then is this, M. Hardinge, to applie that thinge onely, or ſpecially vnto one, that is equally common vnto ſo many? Origen. in Matthæ. Tract. 1. Hieronym. adverſus Iouinianum. Lib. 1. Ex æquo.

You ſaie, *Chriſte beeinge him ſelfe the Rocke, gaue the ſame title vnto* Peter: *Therefore* Leo *might iuſtely ſaie, Chriſte receiued* Peter *into the felowſhip of his Indiuiſible Vnitie.* This argumente hangeth very Loſely, as it ſhall appeare. For Chriſte likewiſe ſaith of him ſelfe: *I am the lighte of the Worlde.* And yet he ſaithe to his Diſciples, *You are the lighte of the Worlde,* geuinge them that name, that was proper, and peculiare to him ſelfe. Shal we therefore ſaie, Chriſte toke al his Diſciples into the felowſhip of his Indiuiſible Vnitie? If ſo, where then is Peters Priuilege? Or, what hath Peter aboue the reſte? Or, howe can theſe woordes of Pope Leo be excuſed? It is too ambitious M. Hardinge: It is too mutche. No Learned Father euer gaue S. Peter the like title. Iuſtifie nomore then maie wel be Iuſtified. Iohan. 8. Matthæ. 5.

Leo Epiſt. 89. Againe Leo ſaithe, Deo inſpirante, & Beatiſsimo Petro Apoſtolo: *By the inſpiration of God, and of the moſte Bleſſed S. Peter the Apoſtle.*

M. Hard. 179. a Here M. Hardinge in defenſe of theſe vnlauery wordes, vnaduiſedly vttered by Pope Leo, you haue vſed ſutche vnmannerly, and vnmanly ſpeache, as maie becomme noman, but onely your ſelfe. Though I had miſconceiued Pope Leo, and taken him otherwiſe, then he meante, as you haue often the Holy Fathers, yet ſobrietie, and grauitie had benne fittinge, and ſemely for a Doctoure.

M. Hard. 176. a. *Mutche talke you moone, of the prepoſition, A, firſte placed, and after repeted, and yet not expreſſed: of the Ablatiue caſe ruled, and of the Ablatiue caſe Abſolute:* and ſo you Leade the ſimple alonge in the darke, he wateth not, whether: But in deede you haue purpoſely corrupted, and miſpointed the whole place, as it maie eaſily appeare to any man, that ſhal compare your Booke, and Leoes Epiſtles bothe togeateer. For Leo hath two Commates betwene theſe wordes, Apoſtolo, and, Decreta ſunt, and readeth thus, as in al the Bookes, that I haue readde, it is eaſie to ſe: Obteſtamur, vt ea, quæ à nobis, Deo inſpirante, & Beatiſsimo Petro Apoſtolo, diſcuſsis, probatiſque nunc omnibus cauſis, decreta ſunt, ſeruetis. By whiche manner of pointinge, it maie appeare to any man, that is hable to iudge, that theſe wordes, Deo inſpirante, & Beatiſsimo Petro Apoſtolo, are gouerned by one rule of conſtruction, and gor together: As if in plainer ſorte the whole ſentence were Laide thus: Obteſtamur, vt ſeruetis ea, quæ diſcuſsis, probatiſq; omnibus cauſis, decreta ſunt à nobis, Deo inſpirante, & Beatiſsimo Petro Apoſtolo: *Wee beſeeche you, to keepe thoſe thinges, whiche, al cauſes beinge diſcuſſed, and proued, haue benne decreed by vs, by the inſpiration of God, and the moſte Bleſſed* Peter *the Apoſtle:* Neither is there any Grammarien, that, the pointes thus ſtandinge, as they be in al Bookes bothe printed, and written, can expounde it otherwiſe.

Nowe M. Hardinge, beholde Leoes wordes, as you haue ſtalled them. Thus you write: Obteſtamur, vt ea, quæ à nobis Deo inſpirante, & Beatiſsimo Petro Apoſtolo decreta ſunt, ſeruetis. Mary, nowe it is, as you woulde haue it: But yet is it nothinge, as Leo leafte it. Laie theſe places togeather: viewe your wordes againe. Where is the Comma after this worde, Apoſtolo? Where is the other Comma after this worde cauſis? Why haue you brought theſe wordes Apoſtolo, and Decreta ſunt, ſo neare togeather? Coulde you cutte of two Commates togeather in one place, and ſo cunningly beguile your ſimple Reader? In deede, ye were aſhamed of the erroor: The ſenſe was blaſphemous, you thought it moſte wiſedome, to leaue out the pointes, and to alter your Booke, and to ſhifte awaie Blaſphemie by plaine corruption. I woulde neuer haue made ſo greate accompte of ſo ſimple reckeninges, had not you, M. Hardinge, geuen the occaſion.

How be it, let vs yelde vnto you, and contrarie to the credite of al your Bookes printed, or written. Newe, or Olde, let vs folowe your owne readinge, and ſaie thus, Obteſtamur, vt ſeruetis ea, quæ Decreta ſunt à nobis, & Beatiſsimo Petro Apoſtolo: Beware ye fal not from one erroure into an other. Here firſte the Pope placeth him ſelfe before S. Peter. For thus he ſaithe, *It is decreed by me, and by* S. Peter. This perhaps is no greate blaſphemie. It maie rather ſeeme to be ſomme lacke of good manner. Yet is it not likely, that Leo, beinge ſo Holy a man, as M. Hardinge imagineth, no, though he were neuer ſo mutche ambitious, woulde ſette S. Peter behinde, and him ſelfe before. That had benne penough for Pope Alexander. 3. Who, when he had ſette his foote in Frederichus the Emperours necke, and the Emperour had tolde him, that he yelded that Honour, not vnto him beinge Pope, but vnto Peter: Yes, ſaide the Pope, Et mihi, & Petro: *Thou ſhalt ſtoupe to mee, and to* Peter: geuinge the firſte place vnto him ſelfe.

Carion in Vita Alexand. 3.

Beſides this, by M. Hardinges conſtruction Leo imagineth, that S. Peter is alwaies preſente with the Pope, and ſitteth with him in Conſiſtorie, or in Clauſet, diſcuſſinge of Caſes, and diuidinge of Lawes. I wil not ſaie, that this is blaſphemie. Perhappes I maie thinke, it is great folie. For what parte of Peter is it, that ſitteth there? His ſoule is in Heauen: his Body in the graue. If he be there neither

in

in Soule, nor in Body, Howe is he there? Or, if S. Peter be there, and that in suche order, that he is able to heare causes, to make Decrées, and to gouerne the Churche, what nede hath he then of any Successour? A Successour hath no place, while the Predecessour is present. By suche fables, M. Hardinge, and outrage of speache, we abuse the poore people, and beare them in hande, that, what so euer is donne by the Pope, it is donne by S. Peter.

But, if Peter be yet stil in Rome, & make Lawes now, as when he was liuinge, wherefore then M. Hardinge, haue you written thus in your late Confutation: Christe nowe requireth vs, not to obeie Peter, and Paule, but him, that sitteth in theire Chaire. *Confut. pa. 192. b*
Theise be your woordes. You make not forgeat them. If S. Peter be nowe in Rome, & make Lawes for you, as you saie, how can you saie, You are not bounde to obeie him? If we be not bounde to obeie him, how can you telle vs, he maketh you Lawes? Certainely it is mete, that the Lawemaker be euer obeied. But we muste pardonne you, M. Hardinge: ye walke in the darke, and saie, and vnsaie, ye know not what.

In the Life of this Leo, it is written thus: Leo *wrote an Epistle againste the Heretique* Eutyches: *and doubtinge the habilitie of his owne learninge, he laide the same Epistle vpon* Peters *Aultare, and fasted fourtie daies, and besought* S. Peter, *that if there were any errour therein, he woulde correcte it with his owne handes*. The fable is true, Peter came downe from Heauen, with penne, and inke, as I trowe, and corrected it. After the fourthe daie the Epistle was perfite. *In Vita Leonis. Vt ille suis manibus correctũ absolueret.*

Leo him selfe saithe, Omnes Sacerdotes propriè regit Petrus: *In plaine manner of speache, or to speake conueniently,* Peter *gouerneth al the Priestes, that be*. Againe he saithe, Si quid nostris temporibus rectè à nobis agitur, Petri gubernaculis est deputandum: *If in our time any thinge be wel donne by vs wee muste recken it as donne by* Peters *gouernement*. Againe, *There shal nothinge be bounde, or loosed, but that* Peter *shal binde, or loose*. And againe, *Euen nowe* Peter *feedeth the sheepe &c.* *Leo in Anniuersario die Assumptionis suæ Sermo. 3. In eod. Sermone. Leo in Natali Petri, & Pauli, Serm. 2.*

S. Gregorie saithe, Transmisimus vobis de benedictione S. Petri Apostoli Cucullam, & Tunicam: *I haue sente you a Cowle, and a Coate of the Blessinge of* S. Peter. *Leo in Anniuersar. die Assump. suæ.*

Likewise he writeth to Theoctistus, I haue sente thee S. Peters Blessinge, I meane a Bete taken from his blessed Body, that by that same Bete you maie haue Life, bothe presente, and Euerlastinge. Nowe, M. Hardinge, if S. Peter can Sitte with the Pope, Write letters, Discusse causes, Gouerne Priestes, Rule the Churche, Fede the Flocke, Bless Cowles, Coates, and Betes, and Binde, and Lose, why maie he not also enspire the Faithefull. *Greg. li. 8. Epi. 45. Greg. li. 6 Epi 23. Vt per eam vos, qui eũ timetis, & diligitis, & præsentem salutem & æternam habere valeatis, Epist. Iulij. 1. Extra. De Elect. Fundamenta. Concil. Aphrica. Cap. 105.*

Take heede, in shunninge one Blasphemie, ye commit not an other. Shifte Pope Leoes woordes, as you shal thinke best: What so euer sense ye shal pike out of them, it wilbe Blasphemie.

Somme others haue thought, that as wel theise Epistles of Leo, as also others moe, of other the Ancient Bishoppes of Rome, haue benne interlaced, and falsified by the ambitious Popes, that folowed afterwarde. Whiche thinge is the more likely, bothe for that the selfe same woordes be likewise alleged, partly vnder the name of Pope Iulius, partely vnder the name of Pope Nicolas: and also for that Pope Zosimus, whiche was the fifthe before Leo, as it is saide before, doubted not, for an aduantage, to falsifie the Holy Councel of Nice. *Gregor. Lib. 4. Epist. 36.*

Verily, when the Councel of Chalcedon had offered vnto this same Leo, the Title of Vniuersal Bishop, as Gregorie witnesseth, he vtterly refused it, and woulde none of it.

Now touchinge that S. Hierome saith, the poore Bishop of Eugubium, & the Bishop of Rome are bothe of one Authoritie (for of Authoritie he speaketh, as it is prooued before): S. Cyprian also saithe the same, that the Authoritie of the Bishoppes in Aphrica is as good, as that Authoritie of the Bishop of Rome: and calleth them al Lewde, & Desperate Personnes, that would, as M. Harding doth, saie the contrarie. *Cyprian. Lib. 1. Epist. 3. Nisi paucis deo speratis, & perditis.*

Therefore, whereas M. Hardinge saithe, By very Order of Christe him selfe it hathe benne Ordeined, that maters touchinge Faithe, and Religion be referred to that One Prince of Pastoures, who sitteth on the Chaire of Peter, the Highest

Bishop, and that the same hath alwaies bene donne, and obserued from the Apostles time vntil our daies: He bringeth vs two manifest Untruthes togeather, without any manner proufe at al, onely auouched vpon him selfe. For it appeareth not, that Christe euer toke this Order, or euer made any sutche mention, either of any sutche Prince of Pastours, or of Peters Chaire. And in the Councel of Aphrica it was decreed, that no maters shoulde be remoued from thence to Rome. The

Concil. Aphrican. Cap. 92.

wordes of the Councel are these, Ad transmarina Iudicia qui putauerint appellandum, à nullo intra Aphricam in Communionem suscipiatur: *Who so euer shal thinke he ought to appeale to the Iudgementes beyonde the Seas* (that is, to the Bishop of Rome) *let no man within* Aphrica *receiue him to the Communion.*

Touchinge that M. Hardinge calleth the Pope the Prince of Pastoures, he might haue remembred, that the right of this name belongeth onely vnto Christe.

1. Petr. 5.

S. Peter saithe, *That when* Christe *the Prince of Pastours shal appeare, yee maie receiue the Vncorruptible Crowne.* Now, to inclasse the Pope with Christes peculiare Titles, a man might thinke it were great blasphemie. Certainely S. Cyprian saithe, Nemo nostrum Episcopum se esse Episcoporum constituit: *None of vs appointeth him selfe Bishop of Bishoppes:* Much lesse the Prince of al Pastours. And in the Councel of

In Concil. Carthaginen.

Concil. Constantinop. 2. Ca. 36. Τῶν ἴσων ἃς πρεσβείων τῆς πρεσβυτέρας ῥώμης θρόνε.

Constantinople it was Decreed, that the Bishop there shoulde haue Euen, and Equal Authoritie with the Bishop of Rome.

As for the other Authoritie of S. Cyprian, M. Hardinge saithe, we vnderstode it not: and therefore he willeth vs, to loke better vpon our Bokes. The counsel is good. But if M. Hardinge wil graunte, that S. Cyprian him selfe knew, what he him selfe wrote, and vnderstode his owne meaninge, it shalbe sufficient. Verily the wordes that he vseth, seme not so darke. For thus he writeth: Episcopatus Vnus est, cuius à singulis in solidum pars tenetur. Ecclesia Vna est, quæ in multitudinem latiùs incremento Fœcunditatis extenditur: Quomodò Solis multi radij, sed lumen Vnum: & rami arboris multi, sed robur Vnum: *The Bishoprike is One, a parte whereof of euery seueral Bishop is possessed in whole. The Churche is One, whiche by her greate increase is extended vnto many: As in the Sunne the beames be many, but the light is one: and in a Tree the boughes be many, but the body is One.*

Cyprian. De Simpl. Prælator.

If there appeare any greate darkenesse, or doubte in these wordes, S. Cyprian him selfe in other places thus expoundeth his owne meaninge in plainer wise: Vna est Ecclesia à Christo per totum Mundum in plura membra diuisa: Item Episcopatus Vnus, Episcoporum multorum concordi numerositate diffusus: *There is One Churche diuided by Christe into many Members throughout the worlde: Likewise One Bishoprike powred farre abroade by the agreeable multitude of many Bishoppes.* Againe, Ecclesia Vna est, & connexa, & cohærentium sibi inuicem Sacerdotum glutino copulata: *There is One Churche, ioined, and fastened, in One, by the consent of Bishoppes agreeinge togeather.* Againe, Quando Oramus, non pro Vno Oramus, sed pro toto populo: Quia totus populus Vnum sumus: *When wee Praie, wee Praie not for One, but for the whole people. For wee the whole people are but One.* Againe, immediately before these wordes, whiche, M. Hardinge saithe, we are not able to vnderstande, he saithe: Hanc Vnitatem firmiter tenere, & vendicare debemus, maximè Episcopi, qui in Ecclesia præsidemus: vt Episcopatum quoque ipsum Vnum, & Indiuisum probemus: *This Vnitie muste wee holde specially Bishoppes, that sitte as Rulers in the Churche: that wee maie declare our Bishoprike to be One, and without diuision.* Againe, Etsi Pastores multi sumus, Vnum tamen Gregem Pascimus: & Oues Vniuersas, quas Christus Sanguine suo, & Passione quæsiuit, colligere, & fouere debemus: *Notwithstandinge wee be many Shepheardes, yet wee Feede but One Flocke: and wee are al bounde to geather vp, and to nourishe al the Sheepe, that* Christe *hath wonne by his Bloude, and Passion.*

Cyprian. In Oration. Dominicam.

Cyprian. De Simpli. Prælat.

Cyprian. Lib. 4. Epist. 9.

Cyprian. Lib. 4. Epistol. 2.

If either the Author of the Apologie, or the Interpreter vnderstode not S. Cyprian, yet, M. Hardinge, ye maie geue S. Cyprian leaue, to vnderstande him selfe.

And in this sense S. Hierome saithe, Communi Presbyterorum Consilio Ecclesiæ gubernabantur: *The Churches were ordred* (not by the Vniuersal Authoritie of the Bishop of Rome, but) *by Common Aduise of the Priestes.* Likewise S. Cyprian saithe,

Hieronym. in Epist. ad Tit. Ca. 1.

Idcirco

Idcirco capiosum est Corpus Sacerdotum, Concordiæ mutuæ glutine, atque Vnitatis vinculo copulatum, vt si quis ex Collegio nostro Hæresim facere, & Gregem Christi lacerare, ac vastare tentauerit, subueniant cæteri: *Therefore is the Body, or companie of Priestes so copious, ioined togeather with consente of Concorde and Vnitie, that if any one of our Companie enterprise to raise an Heresie, and to scatter and waste the Flocke of Christe, the reste shoulde healpe.* Cyprian. Lib. 3. Epist. 13.

So likewise S. Basile: Interrogate Patres Vestros, & renuntiabunt vobis, quod, etiamsi loci situ diuisæ inter se sint Parœciæ, tamen veluti Coronamento quodam Vnitæ, vnaq; sententia gubernatæ fuerunt. Assidua quidem populi fuit inter se commixtio: Ipsi verò Pastores tanta præditi fuerunt mutua inter ipsos Charitate, vt alius alio Præceptore, ac Duce vsi fuerint: *Aske of your Fathers, and they wil telle you, that although Bishoprikes be diuided, and sundred by distance of place, yet were they euer knitte togeather as with a Garlande, and euer ruled by One Aduise. In deede the People was euer mingled togeather: But the Bishoppes were also ioyned in Charitie, that euery of them was content to be taught, and to be leadde by other.* Basil. ad Neocæsarienses.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ Here, M. Hardinge, dissemblinge al other Authorities, and proufes by me allegred, yet take holde onely of S. Basile, seekinge meanes to shadowe one plaine Sentence of that Holy Father, by the manifest corruption of an other. S. Basiles meaninge (you saie) maie beste be knowen by S. Basile him self writinge thus to *Athanasius: Visum est vtile scribere ad Episcopum Romanum, vt consideret res nostras, & iudicij sui decretum interponat: vt, quoniam de communi, & conciliari decreto aliquos inde huc amandari difficile est, ipse sua authoritate negotium componat:* Whiche whole sentence beinge by you vntruely Latined, it hathe pleased you to Englishe thus: It hathe seemed good vnto vs, to write vnto the Bishop of Rome, that he wil consider our Cases, (or visite vs, for so the Greeke woorde, ἐπισκέψαι, maie be translated) and to determine the mater by his sentence: that, for as muche as it is harde for any to be sente hither from thence by Authoritie of a common, and Synodical Decree, he take the mater into his owne hande, and by his Authoritie strike the stroke. M. Har. fo. 179. b

Theise be S. Basiles woordes, M. Hardinge, so miserablie maimed by you, and so sette out of ioint, as wel in the Latine, as in the English, that it is pitie to beholde them. And yet, as though the case were cleare of your side, you saie further, VVhy shoulde S. Basile beinge a Greeke of the Easte Church, thinke it conuenient to write to the Bishop of Rome, beinge in the VVeaste, to consider of, or to visite them of the Easte (for so to the Greeke woorde, ἐπισκέψαι, as you saie, signifieth) theire state, and to sende foorthe a Decree of his iudgemente, and to geeue sentence, oneleste he agnised the prerogatiue of the Bishop of Rome? In the ende you conclude thus: The more ye sturre the mater, the more it turneth stille to your shame. Suche is the maidenly modestie of your talke. M. Har. fo. 182. d.

You saie, VVhy should S. Basile desire the Bishop of Rome to visite them of the East, to sende foorthe the Decree of his iudgement, and to geeue Sentence? Nay, nay, M. Hardinge, why shoulde you thus alege Greeke Authours, if you knowe them not: or if you knowe them, why should you thus corrupte them? Verily in theise fewe woordes you haue muche betraied your wante of skil. Firste δοῦναι γνώμην you expounde thus, To determine the mater by Decree, or by Sentence. And why so? dothe δοῦναι signifie to Determine, or is, γνώμη a Decree, or Sentence in Iudgemente? Surely, M. Hardinge, δοῦναι γνώμην, is nothinge els, but to geeue aduise, or to aide with Counsel. Theise woordes Αὐθεντῆσαι περὶ τὸ πρᾶγμα, you expounde thus, To take the mater into his owne handes, and by his Authoritie to strike the stroke. And why so? Who taught you this exposition? Euery childe coulde haue tolde you, that αὐθεντῆσαι signifieth, neither striking, nor strokinge. S. Basiles meaninge is this, that, for as muche as a Councel of al the partes of the VVeaste Churche coulde not be geathered vpon the suddaine, and the Churche of Græcia stode in neede of present healpe, that therefore the Bishop of Rome in the meane while should vse his owne discretion, and intreate some of the VVeastren Bishoppes to trauaile vnto them. And so muche in this place signifieth the Greeke woorde αὐθεντῆσαι.

But ἐπισκέψαι (you saie) signifieth to visite. So dothe Bubo signifie a Nightingale. Wille ye haue vsed this woorde ἐπισκέψαι in one place: not only inclosing it in your texte, but also prickinge it in your Margine, that your simple Reader might thinke

there were some mysterie in your Greke. But I praie you, M. Harding, in al ỹ Greke Bookes, that euer you readde, where euer sawe you ἐπισκέπτεσθαι in the firste Indefinite of the Infinitiue Mode? If ye euer once sawe it, I wil yelde vnto yowe. If you neuer sawe it once, why haue you vsed it twise, and that euen togeather in one place? Ἐπισκέπτεσθαι, ye shoulde haue sayde, M. Hardinge: Ἐπισκέπτεσθαι, it is, and not ἐπισκέψασθαι. And yet Ἐπισκέπτεσθαι in this place is not to Ride in Visitation, as you imagine, but to consider of the miserable state of the Easte Churche, and to be careful for it. The true, and common translation is this, Visum est mihi consentaneum, vt scribatur Episcopo Romæ, vt, quæ hic geruntur, consideret, detéque consilium: Et, quoniam difficile est, vt communi, ac Synodico Decreto aliqui illinc mittantur, ipse sua Authoritate in hac causa vsus viros eligat ad ferendas itineris molestias accommodos: *It seemeth good vnto mee, that wee write vnto the Bishop of Rome, that he consider our estate, and geue vs counsel: and, for as mutche as it is a harde matter, for any to be sent hither from thence by the Common Decree of a Councel, that he, vsinge his owne Authoritie, or discretion in the case, chuse sutche men, as be hable to beare the trauayle of the iourney. &c.*

Basilius Epist. 52. ad Athanasium.

Nowe, M. Hardinge, compare your translation, and this togeather: Here is neither Visitation of the Churche, nor Determination by Sentence, nor striking of strokes. Ye coulde not haue missed so oftentimes in one thing without somme studie. If I listed to folowe somme parte of your eloquence, I coulde saie phy, and shame, and, I knowe not what, as you do.

Yet you saie, S. Basile thought it good, that the Bishop of Rome should consider theire estate, and sende foorthe a Decree of his Iudgemente. O M. Hardinge, grosse erroure and ignorance maketh no proufe. But be it, that al this were true: Yet what Decrée of Iudgement coulde the Pope sende foorthe? he had hearde neither the one parte, nor the other, but was a mere stranger to their cases. And thinke you, he woulde determine maters, before he knew them? So might he Caste Christe, and Quite Barabbas. Hereof Basile him selfe writeth thus: Quid auxilij conferet nobis Occidentalium fastus? qui quid in causa veri sit, neque sciunt, neque discere sustinent: falsis verò suspicionibus præoccupati eadem nunc quoque faciunt, quæ anteà in causa Marcelli, cum illis, qui Veritatem annũtiabant, contentiosè egerunt, & Hæresim interea per seipsos corroborarunt. Ego quidem ipse non publica formula, sed priuatim volebam scribere ipsorũ Coryphæo: de Ecclesiasticis quidem rebus nihil, nisi tantùm vt admonerem, ipsos neque veritatem rerum nostrarum scire, neque viam, qua doceri possint, admittere: *What shal the pride of the Weastren Bishops auaile vs? For neither doo they knowe, nor wil they Learne to knowe, the Truthe of our maters: But beeinge leadde away with vaine suspicions, they doo euen nowe, as they did before in the case of* Marcellus. *For then they cauilled contentiously with them, that tolde the Truth, and by meane therof emboldened, and confirmed Heresie. In deede for mine owne part, I was contented to write vnto the chiefe, or Principal of them al,* (that is to the Pope) *not by any publique instrument, but mine owne priuate letter. Of matters Ecclesiastical I woulde write nothinge, but onely to telle him, that neither they doo knowe the Truthe of our cases, nor wil abide the waie, whereby they maie know it.* This M. Hardinge, is that Decrée, and Determination of Iudgement, S. Basile founde in the Pope. Neither did he know the case, nor woulde he learne, bowe to knowe it. Therefore Chrysostome saithe, Non est congruum, vt hi, qui sunt in Aegypto, iudicent eos, qui sunt in Thracia: *It is not meete, that they, that be in Ægypt, should be Iudges ouer them, that dwel in* Thracia: S. Cyprian also like wise saith, Aequum, iustumque est, vt vniuscuiusque causa illic audiatur, vbi crimen admissum est: *It is good reason, that euery mans cause be hearde there, where the faulte was committed.*

Basil. Epist. 10. Ad Eusebium.

The Pride of the VVeaste Churche. Neither knowe, nor wil learne. Confirmed Heresie.

Chrysost. Epist. prior. ad Innocentium.

Cyprian. Lib. 1. Epist. 3.

But you wil saie, *S. Basile* thought it good, to write to the Pope. I graunt you: but in sutche sorte, as I haue tolde you. Againe ye saie, VVhy shoulde Basile so doo oneleste he knewe the priuilege of the Pope? Howe foloweth this, M. Hardinge? Wil you beare vs in hand, that euery Bishop vnto whom S. Basile wrote to like pourpose, had therefore the like priuilege? At the same time thus he wrote, not onely to the Pope, but also, to al the Bishoppes of the Weast, Quantam poteritis, consolationem, & opem laborantibus, & afflictis Ecclesijs afferre ne detrectetis: *Forestowe not to healpe our miserable*

M. Har pa. 179. b

Basil. ad Episc. Occident. 1 pt. 61

Equalitie of Bishoppes.

rable afflicted Churches with ſuche aide, and comforte, as you maie. Likewiſe he writeth to the Biſhoppes of France, and Italie, *Wee haue good hope, that aſ ſoone, as wee ſhal doo you to vnderſtande the cauſe of our griefes, you wilbe moued to ſeeke healpe for vs.*

Basil. Ad Italos & Gallos Epiſt. 69.

To like pourpoſe the whole Councel of Alexandria writeth, not onelye to the Pope, but alſo to al other Biſhoppes of the Catholique Churche, Vos vindices huius iniuſtitiæ imploramus: *Wee beſeeche you to reuenge this wronge.* Yet had not therefore euery ſuche Biſhop Supreme Authoritie in the gouernment of the Churche. So writeth S. Baſile vnto Athanaſius, Quanto Eccleſiarum &c. *The more the maladies of our Churches doo abounde, the more wee al turne our ſelues to thy goodneſſe, beleeuinge, that the comforte of our griefes, reſteth onely in thy defenſe. For thou by the power of thy prayers, and by the ſkil of Gouernemente, art thought hable to deliuer vs from this horrible tempeſte. Thou carrieſt the care of al Churches: thou diſputeſt, thou warneſt, thou writeſt, thou ſendeſt. Wee flee vnto thee, as vnto the Head of al: Wee vſe thee, as our Counſeller, and as the Leader, and Prince of our cauſes. The whole ſtate of the Churche of* Antioche *dependeth of thee. Thou maiſte inſtruſte ſimme, repreſſe others, and make them quiete, and reſtoare the ſtrengthe of the Churche.*

Athanaſ. in Apologia. 2.

Basil. Ad Athanaſ. Epiſt. 49.

Basil. Ad Athanaſ. Epiſt. 52.

Athanaſius Heade of al.

Suche Power, and Authoritie S. Baſile geueth to Athanaſius. Yet was Athanaſius the Biſhop of Alexandria, and not of Rome. Had you wel conſidered theſe thinges, M. Hardinge, ye woulde not ſo rawly haue thus concluded, *S. Baſile* thoughte it good to write thus, and thus, to the Biſhop of Rome: *Ergo*, He confeſſed, that the Biſhop of Rome had a Priuilege aboue al others.

Basil. Ad Athanaſ. Epiſt. 48.

Al this notwithſtandinge, you ſaie, VVhy ſhould S. Baſile thinke it conuenient, to write to the Biſhop of Rome &c. The Anſweare is eaſie. S. Baſile him ſelfe ſaithe thus, Quæ nos loquimur, multis ſuſpecta ſunt &c. *What ſo euer wee our ſelues ſaie, it is ſuſpected of many, as if for our owne priuate quarreles wee woulde keepe them in awe. But you (*beinge ſtraungers*) the further yee dwel from them, the more credite you haue with our people.* This was it, M. Hardinge, that S. Baſile required of the Pope. Here is no Vniuerſal Power, no Priuilege, no Decree, no Determination by Sentence, no ſtrikinge of ſtrokes. Aduiſe your ſelfe better hereafter of your Authorities, before you allege them.

Basil. Ad Epiſc. Occidens Epiſt. 74.

Therefore, as many Faithes in ſundrie Faithefulles, are but One Faithe: As many Churches are but One Church: As many Baptiſmes are but One Baptiſme: Euen ſo, ſaithe S. Cyprian, many Biſhoprikes are but One Biſhoprike: and therein, as wel the Biſhop of Rome, as alſo euery other ſeueral Biſhop, hathe his portion.

I ſaie, The Biſhoprike of Rome is not this Whole Biſhoprike, but a Parte: Not the Body of the Sunne, but a beame: Not the ſtemme of the Tree, but a Braunche.

And thus, by S. Cyprians minde, neither hathe One Biſhop holde of an other: Nor is any One Biſhop Heade of the whole: Nor is One Biſhop al in al: but al Biſhoppes are onelye One.

The Apologie, Cap. 3. Diuiſion. 6.

And accordinge to the iudgemente of the Nicene Councel, we ſaie, that the Biſhop of Rome hathe no more iuriſdiction ouer the Churche of God, then the reſt of the Patriarkes, either of Alexandria, or of Antioche haue.

The ſixth Canon of the Nicene Councel declared to make againſt the Defenders of Traditions.

M. Hardinge.

If it be a ſhame to belie the Diuel, according to the olde Prouerbe, what is it to belie the Church of God repreſented in the Nicene Councel?

The ſixth Canon amonge al others of the Nicene Councel is that you grounde youre furniſe vpon, I knowe wel. For that hathe benne wreaſted to your pourpoſe by certaine of your ſide. And the ſame rightly conſtrued (a) maketh moſte againſte you. For it ſeemeth to acknowledge the Biſhop of Rome his Supremacie and ſoueraignte of iudgement ouer other Patriarkes. Theſe be the woordes of the Canon rightly Engliſhed: Let the Ancient cuſtome continewe in force which is in Egypte, Lybia, and Pentapoli: ſo that the Biſhop of Alexandria haue Power ouer them al. *Quandoquidem etiam Epiſcopo Romano hoc conſuetum eſt.* For as mutche as the Biſhop of Rome hath thus vſed. Likewiſe in Antiochia alſo, and in other Prouinces, let the Churches keepe their Prerogatiue. VVhat can be gathered of the woordes of this Canon, but that for ratefiynge the Iuriſdiction of the Patri-

(a) Vntruthe. For the expreſſe woordes are plaine to the contrarie.

arkes of Alexandria, and Antiochia, the Fathers of the Nicene Councel thoughte good to alter nothinge: but to folowe the Ancient cuſtome of Olde time vſed and allowed by the Biſhop of Rome. For it is as muche to ſaie, as thus: In almuche as (b) the Biſhop of Rome hathe bene woont from the beginninge to graunte to the Biſhop of Alexandria iuriſdiction ouer Egypte, Lybia, and Pentapoly: the (c) Nicene Councel folowinge his Authoritie and rule, or at the leaſt his vſage, willeth and grauteth, that the ſaide Biſhop retaine and keepe his Auncient right. For if the Biſhop of Alexandria had not receiued ſutche iuriſdiction by Authoritie and graunt of the Biſhop of Rome of olde time, what reaſon ſhoulde haue moued thoſe Fathers, for confirmation thereof to alleage the Cuſtome of the Biſhop of Rome? And in that caſe, (d) whereto perteined the addition of the cauſe: *Quia Epiſcopus Romanus hoc conſuevit*, Bicauſe this was the Biſhop of Rome his cuſtome? If this had not bene theſe meaninge, they woulde neuer ſo haue ſpoken. For what was his cuſtome other, (e) then to allotte thoſe Prouinces to the Biſhop of Alexandria? If any other thinge be alleaged to haue bene his maner and cuſtome, beſides that the woordes of the Canon beare it not, what had that bene to the purpoſe, what ſo euer it be, for cauſe and confirmation of the Biſhop of Alexandria his iuriſdiction ouer Egypte, Lybia, and Pentapoli? Alleage you, Defender, for olde cuſtome of the Biſhop of Rome, what els you liſte, ſo that you make no violence to the Canon, and thereupon make your Argumente, inferringe of your allegation the Concluſion, (*Ergo*, the Biſhop of Alexandria ought to haue iuriſdiction ouer Egypte, Lybia, and Pentapoli) and you ſhal finde it to be ſutche an argument, as any Sotte woulde be aſhamed to make.

(b) Vntruthe. Vaine and childiſhe.

(c) This Expoſition is like a ſicke mannes dreame.

(d) O folie. The woordes are plaine: *Quia Epiſcopo Romano pariſis mos eſt.*

(e) Vntruth. For the Biſhop of Rome neuer had power, to allotte Prouinces: but him ſelfe had his Prouince allotted him, as wel as others.

A Ne Recipiatur.

Againſt this if it ſhal like you to Replie, wee warne you before, that neither ye take aduantage of a doubtful interpretation, as wee know that Canon to be found in diuers Bookes not ſo plainely Tranſlated, and therefore we require you to ſtande to the Original, as it is in Greeke: neither that ye defende your lie with the wreſted Expoſition of Theodore Balſamon, who hath written Greeke Commentaries vpon the Canons of the Councels, ſithens the Schiſme of the Greekes, him ſelfe beinge a Schiſmatike. For he being a Greeke borne, and pricke with the hatred of his Nation againſt the Latine Churche, and ſpecially the See of Rome: in the expoſition of that ſixthe Canon of the Nicene Councel ſwarueth bothe from learninge, and alſo from reaſon.

Theodor Balſamon.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

In déede it is a ſhame to belie any creature: for that lieinge is ſhameful of it ſelfe. And therefore, M. Hardinge, ye might do mutch better, to vſe it leſſe. You haue brought vs here an Expoſition of the Councel of Nice, ſutche, as I thinke, from that time vntil this time hath ſeldome bene hearde of. You ſaie, The Biſhop of Romes Cuſtome was, to geue Juriſdiction to the Patriarkes of Alexandria, of Antioche, and of Hieruſalem: and that they had none Authoritie of Gouernemente, but onely ſo mutche, as was limited, and allowed by him. And this, you ſaie, was the onely, and vndoubted meaninge of that Councel. This fantaſie is not here auouched by any Ancient Doctour, or Learned Father. Therefore we muſt thinke, what ſo euer it be, it is your owne. And weighinge the ſtrangeneſſe of the ſame, I muſt néedes ſaie of you, as S. Hierome ſaide ſomtime of one Rheticius **in the like caſe,** Rheticius eloquens quidem eſt, ſed ineptus Interpres: Rheticius *is an eloquente man in deede: and yet but a fonde Interpreter.* **For it is certaine, and knowen euen vnto Children, that the Biſhop of** Rome, **before the Councel of Nice, had neither ſutche Cuſtome of Superioritie, nor ſutche dealinge of Juriſdictions. Pope** Pius Secundus **ſaithe,** Ante Nicenam Synodum vnuſquiſque ſibi vixit: & paruus reſpectus ad Romanam Eccleſiam habebatur: *Before the Councel of* Nice, *euery Biſhop liued to him ſelfe: and there was then ſmal regarde had of the Churche of* Rome.

Hieronym. Ad Marcellam.

Æneas Syluius, Epiſt. 288.

As for our ſottiſh Argumentes, ſutche as by your iudgement any ſotte would be aſhamed to make, I mate leaue them wel to you, M. Hardinge: not for that ye lacke them greatly, but for that, as it appeareth by your Bookes, ye knowe beſte howe to vſe them.

Touching the firſte Canon of this Councel, which you imagine, is ſo darke, and doubtful, I truſte it ſhalbe plainely, and clearely opened, by them that were neuer hitherto accounted ſottiſhe.

The woordes thereof are plaine ynough. The ſenſe is this: The whole Body of Chriſtendome was diuided into foure Patriarkeſhippes: whereof the Firſte was Rome: **the Seconde** Alexandria: **the Thirde** Antioche: **the Fourthe** Hieruſalem. **And eche of theſe was limited, and bounded within it ſelfe:** Alexandria, **to haue the ouerſight ouer** Egypt, **and** Pentapolis: Antioche, **ouer** Syria: Hieruſalem, **ouer** Iurie: Rome, **ouer** Italie, **and other Churches of the Weſte. And herein was haue the Expoſition**

The Coū-cel of Nice

position of Theodorus Balsamon, that liued fiue hundred yeres agoe, and was Patriarche of Antioche, and, as somme of M. Hardinges friendes haue thought a man of greate Learninge. Yet for as mutche as M. Hardinge here vtterly refuseth him, not onely as a Schismatique, but also as a man voide of Learninge, and Reason, let vs therefore sée somme others.

L'pomanus in Prefatione. Copus Dial. 166 Balsamonem Virum certè doctū

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ Here, saithe M. Hardinge, Searche out, M. Iewel: why was Rome the Firste, and not rather the Seconde, or the Thirde? Thereby shal you perceiue, howe your selfe vnwares are taken in your owne snare. This mater, M. Hardinge, is easily searched, & soone founde. In déede your forged Anacletus saithe, *The Apostolique Churche of* Rome *hathe the Preeminence ouer al Churches, not from the Apostles of Christe, but from Christe him selfe.* And therefore ful prettily he expounded the wordes of Christe, Super hanc Petram, id est, Super Ecclesiam Romanam ædificabo Ecclesiam meam: *Vpon this Rocke, that is to saie, Vpon the Churche of* Rome, *wil I builde my Churche.* But suche vaine forgeries make simple proufe. The very cause why the Churche of Rome was placed in order, and dignitie before al others, was not the worde of Christe, as you imagine, but the Empire, and Honour of that Cittie, whiche then in respecte of worldly Glorie, was the Ladie, & Heade of the worlde. And therefore in the Councel of Chalcedon it is written thus: Sedi Veteris Romæ propter Imperium Ciuitatis illius, Patres consequenter Priuilegia reddiderunt: *The Fathers orderly gaue the Priuilege of Chiefetie to the See of Olde* Rome, *bicause that Cittie had the Empire.* And immediately after it followeth further, Et eadem intentione permoti æqua Sanctissimæ Sedi Nouæ Romæ Priuilegia tribuerunt, rationi congruum iudicantes, vt Ciuitas illa ornata Imperio, & Senatu, æquis Seniori Regiæ Romæ Priuilegijs frueretur: *The saide Holy Fathers, moued with like consideration gaue the like Priuileges to the most Holy See of* Constantinople, *which is called Newe* Rome, *thinking it agreeable vnto reason, that the same Cittie of* Constantinople, *beinge honoured with Empire, and Senate, as* Rome *was, shoulde enioie the same Priuileges, that* Rome *enioied.*

Epist. 3.

Anacle. epist. 1.

Concil. Chalced. Actio. 16. pa. 938

The like hereof is written in the Councel of Constantinople. This, this, M. Hardinge, was the cause, and not the voice of Christe our Sauiour, as you woulde telle vs. For Christe neuer spake one worde of the Cities either of Constantinople, or of Rome, or of the Firste Sée, or of the Seconde. ☜

Concil. Constantinopol. Cap. 3.

Nilus a Greeke Authoure, hereof writeth thus: Sed vt etiam liquidiùs appareat, Papam non imperare alijs omnibus Episcopis, legatur Sextus Canon Synodi Nicenę: quo diserte præcipitur, vt alijs Ecclesijs Alexandrinus, alijs Romanus, alijs Antiochenus præsit: vt non liceat alteri alterius prouinciam inuadere: *That it maie the more plainely appeare, that the Pope hathe no Gouernemente ouer al other Bisshoppes, reade the Sixth Canon of the Councel of* Nice. *There it is expressely Commaunded, that the Bisshop of* Alexandria *shal haue the Rule ouer certaine Churches: and the Bisshop of* Rome *ouer certaine: and the Bisshop of* Antioche *likewise ouer certaine: and that it be not lawful for any one of them to inuade an others Iurisdiction.* Farther he saithe, Quòd si quis suis non contentus, aliena appetit, ille sanè meritò & Consuetudinis, & Sanctorum Canonum violator haberi debet: *If any one* (of the se Patriarkes) *not contented with his owne, craue Dominion ouer others* (as dothe the Pope) *he ought of right to be called a breaker bothe of the custome, and also of the Holy Canons.*

Nilus, De Primatu Romani Pontificu. καὶ ὡς ἂν ἐξ ἑτέρου τῆς ἀληθείας ἐπιλάμψῃ.

If M. Hardinge wil yet saie, this Exposition is sottishe, let vs sée, in what sorte Others haue expounded the same. Rufinus openinge the same Canon saithe thus: Statutum est in Concilio Niceno, vt apud Alexandriam, & in Vrbe Roma Vetusta Consuetudo seruetur: vt vel ille Aegypti, vel hic Suburbicarum Ecclesiarum solicitudinem gerat: *It was Decreed in the Councel of* Nice, *that in* Alexandria, *and in* Rome *the Olde Custome shoulde be kepte: that the Bisshop of* Alexandria *shoulde Rule ouer* Egypte: *and the Bisshop of* Rome (not ouer al the worlde, but) *ouer the Churches of his Suburbs.*

Ruffinus Eccle. Histor. li. 1. ca. 6 Suburbicarū Ecclesiarum.

Likewise it was afterwarde ordred in the Councel holden at Constantinople: Definimus Sedi Constantinopolitanæ Paria Iura, & Priuilegia cum Sede Veteris Romæ: *Wee Decree, that the See of* Constantinople *shal haue Rightes, and Priuileges* Equal (& one) *with the See of Olde* Rome.

Concil. Constantinop. 2. Cap. 36 τῶν ἴσων ἀπολαύειν πρεσβείων.

There-

The Coūcel of Nice

Therefore Nicephorus saith, Romano, & Constantinopolitano Episcopo Ex Aequo Paria sunt, & Dignitatis præmia, & Honorum iura: *The Titles of Dignities, and Rightes of Honoure geuen to the Bishop of* Rome, *and to the Bishop of* Constantinople, *are* One, *and* Equal.

Nicepho. Lib. 12 Cap. 13.

For this cause Athanasius saithe, Romano erat Metropolis Romanæ Ditionis: Rome *was the Mother Churche (*not of the Whole World, but*) of the* Romaine *Iurisdiction.* In like sorte the Emperour Iustinian saithe, Ecclesia Vrbis Constantinopolitanæ Romæ Veteris Prærogatiua lætatur: *The Churche of* Constantinople *enioieth the Prerogatiue, or Priuilege of the Churche of Olde* Rome. So likewise S. Augustine, & other Learned, & godly Bishops in the Councel of Aphrica, vnderstod the same Canon. And therfore they called the Popes Presumption, crauinge Vniuersal Iurisdiction ouer al the World, Fumosum Sæculi Typhum, *The smokie Pride of the World.* To conclude, Nilus saithe thus, Nunc, cùm aliæ Regiones assignatæ sint Romano, aliæ Alexandrino, aliæ Constantinopolitano, non magis hi sub illo sunt, quàm ille sub hisce: *Seeinge there be certaine Countries appointed out for the Bishop of* Rome, *certaine for the Bishop of* Alexandria, *and certaine for the Bishop of* Constantinople, *they are nowe nomore subiecte vnto him, then he vnto them.*

Athanas. ad Solitariam Vitam agentes.

Cod. De Sacrosanctis Ecclesijs Omni Innouatione.

Concil. Aphrica. Cap. 105.

Nilus, De Primatu Papæ.

But al these perhaps were Sottes, and their saieinges Sottishe: and noman is able rightly to vnderstande theise maters, but he that can saie, Consuetudo, is Latine for a Commission: or, Mos parilis, for Vniuersal Iurisdiction.

The Apologie, Cap. 3. Diuision. 7.

And as for the Bishop of Rome, who nowe calleth al maters before him selfe alone, excepte he doo his duetie, as he ought to doo, excepte he minister the Sacramentes, excepte he instructe the People, excepte he warne them & teache them, we saie, that he ought not of right once to be called a Bishop, or so mutche as an Elder. For a Bishop, as saithe Augustine, is a name of Labour, and not of Honour: that the man, that seeketh to haue Preeminence, and not to profite, maie vnderstande, him selfe to be no Bishop.

M. Hardinge.

Neither the Bishop of Rome, nor any other Bishop is woorthy of the name of a Bishop, excepte he doothe the duetie of a Bishop. Al this wee graunte. But that he ought not of right to be so called, of those whome he hathe charge ouer, in case of omittinge his duetie: thereto wee saie, that althoughe in respecte of his demeanoure he be not woorthy to be called a Bishop, yet in respecte of the Vocation, Degree, and Preeminence thoughe he leaue his duetie vndonne, for whiche he incurreth daunger of damnation, that Title perteineth vnto him of good righte, and so continually he is and ought to be acknowledged for a Bishop, though an euil, and an vnwoorthy Bishop: likewise a Priest. And whereas S. Augustine saithe, that a Bishop is a name of Labour, and not of Honoure, he is to be vnderstanded so as the Scripture is: whiche in somme places speaking of twoo thinges, that are both in deede to be affirmed, the one beinge of more importance then the other, denieth the one in comparison of the other, &c.

An euil Bishop loseth not the name of a Bishop, though he loose the merite of a Bishop. Vide Aug. li. 2. contra Epist. Parmen. ca. 13. Tom. 7. 1. Tim. 3.

Yet it seemeth to be a secrete preparation towarde a pourpose againste sutche time, as the Princes Gouernement shal mislike their phantasies. For where they Learned this opinion, concerninge Bishoppes, there Learned they also the like, concerning Ciuil Magistrates. I meane VVickleffe. Among whose Heretical Articles condemned by the Churche in the Councel of Constance, this is reckened for the fiftenth: *Nullus est Dominus Ciuilis, nullus est Prælatus, nullus est Episcopus, dum est in peccato mortali.* That is to saie, None is a Temporal Lorde, none is a Prelate, none is a Bishop, so longe as he is in deadly sinne.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

This mater shal nede no greate contention. The like woordes haue benne vttered by sundrie other Holy Fathers. S. Chrysostome saithe, Multi Sacerdotes, & Pauci Sacerdotes: Multi Nomine, Pauci Opere: *Many Priestes there be, and fewe Priestes there be: Many in Name, and fewe in Labour.* Againe, Quomodò potest esse Magister, qui Discipulum non habet? Acquirere Discipulum, & esto Magister: *Howe can he be a Maister, that hathe no Scholare? Geate the a Scholare, and then be a Maister.*

Chryso. in Opere Imper. Homi. 43

Chrysost in ead. Homil.

S. Ambrose saithe, Nisi bonum Opus amplectaris, Episcopus esse non potes: *Onelesse thou embrace the good Laboure, a Bishop thou canste not be.* S. Gregorie saithe,

Ambros. De Dignita. Sacerdotali, cap. 4.

A Biſhop no Biſhop

ſaithe, Sacerdotes nominamur, & non ſumus: *Prieſtes wee are called, but Prieſtes wee are not.*

Gregor. Lib. 4. Epiſt. 32.

As for VVickleffe, his Scholare Iohn Hus expounded his meaninge, and that with M. Hardinges owne Conſtruction. For theſe be his woordes, euen as they are alleged by his enimies: Papa, vel Prælatus malus, & Præſcitus, eſt æquiuocè Paſtor: & verè Fur, & Latro: *The Pope, or any other wicked Prelate, in double, or doubtful ſpeache is a Paſtour: but in very deede he is a Theefe, and a Murderer.* So Chryſoſtome ſaithe: Qui ab hominibus ordinatus eſt quantum ad Deum attinet, non eſt Sacerdos, aut Diaconus: *He that is appointed by menne (and not by God) before God, is neither Prieſt, nor Deacon.*

In Conc Conſtantien. ſeſſione. 15.

Chryſo. in Matth. Homil. 3.

If VVickleffe, vpon ſuſte zeale of the Houſe of God, for that he then ſawe, the Biſhops either knewe nothinge, or did nothinge, or cared for nothinge, either ſpake or meante more, then Truthe maie beare, wee defende it not. Notwithſtandinge, touchinge that is obiected of deadly ſinne, it ſeemeth, he folowed therein the Counſel of Valentia in France. The woordes be theſe: Quicunque ſub Ordinatione, vel Diaconatus, vel Presbyterij, vel Epiſcopatus, Mortali Crimine dixerint ſe eſſe polluctos, à ſupradictis Ordinationibus ſubmoueantur: *Who ſo euer after the Order, either of Deaconſhip, or Prieſthoode, or of Biſhoprike, ſhal ſaie they haue benne defiled with a Mortal Sinne, let them be removed from the foreſaide Orders.* If M. Hardinge ſhal diuiſe any other Expoſition hereof, I wil not greatly ſtriue with him for it. So S. Auguſtine ſaith, as he is alleged by Gratian, *He that neither hathe wiped of his owne Sinnes, nor corrected the Sinnes of his Children, ought rather to be called a ſhameleſſe Dogge, then a Biſhop.*

Concil. Valentin. ſub Damaſ. ca 4

2. Quæſt. 7. Qui nec regimini.

Yet notwithſtandinge, to remoue al ſtrife, what ſo euer the Biſhop of Rome be, or what ſo euer he do, let him hardly be called a Biſhop, becauſe, as M. Hardinge ſaithe, he ſtandeth in rome of a Biſhop: Or, as VVickleffe ſaithe, let him ſo be called, Aequiuocè, that is to ſaie, by a woorde of double meaninge: As Vnſauerie Salte is called Salte: Or, as the Prophetes of Baal are called Prophetes: Or, as a painted Man is called a Man: And, as S Gregorie ſaithe, *Let him in woordes be called a Prieſt, although he in deede he be no Prieſte.* Let him be called a Teacher, although he Teache not: Let him be called a Father, although he Father not. S. Cyprian ſaithe of S. Paule, ipſum, quamuis inane Nomen, & Vmbram quandam Sacerdotis cogitans, expauit: S. Paule *was afraide, conſideringe onely the emptie Name, and Shadowe of a Biſhop.* And in the late Councel of Tridente the matter is concluded thus: Qui dicit, eos, qui non exercent Miniſterium Verbi, & Sacramentorum, non eſſe Sacerdotes, Anathema ſit: *Who ſo euer ſaithe, that they, that Miniſter neither the Woorde of God, nor the Sacramentes, be no Prieſtes, Accurſed be he.* But Athanaſius ſaithe, Quid opus eſt Hominibus titulo Epiſcopis: *What neede haue wee of theſe menne, that beare onely the name of Biſhoppes?* Therefore S. Hierome ſaithe, Auferet Dominus Nomina Vanæ Gloriæ, & Admirationis falſæ, quę verſantur in Eccleſia. Sed & Nomina Sacerdotum cum Sacerdotibus auferet, qui fruſtra ſibi applaudunt in Epiſcopali, & in Presbyterij Dignitate, & non in Opere: *The Lorde ſhal take awaie the Names of Vaine Glorie, and of feined woonderinge, whiche are in the Churche: Yea he ſhal take awaie bothe the names of thoſe Prieſtes, and the Prieſtes withal, whiche vaunte themſelues in the Dignitie of Biſhoprike, and Prieſthoode, but not in the Laboure.*

Cyprian. Lib. 1. Epiſt. 3.

Concil. Trident. De Sacramento Ordinu.

Athanaſius. Ad ſolitariam Vitam agentes.

Hieron. in Sophoniam. cap. 1.

The Apologie, Cap. 4. Diuiſion. 1.

And that neither the Pope, nor any other worldly Creature can no more be Heade of the whole Churche, or a Biſhop ouer al, then he can be the Bridegroome, the Light, the Saluation, & Life of the Churche. For theſe Priuileges, and Names belonge onely to Chriſte, and be properly, and onely fitte for him alone.

And that no Biſhop of Rome did euer ſuffer him ſelfe to be called by ſuche a proude name and title, before Phocas the Emperours time, (who, as wee knowe, by killinge his owne Soueraigne Mauritius the

Prouude Name.

the Emperoure, did by a Traiterous Villanie aspire to the Empire.) Whiche was about the sixth hundred and thirteenth yeere after Christ was borne.

M. Hardinge.

*Vntruthe: For it belonged not vnto the Pope.

The name of Vniuersal Bishop, whiche this Interpreter meaneth, beinge taken in a right sence, is no prowde name, in respecte of him, * to whom it belongeth. VVhether any Bishop of Rome euer suffered him selfe to be called by that name, or no, as you denie it, and proue it not, so it forceth not whether any did so, or no. If they refused it of humilitie, that proueth it not to be vnlawfull. Vniuersall Bishop.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

If the name of Vniuersal Bishop be a Prowde Name in others, why maie it not also be a Prowde Name in the Bishop of Rome? Hathe the Bishop there suche a special Priuilege for Pride aboue al others? Maie Pride be Humilitie, and Humilitie Pride, onely in respecte of diuerse Persones? You saie, This Title of righte belonged to the Bishop of Rome: and therefore in him it was no Pride. This, M. Hardinge, is a foule Untruthe, as it shal appeare by the nexte Diuision. For these be the wordes of the Councel of Carthage, Or at leaste, by youre owne confession, of Gratian, allegynge the Councel of Carthage: Vniuersalis autem (Episcopus) nec ipse Romanus Pontifex appelletur: *The Bishop of Rome him selfe maie not be called the Vniuersal Bishop.*

Dist. 59. Prima sedu.

That the Olde Learned and Godly Bishoppes of Rome refused this Name, as Prowde, and Arrogant, it is so plaine by S. Gregorie, that I maruelle, any Learned man woulde cal it to question. His wordes thereof be these: Nullus Decessorum meorum hoc tam Profano Vocabulo vti consensit: Nullus Romanorum Pontificum hoc Singularitatis Nomen assumpsit: Nos hunc honorem nolumus oblatum suscipere: *None of my Predecessours Bishoppes of Rome, euer consented to vse this Vngodly Name: No Bishop of Rome euer tooke vpon him this Name of Singularitie: Wee, the Bishop of Rome, wil not receiue this honour beinge offred vnto vs.*

Gregor. Lib. 4. Epist. 32. & 36.

If the Bishoppes of Rome in Olde times refused this Name, not for wante of Righte, but onely, as M. Hardinge saithe, of Humilitie, wherefore then did theire Successoures, that folowed afterwarde, so ambitiously laboure to geate the same? Platyna saith, Bonifacius Tertius obtinuit à Phoca, Magna tamen Contentione: *Pope* Bonifacius *the Thirde obteined of the Emperour* Phocas (that Rome shoulde be called the Heade of al Churches) *but with* Greate Contention, and mutch adoo. Wherefore then doth S. Augustine, & the whole Councel of Aphrica condemne the attempt of this vsurped Jurisdiction, & calle it, Fumosum Sæculi Typhum? *The smokie Pride of the Worlde:* And that euen in the Bishoppes of Rome?

Platyna in Bonifacio 3.

If the Bishop of Rome be so fulle of Humilitie, as we are here borne in hande, why auaunceth he him selfe so Highe aboue al Generall Councelles? Why saithe he, that no Creature maie iudge his dooinges? Why claimeth he the Swerde & Scepter of al the Worlde? Why saithe he, that Christes Consistorie, and his Consistorie are al One, and that he can doo al, that God can doo? Why dothe he saie, That the Emperour is but the Proctour, or Baillie of the Churche of Rome: Procurator, siue Defensor Romanæ Ecclesiæ? Why doth he suffer Kinges, and Emperours to holde his Stirope, to leade his Palfrai, and to kisse his Feete? Verily this kinde of Humilitie in other places might goe for Pride. Helychius saithe, Vbi Superbia regnat, & Hypocrisis, Humilitas locum non habet: *Where Pride, and Hypocrisie beare the swaie, there Humilitie can haue no place.* Likewise Chrysostome saithe, Quicunque desiderauerit Primatum in Terra, inueniet in Cœlo Confusionem: nec inter Seruos Christi computabitur, qui de Primatu tractauerit: *Who so euer desireth Primacie in Earthe, in Heauen he shal finde Confusion: Neither shal he be accounpted emonge the Seruauntes of* Christe, *that wil once intreate of Primacie.*

Dist. 98. Si Imperat. in Gloss.

Hesychius Sene. Lib. 4. Dist. 17. Cur ergo.

Dist. 40. Multi.

M. Hard. 85. a.

Addition. ☞ But hereto M. Hardinge answeareth, VVhy did you not quote the place, M. Iewel? Chrysostome hathe no suche saieinge. That, whiche goeth before in Gratian is taken Addition ☞

Prouvde Name.

taken out of *Opus Imperfectum*, Homil. 43. whiche is wel knowen not to be Chryſoſtomes. But this ſaieinge whiche here you allege out of Gratian, is neither there, nor in Chryſoſtome. It is a forgerie: and that you knowe wel yenoughe. Yet you are not aſhamed to vſe it, to deceiue the ignorante Reader. Leaue, leaue, M. Iewel, to abuſe the ſimplicitie of the vnlearned with ſutche forged pecces and patches. M. Hard. 183. b.

The Anſweare. **M. Hardinge, howe ſhal poꝛe M. Iewel be dable to anſweare this kinde of Eloquence? It becommeth pou ſo wel, that it were greate pitie, pe ſhoulde ſpeake better. Thoughe this were a forgerie in deede, as pou haue ſo ſadly tolde vs, yet you knowe, it were poure owne Gratians forgerie: it were not mine, You ſaie,** The Booke entituled *Opus Imperfectum*, **was neuer written by** Chryſoſtome. **I can eaſily perſwade hereto, and neuer ſtriue foꝛ it. And yet pour Gratian allegeth the ſame Booke by the name of** Chryſoſtome, **as pou knowe. Neither did I allege theſe woꝛdes, as out of** Chryſoſtome, **but as out of the Booke of** Gratians Decrees, **allowed to the woꝛlde by** Pope Eugenius 3. **and commonly called** Fundamentum Iuris Canonici. **Who ſo is dable truely to bꝛinge foꝛthe his Authour, ought not of right to be charged with forgerie. Pou doo wꝛonge therefoꝛe, M. Harding, with ſutche outcries, to raiſe the Countrie vpon him, that hath not offended.** Diſt. 40. *Malit.*

But, I pꝛaye you, be theſe woꝛdes neither in Opere Imperfecto, **as pou ſaie, noꝛ in any other Booke of** Chryſoſtome? **And doo I knowe it, as you telle me? Oꝛ wil you ſaie, your ſelfe doo know it? Oꝛ, if you ſo ſaie, maie we beleeue it? Surely if pe had ſought theſe woꝛdes better, pe might haue founde them. But ye ſought them, where they were not, and ſought in vaine. In the.** 35. Homilie **of that ſame Booke, it is wꝛitten thus,** Quicunque deſiderauerit Primatum in terra, inueniet in Cœlo confuſionem: vt iam inter ſeruos Chriſti non ſit de Primatu certamen. **Theſe be the ſelfe ſame woꝛdes, that you ſaie, cannot be founde, neither in Opere Imperfecto, noꝛ in any other Booke of** Chryſoſtome. **Here is neither peeꝛing, noꝛ patching, M. Hardinge. It is plaine dealinge: It is no forgerie. If theſe woꝛdes thus placed doo not like you, as it appeareth, they doo not, then change them hardly, and take the contrarie: and rather ſaie thus,** VVho ſo euer deſireth Primacie in Earth, ſhal finde no confuſion in Heauen. **This perhappes maie ſeeme better to ſerue pour turne. Here might I triumphe and ſaie to you, as you ſaie to me.** Yet are you not aſhamed, &c. Leaue, leaue, M. Hardinge, &c. Homil. 35. *In Opere Imperfecto.*

To conclude, a Learned Man, one of M. Hardinges owne ſide, hereupon hath noted thus: Bonifacius obtinuit à Phoca, vt Eccleſia Romana eſſet Caput Omnium Eccleſiarum. Ex quo poſſet modo conſimili ſumi Argumentum, quòd ad Imperatorem pertineat: Primatum Eccleſiæ tranſferre, & de Eccleſijs Ordinare: *Pope* Bonifacius *the thirde obteined of the Emperoure* Phocas, *that the Churche of Rome ſhould be the Heade of al Churches. Whereof wee maie in like caſe geather an Argument, that it belongeth to the Emperoure, to tranſlate the Primacie of the Churche, and to take Order for the Churches.* Iohan. de Parisijs de Potest. Reg. & Papali Cap. 13.

The Apologie, Cap. 4. Diuiſion. 2.

Alſo the Councel of Carthage did circumſpectly pꝛouide, that no Biſhop ſhoulde be called either the Higheſt Biſhop, oꝛ Chiefe Pꝛieſte.

M. Hardinge.

Falſifieing of a Councel

Here by your leaue, Syr Defender, you plaie falſe, and are taken, as it were with falſe Diſe, and therefore ye ought iuſtly to looſe al that ye haue vniuſtly wonne by your falſe plaie, and falſe Dyſe: I meane your ſhameful falſifieinge of this Councel by you alleaged. And for this and other your falſehed it is righte you looſe the credite, whiche vniuſtly (bicauſe by falſe Teachinge) you haue wonne amonge the Vnlearned. That your falſe plaie might not ſoone be eſpied, you doo as like to Maiſter Iuel, as thoughe you were his Fathers Sonne. For that falſe ſleight he vſeth more, then any that euer I readde. For where as we haue ſeuen Councels of Carthage, neither ſhewe you, which of them it is that you alleage, nor geue any notice of the number, where the Canon maie be founde. But contrariwiſe as the Lapwinge with her buſie crie leadeth a man from her neſte, ſo you leade vs from the place, where it is, by putunge in the Margent of your Booke the number 47. that not findinge it by your note, wee ſhoulde geue ouer further lookinge for it. VVho dothe euil, hateth light, ſaithe Chriſte. So here falſifieinge (a) and forginge a Canon of a Councel you woulde faine walke in clowdes, that your lieinge might not be deprehended, &c. So had it benne donne more circumſpectly for furtherance of your falſehed, if the mater ſhoulde neuer come to trial of Learninge. Iohan. 3. M. Hardinge is a mery man. (a) Vntruth. For this Canon wil ſoone be found

Nowe, who so euer examineth the place truely, muste needes crie out shame on you, Defender, who are th'auctour. The woordes, if you had listed to haue alleged them without falshead, be these, VVhiche wee finde in the 26. Canon of the Thirde Councel of Carthage, whiche Councel was Authorized by the sixth General Councel holden at Constantinople in Trullo. *Vt prima Sedis Episcopus non appelletur Princeps Sacerdotum, aut Summus Sacerdos, aut aliquid huiusmodi, Sed tantum, Prima Sedis Episcopus.* And thus they are to be Englished, It hathe liked vs (saie the Fathers of that Councel) that a Bishop of a Firste See be not called Prince of Priestes, or Higheste Priestes, or any suche other thinge, but onely a Bishop of a First See. Nowe commeth me this ioyly Defender, and saithe, the Councel of Carthage hathe expresse woordes, (for so muche his Latine soundeth) that no Bishop shoulde be called either the Higheste Bishop, or Chiefe Priestes. By whiche Canon thus by him vntruely vttered, he thought to deprive the Pope of this (b) Ancient Title, that al the world hath euer attributed vnto him, so as he be called nomore *Summus Pontifex*.

The 26. Canon of the thirde Councel of Carthage discussed.

(b) Vntruthe, as shal appeare.

For the right vnderstandinge of this Canon, twoo thinges are to be considered. How farre the Authoritie of this Councel ought to be extended, and what is meant by a Firste See. (c) The Decrees of this Councel pertained but to the Prouince of Aphrike. For Prouincial Councelles binde only the Prouinces, in which, and for Order of whiche they be kepte. Onely the General Councelles are to be receiued of al.

Vide Epist. Leon. 9 ad Petrum & Iohannem Aphricæ Episcopos.

(c) Vntruth. For this Councel namely restraineth the Bishop of Rome.

By these twoo woordes, *Prima Sedes*, those Fathers vnderstoode any Citie, in which a Patriarke or Primate, who are of one Office, though of diuerse names, hathe his See. I cal it a First See, or rather (if it mighte be permitted) a Primate See. (d) In greate Cities where the Higheste Courtes for Iustice were kepte, and where the chiefe Pagane Priestes of the Latines named, *Primi Flamines*, were resident before the comminge of Christe, there after Christes comminge were Patriarkes or Primates placed: by whom the weightie maters of Bishoppes shoulde be decided. (e) VVhiche Order was taken firste by commaundemente of S Peter, as Clement writeth: by the Apostles and Clement, as Anacletus witnesseth: by the Apostles and theire Successoures afterwarde, as Lucius the Pope saithe.

Prima Sedis, what meaneth. Dist. 99. & Primatib.

(d) Vntruthe, grounded vpon a fable.

(e) Vntruthe, grounded as the Former.

Dist. 99. C. Prouincæ.

Nowe the Councel of Carthage by this Defender alleged, and likewise the Aphrican Councel ordeined and willed, that a Bishop of any of the Primate Sees of Aphrike shoulde not be called, *Princeps Sacerdotum, aut Summus Sacerdos*, Prince or chiefe of the Priestes, or Higheste Priestes by whiche woorde a Bishop is there signified: but onely a Bishop of the Primate See, whereof he was Primate. By which Decree they willed (f) onely their Primates of Aphrike to keepe them selues within their limites, and not presumptuously to take vpon them more glorious Titles, and further Iurisdiction, then to them perteined, leaste surely they mighte seeme to preiudicate the Popes Supremacie. Thus it is euidente, th'auctoritie of that Carthage Councel, beinge restrained to Aphrike onely, that by this Canon the Popes Primacie and Title is no whitte diminished or disproued. And so for al this Defender, he remaineth as he hathe (g) euer, Higheste Bishop.

(f) Moste manifest, and moste vaine Vntruthe

(g) A greate Vntruthe.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

What, M. Hardinge, so muche talicheb vpon vs at one time? Falsifieinge of Councelles: Shameful Falsifeinge: False teachinge: False sleighte: False Dise: False Plate: and al False? Christe saithe of him selfe, *I am the Truthe*. God geue you grace to credite him. For the errroure of quotation in the Margine, wherein you spende so many woordes, it maie please you to knowe, that I neither was the Printer, nor coulde be presente at the Printinge. For the reste, if there can be any one pointe of Falsehed founde in me, touchinge the allegation of this Councel of Carthage, I wil not refuse to stande charged with the whole. But if euery of these horrible Falsehoddes be founde an euidente, and plaine Truthe, then it maie please you, to take home al these pretty Titles to youre selfe againe, as in euery of theise woordes so often doubled, and so heapte tograther, hauinge youre selfe committed a seuerall Falsehedde.

And herein for trial of your courteous dealinge, I am contente, youre selfe shal sitte, and be the Iudge. For, notwithstanding it be thought of many, that ye dissemble deepely, and wil not bestowe your voice to saie the Truthe: Yet I doubte not, but in this mater, if ye haue eies, ye maie easily wake vp, and see the Truthe.

You saie, Sir Defender hathe falsely alleged the Councel of Carthage. **And why so? For that he saithe, The Councel Decreed by expresse woordes, that the Bishop of Rome shoulde not be called the Vniuersal Bishop. This, you saie, is Forged, and Falsified, and is no parte of that Councel. For indifferent trial bothe of the Truthe, and of the Falsehed herein, I beseeche you, beholde the very woordes of the Councel, euen as they are alleged by youre owne Doctoure Gratian. Theise they are:** Primæ Sedis Episcopus non appelletur Princeps Sacerdotum, vel Summus Sacerdos, vel

Dist. 59. Prima.

Highest Bishop, Prince of Priestes.

vel aliquid huiusmodi: Sed tantùm, Primæ Sedis Episcopus. Vniuersalis autem nec etiam Romanus Pontifex appelletur: *Let not the Bishop of any of the Firste Sees be called the Prince of Priestes, Or the Highest Priestes, or by any other like name. but Onely the Bishop of the Firste See. But let not the Bishop of Rome him selfe be called the Vniuersal Bishop.* And in the Glose thereupon it is noted thus, In hac Distinctione dicitur, quòd Papa non debet dici Vniuersalis: *In this distinction it is saide, that the Pope oughte not to be called the Vniuersal Bishop.*

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ Here M. Hardinge crieth out bitterly, M. Iewel is a shamelesse man: Three maine Lies: O impudente Gloser. Are ye not ashamed &c. Theise be not the woordes of the Councel of Carthage. They are to be referred to the thirde parte of the distinction, that foloweth afterwarde. Youre speache is terrible, M. Hardinge, and argueth somme inordinate passion in youre stomake. Referre theise woordes, whither you wil. If they be not written in the Councel of Carthage, yet at the leaste thei are the woordes of Gratian alleginge the woordes of the Councel of Carthage. Be they his woordes, or be they the Councelles. I wil not striue. Wel you knowe, they are not mine. Thus be saithe, by youre owne Confession, Vniuersalis autem, nec etiam Romanus Pontifex appelletur: *Let not the Bishop of Rome him selfe be called the Vniuersal Bishop.* And this you confesse, is the meaninge of Pope Pelagius, that foloweth immediately in the same Distinction. Nowe, M. Hardinge, What greate preiudice is this, as touchinge the righte of oure cause, if wee lose the Authoritie of the Councel of Carthage, and geate the Authoritie of the Pope him selfe, who in youre iudgemente, and as you haue written and published to the Worlde, is aboue the Authoritie of al Councelles. What so euer the Councel of Carthage saie, the Pope him selfe saithe, as it is noted in the Rubrike, Nec etiam Romanus Pontifex Vniuersalis est appellandus. *M. Hard. in 190. b.* *M. Hard. 191. a.* *M. Hard. Confutat. Pag. 284. a.*

Nowe touchinge the Glose, you renne vpon mee with hue, and crie, O impudente Gloser, (you saie) Are you not ashamed to shewe youre preuishe Falsehedde? why leafte you out the beginninge of the sentence? Truely, M. Hardinge, I knewe not youre dicte: Otherwise I coulde as good cheape haue serued you with altogether. I leafte out nothinge, that was necessarie. But, for as mutche, as you wante somme thinge, I knowe not what, you shal haue free libertie to make it vp at youre pleasure. The whole woordes be theise: Hæc est Tertia pars Distinctionis, in qua dicitur, quòd Papa non debet vocari Vniuersalis: *This is the Thirde parte of this Distinction, Wherein it is saide, that the Pope oughte not to be called the Vniuersal Bishop.*

Nowe telle vs, good M. Hardinge, what prouishe Falsehed, or what impudente glosinge is this? or, sauinge somme parte of youre folie, whereat oughte any man to be ashamed? ☞

Touchinge, that you so pleasantly cheere your selfe with theise woordes, You doo as like to M. Iewel, as if you were his Fathers Sonne. I muste answeare you, as S. Augustine sommetime did the Heretique Cresconius: Serua potius Puerilia Pueris: *Keepe suche Childishe toies to plaie with your Children.* God make vs bothe like vnto oure Father, that is in Heauen. *Aug. cont. Cresc. li. 3. ca. 38.*

Where you saie, of your selfe onely, without farther witnesse, that this Title is the Popes Auncient Righte, euer geuen to him by al the worlde, I doubte not, but the Untruthe hereof by my Former Replie, touchinge the same, maie some appeare. Certainely, when the same Title was offered to S. Gregorie, he refused it vtterly, as none of his. *Artic. 4. Greg. li. 7. epist. 30.*

In deede, this Councel of Carthage notwithstandinge, The Title of Highe-

Higheste Bishop, Prince of Priestes.

A Primate See.

Bishops was sommetime geuen, not only to the Bishop of Rome, and other Patriarkes, but also vnto al other Bishoppes. M. Hardinges owne Amphilochius calleth S. Basile, Principem Sacerdotum: *The Prince, or Chiefe of Bishoppes.* Rufinus calleth Athanasius, Pontificem Maximum: *The Highest Bishop.* Nazianzenus calleth the same Athanasius, Archisacerdotem Sacerdotum: *The Chiefe Bishop of Bishoppes.* Lactantius calleth euery Bishoprike, Summum Sacerdotium. Like wise S. Hierome saithe, Ecclesiæ Salus in Summi Sacerdotis dignitate pendet: *The Safetie of the Churche standeth in the dignitie of the Highest Priestе.* By which Highest Priestе, M. Hardinge him selfe saithe, is meante euery seuerall Bishop within his owne Diocese. S. Augustine saithe, Quid est Episcopus, nisi Primus Presbyter, hoc est, Summus Sacerdos? *What is a Bishop, but the Firste, or Chiefe Priestе, that is to saie, the Highest Priestе?* Therefore we mate lakely spare the Pope this Title, of Highest Bishop, not as Peculiare to him alone, as M. Hardinge imagineth, but as Common, and Generall to al Bishoppes.

M. Hardinges Amphilochius. Rufinus. Lib. 2. Cap. 23. Nazian. ad Heronem. Lactan. Lib. 4. Cap. 30. Hieron. contra Luciferianos.

M. Hardinge in his Answeare to the Apologie, Fol. 204. b.

All that pœ haue here alleged of the Jurisdiction of the Flamines, is a mere fantasie, grounded onely vpon an vnlauery Fable of Anacletus, and Clemens. Neither are you able to finde, either these names, Archiflamines, or Protoflamines, whiche here are imagined, in any Ancient allowed Writer, or any suche Vniuersal Jurisdiction to them belonginge.

In Quæst. Ex vtroq. Testam. mixtim Qu. 101

The Firste, or Principal, or Mother Sées were limited, not by the Flamines, but by the Prince. So it is written in the Councel of Chalcedon: Quascunque Ciuitates per Literas Regias Metropolitico nomine honorarunt: *What Cities so euer by the Princes Charter, they honoured with the name of the Mother See.*

Concil. Chalced. Can. 12.

And therefore the Emperoure Theodosius vpon displeasure conceiued, toke that Name of Honoure from the Cittie of Antioche, mindinge it shoulde so be called no more. And for that cause was the Cittie of Rome chosen emongest others, to be a Primate, or a Principal Mother Sée, not for that either Christe, or Peter had so appointed, as M. Hardinge telleth vs, but for that it was the moste Noble Cittie, and of greateste renoume in al the Worlde. The wordes be plaine:

Chrys. ad Popul. Antiochen. Homil. 17.

Concil. Chalced. Cap. 28.

Sedi Veteris Romæ Patres meritò dederunt Primatum, Quòd illa Ciuitas aliis Imperaret: *The Fathers worthily gaue the Chiefetie to the See of the Olde Rome: Bicause that Cittie had the Princehoode ouer others.*

Nowe concerninge this Decrée of the Councel of Carthage, it touched as wel the Bishop of Rome, as other Primates. And therefore Pope Adriane afterwarde alleginge, and corruptinge the same, added thereto this special Prouiso for him selfe:

Adrian. Papa. In Capitula ex Synodo. & Canonib. diuer. collec. To. 2. Pag. 611.

Nullus Archiepiscoporum, nisi qui Primas Sedes tenent, appelletur Primas, aut Princeps Sacerdotum, aut Summus Sacerdos, aut aliquid huiusmodi &c. Salua semper in omnibus Authoritate Beati Petri Apostoli: *Let no Archebishop, sauinge suche, as haue the Principal, or Firste Sees, be called either the Primate, or the Prince of Priestes, or the Highеste Priestе, or by any other like name, &c. Sauinge alwaies, and in al thinges, the Authoritie of Blessed S. Peter the Apostle.*

The Apologie, Cap. 4. Diuision. 3.

And therefore, sithence the Bishop of Rome wil nowe a daies so be called, and chalengeth vnto him selfe an Authoritie, that is none of his: besides that, he doothe plainely contrarie to the Auciente Councelles, and contrarie to the Olde Fathers: We beleue, that he doothe geene to him selfe, as it is written by his owne Companion Gregorie, a Presumptuouse, a Prophane, a Sacrilegious, and an Antichristian name: that he is also the kinge of Pride, that he is Lucifer, which preferreth him

Al these be the wordes of Gregorie.

him ſelfe before his Brethren: that he hathe forſaken the Faithe, and is the Forerenner of Antichriſte.

M. Hardinge.

Here is muche adoo about naught, and a number of bitter woordes piked out of S. Gregories Epiſtles, pretended to be written againſte the Biſhop of Rome, to no purpoſe. For if wee ſaie, (a) as wee maie ſaie truely, that he chalengeth to him ſelfe no ſutche name, then what hathe this Defender to ſaie? Let him ſhewe vs howe many Biſhoppes of that See euer tooke the name of the Vniuerſal Biſhop vpon them, ſpecially as Gregorie vnderſtandeth it to ſignifie. If he can ſhewe none, why bloteth he ſo muche Paper with ſo impudent Lies?

(b) In deede the ſixe hundred and thirtie Fathers of the General Councel of Chalcedon, gaue to Pope Leo that name, as Gregorie in three ſundrie Epiſtles writeth, and certaine other in theire writinges haue attributed to the Pope the ſame. But that either Leo, or any other his Succeſſour (c) affected ſo to be called, Gregorie denieth. (d) And that any ſince Gregories time to our daies, euer called or wrote him ſelfe Vniuerſal Biſhop, wee denie.

VVhereas Pelagius, and Gregorie, writinge againſte the Preſumption of Iohn the Biſhop of Conſtantinople for takinge vpon him this name, are muche alleged by the enimies of Vnitie, againſt the Authoritie of Peters Succeſſour ouer the whole Churche: wee ſaie, that they ſolowing the ſteppes of theire Predeceſſours, refuſed the name of Vniuerſal Biſhop in ſuche ſenſe, as Pelagius, and ſpecially Gregorie oftentimes declareth, that where one is called Vniuerſal Biſhop, he ſeemeth to be called (e) Biſhop alone, ſo as Biſhoprike ſhoulde be taken awaie from al others. But they refuſed not ſo to be called after this meaninge, as though by that refuſal, the Auctoritie of the Biſhop of Rome ſhould be reſtrained, and not extended ouer the whole Churche. They denie, that any man might ſo be Vniuerſal Biſhop, as he ſhould be alſo the peculiar Ruler, and Gouernour of euery particular Church. For ſo al other Biſhoppes had benne in vaine: and that is contrarie to Chriſtes Inſtitution, who ordeined al the Apoſtles to be Biſhoppes. To ſaie al in fewe, they refuſed the name that might odiouſly be taken, they refuſed not the Primacie (f) whiche Chriſte to them had committed. Therefore Gregorie writinge to Morice the Emperoure, alleaginge the woordes that make for Peters Auctoritie ouer the whole Flocke of Chriſte, ſaithe of Peter, (g) The charge of the whole Churche and Principalitie is committed to him, and yet is he not called Vniuerſal Apoſtle. VVhere it is plaine, that Gregorie doothe bothe affirme the charge of the whole, and denieth the name of Vniuerſal. Let theſe Defenders graunte the thinge, and wee ſtriue not for the name.

(a) Vntruth. For Platyna ſaithe, *Bonifacius 3. Obtinuit à Phoca, Magna tamen Contentione.*

(b) There appeareth no ſuch matter in al that Councel.

(c) Vntruth. As appeareth by the Former Authorities of Platina.

(d) Vntruth. As further appeareth by the Anſweare.

(e) Vntruthe, and moſt vaine fantaſie. For no Biſhop of Conſtãtinople euer dreamed of ſutche Authoritie.

(f) Vntruth. For Chriſte neuer erected any ſuche Primacie.

(g) The like whole Charge was geeuen to Paule, Iohn, and Mathewe: as ſhal appeare. M. Har. pa. 186. *b*

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Here it pleaſeth M. Hardinge of his Courteſie to ſaie, We haue blotted oure papers with ſo many, and ſo many impudente Lies. His whole diſcourſe ſtandeth onely in the Conſtruction of this woorde, Vniuerſal, in what ſenſe it maie be either refuſed, or claimed. Howe be it, vnderſtande thou, gentle Reader, that al this is M. Hardinges owne onely Commentarie. For other Doctour, or Father he alleageth none.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ But M. Hardinge ſaithe, M. Iewel miſliketh with me for ſaieinge, that the name of Vniuerſal Biſhop in a righte ſenſe is no prowde name, in reſpecte of him, to whom it belongeth. By a right ſenſe, I meane that ſenſe, whiche S. Gregorie allowed, and that, which the fourthe General Councel of Chalcedon allowed.

The Anſweare. But what is that right ſenſe, M. Hardinge? The ſame, (you ſaie) that is allowed by the Councel of Chalcedon, and by S. Gregorie. But what ſenſe, that maie be, neither the Councel of Chalcedon, nor S. Gregorie euer told you. Verily, S. Gregorie hauinge occaſion largely to diſpute hereof, euen in the ſame ſenſe, I meaninge, as it was claimed by the Biſhop of Conſtantinople, ſaithe, that the ſame Title with the ſame ſenſe was offered by the Councel of Chalcedon to the Biſhop of Rome. In the ſame ſenſe, I ſaie, M. Hardinge, and in none other: And in what ſenſe it was offered by the Councel, in the ſame ſenſe the Pope refuſed it. The ſenſe therefore beinge one, why do you ſo vainely imagine ſutche choiſe of ſenſes? The ſenſe that was offered, (you ſaie) was good: The ſenſe, that was refuſed, (you ſaie) was naught. And yet bothe theſe ſenſes were al one ſenſe. Otherwiſe ſhewe you me, where S. Gregorie euer called him ſelfe the Vniuerſal Biſhop in any kinde of ſenſe. Certainely, ſpeakinge of the ſame Title of Vniuerſal Biſhop, and of the ſame ſenſe, and of none other he ſaithe, Petrus Vniuerſalis Apoſtolus non vocatur: S. Peter *is not called the Vniuerſal Apoſtle.* If this title, and this ſenſe neuer belonged vnto S. Peter, howe then maie it belonge vnto the Pope? Wherefore, M. Hardinge, touchinge the righte ſenſe of theſe woordes, I thinke him not in his righte wittes, that can diuiſe ſutche

Lib. 4. Epiſt. 32.

diſtinction of Senſes without any difference. Him S. Gregorie meant to claime the name of Vniuerſal Biſhop, that ſought to ſubdue al the Members of Chriſtes Church vnto him ſelfe. And this is that ſelfe ſame Title, and that ſelfe ſame Senſe, that this daie is claimed by the Pope, as it is euidente vnto the worlde. Pope Clemente ſaithe, Omnes ſubiecti ſunt motioni Papæ: & ſunt in illo, quaſi membra de membro: *Al menne are ſubiecte to the Popes Will: and are in him, as Members of a Member.* Durandus ſaithe, Omnes Epiſcopi deſcendunt à Papa, tanquam Membra à Capite: *Al Biſhoppes comme from the Pope, as Members from the Heade.* An other ſaithe, Papa eſt Ordinarius totius Mundi: *The Pope is the Ordinarie, or Biſhop of al the whole Worlde.* And therefore Pope Bonifacius 8. hathe concluded by Solemne Sentence, *That euery Creature muſte ſubmitte it ſelfe vnto the Biſhop of Rome, vpon the paine of euerlaſtinge damnation.* This is the right ſenſe, that you meane, M. Hardinge: Thus the Pope claimeth this daie, to be the Vniuerſal Biſhop. And this ſame Title, and Senſe is it, that S. Gregorie condemneth.

Clemens Lib. 5. De Hæreticis. Ad Veſtrum.

Durand. De Miniſtris & Ordinibus, Lib 2. De Maior. & Obedient. Vnam Sanctam.

Firſte, where it is ſaide, that S. Gregorie by this worde, Vniuerſal Biſhop, meante him, that woulde be Biſhop alone ouer al the worlde, excludinge al others, this expoſition is not onely ſtrange, but alſo vaine, and fonde, and voide of reaſon. For what Biſhop of Conſtantinople euer was there, that called him ſelfe the Onely Biſhop, and excluded al others? Doubtleſſe Iohn, that firſte laide Claime vnto this name, as he called him ſelfe the Vniuerſal Biſhop, ſo he wrote his Letters vnto others, and neuer refuſed to calle them Biſhoppes.

But, to leaue theſe Gloſes, and fantaſies, by the Title of Vniuerſal Biſhop, S. Gregorie meante ſutche a one, not, as woulde be Biſhop alone, but as would claime Infinite Authoritie, and Vniuerſal Juriſdiction ouer al other Biſhoppes throughout the Worlde: and that as S. Cyprian ſaithe, woulde calle him ſelfe, Epiſcopum Epiſcoporum: *The Biſhop of Biſhoppes.*

Cyprian in Concil. Carthagin.

Therefore S. Gregorie thus writeth vnto Iohn the Biſhop of Conſtantinople, the Firſte Vſurper of this Title: Quid tu Chriſto Vniuerſalis Eccleſiæ Capiti in Extremi Iudicij reſponſurus es examine, qui cuncta eius Membra tibimet Vniuerſalis conaris appellatione ſupponere? *What Anſweare wilt thou make vnto* Chriſt *the Head of the Vniuerſal Churche, when thou ſhalt be examined at the laſte Iudgement,* (not that thou haſt called thee ſelfe ✠ onely Biſhop, but) *that thou geeſt about by the name of Vniuerſal Biſhop, to make al his Members ſubiecte vnto thee?* It was this immoderate Vniuerſal Juriſdiction, that S. Gregorie reproued, and not the makinge of him ſelfe Biſhop alone, excludinge al others.

Gregor. Lib. 4. Epiſt. 38.

Likewiſe he writeth of him ſelfe vnto Eulogius: Beatitudo veſtra mihi ſic loquitur, Sicut Iuſiſtis. Quod Verbum Iuſionis, peto, à meo auditu remouete. Non Iuſi: Sed quæ vtilia viſa ſunt, indicare curaui: *Your Holineſſe ſaithe thus vnto mee,* (bidinge the Biſhop of Rome) *As you haue Commaunded. Haue away this woorde of Commaundinge from my hearing, I beſeeche you. I Commaunded you not: but that I tooke to be the beſte, I thoughte good to ſhewe you.* The faulte therefore that Gregorie findeth with Iohn the Biſhop of Conſtantinople, ſtode not in callinge him ſelfe the Onely Biſhop, for ſo he neuer did, but in Biddinge, and Commaundinge, and Claiminge Vniuerſalitie of Juriſdiction ouer the whole Churche of Chriſte. And for that cauſe he ſaithe vnto Eulogius: Ecce in Præfatione Epiſtolæ, quam ad meipſum, qui prohibui, direxiſtis, Superbæ Appellationis Verbum Vniuerſalem me Papam dicentes imprimere Curaſtis. Quod, peto, dulciſſima mihi Sanctitas veſtra vltrà non faciat: quia vobis ſubtrahitur, quod alteri pluſquam ratio exigit præbetur: *Beholde euen in the Title of your Letter yee haue written this Prowde Poſte, naminge mee* The Vniuerſal Pope: *notwithſtandinge I haue forebidden.*

Gregor. Lib. 7. Epiſt. 30.

forbidden it. I beseche your Holinesse, to doo so nomore. For what so euer is geuen vnto any other aboue reason, the same is taken from your selues.

M. Harainge saithe, Gregorie affirmeth the Charge of the whole, and denieth the name of Vniuersal. Let these Defenders (saithe he) graunte the thinge, and wee striue not for the name. Verily this plate had benne to vaine for Children: to allowe the thinge it selfe, and to cauil onely aboute the name: that is to receiue the Bodie, and to shunne the Shadowe: Or, as Christe saithe, to swalowe a Camel, and to straine a gnatte. So Appian saithe, Iulius Cæsar nicely refused to be called a King: and yet in al manner Authoritie and Gouernmente bare him selfe none otherwise, then as a King.

Matth. 23. Appianus: ἐπὶ δὲ τὰς ἐμ βασιλείας.

It was not the bare Name of Vniuersal Bishop, that so mutche offended the Holy Fathers: but the Pride, and Tyrannie, and Vniuersal Gouernemente, and Iurisdiction, that is signified by that name. If the name were naught, then was the Vsurpation of the thinge it selfe a greate deale worse.

But S. Gregorie saithe, *The Charge, and Principalitie of the whole Churche was committed vnto* Peter. This is not denied: In like sorte Chrysostome saithe, *The like Charge, and Principalitie of the Churche was committed vnto* Paule. For thus he writeth, Paulo Totus Orbis creditus est: Paulus gubernat Orbis Ecclesiam: Paulus Vniuersum gubernat Orbem: *Vnto* Paule *the whole Worlde is committed:* Paule *gouerneth the Church of the Worlde:* Paule *ruleth the whole Worlde.* And yet Chrysostome meante not hereby, that Paule had the Vniuersal Gouernemente of the whole: but that his care and Charge was general, as not bounde or limited vnto one place, but indifferente, and common vnto al. So he saithe, Paulus tam anxiè omnium salutem curabat, ac si Totus Mundus vnica esset Domus: Paule *was so careful for the Saluation of al menne, as if the Whole Worlde had benne but one House.* Againe, Paulum tangebat solicitudo Omnium Ecclesiarum: non Vnius, aut Duarum, aut Trium, sed Omnium, quæ erant per Orbem Terrarum: Paule *was moued with the care of Al Churches: not of One, or Two, or Three, but of Al the Churches throughout the Worlde.* Likewise he saithe of S. Iohn, Columna erat Omnium, quæ in Orbe sunt, Ecclesiarum: *Hee was the Piller of Al the Churches in the Worlde.* Likewise againe of S. Matthewe, Matthæus Vniuersi Orbis curam gerebat: *The Whole Worlde was vnder* Matthewes *Charge.*

Chrys. in Serm. De Eleemos. Chrysost. in Act. Homil. 53. Chrysostom. De Laudibus Pauli Homil 2. Chrys. in Homil. De Profectu Euangelij. Chrys. ad Popul. Antioche Homil. 73. Chrysost. in Prologo in Iohan. Chrysost. in Matthæ. Homil. 48.

Therefore, if M. Hardinge wil gather out of these three wordes of S. Gregorie (Totius Ecclesiæ Cura) that Peter had Vniuersal Iurisdiction ouer al, it muste nedes folowe by the same wordes, that Paule, Iohn, and Matthewe had the same Iurisdiction ouer al. What other thing he hopeth to gaine by these wordes of S. Gregorie, I cannot tel: Onlesse happily he wil founde his reason thus: S. Gregorie saithe, Petrus Vniuersalis Apostolus non vocatur: Peter *is not called the Vniuersal Apostle:* Ergo, *The Pope is the Vniuersal Bishop.*

So handsomely these thinges are gathered togeather, to serue the Purpose.

Pope Leo (ye late) of Humilitie refused this Name openly in the Councel of Chalcedon. In deede Pope Gregorie so reporteth it. Notwithstandinge it appeareth not by any thinge donne in that Councel, that this Title was euer offered him. And to refuse a thinge before it be offered, it is no greate pointe of Humilitie.

To be short, the beste we can gather hereof, is this: Iohn the Bishop of Constantinople ambitiously craued this name: Pope Leo godly refused it beinge offered vnto him: The Popes afterward gladly receiued it without offeringe. If it were a good name, why was it refused? If it were an il name, why was it receiued?

Now let vs see, what they of M. Hardinges side haue meante by this worde, Vniuersal, and with what Humilitie the Popes haue receiued the same. Thus therefore they write: [a] Papa Totius Orbis obtinet Principatum: *The Pope hathe the Princehoode of Al the Worlde:* And when the Pope is Consecrate, the Chiefe Minister saithe vnto him, [b] Ego inuestio te de Papatu, vt præsis Vrbi, & Orbi: I *doo inuest thee with the Popedome, that thou maiste rule bothe the Citie, and the Worlde.*

[a] Extra. De Sacra Regular. Pernicioso. In Clem. [b] Ceremoniar. Lib. 1. cap. 4.

And whereas M. Hardinge demaundeth, how many Popes haue claimed this name, it maie please him, to remember, that in the late Councel of Constance, it

was not only claimed, but also published, as an Article of the Faythe. The wordes are theise, cDe necessitate Salutis est credere, Papam esse Oecumenicum: *It is of the necessitie of Saluation to beleue, that the Pope is the Vniuersal Bishop.*

cParalipsme. Vrspergen. De Disputatione Lipsiæ.

Of this Vniuersalitie of power Franciscus Zabarella writeth thus: dPapa iam occupauit Omnia iura inferiorum Ecclesiarum, ita, vt inferiores Prælati sint pro nihilo: *The Pope hath nowe gotten the righte of All Inferiour Churches, so that the Inferiour Prelates stande nowe for nothinge.*

dFrancis. Zabarella.

For theise causes Gregorie calleth the name of Vniuersal Bishop, a Prophane, a Presumptuous, a Wicked, and an Antichristian name: Comparing the Vsurper thereof with Lucifer, and Antichriste.

The Apologie, Cap. 5. Diuision. 1.

Further wee saie, that the Ministre ought lawfully, duely, and orderly to be preferred to that office of the Churche of God, and that no man hathe Power to wreaste him selfe into the Holy Ministerie at his owne pleasure. Wherefore theise personnes doo vs the greater wronge, whiche haue nothinge so common in their mouthes, as that wee doo nothing Orderly, and comely, but al thinges troublesomely, and without Order: And that wee allowe euery man to bee a Priest, to bee a Teacher, and to be an Interpreter of the Scriptures.

M. Hardinge.

Ye saie, that the Ministre ought lawfully to be called (for so hath your Latine) and duely and orderly to be preferred to that office of the Churche of God. VVhy doo ye not so? VVhy is not this obserued amonge you Gospellers? VVhat so euer ye meane by your Ministre, and by that office, (a) this are wee assured of, that in this your newe Churche, Bishoppes, Priestes, Deacons, Subdeacons, or any other Inferiour Orders, ye haue none.

(a) Vntruth. For it is knowen, we haue them.

For whereas after the doctrine of your newe Gospel, like the Forerenners of Antichriste, ye haue (b) abandoned the external Sacrifice, and Priesthoode of the Newe Testamente, and haue not in your Secte consecrated Bishops, and therefore beinge without Priestes made with lawful laieinge on of handes, as Scripture requireth, al Holy Orders beinge geuen by Bishoppes onely: how can ye saie, that any amonge you can lawfully Ministre, or that ye haue any lawful Ministers at al?

(b) Vntruth. For we haue abandoned neither the Priesthood, nor the Sacrifice, that Christ appointed.

This then beinge so, let me haue leaue to oppose one of these Defenders consciences. And that for the better vnderstanding I maie directe my woordes to a certaine person, let him be the Authour of this Apologie, or bicause his name to me is vnknowen, let him be M. Iewel. For with him gladly would I reason in this pointe, the rather for acquaintance, and for that he beareth the name of a Bishop in that Church, where my selfe had a roume. Howe saie you, Sir Ministre Bishop, ought the Ministre to be lawfully called? ought he dewly and orderly to be preferred to that office, or (as the Latine here hath) promoted, or put in Authority ouer the Church? in the Apologie this Defender saith, yea.

How many Bishoppes can you recken, whome in the Churche of Salisburie you haue succeeded as wel in Doctrine, as in outwarde sittinge in that Chaire? Howe many can you tel vs of, that beinge your Predecessours in order before you, were of your Opinion, and taught the faithful people of that Dioces the Doctrine, that you teache? Did Bishop Capon teache your Doctrine? did Shaxton? did Campegius? did Bishop Audley? Briefly, did euer any Bishop of that See before you teache your Doctrine? (c) It is moste certaine they did not.

(c) Vntruth. For B. Shaxton, and Bishop Capon taught the same.

If you cannot shewe your Bishoply Petigree, if you can proue no Succession, then whereby holde you? VVil you shewe vs the Letters Patentes of the Prince? VVel maie they stande you in some steede before men: before God, who shal cal you to accounpt for presuminge to take the Highest office in his Churche (d) not duely called thereto, they shal serue you to no purpose.

(d) Vntruth. For he was chosen by Canonical Election of the Chapter, as al other Bishops haue benne before.

You knowe what Tertullian saithe of suche as ye be: *Edant Origines Ecclesiarũ suarum, &c.* VVee saie likewise to you M. Iewel, and that we saie to you, wee saie to eche one of your Companions: Tel vs the Original and firste springe of your Churche. Shewe vs the Register of your Bishops continually succeedinge one an other from the beginninge, so as that firste Bishop haue some one of the Apostles, or of the Apostolike men for his Authour, and Predecessoure. For by this waie the Apostolike Churches shewe what reputation they bee of. As the Churche of Smyrna telleth vs of Polycarpe by Iohn the Apostle placed there. The Churche of the Romaines telleth vs of Clemente ordeined by Peter. S. Austustine hauinge reckened vp in order the Bishoppes of Rome to *Anastasius* Successour to *Siricius*, who was the Eighte and thirteth after Peter, saithe that in al that Number and rolle of Bishoppes there is not founde One, that was a Donatiste: and thereof hee concludeth, *Ergo*, the Donatistes be not Catholikes. So after that wee haue reckened al the Bishoppes of Salisburie from Bishoppe Capon vpwarde, wee shal come at lengthe in respecte of Doctrine and Orders to S. Augustine the Apostle of the Englishe, who was made Bishoppe by Gregorie.

In præscriptionibus aduersus Hæreticos. These be Tertullias woordes.

Epist. 165.

Gregorie, and from Gregorie vpwarde to S. Peter. And in al that rewe of Biſhoppes (e)wee ſhal finde neuer a one that beleeued, as M. Iewel beleeueth. *Ergo*, your Zwinglian and Caluinian Beleefe, M. Iewel, and of the reſte of your felowes is not Catholike.

(e) Vntruthe, By your owne Confeſion.

Therefore, to go from your Succeſſion, which ye cannot proue, and to come to your Vocation, how ſaie you Syr? You beare your ſelfe as though you were Biſhop of Salisburie. But howe can you proue your Vocation? By what Authoritie Vſurpe you the Adminiſtration of Doctrine and Sacramentes? VVhat can you alleage for the right and Proufe of your Miniſterie? who hath called you? VVho hath laide handes on you? By what example hath he done it? Howe, and by whom are you conſecrated? VVho hath ſente you? VVho hath committed to you the office you take vpon you? Be you a Prieſte, or be you not? If you be not, howe dare you Vſurpe the name and Office of a Biſhop? If you be, tel vs (f) who gaue you Orders? The Inſtitution of a Prieſte, was neuer yet but in the power of a Biſhop. Biſhoppes haue alwaies after the Apoſtles time, accordinge to the Eccleſiaſtical Canons, bene conſecrated by (g) three other Biſhopes, with the conſent of the Metropolitane, and confirmation g) of the Biſhop of Rome.

(f) Euen he that gaue M. Harding Orders in the time of K. Edwarde.

(g) Vntruthes two togeather in one Sentence. See the Anſweare.

Athana. in Apolog. 2. Macarius a Prieſte of Athanaſius, (as it was laide to his Charge by his accuſers) pulled Iſchyras from the Aultar, as he was at (h) Maſſe, ouerthrewe the Holy Table, brake the Chalice. The matter brought to iudgemente, Athanaſius and thoſe Biſhoppes bothe denied the facte, and alſo thoughe it were graunted, yet defended the ſame as wel done, becauſe Iſchyras was not a lawful Miniſter of the Churche. And why ſo? bicauſe he was not lawfully made Prieſte, nor with Churchely laieinge on of handes conſecrated. By whiche example beſides other pointes we are taught, what to iudge of your pretenſed Communion.

(h) A vaine Vntruthe. For if it had benne any thinge, it had benne a Communion, and not a Maſſe. But Athanaſius ſaithe plainely: *Neq; Eccleſia ibi erat, neq; Sacra fiebant, neq; tempus myſteriorum agebatur.*

Contra Heref. Lib. 2. In Dialogo contra Luciferanos. Againe, what ſaie you to Epiphanius, who writeth againſte one Zacchæus of his time, for that beinge but a Laie man, with wicked Preſumption tooke vpon him to * handle the Holy Myſteries, and falſhely to do the office of a Prieſte? Hereof S. Hierome ſaithe notably: *Hilarius cum Diaconus de Eccleſia receſſerit, &c.* Hilary for aſmuche as he wente from the Churche being a Deacon, and is onely (as he thinketh) the multitude of the woulde, can neither conſecrate the Sacrament of the Aulter beinge without Biſhops and Prieſtes, nor deliuer Baptiſme without the Euchariſte. And whereas nowe the man is deade, with the man alſo the ſecte is ended, becauſe beeinge a Deacon he coulde not conſecrate any Clerke that ſhoulde remaine after him. And Churche is there none, whiche hath not a Prieſte. But lettinge goe theſe fewe of litle regarde, that to them ſelues bee bothe Laie, and Biſhoppes, liſten what is to be thought of the Churche. Thus S. Hierome there. In whome leauinge other thinges I note, that if there be no Churche, where is no Prieſte, VVhere is your Churche like to become, after that our Apoſtates, that nowe be fledde from vs to you, ſhalbe departed this Life? Therefore this beinge true, it remaineth, M. Iewel, you tel vs, whether your Vocation be Ordinarie or Extraordinarie. If it be Ordinarie, ſhewe vs the letters of your Orders. At leaſte ſhewe vs, that you haue receiued Power to doo the Office, you preſume to exerciſe, by due order of laieinge on of handes and Conſecration. *But Order, and Conſecration you haue not. For who could geue that to you of al theſe Newe Miniſters, how ſo euer els you cal them, whiche he hath not him ſelfe? If it be Extraordinarie (as al that ye haue done hitherto, is beſides al good Order) ſhewe vs ſome Signe of Miracle. If you faile in al theſe, why ought not you to be put awaie.

Sacerdoté.

M. Hardinges Brethren Apoſtates.

*A manifeſt Vntruthe: For we haue both Order, and Conſecration.

Finally, what can you anſweare to that, whiche maie be obiected to you out of S. Cyprians Epiſtle to Magnus, touchinge Nouatian? It was at thoſe daies a queſtion, whether Nouatian Baptized and offered, ſpecially where as he vſed the Forme, Maner, and Ceremonies of the Churche. Cyprian denieth it. For he can not (ſaithe he) be compted a Biſhop, who ſeeinge at naught the Tradition of the Goſpel, and of the Apoſtles, *Neminī ſuccedens à ſeipſo ordinatus eſt*, Succeedinge no man is ordeined Biſhop of him ſelfe. For by no meanes maie one haue or holde a Churche, that is not ordeined in the Churche.

Lib. 1. Epi. 6.

Euſebius Eccle. Hiſt. lib. 6. ca. 43 in Greco.

This beinge ſo, we doo you no wronge, as ye complaine, in tellinge you and declaringe to the VVorlde, that touchinge the exerciſe of your Miniſterie, ye doo nothinge orderly, or comely, but al thinges troubleſomely and without Order. Onleſſe yee meane ſuche Order, and comelineſſe, as Theeues obſerue amonge them ſelues in the diſtribution of their Robberies.

M. Hardinges modeſtie.

Laſtly, if ye allowe not euery Man, yea and euery VVoman to bee a Prieſte, why driue ye not ſome of your felowes to recante, * that ſo haue Preached? VVhy allowe ye the Bookes of your New Euangeliſtes, that ſo haue written?

*An odious Vntruthe: For touchinge the Miniſterie of the Churche, wee haue neither Preaced ſo, nor witten ſo.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Here hath M. Hardinge taken ſome paines more then ordinarie. He thought, if he coulde by any coloure make the worlde beleeue, we haue neither Biſhoppes, nor Prieſtes, nor Deacons this daie in the Churche of Englande, he mighte the more eaſily claime the whole right vnto him ſelfe. And in deede, if it were certaine, that the Religion, and Truthe of God paſſeth euermore orderly by Succeſsion, and none otherwiſe, then were Succeſsion, wherof he hath to doe vs ſo longe a taſe, a very good ſubſtantial Argumente of the Truthe. But Chriſte ſaith, In Cathedra Moſi ſedent Scribæ, & Phariſæi: (By order of Succeſsion) *the Scribes, and Phariſeis ſitte in Moſes Chaire.* Annas, and Chaiphas, touchinge Succeſsion, were as wel Biſhoppes,

Matthæ. 23.

as Aaron, and Eleazar. Of Succeſsion S. Paule ſaithe to the Faithful at Epheſus: Scio, quòd poſt diſceſſum meum intrabunt Lupi rapaces. Ex Vobis ipſis exurgent viri peruerſa loquentes: *I knowe, that after my departure heuce, Rauenинge Woulues ſhal enter, and* Succeede *me. And out of your ſelues there ſhal (by* Succeſsion*) ſpringe vp menne ſpeakinge peruerſely.* Therefore S. Hierome ſaithe, Non Sanctorum filij ſunt, qui tenent loca Sanctorum: *Thei be not alwaies the Children of Holy Menne, that (by* Succeſsion*) haue the places of Holy Menne.*

Actor. 20.

Diſt. 40. Non eſt Facile.

M. Hard. Pag. 197. a.

M. Hard. Pag. 139. b.

Addition. ☞ Naie, (ſaithe M. Hardinge) you binge theſe woordes, as in the reproche of Succeſsion: whereas Chriſte of the ſame made an argument for Succeſsion. Coulde you not perceiue, that Chriſte made a plaine argumeate, why, and why onely the Scribes, and Phariſeis ſhould be obeied? Thus Chriſte ſaith, Obeie them only for Succeſsions ſake, bicauſe by order of Succeſsion they ſitte in Moſes Chaire. This place ſo maketh for Succeſsion, that it can neuer be auoided. Addition ☞

The Anſweare. And thinke you in deede, M. Hardinge, that the Scribes, and Phariſeis came from Moſes by Succeſsion, as the Pope woulde ſeme to come from Peter? were they the Dukes, and Princes of the Countrie, as Moſes was? Or, were they the high Prieſtes, or Biſhoppes, as was Aaron? Or, had they continued their eſtate, & doctrine euen from the time of Moſes vntil Chriſte weineare by the ſpace of two thouſande yeres? Certainely S. Hierome ſaithe, *The Scribes and Phariſeis grewe out of two houſes in* Iewrie, *the one called* Sammai, *the other* Hillel *not longe before* Chriſte *was borne*. Non multò prius quam dominus naſceretur. And Ioſephus ſaithe, The Phariſeis were firſte brought to the gouernment of the ſtate by the policie of Alexandra, after the death of Alexander her huſbande, whiche was not aboue three ſcore yeres before Chriſte. Now, M. Hardinge, if the Scribes, and Phariſeis had neither the office of Moſes, nor his Doctrine, nor his Lawes, nor his Swerde, but onely had ſhifted in them ſelues ſo many yeres after him, howe then can you ſaie, That Chriſte commaunded them to be obeied onely for Succeſsions ſake, for that by order of Succeſsion they had placed them ſelues in Moſes Chaire? In deede they had ſet them ſelues in the rome of Moſes, and were his Succeſſours, as touchinge place. But other Succeſsion of continuance, or Vniuerſally of euery parte of Doctrine I knowe none. Vniuerſally, I ſaie, and of euery parte. For otherwiſe in many partes they taught Moſes Lawe, and taught it truely. How be it, as the Scribes, and Phariſeis ſucceded Moſes, peruertinge, and breakinge the Lawes of Moſes: euen ſo do the Biſhoppes of Rome this date ſucceede Chriſte, peruertinge, & breakinge the Lawes of Chriſte.

In Eſaiæ Ca. 8.

Ioſeph. Antiquitat. Li. 13. Ca. 21.

But, I praie you, did Chriſte commaunde the people to obeie the Phariſeis, what ſo euer they ſaide, true, or falſe, onely bicauſe of their Succeſsion? wherefore then ſaide he to his Diſciples, *Beware of the Leauen of the Scribes, and Phariſeis? Blinde they are, and leade the blinde, and both fal into the pitte. They breake the Lawes of God to vpholde their owne Traditions. They are Theeues and Murtherers: They ſeeke onely to deſtroie and Kille. They ſhutte vp the Kingedome of God before menne?* Yet wil you telle vs, that Chriſte commaunded the people to folowe the Phariſeis abſolutely, and without exception, breakinge, and defacinge Goddes Holy Lawes: Shuttinge vp the kingdome of God: deſtroieinge, and killinge the ſoules of Goddes people: and leadinge them headlonge into the pitte? Naie, M. Hardinge, Chriſte rather ſaithe, *My ſheepe heare my voice, and folowe me: and wil not heare the voice of Strangers:* By Strangers he meante the Scribes and Phariſeis, and other like. For ful anſweare hereto, S. Auguſtine ſaithe thus: Sedendo in Cathedra Moſis Legem Dei docent &c. *Sitting in the Chaire of* Moſes, *they teache the Lawe of God. Therfore it is God that teacheth in them. But if they wil teache any thinge of their owne, then* (ſaithe S. Auguſtine) *heare it not: then do it not.*

Matth. 16.
Matth. 15.
Ibidem.
Iohan. 10.
Matth. 23.
Iohan. 10.
Augu. in Iohan. Tractat. 46.

Thus, M. Hardinge you ſe, neither had the Phariſeis deiue Succeſsion, and Continuance from Moſes, no more then the Pope hath from S. Peter: nor did they Vniuerſally, and in al pointes teache the true meaninge of Moſes Lawe: nor did Chriſte wil the people Vniuerſally, and Abſolutely to obeie them. So mutche this place maketh for your Succeſsion. ☞

Not withſtandinge the Pope him ſelfe wil ſaie, as it is before alleged, In Papa ſi deſint bona acquiſita per meritum, ſufficiunt, quæ à Loci Prædeceſſore Præſtantur: *If the Pope wante good thinges gotten by his owne Merites: the good thinges, whiche he hath*

Diſt. 40. Non nos.

hath (by Succeſsion) *of* Peter *his Predeceſſour, are ſufficient.* And the Cloſe thereupon: Petrus fecit Papas Hæredes bonitatis ſuæ: Peter *made the Popes Heires of his goodneſſe* (by Succeſsion.) And againe, Papa Sanctitatem recipit a Cathedra: *The Pope receiueth his Holineſſe* (by Succeſsion) *of his Chaire.* Diſt. 19. Sit Omnes: in Gloſſ.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ The effect of M. Hardings anſweare hereto is this: The Pope maie be holy, although not by vertue, that ſhould be within him, yet by his office, that is without him. M. Hard. Pag. 204.

The Anſweare. And yet it is Vniuerſally confeſſed emonge the Learned, that Holineſſe is a Vertue, and, that Vertue is an ornamente of the minde, and is within vs. Sanctitas eſt virtus: virtus eſt habitus animi. But the Pope hath a priuilege aboue others, and maie be holy without Holineſſe. So the Scribes, and Phariſeis, and Annas, and Caiphas, were they neuer ſo wicked, might be holy by their Office. And ſo by this concluſion, it maie ſtande wel with reaſon, that Wickednelle, and Holineſſe maie dwel togeather. But S. Hierome ſaithe, Si quis hominem, qui Sanctus non eſt, Sanctum eſſe crediderit, & Dei eum iunxerit ſocietati, Chriſtum violat, cuius membra ſumus: *If any man beleeue, that man to be Holy, that is not Holy, and wil ioine him to Goddes companie, he dothe villanie to* Chriſte, *whoſe members wee are.* Cauſa. 11. q. 3. Si quis hominem.

☞ Suche the affiance ſometime had the Scribes, and Phariſeis in their Succeſsion. Therefore they ſaide, *Wee are the Children of* Abraham: *Vnto vs hath God made his promiſe: Arte thou greater then our Father* Abraham? *As for* Chriſte, *wee knowe not, from whence he came*, or, what he can ſhewe for his Succeſsion. And, when Chriſte begaine to reproue their Abuſes, & Errours, they ſaide vnto him, *By what Power doeſt thou theſe thinges? And who gaue thee this Authoritie?* where is thy Succeſsion? Vpon whiche wordes Beda ſaithe, Intelligi volunt, Diaboli eſſe, quod facit: *They woulde haue the People vnderſtande* (for that he had no ſolemne Succeſsion) *that al that he did, was of the Diuel.* And Cyrillus frameth their wordes in this ſorte: Tu Ortus ex Iuda, commiſſos nobis faſces vſurpas: *Thou beinge of the Tribe of* Iuda, (and therefore hauinge no rigbte by Succeſsion vnto the Prieſthoode) *takeſt vpon thee the office, that is committed vnto vs.* Likewiſe Chryſoſtome imagineth, for Phariſeis thus to ſaie: Tu de Sacerdotali Familia natus non es: Senatus tibi hoc non conceſsit: Cæſar non donauit: *Thou arte not of the houſe of Prieſtes: The Councel hath not graunted it thee: The Emperour hath not geeuen it thee.* Thus to maineteine them ſelues in credite, for that they had Succeſsion, and continuance from Aaron, and ſate in Moſes Chaire, they kepte Chriſte quite out of poſſeſſion: and laide vnto him then, euen as M. Hardinge ſaithe nowe vnto vs: Who euer taught vs theſe thinges before thee? What Ordinarie Succeſsion, and Vocation haſte thou? What Biſhop admitted thee? Who confirmed thee? Who allowed thee? Luke. 8. Iohan. 9. Luce. 20. Marc. 11. Beda in Luc. Lib. 5. Ca. 80. Cyril. in Cathena in Luc. 20. Chryſo. in Matthæ. Homi. 39.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ But M. Hardinge ſaithe, Chriſte had a moſte perfite Succeſsion from Adam, til Ioſeph the huſbande of the Virgine Marie.

The Anſweare. I graunte, as touchinge his Birthe, Chriſte had his Succeſsion from Adam downewarde. So hath euery man liuinge, what ſo euer he be. Euen you your ſelfe, M. Hardinge, are lineally deſcended from Adam by vndoubted Succeſsion, although vnknowen: onleſſe we ſhal thinke, ye were borne without Father, or Mother, and are none of Adams children. But we ſpeake not now of Succeſsion of Birthe, but of Succeſsion of Office. And you know the Office of Prieſthood, whereof the Phariſeis ſpake, was neuer in the houſe of Dauid, that is reckened in Luke, and Mathew, but onely in the houſe of Leui. Otherwiſe tel me, in that whole raſe of Dauids deſcente, who was euer accounpted a Prieſte, or offered the Sacrifice, or had Ordinarie power to teache the Goſpel before Chriſte? You do ouer plainely abuſe your Reader, thus confoundinge, and blindinge your thinges togeather. Touchinge the Ordinarie Office of Prieſthode, and inſtruatinge the people, wherof we ſpeake, Chriſte ſaithe plainely, *As many as came before me, they were Theeues, and Murtherers.* As if he woulde ſaie vnto them, *I haue no Ordinarie deſcente from the Biſhoppes, and Prieſtes of the houſe of* Leui. *I am hable to ſhewe you no ſuche Succeſſion. My heauenly Father hath ſente me to you.* Conſider better, what you write, M. Hardinge, leſt that the leſſe deceiue the ſimple.

Further

M. Hard. Pag. 210. 4.

Further you ſaie, S. Peters Chaire to the Newe Lawe, is that, whiche Moſes Chaire was to the Olde Lawe. Who tolde you this tale, M. Hardinge? In what Scripture maie we finde it? your owne worde carrieth no ſuche credite: proue it better, that we maie beleue you. Hereto ye adde further, VVhat ſo euer Kinge, or Queene, or Prieſte ſetteth vp a Succeſſion againſte Peters Chaire, (you meane, that is not obediente to the Pope) before Chriſtes ſeconde commynge, is a Schiſmatique, and without repentance ſhalbe damned in Hel fire with Idolaters for euer. And is this your Definitiue Sentence, M. Hardinge? or maie not a poore man appeale from it? In deede ſo ſaide Pope Bonifacius in his Vanitie, *I haue Decreed, and Determined* (ſaithe he) *that euery Creature be ſubiecte to the Biſhop of* Rome, *vpon the neceſſitie of his Saluation*. Thus al other Chriſtians, what ſo euer, dwellinge in Græcia, Armenia, Aphrica, Aſia, Aethiopia, India, &c. muſte nedes be damned. For certainely they neuer knewe any ſuche ſubiection to the Pope. But God be thanked, S. Peter him ſelfe, of whoſe Chaire we ſpeake, ſaithe thus, *Before God there is no differēce, nor choiſe of perſonnes. But in euery Nation, who ſo euer feareth God, and woorketh righteouſneſſe, is acceptable vnto him*. But of any ſuche neceſſitie of Obedience to the See of Rome, he telleth vs nothinge.

De Maiorit. & Obedient. Vnam Sanctam.

Therefore, good Chriſtian Reader, lette not theſe M. Hardinges great wordes muche abaſhe thee. The Scribes, and Phariſeis in the like caſes vſed the like language longe agoe.

Cornel. Epiſco. Bitontin. in Concil. Trident.

Touchinge the Churche of Rome, I wil ſaie nomore for this preſente, but onely, that was ſpoken openly by Cornelius the Biſhop of Bitonto in the late Councel of Tridente: Vtinam non à Religione ad Superſtitionem, à Fide ad Infidelitatem, à Chriſto ad Antichriſtum, velut prorſus Vnanimes declinaſſent: *Woulde God they were not gonne as it were vtterly by conſente togeather, from Religion to Superſtition: from Faithe to Infidelitie: from* Chriſte *to* Antichriſte. Theſe fewe wordes, conſideringe either the ſpeaker, or the place, where they were ſpoken, maie ſeeme ſufficient. They are gonne from Faithe to Infidelitie: from Chriſte to Antichriſte. And yet, al other thinges failinge, they muſte holde onely by Succeſſion: and, onely becauſe they ſitte in Moſes Chaire, they muſte claime the poſſeſſion of the whole. This is the right, and vertue of their Succeſſion.

The wordes of Tertullian, M. Hardinge, whiche you haue here alleged were ſpoken of certaine your Ancient Fathers, that had raiſed vp a Newe Religion of them ſelues, as you haue alſo donne, without either Worde of God, or example of the Apoſtles, and Holy Fathers. And therefore he ſaithe, not vnto vs, but vnto you, and ſuche, as you be, Edant Origines Eccleſiarum ſuarum: *Lette them ſhewe forthe the Originalles of theire Churches*. Euen ſo we ſaie vnto you, ſhewe vs the Originalles of your Doctrine: Shewe vs any one of the Apoſtles of Chriſte, or of the Learned Catholique Doctours of the Churche, that euer ſaide your Priuate Maſſe: Shewe one at the leaſte, either Greeke, or Latine. S. Auguſtine ſaithe, of ſo many Biſhops of Rome, there could not one be founde, that had benne a Donatiſte. Euen ſo in like ſorte ſaie we to you, of al the ſame Biſhoppes of Rome, there cannot one be founde, that euer agreed with M. Hardinge in ſaieinge Maſſe. Or if there were any ſuche, ſhewe vs his name, with other Circumſtances, when, and where, and who were witneſſes of the doinge. Shewe vs your Originalles, M. Hardinge: Confeſſe the Truthe: Deceiue vs no lenger: It is a newe Diuiſe: ye haue it onely of your ſelues: and not by Succeſſion from the Apoſtles.

Auguſt. Epiſt. 163.

M. Har. pag. 217

Addition. Hereto, M. Hardinge anſweareth, You ſaie not euen right ſo, as Tertullian ſaide, For he called not for the Originalles of doctrine, but of Churches. For by the Churches the doctrine is knowen, to be good, or euil, to be allowable, or reprouceable.

Addition

The Anſweare. I graunt, M. Harding, greate, and worthy is the Authoritie of the Churche of God. Yet is not the Truthe of Goddes Goſpel alwaies knowen by the name of the Churche: But contrariwiſe the true Churche is alwaies knowen by the Goſpel. S. Auguſtine ſaithe vnto Creſconius, Eccleſiam ſine vlla ambiguitate ſancta Scriptura demonſtrat: *The Holy Scripture ſheweth forthe the Churche without doubtefulneſſe*. And the Authour of the Booke, called Opus Imperfectum, ſpeakinge

Auguſtin. contra Creſconi. Lib. 1. Ca. 33.

ponrpoſely

Succeſsiō. Confirmation.

pourpoſely hereof, ſaithe thus, Ideò mandat, vt Chriſtiani volentes &c. *Therefore* Chriſte *commaundeth, that Chriſtian menne willinge to be aſſured of the true Faithe, reſorte to nothinge els, but onely to the Scriptures. For if they haue regarde to any thinge els, they ſhalbe offended, and periſhe, not knowinge, whiche is the true Churche.*

Chryſ. in Opere imperfect. Homil. 94.

Further you ſaie, It is cleare, that S. Chryſoſtome ſaide Maſſe, and yet had no man to receiue with him.

M. Hard. Pag. 218. a.

The Anſweare. **This is al vntrue, M. Hardinge. For your credites ſake proue it better. It is euident by Chryſoſtome, that, when he Miniſtred the Holy Communion, greate multitudes, as wel of the Laie people, as alſo of the Clergie receiued with him. For proufe whereof, it mate pleaſe thē, good Reader, to conſider ſomme parte of my Replie to M. Hardinge.**

Article. 1. Diuiſion. 34.

Againe you ſaie, VVee ſaie Priuate Maſſe, bicauſe the Popes and other Biſhops, who ſitte in Peters, and in other the Apoſtles Chaires, doo telle vs, that it is lawful to ſaie Priuate Maſſe.

The Anſweare. **If this Rule be infallible, then happy are you. Folowinge the Pope, whither ſo euer he leade you, you can neuer goe amiſſe. This is that Miſterie, that we haue diſcloſed to the worlde in your late Confutation. Thus you ſaie,** It ſhalbe ſufficient for vs to doo, as Peters Succeſſours bid vs to doo: Chriſte nowe requireth not of vs to obeie Peter, or Paule, but him, that ſitteth in their Chaire, that is the Pope.

M. Har. Confut. Pag. 192. a. b.

But wherfore telleth vs M. Hardinge this longe tale of Succeſsion? Haue theſe menne theire owne Succeſsion in ſo fare Recorde? Who was then the Biſhop of Rome nexte by Succeſsion vnto Peter? Who was the Seconde? Who the Thirde? Who the Fourthe? Irenæus **reckeneth them togeather in this order:** Petrus, Linus, Anacletus, Clemens: Epiphanius **thus,** Petrus, Linus, Cletus, Clemens: Optatus **thus,** Petrus, Linus, Clemens, Anacletus. Clemens **ſaithe, that he him ſelfe was nexte vnto** Peter: **And then muſte the reckeninge goe thus:** Petrus, Clemens, Linus, Anacletus. **Hereby it is cleare, that of the foure firſte Biſhoppes of** Rome, **M. Hardinge cannot certainely telle vs, who in order Succeded other. And thus talkinge ſo mutche of Succeſsion, they are not wel hable to blaſe their owne** Succeſsion.

Irenæ. li. 3. ca. 3. Euſeb. li. 5. ca. 5. Epiphan. Lib. 1. De Corporat. Optat. contra Donatiſt. lib. 2.

I might farther ſaie, that Peters **Sea Apoſtolike was ouer the Iewes, and not at** Rome **ouer the** Heathens. **For ſo** S. Paule **ſaithe,** Mihi concreditum eſt Euangelium Præputij, ſicut Petro Circumciſionis: Qui potens erat Petro in Apoſtolatu Circumciſionis. Potens erat in me inter Gentes: *The Goſpel of the Vncircumciſion emonge the Heathens, was committed vnto me, as the Goſpel of the Circumciſion, emonge the Iewes, vnto* Peter: *God that was mighty in* Peter *in the Apoſtleſhip of the Circumciſion, was mighty in me emonge the Heathens.* **Therefore if the Pope this daie wil claime onely by Peters Title, and require nomore then Peter had, then muſte he ſeke his Primacie emongſt the Iewes, where Peter had his Juriſdiction limited, and not at** Rome **emonge the** Heathen **Chriſtians, emonge whome, as** S. Paule **ſaithe, he had not mutche to doo.**

Gala. 2.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ **Here ſaithe M. Hardinge,** The lewdneſſe of this licenceous Miniſter paſſeth al reaſon. His maliceous and fonde conceite: you are ſo impudente: Shame it is to you M. Iewel: The ſhame of ignorance, I meane, or whiche is more likely, the ſhame of impudencie.

M. Hard. Pag. 221. a. 222. a.

The Anſweare. **You are liberal, M. Hardinge. It is your good wil, I ſhoulde wante no ſhame. Of lewde, and licenceous Miniſters, I haue no ſkil. Sutche licenceous ſpeache mighte wel be ſpared. But why are you ſo impatiently moued without cauſe? You ſaie,** I exclude, not onely the Pope, but alſo S. Peter, from the Gouernmente of his owne Chaire in Rome. **You mate not beare falſe witneſſe, M. Hardinge, be you neuer ſo angrie.** The mouth that ſeeketh ſutche aduantages, killeth the ſoule. **You know ful wel, we exclude not the Pope from the gouernemente of his owne Chaire in** Rome. **Otherwiſe why ſhould we ſo oftentimes calle him the Biſhop of** Rome? **God geue him grace, that he mate ſo gouerne his Chaire, as the Seruante of** Chriſte, **and the Stewarde of Goddes Myſteries: Leaſte his Chaire be laide to his confuſion.** S. Hierome **ſaithe,** *It is no eaſie mater to ſtande in the place of* Peter, *and* Paule, *and to holde the Chaire of them nowe rainge with* Chriſte. **And** Chryſoſtome **ſaithe, as he is alleged by** Gratian, Non Cathedra facit Sacerdotem, ſed Sacerdos Cathedram: *It is not the Chaire, that maketh the Prieſte: But it is the Prieſte, that maketh the Chaire.*

1. Corinth. 4. Hieron. ad Heliodorum. 40 Diſt. Multi. In opero Imperfecto Homil. 43.

But I haue saide, S. Peters *See Apostolique was ouer the Iewes*. This is it, that hath offended you. Yet, I saide not, his See was onely ouer the Iewes, vtterly excludinge al manner Heathens. Beholde my wordes better. Thus I saie, speakinge of the Agreement taken betweene Peter and Paule, *At* Rome *emonge the Heathen Christians* S. Peter *had not muche to doo*. This (you saie) is lewdnesse, and impudencie, and ignorance, and a malicious, and fonde conceite, and I knowe not what. I beseeche you, M. Hardinge, and oethe not S. Paule same the same? Did not Peter, and Paule diuide the Charge betweene them selues, that Peter, Iames, and Iohn should haue the Iewes for theire portion: and Paule, and Barnabas for theire portion, shoulde haue the Heathens? Be not theise S. Paules owne expresse, and plaine wordes: *When* Iames, Peter, *and* Iohn, *that are taken as the pillers, or chiefe emonge them, had knowen the grace, that was geuen to me, they ioined with mee, and* Barnabas *the right handes of fellowship, that wee shoulde preache emonge the Heathens, and they in the Circumcision emonge the Iewes?* Weigh wel theise wordes, M. Hardinge. What signifie they? what meane they? was not this the conclusion of theire Agreement, that Iames, Peter, and Iohn shoulde vse theire Apostolique Authoritie ouer the Iewes: and Paule, and Barnabas theire like Authoritie ouer the Heathens? If you can diuise vs any other exposition hereof, I praie you, shewe it. Origen writinge vpon the Gospel of S. Mathewe expounded it thus, Peter *and* Paule *gaue right handes of fellowship, the one to the other, that* Peter *should goe vnto the Circumcision, to preache vnto the Iewes, liuinge vnder the Lawe, as vnto an Asse vnder the Yoke: But* Paule *shoulde goe vnto the Heathens, as vnto a Colte, that had neuer benne broken.*

Gals. 2.

Origen. in Matthæ. Tract. 14.

S Augustine expounded it thus, *They agreed, that* Paule, *and* Barnabas *shoulde goe to the Heathens: and them selues,* Iames, Peter, *and* Iohn *vnto the Circumcision, whiche seemed contrarie to the Heathens*. S. Hierome thus, Vnus atque idem &c. *One God hathe committed vnto me, the preachinge of the Gospel emonge the Heathens: and to* Peter *emonge the Iewes. He sente me vnto the Gentiles, and placed* Peter *in* Iewrie. *By Goddes prouidence, one Apostle is geeuen to the Iewes: and an other vnto the Heathens*. Chrysostome thus, *One thinge pleased them bothe, that* Peter, *and his side shoulde preache to the Iewes: and* Paule, *and* Barnabas *to the Heathens*. Afterwarde he imagineth S. Paule thus to saie, In prædicandi munere partiti sumus inter nos Orbem terrarum: *In the Office of preachinge, wee haue diuided the Worlde betweene our selues*. And a litle before he saithe thus, Paulus nihil opus habebat Petro, nec illius egebat voce: sed honore par erat illi. Nihil enim hic dicam amplius: Paule *had no lacke of* Peter, *nor stoode in neede of his voice: but in honoure was his Peere. I wil saie nomore*. S. Ambrose saithe thus, Paule *saithe, That the Grace, he had receiued of God, was allowed of them, that he might be thought woorthy to haue the Primacie in Preachinge emonge the Heathens, as* Peter *had in preachinge emonge the Iewes*. Anselmus a Latter writer saithe thus: *Theise twoo Principal Apostles were chosen to the Saluation of twoo Peoples:* Peter *to the Saluation of the Iewes: and* Paule *to the Saluation of the Heathens*.

Augustin. in Epist. ad Galat. Lib 1.

Hieron. in Epist. ad Galat. Ca. 2.

Chrysost. in Epist. ad Galat. Cap. 2.

Ambros. ad Galat. Cap. 2.

Anselm in Epist. ad Galat. Ca. 2.

What shal we neede moe Authorities in a mater so euidente? This is the Exposition of al the Learned Fathers, bothe Greekes, and Latines. Yet wil you stil telle vs, The lewdnesse of this licenceous Ministre passeth al reason? Wil you stil crie out, Shame, Impudencie, and Ignorance, &c.

M. Harding. 222.

But you saie, I haue leafte out this woorde, *Enim*, whiche in Englishe dooth signifie, for. This woorde, for, (you saie) geueth greate light to S. Paules meaninge. A fowle faulte no doubte, M. Hardinge, and wel worthy to be proclaimed by printed Bokes vnto the worlde. Perhappes we woulde rather, I had begonne the firste Sentence with. Enim, as dothe your Hippolytus. But if there be any suche special Vertue in Enim, let him comme in againe Hardy, M. Hardinge, and take his place. Theophylactus vpon this, Enim, hathe written thus, Quin etiam parem hoc loco se Petro demonstrat: *Yea further* Paule *in this place sheweth him selfe to be equal to* Peter.

Theoph. in Epist. ad Galat. Cap. 2.

Likewise vpon the same, Enim, saithe Chrysostome, *Nowe* Paule *sheweth him selfe to be equal in Honoure vnto the reste: not onely vnto others, but also vnto* (Peter) *the Chiefe of al*. Likewise it is written in the shorte Scholies, that beare the name of S. Hierome,

Chrysost. ad Galat. Cap. 2.

Confirmation. Consecration.

S. Hierome, Ego in nullo sum illo inferior: *I (saithe S. Paule) am in nothinge inferioure vnto* Peter. Uerily if he thought not him selfe inferiour to Peter, then he thought not Peter to be his Heade.

Nowe haue yon your, Enim, M. Hardinge, and, as we maie Learne by theise Ancient Fathers, the very Light of S. Paules meaninge: that is, that Paule shoulde deale emonge the Heathens, and Peter emonge the Iewes. And therefore Erasmus expounde th it thus, Fœdus, ac societatem inierunt, vt idem Euangelium concordibus animis in sua quisque portione prædicaremus: Illi inter Iudæos, nos inter Gentes: *They ioyned in League, and felowship with vs, that with consentinge mindes wee shoulde preache one Gospel, eche man within his owne portion: they emonge the* Iewes, *and wee emonge the* Heathens. Thus were they charged by their owne agrément, eche of them within his owne Particulare portion. By theire owne agrémente, I saie. For otherwise Christe saithe, not onely to Peter, but also equally vnto them al, *Goe you into the Whole Worlde, and preache the Gospel.* But by this Commission, Thomas, and Thaddee might haue preached in Rome, as wel as Peter. By theire owne agrément they knewe theire portions. It is no euen dealinge, M. Hardinge, to diuide portions bitwéene two, or moe, and afterwarde to geue ouer the whole to one alone.

Hieron. in. ad Galat. Cap. 2.

Erasm. Paraphra.

Mark. 16.

Here wil you saie, Had Peter then nothinge to doo emonge the Heathens? Or, had Paule nothinge to doo emonge the Iewes? Yes verily, M. Hardinge. For we know, that Peter preached vnto the Heathen Centurion: And Paule oftentimes entred into the Synagoges of the Iewes, as by the Actes of the Apostles it maie appeare: And of him selfe he saithe thus, Factus sum Iudæis quasi Iudæus: *Unto the* Iewes *I was as a* Iewe. And againe, *I wisshe me selfe to be accursed, and diuided from* Christe, *for (the* Iewes *sake, which be are) my bretherne, and kinsmenne accordinge to the fleashe.*

Act. 9. 21. & 26

1. Cor. 9.

Cupio anathema esse.

Where so euer they sawe occasion offred, they were alwaies ready to dw good to al men, without choise of persons, whether they were Iewes, or Heathens.

Howe be it, this question is very wel moued, and answeared by S. Hierome. Thus he saithe, Occulta hic oritur quæstio. Quid igitur, Petrus, si inuenisset ex Gentibus, non eos adducebat ad Fidem? Aut Paulus &c. *Here ariseth a secrete question. If* Peter *had founde any of the* Heathens, *did he not traine them to the Faithe? Or, if* S. Paule *had happened vpon any of the* Iewes, *did he not exhorte them to be Baptized?* This question, saithe he, is thus assoiled. *Wee muste saie, that either of them had a Principal, or a Special Commission, the one ouer the* Iewes, *the other ouer the* Heathens: *that the* Iewes, *that defended the Lawe, might haue One, whome to folowe: And the* Heathens, *that chose rather the free Grace of God, and leafte the Lawe, might likewise haue a Teacher to goe before them. But generally this pourpose was common to them bothe, that out of al Nations, as wel* Iewes, *as* Heathens, *they might geather a Churche vnto* Christe. That is to saie, Peters Apostleship was Ordinarie emonge the Iewes, & Extraordinarie emonge the Heathens: of the other side, Paules Apostleship was Ordinarie emonge the Heathens? And Extraordinarie emonge the Iewes.

Hieronym. ad Galat. Cap. 2.

Principalis sine gula in Iudæos. & Gentes fuisse mandatum.

Thus muche haue I added for your sake, M. Hardinge. For otherwise it had benne nédeleste. Hereby it is euident, *That by Goddes secrete Prouidence, and by the Apostles agreement bitweene them selues,* Peter *was placed in* Iewrie, *and* Paule *emonge the* Heathens: For so saithe S. Hierome, *That* Paule *had the Primacie emonge the* Heathens, *as* Peter *had emonge the* Iewes: For so saithe S. Ambrose, *That* Paule *was equal vnto* Peter? For so saithe Chrysostome, *That* Paule *was in no pointe inferioure vnto* Peter: For so saithe he, that beareth the name of S. Hierome: *Briefly, that either of them was allotted to his seueral portion, and neither had the charge Vniuersal of the whole.* This is neither Lewdenesse, nor Licenceous Ministerie, nor shame, nor Wilante. Leaue suche wilde talke, M. Hardinge, and learne your tongue to speake better.

Where you saie, that, according to the Ecclesiastical Canons, euer from the Apostles time, Bishoppes haue euermore benne Consecrate by three other Bishoppes, with the Confirmation of the Bishop of Rome, as if without him noman might be allowed to be a Bishop, ye shoulde not so vnaduisedly report so manifest Untruthe. For, I beseche you, where be these Ecclesiastical Canons? Who deuised

Confirmation. Consecration.

uised them? Who made them? Who gaue the Pope that singulare Priuilege, that no Bishoppes should be admitted in al the Worlde, but onely by him? I remember, your Canonistes haue saide, Papa potest Solo Verbo facere Episcopum: *The Pope maie make a Bishop onely by his Woorde*, without any farther Consecration. And Abbate Panormitane moueth a doubte, whether the Pope by the fulnesse of his Power, maie depriue al the Bishoppes in the Worlde at one time. But thus they saie, that care not greatly, what they saie.

Felin. De Constitu. Ca. Canonum Statuta. Colum. 6. Ver. Fallit. Panor. De Constitution. Trãslato.

Addition. ☞ M. Hardinge answeareth hereto, Amonge the Canons of the Apostles, this is the firste, *Episcopus à duobus, aut tribus Episcopis ordinetur*. Yet can you aske, where be these Ecclesiastical Canons? VVho diuised them? VVho made them? Addition ☞

The Answeare. Yon forgeat your selfe mutche, M. Hardinge. This was not the question. You are demaunded one thinge, and answeare an other. We denie not the Consecration of thre Bishoppes: We denie not the Confirmation of the Metropolitane. We our selues are so Consecrated, & so Confirmed. The mater that lieth betweene vs, is this, VVhether through the whole Churche of Christe noman maie be allowed for a Bishop, without the Confirmation of the Pope. Thereto I saie, where be your Ecclesiastical Canons? Who diuised them? Who made them? If we haue any, shewe them for the hardely: they wil further your cause. If we haue none at al, why shoulde you thus vaunte your selfe of emptie floare? Why shoulde you talke so vainely of your Ecclesiastical Canons, so Olde, so Ancient, so longe continewed in the Catholique Churche from the Apostles time vntil this daie?

M. Hard. Confutation. 58. a.

M. Hard. Determination. 223. b.

Christe (you saie) loued Peter, and inspired him, and gaue the Bishop of Rome, Peters Successour, this Priuilege, that no Bishop ought to be a Bishop without his consente. Verily, this had benne a iolly large Commission. And was it graunted vnto the Pope, as you saie, and not vnto Peter? for so you saie: Beholde your wordes: Christe gaue the Bishop of Rome Peters Successour, this Priuilege, that no Bishop ought to be a Bishop without his consente. Of Peters Priuilege, or consente you tel vs nothinge: You speake onely of the Consente, and Priuilege of the Pope, the Successoure of Peter. But where maie we finde this Commission? In what Gospel? In what Scripture? In what Generall Councel? In what Ancient Father? Are suche Monumentes laide vp onely in the Rolles, and Pipes of your memorie? Or, is it sufficient for you to tel vs, Christe inspired, and Loued Peter: Christe gaue Priuileges to the Pope, Without any manner worde of proufe? I beseeche you, M. Hardinge, howe many Bishoppes can you recken, that were Confirmed by S. Peter? Where Dwelte they? Where Preached they? What were theire names? Cardinal Cusanus saithe, Tam Petri primatus inter Apostolos, & Iudæos, quàm Pauli Primatus inter Gentes immediatè à Christo Conferebatur: &c. Nec in hoc alter alteri suberat: Sed ambo sub Christo immediatè: *As wel* Peters *Primacie emonge the Apostles, and* Iewes, *as also* Paules *Primacie emonge the* Heathens, *was geuen by* Christe *immediatly*, (that is to saie) *without the Consecration, and Confirmation of any man &c. And in this respecte neither of them was vnder other: But either was immediately vnder* Christe. That is to saie, S. Paule was nowe Confirmed by S. Peter, then S. Peter was Confirmed by S. Paule. And maie we thinke, S. Peter knewe not his owne Authoritie? Or, that he had suche Priuileges, and Chartres geuen him by Christe, and woulde not vse them? Here, it seemeth, somme what woulde we tel vs of Pope Anacletus, if we wiste what it were. But what saithe he? That Peter Confirmed al the reste of the Apostles? Or, that the Pope ought to Confirme al other Bishoppes through the worlde? It pitieth me, M. Hardinge, in your behalfe, to see theise folies. ☞

Nicol. Cusanus, ad Bohem. Epi. 2.

Nilus de Primatu Romani Pontificis.

Verily, Nilus a Greeke Writer saithe thus, Constantinopolitanus Cæsariensem Episcopum, aliosq; sibi subiectos ordinat: Romanus verò nec Constantinopolitanum, nec alium quenquam Metropolitanum: *The Bishop of* Constantinople *doothe Order the Bishop of* Cæsaria, *and other Bishoppes vnder him: But the Bishop of* Rome *doothe Order neither the Bishop of* Constantinople, *nor any other* Metropolitane.

M. Har. fo. 22. d

Addition. ☞ M. Hardinge answeareth hereto: It skilleth not mutche, what Nilus dooth saie. He speaketh of a mater of Facte, and not of Power: He saithe not, that the Bishop of Rome is not hable, or hathe no power, to Order some Metropolitane, but onely that he dooth not so. Addition ☞

Confirmation. Consecration.

not so. Or, if he were so foolishe to thinke so, yet you M. Iewel, shoulde not in that behalfe beare the bable with him. You, that can cal so many Glosses to your remembrance, coulde you not remember that Agapetus, that good Bishop of Rome Consecrated and ordered with his owne handes Mennas, makinge him Bishop of Constantinople?

The Answeare. And must Nilus, and poore M. Iewel nedes beare the Bable? I praie you, M. Hardinge, what wil you do the while? Wil you stande by, and do nothinge? Verily Nilus was a Bishop, and, as it maie appeare by his writinges, a Learned man, and woulde thinke scorne to beare the Bable in your presence. But you saie, Could you not remember that Pope Agapetus with his owne handes ordered Mennas, and made him the Bishop of Constantinople? Yes, M. Hardinge, I remember it very wel. And further, I can remember, that Liberatus your Authoure saithe, Tunc Papa principis fauore Mennam ordinauit Antistitem: *The Pope* (saithe he) *ordered* Mennas *the Bishop of* Constantinople (not by any Right, or Authoritie of his owne, but) *by the licence, and fauoure of the Emperoure*. Againe, I can remember, that Pope Agapetus was then present in Constantinople, to deale with the Emperour about certaine great maters touchinge the State. And beinge there present in his owne personne, and a newe Bishop beinge by occasion to be enstalled, it was most méte, that he shoulde haue the Honoure of Consecration. And, as for the takinge of that longe, and painful iourney, thus mutche also I can remember, that, when so euer the Emperoure by his Messenger had willed the Pope to come vnto him, although it were from Rome to Constantinople, streighte waie he went alonge, all occasions sette aparte, ye although he certainly knewe, that he shoulde neuer returne home againe, but be sente into banishemente. Further, I can remember, that Pope Agapetus him selfe saide thus at the time of the saide Consecration, in the behoulde, and commendation of the saide Mennas, Et hoc Dignitati eius accedere credimus, quòd à temporibus Petri Apostoli, nullum alium vnquam Orientalis Ecclesia suscepit Episcopum nostre Sedis manibus Consecratum: *This also maie bee an augmentation to his Dignitie, that from the time of* Peter *the Apostle, vntil this daie* (whiche was by the space of nine hundred yeres) *the* Easte *Churche neuer receiued any one Bishop Consecrate by the handes of any Bishop of* Rome, *but onely* Mennas. Mennas was the first as it appeareth by the Popes owne witnesse: And for ought, that I knowe to the contrarie, he was also the laste. And had not Pope Agapetus vppon occasion benne there presente in his owne personne, then had he not Consecrated Mennas neither. Consider better what ye bring vs, M. Hardinge: Ye shal hardely thriue by suche Authorities. Laste of al I can remember, that the Bishoppe of Rome him selfe is alwaies Consecrate by the Bishop of Hostia. Yet is not the Bishop of Hostia therefore aboue the Bishop of Rome. It is no great maisterie to remember theise thinges, M. Hardinge. But I meruile mutche, wherein this remembrance shoulde relieue you.

225 b.

Liberatus ca 21.

Liberatus ca 21.

Libera. eod. loco.

Eutropi. in Appen. in Syluerio.

Concil. Constane. 5. Act. 2.

But hereof I haue spoken more at large in my Former Replie to M. Hardinge. Certainely S. Cyprian willeth, that Sabinus, beinge lawfully elected, and Consecrate Bishop in Spaine, shoulde continewe Bishop stil, yea although Stephanus beinge then Bishop of Rome, woulde not Confirme him.

Artic. 4. Diui. 25

Cyprian. Lib. 1. Epist. 4.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ By this a man maie know, what a dodger you are, and whence your great Bookes proceede. Verily from certaine Heretical Notebookes, made by some Grammarians, or Scholemaisters of Germanie.

M. Hard 226.

The Answeare. I maruaile, M. Harding, you saide not as wel, from Tailers and Shomakers: for we poore menne must take our Learninge at Deliuerie, as it may like you to allow it. The mater it selfe by your owne confession is true. For S. Cyprian willed, that Sabinus, beinge once elected and Consecrated Bishop in Spaine, should continewe so stil, yea although the Bishop of Rome had disallowed him. If ye doubt hereof, leaue dodginge in your note Bookes, and reade S. Cyprian, and ye shal finde it. Twise tograther in one place ye tel vs, that Pope Stephanus restoared Basilides by his Decree: As if his onely Authoritie had benne sufficient to set vp Bishoppes, and to pulle them downe at his pleasure. But in so sayinge, you condemne Pope Stephanus of manifest folse. For what wise Rome had it benne, to be so ready

Cyprian Lib. 1. Epist. 4.

with his Sentence, & to publish his Decrées, before he had heard both parties togethere? A Iudge must walke with fete of lead. A certaine graue wise man saith thus:

Seneca

Qui statuit aliquid, parte inaudita altera,
Æquum licet Statuerit, haud æquus fuit.

Who so euer Decreed any thinge, before he hearde bothe parties, although his Decrée were iuste, yet was he no iuste man in his doinge.

Pope Stephanus, M. Hardinge, intreated onely for Basilides, that he might be restoared. As for Decrée, or Sentence in Iudgement, he gaue none. But, if S. Cyprian had made suche accompte of the Popes pleasure, and had thought it vnlawful for Sabinus to occupie the rome of a Bishop without his special Confirmation, he woulde haue written vnto Stephanus, to calle the parties before him, and to consider better of the mater. He woulde also haue written to the Clergie, and people of Spaine, to staie their attemptes, vntil the Pope had taken further Order. But contrariewise, notwithstandinge he knewe, what the Pope had written, yet he saithe vnto them, Plebs ipsa habet potestatem, vel eligendi dignos Sacerdotes, vel indignos recusandi: *The people haue power of them selues, either to chuse woorthy Bishoppes, or els to refuse them that be vnworthy.* As if he woulde saie, Thus maie the people do of them selues, whether the Pope wil, or no.

Cyprian. Lib. 1. Epist. 4.

And to comme neare vnto the mater, thus he saithe, Ferè per prouincias vniuersas tenetur, vt ad Ordinationes ritè celebrandas, ad eam plebem, cui præpositus Ordinatur, Episcopi eiusdem prouinciæ proximi quique conueniant, & Episcopus Deligatur, plebe præsente, quæ singulorum vitam plenissimè nouit, &c. Quod & apud vos factum videmus in Sabini Collegæ nostri Ordinatione, &c. Neque rescindere Ordinationem iure perfectam potest, quòd Basilides post crimina sua detecta, Romam pergens, Stephanum collegam nostrum longè positum fefellerit &c. *This Order is keapte welneare throughout al Countries, that at the Consecration of a Bishop, the Bishoppes of the same Prouince next adioining, resort together to the people of that Diocese, ouer which the Bishop must be Consecrate, that the Bishop maie be chosen in the presence of the people, that best knoweth eche mans Life. This Order, I see, you haue keapte in the Consecration of my Brother* Sabinus. *Neither maie that thinge hinder his Consecration, beeinge lawfully donne, that* Basilides, *after his faultes were espied, wente to* Rome, *and beguiled my Brother Pope* Stephanus *dwellinge so farre of.* Marke wel theise wordes M. Hardinge: Neither Basilides renninge to Rome, nor the Popes letters written in his fauoure, were hable to auoide the Consecration, of the other Bishop notwithstandinge, it was neuer Confirmed by the Pope.

But you wil saie, The Bishop of Rome, dwelling so farre from Spaine, yet had Authoritie ouer the Bishoppes of Spaine. I denie it not. So had S. Cyprian the like Authoritie, notwithstanding he dwelt from Spaine a great waie further then the Bishop of Rome. For as Basilides fledde to Rome for succour to Pope Stephanus, so Sabinus his aduersarie fledde to Carthage for succour to S. Cyprian. As the Pope Decreed, that Sabinus shoulde not be Bishop: So S. Cyprian Decreed, that Sabinus shoulde be Bishop. There was like Authoritie in them bothe. This onely was the difference: the Popes Decrée was auoided by a writte of Errour: But S. Cyprians Decrée tooke place, and continewed stil. And leaste you shoulde thinke, I imagine vainely of S. Cyprian, extending his power from Carthage into Spaine, Gregorie Nazianzene of his Authoritie writeth thus: Pastor erat, & Pastorum potentissimus, & spectatissimus. Non enim Carthaginensium tantùm Ecclesiæ præfuit &c. Cyprian *was a Bishop the mightiest, and noblest of al Bishoppes. For he had Rule not onely ouer the Churche of* Carthage, *nor onely ouer* Aphrica, *that vntil this daie is famous of him, and by his meanes, but also ouer al the* VVeaste, *and in a manner ouer al the* Easte, *likewise ouer bothe* Northe, *and* Southe. Ouer al theise Coastes and Countries, saithe the Nazianzene, S. Cyprian bare Rule: And yet was he onely the Bishoppe of Carthage, and not Pope of Rome. O M. Hardinge, if you coulde shewe vs but one suche sentence of the Pope, who

Nazianzen. De Cypriano.

Περιμαθέστατος

should

Confirmation. Consecration.

shoulde be hable to stale your triumphe? Deale substantially hencefoorthe. It will better becomme you. Thus vainely trifling with your Grammarians, and Note Bookes, to vse your owne wordes, ye shewe your selfe to be but a dodger.

In deede, touchinge every Metropolitanes seuerall Jurisdiction, Gratianus noteth thus: Illud generaliter clarum est, quòd si quis præter Sententiam Metropolitani fuerit factus Episcopus, hunc magna Synodus definiuit Episcopum esse non oportere: *This is generally cleare, that if any man be made Bishop, without the consente of his Metropolitane, the greate Councel (of Nice) hath decreed, that suche a one maie not be Bishop.* *Dist. 64. Cap finali.*

So likewise saithe Socrates of the Bishop of Constantinople: Præter Sententiam Episcopi Constantinopolitani Electio Episcopi ne fiat: *Without the Consente of the Bishop of Constantinople let no man be chosen Bishop.* Here is a right, specially reserued to the Bishop of Constantinople, and to euery Metropolitane within his owne Province: but of the Bishop of Romes Uniuersal right of Confirmation, we heare nothinge. *Socra. li. 7. ca. 28* χειροτονίαν ἐπισκόπου μὴ γίνεσθαι.

Addition. Hereto, M. Hardinge saithe, For lacke of the Popes Confirmation, any Bishop newely elected coulde not rightly haue enioyed his Bishoprike, as it appeareth by many examples, whiche woulde require a discourse ouer longe for this place. *M. Har. fo. 227. a*

The Answeare. O M. Hardinge, wil you deale so straitly with your friendes? Of so many, and so many examples, maie we not set so muche as one? I speake not nowe of Bishoppes within the Territorie of the Romaine Prouince. For they were Confirmed by the Bishop of Rome. I speake of the Bishoppes of al other Churches, and Jurisdictions throughout the worlde. You saie, It woulde require a discourse ouer longe for this place. Therefore it was good skil, thus courtely to passe it ouer. Silence serueth beste, where nothinge can be saide.

Neither doth M. Hardinges Counterfeit Anacletus claime al the Bishoppes through the worlde, as belonginge to his Admission, but onely a parte. Theise be his wordes, Omnes Episcopi, qui huius Apostolicæ, Sedis Ordinationi subiacent: *Al the Bishoppes that are vnder the Orderinge, or Confirmation of this Apostolike See.* So likewise writeth Damasus to the Bishoppes of Illyricum, Par est, omnes, qui sunt in Orbe Romano, Magistros consentire: *It is meete, that al the Teachers within the Romaine Jurisdiction, shoulde agree togeather.* *Anaclet. Epist. 3. Dist. 93. Iuxta Sanctorum. Sozomen. Lib. 6. Cap. 23.*

Addition. M. Hardinges answeare hereto is this: The Romaine world, of Iurisdiction was bothe Easte, and Weste, as farre as the Romaines had conquered. *Fol. 228. a*

The Answeare. And dothe the Jurisdiction of Rome reache from the Easte to the Weaste: from the Northe, to the Southe, and so ouer and ouer the whole worlde? Howe happeneth it then, that no Learned Father, no; Ancient Writer, Greke, or Latine, what so euer, vouchesaued euer to telle vs of it? Did no man euer heare it, or knowe it, but M. Hardinge? Or, is it enough for M. Hardinge to speake it, and to shewe vs nothinge? At leaste he shoulde haue brought forthe Constantines Donation, or somme other suche Antiquitie of like value. But if the Romaine Jurisdiction, were so large, as it is here imagined, wherefore then dothe S. Hierome saie, Maior est Authoritas Orbis, quàm Vrbis? *The Authoritie of the worlde is more then the Authoritie of the Citie of* Rome? For by M. Hardinges supposalles, the one had beene equal to the other. Or wherefore dothe Gennadius the Patriarke of Constantinople, togeather with the whole Councel of Bishoppes there assembled, write thus vnto the Bishop of Rome? Curet Sanctitas tua Vniuersas tuas Custodias, tibiq; subiectos Episcopos: *Let your Holinesse see vnto your owne charge, and vnto the Bishoppes, that be vnder you.* It had beene wronge to restraine the Pope to a fewe, hauinge, as you saie, a charge general ouer the whole. *Hieronym ad Enagrium. Gennadius in Constantinopol.*

Againe, that you saie, A Bishop hath alwaies bene Consecrate by other three Bishoppes. Whether it be true, or no, it maie wel be called in question, as beinge of your part hitherto very weakely affirmed. Surely Petrus de Palude, one of your owne Doctours, woulde haue tolde you thus: In Ecclesia Vnus Episcopus sufficit ad alium Consecrandum: nec est, nisi propter Solennitatem ab Ecclesia inuentum, vt Tres concurrant: *Petr. de Palude. De Potestate Apostol.*

Confirmation. Consecration.

concurrant: *In the Churche One Bishop is sufficient to Consecrate an other: and it is nothing els, but for the Solemnitie of the mater, that the Churche hathe diuised, that Three Bishoppes shoulde ioine togeather.* Likewise, Iohannes Maior an other of your owne Doctours woulde haue saide vnto you, Quis ordinauit Petrum? Non dabunt Tres Ordinatores. Dico ergo, esse Constitutionem Humanam, quòd Episcopus Ordinetur à Tribus. Paulus enim non quæsiuit Duos pro Ordinatione Titi, & Timothei: *Who Ordered Peter, and made him Bishop? They cannot shewe me Three Bishoppes that Ordered him. Therefore I saie, that a Bishop be Ordered by other Three Bishoppes, it is an Ordinance made by Man. For* Paule, *when he Ordered* Titus, *and* Timotheus, *sought not aboute for other Twoo Bishoppes.*

Seneca. Ioh. en Maior in 4. Sent. Dist. 24 Quæst. 3.

Whereas it farther pleaseth you, to calle for my Letters of Orders, and to demaunde of me, as by somme Authoritie, VVhether I be a Priest, or no? VVhat hands were laide ouer me: and by what Order I was made: I answeare you, I am a Priest, made longe sithence, by the same Order, and Ordinance, and, I thinke also by the same Man, and the same handes that you, M. Hardinge, were made Priest by, in the late time of that moste vertuous Prince King Edwarde the Sixthe. Therefore ye cannot wel doubte of my Priesthode, without like doubtinge of your owne.

Farther, as if ye were my Metropolitane, ye demaunde of me, VVhether I bee a Bishop, or no. I answeare you, I am a Bishop, and that by the Frée and accustomed Canonical Election of the whole Chapter of Sarisburie, assembled solemnely tograther for that purpose. Of whiche companie you, M. Hardinge, were then One, and, as I was enkourmed, beinge presente there in your owne personne emongest your Brethren, gaue free, and open consente vnto the Election. If you denie this, take héede, your owne breathe blowe not againste you.

As for the impertinente tales of Ischyras, and Zacchæus, they touche vs nothing. They were none of ours: We knowe them not. Our Bishoppes are made in Fourme and Order, as they haue benne euer, by Frée Election of the Chapter: by Consecration of the Archebishop, and other Three Bishoppes: and by the Admission of the Prince. And in this sorte not longe sithence, the Pope him selfe was admitted: and, as Platyna saithe, without the Emperoures letters Patentes, the Pope was no Pope: as hereafter it shalbe shewed more at large.

Platyna in Seuerino Papa.

Addition. ☞ VVhat Fourme or Order meane you? (saithe M. Hardinge) In the old Fourme, after the Election, notice was giuen to the Bishop of Rome and to al the Bishop. of the Churche, that suche a man was lawfully chosen in the Churche, and not Scismatically, &c. But so yee were not made Bishoppes. If yee were, shewe vs to what Bishoppes out of Englande yee wrote any suche letters.

Addition ☞

M. Har. fo. 134. a

The Answeare. What folie is this M. Hardinge? What suche letters haue the Bishoppes of Spaine vsed to write to the Bishoppes of Englande? Or what letters haue the Bishoppes of Fraunce vsed to write to the Bishoppes of Spaine? or when did the Pope write his letters Communicatorie to the Patriarkes of Constantinople, of Alexandria, of Antioche, or to the other Bishoppes of the Easte? But you confesse, This order is broken by your selues. Beholde your owne wordes. Thus you saie, The Custome of these Letters is out of vse. And hauinge broken it your selues, M. Hardinge, woulde ye haue vs to kéepe it? Or woulde you haue vs to reuerence those thinges, that your selues haue refused?

Fol. 134. b.

But you saie, After that the Custome of those Letters became to be out of vse, the onely Bishop of Romes Confirmation was in steede of the said notice. Thus you saie, and saie it only, & proue nothinge: as if there were some weight in your saienge. But who made vs these Lawes? Where sprange they? When began they? In what Synode, in what Councel were they written? If ye had any good thinge to shewe, it is likely, ye would not hide it.

Therefore we neither haue Bishoppes without Churche, nor Churche without Bishoppes. Neither doth the Churche of Englande this daie depende of them, whome you often calle Apostates, as if our Churche were no Churche without them. They are no Apostates M. Hardinge: That is rather your owne name, and of good

of gōd right belongeth vnto you. They are for a great part learned and graue, and Gods menne, and are muche aſhamed to ſee your folies. Notwithſtandinge, if there were not one, neither of them, nor of vs leaſte alyue, yet woulde not therfore the whole Churche of Englande flee to Louaine. Tertullian ſaithe, Nonne & Laici Sacerdotes ſumus? Scriptum eſt, Regnum quoque, & Sacerdotes Deo, & Patri ſuo nos fecit. Differentiam inter Ordinem, & Plebem conſtituit Eccleſiæ Authoritas, & honor per Ordinis Conſeſſum Sanctificatus à Deo. Vbi Eccleſiaſtici Ordinis non eſt Conſeſſus, & Offert, & Tingit Sacerdos, qui eſt ibi ſolus. Sed & vbi Tres ſunt, Eccleſia eſt, licet Laici. Vnuſquiſque enim de ſua Fide viuit: *And wee beinge Laiemenne, are wee not Prieſtes? It is written,* Chriſte *hathe made vs bothe a Kingedome, and Prieſtes vnto God his Father: The Authoritie of the Churche, and the Honoure by the Aſſemblie, or Councel of Order Sanctified of God, hath made a difference betweene the Laie, and the Clergie. Where as there is no Aſſemblie of Eccleſiaſtical Order, the Prieſte beeinge there alone,* (without the compante of other Prieſtes) *doothe bothe Miniſter the Oblation, and alſo Baptize. Yea, and be there but Three togeather, and, though they be Laiemenne, yet is there a Churche. For every man liueth of his owne Faith.* Tertullian in Exhorta. ad Caſtitatem.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ For answeare hereto M. Hardinge hath yelded vs wordes ynough. A thousande faultes (he ſaithe) and many thousande lies are in my Bookes. Ye woulde bluſhe (he ſaithe) if any ſhame were in you, &c. The total ſumme herof is this: Tertullian was an Heritique, and wrote this Booke againſte the Churche: There is a difference bitwene Prieſts, and Laiemenne: There is Prieſthode Internal, and Prieſthode External: where the External Prieſthode is denied, as emonge the Lutheranes, and Caluiniſtes, there is no Churche, &c. M. Har. fo. 238. a. Fol. 140. a.

Touchinge the firſte parte hereof, I graunte, Tertullian in ſome parte fell from the Truthe of God, euen as you haue alſo, M. Hardinge, and folowed Montanus the Heretique in his Errours. The Errours of Montanus were theſe: Firſte he ſaide, *He knewe more then the Apoſtles of* Chriſte: *and that the Apoſtles knowledge was vncertaine, and wanted perfection.* Further he ſaide, *That Seconde Marriage was Fornication and Filthineſſe.* But the thinge, wherein you haue taken holde, touching Prieſts, and Laie People, was no parte of Montanus Errours. If it were, bringe it forthe out of ſome recorde: let it appeare, that wee maie ſee it. Neither maie you iuſtely conclude, becauſe Tertullian in one or two pointes was an Heretique, that therfore euery ſentence in his Booke, is ful of Hereſies. As for theſe wordes, he had them not out of Montanus the Heretique, but out of S. Peter the Apoſtle of Chriſt. Thus ſaithe S. Peter, Vos eſtis Regale Sacerdotium: *You are the Kingly Prieſthode:* And thus he ſaithe, not onely vnto Prieſtes and Biſhoppes, but alſo vnto the whole Chriſtian people. Likewiſe S. Iohn the Euangeliſte ſaithe, Chriſte *with his Blonde hath waſhte vs from our ſinnes, and hath made vs Kinges, and Prieſtes vnto God his Father.* But yet telle vs, There is a Prieſthode Internal, and a Prieſthode External: and, there is a difference bitweene Laiemenne, and Prieſtes. What needed this talke, M. Hardinge? There is not one of vs, that euer taught otherwiſe. Wee knowe, that the Prieſte, or Miniſter of the Churche of God is diuided from the reſte of his Brethren, as was the Tribe of Leui from the Children of Iſrael, and hathe a ſpecial Office ouer the people. Neither maie any man force him ſelfe into that Office without lawful callinge. But as touchinge the Inwarde Prieſthode, and the exercise of the Soule, Wee ſaie, euen as S. Peter, and S. Iohn, and Tertullian, haue ſaide, in this ſenſe euery faythful Chriſtian man is a Prieſte, and offereth vnto God Spiritual Sacrifices. In this onely ſenſe, I ſaie, and none otherwiſe. 1. Pet. 2. Apocal. 1. Numer 8. Deuter. 10.

Nowe, if any man ſhal thinke it ſtrange, to heare a Laie Man in any ſenſe called a Prieſte, maie it pleaſe him to peruſe ſome parte of that hereafter folowth in this Defenſe. There ſhal he finde by the Authorities of S. Auguſtine, S. Ambroſe, S. Hierome, and S. Chryſoſtome, that who ſo euer is a member of Chriſtes Body, who ſo euer is a Childe of the Church, Who ſo euer is Baptized in Chriſte, and beareth his name, is fully inueſted with this Prieſthode, and therefore maie iuſtely be called a Prieſte. And where ſo euer there bee three ſuche togeather, as Tertullian ſaithe, Yea though they be onely Laie menne, yet haue they a Churche. Defenſe. parte. 6. Cap. 11. Dist. 4. ☞ 5.

The

Origen. in Leuit. Homil. 5.

The Olde Father Origen saithe: Omnes quicunque vnguento Sacri Chrismatis delibuti sunt, fiunt Sacerdotes: *All they, that are bathed with the ointement of Holy Chrisme, are made Priestes.* S. Augustine saithe: Holocaustum Dominicæ Passionis offert quisque pro peccatis suis, &c. *Euery man offereth vp the Sacrifice of our Lordes Passion for his sinnes.* Likewise S. Cyprian, Omnes, qui à Christi nomine dicuntur Christiani, offerunt Deo quotidianum Sacrificium, ordinati à Deo sanctimonie Sacerdotes: *All menne, that of the name of* Christe *be called Christians, offer vp vnto God the daiely Sacrifice, beeinge ordeined of God, the Priestes of Holinesse.* Thus we se, al Christian menne are Priestes, and offer vp to God the daiely Sacrifice, that is the Sacrifice of Christes Passion. Therefore, M. Hardinge, if ye condemne Tertullian in this behalfe, ye muste also condemne so many Holy, and Learned Fathers for the same.

August. in Expo sition inchoata, ad Roman.

Cyprian. de Vnctione Chrismatis.

M. Har. fo. 140. a

But you Protestantes (ye saie) haue no External Sacrifice: and therfore ye haue no Church at al.

It pitieth me, M. Hardinge, to se the vanitie of your dealinge. Haue we no External Sacrifice, saie you? I beseche you, what Sacrifice did Christe or his Apostles euer commaunde, that we haue refused? Leaue your mistie cloudes, and generalities of wordes, and speake it plainely, that ye may serme to saie some Truthe.

We haue the Sacrifice of Prayer, the Sacrifice of Almouse dædes, the Sacrifice of Praise, the Sacrifice of Thankesgeuinge, and the Sacrifice of the Deathe of Christe. We are taught to present our owne bodies, as a pure, and a Holy, and

Rom. 12.

a wel pleasinge Sacrifice vnto God, and to offer vp vnto him the burninge Oblation of our lippes. *These* (saithe S. Paule) *be the Sacrifices wherwith God is pleased.* These be the Sacrifices of the Churche of God. Who so euer hath these, we cannot saie, he is voide of Sacrifice. Howe be it, if we speake of a Sacrifice Propitiatorie for the Satisfaction of sinnes, we haue none other but onely Christe Iesus, the Sonne of God vpon his Crosse. *He is that Sacrificed Lambe of God, that hathe taken awaie the sinnes of the Worlde.*

Hosee. 14. Hebr. 13.

Iohan. 1.

You wil saie, Ye offer not vp Christe really vnto God his Father. No, M. Hardinge: neither we, nor you can so offer him: nor did Christe euer geue you Commission to make suche Sacrifice. And this is it, wherewith you so fowly beguile the simple. Christe offreth and presenteth vs vnto his Father. *For by him we haue accesse to the Throne of Grace.* But no Creature is hable to offer him. Christe Iesus vpon his Crosse was a Priest for euer, according to the Order of Melchisedech. As for our part. S. Augustine saith, Holocausti eius Imaginem ad memoriam Passionis suæ in Ecclesia celebrandam dedit: Christ *hath geuen vs to celebrate in his Churche, an Image, or token of that Sacrifice for the remembrance of his Passion.* Againe he saithe, Huius Sacrificii Caro, & Sanguis post Ascensionem Christi per Sacramentum memoriæ celebratur: *After* Christes *Ascension into Heauen, the Flesh, and Blonde of this Sacrifice, is continewed by a Sacramente of remembrance.* Eusebius saithe, Sacrificium incendimus illi Memoriam Magni illius Sacrificii, &c. Iussit nos offerre memoriam pro Sacrificio: *Wee burne a Sacrifice vnto God, the remembrance of that great Sacrifice, vpon the Crosse, &c.* Christe *Commaunded vs to offer vp a remembrance (of his Deathe) in stede of a Sacrifice.* It were an infinite labour to reporte al, that maie be laide. To be shorte, S. Hierome saithe, turninge him selfe vnto Christe: Tunc acceptabis Sacrificium, vel cum te pro nobis Offers Patri, vel cùm à nobis Laudes, & Gratiarum actiones accipis: *Then shalt thou, O Christe, receiue Sacrifice, either when thou offrest vp thee selfe for vs vnto thy Father,* (whiche was onely vpon the Crosse) *or els, when thou receiuest of vs Praises, and thankesgeuinge.*

Hebr. 4.

August. in li. 80. Quæst. quæ. 61.

August. contra Faust. li. 20. ca. 21

Euseb. de Demonstration. li. 1.

Hieronym. in Psalm. 51.

Al theise thinges are true, M. Hardinge: you cannot denie them. You maie therefore laie vp the thousande faultes, and so many thousand lies, with the shame, and blusshinge, that ye speake of. Sclaunder nomore, neither Montanus, nor Tertullian. Though in some pointes they were deceiued, as Heretiques, yet herein thei were Catholique, and agreed with others the Godly Learned Fathers of the Church. Goddes name be blessed for euer. We wante neither Church, nor Priesthode, nor any kinde of Sacrifice, that Christe hath leaft vnto his Faithful.

Againe, ye demaunde of me, What Bishop of Sarisburie euer sithence Augustines time, maintained

S. Ambrose, and other Holy Fathers neuer knewe it, nor hearde of it. Therefore, it was never deliuered from the Apostles.

Howe be it, you saie, You cannot telle, when your Priuate Masse firste beganne, or who was the firste that euer saide it. God be thanked, that thus hathe forced you to vttre somme Truthe. Yet are we hable to telle you, when the Holy Communion firste began. We knowe, in what place, and at what time it was firste Ministred: we knowe that Christe Iesus the Sonne of God was the firste, that euer saide it.

But bicause ye are not hable to shewe vs the Antiquitie and first Originalles of your Masse, muste we therefore thinke, M. Hardinge, that Christe, or his Apostles were the firste that euer saide it? Or, is your ignorance cause sufficiente to proue it good? What if you cannot tel, as, I reckon, you cannot, in what time, or vnder what Pope, your Stewes and Pardonnes were first diuised? Wil you therfore tel vs, and must we beleeue, That Christ and his Apostles firste diuised them?

M. Hardinge, in his Answeare fo. 12. a.

As for your Priuate Masse, you your selfe haue confessed, It grewe not, either from the Apostles, or of the Spirite of God, but onely of the Negligence and wante of deuotion of the people. Christe saithe by waie of a Parable vnto his Disciples: *The Kingedome of Heauen is likened vnto a man, that sowed good seede in his grounde: but when the folkes were a sleepe, that mannes enemie came, and sowed Tares, and Cokles emonge the Corne.* Christe is the housbanderman: We planted the Holy Communion in his Churche: And so it continewed many hundred yeres. Afterward when the Priests and Bishoppes became careleste, and felle faste a slepe, the Diuel came with Negligence, and il disposition, and wante of deuotion of the people, and planted youre Masse. The Seruantes saide to their Maister, *Sir, did not you sowe good Corne in your fielde? From whence then be theise Tares?* Euen so maie we saie, did not Christe deliuer vs the Holy Communion, that the People shoulde kraste and Communicate together, and publishe the benefites of his Passion? From whence then is this Priuate bankette, that one man receiueth al alone? The Seruantes knewe not, who sowed the Tares: Neither do you knowe, who founded your Masse. Notwithstandinge there is notable difference in the Churche of God betwene your Masse, and the Holy Communion, then is in the fielde betwene wilde Tares, and wholesome Corne. The one was planted by daie, the other by night. But Christe saithe, *Euery plante, that my Heauenly Father hathe not planted, shalbe taken vp by the roote.*

Matth. 13.

Touchinge the Bishoppes of Sarisburie, you your selfe haue already named two, Bishop Shaxton, and Bishop Capon, bothe Learned and graue Fathers, and bothe Preachers, and Professoures of the Gospel. For the reste of the Bishoppes, that were before them, what Faith they helde, and what they either liked, or misliked, by theire writinges, or Sermons it dothe not greatly appeare. I trust, they helde the Fundation, and liued, and died in the Faith of Christe. If they had liued in theise daies, and sene, that you se, they woulde not haue bene partakers of your wilfulnesse.

Addition. M. Hardinge, These be the woordes of an Antichriste: who seeking to make him selfe equal with Christe, doothe vse suche phrases by his wicked Members. Addition

The Answeare. The sobrietie of theise wordes needeth no answeare.

To be shorte, we succede the Bishoppes that haue bene before our daies. We are Elected, Consecrate, Confirmed, and Admitted, as they were. If they were deceiued in any thinge, we succede them in Place, but not in Errour. They were our Predecessours, but not the Rules and Standardes of our Faith. Or rather, to sette aparte al comparison of Personnes, the Doctrine of Christe this daie M. Hardinge, Succedeth your Doctrine: as the Daie Succedeth the Nighte: as the Light Succedeth Darkenesse: and as the Truthe Succedeth Errour.

Nowe for as mutche as ye haue thought it so good, to examine the Petite Degrée of the Bishoppes of Sarisburie, I truste ye wil not thinke it il, if I a litle touche the like in the Bishoppes of Rome: that we maie therebye be the better hable to se some of the branches of your Succesion. Therefore shortely to saie, you knowe that Pope Marcellinus committed Idolatrie.

Addition.

maintained this Doctrine. I might likewiſe, and by as good authoritie demaunde of you, what Biſhop of Rome euer before the ſame Engliſhe Auguſtines time maintained your Doctrine? Or, as I ſaide before, what Biſhop of Rome euer before that time either ſaide, or knewe your Priuate Maſſe?

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ M. Harding, The queſtions are not like, M. Iewel: Many things haue benne, or might haue benne lawfully concluded betwene thus, and Auguſtines (the Italian Monkes) time, albeit the ſame had not benne vſed before, &c. Fol. 241. a.

The Anſweare. I graunt you, M. Hardinge many pretie things haue ſprunge vp within theſe thouſande yeres, your Maſſe Communions, your priuate Maſſes, your Vnknowen Prayers in Strange Tongues, your Adoration of Images, your Pardons, &c. But how wel, and how lawfully, it were harde to ſaie. Verily, theſe be the thinges, that neither Peter, euer planted, nor Paule euer watered.

M. Hardinge, Al the Biſhoppes of Rome, as wel before Auguſtine, (the Monkes) time, as ſithence, maintained our Religion. That I proue, becauſe the Biſhop of Rome, that nowe is, dothe allowe our Religion. For wee communicate with him, and he with vs. And this Pope agreed with his Predeceſſoure Pius the fourthe: and ſo vpwarde from Pope to Pope, &c. M. Har. fo. 241. b.

The Anſweare. This doubteleſſe is a mightie Argumente, and concludeth from Pope to Pope, A primo ad Vltimum. By this reaſon ye might very wel iuſtifie Annas, and Chaiphas. For either of them followed the Biſhoppes their Predeceſſours, that had benne before them, and ſo vpwarde vnto Aaron, that was the firſt. Yet Chriſte ſaith vnto them, *Ye haue broken the Commaundementes of God to maintein your owne Traditions: From the beginning it was not ſo: They are Blinde Guides, and leade the Blinde: they haue defaced the Houſe of God, and turned it into a Caue of Theeues.* Matth. 15. Matthæ. 19. Matthæ. 15.

By the ſame reaſon ye maie ſaie thus, The Biſhop of Rome, that nowe is, alloweth the Stewes: and therein we Communicate with him, and he with vs: for in al Catholique Townes and Countries of our Religion, open Stewes be maintened, as wel as in Rome: And this Pope agreeth with his Predeceſſoure, Pius the Fourth: and he again withe his Predeceſſour Paulus the Fourth: and ſo vpwarde from Pope to Pope &c. Ergo S. Peter, that was the Firſt Biſhop of Rome maintened the Stewes. So weighty, M. Harding, be the Argumentes that you ſende vs. Matthæ. 21

M. Hardinge. But, ſeeinge M. Iewel can name no man, who began to ſaie, or allowe Priuate Maſſe, and yet, ſeeinge it is ſaide, and allowed throughout al Chriſtendome, it is S. Auguſtines owne rule, that the ſaid vſe of Priuate Maſſe came from the Apoſtles themſelues. For thus he writeth, *Quod vniuerſa tenet Eccleſia, nec in Conciliis inſtitutum ſed ſemper retentum eſt, non niſi Authoritate Apoſtolica traditum rectiſſimè creditur:* VVhat thing the whole Churche keepeth, and hath not bee inſtituted in Councelles, but hathe benne alwaies retained, the ſame is moſte righlie beleued, to haue benne deliuered none otherwiſe, then by Apoſtolique Authoritie M. Har. fo. 242. a

The Anſweare. S. Auguſtines Rule I like very wel M. Hardinge: But your bolde ſome vſinge, and applieinge of the ſame, I cannot like. For the matters ye ſpeake of, are no waie applicable to the Rule. Marke I beſeeche you S. Auguſtines wordes: Quod vniuerſa tenet Eccleſia: Quod ſemper retentum eſt: *That thinge* (ſaithe S. Auguſtine) *that the whole Vniuerſal Churche vſeth: That thing, that hath alwaies, and euermore benne obſerued.* Suche a thinge muſte it be, M. Hardinge, if ye wil haue S. Auguſtines Rule to agree vnto it. Nowe thinke you, that your Priuate Maſſe hathe benne Vniuerſally allowed throughout the whole Churche of God? In deede ye haue ſaide ſo: but ye haue ſaide it fol vntruely, as in place hereafter more conueniente it ſhal appeare. Or thinke you, that your Priuate Maſſe hathe benne holden and vſed alwaies, and euermore from the beginninge? Or if it be ſo, is your learninge, or your locke ſo il, that for the ſpace of ſo many hundred yeres, out of the Recordes of ſo manie Learned Fathers, with ſuche conference of ſtudie, ſuche healpe of friendes, ſuche time, and ſuche leaſure, ye are not hable to ſhew vs one good proufe, neither, of Place, where it was ſaide, nor of Perſone, that ſaide it, nor of Witneſſe that hearde it? No, No, M. Hardinge, if you ſtande to S. Auguſtines Rule, then muſte your Maſſe neades be condemned. It was neuer Vniuerſally vſed throughout the whole Churche of God: It hath not benne continewed alwaies, and euermore from the beginninge: S. Auguſtine him ſelf. S. Hierome, S. Chryſoſtome, S. Am- Defenſe. parte 3. Cap. 15. Diuiſ. 2.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ To this M. Hardinge anſweareth: Yet this very Idolatour, becauſe he was S. Peters Succeſſoure, and ſate in the firſte See, was in caſe for the roome he occupied, to be iudged of no man in the earthe, as the Councel of the three hundred and thirtie Biſhoppes aſſembled at Sinueſſa pronounced aboue twelue hundred yeeres paſte.

The Anſweare. The reaſon hereof is declared in a Councel holden about the ſame time at Rome, by Sylueſter the Firſte. Præſul ſummus non iudicabitur a quoquam. Quia ſcriptum eſt, non eſt Diſcipulus ſupra Magiſtrum: *The Higheſte Prelate ſhalbe iudged of noman. For it is written, There is no Scholare aboue his Maiſter.* Thus the Pope is the Scholemaiſter, & al the Biſhops through the worlde are his Scholares, and maie not controlle him, what ſo euer he do, and al this he claimeth, by the Authoritie of the Scriptures. If it be ſo, M. Hardinge, then is it true, that the Accuſers of Pope Symmachus ſaide in the preſence of kinge Theodoricus, Succeſſores Petri, vna cum Sedis Priuilegijs, peccandi quoque licentiam accepiſſe: *That the Popes, Peters Succeſſours, together with the Priuileges of their See, haue receiued libertie to doo il.* Concil. Roman. 1 Matth. 10. Eunodius, Concil. Tom. 1.

In deede the Councel of Sinueſſa vſed ye Pope Marcellinus with much Courteſie, as it maie appeare. Yet, good Reader, that thou maiſte ſee the ſimplicitie, and plainneſſe of M. Hardinges dealinge, where as he ſaithe, It was Decreed by the Councel of Sinueſſa, that Marcellinus beinge Peters Succeſſoure, ſhoulde be iudged of no man in earthe, he might alſo haue told thee, that the ſame Pope Marcellinus the Idolatour, notwithſtanding the Succeſsion of S. Peter, and al the Priuileges of his See, is founde fiue times, not onely iudged, but alſo condemned in the ſame Councel. And, for that the mater it ſelfe is not otherwiſe weighbie, ſauinge that it maie witneſſe the Truthe of M. Hardinges reportes, for ſhortneſſe ſake, I wil laie forth the wordes thereof onely in Latine without traſlation.

Thus therefore it is written in the Councel of Sinueſſa, Introiuit & Marcellinus Vrbis Romæ Epiſcopus, adhuc nomen tenens Epiſcopatus: Nondum enim fuerat damnatus &c. Againe, Epiſcopus Quirinus dixit, Infudiſti cor tuum, Pontifex, malitia &c. Vulneraſti vniuerſa membra tua. Againe, Te non condemnamus Præſul: quoniam ex ore tuo iuſtificaberis, & ex ore tuo condemnaberis: Marcellinus in conſpectu Synodi cecidit in terram. Ibi ergo iacentem eum, & moram facientem damnauerunt. Againe, Subſcripſerunt igitur in eius damnationem, & damnauerunt eum extra Ciuitatem. Againe, Sacerdos Helchiades ſubſcripſit primus in eius damnationem, non tantum pro hoc tempore, ſed etiam in exemplum futuri temporis. And againe, Diocletianus Imperator audiuit, quòd trecenti Epiſcopi in eandem damnationem conuenilſent. Nowe you ſaie, VVhat haue you wonne by this example? Thus mutche verily, M. Hardinge: Firſt, that the Succeſſour of Peter maie be an Idolatour, for ſo was Marcellinus. Secondly, that the ſame Marcellinus was iudged by the Councel of Sinueſſa: wherein alſo you maie finde your ſelfe guiltie of greate vntruthe: onelie ye wil ſaie, So many graue Fathers condemned the Pope openly without Iudgemente. Concil. Sinueſſa. De Condemna. Marcellini. Concil. Tom. 1. Alia. Et ecce. Singulo autem in fine.

That Pope Sylueſter 2. was a Conſurer, and gaue him ſelfe whole Body, and Soule vnto the Diuel, and by the Diuelles procurement was made Pope: That Pope Zoſimus for ambition, and claime of gouernment, corrupted the Holy Counſel of Nice.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ M. Hardinge. You ſaie it: but neuer did any honeſte man ſaie it from the beginninge of the worlde. You ſhewe your ſelfe to be a man of il diſpoſition. No man euer ſaide it but Illyricus, or bawdy Bale. You mainteine the Succeſsion of your generation. M. Hardinge. Fol. 249. a. & b.

The Anſweare. This is M. Hardinges Ordinarie eloquence, Good Reader. Therefore let it not offende thee. For the Truthe of this mater, I referre thee to the Councel of Aphrica, whereat were preſente S. Auguſtine, Alypius, and two hundred, and fiftiene other Biſhoppes. The diſcourſe is longe. Shortely to open it, thus it ſtandeth. Zoſimus the Biſhop of Rome claimed a Soueraintie in Iudgemente, and Iuriſdiction ouer al Aphrica. The Biſhoppes there withſtode him, and ſaide, he had no ſuche Righte to deale emonge them. Zoſimus, for proufe of his Claime, alleged a Canon of the Councel of Nice, touchinge the Vniuerſal Authoritie of the Pope. They Anſweared, they had likewiſe the Councel of Nice, but Concil. Aphrica Ca. 101. 102. 103. 104. 105.

in al the ſame coulde finde no ſutche Canon. Alypius the Biſhop of Tagaſta, ſpeakinge herevnto, ſaithe thus, *This thinge moueth me muche, that when wee laide togeather, and examined the Originalles of the* Nicene *Councel, written in Greeke, theiſe thinges (concerninge the Superioritie of the Pope) wee founde not there. But howe it commeth to paſſe, I cannot telle.* The Pope ſheweth for the one Copie of the Councel: they ſhewed for the an other. They were not ſo ſupplante, or ſimple, to thinke the Popes Copie was vndoubtedly true, and therefore to yelde vnto him without further ſearche. They Imagined, that either he ſought to deceiue them, or was deceiued him ſelfe. In concluſion they agreed, that either partie ſhoulde ſende into the Caſte, to the Biſhoppes of Conſtantinople, Alexandria, and Antiochia, for a Copie of the ſame Councel, taken out of the very Originalles, that remained emonge them, that thereby it might appeare, whether theire Copie were falſified, or the Popes. Hereunto Atticus the Biſhop of Conſtantinople, and Cyrillus the Biſhop of Alexandria returned theire Anſweares. Theire Epiſtles are extante to be ſeene vntil this daie, as wel in Crake, as in Latine. By this Certificate it was euidente to al menne, that the Popes Copie diſagreed from al the reſte, and was corrupted: but by whome, and to what pourpoſe, a Babe maie eaſily vnderſtand. Al other Copies were true: The Popes onely Copie was falſe. If this be not Falſifieinge, and Corruption, M. Hardinge, geue it any other name, that maie like you better. And withal I beſeeche you to conſider, whether of theiſe two thinges in youre owne iudgemente ſeemeth more likely, either, that the Pope, to mainteine his eſtate, and Authoritie, ſhoulde falſifie one Copie, or els, that al the Biſhoppes of Aphrica, Aſia Minor, Aegypte, and Græcia, without cauſe, or hope of any manner gaine ſhould falſifie al the Copies throughe the worlde. Verily the one is not vnlikely: The other almoſte impoſſible.

Concil. Carthag. 6. Cap. 4.

In Conc. Aphricæ. cap. 102. 103. In Græco. Pa. 82.

But you ſaie, That Pope Zoſimus corrupted the Nicene Councel, never did any honeſte man ſaie it from the beginninge of the worlde. No man euer ſaide it, but Illyricus, or Bawdy Bale. Yes, M. Hardinge, there were ſomme, that ſaide it, before either Illyricus, or Bale was borne. And that M. Cope, one of your Pewfelowes, coulde haue tolde you. For thus he ſaithe, although diſcretely, and in ſeemely meaninge: Cretè doctiſsimi quique ex omni Græcia, & inter eos Beſſarion, cum Florentino Concilio interesſent, iactabant Nicenum Canonem per Romanos Pontifices depravatum: *Verily the beſte Learned menne of al* Græcia, *and emonge them,* Beſſarion, *beeinge preſente at the Councel of* Florence, *make crakes, that the Canon of the* Nicene *Councel was corrupted by the Biſhoppes of* Rome. In deede theiſe woordes they ſpake, and ſpake them with modeſtie, as might becomme them: as for their crakes, and bragges, I remember none.

Copus Dialo. 1. Pag. 78.

Thus there ſaide, Marcus the Archebiſhop of Epheſus, in the name of al the reſt: Nónne vides, Reuerende Pater, Summum Pontificem (Zoſimum) falſum Decretum, & non in Synodo promulgatum ad tantum Concilium, pro re tam magna miſiſſe? *And ſee you not, Right Reuerende Father, that Pope* Zoſimus *beeinge the Higheſte Biſhop, for a matter of ſo greate weighte, ſente, vnto that Woorthy Councel of* Aphrica, *a falſe, or a falſified Decree, ſutche as neuer was publiſhed in the Councel of* Nice? Againe he ſaithe, Nullam equidem de Zoſimo feciſſem mentionem, Reuerende Pater, niſi meum de eo ſermonem verum eſſe, poſſem oſtendere: *I woulde not haue ſpoken one woorde of Pope* Zoſimus, *Reuerende Father, onleſſe I had benne hable to proue, my tale to be true.* They that gaue conſente herevnto, and auouched the ſame, and at that time ſate preſente in the Councel, were Ioſephus the Patriarche of Conſtantinople: Beſſarion the Archebiſhop of Nice, and afterwarde Biſhop of Tuſculum, and Cardinal of Rome, Iſidorus the Metropolitane of Syria, beſides ſeuentie others Archebiſhoppes, and Metropolitanes, with a greate number of other inferiour Biſhoppes, and Learned Fathers, that attended vpon them.

Concil. Florent. Seſſion. 20.

In ead. Seſſione

It were very harde for you, M. Hardinge, to ſaie, that al theiſe were vnhoneſte menne, or of il diſpoſition, or the mainteiners of the Succeſsion of Lies. They liued in the Lighte, and commendation of the woorlde aboue a hun dred and fourtie

fourtie yéres agoe, longe before either Flacius Illyricus, or Iohn Bale was heard of. They ſaide openly in the Councel of Florence, *That Pope* Zoſimus *had falſified the Councel of* Nice, *and further ſaide they were hable to proue it, and that otherwiſe they would not haue ſaide it.* Marke therefore, M. Hardinge, the truthe, and courteſie of youre wordes. Thus you ſaie, Neuer did any honeſte man thus ſaie from the beginninge of the worlde.

That Pope Liberius was an Arian Heretique.

Addition. ☞ M. Hardinge. Or els ye are an errante ſclaunderous Lier. Howe ſeemeth not this wicked generation to ſpringe of the Diuel, ſeeinge it maketh the woorſte of euery thinge, ſpeakinge il of that, whiche maie wel, and oughte charitably to be defended? And yet, if he had benne an Arian with al his harte, ſo longe, as he neuer decreed any thinge accordinge to the Arian Hereſie, nor did ſet it foorthe by publike Authoritie of the See of Rome, that ſhoulde not hurte our mater of Succeſsion. M. Hard. 249. b. M. Hard. 251. a.

The Anſweare. Who ſo is hable to allege, the allowed Autheritie of good Writers, and imagineth nothinge of him ſelfe, M. Hardinge, is neither a Sclaunderer, nor a Lier. Firſte your ſelfe haue graunted, that Pope Liberius ſubſcribed, and gaue his Hand vnto the Arian Heretiques. Wherein it maie reaſonably be thought, that the Arians beleued, he gaue alſo the inwarde agrément of his harte, and therefore embraced him, as one of theire owne. Further Rhegino ſaithe in plaine wiſe, Liberius reuerſus ab exilio Hæreticis fauet: *Pope* Liberius *after he returned from out of banniſhmente, bare good will to the Heretiques.* Rhegino. Lib. 1.

Alphonſus de Caſtro ſaithe, De Liberio Papa conſtat, fuiſſe Arianum: *Touchinge Pope* Liberius *it is wel knowen, he was an* Arian. Sabellicus ſaithe, Ariani precibus ſuis apud Conſtantium Liberio reditum ad Vrbem confecere. Quo ille beneficio commotus, ex confeſſo Arianus, vt quidam ſcribunt, eſt factus: *The* Arian *Heretiques by theire entreatie vnto the Emperoure* Conſtantius, *obteined of him, that Pope* Liberius *might be reſtoared againe vnto the Citte. With whiche good turne* Liberius *beeinge moued, as ſomme haue written, became an* Arian *Heretique (* Ex Confeſſo *) in good earneſte, and with his harte.* Platina ſaithe, Liberius Imperatoris beneficio motus, vt quidam volunt, in rebus omnibus ſenſit cum Hæreticis &c. Pontifex tametſi cum Arianis ſentiebat, tamen Eccleſias Dei diligenter exornabat: *Pope* Liberius *moued with the Emperoures gentleneſſe, as ſomme thinke, agreed in al thinges with the Heretiques.* Marke wel theſe wordes, M. Hardinge. *He agreed (* ſaithe he *) in al thinges with the Heretiques.* And againe, *Pope* Liberius, *notwithſtandinge he were of one Iudgemente with the* Arians, *yet he diligently furniſhed the Churche of God.* In an Olde Pontificale, written in Uelum, you maie finde this whole mater recorded thus: Imperator Liberium, qui ſibi, & Arianis conſenſerat, in Sede repoſuit: & ſic infœlix Liberius Baſilicam S. Petri vi tenuit ſeptem annos: & tum facta eſt magna perſequutio in Vrbe, ita vt Clerici Liberio contradicentes Martyrio coronorentur: *The Emperoure* Conſtantius *beeinge an* Arian *Heretique, reſtoared Pope* Liberius *to his See, for that he agreed with him, and with the* Arians. *And thus wicked* Liberius *helde* Peters *Churche ſeuen yeares by violence. Then was there raiſed a greate perſecution in the Citie of Rome, ſo that the Prieſtes there for withſtandinge* Liberius, *were crowned with Martyrdome.* Nicolaus Cuſanus ſaithe, Liberius, & Honorius, & alij in Cathedra Petri aliquando inſedentes, in errorem Schiſmaticum ſeducti ceciderunt: Sedes tamen abſque vitio remanſit: *Pope* Liberius, *and Pope* Honorius, *and other Popes ſittinge for a while in* Peters *Chaire, beeinge miſleadde, fille into Schiſmatical errour: yet* Peters *Chaire remained ſtil without faulte.* Againe afterwarde he ſaithe, Liberius conſenſit errori Arianorum: *Pope* Liberius *gaue his conſente to the errour of the* Arians, and for proufe thereof he alleageth S. Hierome in Chronicis. Anſelmus Rid ſaithe, Liberius primus à Pontificum Romanorum integritate receſsit: *Pope* Liberius *was the firſte, that forſooke the pure Doctrine of the Biſhoppes of Rome.* Plating in Liberio. Nicol. Cuſan. De Concordantia, Lib. 1. Cap. 14. Nicol Cuſan. De Concordantia, Lib. 2. Cap. 5. Anſelmus Rid.

By theſe wordes maie ſee, that Pope Liberius felle into the Schiſmatical errour of the Arians: That he ſubſcribed, and gaue his name, and hande vnto the Arians: That he fauoured the Arians: That he conſented vnto the Arians: That it is certainely knowen, he was an Arian: That in good earneſte, and with his harte, he be-

came an Arian: And that in al maters, & pointes of Doctrine, he was of one minde, and iudgemente with the Arians. If al theſe Writers were errante Liers, and ſclaunderers, as you ſaie, M. Hardinge, why then are they not ſo publiſhed to the worlde? I reckon, ye wil not ſaie, they were al Lutherans.

But, touchinge that Pope Liberius was a fauourer of the Arian Heretiques, I haue ſaide further, The Authour hereof is S. Hierome, De Scriptoribus Eccleſiaſticis in Fortunatiano. And one of M. Hardinges owne principal Doctours ſaithe, De Liberio Papa conſtat, fuiſſe Arianum. Herevnto M. Hardinge, you haue anſwearde thus:

M. Har. fo. 26. a.

Here haue wee twoo newe Vntruthes added to the olde. S. Hierome in the place by M. Iewel alleged, ſaithe not, that Pope Liberius was a fauourer of the Arians.

The Anſweare. Then, M. Hardinge, maie it like you, to heare Cardinalis Cuſanus, what he can telle you. I truſte, you wil not diſcredite him with ſo many Vntruthes. He was a Cardinal of the Churche of Rome. His woordes be theſe, as you haue heарde before: Redijt Liberius ab exilio victus, & conſenſit errori, vt ſcribit S. Hieronymus in Chronicis; *Pope* Liberius *returned from Banniſhmente, and yeelded, and conſented vnto the errour* (of the Arians) *as* S. Hierome *writeth in* Chronicis. If Hieronyme, and conſentinge be not ſufficient, Rhegino ſaithe further, *He fauoured the Heretiques.* Sabellicus ſaithe, *As ſomme haue written, he became an* Arian *in good earneſt.* Platina ſaithe, *By the reporte of ſomme, he agreed in al thinges with the Heretiques.* But hereof wee haue ſufficiently ſpoken before.

Nicol. Cuſan. de Concordan. Lib. 2. Cap. 5.

Fauet Hæreticis Ex confeſſo. In rebus omnibus conſenſit cum Hæreticis.

Further ye ſaie, But who is that one of M. Hardinges principal Doctoures, that ſaithe theſe woordes, *De Liberio conſtat, fuiſſe Arianum?* What is the cauſe, that here M. Iewel, nameth him not? Is he growen more ſhamefaced, then heretofore, that he woulde be lothe, to be founde a notorious Lier, wel thoughe he were aſhamed to be taken with a Lie, yet was he not aſhamed to make a Lie. This principal Doctoure of mine is *Alphonſus de Caſtro.* Howe maie this be knowen? Forſooth, e euen by M. Iewel him ſelfe, who in his pretenced Defenſe writeth thus, where without al errour, ye maie be ſure, he bringeth muche matter, to ſhewe, that the Pope doothe erre. Certainely Alphonſus ſaith, &c. And where ſaith Alphonſus thus? Marie, ſaith M. Iewel, in his Marginal quotation, *Alphonſus contra Hæreſes, Lib. 1. Cap. 4.* But reade that Chapter who wil: Verily in the Bookes of ſundrie printes, that I haue ſeene, he ſaithe it not. If it were once ſo printed, and afterwarde by the Authour reuoked, it ought not to be alleged.

M. Hard. Fo. 63.

The Anſweare. But who (ſaie you) is that one of M. Hardinges principal Doctoures? Peuiſe, M. Hardinge, ye are not ignorante, who it is. Al poore game is ſpitte in vaine. Roman was readye to ſpare you the laughter. Alphonſus it is: And Alphonſus de Caſtro, in his Booke intituled, De Hæreſibus, printed at Pariſe by Iodocus Badius in Folio: An. 1534. If it haue ben otherwiſe altered ſithence, we maie eaſily imagine, who were the doers. Certainely thus ſaithe Alphonſus, Omnis homo errare poteſt in Fide, etiamſi Papa ſit. Nam de Liberio Papa, conſtat fuiſſe Arianum: & Anaſtaſium Papam fuiſſe Neſtorianis, qui Hiſtorias legerit, non dubitat. Quòd autem alij dicunt, eum, qui errauerit in Fide obſtinatè, iam non eſſe Papam, ac per hoc affirmant, Papam non poſſe eſſe Hæreticum, eſt in re ſeria verbis velle iocari. Non enim dubitamus, An Hæreticum eſſe, & Papam eſſe, in vnum coire poſſint: Sed id quærimus, An hominem, qui aliàs in Fide errare potuiſſet, dignitas Pontificalis efficiat in Fide indeuiabilem. Non enim credo, aliquem eſſe adeò impudentem Papæ aſſentatorem, vt ei tribuere hoc velit, vt nec errare, nec in Interpretatione ſacrarum Scripturarum hallucinari poſsit. Nam, cùm conſtet, plures eorum adeò eſſe illiteratos, vt Grammaticam penitùs ignorent, qui fit, vt Sacras Literas interpretari poſsint?

Lib. 1. Cap. 4.

Yea although it be the Pope.

Euery man maie Erre in the Faithe, yea althoughe it be the Pope.

It is certaine.

For, as touchinge Pope Liberius it is certaine, that he was an Arian *Heretique.*

wee make no doubte.

Neither can any man doubte, that hath readde the Stories, but Pope Anaſtaſius *was a fauourer of the* Neſtorians.

So Impudent a flatterer.

But whereas ſome ſaie, that he, that Erreth wilfully in the Faithe, is nowe no lenger Pope, and therefore ſaie, the Pope cannot be an Heretique, they ſeeme in a ſadde mater to dallie with woordes. For wee make no doubtes, whether the Pope, and an Heretique maie agree in one perſonne. But this is oure queſtion, whether a man, that otherwiſe might haue Erred in the Faithe, by vertue of the Papal Dignitie be made ſtaiche, as cannot Erre? For I doo not beleeue, that there is any ſo impudente a Flatterer of the Pope, that wil geeue him this preeminence, that he can neither be deceiued, nor miſſe in the expoundinge of the Scriptures. For ſeeinge

Succeſſion.

is wel knowen, that many Popes be ſo vtterly voide of Learning, that they knowe not the Principles of theire Grammare, howe maie it be, that they ſhoulde be hable to expounde the Scriptures.

Popes know not theire Grammare Rules.

Alphonſus Co-lenſis. An. 1539.

Thus ſaith my Alphonſus, M. Hardinge, printed at Pariſe fine and thirtie yeres agoe. In like ſorte, and with the very ſame wordes was the ſame Bolke afterward Printed at Colaine by Arnolde Brickman, Anno 1539. What other newe Bokes, or newe ſpectacles you haue gotten you, I cannot Imagine. Euen to like youre purpoſe writteth Nicolaus Cuſanus, a Cardinal of Rome, Iudicium Fidei non eſt ſemper in nutu vnius Pontificis definibile: quia Hæreticus eſſe poteſt: *The Iudgemente of Faithe, is not alwaies to be determined by the becke of the Pope alone: for the Pope maie poſſibly be an Heretique.*

Nicol. Cuſan. de Concordan. Lib. 1. Cap. 16.

The Pope maie be an Heretique.

That Pope Leo, as appeareth by the Legende, was likewiſe an Arian.

Addition. M. Hardinge. As it appeareth by the Legende. VVhat an obſcure proufe is this? Forſoothe there is an olde Motheeaten Booke, wherein Sainctes Liues are ſaide to be conteined &c. It ſhal not greatly ſkil, who was the Authour of it. Certaine it is, that emonge ſomme true Stories, there be many vaine Fables written. Emonge whiche is one &c.

Addition

M. Hard. 13. a. b.

The Anſweare. This Boke was not ſo mutche Motheeaten, nor ſo farre out of credite, M. Hardinge, as you telle vs. It was readde ſaely vnto the people, and had in reuerence, when the Holy Scriptures of God were Motheeaten, and throwen in to corners: and it was called Aurea Legenda, as you knowe, the Golden Legende, for the excellencie, that it ſeemed to haue aboue al other Stories. Thus were you hable in youre Kingedome of darkeneſſe, to geue the people Diſſe, and to calle it Coulde: and to leade them into the Clowdes, and ſhadowes of Deathe: and yet to make them beleue, they walke in the Lighte.

As for this mater of Pope Leo, I reporte it not, as a certaine truthe, as it might appeare vnto you by my wordes. I leaue the credite thereof to the Authour. If it be a Fable, it is your owne: it is not ours. Thus mutche at the leaſte, we maie reaſonably gather hereof: Although Pope Leo were no Arian, yet, notwithſtandinge his Popedome, and the Succeſſion of Peter, by this Authours iudgemente, he mighte wel haue benne an Arian.

That Pope Cœleſtinus was a Neſtorian Heretique.

Addition. M. Hardinge. VVho euer heard ſutche an impudent man? It was Cœleſtinus, whiche condemned Neſtorius &c. A moſte impudent Lier: A wicked Sclaunderer.

Addition

The Anſweare. Theſe outcries ful wel becomme you, M. Hardinge. Beſtow youre ſhame vpon him, that hathe beſte deſerued it. *Pope Cœleſtinus* (you ſaie) condemned Neſtorius, and al his Hereſies. So did Pope Liberius, as it is ſaide before, condemne the Arians: And yet afterwarde him ſelfe became an Arian. This is a caſe, that often happeneth, and maie be proued by ſundrie examples. You youre ſelfe, M. Hardinge, haue preached mightily, and terribly againſte the Romaine Religion, as you maie remember: And yet ſithence, we knowe, we are becomme a Defender, and Patrone of the ſame. This mater, that ſo mutche greeueth you, touchinge Pope Cœleſtinus, is recorded by Laurentius Valla, no Lutherane, I trowe, but a greate Learned man, and a Canon of the Churche of Rome. His wordes be theſe: Neque aliquem ſua dignitas ab increpationibus tutum reddit, quæ Petrum non reddidit: multoſque alios eodem prædito gradu, vt Marcellum, quod Dijs libaſſet, vt Cœleſtinum, quòd cum Neſtorio Hæretico ſentiret: *No mannes dignitie maie defende him from controlmente, (if he offende) for* Peter *was not ſo defended: nor many others, that were auaunced to the ſame degree: as Pope* Marcellus (or rather Pope Marcellinus) *for that he had offered vp Sacrifice vnto Idolles: And as Pope* Cœleſtinus, *for that he agreed with the Heretique* Neſtorius. Here you finde plainely by expreſſe wordes, M. Hardinge, that Pope Cœleſtinus was a Neſtorian Heretique. Nowe, if you be ſo mutche aſhamed hereof, returne the ſhame to Rome againe hardely, from whence it came: either to Laurentius Valla, that ſente it hither: or to the Pope him ſelfe, that beſte deſerued it.

Laur. Valla, de Donatione Conſtantini.

Pope Cœleſtinus a Neſtorian Heretique.

That Pope Honorius was a Monothelite Heretique.

Addition. ☞ M. Hardinge. Nowe at length, M. Iewel, you saie that, which hath some face of Truthe. For Honorius in deede selle into the Heresie of the Monothelites. But he selle into it, when as yet it was not euidently condemned by the Churche in any General Councel &c. It standeth wel togeather, that Pope Honorius, al be it in his owne personne he fauoured that Heresie, yet durst not to publish it in common assemblie. but contrariwise did there, as they gaue him Counsel. Whereby it came to passe, that he both deposed the Monothelites openly, and yet fauoured their opinion priuily. And this is the onely Pope, who maie iustely be burdened with Heresie. Addition ☞

M. Hard. 131.

The Answeare. Here is a proper Defense, and a proper Pope. Openly, abroade, he condemneth them as Heretiques, whome priuily in his harte he alloweth, and liketh as Catholiques. This onely Pope (you saie) maie be iustly charged with Heresie. For in deede he selle into the Heresie of the Monothelites. Al this is your owne Confession, M. Hardinge. And yet, whereas I saie, the same Pope Honorius was a Monothelite Heretique, you telle me, That this tale hathe somme face of Truthe. Somme face, you saie, and nomore. For Truthe it selfe ye dare not allowe me: be it neuer so true. ☞

Iustly charged.

In deede.

That Pope Iohn 22. was reproued by Gerson, and the Schole of Parise for an Heretique: Petrarcha saithe, Rome *is a Sanctuarie of al Heresies:* Lyra saithe, *That many Popes haue fallen into Heresies.*

Nicol. Lyra in Matthe. cap. 16.

Addition. ☞ M. Hardinge. He saithe many, as wel Princes, as Chiefe Priestes haue fallen from the Faithe: but not that many haue Decreed Heresies, as to be folowed. But I finde not those Many, nor yet M. Iewel him selfe, as diligente as he is aboute it. Addition ☞

M. Har. fo. 256.

The Answeare. I maruelle not, M. Hardinge, though ye finde not these Many. For ye seke, as a man, that woulde not finde them. I haue already reckened seuen Popes, that were Heretiques. Ye maie adde thereunto Pope Anastasius 2. an Arian Heretique. If al these maie not be countped Many in the See of Rome, ye maie at your pleasure calle them Fewe. The Lawe saithe, Decem faciunt populum: *Tenne menne are yenoughe to make a people.* Vtche more eighte menne are yenough to make Many. Verily I knowe not any one See in al Europe, wherein you can lightly finde so Many Heretiques, as we haue founde sittinge in Peters Chaire. Nicolaus Lyra saithe, Many *Popes haue fallen from the Faithe.* But you make smal accounpte of his Authoritie. Adde therefore to him the Councel of Basile. There shal you finde the selfe same wordes, Multi Pontifices in Errores, & Hæreses lapsi esse leguntur: *We reade, that* Many *Popes haue fallen into Errours, and Heresies.* Adde also Aeneas Syluius, beinge afterwarde a Pope him selfe. Thus he saithe: De Romanis Pontificibus liceret exempla admodum multa adferre, si tempus sineret: quoniam aut Hæretici, aut alijs imbuti vitijs sunt reperti: *Of the Popes of Rome wee might shewe fiorthe very Many examples, if time woulde suffer it, that they haue benne founde either Heretiques, or els defiled with other vices.* Thus you haue by the witnesse bothe of a Pope, and of a Councel, that Many, and Very Many Popes haue benne Heretiques. ☞

Pulgosius. De inuitatu Mortu generib. 10. quæst. 3. Vnio.

Con. Basilien. in Epist. Synodali.

Æneas Sylui. De Gestis Concil. Basil. Lib. 1.

Very Many.

You knowe, that Pope Hildebrande, as he was charged by the Councel of Brixia, was an Aduouterer, a Churcherobber, a Periured man, a Mankiller, a Sorcerer, and a Renegate of the Faithe.

M. Har. 256. b.

Addition. ☞ M. Hardinge. I knowe that you Lie: I maie saie it, sauinge my Charitie, rather then your worshipp. For Pope Gregorie the Seuenth was a very holy man &c. If you were but a Ciuile honeste man, M. Iewel, you woulde not take that for a Truthe, whiche one enimie saithe of an other. By perusinge of Marianus Scotus, Platina, Lambertus Scaphnaburgensis, and Nauclerus, you shal finde your selfe a Lier, and Pope Hildebrande a vertuous man. Addition ☞

M. Hard. 257. a.

The Answeare. No doubte, M. Hardinge, a Holy, and a Vertuous man, and very mutche like vnto the Apostles of Christe: But wherein, I beleeue, ye cannot readily telle vs: onelesse it were, for that he was prowde, and stately aboue al measure, and suffered the Emperour Henrie the Fourth to waite vpon him in Italie before the gates of Canossus, without his Imperial Roabes, in the winter season, in harde froste, and extreme colde, with bare legges, and bare face, three daies togeather, before he woulde once admitte him to his presence. Thus, I trowe, Peter, and Paule but seldome did.

Sabel. Ennead. 9 Lib. 3.

Blondus Decad. 2. Lib. 3.

Beno. *Beno,* (you saie) was his enimie, and wrote of displeasure, and therfore his words weigh the lesse. So maie I saie, Marianus Scotus was his friende, and wrote of fauoure, and therefore

fore his wordes like wise weighe the lesse. In deede Beno, that lived with him, and best knewe him, saithe thus: That Hildebrande beinge as yet but a Cardinal, smote Pope Alexander with his fiste, & later him in prison: That he poisoned fire Popes his Predecessours, to make him selfe waie to the Popedome: That he was a Conjurer, and a raiser of Diuelles, and that in his furie he threwe the Sacramente into the fiere. But, leaste onely Beno shoulde beare al the blame, a greate number of Catholique Bishoppes in Italie, at the Councel of Brixia, called Hildebrande then beinge Pope, *A false Monke: An Usurper of the See of* Rome: *Not appointed by God: but intruded by fraude, and Monie: A disturber of the Empire, A Subuerter of the Churche.* Now be it, you saie, Al these Bishoppes conspired togeather againste our Lorde, and against his Vicare. Vrspergen. An. 1080.

Anselmus Rid saithe, *That Pope* Hildebrande *by his meanes had made the leadden Swerde of the Popes Authoritie so mightie, that it had vtterly dulled, and defaced the yron Sword of the Empire: and that in the time of his Popedome bothe the Ecclesiastical, and the Temporal Jurisdiction was shaken, and broken with infinite miseries.* M Har. f. 257. a Anselmus Rid.

Sigibertus Gemblacensis saithe, *Pope* Hildebrande *troubled the States of Christendome: raised vp the* Saxons *againste their liege Prince: discharged the Subiectes from their Othe of Fidelitie: caused* Rodolphus *the* Duke *of* Burgundie *to Proclaime him selfe Emperoure, and sente him a Crowne Emperial with this Posee,* Sigibertus Gemblacensis. An. 1074.

Petra dedit Petro: Petrus Diadema Rodolpho.

In the ende the Citizens of Rome *expelled him, and chased him out of the Cuie: not for any his greate vertue, or Holinesse, I trowe: for* Rome *is Holy. By meane of the griefe, and agonie hereof, he fel into Melancholie, and deadly Diseases, and findinge him selfe paste al recouerie, he called vnto him one of his* Cardinalles, *whome he specially trusted, and confessed vnto him, that he had fowly abused his Pastoral Office, and that he had troubled mankinde with Malice, and mischiefe, by the procurement and Counsel of the Diuel.* Sigibertus An. 1085. Se valde peccasse pastorali cura & suadente Diabolo contra humanum genus odium, & iram concitasse.

And yet, M. Hardinge, must we beleue you vpon the credite of your worde, That Pope Hildebrande was so vertuous, and so godly a man? Or is it a matter of lutche Vertue, and Honestie to trouble the Churche of God with Warres, and Murders, and to folowe the Counsel of the Diuel? Though we maie falsely discredite others, yet maie you not discredite the Pope him selfe. This is the Popes owne Confession, openlie vttered vnto his Ghostely Father, immediately before his deathe. Though Beno were an enimie vnto him, yet was he no enimie vnto him selfe.

But you saie, Reade Lambertus Scaphnaburgensis, Nauclerus, and others: and you shal finde your selfe to be a Lier. What saie they then, M. Hardinge? Verily Lambertus saithe thus, Clerici clamant, Hildebrandum esse hominem planè Hæreticum, & vesani Dogmatis: *The Priestes crie out againste Pope* Hildebrande, *and calle him a plaine Heretique, and a man of wicked Doctrine.* M. Hard. 257. a. Lambertus Scaphnabur.

You wil saie, Lambertus vttereth not this, as his owne Judgemente. I graunte you that. Yet he vttereth it, as the Judgemente of the Clergie.

In like sorte also saithe Nauclerus, *The Clergie saide, that Pope* Hildebrande, *for good causes, was excommunicate by al the Bishoppes of* Italie: *that he had Defiled the See Apostolique with Simonie, Heresie, Murder, and Aduoutrie: that he was an* Apostata, *and had forsaken the Faithe of Christe.* Nauler. Gener. 26.

And, leaste you should saie, he vttereth these wordes, as spoken by his enimies, and not as of him selfe, in the ende he concludeth thus: Quæ Hildebrandi tempore in Republica Christiana sunt acta, huiusmodi ferè sunt, vt Scriptores dubitent, an Honestatis argumento, & Fidei zelo ab eo gesta sint: *The thinges that were donne in the time of Pope* Hildebrandus, *were sutche for the moste parte, that the Writers doubte, whether they were donne in consideration of Honeste Order, and zeale of Faithe, or rather otherwise.* Nauclerus Generatio. 37.

You saie, He was zelously bent, to correcte such faultes, aswere in the Clergie at that time, specially Simonie. Yea, M. Hardinge, but Sigibertus saithe thus, speakinge of Pope Hildebrande by name: Notam Auaritiæ Honesto nomine prætexunt, dum hoc, quod se gratis dare iactant, sub Charitatis nomine vendunt: vt de Montanis dicit Eusebius, Sub nomine Oblationis artificiosius munera accipiunt: *They couer the shame of theire Couetuousnesse* M. Hard. 257. a. Sigibert. Gemblacen. an. 1074.

vncunſneſſe with the cloke of an Honeſt name: They ſelle thinges vnder the name of Charitie: and yet they boaſte, they geeue them freely. So ſaithe Euſebius *of the Heretiques called* Montaniſtes, *They take Bribes cunningly, and with better ſkil, vnder the name of Oblations.*

Nowe, M. Hardinge, I beſeeche you, iudge vprightly: He that ſmiteth the Pope violently with his Fiſte, and with force and villanie imprſoneth his Perſon: That is a falſe Monke, a Poiſoner, a Coniurer, a Burner of Sacramentes, a Simoniſte, an Vſurper of the See, a Diſturber of the Empire, a Subuerter of the Churche, an Aduaunсer of Traitours, a Raiſer of Rebelles, a Perſon iuſtly Excommunicate, and an Heretique, maie he neuertheleſſe be called a Vertuous, and a Holy man? Is Vertue, and Holinеſſe ſo riſe in Rome?

Saue your Charitie hardly, and what Worſhip you liſte. What ſo euer ye preſume, to finde in others, it is wiſedome to ſeе afore hande, what maie be founde worthily in your ſelfe.

Platyna in Rot mano. 1.

That Platina calleth the Popes ſommetimes in ſcorne, Pontificulos, *Litle Petite Popes:* ſommetimes Monſtra, & Portenta, *Monſters, and vnnatural, and il ſhapen Creatures.* Pope Adrian the fourth was wonte to ſaie, Succedimus, non Petro in Paſcendo, ſed Romulo in Parricidio: *Wee Succeede, not* Peter *in Feedinge, but* Romulus *in Killinge.*

Petrus Pariſien. in Speculo citatur ab Illyrico De Teſtibus.

And to leaue Dame Iohane the woman Pope, with many others moe of like Vertue, and Holinеſſe, as hauinge no pleaſure in this reherſal: And, for as much as M. Hardinge begaane this mater with Sariſburie, to ende it with the ſame, Iohannes Sariſburienſis ſaithe, In Romana Eccleſia ſedent Scribæ, & Phariſæi: *In the Churche of* Rome (by Succeſſion) *ſitte the Scribes, and Phariſeis.*

Iohan. Sariſburien. in Polycratico.

This is M. Hardinges Holy Succeſſion. Though Faithe faile, yet Succeſſion muſte holde. For vnto ſuch Succeſſion God hath bounde the Holy Ghoſt. For lacke of this Succeſſion, for that in our Sees in the Churches of Englande, we finde not ſo many Idolatours, Necromancers, Heretiques, Aduouterers, Churcherobbers, Periured Perſones, Pankillers, Renegates, Monſters, Scribes, & Phariſeis, as we maie eaſily finde in the Churche of Rome, therefore, I trowe, M. Hardinge ſaithe, we haue no Succeſſion: we are no Biſhoppes: we haue no Churche at al.

Addition. ☞ M. Hardinge. Are you not aſhamed, thus notoriouſly, and withal moſte ſclanderouſly to belie that moſte Bleſſed Succeſſion of the Biſhop of Rome? Addition ☞

But S. Paule ſaithe, *Faithe commeth* (not by Succeſſion, but) *by hearinge: and hearing commeth* (not of Legacie, or Enheritance from Biſhop to Biſhop, but) *of the Woord of God.* They are not alwaies Godly, that Succeede the Godly. Manaſſes ſucceeded Ezechias: & Hieroboam ſucceeded Dauid. By Succeſſion the Turke this date poſſeſſeth, and holdeth the foure greate Patriarkal Sees of the Churche, Conſtantinople, Alexandria, Antioche, and Hieruſalem. By Succeſſion, Chriſte ſaithe, Deſolation *ſhal ſitte in the Holy Place:* And Antichriſte ſhal preſſe into the rome of Chriſte.

Matthe. 24. M. Hard. 266. b. 267. a.

Addition. ☞ M. Hardinge. Doothe Chriſte ſaie, It ſhal be ſo by Succeſſion? You falſifie the woordes of God, and Man: and that verily by Succeſſion. For ſo haue al Heretiques your Forefathers donne before you. Succeſſion is the chiefe waie for any Chriſtian man to auoide Antichriſte &c. For Antichriſte commeth not, excepte Defection, and Apoſtacie goe before. Addition ☞

The Anſweare. I woulde be lothe, M. Hardinge, to falſifie the woordes either of God, or of Man. Touchinge the Succeſſion of Place, whereof onely we ſpeake, Chriſte ſaithe, Deſolation *ſhal ſtande in the Holy Place.* And S. Paule ſaithe, *Antichriſte ſhal ſitte in the Place of* Chriſte. The ſame Place, that receiued the one, ſhal receiue the other. Otherwiſe telle vs, I praie you, M. Hardinge, in what other Place ſhal he ſitte? Or, why dothe S. Paule ſaie, *Antichriſte ſhal ſitte in the Temple of God.* Or, why dothe S. Auguſtine, and S. Chryſoſtome ſaie, *Antichriſte ſhall ſitte in the Churche of* Chriſte.

2. Theſſal. 2. Augu. de Antichriſto. Tomo 9. Chryſ. in 2. Epiſt. ad Theſſa Ho. 3.

Succeſſion (you ſaie) is the chiefe waie, for any Chriſtian man to auoide Antichriſte. I graunt you, if you meane the Succeſſion of Doctrine. Therefore S. Paule ſaithe, *In*

the

Succeſsion of Popes.

the later daies ſomme ſhal departe from the Faithe. He ſaithe not, They ſhal depart from their Place, but *from theire Faithe.* And S. Iohn ſaithe, *If any man comme vnto you, and bringe not this Doctrine, ſalute him not.* He ſaithe not, If he kepe not his Place, but, *If he bringe not this Doctrine.* It is the Doctrine, whereby Antichriſt ſhal be knowen, and not his Place. For, as I haue ſaide, *He ſhal ſitte in the Place of Chriſte.*

1. Tim 4.
2. Iohan.

You ſaie, Antichriſte ſhal not comme, except a Defection, or Departinge goe before. What Defection, or what Departinge, M. Hardinge? Meane you a Departinge from the Pope? What ſo euer you meane, verily S. Paule meaneth a Departing from Chriſt. And ſo the Olde Learned Fathers haue expounded it. In like ſenſe S. Paule ſaithe, *The time ſhal come, when they ſhal not beare wholeſome Doctrine. They ſhal ſtoppe theire eares againſt the Truthe. They ſhal turne them ſelues to heare fables.* And, what if the Pope him ſelfe be Departed from Chriſte? Yet muſt we nedes kepe him compante, and Departe together? Verily, as I haue otherwheres reported, The Biſhop of Bitonto doubted not, openly to ſaie in the late Councel of Tridente, Vtinam non a Chriſto ad Antichriſtum, velut prorſus vnanimes, declinaſſent: *Would God, they were not gonne from Chriſte to Antichriſte, as it were, with one conſente.* And thus he pronounceth of the Pope, and of his Clergie of the Churche of Rome. Nicolaus Lyra aboue two hundred and fiftie yeres agoe, ſaide thus: Ab Eccleſia Romana iam diu eſt, quòd receſſit Gratia: *It is longe ſithence the Grace of God is Departed from the Churche of Rome.* This, this, M. Hardinge, is the Departinge that S. Paule ſpeaketh of. Not ours Departinge from the Pope, but the Popes Departinge from the Grace of God. From whiche Grace, who ſo euer is Departed, is Departed from Chriſte.

M. Hard. 167 a.
2. Timoth. 4.
Concil. Trident.
Nicol. Lyra in 2. ad Theſſalon. 2.

Now, M. Hardinge, if the Pope, and his Romaine Clergie, by his owne frendes Confeſſion, be fallen from Goddes Grace, and Departed from Chriſt to Antichriſt, what a miſerable Claime is it for them, to holde onely by bare Succeſsion?

It is not ſufficient, to claime Succeſsion of place: It behoueth vs rather to haue regarde to the Succeſsion of Doctrine. S. Bernarde ſaithe, Quid prodeſt, ſi Canonicè eligantur, & non Canonicè viuant: *What auaileth it, if they be choſen in Order, and liue out of Order?* So ſaithe S. Auguſtine, Ipſum Characterem multi, & Lupi, & Lupis imprimunt: *The outwarde marke, or righte of a Biſhop, many geue to Woulues, and be Woulues them ſelues.* Therefore the Ancient Father Irenæus geueth vs this good Counſel: Eis qui ſunt in Eccleſia, Presbyteris, obaudire oportet, qui Succeſsionem habent ab Apoſtolis, qui cum Epiſcopatus Succeſsione, Charisma Veritatis certum, ſecundum beneplacitum Patris acceperunt: *It becommeth vs, to obeie thoſe Prieſtes in the Church, which haue theire* Succeſsion *from the Apoſtles: and togeather with the* Succeſsion *of theire Biſhoprikes, according to the good wil of God the Father, haue receiued* the vndoubted guifte of the Truthe. S. Cyprian beinge like wiſe charged for diſſentinge from his Predeceſſours, anſwereth thus: Si quis de Anteceſſoribus meis, non hoc obſeruauit, & tenuit, quod nos Dominus exemplo, & Magiſterio ſuo docuit, poteſt ſimplicitati eius venia concedi: Nobis verò ignoſci non poteſt, qui nunc a Domino admoniti, & inſtructi ſumus: *If any of my Predeceſſoures haue not obſerued, and keapte the ſame, that oure Lorde hathe taughte vs bothe by his example, and alſo by his Commaundemente, his ſimplicitie muſt be pardoned. But wee (if we doo the like) can hope for no pardone, beinge nowe admoniſhed, and inſtructed of our Lorde.*

Bernar. in Concil. Remen.
Auguſt. contra Donatiſt. Lib. 6. c. 3. Pacianus Canes.
Irena. li. 4. ca. 43
Lib. 2. Epiſt. 3.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ M. Hardinge. Coughe vp man. It wil choke you, if you let it tarry within your throte. Here is but halfe the boane. There is yet in Cyprian no ſul pointe. It foloweth in the ſame ſentence, *Ut Calicem Dominicum vino mixtum, ſecundum quod Dominus obtulit, offeramus.* That we ſhould offer our Lords Cuppe mixte with wine, accordingly as our Lord offered the ſame &c. Doo they offer our Lordes Chalice at al? Or, doo they graunte that our Lorde in his Supper offered it? Doo they mingle water with wine at the time of Conſecratinge the Myſteries? What folie, what madneſſe &c.

M. Hard. 269 a.
M. Hard. 269 b.

The Anſwere. There is no ſuche danger of Boanes, M. Hardinge. The childe ſhal do wel ynoughe by Goddes grace. I make no mention (you ſaie) of offeringe our Lordes Cuppe. I graunte you. Nowe do I of many other thinges in the ſame Epiſtle contained. What then? Shoulde I for your pleaſure haue alleged, and tranſlated the whole Epiſtle? Or, haue you Decreed it to be an Hereſie, if a man

a man allege nomore, then is néedeful? Or, haue I reported any maner vntruthe? Or, ſtande the wordes otherwiſe, then I haue reported them? In this place I had cauſe onely to ſpeake of Succeſsion: but, to ſpeake of Sacrifice, I had no cauſe. Howbe it, as you knowe, in fiue hundred other places, as time required, I haue ſpoken alſo fully, and largely of the Sacrifice: And yet peraduenture without any greate danger of Choakinge. Suche childiſhe toies are méete for children.

S. Cyprian ſaithe, *Wee offer our Lordes Cuppe mixte with Wine.* But he ſaithe not, as you ſaie, VVee offer vp the Sonne of God Subſtantialy, and Really vnto his Father. Take awaie onely that Blaſphemie, wherewith you haue Deceiued the worlde: and then talke of minglinge the Cuppe, & of the Sacrifice, while yée liſte. S. Cyprian ſaithe, *Wee offer the Lordes Cuppe*, meaninge thereby, the Wine contained in the Cuppe. So likewiſe S. Auguſtine ſaith, Eccleſia offert Sacrificium Panis, & Vini: *The Church offereth vp the Sacrifice of Breade, and Wine.* If there be any Darkeneſſe in this maner of ſpeache, both S. Cyprian, and S. Auguſtine haue plainely expounded theire meaninge. S. Cyprian in the ſame Epiſtle before alleaged, ſaithe thus,

Auguſt. de Fide ad Petrum, ca. 19 Cyprian Lib. 2. Epiſt. 3.

Calix in Commemorationem Chriſti offertur: Vino Chriſti Sanguis oſtenditur: Ideò Vinum ponitur, vt Domini Sanguis Vino intelligatur: Aqua ſola (ſine Vino) non poteſt exprimere Sanguinem Chriſti: In Aqua Populus intelligitur: In Vino oſtenditur Sanguis Chriſti: Paſſionis Chriſti memoriam in omnibus Sacrificijs facimus: Paſsio Domini eſt Sacrificium, quod offerimus: *The Cuppe is offered in Remembrance of* Chriſte: *By the Wine* Chriſtes *Bloude is ſhewed* (or Signified): *Therefore Wine is vſed, that by Wine wee maie vnderſtande the Lordes Bloude: Water onely without Wine, cannot expreſſe the Bloude of Chriſte: In the Water wee vnderſtande the People: In the Wine Chriſtes Bloude is repreſented: In al our Sacrifices, wee woorke the Memorie of Chriſtes Paſſion: The Sacrifice, that wee offer, is the Paſſion of our Lorde.* Thus mutche S. Cyprian in the ſame Epiſtle. S. Auguſtine ſaithe, In hoc Sacrificio eſt gratiarum actio, & Commemoratio Carnis Chriſti, quam pro nobis obtulit, & Sanguinis eius, quem pro nobis effudit: *In this Sacrifice is a thankes geeuinge, and a Remembrance of the Fleaſhe of Chriſte, that he hathe offered for vs, and of the Bloude of Chriſte that he ſheadde for vs.* Thus ſaithe S. Cyprian: Thus ſaithe S. Auguſtine: Thus ſaie the Olde Godly Learned Fathers of the Churche of Chriſte. Theſe are no Boanes, M. Hardinge: they are the Foode of euerlaſtinge Life.

Auguſt. de Fide ad Petrum, ca. 19

Compare the vſe, and order of our Churches, M. Hardinge, with the Primitiue Churche of God, and yée ſhal eaſily ſée the right of out Succeſsion. S. Cyprian ſaithe, Si Canalis aquæ, quæ copioſè priùs, & largiter profluebat, ſubitò deficiat, nónne ad Fontem pergitur? &c. Hoc & nunc facere oportet Dei Sacerdotes Præcepta Diuina ſeruantes, vt in aliquo ſi nutauerit, & vacillauerit Veritas, ad originem Dominicam, & Euangelicam atq; Apoſtolicam Traditionem reuertamur: & inde ſurgat actus noſtri ratio, vnde & Ordo, & Origo ſurrexit: *If the Pipes of the Conduit, whiche before ranne with abundance, happen to faile, doo wee not vſe to ſearche the Heade? &c. The Prieſtes of God keepinge Goddes Commaundementes, muſte doo the ſame: that if the Truthe haue fainted, or failed in any pointe*, wee returne to the very Original of our Lorde, and to the Tradition of the Goſpel, and of the Apoſtles: *that therehence wee maie take the diſcretion of our doinges, from whence the Order is ſelfe, and Original firſte beganne.*

Cyprian ad Pompeium contra Epiſt. Stephani.

M. Hard. 171. *Addition.* M. Hardinge. It is to be knowen, M. Iewel, that S. Cyprian vſed that ſaieinge in an euil caſe. And therefore, he defendinge a Falſehoode, was driuen to the very ſame ſhiftes, whereunto al Heretiques are driuen. Addition

The Anſwere. What ſo euer were S. Cyprians caſe, verily, M. Hardinge hathe deuiſed but a poore defenſe for him ſelfe. For, alas, what a ſimple ſhifte is this, to ſaie, that ſo Holy a Father, and Martyre of Chriſte, was driuen to vſe the ſhiftes of al Heretiques? Graunte wée, that S. Cyprian ſtoode in ſomme errour. Yet let vs ſée, what were his Heretical ſhiftes. Thus he ſaithe, *If the Truthe fainte, or faile in any pointe, wee ought to returne to the Original of our Lorde, and to the Tradition of the Goſpel, &c.* Had is this the ſhifte of al Heretiques, to ſubmitte them ſelues, and their cauſes, to the trial of Goddes Truthe? Or dothe noman vſe this kinde of

ſhifte,

Confessi-
on not ne-
cessarie.

shifte, but onely Heretiques? Wherefore then dothe Christe so often vse the same? Wherefore dothe Christe saie, *From the beginninge it was not thus: It is written in the Scriptures: Searche the Scriptures?* Wherefore dothe the Prophete Esaie saie, *Resorte to the Lawe, and to the Testimonie of our Lorde?* Wherefore dothe Tertullian saie, Peræquè ad Vniuersas Hæreses iam hinc præiudicatum est, id esse verum, quodcunque primum: id esse adulterum, quodcunque posterius? *By this Rule, wee maie equally prescribe againste al Heretiques: That is true, that was firste appointed: That is false, that was afterwarde Deuised.* It were harde to saie, that Christe, his Apostles, the Prophetes, and holy Fathers were Shifters, and Heretiques.

Matthæ. 19. Iohan. 5. & 7. Tertul. aduersus Praxeam.

Yet notwithstandinge, M. Hardinge saithe, VVee maie not be leadde by S. Cyprians Rule. It is a shifte, and a practise of Heretiques. This therefore muste be his Rule: Althoughe the Truthe fainte, or faile in any pointe, yet maie wee not returne to the Original of our Lorde, nor to the Tradition of the Gospel. S. Cyprian saithe, Non debemus hominis Consuetudinem sequi, sed Veritatem Dei: *Wee maie not folowe the Custome of man, but the Truthe of God.* Nay saithe M. Hardinge, This is the shifte of al Heretiques. We maie not folowe the Truthe of God, but the Custome of man. S. Cyprian saithe, Relicto Errore, sequamur Veritatem: *Forsakinge Errour, let vs folowe the Truthe.* Naie, saithe M. Hardinge, So doo Heretiques: This is but a shifte. VVee muste leaue the Truthe, and folowe Errour. If you wil nedes shifte of, and so miserably glose S. Cypians saieinges, M. Hardinge, thus verily muste you saie: And in deede, this Rule hathe of longe time bene Canonized in the Churche of Rome, and accounpted Catholique. But suche are they, of whom Christe saithe, *Yee haue broken the Commaundementes of God, to maintein your owne Traditions.* ☞

Cyprian. Lib. 2. Epist. 3.

Cyprian. ad Pompeium contra Epist. Stephani.

Matthæ. 15.

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuision. 1.

Moreouer wee saie, that Christe hathe geuen to his Ministers power to Binde, to Loose, to Open, to Shutte.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

The difference that is betwéne vs, and our Aduersaries in this whole mater, is not greate: sauinge that it liketh wel M. Hardinge to busie him selfe with nédeles quarreles without cause. Three kindes of Confession are expressed vnto vs in the Scriptures. The Firste made secretely vnto God alone: The Seconde Openly before the whole Congregation: The Thirde Priuately vnto our Brother. Of the two Former kindes there is no question. Touchinge the Thirde, if it be discretely vsed, to the greater comforte, and better satisfaction of the Penitent, without superstition, or other yl, it is not in any wise by vs reproued. The Abuses, and Errours sette aparte, wé doo nomore mislike a Priuate Confession, then a Priuate Sermon.

Thus muche onely wé saie, that Priuate Confession to be made vnto the Minister, is neither commaunded by Christe, nor necessarie to Saluation. And therefore Chrysostome saithe, Non dico tibi, vt te prodas in publicum, neq; vt te accuses apud alios. Sed obedire te volo Prophetæ dicenti, Reuela Domino viam tuam: *I wil thee, not to bewraie thee selfe openly, nor to accuse thee selfe before others: But I counsel thee, to obeie the Prophete saieinge, Open thy waie vnto the Lorde.*

Chrysost. ad Hebræos. Homil. 30.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ M. Hardinge. S. Chrysostome in this place speaketh not in deede of Sacramental Confession, but of that, whiche is daiely to be made to God alone &c. But in other places he hathe taught vs, that vnto our Priestes it is geuen vtterly to cleanse, not the Lepre of the Body, but the filthe of the Soule &c.

M. Hard. 274. b M. Ha. fol. 275. a

The Answeare. S. Chrysostome (you saie,) in these woordes, speaketh not of Sacramental Confession. No greate maruelle, M. Hardinge. For, I beleue, you cannot finde, that any Confession was knowē by that name in Chrysostomes time. But in these woordes, he speaketh of Confession to be made vnto others. Cal it Sacramental, or Priuate, or Auriculare, or What you liste. Of this kinde of Confession Chrysostome saithe, *I wil thee not to betraie thee selfe openly, nor to accuse thee selfe before other.* Thus, I trow, he would not haue saide, had he thought this kind of Confession to be necessary.

But you saie, S. *Chrysostome* saithe, Our Priestes haue power vtterly to cleanse the filthe of the

of the Soule. And who saithe otherwise? When wee Consecrate Priestes, wee pronounce Christes wordes ouer them: *Whose sinnes you doo forgeeue, they are forgeuen.*

Sozom.li.5.ca.19 But are sinnes forgeuen onely by Priuate Confession? If so, howe happened it then, that there was no Priuate Confession vsed in the Churche of Constantinople, during the whole time, that S. Chrysostome was Bishop there.

Notwithstanding, good Christian Reader, that thou maiste vnderstande the truthe of M. Hardinges dealinge, in that whole place of Chrysostome, there is no mention at al of any Confession, either Priuate, or Publique, or Sacramental, or Auriculare, or any other. Reade the place. If thou finde it otherwise, I will yelde. You will saie, He speaketh of forgeuenesse of sinnes. I knowe it wel: yet not of Confession. He speaketh of the Sacrament of Baptisme: of Preachinge, & of Prayer. By these meanes S. Chrysostome saithe, The Priest remitteth sinnes, and reconcileth God vnto the people. Who woulde thinke, that M. Hardinge woulde allege those places for Priuate Confession, whereas is not so mutche as one worde once spoken of Confession?

Chrysost. de sacerdo. Li. 3.

M. Har. fo. 275. b

M. Hardinge. Againste your Heretical proposition I wil set S. Basiles Catholike Iudgement. Thus he saithe, It is necessarie to confesse sinnes vnto them, to whome the Dispensation of the Mysteries is committed. For so they, that in olde time did penance, are founde to haue donne before the Sainctes. For it is written in the Gospel, that they confessed theire sinnes to Iohn Baptiste: In the Actes, that they confessed them to the Apostles. By S. Basile it is necessarie to confesse sinnes vnto the Priestes. By M. Iewel it is not necessarie at al. VVho is the Likelier of these twoo to be a Lier?

The Answeare. O M. Hardinge, why doo you thus abuse your simple Reader? My wordes are these, as they lie plainely before you: *That* Priuate Confession *be made vnto the Minister, it is neither commaunded by* Christe, *nor necessarie to Saluation.* To proue this Heretical Proposition, for so it pleaseth you to calle it, you haue broughte in the Catholique Iudgemente of S. Basile: But, I beseche you, emonge al theise wordes of S. Basile, is there any one worde of Priuate Confession? If there be any, let it appeare? If there be none, why doo you allege it? Marke the wordes, & examples, that S. Basile vseth. *Thus* (saithe he) *the people confessed their Sinnes to* Iohn Baptiste: *Thus they confessed theire Sinnes to the Apostles.* Thus saithe S. Basile. But did either the Apostles, or Iohn Baptiste, heare Priuate Confessions? Did they sitte downe vpon a stole, in a corner, and hearken what eche man shoulde seuerally saie vnto them? No, no, M. Hardinge, S. Basile spake onely of Publique offenses, that were knowen to many. Suche offenses it was necessarie, for the satisfaction of the Churche, to be confessed vnto the Priest, as vnto the common Minister of the whole, not secretely, or in a corner, but openly, and in the hearing of al the people. This Confession, M. Iewel saithe, is stil necessarie in the Churche of God. Nowe therefore your selfe maie iudge, to vse your owne courteous wordes, VVhether of vs is likelier to be the Lier.

De Pœnitent. dis. 1. Quamuis plenitudo.

De Pœnit. Dist. 5. In Pœnitentia in Glossa.

De Pœnit. Dist. 1. Quidam

De Pœnit. Dist 5 In Pœniten.

And Gratian, hauinge thorowly disputed, and debated the whole mater of bothe sides, in the ende leaueth it thus at large: Cui harum sententiarum potiùs adhærendum sit, Lectoris Iudicio reseruatur: Vtraque enim fautores habet Sapientes, & Religiosos Viros: *Whether of these twoo opinions it were better to folowe, it is leaft to the discretion of the Reader: For either side is fauoured, bothe by Wise, and also by Godly menne.* Therefore the Glose there concludeth thus: Melius dicitur Confessionem institutam fuisse à quadam Vniuersalis Ecclesiæ Traditione potiùs, quàm ex Noui, vel Veteris Testamenti Authoritate: *It is better to saie, that Confession was ordeined by somme Tradition of the Vniuersal Church, then by the Authoritie of the Newe, or Old Testament.* Likewise saith Theodorus, sometime Archebishop of Canturburie, a Greke borne: Quidam Deo solummodò confiteri debere peccata dicunt, vt Græci: *Some saie, wee are bounde to confesse our sinnes* onely to God, *as doo the* Grecians. Whereupon the Glose noteth thus: Apud Græcos Confessio non est necessaria: quia non emanauit ad ilos Traditio talis: *Emong the* Grecians *Confession is not necessarie, for that no such Tradition euer came emongst them.*

M. Har. fo. 71. a

But what nede many wordes? M. Hardinge him selfe in the discourse hereof, is forced to confesse, that the expresse Terme of Auricular, or Secret Confession, is seldome mentioned in the Ancient Fathers. His tale had bene truer, if he had saide thus, The Expresse terme

terme of Auriculare, or Secrete Confession, is neuer mentioned in the Auncient Fathers. Nowe to passe ouer certaine other M. Hardinges vnnecessarie talkes, whereby groweth to the mater in this sorte:

M. Hardinge.

Concerninge the Ministers of the Churche, we saie, that they open and shutte by dispensinge the Sacramentes, who haue theire vertue of the merites of Christe. For where as the Sacraments haue issued and flowed out of the side of our Sauiour Christe sleeping on the Crosse, (as by allusion wee maie vse the woordes of the old figure) wherewith the Churche is builded, therefore in the Sacramentes of the Churche, the efficacie of the passion remaineth. And for that cause to the Ministers also of the Churche, who be dispensours of the Sacramentes, a certaine power is geeuen to remoue the barre, that excludeth vs from Goddes fauour, not through theire owne, but through Goddes vertue, and power, and merite of Christes Passion. And this power is called by a metaphore, the Keie of the Churche, whiche is the Keie of Ministerie: whereof we shal speake hereafter. This power, so muche as concerneth release of sinnes, is exercised in the Sacramente of Penance, to the benefite of them, that after Baptisme be relapsed, and fallen into sinne againe. Of whiche power, no Christen man doubteth, onlesse he holde the Heresie of the Nouatians, who were condemned for Heretiques by the Churche, bicause they denied, that Priestes in the Churche had authoritie to remitte Sinnes, and so denied the Sacramente of Penaunce.

The Keie of the Churche.

For whom seueth the Sacrament of Penance Nouatian denied Penaunce.

*This sauoureth of vntruth. For Nouatus denied not Priuate, but Open Penaunce.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

That dewely receiuinge the Holy Sacramentes ordeined by Christe, wee receiue also the Remission of Sinnes, it is not any waie denied. For the Substance of al Sacramentes is the Worde of God, whiche S. Paule calleth Verbum Reconciliationis: *The Woorde of Atonemente*. This Worde is the Instrumente of Remission of Sinne. The Sacramentes are the Seales affixed to the same: The Priest is the meane. S. Augustine saithe, In Aqua Verbum mundat. Detrahe Verbum: quid est Aqua, nisi Aqua? *In the Water is the Woorde of God, that maketh cleane. Take the Woorde awaie: and what is Water els, but Water.* Hereof wee shal haue cause to saie more hereafter.

2. Corinth. 5.

Augu. in Iohan. tract. 80.

Al that is here brought in touchinge Nouatus, it is vtterly from the purpose. For Nouatus neuer denied, but a Sinner might Confesse his sinnes, either secretly to God alone, or publiquely and openly before the whole Congregation. As for Auriculare Confession to the Priest, for ought that may appeare, he neuer hearde of it. But herein stode his whole errour, that he thought, who so euer had committed any great notorious Sinne after Baptisme, notwithstandinge any Submission, or Satisfaction, he was vnable to make, yet might he neuer be reconciled vnto his Brethren, or be receiued againe into the Church: not that he would hereby driue the Penitent sorowful sinner to despaire of Gods mercie, but (as some Learned men haue thought) onely for example and terrour vnto others. And therefore Beatus Rhenanus saith, In hac sententia veterum permulti fuerunt, & in ijs etiam Augustinus.

B. Rhenanus in Argumento Libelli Tertul. De Pœnitent. Augustinus, Epistola. 54.

S. Augustine saith, Caute, salubriterq; prouisum est, vt locus illius Humilimæ Pœnitentiæ semel in Ecclesia concedatur: ne medicina vilis minùs vtilis esset ægrotis: *It hathe ben discretely, and wholesomely prouided, that it shoulde not be graunted to any man, to doo that moste humble Open Penance, but onely once in the Churche, and neuer more afterwarde: least the Medicine, beinge made ouer common, shoulde not be profitable to the Sicke.*

Thus much difference therefore we se, there was betwene the Church, and Nouatus, The Churche graunteth the Open Sinner one onely time of Open Reconciliation, and neuer more: But Nouatus graunteth none at al. Therfore the whole mater of Nouatus, might haue serued M. Hardinge to some other purpose. For confession, whether it were Priuate or Publique, was no parte of his Errour.

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuision. 2.

And (we saie) that the office of Loosinge consisteth in this pointe: that the Minister, either by the Preachinge of the Gospel, offereth the Merites of Christe, and ful Pardon to such as haue lowly & contrite hartes, and doo vnfainedly repente them selues, pronouncinge vnto the same a sure, and vndoubted forgeuenesse of their sinnes, and hope of Euerlastinge Saluation: Or els that the same Minister, when any

haue offended their Brothers mindes with somme greate offence, or notable, and open crime, whereby they haue, as it were, banniſhed, and made them ſelues ſtraungers from the Common Felowſhip, and from the Body of Chriſte, then after perfite amendement of ſutche perſonnes, dothe reconcile them, and bringe them home againe, and reſtore them to the Companie, and Vnitie of the Faithful.

M. Hardinge.

The ſumme of al theſe gaye woordes abbridged doth attribute Looſinge, or Abſolution firſt to Preachinge, nexte to aſſoilinge ſutch as be Excommunicate. As touchinge the firſte, theſe Defenders confounde the offices of Preachinge and of Abſolution. The Preacher teacheth the hearers, and reporteth the woordes of Chriſte, as out of the mouthe of Chriſte, ſaieinge: Thus ſaith Chriſte, &c. The Prieſte, whiche is the Miniſter of Abſolution, accordinge to the Authoritie geeuen to him by Chriſt, in his owne perſone aſſoileth the Penitent, ſaieinge *I aſſoile thee in the name of the Father, &c. *The Preacher in that he preacheth onely, doth not aſſoile ſinners, neither geueth he the Merites of Chriſt, nor ful pardon by pronouncinge vnto them the Goſpel. *For if that great benefite conſiſte in pronouncinge, or denouncing of the Goſpel, then why might not euery laye man, yea womenne, yea yonge boyes, and gyrles aſſoile ſinners? yea why mighte not euery man aſſoile him ſelfe? And woulde ye Sirs appointe vnto vs ſutche for Iudges conſtituted by Chriſte?

*Vntruthe. For Chriſte neuer gaue the Prieſte any ſutche Commiſsion.

*Vntruthe. For S. Hierome ſaithe, Soluunt Sermone Dei, & teſtimoniis Scripturarum.

*Vntruthe. By M Hardinges owne Doctrine Reade the Anſweare.

*The ſame power, bicauſe they haue the ſame woorde, and not otherwiſe.

For the woordes of Chriſt be ſo plaine, as they cannot be ſo violently wreſted. For Chriſte ſaide not, To whome ye offer by preachinge of the Goſpel my Merites, and Pardon, or whoſe ſinnes yee pronoûce by the goſpel to be remitted, but *quorumcunque remiſeritis*, whoſe ſo euer ſinnes yee remit, they are remitted to them For as the ſonne of man remitted ſinnes to him that was ſicke of the Palſye, and to Mary Maudelene, that ye may knowe (ſaithe he) that the ſonne of man hath Power to remitte ſinnes, &c. Euen ſo hee hath transferred * the ſame power vnto Prieſtes, ſaithe Chryſoſtome. VVhich Prieſtes he hath ſent, as the Father ſent him. And if Abſolution conſiſte in pronouncinge of the Goſpel, which profiteth ſo much as it is beleued, * then the power of the Keies whiche Chriſt hath geeuen to the Church, conſiſteth not ſo mutch in the Miniſter, as in the ſinner that heareth and beleeueth, and ſo is forgeeuen by Luthers Opinion. And by this meanes the Prieſte hath no ſpecial power. But we ſaye with the Church, that a Sacrament hath his efficacie of the inſtitution of Chriſte in him, to whom it is adhibited. In this ſence the Catholike Churche of Chriſte hathe euer taught, that God woorketh our Saluation by Sacramentes, and in this faithe it hath alwaies Baptized infantes, that their ſinnes being remitted, they might be made the children of God. * Likewiſe by the Keies of the Churche, it hath aſſoiled perſons bereft of the vſe of ſpeache and reaſon, as the Learned and Anciente Holy Father, Leo teacheth in his Epiſtle *ad Theodorum Epiſcopum Foroiulienſem*, and S. Auguſtine, *de adulterinis coniugijs, Lib. 1. Cap. 26. & vltimo.*

Iohan.20. Lib.3. de Dignitate Sacerdotij

*Vntruthe. By M Hardinges owne Doctrine Reade the Anſweare.

*The ſame power, bicauſe they haue the ſame woorde, and not otherwiſe.

* Vntruthe ioined with vaine folie.

*Vntruthe. For the Church aſſoiled not mad men: but onely pronounced them to bee aſſoiled before, when thei were ſober.

Finally, if the office of Looſinge, that is Abſolution, conſiſteth in Preachinge the Goſpel, and offeringe the Merites of Chriſte by pronouncinge the wootdes, in which the remiſsion of our ſinnes is expreſſed, as this Defender teacheth: then had not the Catechumens of olde time, neither nowe ſhoulde they be in any danger, if they ſhould die without Baptiſme, and the grace of reconciliation, that is, not beinge aſſoiled. For they lacked no preachinge, as now they lacke not where any ſuch be. The contrarie whereof, the Churche hathe euer taught, and for witneſſe of the ſame, beſides other fathers, we haue the plaine Doctine of S. Auguſtine: VVho ſaieth, that a Catechumen, how much ſo euer he profiteth, beareth ſtil the burthen of his iniquitie ſo longe, as he is not Baptized.

Trad. in Iohan.13.

I denie not, but caſes of iuſte neceſsitie be excepted in the one, and the other, hauing right and firme willes, and deſire in eche caſe: VVhen not the contempt of Religion, but the point of neceſsitie excludeth the Myſterie of Baptiſme, as S. Auguſtine ſaith. Then how dangerous and pernicious is the Doctrine of theſe Defenders our New Miniſtring Prelates, who more with ſweete and Holy woordes, then with truthe, teache Chriſten people, that the office of Looſinge conſiſteth in offeringe, by preachinge of the Goſpel (as they cal it) the Merites of Chriſte, and ful pardon, and by pronouncinge (I knowe not howe) a ſuer and vntoubted forgeueneſſe of ſinnes, and hope of Euerlaſtinge Saluation to ſuche, forſooth, as haue ſowly and contrite hartes, and doo vnfainedly repent them? The contrition of harte, they ſeeme to ſpeake of, ſufficeth not for Looſinge of ſinnes, onleſſe it be contrition formed with charitie, as the Diuines teache. VVhiche charitie, ſeketh and requireth the Sacrament of Penance, and the grace of reconciliation, which cannot be miniſtred, but by a Prieſte. *Neither is it poſsible, the Prieſte to iudge truely, who are lowly and contrite of harte, and repente them vnfainedly, forasmutche as he cannot ſearche the Harte, onleſſe the Penitentes humble them ſelues vnto him, and delare theire repentaunce by ſimple and lowly Confeſsion of theire ſinnes. VVhiche Confeſsion, theſe Newe Goſpellers haue abandoned out of their Congregations. Howe mutch is more the Catholike and holeſome Doctrine of S *Auguſtine to bee embraced and folowed, whiche he vttereth in theſe woordes? Doo ye penance, ſutche as is donne in the Churche, that the Churche maie praie for you. Let no man ſaie to him ſelfe, I doo penance ſecretely, before God I doo it: God, who forgeueth me, knoweth, that I doo it in my harte But what ſaith S. Auguſtine hereunto? VVhy then (ſaith he) it was ſaide in vaine, VVhat things ye Looſe in Earth, they ſhalbe Looſed in Heauen. Then

O dangerous Doctrine.

*Vntruthe. Reade the Anſweare.

*Manifeſt Vntruthe. For S. Auguſtine ſpeaketh theſe words of Open Confeſsion before the people

Lib.50. Homiliarū Homi.49.

Mat.18.

A Laiman remitteth Sinne.

Then without cause the Keies be geuen to the Churche. VVe make voide the Gospel of God: wee make frustrate the woordes of Christe.

3. Augustine saith, doo ye penance, not suche as liketh your selues, not suche as Newe fangled selfepleasinge Preachers teache you, but suche, as is donne in the Churche, whiche consisteth in Contrition of harte, confession of mouthe, and satisfaction of worke, that so ye maie bee assoiled, and perfitely reconciled.

Touchinge the seconde pointe, we doo not attribute the Loosinge of suche, as be excommunicate, to the offeringe of Christes Merites, and pronouncinge of the Gospel vnto them, as you doo, but to the power of Iurisdiction by Christe geuen to the Churche.

By the Fathers Excommunication in consideration of the necessitie of it, is called *Neruus Ecclesiasticæ Disciplinæ*, the sinewe of Churchely Discipline. by the Canons, *Mucro Episcopi*, the Swerde of a Bishop: by S. Augustine, *Episcopalis Iudicij damnatio, qua pœna nulla in Ecclesia maior est*. The condemnation of a man by Bishoply Iudgemente, then the whiche there is no greater punishmente in the Churche.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

We commit the Keies of the Kingedome of Heauen, only vnto the Priest, and to none other: and to him onely we saie, *What so euer thou bindest in Earthe, shalbe bounde in Heauen.* **Yet neuertheleste hathe not euery Priestе the vse of these Keies,** Peter Lombarde **him selfe saithe,** Sanè dici potest, quòd alteram istarum Clauium, id est, Scientiam discernendi, non habent omnes Sacerdotes: *Wee maie safely saie, that al Priestes haue not the one of the these two Keies: I meane the knowledge to discerne.* **If they haue not the Keies, then can they neither Open, nor Shutte.** Sentēn. 4 Dist. 19

Neither doth it folowe of our Doctrine, that either Childzen, or Lapemenne do, or maie forgeue Sinnes. And yet Goddes Worde maie bee mightie, be the Pronouncer of it neuer so simple. S. Augustine **saith,** Cùm Christus Petro diceret, tibi dabo Claues Regni Cœlorum, Vniuersam significabat Ecclesiam: *When* Christ *saide vnto* Peter, *Vnto thee wil I geeue the Keies of the Kingedome of Heauen, hee signified thereby the whole Churche.* **And againe,** Quæcunque ligaueris super Terram, erunt ligata in Cœlo. Cœpisti habere Fratrem tuum, tanquam Publicanum: Ligas illum in Terra. Cùm autem correxeris, & concordaueris cum Fratre tuo, soluisti illum in terra. Cùm solueris in terra, solutus erit in Cœlo: *What so euer thinges thou shalt Binde in Earthe, they shalbe Bounde in Heauen. Thou* (**beinge a Laieman**) *haste beganne to haue thy Brother as a Publicane: Thou Bindest him in Earthe. But when thou haste corrected him, and haste agreed with thy Brother, thou haste Loosed him in Earthe. And when thou haste Loosed him in Earthe, he shalbe Loosed in Heauen.* Augustī. In Iohan tract. 124. Augustī. De Verb Dom. Secund Matthæ. Sermo. 16.

Likewise Theophylacte **saithe,** Si tu offensus habes eum, qui te affecit iniuria, sicut Publicanum, & Gentilem, erit ille & in Cœlo talis: si autem solueris eum, hoc est, Si illi condonaueris, erit illi & in Cœlo condonatum. Non enim solùm, quæ soluunt Sacerdotes, sunt soluta: sed quæcunq; & nos iniuria affecti vel ligamus, vel soluimus, & ipsa erunt ligata, vel soluta: *If thou beinge offended, haue him, that hathe donne thee wronge, as a Publicane, and as an Heathen, suche shal he be also in Heauen. But if thou Loose him, that is to saie, if thou pardonne him, he shalbe pardoned also in Heauen. For, not onely the thinges, that Priestes Loose, are Loosed: but also what so euer we,* (**beinge Laiemen**) *hauinge taken wronge, doo Binde, or Loose, the same thinges shal also be Bounde, or Loosed.* Theophylact. In Matthæ. Cap. 18.

This Doctrine may not seme so strange to M. Hardinge, Onlesse he be a stranger emongest his owne. For by the Order of his owne Churche of Rome, **an Olde wife, or a Ponge gyrle may Minister the Sacramente of Baptisme. And, I trowe, he wil not saie, they maie Minister Baptisme without Remission of Sinnes.**

In this Churche of Rome, **the Power of the Keies is lapped vp oftentimes in a Bulle of Leade, and sente abroade into the worlde by a Laye Pardonner: and is thoughte neuertheleste good, and sufficiente, vnto the Receiuer for Remission of Sinnes, notwithstandinge the messenger be no Priestе.**

Some of the late Doctours of his said Churche haue taught vs, that a man maie make his Confession by a bil of his hande, and receiue Absolution by a Trusheman, or by a Broker. Peter Lombarde **the Grande Maister of their whole Schole saith,** Si tamen defuerit Sacerdos, Proximo, vel Socio est facienda Confessio: *If thou waute a* De Pœnit. dist. 1. Quem Pœnitet. Secund 4 Sentēn. Dist. 17. Artic. 3.

A Laiman remitteth Sinne.

Prieſte, thou muſte make thy Confeſſion vnto thy neighboure, or vnto thy felowe. And Beda ſaithe, as he is allegred by the ſaide Peter Lombarde, Coæqualibus quotidiana, & leuia: grauiora verò Sacerdoti pandamus: *Let vs open our ſmal, and daiely ſinnes vnto our felowes: and the greatter vnto the Prieſte.*

Senten. 4. dis. 17 Nunc prius quã. Senten. 4 Eadem Diſt.

And to be ſhorte, vpon the Decretales it is noted thus, In neceſsitate, Laicus poteſt & Audire Confeſsiones, & Abſoluere: *In caſe of neceſsitie, a Laie man maie bothe heare Confeſsions, and Abſolue.*

Extra. De offi. Iudicu ordinat. Paſtoralu. In Gloſſa.

This is the Order and Doctrine of M. Hardinges owne Churche. His owne Doctours tel him, that Laie Men and Womenne maie Abſolue the Penitente, and forgeue Sinnes. Therefore he hathe the leſſe cauſe to miſlike it.

M. Hardinge ſaithe further, Chriſt ſaithe not, To whome ye offer, by preachinge of the Goſpel, my Merites, and Pardonne: or whoſe ſinnes ye pronounce by the goſpel to be remitted: but *quorumcunque remiſeritis*, whoſe ſo euer ſinnes ye remit, they are remitted. If M. Hardinge wil conclude of this Negatiue, Ergo, Sinnes be not forgeuen by the preaching of the Goſpel. I trowe it wil be but a ſimple Argument. For Chryſoſtome ſaith, Clauicularij ſunt Sacerdotes, quibus creditum eſt Verbum Docendi, & Interpretandi Scripturas: *The Keiebearers be the Prieſtes, to whom is committed the Woorde of Teaching, and Expounding the Scriptures.* And S. Hierome ſaithe, Quæcunq; ſolueritis ſuper terram, erunt ſoluta & in Cœlo. Soluunt autem eos Apoſtoli Sermone Dei, & Teſtimonijs Scripturarum, & exhortatione Virtutum: *What ſo euer thinges ye Looſe vpon Earthe, they ſhalbe Looſed alſo in Heauen. But the Apoſtles Looſe them by the Woorde of God, and by the Teſtimonies of the Scriptures, and by exhortation vnto Vertue.*

Chryſoſt. in Matthe. in Opere imperfect. cap. 23. Hieronym. in Eſai. Lib. 6. ca. 14

Likewiſe S. Auguſtine ſaithe: Iam vos Mundi eſtis propter Verbum quod loquutus ſum vobis. Quare non ait, Mundi eſtis propter Baptiſmum, quo loti eſtis? Niſi quia & in aqua Verbum mundat: *Nowe are you cleane bicauſe of the Woorde, that I haue ſpoken to you. Why ſaith he not, you are cleane bicauſe of the Baptiſme, wherewith yee are waſhed? Sauinge that euen in the Water, it is the Woorde, that maketh Cleane.* Likewiſe S. Ambroſe, Remittuntur peccata per Verbum Dei, cuius Leuites eſt Interpres: *Sinnes be forgeuen by the Woorde of God, the Expounder whereof, is the Leuite, or Prieſte.*

Auguſtin. in Iohan. tract. 80. Ambroſi. De Cain & Abel. Cap 4.

All the Power is in the woord of God, which S. Paule calleth *The Power of God vnto Saluation:* & Verbum Reconciliationis, *The Woorde whereby we be Reconciled vnto God.*

Roman. 1. 2. Corinth. 5.

And for this cauſe Chryſoſtome ſaithe, as it is alleged by M. Harding, that the Prieſt hath the ſame Power that Chriſt had: For that he preacheth the ſame Woord of God, that Chriſt preacheth. And in this ſenſe, Chriſte ſaithe vnto his Diſciples: *As my liuinge Father ſente me, euen ſo* (and with like Commiſſion) *doo I ſende you.*

Chryſoſt. De Sacerdot. Li. 3. Iohan 6. Matth. 11.

Otherwiſe the Power of Chriſte farre ſurmounteth and paſſeth al Creatures: not onely in Earthe, but alſo in Heauen. Chriſte him ſelfe thereof ſaithe thus: *Al thinges are deliuered to mee of my Father.* And the Prophete Eſaie ſaithe, Ponam Clauem Domus Dauid ſuper humerum eius. Aperiet, & nemo Claudet: Claudet, & nemo Aperiet. *I wil ſet the Keie of the Houſe of* Dauid, *vpon his ſhoulder. Hee ſhal Open, and no man ſhal Shutte, Hee ſhal Shutte, and noman ſhal Open.*

Eſaie. Cap. 22.

Of this Doctrine, ſaithe M. Hardinge, foloweth a greate inconuenience. For then (ſaithe he) the Power of the Keies conſiſteth not ſo mutche in the Miniſter, as in the Sinner, that heareth and beleeueth. This inconuenience is nothinge ſo greate, as it is pretended. The Errour hereof, ſtandeth in the Equiuocation, or doubtful takinge of one Woorde. For one thinge maie be in an other ſundrie waies. As Remiſſion of Sinnes maie be in the Prieſte, as in the Meſſenger: In the Woorde of God, as in the Inſtrumente: In the Penitente partie, as in the Receiuer. The offeringe hereof is in the Miniſter: but the effecte, and force, is in the Sinner. Therefore S. Luke ſaithe, *God Opened the Harte of the Silkewoman, that ſhee ſhoulde geeue eare vnto the woordes that were ſpoken by* S. Paule. And Chriſte ſaithe, *Who ſo euer ſhal Beleeue, and bee Baptized, ſhalbe ſaued: but he, that beleeueth not, ſhalbe damned.* Likewiſe Peter Lombarde him ſelfe ſaithe, Ex his aperte oſtenditur, quod Deus ipſe Pœnitentem ſoluit, quando intus illuminat inſpirando veram cordis Contritionem: *Hereby it plainely appeareth, that God him ſelfe Looſeth the Penitent, when by geeuing him inwarde lighte, hee inſpireth*

Act. 16. Marke. 16. 4. Sent. Diſt. 18. Sed quæritur. Clemens in Paræneticõ.

Absolutiō of Madde menne.

spireth into him the true Contrition of the Harte. And therefore Clemens Alexandrinus saithe, Fides nostra est Clauis Regni Cœlorum, *Our Faith is the Keie of the Kingedome of Heauen.* And S. Augustine likewise saithe, Cor clausum habent, quia Clauem Fidei non habent: *They haue their harte shutte, because they lacke the Keie of Faithe.* Again, he saithe: Suscitari mortuus, nisi intus clamante Domino, non potest: *The deade man cannot be raised againe, onlesse the Lorde Crie within him.*

Augustin. in Iohan tract. 49.

Augustin. in Psalm. 101.

And to comme neare to the purpose, Gratian him selfe saith, Voluntas Sacerdotis nec prodesse, nec obesse potest: sed meritum benedictionem poscentis: *The wil of the Priestе can neither further, nor hinder: but the Merite of him that desireth Absolution.*

1 quæst. 1. Dictum est.

Touchinge the Oblation of Frantique Persones, and madde menne, in what sorte, and howe farre Absolution taketh place in them, for as mutche, as it is an Extraordinarie case, I thinke it neither needeful, nor easie to define. In deede a question is moued by Pope Innocentius the thirde, whether, and in what sorte a man, either in his madnesse, or in his slepe maie be Baptized. And S. Augustine semeth to witnesse, that Children sommetime were Baptized in theire Mothers Wombe. Likewise he writeth of a frende of his owne. Cum iaceret sine sensu in dolore lætali, & desperaretur, Baptizatus est nesciens, *Whereas hee laie in a Traunse, without sense, in deadly paine, and was despaired of, hee was Baptized, and knewe not of it.*

Extra. De Baptismo & eius Effectu. Maiores ecclesiæ. 5. Item quæritur.

Augustin. Contra Iulian. Li. 6. Cap. 5.

Augustin. Confession. li. 3. ca. 4

Bonauentura addeth somme sorte vnto the maker, and demaundeth this Question, An aliquis possit Absolui inuitus: *Whether a man maie bee Absolued againste his wil, or no.*

Bonauentura in 4. Senten. Dist. 18 quæst. 6.

But, concerninge the Absolution of Madde menne in the time of their penitence, It sheweth, this was bothe the meaninge of Leo, and the godly discretion of the Churche out that time, that if a man, standinge Excommunicate, had happened to be bereste of his senses, and beinge in that case, had bene likely to departe this life, vpon proufe of his former repentaunce, he shoulde be restoared, that he mighte departe in peace, as a Member of the Churche of God. The practise hereof wee maie finde in the Councel of Carthage by these wordes: Si is, qui Pœnitentiam in infirmitate petit, in Phrenesim versus fuerit, dent Testimonium, qui eum audiuerunt, & accipiat pœnitentiam: *If hee, that desired Reconciliation by Penaunce in his sickenesse, afterwarde fal Madde, let them, that hearde him, beare witnesse with him: and so let him receiue Penaunce.*

Concil. Carthag. 4 Can. 76

This was onely a publique Testimonie vnto the Churche, that the partie Excommunicate was repentante before, when his minde was quiet. And what thing els M. Hardinge can gather hereof, I cannot telle. Certainely in this Order, and manner they restoared, not onely Madde menne, but also Deade menne vnto the Churche. For it is noted vpon the Decrées: Ex quo, cum per eum non stabat, ei Communicare debemus. Et ita est Absoluendus post mortem: *Wherefore, seeing there was no Lacke in his parte, wee ought to Communicate with him. And so hee must be Absolued after his deathe.*

24 quæst. 2. De Communione. In Glossa.

The wordes that S. Augustine, often vseth vnto Beginners, or Entrers of the Faithe, called Catechumeni, are vttered rather for terrour of others, then for rigoure of Truthe, as shal appeare. For otherwheres he writeth thus: Catechumeni secundum quendam modum per Signum Christi sanctificantur, *The Catechumeni, or Beginners, after their sorte, are Sanctified by the Signe of* Christe. Againe he saith to them: Non dum renati estis, sed per Crucis Signum in vtero Sanctæ Matris Ecclesiæ iam concepti estis: *Ye are not yet borne anewe, but by the Signe of the Crosse, ye are already conceiued in the Wombe of the Holy Churche your Mother.*

Augustin. De Peccator. Meritis & Remiss. Li. 2 Cap. 26.

Augustin. ad Catechumen. Lib. 2 Cap. 1.

Therefore hauing thus once entred into the Faithe of Christe, although they happened afterwarde to departe this life without Baptisme, yet the Churche oftentimes thought it good, to Iudge wel of them. S. Ambrose doubted not, but the Emperoure Valentinian departed hence in Goddes fauoure: And yet was the same Emperour but a Beginner, and a Nouice in the Faithe, and departed hence without Baptisme.

Ambros. De Obitu Valentiniani

W. Hardinge ſaithe further, Onleſſe the Penitente make particulare reherſal of al his ſinnes, the Prieſte, or Miniſter can be no Iudge. Whercunto I adde alſo further, Notwithſtandinge any reherſal that maie be made, yet can the Prieſte neuer be, but a doubtefull Iudge. S. Auguſtine ſaith. Quid ergo mihi eſt cum Hominibus, vt audiant Confeſsiones meas, quaſi ſanaturi ſint Omnes Languores meos? Vnde ſciunt, cùm à meipſo de meipſo audiunt, an verum dicam? Quandoquidem nemo ſcit Hominum, quid agatur in Homine, niſi Spiritus Hominis qui eſt in Homine: *What haue I to doo with menne, that they ſhoulde heare my Confeſsions, as if they were hable to heale al my griefes? When they heare me ſpeake of mee ſelfe, howe can they tel, whether I doo ſaie the Truthe, or no? For noman knoweth, what is donne in Man, but the Spirite of Man, that is in Man.*

Auguſtin. Confeſſ. Li. 10. ca 3.

Howe be it, hereof haue growen many vnneceſſarie and curious queſtions, what Peeces, what Monethes, what Daies, what Houres, what Manner, what Order of Penance ſhoulde ſerue for euery ſeuerall Sinne. In Reſolution of whiche doubtes ſtode the Iudgemente of the Prieſte. And therfore Carolus Magnus in his Lawes ſtraitely commaundeth, that the Prieſtes ſhoulde be ſkilful in the Boke of Penance.

Beat. Rhenanus in Tertul. de Pœnitent. Vt Sacerdotes Pœnitent. librum bene calleant, Chryſoſt. ad Hebræ. Homil. 31. Chryſoſt. in ſer. de Confeſſione et Pœnitentia. Chryſoſt. Hom 9. De Pœnitentia. De Pœnitent. Diſt. 1. Omnes qui. In eod. Capitt.

But as touchinge the Iudge of Sinnes, S. Chryſoſtome ſaithe: Ante Deum confiteri peccata tua. Apud Verum Iudicem cum Oratione delicta tua pronuntia: *Confeſſe thy Sinnes before God. Before the* True Iudge, *with Praier pronounce thine offenſes.* And againe: Cogitatione fiat delictorum exquiſitio: Sine Teſte ſit hoc Iudicium: Solus te Deus confitentem videat: *Lette the examination of thy ſinnes be wroughte in thy Harte: Let this Iudgemente be* without Witneſſe: *Let God* Onely *heare thee, when thou makeſt thy Confeſſion.* And againe he ſaithe, Medicinæ locus hic eſt, non Iudicii: non pœnas, ſed peccatorum Remiſsionem tribuens: Deo Soli dic peccatum tuum: *Heere is place of Medicine, and* not of Iudgemente: *geuinge not pouniſhmente, but Remiſsion of Sinnes. Open thy Sinne to God* Alone.

And therefore in W. Hardinges owne Canons it is noted thus: Confeſsio fit ad oſtenſionem pœnitentiæ: non ad impetrationem veniæ: *Confeſsion is made* (vnto the Prieſte) *not thereby to obtaine foregeneueneſſe, but to declare our repentance.* And againe, Confeſsio Sacerdoti offertur in Signum veniæ acceptæ: non in cauſam Remiſsionis accipiendæ: *Confeſsion is made vnto the Prieſte, in token of Remiſsion already obteined, and not as a cauſe whereby to procure Remiſsion.*

And yet is the Prieſte a Iudge, al this notwithſtanding: and pronounceth ſentence as a Iudge, of Doctrine, of Open Sinne, of the Offence of the Churche, and of the Humilitie, and Reamineſſe of the Penitente: and as a Iudge, together with the Elders of the Congregation, he hathe Authoritie, bothe to Condemne, and to Abſolue. Peter Lombarde him ſelfe ſaithe, Etſi aliquis apud Deum ſit ſolutus, non tamen in facie Eccleſiæ ſolutus habetur, niſi per iudicium Sacerdotis: *Albeit a man be Abſolued before God yet is he not accounpted Abſolued in the face of the Churche, but by the Iudgemente of the Prieſte.*

4 Sentē. diſt. 18. Non autem.

Like wiſe ſaithe S. Auguſtine, Hortor, prius publica Pœnitentia ſatisfacere, & Sacerdotis Iudicio reconciliatum Communioni ſociari: *I exhorte you firſte, to make Satisfaction* (vnto the Churche) *by open penance: and ſo to be reſtoared to the Communion by the diſcretion of the Prieſte.*

Auguſtin. De Eccleſiaſt. dogmatib. li. 1. ca 53.

The Order hereof, as it is ſet forth by S. Cyprian, was this: Firſte, the Sinner by manie outwarde geſtures and tokens ſhewed him ſelfe to be penitente, and ſorowful for his ſinne: After that, he made humble Confeſſion therof before the whole Congregation, and deſired his brethren to praie for him: Laſtly, the Biſhoppe and the Clergie laide their handes ouer him, and ſo reconciled him. So ſaithe Origen, Qui lapſus eſt, procedat in medium, & Exomologeſin facit: *Hee, that hathe offended, commeth foorthe into the middes* (of the People) *and maketh his Confeſsion.* Sozomenus like wiſe deſcribinge the ſame Order, ſaithe thus: Rei ad terram ſeſe pronos abiiciunt cum planctu, & lamentatione: Epiſcopus ex aduerſo occurrit cum Lachrymis, & ipſe ad pauimentum lamentando prouoluitur: & vniuerſa Eccleſiæ multitudo

Cyprian. Lib. 3. Epiſt. 15.

Origen. in Pſal. 37.

Sozomen. Li. 7 Cap. 16.

Lachry-

Open Confession.

Lachrymis ſuffunditur: *They, that haue offended fal downe flatte with weepinge, and lamentation to the grounde. The Biſhop commeth to him with teares, and him ſelfe likewiſe falleth downe: and the whole multitude of the Churche is powred ouer and ouer with teares.*

Jt vſe the moe wordes herein, for that the whole mater is longe ſithence growen vtterly out of vſe. Notwithſtandinge this is the Confeſſion, and Penance, that S. Auguſtine ſpeaketh of. Of Open Confeſſion, M. Hardinge, he ſaithe, *The Keis were not geuen to the Churche in vaine.* Of open Confeſſion he ſaithe, *What ſo euer yee Looſe in Earthe, ſhalbe Looſed in Heauen.* Of Open Confeſſion he ſpeaketh al theſe wordes: and not of any Auriculare, or Priuate dealinge. Yf M. Hardinge happen to doubte hereof, let him loke better vpon his Bookes. There ſhal he finde, euen in the very ſame place, he hath alleged, theſe wordes partely goinge before, partely folowinge: Agite Pœnitentiam, qualis agitur in Eccleſia, vt oret pro vobis Eccleſia: Job dicit, Si erubui in conſpectu populi confiteri peccata mea: Propterea Deus voluit, vt Theodoſius ageret Pœnitentiam publicam in conſpectu populi: Nolite permittere viros veſtros fornicari: Interpellate contra eos Eccleſiam: *Doo Penaunce, ſuithe ai is donne in the Churche, that the Churche maie praie for you*: Iob *ſaithe, I was not aſhamed* in the ſighte of al the people *to confeſſe my ſinnes. Therefore God woulde, that* Theodoſius (bringe the Emperoure of the worlde) *ſhould doo* Open Penance *euen in the preſence of al the people. Yee Wiues, ſuffer not your Huſbandes to liue in fornication: Comme before the* Congregation, *and crie againſte them.*

Auguſt. in Li. 50. Homiliarum. Homil. 49.

This is the Confeſſion, that S. Auguſtine ſpeaketh of: not Secrete, or Priuate, or in the eare: but Publique, and Open, and in the Sighte, and Hearinge of al the People. Jn like maner ſaithe S. Ambroſe, Multos neceſſe eſt vt ambias, & obſecres, vt dignentur interuenire Fleat pro te Mater Eccleſia, & culpam tuam Lachrymis lauet: Thou muſte needes humble thee ſelfe, and deſire many *to intreate for thee.* Let the Churche, thy Mother, *weepe for thee: and let her waſhe thy offence with her teares.*

Ambroſ. De Pœnitentia. Li. 2. Cap. 10.

This therefore, M. Hardinge, was no plaine dealinge, with ſuche ſleight to turne Publique into Priuate: and the Open audience of the whole people, into One onely mannes ſecrete eare: and ſo muche to abuſe the ſimplicitie of your Reader. Certainely theſe wordes of S. Auguſtine, Open Penaunce: Confeſſe Openly: In the ſight of al the people: That the whole Churche maie praie for thee: theſe wordes, I ſaie, wil not eaſily ſerue to proue your purpoſe, for Priuate Confeſſion.

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuiſion. 3.

Wee ſaie alſo, that the Miniſter dothe execute the Authoritie of Binding and Shuttinge, as often as he ſhutteth vp the Gate of the kingdome of Heauen againſt vnbeleeuing, and ſtubborne perſones, denouncinge vnto them Gods vengeaunce, and Euerlaſtinge punishment: Or cinge vnto them Gods vengeaunce, and Euerlaſtinge punishment: Or els, when he dooth quite ſhut them out from the boſome of the Churches, by open Excommunication. Out of doubte, what ſentence ſo euer the Miniſter of God ſhal geue in this ſorte, God him ſelfe dothe ſo wel alowe it, that, what ſo euer here in Earthe by theire meanes is Looſed, and Bounde, God him ſelfe wil Looſe, & Binde, and confirme the ſame in Heauen.

M. Hardinge.

* Here againe you confounde the Power of Bindinge, and the office of Preachinge, as you did before ſpeakinge of the power of Looſinge. VVhereto wee ſaie, as wee ſaide before of that other, that Bindinge and Shuttinge conſiſteth not in denouncinge of Goddes vengeaunce, but in the exerciſe of the Keie of iuriſdiction committed to the Churche. The Miniſters whereof Binde ſinners, whom for iuſte cauſe they Looſe not, but knowe that they are not to be Looſed. And to that Keie perteineth Excommunication, and by the ſame it is exerciſed.

* Vntruthe. For we confounde them not.

VVhat ſo euer by them is thus Looſed or Bounde in Earthe, God him ſelfe alloweth for looſed and bounde in Heauen. Suche Prieſtes becauſe yee, 1. haue not in your Newe Churche, at leaſte after this wiſe, 2. vſinge Prieſtly Auctoritie, 3 and none wil ſuffer to be made, 4. nor ſuche Auctoritie to be exerciſed: ye, 5. defraude the faithful people of the great benefite of the Sacrament of penaunce, keepinge them faſte bounde to their ſinnes after Baptiſme committed. And ſo ye cauſe their Euerla-

* Vntruthes. fiue togeather, as maie further appeare by the anſweare.

 ſtinge

Bindinge and Loosinge. Sinne forgeuen vvithout Confession.

stinge Damnation, for whome Christe hath shedde his Blond, the Price of theire Redemption.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

We Confounde not theise Keies, M. Hardinge, but speake plainely, & distinctly of either other. We saie, that the Power, as wel of Loosinge, as also of Bindinge, standeth in Gods Worde: and the exercise, or execution of the same standeth either in Preachinge, or els in Sentence of Correction, and Ecclesiastical Discipline.

Of the later hereof, there is no question: of the former, M. Hardinge pronounceth precisely, although, as it appeareth, not moste aduisedly: Bindinge (saithe he) and Shuttinge standeth not in denouncinge of Goddes Vengeaunce. And hereof he certainely assureth vs, as of a moste vndoubted Veritie. How be it, in so saieinge, he semeth not to consider the Power, and Weight of the Worde of God.

Iohn 12. Christe him selfe saithe, *If any man shal heare my Woordes, and shal not Beleeue, I condemne him not. He that refuseth mee, and receiueth not my Woordes, hath one, that condemneth him. The Woorde, that I haue spoken, is it, that shal Iudge him at the laste daie.* Likewise saithe S. Paule, *Wee are the good sauour of* Christe *in them, that be saued, and in them, that perishe. Vnto them, that perishe, wee are the sauoure of Deathe vnto Deathe: In them that be saued, wee are the sauour of Life vnto Life.* And againe, *If the Gospel be hidden, it is hidden from them, that perishe.* So saithe God vnto the Prophete Ezechiel, *If thou gene warninge to the wicked, and he wil not be turned from his wickednesse, he shal perishe in the same. Yet haste thou discharged thine owne soule.*

2 Cor. 2.

2 Corinth. 4.

Ezechiel. 3.

To be shorte, The whole Scriptures are ful hereof. And therefore S. Augustine saithe, Prædicatur Euangelium, quibusdam ad præmium, quibusdam ad Iudicium: *The Gospel is Preached, to some vnto reward, to some vnto Iudgemente.*

Augustin. Epist. 49. ad Deogratias.

For the reste, M. Harding saithe, Suche Priestes bicause yee haue not in your Newe Churche, at leaste after this wise vsinge Priestly Auctoritie, and none will suffer to be made, and suche Auctoritie to be exercised, ye defraude the faithful people of the great benefite of the Sacramente of Penance, keeping them falle bounde to their sinnes after Baptisme committed: And so ye cause their euerlastinge Damnation, for whom Christe hath shead his Bloud, the Price of their Redemption.

These great Wordes are not verie wel seasoned: They are bigge in sounde, and smal in weight: they are ful of erroure, and voide of witte. For the Churche of Englande hath Authoritie this daie by Goddes Worde, to Binde, and Loose, as mutche as euer Christe gaue any to his Apostles: And by the same Authoritie the same Churche of Englande is able to Binde, not onely M. Hardinge, and his Felowes, as Peter bounde Simon Magus, or as Paule bounde Elymas the False Prophete: but also the Pope him selfe, if he be an Open Offender: and as S. Paule saithe, is able to deliuer him ouer vnto Sathan: And vndoubtedly beinge so Bounde in Earthe, he shal also stande Bounde in Heauen.

Our People remaine not Bounde, nor perishe in theire sinnes, as theise menne so vncharitably, and fondly haue imagined. They be so certaine of the Remission of theire sinnes in the Blonde of Christe, as if Christe him selfe were presente, and spake it to them. They are taught, and know, that *The Blonde of* Christe, *the Sonne of God, hath made vs cleane from al our sinnes:* and, *that there is no name vnder Heauen, whereby wee shalbe saued, but onely the name of Iesus* Christe.

1 Iohan. 1. Actor. 4.

As for Priuate Confession, Abuses, and Errours set aparte, as it is saide before, we condemne it not, but leaue it at libertie. And therein we male seme to folowe the aduise of Charles the Emperoure in his late, Interim: For thus he writeth, Confessio, & Peccatorum Enumeratio, vt non nimis laxanda est, ita vicissim non nimis est astringenda.

Interim Carol. 5. An. 1548.

Touching the Priestes of your makinge, M. Hardinge, of whom ye seme to make so greate accompte, your owne Peter Lombarde saithe of them, as it is saide before, Sanè dici potest, quòd alteram Clauem, id est, Scientiam discernendi, multi Sacerdotes non habent. And in like manner saithe your owne Bonauentura, Omnes ferè ita sunt Simplices, & Idiotæ post susceptionem Sacerdotij, sicut antè: *Al Priestes for the moste parte are as Simple, and Vnlearned after the receiuinge of Orders, as they were before.*

4 Senten. dist. 19 Post Bonauent. 4. Senten. dist. 18. quæst. 1. E.

But, be it graunted, that your Priestes be fully furnished with al his Keies. Yet is it not he, that by any his Authoritie forgeueth sinnes. Your owne Gratian saithe,

The vvoorde is the Keie.

saithe, Euidentissimè datur intelligi, quòd sine Confessione Oris, Peccata possunt deleri: *It is euidently geeuen vs to vnderstande*, that without Confession of mouthe, *Sinnes maie bee forgeeuen*. And againe, Ore tacente, veniam consequi possumus: Though wee saie nothinge, *yet wee maie haue pardonne*. Againe, Luce clariùs constat, Cordis Contritione, non Oris Confessione, Peccata dimitti: *It is apparente, and more cleare then the lighte, that Sinnes be forgeeuen by Contrition of the Harte, and* not by Confession of the mouthe. And againe, Dominus ostendit, quòd non Sacerdotali Iudicio, sed largitate Diuina Peccator mundatur: *Our Lorde hath taught vs, that the Sinner is made cleane*, not by the Iudgement of the Priest, *but by the Mercie of God*.

De Pœnit. dist. 1. Quis aliquãdo. De Pœnit. dist. 1. Conuertimini.

Thus, M. Hardinge, it is plaine by the Iudgemente of your owne Doctours, that, were your Auriculare Confession quite abolished, yet might the People notwithstandinge haue ful Remission of theire Sinnes. But of you it maie be verified, that Christe saide vnto the Pharisees: *Yee haue taken awaie the Keies of the Kingedome of Heauen: And neither doo yee enter your selues, nor wil you suffer others, that woulde enter.* Of your Keies Vesselus saide longe sithence, Claues Papæ, & Prælatorum non aperiunt Regnum Dei, sed claudunt potiùs: *The Popes, and the Prelates Keies doo not Open the Kingedome of God, but rather Shutte it.*

Luk. 11.

Vesselus, de Subditu. & superiorib.

The Apologie, Cap. 7. Diuision. 1.

And touchinge the Keies, wherewith they maie either Shutte, or Open the Kingdome of Heauen, wee with Chrysostome saye, They be the Knowledge of the Scriptures: with Tertullian wee saie, They be the Interpretation of the Lawe: and with Eusebius wee cal them the VVoorde of God.

M. Hardinge.

The let, whereby the whole Nature of man is shutte out of Heauen by the sinne of our Firste Parent, is taken awaie by the Passion of Christe. But because before that benefite be receiued, Heauen yet remaineth shutte bothe for sinne Original contracted, and sinne actual committed: wee haue neede of the Sacramentes, and Keies of the Churche.

The Holy Fathers for good considerations grounded vpon Scripture, haue diuided the Keies into the Keie of Order, and the Keie of Iurisdiction: And either of them into the Keie of Knowledge, whiche they cal also the Keie of Discretion, and into the Keie of Power.

To these Defenders wee saie, that they confounde the Keies, and seeme not to know, what the Keies are. Verely these be not onely the knowledge of the Scriptures, nor the Interpretation of the lawe, nor the VVoorde of God, although these also doo open or shutte the Kingdome of Heauen in their kinde, as Chrysostome, Tertullian, and Eusebius maye wel saie: and not onely these, but also Miracles, and Plagues, and al other thinges, whiche prepare the wil, or vnderstandinge of man, whereby hee maie receiue the benefite of those moste principal Keies, that nowe wee speake of.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Gentle Reader, for the better vnderstandinge hereof, it maie please thée to consider, that the Worde of God, accordinge to the sundrie effectes, and properties thereof, hath sundrie names. For example, For that it encreaseth, and multiplieth, it is called Seede: For that it cutteth the Harte, and diuideth the Fleashe from the Spirite, it is called a Swerde: For that it taketh, and encloseth vs, and bringeth vs togeather, it is called a Nette: For that it washeth vs cleane, it is called VVater: For that it Enflameth vs, it is called Fire: For that it Feedeth vs, it is called Bread. And euen so, for that it Openeth, and geueth vs an Entrie into the House, it is called the Keie. This House is the Kingedome of Heauen: Christe is the Dore: the Worde of God is the Keie.

For thus saieinge, M. Hardinge telleth vs, VVee confounde maters, and seeme not to knowe, what wee saie. Notwithstandinge, herein we imagine nothinge of our owne, but onely reporte the very Wordes, and Sentences of the Ancient Learned Catholique Fathers.

Tertullian saithe, Quam Clauem habebant Legis Doctores: nisi Interpretationem Legis? *What Keie had the Doctours of the Lawe, sauinge the Exposition of the Lawe?* S. Hierome saithe, Duces Ecclesiæ habent Claues Scientiæ, vt aperiant Scripturas creditis sibi Populis. Vnde præcipitur, vt Magistri aperiant, & Discipuli ingrediantur:

Tertull. contra Marcion Lib. 4.

Hiero. in Esaiam Li. 6. ca 24.

The

Multiplication of Keies.

The Captaines of the Churche haue the Keies of Knowledge, to open the Scriptures vnto the People to them committed. Therefore Commaundementes is geuen, that the Maisters shoulde open, and the Scholars shoulde enter. S. Ambrose saithe, Remittuntur peccata per Dei Verbum, cuius Leuites est Interpres: *Sinnes be forgeuen by the Woorde of God, the Expounder whereof is the Priest.*

Ambros. De Cain. & Abel. Lib. 2.

Thus these, and other like Ancient Fathers haue opened the meaninge of these Keies. And yet were they neuer therefore condemned of Ignorance, as men, that wiste not, what they saide. Certainely Chrysostome saithe, Clauis est Scientia Scripturarum, per quam aperitur Ianua Veritatis: *The Keie is the knowledge of the Scriptures, whereby is opened the gate of the Truthe.* And S. Augustine saithe, Clauis est dicenda, qua ad Fidem pectorum dura reserantur: *That ought to be called the Keie, wherewith the hardnesse of mennes hartes is opened vnto Faithe.*

Chrysost. in Opere Imperfecto Homil. 44.

August. De Sanctis. Homil. 27.

Here hath M. Hardinge wel multiplied, and encreased his Keies, and hathe brought vs forthe a whole Bunche of them altogeather: The Keies of Orders: The Keies of Iurisdiction: The Keies of Discretion: The Keies of Power: The Keies moste Principal, and the Keies not so Principal. And thus hath he Keies of Order without Iurisdiction, and Keies of Iurisdiction without Order: Keies of Discretion without Power, & Keies of Power without Discretion. And al these prette shiftes of Keies hath he diuised, to auoide Confusion: and, to make vp his tale, as if the Popes Crosse Keies were not sufficient, Plagues, and Miracles, and, I knowe not what thinges els, are brought forth vnto vs in the likenesse of Keies. And this distinction, and limitation of Keies, (saithe he) hath vpon good considerations benne diuised by the Holy Fathers. And yet of al these Holy Fathers, for modesties sake, he nameth not one.

What answeare were it beste to make to suche Vanities? In deede, when the right Keie of Knowledge was loste, and gonne, it was time to diuise somme other prette Pikelockes to worke the feate. Bonauentura hereof writeth thus, as it is partely alleged before: Omnes ferè Sacerdotes ita sunt simplices, & idiotæ post susceptionem Sacerdotij, sicut antè. Dicendum ergo, quòd Scientia non est Clauis Principalis, nec per se, sed prout iuncta est Authoritati Ligandi, vel soluendi. Et hæc Clauis non est de Esse Ordinis, sed de bene esse: *Al Priestes, for the moste parte, are as simple, and as rude after the receiuinge of Priesthoode, as they were before. Therefore wee muste saie, that Knowledge is not the Principal Keie, nor any Keie at al of it selfe: but as it is ioyned with the Authoritie of Bindinge, or Loosinge. And this Keie (of Knowledge) is not of the Substance of the Order of Priesthoode, but of the better beinge of the same.* And therefore, to encrease M. Hardinges number of Keies, he saithe, Quidam habent Scientiam Clauium: quidam Clauiculam: quidam nullam: *Somme haue the Knowledge of the Keies: somme a prette litle Keie: somme no Keie at al.* In this case it were good for M. Hardinge, to resolue his Reader, when the Priestе hathe nothinge els, but a prette litle Keie, or no Keie at al, what Authoritie he hath, either to Open, or to Shutte.

Bonauen. 4. Sentent. Dist. 18. Quæ. 1. E.

Eodem loco.

M. Hardinge replieth farther, VVee haue Remission of Sinnes in the Ministration of the Sacramentes: Therefore wee haue it not onely by the Hearinge of the VVoorde of God. This Obiection is touched, and partely answeared a litle before. S. Augustine calleth the Sacramentes, Verba Visibilia: *Woordes Visible:* for that in them, as in liuely Images, the Deathe of Christe is sensibly sette before our eies. For the Worde of God is the Substance, and Life of al Sacramentes: and without the same, Sacramentes, what so euer, are no Sacramentes. And therefore S. Augustine saithe, as it is alleged before, Quare non ait, vos mundi estis propter Baptismum, quo loti estis: Sed ait, propter Verbum, quod locutus sum vobis? Nisi quia & in Aqua Verbum mundat. Detrahe Verbum: & quid est Aqua, nisi Aqua? *Why saithe not* Christe, *you are cleane bicause of the Baptisme, wherewith yee are washed: But, Bicause of the Woorde, that I haue spoken to you? Sauinge for that, it is the Woorde, that cleanseth in the Water. Take the Woorde awaie: and what is Water els, but Water.*

August. contra Faustum. Lib. 19. Cap. 16.

August. in Ioan. Tract. 80.

The Apologie, Cap. 7. Diuision. 2.

Moreouer that Christes Disciples did receiue this Authoritie, not

not that they ſhould heare the Priuate Confeſſions of the people, and liſten to their whiſperinges, as the common Maſſinge Prieſtes doo euerywhere now adaies, and doo it ſo, as though in that one ponte laie al the Vertue, and vſe of the Keies: but to the ende, they ſhoulde Goe, they ſhoulde Teache, they ſhoulde Publiſhe abroade the Goſpel, and be vnto the Beleeuinge a ſweete Sauoure of Life vnto Life: and vnto the Vnbeleeuinge, and Vnfaitheful, a Sauoure of Deathe vnto Deathe: and that the mindes of Godly perſons beinge brought lowe by the remorſe of theire former Life and errours, after they once begonne to looke vp vnto the Light of the Goſpel, and beleue in Chriſte, might be opened with the Woorde of God, euen as a dooze is opened with a Keie. Contrariewiſe, that the Wicked, and wilful, & ſutche, as would not beleeue, noz returne into the righte way, ſhould be leafte ſtil as faſte locked, and ſhutte vp, and, as S. Paule ſaithe, ware woorſe, and woorſe. This take we to be the meaninge of the Keies: and that after this ſozte mennes Conſciences be either opened, oz ſhutte. 2. *Timoth.* 3.

M. Hardinge.

Here ye Harpe muche vpon one ſtringe, which ſo iarreth in the eares of the Hearers, as your confuſe Harmonie can like noman, onleſſe he be a Minſtrel of your owne Secte. The Auctoritie and power of the Keies conſiſteth not altogeathes, nor Principally in Preachinge, or pronouncinge of the Goſpel, as already wee haue proued. VVhat maie wee iudge of you? proceedeth this of Malice, or of Ignorance, that thus ye confounde the Keies, the Powers, and the Miniſteries?

1. Corin. 1. Preachinge is one thinge, to gouerne the Churche is an other, to remitte and reteine ſinnes is an other, to diſtribute the Sacramentes is an other. Dothe not S. Paule in cleare woordes ſpeake Seuerally, and diſtinctly of Miniſteries, where he ſaithe, that he was not ſente of Chriſte to Baptiſe, but to Preache the Goſpel? This Doctrine of yours, whereby ye confounde the Keies, Powers, and Miniſteries, dothe not onely obſcure the Scriptures, and bringe the people to greate errours: but alſo vnder pretence of a loue towarde preachinge of the Goſpel, leadeth them into contempt of the Sacraments, and ſpecially of the Sacrament of Penaunce, without whiche, if after Baptiſme wee haue ſinned, (not beinge letted by caſe of neceſſitie, wherein VVil, Deſire, and Vowe is accepted) (a) wee can not attaine to Saluation. As you folow Caluine your Maiſter in this and ſundrie other falſe, and perilous Doctrines, ſo it is to be feared, if your wicked temeritie be ſuffered to proceede, that at length hauing brought al Religion to bare Preachinge, ye will abandon al the Sacramentes of the Church, as thinges not neceſſarie. For ſo that wicked Maiſter of yours teacheth: That, where Chriſtes deathe maye be remembred otherwiſe, there (b) al the Sacramentes be Superfluous. And that I ſeeme not to ſclaunder him, I remitte you to his Commentaries vpon the firſte Epiſtle of S. Paule to the Corinthians, where expoundinge theſe woordes, Doo this in my remembraunce, he ſaithe thus: The Supper is a token of remembrance ordeined to lifte vp, or helpe our infirmitie: for if otherwiſe we were mindeful inoughe of Chriſtes deathe, this healpe (he meaneth the Bleſſed Sacramente of the Aultar) were ſuperfluous, whiche is common to al the Sacramentes, for they be healpes of our infirmitie. Lo, by Caluines Doctrine, if we remember the deathe of Chriſte, bothe the Euchariſte, and al other Holy Sacramentes be voide, and Superfluous. And then, becauſe no other thinge bringeth to our remembrance the Deathe of Chriſte, more then Preachinge, to what purpoſe ſerue al the Sacramentes?

(a) Vntruthe, as by the Anſweare may further appeare.

Caluines wicked doctrine againſte the Sacramẽts.

(b) A greate vntruthe, ioined with a ſclaunder. Reade the Anſweare.

Thus theſe Defenders with their Maiſter Caluine haue founde a ſhorter waie to Heauen, then was knowen before.

Contra Interim.

In an other place he ſeemeth to derogate muche of the neceſſitie of Baptiſme of Chriſten mens Children. VVhere he ſaithe, that by reaſon of Gods promiſe the iſſue whiche commeth of Faithful parentes, (c) is borne Holy, and is a Holy Progenie, and that the children of ſuche, beinge yet enclоſed in the wombe, before they drawe breathe of life, be neuertheleſſe choſen into the couenaunt of life euerlaſtinge. This doctrine, when it ſhal take place, as by you Defenders it is ſette in a good furtherance, what ſhal we looke for, but that the neceſſarie Sacramente of Baptiſme (without whiche who is to be cõpted a Chriſten man?) and the moſte Bleſſed, and comfortable Sacramente of the Aultar, and the Holeſome Sacrament of Penaunce, and Abſolution, and the reſte of the Sacramentes, ſhal be nomore eſteemed and vſed, then nowe ye eſteeme, and vſe the Maſſe, Holy Breade, and Holy VVater? This beinge once brought to paſſe, ſhal not the people eaſely be induced either to receiue Mahometes Religion, or ſomme other, as farre from God, as that is. or to allowe the pleaſant trade of life of the (d) Epicureans, the moſte parte beinge already thereto inclined, and no ſmal number wel entred:

(c) Theſe be not M. Caluines woordes, but S. Paules: *Filij veſtri Sancti ſunt, 1. Cor. 7.*

Quid ſi Cœlum ruat?

(d) Otherwiſe called the Romaines.

But to returne againe to the Keies, which ſeeme to you to haue no force ne vſe but in Preaching: Firſte, as touching the ſcorneful ſcoffes vttered by you, Sir Defender, in Latine, and by your interpreter in Engliſhe, againſt Priuate Confeſſions, and againſt the Miniſters of the Churche appointed by God

God for grace of reconciliation to be imparted to penitentes: your lighte mockinge ſpirite deliteth your ſelues not ſo muche, as it pitieth vs to ſee you bothe ſo faſte bounde in Satans fetters. Next concerninge Confeſſion (e) neceſſarely required to the vſe, and power of the Keies, whiche you ſpeake of at your pleaſure, thus we ſaie accordinge to the Scriptures: Among ſundrie effectes, for which Chriſt gaue the Keies to the Apoſtles, and their Succeſſours, this is one, that by Power of them they ſhoulde remitte, and retaine ſinnes, as him ſelfe ſaide, VVhoſe ſinnes ye remitte, they are remitted vnto them: and whoſe ſinnes yee reteine, they are reteined. (f) But ſinnes cannot duely be remitted, or reteined, onleſſe they be knowen to him, that hath auctoritie thereto: and knowledge of ſinnes (ſpecially ſuch as are priuie) can not be had of man, who cannot ſee into the harte of man, (f) but by Confeſſion of the ſinner: VVherfore conſequently it foloweth, that they receiued this auctoritie to heare the Confeſſion of Chriſten people deſirous to be aſſoiled, and reconciled. Mat. 16. 18. Iohan. 20.

(e) Vntruth. For it is not required of neceſsitie, as ſhal appeare.

(f) Vntruthes, two togeather. See the Anſweare.

VVherefore the Confeſſion, yea of Secrete ſinnes, is neceſſarie to Saluation by (g) the inſtitution of Chriſte. For in that he inſtituted the ende, he inſtituted alſo the meanes, whiche ſhoulde be neceſſarie to the obteininge of the ende: onleſſe wee woulde make Chriſte our Lawemaker to haue failed his Churche in thinges neceſſarie. That ſinnes cannot either be remitted, or reteined, except the Prieſt knowe them, we are bolde to ſaie with the Fathers, and ſpecially with S. Hierome, who ſo (h) vnderſtoode the woordes of Chriſte: where he promiſed the Keies of the Kingedome of Heauen to Peter. *Sacerdos pro officio ſuo cùm peccatorũ audierit Varietates, ſcit qui Ligandus ſit, qui Soluendus:* The Prieſte (ſaithe he) when as accordinge to his office he hathe hearde the diuerſitie of ſinnes, knoweth who is to be bounde, who is to be looſed. Right ſo as in the time of Moſes Lawe he pronounced not, who was cleane of Lepre, who was not, before that he had vewed the colour, the bunches, and al other tokens of that diſeaſe. And thus it foloweth of the woordes of Chriſte, that Confeſſion of al Sinnes, at leaſte deadly, muſt be made to the Prieſte, before they can be remitted. VVhich Prieſt is the Miniſter of this Sacrament, and hath auctoritie to abſolue, either Ordinarie, or by Commiſſion of the Superiour. Mat. 16. Comment. in Mat. 16.

(g) vntruth. For M. Hardinges owne Doctours ſaie, It was ordeined by Tradition, and not by Chriſte.

(h) Vntruth, In miſtaking, and abbridginge S. Hieromes woordes.

Againe, for prouſe that Confeſſion is neceſſarie, wee ſaie, that to remitte and reteine ſinnes committed againſte God, as to binde and to looſe, be iudicial actes. And therefore by theſe wordes Chriſt ordeined a Courte, a Conſiſtorie, a ſeate of Iudgemente in the Churche, and appointed the Apoſtles and theire Succeſſoures to be Iudges. And that this maie appeare not to be a fantaſie of our owne heades, S. Auguſtine expoundeth theſe woordes of S. Iohn in his Reuelation: *Et vidi Sedes, &c.* And I ſawe Seates, and ſomme ſittinge on them, and Iudgemente was geuen. VVee muſt not thinke (ſaithe he) this to be ſpoken of the laſte Iudgement, but wee muſte vnderſtande the Seates of the Rulers, and the Rulers them ſelues, by whom nowe the Church is gouerned. And as for the Iudgement geuen, it ſeemeth not to be taken for any other, then for that, whereof it is ſaide, VVhat thinges yee binde in Earthe, they ſhal be bounde alſo in Heauen: and what thinges yee looſe in Earthe, they ſhal be looſed alſo in Heauen. Sundrie other Fathers haue vttered in theire writinges the ſame Doctrine. Hilarius vpon the ſixteenth Chapter of Matthewe ſaithe, *Beatus Cœli ianitor, &c.* Bleſſed is the Porter of Heauen, whoſe earthly Iudgement (that is to ſaie, whiche is geuen here on Earthe) is a foreiudged auctoritie in Heauen, that what thinges be bounde, or looſed in Earthe, they haue the condition of the ſame Statute alſo in Heauen. S. Cyprian hath the like ſaieinge in an Epiſtle to Cornelius. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, that Chriſte hathe tranſlated al Iudgemente, whiche he receiued of the Father, vnto the Apoſtles, and Prieſtes. Gregorie Nazianzene in an Oration to the Emperoure and his Princes, ſaithe to the Emperour, *Quis mea es, & nos habemus Tribunalia:* Thou are my Sheepe, and we haue our ſeates of Iudgemente. S. Gregorie the Pope compareth the Sacramente of Penance with a Courte of Iuſtice, in whiche cauſes be firſte examined and tried, and afterwarde iudged. That the ſame is to be donne by the Prieſte, S. Bernarde ſheweth: who, as alſo the learned Father Hugo *de S. Victore*, be not afraid to ſaie after S. Cyprian, Hilarie, and Chryſoſtome, that the ſentence of Peter remittinge ſinnes, goeth before the ſentence of Heauen. This Ordinance of Chriſte requireth, that al Treſpaſſes, Offenſes, Diſorders, Trangreſſions, and Sinnes committed againſte him and his Lawes, be referred to this Conſiſtorie. In Mat. Cap. 16. Lib. Epist. De dignit. sacerd. l. 3.

This Conſiſtorie ſtood ſometime in Excommunication, ſommetime in Preachinge.

This ſaieinge perteineth, not to Confeſſion, but to the Authority of Gods woorde.

VVhether theſe Defenders allowe Publike Confeſſion, or no, wee knowe not: but whereas they inueighe againſte Priuate Confeſſion, and ſaie in ſpiteful woordes, whiche they haue learned in the Schole of Satan, being lothe the ſinnes of the people, whereby he holdeth his Kingedome, ſhould be remitted, that Chriſtes Diſciples receiued not the auctoritie of the Keies, that they ſhoulde heare Priuate Confeſſions of the people, and liſten to their whiſperinges. VVee tel them, that Confeſſion of al deadly ſinnes is of the (i) Inſtitution of God, not of Man. But concerning the maner of confeſſing ſecretly to a Prieſt alone, it is moſte agreable to Natural Reaſon, that ſecrete ſinnes be confeſſed ſecretly.

(i) Vntruthe, As it is prooued before. Confeſſion grounded vpon Natural Reaſon

(k) Clemente amongeſt thoſe thinges that he acknowledgeth him ſelfe to haue receiued of Peter, this is One, as he writeth in his firſte Epiſtle tranſlated by Rufine the Prieſte: That, if it fortune either Enuie or Infidelitie priuily to creepe into any mannes harte, or any other like euil: he whiche regardeth his Soule, be not aſhamed to confeſſe thoſe thinges to Him, that is in Office ouer him, to the ende, that by him, throughe the VVoorde of God, and holeſome Counſel, he maye be healed. So as by perfite Faithe, and good VVoorkes he maye eſcape the paines of euerlaſtinge Fiere, and comme to the rewardes of Life that endureth for euer. No man ſpeaketh more plainely of Secrete Confeſsion (l) then Origen, and that in ſundrie places, to whiche for breuities ſake I remitte the Reader. *In 2. Cap. Leuitici, Homil. 2. De Principijs, Lib. 3. In Pſalm. 37. Homil. 2.*

(k) A vaine forgerie.

(l) Vntruth. For he ſpeaketh onely of open Confeſsion.

VVhere

Priuate Confession.

VVhere he compareth the state of a Sinner, to a man, that hath euil and vndigested humours in his stomake. And saithe that as by remaininge of suche euil matter, the man feeleth him selfe very sicke, and by vomitinge of it foorthe, he is eased: so the sinner by keepinge his sinnes secrete, is the more greuously charged in his owne conscience, and standeth in daunger to be choked with the Fleume and humour of his sinnes. But if he accuse him selfe, and confesse his faultes, he bothe vomiteth foorthe his sinnes, and digesteth the cause of the same. S. Cyprian as in many other places, so moste plainely speaketh of Secrete Confession. *Sermone. 5. de lapsis.* Although (saithe he of certaine deuoute persones) they be entangled with no greate Sinne, yet bicause at leaste they thought of it, the same vnto the Priethes of God Confesse they sorowfully and simply. They make Confession of theire Conscience, they laie foorthe the burthen of their minde, &c.

Al this belongeth to open Confession.

Confession of euil thought.

S. Augustine treatinge of the Power of the Keies in many places, but specially of Confession *in Psalm. 60.* VVhere speakinge muche of the necessitie of Confession, he saithe thus: VVhy feareste thou to be Confessed? If not beinge Confessed thou remaine hidden, not beinge Confessed thou shalt be damned. And afterwardes thus: To this ende God requireth Confession, to deliuer the humble, to this ende he damneth him that confesseth not, to punishe the Proude. Therefore be thou sorie before thou be Confessed: beinge Confessed, Reioyse: thou shalt be hole.

By these and many other Holy Fathers, of whome there is no doubte, but they had the Holy Ghoste for their Teacher and prompter of al Truthe, the Catholike Churche hath bene persuaded, that the recital and rehersinge of (m) al Sinnes before the Priest is necessarie to Saluation: onlesse necessitie for lacke of a Priest or otherwise, exclude vs from it: and that a (n) General Confession in no wise suffiseth. True Faithe acknowledgeth, that Confession is to be made of al (n) Sinnes, as (n) commaunded by Christe, and the Apostles, commended to vs by the (n) Fathers of the Primitiue Church, by al (n) learned Doctours, and general vse of the (n) whole Churche. And if the expresse terme of Secrete or auricular Confession be (o) seldome mentioned in the Ancient Fathers, as that of Publike Confession is oftentimes, as in the Nicene Councel, and in sundrie other places: that is nothinge repugnante to the Doctrine of the Catholike Churche.

(m) Vntruthe: Reade the Answeare.
(n) Vntruthes, many, and manifest, as shal appeare.
(o) Vntruthe. For it is neuer founde. Otherwise let him shewe it.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Al this greate shewe of Authorities of Fathers, and Doctours, M. Hardinge him selfe in the ende dischargeth easily with one Worde. For, notwithstandinge al, that he coulde beste diuise to sale herein, his Conclusion at the laste is this, The Expresse Terme of Secrete, or Auriculare Confession is Seldome mentioned in the Ancient Fathers. Seldome, **he saithe, as if it were sometimes vsed, although but** Seldome. **But if he had leaste,** Seldome, **and saide,** Neuer, **I trowe this tale had benne the truer.**

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ **Here M. Hardinge allegeth againste me, the Authorities of** Pope Leo, **condemninge Publique Confession offered vp in writinge, to be published openly to the people, and allowinge rather Confession made onely priuately to the Priest:** *Least* (saithe Leo) *the Penitentes should be ashamed, or afraide, to open their deedes vnto theire enimies, of whome they maie be troubled therefore by the Ordinaunce of the Lawes. &c.*

The Answeare. **The name of** Pope Leo **is great: But his reasons are very weake. For, touchinge the firste reason, for that special cause, in Olde times, the Penitentes were forced to make open Confession, to the ende they might shewe them selues ashamed of theire Sinnes, and be an example vnto others. As for feare of enimies, and troubles, and suites in Lawe, that might happen to growe vpon suche Confessions, if the Ancient Holy Fathers had caste suche doubtes, Publique Confession had neuer benne vsed.** ☜

For the reste, we sale, as before: We make no Confusion of the Keies. Our Doctrine is plaine, that there be two Keies in the Churche of God: The one of Instruction, the other of Correction. Whereof the one worketh inwardely, the other outwardely: The one before God, the other before the Congregation. And yet either of theise standeth wholy in the Worde of God. And therefore S. Paule saithe, Omnis Scriptura Diuinitùs inspirata vtilis est ad Doctrinam, ad Redargutionem, ad Correctionem, ad Institutionem, &c. *Al Scriptures inspired from God, are profitable, To teache the Truthe: To reproue the Falsehedde: To correcte the Wicked: To Nourtoure, and instruct the Godly.* 2. *Timoth.* 3.

Of the Former of theise Keies S. Paule saithe, *Beleeue in the Lorde* Iesus: *and thou shalt be saft, with al thy House.* *Actor.* 16.

Of the other he saithe, *The Weapons of our warfare are not Fleashely: but mightie through God, to throwe downe holdes, castinge downe euery Highe thinge, that is builded vp* 2. *Corin.* 10.

Sacraments necessarie.

againste the knowledge of God, and to bringe al vnderstandinge captiue to the Obedience of Christe.

This Doctrine semeth to be simple, and plaine, and without Confusion.

Touchinge M. Caluine, it is greate wronge, vntruely to reporte so Reuerende a Father, and so Worthy an Ornamente of the Churche of God. If you had euer knowen the order, of the Churche of Geneua, and had seene foure thousande people, or moe, receiuinge the Holy Mysteries togeather at one Communion, ye coulde not without your greate shame, and wante of modestie, thus vntruely haue published to the worlde, that by M. Caluines Doctrine, the Sacramentes of Christe are Superfluous. Certainely to leaue al, that he hath otherwise spoken of the Sacramentes in general, Of the Sacramente of Christes laste Supper, he writeth thus:

Institution. Cap. 18. 2. Magnum Consolationis, ac suauitatis fructum ex hoc Sacramento colligere possunt piæ animæ: quòd illic Testimonium habeant, Christum sic nobis adunatum esse, sic nos illi vicissim insertos, adeoq; in vnum Corpus cum ipso coaluisse, vt quicquid ipsius est, nostrum vocare liceat: *The Godly mindes maie take greate fruite of pleasure, and Comforte of this Sacramente: for that therein they haue a witnesse, that* Christe *is so made one with vs, and wee so graffed into him, and are so growen bothe into one Bodie, that, what so euer is his, wee maie nowe calle it ours.*

But Caluine (you saie) writeth thus: The Supper is a token of remembrance, to lifte vp, or to healpe our infirmitie. For if otherwise we were mindeful ynough of Christes Deathe, this healpe were Superfluous. O M. Hardinge, howe farre malice maie beare a man? Bicause M. Caluine saithe, *Wee are weake, and haue neede of outwarde Sacramentes, to quicken the dulnesse of our Senses,* saithe he therefore, That the Sacramentes be Superfluous? If he had likewise saide, Our bodies be weake, & haue nede to be refreashed with Meate, and Drinke, would you geather thereof, that Meate, and Drinke are Superfluous? Nay contrariewise he concludeth, *Wee haue neede of Sacramentes: Therefore Sacramentes be needeful:* And the greater our weakenesse is, the more nede haue we of suche remedies. His wordes emongst many others of like sense be theise:

Institution. Cap. 16. 3. Sic est exigua nostra Fides, vt nisi vndiq; fulciatur, atque omnibus modis sustentetur, statim concutiatur, fluctuet, vacillet: *So smal is our Faithe, that onlesse it be borne vp of euery side, and by al meanes be mainteined, it shaketh, it wauereth, and is like to falle.*

If this be so dangerous a Doctrine, as you telle vs, why then are the Ancient Catholique Fathers suffered to holde, and mainteine the same? Dionysius, whom you so often calle S. Paules Scholar, writeth thus, Nos imaginibus sensibilibus, quantum fieri potest, ad Diuinas adducimur Contemplationes: *Wee, as mutche as maie be, by Sensible Images, or Sacramentes, are brought vnto Diuine Contemplations.*

Eccleſiaſt. Hierarch. Cap. 1.

In Quæstion. Vet. Testament. Likewise S. Augustine saithe, Sacramenta propter Carnales Visibilia instituta sunt: vt ab illis, quæ oculis cernuntur, ad illa, quæ intelliguntur, Sacramentorum gradibus transferamur: *Visible Sacramentes are ordeined for Carnal Menne: that by the steppes of Sacramentes wee maie be leadde from the thinges, that wee see with eie, vnto the thinges, that wee vnderstande.* So saithe S. Cyprian, Fidei nostræ infirmitas Symboli argumento edocta est, &c. *The weakenesse of our Faithe is taught by the vnderstandinge of the Sacramente, &c.* So S. Chrysostome, Si incorporei essemus, nuda, & incorporea nobis hæc ipsa daret. Nunc, quia Corporibus insertas habemus animas sub visibilibus spiritualia tradit: *If wee were Bodilesse, God woulde geue vs these thinges bare, and Bodilesse. But for asmutche, as wee haue Soules fastened vnto our Bodies, therefore God geueth vs thinges Spiritual vnder thinges Visible.* Againe he saithe, Rectis & Fidelibus Scripturæ non sunt Necessariæ, dicente Apostolo, Lex iustis non est posita: *To the Godly, and Faithful the Scriptures are not Necessarie: For so the Apostle saithe, There is no Lawe prouided for the Juste.* And againe, Oportuerat quidem nos nihil indigere auxilio Literarum, sed tam nudam in omnibus vitam exhibere, vt Librorum vice Gratia Spiritus vteremur: *It behooued vs to haue no neede of the Scriptures: but in al thinges to shewe our Liues so pure, and cleane, that in steede of Bookes wee might vse the Grace of the Holy Ghoste.*

Cyprian. De Cœna Domini.

Chryſoſt. ad Popul. Antiochen. Homil. 60.

Chryſoſt in Matthæ. Homil. 22.

Chryſoſt in Matthæ. Homil. 1.

In like manner S. Hierome saithe, Cum meruerimus esse cum Christo, & similes Angelis fuerimus, tunc Librorum Doctrina cessabit: *When wee shal obteine to be with* Christe,

Hieronym. in Præfatione in Lamen. Hieremiæ.

Sacraments necessarie.

Christe, *and shalbe like vnto the Angelles, then the Doctrine of Bookes shal geue place.*

Nowe tel vs, M. Hardinge, muste wee hereof conclude, as you do, that these Holy Fathers, S. Cyprian, S. Augustine, S. Hierome, S. Chrysostome, Helde false, and perillous Doctrines, and with wicked temeritie (as you saie) woulde abandonne bothe Scriptures, and Sacramentes, as thinges not Necessarie? Certainely for ful resolution hereof, M. Caluine him selfe saithe thus, Facilè patior, vt, quæ Christus nobis dedit, Salutis adiumenta, eorum vsus Necessarius dicatur: quando, scilicet, datur facultas, Quanquam Semper admonendi sunt Fideles, non aliam esse cuiusuis Sacramenti Necessitatem, quam Instrumentalis Causæ, cui nequaquam alligandа est Dei virtus. Vocem sanè illam nemo pius est, qui non toto pectore exhorreat, Sacramenta res esse Superfluas: *I can wel suffer, that, what so euer* healpes of Saluation Christe *hathe geuen vs, the vse thereof be counted* Necessarie: *I meane, when wee maie haue oportunitie, and time to vse them. Heare be it, thus muche the Faithful muste be warned, that the* Necessitie *of any Sacrament is none otherwise, but as of a Cause Instrumental: vnto whiche Cause wee maie not in any wise binde the Power of God.* But that the Sacramentes be thinges Superfluous, no Godly man can abide to heare it.

Iohan. Caluinus in Antidoto ad 7. sessionem Cõcilij Tridentin.

Whereas you further charge M. Caluine, for saieinge, The Children of the Faithful are borne Holy, We shoulde rather herewith haue charged S. Paule. For thus he saithe, Nunc Liberi vestri Sancti sunt: *Nowe are your Children Holy.* We shoulde haue remembred, M. Hardinge, that theise be S. Paules wordes, and not M. Caluines. His meaninge is, that the Children of the Faithful, notwithstandinge by Nature they be the Children of Anger, yet by Gods Free Election they be Pure, and Holy. This is S. Paules vndoubted Doctrine: Whiche notwithstandinge, He neuer neither despised the Sacramentes of Christe, nor leadde the people (as you saie) to Mahomete, or Epicure.

1. Cor. 7.

Here at the laste, M. Hardinge, to returne, as he saithe, to his Reles, firste beginneth with the spiteful woordes, and scorneful scoffes, and light Sprite of Sir Defender, whiche (he saithe) he learned in the Schoole of Sathan, and nowe lieth bounde in Sathans fetters.

To answeare al suche M. Hardinges vanities, it were but vaine. Wise men wil not greatly weigh these childishe Tragedies.

But he saithe, The Priest holdeth a Consistorie, and is a Iudge ouer the Sinnes of the People. But beinge a Iudge he cannot discerne Sinnes, onlesse he knowe them. Neither can he knowe them, but by Confession. Therefore (saithe M. Hardinge) wee tel them, that Confession of al Deadly Sinnes is of the Institution of God: and not of Man. Mary (saithe he) touchinge the manner of Confession, secretely to the Priest alone, it is most agreeable to Natural Reason, that secrete Sinnes be Confessed secretely.

Here, I beseeche thee, good Christian Reader, note this one thinge by the waie: M. Hardinge, contrarie to common order, hath brought vs the Institution of God without any manner Worde of God. And thus (he saithe) we tel them: As if his bare tellinge shoulde stande for proufe.

Verily, notwithstandinge Christe gaue his Apostles Power of Bindinge, and Losinge, yet it appeareth not, that he spake any one worde of Secrete Confession. And Gratian a Famouse Doctoure of that side doubteth not to saie, Latentia peccata non probantur Necessariò Sacerdoti Confitenda: *It is not prooued, that Priuie sinnes ought of Necessitie to be Confessed vnto the Priest.* And againe, Datur intelligi quòd etiam, ore tacente, Veniam Consequi possumus: *Wee are geuen to vnderstande, that although wee* vtter nothinge with our mouthe, *yet wee maie obteine pardonne, or Absolution of our Sinnes.* Therefore, notwithstandinge al this M. Hardinges tellinge, his owne Doctour Gratian telleth him, that Auriculare Confession is not Gods Institution.

De Pœnit. dist. 1. Quis aliquãdo. De Pœnit. dist. 1. Conuertimini.

But wherefore speaketh M. Hardinge so precisely, & specially of Deadly Sinnes? Or, why mate not his Venial Sinnes comme likewise in the rekeninge as wel, as others? In deede it is specially prouided in the late Chapter at Trident, that Litle Petite Sinnes neede not to be vttered in Confession. And Rob. Holcote saithe, De Venialibus Confitori, magis est Supererogationis, quàm Necessitatis: *To make Confession of* Venial Sinnes, *is more of Deuotion, then of Necessitie.* And Thomas of Aquine saithe, Quidam probabiliter dicunt, quòd per ingressum Ecclesiæ Consecratæ, homo

Concil. Trident. Cap 5. De Confessione. Rob. Holcot in 4. senten. Q. 4.

homo consequitur Remissionem peccatorum Venialium : *Somme saie, and that not without good reason, that a man maie obteine Remission of his* Venial Sinnes, *onely by entring into a Churche, that is Consecrate.* **And it is purposely noted in the Glose upon the Decretales,** Venialia tolluntur, vel per Orationem Dominicam, vel per Aquam Benedictam : Venial Sinnes *maie be remoued, either by a* Pater noster, *or by Holy Water.* **And therefore perhappes M. Hardinge wil saie, according to the iudgemente of these, and others his owne Doctours, that his** Litle Pretie Venial Sinnes **ought not of dewtie to be reckened in Confession : but maie otherwise be remitted, and haue no nede of** Christes Bloude. **This is a shorter waie to Heauen, then either** Christe, **or his Apostles euer taught vs.**

4. Senten. Q. 4. Artic. 3. Extra. De Pœnit. & Remiss. Omnis vtriusque In Glossa.

Howe be it, al this errour semeth firste to haue growen of mistakinge these wordes of Beda : Coæqualibus quotidiana, & Leuia: grauiora verò Sacerdoti Pandamus : *Let vs open our smal, and daiely Sinnes vnto our felowes : and our great Sinnes vnto the Priest.*

Beda in 5. Cap. Iacobi Citatur à Magistro 4. Senten. Dist. 17.

For the reste, M. Hardinges Resolution maie stande with good fauoure. For saeinge his Auriculare Confession **can holde no better by Diuinitie, that it maie serme to holde by somewhat, he did wel, to saie,** It holdeth wel by Natural Reason.

M. Hardinge saithe, The Priest can be no Iudge without particular knowledge of euery Sinne: Nor can he knowe without hearing: Nor can he heare without Confession. **For answeare hereto,** Chrysostome **saithe, as he is before alleged :** Medicinæ locus hic est, non Iudicij : Non Pœnas, sed Peccatorum Remissionem tribuens : Deo Soli die Peccatum tuum : *Here is a place of Medicine, and not of Iudgement : rendringe not pounishmente, but Remission of Sinnes : Open thine offences to God onely.*

Chrysostom. De Pœnit. Homil. 9.

But, if the Priest can be no Iudge without knowledge, then doubteles, M. Hardinge, your Priestes, for the more parte, can be no Iudges at al. For your owne Peter Lombarde **saithe,** Scientiam discernendi Omnes Sacerdotes non habent: *Al Priestes haue not knowledge to discerne betweene sinne, and sinne.* **And many of them be vtterly ignorant, and knowe nothinge.**

4. Senten. Dist. 19 Postquam.

Notwithstandinge, be the Priest neuer so wise, or wel learned, yet howe is he hable to enter into the breaste of man, and to knowe the Secretes of the harte ? S. Paule **saithe,** *What man knoweth, what is in man, but the spirit of man, that is within him?* Salomon **saithe,** *God Onely knoweth the thoughtes of menne.* S. Paule **saithe,** *God Onely searcheth the Harte, and Reines.* **And** S. Augustine **purposely speakinge hereof, as it is saide before, saithe thus,** Vnde sciunt, cùm à me ipso de me ipso audiunt, an verum dicam ? *Howe knowe they, when they heare mee speake of my selfe, whether I saie Truthe or no ?* **Therefore the Priest iudginge that, that he cannot knowe, muste nedes wander vncertainely, and be a very doubtful Iudge.**

1. Cor. 2. 3. Reg. 8. Roman. 8. August. Confess. Lib. 10. Ca. 3

Neuertheles, admittinge the Priest to be a Iudge, yet, if it maie be proued, either, that he maie be a Iudge ouer the sinnes of the people, without Particulare knowledge of the same : or, that he maie comme to certaine, and particulare knowledge thereof without any manner Auriculare Confession, **then, I truste, this whole mater wil sone be answeared.**

Firste therefore I saie, that a Priest hauinge Authoritie to pronounce the Worde of God, is thereby a Iudge ouer Sinne. For the Worde that he speaketh, *Is the Power of God vnto Saluation: and a Two edged swerde, hable to sunder the Soule, and the Sprite, and the marie from the Bones : and is* hable to Iudge, (for so S. Paule saithe) *the thoughtes, and cogitations of the Harte.* **And thus M. Hardinge him selfe graunteth,** That a Priest pronouncinge Goddes VVoordes, maie therewith bothe Binde and Loose : **That is, in this case, to do, the office of a Iudge.** S. Augustine **saithe,** Clauis ea dicenda est, qua pectorum dura reserantur : *That thinge ought to be called the Keie, wherewith the hardnesse of the harte is opened.*

Roma. 1. Heb. 4. κριτικὸς ἐνθυμήσεων καὶ ἐννοιῶν καρδίας. August. De Sanctis. Homil. 26.

So saithe Tertullian, Ipse Clauem imbuit. Vides, quam? Viri Israelitæ, auribus mandate, quæ dico Iesum Nazarenum Virum à Deo nobis destinatum : *He endewed the Keie. And know you, what Keie? This Keie, I meane: Ye menne of* Israel, *marke, what I saie :* Iesus *of* Nazareth, *a man appointed vnto you from God.* **These wordes, saithe**

Tertullian De Pudicitia. Actor. 2.

Tertul-

Tertullian, are the Deie. So saithe S. Augustine, Loquimur in auribus vestris. Vnde scimus, quid agatur in Cordibus vestris? Quod autem intus agitur, non à nobis, sed ab illo agitur. Prospexit ergo Deus, vt Soluat filios mortificatorum. *Wee speake in your eares. But howe knowe we, what is wrought in your hartes? Howe be it, what so euer is wrought within you, it is wrought, not by vs, but by God. God therefore hath looked foorthe, to* Loose *the Children of them, that were appointed to Deathe.* Thus is the Priest a Iudge, and Bindeth, and Loseth, without any hearinge of Priuate Confessions.

Of the other side, I saie, that in open crimes, and Publike Penance, the Priest is likewise appointed to bee a Iudge. For notwithstandinge in the Primitiue Churche, either the whole people, or the Elders of the Congregation had Authoritie herein, yet the direction, and Iudgement rested euermore in the Priest. And in this sense S. Paule saithe vnto Timothee, *Receiue no accusation againste an Elder, onlesse it bee vnder twoo, or three witnesses.* 1. Tim. 5.

And, notwithstandinge these Orders, for the greatest parte thereof, be nowe vtterly out of vse, yet, I truste, it shal not be neither impertinente to the mater, nor vnpleasant vnto the Reader, to consider howe the same were vsed in Olde times. Therefore, as it is Learnedly noted by Beatus Rhenanus, The Sinner, when hee beganne to mislike him selfe, and to be penitente for his wicked life, for that he had offended God, and his Churche, came firste vnto the Bishoppe, and Priestes, as vnto the Mouthes of the Churche, and opened vnto them the whole burthen of his harte. Afterwarde he was by them brought into the Congregation, and there made the same Confession Openly before his Brethren: and further was appointed to make Satisfaction by open Penance. Whiche Penance beinge dewly and humbly donne, he was restored againe openly vnto the Churche, by laieinge on of the handes of the Priestes and Elders.

Hereof S. Paule saithe vnto the Corinthians, *If you haue forgeeuen any thinge to any man, I haue likewise forgeeuen it. For I mee selfe, What so euer I haue forgeeuen, I haue forgeeuen it for your sakes in the Personne of* Christe. 2. Cor. 2.

In this Limitation of Penance, leaste any thinge shoulde passe vnadulsedly, and out of Order, the Priestе was appointed to be the Iudge. S. Basile saithe, Modus Conuersionis debet esse conueniens illi, qui peccauit: *The Order of Conuersion, or Open Penance, muste bee agreeable vnto him, that hathe offended.* And therefore S. Augustine saithe, Quia Plærunque, &c. *For as much as, for the moste parte, the griefe of one mannes harte is vnknowen vnto an other, neither commeth foorth into the knowledge of others, either by woordes, or by other tokens, as beinge before him, vnto whome it is saide,* My Mourninge is not hidde from thee, *therefore it is very wel, that by them, that haue the ouersighte of the Churche, certaine times of Penance are appointed, that the Congregation maie be satisfied.* Againe he saithe, Hortor Prius Publica Pœnitentia satisfacere, & ita Sacerdotis Iudicio reconciliatum Communioni sociari: *I Counsel him, that firste he make Satisfaction by Open Penance: that beinge so reconciled, he maie afterwarde be restoared vnto the Communion by the* Iudgemente, and discretion of Priestе. Likewise saithe Cassiodorus, Rei expectant Communionis tempus, quod decreuit Episcopus: *The Penitent parties waite for the Communion time,* appointed vnto them by the Bishop.

Basili. Quæ. 228. ὁ μὲν ἐπίσκοπος τῶν ἁμαρτάνοντος. Augu. in Enchirid. ad Laurentium. Cap 65. August. De Ecclesiast. Dogmatib. Cap 35. Cassiodor Lib. 9 Cap 33.

S. Ambrose demaunded of the Emperoure Theodosius, beinge then excommuniate, Quibus Medicamentis incurabilia vulnera tua, plagasque curasti? *By what Medicines haue you healed your woundes, and cuttes, that were incurable?* The Emperour answeared, Tuum Opus est, & Docere, & Medicamenta temperare: Meum verò, oblata suscipere: *It is your parte, to Instructe mee, and to Minister Medicines: and it is my parte to receiue, that you Minister.* And therefore Peter Lombarde saithe, Etsi aliquis apud Deum sit solutus, non tamen in facie Ecclesiæ solutus habetur, nisi per Iudicium Sacerdotis: *Although a man be assoiled before God, yet is he not accounpted assoiled in the Face, or Sight of the Churche, but by the* Iudgemente of the Priestе. Cassiodor. Lib. 9 Cap 30. 4. Senten. Dist 18 Non autem.

By these, M. Hardinge, I doubte not, but ye maie see, that the Priestе maie be a Iudge ouer Sinne, notwithstandinge he neuer heare Priuate Confessions, nor haue particulare knowledge of euery seuerall sinne.

This is that Confession, that the Holy Fathers haue so often spoken of. It was made, not secretly, or in a corner: but publiquely, and openly, and in the sight of the Congregation. Hereof Origen saithe, as it is reported before: Si quis sibi sit conscius, Procedat in Medium, & ipse sui accusator existat: *If any man finde him selfe guilty, let him comme forthe into the middes of the Churche, and let him be his owne accuser.* Likewise Tertullian saithe, Aduolui Presbyteris, & Aris Dei adgeniculari, & Omnibus Fratribus legationes deprecationis suæ iniungere: *To falle downe before the Priestes: To kneele before the Aultare, or Communion Table: and to desire All the Brethren, to praie for him.*

Origen. in Psam. 37.

Tertullian. De Pœnitentia.

Touchinge S. Hierome, M. Hardinge, ye late in his wordes as faithfully, as Ananias sommetime laide in his monie at the Apostles fæte. Yæ serue vs with a parcel, and holde backe the reste. It is true, that S. Hierome saithe, It is the Priestes parte to discerne the diuersitie bitweene sinne, and sinne. As in cases of Excommunication, and Publique offences. But wherefore coulde ye not espie: or rather, why woulde you so closely dissemble so many, and so plaine Wordes goeinge immediatly before? For thus S. Hierome writeth of the Power of the Keies, and of the vse of Confession: Istum locum Episcopi, & Presbyteri non intelligentes, aliquid sibi de Pharisæorum assumunt Supercilio: vt vel damnent innocentes, vel soluere se noxios arbitrentur: cùm apud Deum non sententia Sacerdotum, sed reorum vita qnæratur: *This place the Bishoppes, and Priestes, not vnderstandinge, take vnto them somme parte of the Proude lookes of the Phariseis: thinkinge them selues hable either to Condemne the Innocent, or to Absolue the guiltie:* VVhereas in deede it is not the Absolution of the Priest, but the life of the Sinner, that is weighed before God. These wordes, M. Hardinge, woulde not thus haue benne dissembled, if yæ had meante simple dealinge. S. Hierome saithe plainely, That your Bishoppes, and Priestes vnderstande not the vse of the Keies: That ye haue taken vpon you somme parte of the Proude lookes of the Phariseis: And, That it is not the Absolution of the Priest, but the Life of the partie, that is accepted before God.

Hieronym. in Matthæ Cap. 16.

In the ende, he concludeth thus, Alligat, vel soluit Episcopus, vel Presbyter, non eos, qui insontes sunt, vel noxij: Sed pro officio suo, cùm Peccatorum audierit varietates, scit, qui ligandus sit, qui soluendus: *The Bishop, or Priest neither Bindeth the innocente, or Looseth the guiltie: but accordinge to his office, when he hath hearde the diuersitie of Sinnes,* (as in Publique offences) *he knoweth who ought to be Bounde, who ought to be loosed.* In like sorte writeth Peter Lombarde, Dominus tribuit Sacerdotibus potestatem Ligandi, & Soluendi: id est, ostendendi hominibus Ligatos, vel Solutos: *God hathe geeuen to Priestes Power to Binde, and to Loose: that is to saie, to declare vnto menne, that the Penitentes be either Bounde, or Loosed.*

4. Senten. Dist. 18 Nec ideo.

Al this notwithstanding, al be it M. Harding were hable to proue, that the Fathers had sommewhere made mention of Confession in Secrete, yet should not that greatly either farther his purpose, or hinder ours. For, Abuses, and Errours remoued, and specially the Prieste beinge Learned, as wæ haue saide before, wæ mislike no manner Confession, whether it be Priuate, or Publique. For as wæ thinke it not vnlawful, to make open Confession before many, so wæ thinke it not vnlawful, Abuses alwaies excepted, to make the like Confession in Priuate, either before a fewe, or before one alone. And, as the Holy Fathers, vpon good considerations, were forced to remoue the vse of Open Confession, euen so wæ saie, that vpon like good Considerations, Priuate Confession also maie be remoued.

Onely this wæ saie, that Christ, when he sent his Disciples into the World, and gaue them authoritie to Binde, and to Lose, made no manner mention of any such Hearinge of Confessions, but onely bade them, Goe, and Preache the Gospel.

Hilarie, Bernarde, and Hugo, as ye haue alleged them, séeme to saie, That the Iudgemente of Man goeth before the Iudgemente of God. Other the like, or rather more vehemente speaches ye might haue founde in Chrysostome: Cœlum accipit Authoritatem Iudicandi à Terra. Iudex sedet in Terris: Dominus sequitur Seruum: *Heauen taketh Authoritie of Iudgemente from the Earthe. In Earthe sitteth the Iudge: The Lorde*

Chrysostm. in Esai. Homil. 5.

Confession not Commaunded.

Lorde foloweth the Seruante. Theise, and lutch other the like extraordinarie speaches, with good Construction, mate be comfortable to the afflicted minde. But as one laid sometime, they muste be receiued with a Graine of Salte: For otherwise, of them selues they be vnsauerie. For: S. Hierome saithe, as I haue alleged before, Apud Deum, non sententia Sacerdotis, sed reorum vita quæritur: *It is not the Sentence, or Absolution of the Prieste, but the life of the Penitente, that is accepted before God.* And againe, Tunc vera est sententia Præsidentis, quando Aeterni sequitur sententiam Iudicis: *Then the iudgement of the President, or Prieste is true,* (not when it goeth before, but) *when it foloweth the Iudgemente of the Euerlastinge Iudge.* And Gratian him selfe saithe, Non Sacerdotali Iudicio, sed largitate Diuinæ Gratiæ Peccator emundatur: *The Sinner is made cleane, not by Iudgemente of the Prieste, but by the abundance of the Heauenly Grace.*

Hieronym in Matthæ. Cap 16. 11 Quæst. 3. Tunc vera.

De Pœnit dist 1. Conuerti inini.

But Nazianzene, as he is here alleged, saide vnto the Emperoure, Ouis nostra es: *Thou arte our Sheepe.* No maruelle. He meant, that the Emperour was One of the Flocke, and Folde of Christe. So S. Ambrose saide sometime vnto the Emperoure Valentinian, Quid honorificentius, quàm vt Ecclesiæ Filius dicatur Imperator? Imperator enim bonus intra Ecclesiam, non supra Ecclesiam est: *What thinge is there more honourable, then for the Emperoure to be called a Childe of the Churche? For a good Emperour is Within the Churche: but not Aboue the Churche.* S. Chrysostome saith, Deus ipse subiecit Caput Principis manui Sacerdotis: *God him selfe hath set the Head of the Prince vnder the Hande of the Prieste.* For, as touchinge Faithe, and the Obedience of the Gospel, the Highest Prince is but a Subiect. All this proueth wel the Authoritie, and Dignitie of Goddes Worde: but it maketh nothinge for Confession.

Ambros. ad Valentinian. Epist 32

Chrysostom. De Verbu Esaie, Homil. 5.

To conclude, M. Hardinge saithe, It hathe benne persuaded, that the recitinge, and rehearsal of al sinnes before the Prieste, is necessarie to Saluation: and that a General Confession is in no wise sufficient. **And againe he saithe,** True Faith acknowledgeth, that Confession is to bee made of al Sinnes, as Commaunded by Christe and his Apostles: Commended vnto vs by the Fathers of the Primitiue Churche, and by al Learned Doctours, and General vse of the whole Church.

Good Reader, Thou wouldest thinke, that emongest so many great Wordes, there were somme Truthe: and that M. Hardinge of his modestie, and for his Credites sake, woulde not speake so boldely without somme good grounde. But, I beseche thee, Consider these fewe: and thereby Iudge indifferently of the reste.

Chrysostome saithe, Non dico, vt Confitearis Conseruo tuo peccata tua Dicito Deo, qui curet ea: *I wil thee not* to Confesse thy Sinnes vnto the Prieste, *that is thy felow seruante. Confesse them* vnto God, *that maie heale them.* Againe, Cogitatione tua fiat delictorum exquisitio: Sine teste sit hoc Iudicium: Solus Deus te Confitentem videat: *Examine thy Sinnes in thy harte within thee. Let this Iudgement be* without witnesse: *Let* God onely see *thee makinge thy Confession.* Beatus Rhenanus, **a man of greate readinge, and singular Iudgement, herof writeth thus:** Tertullianus de Clancularia ista Confessione admissorum nihil loquitur. Neque eam vsquam olim Præceptam legimus: Tertullian *of this Priuie Confession of Sinnes saithe nothinge. Neither doo we reade that the same Kinde of Priuie Confession in* Olde Times was euer Commaunded.

Chrysostom. in Psal. 50. Homil 2. Chrysostom. in Homil. De Pœnitent & Confessione. Beat. Rhenan. in Argum. Libelli Tertull. De Pœnitentia.

M. Hardinge saithe, It was Commaunded, Rhenanus saithe, *It was not Commaunded.* **If** Rhenanus **wordes be true, as they be in dede, then are M. Hardinges wordes moste vntrue. Likewise it is noted in the very** Glose **vpon M. Hardinges owne Decrees:** Fortè tunc (tempore Ambrosij) non erat facta Institutio Confessionis, quæ modò est: *Perhappes then* (**in the time of** S. Ambrose, **which was foure hundred yeres after** Christe) *the manner of Confession, that nowe is vsed, was not appointed.*

De Pœnit. dist 1. Petrus in Gloss.

And Gratian saithe, Antequam Sacerdoti Ora nostra ostendamus, id est, Peccata nostra Confiteamur, à Lepra Peccati mundamur: *Before wee open our mouthe vnto the Prieste, that is to saie,* before we make Confession of our Sinnes, *the Leprosie of our Sinne is made cleane.* Theodorus saithe, Quidam Deo solummodò confiteri debere peccata dicunt, vt Græci: *Somme saie, wee ought to Confesse our Sinnes* onely vnto God, *as doo the Grecians.* Peter Lombarde **the Chiefe Founder of M. Hardinges Diuinitie, saith thus:** Sanè dici potest, quòd sine Confessione Oris, & solutione Pœnæ exterioris, Peccata delentur per Contritionem, & humilitatem Cordis: *Wee maie safely say, that*

De Pœnit. dist 1. Conuerti in ini.

De Pœnit dist 1. Quidam

4 Senten. dist 17. Quid ergo.

Confession not Commaunded.

without Confession of the Mouthe, *and Absolution of the outwarde paine, Sinnes be forgeeuen by the Contrition, and humilitie of the Harte.*

Briefely, Gratian **hauinge thorowly debated the mater of bothe sides, that is to saie, bothe for Confession, and againste Confession, in the ende concludeth thus,** De Pœnit. dist. 1. Quamuis. **as it is saide before:** Cui harum sententiarum potiùs adhærendum sit, Lectoris Iudicio reseruatur. Vtraq; enim sententia fautores habet Sapientes, & Religiosos Viros: *Whether of these saieinges it is beste to folowe, it is leafte to the Iudgemente of the Reader:* For either Saieinge, is mainteined, and fauoured, bothe by VVise, and by Godly Menne. **And, whereas M. Hardinge saithe,** Confession of al Sinnes is Commaunded by Christe, and his Apostles, **his owne** Glose **vpon his owne Decrees openly reproueth his errour, and teacheth him the contrarie. The wordes be these,** Melius dicitur, Confessionem institutam fuisse à quadam Vniuersalis Ecclesiæ Traditione, potius quàm ex Noui, vel Veteris Testamenti Authoritate: *It is better saide, that Confession was appointed by* somme Tradition of the Vniuersal Churche, *then by any Authoritie, or Commaundemente of the Newe, or Olde Testament.* De Pœnit. dist. 5. In Pœnitentia, In Glossa.

Nowe god Christian Reader, I beseche thee, examine a litle the Truthe of M. Hardinges tale. Firste he saithe, The Recitinge and Rehearsal of al Sinnes before the Priest, is Necessarie to Salutation: Chrysostome **answeareth,** *Lette* God Onely *heare thy Confession.* **There is one Untruthe. M. Hardinge saithe,** General Confession is not sufficient: Peter Lombarde **answeareth,** Sine Confessione Oris, &c. VVithout any Confession made by Mouthe *our Sinnes maie be forgeeuen.* **There are two Untruthes.** 1. 2.

M. Hardinge saithe, Confession of al Sinnes is commaunded By Christe, and his Apostles: **His owne** Glose **saithe,** It is Onely a Tradition of the Churche, commaunded neither in the Olde Testamente, nor in the Newe. **There are three Untruthes. M. Harding saith,** It was cõmended vnto vs by the *Doctours, and Fathers of the *Primitiue Church. Rhenanus **saithe,** VVee reade not, that this kinde of Priuie Confession, in the Olde times was euer Commaunded: **And his owne** Glose **saith,** *In the time of* S. Ambrose, **(whiche was foure hundred yeres after** Christe) *perhappes it was not vsed.* **There are Foure, and Fiue Untruthes. M. Hardinge saithe,** It hathe euer benne allowed by al the Learned Doctours. **His owne** Gratian **answeareth him,** The Contrarie hath benne mainteined, and Fauoured bothe by VVise, and by Godly Fathers. **There are fiue Untruthes.** 3. 4. 5. 6.

To be shorte, M. Hardinge saithe, It hathe benne Commended vnto vs by the General vse of the whole Churche: Theodorus **answeareth him,** The whole Churche of Grecia vseth it not. **There are Seuen apparente, and greate Untruthes, disclosed by M. Hardinges owne Doctoures. He coulde not haue compriſed so mutche Untruthe, in so narrowe rome, without somme studie.** 7.

Erasmus **a man of great Iudgemente saithe thus,** Apparet tempore Hieronymi nondum Institutam fuisse Secretam admissorum Confessionem: quàm postea Ecclesia salubriter instituit: si modò rectè vtantur ea & Sacerdotes, & Laici. Verùm in hoc labuntur Theologi quidam parùm attenti, quòd, quæ Veteres scribunt de huiusmodi Publica, & Generali Confessione, ea trahunt ad hanc Occultam, & longè diuersi generis: *It appeareth, that in the time of* S. Hierome, **(which was foure hundred yeres after** Christe) Secrete Confession of Sinnes was not yet ordeined: *Which notwithstandinge was afterwarde wholesomely, and profitablie appointed by the Churche, so that it be wel vsed, as wel by the Prieſtes, as by the People. But herein certaine Diuines, not considering aduisedly, what they saie, are mutche deceiued: for what so euer the Anciente Fathers write of* General and Open Confession, *they wreaste, and drawe the same to this* Priuie, and Secrete kinde, *whiche is farre of an other sorte.* Erasm. in schol. in Epitaphium Fabiolæ.

Here M. Hardinge, Erasmus **telleth you, ye are folwly deceiued: and sheweth you also the cause of your errour: for that, as he saieth,** *Ye consider not aduisedly, what ye either reade, or write: but where so euer ye heare this woorde* Confession, *yet imagine streight waie, It must needes be your owne* Auriculare Confession, *and can be none other.*

Laste of al, ye graunt, The expresse Terme of Auriculare or Secrete Confession is seldome mentioned in the Ancientz Fathers. **Here wanteth, M. Hardinge, somme parte of your**

simplicitie

Authoritie, and Povver.

ſimplicitie. If ye woulde haue your Reader to beléeue you, ye ſhoulde haue alleged certaine of the Aunciente Fathers, One at the leaſte, if ye coulde haue founde ſo many, that had at any time vſed the expreſſe terme of Auriculare, or Secrete Confeſſion. Otherwiſe it had benne the better, and plainer waie, to haue Confeſſed expreſſely, that the ſame expreſſe terme is neuer vſed in any one of al the Ancient Fathers. Howe be it, if Auriculare, or Secrete Confeſsion had then benne vſed, it could neuer ſo longe haue lacked a name.

The Apologie, Cap. 7. Diuiſion. 3.

Wee ſaie, that the Prieſte in deede is a Iudge in this Caſe, but yet hathe no manner of Righte to chalenge an Authoritie, or Power, as ſaithe Ambroſe.

M. Hardinge.

VVhereas ye make preachinge of the Goſpel to be the Keies, howe cal ye the Prieſte Iudge in this caſe? Preache ye neuer ſo mutche, the conſcience of man beinge ſo ſecrete a thinge as it is, howe can ye iudge, who inwardly and thoroughly repenteth, and who repenteth not? And though one repente and be ſory, and haue remorſe of his former life, though he looke vnto the light of the Goſpel, as ye ſaie, and beleeue in Chriſte, what then? howe can ye iudge of ſutche a Perſonne? *Doo ye knowe his harte by lookinge in his face?

*And doo ye knowe his hart by tootinge in his eare?

De Pœnit. Dist. 1. C. Verbi Dei.

The Prieſte dewly vſinge the Keie of knowledge and diſcretion, doothe the office of a Iudge, and as he ſeethe cauſe, either Looſeth or Bindeth. As touchinge the Prieſtes Authoritie, or Power, whiche to chalenge hee hathe no right, for ſo your Interpreter maketh you to ſpeake, and impute it to S. Ambroſe: we denie that S. Ambroſe ſaithe *euen very ſo. But as we may gather of his woordes, as hee meaneth that a Prieſte exerciſeth not the righte of any his owne proper power in remittinge ſinnes: ſo in the very place by you alleaged, he ſaithe the contrarie to your Doctrine. For the Right of Looſinge and Bindinge (ſaithe he) is graunted to Prieſtes onely, and therefore the Churche chalengeth it rightly, whiche hathe true Prieſtes. Lo he vſeth the woorde of chalenge. Againe in the ſame place he auoucheth, that he whiche receiueth the Holy Ghoſte, (whome Prieſtes receiue, when they bee Conſecrated in the Sacramente of Order) receiue alſo Power to Looſe and Binde Sinnes. For proufe thereof, he alleged the Scripture: Take ye the Holy Ghoſte, whoſe ſinnes ye remitte, they are remitted: and whoſe ſinnes ye reteine, they are reteined. And if you, Defender, were accuſtomed to make your humble Confeſſion, and ſo to be aſſoiled, you ſhoulde heare ſome Ghoſtly Fathers ſaie to you, after certaine other woordes, *Auctoritate mihi commiſſa ego te Abſoluo, &c.*

*Vntruthe. For the woordes bee theſe, *Nullius poteſtatis iura exercet.*

Iohan. 20.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

In what ſenſe the Prieſte without hearinge Confeſſions maie bée a Iudge, wée haue ſufficiently ſaide before. Neither knowe I, what fantaſie M. Hardinge can haue in ſo often rehearſal of one thinge. With what woordes, or coloure of Commiſſion, M. Hardinge can furniſhe out his Authoritie, it forceth not greatly. Verily without ſomme ſhewe, or countenance, his credite woulde not holde. In deede, Hugo, and Bernarde ſaie, *The Iudgemente of God followeth the Iudgement of man.* And Pope Iulius ſaithe, Habet Sacroſancta Romana Eccleſia Poteſtatem, ſingulari ſibi Priuilegio Conceſſam, Aperire, & Claudere ianuas Regni Cœleſtis, quibus voluerit: *The Holy Churche of* Rome, *hathe Power graunted vnto her by Singular Priuilege, to Open, and to Shutte the gates of the Kingedome of Heauen,* to whom ſhee liſteth. And Cardinal Cuſanus ſaithe, Hæc Ligandi, & Soluendi Poteſtas, non minor eſt in Eccleſia, quàm in Chriſto: *This Power of Bindinge, and Looſinge is no leſſe in the Churche,* then it is in Chriſte.

Concil. Tom. 1. De Primatu. Rom. Eccleſiæ.

Nicol. Cuſanus. Ad Bohemos Epiſt. 2.

But it is no greate wiſedome to géeue ouer mutche credite vnto them, that ſo often haue deceiued vs. If their Authoritie be ſo greate, as they make it, lette them ſhewe ſowthe the woordes of their Commiſſion.

The ſaieinge of S. Ambroſe is cleare, and plaine: Verbum Dei dimittit Peccata. Sacerdos eſt Iudex Sacerdos quidem officium ſuum exhibet: Sed nullius poteſtatis iura exercet: *The Woorde of God forgeueth Sinnes. The Prieſt is the Iudge. The Prieſt executeth his office,* But he exerciſeth the right of no Power. **And to this ende in an other place he alleageth the woordes of the Prophet** Eſaie ſpoken in the perſon of God, Ego ſum, ego ſum, qui deleo iniquitates tuas: *I am he, I am he, that put awaie thine iniquities.*

De Pœnit. dist. 1. Verbum Dei. Ambroſ. De Noë & Arca. Cap. 13. Eſaiæ. 4.

And, to laie more weight to S. Ambroſes woordes, S. Auguſtine ſaithe in like ſenſe, Officium Baptizandi Dominus conceſsit multis: Poteſtatem verò, & Authoritatem

Auguſt. De ſcalis Paradiſi.

ritatem in Baptismo remittendi peccata, sibi Soli reseruauit: *Our Lorde hathe graunted the office of Baptizinge vnto many: but the Power, and Authoritie in Baptisme to forgeeue Sinnes, he hathe reserued* Onely to him selfe. So saithe S. Ambrose, Nostrum est onera remittere: Illius est resuscitare: Illius est educere de Sepulchro: *It is our parte, to remoue the stone from the graue* (by Preachinge, by Counsel, and by Exhortation): *But it is the Lordes woorke to raise vp the dead: It is the Lordes woorke, to bringe him from the Pitte.*

Ambros. De Panitent. Li. 2 Ca. 7

Ambros. Lib. 9. Epist 76.

Like wise again he saith, Neq; Legatus, neque Nuntius, sed ipse Dominus saluum fecit populum suum. Solus remanet: quia non potest hoc cuiquam hominum cum Christo esse commune, vt peccata condonet. Solus hoc munus est Christi, qui tulit peccata mundi: *It is not the Embassadoure: It is not the Messenger, but the* Lorde him selfe, *that hathe saued his people.* The Lorde remaineth alone. For noman can be partener with God in forgeeuinge of Sinnes. This is Christes Onely office, *that hathe taken awaie the Sinnes of the Worlde.*

2. Corinth. 5. Tertullian De Baptismo. August. in Iohan. Tract. 5. Luke. 12. ἐξουσίαν καὶ δύναμιν.

And yet is not therefore the Priestes office voide of Power. He hathe Power, and Commission to open the Wil of God, and, as S. Paule saithe, *To speake vnto the people, euen as in the Persone of* Christe. So Tertullian saithe, Dandi Baptismi ius habet Summus Sacerdos, id est, Episcopus: *The Chiefe Priest, that is to saie, the Bishop, hath Right, and Power, to geeue Baptisme.* But S. Augustine saithe, Ministerium dedit seruis: Potestatem sibi retinuit: *God gaue the Ministerie (of Remission of Sinnes) vnto his Seruauntes:* But the Power thereof he reteined to him selfe. So, when Christe sente out his Disciples to Preache the Gospel, he gaue them Authoritie, and Power, as it is writen in S. Luke.

Hosius in Confessione Petricouien. Cap. 32.

If M. Hardinge wil saie, There is no Power, or Authoritie in the Reading, or Publishinge of Goddes Worde, his owne Doctoure Hosius wil tel him, that, when the Bishop Ordereth a Reader, euen after the manner of the Churche of Rome, he saithe vnto him, Habe Potestatem legendi Epistolas in Ecclesia Sancta Dei, tam pro viuis, quàm pro defunctis: *Haue thou Power to Reade the Epistles in the Holy Churche of God, as wel for the Quicke, as for the Deade.*

Hierowym. in Matthe. Cap 16. August. De Fide & Operibus, Cap. 14. Richar. De Sancto Victore, De Potestat. Ligan. & Soluen. Par. 2. Cap. 24.

In deede, this is a very special Power, suche as, I trowe, Christ and his Apostles neuer taught vs. Neither woulde I haue noted it in this place, sauinge that Hosius, the profoundest Proctour of that side, thoughte it a mater worthe the Noting. Suche Power therefore belongeth to Priestes, and Ministers in the Churche of God. But the Power of Geuinge Remission of Sinne, belongeth to God alone, and to none other. If any man wil presume further, S. Hierome saithe, as it is alleged before. *He hathe put on the proude looke of the Pharisei.* And saithe further, that suche Priestes, and Bishoppes vnderstande not the Wordes of Christe. For, saithe he, *It is not the Iudgemente, or Absolution of the Priest, but the Life of the Penitente, that is regarded before God.* And therefore S. Augustine saithe, Inde nata sunt Scismata, cùm homines dicunt, Nos Sanctificamus immundos: Nos Iustificamus impios: nos petimus: nos impetramus: *Hereof growe Scismes, and Diuisions in the Churche, when menne saie, Wee Sanctifie the vncleane: wee Iustifie the wicked: wee praie: wee obteine.*

4. Senten. Dist. 18 Nec tidea.

Howe be it, here commeth in Richardus de Sancto Victore, God wote, with a ful colde distinction, betweene these two wordes, Dimittere, and Remittere. For thus he saithe: Christus potuit Dimittere peccata: Nos verò non possumus Dimittere Peccata, sed tantùm Remittere.

Peter Lombarde saithe mutche better, Christus Sacerdotibus tribuit potestatem Ligandi, & Soluendi, id est, ostendendi hominibus Ligatos, vel Solutos: Christe *hathe geeuen Power vnto Priestes to Binde, and to Loose: that is to saie, to declare vnto menne, whoe be Bounde, whoe be Loosed.*

Bonauent. 4. Sentent. Dist. 1. In Præmio. 1. qu. 1. Dictū est.

So saithe Bonauentura of the Priestes vnder the Lawe of Moses: Mundare dicebantur, quia mundatum ostendebant: *They were saide to cleanse the Leprose, because they shewed, who was cleansed.* So saithe S. Augustine, Nec voluntas Sacerdotis obesse vel prodesse potest, sed Meritum Benedictionem Poscentis: The wil of the Priest can neither further, nor hinder: *But the Merite of him, that desireth Absolution.*

This

Authoritie, and Powver.

This therefore is the meaninge of S. Ambrose, *The Priest is a Iudge to discerne betweene sinne, and sinne, as wel Priuate, as Publique. But Right, Power, or Authoritie to forgeeue sinnes, he hath none.*

The Apologie, Cap. 7. Diuision. 4.

And therefore our Sauiour Iesus Christe, to reproue the Negligence of the Scribes, and Pharisies in teachinge, did with these woordes rebuke them, saieinge: VVoe bee vnto you Scribes, and Pharisies, vvhiche haue taken avvaie the Keis of Knovvledge, and haue Shutte vp the Kingedome of Heauen before Menne. **Seeinge then the Keie whereby the waie, and entrie to the Kingdome of God is opened vnto vs, is the Woord of the Gospel, and the Expoundinge of the Lawe, and Scriptures, we saie plainely, where the same woorde is not, there is not the Keie.**

M. Hardinge.

The knowledge of the Scripture is a Keie.

By this wee are induced to graunte, that the knowledge of the Scripture is a Keie, whereby the gate to the Truthe is opened, the vse whereof consisteth in expoundinge of the Lawe, and Prophets, as they shewe Christ. But we say, this not to be the special Keies, which Christ gaue to the Churche, but one Keie alone. And so Christe calleth it, where he rebuked the Scribes and Pharisies. Though you haue put it otherwise then the Gospel hath, in the Plural number. And this Keie is common to the Lawe, and to the Gospel. But the Keies, whiche we speake of, are an other thing. By the name of these Keies, we vnderstande the whole Spiritual Power, whiche Christe firste promised to Peter, and afterwarde gaue to the Apostles, and from them is transferred to al Bishoppes and Priestes. By whiche Power, Priestes teache the Gospel, Consecrate the Body and Bloude of Christe, and Minister the Sacramentes, through Auctoritie of the VVoorde Absolue Penitentes, and Excommunicate Publique and hainous sinners. The Keie that you confusely speake of, naming it to be the VVoorde of the Gospel, and Expoundinge of the Lawe, and Scriptures, is one parte perteininge to this Spiritual Power, it is not the whole Power. And where this VVoorde is not, that is to saie, where the Scriptures be not taught, and the Gospel preached, there is not the Keie saie ye: there is not the exercise of that Keie, saie we. Yet there is this Spiritual Power, that is to witte, there be the Keies. Ye we saie that a simple Priestе * thoughe he haue no great learninge, yet hath he the Keies, though he might doo better, and more worthely vse them, hauinge learninge and knowledge.

*Vntruthe. The Keie of knoweledge, without knowledge.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

M. Hardinge mutche and often complaineth of the Confusion of the Keies: for that we appointe not distinctly, as he saithe, eche Keie to his seuerall office. Marke therefore, I beseeche thee, Gentle Reader, how distinctly, and plainely M. Hardinge him selfe intreateth of the same.

Firste, of the two Keies, that Christe **hath deliuered vs in the Gospel, he hathe made a greate many Keies: The Keie of knowledge: The Keie of Order: The Keie of Power: The Keie of Discretion: The Keie of Sacramentes: And, for as mutche, as Sacramentes by his Doctrine be Seuen in number, there must also bee of this sorte Seuen other seuerall Keies. And yet ouer, and bisides al these Keies, beeinge so many, the Pope hathe also One Special Maister Keie. Afterwarde by a sleighte, and by nimblinesse of his fingers, he conueigheth al this heape of Keies into two Onely Keies: Whereof the One he calleth the Keie of knowledge, and the other, the Keie of Power: Which two Keies notwithstanding, in the ende, are suddainely consumed bothe into One onely Keie. For whereas the Keie of knoweledge is loste, there, by M. Hardinges Iudgement, Power onely remaineth without knowledge: And that Keie alone dischargeth al offices, and is vtterly al in al.**

De Pœn. dis. 1. Verbum. Dei. Lucke. 22.

This Keie of Power without knowledge, muste nedes bee the Keie of Ignorance: Or, as they them selues haue vsed to cal it, Clauis Errans: *The Keie of Errour.* **Of whiche Keie vndoubtedly Christe saide sommetime,** Hoc est tempus vestrum, & Potestas Tenebrarum: *This is your time, and the Power of Darkenesse.* Peter Lombarde **him selfe saithe,** *Many Priestes be Ignorante, and haue not the Keie of knowledge:* Alexander of Hales **saithe,** Scientia non est Clauis: *Knowledge is no Keie at al.*

4 Senten. Dis. 19. Postquam. Alexand. De Hales Par. 4. Quæst. 79.

Yet M. Hardinge answeareth vs, that the simple Ignorant Priestе, that knoweth nothinge, hathe not onely One Keie, but bothe Keies (for so he calleth them in the

in the Plural number) that is to saie, as wel the Kete of knowledge, as the Kete of Power. And thus haue they forged a Kete of knowledge, without knowledge: and with the same Kete they expounde and open the Scriptures: they Minister the Sacraments: they Binde: they Loose: and breake vp a bywaie into the Kingedome of Heauen. Yet muste wée beléeue, that they speake simplie, and plainely of these Keies, and without confusion.

The Apologie, Cap. 7. Diuision. 5.

And, seeinge one manner of Woorde is geuen to al, and one onely Kete belongeth to al, we saie, there is but one onely Power of al Ministers, as concerninge Openinge, and Shuttinge. And, as touchinge the Bishop of Rome, for al that his Flatteringe Parasites singe these Woordes in his eares, To thee vvil I geeue the Keies of the Kingdome of Heauen, (as thonghe these Keies were fitte for him alone, and for no body els) excepte he goe so to woorke, as Mennes Consciences maie be made pliaunte, and be subdued to the Woorde of God, we denie, that he doothe either Open, or Shutte, or hathe the Keies at al.

And although he taught, and instructed the People (as woulde God he might once truely doo, and perswade him selfe, it were at the leaste any peece of his dewtie) yet wee thinke his Kete to be neuer a white better, or of greater force, then other Mennes. For who hathe seuered him from the reste? Who hathe taughte him more conningely to Open, or better to Absolue, then his bretherne?

M. Hardinge.

Your grounde beinge false, what ye builde thereon, sone faileth. The whole Power of the Keies pardy (howe often times muste we tel you one thinge?) standeth not in preachinge onely, but in sundrie other excellente Ministeries also, as we haue proued. If the Bishop of Rome preache not, he doothe neither Open, not Shutte by preachinge: we graunte. Yet mennes Consciences being made pliant and subdued by the VVoorde of God, by others that preache at his appointemente, he maie by vertue of the Keies, either Open or Shutte, Loose or Binde, as by discretion he seeth cause. And whereas Christe saide to Peter, and therefore to the Bishop of Rome Peters Successour, To thee wil I geue the Keies of the Kingedome of Heauen: wil ye cal them flatteringe Parasites, that yeelde to him that, whiche Christe gaue to him? Suche vomite shewеth what humour your stomake is charged withal. Denyinge the Bishop of Rome, whome, for al the spite ye beare towarde him, ye muste acknowledge to be a Bishop, to haue the Keies at al, onelesse he preache in his owne Persoune, ye declare your greate ignoraunce, and fowle temeritie. Knowe ye not, that a Power annexed to an Order, and Vocation, is not taken awaie from one by not exercisinge the same in his owne Person? Matha. 16

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

The effect hereof, besides other ordinarie idle talke, standeth in two pointes. Firste, M. Hardinge saith, The Pope, thoughe he doo nothinge him selfe in his owne Persoune, yet he maie sufficiently feede the Flocke of Christe, and Binde, and Loose, and discharge al dewties by his Deputies, and Vnderuicars, that is to saie, by his Cardinalles, and Bishops, whiche are as careful and zelous for their offices, and tender theire charge, as muche, as he. This grounde, I trowe, is not false: and therefore what so euer M. Hardinge shal builde thereon, it can neuer faile. Notwithstandinge, I dw not remember that either Christ, or his Apostles euer vsed to dw the like. One saide sometime, Impudens est Imperator, qui, cùm alienis oculis omnia ei agenda sint, postulet sibi aliorum Capita, & Fortunas committi: *He is a shameleſſe Captaine, that whereas he muſte needes guide al thinges by the eies of others, wil require other mennes liues, and goodes to be committed to his handes.*

Tirus Liuius Decade. 3. Lib. 6.

Pope Damasus saithe, Illi Episcopi, qui talia sibi præsumunt, videntur mihi similes esse Meretricibus: quæ statim, vt pariunt, infantes suos alijs nutricibus tradunt educandos: vt suam citiùs libidinem explere valeant. Sic & isti Infantes suos, id est, populos sibi Commissos, alijs educandos tradunt, vt ipsi suas libidines expleant, id est, vt pro suo libitu Sæcularibus curis inhient, &, quod cuique visum fuerit, liberiùs agant: *Suche Bishoppes takinge suche maters vpon them selues, seeme like vnto Harlottes: Whiche*

Damasus Papa Epistol. 4

Preache by a Deputie.

Whiche as soone, as they be once deliuered, streightwaie deliuer out theire Children vnto Nourses, that they maie the rather folowe theire pleasures. Euen so these Bishoppes deliuer ouer theire Children, that is to saie, the people committed to theire Charges, to be reared, and broughte vp by others, that they them selues maie the better accomplishe theire pleasures, that is to saie, that they maie geeue them selues ouer to worldly cares, and doo what so euer shal like them beste.

Further, saithe M. Hardinge, Christe saide **vnto** Peter, *To thee wil I geeue the Keies: Feede my Sheepe: Confirme thy Brethren:* Ergo, **The Pope is a Lorde Paramount, and hathe a Power Pereleste ouer al the Worlde.** Peter **of** Palus **hereof** writeth **thus**: Christus dixit Apostolis, Quæcunque ligaueritis in terra, erunt ligata & in Cœlo: Non dixit, In Cœlis, sicut Petro dixerat: Sed in Cœlo Vno. Vnde non sunt tantæ perfectionis, sicut Petrus: Christe *saide vnto the Apostles, What so euer ye shal Binde in Earthe, it shalbe Bounde in* Heauen. *He saide not, It shalbe bounde in* Heauens, *as he saide to* Peter: *But in* One Heauen. *Therefore the other Apostles were not of sutche perfection, as* Peter *was.* — *Petrus de Palude. De Potestate collata Apostolis, Artic. 1.*

Againe he saithe, Illa verba, Quæcunque Ligaueris, intelliguntur de vtroque Foro, & de vtraque Potestate. Illa autem verba, Quorumcunque Ligaueritis, intelliguntur tantùm de Foro Conscientiæ: *These woordes* (**spoken vnto** Peter) VVhat so euer thou shalte Binde, *are vnderstoode of bothe Courtes, as wel of the Courte of Iudgemente, as of the Courte of Conscience. But these other woordes* (**spoken vnto the other Apostles**) VVhat so euer you shal Binde, &c. *are vnderstoode onely of the Courte of Conscience.* — *Petr. de Palude.*

This fantasie, it séemeth, **be learned out of theise woordes of** Origen: Non modica differentia est, quòd Petro quidem datæ sunt Claues, non Vnius Cœli, sed multorum Cœlorum: vt quæcunque Ligauerit super terram, sint Ligata, non tantùm Vno in Cœlo, sed etiam in Omnibus Cœlis. Ad alios dicit, vt soluant, & ligent, non in Cœlis, sicut Petrus, sed in Vno Cœlo: quia non sunt in tanta perfectione, sicut Petrus, vt Ligent, & Soluant in Omnibus Cœlis: *The difference is greate: For vnto* Peter *are geeuen the Keies,* not of One Heauen, *but of* many Heauens: *that, What so euer he Bindeth in Earthe, shalbe Bounde, not* onely in One Heauen, *but also in* Al the Heauens. *But vnto the reste he geeueth Power to Binde, and Loose,* not in the Heauens, *as* Peter *doothe, but in* One Heauen: *for that they were not in sutche perfection, as* Peter *was, to Binde, or Loose in* Al the Heauens. — *Origen in Matth. Tract. 6.*

This multiplication of Heauens, as I haue saide, is but a fantasie: and yet to M. Hardinges pourpose it maketh nothinge. For Origen by **this worde** Peter, **meant not** Peter **the Apostle, but any other Godly Learned Priest, or Bishop: whome he expresseth here vnder the name of** Peter. **For it foloweth immediately**, Ergo, quantò melior fuerit, qui soluit, tantò beatior erit, qui soluitur: quonian in omnibus solutus est Cœlis: *Therefore the better man he is, that Looseth, the more Blessed is he, that is Loosed: for that he is Loosed* in al the Heauens. **Againe he saithe**, Quod si nos idem loquimur, quod Petrus loquutus est, efficimur Petrus. Et nobis dicetur, Tu es Petrus. Petra enim est, quisquis est Discipulus Christi: *If wee speake the same, that* Peter *spake, wee are* made Peter: *And vnto vs it shalbe saide,* Thou arte Peter. *For he is the Rocke,* that is the Disciple of Christe. — *Origen in Matth. Tract. 1.*

And againe he saithe, Hoc dictum, Tibi dabo Claues Regni Cœlorum, Cæteris quoque commune est. Et, quæ sequuntur, velut ad Petrum dicta, sunt omnium communia: *This saieinge, to thee wil I geeue the Keies of the Kingedome of Heauen, is common to the reste of the Apostles. And the woordes that folowe,* as spoken vnto Peter, are common vnto al. — *In eodem Tractatu.*

So saithe, S. Augustine, Petrus, quando accepit Claues, Ecclesiam Sanctam significauit: Peter, *when he receiued the Keies, signified the Holy Churche.* **So saithe** S. Basile, Petre, inquit, Amas me? Pasce Oues meas: Et consequenter Omnibus Pastoribus, & Doctoribus eandem Potestatem tribuit. Cuius signum est, quòd omnes ex Aequo, & Ligant, & Absoluunt, quemadmodum ille: Christ *said vnto* Peter, *Louest thou mee? Feede my Sheepe. And in like sorte vnto Al Pastours, and Doctours he gaue* the same Power. *A token whereof is this, that al others* Binde, and Loose Equally, as wel as Peter. — *Augu. in Iohan. Tract. 50. Basil. in Vita Solitaria. ca. 23.*

Likewise saithe S. Ambrose, Dominus dixit Petro, Pasce Oues meas. Quas O- — *Ambros. De Di-*

gnita, Sacerdotali. cap. 2.

ues, & quem Gregem non solùm tunc Beatus Petrus suscepit, sed & nobiscum eas suscepit, & cum illo eas nos suscepimus omnes: *Our Lorde saide vnto* Peter, *Feede my Sheepe. Which Sheepe, and Flocke,* not Onely *Blessed* Peter *then receiued, but he receiued the same* togeather with vs: *And al wee haue receiued* the same togeather with him. Likewise S. Cyprian, Christus eandem dedit Apostolis omnibus Potestatem: Christe *gaue vnto al his Apostles* Like, and Equal Power.

Cyprian de Simplicitate Prælatorum.

So likewise saithe Beda, Potestas Ligandi, & Soluendi, quamuis Soli Petro à Domino data videatur, tamen absque vlla dubietate noscendum est, quòd & Cæteris Apostolis data est: *The Power of Bindinge, and Looſinge, notwithſtandinge it ſeeme to be geeuen Onely vnto* Peter, *yet without al doubt wee muſt vnderſtande, that it was geeuen alſo to the reſte of the Apoſtles.*

Beda in Homil. in Euāg. Quemme dicunt.

Briefly M. Hardinges owne Scholastical Doctours Confesse, that the Power of the Apostles was One, and Equal. But they saie, that the whole multitude of the Churche was committed onely vnto Peter, and not likewise to any other: and that therein onely standeth al the difference. Heruæus saith, Quamuis Apostoli eandem habuerint à Christo, & æqualem Potestatem Clauium, & Iurisdictionis, tamen Iurisdictionem, siue Materiam subiectam, non habuit, nisi Petrus, & cui eam Petrus committere voluit: *Notwithstandinge the Apostles receiued of Christe* Equal Power of the Keies, and Iurisdiction, *yet the Iurisdiction, or mater wherein to vse their Power, none had, but* Onely Peter, *and to whom so euer* Peter *woulde committe the same.* And thus he imagineth, that al the Apostles, sauinge Onely Peter, had Keies geuen them, but no House to Open: and Iurisdiction of Gouernemente, but no People to gouerne.

Iohan. De Parisijs De Potestat. Regia. & Papali. cap. 12.

Verily Alphonsus de Castro saithe, Quando Absoluit Simplex Sacerdos, tantùm Absoluit de Culpa, sicut Papa: *When a Simple Prieſte Abſolueth,* he Absolueth as muche, touchinge Sinne, as doothe the Pope.

Alphonsus Aduersus Hæres. Lib. 2. De Absolutione.

But touchinge the Pope, howe greate so euer he fancie his Keie to be above al others, if he neuer vse the same, and if he either knowe not, or biter not the Worde of God, we saie, as before, wel maie he shutte vp the Kingedome of God before men: but open it he cannot. Origen saithe, Qui funibus peccatorum suorum constringitur, frustrà vel Ligat, vel Soluit: *He that is bounde with the bandes of his owne Sinnes, Bindeth, and Looſeth but in vaine.*

Origen in Matth. Tract. 1.

To conclude, S. Augustine saithe, Cùm Petro dicitur, Omnibus dicitur, Amas me? Pasce Oues meas: *Theſe woordes of* Christe, *Loueſt thou mee? Feede my Sheepe: when they are ſpoken vnto* Peter, *they are ſpoken* vnto Al *Prieſtes, or Miniſters.* He addeth further, Itaque miseri, dum in Petro Petram non intelligunt, & nolunt credere, datas Ecclesiæ Claues Regni Cœlorum, ipsi eas de manibus amiserunt: *Therefore wretched menne, while in* Peter *they vnderſtande not (Chriſte, that is) the Rocke, and while they wil not beleeue, that the Keies of the Kingedome of Heauen are geeuen (*not vnto Peter alone, but) *vnto the Churche, they haue quite loſte the Keies out of their handes.*

Augustin. de Agone Christiano. cap. 30.

Augustī. De Agone Christiano. cap. 31.

The Apologie, Cap. 8. Diuiſion. 1.

We saie, that Matrimonie is Holy, & Honorable in al sortes, & states of Persons: as in the Patriarches, in the Prophetes, in the Apostles, in the Holy Martyres, in the Ministers of the Churche, and in Bishops: and that it is an Honeste, and Lawful thinge (as Chrysostome saithe) for a man, liuinge in Matrimonie, to take vpon him therewith the Dignitie of a Bishop.

M. Hardinge.

* Vntruthes, two togeather, as better appeareth by the Answeare.

Matrimonie is Holy and Honorable in al persons, and an vndefiled bedde, as saithe S. Paule. Yet is it not lawful for them to marie * whiche either haue by deliberate vowe dedicated al manner theire Chastitie vnto God, * or haue receiued Holy Order. For the Vowed be forbidden Mariage by expresse VVoorde of God: Those that haue taken Holy Orders, by Tradition of the Apostles, and Aunciente Ordinaunce of the Churche. Hebr. 13.

Touchinge the firste, the Scripture is plaine: because a Vowe is to be performed. *Vouete & reddite Domino Deo veſtro:* Vowe ye and pay (or render that ye vowe) to our Lorde God. Christe also saithe in the Gospel, There be somme Eunuches that haue made them selues Eunuches for the Kingedome Psalm. 75. Matth. 19.

Kingedome of Heauens ſake. He that can take, let him take. Againe S. Paule ſpeakinge of yonge VVidowes, whiche haue vowed and promiſed Chaſtitie, ſaithe, that when they waxe wanton againſt Chriſte, they wil marrie, hauinge damnation, becauſe they haue broken their firſte Faithe. VVhether theſe Scriptures perteine hereto, and be thus to be vnderſtanded, we refer vs to the Primitiue Church and to al the Holy Fathers.

The firſt Faith S. Hierome expoundeth, The Faithe of Baptiſme. See the Anſweare.

Sutche Marriages, or rather ſlidinges and falles from the holier Chaſtetie, that is Vowed to God, S. Auguſtine doubteth not but they be woorſe then Aduoutries. S. Cyprian calleth this caſe plaine Inceſt. S. Baſile accompteth the Marriages of vailed virgens to be voide, of no force, and Sacrilegious.

Shee that hathe deſpouſed her ſelfe to our Lorde (ſaithe S. Baſile) is not free. For her Husbande is not deade, that ſhee maie marrie to whom ſhe liſte. And whiles her immortal Husbande liueth, ſhee ſhal be called an Aduoutreſſe, whiche for luſtes of the Fleaſhe hathe brought a mortal man into our Lordes Chamber.

Clerckes bounde to continencie. L. 1. Ca. 11 Paphnutius. l. c. 23

Touchinge the ſeconde, the Apoſtles forbidde thoſe, that come ſingle to the Cleregie, to Marrie, excepte ſutche as remaine in the inferiour Orders, and proceede not to the greater, as we finde in their *Canons: Can. 25. Paphnutius*, as Socrates, and Sozomenus recorde in their Eccleſiaſtical ſtorie, ſaide at the Nicene Councel, that it was an olde Tradition of the Church, that ſuch as come to the Degree or Order of Prieſthoode ſingle, ſhoulde not Marrie wiues. And this is that Holy Biſhop Paphnutius, whom theſe Euangelical Vowebreakers pretende to be their proctour for their vnlawful Mariages.

This Pope Siricius ſhamefully abuſeth the woordes of S. Paule, and condemneth al Marriage.

Reade who liſte the Epiſtle of *Siricius ad Himerium Tarraconenſem, Cap. 7.* the ſecond Epiſtle of Innocentius to Victritius Biſhop of Roen, Cap. 9. and his thirde Epiſtle to Exuperius Biſhop of Tolouſe, Cap. 1. And weighinge wel theſe places, he ſhal perceiue, that theſe Holy Popes forbad the Miniſters of the Churche the vſe of VVedlocke by the ſame Reaſon, by whiche the Prieſtes of Moſes Lawe were forbidden to come within their owne houſes in the time, when their courſe came to ſerue in the Holy Miniſteries. By the ſame reaſon alſo by whiche S. Paule requireth Married folke for a time to forbeare the vſe of their wiues, that they might attende Praieinge.

1. Corin. 7.

Anſweare to Chryſoſtomes place. In 1. Ca. ad Tim. Homil. 2.

The place of Chryſoſtome, alleged by this Defender, wel conſidered, diſproueth no parte of the Catholike Doctrine in this behalfe, but condemneth both the Doctrine, and common Practiſe of his companions theſe newe fleaſhely Goſpellers. His woordes be theſe vpon the faieinge of S. Paule, that a Biſhop ought to be without crime, the Husbande of one wife. The Apoſtle (ſaithe he) ſtoppeth the mouthes of Heretikes, whiche condemne Mariage, ſhewinge, that it is not an vncleane thinge, but ſo reuerende that with the ſame a man maie Aſcende to the Holy throne, or ſeate (he meaneth the ſtate of a Biſhop) and herewith he chaſtiſeth and reſtraineth the vnchaſte perſones, not permittinge them, who haue twiſe Maried, to attaine ſuche a roume. For whereas he keepeth no beneuolence towarde his wife * deceaſed, how can he be a good gouernour? yea what greeuous accuſations ſhal not he be ſubiecte vnto daiely? For ye al knowe righte wel, that albeit by the Lawes the ſeconde Mariages be permitted, yet that mater lieth open to many accuſations. And therefore he would a Biſhop to geue no occaſion (of euil) to thoſe that be vnder him. He putteth bigamie * that is to witte, maryinge an other after the firſte or a widowe, to be lawful rather then commendable.

Twiſe Maried maye not be Biſhops, and why.

* Vntruthe. For M. Hardinge fowly miſtaketh S. Chryſoſtomes meaninge.

So wee ſee the impure Bigamie of our Holy Goſpellers condemned bothe by Chryſoſtome, and S. Paule, of whom many beinge Prieſtes, and (as they ſaie) Biſhoppes, at leaſte preſuminge to occupie that Holy ſeate for cuſtodie of their Chaſtitie, after their former olde yokefelowes deceaſe, ſolace them ſelues with newe Strompetes. By a better name I woulde cal them, if I wiſte I ſhoulde not offende. For what woman ſo euer coupleth her ſelfe in ſutche damnable yokinge, howe can ſhee appeare either to be honeſte, or to haue care of her ſoule Healthe? As for the ſimple that be deceiued by the importunitie and craſte of thoſe Lurdens, as they are not to be borne withal, ſo yet I thinke them to be pitied.

Strompets.

* Vntruthe, ſtandinge in falſe expoſition

After holy Orders reciued, Mariage neuer compted lawful amonge Catholikes Prieſts maried in Englande in the time of Anſelmus.

But if this Defender preſſe vs with Chryſoſtome, wee anſweare, that thoughe Chryſoſtome graunte, that a Maried man maie aſcende to the Holy ſeate, yet he ſaithe not, that a man deſcende from that Holy ſeate to the Bride Bedde. For wee denie vtterly, that any man after that he hathe receiued Holy Orders, maie Marie. * Neither can it be ſhewed, that the Mariage of ſutche was euer accoumpted lawful in the Catholique Churche. In deede wee knowe, that in Germanie, and in Englande, and certaine other Prouinces at diſſolute times, when the diſcipline of the Churche was ſhaken of, Prieſtes haue benne Maried, as wee reade of the time in whiche Anſelmus was Biſhop of Cantorburie. But that diſorder was alwaies by * due correction of Biſhoppes puniſhed, and redreſſed.

* Vntruthe. For it was vndoubtedly compted lawful.

* That is by allowinge of Concubines.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Here, I graunte, M. Hardinge is like to finde ſome good aduantage, as hauinge vndoubtedly a greate number of the Holy Fathers of his ſide. For Single Life in the eies of Politique wiſe menne, for many cauſes ſameth worthy of fauour. But, good Chriſtian Reader, that thou maiſte be the better hable to ſay, and iudge howe vprightly, and indifferently the Fathers haue dealt herein, either in the auaunce of Virginitie, or els in the diſgracinge of Lawful Matrimonie, it maie pleaſe thee to conſider the fourme, and manner of their ſaieinges.

Origen in Epiſt. ad Roman. Cap. 12. Lib. 9.

In deede Origen ſaithe, Poteſt aliquis de Caſtitate plus ſapere, quàm oporteat ſapere: *A man maie thinke more of Chaſtitie, then is conueniente.* Likewiſe ſaithe S. Hierome:

S. Hierome: Declinare ad Dextram, est abstinere à Cibis, quos Deus creauit, & Condemnare Matrimonium, & incurrere in illud, quod dictum est, Noli iustus esse nimium: *To turne to the Righte hande, is to abstaine from Meates, whiche God hathe made, and to* Condemne Matrimonie: *and to falle into the danger of the Woordes written by the Wiseman,* Neuer be ouer iuste.

Hierony. In Malachi. cap. 2. Vos autem recessistis Eccle. 7.

Firste therefore Tertullian **in the disprouse of Matrimonie, saithe thus:** Ecquid tibi videtur Stupri affine esse Matrimonium? Quoniam in illo deprehendo, quæ stupro competunt: *Doeste not thou thinke, that* Matrimonie is like vnto Fornication? *Certainely I finde the same thinges in the One, that I finde in the Other.* **Farther he saithe:** Ergo, inquies, iam & Primas, id est, vnas Nuptias destruis. Nec immeritò: Quoniam & ipsæ ex eo constant, quod est stuprum: *Then, thou wilte saie to mee, thou condemneste also the Firste Marriage. Yea verily, and not without cause:* For bothe Matrimonie, and Fornication consiste bothe of one thinge. Chrysostome **saithe,** Hæc ipsa Coniunctio Maritalis malum est antè Deum. Non dico, Peccatum, sed malum: *The very Copulation of Matrimonie is* an euil thinge before God. *I saie not, It is Sinne: but I saie it is* an euil thinge. **And yet immediately after he saithe,** Si in Maritis, & Adulteris vna est libido, quomodò potest fieri, vt vna, eademque res pro dimidia parte sit Iustitia, pro dimidia autem sit Peccatum? Aut enim tota est Iustitia, aut tota est Peccatum: Quia res Vna est: *If the Married man, and the Aduoutrer haue one kinde of pleasure, howe can it be, that one, and the selfe same thinge, for the one halfe shoulde be Righteousneste, and for the other halfe shoulde be Sinne? Either it is al Sinne, or al Righteousneste:* For the thinge it selfe is One.

Tertul. in exhorta. ad Castitatem. Eodem loco.

Chrysost. in O. pere Imperfecto, Homil. 1.

M. Har. *fo.* 283. *b* *Addition.* ☞ **Here M. Hardinge saithe,** I doo falsely demaine mee selfe, and beguile my vnlearned Reader. For the Authour by these woordes, *Coniunctio Maritalis,* meant not the Copulation of Matrimonie, as you translate it, as thoughe he saide, Matrimonie it selfe were an euil thinge: God forebidde, any shoulde so speake of Goddes Holy Ordinance. But he meaneth the Coniunction of the Husband with his VVife in the acte of Generation. Besides al this he telleth vs of *Fides, Proles,* and *Sacramentum:* of *Malum Culpæ,* and *Malum Pœnæ:* Of Immoderate Concupiscence, Inordination, and Rebellion of the Fleashe &c. **And al to excuse theise woordes written in** Opere Imperfecto, **vnder the name of** Chrysostome, *The Copulation of Matrimonie, or the Coniunction of Man, and Wife, is an euil thinge before God.* Addition ☞

M. Har. *fo.* 284. *a*

The Answeare. **First, M. Hardinge, where you charge me with false translation, and corruption of mine Authour, besides that my woordes of them selfe be plaine penough, I meante also the very same thinge, that you meane. Onely I sought to expresse my meaning modestly, & in comely termes without offense. Neither euer was there any Heretique, that I haue heard of, that condemned ỹ very State of Matrimonie of it selfe, otherwise then in respect of the Coniunction, that foloweth afterward. Therefore it was nedeles for you so spitefully to crie out,** God forebidde, any man shoulde so speake of Goddes Holy Ordinance, to saie, that Matrimonie it selfe were an euil thinge. **And yet God ordeined, not onely the State of Matrimonie it selfe, but also the very acte it selfe of Generation. And therefore you haue brought vs a vaine Distinction, M. Hardinge, without sense, or sauour. You might better haue saide,** God forebid, that any man should saie, The acte of Generation it selfe were an euil thinge, or should so speake of Goddes Holy Ordinance.

M. Har. *fo* 283. *b*

But you tel vs a tale of *Malum Pœnæ,* and *Malum Culpæ. Malum Pœnæ,* **is that necessitie, infirmitie, and miserie, that is fired, and mortified vnto our bodies, as Care, Trouble, Hunger, Thirste, Sickenesse, Deathe, and sutche other. But are theise il thinges before God? Are theise the thinges whereof** S. Paule **complaineth of him selfe, saieinge,** *I doo not that good thinge, that I woulde doo: but I doo that euil thinge, that I woulde not doo.*

Roman. 7.

You wil saie, The Authoure of the woorke, called *Opus Imperfectum,* speaketh not of these Natural infirmities of the bodie: but of that Concupiscence, whiche you calle a Rebellion of the Fleashe. **If the Authoure meante thus, then, I praie you, against what thinge doethe Concupiscence worke this Rebellion? you muste nedes saie,** Against the VVil, and Sprite of God. **For so saithe** S. Paule. **And wil you saie,**

This

This is onely an il thinge: It is no ſinne? Is it no ſinne, to Rebelle againſte Gods Holy Spirite, and to withſtande his Will? Verily S. Auguſtine ſaithe platnely, Concupiſcentia Carnis, aduerſus quam bonus concupiſcit Spiritus, & Peccatum eſt, & pœna peccati, & cauſa peccati: *The Concupiſcence of the Fleaſhe, againſte whiche the good Sprite deſireth, or laboureth, is bothe Sinne it ſelfe, and alſo the paine of Sinne, and the cauſe of Sinne.* Here S. Auguſtine ſaithe, that the ſame Concupiſcence, and Rebellion, whereof you ſpeake, is not onely an euil thing, but alſo very Sinne in dede. Therfore leaue this niceneſſe, M. Hardinge, and telle vs plainely, that the Coniunction of Man, and Wife is not onely an euil thinge, but alſo Sinne before God. *Auguſt. contra Iulian. li. 5. ca. 3.*

But S. Auguſtine ſaithe farre otherwiſe, Paulus modeſtè deterret à Nuptijs, non tanquam à re mala, & illicita: Sed tanquam ob oneroſa, & moleſta. Aliud eſt enim admittere Carnis turpitudinem, aliud habere Carnis tribulationem. Illud eſt Criminis facere: Hoc laboris eſt pati: S. Paule *in modeſte manner withdraweth menne from Marriage: not, as from a thinge euil, and vnlawful: but, as from a thinge greeuous, and burthenous. For, to commiute the filthineſſe of the Fleaſhe, it is one thinge: To haue the trouble of the Fleaſhe, it is an other thinge. The one is to committe a fault. the other is to ſuffer a paine.* Thus, by S. Auguſtines iuogement, Marriage is not an euil, or vnlawful thinge, but onely a bourthenous, and a greeuous thinge. *Auguſt. de ſancta Virginita. Ca. 16.*

But why ſhoulde you thus Defende an open errour? This Authour bearinge the name of Chryſoſtome, ſaithe, that the Copulation, whiche is in Marriage, notwithſtandinge it be no ſinne, yet is an euil thinge before God. Where did God him ſelfe euer ſo ſaie in al the Scriptures? Where did the Holy Ghoſte euer ſaie, that VVedlocke is an euil thing? Neither do I here meane the degree, or ſtate of Wedlocke, but the very felowſhip, and vſe of Wedlocke. Where did the Holy Ghoſte euer ſaie hereof, It is an euil thinge before God?

Verily S. Paule ſaithe, *Marriage is Honourable in al Degrees, and a bedde vndefiled.* The Marriage bedde, ſaithe S. Paule, is no euil thinge before God: *It is pure, and holy, and vndefiled.* God him ſelfe ordeined Matrimonie: He ordeineth no il. God him ſelfe commaunded the Coniunction it ſelfe, and vſe of Matrimonie: He commaundeth no il. *Vnto the cleane, al thinges are cleane. He that beſtoweth his Virgine in Marriage* (ſaithe S. Paule) *Doothe wel.* S. Paule ſaithe not, He doothe euil before God: But contrariwiſe, *He doothe wel.* But, how coulo he do wel, in geuinge her occaſion to do il? The Holy Father Paphnutius in the greate Councel of Nice ſaid thus, Congreſſus cum legitima vxore, eſt Caſtitas: *The companie of a man with his lawful Wife, is Chaſtitie.* Touching the diſordered affections, that maie happen in ỹ vſe of Marriage, I wil ſaie nothing. If ỹt reaſon thus, Sutche affections be il: *Ergo*, the vſe of Marriage it ſelfe is il, ỹt fal into a fowle errour in arguing, called, as you knowe, Paralogiſmus Accidentis. S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Non, quia incontinentia malum eſt, ideò Concubinum, vel id, quo incontinentes Copulantur, non eſt bonum: *Wee maie not ſaie, bicauſe Incontinencie is an euil thinge, therefore Wedlocke, or that Copulation, that is betweene* (Man and Wife) *that conteine not, is no good thinge.* S. Auguſtine calleth the very Copulation of Man, & Wife, and the vſe of Matrimonie, a good thing, and that foure times togeather in the ſame one place. Howe then can you ſaie, that the ſame Copulation, and vſe of Matrimonie, is an euil thinge before God? Beware, M. Hardinge, ỹt be not founde in the Companie of them, that ſaie, *Good is Euil, and Euil is Good.* *Tit. 1.* *1. Corinth. 7.* *Socra. Li. 1. ca. 11.* *Auguſt. de Gen. ad Literam. Li. 9. cap. 7.* *Eſai. 5.*

S. Hierome ſaithe, Si bonum eſt, Mulierem non tangere, malum eſt ergo tangere. Nihil enim Bono contrarium eſt, niſi Malum: *If it be good for a man not to touche his Wife, then is it* euil to touche his wife. *For there is nothinge contrarie to Good, but Euil.* Againe he ſaithe, Quam diu impleo Mariti officium, non impleo Chriſtiani: *As longe as I doo the duetie of a Huſbande*, I doo not the duetie of a Chriſtian man. Againe, Non negamus Viduas, non negamus Maritatas Sanctas Mulieres inueniri. Sed quæ Vxores eſſe deſierint: quæ in ipſa neceſsitate Coniugij Virginum imitentur Caſtitatem: *Wee denie not, but Widowes, and Married weemen maie be Holy. But ſutche, as haue* leafte, and foreſaken wiues dueties, *and in the very neceſſitie of Matrimonie doo counterfeite the Chaſtitie, that is in Maidens.* *Hieronym. contra Iouinian. Lib. 1.* *Ibidem.* *Hieronym. contra Heluidium.*

The like accoumpte wee maie make of sundrie others: These fewe maie suffice for this present.

Nowe, touchinge the Marriage of Widowers, and Widowes, a greate many of the Ancient Fathers seeme erpressely, and vtterly to condemne it.

Athenagoras in Apologia pro Christianis. Athenagoras saithe, Secundæ Nuptiæ decorum quoddam sunt Adulterium: *The Seconde Marriage* (of Widowers, or Widowes) *is a* faire kinde of Aduouterie. And S. Hierome calleth Widowes so married, Harlottes, and Naughtie VVeemen, Malas, & Prostitutas: And saithe, Digamia non nascitur in terra bona: *Seconde Marriage groweth not in good soile.* Againe he saithe, Tolerabilius est, vni prostitutam esse, quam multis: *More tolerable it is,* to be Concubine vnto one, *then vnto many.* Againe, Vbi numerus Maritorum est, ibi vir, qui proprie vnus est, esse desijt: *Where as there is a number of Husbandes,* there the Husbande, that in proper speach is but one, is no Husband. Likewise againe, Non damno Digamos. Etiam Scortatorem recipio Pœnitentem. Quicquid æquliter licet, æqua lance pensandum est: *I condemne not Widowers, or Widowes, that haue Married againe. No, I refuse not the Fornicatoure vpon his repentance.* VVhat so euer is equally lawful, muste be weighed in One ballance.

Hieronym. ad Geruntiam.

Hieronym. contra Iouinian. Lib. 1.

In eod. Lib. 2.

Nazian. in dictum Euang. Cũ perfecisset Iesus Nazianzenus saithe, Hic sermo videtur mihi reijcere Secundas Nuptias. Si enim Duo sunt Christi, Duo item sunt Mariti, & Duæ Vxores: *This saieinge seemeth to condemne* Seconde Marriage. *For, if there be Twoo Christes, then are there Twoo Husbandes, and Twoo Wiues.* Origen saithe, Nunc & Secundæ, & Tertiæ, & Quartæ Nuptiæ repetuntur: & non ignoramus, quòd tale coniugium eijciet nos de Regno Dei: *Nowe the Seconde, and Thirde, and Fourthe Marriage is receiued. And wee knowe, that sutche Marriage* shal caste vs out of the kingedome of God.

Origen. in Lucam, Homil. 17.

By these fewe examples wee maie see, It was harde for these Holy Learned Fathers, in so large Amplifications of Praisinge, or Dispraisinge, to holde measure. Yet, al these vehement wordes, and Amplifications notwithstandinge, partely the same, partly other the like Holy, and Learned Fathers, bothe vsed Marriage themselues in their owne Persones, and also otherwise wrote, and spake therof with greate reuerence.

Hieronym. De Scriptor. Eccle. Tertullian, as S. Hierome witnesseth, was a Married Priest. Spiridion the Bishop of Cyprus, sommetime famouse in the Counsel of Nice, was Married, and had Children. So was S. Hilarie the Bishop of Poiters, as appeareth by his Epistle to his Daughter Abra.

Sozom. Lib. 1. Cap. 11. Hilarius.

Addition. ☞ This Authoritie of Hilarie (saithe M. Hardinge) is a simple ragge, and a peeuishe Apocryphal forged write &c. Addition ☞

The Answeare. It is euen so in deede. I neuer take it to be otherwise. Neither doe I allege it in sutche greate sadde, as you imagine, but onely as a Pamflet of your owne. For, howe so euer you weighe it nowe, they were your owne frendes, that firste forged this forgerie: they were not of vs. If you would shake of al sutche the like ragges, that you, and your Fathers haue patched vp vnder the names of Anacletus, Athanasius, Amphilochius, and others, a greate parte of your Bookes must needes goe naked. But notwithstandinge theise Writes be forged, and ful of Fables, yet the Fathers them selues, whose names they beare, in their owne persons, were not forged. For Anacletus in deede was Bishop of Rome: Athanasius in deede was Bishop of Alexandria: Amphilochius in deede was Bishop of Iconium. Euen so, although this Epistle, whiche somme of you haue forged, vnder the name of S. Hilarie, be a Fable, yet S. Hilarie in deede in his owne persone was a Learned Father, and Bishop of Poiters in France aboue eleuen hundred yeares agoe: And might in deede haue a wife: And Abra in deede might be his daughter. And what maruelle? For the Priestes in France lined stil in wedlocke vntil ỹ time of Pope Hildebrande, whiche was aboue seuen hundred yeares after the deathe of S. Hilarie. Verily, Baptista Mantuanus witnesseth, that Hilarius in the time of his Bishoprike had a wife, and lined with her.

Baptist. Mantuanus in Fastis. Niceph. Lib. 11. Cap. 19.

So was Gregorie S. Basiles Brother, the Bishop of Nyssa. So was Gregorie the Bishop of Nazianzum, Father vnto Gregorie Nazianzene, as appeareth by Ruffinus:

nus: Yet was he neuertheleſſe *A Faithful Seruante, and a Stewarde of the Myſteries of God: A man of Spiritual deſires: The God of Pharao: The Pillar, and Buttreſſe of the Church: and the Starre of the worlde.* For in ſuche wiſe his owne Sonne Gregorie Nazianzene reporteth of him. Suche a one was he, his Wife, and Familie notwithſtandinge. So was Proſper of Aquitania, the Biſhop of Rhegium, as it appeareth by his Epigramme written vnto his wife: Mearum Comes irremota rerum.

So was the Holy Father Cheremon the Biſhop of Nilus: Who, as Euſebius writeth, was ſente into banniſhmente with his Wife. So Polycrates beinge likewiſe a Biſhop, ſometime ſaid, that ſeuen of his Fathers, or Anceſters had bene Biſhoppes. The Greeke worde is συγγενεῖς. Ruffinus tranſlateth it, Parentes.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ M. Hardinge. The Greeke woorde (you ſaie) is συγγενεῖς: and Ruffinus tranſlateth it Parentes &c. You meane not, I trowe, that Polycrates had ſeuen Fathers. For that were too many by ſixe, you knowe. One Father is enough pardy for one man. What geather you hereof, that Polycrates was Married, becauſe he had ſeuen Anceſters?

Nazianzen. in Laudem Patris: θεὸν φαραώ, ξύλον καὶ ἐλεφαντιάσαντα τῆς ἐκκλησίας, καὶ φωστῆρα ἐν κόσμῳ *Proſper. Euſeb. li 6. ca. 42* χερήμωνα. *Euſeb li. 5. ca. 25. Nouell Conſtitu. 3. § finale. E. Greco.*

The Anſweare. Ye are a pleaſant man, M. Hardinge: I ſée, a litle thinge maie make you merye. But, you ſaie further, I haue belied Ruffinus. For he tranſlateth not συγγενεῖς, *Patres*, but, *Parentes*: whiche (you ſaie) goeth further of in ſignification, then the woorde, *Patres*, doothe, as the Learned in the Ciuile Lawes doo knowe. In déede herein, I confeſſe, there was an ouerſight. It is true, Ruffinus hathe not Patres, but Parentes. And yet where you ſaie, I belie Ruffinus, ye are ouer bitter. You knowe, the difference betwéene Patres, & Parentes, is not ſo greate. For oftentimes in good ſignification both Patres be Parentes, and Parentes be Patres. Cicero ioineth them in one, and ſaithe, Pater, Parenſque bothe togeather. You ſaie, This woorde, *Parentes*, goeth further in ſignification, then this woorde, *Patres*, as the Learned in the Ciuile Lawe doo knowe. I denie it not, M. Hardinge. But wil you alſo ſaie, that Ruffinus was ſo curious in choiſe of woordes, or that he wente to the Ciuilians, to learne Latine? Uerile S. Hierome ſpeaketh ſcornefully of him in that behalfe, & thinketh him not hable to ſpeake good Latine. Howe be it, let vs ſée, what ſignification this woorde Parentes beareth emonge the Ciuilians. Thus therefore ſaithe Caius one of the Fathers of the Lawe: Appellatione Parentis, non tantùm Pater, ſed etiam Auus, & Proauus, & deinceps omnes ſuperiores continentur: Sed & Mater, & Auia: *Vnder this name* Parens, *is conteined, not onely Father, Grandefather, and Greategrandefather, and al other orderly goeinge vpwarde, but alſo Mother, and Grandemother.* Al theſe, ſaithe, Caius, are conteined vnder this woord, Parens. Howe, M. Hardinge, for that it liketh you to make nedeleſſe quarrelles, & to plaie with woordes, I reckon, ye wil not ſaie, that Polycrates Mother, or Grandemother, or Greatgrandemother were Biſhoppes before him. For ſo, I trowe, your Learned Ciuilians wil not ſaie. Then it reſteth, that Polycrates ſaide, His Father, his Grandefather, & his Greategrandfather &c. were Biſhops, and that one of them had bene Father vnto an other. And this is al that I ſaide. Therefore your mirth is at an ende. ☜

Hieronym. In Apologia aduerſus Ruffinum. Συγγραφεὺς ἀγράμματος. *De Verb. & Rat ſignifica. Lib. 50*

Iuſtinianus the Emperoure ſéemeth the more to eſtéeme Epiphanius the Biſhop of Conſtantinople, for that his Father, and other his Anceſters had bene Prieſtes, and Biſhoppes.

Ignat. ad Philadelphien. *Clemens Stromat. 3.* *Euſeb. li. 3. ca. 30* *Origen in Epiſt. ad Rom. cap. 1.* *Lib 1.* *Philippen. 4.* *Ambroſ. in 2. Corinth. 11.*

Ignatius, S. Iohn the Euangeliſtes Scholare, ſaithe, Peter, *and other the Apoſtles of Chriſte, were Married menne.* So writeth Clemens Alexandrinus: So writeth Euſebius. Origen ſaith, by the reporte of others his Anceſtours, *That* S. Paule, *and his wife were called to the Faithe, bothe at one time.*

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ Of whiche Wife, as he ſaithe, he writeth thus in his Epiſtle to the Philippiens: Rogo te Germana Compar &c. *I beſeeche thee, faitheful yokefelowe, healpe thoſe weemen, that haue laboured with me in the Goſpel.* ☜

S. Ambroſe ſaithe, Omnes Apoſtoli, excepto Iohanne, & Paulo, Vxores habuerunt: Al the Apoſtles *had Wiues, onely* Iohn, *and* Paule *excepted.*

☞ *Addition.* ☞ Here, ſaithe M. Hardinge, VVhether is truer man, M. Iewel, that Addition wrote the Replie, or M. Iewel, that wrote this pretenſed Defenſe. There he ſaithe thus, The twelue Apoſtles, ſaithe S. Ambroſe, onely S. Iohn excepted, were al Married: Here he

M Hard. fol. 236 a. b.

faithe otherwise, S. Ambrose saith, **All the Apostles had Wiues, onely S. Iohn, and S. Paule excepted.** Here S. Paule hathe no wife: There S. Paule hathe a wife. If you were a true man there, then are you false here. If you be true here, then were you false there. Or he had a wife, or he had not. Saie whiche ye wil: M. Iewel is contrarie to M. Iewel. Faine woulde I knowe, which of these M. Iewelles were to be trusted.

The Answeare. Here we haue M Iewel in his Replie: and M. Iewel in his Defense: M. Iewel contrarie to M. Iewel: True here, and False there: False here, and True there. O what a merry pange was this, M. Hardinge? We lacke but somewhat to make your selfe sport.

Ambros. in 2. Corinth. Cap. 11 S. Ambrose saith, *The twelue Apostles, onely* S. Iohn *excepted, were al Married.* Againe S. Ambrose saithe, *All the Apostles had Wiues, onely* S. Iohn, *and* S. Paule *excepted.* I praie you, good M. Hardinge, what contrarietie finde you in these wordes? Do I make S. Ambrose first to saie, S. Paule had a VVife: And do I make him after warde to saie, S. Paule had no VVife? I trowe we were not awake. We laughte at somewhat in your dreame. You knowe, though S. Paule were an Apostle of Christe, yet was he none of the twelue Apostles. What should you be tolde those thinges, that Children knowe? We mutche misreckon youre selfe. These saiinges maie wel stande togeather. Al the twelue Apostles, Iohn onely excepted, had wiues. And yet S. Paule, beinge none of the twelue, had no Wife. What meane you then with This M. Iewel, and that M. Iewel: M. Iewel here, and M. Iewel there? Bothe here, & there M. Iewel saithe Truthe. But bothe here, & there, you are one man stil. Why should you so vainely bestowe your wittes?

Ignatius ad Philadelphien. As touchinge S Paule, Clemens Alexandrinus, Eusebius, and Ignatius, that sawe Christe after his Resurrection, & was in companie with the Apostles, saie in plaine wordes, *He had a Wife.* Of the other side S. Ambrose, S. Chrysostome, S. Hierome, and others, that liued welneare foure hundred yeres after Christes Ascension, saie plainely, He had no wife. Here haue you Doctours against Doctours: Ther against ther: and that namely touchinge the Marriage of S. Paule. Will you therefore come in with these grewegawes, and telle vs, Faine woulde I knowe, whiche of these Doctours were to be trusted? Leaue, leaue this vnsemely sportinge, M. Hardinge. Yf wisse it becommeth you not. There is nothinge here worthy the laughinge at, but onely your folie. ☞

Clemens. Stro ma. Lib. 7. Clemens Alexandrinus saithe, Perfecti Christiani Edunt, Bibunt, contrahunt Matrimonium: They that be perfite Christian menne, *doo Eate, and Drinke, and contracte Matrimonie.* S. Hierome writtinge against Iouinian, saithe thus, Quasi non hodiè quoque plurimi Sacerdotes habeant Matrimonia: *As thoughe nowe a daies* very many Priestes *were not Married.* And therefore he saithe, as he is alleged by Gratian, Legant Episcopi, & Presbyteri, qui Filios suos sæcularibus literis erudiunt: *Let* Bishoppes, and Priestes *reade these thinges, that* bringe vp theire Children *in worldly learninge* (and not in the Scriptures of God.)

Hieronym. Aduers. Iouinian. Lib. 1.

Dis. 37. Legant. Dist. 56. Osius. Pope Damasus, and others haue shewed vs, that a greate number of Bishoppes of Rome were Priestes Sonnes: As Pope Syluerius: Pope Deusdedit: Pope Adrianus 2. Pope Iohn 15. Pope Fœlix 3. Pope Hosius: Pope Agapetus: Pope Gelasius: Pope Bonifacius: Pope Iohn 10. Pope Theodorus. And concludeth thus, Complures etiam alij inueniuntur, qui de Sacerdotibus nati Apostolicæ Sedi præfuerunt: Many others *biside there are founde, that* beinge Priestes Sonnes ruled the Apostolique See of Rome.

Addition. ☞ M. Hardinge. VVhat shal I saie vnto this felowe? VVho euer sawe so impudente a man? Dooth Pope Damasus shewe you al this, M. Iewel? Fy for shame man. You a Minister of Goddes VVoorde? Nay a Minister of vaine Fables, and a Minister of open Lies. VVhat maie wee cal this in you? Foolishe ignorance, or shameleese malice? Howe coulde you be so ignorant, or so witlesse, as once to dreame, that Damasus, that Learned Pope, should thus write? that you might seeme a ioyly proctour for your brothers, the married Apostates, Sacrilegious, Incestuous, and abominable yokinge, muste Damasus needes be made a Prophete? Consider, Reader, I praie thee (for it booteth not to tel it M. Iewel) howe this tale hangeth togeather. Damasus was the 39. Pope: Syluerius was the 60. Pope: Deusdedit was the 70. Pope: Adrianus 2. was the 109. Pope &c. VVhat a marueilous Prophete then was M. Iewelles Damasus, that coulde thus Prophecie of so many Popes so longe to comme after his deathe? As for Pope Hosius, he is a Pope of M. Iewelles owne makinge. Addition ☞

M. Har. fo. 387. a

kinge. In the Regiſters of the Popes I finde none ſo named. Gratian hathe not ſo many Popes by three. For he nameth not Iohn 10. nor Iohn 15. nor Adrian 2. &c.

The Anſweare. What meane theſe terrible exclamations, M. Hardinge? you crie out, Vaine, Fooliſhe, Ignorant, VVitleſſe, Impudent, Shameleſſe, Sacrilegious, Inceſtuous, Abominable yoking. Who hath thus offended you? what wiſe man would be ſo vehement without ſome cauſe? It were mutch better for you, to come againe to youre ſelfe, and to learne to be ſober. *Pope Damaſus* (you ſaie) coulde not write of *Syluerius*, and *Deuſdedit*, and *Adrianus*, and *Felix*, and others, that were borne ſo many yeeres after his deathe. What then? wil you therefore thus fondly falle out, and rage with me? It is your owne friende Doctour Gratian, M. Hardinge, that thus hathe written. I am the reporter onely: I write it not. Calle him, Vaine, Fooliſhe, Ignorante, VVitleſſe, Impudente, Shameleſſe, and what you liſte. Falle out rather with them, that haue called his Bookes, The Fundation of the Canon Lawe: Falle out with Pope Eugenius, that commended his Bookes vnto the worlde. As for me, I knowe, what he is. I allege him, as I finde him. Compare my wordes with Gratian: you ſhal ſée, I do righte. Onely I leafte out certaine Popes names for ſhortneſſe ſake: whiche faulte here for your pleaſure I haue reformed. *Diſt. 96. Hoſius.*

But (you ſaie) Hoſius is a Pope of M. Iewelles owne makinge. For in the Regiſter of Popes yee finde none ſo named. Yet, if you had better conferred with Gratian, you ſhoulde haue founde, that Pope Hoſius is the firſte in al the ranke. Howe truely he is either ſo named, or ſo placed, I make none accoumpt. It is your own Gratian, that ſo reporteth: And, as I haue ſaide before, it is the grounde, and Fundation of al your Lawes. *Fundamentum Iuris Canonici.*

Pope Damaſus (you ſaie) coulde not write of thoſe Popes, that ſo many hundred yeeres folowed after him. That, I graunt you, is alſo an errour. Bidde your Gratian reforme it. For his onely erroure it is: It is none of ours. Howe be it, as for the truthe of the mater it ſelfe, reade the liues of al theſe Popes: And ye ſhal finde it true, that Gratian ſaithe, that euery of them had a Prieſte to his Father. For example, Platina ſaithe, Pope Syluerius was the Sonne of Biſhop Hormiſda: Pope Bonifacius 1. was the Sonne of Iucundus a Prieſte. And ſo the reſte. Therefore, ſommewhat to relieue your Gratians credite, notwithſtandinge he erred in the name of Damaſus, yet in the true Storie of theſe Popes, and of their Fathers, he erred nothinge. For in déde, al they, whoſe names he rehearſeth, were Prieſtes Sonnes. *Platina in Syl. nerio. & in Bonifacio. 1.*

Further, you ſaie, *Gratian* hath not ſo many Popes names by three, as I haue reckened. For he nameth not Pope Iohn 10. nor Pope Iohn 15. nor Pope Adrian 2. This, I confeſſe, was mine owne ouerſighte, in that I mingled theſe names with the reſte, neither alleginge, nor notinge mine Authour. Notwithſtandinge, this errour proceéded onely of negligence, and not of malice, as to any Indifferente man it maie ſone appeare. For touchinge the truthe of the mater it ſelfe, Platina ſaithe, *Euery of theſe three Popes had a Prieſte to his Father*, as had the others, whome wé haue named. Theſe be his wordes: Pope Iohn *the eleuenth* (which in other computations is reckened the tenth) *was Sonne vnto Pope* Sergius: Pope Iohn *the ſixtenth* (who of ſome others is coumpted the fiftéenth) *was Sonne to a Prieſte, called* Leo: Pope Adrian *the Seconde, was the Sonne of a Biſhop, named* Taralus. Here you haue your whole reckeninge, M. Hardinge, And no cauſe, why yé ſhoulde be further offended. *Platina in Iohanne. 11. In Iohan. 6. In Adrian. 2.*

But you tel your Reader, That this Authoritie is brought in by Gratian vnder the name of *Palea*: And that *Palea* is as muche to ſaie, as Chaffe, and ſignifieth, that al that foloweth, is litle woorthe. Sutche Chaffe (ſaie you) is M. Iewel driuen to take holde at, to mainteine his brothers filthineſſe, for lacke of better ſtuffe. And is it true, M. Hardinge, that al, that Gratian laieth out vnder the name of Palea, is nothinge els, but Chaffe, and vaine ſtuffe, of litle woorthe? What wil you then do with youre greate Donation of Conſtantine, whereby the Pope claimeth his Juriſdiction ouer the other three Patriarkes, his Whole Triple Crowne, and the whole Empiere of the Weaſte? Shal this alſo goe for Chaffe, and Forgerie, and Vaine ſtuffe? Do you not knowe, that the ſaide Donation is intituled, Palea, as wel, as this? Wil you for the ſaufgarde of youre Prieſtes children, leaue the Pope with al his Vniuerſal Power, and Authoritie in the *M. Har. fo. 287. b* *Diſtinct. 96. Conſtantinus.*

the Chaffe? Thus you vse your Authoures, and Doctours, M. Hardinge: Sommetimes they are Chaffe, Sommetimes they are Corne: Sommetimes they are Drosse, Sommetimes they are Goulde.

Here you haue the whole mater truely proued: Al these Popes, by your Gratian alleged, founde Priestes Sonnes: The other three Popes with the Priestes theire Fathers fully auouched: your vaine Chaffe blowen into the winde: And your Gratians errours, touchinge the names of Damasus, and Hosius sufficiently answeared. Leaue therefore your ordinarie talke of Foolishe, VVitlesse, Impudente, and Shamelesse men, M. Hardinge, leaste your Reader happen to open his eies, and espie whose dealinge is Impudente.

Æneas Syluius De gestis Concil. Basil. Lib. 2.

Pope Pius saithe, A Married man, hauinge his wife aliue maie be chosen Pope. His wordes be these: Cur enim disputant Doctores, an Electus in Papam Vxori suæ debitum soluere teneatur, &c. *For, wherefore doo the Canonistes moone this doubte,* VVhether a man beinge chosen Pope, be bounde to yeelde Marriage duetie to his VVife, *unlesse a Married man maie be chosen to that roume?* Polydorus Vergilius saithe, that the restrainte of Priestes Marriage was first attempted in Englande about the pere of our Lord Niene hundred three scoare and tenne: and that the same was afterward concluded in the Weaste Churche, aboute the pere of Our Lorde a thousande and a hundred, and neuer before.

Polydorus in Historia Anglor. Lib. 6. Ann. Dom. 970.

Fabian saithe, that Bishoppes, and Priestes liued a thousand yeeres togeather with their VViues, no Lawe beinge to the contrarie.

Polydorus De Inuentoribus Rer. Lib. 5. An. Dom. 1100. Fabian. Pa. 293.

These two Principles beinge thus laide, the one of immoderate, and extraordinarie speache of the Holy Fathers, the other of the continual, and Ordinarie Practise of the Churche, we maie nowe be the better hable to consider the Substance of M. Hardinges reasons.

M. Har fo. 282 b

Addition. M. Hardinge. VVhat wil M. Iewel make this fonde, and Childish Argumente, Certaine Fathers spake ouer vehemently concerninge Matrimonie: Item, Some of them were called to dignitie of Bishoppes from the state of Maried menne: Ergo, Priestes, Monkes, Freers, Nonnes, who haue vowed Chastitie, maie lawfuly Marie VViues, and take Husbandes? Of what smal substance this reason is, the veriest Coblers of al their Ministers, if they can reade any Englishe, besides their Communion Booke, maie easily perceiue. Addition

The Answeare. Coblers we haue none in the Holy Ministerie, M. Hardinge. And yet if we had any sutche, I se no cause, but they mighte do God better seruice in his Churche, then many that haue benne, and yet are Priestes, and Cardinalles in the Churche of Rome. And what greate wonder were it, if a good simple godly man were made a Priest? You maie remember, that Iulius the 2. a man vtterly voide both of Learning, & Vertue, from a wheary slaue, not longe sithence became a Pope. Verily S. Chrysostome is not ashamed oftentimes to cal S. Paule, Sutorem Pellium, whiche wordes you maie Englishe, A Clowter of Skinnes, or, A Cobler. But, to leaue these your vaine, and needelesse quarrelles, there is no Cobler so simple, but it pitieth him, to se you, in so weightie maters, to shewe sutche folie.

Erasm. in Proverbio. A Remo ad Tribunal. Chryso. in 2. ad Timo. Homil. 5.

The Childish Argumentes, that you haue imagined, are youre owne, M. Hardinge: you knowe ful wel, they are none of mine. Thus onely I saie: Diuerse the Holy Fathers haue written ouer basely, I wil not saie, vilely, and sclaunderously of the state of Matrimonie in general, Callinge it in al kinde of men, Fornication, an il thing, and like to Aduouterie: Therefore, I saie, they maie mutche lesse be taken, as indifferente Iudges in Priestes Marriage. Againe, Diuers the Holy Fathers, beeinge them selues Priestes, and Bishoppes, had wiues, and liued in Matrimonie: Therefore, I saie, they condemned not Priestes Marriage.

Firste of al, his Obiection of Vowes nothinge toucheth the Clergie of Englande. For it is knowen, and Confessed, that the Priestes of Englande were neuer Votaries.

M. Har. fo 290. b

Addition. Further, where I saie, The Clergie of Englande was neuer bounde to sutche Vowe of Chastitie, you saie, VVhat moueth you to saie, the Priestes of Englande are no Votaries? VVhat priuilege haue they aboue al other Priestes of Christendome, at leaste, of the Latine, and VVeaste Churche? &c. Addition

The

Bishops & Prieſtes Married.

The Anſweare. You knowe, M. Hardinge, neither the Prieſtes of Englande euer offered any ſuche Vowe, nor the Biſhop euer required it. And howe can ye be a Votarie, that maketh no Vowe? or how can there be a vow, where nothing is vowed?

You ſaie, This Vowe is annexed to Holy Orders by ſtatute of Holy Churche: And Biſhoppes, Prieſtes, and Deacons be tied to Chaſtitie. To Chaſtitie, ſaie you, M. Hardinge? Would God it were ſo. Would God the worlde ſawe not the contrarie. Howe be it, here you allege Pope Gregorie, The Emperour Iuſtinian, The Councel of Carthage, Pope Leo, and others. Yea, althoughe the Biſhop require nothinge, and althoughe the Prieſte promiſe nothinge, Yet (you ſaie) Othes, and promiſes maie lawfully paſſe without woordes. And here you bring in many proper thinges, of laieinge handes on a Booke, of Holdinge vp twoo fingers, of Souldiers Badges, and I wote not, what. In the ende you conclude, A becke is as good, as a Dieu garde. All theſe woordes, M. Hardinge, are not worthe one woorde of Anſweare.

M. Hardinge, Fo. 291. a. 291. b.

M. Har. fo. 293. a

M. Hard. 293. b.

If the Prieſtes of Englande were alwaies Votaries, and haue ſo continewed from the beginninge, howe is it then, that the ſame Prieſtes neuertheleſſe continewed ſtil in Lawful Matrimonie, for the ſpace of more then a thouſande yeres tograther after Chriſte, and that without reproufe, and without offenſe of the Church of God? Were they al bounde by Vowe to Liue ſingle: and yet did they altogether, al that while, contrarie to theire Solemne Vowe, liue lawfully in open Wedlocke? Who woulde thus ſaie, but M. Hardinge? Where then was the Pope, that ſhoulde haue reproued them? Where was then M. Hardinge, that ſhould haue cried out vpon them, Fleaſhely, Inceſtuous, Sacrilegious, Vowebreakers? Was Inceſte, and Sacrilege ſo lightly weighed emong our Fathers ſo longe a time? Was there neither Biſhop, nor Prieſte, nor other Holy man within this Realme, duringe the ſpace of ſo many hundred yeres, that would reproue it? Did al the Godly Prieſtes of this Realme make ſolemne Vowes, for no other cauſe, but onely to breake them? Let vs thinke better of our Fathers, M. Hardinge. Certainely they made no ſuche Vowe, neither by Becke, as you ſaie, nor by Dieu garde.

Againe, If the Vowe of Chaſtitie be of it ſelfe annexed to Orders, as you ſaie, What ſhal we then thinke of the Prieſtes of Græcia, and Aſia, & of al other Chriſtened Countries throughe the Worlde? Are they al bounde to Chaſtitie by Solemne Vowe, and yet liue they al in open Matrimonie againſte their Vowe? Are they al Fleaſhly, Inceſtuous, Sacrilegious Vowebreakers without exception? Wherefore then doth Pope Stephanus ſaie, Aliter ſe Orientalium traditio habet Eccleſiarum, aliter huius Sanctæ Romanæ Eccleſiæ. Nam illarum Sacerdotes, Diaconi, & Subdiaconi Matrimonio copulantur: *The Tradition of the Eaſte Churche is one, and the Tradition of this Holy Churche of Rome is an other: For the Prieſtes, Deacons, and Subdeacons of the Eaſte Churche, are ioined in Matrimonie?* Wherefore is it noted there in the Rubrike, Orientalis Eccleſia Votum Caſtitatis non obtulit: *The Eaſte Churche hathe not offered the Vowe of Chaſtitie?* Wherefore dw you your ſelfe, M. Hardinge, ſecretely Confeſſe, That the Prieſtes of the Eaſte Churche are no Votaries? Remember your woordes: Thus you ſaie, VVhat priuilege haue the Prieſtes of Englande aboue al other Prieſtes of Chriſtendome, at leaſte of the Latine, and VVeaſte Churche, you ſaie: you dare not ſaie, The Eaſte Churche was euer ſubiecte to any ſuche Vowe. Wherefore doth the Cardinal Caietane ſaie, Nec ordo, in quantum Ordo, Nec ordo, in quantum Sacer, eſt impeditiuus Matrimonij: *Neither the Order of Prieſthoode, in that it is an Order, nor the ſame Order, in that it is Holy, is any hinderance to Matrimonie?* Neither Pope Stephanus, nor Gratian, nor Cardinal Caietane, nor you youre ſelfe moughte thus haue written, if the Vowe of Chaſtitie were neceſſarily annexed to Holy Orders.

Dift. 31. Aliter.

M. Har fo. 290. b

Cardinal Caietan. in Quodlibeto.

You allege a Canon of the Councel of Ancyra, where, you ſaie, it is thus Decreed, touchinge Deacons: If a Deacon receiue Orders of the Biſhop, and holde his peace, it ſhal not be lawful afterwarde for him to Marie. By this Canon you teache vs, that the Vowe of Chaſtitie is euermore ioined with Holy Orders. But in the ſame Canon it is alſo Decreed, *That, if the Deacon make Proteſtation, and telle the Biſhop, that he wil Marrie, for that he is not hable to liue Single, then if he afterwarde Marrie, he ſhal ſtil continewe in the Miniſterie.*

M. Hard. 292. a. Concil. Ancyran. Cap. 10.

sterie. All this, I saie, is written in the same Canon: I saie not, in any other, but in the same. Ye woulde not thus haue beguiled youre Reader, if ye had meante plainely. Notwithstandinge, I wil not here touche youre credite, M. Hardinge, nor vse your ordinarie exclamations of Falsehed, and Forgerie. Yet here you se, in this case, the *Councel thoughte it lawful for a Deacon to Marrie, notwithstandinge he were in Holy Orders.* And thus it is plaine by the same Canon, ye haue here alleged, *That then your Vowe was not annexed to Holy Orders.*

M. Hard. 292. a.

Origen. in Numer. Homil. 23.

Further you saie, *Origene*, whome I maie wel allege for witnesse of the Churche of his time, saithe, that none maie offer the Continual Sacrifice, but suche onely, as haue Vowed Continual Chastitie.

The Answeare. By the Continual Sacrifice you woulde beare vs in hande, that Origene meante onely that Sacrifice, that you haue imagined in your Masse. But in deede, M. Hardinge, Origene in that place speaketh not one worde, neither of youre Masse, (for he neuer knewe it: he would haue abhorred it) nor of your imagined Sacrifice, nor of Priest, nor of Deacon, nor of any outwarde Ministerie of the Churche. If it be otherwise, for your credites sake, let the wordes appeare. If there be in Origene not one suche worde, no not one, what opinion maie youre frendes haue in your dealinge, whom they se so sliely to iuggle before their eies? Verily Origene by the Continual Sacrifice, meante none other, but onely the Sacrifice of Faithful Praier: Which Sacrifice also thus many waies he expresseth: Si sine intermissione, &c. *If wee* Praie *without ceasinge. If our* Praier *early in the morninge, rise vp as a pleasant perfume in the sight of God: If the liftinge vp of our handes be vnto him an Eueninge Sacrifice.* This is the Sacrifice, that Origene there speaketh of, M. Hardinge. Of any other your Sacrifice he speaketh nothinge. Of this Sacrifice he saithe, *No man can offer it, that liueth in Wedlocke.* And thus he saithe, not onely of Priestes, and Deacons, as you serme to telle vs, but Generally of euery of Goddes Faithful People. *No man* (saithe he) *can offer vp this continual* Sacrifice *of* Praier, *onlesse he continewe in Chastitie, and liue a Virgine.* And this, M. Hardinge, was not the Generall Order of the Churche in that time, as you report it, but one of Origenes particulare, and knowen Errours.

Thus you haue proued, That your Vowe was annexed to Holy Orders, By the Authoritie of him, that speaketh not one Worde, neither of Priest, nor of Deacon, nor of any other Ecclesiastical Order: but Generally of al Faithful Christian people: and of the particulare Errours of one man, ye haue framed a Generall Order of the Churche. ☞

Cyril. in Leuiticum. Lib. 3.

Yet for further Answeare, we graunte, it is reason, and conuenient, that who so hathe made a Vowe vnto God, shoulde kepe his promise. Cyrillus saithe, Si Castitatem Promiserit, & seruare non poterit, pronuntiet Peccatum suum: *If he haue promised, or Vowed Chastitie, and* cannot keepe it, *let him pronounce, and confesse his Sinne.*

M. Har. fo 290. a

Addition ☞

Addition. ☞ M. Hardinge. As for the saieinge, you alleage out of the thirde Booke of Cyrillus in Leuiticum, it can serue you to no pourpose, but to witnesse your forgerie, and falsehed. For there is no suche saieinge in that Booke.

The Answeare. O M. Hardinge, why shoulde you take so vaine pleasure in euil speache? Is there no suche saieinge in al that Booke? What Booke had you to seke in? Or, what Spectacles had you to beholde it? Your manner is, to pronounce ouer boldely, before you knowe. I graunte I haue not alleged al the wordes, that S. Cyril vseth. Otherwise I shoulde haue taken out of him more, then thirtie lines altogether. Notwithstandinge I haue neither forged, nor altered, nor diuised any manner thinge of mine selfe, as it shal appeare.

Cyril. in Leuiticum. Lib. 3.

Firste S. Cyril saithe thus: Nos, cum venimus ad Dominum, & Vouemus, nos ei in Castitate (velle) seruire, pronuntiamus labijs nostris, & iuramus, nos (velle) castigare Carnem nostram &c. *When wee comme to our Lorde, and make a Vowe, that wee wil serue him in Chastitie; wee pronounce with our lippes, and make an othe, that wee wil Chasten our Fleashe &c.* Here haue we by expresse wordes a Vowe, and a Vowe of Chastitie. After certaine lines it foloweth thus, Si istum ordinem promiseris, & seruare non quiueris, audi, quid Legis ordo præcipiat: Si peccauerit, inquit, vnũ aliquod de istis

pronuntiet

pronuntiet peccatum ſuum, quod peccauit: *If thou haue promiſed to keepe this Order, and canſte not keepe it, Heare, what the order of the Lawe commaundeth thee. Thus ſaithe the Lawe, If a man ſhal offende in any of theiſe thinges, lette him pronounce the ſinne, that he hathe ſinned.* Here you maie not ſaie, M. Hardinge, that theſe later woꝛdes were vttered vpon occaſion of ſomme other mater, that went bitweene. Foꝛ S. Cyril ſpake theiſe ſelfe ſame woꝛdes namely, and onely of him, that hathe Vowed, and ſworne Chaſtitie. *Wee make a Vowe* (ſaithe Cyril) *to ſerue God in Chaſte life: Wee pronounce it, and geeue it out from our Lippes: Wee ſweare, that wee wil Chaſten our Fleaſhe.* Yet, ſaithe he, *If thou haue promiſed to keepe this Order, and canſte not keepe it, pronounce thy ſinne, that thou haſte ſinned.* Theiſe, M. Hardinge, be the woꝛdes, that, you ſay, cannot be founde in S. Cyril. This is my Falſehed: This is my Foꝛgerie. You ſee, your ouer haſty iudgemente maie ſone deceiue you.

Howe be it, touchinge Virginitie, oꝛ Chaſtitie, wee ſaie, It ſtandeth not in our Choiſe, oꝛ Vowe, but in the ſingulare gifte of God. Chriſte him ſelfe ſaithe, *Al menne take not this Woorde: but they, vnto whom it is geeuen.* Iuſtinus Martyꝛ ſaithe, Multi caſtrauerunt ſe propter Regnum Cœlorum. Verùm hoc non cuius datum eſt: *Many haue ghelded them ſelues for the Kingedome of Heauen. But this thinge is not geeuen* to al menne. S. Ambroſe ſaithe, Sola Virginitas eſt, quæ ſuaderi poteſt: imperari non poteſt: Onely Virginitie *is a thinge, that maie be Counſelled: but* commaunded it maie not be. So S. Hierome, Vnde infert Dominus, Qui poteſt capere, capiat, vt vnuſquiſque conſideret vires ſuas: vtrùm poſsit Virginalia, pudicitiæ præcepta implere. Per ſe enim Caſtitas blanda eſt, & quemlibet ad ſe alliciens. Sed conſiderandæ ſunt vires: vt, qui poteſt capere, capiat. *Our Lorde addeth,* He that can take, *lette him take: That euery man maie conſider his owne ſtrength, whether he* be hable *to accompliſhe the Lawes of Virginitie, and Chaſtitie, oꝛ no. For Chaſtitie of it ſelfe is faire, and pleaſant, and hable to allure any man vnto it ſelfe.* But wee muſte weighe our habilitie: That he maie take it, that can take it. *Matthe. 19.* *Iuſtinus Apolo. 2.* *32. Quæſt. 1. Integritas.* *Hieronym. in Matthe. Cap. 19.*

Herevnto the Ancient Father Origen began to complaine ſo longe agoe in his time: Non ſolùm quæ docent, non faciunt, ſed etiam crudeliter, & ſine miſericordia iniungunt alijs maiora virtute ipſorum, non habentes rationem Virium vnuſcuiuſque: vt, qui prohibent nubere, & ab eo, quod expedit, ad immoderatam munditiem compellunt: *Not onely* they doo not, that they teache, *but alſo cruelly, and without mercie, they commaunde others, to doo, that they* be not hable, *not conſideringe, oꝛ weighinge eche mannes ſtrength. Sutche be they,* that forbidde Menne to Marrie, and from that thinge, that is lawful, driue, and force menne to an immoderate kinde of Cleaneneſſe. *Origen in Matth. Tract. 24.*

S. Hierome ſaithe, Si quis conſideret Virginem ſuam, id eſt, Carnem ſuam laſciuire, & ebullire in libidienm, nec refræna re ſe poteſt, duplex illi incumbit neceſsitas, aut capiendæ Coniugis, aut ruendi: *If any man conſider, that his owne Virgine, that is to ſaie, his owne Fleaſhe, groweth prowde, and boileth vnto luſte,* and cannot ſtaie it, there is laide vpon him a double neceſsitie, either to take a wife, or els to falle. *Hieron. Contra Iouinian. Lib. 1.*

In this caſe S. Cyril ſaithe, Oportet compati, & commetiri Doctrinam pro virium qualitate: & huiuſmodi, qui non poſſunt capere Sermonem de Caſtitate, concedere nuptias: *Wee muſte haue conſideration of Menne, and meaſure our Doctrine accordinge to euery mannes habilitie: and vnto ſutche menne,* as cannot take the woorde of Chaſtitie, wee ought to graunt Marriage. *Cyrill. in Leuiticum. Lib. 10.*

If M. Hardinge wil Replie, that this Counſel maie take place in al others, but not in them, that haue Vowed, oꝛ promiſed the contrarie, let him vnderſtande his owne rule written in the Popes owne Decrées: In malis promiſsis reſcinde fidem: In turpi Voto muta decretum. Quod incautè vouiſti, ne facias. Impia eſt Promiſsio, quæ ſcelere impletur: *In an euil promiſe* breake thy Faithe. *In an vnhoneſt* Vowe change thy pourpoſe. *That thou haſte vnaduiſedly Vowed,* ſee thou doo it not. It is an euil promiſſe, *that is keapte with wickednesſe.* *22. Quæſt. 4. In malis.*

Addition. ☞ M. Hardinge. VVhat reliefe bringeth al this vnto his cauſe, onleſſe he be hable to proue, that Chaſtitie is an il, and a wicked thinge? *M. II. fo. 206. a*

The Anſweare. No, M. Hardinge, Chaſtitie is no il thinge: It is the ſpecial

gifte of God. But an vncleane, and a filthy life vnder colour of a Vowe, or the name of Chaſtitie, is a wicked thinge before God. You knowe, it is commonly ſaide vnder the name of S. Hierome, Simulata ſanctitas, duplex eſt iniquitas: *Counterfeite holineſſe is double wickednesse.*

Cyprian. Lib. 1. Epiſt. 11.

S. Cyprian hauinge occaſion to write of certaine Maides, that had Vowed Virginitie, and liued in diſorder, ſaithe thus: Quòd ſi perſeuerare nolunt, vel non poſſunt, melius eſt, vt nubant, quàm vt ignem delicijs ſuis cadant. Certè nullum Fratribus, aut Sororibus ſcandalum faciant: *If they either* cannot, or wil not continewe in Chaſtitie, better it is for them to Marrie, *then to falle into the fiere* (of Helle) *with their pleaſures. At the leaſte, lette them breede no ſclaunder to their Brother, or Siſter.*

Auguſt. De Bono Conjugali. Diſt. 27. Quidam.

S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Quidam, nubentes poſt votum, aſſerunt Adulteros eſſe. Ego autem dico vobis, quod grauiter peccant, qui tales diuidunt: *Some menne there be, that ſaie, They be Aduouterers, that Marrie after that they haue made a Vowe. But I tel you,* that they Sinne greuouſly, that put ſutche aſunder.

Epiphan. contrà Apoſtolic. Lib. 2. Φαυερῶς ἐαυ τῶ λαβεῖν γυναῖκα κατὰ νόμον.

Epiphanius likewiſe ſaithe, Melius eſt, Vnum habere Peccatum, quàm multa. Melius eſt cadentem à ſtudio, aperte ſibi vxorem aſciſcere ſecundum Leges, &c. Et à Virginitate longo tempore agere Pœnitentiam, &c. Et non quotidiè occultis iaculis vulnerari: *Better it is, to haue one Sinne, then many Sinnes.* Better it is *for a man fallinge from his courſe,* openly to take vnto him a wife accordinge to the Lawe, &c. *And a longe time to repente him ſelfe of the breache of his Virginitie, &c. And not to be wounded with priuie dartes euery daie.*

Hieronym. ad Virginem De Metriadem.

S. Hierome ſaithe, Sanctum Virginum Propoſitum, & Cœleſtis, Angelorumq; familiæ Gloriam quarundam non bene ſe agentium nomen infamat. Quibus aperte dicendum eſt, vt, aut nubant, ſi ſe non poſſunt continere: aut contineant, ſi nolunt nubere: *The name of certaine Virgins not wel behauinge them ſelues, defameth, and ſhameth the Holy pourpoſe of Virgins, and the Glorie of the Heauenly, and Angelical Familie. Whome wee muſte plainely charge, that* either they Marrie, if they cannot Conteine: *or that they Conteine, if they wil not Marrie.*

Auguſt. De Sancta Virginitate, Cap 34

To like pourpoſe S. Auguſtine ſaithe: Multas earum reuocat à nubendo, non amor præclari propoſiti, ſed aperti dedecoris timor, veniens & ipſe à Superbia: qua formidatur, hominibus magis diſplicere, quàm Deo. Nubere nolunt: & ideo non nubunt, quia impunè non poſſunt: quæ melius nuberent, quàm vrerentur, id eſt, quàm occulta flamma concupiſcentiæ in ipſa Conſcientia vaſtarentur: quas pœnitet Profeſsionis, & piget Confeſsionis: *Many of them are keapte from Marriage, not for loue of theire goodly pourpoſe of Virginitie, but for feare of open ſhame, whiche ſhame alſo proceedeth of Pride: For that* they are more afraide to diſpleaſe Man, then God. They wil not marrie: and therefore they marrie not, becauſe they cannot without rebuke. *Yet,* better were it for them to marrie, then to burne, *that is to ſaie, then with the flame of theire Concupiſcence in theire owne Conſcience to be waſted. They are ſoary of their Profeſsion: And yet it greeueth them to Confeſſe, &c.*

Marke 6. Actor. 23. 22 Quæ. 4. Inter cætera.

It is not ſufficiente to ſaie, I haue Vowed. Herode Vowed Iohn Baptiſtes heade: The Iewes Vowed S. Paules deathe: Hubaldus, as it is noted by Gratian in the Decrées, made a Vowe, that he would neuer healpe his owne Mother, or Brethren, were theire nede neuer ſo greate.

Alphonſus Vir. Philippica. 19.

Alphonſus Viruesius, one of M. Hardinges greateſt Doctours, ſaithe thus: Si quis Vouerit, & continere non poſsit, & omnia expertus, nihil promouerit, ego illi author eſſem, non vt proprio Conſilio, ſed vt authoritate Pontificis ſaluti ſuæ conſulat per Matrimonium: *If any man haue Vowed,* and Cannot conteine, and hauinge aſſaied al meanes, yet be neuer the neare, *I woulde aduiſe him, that he ſhoulde prouide* for the ſafetie of his Soule by Marriage: *And yet not of his owne Counſel, but by licence, and Authoritie of the Pope.*

Thomas 2. 2. qu. 88. Artic. 12.

Likewiſe Thomas of Aquine ſaithe, Poteſt contingere, quòd in aliquo caſu ſit, vel ſimpliciter malum, vel inutile, vel Maioris boni impeditiuum. Et ideò neceſſe eſt, quòd determinetur, in tali caſu, Votum non eſſe ſeruandum: *It maie happen, that in*

ſomme

some case a Vowe maie be, either vtterly il, or vnprofitable, or an hinderance vnto some other good thinge of more weighte. And therefore it muste of necessitie be determined, that in such a case, a Vowe oughte not to be keapte. Therefore it was thus Decreed in the Councel of Toledo: Non est seruandum Sacramentum, quòd male, & incautè promittitur: *A Vowe il, and vnaduisedly promised,* ought not to be keapte. Concil. Toletan. 8. Can. 2.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ M. Hardinge, Here M. Iewel allegeth the saieinges of sundrie Holy Fathers, Counsellinge those, that either cannot, or wil not keepe Chastitie, to take the remedie, that God hathe ordeined, that is to saie, to Marrie. VVhiche Counsel is vnderstanded to be geuen vnto them, that haue made no Vowe at al to the contrarie. M. Hard. 294. a.

The Answeare. Howe then, M. Hardinge, if you be not hable to kæpe Chastitie? Is your Vowe sufficiente to make you hable? Or wil you kæpe your Vowe, and liue in filthinesse? Or, if you so liue, shal you be excused by your Vowe? S. Paule saithe, *Fornicatours, and Aduouterours the Lorde wil iudge: They shal haue no parte in the Kingedome of* Christe, *and God.* Woe be to that Vowe, that worketh the destruction of the Soule.

But (you saie) this Counsel is geeuen to them, that haue made no Vowe. Thus you saie, and yet you knowe, you saie vntruely. Beholde the Authorities: The wordes be plaine: The Holy Fathers spake expressely of them, that haue Vowed. Lette S. Cyprian be an example for the reste. Thus he saithe, Quod si se ex Fide Christo dicauerunt, pudicè, & castè sine vlla fabula perseuerent, &c. Sin autem perseuerare nolunt, vel non possunt, melius est, vt nubant, &c. *If they haue in Faithe Vowed themselues to* Christe, *let them continewe Chastely, and honestly without guile, &c. But, if they wil not, or cannot continewe, better it is for them to Marrie, then with theire pleasures to falle into the fiere of Helle.* Beholde, M. Hardinge, S. Cyprian speaketh namely of them, that haue Vowed them selues to Christe. Unto them he directeth his Counsel: Of such he saithe, It is better for them to Marrie. M. Hard. 294. a. Cyprian. Lib. 1. Epist. 11.

You saie, S. Cyprian speaketh of them, that haue made a Vowes, S. Cyprian him selfe saithe, *He speaketh of them, that haue made no Vowe.* And muste we beleeue you before S. Cyprian? Why shoulde you with suche Untruthes, and Vanities deceiue the worlde?

Yet notwithstandinge you telle vs, contrarie to al that S. Cyprian hath taughte you, If a man haue once made a Vowe, thoughe he be not hable to liue Chaste, yet he maie in no wise Marrie: That is to saie, he muste liue in Fornication, or other Filthinesse. S. Paule saithe, *If they line not Chastely, let them Marrie: Better it is to Marrie, then to burne.* But by your aduise, we muste take S. Paules wordes, and turne them backewarde, and saie thus, *Marrie not, thoughe you line vnchastely: Better it is to burne in Concupiscence, then to Marrie.* ☞

Here, M. Hardinge, ye crie out in your inordinate heate: Fleashely Gospellers: Euangelical Vowebreakers: Impure Bigamine: Filthie railinge rabble: Lordaines: Strumpettes: And I wote not, what: as if this were the onely waie, to winne the Victorie. Unto this kinde of eloquence I wil make you none other answeare, then that Demetrius sommetime made vnto Lysimachus: Scortum apud nos modestiùs viuit, quàm apud vos Penelope: One of these, whome it liketh you, to calle Strumpettes, *liueth more soberly emongest vs, then dooth emongest you your Chaste* Penelope.

It appeareth by S. Augustine, M. Hardinge, that your errour is Ancient, and beganne longe agoe. For he saithe, that euen then in his time there were somme, that maintetned the same. But he answeared them then, as we do you nowe, They spake fondely, and vnaduisedly: and vnderstoode not, what they saide. His wordes be theise, Qui dicunt, talium Nuptias non esse Nuptias, sed potiùs Adulteria, mihi non videntur satis acutè, ac diligenter considerare, quid dicant: *They that saie,* The Marriage of suche menne, or weemen, (as haue Vowed Chastitie) is no Marriage, *but rather Aduouterie, seeme vnto me not to consider discretely, and wisely, what they saie.* And againe, Fit per hanc minùs consideratam opinionem, vt cùm volunt eas separatas reddere Continentiæ, faciant Maritos earum Adulteros Veros, cùm suis Vxoribus viuis, alteras duxerint: *It commeth to passe by this Vnaduised Opinion, that* August. De Bono Viduitatis, ca 10. In eod Capite.

Whereas they wil remooue theiſe weemen, that ſo haue Vowed, from their Huſbandes, and force them to continewe in their Single Life, they make the Huſbandes of them Aduouterers in deede, *in caſe they Marrie againe, theire owne Wiues beinge ſtil aliue.*

Thus therefore, M. Hardinge, you maie imagine, S. Auguſtine ſaithe vnto you, as he did vnto them: *Ye ſpeake fondly, and vnaduiſedly, and vnderſtande not, What ye ſpeake.*

Dorman fol. 16. And yet one of your Companions there telleth vs, *That he is vndoubtedly the Dinelles Miniſter, that wil ſaie,* (as S. Auguſtine ſaithe) *that the Marriage of ſutche perſonnes is true, and very Marriage.* Thus by the Iudgemente of your late Louanian Clergie, S. Auguſtine is becomme the Miniſter of the Diuel.

But M. Hardinge hathe further to ſaie, that S. Auguſtine called this kinde of Marriage VVoorſe then Aduouterie: An other calleth it Inceſte: and an other Sacrilege. That the Anciente Fathers haue thus written, it is true, and not denied. Howe be it, good Reader, as I haue partely ſhewed before, theiſe, and other like woordes haue proceaded, more of zele, and heate of minde, then of profounde conſideration, and Iudgemente of the cauſe. Neither maie we alwaies ſtraine ſutche ſaieinges to the vttermoſte. For, whereas S. Auguſtine ſaithe, *Sutche Marriage is woorſe then Aduouterie,* he ſaithe neuertheleſſe immediately after in the ſame place, *It is true, and very Marriage in deede before God, and Man, and no Aduouterie.* His woordes be theſe: Non quòd ipſe Nuptiæ vel talium damnandæ iudicentur. Damnatur Propoſiti fraus: Damnatur fracta Voti Fides, &c. Damnantur tales, non quia Coniugalem Fidem Poſteriùs inierunt, ſed quia Continentiæ Primam Fidem irritam fecerunt: Not that the Marriage of ſutche perſonnes is to be blamed, *That defraudinge of theire pourpoſe, and the breache of theire Vowe is blamed. Sutche are blamed,* not for that they haue entred into the Faithe of Matrimonie: *but for that they haue broken theire Firſte Faithe, or promiſe of continente Life.* So likewiſe S. Auguſtine ſaithe of a Woman, that vſed to painte her face: Etſi impudica circa homines non ſis, tamen corruptis, violatiſque, quæ Dei ſunt Peior Adultera detineris: *Althoughe thou be no euil Woman, as touchinge menne, or the miſuſinge of thy body, yet thus colouringe, and corruptinge thy face, whiche thou haſte of God,* thou arte woorſe then an Aduoutreſſe. Here, by waie of compariſon, and in heate of ſpeeche, S. Auguſtine ſaithe, *That paintinge of the face is woorſe then Aduouterie.* In like ſenſe S. Cyprian ſaithe, Diabolo peior eſt, qui fœminarum aſpectibus feritur: *He that is ſtriken, or moued with the ſighte of Weemen, is* woorſe then the Diuel. Likewiſe againe he ſaithe, Multò grauior, & Peior eſt Mœchi cauſa, quàm Libellatici: An Aduouterers caſe is woorſe, *then is the caſe of him, that hathe betraied the Faithe.*

Auguſt. De Bono Viduitatis cap. 9

Auguſt. De Doctrina Chriſtiana. Lib. 4. Ca. 21.

Cyprian. de Singularitate Clericorum.

Cyprian. Lib. 4. Epiſt. 2.

Such compariſons, as I haue ſaide, maie not wel be racked to al pourpoſes: but muſte be taken ſo farre forthe onely, as they were meante. Otherwiſe the ſame S. Cyprian ſaithe, Peius eſt, quàm mœchari, Continentiam ducere criminoſam: *To liue Vnchaſtely vnder the coloure of Chaſte life,* (as your Clergie dothe) *is* woorſe then Aduouterie. Here, M. Hardinge, S. Cyprian ſaithe, that your vnchaſte Chaſtitie, and coloured Vaunte of Virginitie, is woorſe then Aduouterie.

Cyprian. De Singularitate Clericorum.

So S. Ambroſe, when he had ſaide, *If ſhee haue a minde to Marrie, ſhee committeth Aduouterie, ſhee is made the Handemaide of Deathe.* He addeth further, as of a greater euil, Si hoc ita eſt, quid de illa dicendum eſt, quæ occulta, & furtiua turpitudine conſtupratur, & fingit, ſe eſſe, quod non eſt? Bis Adultera eſt: *This beinge ſo,* what then ſhal we ſaie of her, *that is defiled with ſecrete, and priuie filthineſſe: and faineth her ſelfe to be, that in deede ſhee is not?* Shee is twiſe an Aduoutreſſe.

Ambroſ. ad Virginem Lapſam. Cap. 5.

Here S. Ambroſe calleth your painted Virginitie, Double Aduouterie. So S. Chryſoſtome, Virginitas iſta cum Viris plus ab omnibus arguitur, quàm ſtuprum ipſum: *This Virginitie of Women emongeſt menne,* is more reproued of al menne, then Fornication it ſelfe.

Chryſoſt. Tom. 5. Quòd Regulares Fœminæ cũ Viris cohabitẽt.

By theſe ſewe we maie the beter vnderſtande the place, that M. Hardinge hath here alleged, of S. Paule vnto Timothee, *When thei waxe wanton againſt* Chriſt, *they wil Marrie, hauinge damnation, bicauſe they haue broken their Firſte Faithe.* Notwithſtandinge

1. Timoth. 5.

ſtandinge in dede S Paule ſpake theſe wordes, neither of Vowes, nor of Vowebreakers: but of the Widowes, that were appointed to attende vpon the Olde, and ſicke perſonnes, and therefore were relieued, and founde by the Churche.

But let vs imagine, as M. Hardinge would haue vs, that S. Paule ſpake al this of the breache of Vowes. And let Prima Fides: The Firſte Faithe, be the Vowe of Chaſtitie. Howe be it, in dede our Firſte Faithe, is the Faithe, that wee promiſe in Baptiſme, and none other. And ſo S. Hierome ſeemeth to take it. For thus he writeth, Non ſunt digni Fide, qui primam Fidem irritam fecerunt: Marcionem loquor, & Baſilidem: *They be not woorthie to be beleeued, that haue foreſaken theire* Firſte Faithe: *I meane* Marcion, *and* Baſilides. Theſe two famouſe Heretiques Marcion, and Baſilides, were not condemned for breakinge any Vowe of Chaſtitie, but for refuſinge the Faithe of Chriſte: which S. Hierome calleth the Firſte Faithe. *Hieron. in Proœmio in Epiſt. ad Titum.*

S. Paule maketh no mention of any Vowe, but onely rebuketh ſuche light, and waueringe Wemen, as beinge of longe time founde by the Charges of the Congregation, purpoſely to relieue the ſicke, and the feble, afterwarde forſoke bothe the Congregation, and Chriſte too, and became Heathens, and followed the Diuel. For ſo S. Paule ſaithe, Nonnullæ iam deflexerunt poſt Satanam: *Many ſuche Wemen are already gonne after Sathan.* But if S. Paule ſpake this of the breach of Vowes, with what cies then, M. Hardinge, do you reade his wordes? Or what aduantage can you hope to finde in ſuche Authorities, as do ſo expreſſely crie againſte your ſelfe? S. Paule ſaithe euen there, in the ſame place, Vidua eligatur non minor annis ſexaginta. Iuniores Viduas reijce. Volo Iuniores Viduas nubere: Liberos gignere: domum adminiſtrare: nullam occaſionem dare Aduerſario, vt habeat maledicendi cauſam: *Let no Widowe be choſen vnder* threeſcore yeares of age. Refuſe yonge VVidowes. I wil, that yonge VVidowes be Married: *bringe vp their Children: ouerſee their houſe: and geene no occaſion to the aduerſarie to ſpeake il.* 1. Timoth. 5.

If theſe wordes of S. Paule muſte needes be taken of Vowes, and none otherwiſe, why do you ſo violently, contrarie to S. Paules commaundement, either force or ſuffer yonge Maides and Girles to receiue theſe Vowes? Why do ye not ſtaie them vntil they be ſtriken in age, as S. Paule willeth you, that they maie be threeſcore yeres Olde, before they Vowe? It is no reaſon, ye ſhould in one place claime by one Worde, and breake ſo many.

You ſaie, The Vowe of Chaſtitie is annexed vnto Holy Orders by the Anciente Conſtitution of the Churche, and by the Apoſtles of Chriſte. For trial of your Truthe herein, I beſeeche you, to conſider theſe fewe in ſtede of many. Fol. 79 b.

Your owne allowed, and principal Doctour Gratian ſaithe thus: Copula Sacerdotalis, vel conſanguineorum, nec Legali, nec Euangelica, nec Apoſtolica authoritate prohibetur: *Prieſtes Marriage is not forebidden by any* Authoritie, either of the Lawe of Moſes, or of the Goſpel, or of the Apoſtles. 26 qu. 2. Sors.

Clemens Alexandrinus ſaithe, Omnes Apoſtoli Epiſtolæ, quæ moderationem docent, & continentiam, cùm & de Matrimonio, & de Liberorum procreatione, & de domus adminiſtratione innumerabilia præcepta contineant, nunquam tamen honeſtum, moderatumq; Matrimonium prohibuerunt: *All the Epiſtles of the Apoſtles, whiche teache ſobrietie, and continent life, whereas they conteine innumerable Preceptes, touchinge Matrimonie, bringinge vp Children, and gouernement of Houſe,* yet they neuer forebade Honeſte, and ſober Marriage. *Clemens Stromat. Lib. 3.*

Cardinal Caietanus ſaithe, Nec Ratione, nec Authoritate probari poteſt, quòd, abſolutè loquendo, Sacerdos peccet contrahendo Matrimonium. Nam nec Ordo, in quantum Ordo, nec Ordo, in quantum Sacer, eſt impedituus Matrimonij. Siquidem Sacerdotium non dirimit Matrimonium contractum, ſiue antè, ſiue poſt: ſecluſis omnibus Legibus Eccleſiaſticis: ſtando tantùm ijs, quæ habemus à Chriſto, & Apoſtolis: *It cannot* be proued, neither by reaſon, nor by Authoritie, *ſpeakinge Abſolutely, that a Prieſte ſinneth in Marrieinge a wife.* For neither the Order of Prieſthoode, in that it is Order, nor the ſame Order, in that it is Holy, is any hinderance to Matrimonie. *For Prieſthoode breaketh not Marriage, whether it be contracted* before Prieſthoode, or *Cardi. Caietan. in Quod libetu contra Lutherũ*

afterwarde: *setting al Ecclesiastical Lawes aparte*, and standinge onely vnto those thinges, that we haue of Christe, and his Apostles.

Panormitan. De Clericis Coniug. Cùm Olim.

Abbate Panormitane **saithe**, Continentia non est de Substantia Ordinis, nec de Iure Diuino: Single life is not of the substance of the Order of Priesthoode, nor of the Lawe of God.

Antonin. in Sũma. Par. 3 Tit. 1. Cap 21.

Likewise Antoninus **saithe**, Episcopatus ex Natura sua non habet opponi ad Matrimonium: *The office, or Degree of a Bishop, of the* Substance, or Nature of it selfe *is not contrarie to Matrimonie.* **Wherby ye maie easily see, M. Hardinge, howe true it is, that you saie,** The Vowe of Chastitie is annexed to Holy Orders, and that by the Apostles Ancient Constitution.

But this Order (**you saie**) was taken, for that, hauinge the vse of VVedlocke wee cannot Praie. **And, to that ende ye allege the Authoritie of S Paule, Where also ye might haue alleged the names, and sayinges of sundrie Fathers.** Origen **saithe**, *The Holy Ghoste in time of Copulation foresaketh a man, yea although he were a Prophete of God.* **An other saithe,** Virginitas Sola potest animas hominum præsentare Deo: *Onely Virginitie is hable to presente the Soule of a man vnto God.* S. Hierome **saithe**, Quotiescunque vxori debitum reddo, orare non possum: *As often as I doo my duetie to my Wife, I cannot Praie.* **And to this purpose Pope** Siricius **vndiscretely and fondely abuseth the Holy Worde of God. Thus he saithe,** Qui in Carne sunt, Deo placere non possunt: *They that be in the Flesshe, cannot please God.*

Origen in Numer. Homil. 7.

Extra. De Probationib. In Glossa.

Hierony. Aduer. Iouian. Lib. 1.

Inter Decreta Stricij. Cap. 7.

These wordes seeme very harde, and sounde muche to the derogation of Goddes Ordinance. And therefore Ignatius S. Iohns Scholare **saithe,** Si quis Legitimam Commixtionem, & Filiorum Procreationem, Corruptionem, & Coinquinationem vocat, ille habet cohabitatorem Dæmonem Apostatam: *If any man calle lawefull Copulation, and Begettinge of Children, Corruption, and Filthinesse,* he hathe the Diuel that felle from God dwellinge within him.

Rom. 8

Ignatius ad Philadelphien.

In like manner saie the Learned godly Bishoppes in the Councel of Gangra: Si quis discernit Presbyterum Coniugatum, tanquam occasione nuptiarum, quòd offerre non debeat, & ab eius Oblatione abstinet, Anathema sit: *If any man make* difference of a Married Priest, *as if he maie not Minister the Oblation (or Holy Communion) bicause of his Marriage, and abstaineth from his Oblation, accursed be he.*

Concil. Gangren. Cap. 4.

Dist 31. Quoniã.

Likewise it is written in the Councel of Constantinople, Si quis præsumpserit, contra Apostolicos Canones, aliquos Presbyterorum, & Diaconorum priuare à Contactu, & Communione legalis vxoris suæ, Deponatur. Similiter & Presbyter, aut Diaconus, qui Religionis causa Vxorem suam expellit, excommunicetur: *If any man contrarie to the Apostles Canon, presume to remoue either Priest, or Deacon from the vse, and companie* of his lawful wife, *let him be Depriued. And in like manner lette the Priest, or Deacon be excommunicate, that* putteth awaie his wife *vnder the coloure of Religion.*

1. Corinth. 7.

As touchinge the place of S. Paule, *Defraude not your selues, One an Other, Onlesse it be of consente for a season, that ye maie attende vnto Fastinge, and Praier.* **He speaketh not this of that kinde of Praier, that is commonly, and daily vsed of al the Faithefull, as wel Married, as Vnmarried, but onely of the General, and Solemne Praier of the whole Congregation, whiche then, as in time of Persecution, and feare of enimies, was keapte onely in the nighte: and al the whole multitude of the Faithefull, was charged to be presente at the same. At whiche times it was necessarie, that bothe the man, and the wife should leaue the one the others companie, and resorte to Praier.**

Ioel 2.

So it is written in the Prophete Ioel, *Blowe vp the Trumpe in Sion: Proclaime a solemne Faste: Call together a Congregation of the People. Let the Bridgrome leaue his bed: Let the Spouse comme from her Chamber. Lette the Priestes, the Mimisters of God, weepe betwene the Entrie, and the Aultare: And let them saie, O Lorde spare thy people, and geue not ouer thine Enheritance vnto Confusion.* **Of the like kinde of General, and Solemne** Praier, Tertullian **saithe thus,** Quis Solemnibus Paschæ abnoctantem Vxorem securus sustinebit? *What man* (bring an Heathen) *can without mistruste, suffer his Wife,* (bringe a Christian Woman) *to be awaie from him at the Solemnitie of the Easter Praier?*

Tertull. ad Vxorem. Lib. 2.

Of sutche

Of ſutche Solemne, and Seldome mettinges S. Paule ſpeaketh: and not of the the Datelye, Vſual, and Common Praiers of al Chriſtians.

Otherwiſe, touchinge the Puritie, and Holineſſe of Married people, S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Quòd Paulus ait, Quæ innupta eſt, cogitat ea, quæ ſunt Domini, vt ſit ſancta & Corpore, & Spiritu, non ſic accipiendum eſt, vt putemus, non eſſe Sanctam Corpore Chriſtianam Coniugem Caſtam. Omnibus quippe Fidelibus dictum eſt, Neſcitis, quoniam Corpora veſtra Templum ſunt Spiritus Sancti? Sancta ſunt etiam Corpora Coniugatorum, fidem ſibi, & Domino ſeruantium: *Whereas* S. Paule *ſaithe, Shee that is vnmarried, thinketh of the thinges, that perteine vnto the Lorde, that ſhee maie be Holy bothe in Body, and in Sprite, it maie not ſo be taken, as though wee ſhoulde thinke, a Chriſtian wife liuinge Chaſtely with her huſbande, is not Holy in Boate. For it is* generally ſaide vnto al Faithefull, *Knowe yee not, that your Bodies be the Temple of the Holy Ghoſte? Therefore if the* Man, and VVife, *keepe theire faithe bothe bitweene them ſelues, and to the Lorde,* theire Bodies are Holy.

Auguſt. De bono Coniugali. Li. 1. cap. 11.

But, theſe Euangelical Vowebreakers (ſaithe M. Hardinge) pretende Paphnutius to be theire Proctoure. Whether he be our Proctoure, or no, it ſorteth not greatly. Notwithſtandinge it is plaine, He was then the onely Proctoure for the Truth, and that againſte the General Conſente of al the whole Councel biſides. And although he were but One man alone, yet the whole Councel gaue place vnto him. Sozomenus ſaithe, Synodus laudauit ſententiam Paphnutij, & nihil ex hac parte ſanciuit: Sed hoc in vniuſcuiuſque Voluntate, ſine vlla Neceſsitate reliquit: *The Councel commended* Paphnutius *iudgemente, and touchinge this mater of Marriage, made no Decree at al: but leafte it to eche mannes owne Wil, without any force of Neceſſitie.*

Sozom. li. 3. ca. 11.

Of Our ſide thus mutche Paphnutius ſaithe, Marriage is Honorable: *And the Companie of Man, And Wife is* (not filthineſſe, as theſe menne ſeeme to fate, but) Cleanenelſe, and Chaſtitie.

σωφροσύνην δὲ τὴν πρὸς τὰς ἰδίας γυναῖκας συνουσίαν.

But, M. Hardinge, if the ſame Holy Father Paphnutius weighe ſo mutche of your ſide, as you pretende, wherefore then dothe One of your Companions of Louaine ſo lightly, and ſo diſdainefully controlle that whole Storie, with the vtter diſcredite, and condemnation of the Writers? For thus hath he not doubted to puBliſhe his iudgemente therein to al the worlde: Mihi, neſcio quomodo, in dubium venit fides huius Hiſtoriæ de Paphnutio. Sunt enim, quæ ſuſpicionem important, eam eſſe Arianorum, aut Impudicorum hominum Commentum. Tota enim hæc res a Socrate pendet, & Sozomeno: quorum alter Nouatianus fuit: alter Theodorum Mopſueſtenſem à quinta Synodo damnatum magnis laudibus extulit: *I knowe not howe, this Storie of* Paphnutius *ſeemeth to me to be of doubteful credite. For there be maters, that make me to ſuſpecte, that it is but a* vaine forged tale, either of the Arian Heretiques, or of ſomme other filthy perſonnes. *The whole mater hangeth of* Socrates, *and* Sozomenus: *Of whiche twoo, the one was a Nouatian Heretique: The other highely commendeth* Theodorus *of* Mopſueſta, *beeinge condemned by the Fifthe Councel.*

Copus Dialogo 1. Pag. 154.

Thus your Felowes make this whole Storie to be but a vaine Fable: and the Authours, and Writers hereof, Socrates, and Sozomenus, to be Heretiques, Nouatians, Arians, Vnhoneſte, and Shameleſſe perſonnes. And therefore, I trowe, ye wil not ſaie, they are your Proctours.

Whereas S. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Marriage is ſo reuerende a thinge, that a man maie therewith aſcende into the Holy Throne, and be made a Biſhop, notwithſtandinge he haue a wife: and that S. Paule ſuffereth not them, that haue twiſe married, to attaine ſuche a roume: By theſe woordes, ſaithe M. Hardinge, Chryſoſtome condemneth the impure Bigamie of our Holy Goſpellers. Againe he ſaithe, If this Defender preſſe vs with Chryſoſtome, wee anſweare, that, although Chryſoſtome graunte, that a Married man maie aſcende to the Holy Seate, yet he ſaithe not, that a man maie deſcende from that Holy Seate to the Bridebedde. For wee denie vtterly, that any man, after that he hathe receiued Holy Orders, maie Marie. Neither can it be ſhewed, that the Mariage of ſutche was euer accoumpted lawful in the Catholike Churche.

Chryſoſt. in Epiſt. ad Tit. Homil. 2.

I doubte not, good Reader, but it ſhal eaſily appeare, that M. Hardinge in either of theſe twoo partes was ſowly deceiued. For firſte Chryſoſtome as it is

Husbande of One VVife. Timo. 1.

plaine by his wordes, whiche M. Hardinge in his translation hathe pourposely falsified, expoundeth these Wordes of S. Paule, The Husbande of One VVife, not of a man, that neuer had but one wife in al his time, but of a man, that hathe but one wife at one time. If M. Hardinge shal thinke, this Exposition to be strange, and vnlikely, let him remember, that Chrysostome him selfe thereof writeth thus, Vnius Vxoris Virum. Non hoc, veluti sanciens, dicit, quasi non liceat absq; Vxore Episcopum fieri, sed eius rei modum constituens. Iudæis quippe licitum erat, etiam Secundo Matrimonio iungi, & Duas itidem simul habere Vxores: The Husbande of One VVife: S. Paule *writeth not this, as makinge a Lawe, as if it were not lawful for a man to be made a Bishop without a wife: but he appointeth an order in that behalfe. For it was lawful for the* Iewes to be coupled in the Seconde Matrimonie, and to haue twoo VViues at one time.

Chrysost. in Epist. 1. ad Timotheum, Homil. 10.

Hieron. in Epist. ad Titum, cap. 1.

In like sorte saithe S. Hierome, Quidam de hoc loco ita sentiunt: Iudaicæ, inquiunt, Consuetudinis fuit, vel binas vxores habere, vel plures. Et hoc nunc volunt esse Præceptum, ne is, qui Episcopus eligendus est, vno tempore Duas Pariter Vxores habeat: *Touchinge this place, some men thinke thus: By the Custome of the* Iewes *it was lawful for a man, to haue* Twoo wiues, or moe at once. *And this they take to be the Apostles Commaundement, that he, that is to be chosen a Bishop, haue not* Twoo wiues, or moe togeather at one time. Againe he saithe, Diaconi sint Vnius vxoris viri: Non, vt, si non habuerint, ducant: Sed ne Duas habeant: *Let the Deacons be the Husbandes of* One wife: *not that they shoulde needes Marrie a wife, if they haue none: but that they shoulde not haue* twoo wiues togeather. Likewise saithe Cardinal Caietane, Apostolus Episcopis permittit Vnam Vxorem, Cæteris plures: *The Apostle suffereth a Bishop to haue* One wife: Others he suffereth to haue moe.

Hiero. in Epist. 1. ad Tim. Cap. 3. Catharinus contra Errores Caietan. Errore. 99 Dist. 23. Hu igitur.

And to this pourpose, Isidorus sémeth to saie, Castimoniam non Violati Corporis perpetuò obseruare studeant: aut certè Vnius Matrimonij vinculo fœderentur: *Let them studie to keepe and continewe the Chastitie of theire Body vndefiled: or els, let them be Coupled with the* bande of One Marriage.

Of suche a one, Pope Leo wrote sommetime vnto the Bishop of Mauritania, Sicut ad nos relatum est, Duarum simul est Maritus Vxorum: *As wee are enformed, he is* at one time the Husbande of Twoo wiues. And therefore he addeth his iudgemente of him: Priuandum honore decernimus: *Wee thinke him meete to be deprined of his promotion.*

Leo. ad Episcopos Mauritaniæ.

Of this kinde of Seconde Marriage Chrysostome speaketh, I meane, of hauinge twoo Wiues aliue togeather: And not of Marrieinge the Seconde wife after the deathe of the Former. And therefore he saithe, Secundam quidem accipere secundum Præceptum Apostoli licitum est: Secundum autem Veritatis rationem Verè Fornicatio est. Sed cùm, permittente Deo, Publicè, & licenter permittitur, fit Honesta Fornicatio: *To take the* Seconde wife (while the firste is aliue) *accordinge to the Apostles Commaundemente, it is lawful: But by the Iudgement of the Truthe,* in deede it is Fornication: *But while as by Goddes permission it is openly, and lawfully suffered,* the Fornication is made Honeste. The laste Clause the Glose there expoundeth thus: Fornicatio cum ea, quam permisit Moses post repudiatam assumi: *Fornication, I meane, with her, whom* Moses *suffered to be taken to wife,* after the Diuorse *of the Firste.*

31. Quæ. 1. Hac ratione.

Thus therefore S. Chrysostome saithe, that suche a man, as hat *twoo wiues togeather at one time,* or was *Diuorsed from One wife, and had Married an other,* might not be chosen to be a Bishop. For otherwise, Tertullian saithe vnto the Bishoppes of the Catholique Churche: Apud vos Episcopi sunt Digami: *There be Bishoppes emonge you* (he meaneth emonge the Catholiques) *that haue Married* twoo wiues, the one after the deathe of the other.

Tertullian. De Monogamia.

If al this wil not suffice, I referre mé selfe to Chrysostomes owne Wordes, thus he writeth: S. Paule *restraineth Vnchaste persinnes, not permittinge them,* that haue married twoo wiues, *to be Chosen to the gouernemente of the Churche.* His reasons be these, Nam, qui Vxori, quæ decessit (a se) beneuolentiam nullam seruasse deprehenditur, quo pacto potest ille esse bonus Præceptor Ecclesiæ? Imò quibus criminibus

Chrysost. in Epist. ad Tit. Homil 2. τῆς ἀπελθούσης.

non

Marriage in Holy Orders.

non subijcitur in dies? Nostis enim, quòd, etsi per Leges Secundæ nuptiæ permittuntur, tamen ea res accusationibus multis patet: *For, he that is founde, to haue borne no good wil vnto his wife,* (not that is deade, but) that is gonne from him, *howe can he be a meete Maister for the Churche of God? Naie rather to what quarelles, and accusations* (by meane of theise two Wiues) *shal he not be subiecte euery daie? For you knowe, although by the Lawe the* Marriage of the Seconde VVife (after the Diuorse of the firste) be suffered, *yet the mater lieth open to many offenses.*

It appeareth (saithe Chrysostome) *that he bare no good wil towardes his Former Wife,* not, that nowe is deade, *but that is diuorsed,* and so departed from him. And therefore oftentimes growe many accusations, and grieses, betwéene the Wiues, the Children, the Frendes, & others: for partinge of goodes: for restoaringe of Dowers, and other like quarelles. For to haue spoken of good wil, or affection towardes the Former Wife, beinge deade, it had benne impertinente, and to no pourpose.

Thus mutche touchinge Chrysostomes iudgemente vpon these wordes of S. Paule, The Husbande of One VVife. Notwithstandinge I denie not, but certaine other Auncient, and Learned Fathers haue taken it otherwise.

Laste of al, M. Hardinge vnwares falleth into the same Negatiue Diuinitie, that he sooften, and so mutche abhorreth. For thus he saith, *Wee denie vtterly, that any man, after that he hathe receiued Holy Orders, maie Marrie. Neither canne it be shewed, that the Marriage of suche was euer accounpted lawful in the Catholique Churche.* If this tale be true, then be al the Greeke Priestes Votaries, as wel, as the Latines. But it is noted vpon the Decrées, Græci continentiam non promittunt, vel Tacitè, vel Expresse: *The* Greekes *make no Promise of Continente, or Single Life, neither Secretely, nor Expressely.* And in the Councel holden at Ancyra, it is concluded thus, Diaconi, quicunque ordinantur, si in ipsa Ordinatione protestati sunt, & dixerunt, velle se Coniugio Copulari, quia sic manere non possunt, Hi si postmodum Vxores duxerint, in Ministerio maneant: Propterea quòd Episcopus illis licentiam dederit: *Deacons, as many, as be ordered, if at the time of receiuinge Orders, they made Protestation, and saide, that* they woulde Marrie, *for that they finde not them selues hable so to continewe without Marriage*, if they afterwarde Marrie, *let them continewe in the Ministerie: for as mutche as the Bishop hathe geuen them licence.* M. Hardinge, I trowe, wil not denie, but Deaconship is one of the Holy Orders. Yet Deacons at the time of theire Consecration, makinge Protestation solemnly before the Bishop, were licenced by this Councel to Marrie at any time afterwarde: and the same Marriage, contrarie to M. Hardinges position, was euermore in the Catholique Churche accounpted lawful.

Dist. 31. quenã. In Margine.

Conci. Ancyran. Can. 9.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ M. Hardinge. This proueth not, that Deacons did Marrie, nor that any Bishop euer gaue them leaue to Marrie. M. Har. fo. 198. b

The Answeare. What then dothe it prowe, M. Hardinge? Or, to what pourpose was it thus Decreed by the Councel? Whether Deacons Married, or no, I wil not striue. Certainely it appeareth hereby, it was lawful for them to Marrie. Yea although they were within Holy Orders, and that, by the Authoritie and warrante of this Councel.

So saithe Pope Steuin, Græcorum Sacerdotes, Diaconi, aut Subdiaconi Matrimonio Copulantur: *The* Greeke *Priestes, Deacons, or Subdeacons* are Coupled in Matrimonie. Upon whiche wordes the Glose noteth thus, Multi ex hac litera dixerunt, quòd Orientales possunt contrahere in Sacris Ordinibus: *Many haue saide, vpon occasion of this texte, that the* Priestes of the Easte Churche (contrarie to that M. Hardinge so certainely here assureth vs) maie Marrie beeinge within Holy Orders.

Dist. 31. aliter. Gloss. Dist. 31. Aliter.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ M. Hardinge. If you had rehearsed the whole Decree, as you founde it, you had marde your cause, and plaide the simple Proctoure &c. And whereas you allege the glose for you, you make al that be able to reade the place, witnesses of your impudencie. VVhereas the Decree hath *Matrimonio Copulantur*, the Glose expoundeth it thus, *id est, Copulato vtuntur*. As for the other woordes of the Glose, many vpon occasion of this texte, haue saide, that they of the Easte Churche maie Marrye within Holy Orders, it is not the minde of the Glose, but as some saie &c. M. Hard. 199. b.

The Answeare. You saie, If I had rehearsed the whole Decree, I had marred my cause. Neuer a Whitte, M. Hardinge. A litle before I rehearsed it whole: and yet is the Cause

Cause nothinge empaired. The Glose, you saie, is against me. I graunte you: weigh better my wordes. I denie it not: What moueth you thus to crie out, Impudencie, and Corruption of Gloses? Laie our wordes togeather, M. Hardinge. I saie none otherwise, but as the Glose hathe saide. I haue neither added, nor diminished, nor altered, or chaunged one syllable. I beseche you, bothe not the Glose saie thus, Multi ex hac litera dixerunt, quòd Orientales possunt contrahere in Sacris Ordinibus? *Upon occasion of this Texte, many menne haue saide, that the Priestes of the Easte Churche maie Marrie, notwithstandinge they be within Holy Orders.* And do not I from syllable to syllable saie the same? Pe deale vncourteously, M. Hardinge. Pe are to blame, with suche vpbraidinges, and outcries, so muche to abuse your simple Reader. But, you saie, The Glose is directly against mee. So is the same Glose directly against the Auncient Councel of Ancyra before alleged. Wil you therefore saie, The Councel was Impudente? Compare them wel togeather. You shal finde them plaine contrarie, The Glose directly against the Councel. Howe iudge you, M. Hardinge, whether of these ye wil beleeue, either the Councel, or your Glose. Howe be it, lette the Councel géeue place: and lette Gloses preuaile. Yet not longe after, the same Glose saithe thus, Dicunt, quòd olim Sacerdotes poterant contrahere ante Siricium: *They saie, that in Olde times, before the time of Pope* Siricius, *it was lawful for Priestes to Marrie.* And Pope Siricius was wel neare foure hundred yéres after Christe. To conclude, I haue not any waie corrupted one syllable of your Glose. The wordes thereof be cleare: *Upon occasion of this Texte, Many menne haue saide, that the Priestes of the Easte Churche maie Marrie, notwithstandinge they be in Holy Orders.*

Conci. Ancyran. Ca. 10.

Dist. 84. Cum in Præterito.

And of the Priestes of the Weaste Churche Cardinal Caietane saithe, Papa potest dispensare cum Sacerdote Occidentalis Ecclesiæ, vt Vxorem ducat, nulla existente causa Publicæ Vtilitatis: *The Pope maie dispense with a Priest of the VVeaste Churche, to Marrie a VVife, although there be no manner cause of Profite growinge thereby to the Common Weale.*

Catharinus cõtra Error. Caietani. Errore. 103.

Athanasius saithe, Multi quoque ex Episcopis Matrimonia non inierunt: Monachi contrà Parentes liberorum facti sunt: Many of the Bishoppes (he saithe not al, but Many) haue not Married. (By which wordes he géeueth vs to vnderstande, that somme haue Married.) Contrariwise, Monkes haue becomme Fathers of Children.

Athanasius ad Draconti-um.

Cassiodorus writeth thus, In illo tempore ferunt Martyrio vitam finisse Eupsychium Cæsariensem (Episcopum) ducta nuper Vxore: dum adhuc quasi Sponsus esse videretur: *At that time they saie,* Eupsychius *(the Bishop) of* Cæsaria, *died in Martyrdome,* hauinge Married a VVife a litle before, *beeinge as yet in manner a newe married man.*

Cassiodo. Lib. 6. Ca. 14.

Addition. ☞ M. Hardinge. Phy vpon suche shameleſſe falsifiers. O lamentable state: suche false Prophetes: This shameleſſe lie &c. The truthe is good Reader, neither Cassiodorus wrote thus, nor Eupsychius was euer Bishop of Cæsaria, nor of any other place, nor so muche as a Priest, Deacon, or Subdeacon. The writer of the saide Storie, whiche wee haue of this Blessed Martyr Eupsychius, is Sozomenus the Greeke. VVho with the Ecclesiastical Storie of Socrates, and Theodoritus, was translated into Latine, by one Epiphanius Scolasticus, out of whiche three, Cassiodorus gathered the Abridgemente that wee haue vnder the name of the Tripartite Historie. The place truely repeted hathe these woordes: *In illo tempore ferunt vitam finisse Matrimonio Basilium Ecclesiæ Ancyranæ Presbyterum, & Eupsychium Cæsariensem Cappadociæ, ducta nuper vxore, cum adhuc quasi sponsus videretur.* Here is no mention made, that Eupsychius was the Bishop of Cæsaria. The storie, as we haue it in Latine of Epiphanius turninge, calleth him onely *Eupsychium Cæsariensem Cappadocia*, that is to saie, Eupsychius a man of Cæsaria that is in Cappadocia. For thus he reporteth of him in the Greeke, Ἐυψύχιον καὶ Καισαρείας Καππαδόκων τῶν ὑπατρικίων, *Eupsychium Cæsariensem Cappadocia Patricium:* asmuche to saie, Eupsychius of Cæsaria in Cappadocia, a Noble man, or, one of the Lordes of the Citie. Thus is Eupsychius, whom M. Iewel hath made a Bishop (as much as he is him self) founde to be a Laye gentleman, or Noble man of the Citie of Cæsaria. Because M. Iewel knew this much right wel, contrarie to the custome he vseth at other times, he dissembled the greeke Original, an thoughte he might better father this shameful lie vpon Cassiodorus, meaninge the Latine translation of Epiphanius, And to healpe the mater, he sticked not to put in this woorde, Episcopum) Bishop, of his owne,

M. Har. fo. 302. 6

Addition ☞

Hist. Tripar. Lib. 6. Ca. 14.

Sozomen. Li. 5. ca. 11

and

Marriage in Holy Orders.

and so calleth him boldely, Eupsychius the Bishop of Cæsaria. Lette these menne haue leaue, thus to corrupte, and falsifie the Fathers, and by them they shal be hable to proue, what they liste.

The Answeare. Fy, M. Hardinge: why shoulde you thus fare, and torment your selfe without greater cause? take your owne Demaunde: Let it be, that Eupsychius was no Bishop? Yet is it suche Impudencie, or Falsе Prophesie to thinke, that he was a Bishop? Why more, then, that one of your Felowes of Louaine saith, That Oza *the poore* Leuite *was a Kinge?* An Errour ye maie saie, it was. But Falsе Prophesie ye cannot cal it. Albeit, whether Eupsychius were a Bishop, or no, I wil not stryue. They were bothe Wise, and Learned, that so haue thought: And, if I maie be so bolde, M. Hardinge, to telle you the truthe, He hath neither Witte, nor Learninge, that maintaineth the contrarie. The wordes of Cassiodorus, or Epiphanius Scholasticus, seeme very plaine, Ferunt vitam Finisse Martyrio Basilium Ecclesiæ Ancyranæ Presbyterum, & Eupsychium Cæsariensem Cappadociæ, &c. How so euer it were, Eupsychius, for ought, that you knowe, M. Hardinge, might wel haue benne a Bishop: But Oza could in no wise be a Kinge. Dorman. *fol.* 24.

As for the reasons, ye bringe to the contrarie, to proue, that Eupsychius was no Bishop, they weighe but litle. Thus you saie, He is called, *Eupsychius Cæsariensis*, Eupsychius one of Cæsaria, you saie, He is called a Noble man, borne of an Auncient house, and of Noble Parentage: What then, M. Hardinge? Wil you therefore conclude, he was no Bishop? What Logique maie this be? We saie commonly, Augustinus Hipponensis: Eusebius Cæsariensis: Hosius Cardubensis: Ambrosius Mediolanensis. As for Nicephorus, whom you so vnaduisedly saie, I haue fowlie belied, as he in this place saithe, Eupsychius Cæsariensis, not naminge him Bishop, so in an other place he saithe, Protogenes Sardicensis, Marcellus Ancyranus, Gregorius Perinthius, Narcissus Irenopolitanus, Acacius, Cæsariensis, Gregorius Laodicensis &c. neuer callinge any of them by the name of Bishop: And yet, I trowe, ye wil not deme, but thei were Bishoppes, this maner of writinge notwithstandinge. Againe S. Ambrose was a Noble man, of Consulare Dignitie: yet was he the Bishop of Millaine. S. Gregorie was Senatorius, a Noble man of the Dignitie, or Degree of a Counseller: Yet was he the Bishop of Rome. And, not to seke farre abroade for examples, Osmunde was the Earle of Dorset: Roberte Neuil, Richarde Beuchampe, and Edmunde Audlei, were Noble men, of Noble Parentage, & Lordes Brethrene: yet were they al Bishoppes of Sarisburie. The Pope him selfe of late yeres, hathe benne called Lorde of Lordes, and Kinge of Kinges. Shal we therefore thinke, he was no Bishop? I weighe not the matter, M. Hardinge: I weighe onely your reasons. If this example of Eupsychius like you not, we haue others sufficiente, to proue, that good menne haue Married within Holy Orders. S. Hierome saithe, Hodiè quoque multi Sacerdotes habent Matrimonia: *Euen nowe adaies many Priestes liue in Wedlocke*. And to answeare you with like order, and fourme of wordes, as Epiphanius saithe, Eupsychius Cæsariensis Cappadociæ, ducta nuper vxore, dum adhuc quasi sponsus videretur, &c. Euen so saithe Vincentius of Phileas a Bishop in Aegypte, Phileas de Ciuitate Thmui, Nobili genere, & non paruis opibus, suscepto Episcopatu, vxorem habuit, & liberos: Phileas *of the Cittie of* Thmuis, *a Noble man, and of greate richesse, beeinge Consecrate Bishop, had wife, and children*. He was a Noble man, and had wife, and children, and yet, that notwithstandinge, was a Bishop. Cæsarien*sis*. *Nicephor. Li.* 9. *Cap.* 12. *Patritius*. *Hieronym. aduer. Iouinianum, li.* 1 *Vincent. li.* 13. *Ca.* 25.

But, you wil saie, It appeareth not hitherto by any thinge, that is yet alleged, that Eupsychius was a Bishop. What of that, M. Hardinge? You knowe, there haue benne many Bishoppes in the worlde, of whome it woulde be harde for you, to make certaine proufe that they were Bishoppes. Yet notwithstandinge, for your pleasure, and for somme satisfaction of your frendes, that you maie the better vnderstande your errour, and knowe, that this Eupsychius was a Bishop in deede, I praie you, reade the first Oration of Athanasius againste the Arians. There shal you finde theise wordes emonge others: Scripta Sylueſtri, & Protogenis Episcoporum Daciæ: & Leontij, & Eupsychij Episcoporum Cappadociæ. *The Writinges of* Leontius, *and* Eupsychius *Bishoppes of* Cappadocia. Marke wel theise wordes, M. Hardinge: Eupsychius *Athanas. contra Arianos, Orat.* 1

Eupsychius was a Bishop

chius *a Bishop of* Cappadocia. Athanasius saithe, Eupsychius *was a Bishop*, and sheweth the Countrie of his See. You saie, Eupsychius was a Noble man, of anciente Parentage, and therefore you telle vs, he was no Bishop. Athanasius knewe Eupsychius, or might haue knowen him: for they lined bothe in one age. And Athanasius wrote an Epistle specially vnto him, as it maie appeare in the Seconde Councel of Nice: In whiche Councel he is called, Eupsychius Presbyter Cæsariæ: Eupsychius *a Priest of* Cæsaria, as at that time, as yet, beinge no Bishop, but onely a Priest. But you, M. Hardinge, neither knewe him ever, nor coulde euer haue knowen him. And yet wil you looke, to haue more credite herein, then that Godly and Learned Father Athanasius, that wrote vnto him, and, either knewe him familiarely, or might haue knowen him? Athanasius spake the truethe, you goe onely by gheasse: Athanasius spake in simplicitie: you speake of affection, as a partie. Nowe maie your indifferente Reader iudge, whether of bothe he maie better beleeue, either you, or the Ancient Father Athanasius. You saie, Eupsychius was no Bishop: Athanasius saithe, Eupsychius was a Priest. Againe he saithe, Eupsychius *was a* Bishop. And, leaste your Reader should thinke there lieth some errour in the name, and, that Athanasius meante one Eupsychius, and you an other, he sheweth you also of the Place of his Bishoprike, and saithe he was Bishop of Cappadocia. Nowe the same Eupsychius, of whome we speake, was the Bishop of Cæsaria, and Cæsaria was the chiefe Citie of Cappadocia. Thus haue wee founde (saie you) that Eupsychius was a Laie gentleman, or a Noble man of Cæsaria: but neither Priest, nor Bishop.

Eupsychius a Priest. Con. Nicen. 2. Actio. 6. Pag. 81 Colonie.

But in deede we haue founde, that Eupsychius was bothe a Noble man, a Martyr, and a Priest, and a Bishop to. The Name, the Time, the Countrie, the See, and the Cittie do al agree. And this same Eupsychius, beinge a Bishop, Married a Wife, and at the time of his Martyrdome, was a newe Married man. As good a Bishop (saie you) as M. Iewel. This is your pleasure, M. Hardinge: woulde God M. Iewel were as good, as he. Take heede for your credites sake: your frendes wil espie you. There wanteth Consideration, and Sobrietie in your doinges. Ye auouche ouer boldely, before you knowe. You saie, Fy vpon suche shameleese falsifiers: O lamentable state: Suche False Prophetes: Suche shameleese Lies. These be your owne wordes: Ye haue pleasure in them. Beware, leaste your frendes turne them ouer vpon your selfe. Act. 1

Likewise M. Hardinge might haue founde it noted in his owne Glose, Dicunt, quòd olim Sacerdotes poterant contrahere, ante Siricium: *They saie, that in Olde time, before Pope* Siricius (which was aboute foure hundred yeres after Christe) it was lawful for Priestes to Marrie.

Dist. 84. Cum in Præterito. in Gloss.

But we shal haue occasion to speake hereof more hereafter. In the meane season, good Christian Reader, by these fewe, as by a taste, thou maiste easily iudge, howe true it is, that M. Hardinge telleth thee, that Marriage in them, that had receiued Holy Orders, was neuer thought lawful in the Catholique Churche.

The Apologie, Cap. 8. Diuision. 2.

And, as Sozomenus saithe of Spiridon, and, as Nazianzene saithe of his owne Father, wee saie, that a good, and diligent Bishop doothe serue in the Ministerie neuer the woorse, for that he is Married, but rather the better, and with more hableneese to doo good.

M. Hardinge.

VVere it not, that the weight of these maters required an vpright, and plaine dealinge, for Ciuilities sake, I coulde be contente sometimes to spare you, and where ye make manifeste lies, to vse a softer woorde, and terme them fittens. But noweif I tel you that you vse your accustomed Figure Pseudologia, whiche is Lyinge in plaine Englishe, I truste you wil beare with my plainenes: amende your owne faulte, and consider the Power of truthe, that causeth me to be so bolde with you. This I (a) am suer of, that neither Sozomenus, nor Gregorie Nazianzene, nor Eusebius Li. 10. Cap. 5. as you haue caused your bookes, bothe Latine and Englishe, to be noted in the Margent, where yee mistake Eusebius for Rufinus: (b) Nor Nazianzene either in Monodia, as you note also in the Margent, nor in the funeral Oration that he made of his Father, hathe any suche saieinge, as ye report of them. For howe could they saie, that a Bishop serueth in his ministerie neuer the worse, but rather the better, and with more hableneese to doo good, for that he is Married, the Scripture beinge so plaine

(a) M. Hardinge is assured before he knowe.
(b) An Vnadui-sed Vntruthe. Reade the Answeare.

Sozomen. Gregorie Nazianzene Eusebius, belied by

the Authour of the Apologie.

plaine to the contrarie? VVhat wene ye they were either ſo ignorante, or ſo forgetful, or ſo much inclined to promote your Carnal Doctrine of prieſtes Mariges, as to ſaie ſo, notwithſtanding that S. Paule writeth to the Corinthians? Saithe he not of them that be Maried, that ſutche ſhal haue tribulation of the fleſh? Saith he not, He that is without a VVife, careth for the thinges of our Lord howe he maie pleaſe God? Of him that hathe a VVife, ſaith he not, that he careth for the thinges that be the worldes, howe he maie pleaſe his wife, and is diuided? Finally ſaithe he not, I tel you this thinge for your profite, not to tangle you in a ſnare, but for that, whiche is honeſt, and comely vnto you, and that which maie geue you readines to praie to God without lette? VVherefore recante for ſhame that fowle erroure, that a Biſhop ſerueth the better in his miniſterie, and is the more hable to doo good, for that he is Married.

S. Paule writeth thus, not of Prieſtes, and Biſhops, but of al other Chriſtian menne.

Suche men, ſuche Doctrine, fleaſhly men, fleaſhly Doctrine.

M. Hardinges modeſtie.

Nowe therefore ſee you not, howe greate is your impudencie, in that you lie your ſelfe, and Father ſutche a fowle lie vpon Sozomenus, and that light of the worlde in his time Gregorie Nazianzene? The woordes of Sozomenus be theſe: ἐγένετο γὰρ οὗτος ἄγροικος, γαμετὴν καὶ παῖδας ἔχων: ἀλλ' ὅ παρὰ τοῦτο τὰ θεῖα χείρων, that is to ſaie, Spiridon was a Husbandman,

Li. 1. c. 11.

hauinge wife and children, and yet for al that, he was neuer the woorſe about Goddes ſeruice. Of this place we graunt, ye maie ſaie with Sozomenus, that Spiridon ſerued God neuer the woorſe, for that he was Married. But howe, and whereof gather yee, that he ſerued God the better, and was more able to doo good, becauſe of his Marriage? Spiridion obteined that Priuilege thoroughe (c) eſpecial grace by his exceedinge vertue, whiche is graunted to fewe. And the Priuileges of a fewe, make not a Lawe for al in general, ye knowe, as Nazianzene ſaithe.

Neuer the woorſe.

(c) Vntruth. For Chryſoſtome maketh the caſe General.

The place of Sozome alleged by the Defender maketh vtterly againſt the Nazianzenes woordes mourned vpon the Defender.

Furthermore, if the woordes of Sozomenus, that ye builde your carnal Doctrine vpon, be wel examined, ye ſhal finde, that he maketh more againſte you, then with you. For ſignificinge that he had VVife and Children, he addeth, ἀλλ' ὅ παρὰ τοῦτο τὰ θεῖα χείρων: Yet for al that he was neuer the woorſe about Goddes ſeruice, this reuocation or exception negatiue (yet for al that, &c.) implieth a confeſſion affirmatiue to the contrarie.

Neither maketh the place of Gregorie Nazianzene any whit for you more, then this of Sozomenus doth, whoſe woordes be theſe after the tranſlation of Raphael Volateranus varyinge mutch from the Creeke: (d) *Hic Baſilij Pater Baſilius item appellatus, etſi matrimonio ſe vinxit, ita tamen in eo vixit, vt nihil propterea ad Perfectam Virtutem, ac Philoſophiam conſequendam impediretur.* Baſiles Father, who was named alſo Baſile, althoughe he put him ſelfe in bondes of Matrimonie, yet he liued ſo herein, as he was letted no whit from the atteininge of perfite Vertue, and Holy knowledge. VVere not Marriage a lette and hinderaunce to perfection requiſite in a Biſhop, this Learned man coulde not rightly haue ſaide, *Ita tamen in eo vixit, &c.* Yet for al that he liued ſo, &c.

(d) An Erroure. M. Hardinge taketh one place for an other. Nothinge hindereth.

Right ſo it is eaſy to put him from the holde he taketh of Chryſoſtome, by Chryſoſtome him ſelf. For leaſte any man ſhoulde thinke, whereas S. Paule ſaith, a Biſhop ought to be the Husbande of one

1. Timoth. 1.

VVife, that the ſame order continueth ſtil in the Churche, thereto he ſaithe in his ſeconde Homilie, *De Pœnitentia Iob: Non ea ratione, quòd nunc id in Eccleſia obſeruetur. Oportet enim omni prorſus Caſtitate Sacerdotem ornatum eſſe.* S. Paule (ſaithe he) required this, not in conſideration, that the ſame be nowe obſerued in the Churche. For it behooueth a Biſhop to be garniſhed with al manner a Chaſtitie.

Reade the Anſweare.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Here commeth M. Hardinge in a lofte, with Io Triumphe, as hauinge beaten downe al the worlde vnder his feete: And, as beinge already in ſure poſſeſſion of the Victorie, he crieth out, Impudencies, Lewde Lies, fowle Faultes, and preatie Fittons: And ful terribly chargeth vs, like a Conqueroure, to render our ſelues, and to recant for ſhame. This newe courage is ſuddainely blowen vpon him, for that he thinketh, wee haue intruded vpon his office, and, as he ſaithe, haue corrupted and falſified the Holy Fathers. But it were a worthie mater to knowe, wherein. Forſothe wee ſaie, by the reporte of Sozomenus, and Gregorius Nazianzenus, that Spiridon, and Gregorie, Father vnto Nazianzene, beinge bothe Married Biſhoppes, notwithſtandinge theire Marriage, were neuer the woorſe hable to doo theire Eccleſiaſtical Offices, but rather the better.

Here M. Hardinge of him ſelfe, and freely confeſſeth, theſe Holy Fathers were neuer the woorſe hable to doo theire offices. For ſo mutche the woordes of Sozomenus doo reporte: ἀλλ' τὰ θεῖα χείρων. But, that they were the better hable to doo their offices, becauſe of their Vertues, that he denieth vtterly: and herein, he ſaithe, wee are corrupters, and Falſifiers of the Fathers. And thus the whole difference, that is betweene M. Hardinge, and vs, touchinge this mater, ſtandeth onely in theſe two poore woordes, Rather the better, and Neuer the woorſe.

Nowe, gentle Reader, that thou maiſte be the better hable to iudge bitwéne vs, I beſeeche thée indifferently to weighe theſe wordes.

Nazian. in Epitaphio Patru. Ἀλλὰ καὶ ἀρχηγὸς γίνεται, ἔργῳ τε καὶ λόγῳ πρὸς τὰ κράτιστα, ἡ μὲν ἑαυτῆς ἄγνωστα τῆς εὐσεβείας ἐκ ἀικυουμένη παρέχειν ἑαυτὴν καὶ ὁδηγὸν καὶ διδάσκαλον.

Gregorie Nazianzene herevpō, that is, of the healpe, that his Father, beinge the Biſhop of Nazianzum, had by his wife, writeth thus: Illa, quæ data eſt Adamo, &c. Eua, *that was geeuen to* Adam *for a Healper, for as muche, as it was not good for Man to be alone, in ſteede of a Healper, became his Enimie*. It foloweth, Meo autem Patri Mater mea data illi à Deo, non tantùm Adiutrix facta eſt, id enim minùs eſſet mirum, ſed etiam Dux, & Princeps, Verbo, Factoq; inducens illum ad res optimas. Et alijs quidem in rebus quamuis optimum eſſet, ſubditam eſſe Viro, propter iura Coniugij, tamen in Pietate non verebatur, Seipſam illi Magiſtram exhibere: *My Mother beinge geuen to my Father of God, became*, not onely his Healper, *for that had ben no greate wonder, but alſo was* his Leader, and Captaine, bothe by VVoorde, and by Deede traininge him vnto the beſte. *And, albeit in other thinges it were beſte for her to be ſubiecte vnto her huſbande for the Righte of Marriage*, yet in Religion, and Godlineſſe, ſhee doubteth not to becomme his Maiſtreſſe.

διδάσκαλος.

Theſe wordes, M. Hardinge, be plaine, and cleare, and without fitton. Gregorie Nazianzene ſaithe, that his owne Mother was vnto his Father the Biſhop of Nazianzum, a Healper, and a Directour, bothe by VVoorde, and Deede, to leade him to the beſte: and, that in al other thinges beinge his Inferioure, yet in Religion, and Godlineſſe ſhee was his Maiſtreſſe. And yet muſt al theſe wordes, ſo open, ſo plaine, ſo cleare, be drowned with your ſimple diſtinction, of Rather the better, and neuer the woorſe? Maie wée not nowe allowe you with fauoure, to take al theſe, that ye cal Fittons, Lies, Corruptions, and Falſifieinges, home againe vnto your ſelfe?

If you neuer readde theſe thinges before, it is no greate marueile. You muſte remember, al Trueth maie not be meaſured by your Readinge.

Addition. ☞ M. Hardinge. Howe make you not all menne witneſſes of your falſehode, and impudencie? The ſloare of your Notebookes, whiche Illyricus, Freere Bale, and certaine others of that cutte haue made to your hande. You alleage out of Gregorie Nazianzene, that his Moother was to his Father an Healper, a Guide, a Leader, a Captaine, by woorde, and by deede traininge him to the beſte: Yea further, that in Religion, and Godlineſſe, ſhee was not aſhamed to becomme his Maiſtreſſe. Al this is true, M. Iewel, I confeſſe. And yet it proueth not your pourpoſe at al. Howe ſo? Marke Reader, and conſider of it wel, howe M. Iewel beguileth thee. Here lieth the deceite, in that he maketh S. Gregorie Nazianzenes Father, Biſhop of Nazianzum, when he had ſuche helpe of his Mother &c. It is a weake flocke, they ſaie, of ſheepe, where a yewe beareth the belle &c. Thus then is it. Gregorie the elder, S. Gregorie Nazianzenes Father, was a married man longe before he was a Biſhop: and before he was married to his wife, and alſo longe after, he was an Infidel. Shee S. Gregories Mother contrariwiſe was a Chriſtian woman, borne of Chriſtian Parentes &c. Hereby it is made cleare to al menne, how his Father was holpen by his wife, not as beinge a Biſhop, as M. Iewel dothe vntruely ſaie, but as yet beinge an Infidel.

M. Har fo. 313. a. Fol. 313. b. Addition ☞ Fol. 305. a.

The Anſweare. It is true in déede. Nazianzene vttereth theſe thinges, as donne by his Mother, before his Father was conuerted. Therefore, you ſaie, They perteine nothinge to the time, that folowed afterwarde, when his Father was a Biſhop. And why ſo, M. Hardinge? Is this your beſte Logique of Louaine? Or, wil you teache vs to reaſon thus? Gregorie Nazianzenes wife was a helper vnto him before his Conuerſion: Ergo, Afterwarde ſhe did not, or coulde not helpe him? But this is one of your greateſt graces: What ſo euer you imagine, maie ſerue you to any aduantage, ye take it, and holde it, as your owne, either as ſufficiently proued, becauſe you ſpeake it, or els, as confeſſed by youre aduerſarie. Then you ſpreade out youre Banner, and blowe vp your triumphe, and make your ſelfe merie. Nazianzene declaringe the time of his Fathers infidelitie before his Conuerſion, ſaithe, *That his Wife, beeinge a Chriſtian woman, Watched, Faſted, Sange Pſalmes, and praied for her Huſbande, and was careful for him*. Will you therefore ſaie, that, after he was once conuerted, ſhe gaue al ouer, and Watched, and Faſted, and Sange Pſalmes, and praide nomore? Verily, as ſhe praied for her Huſbande, ſo was ſhe a helper to her Huſbande, not onely while he was an Infidel, but alſo al the time of his life. And why not? What wanted there in her? Gód wil, or Vnderſtandinge? As touchinge gód wil, Nazianzene compareth her with Sara, the Moother of al faithful wemen: and ſaithe, *That in godlineſſe*

1. Petri. 3.

lineſſe ſhee paſſed al others. Touchinge her chil, and vnderſtandinge, he ſaithe, *As the Sunne beames are faire, and cleare in the morninge, and growe brighter, and warmer towarde noone, euen ſo my Fathers* wife ſhewinge foorthe the pleaſaunte firſte fruites of godlineſſe at the beginninge, *afterwarde ſhined out with greater Lighte.* Thus wax ſhe, her Lighte, and Habilitie grewe more and more, and encreaſed dailie. And therefore Nazianzene ſaithe vnto her in the ende of the ſame Oration, *You take it not wel, Mother, thus to be counſelled at my handes: I blame you not. For you your ſelfe haue geuen counſel vnto many, whome longe time hath leadde to ſeeke your* wiſedome. So ſaithe S. Paule, *I beſeeche thee faithful Yokefellowe* (by whiche wordes Ignatius, Clemens Alexandrinus, and Euſebius thinke, he meant his Wife) *healpe thoſe weemen, that haue Laboured with mee in the Goſpel.* Thus did Gregorie Nazianzenes Wife: She was godly her ſelfe, and holpe others, bothe menne, and wemen with her godly Counſel. She conuerted her huſbande from infidelitie: ſhe conuerted others: She brought vp her children in the feare of God: *Her huſbande gaue her the charge in deliueringe his monie vnto the poore.* And yet wil you tel vs, that ſhee was no healper to her husbande? or, that her husbande, by her meanes, was not the better hable to doo his office? It ſhameth me, M. Hardinge, to ſe theſe folies. Whereas Nazianzene ſaithe, *Shee was a healper to his Father*, he meaneth not onely the time of his Infidelitie, but generally the whole courſe of al his life. Fiue and fourtie yeres he liued a Biſhop: and al that while ſhe was his healper.

Ignatius, ad Philadelphen. Clemens Stromatum. Li. 7. Euſeb. Li. 3. ca. 30 Totas matri habenas dimiſit.

A weake flocke (you ſaie) where a yewe beareth the Belle. This Prouerbe might better becomme a Shepe of Cotteſholde with his Belle. For the healpe, that we ſpeake of, importeth no ſuche ſouerainetie, nor bearinge of Belles. God him ſelfe ſaithe, *Lette vs make* Adam *a Healper meete for him.* This Healper was his Wife Eua. Yet did not Eua beare the Belle. S. Paule ſaithe, *Salute you* Priſcilla, *and* Aquila *her Huſbande, that are my Healpers in* Chriſte Ieſu. And, as I haue alleged before, he ſaithe to his owne Wife, *Healpe thoſe weemen, that haue laboured with mee in the Goſpel, together with* Clemens, *and others my Healpers.* Yet, I trowe, ye wil not ſaie, that S. Paule ſhal comme behinde: or, that Clemens, or Aquila, or Priſcilla, or his owne Wife, or any other woman ſhal beare the Belle. God ſaide vnto Abraham, *Heare the voice of* Sara *thy Wife, what ſo euer ſhee ſhal ſaie to thee.* She ſhal geue the good Counſel: She ſhal healpe the. Yet the ſouerainetie was in Abraham, and not in Sara: neither was it Sara, but Abraham, that bare the Belle.

Gene. 21.

Thus to cauil at Goddes Inſtitution, M. Hardinge, was the manner of the Olde condemned Heretiques, Marcion, Valentinus, Tatius, and ſuche others: in whoes ſteppes you cannot treade without greate danger.

To be ſhorte, the reſolution hereof is this, *Better it is to Marrie, then to ſwelter inwardely with filthy affections.* S. Paule ſaithe, *I* woulde wiſhe *al menne to be, as I am mee ſelfe. But euery manne hathe his gifte:* One of Chaſtitie, and an other of Marriage. Though Chaſtitie be a ſingulare gifte of God, yet is it not good for him, that hathe not the gifte of Chaſtitie. S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Aliquando hoc expedit, aliquando illud. Nam illis, qui ſe non continent, vtiq; expedit nubere: *Sommetime Chaſtitie is good, ſommetime Marriage. But to them, that conteine not,* (that is to ſaie, that haue not the gifte of Chaſtitie) *it is better to Marrie.* Howe be it, in ſuche, as haue vowed chaſte Life, he ſaithe, *It is neither lawful to Marrie, nor expedient.* But alas, what auaileth a vowe of chaſte Life, without Chaſtitie.

1. Corinth. 7.

Ad Pollentium, Li. 1. Cap. 15.

In deede, Marriage, as alſo other like outwarde thinges, of it ſelfe is neither good, nor ill: but as it is vſed. S. Paule ſaithe, *If the Virgine Marrie, ſhee ſinneth not. He that Marrieth out his Virgine ſinneth not.* Therefore Gregorie Nazianzene ſaithe, Neutrum horum, nec Matrimonium, nec Cœlebs vita, prorſus aut Deo nos, Mundóue conciliat aut à Deo, aut à Mundo alienat: vt alterum natura ſua omninò fugiendum ſit, alterum abſolutè laudandum. Animus eſt, qui & Virginitati, & Nuptijs rectè imperat: *Neither of theiſe twoo, nor Matrimonie, nor Single Life, doothe either ioine vs to God, or to the Worlde: or withdrawe vs from God, or from the Worlde: that the one ought to be refuſed, and the other abſolutely, and of it ſelfe, oughte to be praiſed.* It is the Minde, that ruleth bothe Marriage, and Virginitie.

1 Cor. 7. Nazianzen. in Epitaphio Gorgoniæ. Μιᾶ δ' ἑτέρων τούτων ἢ θεῷ πάντως, ἢ κόσμῳ συνάπτει, καὶ διίστησι πόλῳ.

Marriage Healpeth.

Ουδὲς ἐστιν ὁ καὶ γάμων καὶ παρθενίας καλλὰς ἐπῄσας τῶν.

Ambrosius, De Virgini. Lib. 3.

I graunte, there be moe occasions of let, and hinderaunce in Patrimonie, then in Virginitie, and specially in times of Persecution. The natural affection of Wife, and Children often mollifieth, and melteth the harte, and causeth a man to looke backwarde.

S. Ambrose saithe, Bona Vincula nuptiarum: Sed tamen Vincula: Etsi vincula tamen Vincula Charitatis: Bonum Coniugium: Sed tamen a Iugo tractum: *Good are the Bandes of Matrimonie: yet are they Bandes. And although they be Bandes, yet are they* Bandes of Charitie. Coniugium (VVedlocke) *is good, yet it taketh his name of the* Yoke.

This is that tribulation of the Flesshe, that S. Paule speaketh of.

And, albeit these Cases withdrawe, & oppresse the Minde, as I haue saide, and oftentimes be greate letters to godly pourposes: yet, as it wil appeareth by these examples of Gregorie Nazianzene, & Spiridion, in a Godly man they hinder nothinge. Neither was this any suche Singulare Priuiledge, as M. Hardinge imagineth, graunted onely to these two Bishoppes, Gregorie, and Spiridion, and to none other.

Chrysostom. in 1. Epist. ad Tim. Homil. 10.

S. Chrysostome saithe, not onely generally of al menne, but also specially of Priestes, and Bishoppes, Quamuis Nuptiæ plurimum difficultatis in se habeant, ita tamen assumi possunt, vt perfectiori Vitæ impedimento non sint: *Notwithstandinge Marriage haue muche trouble in it selfe, yet maie it so be taken* (and vsed,) *that it shal be no hinderaunce to perfite life.* Againe he saithe, Ne excuses te propter Nuptias. Dominus tuus nuptijs interfuit, & Nuptias cohonestauit. Et tu Nuptias arguis? Et dicis, Nuptias esse impedimentum ad Pietatem? Nullum enim ad Pietatem est obstaculum. Vis cognoscere, quòd nihil obsit, habere Vxorem, & Liberos? Moses nonne Vxorem habuit, & Liberos? Vide & Petrum, Columnam Ecclesiæ, quòd & ipse Vxorem habuit. Ne accuses Nuptias: *Excuse not thy selfe by thy Marriage. Thy Lorde was at the Marriage Feaste, and honoured Marriage with his Presence.* And yet dooste thou blame Marriage? And saiste thou, that Marriage is an hinderance vnto Godlinesse? I telle thee, Marriage is no manner hinderance vnto Godlinesse? *Wilte thou knowe, that* it hindereth not to haue VVife and Children? *Had not* Moses *Wife, and Children? Beholde* Peter, *a Piller of the Churche: He had a Wife. Therefore* finde no faulte with Marriage.

Chrys. in Esaiã In illa verba, Vidi Dominum. Tom. 1 Homil. 4.

Againe, writinge vpon these wordes of the Prophete Esaie, Vidi Dominum, &c. He saithe thus, Quis ista loquitur? Esaias ille spectator Cœlestium Seraphim, qui cum Coniugio commercium habuit: nec tamen extinxit Gratiam: *Who speaketh these Woordes? Esaias, the Beholder of the Celestial Seraphims: who, notwithstandinge* he had companie with his VVife, yet he quenched not the Grace of God. Againe, Filium habebat, & Vxorem: vt intelligas, non esse malas Nuptias: sed malam esse Scortationem: Esaie *had a Sonne, and a Wife: that thou maiste vnderstande,* that Marriage is not il, *but that Fornication is il.* And againe, Num obstabat Matrimonium? Adiutrix tibi data est Vxor, non Insidiatrix: *What? Did Marriage hinder thee? No.* Thy VVife is geeuen to thee to be thy healper, *and not to deceiue thee.*

August. in quæstionibus Noui, & Veter. Testamen. Quæ. 127.

Likewise saithe S. Augustine, Sanctissimus Samuel filios genuit: non tamen Iustitiæ suæ merita minuit: Zacharias Sacerdos, Vir Iustus, in senectute sua genuit filium. Qua ergo ratione accusatur, quòd minimè obesse probatur? *Moste Holy* Samuel *begate Children: and yet nothinge abated the Merites of his righteousnesse.* Zacharias *the Priuste in his Olde age begate a Childe. Wherefore then is that thinge accused, that is proued* to doo no manner hurte?

Nicephor. Li. 9. Cap. 19.

Nicephorus writinge of Gregorie S. Basiles Brother, the Bishop of Nyssa, saithe thus, Quamuis haberet Coniugem, alijs tamen in rebus non cessit Fratri: *Although he had a Wife, yet in other thinges he was* Nothinge Inferioure (to S. Basile) his Brother.

August. de Bono Coniugali, ca. 11.

S. Augustine saithe, as he is alleged before, Sancta sunt etiam Corpora Coniugatorum, Fidem sibi & Domino seruantium: *Where Married people keepe their Faithe bothe to them selues, and to God,* theire Bodies be Holy.

Nazianzen. in Laud. Cæsarii.

Likewise Nazianzene, Etiam illa, quæ nupsit, & de ijs, quæ sunt Mariti, & de ijs, quæ sunt Domini, Solicita est, vt sit Sancta, & Corpore, & Spiritu: *Euen shee that is Married, is careful bothe for the thinges, that perteine to her Husbande,* and also for the thinges

Marriage Healpeth.

thinges that perteine to God, that shee maie be Holy bothe in Body, and Sprite.

Like wise S. Ambrose, Videmus Virgines de Sæculo cogitare: Et Matrimonio iunctos Dominicis studere Operibus: *Wee see bothe Virgins careful for the Worlde*: and Married menne Careful for the woorkes of the Lorde. *Ambros. in 1. Cor. 7.*

There be troubles in Marriage: **It cannot be denied. But so be there also troubles in Single Life: Specially to them, that feare the Judgementes of God, and haue not the gifte of Chastitie.**

But, Chrysostome saithe, Matrimonium non solùm nihil nobis obstat ad Philosophandum Deo, si voluerimus esse sobrij, sed & magnam adfert Consolationem: Comprimit enim insanum Naturæ impetum: nec turbari sinit, quasi Mare: Sed efficit, vt scapha fœliciter in portum appellat. Et ideo Deus Consolationem hanc tribuit humano generi: *Marriage not onely* hindereth nothinge *towardes the knowledge, and Seruice of God, If wee wil be sober*, but also bringeth vs greate Comforte. *For it oppresseth the raginge furie of Nature, and suffereth vs not to be dashte, and toste, as the waues of the Sea: but causeth that our shippe maie luckily arriue into the Hauen. And for that cause hath God geeuen* this Comforte *vnto mankinde*. *Chrysost. in Genes. Hom. 21.*

Therefore Gregorie Nazianzene **saithe**, Nuptiæ sunt laudabiles propter eam, quæ in Nuptijs est, animi tranquillitatem: *Marriage is worthie of Praise, for the* quietnesse, and contentation of minde, *that is in Marriage*. *Nazianzen. In Funere Gorgoniæ.*

To be shorte, Clemens Alexandrinus **saithe**, Habet vt Castitas, ita etiam Matrimonium, propria munera, & Ministeria, quæ ad Dominum pertinent: *As wel Matrimonie, as also Chastitie, hath either of them theire peculiare offices* perteininge vnto God. διὰ τῆς ἐν γάμῳ ἐγκρατείας. *Clemens Stromat. Lib. 3.*

And Chrysostome **saithe**, Ne quis prætexat Vxorem, vel Liberos, &c. Hæc excusatio, hic prætextus, Diaboli sunt insidiæ: *Let noman make his excuse by his Wife, or Children, &c.* This Excuse, and this pretense is the crafte, and deceitfulnesse of the Diuel. **Thus M. Hardinge, to conclude with** Chrysostomes **woordes, the Grounde, and Fundation of your Doctrine in this behalfe,** is the crafte, and deceitfulnesse of the Diuel.

These thinges considered, I doubte not, but of your courtesie, ye wil take backe your Fittons vnto your selfe. The Conclusion and summe of your whole talke is this: Spiridion serued God neuer the woorse, notwithstandinge he had a wife: And Marriage is no let, or hinderance to perfite Godlinesse.

The Apologie, Cap. 8. Diuision. 3.

Further wee saie, that the same Lawe, whiche by constrainte taketh awaie this libertie from menne, and compelleth them againste theire willes, to liue Single, is the Doctrine of Diuelles, as Paule saithe: and, **that euer sithence the time of this Lawe, a woonderful vncleanenesse of life, and manners in Goddes Ministers, and sundrie horrible enormities haue folowed, as the Bishop of Augusta,** as Faber, **as** Abbas Panormitanus, **as** Latomus, **as the** Tripartite VVoorke, **whiche is annexed to the Seconde Tome of the Councels, and other champions of the Popes bande, yea and as the mater it self, and al Histories do confesse.**

For it was rightly saide by Pius **the Seconde. Bishop of** Rome, **that he savve many causes, vvhy** VViues **shoulde be taken avvaie from Priestes: but that he savve many moe, and more vveighty causes, vvhy they ought to be restoared to them againe.**

M. Hardinge.

1. Cor. 7. Voluntarie Vowe imbarreth libertie of the cõtrarie.

There is (a) no Lawe in the Churche, that by constrainte taketh awaie from men libertie to Marrie. For S. Paules woordes be plaine, If thou take a wife, thou sinnest not. And likewise, If a Virgine Marrie, shee sinneth not. But if any Persons haue of theire owne wil, and deuotion Vowed to God chastitie, the same haue imbarred them selues of this general libertie, and by theire Voluntarie Promise, haue bounde them selues neuer to Marrie. And in sutche, not onely Marriage it selfe, but also a wil to Marrie is damnable, as S. Paule saithe of VVidowes, whiche haue Vowed to liue chaste, (a) Manifeste Vntruth. For al Priestes are restreined from Marriage. And Priestes be mẽ.

that they haue theire damnation (not for that they Marie , but) for that they wil Marie . If the Gospellers allege againſte this Doctrine the woordes of S. Paule , If a Virgine Marie , ſhee ſinneth not: VVee anſweare with Chryſoſtome, and other Fathers, that a Virgine by a Vowe of Chaſtitie dedicated to God, if ſhee Marrie, doubtleſſe ſhe ſinneth mutche, for that beſide Chriſte ſhee hathe ſurmarried an Aduouterer . If they obiecte, It is better to Marrie then to burne : Let S. Ambroſe anſweare: who ſaithe, that this ſaieinge perteineth to her, that hathe not promiſed, to her that is not yet vailed. And by reſtraininge them from Marriage, the Churche vſeth no tyrannie: nor if it teache, that ſutche ought to forebeare Marriage , is that to be accoumpted the Doctrine of Diuelles , but of the Holy Ghoſte , whereby men are keapte from wilful damnation . To forebidde Marriage wholy , Vniuerſally, and altogether , that is the Doctrine of Diuels . But to iudge Marriage for ſomme ſtate , and Order, of leſſe conuenience , then the Single Life, or after Vowe of chaſtitie made , to require perpetual continencie , this is not the Doctrine of Diuels . For S. Paule him ſelfe did bothe . If theſe Defenders wil not admitte this anſweare , and beinge lothe to forſake theire fleaſhly pleaſure, pretende to be moued with the Auctoritie of S. Paule, who calleth the forebiddinge of Marriage the Doctrine of Diuels : I ſende them to S. Auguſtine for an anſweare in his thirteenth Booke, and ſixthe Chapter againſt Fauſtus the Maniche. VVhere for a ſufficient ſolution of their obiection, they ſhal finde theſe plaine woordes: *Ille prohibet, qui hoc malum eſſe dicit: non qui huic bono aliud melius anteponit.* That is to ſaie, He forebiddeth (Marriage) whiche ſaithe it is euil: not he, whiche preferreth an other better thinge before this good thinge .

1. Cor. 7.

Ad Virgin. Lapſam ca. 5.

The Doctrine of Diuels.

(b) Vntruthe. For theſe be the woordes of the Apoſtles canõs: *Epiſcopus , aut Preſbyter , aut Diaconus: vxorẽ ſuam prætextu Religionis ne Abijciat. Aut ſi abiecerit, à Cõmunione ſegregetur. Canone. 5.*

Nowe, that I maie ſhewe in what time , and by what perſons this Lawe of Single Life was ordeined, for breuities ſake I wil content my ſelfe with witnes of One onely Councel . VVhiche is the Seconde Councel of Carthage , holden in the time of Valentinian and Theodoſius the Emperours. VVhere wee finde, that this order was taken (b) by the Apoſtles them ſelues, and that the Antiquitie obſerued, and keapte the ſame. The woordes of the Councel be theſe, Canone. 2.

Aurelius Epiſcopus dixit, &c. Aurelius the Biſhop ſaide : VVherea s in the Councel before this it was treated of the rule of continencie and chaſtitie , theſe three Degrees through their Conſecrations be annexed to chaſtitie by a certaine decree written, to witte, Biſhops, Prieſtes, and Deacons. VVhom it is thought good, as it becommeth the Holy Prelates, and Prieſtes of God, and likewiſe Leuites, or ſutche as attende vpon Holy Sacramentes, to be continent and chaſte in euery condition , to the intent they maie ſimply obteine , that they praie to God for , that wee keepe and obſerue that, whiche (c) the Apoſtles haue taught, and the antiquitie hathe keapte . Lo Sir Defender.

(c) Vntruthe. Reade the Anſweare . M. Hardinge fouly miſtaketh the Councel.

VVhat if the Biſhop of Auguſta finde faulte with Prieſtes liues? (VVhich Auguſta, and whiche Biſhop there yee meane, I knowe not, neither wel can I knowe, excepte I ſawe your notebooke) what if the Abbot Panormitane, what if one Faber, and one Latomus, menne of our time (I trow) and that zelous man whiche wrote the litle tripartite treatiſe annexed to the Laterane Councel , what ſo euer he was : what if al theſe (I ſaie) moued with a zeale , and beinge deſirous of the Clergies Reformation, lamentably complaine of theire looſe life? what then?

Gette you fairer painted, and better filled boxes, then theſe be, or els ſhal ye al be taken for poore Potticaries .

Touchinge Pius , In Platyna yee ſhal finde theſe woordes , for one of that Popes ſaieinges, *Sacerdotibus magna ratione ſublatas nuptias , maiori reſtituendas videri.* As mutche to ſaie in Engliſhe: that Marriage was taken from Prieſtes with greate reaſon , and that it ſeemed it were to be reſtoared againe with greater . This ſaieinge reporteth not , that VViues were taken awaie from Prieſtes, as you reporte, neither that VViues ought to be reſtoared to Prieſtes againe . (d) It ſpeaketh onely of Marriage, which as, before a man enter into Holy Orders, no Vowe beinge made, is lawful: ſo by orders taken , a Vowe of chaſtitie beinge ſolemly made, is vtterly vnlawful : If this ſaieinge had made ſo muche for your pretenſed Marriage, as yee woulde men to beleue, (e) ye woulde neuer haue falſified it by ſuche chaunge of woordes. VVhether it be more expedient, ſuche as come to the Clergie, to be required to leade the Single Life , and to binde them ſelues thereto by Vowes , or to enioye the common libertie of Marriage, (f) that we leaue to the Churche to diſcuſſe an order.

(d) A ſage expoſition. VVhat had this ben to Pius meaning?

(e) Vntruth. For if we had falſified the words, yee woulde not ſo ſimply haue touched it.

If Pius ſawe many weightier cauſes , for Prieſtes to haue VViues, then for theire Single Life , as yee pretende he did : why did not he , or you in his ſteede ſhewe vs , what and howe ſubſtantial they be ? If they be no better , then you and your ſelowes haue vttered in your Sermons , and writinges hitherto , they are not woorthe (g) a Pipt nootte . This ſaieinge of Pius is wel to be weighed and ſcanned.

(f) Now at laſte, the Doctours ſtand in doubt.

(g) *Mira verò Militi quæ placeant.*

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Who ſo euer ſhal wel conſider the Fruites that haue growen of this Tree, maie eaſily iudge , by whome it was planted . Certainely S. Paule , when he had giuen Rules , touchinge the Clergie , that Biſhoppes , and Deacons ſhoulde be the Huſbandes of One Wife , immediately afterwarde , in the ſame tenoure , and courſe of Speache, ſaithe thus : *The Sprite ſaithe plainely , that in the later times , ſomme ſhal departe from the Faithe , geuinge eare vnto lieinge Spirits, and to the Doctrine of Diuels, vtteringe lies vnder Hypocriſie , hauinge their Conſcience burnte with a hote yron* (**thereby made vnſenſible**) Forebiddinge Marriage, &c. **Here wee are taught by the Sprite of**

1. Timoth. 4.

God,

God, that Forebiddinge of Marriage, is the Doctrine of Diuels.

But M. Hardinge saithe, There is no Lawe in the Churche, to restraine Marriage: and that Marriage is not now condemned by him, and others of that side, and thought vnlawful Vniuersally in al menne, (for that, he saithe, was the Heresie of Valentinus, Marcion, Montanus, and others) but onely forbidden, and thought vnlawful in a fewe. By this answeare, M. Hardinge maie seeme to make him selfe somewhat better, then was Valentinus, and Marcion, and other Olde Heretiques. But further to healpe him, and thoroughly to cleare his Doctrine, it wil not serue. It is a Common knowen Rule in the Scholes, Magis, & Minus, non mutant Speciem. Verily, as he, that killeth but a fewe men, is called a Pankiller: Euen so he, that Condemneth Marriage in a fewe, muste likewise be called a Condemner of Marriage. Neither doth S. Paule, when he prophesieth hereof, saie, that somme shoulde Condemne al kinde of Marriage Vniuersally, in al manner of Wenne: but onely he saithe, *There shalbe somme, that shal forebidde Marriage: as the Bishoppes of* Rome *haue donne.*

Neither did al Heretiques Condemne Marriage in one sorte. For somme of them condemned it Generally, and thoroughly, and altogeather: Somme others of them Condemned it onely in a fewe, euen as M. Hardinge, and his Felowes do. For thus S. Augustine writeth of the Heritiques named the Manichees, Auditores, qui appellantur apud eos, & Carnibus vescuntur, & agros colunt, &, si voluerint, Vxores habent: Quorum nihil faciunt illi, qui vocantur Electi: *They, that emonge them be called, the Hearers, doo bothe eate Fleashe, and tille the ground, and Marrie Wiues too, if they liste. But no suche thinge maie they doo, that be called* Electi. The Auditoures, or Hearers emonge the Manicheis, were as the late people: The Electi, or Chosen, were as the Cleregie. Theise Heretiques the Manicheis Condemned Marriage, not generally in al sortes, and degrées of Wenne: but onely, as M. Hardinge dothe, in a fewe. Yet were they Heretiques notwithstandinge, and theire Doctrine was the Doctrine of Diuels. *Augustin. Epist. 74.*

S. Augustine saithe vnto them, as he woulde also saie vnto M. Hardinge: Non Concubitum, sed, vt longè antè ab Apostolo dictum est, Verè Nuptias prohibetis: *Ye forebidde, not Copulation,* (or Concubines) *But, euen as the Apostle Prophesied longe before,* Verily, and in deede, ye forebidde Marriage: (Albeit it were but in a fewe). *Augustin. De Moribus Manichæ. Lib. 2. Cap. 13.*

Al this, M. Hardinge, notwithstandinge, that it maie plainely appeare, whoes Doctrine ye teache, it shalbe good, and not from the purpose, briefely to disclose somme parte of it. And here, to passe ouer theise woordes of Chrysostome, Hæc ipsa Coniunctio Maritalis malum est ante Deum: *This very Copulation of Man, and Wife,* is euil before God. And theise of S. Hierome, Quàm diu impleo Mariti officium, non impleo officium Christiani: *As longe as I doe the dewtie of a Husbande,* I doo not the dewtie of a Christian: And other like Sainges, and Authorities before alleged, Pope Innocentius in the Condemnation of Marriage saith thus: Qui in carne sunt, Deo placere non possunt: *They that be in the Fleashe,* (that is to saie, in Marriage) cannot please God. And to this purpose he alleageth theise woordes of S. Paule, *To the Cleane, al thinges are Cleane:* But to the filthy, and Infidelles (whereby the same Pope Innocentius vnderstandeth Married people) nothinge is Cleane: But bothe theire minde, and theire Conscience is defiled. Pope Siricius calleth Marriage, Vitium, Luxuriam, Fœdas Cupiditates: *Vice, Lecherie, and Filthy Lustes.* One of your late Englishe Doctours of Louaine saithe, *That the whole* Easte Churche, *maintaininge the lawful Marriage of Priests, euermore continewed there from the Apostles time vntil this daie, mainteineth, and contineweth a Schole of Filthinesse.* *Chrysost. in Opere Imperfecto, Homil. 1.* *Hieron. Aduersus Iouinian. Lib. 1.* *Dist. 82. Proposuisti.* *Roman. & Tit. 1.* *Dist. 82. Plurimos.* *Copus Dialog. 1. Pag. 159. Graecos solos in hac impudicitiæ Schola Magistros sequuntur.*

Further you maie remember, that this Rule is written in a Booke of your owne Doctrine, and is geuen in Secrete, as a Special Lesson vnto your Cleregie, Si non Castè, tamen cautè: *If thou deale not* Chastely, *yet deale* Charily. *Const. Othonis. Licet ad profugandũ. In Glos.*

From whence had you this Doctrine, M. Hardinge? Who set it firste abroche? Who taught it? Who confirmed it? Who allowed it? If yée can saie, it is not the Doctrine of the Diuel, yet verily, I beléeue, ye cannot saie, it is in any pointe like the Doctrine of God. S. Hierome hauinge occasion to speake of Antichriste, saithe thus:

thus: Simulabit Castitatem, vt plurimos decipiat: *He shal make a counterfeite shewe of Chastitie, that he maie deceiue many.* Euen so S. Paule saithe, Habentes speciem Pietatis: Virtutem autem eius abnegantes: *Hauinge a Colour of Godlinesse: but the Power thereof denieinge vtterly.*

Hieron. in Daniel. Cap. 11.

2. Timoth. 3.

But, somme what to relieue your selfe, ye allege these wordes of S. Augustine: Ille prohibet Matrimonium, qui illud Malum esse dicit: non qui huic Bono aliud melius anteponit: *He forebiddeth Marriage, that saithe, Marriage is euil: and not he, that before this thinge, beinge Good, setteth an other thinge, that is better.* Here, M. Hardinge, I beseeche you of your indifferent iudgement: He that vseth your wordes, and saithe, as you saie, They that liue in Matrimonie, connot please God: They be Filthy: They be Infidelles: Vnto them nothinge is cleane: Their whole Minde and Conscience is defiled: He that saith *Matrimonie is* Vice, Lecherie, *and* Filthy Pleasure, Saithe he not, *Matrimonie is an euil thinge?* Thus you saie: Thus you write: These Wordes be apparente, and allowed in your Bokes: euen in those Bokes, whereby ye would haue vs to Order, and to directe our Liues, and Manners. Byckely, this is the very Substance of youre Doctrine in this behalfe. Therefore euen by S. Augustines Iudgemente, your Doctrine, is the Doctrine of Diuels.

August. Contra Faust. li. 30. ca. 6.

And whereas ye would seme not vtterly to condemne the state of Matrimonie, but onely to sette Single Life before it, as a Better thinge before a Good: It maie please you to vnderstande, that, notwithstanding a thinge in it selfe be Beste, yet is it not therefore Vniuersally Beste for euery Man. For, notwithstandinge Scarlet be the fairest of al Coloures, and the Face the fairest parte of al the Body, yet, I recken, M. Hardinge, to make your selfe faire, ye would not haue your Face died in Scarlet.

Single life for many causes is the Beste: I graunte. Yet is it not Beste for euery body: but onely for him: that hathe the gifte of Chastitie, and can with quiet Minde, and Vpright Conscience liue Single. Otherwise Matrimonie is much better. And therefore God hathe leafte vs indifferently free to bothe: that, who so euer cannot vse the One, maie chuse the other. S Paule saithe, Volo Omnes esse sicut meipsum: *I woulde euery man woulde liue Single, as I doo.* But he addeth withal a Special Prouiso: Vnusquisque Proprium Donum habet à Deo: alius sic, alius autem sic: *Euery man hath his owne gifte of God: One this, an other that.*

1. Corint. 7.

And therefore he saithe further, Although Single Life be the better state, *Yet, who so euer is not continent, lette him Marrie. Better it is to Marrie, then to Burne.* Although otherwise he weigh Single Life before Marriage, yet in this case, he saithe, it is better to Marrie, then so to liue Single.

M. Hardinge hereto replieth: They, that haue Vowed haue loste this libertie: and by S. Ambrose, and S. Augustines Iudgemente maie not Marrie. Hereof I haue partely spoken before: and partely shal haue occasion offered to saie more hereafter. In the meane season we are taught here by M. Hardinge, to take S. Paules wordes by the toppe, and to turne them quite backewarde: and thus to frame a Newe Rule of Life, and to saie contrarie to S. Paule, Melius est Vri, quàm Nubere: It is better, to burne in Concupiscence, then to Marrie.

Yet S. Augustine saithe euen of them, that haue Vowed, as it is before alleged, Quæ Nubere volunt, & ideo non Nubunt, quia impunè non possunt, Melius Nuberent, quàm vrerentur, id est, quàm occulta flamma Concupiscentiæ in ipsa Conscientia vastarentur: *They, that haue a minde to Marrie, and yet Marrie not, bicause they cannot Marrie without reproche,* Better were it for them to Marrie, then to burne: *that is to saie, then with the priuie flame of theire Concupiscence to be wasted in their Conscience.*

August. de sancta Virginit. Ca 34.

Further M. Hardinge saithe, This Order of Single Life was taken by the Apostles them selues: And therefore (saithe he) it is not the Diuels, but the Apostles Doctrine. If this be true in deede, then is this mater thoroughly concluded But where was this Order taken by the Apostles? By what Writtinge, by what Recorde, by what Tradition maie it appeare? Or, howe is it likely, that the Apostles, beinge Married Menne them selues, would force other menne to liue Single?

I haue

The Apostles Doctrine.

I haue alreadye shewed by Ignatius, by Clemens, by Eusebius, and by S. Ambrose, that the Apostles, S. Iohn Onely excepted, were al Married. Clemens saithe, that Peter sawe his owne Wife carried by the Officers to suffer deathe for Christes sake: and cried vnto her comfortably by her Name, *O Wooman, Remember the Lorde.* Ignatius, S. Iohns Disciple saithe, Opto Deo dignus inueniri, sicut Petrus, & Paulus, & reliqui Apostoli, qui Nuptijs fuerunt sociati, qui non libidinis causa, sed posteritatis surrogandæ gratia Coniuges habuerunt: *I wisshe to be founde meete for God, as was Peter, and Paule, and the other Apostles that were Married: and not for pleasure, but for Posteritees sake had Wiues.*

Ambro. 2 Cor 11.
Euseb. li. 3. ca. 30
Ζῶσιν μεμνησο τῆς κυρίου.
Ignatius ad Philadelphen.

Chrysostome saithe, Cur non ait, Oportet Episcopum Angelum esse, Nulli humanæ perturbationi, vitioue subiectum? Ne Ecclesiæ negotia fructusque perirent. Idcirco moderatam Virtutem proposuit: non supremam illam, atque Cœlestem: *Why saithe not* S. Paule, A Bishop ought to be an Angel, *subiecte neither to any worldly affection, nor to any Vice? Leste the affaires, and fruites of the Churche shoulde perishe* (being without a Gouernoure). *Therefore he required of Bishoppes* a moderate, and a reasonable kinde of Vertue (willinge them to be Husbandes of One Wife) *and not that other Vertue, so Highe, and so Heauenly:* (that is to saie, vtterly to liue vnmarried.)

Chrysost. in Priorem ad Timoth. Homil. 10.

Againe he saithe, Idcirco ait, Vnius Vxoris Virum: Ne nimis in angustum rem eam concluderet, si exactissimam Virtutem expetisset: idcirco moderatiori admonitione maluit vti: ne ex desperatione perfectæ illius inueniendæ Virtutis, Ecclesiæ sine Episcopis essent: *Therefore* S. Paule *saith*, Let a Bishop be the Husband of One VVife: *Leste he shoulde shut vp the mater into too greate a straite, if he had required that moste perfite puritie: therefore he wolde rather vse a reasonable moderation, or meane* (that a Bishop shoulde be the Husbande of one Wife): *Leste of despaire of findinge that excellencie of Vertue* (to liue Vnmarried) *the Churches shoulde be leaste* without *Bishoppes.*

Chrysost. in eadem Homil.

S. Paule saithe, Touchinge Virgins, I haue no commaundemente of the Lorde: Better it is to Marrie, then to burne: Let a Bishop be the Husbande of One VVife. Whiche laste wordes Pope Leo expounded thus: Is Episcopus ordinetur, quem Vnius Vxoris Virum fuisse, aut esse Constiterit: *Let him be Consecrate a Bishop, of whom it maie wel appeare, that either he* is, or hath benne the Husbande of one VVife.

1. Corinth. 7.
1. Timoth. 3.
Tit. 1.
Leo Epist 87.

S. Ambrose expoundinge these wordes of S. Paule, *Touchinge Virgins, I haue no commaundemente of the Lorde*, saithe thus, Si Doctor Gentium non habuit, habere quis potuit? *If the Doctour of the Gentiles had no Commaundemente of the Lorde, touchinge Virgins, what man els then coulde euer haue it?*

Ambros. in 1. Corinth 7.

Emonge the Rules, whiche commonly are called the Apostles Canons, it is written thus, Episcopus, aut Presbyter, aut Diaconus Vxorem suam prætextu Religionis ne abijciat. Aut, si abiecerit, à Communione segregetur: &, si perseueret, deponatur: *Let not either Bishop, or Priest, or Deacon put awaie his Wife vnder coloure of Religion. Or, if he so doo, let him be put from the Communion* (of the Faithful): *And if he so continewe, let him be vtterly deposed from his office.*

Canon 5.

S Hierome expounding these wordes of S. Paule, Let euery man remaine in the vocation, wherein he was called, saith thus, Ex hoc, habentibus Vxores tollit licentiam dimittendi eas: *Hereby* S Paule *forebiddeth Married menne to put awaie their Wiues.*

Hieronym Contra Iouinian. Lib. 1.

In the firste Councel holden at Constantinople, it is written thus: Antiquum sequentes Canonem Apostolicæ diligentiæ, & Constitutiones Sanctorum Virorum, Legales Nuptias Posthac valere volumus, nullo modo cum Vxoribus suis eorum connubia dissoluentes: *Folowinge the Olde Order of the Apostles diligence, and the Constitutions, and Lawes of the Holy Fathers, from henceforthe we will, that* the lawful Marriage (of Bishoppes, and Priestes) *shal stande in force*, not in any wise dissoluinge the VVedlocke, that they haue with their VVifues. And herein, they saie, they folowe the Olde Canon, or Order of the Apostles.

Dist. 31. Quamuis.

Gratian saithe, as he is before alleged, Copula Sacerdotalis, nec Legali, nec Euangelica, nec Apostolica Authoritate prohibetur: *The Marriage of Priestes is not forebidden by any Authoritie, either of the Lawe, or of the Gospel, or of the Apostles.*

26. Quæ 2 sors.

Cardinal Caietane saithe, Dominus Discipulis suis nullum indixit Votum: *Our Lorde*

Catharinus con-

Lorde appointed vnto his Disciples no manner of Vowe.

Clemens Alexandrinus saithe, as it is saide before, Epistolæ Apostoli nusquam honestum, Moderatumq; Matrimonium prohibuerunt: *The Epistles of* Paule *the Apostle neuer forebade honeste, and sobre Marriage.*

Ex errror. Catetant. Errore 11.

Clemens stroma. Lib 3.

All these thinges wel considered, I beseche the, gentle Reader, indifferently to weighe M. Hardinges wordes: and to demaunde of him, with what countenance he coulde thus telle the, that the Order of Single Life was taken by the Apostles them selues, and therefore muste be holden as the Apostles Doctrine.

If he happen to telle the, It is written in the Councel of Carthage, telle him againe, he is deceiued. I saie, tel him, that the Apostles of Christe neuer, neither made any Lawe, nor gaue any Order for the Single Life of the Ministers. And therefore telle him hardely, he is deceiued. He wil saie, The wordes of the Councel be plaine, Quod Apostoli docuerunt, & ipsa seruauit Antiquitas: *Whiche thinge the Apostles haue taught, and the Antiquitie it selfe hathe obserued.* These wordes be plaine in deede: if they were not peruerticly glosed. Therefore telle him againe, he should better haue learned, bothe the manner of the Apostles teachinge, and also the scope, and reach of this Antiquitie. Certainly thus mutch his owne Glose could haue tolde him: Apostoli nihil instituerunt, de non vtendo Matrimonio iam contracto: *The Apostles* tooke no Order, *touchinge the not vsinge of Matrimonie already contracted.*

Conci. Carthag. 2. Cap. 2.

Dist 84. Cùm in Præterito, In Glossa.

And whereas the Councel saithe, Apostoli docuerunt, *The Apostles taughte.* The same Glose saithe, Apostoli docuerunt exemplo: non Institutione, vel Constitutione: *The Apostles taught it by their Example:* but not by appointemente, nor by commaundemente. Perhappes M. Hardinge wil saie, The Apostles Example is sufficient. Thereto I wil answeare, as Clemens Alexandrinus sommetime answeared certaine of the Olde Heretiques in like case: Dicunt glorioſi isti iactatores, se imitari Dominum, qui Vxorem non duxit. Illis dicit Scriptura, Deus Superbis resistit: Humilibus autem dat Gratiam: These glorious Braggers *saie, they wil folowe the Example of our Lorde, that Married no Wife. Vnto them the Scripture saithe, God withstandeth the Prowde: and geueth Grace vnto the humble.*

Clemens stroma. Lib. 7.

And to like pourpose S. Ambrose saithe, Præceptum quidem Apostolus non habuit: at habuit Exemplum: *In deede the Apostle* S. Paule had no Commaundement *to geeue of Virginitie: but* Example he had to geeue.

Ambros. De Virginib. Lib. 1.

Againe, whereas the Councel allegeth Antiquitie, Quod ipsa seruauit Antiquitas, the same Glose expoundeth it thus, A tempore Siricij Papæ hic vocat Antiquitatem: *By this woorde* Antiquitie, *the Councel meaneth the time after* Pope Siricius (*whiche was foure hundred yeeres after* Christe). And againe, as it is alleged before, Ante tempora Siricij Papæ, Sacerdotes poterant contrahere Matrimonium: Before the time of Pope Siricius, it was lawful for Priestes to contracte Matrimonie.

Suche good luche M. Hardinge hathe to his Doctoures, and Councelles. By his owne Glose he hathe loste foure hundred yeres of his Antiquitie.

Panormitane after he had saide, *The Commaundemente of Single Life is not of the Lawe of God,* he added further, Quia ahâs Græci peccarent: Non enim excusaret eos Consuetudo. Quia illa non valet contra Legem Dei: *Otherwise the* Græcians *were offenders. For no Custome coulde excuse them: For as muche as Custome preuaileth not againste the Lawe of God.*

Extra. De Clericis Coniugatis. Cùm Olim.

Nowe, touchinge this Councel of Carthage, notwithstandinge it had benne truely Construed, yet the Authoritie thereof muste nedes seeme so mutche the lesse, for that it decreeth of set pourpose quite contrarie to the Councel of Nice. For the Fathers in the Nicene Councel durst not to remoue Priestes, and Bishoppes from their Wiues: for that it was written, *Whome God hath ioined, let noman sunder.* But these other Fathers in the Councel of Carthage without any sticking, or doubting at the mater, onely with one woorde, vtterly removed them: and so by force, and violence, and contrarie to the Commaundemente of Christe, sundred, and diuided them, whome God had ioined. Whiche thinge, Holy Paphnutius saith, *Was not Lawful for man to doo.*

Sozomen. Lib 1. Cap 23.

Touchinge

The fruites of Single Life.

Touchinge Bishop Hulderichus, Panormitanus, Latomus, and Iacobus Faber, and suche others, as haue spoken, or written in the behalfe of Priestes Marriage, M. Hardinge thinketh it sufficient for him to answeare, VVhat if they complaine of the loose life of the Cleregie? VVhat then? (That is to saie) VVhat if the Cleregie liue in professed shame, and open filthinesse? What then? As if suche Simple Authorities were worthy of none other answeare.

Yet was Hulderichus sommetime Bishop of Augusta in Germanie, welneare fire hundred yeres agoe, and for his vertue and Holinesse was coumpted a Sainct. Abbas Vrspergensis in his storie writeth of him in this sorte: Hiltinus Augustanus Episcopus obijt: Cui Sanctus Vdalrichus (qui idem est Hulderichus) successit: Hiltine *the Bishop of* Augusta *died: To whome succeeded* Sainct Hulderichus. Abbas Panormitanus was a famouse Canonist, in Judgemente Equal with any other.

Abbas Vsperg. Anno 925. Pag. 214.

Faber, and Latomus bothe in our time were accoumpted Learned: and either of them a Special Champion of M. Hardinges side. Verily the worste, and vilest of al these is a greate deale bothe founder in Judgemente, and deaper in Learninge, then either Amphilochius, whome M. Hardinge so highly esteemeth: or Abdias, or Hippolytus, or Leontius: whome they haue lately rakte out of the duste: Or Clement of Rome, whom he so often calleth the Apostles Felowe.

Neither did these writers onely complaine of the lowsenesse of Priestes liues, as M. Hardinge telleth vs: But also for remouinge of Publique shame, and sclaunder out of the Church of God, wished, that the Libertie of Marriage might be restoared: whiche thinge M. Hardinge so closely dissembleth.

Touchinge that Pope Pius was commonly wonte to saie, as Marriage was taken awaie from Priestes vpon greate Considerations, euen so nowe vpon other greater considerations it were to be restoared to them againe. M. Hardinge, after mutch other nedelesse talke, saithe thus: VVhy did not he, or you in his steede shewe vs, what, and howe Substantial considerations they be?

Platina in Pio. 2.

God Christian Reader, lothe I am to disclose, and publishe any thing, that maie sounde to the shame of any one man: mutche lesse, that maie turne to the open shame of so greate a number. But M. Hardinge euer beauily presseth vs with his importunitie, and requireth vs vpon our credite to shewe these causes. Therefore if the reporte hereof shal séeme vnpleasant, the faulte is M. Hardinges: It is not mine. I wil onely shewe forthe simply, and truely, that I finde written in sundrie, bothe of the Ancient learned Fathers, and also in others of his owne side: Whiche nevertheless, had not M. Hardinge benne, mighte mutche better haue benne concealed.

Firste of al, the Ancient Father Origen for his time, whiche was welneare foure téne hundred yeres agoe, hereof complaineth thus: Non solùm, quæ docent, non faciunt, sed etiam crudeliter, & sine misericordia, non secundum æstimationem virium vniuscuiusque, iniungunt: Vt, qui prohibent nubere, & ab eo, quod expedit, ad immoderatam munditiem compellunt. Alligant onera grauia, & faciunt homines cadere sub eis. Et frequenter videmus, eos qui talia docent, contraria facere sermonibus suis. Castitatem docent: & Castitatem non seruant: &c. Omnia faciunt propter personas hominum, & glorias vanas, vt videantur ab hominibus. Et plærunque sunt tales, qui diligunt primos accubitus in conuiuijs, & salutationes in foro, & vocari ab hominibus Rabbi: Qui volunt vocari Episcopi, Presbytei, Diaconi: *Not onely they doo not, that they teache, but also cruelly, and without mercie they laie their iniunctions vpon others, not consideringe eche mannes habilitie. Suche be they, that* forebidde menne to marrie: *and from that thinge, that is lawful to be donne, driue, and force Menne* to an vnreasonable Puritie. *They binde, and laie on heauy burthens, and cause menne to falle vnder them. And oftentimes wee see them, that teache suche thinges, them selues to doo contrarie to theire owne saiinges. They teache Chastitie: and* yet keepe not Chastitie, &c. *They doo al thinges for the commendation of menne, and vaine glorie, that they maie be seene, and noted of the people. And commonly they be suche, as loue the highest places at Feastes, and Banquettes, and to be Saluted, and Honoured in the Market places, and of the people to be called* Rabbi: *That wil be called Bishoppes, Priestes, and Deacons.*

Origen in Matth. Tractat. 24.

At the

At the verie firſte attempte hereof, Dionyſius **the Biſhop of** Corinthe **wrote thus vnto** Pinytus **the Biſhop of** Gnoſus, Noli graue illud onus neceſſariæ Caſtitatis imponere Fratribus: *Laie not that* heauy burthen of the neceſsitie of Chaſte life *vpon the Brethren.* **Meaninge therebye, that is was too heauy a burthen for al menne to carrie.**

Euſeb li. 4. ca. 23. Μὴ βαρὺν φορτίον ἐπάναγκες τὸ περὶ ἁγνείας τοῖς ἀδελφοῖς ἐπιτιθέναι.

Neither was it for nothinge, that S. Cyprian **in his time wrote thus,** Vt quid ſibi adhibuit mulierem, qui ducere contempſit vxorem? Peius eſt, quàm Mœchari, continentiam ducere criminoſam: *Wherefore tooke he a wooman vnto him, that diſdeined to marrie a wife? To liue a continente life with reproche,* is woorſe then Aduouterie.

Cypria. De ſingularitate Clericorum.

It is not for nothinge, that Epiphanius **writeth,** Repudiant Nuptias: at non Libidinem. In honore enim eſt apud illos, non Caſtitas, ſed Hypocriſis: quam tamen appellari volunt Caſtitatem. They refuſe Marriage, but not luſte, or pleaſure. *For they eſteeme, not Chaſtitie, but Hypocriſie: And yet the ſame* Hypocriſie *they will haue to be called* Chaſtitie.

Epiphan. Contra Origenian. Hereſi. 42. Πεφιλοτίμηκε γὰρ παρ' αὐτοῖς οὐχ ἡ ἁγνεία, ἀλλὰ ὑποκρισις τις ἡ ἁγνεία τῷ ὀνόματι καλεμένη.

It is not for nothinge, that Chryſoſtome **writeth of the Vowed, or Chaſte wemen in his time:** Nuptias magis dicere beatas licet, &c. Poſthac melius eſſet, ne Virgines quidem eſſe, &c. Perſeuerat adhuc nomen, & appellatio rei: at negotium totum in corpore ſublatum eſt, &c. In delicijs magis viuunt, quàm mulieres in fornice, &c. Frequens, & quotidianus eſt concurſus Obſtetricum ad Virginum domos: &c. Virginitas iſta cum viris plus ab omnibus arguitur, quàm ſtuprum ipſum: *Wee maie ſaie, that Marriage* is a greate deale better, *(then ſuche Virginitie). Hereafter* it were better, *there were no Virgins at al.* The name *(of Virginitie) continueth ſtil: But Virginitie it ſelfe in theire body is quite gonne. They liue more in pleaſure, then* Harlottes in the Stewes. *There is often, and daiely renninge of* Midwiues to Virgins houſes. This manner of Virginitie, of wemen emongeſt menne, is more reproued of al menne, then Fornication it ſelfe.

Chryſoſt. tom. 5. Quòd Regulares Fœminæ cum viris cohabitent.

It is not for nothinge, that Sulpitius Seuerus **ſaithe of** S. Hierome, Hieronymus de familiaritatibus Virginum, & Monachorum, & Clericorum, quàm vera, quàm fortia diſputauit? Vnde à quibuſdam, quos nominare nolo, dicitur non amari: *Howe truely, and howe ſtoutely hathe* S. Hierome *written of the* Familiaritie, that theſe Virgins haue with Monkes, and Prieſtes? *And therefore it is ſaide, that of ſomme menne, whome I wil not name, he is the leſſe beloued.*

Sulpitius Seuerus. Dialog. 3.

Neither is it for nothinge, that Saluianus **ſaithe of his time, whiche was aboute a thouſande yeres agoe,** Sub ſpecie Religionis, vitijs Sæcularibus mancipantur: *Vnder the* coloure of Religion, and Holineſſe, *they are made ſlaues to worldly vices.* **And againe,** Nouum prorſus Conuerſionis genus: Licita non faciunt: Illicita committunt: *A very ſtrange kinde of Conuerſion:* That they maie doo, *they doo not: And doo* that they maie not doo.

Saluianus De Prouidentia, Lib. 5.

Ibidem.

Al theſe, and other like thinges were written longe agoe, in the olde times, before the fruites of Single life were thoroughly knowen.

But after that, Pope Hildebrande **by Crueltie, and Tyrannie had fully eſtabliſhed the mater, and brought it to perfection,** Auentinus **ſaithe,** *Many godly learned menne vtterly forſooke the Miniſterie,* Et Falſi Prophetæ, Falſi Apoſtoli, Falſi Sacerdotes emerſerunt, qui ſimulata Religione populum deceperunt. Maxima pars ſub honeſto nomine Caſtimoniæ, Stupra, Inceſtus, Adulteria, paſsim, & impunè committunt: *Falſe Prophetes, Falſe Apoſtles, and Falſe Prieſtes ſprange vp: which* vnder a counterfeite Religion *deceiued the people. The moſt parte of them, vnder the* honeſt name of Chaſtitie, *commit whoredome, Aduouterie, Inceſte, and that commonly, and without puniſhement.*

Auentinus in Hildebrando.

S. Bernarde **ſaithe,** Epiſcopi, & Sacerdotes huius temporis Caſtitatis Sanctimoniam, ſine qua nemo videbit Deum, tam in Corde, quàm in Corpore, quomodo ſtudent obſeruare? Traditi in reprobum ſenſum, faciunt, quæ non conueniunt. Quæ enim in occulto fiunt ab Epiſcopis, turpe eſt dicere: *The Biſhoppes, and Preeſtes of this time, how doo they endeuoure to keepe either* in harte, or in body, *the Holineſſe of Chaſtitie, without which, no man ſhal ſee God? They are geuen ouer into a reprobate minde, and doo theſe thinges, that are not conuenient. For it were ſhame to vtter* what theſe Biſhops doo in Secret.

Bernardus in Conſilio Remenſi.

Againe

The fruites of Single Life.

Againe he saithe, Abstinentes à Remedio Coniugali, postea in omne flagitium effluunt: *Abstieninge from* the Remedie of Marriage, *afterwarde they flowe ouer into al kinde of wickednesse.*

He that wrote the litle Booke, called Opus Tripartitum, ioined with the Counsel of Laterane, saithe thus, Tanta immunditia luxuriæ notoria est in multis partibus mundi, non solum in Clericis, sed etiam in Sacerdotibus: imo, quod horribile est audire, in Prælatis Maioribus: &c. *Suche notorious filthinesse of Lecherie there is in many partes of the Worlde, not onely in the inferioure* Clerkes, *but also in* Priestes: *yea and in the* greatter Prelates too: *whiche thinge is horrible to be hearde: &c.*

Bernard. De Conuersione, ad Clericos, ca. 29. In Opere Tripart. li. 3. ca. 7.

And in the Glose vpon the Constitutions Legantine of Englande, it is written thus: Clerici huiusmodi Concubinas tenent Communiter, apparatu honesto, nomine appellationis Sororiæ: *Clerkes commonly holde, and haue suche Concubines, in honest hauour,* vnder the name of their Sisters.

De Concubinis Cleri. remoun. du. Licet ad profligandum. Paralipomena Vrspergen. Pag. 403.

Nicolaus de Clauengijs, complaininge hereof, saithe thus: Capellani, & Canonici similes Episcopis, Indocti, Ebrij, Scortatores: *The Chaplaines, and Canons are like to the Bishoppes, Vnlearned, Dronken, and Fornicatours.*

Rob. Holcote in Librum Sapientiæ, Lectione 184

Roberte Holcote saithe, Sacerdotes moderni sunt Dæmones Incubi per luxuriam, & Sacerdotes Priapi, vel Beelphegor, & Angeli Abysi: *The Priestes of our time by their Lecherie, are like the* Sprites called Incubi, *the Priestes of* Priapus, *or* Beelphegor, *and the Angelles of the pitte of Helle.*

Hulderichus Episcopus Augustan.

Hulderichus, in Olde times the Bishop of Augusta in Germanie, wrote sharpely hereof against Pope Nicolas in this wise: Decreta tua super Clericorum continentia à discretione inueni aliena: Multos consilij tui assentatores hominibus, non Deo, sub falsa specie continentiæ placere volentes, grauiora vides committere: *I haue founde, thy Decrees, touchinge* the Single Life of Priestes, *to be voide of discretion. Thou seest, that many followers of thy counsel, willinge vnder a fained colourre of Continente Life, rather to please Men, then God, commit hainous Actes.* In the ende he concludeth thus, Qua nosti discretionis disciplina, Pharisaicam ab Ouili Dei extirpa Doctrinam: *By suche discipline of discretion, as you knowe beste, roote this* Pharisaical Doctrine *out of Goddes Folde.*

VVolphgangus VVissenburgius in præfatione in Antiologiam Papæ.

But, for as mutche, as M. Hardinge hathe no skil in this Epistle of Hulderichus, he mate vnderstande, that his owne Pope Pius, otherwise called Aeneas Syluis, maketh euidente mention of the same. Notwithstandinge, I haue seene the same Epistle written in Parchemente, in Olde hand, of good recorde, vnder the name of Volusianus Carthaginensis. Further Mantuanus the Poete saithe,

Petrique domus polluta fluenti
Marcescit luxu: Nulla hîc arcana reuelo.
Sanctus ager Scurris, *venerabilis Ara* Cynædis
Seruit: Honorandæ Diuûm Ganymedibus *Ædes.*

The mater hereof is suche, as it is not worthy to be Englished.

But what pleasure can it be, to stande so longe in so vnsauery a place? They themselues saie thus, Fornicatio Simplex non est digna depositione: Simple Fornication (in a Priestе) *is no iuste cause of Depriuation.* The cause thereof in an other Glose is alleged thus, Quia pauci sine illo vitio inueniuntur; *Bicause there be* fewe Priestes founde without that faulte.

2. Qu. 7. Later. in Glossa. Dist. 81. Maximianus in Glossa.

To be shorte, Polydorus Vergilus saith, Nullius delicti crimen maius Ordini dedecus, plus mali Religioni, plus doloris bonis attulit: *No kinde of crime euer broughte either more shame to the Order of Priestehoode: or more hinderance to Religion: or more griefe to the Godly, then the Life of Single Priestes.*

Polyd. Vergil. de Inuentorib. rer. Lib. 5. cap. 4.

These, these, M. Hardinge, were the causes, that moued Pope Pius commonly to saie, as it is before alleged: As Marriage vpon good, and greate considerations was taken from Priestes, so nowe vpon better, and greater considerations it were to be restoared to them againe. And therefore he saithe in his discourse of the Counсel of

Basile, Fortasse non esset peius, Sacerdotes complures vxorari. Quoniam multi saluarentur in Sacerdotio Coniugato, qui nunc in sterili Presbyterio damnantur: *Perhaps it were not woorse*, that many Priestes were Married. *For many might be saued in* Married Priestehoode, *whiche nowe in* barren Priestehoode are condemned. **If the former of these two Sayinges be so doubtful, yet this later is plaine, and cleare, and voide of doubte. In like sense, and sorte he writeth vpon good aduise, and deliberation to his frende:** Quoniam huc ventum est, vt Legi Carnis resistere nequeas, melius est Nubere, quam Vri: *For as muche, as the mater is growen so farre, that yet cannot withstande the Lawe of the Fleashe*, Better it is to Marrie, then to burne.

Æneas Sylui. De Con. Basili. Lib. 2.

Æneas Sylui. Epist. 321. ad Iohan. Fontem. Extra. De Clerici coniugati. Cùm olim.

So saithe Panormitane, Credo pro bono, & salute animarum, quòd esset salubre statutum, vt non valentes continere, possint contrahere. Quia, experientia docente, contrarius prorsus effectus sequitur ex illa Lege Continentiæ: cum hodie non viuant Spiritualiter, nec sint mudi: Sed maculentur illicito coitu, cum ipsorum grauissimo peccato: Vbi cum propria Vxore esset Castitas, Vnde deberet Ecclesia facere sicut bonus medicus: vt, si medicina, experientia docente, potius officiat, quàm prosit, eam tollat. Et vtinam idem esset in omnibus Constitutionibus positiuis: *I beleue*, it were a good Lawe, *and for the wealthe, and safetie of Soules, that* suche, as cannot liue Chaste, maie contracte Matrimonie. *For wee learne by experience, that of the Lawe of Continente, or Single Life, the* contrarie effecte hathe folowed. *For as muche as nowe a daies they liue not Spiritually, nor be cleane, and chaste: but with theire greate Sinne are defiled with vnlawful Copulation:* wheras with their owne VViues they shoulde liue Chastely. *Therefore the Churche oughte to doo, as the skilful Phisitian vseth to doo: Who, if he see by experience, that his Medicine hurteth rather, then doothe good, taketh it cleane awaie. And woulde God the same waie were taken with al* Positiue Constitutions.

Panormitan. Cap. Cùm olim.

So saithe Durandus, Vtile esset, vt in Concilio Matrimonium Sacerdotibus remittatur. Frustrà enim hactenus coacti sunt ad Castitatem: It were good, *that in a Councel, Priestes Marriage were sette at libertie.* For hitherto it hathe benne in vaine, to force them to Chastitie.

Durandus. De modo Celebrandi Concilium. Titul. 46.

So saithe Martinus Peresius, Multis pijs visum est, vt Leges de Cœlibatu tollerentur propter scandala: *Many godly wenne haue thoughte it good, that the* Lawes of Single Life shoulde be abolished, *for auoidinge the offense of the people.*

Martinus Peresius.

Ø. Hardinge wil saie, The Prieste hathe Vowed, and muste keepe his Vowe. **But Pope Pius, as it is saide before, gaue counsel of Marriage vnto a Priestе, that had made a Vowe: his Vowe, and Priesthode notwithstandinge.**

It appeareth righte wel, bothe by that hathe benne already alleged, and also by the common experience, & practise of the worlde, that a Vowe importeth not alwaies a Chaste Life. Optatus Mileuitanus **saithe,** In Mitella signum est Voluntatis: non Castitatis auxilium: *In the apparel there is a token of the Wil: not a healpe towardes Chastitie.* S. Hierome **saithe,** Quid prodest Corporis pudicitia, animo constuprato? VVhen the Minde, or Harte is deflowred, *what auaileth the Chastitie of the Body?*

Optatus Contra Parmenianum Donatist. Lib. 6

Hieron. in Hieremi. li. 2. ca. 7.

S. Ambrose **saithe,** Non imperari potest Virginitas, sed optari. Nam, quæ supra nos sunt, in Voto magis sunt, quàm in Mastisterio: *Wee maie* wishe for *Virginitie, but* commaunde *it wee cannot. For the thinges, that be aboue vs, and out of our power, are rather of Desire, then of Commaundemente.*

Ambro. De Virginib. Lib. 1.

Hereof Epiphanius **maketh this Conclusion:** Vt ne confundantur apud homines, occultè scortantur: & sub Solitudinis, aut continentiæ specie libidinem exercent. Melius est itaque lapsum à cursu, palàm sibi Vxorem accipere secundum Leges: *Least they should be shamed before men, they* keepe Harlottes priuily: *and vnder the colour of* Solitarie, or Continent Life, *they practise their filthy pleasure.* Better is it *therfore for a man, beinge fallen from his course, and breakinge his Vowe,* openly to take vnto him selfe a VVife accordinge to the Lawe. **So saithe** S. Hierome, **as I haue before alleged:** Huiusmodi Virginibus aperte dicendum est, vt aut nubant, si se non possunt continere: aut contineant, si nolunt nubere: *To suche Virgines wee must saie plainely,* that either they Marrie, if they cannot conteine: *Or els, that they Conteine, if they wil not Marrie.*

Epiphan. Lib. 2. Hæres. 41.

Hieronym. Ad Demetriadem.

So saithe S. Bernarde **vnto his Sister:** Quod incautè Vouisti, ne impleas: Impia est pro-

est promissio, quæ scelere adimpletur: *That thou haste vnaduisedly Vowed*, see thou keepe it not. It is a wicked promisse, that is perfourmed with wickednesse. *Bernardus ad Sororem de modo bene viuendi, Sermo. 62.*

To be shorte, Iohannes Scotus saithe, Si Votum Continentiæ est annexum Ordini Sacro solùm ex præcepto Ecclesiæ, sequitur, quòd non simpliciter illegitimat ad contrahendum: *If the Vowe, or Promisse of Chastitie be annexed vnto Holy Orders Onely by force of the Constitution, or Commaundement of the Churche, then dothe it not* of necessitie, and fine force, vnhable a man to contracte Matrimonie. *4. Senten. dist. 36 Quæst. 1.*

Howe be it, hereof wee haue saide already so mutche, as to a reasonable man maie seeme sufficiente.

The Apologie, Cap. 9. Division. 1.

Wee receiue, and embrace al the Canonical Scriptures, both of the Olde, and Newe Testamente, geuinge thankes to our God, who hathe raised vp vnto vs that Light, whiche wee might euer haue before our eies: leaste either by the suttletie of man, or by the snares of the Diuel, wee should be carried awaie to errours, and lies. Also wee profesſe, that these be the Heauenly Voices, whereby God hath opened vnto vs his wil: and that onely in them mannes harte can haue setled reste: that in them be abundantly, & fully comprehended al thinges, what so euer be needeful for our Healthe, as Origene, Augustine, Chrysostome, and Cyrillus haue taughte: That they be the very mighte, and strength of God to attaine to Saluation: That thei be the Fundations of the Prophetes, and Apostles, whereupon is builte the Churche of God: That they be the very sure, and infallible Rule, whereby maie be tried, whether the Churche doo swarue, or erre, and whereunto al Ecclesiastical Doctrine ought to be called to accoumpte: and, that againste these Scriptures neither Lawe, nor Ordinaunce, nor any Custome ought to be heard: no though Paule him selfe, or an Angel from Heauen should comme, and teache the contrarie. *Romans. 1.*

M. Hardinge.

But why doo ye not here plainely declare, which be the Bookes of the Scriptures, that ye allowe, and which be they (a) that ye reiecte? In general, ye saie, that ye embrace al the Canonical Scriptures. Yet if a man presse you with the place of the Machabees, for Praier to be made for the Deade, and with the woordes of S. Iames Epistle againste youre Iustification of Faithe onely, and likewise with certaine other places of the Scriptures, whiche be accoumpted in the Canon of the Churche, againste certaine other your false doctrines: in this case (b) your woonte is to denie those Scriptures to be Canonical. Yet here ye beare the worlde in hande ye allowe al. VVoulde God there were in you either more truth, or lesse craft. VVel, ye geue thankes to God for the Scriptures, for that hauing them before your eies, ye are staied in Truthe, assured, that by the suttletie of man, or snares of the Diuel, ye be not carried awaie into Errours, and Lies. And is it so in deede? I praie you sirs of what secte be ye? or of whiche secte is eche one of you? For I dare boldely saie, and so the worlde seeth, that ye agree not al in one. If ye saie, ye be Lutherans, then muste I further demaunde of you, of whiche sorte of Lutherans? For that puddle runneth out by many sinkes. Be ye Zuinglians, Arians, Osiandrines, Libertines, Adiaphoristes, Anabaptistes, Caluinistes, or Sathanistes? VVhat priuilege haue ye before youre felowes? A matche beinge made betweene you (I meane that newe Cleregie of Englande) and the other sectes of our time, &c. If yee haue this lighte of the Scriptures before your eies, how is it, that ye agree not within youre selues? yea howe is it, that eche one of you oftentimes disagreeth with him selfe? how is that (c) so many times ye haue changed your Communion Booke, the order of your Service, your doctrine of the blessed Sacramente, your Homilies, &c. VVho knoweth not howe in the matter of the Sacramente your chiefe captaines haue shewed them selues inconstante and mutable, and contrary to them selues, I meane Cranmere, Ridley, Latimer, and that great Rabbin Peter Martyr him selfe? As for the reste, they be not woorthy to be named.

1 Mach. 12 Iacob. 2.

(a) Vntruth. For we reiecte no parte of al the Scriptures.

(b) Vntruth. For wee denie no more, then S. Augustine, S. Hierome, and other Holy Fathers haue denied.

(c) Childishe, and fonde Vntruthe: For the Communion Booke was neuer but once changed. But see the often changes of the Masse.

But what saie ye? be these the Heauenly voices, whreby God hath opened vnto vs his wil? Then how dare ye to transgresse his wil declared in these Voices, where ye reade expresselye, that he (d) which heareth not the Churche, is to be taken for no better, then a Heathen, and a Publicane? As yee proceede, yee saie, that onely in the Scriptures mannes harte can haue setled reste, and that in them be abundantly, and fully comprehended al thinges, what so euer be needeful for our Saluation, as Origen,

(d) S. Cyprian saithe, *Non iungitur Ecclesiæ, qui ab Euangelio separatur: De Lapsis Serm.*

Auguſtine, Chryſoſtome, and Cyrillus haue taughte. Either you knowe not, what you ſaie, ſir Defender, nor the thinges of whiche you make affirmation, as S. Paule ſaide of ſuche, as yee are, writinge to Timothe, or you are fowly ouerſeene. If the harte of man haue ſetled reſte in the Scriptures onely, as you ſaie, then in nothinge els but in the Scriptures. By this you ſeeme to trouble and diſquiet many hartes. For if this be true, (e) then had good Abel no better reſte in his harte, then wicked reſtleſſe Cain. 1. Time.4. Mans harte harthe not ſetled reſte in Scriptures only.

VVhen the Holy Booke of Scripture was loſte, whiche God reſtored by Eſdras, were there none in al that time, whoſe hartes had ſetled reſte? VVhat fooliſhe, and abſurde Doctrine is this? (f) VVhat if it had pleaſed God, there had neuer beane letter writtẽ of the Olde, or Newe Teſtament? ſhoulde not Goddes frendes haue founde his peace that paſſeth al ſenſe, as S. Paule ſaithe? Had Paule, Antony, Hilarion, Pambus, and many other Holy men liuinge in VVilderneſſe (g) without letters, no reſte, ne quiet at their hartes? Nay, who had the like? And whereas you ſaie, that al thinges needeful for our Saluation be abundantly, and fully comprehended in the Scriptures, this is alſo as falſe, as ſundry other partes of your Doctrine. For if al thinges neceſſarie to Saluation be conteined in the Scriptures, then what ſo euer is not in them conteined, the ſame is not neceſſarie: If not neceſſarie, why ſhould wee be laden with vnneceſſarie burdens? Then awaie with al Traditions at a clappe, be they neuer ſo Apoſtolike, neuer ſo Ancient, neuer ſo Healthful, neuer ſo longe time in the Churche continued. Remember you not, what the moſte renoumed Fathers haue written of the neceſſitie of Traditions? Or if you remember them, what thoughte you when you wrote thus? Let Learned and Holy Baſile be hearde in ſteede of many, if not to reuoke you from your errour, yet to diſcredite you, and ſtay others in the truthe. His woordes be theſe: Of the Doctrines, whiche be preached in the Churche, certaine wee haue out of the Scripture written, certaine wee haue receiued in ſecrete Miſterye by Tradition of the Apoſtles, (h) whiche bothe be of equal force to Godlineſſe. Neither concerninge theſe any man gainſaieth, be he of neuer ſo ſmal knowledge. For if wee goe aboute to reiecte the cuſtomes that be not ſette foorthe in writinge, as beinge of litle regarde, then ſhal wee condemne thoſe thinges alſo, whiche wee haue in the Goſpel neceſſarie to Saluation. Yea rather wee ſhal bringe the preachinge of the Faithe but to a bare name. For ſo they were taken for Heretikes, which regarded not the ſolemne faſte of Lente(i) receiued at the Apoſtles, as we reade in S. Auguſtine, *De Her. ad Quoduultdeum*, Cap. 53. and in the Councel of Gangra in an Epiſtle to the Biſhops of Armenia. Euen ſo they which denied the (k) diſtinction of a Biſhop, and a Prieſte, were condemned of Hereſie, as wee finde in S. Auguſtine in the Booke, and Chapter afore ſaide, and in Epiphanius Lib. 3. Cap. 75. In the Councel of Conſtance the ſame is to be founde. Philip. 4. Lib. de Spiritu Sancto, ca. 27. Faſte of Lente.

Againe if al thinges neceſſarie to Saluation be (l) expreſſed in the Scriptures, to what pourpoſe ſaide S. Paule concerninge order, and maner, to be vſed at the celebration of the Holy Sacramente: *Cetera cùm venero diſponam:* As for other thinges I wil take order for them, when I come? VVhat meaneth S. Iohn to ſaie, Hauinge other thinges to write to you of, I woulde not (write them) in Paper and Inke: for I truſte to be with you, and ſpeake to you mouthe to mouthe. To conclude much, that mighte be obiected, in fewe woordes for breuities ſake, what ſaie you, ſir Defender, ſhal wee finde al thinges neceſſarie to Saluation in the Scripture? (m) Howe thinke you of the Scripture it ſelfe? Howe knowe you this to be the Scripture? Howe knowe ye the Goſpel of Mathewe, Marke, Luke, and Iohn, to be theirs, whoſe names they beare? This can you not finde in al the Scripture, (n) and yet is the ſame neceſſarie to be beleued. VVhat Scripture haue you to admitte theſe, and to refuſe the Booke bearinge the name of (o) Peter, the Goſpel of Thomas, of Bartholomewe, of Nicodeme? VVhy admitte you not the Prophetes that Baſilides would to be allowed, but onely the foure greate, and the twelue leſſer? VVhat auctoritie haue you to ſtaie youre ſelfe by, concerninge theſe? but onely that of the Churche? for Scripture haue you none for prouſe hereof. Then hathe not Scripture al things in it neceſſary for a Chriſten man. Is it not neceſſary to beleue the Sonne of God to be *Homouſion*, that is to ſaie, of the ſame Subſtance with the Father? whiche if you denie, you reſtoare the olde condemned Hereſie of the Arians. (p) The ſame can you not finde in the Scripture. VVhere in al the Bible finde you that God the Father is *Ingenitus?* VVhere finde you that the Holy Ghoſte proceedeth from the Father and the Sonne? that the bleſſed Virgin Mary continued in her Virginitie? that ſuche as be Baptized of Heretikes oughte to be Baptized againe? That Infantes oughte to be Baptized? That the foure Bookes of the Goſpel were written by Mathewe, Marke, Luke, and Iohn, by what Scripture can you proue it? To ende, where finde you expreſſely in al the Scriptures three perſons to be one God? 1. Cor. 11. Epiſt. 2. *Homouſion*.

(e) Vntruth. For Abel heard the VVoorde of God. Reade the Anſweare.
(f) A woorthy doubte.
(g) Vntruth. For S. Auguſtine ſaithe, *Antonius Scripturas Diuinas memoriter audiendo tenuit, &c.*
(h) Yet now the very ſame neceſſarie Traditions be quite foregotten, and aboliſhed, yea euen in the Churche of Rome.
(i) Vntruthe. Reade the Anſweare.
(k) Vntruth. For herehy bothe S. Paule, and S. Hierome, and other good men are condemned of Hereſie.
(l) Vntruth. For wee ſaie not, Al things are there expreſſed.
(m) Stale, and fonde queſtiõs.
(n) Vntruthe. For it is not neceſſarie to Saluation.
(o) They were written by Heretiques in derogation of the Truthe.
(p) Vntruth. For Epiphani' ſaith *Senſiu eius nominis vbique eſt.*

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Here, to weighe downe the Authoritie of Goddes Holy Worde, M. Hardinge hath brought in a heape of ordinarie ſtale quarrels, Of the difference betweene Prieſtes, and Biſhoppes: of Lente: of the Communion Booke: of the Homilies: of the order of Seruice: and of the perpetual Virginitie of our Lady. **His whole drifte herein is, to beare vs in hande, that there is very litle, or none Authoritie in the Scriptures: and that the whole Credite, and certaintie of our Faithe reſteth onely in the Churche of** Rome. **He ſeemeth to take it in ſcorne, that the Worde of God ſhoulde be called** Lighte. **Yet notwith-**

notwithstanding the Prophet Dauid saith, *Thy Woorde ô Lord is a Lanterne to my feete, And againe, The Commaundement of the Lorde is Lightsome, geeuinge Lighte vnto the eies.* Psalm.118. Psalm.18. And Theophylacte saithe, Verbum Dei est Lucerna, qua Fur deprehenditur: *The Woorde of God is the* Candle, *whereby the* Theefe *(or false Teacher) is espied.* Theophylact. in Lucam. Ca.16.

Whereas M. Hardinge demaundeth of vs so pleasantly, What Scriptures wee allowe, and what wee reiecte, he troubleth him selfe with an idle, and a needelesse question. For wee embrace, and reuerence euery parcel, and title of the Scriptures without exception, not refusinge any parte thereof, that hathe benne allowed by the Ancient, Learned, Catholique Fathers of the Churche of God.

Neither do wee so scornefully calle Goddes Holy Worde, A Nose of Waxe, a Shipmannes Hose, or a Deade Letter: as sundrie of that side haue delighted to cal it. Albert. Pighius. Lib. 3. cap. 3. Hierar. Iohan. Slusdan. Lib 23.

Touchinge the Booke of the Machabees, wee saie nothinge, but that wee finde written by S. Hierome, S. Augustine, and other Holy Fathers. S. Hierome saithe, Machabæorum Libros legit quidem Ecclesia: Sed eos inter Canonicas Scripturas non recipit: *In deede the Churche readeth the Bookes of the* Machabees: but shee receiueth them not emonge the Canonical allowed Scriptures. Hieron. in Prooemio in Prouerb. Salomonis.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ M. Hardinge. S. Hierome speaketh of suche Canonical Scriptures of the Olde Testamente, as the very Iewes allowed for Canonical. Suche in deede the Bookes of the Machabees are not. But S. Augustines woordes condemne you. He saithe, *Machabæorum Libros, non Iudæi, sed Ecclesia pro Canonicis habet:* As for the Bookes of the Machabees, not the Iewes, but the Churche accoumpteth them for Canonical &c. Nowe see, good Reader, what Lowde Lies, M. Iewel made, when he saide, he would denie nomore, then S. Augustine, S. Hierome, and other Fathers haue denied. M. Har. fo. 321. b

The Answeare. Lowde Lies, M. Hardinge: Youre woordes are to smarte. Muche better were it for you, to be sober. I saie nowe againe, as I saide before: *The Bookes of the* Machabees *are not reckened emonge the Canonical Scriptures:* And therein wee denie nomore, then by S. Augustine, S. Hierome, and other Holy Catholique Fathers hathe benne denied. For trial whereof, I praie you, consider, what S. Augustine saithe, Theise be his woordes: In Machabæorum Libris, etsi aliquid Mirabilium numero inferendum conueniens fuisse ordini inueniatur, de hoc tamen nulla cura fatigabimur: quia tantum agere proposuimus, vt de Diuini Canonis Mirabilibus exiguam expositionem tangeremus: *Although there maie some thinge be founde in the Bookes of the* Machabees, *meete for this order of Writinge, and woorthy to be ioined with the number of Miracles, yet hereof wee wil haue no care, for that wee haue intended onely to touche a short rehearsal of the Miracles conteined in the Bookes of the Holy Canon.* August. De Mirabilib. Sacræ Scripturæ, Li. 2. Cap. 34. Marke wel, M. Hardinge: Here S. Augustine telleth you, *That the Bookes of the* Machabees *are no parte of the Canonical Scriptures, and that therefore he wil make none accoumpte of the Miracles therein conteined.* S. Hierome saithe, as it is alleged before, *The Churche readeth the Storie of* Iudith, *the Booke of* Tobie, *and the Bookes of the* Machabees: *But the same Churche receiueth not these Bookes, as the Canonical Scriptures.* Hieronym. in Prafation. in Salomonem. Marke once againe, M. Hardinge: S. Hierome telleth you, euen as S. Augustine tolde you before, *That the Bookes of the* Machabees *are not Canonical.* And he speaketh not of the Iewes Canon, as you imagine, but of the Canon of the Churche. Forgeate not his woordes, Ecclesia eos Libros inter Canonicas Scripturas non recipit.

Likewise S. Cyprian saithe, Alij Libri sunt, qui non Canonici, sed Ecclesiastici appellantur &c. Huius ordinis est Libellus Tobiæ, & Iudith, & Machabæorum Libri: *Other Bookes there be, that are not called Canonical, but onely Ecclesiastical, for that they be allowed to be readde in Churches. Of this sorte are the Bookes of* Tobie, *of* Iudith, *and of the* Machabees. Cyprian. in Expositione Symboli. Beholde, M. Hardinge: Theise Holy Fathers agree al togeather, in that they saie, *The Bookes of the* Machabees, *are no parte of the Canonical Scriptures.* Muche more might be saide. But by these fewe the Reader maie learne, where to finde the Lowde Lie.

Nowe be it, by youre reporte, S. Augustine saithe, The Churche accoumpteth the Bookes of the Machabees, as Canonical Scriptures. What answeare maie here be made? Shal wee sette S. Augustine, againste S. Augustine? One S. Augustine saithe,

Machabees Canonical.

The Booke of the Machabees *is not Canonical.* An other S. Auguſtine ſaithe, *The Booke of the* Machabees *is Canonical.* Is, and Is not, is a plaine contradiction. If the one be true, the other is falſe. Whether of theſe two S. Auguſtines maie we beleue? Why do you thus trifle, M. Harding? Or why do you ſo guilefully conceale S. Auguſtines meaninge? I will take no further for other ſentences. Euen in the ſelfe ſame place by you alleged, S. Auguſtine ſaithe, *The Booke of the* Machabees *is not Canonical.* Theſe be S. Auguſtines wordes, M. Hardinge: Thus he ſaithe, Hæc ſupputatio, non in Scripturis Sanctis, quæ appellantur Canonicæ, ſed in alijs inuenitur, in quibus ſunt & Machabæorum Libri: *This reckeninge is not founde in the Holy Scriptures, that are called Canonical, but in certaine other Bookes, emonge whiche are the Bookes of the* Machabees. Here it is euident, by the iudgemente of S. Auguſtine, That the *Bookes of the* Machabees *are not Canonical.* Theſe wordes, M. Hardinge, ye would not haue diſſembled, if ye had meante to deale plainely. Therefore it maie like you to conſider, how you maie better beſtowe this Lowde Lie.

Auguſtin. De Ciuita. Dei. Lib. 18. cap. 36.

Notwithſtandinge S. Auguſtine ſaithe further, Hos Libros Eccleſia habet pro Canonicis: *Theſe Bookes the Churche alloweth, as Canonical.* This is true: I denie it not. But here you take to beguile your Reader by the miſunderſtandinge of this worde Canonical. For in the former place Canonical Bookes, are ſuche, as maie be alleged in proufe of Faithe: In the Seconde, ſuche Bookes are called Canonical, as although they beare no ſuche Authoritie, yet maie they be allowed for certaine Cauſes, onely to be readde openly in the Churche. If you had alleged S. Auguſtines wordes fully, and truely, as they ſtande, the whole matter had benne euidente. For thus ſaithe S. Auguſtine, Libros Machabæorum Eccleſia habet pro Canonicis, propter quorundam Martyrium Paſsiones vehementes, atq; mirabiles: *The Churche accompteth the Bookes of the* Machabees, *as Canonical,* (not for the Authoritie, and weight of truthe, but) *for the greate, and marueilous Paſſions, and Perſecutions of Martyrs, therein conteined.*

Thus, to be alleged in proufe of Faithe, they are not Canonical: but, to be readde vnto the people in the Church, for example of Life, in this ſenſe, ſaithe S. Auguſtine, they are Canonical. To like pourpoſe S. Auguſtine writeth to Gaudentius: Scriptura, quæ appellatur Machabæorum, recepta eſt ab Eccleſia non inutiliter, ſi ſobriè legatur, vel audiatur, maximè propter illos Machabæos, qui pro Dei Lege tam indigna perpeſsi ſunt: *That Scripture, that ſo is called, and beareth the name of the* Machabees, *is receiued not vnprofitably of the Churche, ſo that it be readde, and hearde with ſobrietie: ſpecially bicauſe of thoſe* Machabees, *that ſuffered ſo cruel tormentes for the Lawe of God.* So ſaithe S. Cyprian, Hæc omnia Legi quidem in Eccleſijs voluerunt: non tamen proferri ad Authoritatem ex his Fidei confirmandum: *All theſe Writinges our Fathers haue allowed, to be readde in the Churche: yet not to be alleged for Authoritie to confirme the Doctrine of our Faithe.* Likewiſe ſaithe S. Hierome touchinge the ſame Bookes of the Machabees, Hæc volumina legit Eccleſia, ad ædificationem plebis: non ad Authoritatem Eccleſiaſticorum Dogmatum confirmandum: *Theſe Bookes the Church readeth for the edifieinge of the people, but not as mater of Authoritie, whereby to proue Eccleſiaſtical Doctrine.* Now, I beſeeche you, M. Hardinge, What Canonical Scriptures are theſe, that maie not be alleged in Confirmation of Doctrine, or in proufe of Faithe? If ye had diſcretely foreſeene theſe thinges, I thinke, ye would not ſo vainely haue charged vs with Lowde Lieinge.

Auguſt. contra ſecundam Epiſt. Gaudentij. l. 2. Cap. 23.

Cyprian in Expoſitione Symboli.

Hieronym. in Præfatione in Salomonem.

Of Prayer for the Dead, we ſhal haue place more conuenient to ſpeake hereafter.

The place of S. Iames, touchinge the Iuſtification of Faithe, and Workes, is answeared before. Neither do we diſcredite any parte, either of the Authoritie, or of the Doctrine of that whole Epiſtle: notwithſtandinge Euſebius ſaithe, It was written by ſomme other, and not by S. Iames. His wordes be theſe: Iſtius Iacobi, qui Iuſtus, & Oblias vocabatur, dicitur eſſe Epiſtola, quæ prima ſcribitur inter Canonicas. Sciendum autem eſt, illam Epiſtolam eſſe Spuriam: *The Opinion is, that the Epiſtle, whiche is reckened the firſte emonge the Canonicalles, is of this* Iames, *whiche was called* Iuſtus *and* Oblias. *But wee muſte vnderſtande, that it is a* Baſtarde Epiſtle, *and not written by* S. Iames.

In the firſt parte c. chap. 10. Diui. 1 Euſeb. li. 2 ca. 23 ἰσέον δὲ ὅτι νοθεύεται.

Likewiſe

Likewise S. Hierome saithe, Epistola Iacobi ab alio quopiam sub eius nomine edita asseritur: *It is saide, that the Epistle of* S. Iames, *was sette forthe* by some other man vnder his name. This therefore is no newe fantasie: but the Iudgemente of the Anciente Learned Fathers. Neuertheless we do bothe receiue the same Epistle, and also reade it in Oure Churches: and allowe euery Clause, and Sentence, that therein is written, euen as the Worde of God. *Hieronym. in Catalogo Eccle. siasticor. Scriptorum.*

M. Hardinge saithe, If yee haue this Light of the Scriptures before your eies, howe is it, that yee agree no better emongest your selues? And here he reckeneth vp by rote a many of Names of his owne makinge, Lutherans, Zuinglians, Arians, Osiandrians, Libertines, Adiaphoristes, Anabaptistes, Caluinistes, and Sathanistes. In whiche his so pleasante fansie, he maie haue leaue to sporte him selfe, while he listeth. God be thanked, we agree thorowly together in the whole Substance of the Religion of Christe: and altogether with one Harte, and one Spirite do glorifie God the Father of our Lorde Iesus Christe. Certainely S. Augustine, S. Hierome, S. Chrysostome, Epiphanius, and Theophilus, as it appeareth by theire writinges, agreed no better tograther in theire time, then we do nowe. Yet had they, and euery of them the Worde of God: and the same Worde of God was a Lighte vnto their feete.

It was not for any greate stoare of better mater, I trowe, that M. Hardinge thus chargeth vs with so often changinge the Communion Booke. For of more, then of One Onely Change, he cannot telle vs. And if there had benne lesse then that, there had bene no change at al. And yet, for that one Change, he him selfe in the meane season hathe changed thrise. But the Holy Communion Booke, and the Order of the Holy Ministration standeth, and by Goddes mercie shal stande stil, without any further Change.

Howe be it, Gentle Reader, if thou wilt knowe the often Alterations, & Changes of the Masse, Reade, I beseche the, Platyna, and Polydore Vergil, touchinge the same: There shalte thou finde, howe, and by whom, and vpon what occasion, and in what processe of time, al the partes of the Masse were pieced, and sette tograther: and that in the space of seuen hundred whole yeres, scarcely, and with muche adoo it was made vp at laste, and brought to somme perfection. *Platin. in Sixto. 1. Polydor. Vergil. De Inuentorib. rer. Lib. 5. Cap. 10.*

Christes Commaundemente of Hearinge the Churche, is answeared before. S. Augustine saithe, Credimus Sanctam Ecclesiam: non Credimus In Sanctam Ecclesiam: *Wee Beleeue, that there is a Holy Churche: But wee Beleeue not In the Holy Churche.* For the Churche is not God, nor is hable of her selfe to make, or alter any One Article of the Faithe. The Prophete Esay saithe, Ad Legem potius, & ad Testimonium. Si non responderint secundum Verbum hoc, non erit illis Lux Matutina: *To the Lawe rather, and to the Testimonie of God. If they answeare not accordinge to this Woorde, they shal haue no Morninge Lighte.* *Augustin. De Fide & Symbol. Esai. 8.*

M. Hardinge saithe further, If quietnesse of Conscience comme of the VVoorde of God onely, then had Abel no more quietnesse of Conscience then wicked restlesse Cain. Then shoulde Paule the Eremite, and Antonie, and Hilarion, and Pambus, and other Holy men, liuinge in wildernesse without Letters, haue had no reste, ne quiet at their Hartes. And why so? Bicause they had no Worde written.

Who woulde thinke, that M. Hardinge, bearinge sutche a countenance of Diuinitie, woulde thus goe about to deceiue him selfe with a pointe of Sophistrie? Chrysostome saithe, Deus Conditor Humani Generis ab initio per seipsum hominibus loquebatur: *God the Creatour of Mankinde, from the beginninge* spake vnto menne by him selfe *in his owne persone*. And S. Paule saithe, Deus olim multifariam, multisque modis Patribus loquutus est: *In Olde times* God spake many waies, *and in sundrie sortes vnto the Fathers*. And dothe M. Hardinge thinke, when God him selfe in his owne persone, and presently spake vnto Abel, that Abel hearde not then the Worde of God? We speake not so precisely, and nicely of Goddes Worde written in Paper. For so it is a Creature Corruptible, and shal consume, ane perishe, as other Corruptible Creatures do. But *the Woorde of God*, whiche we speake of, *endureth for euer*. *Chrysostom. in Genes. Homil. 2. Hebræ. 2.* M. Hard. 318. b.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ M. Hardinge. VVee also in Christes Churche haue as wel Goddes

VVoorde in our Hartes, as in our Bookes: whence also, to witte out of our Hartes, wee maie resolue the doubtes, whiche arise vpon our Bookes.

The Answeare. In your Hartes, M. Hardinge? And is your Harte the onely Oracle of al the Worlde? Or muste wee leaue Goddes Holy Worde, that endureth for euer, and resorte to your Hartes to learne Goddes will? The Prophete Zacharie saithe, *They haue beaten their Hartes as harde, as the* Adamante, *leaste they shoulde heare the Lawe of God, and the woordes, whiche the Lorde of Sabaoth hathe sente in his Sprite by the Ministerie of his Prophetes.* S. Paule saithe, Obscuratum est insipiens cor illorum: dicentes, se esse sapientes, stulti facti sunt: *Theire foolishe harte was blinded with darkenesse: whereas they boasted them selues to be wise menne, they became fooles. They turned the Truthe of God into Lies, and fille downe, and Woorshipped a Creature, forsakinge the Creatour, whiche is God blessed for euer.* God graunte, M. Hardinge, that the Daiestarre maie rise vp, and shine in your Hartes, that wee maie see your Light, & walke safely in your Waies.

Zacharie. 7.

Roman. 1.

2. Petri. 1.

S. Hierome saithe, Quomodò Aeternæ erunt Scripturæ Diuinæ, si Mundus certo fine est terminandus? Verum est quidem, quòd Librorum pelliculæ cum ipsis Literis abolendæ sunt. Sed, quia subiungit Dominus, Verba verò mea non præteribunt, proculdubio, quod illis apicibus pollicetur, erit Aeternum: *Howe shal the Holy Scriptures be Euerlastinge, seeinge the Worlde shal haue an ende? True it is* that the parchemente, or leaues of the Bookes, *with the Letters and al, shalbe abolished. But for as muche as our Lorde addeth, My Woordes shal neuer passe, doubtlesse* (though the Papers, and Letters perishe, yet) the thinge, that is promised by the same Letters, shal laste for euer. So Chrysostome saithe, Paulus Prædicationem non Scriptam appellat, Euangelium: Preachinge not written, Paule *calleth the Gospel.*

Hieronym. in Iohan, cap. 27.

Chrysostom. 2. Cor. in Homil. 18.

That M. Hardinge addeth of Antonius, and Paulus, and Hilarion, and other Eremites, that they liued in Wildernesse without Letters, and therefore presumeth, they liued without the VVoorde of God, it is verie vnaduisedly spoken, and vtterly vntrue. For proufe whereof, to name onely One in stede of the reste, S. Augustine saithe, that Antonius the Eremite was notably Learned, & perfite in the Scriptures. His woordes be thrise, Antonius sine vlla scientia Literarum, Scripturas Diuinas & memoriter audiendo tenuisse, & prudenter cogitando intellexisse, prædicatur: *It is reported, that* Antonius, *without knowledge of Letter, bothe* Learned the Holy Scriptures, and bare them wel in minde, by hearinge: *and also by Wisedome and studie, vnderstoode them.* S. Augustine saithe not, as M. Hardinge saithe, that Antonius liued without the VVoorde of God, but the contrarie, that he was ready, and perfite in the VVoorde of God.

Aug. de Doctrina Christiana, li. 1. In Prologo.

And, whereas M. Hardinge woulde seeme to make suche an accounte of Praier, and Holinesse without knowledge, S. Augustine saithe, Lectio sine Meditatione arida est: Meditatio sine Lectione erronea est: Oratio sine Meditatione tepida est: *Readinge without Meditation, or studie is drie, and barren:* Meditation, or studie without Readinge is erroneous: *And Praier without Cogitation, or studie, is halfe coulde, and vnfruitful.* Thus wee see by S. Augustines Iudgemente, that the Force, and Substance bothe of Praier, and of Meditation dependeth of Readinge. And therefore Nicolaus Cusanus saithe, *The Soule, that wil flee into the Wildernesse of Contemplation, muste haue twoo whinges, the one of Deuotion, the other of Knowledge, or Vnderstandinge.*

Augustin. De Scalis Paradisi, Cap. 11.

Nicol. Cusan. Excita. Lib. 2.

Howe be it, what Comforte, and peace of Conscience, wee haue by Hearinge the Worde of God, S. Paule can telle vs somme what better, then M. Hardinge. Thus he saithe, Quæcunque Scripta sunt, &c. *What so euer thinges are Written, they are written for our Learninge, that by Patience,* and Comforte of the Scriptures *wee maie haue hope.* Euen so saithe Christe him selfe, *O Father, this is the Euerlastinge Life, that they maie knowe thee, the onely, and very God: and Iesus Christe, whom thou hast sente.*

Rom. 15.

Iohan. 17.

But S. Paule saithe, *Keepe the Traditions, whiche ye haue receiued, either by Epistle, or by Woorde.* And S. Basile reckeneth Traditions to be One, and Equal with the VVoorde of God. First, that S. Basile wrote those woordes rather of zeale, then of Iudgement, it maie easily appeare, by that the selfe same Traditions, that he there

2 Thessalon 2.

Basil. De spiritu Sancto, Ca. 27.

specially

ſpecially nameth, and ſo highly commendeth, are for the greateſt parte already abo-liſhed, and quite forgotten, yea and that euen in the Churche of Rome. Yet the Worde of God endureth ſtil, and ſhal endure for euer. For example, by one of S. Baſiles neceſſarie Traditions, It is not lawful for any man, to Kneele in the Churche vpon the Sonnedaie: But euery man is bounde by the ſame Tradition, at Sermon, at Prayer, and at the Communion to ſtande vpright. And this (he ſaithe) was geeuen vnto vs in Secrete Charge by the Apoſtles of Chriſte. This ſo neceſſarie, and ſo Apoſtolique Tradition is nowe diſſolued, and broken, and vtterly forgotten, not onely in Louaine, but alſo in Rome.

ὀρθοὶ ποιεῖμεν τὰς εὐχὰς ἐν τῇ μιᾷ τῶν σαββάτων.

S. Auguſtine ſaithe, By Tradition of the Apoſtles, betweene Eaſter, and Whitſondaie it was not lawful for any man to Faſte. Yet nowe we Faſte within the ſame daies ſo forbidden, and the ſame kinde of Faſte is thoughte lawful, the Apoſtles Tradition to the contrarie notwithſtandinge.

Auguſtinus ad Caſulanum.

The reſte of S. Baſiles Traditions ſtande in Halowinge of Water: in Bleſſinge of Oile: in Prayeringe towardes the Eaſte: in vtteringe certaine wordes of Inuocation at the ſhewinge forthe of the Breade of Thankeſgeuinge vnto the people. Theſe thinges, I beleue, M. Hardinge him ſelfe neuer thoughte to be Equiualente with the Worde of God.

τὰ τῆς ἐπικλήσεως ῥήματα ἐπὶ τῇ ἀναδείξει τοῦ ἄρτου τῆς εὐχαριστίας.

But if theſe, and other like Traditions be ſo weightie, and ſo neceſſarie, as he ſeemeth to make them, then let him telle vs in good ſothe, and without fable: what were theſe Myſtical Solemne woordes of Inuocation, that S. Baſile ſaithe, were ſpoken by the Prieſte at the Openinge, or ſhewinge forthe of the Sacramente? If thei be ſo neceſſarie to be vſed, and continued in the Churche of God, why hathe he, and his whole Romaine Clergie quite forgotten them? If he, and his Clergie haue forgotten them, and vſe them not, and care not for them, howe can he ſaie, or maie we thinke, they are ſo neceſſarie to Saluation?

This is the Simplicitie, and plainneſſe of M. Hardinges dealinge. He telleth vs many tales of the Apoſtles Traditions, beinge him ſelfe the manifeſte deſpiſer, and breaker of the ſame Traditions. Touchinge the wordes of S. Paule, I marueile, that M. Hardinge coulde ſo eaſily be deceiued. For S. Paule him ſelfe, euen in the ſame wordes, and in the ſelfe ſame line, woulde haue tolde him, that by the name of Traditions, he meante, not Vnwritten Verities, and Liueleſſe Ceremonies, as he ſuppoſeth, but the ſelfe ſame Subſtance of Religion, and Doctrine, that he had vttered vnto the Theſſalonians before, either by Epiſtle, or by Preachinge.

Theſe be his wordes, *Holde the Traditions, whiche yee haue receiued, either by Epiſtle, or by Woorde.* He calleth them Traditions, although they were conteined in his Epiſtles, and declared to them by Writtinge. For the Apoſtles preachinge, & writtinge, in grounde, and Subſtance were al one. Nicephorus ſaithe, Paulus, quæ preſens oratione ſua dilucidè docuerat, eadem abſens per compendium in memoriam, ſcripta Epiſtola reuocare voluit: Paule, *what thinges, beeinge preſente, he had* plainely taughte by Mouthe, *the ſame thinges afterwarde, beinge abſente, he ſhortly called* to their remembrance, *by writinge an Epiſtle.* The like he writeth alſo of S. Mathewe, Matthæus diſcedens, (alio prædicatum) abſentiam ſuam ſcripto præſenti compenſauit: S. Mathewe *departinge* (to preache in other places) recompenſed his abſence by preſente writinge.

2. *Theſſalon.* 2.

Nicepho. Lib. 2. *Cap.* 34.

Nicepho. Lib. 2. *Cap.* 45.

S. Paule vnto the Philippians ſaithe thus, Eadem ſcribere mihi quidem non pigrum: vobis autem neceſſarium: *To write vnto you* the ſelfe ſame thinges, *vnto me it is not painefull: but in your behalfe, it is neceſſarie.* Theſe wordes S. Hierome expoundeth thus: Eadem ſcribere, hoc eſt, eadem repetere, quæ præſens dixeram: *To write* the ſame thinges, *that is to ſaie,* to make rehearſal of the ſame thinges, *that I tolde you by Mouthe, when I was preſente.*

Philippen. 3.

Hieronym. in Epiſtol. ad Philippen. Cap. 3.

So ſaith Theophylacte, ſpeakinge in the perſone of S. Luke: Priùs te ſine Scripto inſtitui: nunc Scriptum tibi trado Euangelium: Atque ita mentem tuam munio, vt ne obliuiſcatur eorum, quæ priùs ſine Scriptis tradita ſunt: *Before this time I haue inſtructed thee* without writinge. *Nowe I deliuer vnto thee a* written Goſpel. *And ſo I furniſhe thy minde, that it forgeate not the thinges,* that were deliuered thee before without writinge.

Theophylact. in Lucam. cap. 1.

So saithe Irenæus, Apostoli tunc Euangelium prænunciauerunt. Postea verò per Dei voluntatem, illud in Scripturis nobis tradiderunt, Fundamentum, & Columnam Fidei nostræ futurum: *Then the Apostles preached the Gospel. And afterwarde by Goddes wil*, they deliuered the same to vs in writinge, *to be a Fundation, and a Piller vnto oure Faithe.*

Irenæ. li. 3. ca. 1

And therefore Chrysostome saith, Paulus etiam non Scriptam Prædicationem vocat Euangelium: S. Paule *calleth* his Preachinge not written, *by the name of the Gospel.*

Chrysostom. in 2 Corin. Homil. 18

But me thinketh, M. Hardinge, so stoutely striuinge for the bare name of Traditions, shoulde better haue Learned S. Hieromes Lesson touchinge the same. Thus he writeth vpon these woordes of S. Paule, *Holde the Traditions, whiche yee haue learned, either by Our* Epistle, *or by Our Woorde:* Quando sua vult teneri non vult extranea superaddi: *Whereas* S. Paule *wil haue* his owne thinges *to be keapte, he wil haue* no strange thinges *thereto to be added.*

Hieronym. in 2. Thessalon. 2.

And, that S. Paule, by this Woorde, Traditions, meante not Ceremonies, or certaine Secrete vnknowen Verities, but the very Substance of the Gospel of Christe, as it is laide before: if M. Hardinge wil not beleue vs, yet let him beleue S. Paule him selfe. Thus he writeth, Tradidi vobis in primis, quod etiam accepi, quòd Christus mortuus est pro peccatis nostris secundum Scripturas: *First I haue deliuered to you*, (or geuen to you by Tradition) the same thinge, that I receiued: that is, that Christ died for our Sinnes, accordinge to the Scriptures. Here, by S. Paules Woordes, the Deathe of Christe is called a Tradition.

1. Corinth. 15.

So saithe S. Basile, Hoc palàm impugnat Salutaris Baptismatis Traditionem: Baptismus noster, iuxta ipsam Domini Traditionem, est in nomine Patris, & Filij, & Spiritus Sancti: Per ipsam Baptismi Traditionem habemus confessionem Fidei: *This thinge is plainely againste the* Tradition *of Healthful Baptisme: Our Baptisme, accordinge to the* Tradition *of our Lorde, is in the name of the Father, of the Sonne, and of the Holy Ghost: By the very* Tradition *of Baptisme wee haue the Confession of Faithe.*

Basilius de spiritu sancto. ἐκ τῆς τοῦ βαπτίσματος παραδόσεως.

S. Cyprian saithe, Vnde est ista Traditio? Vtrumne de Dominica, & Euangelica Authoritate discendens, an de Apostolorum Mandatis, atque Epistolis veniens? &c. Si igitur aut in Euangelio præcipitur, aut in Apostolorum Epistolis, & Actis continetur, obseruetur etiam hæc Sancta Traditio: *From whence haue wee this* Tradition? *Whether commeth it from the Authoritie of our Lorde, and of the Gospel: or els from the Commaundementes, and Epistles of the Apostles? &c. Therefore if it be either commaunded in the Gospel, or conteined in the Epistles, or Actes of the Apostles, let vs keepe the same* Tradition.

Cyprian ad Pompeium, contra Epistolam Stephani.

Likewise Eusebius saithe, Polycarpus, cùm recepisset ea ab illis, qui ipsi viderant Vitam Verbi, nuntiauit eadem, omnia Scripturis consona: Polycarpus, *when by* Tradition he had receiued *these thinges of them, that had seene the Life of the Woorde, vttered, and shewed the same*, beeinge al agreeable vnto the Scriptures.

Euseb. li. 5. ca. 20 πάντα σύμφωνα ταῖς γραφαῖς.

Of iuche Tradition, it is plaine, S. Paule speaketh. Howe therefore iudge thou, Gentle Reader, howe trocly, and handesomely M. Hardinge allegeth these woordes of S. Paule against S. Paules expresse woordes, and vndoubted meaninge, to serue his pourpose.

As for Lenten Faste, the Superstition onely excepted, wee condemne it not, but vse it stil. But howe can M. Hardinge saie, either that Lente is so necessarie, as he maketh it: or els, that it is the Tradition of the Apostles? Verily S. Augustine saith, Quibus diebus non oporteat ieiunare, & quibus oporteat, Præcepto Domini, vel Apostolorum non inuenio definitum: *Vpon what daies wee ought not to Faste, and vpon what daies wee ought to Faste*, I finde it not appointed, or limited by any commaundemente, either of our Lorde, or of the Apostles.

August. Epi. 86.

So saithe Socrates, Euangelia non imposuerunt iugum Seruitutis: Sed homines ipsi, suis quisque locis, propter Remissionem, & memoriam Passionis, Pascha, & alios Dies festos, sicut voluerunt, ex Consuetudine quadam celebrarunt. Non enim hoc vel Seruator, vel Apostoli Lege aliqua obseruandum esse mandauerunt: *The Gospel hathe laide vpon vs no Yoke of Bondage: But menne them selues* in the Countries where thei dwelt, *for release of labour, and Remembrance of the Passion of* Christe, of a certaine Custome, *keapt*

Socra. li. 5 ca. 22.

the

Lenten Faſte. Prieſtes, & Biſhops.

the Eaſter, and other Holy daies, eche man, as he woulde. For neither Our Sauioure, nor the Apoſtles by any Lawe commaunded theſe thinges.

Likewiſe ſaithe Caſsiodorus, Alij Piſces ſolummodò comedunt: Alij vnà cum Piſcibus vtuntur etiam Volatilibus: Alij vſque ad Nonam ieiunantes, ſine diſcretione Ciborum reficiuntur. Puto, Apoſtolos ſingulorum hoc reliquiſſe ſententiæ, vt vnuſquiſque Operetur, non timore, aut neceſsitate, quod bonum eſt: *Somme menne* (**in the time of the** Lenten Faſte) eate onely Fiſhe: *Others vſe bothe Fiſhe*, and Foule too: *Somme others, when they haue Faſted vntil three of the Clocke in the afternoone, afterwarde they refreaſhe their bodies without* difference, or Choiſe of Meates. *I thinke, the Apoſtles leafte this matter to euery mannes diſcretion, that euery man maie doo good without feare, or Superſtition, or neceſſitie.*

Caſſiodor. Li. 5. cap. 38.

Tertullian **likewiſe ſaithe**, De cætero ſindifferenter ieiunandum, ex arbitrio, non ex imperio Nouę Diſciplinæ, pro temporibus, & cauſis vniuſcuiuſque. Sic & Apoſtolos obſeruaſſe, nullum aliud imponentes iugum certorum, & in Commune omnibus obeundorum ieiuniorum: *Henceforthe wee muſte Faſte* without compulſion, of free wil, not by commaundemente *of this Newe Diſcipline, accordingely as euery man ſhal ſee time, and cauſe.* For ſo, it appeareth, the Apoſtles keapte it, laieinge on none other yoke of certaine appointed Faſtes, to be obſerued in common of al menne altogeather.

Tertul. De Ieiunio, contra Phyſicos.

Therefore S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Per Quadrageſimam ferè omnes abſtinent, non ſolùm à Carnibus, verùm etiam à quibuſdam Fructibus, quantò magis quiſque, vel minùs ſeu voluerit, ſeu potuerit: *In the Lent ſeaſon al menne for the moſte parte abſteine, not onely from fleaſh, but alſo from certaine fruites, as euery* man either wil, or is hable to doo, more, or leſſe. **Al menne be ſaithe, doo abſteine for the moſt parte: but not al in deede.**

Auguſt. Contra Fauſt. li. 30. ca 5

Al theſe thinges beinge true, and certaine, and out of queſtion, howe can M. Hardinge thus aſſure vs, that the Lenten Faſte **is the Undoubted** Tradition, **and Commaundemente of the Apoſtles?**

Certainely, whereas they ſo often telle vs, *Wee oughte to Faſte Fourtie Daies, for that Chriſte him ſelfe did the like, and gaue vs example ſo to doo*, Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Chriſtus non iubet, vt ieiunium ſuum imitemur: Chriſte *commaunded vs not to folowe his* Faſtinę, *Or*, to Faſte, as he Faſted.

Chryſo. in Matthe. Homil. 47.

And touchinge the numbe of the Daies, Euſebius ſaithe, Quidam putant ieiunare oportere vnum tantùm Diem: alij Duos: alij Plures: alij quadraginta Horas diurnas, nocturnaſque: *Somme thinke, they oughte to* Faſte onely one daie: *Others*, twoo daies: *Others*, Moe: *Somme others*, Fourtie whole Houres *bothe nighte, and daie togeather.*

Euſeb. li. 5 ca. 26

But what meante M. Hardinge here to comme in with the difference betweene Prieſtes, **and** Biſhoppes? **Thinketh he, that** Prieſtes, **and** Biſhoppes **holde onely by** Tradition? **Or is it ſo horrible an Hereſie, as he maketh it, to ſaie, that by the Scriptures of God, a** Biſhop, **and a** Prieſte **are al One? Or knoweth he, howe farre, and vnto whom, he reacheth the name of an Heretique?**

Verily Chryſoſtome **ſaithe.** Inter Epiſcopum, & Presbyterum intereſt fermè nihil: *Betweene a Biſhop, and a Prieſte* in a manner there is no difference. S. Hierome **ſaithe, ſommewhat in rougher ſorte,** Audio, quendam in tantam erupiſſe vecordiam, vt Diaconos Presbyteris, id eſt, Epiſcopis anteferret: Cùm Apoſtolus perſpicuè doceat, eoſdem eſſe Presbyteros, quos Epiſcopos: *I heare ſaie, there is One becomme ſo peeuiſhe, that he ſetteth Deacons before* Prieſtes, that is to ſaie, before Biſhoppes: *where as the Apoſtle plainely teacheth vs*, that Prieſtes, and Biſhoppes be al one.

Chryſoſ. in 1. Timoth. Homil. 11. Hieronym. ad Euagrium.

S. Auguſtine **ſaithe**, Quid eſt Epiſcopus, niſi Primus Presbyter, hoc eſt, Summus Sacerdos? *What is a Biſhop, but the Firſte Prieſte, that is to ſaie, the Higheſt Prieſte?* **So** ſaithe S. Ambroſe, Epiſcopi, & Presbyteri vna Ordinatio eſt: Vterque enim Sacerdos eſt. Sed Epiſcopus Primus eſt: *There is but* one Conſecration *of Prieſte, and Biſhop: For bothe of them are Prieſtes. But the Biſhop is the Firſte.*

Auguſt. in quæſtionib. Noui & Veter. Teſtamen. Quæſt. 101. Ambroſ. De Dignitate Sacerdotali.

Al theſe, and Other moe Holy Fathers togeather with S. Paule **the Apoſtle, for thys ſaieinge, by M. Hardinges aduiſe, muſte be holden for Heretiques.**

But S. Paule **ſaithe to the** Corinthians, Cætera, cùm venero, diſponam: *For the reſte, I wil take order, when I comme.* **And** S. Iohn **ſaithe**, *I wil not write by Paper, and Inke:*

1. Corinth. 7. Iohan. 2.

Inke: but I trust, to be with you mee selfe, and to speake vnto you. Upon these fewe wordes, M. Hardinge is able to builde vp his Dumi Communion, his Priuate Masse, & what so euer he listeth besides.

S. Augustine saithe, Omnes insipientissimi Hæretici, qui se Christianos vocari volunt, audacias figmentorum suorum, quas maximè exhorret sensus humanus, hac occasione Euangelicæ sententiæ colorare conantur, vbi Dominus ait, Adhuc multa vobis habeo dicere: Sed ea non potestis portare modò: *All the moste pernitious Heretiques, that faine woulde be called Christians, goe about to colour the bolde Vanities of theire Inuentions, whiche the very sense, and reason of Man doothe moste abhorre,* with the pretense of this saieinge in the Gospel, *where as our Lorde saith thus: I haue* many thinges *to saie vnto you: but as nowe* yee are not able to beare them.

Augu. in Iohan. Tractat. 97.

Euen so saithe Tertullian, Eadem dementia confitentur, Apostolos quidem nihil ignorasse, nec diuersa inter se prædicasse. Sed non omnia volunt illos omnibus reuelasse: Sed quædam Palàm, & Vniuersis: quædam Secretò, & Paucis demandasse: *By a like kinde of Madnesse they confesse, that the Apostles in deede were ignorante of nothinge: nor taughte any contrarie Doctrine emonge them selues. But they saie, The Apostles reueled not al thinges to al menne: but shewed certaine thinges* openly, and to al: *and other certaine thinges* secretely, and vnto a fewe.

Tertull. de Præscription. Contra Hæreticos.

By suche righte helde sommetime the greate Heretique Arius. For euen so saide he then, as M. Hardinge saithe nowe. Ex Electis Dei secundum Fidem, Peritis Dei, Rectigradis, qui Sanctum Dei Spiritum acceperunt, ego ita didici: *These thinges haue I learned* (not of the Scriptures, but) *of the chosen of God, accordinge to Faithe: of the skilful in Godly vnderstandinge: of them, that walkte vprightly, and had receiued the Sprite of God:* that is to saie, by Tradition.

Athanas. Contra Arian. Oratione. 2.

So Epiphanius saithe, The Heretiques called Caiani, auouched al theire folies, and Heresies, not by the Scriptures, but by Tradition, as they saide, from S. Paule: and toke vpon them, to knowe al those Secrete wordes, that S. Paule had hearde in the Thirde Heauen.

Epiphan. Lib. 1. Hæres. 38.

If M. Hardinge maie haue leaue, to handle the same weapons, I doubt not, but he wil sone be able to proue, that both his Holy Breade, and his Holy VVater, and, what so euer shal please him els, came by Tradition directely from the Apostles of Christe, and from Christe him selfe.

But S. Paule, when he saide, *I wil comme, and take Order,* he meante not to diuise any other Scripture, or newe Verities, that they had not knowen before: but onely to appointe them, in what place, at what time, in what Order, and with what other Circumstances, the Holy Ministration, and other like Ecclesiastical Offices shoulde be vsed.

1. Corinth. 11.

As for theise fantasies, that M. Hardinge, and his felowes haue imagined, S. Augustine saith, Ista, cùm Christus ipse tacuerit, quis nostrum dicat, Ista, vel illa sunt? Aut, si dicere audeat, vndè probat? Quis enim est tam vanus, aut tam temerarius, qui, cùm dixerit etiam vera, quibus voluerit, quæ voluerit, sine vllo Testimonio Diuino, affirmat ea esse, quæ tunc Dominus dicere noluit: *For as muche as* Christe *him self hath not reueled these thinges, whiche of vs, wil saie, they be these, or these? Or if he so saie,* howe can he proue it? *For who is there, either so vaine, or so rashe, who, notwithstandinge he speake the Truthe, to whom he listeth, and what he listeth, wil affirme* without any Testimonie of the Scriptures, *that these be the thinges,* that the Lorde then woulde not Open?

Aug. in Iohan. Tractat. 96.

But the thinges they be, that, as S. Hierome saithe, *Are cutte of with the Swerde* (that is to saie, with the Worde) *of God.*

Hieronym. in Aggæum. cap. 1.

M. Hardinge saithe, These expresse VVoordes, *Persona, Ingenitus, Homousios,* are not founde in the Scriptures. So saide the Arian Heretiques to, as wel, as he. But what forceth that? Epiphanius saithe, Nomen Substantiæ non ponitur nudè, nec in Veteri, nec in Nouo Testamento: Sensus autem eius Nominis vbique est: *This very woorde,* Substantia, *is not plainely expressed, neither in the Newe, nor in the Olde Testamente:* But the sense, and meaninge of that VVoorde is euery where.

Epiphan. Lib. 3. Hæres. 73. ὁ δὲ τῆς πανταχοῦ.

So saith Athanasius, tametsi hę voces in Scriptura non reperiuntur, tamen habent eam

Athanas. Tom. 2 Quòd Decreta Nicenæ Synodi commodu. & Pijs verbis sint exposita.

eam Sententiam, quam Scripturæ volunt: *Notwithſtandinge theſe woordes be not found expreſſed in the Scripture, yet haue they the* ſame ſenſe and meaning, *that the Scripture willeth.*

Touchinge the Perpetual Virginitie of that Bleſſed Virgine, the Mother of Chriſte, whiche M. Hardinge ſaithe, cannot be proued by any Scriptures, Gennadius writeth thus, Heluidij prauitatem arguens Hieronymus, Libellum Documentis Scripturarum Sufficienter factum aduerſus eum edidit: S. Hierome *reprouinge the wilful lewdneſſe of the Heretique* Heluidius (denieinge the Perpetual Virginitie of Chriſtes Mother) *ſette foorthe a Booke againſte him, furniſhed* with ſufficiente Teſtimonies of the Scriptures. Gennadius ſaithe, the Perpetual Virginitie of our Lady is proued ſufficiently by the Scriptures: M. Hardinge onely to mainteine his quarrel, ſaithe: It can not be proued by any Scriptures: but ſtandeth onely by Tradition. *Gennadius in Catalogo Illuſtri. Virorum.*

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ M. Hardinge. This is a lowdie lie. Trie it out who wil. Gennadius ſaithe not ſo: but onely, that S. Hieromes Booke, whiche he wrote againſt Heluidius, affirminge, that our Lady bare Children after ſhee had borne Chriſt, was ſufficiently fourniſhed with Teſtimonies of the Scriptures. M. Har. *fo.* 327. *b*

The Anſweare. O, M. Hardinge, why ſhoulde there be ſo mutche folie in one man? Thus ſtandeth the caſe: Heluidius the Heretique ſaide, *That our Lady had other Children by* Ioſeph *her Husbande beſide* Chriſte, and ſo denied hir Perpetual Virginitie. Againſte this Hereſie S. Hierome wrote a Boke, and, as Gennadius ſaithe, *Furniſhed the ſame ſufficiently with many Teſtimonies of the Scriptures, to proue, that our Lady continewed ſtil a pure Virgine.* For what thing els ſhoulde he proue? And what is this els, but the ſame, that I ſaie, that the Perpetual Virginitie of our Lady, by reporte of *Gennadius*, is proued ſufficiently by the Scriptures? The woordes of Gennadius are theſe, Libellum Teſtimonijs Scripturarum ſufficienter factum. Therefore, M. Hardinge, for humanities ſake, ſpare this vnmanly vpbraidinge of Lewde lies, and beſtowe them rather emonge your fellowes. ☞

S. Hierome him ſelfe in ſo vaine a contention, moued by an Heretique, thought it ſufficiente to anſweare thus: Mariam nupſiſſe poſt partum non credimus: quia non legimus: *Wee beleeue not, that* Marie *was Married againe after her Childbearinge:* bicauſe wee reade it not. *Hierony. Contra Heluidium.*

Here M. Hardinge thinketh to oppreſſe vs with the Olde Heretiques Ordinarie queſtion: Howe knowe you (ſaithe he) that the Scripiures be the Scriptures? Howe knowe you, that the Goſpel of Thomas, Barthelomewe, and Nicodeme, are no Scriptures? Thus they labour to pulle al credite from the Worde of God, and ſende vs onely to theire Traditions. Of God, and his Worde, they woulde euermore haue vs to ſtande in doubt: but of the Pope, and his Worde, they ſaie, in any wiſe wee maie not doubt. Hoſius, a ſpecial proctour of that ſide ſaithe, Quod Eccleſia docet, id eſt, Expreſſum Verbum Dei: *What ſo euer the Churche teacheth,* (he meaneth the Churche of Rome) *that is the very* Expreſſe VVoorde of God. *Hoſius. De expreſſo Verbo Dei.*

A man mighte wel demaunde the like queſtion of M. Hardinge: Howe knowe you, that the Sonne is the Sonne? Or, that the Mone is the Mone? Or, howe knowe you, that the Churche is the Churche? Or, that the Congregation of the Wicked is not the Churche?

Sutche idle queſtions the Olde Heretiques the Manichees demaunded of S. Auguſtine. But S. Auguſtine anſweared them, Si quæratis à nobis, vnde nos ſciamus, Apoſtolorum eſſe iſtas literas, breuiter vobis reſpondemus, Inde nos ſcire, vnde & vos ſcitis illas literas eſſe Manichæi: *If you demaunde of vs,* howe wee knowe, *that theſe be the Apoſtles writinges, wee make you this ſhorte anſweare, Euen ſo wee knowe, that Our writinges are of the Apoſtles, as you knowe, that your writinges are of the Heretique* Manichee. *Auguſt. Contra Fauſt. li. 32. ca. 21*

But for further anſweare, I recken, M. Hardinge cannot be ignorant, that the Goſpelles of Thomas, Bartholomewe, Nicodeme, and ſutche others, were neuer written by them, whoes names they beare: but were wickedly, and falſely counterfeited vnder theire names, by ſundrie Heretiques.

S. Ambroſe ſaithe, Erant Pſeudoprophetæ, &c. Erat autem populi gratia diſcernere Spiritus: vt cognoſceret, quos referre deberet in numerum Prophetarum: quos autem, quaſi bonus Nummularius, reprobare. Sic & nunc in Nouo Teſtamento, *Euſeb. Li. 3. ca. 25 Ambro. in Lucã, in Proœmio.*

multi Euangelia ſcribere conati ſunt: quæ boni Nummularij non probauerunt: *There were Falſe Prophetes, &c. But the* people had a Grace geeuen them, to diſcerne Sprites, *and to iudge, Whome they ſhoulde receiue into the number of the Prophetes: and whome, as ſkilful exchangers, they ſhould refuſe. Euen ſo nowe in the time of the Newe Teſtamente,* Many haue taken in hande to VVrite Goſpelles: *But the ſkilful exchangers, and triers of Coines haue not allowed them.*

Auguſt. contra Fauſt. li 22. ca. 80

So ſaithe S. Auguſtine: Manichæi legunt Scripturas Apocryphas, neſcio à quibus Sutoribus Fabularum, ſub nomine Apoſtolorum Scriptas: *The* Manichees *reade* Secrete Hidden Scriptures, *Written, I knowe not by What* Cobblers of Fables, vnder the name of the Apoſtles.

Euſeb. li. 6. Ca 12

So ſaithe Euſebius **of the Goſpel counterfeited vnder the name of** S. Peter: Nos Petrum, & reliquos Apoſtolos, ſicut Chriſtum recipimus. Sed Pſeudopigrapha reijcimus: Veluti gnari eorum ſenſus, & ſententiæ: Scientes, quòd talia non recipimus tradita ab Apoſtolis: *Wee receiue* Peter, *and the reſte of the Apoſtles, as Wee Woulde receiue* Chriſte *him ſelfe.* But Countrefeite VVritinges (**vnder theire names**) *wee refuſe vtterly: as hauinge vnderſtandinge of theire ſenſe, and meaninge: knowinge wel, that Wee haue receiued no ſutche thinges deliuered by the Apoſtles.*

ὃ παραλάβομεν.

Thus had the Churche of God the Spyite of Wiſedome, whereby to diſcerne the True Scriptures from the Falſe.

Diſt. 4 In iſtis.

Yet maie wee not geather hereof, that the Authozitie of the Churche is ouer, and aboue the Scriptures. S. Auguſtine **ſaithe,** In iſtis temporalibus Legibus, quamuis de illis homines iudicent, cùm eas inſtituunt, tamen cùm fuerint inſtitutæ, & firmatæ, non licebit Iudici, de illis iudicare, ſed ſecundum eas: *In theſe Temporal, or Worldly Lawes, although menne be Iudges ouer them, While they be a makinge, yet after the ſame Lawes be once made, and eſtabliſhed, it is no lenger lawful for the Iudge* to Iudge of them: *Onely it is lawful,* to Iudge by them.

Auguſt. Confeſ. Lib. 13. Cap. 23.

Likewiſe againe he ſaithe, Spirituales, ſiue qui præſunt, ſiue qui obtemperant, Spiritualiter iudicant: non de cognitionibus Spiritualibus, quæ lucent in Firmamento (id eſt, de Scripturis): Non enim oportet de tam ſublimi Authoritate iudicare, &c. Homo enim, licet Spiritualis, factor tamen Legis eſſe debet, non Iudex. De illis dicitur Iudicare, in quibus poteſtatem habet corrigendi: *Menne Spiritual, whether they rule, or be ruled, Iudge accordinge to the Sprite. But they Iudge not of the Spiritual knowledge that ſhineth in the Firmamente (that is to ſaie, of the Scriptures): For it is not lawful* for any man to be Iudge ouer ſo high Authoritie. *For be the man neuer ſo mutche Spiritual, yet muſte he be a* Dooer, and not a Iudge of the Lawe. *There a Man is ſaide to be a Iudge, where he hathe Power, and Authoritie to correcte.*

The Apologie, Cap. 10. Diuiſion. 1.

Moreouer wee allowe the Sacramentes of the Churche, that is to ſaie, certaine Holy Signes, and Ceremonies whiche Chriſte would wee ſhoulde vſe, that by them he mighte ſette before our eies, the Myſteries of oure Saluation, and mighte more ſtrongely confirme the Faithe, whiche wee haue in his Bloude, and mighte ſeale his Grace in oure hartes. And theſe Sacramentes, togeather with Tertullian, Origene, Ambroſe, Auguſtine, Hierome, Chryſoſtome, Baſile, Dionyſius, **and other Catholike Fathers, wee doo calle** Figures, Signes, Markes, Badges, Printes, Copies, Fourmes, Seales, Signettes, Similitudes, Paternes, Repreſentations, Remembraunces, and Memories **And wee make no doubte, togeather with the ſame Doctoures, to ſaie, that theſe be certaine** Viſible vvoordes, Seales of Righteouſnes, and Tokens of Grace.

M. Hardinge.

M. Hardinge.

VVith what face, saie ye, that ye allowe the Sacramentes of the Churche? (a) Haue ye not abandoned almoste al the Sacramentes of the Churche? Retaine ye any moe by name of the Sacramentes then twoo, Baptisme, and your Supper of the Lorde? Of whiche the one, after that Doctrine, as it is by you taught, and ministred, auaileth nothinge, but to your further condemnation.

(a) Vntruth. For the things, that wee haue leaſt, were not the Sacramentes of the Churche.

The soūde and true Doctrine of the Sacramentes. Seuen Sacramentes. Sacrament what it signifieth. Definition of a Sacramente.

The soūde, and true Doctrine, whiche the Catholike Churche holdeth, and beleeueth touchinge this pointe, is this: There be seuen Sacramentes, in whiche, vnder coouer of visible thinges, the (b) Power of God worketh mannes healthe. They be these: Baptisme, Confirmation, the Sacramente of the Aulter, Penaunce, extreme Vnction, Order, VVedlocke. And these so we cal Sacramentes, as neuertheleſſe we acknowledge the name of Sacramente maie be extended to many other thinges. That it be knowen what a Sacramente is, this woorde Sacramente signifieth sommetime a holy thinge, sommetime the signe of a holy thinge instituted by God. As it is taksn for a signe only, so is it founde generally, not onely in the Newe Lawe, but also in the Olde Lawe. But in the Newe Lawe these Signes after a Peculiar, and special manner be called Sacramentes, whiche doo not onely signifie a holy thinge, but also doo sanctifie and make holy those, to whome they be adhibited, beinge sutche as by institution of Christe conteine grace in them, and Power to sanctifie. VVhereof a Sacramente is by the beste learned Diuines defined to be a visible signe of inuisible Grace, so as it beare the image of it, (c) and be cause of the same. For the plaine vnderstandinge of this Definition, howe a Sacramente beareth the forme, signe, or image of inuisible grace, it appeareth euidently in Baptisme, where washinge of the body sheweth the clensinge of the soule. Also in the Sacrament of the Aulter, (d) where the formes of Breade and VVine outwardly presente the spiritual nourishinge of the soule. The like appeareth in other Sacramentes.

(b) Vntruth. As shal appeare.

(c) Vntruth. For they are onely certaine late Scholastical Sophisters.

(d) Vntruthe, Vaine and childishe. For no Learned Father euer saide so.

Neither is it a Newe, and straunge Doctrine to saie, that the Sacramentes of the Cosspel conteine grace in them, for the Fathers teache the same not seldome. Chrysostome expoundinge the Mysterie of the Poole called Bethesda in Hebrewe, that was in Ierusalem, saithe, that, sicke folke were healed at the mouinge of the VVater, to the intente, menne mighte be brought to vnderstande the vertue of Baptisme, For then was it comminge to passe (saithe he) that Baptisme should be ful of power and grace. S. Ambrose in his booke *de Sacramentis*, speakinge of Baptisme, saith, it is not euery water that healeth, but that water healeth, whiche hathe the Grace of Christe. Cyrillus vpon the foresaide Chapter of S. Iohn saithe, that in Baptisme it is not VVater simply, that woorketh, but when as it hathe receiued the grace of the Holy Ghoste. S. Augustine in a Sermon saithe, that VVater in Baptisme is enriched with a more gifte in manner, then was the Virgine Marie. For shee (saithe he) deserued Chastitie to her selfe, this hathe geeuen to vs Sanctification: Shee deserued that Shee sinned not, this that it might purge sinnes. It is saide vniuersally by S. Cyprian of al the Sacramentes, that the satte of Goddes anointinge powreth fulnesse of Grace into the ministerial sanctification, whereby he meaneth the Sacramentes. Yet wee meane, that they conteine grace, and power to sanctifie, after sutche maner of speakinge, as wee saie of Potions, and drinkes, prepared for sicke Persons, that they conteine healthe, to the woorkinge whereof they be effectual.

Cap. 5.

Sermone Dominicæ infra octauas Epiphaniæ.

In sermone de Baptismo Christi.

And as it is saide of the Sacramentes, that they conteine grace, so is it likewise said, that through their vertue, whiche they haue by Goddes institution, they doo not onely signifie (as by these Defenders Doctrine that seemeth to be their special office) but also with signification (e) woorke and cause, as an instrumental cause, the effecte of that, whiche they signifie.

(e) Vntruth. See the Answeare.

Power geeuē to Sacramentes to worke that they signifie by Gods ordinance.

After whiche manner, Cod hathe geeuen to the Sacramentes of the Newe Testamente, that they woorke the thinge signified, throughe vertue geeuen them by Goddes ordinance, to special effectes of Grace.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Of the number of the Sacramentes, wee shal haue more conuenient time to speake hereafter. There, gentle Reader, I truste, thou shalt see M. Hardinges great question easily answeared, with what face wee saie, wee allowe the Sacramentes of the Churche. In the meane season, it maie please thee, to weighe these woordes of Cardinal Bessarion, the Bishop of Tusculum, one of M. Hardinges especial Catholique Doctours: Hæc Duo Sala Sacramenta in Euangelijs manifestè tradita legimus: These Onely Twoo Sacramentes *wee reade to be deliuered vs plainely in the Gospel.* **Here** Bessarion **nameth, not Seuen Sacramentes, as M. Hardinge doth, but Onely Twoo. Certainely wee refuse no Sacramente that euer was either ordeined by Christe, or vsed and practised by the Apostles.**

Bessarion. De Sacramen. Eucharistiæ.

Your Lordes Supper (**saithe M. Hardinge**) auaileth you nothinge, but to your further Condemnation. **So muste it needes be, because M. Hardinge saithe, it shal so be. These Tragical terrours are fit onely to frate Children: In the Date of the Lorde eche Mannes worke shal appeare. The simplest of oure people vnderstandeth the Nature, and Meaninge of the Holy Mysterie of Our** Lordes Supper: **And therefore they receiue the same togeather to theire greate consolation. But in Your** Lady Masse, **the simple people vnderstandeth nothinge, heareth nothinge, and, sauinge**

a fewe vnfæmely Ceremonies, ſeeth nothing. And therefore they ſo ſeldome Communicate, and that onely of cuſtome, without any zele, or comforte of Conſcience, as hauinge no ſenſe, or fælinge in al theſe dоinges. Origen ſaithe, Niſi Circumciſionis reddatur ratio, nutus eſt, & Opus mutum. Paſcha, & aliæ Solennitates nutus magis ſunt, quàm Veritas, vſque hodie Populus Iſrael ſurdus, & mutus eſt : *Onleſſe the reaſons, or cauſes of Circumciſion be opened, Circumciſion is but a* geſture, *and a* doumbe kinde of woorke. *The Eaſter Feaſte, and other like Solemnities, are rather* Ceremonies *then the* Truthe *it ſelfe. Euen ſtil vntil this daie, the people of* Iſrael *is deafe, and doumbe.* S. Ambroſe ſaithe, Indignus eſt Domino, qui aliter Myſterium celebrat, quàm à Chriſto traditum eſt . Non enim poteſt deuotus eſſe, qui aliter præſumit, quàm datum eſt ab Authore : *He is vnworthy of the Lorde, that* Miniſtreth *this Sacramente* otherwiſe, *then* Chriſt *deliuered it. For he cannot be deuoute, that* preſumeth *to vſe it* otherwiſe, *then it was firſte deliuered from* Chriſte *the Authoure.*

Origen. in Lucam Homil. 5.

Ambroſ. in 1. Cor. 11.

Theſe woordes ſæme ſomme what to touche M. Hardinge, and his Companie. But here he is contented, to allowe vs the very Sacramente, and true vſe of Baptiſme, and that vailable, and of force for the Remiſſion of Sinnes. Whereby vnadviſedly, and vnwares he confeſſeth, that wæ haue the very true Catholique Church of God. For S. Auguſtine ſaithe truely, Baptiſmus Eccleſiæ poteſt eſſe extra Eccleſiam : munus autem beatæ Vitæ non niſi intra Eccleſiam inuenitur : *The Baptiſme of the Churche maie be without the Churche : but the gifte of bleſſed Life, is not founde but* within the Churche. But why he alloweth vs this Sacramente, rather then the other, it were a harde mater to diſcuſſe. Neither maie we iuſtly require reaſon of him, that ſpeaketh ſo mutche without reaſon.

De Con. Diſt. 4 Eccleſia.

Perhappes he wil ſaie, Baptiſme is but a lighte Sacramente, and maie be Miniſtred by any Laie Perſon, euen by an olde Woman, or by a girle, ſo that ſhæ ſpeake Latine, and vnderſtande not what ſhæ ſaie. For otherwiſe, I trowe, her dоinge maie not ſtande for good. Certainely, whereas M. Hardinge ſpeaketh of the deiwe Fourme of Woordes, accordinge to Chriſtes Inſtitution, his owne Doctours telle vs, and auouche it for greate Truthe, that if the Prieſte ſaie thus, Ego te Baptizo in nomine Patris, & Filij, & Spiritus Sancti & Diaboli: That is, *I Baptize thee in the name of the Father, and of the Sonne, and of the Holy Ghoſte*, and of the Diuel: Or if he ſaie thus, as one ignorant Prieſte ſometime ſaide, Ego te Baptizo in nomine Patria, & Filia, & Spirita Sancta, yet the Fourme of Baptiſme is very good.

De Conſe. Diſt. 4 Si non.

De Conſe. Diſt. 4 Retulerunt.

But one greate faulte M. Hardinge findeth in our dоings, for that wæ haue leaſt out a great many Holy Rites, his Chriſme, his Oile, his Salte, his Spittle, and ſuche other like thinges : and, for that wæ miniſter this Sacrament plainely and ſimplie, as Chriſte commaunded. This obiection being of no greater weight, maie eaſily diſcharge it ſelfe, and therefore maie paſſe wel without farther anſweare.

M. Hardinge ſaithe, There be Seuen Sacramentes, whiche (as he ſaithe) doo not onely ſignifie a holy thinge, but alſo doo ſanctifie and make Holy thoſe, to whome they be adhibited, beinge ſuch as by inſtitution of Chriſt conteine Grace in them, and Power to ſanctifie. Here to leaue the reaſte, it mighte be demaunded, howe can Matrimonie Sanctifie a Man, and make him Holy : or, by what Inſtitution of Chriſte conteineth it Grace in it ſelfe, and Power to Sanctifie ? Or if it cannot Sanctifie, nor haue ſuche Grace, howe then can it be called a Sacramente ?

I graunt, the Ancient Learned Fathers, entreatinge of the Sacramentes, haue often vſed vehemente, and greate woordes. It is written in the Councel of Nice, Vides Aquam? Conſidera Vim Diuinam, quæ in Aquis latet. Puta, Aquam eſſe plenam Ignis Diuini: *Seeſt thou the Water? Conſider the* Diuine power that lieth Hidde *in the Water. Imagine, that the Water is* ful of Heauenly Fiere. So S. Ambroſe, Spiritus Sanctus deſcendit, & Aquam conſecrat. Adeſt Præſentia Trinitatis: *The Holy Ghoſte commeth downe, and haloweth the Water. There is the* Preſence of the Trinitie. So ſaithe Tertullian, In Baptiſmo tingimur Paſſione Chriſti : *In Baptiſme wee are* waſſhed with the Paſſion of Chriſte. So ſaithe Chryſoſtome, as M. Hardinge hathe here alleged him, *Baptiſme* is ful of Power, and Grace: So ſaithe S. Cyprian: ſo ſaie others.

Concil. Niceen.

Ambroſ. De Sacramen. Lib 2. Cap. 5.

Tertul. De Baptiſmo.

All theſe

To Conteine Grace.

All theſe, and other like vehement ſpeaches M. Hardinge mitigateth, and qualifieth in this wiſe: VVee meane (ſaithe he) that Sacramentes conteine Grace, after ſuche maner of ſpeakinge, as wee ſaie, Potions, and drinkes conteine healthe. That is to ſaie, Sacramentes verily, and in dede conteine not the Grace of God. For Drinkes, and Potions verily, and in dede conteine not the healthe of the Patiente. In this manner of ſpeache the Children of the Prophetes ſaide to Elizæus the Prophete, Mors in olla, Vir Dei: *O thou man of God, Deathe is in the Potte.* So Salomon ſaithe, *Deathe, and Life are in the handes of the tongue.* So Chriſte ſaide vnto the Phariſeis, *Searche the Scriptures: for in them you thinke to haue euerlaſtinge Life.* And yet in dede, neither was Deathe in the Prophetes Potte: nor is Life, and Deathe in the tongue: nor is Life Euerlaſtinge in the Scriptures. Therefore one of M. Hardinges Schole Doctours ſaithe, In Sacramentis Eccleſiæ ſpecialis Virtus Paſsionis Chriſti continetur, ſicut Virtus agentis in inſtrumento: *The ſpecial Grace of the Paſsion of* Chriſte, is conteined in the Sacramentes *of the Churche, as the Power of the woorker is conteined in the inſtrument, wherewith he woorketh.*

4. *Reg.* 4. *Prouerb.* 18. Iohan 5.

Iohan de Pariſijs. De Poteſtate Regia. Cap. 2.

But in dede, it is the Soule of man, and not the Creature of Breade, or Water, that receiueth the Grace of God. We haue nede of Gods Grace: Theſe corruptible Elementes nede it not. Without Faithe of our parte, Sacramentes be not onely vnprofitable to vs, but alſo hurtful. S. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Vbi eſt Virtus Euangelij? In Figuris literarum, an intellectu ſenſuum? *Where is the* Power of the Goſpel? In the Fourmes of the letters, *or els in the vnderſtandinge of the meaninge?*

Chryſoſt. in Matth. Operis Imperfect. Hom. 43

Likewiſe Bonauentura ſaithe, Nullo modo dicendum eſt, quòd Gratia continetur in ipſis Sacramentis eſſentialiter, tanquam Aqua in Vaſe, vel Medicina in Pixide. Imò hoc intelligere, eſt erroneum. Sed dicuntur continere Gratiam, quia eam ſignificant: *Wee maie not in any wiſe ſaie, that the* Grace of God is conteined ſubſtantially, *and verily in the Sacramentes, as Water is conteined in the Veſſel, or a Medicine in the Boxe. For ſo to ſaie, it were erroneous. But wee ſaie, the* Sacramentes conteine the Grace of God: bicauſe they ſignifie the Grace of God. Againe he ſaithe, Gratia eſt in anima, non in Signis viſibilibus: *The Grace of God is, not* in the viſible Signes, *but in* the Soule. And againe he ſaithe, Ad illud, quod obijcitur, quòd Remiſsio Peccatorum Latet in Baptiſmo, dicendum eſt, quòd hoc intelligitur de Latentia Signati in Signo: quod quidem habet vlteriorem rationem, quàm rationem Significandi: Non tamen eſſentialiter continendi in ſe: ſed quia ipſum, quod Signat, continetur in anima: *To the Obiection, that is made, that the Remiſsion of Sinnes is* Hidde in Baptiſme, *wee muſte anſweare thus: that it muſte be taken of the* thinge Signified hidde in the Signe. *Whiche thinge neuertheleſſe hathe a farther meaninge, then to Signifie: yet not to conteine* (the Remiſsion of Sinnes) *verily, and Subſtantially in it ſelfe: but that the Grace, that is Signified thereby,* is conteined in the Soule.

Bonauentura in 4. *Sen. diſt.* 1. *qu.* 3

The Myſtical ſignification, that M. Hardinge hathe imagined, of his Shewes, and Accidentes, that is, that the Fourmes of Breade, and Wine outwardely repreſente the Spiritual nouriſhinge of the Soule, is vaine, and fantaſtical, without the witneſſe of any Ancient Doctoure, or Father, confirmed onely by the Authoritie of him ſelfe. For what manner of Fedinge is there in theſe Accidentes, and Holy Fourmes? Or, howe can that thinge, that fedeth not the Body, repreſente vnto vs the Spiritual fedinge of the Soule?

The mater is plaine ynough of it ſelfe, and nedeth no cauſl. The Signification, and Subſtance of the Sacramente is to ſhewe vs, howe wee are fedde with the Body of Chriſte: that is, that like as Material Breade fedeth our Body, ſo the Body of Chriſt nailed on the Croſſe, embraced, and eaten by Faithe, fedeth the Soule. The like Repreſentation is alſo made in the Sacramente of Baptiſme: That, as our Body is waſhed cleane with Water, ſo our ſoule is waſhed cleane with Chriſtes Blonde. Therefore, S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Niſi Sacramenta ſimilitudinem quandam earum rerum, quarum Sacramenta ſunt, haberent, omninò Sacramenta non eſſent: *If Sacramentes had not* a certaine likeneſſe, and repreſentation *of the thinges, whereof they be Sacramentes, then in deede they were* no Sacramentes.

Auguſt. Epiſt. 23.

This Representation Rabanus Maurus **expoundeth thus,** Quia Panis Corporis cor confirmat, ideo ille congruenter Corpus Christi nuncupatur: Et, quia Vinum Sanguinem operatur in Carne, ideo refertur ad Sanguinem: *Bicause* (**not the** Accidentes, **or** Fourmes **of Breade, but**) Breade it selfe confirmeth the harte of the Body, *therefore it is conueniently called the Body of* Christe: *And, bicause Wine woorketh Bloude in the Fleashe, therefore it hathe relation vnto the Bloude.*

Rabanus Lib. 1. Cap 31.

So likewise saithe Druthmarus, Vinum lætificat, & Sanguinem auget, & ideo non inconuenienter Sanguis Christi per hoc figuratur: (**not the** Accidentes: **or** Fourmes **of Wine, but**) VVine *it selfe* reioiceth the harte, and increaseth Bloude, *And therefore the Bloude of* Christe *conueniently is thereby signified.*

Druthmarus in Matthæ. Cap 26.

M. Hardinge, for that he cannot vtterly denie it, the mater beinge so plaine, is therefore contented to graunte, that the Sacramente is the Figure of Christes Body. **But to helpe out, and to shifte the mater, he hath diuised suche a strange kind of** Figure, **as seldome hathe benne hearde before. Notwithstandinge the Holy Learned Fathers speake plainely, and simply, and vse no kinde of suche** Gloses. S. Hierome **saithe,** Ad Tropicam intelligentiam sermo referatur. Quando dico, Tropicam, doceo, verum non esse, quod dicitur, sed allegoriæ nubilo figuratum: *Lette that saieinge be expounded by a* Figure. *When I saie, a* Figure, *I saie the thinge that is spoken,* is not true in deede, but Figured *vnder the Clowde of an Allegorie.*

Hieron. aduersus Ruffinum.

Likewise Chrysostome **saithe,** Audisti fuisse Figuram. Ne ergo mirare, neque omnia require in typo. Neque enim typus esset, si omnia, quæ Veritati accidunt, haberentur, *Ye haue hearde, that it was* a Figure. *Therefore marueile not: and beinge* a Figure, require not al thinges to agree. *For otherwise it were no* Figure.

Chrysost. in Genesin. Homil. 35.

So likewise S. Augustine **saithe,** In principio cauendum est, ne Figuratam locutionem ad literam accipias. Ad hoc enim pertinet, quod ait Apostolus, Litera occidit. Cùm enim Figuratè dictum sic accipitur, tanquam propriè dictum sit, Carnaliter sapitur: neque vlla mors animæ congruentius appellatur: *Firste of al, thou muste take heede, that thou take not a* Figuratiue Speache accordinge to the Letter, or founde of the woordes. *For that is it, whereof* S. Paule *saithe, The Letter Killeth. For, when the thinge that is spoken vnder* a Figure, *is so taken,* as if it were plainely spoken, there is a Fleashely vnderstandinge. Neither is there any thinge that maie better be called the deathe of the Soule. **Al this, and mutche more to like pourpose, thou maiste finde in my Former Replie to M. Hardinge.**

August. De Doctrina Christiana, Lib. 3. Ca. 5.

S. Hierome saithe, *When I saie, It is a* Figure, *then I saie, it is not the Truthe:* Chrysostome **saithe,** *If it were the Truthe it selfe, it were no* Figure. S. Augustine **saith,** *Beware, thou expounde not a* Figuratiue *Speeche accordinge to the founde of the* Letter, **as if it were the Truthe in deede:** For that is the deathe of the Soule. **Thus the Holy Fathers haue taught vs, to finde a difference betweene a** Figure, **and the** Truthe **it selfe.**

Artic. 12.

An other fantasie M. Hardinge hathe founde, That the Sacramentes of the Newe Lawe, woorke the thinge it selfe, that they signifie, through Vertue (**as he saithe**) geeuen vnto them by Goddes ordinance, to special effectes of Grace. **This, as I saide, is but a fantasie. For the** Sacramentes of the Olde Lawe, and of the Newe, **in Truthe and Substance, are al one.** S. Paule **saithe,** Omnes eundem cibum comederunt: *The Fathers in the Olde Lawe, did al eate* the same meate, **That is to saie, the same** Cristе, **that we eate.** S. Hilarie **saithe,** Sub nube fuerunt, & Christo, aquam Petra præbente, potati sunt: *They were vnder the Cloude, and were* drenched with Christe, *the Rocke geeuinge them Water.* **Likewise saithe** Leo, Mysteria pro temporum ratione variata sunt: quum Fides, qua viuimus, nulla fuerit ætate diuersa: *The Sacramentes are altered accordinge to the diuersitie of the times.* But the Faithe, whereby wee liue, in al ages was euer one.

1. Cor. 10.

Hilarius in Psal. 67.

Leo de Natiuitate Domini. Serm. 3.

Likewise S. Augustine, Sacramenta illa fuerunt, in Signis diuersa: in rebus, quæ significabantur, paria: *These thinges were Sacramentes, in* the outwarde tokens, diuerse: *but in the thinges tokened,* al one with ours.

Augu. in Iohan Tract. 26.

M. Hardinge wil replie, S. Augustine **saithe,** Sacramenta Noui Testamenti dant Salutem: *The Sacramentes of the Newe Testamente geeue Saluation.* **But who can**

August. in Psalm. 73.

better

better erpounde. S. Auguſtines meaninge, then S. Auguſtine him ſelfe: He addeth immediately: Cùm ergo iam teneas promiſſa, quid quæris promittentia Saluatorem? Hoc dico, teneas promiſſa: non quòd iam acceperimus Vitam æternam, Sed quòd iam Chriſtus venerit, qui per Prophetas prænuntiabatur: *Wherefore, ſeeinge thou haſte the* Promiſſes (of the commynge of Chriſte) *already perfourmed, what ſeekeſt thou the thinges* that Promiſed the Saueour? *I ſaie, Thou haſte the Promiſſes already perfourmed: not for that we haue* already receiued *Euerlaſtinge life, but for that* Chriſte is already comme, *that was promiſed by the Prophetes.* Therefore, when S. Auguſtine ſaithe, *Oure Sacramentes geeue Saluation,* his meaninge is this, Our Sacramentes teache vs, that Saluation is already comme into the Worlde.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ M. Hardinge. So then *Dare*, is to teache: and *Salus*, is Saluation comme into the worlde, Here is gaie geare for VVantons, to Dally with woordes, in mater of oure Saluation. M. Har. fo. 330. b

The Anſweare. O what proper ſporte pe make your ſelfe with this gaie geare, M. Hardinge. *Dare* (pou ſaie) is not Latine to teache, I anſweare pon, Neither is Dare Latine to Conteine. But thus I ſaie, *Sacramentes geeue Grace ſo farre foorth, as Sacramentes be hable to geeue Grace.* Your owne Bonauentura ſaithe, Non eſt aliquo modo dicendum, &c. *Wee maie not in any wiſe ſaie, that the Grace of God is Really conteined in the Sacramentes, as Water is conteined in a Veſſel, or a Medicine in a boxe. For ſo to take it, it were an errour. But wee ſaie, Sacramentes conteine the Grace of God, bicauſe they repreſente, or ſignifie the Grace of God.* Bonauentura in 4. Sent. diſt. 1. Quæſt. 3. c. Dicuntur continere Gratiam, quia ipſam ſignificat.

Thus far ſoorthe M. Hardinge, Sacramentes are hable, to geeue Grace. And therefore your Schole Doctours thus commonly define a Sacramente, Sacramentum eſt inuiſibilis Gratiæ viſibile Signum: *A Sacramente is a viſible ſigne of Grace inuiſible.* As for the meaninge of S. Auguſtine, I made it plaine by other his woordes immediately folowinge, whiche you guilefully haue diſſembled. For thus he ſaith, *Thou haſte the promiſſes already perfourmed: not for that wee haue already receiued Euerlaſtinge Life, but for that* Chriſte *is already comme, that was promiſed by the Prophetes.* And althoughe the Deathe of Chriſte be already paſſed, yet is it laide liuely and freſhly before our eies, in the Miniſtration of the Sacramentes. S. Ambroſe ſaithe, In Baptiſmo Crucifigimus in nobis Filium Dei: *In Baptiſme wee Crucifie in our ſelues the Sonne of God.* S. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, In Myſteriis Mors Chriſti perficitur: *The Deathe of* Chriſte *is wrought in the Myſteries.* Thus, the Grace of God is geeuen vnto vs in the Sacramentes, bicauſe it is repreſented, and laide before vs in the Sacraments. Thus ſaithe S. Auguſtine, thus ſaithe S. Chryſoſtome, S. Ambroſe, and other Holy Fathers. They were no VVantons: neither did they, nor we we Dallie, as you ſaie, with theſe thinges. We vſe them humblie with obedience and reuerence, as the Inſtrumentes of the Grace of God. Ambroſ. De Pœnitent. Li. 2. Ca. 2. Chryſoſt. in Acta Homil. 21.

Thus S. Auguſtine ſaithe in an other place: Illa fuerunt Promiſsionis rerum complendarum: hæc ſunt indicia completarum: *The Sacramentes of the Olde Lawe, were Promiſſes of ſutche thinges,* as ſhoulde afterward be accompliſhed: *Our Sacramentes, of the Newe Lawe, are tokens, that the ſame Promiſſes* be already accompliſhed. Thus the Holy Fathers ſaie, *The Sacramentes of the Newe Lawe* woorke Saluation: Bicauſe they teache vs, that our Saluation is already wrought. So Bonauentura ſaithe of the Sacramentes of the Olde Teſtamente, Mundare dicebantur: id eſt, mundatum oſtendebant: *They were ſaide to make a man cleane, bicauſe* they ſhewed, or ſignified, that a man was made cleane. Auguſt. Contra Fauſt. li. 19. ca. 14. Bonauentura in 4. Sent. diſt. 1. In Prœmio.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ M. Hardinge. VVhat then? wil it folowe, that, bicauſe our Sacramentes doo ſhewe, that Chriſte is already comme, therefore our Sacramentes geeue no Grace? &c. He, that eateth Chriſtes Fleaſhe, ſheweth his Deathe, ſaithe S. Paule: And he, that eateth my Fleaſh, ſaith Chriſt, Hathe life Euerlaſtinge. Marke, howe our hauinge of life goeth togeather with our ſhewing of Chriſtes Death, you diuide theſe maters, and make Chriſtes Sacramentes only to be ſhewes. M. Har. fo 330. b

The Anſweare. You haue miſalleged S. Paule, M. Hardinge: Theiſe are not his woordes, loke better on your Bookes, and ſée your errour. If I had ſomme parte of your eloquence, I coulde crie out, as you doo, Falſifiers, and Corrupters of Gods VVoorde.

S.Paule saithe not, *He that eateth* Christes *Fleashe, sheweth his Deathe.* You deale vntruely. Thus he saithe, *As often as you shal eate this Breade, and Drinke this Cuppe, you shal shewe foorthe the Lordes Deathe.* The Breade of the Sacramente is one thinge, M. Hardinge: And the Fleashe of Christe, is an other. The Breade entreth onely into the Bodily mouthe: Christes Fleashe entreth onely into the Soule. Without eatinge of that Breade of the Sacramente, wee maie be saued: Without eatinge of Christds Fleashe we can neuer be saued. S. Augustine saithe precisely, Qui non sumit Carnem Christi, non habet vitam: & qui eam sumit, habet vitam, & eam vtique Aeternam: *He, that receiueth not the* Fleashe of Christe, *hath not life: And he, that receiueth the same, hathe Life, and that for euer.*

1 Cor. 11.

Augu. in Iohan. Tracta. 26.

Againe he saithe, *The Sacramente is receiued, of somme vnto Life, of somme vnto Destruction: But the thinge it selfe* (that is, the Fleashe of Christe) *whereof the Sacramente is a Sacramente, is receiued of al menne vnto life, and of no man to destruction, Who so euer shalbe partetaker of it.*

In eod. Tracta.

Thus you see, M. Hardinge, there is greate difference betweene the Breade of the Sacramente, and the Fleashe of Christe. Wee were to blame therefore, so to falsifie S.Paule, and to place the one in steade of the other. We diuide theise thinges, bicause God him selfe had so diuided them. But you vndiscretely mingle, and confounde theise thinges togeather, whereas in deede they shoulde be diuided: And so, yee wilfully deceiue your simple Reader.

The Apologie, Cap. 11. Diuision. 1.

And wee doo expressely pronounce, that in the Lordes Supper there is Truely geuen vnto the Beleeuinge the Body and Bloude of our Lorde, the Fleashe of the Sonne of God, vvhiche quickeneth our Soules, the Meate that commeth from aboue, the Foode of Immortalitie, of Grace, Truthe, and Life: and that the same Supper is the communion of the Body, and Bloude of Christe: by the partakinge whereof wee be reuiued, strengthened, and fedde vnto Immortalitie: and whereby wee are Ioined, United, and Incorporate vnto Chriſte, that wee maie abide in him, and he in vs.

M. Hardinge.

VVhat ye pronounce of this high Sacramente, the wise and careful tenderers of their Soules wil be right ware therof. Of you and such as ye be, bicause your Doctrine is (a) but of a corner of the worlde in respecte of the Vniuersal Churche: Christe hathe geeuen vs a watche woorde, *Nolite credere,* beleeue them not. In your the Lordes Supper, celebrated by the Ministers of youre owne creation, (b) there is not geeuen the Body and Bloude of our Lorde, neither to the beleeuinge, nor to the vnbeleeuinge. For at the celebration of your schismatical Supper, no (b) consecration beinge done, (b) nor Faithe of the Churche, (b) nor righte intention had, (b) nor Christes institution obserued, what deliuer ye to your Communicates, but (b) a peece of Breade, and a sippe of VVine? Neither is it (b) your wil it be more or better. At the Supper of our Lorde Ministred in the Catholike Churche by Priestes rightly consecrated, and as it hathe benne accustomed in Christes Churche, there is the true and whole Body of our Lorde and Saueour geuen and receiued, be the Receiuers beleeuinge, or (b) not beleeuinge. For when Christe gaue this Sacramente to his Disciples at his laste supper, after that he had consecrated the same, saieinge, take ye, eate ye, this is my Body: Iudas the traitoure, as the (c) Fathers teache, receiued his true Body nolesse then Peter, Andrewe, Iohn, or Iames did: though they to their saluation, he to his damnation.

(a) In respect of this Corner, the Churche of Rome were a simple Corner.

(b) Vntruthes, ioined with Heathenisshe blasphemies.

(c) Vntruthe, Reade the Answeare.

Matth. 24.

The Sacramentaris Lordes Supper.

Iudas receiued the true body of Christe, nolesse the th' apostles Matth. 26.

Nowe it is to be noted, howe this Defender in this longe sentence affecteth a certaine holy (as it were) and solemne eloquence, and vseth a religious amplification of woordes, to set foorthe the Sacramente, as thoughe he had a reuerente and a godly opinion of it: whereas in deede he taketh it (d) but for a poore signe or token, as their Doctour Zwinglius dooth. But such is their crafte, to purchase them credite amonge the people. Thus offer they to the vnlearned theire faire Cuppes ful of venyme, anointinge the brimmes with Hony of sweete and Holy woordes, the rather to poison them. Sutche complainte maketh the graue Father S. Hilary againste the Arians of his time *Ingerunt nobis primum nomina Veritatis, vt virus falsitatis introeat. Bonum in Ore est, vt de corde malum subeat:* Firste (saithe he) they thrust me foorthe woordes of Truth, that the venym of falsched maie enter in. Good is in their mouthe, that out from the harte maie euil procede. And among al theise woordes (he meaneth the Arians confession of their Faith) I heare no where by them saide,

Chryſost. Homil. de Prodicione Iudæ.

Augustin. in Psal. 10.

De Trinit. Lib. 6.

(d) Vntruth. For we cal the Signe the Signe: and the Truthe, the Truthe.

saide, *Deum Dei Filium:* God the Sonne of God. Right so amonge al these saire woordes concerninge the Sacramente, (e) we heare neuer a whit saide of the Real presence of Christes Body. Epiphanius noteth the like crafte in Arius, and so doothe S. Augustine in the Pelagians. Nestorius likewise spake honorably in many places of Christe and his Mother. But nowhere would he cal her θεοτόκον, that is, the Mother of God. The Iewes also, as we finde in the Gospel, called our Sauiour Iesus the Carpenters sonne, confessed Marie to be his Mother, Iames, Ioseph, Simon, and Iude, his brothers, and that his sisters were amonge them (by whome his Kinnesfolke are to be vnderstanded) but the Sonne of God they woulde not acknowledge him, nor in that degree honour him. Better then to those Iewes can I not compare these Defenders, who speake honourably of our Lordes Body and Bloude in theire supper (f) but that his Body is really, that is verely, in the Sacrament of the aulter, that wil not the Diuel who raigneth in theire hartes, suffer theire mouthes to vtter.

Contra Arriomanitas Hæresi. 69. De Gratia Christi, cõtra Pelagiũ & Cœlest. l. 1. cap. 32 Matth. 13.

(e) O meruei-lous horrible Heresie: what Doctour, or Father euer named your Real Presence?

(f) Neither did any Doctour, or Father euer say, That Christes Body is Really, and Verily in the Sacrament.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

M. Hardinge telleth vs, VVe deliuer vnto the Faithful nothing els, but a peece of Breade, and a sippe of VVine: that we haue neither Intention, nor Consecration: that our faire Cuppes be ful of Venime: That our Supper is Schismatical: and our Eloquence is Hypocritical: that our Doctrine is Heretical: that we are like to the Pelagians, to the Nestorians, to the Arians, and to the Iewes: and that the Diuel raigneth in our hartes. **If the Truthe of God were euermore ioined with vaine speache, then might M. Hardinge be hable easily to winne the price. He saithe,** Our Doctrine is but in a Corner of the worlde, and that therefore Christe hath geuen this watche woorde of vs, Beleeue them not. **Howe be it, if he woulde aduisedly consider the mater, and loke wel aboute him, he shoulde finde, that so many Kingedomes, and Countries, and Common Weales, as this daie professe the Gospel of** Christe, **would make a good large Corner in the Churche of God. Certainely in respecte thereof,** Rome **it selfe were a very poore Corner.**

Unto whome Christe **specially pointed, when he saide these woordes,** Beleeue them not, **bicause it is a Prophesie, it is harde to Iudge. But it is very likely, he meante** Antichriste, *that Man of Sinne, the Childe of destruction, that auaunceth him selfe aboue al that is called God.* **Uerily** Chrysostome **thereof saithe thus:** Non dico, si dixerint vobis, Ecce in Hæreticis Ecclesijs illis, vel in illis apparuit Christus: sed etiam si in ipsis veris Ecclesijs, quæ Dei sunt, id est, domus vestræ, dixerint vobis, Christum apparuisse, nolite eis credere dicentibus ista de me: quia non est digna Diuinitatis meæ notitia hæc: Ostendens per hæc, quomodò ex ipsis Ecclesijs veris frequenter exeunt Seductores. Propterea nec ipsis omninò credendum est, nisi ea dicant, vel faciant, quæ conuenientia sint Scripturis: *If saie not, if they telle you, Beholde* Christe *hath appeared in theise, or in theise Churches of Heretiques: But if they shal saie vnto you, that* Christe *hath appeared* in the very true Churches, *that are of God, that is to saie, that are your houses, Beleeue them not, if they saie thus of me: for this is no woorthy knowledge of my Diuinitie: by these he sheweth,* how that out of the very true Churches oftentimes come foorth deceiuers. *Therefore wee maie not beleeue, no not them, onlesse they speake, or doo those thinges,* that are agreeable to the Scriptures.

2. *Thessalon.* 2. *Chrysostom. in Opere Imperfecto, Homil* 49.

Uerily, howe so euer M. Hardinge wil shifte this mater, the plaine woordes séme rather to touche him, and his companie, then either Luther, **or** Zuinglius, **or any other. For they can pointe with theire fingers, and saie,** Here is Christe, **and** There is Christe. **Beholde in this Pyxe are three** Christes: **in that fiue: in that seuen: in that moe. Therefore it is likely, that** Christe **geueth vs this special watche woorde of them, and sutche others,** Beleeue them not.

Here M. Hardinge maketh mutche ado aboute Consecration: **and yet are not his Felowes wel agreed, what to make of theire owne** Consecration. Gabriel **saithe,** Christus potuit sine verbo tanquam verus Deus, Substantiam Panis, & Vini Consecrare: Vel, potuit verba quædam secretò proferre, & per illa Consecrare: Vel, per hæc verba, Hoc est Corpus meum, Consecrare potuit: Vel, potuit priùs Consecrare, & posteà distribuere: Vel, primùm distribuere, & posteà Consecrare. Quid autem horum fecerit, ex Sacris Scripturis non constat: Christe, *as beinge very God, might Consecrate the Substance of Breade, and Wine* without woorde: *Or els, he might speake certaine woordes* in secrete, *and by them Consecrate: Or els, he might Consecrate by these woordes,* This is my Body: *Or els, he might* firste *Consecrate, and* after *deliuer: Or els,* firste *deliuer, and* after *Consecrate.* But whiche of al these he did in deede, by the Holy Scriptures

Gabriel Biel. Lectio. 26.

Scriptures it appeareth not. Cardinal Beſſarion **ſaithe, that in the Latine Churche** Conſecration **is wrought by the VVoordes of Chriſte: in the Greeke Churche by other Praiers, that folowe afterwarde.** Catharinus **intreatinge pourpoſely hereof, ſaithe,** Chriſte Conſecrated not with the ſame woordes, *that are nowe vſed in the Maſſe,* This is my Body. Durandus **ſaithe,** Chriſte *Conſecrated by his* Diuine Power, *and after Conſecration ſaide,* This is my Body. Petrus Alliacenſis **pŕoueth this reaſon hereof,** Quia, niſi antè fuiſſet Corpus Chriſti, Chriſtus non verè dixiſſet, Hoc eſt Corpus meum: *If it had not benne* Chriſtes *Body before,* Chriſte coulde not haue ſaide truely, *This is my Body.* **It is concluded in a Boke called** Antididagma, **lately ſette forthe by the Chapter of** Colaine, **that the bare Woordes of** Chriſtes **Inſtitution, without the woordes of the** Canon **of the** Maſſe, **are not ſufficient to worke** Conſecration. Bonauentura **ſaithe,** *To haue the true Fourme of* Conſecration, *wee muſte ſeeke, not to the Goſpel of* Chriſte, *but to the* Canon.

Conſecration.

Beſſarion de Sacramen. Euchariſtiæ.

Catharinus De Conſecratione.

Durandus Li. 4. De Sexta parte Canonis.

Petrus de Alliaco. in 4. Senten. Quæſt. 5.

Antididagma.

Bonauentura in 4. Senten. Diſt. 8 Quæſt. 2.

Howbeit, thereof groweth a greate inconuenience, that Chriſte, **and his Apoſtles, for that they had not the woordes of the** Canon, **had therefore no** Conſecration. **Againe** Bonauentura **ſaithe, that theſe woordes,** Noui, & Aeterni Teſtamenti, **are not of the Subſtance of** Conſecration: **but are vſed onely as a fourniture.** Iohannes Scotus **ſaithe,** Quod ergo eſt Conſilium? Dico, quòd Sacerdos intendens facere, quod facit Eccleſia, legens diſtinctè verba Canonis, à Principio vſque ad finem, verè conficit: nec eſt tutum alicui, reputare ſe valdè peritum in ſcientia ſua, & dicere, volo vti præciſè iſtis verbis pro Conſecratione: *The mater beinge ſo doubteful, what then is your Counſel? I ſaie, that the Prieſte intendinge to doo, what ſo euer the Churche doothe, and readinge the woordes of the* Canon *diſtinctly, and plainely, from the beginninge to the ende, doothe verily* Conſecrate. *Neither is it good for a man to recken him ſelfe very ſkilful in his knowledge, and to ſaie,* I wil vſe preciſely theſe, or theſe woordes, to woorke Conſecration. **Where alſo theſe woordes are ſpecially noted in the Margine,** Nota, quòd de hac materia, Doctor nihil hîc aſſerit, ſed probabiliter aliquid dicens, ſub dubio relinquit: *Here marke, that touchinge this mater* (of Conſecration) *the* Doctour auoucheth nothinge: *but ſpeakinge ſommewhat by the waie of likelyhoode,* he leaueth the whole mater vnder doubte. **In the ende** Scotus **vncertainely, and doubtefully concludeth thus:** Vnde dicunt aliqui, quòd Forma Græcorum, & Forma noſtra, & quæcunque ſcripta in Euangelijs, ſufficiens eſt ad Conſecrationem: *Whereof ſomme ſaie thus, that the* Fourme of woordes, *that the Greekes vſe, and* the Fourme that wee vſe, and any Fourme els written in the Goſpels *is ſufficient to* Conſecration. **The like certainetie** Bonauentura **teacheth vs: For thus he endeth:** De hoc eſt vtilius dubitare: Quis enim poteſt ſcire, vtrùm Euangeliſtæ, aut Apoſtolus ipſe intenderint deſcribere Formam? Igitur melius eſt, hîc piè dubitare, quàm præſumptuoſè definire: Hereof it is beſte to ſtande in doubte. *For who can tel, whether the Euangeliſtes, or the Apoſtle* Paule *him ſelfe, meante to write vs the Fourme of* Conſecration? *Therefore in this pointe it* is better, Soberly to doubte, *then preſumptuouſly to determine.*

Scotus in 4. Senten. diſt. 8. quæ. 2.

Bonauentura in 4. Senten. diſt. 8.

By theſe fewe, good Chriſtian Reader, thou maiſte ſée the grounde, & certainetie of M. Hardinges Doctrine. He ſaith, VVee haue no Conſecration, for that we lacke a Thinge: **but what Thinge it ſhould be, he, and his Felowes cannot telle.**

How be it, in déede wée vſe the ſame woordes, that Chriſte **vſed. If** Chriſte, **and his Apoſtles Conſecrated, then do wée vndoubtedly likewiſe Conſecrate. The wante, that he findeth in vs, he maie alſo finde in them.** S. Auguſtine **ſaithe,** Accedat Verbum ad Elementum, & fit Sacramentum: *Ioine the Woorde of God vnto the Eltmente* (**or outwarde Creature**) *and thereby is made a Sacrament.* Origen **ſaithe,** Panis ſanctificatur per Verbum Dei, & Obſecrationem: *The Breade is* Conſecrate *by the Woorde of God, and by Praier.* S. Ambroſe **ſaithe,** Ante Benedictionem Verborum Cœleſtium, alia ſpecies nominatur: poſt Conſecrationem, Corpus Chriſti Significatur: *Before the Bleſſinge of the Heauenly Woordes, it is called an other kinde: After* Conſecration, *the Body of Chriſte is* Signified.

Auguſt. in Iohan. tracta. 80.

Origen in Matthæ. Cap. 15.

Ambroſ. De iis qui initiantur, Cap. 9.

M. Hard. 331. b. *Addition.* ☞ **M. Hardinge.** Chriſte was a Prieſte, and Conſecrated as a Prieſte, as S. Cyprian, and S. Hierome doo witneſſe, that as Melchiſedech in foreſhewinge the Figure of Chriſte ☞ Addition

Conſe-
cration.
Intention.

Chriſte had donne, *Panem, & vinum offerens, ipſe quoque Veritatem ſui Corporis, & Sanguinis Repræſentaret:* Chriſte him ſelfe alſo ſhould make preſente the Truthe of his Body, and Bloude. Chriſte made his Apoſtles alſo Miniſterial Prieſtes, ſaieinge, Doo this (wherein is conteined, Make this) in my Remembrance.

The Anſweare. Is Repræſentare, Latine to Make preſente, M. Hardinge? What Grammarian euer taught you, ſo to ſaie? Or, what Makinge finde you in this woꝛde? As you tender your credite, telle vs, who euer ſpake ſutche Latine, oꝛ out of ſutche Latine, made ſutche Engliſhe? If you can ſhewe vs no better Authour, wee muſte nedes thinke, it is your owne. I graunte, the Olde Ciuilians haue ſommetimes vſed this woꝛde Repræſentare, in ſomme ſutche meaninge: As when they ſaie, Repræſentare legatum, Repræſentare pretium, Repræſentare pecuniam. But in this newe ſenſe, that you haue imagined, I trowe, M. Hardinge, they neuer vſed it. How be it, wee ſpeake not now of Ciuilians: wee ſpeake of Diuines. Columella ſaithe, Repræſentare faciem veri Maris: *To repreſente the ſight of the very Sea:* Curtius ſaithe, Vrbis dirutæ ſpecies Repræſentabatur animis: *The Image of the defaced Cittie was Repreſented to theire mindes:* Will you hereof conclude, that the very Sea, oꝛ the very defaced Cittie was made preſente and ſtode Really, and Verily before their eies? The ſtrangeneſſe of your dealinge, M. Hardinge, forceth mee to vſe moe woꝛdes, then might ſeeme needeful.

Columel. Li. 8.
Quint. Curtius Lib. 3.

The place of S. Hierome is plaine againſte you: Thus he ſaithe, Vt quomodo in præfiguratione eius Melchiſedech Summi Dei Sacerdos Panem, & Vinum offerens, fecerat, ipſe quoque veritatem ſui Corporis, & Sanguinis Repræſentaret: *That, as* Melchiſedech, *the Prieſte of the Higheſt God had donne, offeringe Breade, and Wine in Figure of him, euen ſo he him ſelfe ſhoulde Repreſente the Truthe of his Body, and Bloude.* As Melchiſedech by Breade, and VVine Repreſented the Truthe of Chriſtes Bodie, and Bloude, ſo did Chriſte alſo Repreſente the ſame. And if Chriſte, as you ſaie, Made it preſente, then did Melchiſedech alſo, by S. Hieromes iudgemente, Make it preſente. But, when wee ſpeake of Sacramentes, Repreſentinge is nothinge els, but Sheweinge, oꝛ Signifieinge. So Tertullian ſaithe, Chriſtus non reprobauit Panem, quo ipſum Corpus ſuum Repræſentauit: Chriſte *refuſed not Breade, by whiche he Repreſented his very Body.* Whiche woꝛdes afterwardes in plainer ſoꝛte he expoundeth thus: Chriſtus accepit Panem, & Corpus ſuum illum fecit, dicendo, Hoc eſt Corpus meum, hoc eſt, Figura Corporis mei: Chriſte *tooke the Breade, and made it his Body, ſaieinge, This is my Body, that is to ſaie, This is a Figure of my Body.*

Hieronym. in Matthæ. Ca. 26.
Tertul. Contra Marcion. Lib. 1.
Tertul. Contra Marcion. Lib. 4.

But that, Repræſentare, ſhoulde ſignifie, either to make Chriſtes Body, oꝛ to Make it preſente, noman, I trowe, euer durſte to ſaie it, but M. Hardinge.

In theiſe woordes, Doo this, you ſaie, is conteined, Make this. Dothe Chriſte bid you, to Make this in deede, M. Hardinge? And what, This, I praie you, woulde you Make? We will ſaie, Chriſtes Body. But Chriſtes Body, as wee beleeue, is Made already, and needeth no Newe Makinge at your handes. But you will ſaie, Yee Make Chriſte in Remembrance of Chriſte: All this is mere folie. For euery waie pertel vs, Yee make Chriſte. Preſume not, M. Hardinge, to Make him, that made you. It is ynough for your Stella Clericorum to ſaie, Qui Creauit me, dedit mihi poteſtatem Creandi ſe: Sacerdos eſt Creator Creatoris ſui: *He, that* made *mee, hath geeuen mee Power to* make *him: A Prieſte is his* Makers Maker. But God hath made Hel fiere to the deſtruction of al them, that yelde their mouthes to ſpeake ſutch blaſphemie. Chriſte neuer badde you, to make his Body, as you imagine. His woꝛdes be plaine: you haue vntruely repoꝛted them: Doo this in my Remembrance. Doo this, ſaith Chriſte: He ſaithe not, Make this. And what is meante by this, Dooinge, Who can better teache vs, then S. Paule? Thus he ſaithe, *As often, as you ſhal Eate this Breade, or Drinke this Cuppe, you ſhal publiſhe the Lordes Deathe, vntil he comme.* This is the Dooinge, that Chriſte commaunded, and this is it, that you haue to doo.

An other quarrel, that M. Hardinge piketh to vs, is this, That wee haue no Intention, or minde to Conſecrate. But howe longe hathe M. Hardinge benne a Wiſarde? Oꝛ, who made him ſo pꝛiute to our Intentions? S. Paule ſaithe, *Noman can telle,* 1. Corinth. 2.

The vvicked Receiueth.

telle, what is in Man, but the Sprite of Man, that is within him. These folies are answered at large in my Former Replie to M. Hardinge. Verily by the late Doctours of that side, the Prieste maie haue Intention, to Consecrate the one halfe of the Hoste, and not the other: Or, hauinge thirténe Hostes, he maie haue Intention, to Consecrate but twelue. And thereof groweth a greate question, when he commeth to the reckeninge, & seeth his errour, whiche of al that whole Companie of Hostes shal goe vnconsecrate. Yea Abbate Panormitane saithe, Etiamsi Sacerdos celebret, vt Deus perdat aliquem, tamen bene Consecrat: *Notwithstandinge the Prieste saie Masse, with* Intention, *that God woulde destroie somme man, yet doothe he Consecrate neuertheleſſe.* Into suche toies these menne throwe them selues, with their foule Intentions.

Articulo. 1. Diuiſion. 11. Summa Angel. Euchariſtia. 26. Gerſon in Floretum. Lib. 4. Panormitan. de Celebratione Miſſ. Quidam. Matthæ. 16. 1 Cor. 11. Pupilla Oculi, De Euchariſtia, Cap. 5.

Our Intention is, to do, that Christe hathe taught vs to do, that is, to Minister the Holy Sacramente in Remembrance of him: and as S. Paule saithe, *To shewe foorthe, and to publiſhe the Lordes Deathe, vntil he comme.* And, to this pourpose one of M. Hardinges owne Doctours saithe, Non ſufficit Intentio Conſecrandi abſolutè: Sed Oportet, vt ſit conformis Intentioni Sacramentum Inſtituentis: *Absolutely the* Intention, *to Consecrate, is not sufficient:* but it muste be answeareable vnto the Intention of Christe, that ordeined the Sacramente.

At the Supper of our Lorde (saithe M. Hardinge) ministred in the Catholique Churche, by Prieſtes rightly Consecrate, there is the true, and whole Body of Our Lorde and Saueour geuen, and receiued: be the receiuers beleeuinge, or not beleeuinge. This is no greate maruelle in M. Hardinges Doctrine. For they of his side saie, Si dicatur, quòd Mus ſumat Corpus Chriſti, non eſt magnum inconueniens: *If it be ſaide, that a* Mouse receiueth the Body of Christe, *it is no greate inconuenience.* And Alexander of Hales, a notable Schole Doctour saithe, though in more vnſeemely, and grosser wise, Si Canis, vel Porcus deglutiret Hoſtiam Conſecratam integram, non video, quare Corpus Domini non ſimul traijceretur in ventrem Canis, vel Porci: *If a Dogge, or a Sowe ſhoulde happen to ſwallowe downe the whole Hoste beinge Consecrate, I see no reaſon, but the body of our Lorde maie paſſe withal into the belly of the Dogge, or of the Sowe.*

De Conſecrat. Diſ. 2. Qui bene In Gloſſa. Alexand. Halen. Par. 4. quæ. 45. memb. 1.

But S. Augustine saithe farre otherwise, Hoc eſt manducare illam eſcam, & illum potum bibere, in Christo manere, & Christum manentem in ſe habere: *This is the* Eatinge *of that meate, and the* Drinkinge *of that Drinke, that a man dwel in* Christe, *and haue* Christe *dwellinge in him.*

Auguſt. in Ioh. Tract. 26.

Likewise Origen saithe, Eſt verus Cibus, quem nemo malus poteſt edere. Etenim ſi malus poſſet edere Corpus Domini, non ſcriberetur, Qui edit hunc Panem, viuet in æternum: *The Body of* Christe *is the True Foode, whiche no euil man can Eate. For, if the euil man coulde Eate the Body of Our Lorde, it ſhoulde not be written, He that Eateth this Breade, ſhal liue for euer.* But hereof we haue spoken more at large in the Former Replie to M. Hardinge.

Origen in Matth. Cap. 15.

Article. 23.

M. Hard. 333. b.

Addition. ☞ M. Hardinge. You haue fowly corrupted this place, M. Iewel. Origen speaketh not of the Sacramente in those woordes, nor of the Sacramental Eatinge &c. M. Iewel hath so mangled these woordes, that the sense is cleane altered. For in steede of *Verbum Caro factum*, he hath placed the Body of Christe, referringe it to the Sacramente &c. He hath changed *Edere verbum factum Carnem*, into *Edere Corpus Domini*. And so, whereas Origen meante, that euil menne cannot Eate Spiritually, and effectually the Diuinitie of Christe, M. Iewel hath taught him to saie, that an euil man cannot in the Sacramente eate Christes Body.

Addition ☞

And so M. Hardinge awaked out of his dreame.

The Answeare. Wil you leade your whole life in wranglinge, M. Hardinge? And wil you neuer learne to deale plainely? Origen (you saie) speaketh nothinge in this place of the Sacramente. I graunte you. Neither do I in this place Speake one woorde of the Sacramente. I speake onely of Christes Body, that is represented by the Sacramente: That Body (I saie) cannot be eaten by the wicked. So saithe Origene: so saie others the Learned Fathers.

As for that, you speake of manglinge the woordes, and alteringe the meaninge, it is to Childishe to be answeared. You saie, Origene meante, that the wicked man cannot Eate the Diuinitie of Christe Spiritually. Be it so. Wil you then saie, that the wicked man maie eate

eate the Diuinitie, or the Godhed of Christe Corporally, with his bodily mouthe, and with his Teethe? Is this the Diuinitie, yee haue Learned at Louaine? Season it better, M. Hardinge: It is vnsauery. Origene in this place firste speaketh of the Sacramente of Christes Body. Afterwarde he speaketh of Christes Body it selfe: And saithe, That no euil man can receiue it. And to that pourpose he allegeth the wordes of Christe in S. Iohn, *Who so eateth of this Breade, shal liue for euer*. Leaue this lightnesse, M. Hardinge. Here is neither Manglinge of woordes nor alteringe of sentence.

The Heretical Doctrine, that M. Hardinge talketh of, with al the whole furniture of Hypocritical Eloquence, wee maie safely sende home, from whence it came. And I doubte nothinge, but he can wel tel, how to vse it.

As for Pelagius, Arius, and Nestorius, wee defie them vtterly, and detest them, as wee do also al other sortes, and sectes of Heresies.

Of the Sacramentes of Christe, wee do bothe speake, and thinke reuerently, and, as it becommeth vs, and accordinge to the Holy Scriptures. Wee saie, that a Creature, is a Creature: that a Sacramente, is a Sacramente, and not God. Wee saie with S. Augustine, *The Sacramente is not our Lorde, but the Breade of our Lorde*. Againe S. Augustine saithe, In Sacramentis videndum est, non quid sint, sed quid Significent: *In Sacramentes wee muste consider*, not what they be in deede, *but* what they Signifie.

August. in Iohan. tract. 59. Contra Maximin. Cap. 22.

The Apologie, Cap. 11. Diuision. 2.

Besides this, wee acknowledge, there be twoo Sacramentes, whiche, wee iudge, properly ought to be called by this name: that is to saie, Baptisme, and the Sacramente of thankesgeuinge. For thus many we see were deliuered and sanctified by Christe, and wel allowed of the Olde Fathers, Ambrose, and Augustine, and suche others.

M. Hardinge.

The Defenders acknowlege but twoo Sacraméts.

VVhy speake ye not plainely? Be there no moe but twoo Sacramentes? Though yee saie not so expresselye, yet wee iudge, that so ye meane. For so your scholefelowe of Geneua Theodore Beza pronounceth in plaine termes in the Confession of your Geneuian Faithe. And so your selues, Defenders, doo affirme in the Articles, whiche yee agreed vpon in your Conuocation holden at London in the yeere of our Lorde. 1562. VVhiche Articles ye haue put foorthe in printe by the Queenes Authoritie, as yee pretende. Now whereas ye acknowledge there be but twoo Sacramentes, why should any man beleeue you, rather then the Germaines your firste Scholemaisters, who (a) in theire Confession exhibited to Charles the fifthe then Emperoure at Augspurge in the name of al the Protestantes, Anno. 1530. appointe three Sacramentes, Baptisme, the Eucharistie, and Penance? The nexte yeere after, (b) Philip Melanchton in his Apologie auouched those three Sacramentes: but afterwarde in the yeere. 1552. he founde out an other, and made vp the number of foure, by addinge the Sacramente of Order to the foresaide three. In Lipsia they receiue three: In VVittenberg, whiche Cittie is not thence far of, they haue foure. At Magdeburg thereby also Flacius Illyricus, and so many as folowe him, wil haue but twoo: and the Zwenckfeldians, that springe out of the same stocke, care for none at al.

Diuersitie of Iudgement in the Gospel lesse aboute the nüber of the Sacramentes.

(a) Vntruthe fond and vaine
(b) Vntruthe, proceedinge of vnaduised malice. Reade the Answeare.

That there be moe Sacramentes then twoo by the Doctrine of the Fathers Cap. 104.

Forasmuche as yee alleage the names of the Olde Fathers for you, specially S. Ambrose, and S. Augustine, that there be but twoo Sacramentes, let vs see howe muche they make for maintenance of your Doctrine, and whether they teache vs not, that there be moe, S. Augustine in his 2. Booke, *Contra literas Petiliani*, speakinge of the place of the Psalme, *Sicut vnguentum in Capite*, which the Heretike had alleaged, saithe thus: *In hoc vnguento, &c.* In this oinctement his wil is to interprete the Sacramente of Chrisme (he meaneth the Sacramente of Confirmation) whiche in the kinde of visible signes is Holy, as Baptisme is. Lo, S. Augustine calleth Confirmation a Sacramente. S. Eusebius Pope nameth it a Sacrament in his third Epistle written to al the Bishoppes of Tuscia and Campania: *Manus impositionis Sacramentum, &c.* The Sacramente of imposition of Handes (saithe he) is to be kepte with greate reuerence, which cannot be performed but by the high Priestes, (he vnderstandeth Bishoppes). Melchiades nexte to Sylvester before the Nicene Councel speakinge much of Confirmation, amonge othet thinges saithe thus, *Duo hæc Sacramenta, Baptismi, & confirmationis separanda non sunt*: These twoo Sacramentes of Baptisme, and Confirmation, maie not be sundered. Though these twoo Bishoppes were Popes, yet they deserue credite, forasmuche as they liued before that corruption crepte into the Churche, after your accoumpte, and died Holy Martyrs.

The Sacramente of Confirmation.

This forged Melciades auanceth his Oile aboue the Sacramente of Baptisme.

The Sacramente of Penance.

That Penaunce is a Sacramente, and so accoumpted amonge the Fathers, it is so euidente, that who doubteth of it, maie seeme not to haue perused theire writinges. S. Augustine in *Enchiridio ad Laure-*

ad Laurentium, speakinge of Baptisme and Penance, calleth bothe, *Salutaria Sacramenta*, Healthful Sacramentes. S. Ambrose signifieth him selfe to be of the same minde, in his firste Booke *De Pœnitentia, Cap. 6. & 7.* And in the seconde Booke, Cap. 2. thoughe without puttinge the expresse name of Sacramente. But in the thirde Chapter of that Booke he putteth the name of Sacramente expressely. Cap. 66. Homil. 10. in epist. ad Heb.

Touchinge Order, that is a Sacramente also by verdite of S. Augustine, whome yee alleage for you. Let vs heare what he saithe. In his seconde Booke *contra Epist. Parmeniani, Cap. 13.* these be his woordes, where he speaketh of Baptisme, and of the Power to Baptize, whiche is geuen in the Sacrament of Order: *Vtrunque enim Sacramentum est, & quadam consecratione vtrunq; homini datur, illud cùm Baptizatur, istud cùm ordinatur. Ideo in Catholica non licet vtrunq; iterari:* Either of them is a Sacramente, and with a certaine Consecration either is geeuen to man: the one when he is Baptized, the other when he taketh Orders. Therefore in the Catholike Churche it is not lawful either of them to be taken twise. The Sacramente of Order.

For the Sacramente of wedlocke, besides other good and sufficiente proufes, that it is a Sacramente, wee haue sundrie testimonies out of S. Augustine, and other Doctours. In the Churche (saith S. Augustine) not onely the bande of mariage, but also the Sacramente, is so commended, that it is not lawful for the Husbande to deliuer his VVife to an other. He calleth wedlocke a Sacramente in many places of his workes, *De bono Coniugali, Cap. 7. 18.* and in the 24. Chapter of that Booke, he saithe, *Hæc omnia bona sunt, propter quæ nuptiæ bonæ sunt, Proles, Fides, Sacramentum:* Al these thinges be good, for whiche marriage is good, issue, Faithe, the Sacramente. The Sacramente of wedlocke. lib. de Fide & Operib. cap. 7.

Of extreme Vnction, who doubteth whether it be a Sacramente, lette him reade the Epistle of Innocentius the Firste, *ad Decentium Eugubinum Episcopum, Cap. 8.* where moste plainely treatinge of it, he nameth it a Sacramente. Chrysostome interpreteth the place of S. Iames Epistle for this Sacramente. And so dothe Bede alleaginge the place of S. Iames, the sixthe of Marke, the Auctoritie of Innocentius, and the custome of the Churche. Seeinge then wee haue founde the (c) seuen Sacramentes expressely mentioned in the Fathers, according to the teaching of the Catholique Church: whereas ye teache menne to beleue there be but two, and pretende that the Fathers speake of no mo: (d) I truste from hence foorth they wil take better aduise, howe they beleeue your bare VVoorde without al proufe, and with certaine danger of their soules, forsake the Doctrine of the Churche, whiche is the sure Pillour, and grounde of truthe, as S. Paule saithe. In this great pointe, Beza, and yee of that saide bee manifestly founde liers. The Sacramente of extreme Vnction. Iacob. 5. Lib. 3. de Sacerdo. 1. Timot. 1

(c) Vntruth. For the Ancient Fathers neuer recken precisely Seuen onely Sacramentes.
(d) As this is true, so wee desire further credite.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

To spende woordes without cause, is affliction of the Spirite, and losse of time. M. Hardinge here bestoweth muche labour, and allegeth many Doctours, to winne that thinge, that he might easily haue obteined without any suche adoe. For, gentle Reader, least that thou be deceiued, and thinke there is some weight in this heape of feathers, wee wil graunt without force, and freely, that the Holy Catholique Fathers haue made mention, not onely of Seuen, **as M. Hardinge here accounpteth them, but also of** Seuenteene sundrie Sacramentes. a Tertullian **calleth the Helue, wherewith** Elizæus **recouered the Axe out of the water,** Sacramentum Ligni, **the Sacramente of VVoode: And the whole state of the Christian Faithe, he calleth** b Religionis Christianæ Sacramentum, The Sacramente of Christian Religion. c. d S. Augustine **in many places hathe** Sacramentum Crucis, *The Sacrament of the Crosse.* **Thus he saithe,** In hac Crucis Figura continetur Sacramentum: *In this* Figure, *or Fourme of the* Crosse, *there is conteined a Sacramente:* **So saithe** Leo, e Crux Christi, quæ saluandis est impensa Fidelibus, & Sacramentum est, & exemplum: The Crosse of Christe, *whiche was geeuen to saue the Faithefull, is bothe a* Sacramente, *and also a Samplar.* S. Hierome **saithe,** f E latere Christi Baptismi, atque Martyrij pariter Sacramenta funduntur: *Out of* Christes *side the* Sacramentes *of* Baptisme, *and* Martyrdome *are powred foorth bothe togeather.* ✳ **Leo calleth the promisse of** Virginitie, Sacramentum: Quid eos manebit, qui corruperint fœdera Diuini Sacramenti? *What shal becomme of them, that haue broken the Couenante of the* Heauenly Sacramente? g **The Breade, that was geeuen vnto the Nouices, or Beginners in the Faithe, called** Catechumeni, **before they were Baptized, of** S. Augustine **is called** a Sacramente. h S. Hilarie **in sundrie places saithe,** Sacramentum Orationis: Sacramentum Esuritionis: Sacramentum Scripturarum: Sacramentum Fletus: Sacramentum Sitis: *The Sacramente of Praier: The Sacramente of Fastinge: The Sacramente of the Scriptures: The Sacrament of Weepinge: The Sacramente of Thirste.* i S. Bernarde **calleth the washinge of the Apostles feete, a Sacrament:** Ablutio Pedum, Sacramentum est quotidianorum peccatorum: *The Washing of Feete is the Sacramente of daily Sinnes.*

a Tertul. Aduersus Iudæos.
b Tertul. contra Marcionem. li. 4
c August. Epist. 12
d Augustin. in Sermone de Sanctis 19.
e Leo de Resurrectione Domini, Sermo. 2.
f Hieronym. ad Oceanum.
✳ Inter Decreta Leonis, Cap. 14.
g Augustin. De Peccator. merit. & remiss. Li. 2.
h Hilar. in Matt. Canon 11. & 12. & Canon 23.
i Bernard in Serm de Cœna Domini.

Thus

Number of Sacramentes.

Thus many, and many moe Sacramentes, it had benne eaſie for M. Hardinge to haue founde in the Catholique Learned Fathers. Yet, I trowe, he wil not ſaie, that either the Helue of an Axe, or the whole Religion of Chriſte, or a Croſſe printed in the foreheade, or Martyrdome, or the Scriptures, or a Vowe of Virginitie, or the Breade geuen to the Catechumeni, or Praier, or Faſtinge, or VVeepinge, or Thirſte, or VVaſſhinge of feete, are the neceſſarie Seuen Sacramentes of the Churche.

How be it, wee wil not greately ſtriue for the name. It appeareth hereby, that many thinges, that in deede, and by ſpecial propertie be no Sacramentes, maie neuertheleſſe paſſe vnder the general name of a Sacramente. But thus wee ſaie, It cannot be proued, neither by the Scriptures, nor by the Ancient Learned Fathers, that this Number of Sacramentes is ſo ſpecially appointed, and Conſecrate to this pourpoſe, or, that there be neither moe, nor leſſe Sacramentes in the Churche, but onely Seuen.

As for the Reaſons, that they of M. Hardinges ſide haue brought vs for proufe hereof, they are to Childiſhe, to be remembred. For thus they ſaie,

The Booke in the Apocalyps hathe Seuen Seales: *Apocalyp. 5.*

The Seuen Angels there haue Seuen Trumpettes: *Apocalyp. 8.*

Chriſte hath in his right hande Seuen ſtarres: *Apocalyp. 7.*

Chriſte vvalketh in the middes of Seuen golden Candelſticks: *Apocalyp. 1.*

Zacharie ſavve Seuen eies vpon a ſtone: *Zachar. 3.*

There vvere Seuen Candelſtickes in the Tabernacle: *Exod. 37.*

Ergo, ſaie they, there muſte nedes be iuſte Seuen Sacramentes in the Churche of God. *In Compendio Theologiæ.*

But, to leaue theſe Vanities, and to comme to the pourpoſe, vnto euery neceſſarie Sacramente of the Churche, two thinges ſpecially are required: that is, a Senſible outwarde Elemente, and the VVoorde of Inſtitution. Without either of theſe there is no Sacramente. Therefore S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Accedat Verbum ad Elementum, & fit Sacramentum: *Joine the Woorde, of Chriſtes Inſtitution, vnto the ſenſible Creature, or outwarde Elemente: and thereof is* made a Sacramente. The Element, or Creature in Baptiſme is Water: the Elementes, or Creatures in Our Lordes Supper, are Breade, and Wine: The wordes of Inſtitution are common, and knowen. *Auguſt. in Ioan. tract. 80.*

The other fiue Sacramentes want, either the VVoorde, or the Element, or both together: As for example, Matrimonie, Order, and Penance haue the Worde of God, but thei haue no outwarde Creature, or Elemente: Extreme Vnction, and Confirmation haue neither VVoorde, nor Elemente. Therefore theſe fiue later, in proper vſe of ſpeache, are not taken for neceſſarie Sacramentes of the Churche.

For thus Alexander of Hales ſaithe, Sacramentum Confirmationis, vt eſt Sacramentum, neque Dominus inſtituit, neque Apoſtoli: Sed poſtea inſtitutum eſt in Concilio Meldenſi: *The Sacramente of* Confirmation, *as it is a* Sacramente, *was not ordeined, either by* Chriſte, *or by the Apoſtles: but afterwarde in the Councel of* Melda. *Alexander Halen. par. 4 quæ. 24. mem. 1.*

So likewiſe Durandus ſaithe, Matrimonium ſtrictè, & propriè loquendo, non eſt Sacramentum: Matrimonie *in deede, and proper kinde of ſpeache,* is no Sacramente. *Durandus.*

Thus one of M. Hardinges owne Doctours ſaithe, Confirmation is no Sacramente: An other ſaithe likewiſe, Matrimonie is no Sacramente. *Irenæus. Iuſtin. Apol 2. Tertul 1 & 4 Con. Marcion. Ambroſ. De ſacramen. Cyril. in Myſagogicis.*

Nowe to that, wee make accoumpte onely of Twoo Sacramentes, as inſtituted by Chriſte, wherewith M. Hardinge findeth him ſelfe ſo mutche offended, it maie pleaſe him to vnderſtande, that the Ancient Learned Fathers, Irenæus, Iuſtinus Martyr, Tertullian, S. Ambroſe, Cyrillus, Alexandrinus, and others, hauinge occaſion to intreate of pourpoſe, and ſpecially hereof, ſpeake onely of Twoo Sacramentes, I meane of Baptiſme, and of Our Lordes Supper, and name none other. S. Cyprian ſaithe, Tunc demùm planè ſanctificari, & eſſe Filij Dei poſſunt, ſi vtroque Sacramento naſcantur: *Then maie they be throughly Sanctified, and become the children of God, if they be newe borne by* both the Sacramentes. *By* both the Sacramentes, *Cyprian. Lib. 2 Epiſt. 1. ad Steph.*

he saithe, meaninge onely of two. S. Augustine saithe, Quædam pauca pro multis, eademq; factu facillima, & intellectu augustissima, & obseruatione castissima, ipse Dominus, & Apostolica tradidit disciplina: sicuti est Baptismi Sacramentum, & Celebratio Corporis, & Sanguinis Domini: *Our Lorde, and his Apostles haue deliuered vnto vs a fewe Sacramentes in steede of many, and the same in dooinge moste easie, in signification moste excellente, in obseruation moste reuerende: as is the* Sacramente of Baptisme, and the Celebration of the Body, and Bloude of Our Lorde. Againe, speakinge of Baptisme, and of the Supper, he saithe thus: Hæc sunt Ecclesiæ Gemina Sacramenta: *These be the* Twoo Sacramentes *of the* Churche. *The* twoo Sacramentes, he saithe, plainely expressinge the number of two. Paschasius saithe, Sunt Sacramenta Christi in Ecclesia Catholica, Baptismus, & Corpus, & Sanguis Domini: *These be the Sacramentes of* Christe *in the Catholique Churche:* Baptisme, and the Body and Bloude of our Lorde. To be shorte, Cardinal Bessarion saithe, Hæc Duo Sola Sacramenta in Euangelijs manifestè tradita legimus: *Wee reade, that these* Onely twoo Sacramentes *were deliuered vs plainely in the Gospel.*

August. De Doct. Christian. Li. 3. Ca. 9.

Augu. De Symbolo ad Catechumenos, Paschasius De Cœna Domini.

Bessarion De Sacramento Eucharistiæ.

Here hathe M. Hardinge in expresse woordes, Bothe the Sacramentes, and the Twoo Sacramentes, and the Onely twoo Sacramentes of the Churche. Judge thou nowe therefore, good Christian Reader, what truthe thou maiste recken to bee in him, that saithe, Beza, and they of his side, are manifestly founde Liers.

M. Hard. 335. a.

Addition. ☞ M. Hardinge. *Bessarion* nameth other Sacramentes. Wherefore there is an impudent Lie included in your woordes, where you saie, that I haue in expresse woordes, the onely twoo Sacramentes of the Churche. Addition ☞

The Answeare. What coloure haue you in your face, M. Hardinge, when ye thus modestly cal others Impudent? I knowe not, Howe Bessarion coulde in plainer wise haue expressed his minde. Theise be his woordes, Hæc Duo Sola Sacramenta in Euangelijs manifestè tradita legimus: *Wee reade, that theise Onely twoo Sacramentes, are deliuered to vs plainely in the Gospelles.* If Onely twoo, be Onely twoo, then iudge thou, good Reader, who is Impudent. ☜ ☜

All these thinges notwithstandinge, the late pretensed Councel of Tridente with moste horrible threates, and greate Curses, concludeth the contrarie: Si quis dixerit, Sacramenta Nouæ Legis non fuisse omnia à Iesu Christo Domino nostro institutta, aut esse Plura, vel pauciora, quàm Septem, aut etiam aliquod horum non esse verè, & propriè Sacramentum, Anathema sit: *If any man shal saie, that the Sacramentes of the Newe Lawe, were not al ordeined of Our Lorde* Iesus Christe: *or, that there be* fewer, or moe then Seuen: *or, that any one of the same, verily, and in proper vse of speeche, is not a Sacramente, accursed be hee.*

Concil. Trident. Sessio. 7.

But, ye saie, Luther, and the Germaines, admitte three Sacramentes, Baptisme, the Lordes Supper, and Penance: And Philip Melancthon afterwarde founde out the Fourthe. O, M. Hardinge, what is it, that thus enflameth your tongue to speake Untruthe? If it had pleased you, to haue seene it, Luther, and Melancthon plainely expressed their owne meaninge, and vtterly remoued al manner occasion of suche cauilles. Luther writeth thus, Propriè ea visum est vocare Sacramenta, quæ annexis Signis promissa sunt: Cætera quia Signis alligata non sunt, nuda promissa sunt. Quò fit, vt si rigidè loqui velimus, tantùm duo sint in Ecclesia Dei Sacramenta, Baptismus, & Panis: cùm in his solis, & institutum diuinitùs Signum, & promissionem Remissionis Peccatorum videamus: *In* Proper speeche *those wee cal* Sacramentes, *whiche are promised with Signes annexed. The reste, that haue no Signes, are* bare promisses. *Wherefore speakinge hereof precisely, and strictely, there are* Onely twoo Sacramentes *in the Churche of God,* Baptisme, and the Breade: *for as muche as in* these Onely *wee finde bothe the* Signe *ordeined by God, and also the* Promisse of Remission of Sinnes.

In Captiuitate Babylonica.

Like wise Melancthon saithe, *He can wel cal* Order *a* Sacramente, *so that it be knowen from* Baptisme, *and the* Supper, *whiche in proper speeche, and verily be called* Sacramentes.

In Apologia Confessionis Augustanæ.

The Apologie, Cap. 11. Diuision. 3.

We saie, that Baptisme is a Sacrament of the Remission of sinnes, and

and of that washinge, whiche wee haue in the Bloude of Christe: and that no person, whiche wil professe Christes name, ought to be restrained, or kept backe there from: no not the very Babes of Christians: for somuche as they be borne in sinne, and doo perteine vnto the people of God.

M. Hardinge.

Baptisme very slenderly spoke of by the Defenders.

As ye acknowledge fewe Sacramentes, so ye speake of them very slenderly. Baptisme (ye saie) is a Sacramente of the Remission of sinnes, and of that washinge whiche wee haue in the Bloude of Christe. Nowe whereas ye meane, as within fewe lines ye declare, by the name of a Sacramente, (a) no more but a Token or Signe, specially sithe ye teache in your articles, that Baptisme at the beste, is but a Signe, and Seale of our newe birthe: ye seeme not to attribute to Baptisme so muche, as the Scripture doothe. Neither is Baptisme onely a Signe or Token, that sinnes be remitted, but wee beleue, as the Catholique Churche, accordinge to the Scriptures teacheth, that in, and by Baptisme sinnes be fully, and truely remitted, and put awaie: and that not through the Faithe (b) only of the geuer, or receiuer, or of any other, though hereunto it be necessarie in those, that be come to age of discretion: but through the power, and vertue of the Sacrament, and Gods promise. And therefore to whom it is geuen, of them it is rightly saide, that they be Baptized for remission of their sinnes. The Scriptures be plaine. Firste Ezechiel speakinge of this Holy Sacramente, saithe in the person of God: I wished vpon you cleane water, and ye shalbe made cleane from al your defilinges, and from your Idols wil I clense you. Nexte S. Paule saith, That God hath saued vs by the washinge of Regeneration, and of the renewinge of the Holy Ghost, whom he hath powred vpon vs aboundantly by Iesus Christe our Sauiour. That I maie adde to these manifest Scriptures the Auctoritie of a Learned Father, not whereby to strengthen the truth of them, but to witnesse our right vnderstandinge of them: S. Augustine, Lib. 3. contra duas epist. Pelagian. Cap. 3. shewinge the sclaunder of the Pelagians against the Catholikes, saithe thus in their person: Againe they (that is, after their meaning, the Catholikes) auouche, that Baptisme maketh not in deede newe men againe, that is to wit, that it geeueth not ful remission of sinnes, &c. Thereto eftsoones answeringe S. Augustine saith, (c) *Mentiuntur, insidiantur, tergiuersantur*. They lie, they studie how to deceiue, they seeke shiftes: wee saie not this. And after certaine sentences retourninge to Baptisme, he concludeth thus: VVherefore Baptisme washeth awaie al sinnes, vtterly al, of deedes, woordes, thoughtes, be they Original, or Actual: be they done ignorantly, or wittingly. But it taketh not awaie the infirmitie, which the regenerate resisteth, &c. VVhich place dothe not only set foorthe the vertue of Baptisme, but also (d) destroieth the Doctrine of our newe Gospellers, that affirme Concupiscence, whiche remaineth after Baptisme, to be verily sinne. (e) VVherein they erre manifestly againste the Scripture, and sense of the Fathers.

Cap. 36. Timot. 3.

Pelagians belied the Catholikes as the Sacramentaries doo also nowe.

(a) Vntruth. For wee saie not so.

(b) This tale is needeleslesse, and out of season.

(c) These words maie wel perteine to M. Har. him selfe. For we say not thus

(d) Vntruth ioined with grosse ignorance. M. Har. fouly mistaketh S. Augustines minde.

(e) Vntruthe, fond, & vaine. Reade the Answeare.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Al wil is euer plentiful of il woordes. M. Hardinge here maketh him selfe mutch mater without cause. He teacheth our Newe Cleregie, that Baptisme is not onely a Signe, or a Token of Remission of sinnes: He telleth vs of the Faithe of the Geeuer: of the Faithe of the Receiuer: of the power of the Sacrament: of Concupiscence, that it is no sinne. And more, I trowe, he woulde haue saide, if more had presently comme to minde. Verily the poore Newe Cleregie speaketh not one woorde in al this whole place, neither of Signe, nor of Token, nor of the Receiuer, nor of the Geeuer, nor of the Power of the Sacrament, nor of Concupiscence, whether it be Sinne, or not Sinne, nor of any other like thinge. Yet in the ende, he taketh S. Augustines woordes, without his meaninge, and crieth out againste vs, They lie, they studie to deceiue, they seeke shiftes. And why so? Certainely bicause wee saie, *Baptisme is a Sacramente of Remission of Sinnes: And, that the Children of the Faithefull, for that they be borne in Sinne, and pertaine to the people of God, ought therefore to be Baptized*. Other causes then these, in any Our woordes he can finde none.

True it is, that the Sacramente dependeth not, neither of the Minister, nor of the Receiuer, nor of any other. For, though they be al the Children of sinne, yet is Baptisme the Sacramente of Remission of Sinne. S. Augustine saithe, Securum me fecit Magister meus, de quo Spiritus eius dicit, Hic est, qui Baptizat: Christe *my Maister hathe assured mee, of whome his owne Sprite saithe, This is hee, that Baptizeth*.

August. in Iohan. Tract. 5. De Conse. dist. 4 Baptismus talis Iohan. 1.

Neuertheleste concerninge the Faithe of the Parentes, and others, the Holy Doctours haue sommetime written otherwise. S. Augustine saithe, Satis piè, recteq; creditur, Prodesse paruulo eorum Fidem, à quibus Consecrandus offertur: *It is good, and Godly to beleeue, that the Childe is* holpen by the Faithe of them, *by whom he is offered, or brought vnto Baptisme*. Againe he saithe, Accommodat illis Mater Ecclesia, aliorum

Augustin. De Libero Arbitrio Li. 3. Cap. 22.

aliorum pedes, vt veniant: aliorum Cor, vt credant: *Our Mother the Church lendeth them* other mennes *feete, that they maie comme:* and other mennes hartes, that they maie beleeue. The like saieinges might be alleged out of Iustinus Martyr, S. Cyprian, S. Hierome, and others. For thus they write. Howe truely, I wil not saie. But their wordes be plaine. The Prophete Abacuc saithe, Iustus ex Fide sua viuet: *The iuste man shal liue* (not by the Faithe of his Parentes, but) *by* his owne Faithe.

Augustin De Verbis Apostoli, Sermo 10.

Hieronym. in Ezechiel. ca 16. De Consecra. Dist. 4 Verus. Actor. 15. 1. Petri. 3.

Of this Faithe, S. Hierome saithe, Qui plena Fide non suscipiunt Salutare Baptisma, accipiunt quidem Aquam, sed non accipiunt Spiritum: *They that receiue not Baptisme with perfite Faithe, receiue the* VVater: *But the* Holy Ghoste *they receiue not.* S. Augustine saithe, Verus Baptismus constat, non tam ablutione Corporis, quam Fide Cordis, Sicut Apostolica Doctrina tradidit, dicens, Fide mundans Corda eorum: Et alibi, Saluos facit Baptisma, non Carnis depositio sordium, sed conscientiæ bonæ interrogatio in Deum, per Resurrectionem Iesu Christi: *True Baptisme standeth, not so mutche in Washinge of the Body, as in the* Faithe of the harte: *As the Doctrine of the Apostles hathe taughte vs, saieinge, By* Faithe purifieinge theire hartes: *And in an other place, Baptisme maketh vs safe: not the puttinge awaie of the filthe of the Fleashe, but the* examininge of a good Conscience *before God, by the Resurrection of* Iesus Christe. Likewise againe he saithe, Vnde ista tanta Virtus Aquæ, vt Corpus tangat, & Cor abluat, nisi faciente Verbo? Non quia dicitur, sed quia creditur: *Whence is al this so greate Vertue, or Power of the Water, that it toucheth the Body, and washeth the Harte, but by the Woorkinge of the Woorde? Not for that it is spoken* (by the Minister) *but* for that it is beleeued, (of the Faithefull).

Augustin. in Iohan. tractat. 80.

Somme man wil saie, Children, or Infantes beleeue nothinge, but are vtterly voide of Faithe. S. Augustine answereth, Qui non crediderit, condemnabitur. Sicut eos renasci per Ministerium Baptizantium, ita etiam eos credere per corda, & ora confitentium confitemur: *He that beleeueth not, shalbe damned. Wee confesse that as they be borne againe by the Ministerie of Baptizers, so they* beleue by the hartes, and mouthes *of the Confessours.* Againe he saithe, Habent Fidem, propter Fidei Sacramentum: They haue Faithe, *bicause they haue* (Baptisme, whiche is) *the Sacramente of Faithe.* For he saithe, Quemadmodum Sacramentum Corporis Christi, secundum quendam modum Corpus Christi est, ita Sacramentum Fidei Fides est: *As the Sacramente of* Christes *Body,* (not verily, and in deede, but) after a certaine manner of speeche, *is* Christes *Body: So* Baptisme is Faithe, *bicause it is the Sacramente of Faithe.* Therefore Cardinal Caietane is worthily blamed by Catharinus in that he saithe, *An Infante, for that he wanteth Instruction in Faithe, therefore hathe not perfite Baptisme.*

August in Epist. 105. Augu. Epist 23. In eadem Epist.

Catharinus contra Caietanum. errore 87. & 88.

Touchinge the Vertue, or Power of this Sacramente, if M. Hardinge meane thereby the outwarde Elemente of the Water, he knoweth, or maie easily knowe, It is a common resolution emongest al his owne Schole Doctours, Gratia Dei non est alligata Sacramentis: *The Grace of God is* not tied *to any Sacramentes.* The meaninge thereof is this, that God is able to worke Saluation, bothe with them, and without them. S. Augustine saithe, as it is before alleged: Iam vos Mundi estis propter sermonem, quem loquutus sum vobis. Quare non ait, Mundi estis propter Baptismum, quo loti estis: Nisi quia etiam in Aqua Verbum mundat? Detrahe Verbum: & quid est Aqua, nisi Aqua? *Nowe are yee cleane, bicause of the Woorde, that I haue spoken to you. But why saithe he not, Nowe* yee are cleane bicause of the Baptisme, *wherewith yee are washed: sauinge that, bicause in the Water it is the Woorde, that maketh cleane? Take awaie the Woorde, and* what is the VVater, more then VVater? Therefore he saithe, Aqua exhibet forinsecus Sacramentum Gratiæ: *The Water geeueth vs* outwardely *The Sacramente of Grace.* And this is the Power, and Vertue of the Sacramentes.

Augu. in Iohan. tract. 80. De Con. Dis. 4. Aliud est.

August. Epist. 23.

Notwithstandinge, wee muste consider, that the Learned Fathers in theire treaties of the Sacramentes, sommetime vse the outwarde Signe in stede of the thinge it selfe, that is signified: sommetime they vse the thinge Signified, in stede of the Signe. As for example, Sommetimes they name Christes Bloude in stede of the VVater: Sommetime they name the VVater in stede of Christes Bloude.

This

This Figure is called Metonymia, that is to saie, an exchange of names: and is muche vsed emongest the Learned, specially speakinge of the Sacramentes.

S. Augustine vsinge the VVater in place of the Bloude of Christe, that is Signified by the Water, saithe thus: Soluit vinculum culpæ: reconciliat bonum naturæ: regenerat hominem in Vno Christo: *It breaketh the bande of Sinne: It reconcileth the goodnesse of Nature: It doothe renewe a man in One* Christe. *Augustin Epist. 23.*

Notwithstandinge, in deede, and in precise manner of speache, Saluation muste be soughte in Christe alone, and not in any outwarde Signes. Christ is that Lambe of God, that taketh awaie the Sinnes of the VVorlde. The Bloude of Christ maketh vs cleane from al our Sinnes. S. Cyprian saithe, Remissio peccatorum, siue per Baptismum, siue per alia Sacramenta donetur, Propriè Spiritus Sancti est: & ipsi Soli huius officientiæ Priuilegium manet. Verborum solennitas, & Sacri inuocatio nominis, & Signa Apostolicis Institutionibus attributa, Visibile celebrant Sacramentum. Rem verò ipsam Spiritus Sanctus format, & efficit: *The Remission of Sinne, whether it be geeuen by Baptisme, or by any other Sacramente,* is in deede of the Holy Ghoste: *and to the same* Holy Ghoste onely *the Priuilege of this woorke doothe appertaine. The solemnitie of the Woordes, and the inuocation of Goddes Holy Name, and the outwarde Signes appointed to the Ministerie of the Priestes, by the institution of the Apostles, woorke the Visible outward Sacramente: But touchinge the Substance thereof,* (whiche is the Remission of Sinnes) *it is the Holy Ghoste, that woorketh it.* *Iohan. 1. 1. Iohan. 1. Cyprian. De Baptismo Christi.*

Likewise saith S. Hierome, Homo Aquam tantùm tribuit: Deus autem dat Spiritum Sanctum, quo sordes abluuntur: *The Minister, beinge a man, geeueth* onely the VVater: *But God geeueth the Holy Ghost, whereby the Sinnes be washte awaie.* And againe, Si quis Corporeum, &, quod oculis Carnis aspicitur, Aquæ tantùm accipit lauacrum, non est indutus Dominum Iesum Christum: *If any man haue receiued* onely the bodily washinge of VVater, *that is outwardely seene with the eie, he hathe not put on oure Lorde* Iesus Christe. *Hieronym. in Esaiam. Cap. 4. Hierony. ad Gal. Cap. 3.*

Concerninge Concupiscence, remaininge in the Faithefull after Baptisme, whether it be Sinne, or no Sinne, there was no great cause, why M. Hardinge should in this place moue question: sauinge that, as he hath hitherto denied, that Falshedde is Falshedde, so he woulde nowe denie, that Sinne is Sinne. Undoubtedly S. Paule sainge the same Concupiscence in him selfe, is forced to mourne, and to crie oute, *I see an other Lawe in my members, fightinge againste the Lawe of my minde, and leading me Prisoner to the* Lawe of Sinne. And againe, *O Wretched man, that I am: Who shal deliuer me from* this Body of Deathe. *Roman. 7.*

Therefore S. Ambrose saithe, Non inuenitur in vllo hominum tanta concordia, vt Legi Mentis Lex, quæ membris est insita, non repugnet. Propter quod ex omnium Sanctorum Persona accipitur, quod Iohannes Apostolus ait, Si dixerimus, quòd Peccatum non habemus, nos ipsos seducimus, & Veritas in nobis non est: *There is not found in any man sutche concorde* (bitwæne the Fleashe, and the Spirite) *but that the Lawe* (of Concupiscence) *whiche is planted in the Members, fighteth againste the Lawe of the minde. And for that cause, theise woordes of* S. Iohn *the Apostle are taken, as spoken in the persone of* al Sainctes, *If wee saie, wee haue no Sinne, wee deceiue our selues, and there is no Trutche in vs.* And, to leaue al others, S. Augustine saithe in moste plaine wise, Concupiscentia Carnis, aduersus quam, bonus concupiscit Spiritus, & Peccatum est, & Pœna Peccati, & Causa Peccati: *The* Concupiscence *of the* Fleashe, *against whiche, the good Sprite lusteth,* is bothe Sinne, and the Paine of Sinne, and the cause of Sinne. And againe he saithe, Quàmdiu viuis, necesse est Peccatum esse in membris tuis: *As longe as thou liuest,* there muste needes be *Sinne in thy members.* *Ambros. Lib. 10. Epist. 84. 1. Iohan. 1. August. contra. Iulian. li. 5. ca. 3. Augu. in Iohan. Tract. 41.*

If M. Hardinge saie, VVee wreaste, and racke S. Augustine, and take his woordes otherwise, then he meante, Albertus Pigghius his owne Principal Doctoure wil controlle him. Thus he writeth, Augustinus tradit, hanc ipsam Concupiscentiam Corpori nostro insperſam, atque innatam in nondum renatis Verè, & Propriè Peccatum esse: quæ ignoscatur quidem, sed non tollatur in Baptismo: S. Augustine *teacheth vs, that this same Concupiscence, planted in our Body, in them, that be not regenerate by Baptisme,* *Albertus Pighi. in controuer. de Peccato Originali.*

Concupiſcence is Sinne.

Verily, and in plaine manner of ſpeache is Sinne: and that the ſame Concupiſcence is forgeeuen in Baptiſme, but is not vtterly taken awaie.

Yet the late Blessed Chapter of Trident, in ſpite of S. Auguſtine, hath publiſhed the Contrarie. For this is the determination of the Fathers there: Hanc Concupiſcentiam, quam Apoſtolus aliquando appellat Peccatum, Sancta Synodus declarat, Eccleſiam Catholicam nunquam intellexiſſe, quòd verè, & Proprie in Renatis Peccatum ſit: ſed quia ex Peccato eſt, & ad Peccatum inclinat. Si quis autem contrarium ſenſerit, Anathema ſit: *The Concupiſcence, whiche the Apoſtle* S. Paule *ſommetime calleth Sinne: this Holy Councel declareth, that the Catholique Churche neuer vnderſtoode it to be called* Sinne, for that it is ſo in deede, and in Proper maner of Speache, *in them that be Baptized: but bicauſe it is of Sinne, and enclineth vs vnto Sinne. And if any man thinke the Contrarie, accurſed be he.* Thus wée ſée, that by the Decrée of this worthie Couente, S. Ambroſe, and S. Auguſtine, and other Holy Fathers, that haue written the ſame, are al accurſed.

Concil. Trident. Seſſi. 5.

As for that, M. Hardinge here toucheth, as an erroure defended by certaine, I knowe not, by whome, that Baptiſme geeueth not ful Remiſsion of Sinnes, he maie commaunde it home againe to Louaine, emongeſt his felowes, and ioine it with other of his, and theire Vanities. For it is no parte, nor portion of oure Doctrine. Wée Confeſſe, and haue euermore taught, that in the Sacrament of Baptiſme by the Deathe, and Bloude of Chriſt, is géeuen Remiſſion of al manner Sinnes: and that, not in halfe, or in parte, or by waie of Imagination, or by fanſie: but ful, whole, and perfite of al togeather: ſo that nowe, as S. Paule ſaithe, *There is no damnation vnto them, that be in* Chriſte Ieſu.

Roman. 8.

Nowe iudge thou indifferently, gentle Reader, what Spirite forced M. Hardinge thus terriblie to crie out, They Lie: they ſtudie to deceiue: they ſeeke ſhiftes, &c.

The Apologie, Cap. 12. Diuiſion. 1.

Wee ſaie, that Euchariſtia, that is to ſaie, the Supper of the Lorde, is a Sacramente, that is, an euidente Repreſentation of the Body, and Bloude of Chriſte, wherein is ſette, as it were, before oure eies, the Deathe of Chriſte, and his Reſurrection, and what ſo euer he did, whileſt he was in his Mortal Body: to the ende wee maie geeue him thankes for his Deathe, and for our deliueraunce. And that by the often receiuinge of this Sacramente, wee maie daiely renewe the remembrance thereof, to thintente, wee beeinge fedde with the Body, and Bloude of Chriſte, maie be broughte into the hope of the Reſurrection, and of Euerlaſtinge Life, and maie moſte aſſuredly beleeue, that, as our bodies be fedde with Breade, and Wine, ſo our Soules be fedde with the Body, and Bloude of Chriſte.

M. Hardinge.

(a) VVe vtter as many Syllables of Real Preſence, as Chriſt euer vttered.

Amonge al theſe gaye woordes (a) wee heare not ſo mutche as one Syllable vttered, whereby wee maie vnderſtande, that yee beleeue, the Very Body of Chriſte to bee in deede preſente in the bleſſed Sacramente of the Aultar. Yee confeſſe the Euchariſtia, whiche commonly ye cal, the Supper of the Lorde, to be a Sacramente, and al that to be none other then an euidente token of the Body and Bloude of Chriſte. As for that ye adde to make the mater ſeeme ſommewhat, of the Deathe of Chriſte, and his Reſurrection, and his actes done in Fleaſhe: VVhat reaſon or Scripture haue yee, that a peece of Bread and a Cuppe of VVine, (for b) in your beleefe more make ye not of this Sacrament) can ſet them as it were before our eies? Dothe not rather a faire Painted Table ſet foorthe the actes of our Saueour before our eies more liuely and more expreſſely? And be we not moued therwith to geeue God thankes for his great benefites, as wel as if we haue Breade and VVine on a table? But I praie you, ſithence al is (c) but Breade and VVine after your teachinge, how ſhal wee by eatinge and drinkinge thereof be fedde with the Body and Bloude of Chriſte? Againe, can we by (d) Breade and VVine be broughte into hope of the Reſurrection, and Euerlaſtinge Life, as yee ſaie? And howe ſhal wee by Eatinge of Breade and Drinkinge of VVine be aſſured, that Chriſtes Body and Bloude doth in like manner feede our Soules, as Breade and VVine feedeth our bodies? Though your imagination be neuer ſo ſtronge, yet by eatinge of that, whiche is Breade onely, and Drinkinge of that whiche

(b) Vntruth ioined with ſclaunder.

(c) Vntruthe, ſclaunderous, as the Former.

(d) Euen as wel as by the VVater in Baptiſme.

The Lordes ſupper with the Defenders is an euident token of the Body and Bloud of Chriſte.

whiche is VVine onely, we ſee not howe your ſoules can be fedde with the true Body and Bloude of Chriſte, nomore then ye be at your common meales.

Verily, when al your tale is tolde, ye ſeme to ſaie nothinge els touching the eatinge of our Lordes Body, but that the Body of Chriſte remaineth in Heauen, and that wee muſte ſende vp our ſoules thither, to eate it there by a certeine Imagination, whiche ye cal faithe. For this is your Maiſter Caluines Doctrine. By this Doctrine al ſtandeth vpon your faithe: your faith doth al alone. And he that beleeueth in Chriſte, ſo as ye teache, eateth his Body, and Drinketh his Bloude. For by your Goſpel, to eate the Body, is nothinge els, but to beleue in Chriſte. If this be true, then is your Supper ſuperfluous.

Faithe doeth al.

For declaration of the Truthe herein, it is to be conſidered, that, when we ſpeake of this bleſſed Sacrament, we meane ſpecially, the thinge receiued to be the very Real Body of Chriſte, not onely a Signe or Token of his Body. Yet we thinke it neceſſarie, (e) the Doctrine of the Fathers be clearely taught: whiche is, that here is a Sacrament, and the thinge of the Sacramente. The (f) Forme of Breade and VVine, which is ſeene, is the Sacrament, that is to ſaie, a Signe of the Holy thinge. For a Sacrament beſides the outwarde ſhape, which it repreſenteth to the ſenſes, cauſeth an other thinge to comme into knowledge. The thinge of this Sacrament is of twoo ſortes, the one (g) in the ſame conteined and ſignified, the other ſignified, but not conteined. The firſte is the Body of Chriſte borne of the Virgine Marie, and his Bloude ſhedde for our Redemption: The ſeconde is the Vnitie of the Churche in thoſe that be predeſtinate, called, iuſtified, and glorified. VVhich Church is Chriſtes Body myſtical. So that here are three diſtincte thinges vnderſtanded. The one is a Sacramente onely: the other a Sacrament and the thinge: the thirde, the thinge and not a Sacramente. The firſte is the viſible ſhape or Forme of Breade and VVine: the ſeconde is the proper and very Fleaſhe and Bloude of Chriſte: the thirde his Myſtical Body.

The Catholike Doctrine touchinge the Sacramente of thaulter.

A threfold diſtinction to be conſidered in the Doctrine of this Sacramente. Indiſtincte ſpeakinge of diſtincte thinges.

And as there be twoo thinges of this Sacrament, ſo be there alſo two meanes or waies of eating. The one Sacramental, after whiche both good and (h) euil eate the true Body of Chriſte: they to ſaluation, theſe to damnation. The other ſpiritual, after which the good onely doo eate. Theſe Defenders, as al other the Sacramentaries, ſpeakinge of theſe diſtinct thinges indiſtinctly, cauſe confuſion, and deceiue the vnlearned readers. In ſuche a ſenſe and meaninge the place commonly alleged out of S. Auguſtine, as alſo many other the like, maie wel be vnderſtanded, without preiudice of the Truthe of Chriſtes Body in the Sacramente: *Ut quid paras dentem & ventrem? Crede, & manducaſti.* To what pourpoſe makeſt thou ready teeth and belly? Beleeue, and thou haſte eaten. Nowe theſe Defenders harpinge onely vpon this one ſtringe of ſpiritual eatinge, and ſhunninge the Faithe of the Catholike Churche touchinge the true preſence of the Body, and Violently wreſtinge the Holy Scripture, and Aunciente Fathers to a contrarie ſenſe, admittinge Figures for Truthe, tropes for the letter, ſhadowes for thinges: plaie vs many a falſe leſſon, and teache horrible lies, to the vtter ſubuerſion of thoſe, that be lead by them.

(e) Vntruth, cõtrarie to the Anciente Fathers: Reade the Anſwere.

(f) Vntruthe, without ſenſe, or ſauoure. No Catholique Father euer taught this peuiſhe Doctrine.

(g) Vntruthe, and one of M. Har. myſtical dreames.

(h) Vntruthe horrible, and Heatheniſhe.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Here is no mention (ſaithe M. Hardinge) of Real Preſence: and therevpon he plaieth vs many a proper Leſſon. Notwithſtandinge, here is as mutche mention made of Real Preſence, as either Chriſte, or his Apoſtles euer made: or in the Primitiue Catholique Churche of God was euer beleeued.

Al this is onely M. Hardinges diſcante. VVee admit Figures for Figures, and Truthe for Truthe.

Addition. M. Hardinge. *S. Ambroſe* ſaithe, thou, whiche receiueſt the fleaſhe of Chriſte, arte made partaker in that foode, of his Diuine ſuſtance. But if it were breade, whiche wee receiue at Chriſtes Supper, in that foode of breade, wee ſhoulde not be made partakers of the Diuine Subſtance, &c. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, *Vaſa non ſunt capacia illius, quem in ſe habent: non ſentiunt illum: Nos verò plenè.* They Veſſels be not partakers of him, nor feele him, whom they conteine: but wee doo truely, &c. Leo ſaithe, Ye ought ſo to communicate of the Holy Table, that yee Doubte nothinge at al of Chriſtes Body, and Bloude. *Hoc enim ore ſumitur, quod fide creditur:* For that thinge is taken in my mouthe, whiche is beleeued in faithe, &c. Theiſe are ſutche Teſtimonies, that can neuer be auoided by any anſweare.

M. Har. 339. b.

340 b.

The Anſweare. VVhether theiſe Teſtimonies maie be anſweared, or no, I doubt not, but it maie ſome appeare. But firſte, M. Harding, it maie pleaſe you to remember, that the Authoure, that beareth the name of Chryſoſtome, ſaithe thus: In ſacris Vaſis non eſt verum Corpus Chriſti, Sed Myſterium Corporis eius continetur: *The very Body of* Chriſte *is not in the Holy Veſſels, But the Sacrament of that Body is therein conteined.* Here haue wee Chryſoſtome againſte Chryſoſtome: The one ſaithe: Chriſtes Body is in the Veſſels: The other ſaithe: Chriſtes Body is not in the Veſſels. And as touchinge the mouthe, S. Auguſtine ſaithe, *The Body of* Chriſte *requireth the hunger of the inwarde Man: By inwarde drinkinge I am bleſſed: This breade entreth not into the belly: To beleeue in* Chriſte, *That is, to eate the Breade of Life.* Thus wee ſee, that Chriſtes Body is in the Veſſels, and yet not in the Veſſels: In the Mouthe, and yet not in the Mouthe. Theſe Contradictions maie eaſily be reconciled, if a man be acquainted with the phraſes of the Ancient Writers. For further reſolution whereof, and for

Chryſoſt. in Opere imperfecto Homil. 11.

The Lordes ſupper with the Defenders is an euidẽt token of the Body and Bloud of Chriſte.

and for shortenesse of time, I wil referre thé, gentle Reader, to that I haue otherwhere written touchinge the same. There shalt thou finde, that, as Chrysostome saithe here, Christes *Body is in the Vessels,* euen so Athanasius saithe, *Oure Lorde is in the woordes of the Scriptures:* S. Augustine saithe, *Holy Menne receiue* Christe *in theire handes, and in their forehead:* S. Chrysostome saith, *The Priestе beareth the Holy Ghoste:* S. Augustine saith, *The people is laide vpon the Communion Table: The people is in the Cuppe:* S. Gregorie saith, Abel, *by signification bare* Christ *in his handes.* Theise, and other like phrases are there alleged. Thus is Christes Body present, not Really, nor in Substance, but onely in Mysterie. Thus Chrysostome saith, Christes *Body is in the Communion Vessels:* Thus Leo saith, *The same Body is in the mouth of the Faithful.* Nowe, if M. Hardinge wil gather of Chrysostome, that Christes *Body is Really present in the Vessels:* or of Leo, *that the same Body is really present in the mouth.* Then must he likewise gather of theise other Fathers, That God is really present in the woordes of the Scripture: That, Christ is really present in oure foreheades: That, the Holy Ghoste is really present in the Bason: That, the people is Really laide vpon the Holy Table, or really present in the Cuppe: And that, Abel bare Christ Really in his handes. Suche, & other like Absurdities, M. Hardinge, muste néedes folowe of your Doctrine. But Gregorius Nyssenus saith, Abusiuè aliquid in aliquo loco esse dicimus, propter operationem eius quæ ibi est. Cùm enim dicere deberemus, Ibi operatur, Dicimus, ibi est: *Wee saie, that a thing is in some place, by an abuse of speech, in respect of the effect of some thing, that there is wrought. For, where as wee shoulde saie, There it woorketh, wee saie, There it is.* Thus wée saie, The Moone is in the Heade, or, in the Legge: And our woordes are true: And yet in déede Substantially, and Really the Moone is neither in the one parte, nor in the other. And this is it, that Chrysostome saithe, *The very Body of* Christe *is not in the Communion Vessels: But the Sacramente thereof, is there conteined.*

Defense. parte 2. ca. 14. Diui 45.

Gregor. Nyssenus, De Anima. Cap. 11.

But S. Ambrose saithe, *In receiuinge the Sacramente, wee are made partetakers of the Diuine Substance.* This (saie you) coulde not be, if there remained breade in the Sacramente. And why so, M. Hardinge? Are not wée partakers of the same Diuine Substance in the Sacrament of Baptisme. S. Augustine saithe, *By Baptisme wee are incorporate into* Christe, *and are made One Body with his Body.* Leo saithe, Corpus Regenerati, fit Caro Crucifixi: *The Body, of him, that is newe borne in Baptisme, is made the Fleashe of* Christe *Crucified,* that is to saie, Fleashe of his Fleashe, and Boane of his Boane. And, what greatter participation of the Diuine Substance can you desire? Yet neuertheless, the very Substance of VVater remaineth stil. Euen so notwithstandinge wée be made partakers of the Diuine Substance of Christe, in the receiuinge of the Holy Mysteries, yet the Substance of Breade, therein remaineth stil. And for as mutche as, ye woulde proue by theise woordes of S. Ambrose, That Christe is presente in the Sacramente. The same S. Ambrose also saithe, that Christe *is likewise presente in the Water of Baptisme.* Thus he saithe, Crede Diuinitatis illic esse Præsentiam, Operationem credis? Non credis Præsentiam? Vnde sequeretur operatio, nisi præcederet antè Præsentia? &c. Crede adesse Dominum Iesum inuocatum precibus Sacerdotum. Ait, vbi fuerint duo, vel tres, Ibi & ego sum. Quantò magis, vbi est Ecclesia, vbi Mysteria sua sunt, ibi dignatur suam impartire Præsentiam? *Beleeue thou, that there* (in the Sacramentes of Baptisme) *is the Presence of the Godhead. Beleeuest thou the woorkinge? and beleeuest thou not the Presence? Howe coulde the woorkinge folowe, onlesse the Presence went before? Beleeue thou, that our Lorde Iesus is presente* (at the Baptisme) *beeinge called vpon by the Prayers of the Priestes.* Christe *saithe, Whereas be twoo, or three, there am I. Howe mutch more wil he vouchesaue to offer his Presence, whereas his Churche is, and where as are the Mysteries* (of his Baptisme?) Nowe, M. Hardinge, as Christe is Present in the one Sacrament, euen so, and none otherwise, is he Presente in the other.

Augustl. De Baptismo parualor. Leo, De Passion. Domi. Serm. 4

Ambros. de his qui initiam. ca. 2. Cap. 5.

But, Leo saithe, *The same thinge is receiued by the mouthe, that is beleeued by oure Faithe.* Theise woordes, as Leo meante them, are very true: but as you woulde handle them, by your Constructions, they are moste vntrue: Leo in that place Disputeth against the Heretique Eutyches, whoes errour was this, That Christes Body after his Ascension, was wholy changed into his Godhead, and that therefore

nowe

nowe he hath no Body at al. Against him, Leo reasoneth thus: *The very Sacrament of* Christes *Body, whiche thou receiueste with thy mouthe, is sufficient to reprone thee. For, if* Christe *beeinge nowe in Heauen, haue no Body at al, howe can this be a Sacramente of his Body?* In like sorte Chrysostome Disputeth against certaine other Heretiques, that saide, Christe died not vpon the Crosse. Nam, quando dicunt, &c. *When they saie, howe maie it appeare, that* Christe *was Crucified, besides many other Argumentes, wee bringe foorthe the Mysteries, and stoppe theire mouthes. For if* Christe *Died not, whoes Figure, whoes Signe, or Remembrance is this Sacrifice?* Cuius Symbolum, ac Signum est hoc Sacrificium? As if he woulde reason thus: *The Sacrament is a Remembrance of* Christes *Deathe, Therefore it is euidente, that* Christe *hathe Died.* *Chrysost. in Mat. Homil. 83.*

Likewise Tertullian reasoneth against the Heretique Marcion, that saide, Christe had neuer any Body at al, but onely a vaine shewe, or a likelinesse of a Body: Christe (saithe he) *saide thus, This is my Body, that is to saie, This is a Figure of my Body. It coulde not be a Figure, onlesse* Christe *in deede had a Body. For a vaine shewe or a likelinesse, can beare no Figure.* Thus reasoneth Tertullian. *Tertulli. contra Marcion Li. 4.*

Euen so saithe Leo vnto Eutyches: *Thou saiest, that* Christe *hathe no Body. But the very Sacramente, that thou receiuest, reproueth thee. For the thinge, that thy mouthe receiueth, is the same, that thou beleeuest by thy Faithe,* That is to saie, *it is a Sacramente of that thinge, that thou beleeuest by thy Faithe.* We beleeue, that Christ was Borne in the very Substance of our Body: that he Died: that he was Buried: that he Rose againe: that he Ascended into Heauen, in the same Body: and that he sitteth at the Righte hand of God the Father. The Sacramente of that Body is it, that we receiue with oure mouthes. So saithe Gelasius, Hoc nobis in ipso Domino sentiendum est, quod in eius imagine profitemur: *Wee muste thinke the same of* Christe *our Lorde, that we professe in* (the Sacramente, whiche is) *his image. Wee muste thinke the same,* he saithe: and yet, if we goe precisely to the mater, we maie in no wise *thinke the same.* So saith S. Augustine, Aqua Corpus tangit, & cor abluit: *The Water* (of Baptisme) *toucheth the Body, and washeth the harte.* Yet is it not the Water in deede, that washeth the harte. The Water is a Sacramente of Goddes grace: and that is it, that washeth the harte. So saithe Leo in an other place, speakinge likewise of the Sacramente: Transimus in quod sumimus: *Wee are changed into the same thinge, that wee receiue.* Yet, I trowe, M. Hardinge, you wil not saie, We are changed into the Sacramente: But, we are changed into Christes Body, that is represented by the Sacramente. *Gelas. contra Eutychen.* *August. in Ioh. Tract. 80.*

This Answeare is plaine, and agreeable to the Articles of our Faithe, and to the general Doctrine of the Catholique Fathers. And theise are the Testimonies, whiche M. Hardinge saithe, Can neuer be auoided by any Answeare, while the worlde standeth. ☙

Farther he saithe, What reason, or Scripture haue ye, that a peece of Breade, and a Cuppe of Wine can sette the Deathe and Resurrection of Christe, as it were, before your eies? Verily, when al your tale is tolde, yee seeme to saie nothinge els, but that the Body of Christe remaineth in Heauen, and that wee muste sende vp our soules thither, to eate it there by a certaine Imagination, whiche ye cal Faithe. M. Har. *fo.* 341. *b.*

Here ye do greate wronge, M. Hardinge, to cal the Faithe of Christe, an Imagination, or, as I trowe, ye meane, a Fansie. S. Paule saithe, Fides est Substantia rerum sperandarum: *Faithe is* (not an Imagination, but) *the* Substance, *and grounde of the thinges that wee hope for.* If we trauaile once againe to Rome, bringe thus farre instructed already, ye wil easily learne the lesson, that one of your late Popes there, as it is reported, taught his Cardinalles: O, quantùm nobis profuit illa Fabula de Christo?

That we ought to sende vp our Faithe into Heauen, and there to embrace the Body of Christe, it is S. Augustines Doctrine, it is not ours. These be his wordes: Dices, Quomodò tenebo Christum Absentem? Quomodò in Cœlum manum mittam, vt ibi sedentem teneam? Fidem mitte: & tenuisti. Parentes tui tenuerunt Carne: tu tene Corde: *Thou wilt saie, Howe shal I holde* Christe *beeinge* Absente? *Howe shal I reache my hande into Heauen, that I maie holde him* sittinge there? Sende vp thy *Augu. in Iohan. Tracta 50.*

Faithe Eateth.

thy Faithe: *and thou holdeſt him. Thy Fathers* (the Iewes) *holde him in the Fleaſhe:* Holde him thou in thy harte.

But, for as mutche as M. Hardinge thought it ſufficient, ſo pleaſantly to paſſe ouer this mater with his Imaginations, and Fanſies, I thinke it therefore ſo mutche the more nedeful, to ſhewe the iudgemente of the Aunciente Learned Fathers in this behalfe.

Auguſt. de Trinitate. li. 13. ca 1

Firſte therefore, S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Rerum Abſentium: Præſens eſt Fides: & rerum, quæ foris ſunt, intus eſt Fides: & rerum, quæ non videntur, videtur Fides: *Of thinges that be* Abſente, *Faith is Preſente: of thinges, that be without, Faithe is within: and of thinges, that be not ſeene, Faith is ſeene.* Againe he ſaithe, Cùm non obliuiſcimur munus

Augu. in Pſal. 75

Saluatoris, nónne nobis quotidiè Chriſtus immolatur? Ex ipſis reliquijs cogitationis noſtræ, id eſt, ex ipſa memoria Chriſtus quotidiè nobis ſic immolatur, quaſi quotidiè nos innouet: *When wee forgeate not the gifte of our Sauiour, is not* Chriſte *offered vnto vs euery daie? Of the very* remnantes of our thoughtes, *that is to ſaie, of our very* memorie, Chriſte *is ſo daiely offered vnto vs, as though he renewed vs euery daie.*

Hieronym. De 7. Ordinib Eccle. De Gradu. 7.

And, the more liuely to expreſſe this mater, S. Hierome ſaith, Tibi Conuiuium Chriſtus eſt: Cogitatio Chriſtus eſt: Gaudium Chriſtus eſt: Deſiderium Chriſtus eſt: Lectio Chriſtus eſt: Quies Chriſtus eſt: Chriſte *is thy Banket:* Chriſte *is thy Thoughte:* Chriſte *is thy Ioie:* Chriſte *is thy Deſire:* Chriſte *is thy Readinge:* Chriſte *is thy Reaſte.* Likewiſe S. Ambroſe, In animis veſtris quotidiè pro Redemptione Corporis Chriſtus offertur: In your mindes Chriſte *is daiely offered for the Redemption of the Body.*

Ambroſ. De Virginib. Lib. 2.

And to paſſe ouer others, for that it pleaſeth M. Hardinge, to make him ſelfe ſutche mirthe with Imaginations: Euthymius a Greeke Authoure, writinge pourpoſely of this mater, ſaithe thus, Non oportet ſimpliciter ea intueri, ſed aliud quiddam imaginari, & interioribus oculis ea perſpicere, tanquam Myſteria: *Wee maie not looke barely vpon theſe thinges,* (that is, vpon the Breade and Wine,) *but muſte thereof*

Euthymi. in Ioh. Cap 9.

imagine *ſomme other mater, and beholde the ſame with our* inwarde Spiritual eies, *as it is meete to beholde Myſteries.* This Spiritual Imagination, this Hauinge, this Holdinge, this Enioieinge of Chriſte, it liketh wel M. Hardinge in his pleaſance, to ſcorne, as a fantaſie. But S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Magis ſunt illa, quæ intelligimus, quàm iſta, quæ cernimus: *the thinges, that wee* vnderſtande (or Imagine by Faithe) *are more certaine, then the thinges, that wee* ſee with our eies.

Auguſt Epiſt. 117

Neither maie you thinke, M. Hardinge, that, theſe thinges beinge graunted, the Miniſtration of the Holy Supper woulde be ſuperfluous. For theſe twoo Kindes of Eatinge muſte euermore neceſſarily be ioined togeather. And who ſo euer commeth to the Holy Table, and auaunceth not his minde vnto Heauen, there to feede vpon Chriſtes Body at the Righte Hande of God, he knoweth not the meaninge of theſe Myſteries, but is voide of vnderſtandinge, as the Horſe, or the Mule, and receiueth onely the bare Sacramentes to his Condemnation. Therefore the Myſtical Supper of Chriſte, notwithſtandinge this Doctrine, is not ſuperfluous: But your Tranſubſtantiation, your Real Preſence, and a greate parte of this your idle talke is moſte vaine, and moſte ſuperfluous.

But ye ſaie, Howe can Breade, and VVine bringe vs to the hope of Reſurrection, or of Euerlaſtinge Life? And why maie not a man in like manner demaunde of you, Howe can a kewe Droppes of colde VVater bringe vs to the Hope of Reſurrection? If VVater maie do it, why maie not Breade, and VVine likewiſe do it?

Baſilius, De Sancto Baptiſmo.

Touchinge the VVater, S. Baſile ſaithe, Baptiſmus eſt Potentia Dei ad Reſurrectionem: *Baptiſme is the* Power of God *to Reſurrection.* Againe he ſaithe, Reſurrectionis Gratiam in Die Reſurrectionis recipiamus: *Vpon the Daie of Reſurrection, let vs receiue* (Baptiſme, whiche is) the Grace of Reſurrection. S. Hierome ſaithe, Non ſolùm propter Remiſsionem Peccatorum Baptizamur, ſed etiam propter Reſurrectionem Carnis noſtræ: *Wee are Baptized, not onely for Remiſſion of Sinnes, but alſo for the* Reſurrection of our Fleaſhe. And therefore the Greekes calle Baptiſme

Hieronym. in 1. Cor. 15.

Dionyſius. Cap 2

ἀφθαρσίας ἔνδυμα, That is, the VVeede of immortalitie.

Here, M. Hardinge, it were ſomme point of ſkil, to ſhewe vs, howe ſo greate

Power

Power maie be in ſo litle VVater. Howe be it, it is not the VVater in déde, that worketh the force of Reſurrection, but the Bloude of Chriſte, that is ſignified by the VVater. And therefore S. Ambroſe ſaithe, Baptiſmus Reſurrectionis Pignus, & Imago eſt: *Baptiſme is the* Pledge, *and* Image *of Reſurrection.* Likewiſe Ignatius, Credentes in Mortem eius, per Baptiſma participes Reſurrectionis eius efficimur: *Beleeuinge in the Deathe of* Chriſte, by Baptiſme *wee are made partakers of his Reſurrection.* The like wée ſaie of the Holy Supper. Neither is M. Hardinge hable to ſhewe vs any ſufficiente cauſe to the contrarie, but VVine, or Breade maie haue this Power, as wel, as VVater. Of this whole mater wé ſhal ſpeake hereafter more at large.

Ambroſ. in Epiſt. ad Roman. ca. 6

Ignatius ad Trallianos.

But if Breade, and VVine, as M. Hardinge ſaithe, haue no Power to worke Reſurrection, what Power then can his Accidentes, and emptie Fourmes haue to worke the ſame? For, as touchinge the Body of Chriſte it ſelfe, his owne Doctours coulde haue tolde him, that it entreth not into our Bodies. For thus it is noted, and publiſhed for ſounde, and certaine Doctrine vpon the Decrées: Certum eſt, quòd quàm citò Species teruntur dentibus, tam citò in Cœlum rapitur Corpus Chriſti: *It is certaine, and out of doubte, that as ſoone, as the Accidentes, or Fourmes are touched with the teethe, ſtraighte waie the* Body of Chriſte is taken vp into Heauen.

De Conſe. Diſt 2 Tribus gradib. In Gloſſa.

Hereof wé maie reaſon thus: Chriſtes Body is ſuddainely taken vp into Heauen, and is not receiued into our Bodies: and that, as it is noted here, is true, and certaine: The Breade, and Wine, by M. Hardinges Doctrine, are vtterly conſumed, no parte of the Subſtance thereof remaininge: There is nothinge leafte there, but Fourmes, and Accidentes. Hereof it muſte néedes folowe, by this Doctrine, that the ſame bare Fourmes, and Accidentes, beinge receiued into our Bodies, haue Power to worke our Reſurrection. But it is wel knowen, and confeſſed in al Scholes, that the Subſtance is better, and worthier, then is the Accidente. Therefore wé maie conclude thus, The Accidente of Breade, maie doo it: *Ergo*, the Subſtance of Breade, maie mutche more doo it.

For the reſte, M. Hardinge ſaithe, The Subſtance of the Breade is quite remoued: The roundeneſſe, and whiteneſſe are the Sacramente: The thinge thereof is of twoo ſortes: The one conteined, and ſignified: the other ſignified, and not conteined. Theſe Myſtical fanſies maie lie ſtil, vntil M. Hardinge by ſomme Authoritie, other then his owne, haue proued them better. True it is, that M. Hardinge ſaithe, Betwéene the Sacramente, and the thinge it ſelfe, that is to ſaie, betwéene the Sacramente, and the Body of Chriſte repreſented by the Sacrament, there is greate difference. For in déde, and verily, and in preciſe manner of ſpeache, neither is Chriſtes Body the Sacrament: nor is the Sacramente Chriſtes Body.

S. Auguſtine ſaithe, as it is alleged before, Niſi Sacramenta ſimilitudinem quandam earum rerum, quarum Sacramenta ſunt, haberent, omninò Sacramenta non eſſent. Ex hac autem ſimilitudine plærunque rerum ipſarum nomina accipiunt. Itaque ſecundum quendam modum Sacramentum Corporis Chriſti, Corpus Chriſti eſt: *Onleſſe* Sacramentes *had a certaine likeneſſe of the thinges, whereof they be* Sacramentes, *without queſtion they were no* Sacramentes. *And in conſideration of this likeneſſe, oftentimes they beare the names of the thinges them ſelues. Therefore* after a certaine manner of ſpeache (and not otherwiſe) the Sacramente of the Body of Chriſte, is Chriſtes Body.

Augu. Epiſt. 23. ad Bonifacium.

Hereof I haue written more at large, as occaſion was offered, in my Former Replie to M. Hardinge. S. Ambroſe noting this difference, ſaithe thus, Non iſte Panis, qui vadit in ventrem: Sed Panis Vitæ Aeternæ, qui animæ noſtræ Subſtantiam fulcit: Not this Breade (of the Sacramente) *that paſſeth into the belly: but* (the Body of Chriſte it ſelfe, whiche is) the Breade of Euerlaſtinge Life: *whiche reliueth the Subſtance of our Soule*, and is ſignified by the Sacramente. Rabanus Maurus ſaithe, Aliud eſt Sacramentum, aliud vis Sacramenti. Sacramentum in Corporis alimentum redigitur: Virtute Sacramenti Aeternæ Vitæ dignitas adipiſcitur: *The* Sacramente *is one thinge: The* Power of the Sacramente, *is an other thinge. The* Sacramente *is changed into the foode, or nouriſhemente of the Body: by the* Vertue of the Sacramente,

Articulo. 21. De Conſe. diſt. 2. Non iſte.

Rabanus Lib. 1. Cap. 31.

mente, *is gotten the dignitie of Euerlastinge Life.*

Likewise S. Chrysostome, In Sacris Vasis, non ipsum Corpus Christi, sed Mysterium Corporis eius continetur: *In the Holy Vesselles is conteined*, not the Very Body of Christe it selfe, *but a* Mysterie, *or* Sacramente of his Body.

Chrysost. in Matthæ. Homil. 11.

So greate difference there is betweene the Sacramente, and the Body of Christe. The Sacramente passeth into the Belly: Christes Body passeth into the Soule. The Sacramente is vpon Earthe: Christes Body is in Heauen. The Sacramente is corruptible: Christes Body is glorious. The Sacramente is the Signe: Christes Body is the thinge Signified. For want of this distinction M. Hardinge wandreth blindly in the darke, he woteth not, whither. Therefore S. Augustine saithe, speakinge pourposely hereof, Ea demum est miserabilis animæ seruitus, Signa pro rebus accipere: *This is a miserable bondage of the Soule, to take the Signes in steede of the thinges, that be signified.*

Augustin. De Doctrina Christiana. Li. 3. cap. 5.

Whether, and in what sense the wicked maie be said, to eate the Body of Christ, it shalbe discussed hereafter more at large.

As for M. Hardinges Ordinarie Conclusion, Of wreastinge the Scriptures, and Holy Fathers: Of plaieinge false Lessons: Of teachinge (as he saithe) horrible Lies: and of subuertinge the people, with al other the like furniture, wee will leaue it freely, and wholy vnto the Authour.

The Apologie, Cap. 12. Division. 2.

To this Banket wee thinke the People of God oughte to be earnestly bidden, that they maie al Communicate emong them selues, and openly declare, and testifie bothe the godly Societie, which is emonge them, and also the hope, whiche they haue in Christe Iesu. For this cause, if there had benne any, whiche woulde be but a looker on, and abstaine from the Holy Communion, him did the Olde Fathers, and Bishoppes of Rome in the Primitiue Churche, before Priuate Masse came vp, excommunicate, as a wicked person, and as a Pagane. Neither was there any Christian at that time, whiche did Communicate alone, whiles other looked on. For so did Calixtus in times past decree, That after the Consecration vvas finished, al should Communicate, excepte they had rather stande vvithout the Churche doores. For thus (saithe he) did the Apostles appointe, and the same the Holy Churche of Rome keepeth stil.

M. Hardinge.

Let this Banket be dighte as it oughte to be: let the beste dishe be made readie in due sorte, whiche is the very Body of our Sauioure Christe: let the gheستes be tolde what is sette before them at that Holy Table: let them be taughte to beleue rightly, to prooue, and prepare them selues, as behoueth: then wee thinke it moste conueniente the people of God to be bidden thereto, not thereby to Communicate amonge them selues onely, but also, and rather to Communicate with God, to be incorporate in Christe, and to be made Partakers of al the benefites of God procured to man by the Deathe of his Sonne suffered in that Body, whiche at this highe Feaste they eate. This Banket beinge thus set foorth, if some deuoute persons thinke them selues for good causes vnworthy to assaie thereof, and to receiue that heauenly foode Sacramentally, findinge them selues not so wel prepared, as S. Paule requireth in that behalfe, yet for loue of it desire to be presente, and beholde that Table, and spiritually to taste of that healthful Dishe by Faithe, Charitie, Praier, and feruent Deuotion, wherein they doo not wholy absteine from the Holy Communion: such (a) are not to be condemned as idle lookers on, for so yee make them, not to be driuen out of the Churche. Neither did euer the Olde Fathers, and Bishoppes of Rome in the Primitiue Churche (saie what ye wil Defenders) excommunicate them, muche lesse did they repute them for (b) wicked Persons, and Paganes. And (c) not seldome the Priest at the Masse (whiche for this respecte with vnreasonable Noueltie yee terme Priuate) when none other were disposed to receiue with him Sacramentally, but Spiritually onely, hathe receiued alone the Holy thinges, whiche he hathe offered.

Deuoute lookers on doo Spiritually Communicate.

(a) Vntruth. For the Catholique Fathers condēned them.

(b) Vntruth. For S. Chrysostome calleth them, *Impudentes, & improbos. Ad Ephes. Homil. 3.*

(c) Vntruthe, coldely auouched. Reade the Answeare.

Neither

Calist' alleaged for Anacletus. The Defendersrequire moreof the Catholikes than they performe thé selues. The place of Anaclet' discussed. This Commaundement of receiuing the Communiõ geuen by Anacletus pertaineth only to the Ministers of the Church in solemne Feastes. See the 9. Canon of the Apostles.

Neither the Decree of Anacletus, whiche ye beinge deceiued by Gratian (d) vntruely father vpon Calixtus, requireth that (d) al the people present shoulde Communicate with the Priestе at the Masse. VVhiche thinge ye shoulde not haue obiected to the Churche, seeinge that it is not obserued by your owne Newe order in your Congregations. Reade the Epistle of Anacletus, from whence this Decree is taken, and your selues wil confesse the same. That Holy Father and Martyr prescribeth the Order whiche he would to be kepte, when Bishoppes, or Priestes saie Masse: VVhiche was, that it be donne in places consecrated to God, that a Bishop at his Masse haue witnesses with him moe then an other Priestе. In the (d) solemne Feastes he requireth Seuen, Fiue, or three Deacons, likewise Subdeacons, and other Ministers, al cloathed in hallowed Vestimentes to attende vpon him, to stande of euery side of him with a contrite harte, and humble Sprite lookinge donewarde, keepinge him from malicious menne, geuinge consente to his Sacrifice. Thus muche beinge declared in that Epistle, it foloweth immediately, *Peracta autem Consecratione, &c.* And when the Consecration is ended, let them al Communicate, that wil not be keapte without the Churche Doores. For so the Apostles haue ordeined, and the Holy Churche of Rome obserueth. VVho seeth not this requeste of receiuinge the Communion to be referred (e) to the Priestes, Deacons, Subdeacons, and other Ministers in solemne Feastes, seruinge the Bishop at Masse? For in that place Anacletus speaketh neuer a woorde expressely of the Lay people. Therefore yee deceiue the vnlearned Reader with a Lie.

(d) Vntruthes three togeather as shal appeare.

(e) Vntruthe, plaine, and manifeste. Reade the Answeare.

For the better vnderstandinge of this Decree, specially whereas Anacletus allegeth the Apostles ordinaunce for the same, the ninth Canon of the Apostles is to be considered: In which they require (f) euery Ecclesiastical person to be partaker of the Sacrifice, that is offered, or to be excluded from the Communion: onlesse he shewe iuste cause for the contrary. The reason whereof in that Canon expressed is this: Leaste the Clerkes absteininge from the Communion shoulde be occasion of offense to the people, and thereby raise an euil suspition againste him, that Sacrificed, as thoughe he had not made the Oblation as it ought to be.

(f) Vntruthe. For in the Apostles Canons it is written thus: *Quicunq; Fideles ingrediuntur in Ecclesiam, &c. Canone, 10.*

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Let this Banket be dight (saithe **M. Hardinge**) as it ought to be: Let the beste dishe be made ready. **Good Christian Reader, the beste, the wholesomest, the moste pleasante, and moste Comfortable Dishe at this Table, is the Deathe of Christe, that Lambe of God, that hath taken awaie the Sinnes of the worlde. Thus** Christe **him selfe, the Maister of this Feaste, hathe willed vs to dresse this Dinner:** *Doo this* (saithe he) *in Remembrance of mee.* **Likewise** S. Paule, *As often as ye shal eate of this Breade, and drinke of this Cuppe, yee shal shewe forthe, and publishe the Lordes Deathe, vntil he comme.* 1. *Corinth.* 11.

This Banket therefore is not the outwarde, or bare Sacramente, **but** Christes very Body, **and** Bloude, **whiche are represented vnto vs by the** Sacramente: **And, as it is before alleged out of** S. Ambrose, *It is not the* Breade (**of the Sacramente**) that passeth into the belly, but the Breade of Euerlastinge Life, *Whiche releueth the Substance of the Soule.* **Therefore** S. Hierome saithe, Iudaicas fabulas repellamus, & Ascendamus cum Domino in Cœnaculum magnum stratum, atque mundatum, & accipiamus ab eo sursum Calicem Noui Testamenti: *Lette vs abandonne from vs Iewishe Fables, and lette vs* Ascende *vp with our Lorde into Heauen, into that greate Parlare dreaste, and made cleane:* and there aboue lette vs receiue of him, *the Cuppe of the Newe Testamente.* De Con. Dist. 2. *Non iste.* Hieronym. Ad Hedibiam.

In this sense S. Cyprian saithe, Vident hæc Sacramenta Pauperes Spiritu, & hoc Vno contenti Ferculo, omnes huius mundi delicias aspernantur: & possidentes Christum, aliquam huius mundi possidere suppellectilem dedignantur: *The poore in Sprite see these* Sacramentes, *and beeinge contented with this* Onely Dishe, *they despise al other the deinty fares of the worlde: and hauinge possession of* Christe, *they disdeigne to possesse any worldly Substance.* Cyprian De Cœna Domini.

In like sorte speakinge of the Birthe of Christe, he saithe thus: Ea quæ licita sunt, & concessa, tangamus: & circa incunabula Saluatoris Prima Infantiæ eius Fercula degustemus: *Let vs touche those thinges, that be lawful for vs to touche: and standinge aboute the Cradle of our Sauioure, let vs taste of the* Firste Dishe of his Childehoode. Cyprian De Natiuitate Christi.

Like wise saithe S. Augustine, Cœcus interius Panem Christum non videt. Et beatus est? Hoc non dicit, nisi Pariter Cœcus: *He, that is blinde in his hart within, seeth not* Christ, *that is* our Breade. *And is he blessed? Noman wil so saie, onlesse it be one as blinde, as he.* August. in Psalmum. 57.

But, what manner of Feaste is it, that M. Hardinge prepareth for the people? Howe is it seasoned? howe is it dresse? Firste, by very vncourteous, and vntrue dealinge, he withdraweth the one halfe, that is, the Cuppe of the Newe Testamente, **and reserueth it seuerally to him selfe: and yet woulde make the people beleaue, they haue the whole. And thus dothe he, when he hathe greatest companie to**

Suppe with him, and, when his feaste is beste furnished. Otherwise he suffereth his gheastes to stande a lufte, and he consumeth al his prouision him selfe alon. Neither in deede hath he any thinge to set before them, saainge onely a cold surcharge of deade Shewes, and doumbe Ceremonies. The poore people heareth nothinge, Understandeth nothinge, Eateth nothinge, Drinketh nothinge, Tasteth nothinge. They publishe not the Lordes Deathe: They knowe not the Lordes Supper.

Suidas. To sutche a Banket Pasetes the Juggler used sommetimes to calle his frendes. There was great shewe of varietie, and plentie of al manner of Meates, & Drinkes, the Table fulle. But when any of the gheastes woulde haue touched any thinge, it vanished suddainely awaie, and was turned to nothinge. And so, when their eies were fulle, they put vp their knives, and rose ahungred. Euen thus M. Hardinge feedeth, and feasteth the people of God, with Shewes, and Ceremonies, and suffereth them in the meane while to sterue for hungre. Euen as the Prophete saithe, *Esai. 29.* *It shalbe like the dreame of a hungrie man. Beholde he eateth, and maketh merry: But when he is awakte, his Soule is emptie.*

Good menne (saithe M. Hardinge) withdrawe them selues, and are contented to be presente onely, and to stande by: but receiue not the Sacramente. But Chrysostome saithe to sutche a good deuoute man, *If thou stande by, and doo not Communicate, thou arte* wicked, *thou arte* shameleſſe, *thou arte* impudente. *Thou wilt saie,* I am vnworthy *to be partaker of the Holy Mysteries. Then arte thou* vnworthy *to be partaker of the Praiers. Thou maiſte nomore* stande here, then one of the Nouices, called Catechumeni, *that neuer was Christened.*

Chryſoſt. ad Epheſ. Homil. 3. Impudens. Improbus.

M. Har. fo. 342. b *Addition.* ☞ M. Hardinge. A wise man, as M. Iewel taketh him selfe, to be, would vnderstande, that, how earnestly so euer Chrysostome speaketh, to prouoke, that were present, to Communicate, his woordes importe a Counsel rather then a Precepte. Addition ☞

Chryſoſtom. ad Epheſ. Homil. 3. *The Answeare.* I neede not to telle you, M. Hardinge, what you take youre selfe to be. S. Chrysostome saithe, *Who so euer standeth by, refusinge to Communicate, is wicked, and shameleſſe, and vnworthy to be partaker of the Praiers: after the Communion is ended, thou maiſte lawfully comme, and see: but while the Mysteries are presente, departe thee hence. Thou maiſte nomore be here, then a* Catechumenus, *or a* Nouice, *that neuer was Baptized.* Do al these woordes importe onely a Counsel, M. Hardinge, and no Commaundemente?

De Conſecra. Diſt. 2. Peracta. Canon. 10. Anacletus saithe, *Let them al Communicate, onleſſe they wilbe thruſte out of the Churche.* The Apostles in their Canons saie thus: *Who so entreth into the Churche, and heareth the Scriptures, and receiueth not the Communion, let him be Excommunicate, as a diſturber of the Churche, and a breaker of Order.* Thomas of Aquine saithe, Statutum fuit, vt Fideles quotidiè Communicarent: *It was a Decree, that the Faithefull shoulde Communicate euery daie.* It was a Decree, saithe Thomas, It was an Ordinance, It was a Lawe, It was a Statute. Yet muste woe saie, for youre pleasure, that maters of Excommunication, and Disturbance of the Churche, Decrees, Lawes, Ordinances, and Statutes, are onely Counselles, and no Commaundementes? Happy are you, that haue suche power, to change the Nature of thinges, and so easily of Counselles to make Commaundementes, and of Commaundementes to make Counselles, when you liste. ☞

Here, gentle Reader, maiſte thou see, a maruellous change in the Churche of God. The thinge, that in olde times was coumpted Heathenishe, Impudencie, and VVickednesse, is nowe, by M. Hardinges Newe Diuinitie, becomme Godlinesse, and greate Deuotion.

Not Seldome But, God wote, here foloweth a very colde Affeueration. Not seldome (he saie) the Prieste at the Masse, when none other were disposed, receiued alone. O, M. Hardinge, the worlde wel seeth, youre woorde is no Gospel. It appeareth by youre so many Untruthes, he care not greately, what you saie. Thus he telle vs, Not seldome the Prieste receiued alone. Not seldome? What is that? why speake you so nicely? what meaneth this colde, and doubtefull eloquence, specially in him, that otherwise hathe acquainted his voice, to speake so bigge? why saie you not, The Prieste vsed daiely, and commonly so to doe? Or, if he coulde not auouche so greate Untruthe for

Priuate Masse.

for very shame, why saide you not, The Priest oftentimes, or at somme certaine times receiued alone: at the leaste, at foure, or three, or twoo sundrie times, within the space of fiue hundred yeres? At the worste, if ye had saide, but Once, it had benne somme what. As for, Not seldome, it is too base: it is too simple: it disgraceth the whole course of your pleadinge, and in plaine speache soundeth, as muche, as Neuer. It had rather benne youre parte, takinge vpon you this countenance of credite, and grauitie, to haue tolde vs substantially, and plainely, what manner of man this Priest was: where he dwelte: what was his name: when, and where, and in what Companie he saide this Masse: who sawe it: who hearde it: who bare witnesse to it: by what Recorde, or Authoritie it maie be proued. The mater beinge so greate, and of suche Antiquitie, is there noman leafte behinde, to witnesse the same, but M. Hardinge? In your Former Answeare ye bringe vs in Boies, Girles, Sicke folke, Laie people, and VVeemen: and vpon suche grounde ye sticke not to founde your Priuate Masse. And doubteleſſe theise examples might haue semed to stande you in somme prety steede, if in those daies Boies, and VVeemen had benne Prieſtes. For Prieſte, or Bishop, that euer receiued the Sacramente alone, in the Churche, before the people, ye are not yet able to shewe vs one. As for your Leontius, and Amphilochius, and S. Basiles Masse at Midnighte, and other like folies, and fables, it semeth by the silence, ye vse in your late Reioinder, ye are contented wisely, and quietly to geue them ouer.

Ye saie, VVee are deceiued by Gratian, and haue placed Calixtus in steede of Anacletus. Here firſt of al, ye confeſſe, that Gratian your greate Rabbin, the Father, and Fountaine of your Decrees might be deceiued. And verily suche plainenesse in dealinge, if ye woulde vouchesaue to vse it oftener, were worthy of somme commendation. For in deede your Gratian, as he was a man of greate readinge, and smal iudgemente, so he alleageth oftentimes, he knoweth not what: Hierome, for Origen: Cyprian, for Auguſtine: Beda, for Ambroſe: Iuuencus, for Vincentius: Greeke, for Latine: Newe for Olde. As for this Authoritie, wherein you saie, we are deceiued, he alleageth it in two sundrie places: firſte vnder the name of Anacletus: nexte vnder the name of Calixtus: meaninge, I trowe, if there were errour in the one, at leaſte to redreſſe it by the other. Therefore M. Hardinge, if ye had loked better vpon your Booke, what so euer opinion ye haue of Gratian, your Doctour, ye should haue founde, that we, for our parte, were nothinge deceiued. Howe be it, your Gratian, in steede of one errour, hathe made two. For in deede, as it is true, that these wordes were neuer written by Calixtus: so, of the other side, it is likewise true, they were neuer written by Anacletus: but were manifeſtly forged, and falsified by others, that followed afterwarde: as in my Former Replie I haue declared more at large.

De Con. Diſt. 1. Epiſcopus. De Con. Diſt. 2. Feraſia.

Artic. 4. Diuiſ. 3

But it is a worlde to see, what wiles, and shiftes these menne can finde to beare out errour. Firſte (ye saie) These woordes were spoken of the Prieſtes, Deacons, and Subdeacons, seruinge the Prieſte at Masse vpon solemne Feaſtes. Pardonne me, M. Hardinge, to saie the Truthe. For verily, notwithstandinge this solemne tale, it semeth, ye knowe not, what ye saie. For it maie pleaſe you to remember, that youre Anacletus, whose forged Authoritie ye haue alleged, was Bishop in Rome in the time of S. Peter, shortly vpon the Deathe of Christe, when the Churche was euery where vnder perſecution, and ful of Bloude. Nowe, I praie you, who euer tolde you, either of any office, that your Subdeacons had in the Holy Miniſterie, or of any greate highe Holy Daies, of Duplex, or magis Duplex, or principal Solemne Feaſte in the Churche of God, in al that time? Saie we thinke, that the Bleſſed Virgins, and the Apoſtles Daies were keapte Highe, and Holy, while the same Bleſſed Virgine, and Apoſtles were yet aliue? Thoughe ye had none other regarde, either to God, or to youre selfe, yet shame shoulde forze you, to forbeare more aduiſedly, what ye saie.

But youre greatteſte folie appeareth in the shiftinge, and glosinge of theise wordes. For you saie, This Calixtus, or Anacletus speaketh onely of the Prieſtes, the Deacons, and the Subdeacons: and neuer a woorde expreſſely of the Laie people: and therefore, ye saie) wee deceiue the vnlearned Reader with a Lie. Touchinge youre vncourteous speache, I

weighe it none otherwiſe, but as it is. The Truthe wilbe hable euermore to beare it ſelfe. But, that theſe woordes of Anacletus, or Calixtus, touche not the Laie people, but onely the Prieſtes, and the Miniſters, the very Gloſer him ſelfe was neuer, either ſo vnſkilful, or ſo impudente, ſo to ſaie. For, whereas the woordes be theſe, *Let them al* Communicate, *onleſſe they wilbe removed out of the Churche*, he ſetteth thereto this expoſition, Hoc antiquum eſt: Nam hoc hodiè relictum videtur arbitrio cuiuſlibet: This was the olde maner: For nowe adaies it is free for euery man to doo therein, what he wil.

De Con. Diſt. 2. Peracta. In Gloſſa.

The like Decree is founde vnder the name of the Apoſtles Canons: Quicunque fideles ingrediuntur in Eccleſiam, & Scripturas audiunt, non autem perſeuerant in Oratione, nec Sanctam Communionem percipiunt, velut qui ordinis perturbationem commouent, ab Eccleſiæ Communione arceri conuenit: *As many (*not onely of the Prieſtes, and Miniſters, but) of the Faithful people, *as comme into the Church, and heare the Scriptures, but continewe not out the Praiers, nor receiue the Holy Communion, let them be put from the Communion of the Church, as menthat woorke the breache of Order.* Likewiſe it is noted in the Margin vpon the ſame Canons, Omnes olim, qui intererant, Communicabant: *In olde times al*, that were preſente, did Communicate. In the Counſel of Antioche it was Decreed thus: Omnes, qui ingrediuntur in Eccleſiam Dei, & Sacras Scripturas audiunt, auerſantur autem perceptionem Dominici Sacramenti, &c. ab Eccleſia abijci oportet, &c. Al, that comme into the Churche *of God, and heare the Holy Scriptures, and refuſe the receiuinge of the Lordes Sacramente, let them be put from the Churche.* Theſe Decrees reache not onely to the Miniſters of the Churche, but alſo to the whole people.

Canon. Apoſt. l. Can. 9. In Margine. Concil. Antiochen. Can. 2. Concil. Aquiſgran. Cap. 70.

Clemens, that was Biſhop in Rome, as it is thought, nexte after this Anacletus, ſaithe thus, Tanta in Altario Holocauſta offerantur, quanta populo ſufficere debeant: *Let ſo many Loues be offered at the Aultare, as maie ſuffice to ſerue,* (not onely the Miniſters, but alſo) *the people.*

Clemens Epiſt. 2

S. Ambroſe ſaithe, Munus oblatum totius populi ſit: quia in vno Pane omnes ſignificantur. Per idem enim, quod vnum ſumus, de vno Pane omnes ſumere oportet: *The Oblation offered is made the whole peoples: for that in one Breade* al are ſignified. *For in that wee are al one*, wee muſte al receiue of one Breade.

Ambroſ. in 1. Corinth. 11.

S. Chryſoſtome ſaithe vnto the people, Neque nos abundantiùs, vos autem minùs, de Sacra menſa participamus: Sed pariter, & ex æquo illam vtrique deguſtamus: *Neither doo wee receiue more, and you leſſe of the Holy Table: but wee taſte thereof* equally bothe togeather. The like might be alleged out of S. Hierome, S. Auguſtine, Dionyſius, and others.

Chryſoſt. in 2. Theſſal. Homi. 4

But, for as mutche, as yée ſo bitterly tel vs, that wee miſconſtrue theſe woordes of Anacletus, and deceiue the vnlearned Reader with a Lie, maie it therefore pleaſe you farther to heare, what your owne late Scholaſtical Doctours haue written, and iudged in this behalfe.

Thomas of Aquine ſaithe, In Primitiua Eccleſia, quando magna vigebat deuotio Fidei Chriſtianæ, ſtatutum fuit, vt Fideles quotidiè Communicarent: *In the Primitiue Churche, when greate Deuotion of the Chriſtian Faithe was in ſtrengthe, it was ordeined,* that the Faithful ſhoulde receiue the Communion euery daie. Durandus ſaithe, In Primitiua Eccleſia omnes Fideles quotidiè Communicabant: *In the Primitiue Churche* al the Faithful *daily receiued the Communion.* Hugo Cardinalis ſaithe, In Primitiua Eccleſia omnes, quotquot intererant Canoni Miſſæ, ſingulis diebus Communicabant. Et, ſi nollent Communicare, egrediebantur poſt Offertorium: *In the Primitiue Church,* as many as were preſente at the Canon of the Maſſe, *did daiely Communicate: and, if they woulde not, they departed fourthe after the Offertorie.*

Durandus in Rational. Li. 4. Cap. 55. Hugo Cardinal. in Luc. cap. 24.

If yée thinke, theſe Authorities are not ſufficiente, Iohannes Cochlæus ſaithe, Omnes olim, tum Sacerdotes, tum Laici, cum Sacrificante Communicabant, ſicut ex Canonibus Apoſtolorum, & ex Libris antiquiſsimorum Eccleſiæ Doctorum perſpicuè cognoſcitur. Hic vnicum hac de re Canonem recitabo, qui Calixto adſcribitur: Peracta, &c. *In olde times bothe al the Prieſtes, and* al the Laie people *receiued the Communion.*

Iohan. Cochlæ. contra Muſcul. De Sacrificio.

Anacletus Calixtus.

nion with the Minister, that had made the Oblation: as it is plainely perceiued by the Canons of the Apostles, and by the Bookes of the Anciente Doctours of the Churche. One Canon hereof I wil allege, written by Calixtus: &c. Like wise saithe Iudocus Clichthoueus, In Primitiua Ecclesia Fideles quotidie sumebant Communionem, secundum illam Calixti Sanctionem, Peracta, &c. *In the Primitiue Churche* the Faithful *receiued the Communion euery daie*, accordinge to this Decree of Calixtus, &c.

Iudocus Clichthoueus in Canon Missæ.

Here you maie se, not onely, that these wordes are alleged by youre owne Doctours, vnder the name of Calixtus, wherein you haue noted so greate an errour, but also that the same wordes, by the iudgemente of the same Doctours, are thought to perteine no lesse to the Laie people, then to the Preste.

Nowe, M. Hardinge, these thinges considered, I referre the indifferente iudgemente hereof to youre owne knowledge, and Conscience, whether of vs two hathe deceiued the Reader with a Lie.

The Apologie, Cap. 12. Diuision. 3.

Moreouer, when the people commeth to the Holy Communion, the Sacramente oughte to be geeuen them in Bothe Kindes: for so bothe Christe hathe commaunded, and the Apostles in euery place haue ordeined, and al the Anciente Fathers, and Catholique Bishoppes haue folowed the same. And who so doothe contrarie to this, he (as Gelasius saithe) committeth Sacrilege And therefore wee saie, that our Aduersaries at this daie, who hauinge violently thruste out, and quite forbidden the Holy Communion, doo without the woorde of God, without the Authoritie of any Anciente Councel, without any Catholique Father, without any Example of the Primitiue Churche, yea & without reason also, defende, and mainteine their Priuate Masses, and the manglinge of the Sacramentes, and doo this not onely againste the plaine expresse Commaundemente of Christe, but also againste al Antiquitie doo wickedly therein, and are very Churcherobbers.

De Consec. Dist. 2. Comperimus.

M. Hardinge.

Communion vnder bothe Kindes not commaunded expressly by Christ nor ordeined by the Apostles.

An vnshamefaste and slaunderous lie.

Softe, and fayre, Maisters. Yee shewe more heate then witte, more stomake then learninge, more anger then reason. Yee saie mutche, and proue litle. But saie yee, and saie againe, what ye wil: wee telle you boldely, that (a) neither Christe euer commaunded, (a) nor the Apostles ordeined, (a) nor al the Anciente Fathers obserued, that the Sacrament be geuen to the people none otherwise, but vnder bothe Kindes onely. If Christe had expressely commaunded it, the Churche (of Rome) had not so longe time receiued, and kepte the vse of one Kinde. The Apostles and sundry Holy Fathers Ministred bothe kindes: wee confesse. That the one Kinde was not also by them Ministred, and that it is vtterly vnlawful, wee denie, (b) and the same shal ye neuer be hable to proue. Touchinge this whole pointe, and howe litle, that ye allege out of Gelasius, maketh for you, and concerninge Masse not to be omitted for lacke of companie, to Communicate Sacramentally with the Priest: (c) I haue saide yenoughe in my answeare to your fellowe, M. Iewel his chalenge. Bringe yee other stuffe, and better then this, or els al the worlde wil see your haltinge, and the feeblenesse of your side. That wee haue violently thruste out, and quite forbidden the Holy Commnnion, onlesse yee meane your owne Schismatical, mutable, and polluted Communion, if there were any sparke of shame, or hatred of lyinge in you, yee woulde neuer impute it vnto vs. God doothe knowe, and the worlde is not vnwittinge, (d) howe muche, howe often, and howe earnestly the Catholike Churche exhorteth her Children to prepare them selues, to receiue their (e) Maker. And thoughe the people of Englande of late yeeres resorted not commonly thereto, yet the deuotion of Christen folke in this Countrie of base Almaigne, in Fraunce, in Italy, in Spaine, and in sundrie other Christen Prouinces, is so feruente in frequentinge the Holy Communion, as if yee sawe it, ye woulde be ashamed of youre slaunderous reporte. Let wise men, and good men iudge, whether wee be Churcherobbers, or ye vnshamefaste Liers.

(a) Vntruthes, three togeather boldely presumed.

(b) To proue a Negatiue, it is a folie. But you shal neuer proue the affirmatiue.

(c) Certainely yenough. For in the same twoo Articles ye haue vttered threescore and foure greate Vntruthes.

(d) Vntruthe, so sensible, and so grosse, that a man maie feele it with his fingers.

(e) Vntruth. No Learned Father euer called the Sacramente his God, or Maker.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Where nothinge is answeared, it were not amisse, to replie nothinge. If M. Hardinge can onely vouchesaue, to cal vs slaunderous Reporters, and vnshamefaste Liers: and the Lordes Supper a Schismatical, Mutable, polluted Communion, it is

sufficiente: the case needeth no farther proufe. To this whole mater M. Hardinge saithe, He hathe sufficiently answeared M. Iewel. He hathe answeared, I graunte: but howe sufficiently, the mater it selfe wil declare. Howe be it, he maie not in any wise forgeate, that in the same two shorte Treaties to M. Iewel, conteininge onely two and fourtie litle leaues of Paper, he hathe sente vs ouer, and published three score and foure notable, & greate vntruthes: whereof, I thinke, he hathe no greate cause so muche to glorie.

He saithe, That the Sacramente shoulde be deliuered to the people in Bothe Kindes, neither Christe commaunded it, nor the Apostles euer ordeined it. Thus M. Hardinge saithe, onely bicause it liketh him thus to saie. Yet his owne Catholique Doctoures, and the Chiefe Champions of that side saie farre otherwise. Gerardus Lorichius saithe, Ipsius Sacramenti Institutio vult, vt Omnes vnà manducemus, & bibamus: *The very* Institution *of the Sacrament it selfe willeth, that* we eate, and drinke al togeather.

De Miss. Publica prorogenda.

And Ruardus Tapper the Deane of Louaine saithe thus: Habito respectu ad Sacramentum, eiusque perfectionem, magis conueniret, sub Vtraque specie fieri Communionem, quàm sub altera tantùm. Hoc enim magis consonum est eius Institutioni, & integritati, & refectioni Corporali: imò & exemplo Christi, & Patrum Primitiuæ Ecclesiæ: *Consideration had vnto the Sacramente, and to the perfection of the same, it were more conueniente, that the Communion were Ministred vnder* Bothe Kindes, *then vnder* One alone. *For this were more agreeable to the* Institution, *and fulnesse thereof, and to the outwarde perfection of the Body. Yea and to the example bothe of Christe, and also of the Fathers of the Primitiue Churche.*

Cassander De Vtraque Specie. Pag. 29.

Certainely theise woordes of Christe, Drinke yee al of this: Doo this in my remembrance, are very plaine woordes of commaundemente, and Institution. Therefore Chrysostome saithe, Et in Pane, & in Calice Christus dixit, Hoc facite in meam Commemorationem: Christe *bothe in the Breade, and* also in the Cuppe *saide, Doo this in remembrance of mee.*

Chrysost. in 1. Corin. Homil. 27

Likewise Theophylactus, Tremendus Calix pari cunctis conditione traditus est: *The Reuerende Cuppe is in* equal manner *deliuered* to al. And, whereas Christe saith, Drinke yee al of this, Paschasius, to make the mater the plainer, putteth thereto theise woordes: Tam Ministri, quàm reliqui Credentes: *As wel the Ministers, as the* reste of the Faitheful. In like manner S. Augustine saithe, Simul hoc sumimus: simul bibimus: quia simul viuimus: *Wee receiue togeather:* wee drinke togeather: *bicause wee liue togeather.*

Theophylact. 1. Corinth. 11.

Paschasius. De Con. Dist. 2. Quis passus.

M. Har. fo 343 b

Addition. ☞ M. Hardinge. The Literal sense of those woordes, Drinke yee al of this, was none other, then that the Cuppe shoulde be diuided bitweene al the twelue in suche sorte, that twoo, or three of them shoulde not drinke it vp, as thinkinge to haue it filled againe for the reste. But, that Peter shoulde so drinke, as to leaue somme for Iohn: And Iohn so, as to leaue somme for Andrewe: And so eche man to leaue somme deale, til the very laste man had drunke of that Cuppe &c. Addition ☞

The Answeare. This is a mannerly kinde of Diuinitie, and méete to be noted by M. Hardinge for manners sake.

M. Hardinge. Paschasius in that place disputeth of Spiritual eatinge, or drinkinge, and saith, that as wel the Faitheful people, as the Ministees muste drinke Spiritually of this Cuppe.

M. Hard. 344. b.

The Answeare. O good Reader, howe longe wil M. Hardinge abuse thy simplicitie? Verily Paschasius in that place wrote onely of the Sacramente, as M. Hardinge wel knoweth. But he saithe, Solus Christus est, qui frangit hunc Panem: *It is* Christe *onely, that breaketh this Breade.* Wil you therefore saie, M. Hardinge, he spake not of the Sacramente? The nexte woordes folowinge, are theise, Per manus Ministrorum distribuit credentibus: Christe *diuided the Cuppe vnto the Faithefull by the handes of the Ministers.* I beséeche you, is this the Ministration of the Sacramente? Or, what wil you calle it? Muste Paschasius be forced to make Spiritual Ministers, Spiritual Handes, Spiritual Cuppes, Spiritual Receiuers, Spiritual Beléeuers, and al Spiritual for your pleasure? But Paschasius saithe, Christe *breaketh this Breade.*

Aug. contra Literas Petiliæ, li. 3. cap. 49.

So S. Augustine saithe of the Sacramente of Baptisme, *It is* Christe *that Baptiseth.*

Institution in Bothe Kindes.

zeth. And Chryſoſtome ſaithe, *It is not the Prieſte, that Baptizeth thee: It is God himſelfe, that holdeth thy Heade.* Shal we therefore ſaie, That theſe wordes belonge nothinge to the Sacramente of outwarde Baptiſme, but onely to the inwarde, and Spiritual waſhinge of the Soule? Verily Paſchaſius is as cleare, as the Sunne beames. Conſider the whole circumſtance of the place. He ſpeaketh onely of the Sacramente. His wordes be euidente, *Take, and Drinke yee al of this, as wel the Miniſteri, as the reſte of the Faithefull.* Leaue this vanitie, M. Harding: It is meete for Children. Manlineſſe is more ſeemely for a man.

Chryſ. in Matth. Homil. 5.

Notwithſtandinge any Promiſſe of Conſtancie, made to the contrarie, yet, I truſte, M. Hardinge of his courteſie wil beleeue, either S. Chryſoſtome, or S. Auguſtine, or Theophylacte, or Paſchaſius, or Lorichius, or Tapper, or his Newe Doctours, or the Olde, or his owne, or others. Otherwiſe, if he be fully determined to beleue noman, it is reaſon, that noman beleue him.

Here haue we Chriſtes VVoorde, Chriſtes Example, Chriſtes Ordinance: The Tradition, Perfection, and Inſtitution of the Sacramente. Nowe, let M. Hardinge ſhewe vs the Authoritie of any one Anciente Father, either Greeke, or Latine, by whom it maie appeare, that Chriſte commaunded the Sacrament to be deliuered to the people in One kinde onely, and not in Bothe, Or, that Chriſte appointed One Order of Receiuinge the Sacramente for the Prieſte, and an other for the people: and it ſhalbe ſufficiente: we wil ſtriue no further.

Perhaps he wil ſaie, Notwithſtandinge Chriſtes wordes be plaine, yet they are not of force ſufficiente, to binde vs for euer. For ſo writeth Cardinal Cuſanus touchinge the ſelfe ſame mater: Scripturæ ad tempus adaptantur, & variè intelliguntur: ita vt vno tempore ſecundum currentem Eccleſiæ ritum exponantur: mutato verò ritu, iterum ſententia mutetur: The Scriptures are applied to the ſtates of diuers times, and ſo are taken in diuers ſenſes: *So that at one time they are expounded accordinge to the currente order of the Churche: But the order of the Churche beeinge changed, the ſenſe of the Scripture is likewiſe changed.* So S. Auguſtine ſaithe of the Heretiques the Manichees: Expendunt iſta, non in ſtatera æqua Diuinarum Scripturarum, ſed in ſtatera doloſa Conſuetudinum ſuarum: *They weighe theſe maters, not in the equal Balance of the Diuine Scriptures, but in the deceiteful Balance of* theire owne Cuſtomes.

Nicola. Cuſanus Epiſt. 2. ad Bohemos.

Auguſt. Contra Epiſt. Parmenant. Lib. 3. cap. 2.

Of the like ſorte of Heretiques S. Hilarie ſaithe, Qui ea, quæ ſcripta ſunt, negas, quid reſtat, niſi vt ea, quæ non ſcripta ſunt, credas: *Seeinge thou denieſt the thinges, that be written in the Scriptures, what remaineth there, but that thou muſte beleue ſutche thinges, as be not written in the Scriptures.*

Hilar. de Trinitate. Lib. 9.

But where haue theſe menne the Inſtitution of their Halfe Communion? Who ordeined it? Who commaunded it? What Apoſtle, what Anciente Doctour, what Holy Father euer vſed it? M. Hardinge him ſelfe was forced to confeſſe, by the reporte of Leo, that the firſte knowen Diuiſers, and Authoures of it, were the Olde Heretiques called the Manichees. Sutche is the Inſtitution, and Antiquitie of their Doctrine. It ſprange firſte of Hereſie, and was founded by Heretiques.

M. Har. Pa. 48. b Leo. Sermõn. 4. De Quadrageſima.

Touchinge Gelaſius, I haue alreadi in my Former Replie ſaide ſo mutche, as then vnto me ſeemed ſufficiente. The wordes be plaine enough of them ſelfe, and neede no Commentarie: Aut integra Sacramenta percipiant, aut ab integris arceantur. Quia diuiſio vnius, eiuſdemque Myſterij ſine grandi Sacrilegio non poteſt peruenire: *Either let them receiue* the whole Sacramentes (in Bothe Kindes) *or els let them be driuen from* the whole. By whiche wordes of Gelaſius it maie appeare, that, where ſo euer the Sacramente is Miniſtred in One kinde onely, there is onely a parte, or a Halfe Communion, and not the whole.

De Conſec. Diſt. 2. Comperimus.

Farther M. Hardinge ſaithe, God doothe knowe, howe mutche, howe often, and howe earneſtly the Catholike Church exhorteth her children, to prepare them ſelues to receiue their maker. O M. Hardinge, why ſhoulde you ſo fondely mocke the Worlde with ſo manifeſte folies? By what wordes, by what examples exhorte you them? When euer ſaide you, as Chryſoſtome ſaithe to the people, *Departe yee hence: yee haue nomore right to ſtande here, then* Heathens, *and* Infidelles: *yee are* VVicked: *yee are* Shameleſſe: *yee are* Impupente,

Chryſoſt. ad Popul. Antioch. Homil. 61.

Impudente, *that ſtande by, and wil not Communicate.* And if the Catholique Churche doo ſo often, and ſo earneſtly exhorte her Children, howe is it then, that the Pope, and his Cardinalles doo ſo ſeldome Communicate, ſcarcely once throughe the yeere? Wate we thinke, that the Pope, and his Cardinalles be not the Children of the Churche?

In Epiſt. ad Epheſ. Homil. 3.

Laſte of al, we ſaie, Yee exhorte the people to receiue their Maker. I beſeeche you, M. Hardinge, what Scripture, what Father, what Doctoure euer taughte you thus to ſaie? The Sacrament is a Sacrament: it is not God. It is the Breade of our Lord, as S. Auguſtine ſaithe: it is not our Lorde. It is a Creature corruptible: it is not the Maker of Heauen, and Earthe. Accurſed is he, that geueth the name, and glorie of God vnto a Creature, that is no God. S. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Nolimus quæſo Creatorem cum Creatura confundere: Ne illud audiamus, Seruierunt Creaturæ potius, quam Creatori: *Let vs not confounde the Creature, and the Creatoure bothe togeather: Leaſte it be ſaide of vs, They haue honoured a Creature more, then their Maker.*

Augu. in Iohan. Tract. 59.

Chryſoſt. in Iohan. Homil. 3.

Addition. ☞ M. Hardinge. Good woordes, M. Iewel. Chriſte ſaithe, He that eateth mee, ſhal liue for mee. Was not he the Maker of Heauen, and Earthe? If he were, accurſed be he, that denieth him ſo to be. Addition ☞

M. Hard. 345. b.

The Anſweare. Hereunto, M. Hardinge, we ſaie, Amen. We knowe, that Chriſte is very God of very God. But deceiue not your ſelfe. We ſpeake nowe of the Sacramente of Chriſte, and not of Chriſte. The Sacramente is one thinge, and Chriſte is an other. We eate Chriſte onely by Faithe: we eate the Sacramente onely with the mouthe of our Body. When Chriſte ſpake theſe woordes, *He that eateth mee, ſhal liue by mee,* he ſpake onely of him ſelfe to be eaten Spiritually by Faith: but he ſpake not one woorde there of the Sacramente. He, that knoweth not this, knoweth nothinge.

But S. Auguſtine ſaithe, *The Sacramente is called Life.* What then? Yet he ſaithe not, The Sacramente is called our Maker. S. Paule ſaithe, Petra erat Chriſtus: *The Rocke was* Chriſte: Yet you maie not ſo vnaduiſedly conclude hereof, That the ſame Rocke was the Maker of the worlde. Howe be it, S. Auguſtine ſaithe, *The Sacramente of* Chriſtes *Body was called Life:* So he ſaithe euen in the ſame place, *The Sacramente of Baptiſme was called,* Salus, *Salnation:* And S. Cyprian calleth the ſame, *The Fountaine of Life:* And S. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, *The Baptiſme of* Chriſte, *is* Chriſtes *Bloude:* This is no leſſe, then if they had ſaide, Baptiſme is Life. And yet none of them euer ſaide, The Water of Baptiſme is our Maker. S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Plus eſt Vnus Deus, quam Vnus Baptiſmus. Neque enim eſt Baptiſmus Deus. Sed ideò magnum aliquid eſt, quia Sacramentum eſt Dei: *One God is more, then One Baptiſme. For Baptiſme is not God. Yet is Baptiſme a greate thinge, bicauſe it is a Sacramente of God:* God woorde therefore, M. Hardinge: and ſpare theſe Blaſphemies. For Fulgentius ſaithe, Veritatem Dei tenere, eſt Vnum Deum colere: Veritatem Dei in mendacium conuertere, eſt Creaturæ ſeruire: *To holde the Truthe of God, is to Woorſhip the Onely God: To turne the Truthe of God into a Lie, is to doo homage to a Creature.* ☜

M. Hard. 346. a.

Auguſt. de Peccatorum Meri. & Remiſſ. Li. 1 Cap. 24.

Cyprian de ſimplicita Prælator

Chryſoſt. ad Hebræ. Homil. 16.

Auguſt. de Vnico Baptiſmo, ca. 5

Fulgent. ad Donatum.

The Apologie, Cap. 13. Diuiſion. 1.

Wee affirme, that the Breade, and Wine are the Holy, and Heauenly Myſteries of the Body, and Bloude of Chriſte, and that by them Chriſte him ſelfe, beinge the true Breade of Eternal Life, is ſo preſently geeuen vnto vs, as that by Faithe wee verily receiue his Body, and Bloude. Yet ſaie wee not this ſo, as thoughe wee thoughte, that the Nature, and Subſtance of the Breade, and VVine, is clearely changed, and goeth to nothinge: as many haue dreamed in theſe later times, and yet coulde neuer agree emonge them ſelues vpon theire owne Dreames. For that was not Chriſtes meaninge, that the VVheaten Breade ſhoulde laie aparte his owne Nature, and receiue a certaine

Substance Accidents

newe Diminutie: but that he might rather Chaunge vs, and (to vse Theophylactes woordes) might Transfourme vs into his Body. For what can be saide more plainely, then that, which Ambrose saithe, Breade and VVine remaine stil the same, they were before: and yet are changed into an other thinge: Or, that, whiche Gelasius saithe, The Substance of the Breade, or the Nature of the VVine ceaseth not to be: Or, that, whiche Theodoretus saithe, After the Consecration, the Mystical Signes doo not caste of their owne proper Nature: for they remaine stil in their former Substance, Fourme, and Kinde: Or, that, whiche Augustine saithe, That, vvhiche yee see, is the Breade, and Cuppe, and so our eies doo telle vs: but that vvhich youre Faithe requireth to be taughte, is this: The Breade is the Body of Christe, and the Cuppe is his Bloude: Or, that, whiche Origen saithe, The Breade, vvhiche is Sanctified by the VVoorde of God, as touchinge the material Substance thereof, goeth into the Belly, and is caste out into the Priuie: Or, that, whiche Christe him selfe saide, not onely after the blessinge of the Cuppe, but also after he hadde Ministred the Communion: I vvil drinke nomore of this Fruite of the Vine. It is wel knowen, that the Fruite of the Vine is Wine, and not Bloude.

In Iohan. ca. 6. De Sacr. Li. 4. Cap. 4.

Gelasi. Contra Eutychetem.

In Dialog. 1. & 2.

In Sermon. ad Infantes.

In Matthæ. Hom. 15.

M. Hardinge.

What is that we cal holy and heauenly Mysteries.

In this Sacramente, after Consecration, the Substance of Breade and VVine beinge tourned into the Substance of the Body and Bloude of Christe, the * outwarde Fourmes of Breade and VVine, whiche remaine, are the Sacramentes of Holy thinges, the Body and Bloude of Christe.

* Vntruthe. No Doctour, or Father euer taught suche vaine folies.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

In euery natural thinge, two thinges are specially to be considered: the Substance, and the Accidente, or, as M. Hardinge calleth it, the outwarde Fourme. For example, In Breade, the Material thinge, that fœdeth vs, and is Changed into the Bloude, and nourisheth our Bodies, is called the Substance of the Breade: The Whitenesse, the Roundenesse, the Thicknesse, the Swœtenesse, and other the like, that are perceiued outwardly by our senses, are called Accidentes. Now, saithe M. Hardinge, for as muche as the Substance of the Breade, and Wine is remoued by Consecration, and for that cause cannot be the Sacramente: therefore the Accidentes, and Fourmes, which remaine, must nedes be thought to be the Sacramentes. And so vpon a false Position, as shal appeare, he laieth the fundation of al his Doctrine by the olde Rule, I trowe, that he learned sommetimes in his Sophistrie, Ex Impossibili sequitur quodlibet: *Of an Impossibilitie yee maie conclude, what yee liste.* Euen as aptly, and as truely, as some haue saide, If Christe were not Christe, then Saincte Patrike shoulde be Christe.

If M. Hardinge had alleged, either Scripture, or Doctour, or Father, or Counsel, or any other Authoritie biside his owne, he might happily haue benne beleeued.

To this whole fansie, gentle Reader, in my Former Replie, I haue made a seueral answeare. Verily Christe saithe, Non bibam ex hoc fructu Vitis: *I wil nomore drinke,* (not of these Accidentes, but) *of this* generation, and fruite, (and Substance) of the Vine. Matthæ. 26. Luc. 22.

S. Paule saithe, Panis, quem frangimus: (not the Fourmes, or Accidentes, but (*the* Breade, *that wee breake.* And againe, Quoties manducabitis Panem hunc: *As often as yee shal eate* (not these Accidentes, but) this Breade. 1. Corinth. 10. 1. Corinth. 11.

S. Cyprian saithe of the same, Panis ex multorum granorum adunatione congestus: Cyprian in Oratio. Dominicâ.

Subſtance Accidents In, and By

geſtus: *Breade moulded, and made of* many cornes. **I doubte not, but M. Hardinge wil confeſſe, that cornes yelde Flower, and** Subſtance: **and not onely** Fourmes, **and** Accidentes. S. Auguſtine calleth the Holy Myſterie, Sacramentum Panis, & Vini: *The Sacramente* (**not of** Fourmes, **and** Accidentes, **as M. Hardinge ſaithe, but**) *of* Breade, and wine. Cyrillus ſaith, Credentibus Diſcipulis fragmenta Panis dedit: Chriſt *gaue vnto his Diſciples, beleeuinge in him,* peeces of Breade, (**not peeces of** Accidentes.)

Auguſt. de Fide ad Petrum. ca. 19

Cyril. in Iohan. Lib. 4. cap. 24.

But M. Hardinge, hauinge in his fantaſie remoued the whole Subſtance **of the Breade, in ſtede thereof hathe brought be in** Holy Fourmes, Holy Shewes, **and** Holy Accidentes. **His** Accidentes **be the Myſteries of heauenly thinges: His** Accidentes **be the Inſtrumentes of Goddes Grace: his** Accidentes **be the cauſes of Remiſſion of Sinne. We breake** Accidentes: **We eate** Accidentes: **We drinke** Accidentes: **We are fedde with** Accidentes: **The** Subſtance **of our Bodies is increaſed with** Accidentes. **And, to be ſhorte, he worketh al his Miracles by the Power of his** Accidentes.

M. Hardinge.

VVhy be ye ſo lothe to ſpeake, as the Churche ſpeaketh, that in this bleſſed Sacramente wee receiue the Body of Chriſte? VVhy had yee rather ſaie after a * ſtrange manner, that by Breade and VVine Chriſt him ſelfe is ſo preſently geuen vnto vs, as that by Faithe wee verily receiue his Body and his Bloude.

The Defenders refuſe to ſpeake the Church ſpeaketh.

* Vntruthe. For this phraſe is vſed commonly of the Anciente Fathers: as ſhal appeare.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

I neuer thoughte, it had benne ſo greate an Hereſie, to ſpeake, as the Apoſtles of Chriſte, and the Learned Doctours of the Churche haue ſpoken before vs. S. Paule ſaithe, Conſepulti ſumus cum Chriſto Per Baptiſmum in mortem: *Wee are buried together with* Chriſte By *Baptiſme vnto Deathe.* S. Hierome ſaithe, Per Aquam Baptiſmi, vel Per Ignem Spiritus Sancti, Aeterni illius Panis Corpus efficitur: By *the Water of Baptiſme, or* By *the Fiere of the Holy Ghoſte, he is made the Body of the Euerlaſtinge Breade.* S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Habes Chriſtum in præſenti Per Fidem: In præſenti Per Baptiſmatis Sacramentum: In præſenti Per Altaris Cibum, & Potum: *Thou haſt* Chriſte *in Preſence,* By *Faithe: In Preſence,* By *the Sacramente of Baptiſme: In Preſence,* By *the Meate, and Drinke of the Aultare.* S. Cyril ſaithe, Corporaliter Filius Per Benedictionem Myſticam nobis vnitur, vt Homo: *The Sonne of God* By *the Myſtical Bleſſinge is vnited vnto vs, as Man.* S. Hilarie ſaithe, Chriſtus eſt in nobis Per Sacramentorum Myſterium: Chriſte *is in vs* By *the Myſterie of the Sacramentes.*

Roman. 6. Coloſ. 2. Hieronym. De Corp. & Sanguine Chriſti. Augu. in Iohan. Tract. 50. Cyril. in Iohan. Lib. 11. Cap. 27. Hilarius De Trinit. Lib. 8.

And, leaſte M. Hardinge ſhoulde thinke, to take any greate aduantage by theſe woordes thus vttered, as he, and others of his ſide haue often donne, S. Auguſtine **in moſte plaine wiſe expounderh the ſame:** Si ad ipſas res viſibiles, quibus Sacramenta tractantur, animum conferamus, quis neſciat, eas eſſe corruptibiles? Si autem ad id quod Per illas res agitur, quis non videat, non poſſe corrumpi? *If wee beholde the Viſible Creatures,* (**as the Breade, the Wine, the Water**) *wherein the Sacramentes are Miniſtred, who ſeeth not, that they be* corruptible? *But if wee conſider the thinges, that are wrought thereby, who ſeeth not, that they* cannot be corrupted?

Auguſti De Baptiſmo contra Donatiſt. Li. 3. Cap. 10.

Nowe iudge thou, good Chriſtian Reader, howe Childiſhely theſe quarelles be ſought againſt vs, without cauſe: and what Myſtical Catholique eares M. Hardinge hathe, that cannot abide the phraſes, and ſpeaches of the Anciente Fathers.

M. Hardinge.

If a man ſhoulde preſſe you with your owne woordes, and demaunde, what manner of Preſence ye teache, affirminge Chriſte him ſelfe preſently to be geuen: I weene, ye would be founde haltinge. For howe ſaie ye? If Chriſte be preſently geuen vnto vs by Breade and VVine in the Sacramente, then is Chriſte preſente. If he be preſente, whiche yee muſte needes graunte, tel vs further, howe is he preſent: accordinge to the Subſtance of his Body, or by Grace, or accordinge to the Maieſtie of his Godhed? The firſte, what ſhiftes ſo euer yee ſee, ye wil not graunte. And therefore is your owne Apoſtle Martin Luther at fowle defiance with your maiſters, Zwinglius, Oecolampadius, Caluine, and you, and ſo be his Diſciples, Ioachimus VVeſtphalus, Epinus, Pomeran, Heſſhuſius, Brentius, Illyricus, and many others, as ye knowe. If ye wil ſaie, he is Preſent by his Grace, ſo is he Preſent with al good men: and that not onely when the Sacramente is miniſtred, but alſo at al other times. Againe, howe can yee make good, that by Faithe we receiue his Body, and Bloude? By Faithe we receiue Grace, and the Merites of his Deathe ſuffered in his Body with ſheaddinge of his Bloude. But the Body and Bloude it ſelfe, that is, the very (a) Subſtance of his Body and Bloude: telle vs, howe by Faithe (a) properly and

VVhat preſence of Chriſte in the Sacrament doo the Defenders acknowledge

(a) Vntruthe.

and truely to ſpeake) as who ſhoulde ſaie, by Faithe made Preſente, wee receiue it? Furthermore (b) what haue ye to anſweare to this queſtion? If wee receiue the Body and Bloude of Chriſte verily by Faithe (for ſo ye ſaie) wee demaunde whether wee receiue the ſame by Faithe onely without the Body, or with the office of our Body. If the office of our Body be required to the receiuinge of Chriſtes Body in the Sacramente, as Chriſte him ſelfe (c) certainely meante (for els howe obeyed the Diſciples his commaundemente, to whome he ſaide at his Supper, Take and eate, this is my Body, likewiſe of the Cuppe, Take and Drinke, whiche cannot be done but by the ſeruice of the Body) hereof then it followeth, that his Body is verily preſent. Now, that it is not receiued by Faithe onely, thus wee proue it by your owne Doctrine: (d) It is ſo receiued, as it is preſente: but it is Preſente by Breade and VVine (as ye ſaie,) *Ergo*, it is receiued by Breade and VVine. To conclude, if by Breade and VVine, then not by Faith onely. VVil ye geeue me leaue to ſaie, what I thinke of you? Verily it ſeemeth by your vaine ianglinge, that, as S. Paule ſaithe of ſutche other like you, yee vnderſtande not, what yee ſpeake, nor whereof yee affirme.

The Body of Chriſte not receiued by Faithe onely.

Abſente in Body.

two togeather, For properly, & in Subſtance, wee receiue it not. Reade the Anſwere.

(b) VVee anſwere, It is a peeuiſhe queſtion.

(c) Vntruth. For Chriſte meante no ſuche thing, as appeareth by the Fathers.

(d) A Sophiſticall, and a childiſhe cauil. Reade the Anſwere.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

In what ſenſe wee make truely ſaie, Chriſte is either Preſente with vs, or Abſente from vs, **the mater is not doubteful, or dangerous to be anſweared: onleſſe M. Hardinge haue forgotten the Articles of his Creede. For thus wee are taught to beleeue,** Chriſte *is Aſcended into Heauen, and ſitteth at the Righte Hande of God.* **Whiche Article** S. Auguſtine **erpoundeth thus:** Noli dubitare, ibi nunc eſſe hominem Chriſtum Ieſum, vnde venturus eſt: memoriterq; recole, & fideliter tene Chriſtianam Confeſsionem, Quoniam Reſurrexit à mortuis: Aſcendit ad Cœlum: Sedet ad Dextram Patris: nec aliunde, quàm inde venturus eſt ad viuos, motuoſque iudicandos: *Doubte thou not, but* Chriſte Ieſus, *as Man, is there nowe, from whence he ſhal come: And beare thou wel in minde, and faithefully beleeue the Chriſtian Confeſsion, That* Chriſte *is Riſen againe from the Deade: And Aſcended into Heauen: And Sitteth at the Righte Hande of the Father: And that he ſhal comme againe* from thence, and from no where els, *to Iudge the quicke, and the Deade.* **Againe he ſaithe,** Homo, ſecundum Corpus, in Cœlo eſt: & de loco migrat: &, cùm ad alium locum venerit, in eo loco, vnde venit, non eſt: Chriſte, *as Man,* accordinge to his Body, *is in Heauen: and paſſeth* from place to place: *And,* when he commeth to an other place, he is not in the other place, from whence he came. **Likewiſe againe,** Secundum Præſentiam Maieſtatis, ſemper habemus Chriſtum nobiſcum: Secundum Præſentiam Carnis, rectè dictum eſt Diſcipulis, Me autem non ſemper habebitis: *Accordinge to the Preſence of his Maieſtie, wee haue* Chriſte *euermore with vs: But accordinge to the* Preſence of the Fleaſh, *it is true, that* Chriſte *ſaide to his Diſciples,* Me you ſhal not haue alwaies with you.

Auguſt. Epiſt. 57. Ad Dardan.

Augu. in Iohan. Tract. 31.

Augu. in Iohan. Tract. 50.

So ſaith the Holy Father, and Martyr Vigilius, Dei Filius, ſecundum Humanitatem ſuam, receſsit à nobis: Secundum Diuinitatem, ait, Ecce ego vobiſcum ſum vſque ad conſummationem Sæculi: *The Sonne of God,* accordinge to his Manhoode, is gonne from vs: *But accordinge to his* Godhed, *he ſaithe, Beholde, I am with you vntil the ende of the Worlde.* **And againe,** Et nobiſcum eſt, & non eſt nobiſcum: quia quos reliquit Humanitate, non Deſeruit Diuinitate: Chriſt *is with vs: and yet* he is not with vs: *For* whome he leafte, touchinge his Humaine Nature, or his Body, *touchinge his* Godhed, *he leafte them not.* **And againe,** Verbum vbiq; eſt: Caro autem eius vbique non eſt: *The Woorde (or* Godhed *of* Chriſte) *is euerywhere:* but his Fleaſhe, or Body, is not euerywhere. **So ſaithe** S. Cyril, Etſi corpore abfuero, Præſens tamen ero, vt Deus. *Althoughe I be* Abſente as touchinge my Body, *yet, as God, I wil be Preſent.*

Vigilius contra Eutichen. Lib. 1.

Cyrill. in Iohannem. Li. 10. Ca. 7.

And, to leaue an infinite number of other Learned, and Catholique Fathers, that haue written the like, Origene **ſaithe thus:** Secundum Diuinitatis Naturam, non peregrinatur à nobis: Peregrinatur ſecundum diſpenſationem Corporis, quod ſuſcepit: Chriſte, *accordinge to his* Godhed, *is not a ſtranger to vs: But he is a ſtranger,* accordinge to the diſpenſation of the Body, *that he receiued.*

Origen in Matthe. Homil. 33.

Thus is Chriſte **bothe** Abſente, **and** Preſente: Preſent **in Maieſtie,** Abſente **in Body. And in this ſenſe** Chryſoſtome **ſaithe,** Semper nobiſcum eſt Chriſtus: Neque enim, niſi nobiſcum eſſet Chriſtus, ſupereſſet Eccleſia: Chriſte *is euermore* Preſent *with vs: For onleſſe he were* Preſente, *the Churche of God coulde not continewe.*

Chriſoſt. 1. Corinth. Homil. 6

But M. Hardinge ſaithe, Howe can yee make good, that by Faith we receiue his Body, and Bloude? By Faithe wee receiue Grace, &c. **This queſtion ſhoulde rather haue benne**

Faithe Eateth.

demaunded of S. Auguſtine, and of other Learned Doctours, and Ancient Fathers of the Churche. Howe coulde S. Auguſtine ſaie: Quid paras dentem, & ventrem? Crede, & Manducaſti: *What prepareſt thou thy toothe, and thy Belly?* Beleeue: and thou haſte eaten. Howe coulde Tertullian ſaie, Chriſtus auditu deuorandus eſt: intellectu ruminandus eſt: & Fide digerendus eſt? Chriſt muſte be deuoured by Hearinge: chewed by vnderſtandinge: digeſted by Faithe. How could Origene ſaie, Sanguis Teſtamenti infuſus eſt in Corda noſtra? *The Blonde of the Teſtamente, is* powred into oure hartes. Howe coulde S. Cyprian ſaie, Eſus huius Carnis eſt quædam auiditas, & quoddam deſiderium manendi in Chriſto? Quod eſt eſca Carni, hoc eſt Animæ Fides. Non dentes ad mordendum acuimus: ſed Fide ſincera Panem Sanctum frangimus: *The Eatinge of this Fleaſhe is a certaine greedineſſe, and a certaine deſire to tarrie in* Chriſte. *That meate is vnto our Fleaſhe,* the ſame is Faithe vnto our Soules. *Wee ſharpen not our teethe to bite withal: But* with pure Faithe wee breake this Holy Breade. To be ſhort, howe could S. Auguſtine ſaie, Credere in Chriſtum, hoc eſt manducare Panem Viuum? To beleeue in Chriſte, that is the Eatinge of the Breade of Life. And againe, Nolite parare fauces, ſed Cor: *Prepare not your* mouthes (to Eate of this Breade, but) *prepare your* Hartes. To theſe, and other like Ancient Catholique Fathers, M. Hardinge ſhould haue ſaide, *Howe can ye make good, that by* Faithe *wee receiue* Chriſtes *Body, and Blonde?* Thus they witneſſe: thus they write: thus they ſaie: and therefore, onleſſe M. Hardinge can finde vntruthe in their wordes, they make it good.

Angu. in Iohan. Tracta. 25.
Tertull de Reſurrectione Carnis.
Origen in Matth. Tracta. 26.
Cyprian. De Cœna Domini.
Angu. in Iohan. Tracta. 26.

But, to forge onwarde his mater, he ſaithe, Poperly, and truely to ſpeake, howe can wee Eate Chriſtes Body by Faith? Here it mighte haue pleaſed M. Hardinge to remember, that theſe phraſes, To Eate Chriſte: To Drinke Chriſte: To Digeſte Chriſte: To be Fedde with Chriſte: To dwelle in Chriſte: To be cladde with Chriſte: To be grafte in Chriſte: and other the like, are not plaine, ordinarie, vſual, and Common Speaches: but Myſtically, and Couertly vttered vnder a Figure: thereby to geue vs to vnderſtande, that Chriſte is our Spiritual Meate: our Spiritual Drinke: our Spiritual Suſtenance: our Spiritual houſe: our Spiritual robe, and our Spiritual ſtocke. Therefore S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Niſi manducaueritis Carnem Filij Hominis, & Sanguinem biberitis, non habebitis Vitam in vobis. Facinus, vel Flagitium videtur iubere. Figura ergo eſt, Præcipiens Paſſioni Domini eſſe communicandum, & ſuauiter, atque vtiliter recondendum in memoria, quòd pro nobis Caro eius Crucifixa, & vulnerata ſit: *Onleſſe yee eate the Fleaſhe of the Sonne of Man, and drinke his Blonde, ye ſhal haue no Life in you. He ſeemeth by theſe woordes, to commaund vs to doo an horrible wickednesſe.* (For it is an horrible mater to eate Mannes Fleaſhe, or to drinke Mannes Blonde). Therefore this is a Figure, (or manner of ſpeache) *commaundinge vs to be partakers of* Chriſtes *Paſſion, and comfortably to laie vp in our* minde, *that his Fleaſhe was Crucified, and wounded for our ſakes.* So ſaithe Gratian, touchinge the ſame, Quidam non improbabiliter exponunt, Carnis, & Sanguinis Veritatem, ipſam earundem rerum efficientiam, id eſt, Remiſsionem Peccatorum: *Touchinge theſe woordes, The* Truthe *of* Chriſtes *Fleaſhe, and Blonde, ſomme menne not vnaptely vnderſtande thereby,* the effecte, and force of Chriſtes Fleaſhe, and Bloude, *that is to ſaie, The Remiſſion of our Sinnes.* And ſo S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Lauerunt Stolas ſuas in Sanguine Agni, hoc eſt, in Gratia Dei per Chriſtum: *They waſhte theire coates in the* Bloude of the Lambe, *that is to ſaie, in the* Grace of God *throughe* Chriſte. This Grace flowinge from Chriſtes Body vpon the Croſſe, and geuen to the Faithefull in the Miniſtration of the Holy Myſteries, oftentimes beareth the name of Chriſtes Body, and is the grounde, and Subſtance of the Sacramente: And who ſo euer is Partaker of this Grace, is alſo Partaker of Chriſtes Body. Therefore S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Cùm eſſent Omnibus Communia Sacramenta, non Communis erat omnibus Gratia, quæ eſt Virtus Sacramentorum: *Whereas the Sacramentes were common to al, yet the* Grace *thereof was not common to al.* And that is the Power, and ſtrength of the Sacramentes.

Auguſt. De Doctrina Chriſtiana. Lib. 3. Ca. 16.
De Conſe. diſt. 2. Species.
Auguſt. in Apoc. Homil. 6.
Auguſtin in Pſal 77.

Likewiſe S. Ambroſe, In ſimilitudinem quidem accipis Sacramentum: Sed Veræ Naturæ Gratiam, Virtutemq; conſequeris: *Ye take the Sacrament in Repreſentation, or Remembrance: But yee obteine thereby the* Grace, and Power of Chriſtes Very Nature.

Ambroſ. De Sacramen. li. 6 ca. 1

Here

Here M. Hardinge once againe moueth a very needeleſſe queſtion. VVee demaunde, (ſaithe he) whether wee receiue the ſame Body of Chriſte by Faithe onely, without our Body, or with the Office of our Body. Any Childe might ſone be able to ſolue this reddle. Rabanus Maurus ſaithe, as it is alleged before, Sacramentum ore percipitur: Virtute verò Sacramenti interior homo ſatiatur: *The* Sacramente *is receiued with the* bodily mouthe: *but* with the vertue *of the* Sacramente, (whiche is the Body of Chriſte) the Inner man, (that is, not the Body, but the Soule) *is filled*. So ſaithe Auguſtine, Cùm videbitis Filium Hominis aſcendentem, vbi erat priùs, certè vel tunc videbitis, quia non eo modo, quo putatis, erogat Corpus ſuum: certè vel tunc intelligetis, quia Gratia eius non conſumitur morſibus: *When yee ſhal ſee the Sonne of Man Aſcendinge thither, where he was before, then at the leaſte, yee ſhal ſee that he geueth not his* Body in ſutche ſorte, as you imagine: *Then ſhal you vnderſtande, that his* Grace is not conſumed with the bitte of mouthe. Againe he ſaithe, Qui manducat intus, non foris: qui manducat in Corde, non qui premit dente: *He that eateth* Chriſtes *Body* inwardely, *not that eateth* (the Sacramente) outwardely: *He that eateth the Body of* Chriſt *it ſelfe* in his harte, *not that preſſeth* (the Sacramente) with his toothe.

Rabanus Maurus. Lib. 2. Ca. 31.

Aug. in Iohan. Tract. 27.

Aug. in Iohan. Tract. 26.

M. Hardinge argueth farther, Chriſtes Body is ſo receiued, as it is Preſente: But it is preſente by Breade and VVine (yee ſaie) *Ergo*, it is receiued by Breade, and VVine: To conclude, if by Breade, and VVine, then not by Faithe onely. If M. Hardinge had better conſidered the Rules of his Olde Sophiſtrie, he might ſone haue ſeene the wantes, and deformities of this Reaſon. Emongeſt childzen it is called Ignoratio Elenchi: Whiche is the Simpleſt Fallax of al the reſte.

It is true, that of our parte, it is not either our hande, or our mouthe, but Faithe onely, that receiueth the Body of Chriſte: but the ſame Body of Chriſt is offered, and repreſented vnto our Faithe by meane of the Sacramentes. Wee ſpeake of ſutch inſtrumentes of Receiuinge, as are of our ſelfe, and be within vs: M. Hardinge anſweareth of the Sacramentes, that be external Inſtrumentes, and are wholy without vs. So in Baptiſme, notwithſtandinge wee haue Chriſte Preſente of our parte Onely by Faithe, yet S. Auguſtine ſaithe, as it is ſaide before, Habemus Chriſtum in Præſenti per Baptiſmatis Sacramentum: *Wee haue* Chriſte *Preſently by the Sacramente of Baptiſme*. Thus is Chriſte Preſente vnto vs: Of his parte, Onely by his Grace: Of our parte, Onely by our Faith: By the Sacramentes, Onely, as by meane of outwarde Inſtrumentes, to moue our ſenſes. This lighte, and childiſhe errour, I haue ſaide before, is called Ignoratio Elenchi, and therefore ſemeth to proceede of Ignorance. M. Hardinge ſhould haue better examined the force of his Argumentes, before he thus ſuddainly ſente them abroade.

Touchinge the mater it ſelf, it is not the Bodily mouthe, but Faithe alone, that receiueth, and embraceth Chriſtes Body. S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Panis iſte Interioris Hominis quærit eſuriem. Qui credit in eum, manducat: *This Breade requireth the hunger of the* Inner Man. *He that* beleeueth *in him, eateth his Body*.

Aug. in Iohan. Tract. 26.

This is no ianglinge, as you ſaie, M. Hardinge: It is the Ancient Catholique Doctrine of the Churche of God. Wee be wel aſſured of it, and knowe certainely, what wee ſaie. But touchinge the certainetie of your Doctrine in this pointe, I haue briefely touched it in my Former Replie, ſo mutche, as I then thought might ſeeme ſufficient. Somme of you holde, That Chriſtes Body paſſeth downe into the ſtomacke: Somme ſaie, That it entreth onely into the Mouthe, and goeth no further: Somme other ſaie, Quàm citò Species teruntur dentibus, tam citò in Cœlum rapitur Corpus Chriſti: *As ſoone as the Fourmes of the Breade be grated with the teeth, ſtreight waie the Body of* Chriſte is caught vp *into Heauen*. An other of you ſaithe, *A* Mouſe *eateth the Body of* Chriſte: An other ſaithe, *Nay, a* Mouſe *cannot eate it*: Peter Lombarde, the Grande Maiſter of al your Schoole, is pitcouſly confounded in the caſe, and cannot imagine, poore man, what thinge it ſhoulde be, that the Mouſe eateth. For after he had him ſelfe moued the queſtion, Quid igitur ſumit Mus, vel quid manducat? *What is it then, that the* Mouſe *receiueth, or, what eateth it?* He anſweareth, Deus Nouit: Nowe, God knoweth: (*As for my parte, I cannot telle*).

De Con. Diſt. 2. Tribus Gradib. In Gloſſa.

4 Senten. Diſt 13

Transubstantiatiō Newe, & doubtful.

Suche be your Doctours, M. Hardinge: suche is your Doctrine. Therefore, to conclude with your owne wordes, It appeareth by your agreemente, and your answeares, yee vnderstande not the thinges ye speake of: but both affirme, and denie, ye knowe not what.

M. Hardinge.

As yee proceede fourth, ye geue warninge to your Readers, not to take you so, as though ye holde with Transubstantiation. And there ye speake thereof as best becommeth your scoffinge sprite, callinge it a dreame of menne of later times, whereof they coulde neuer yet agree within them selues. By whiche woordes your eloquence hathe set foorthe your spite and lieinge at once. For albeit the terme of Transubstantiation be (a) of no greater antiquitie, then the Councel of Laterane vnder Innocentius the thirde, where it was by the Holy Ghoste, and the Fathers there deuised, as very fitte for openinge of the Truthe impugned by the Berengarians: yet is the Doctrine thereof noleſſe Ancient, then the Cospel it selfe. For maugre the malice of the Diuel, and of al the Sacramentaries, the Olde Truthe shal preuaile, by whiche wee are taught, that, whiche was Breade, by the Mystical blessinge to be (b) made Christes Body: and that whiche was wine, to be made his Bloude, as I haue otherwheres sufficiently declared. And the Church hathe (c) alwaies hereupon perfitely accorded, touchinge the Subſtance: though certaine Schoolemen in theire Scholastical Disputations, where oftentimes, victorie is sought, and Faith not impugned, about discussion of somme schoole point, haue without preiudice of our beleefe disagreed. Transubstantiation.

(a) Marke this Antiquity. This Councel was holden twelue hundred and fifteene yeeres after Christe.

(b) As in a Mysterie, or Sacramente: but not in Subſtance: Otherwise it is a great vntruth

(c) Vntruthe manifeste, As shal appeare.

The Bisshop of Sarisburie.

As for the scoffes, and spites, and lies, ye speake of, M. Hardinge, lette him haue them, that hathe beste deserued them. Then verily, without greate wronge, you cannot lose them.

Touchinge your Newe Fantasie of Transubstantiation, VVhether it be a dreame, or no, and whether the dreamers of it them selues were euer yet hable rightly to expound their owne dreame, It appeareth partely by your owne Confession. Ye graunte, The name and terme thereof was neuer knowen, or hearde of in al the VVorld, vntil your late Councel of Laterane, Holden in Rome vnder Pope Innocentius the Thirde, in the yere of our Lorde a thousande two hundred and fiftene, in the time of Kinge Iohn, the Kinge of Englande, and neuer before. Then did your strange Doctrine, and Newe Diuinitie, touchinge this Article, Firste beginne. So longe the Churche of God was hable wel to stande without your Transubstantiation.

Anno, 1215.

And, al be it, ye trulie vs, Notwithstandinge the neweneſſe of the name, yet neuertheleſſe the Doctrine thereof hath stil continewed in the Churche, and hathe benne euermore receiued, and confessed of al the Faitheful: and that maugre the malice of the Diuel, and al the Sacramentaries, it is as Anciente as the Gospel, or as Christe him selfe: Yet of the other side ye confesse plainely, that for the space of twelue hundred yeres, and more, no man wiste, by what name to calle it.

But for as mutche, as you thinke it lawful for you to auouche, and affirme, what you liste, true, or false, without controlmente: whereas ye saie, This late Faithe of yours is as Anciente, as the Gospel, knowe you, that somme of the beste learned of your owne side haue saide, It is a newe Pointe in Religion: and therefore not so Ancient, as you seme to make it: Somme others saie: It is a doubtful Conclusion: and therefore no Faithe at al. D. Tonstal thereof saithe thus: De modo, quo id fieret, fortasse satius erat, Curiosum quenque suæ relinquere Coniecturæ: sicut liberum fuit ante Concilium Lateranum: *Of the manner, and meane, howe this mighte be* (whether by Transubstantiation, or otherwise) *perhappes it had benne better, to leaue euery man, that woulde be* Curious, *to his owne* Coniecture: as before the Councel of Laterane it was leafte at libertie. You saie, It is as Anciente, as the Gospel: D. Tonstal saithe, *It is but newe, and came in twelue hundred yeeres, and more, after the Gospel.* You saie, It is the Catholique Faithe: D. Tonstal saithe, *It is a* Coniecture, *or a* Gheasse (which differeth not mutche from a dreame) *and that before the saide late* Councel of Laterane, *noman* was bounde to beleeue it. And here it male please you, to consider indifferently with your selfe: *If it were leafte at Libertie,* as D. Tonstal saithe, for any man, either to receiue it, or to refuse it, as he thought good, howe coulde it then be the Catholique Faith? If it were the Catholique Faith, as you saie, And that maugre the malice of the Diuel, howe then coulde it so many hundred yeres be leafte at Libertie?

Cuthbertus Tonstallus, De Eucharistia. Lib. 1. Pag. 46.

Hereof ye saie, Ye haue written sufficiently otherwheres. Al this I graunte: your Bokes are knowen. Howe be it, if you woulde haue written nomore but Truthe, ye might

Transubstantiatiō Newue, & doubtful.

ye might haue saued muche time, and spared somme paper. But if it shal not mislike you, once againe more aduisedly to viewe the same, ye shal finde in the very Firste Diuision thereof three great Untruthes togeather, al within the space of Fourtéene lines.

Nowe, whether your fantasie of Transubstantiation be a Dreame, or no, by the Constancie, and Certainetie thereof, and by the agrœmente of your Doctours, that founded it firste, it maie appeare. Petrus Lombardus, the onely General of al this Campe, hereof vseth these speaches: Quibusdam ita videtur: Quidam dicunt: Quidam tradunt: Quidam concedunt: Alij putauerunt, Substantiam ibi Panis & Vini remanere: *Somme menne* Iudge *thus*: *Somme* saie *thus*: *Somme haue* written *thus*: *Somme* graunte *this*: *Somme others haue* thought *thus, that the very* Substance of the Breade and VVine, remaineth stil. Here is a strange agrément of Learned menne, specially in a case of the Catholique Faithe. But hereto what saithe Peter Lombarde him selfe, that taketh vpon him, as a Iudge, to determine these doubtes? Howe is he resolued? Or, howe agreeth he in Iudgemente with him selfe? His answeare is this, Si autem quæritur, qualis sit illa Conuersio, An Formalis, An Substantialis, An alterius generis, definire non sufficio: *If a question were moued, what manner of Conuersion, or change this is: Whether it be in* Fourme, or in Substance, *or of somme other sorte*, I am not hable to discusse it. Here wée maie sée, the blinde leadeth the blinde. He that setteth him self before al the reste, and would be taken for a guide, knoweth not where to sette his owne foote. Gabriel Biel saithe, Quomodo sit ibi Corpus Christi, Vtrum per Conuersionem alicuius in ipsum, an sine Conuersione incipiat esse Corpus Christi cum Pane, manentibus Substantia, & Accidentibus Panis, non inuenitur expressum in Canone Bibliæ: *Howe the Body of* Christ *is there, whether it be by changing of some thinge into it, Or,* Christes *Body beginne to be there togeather with the Breade, bothe* the Substance, and the Accidentes of the Breade remaininge stil without changinge, *it is not founde expreste in the Canon of the Bible.* I leaue Innocentius, Scotus, and sundrie others of your Scholastical Doctoures, with their doubtful Dreames, and ghesses to like purpose.

Sentenc. 4. Dist. 11. si autem &c.

Gabriel. in Canonem. Lect. 40.

Whether these be Dreames, or no, I leaue to you, M. Hardinge, to consider. Verily Innocentius. 3. saithe, Fuerunt, qui dicerent, quòd, sicut post Consecrationem vera Panis remanent Accidentia, ita Panis remanet vera Substantia: *There were some, that saide, that, as after Consecration there remaine the very Accidentes, or Fourmes of Bread, so likewise the* very Substance of the same Breade remaineth stil. And Cardinal Cusanus saithe, Quidam Veteres Theologi intellexisse reperiuntur, Panem non Transubstantiari, Sed superuestiri nobiliori Substantia: *Certaine of the Ancient Diuines are found of this minde, that the Breade in the Sacramente is not* Transubstantiate, *or changed in Nature, but remaineth stil, and is clothed with an other Substance, more noble then it selfe.* This was the Iudgemente of sundrie the Fathers, beste learned in Diuinitie: And this same Iudgemente Durandus, although he him selfe holde it not, yet he wil not haue it in any wise to be condemned.

Nicola. Cusanus Excitationū. li. 6

Nowe, M. Hardinge, if you dissemble not, but beléeue constantly, as you saie, then cannot these thinges stande, without Préiudice of your beléefe. For Faithe builte vpon vncertaintie, is no Faithe at al.

M. Hardinge.

But Lorde what meante yee to allege Theophylacte, and S. Ambrose, whose Doctrine is so contrarie to yours, as light is to darkenes? Theophylacte expoundinge these woordes of Christe in S. Iohn, As the Liuinge Father hathe sente me, euen so liue I by the Father, and he that eateth me, shal liue by me, saithe thus: Doest thou not heare a dreadful saieinge? VVee eate not pure God, for he is vntoucheable, and vnbodily. Neither can he be comprehended with eies, nor teethe. Neither eate wee the Fleashe of a pure man: for that can profite nothinge at al. But nowe that God hathe vnited vnto him selfe Fleashe after an vnspeakeable contemperament, the fleash is also become lifemakinge. Not for that it passed awaie into the Nature of God, beware of that, but after the likenesse of fiery yron, whiche abideth yron, and sheweth the operation of fiere: euen so (quoth he) the fleash of our Lorde abidinge fleashe, is lifemakinge, as beinge the Fleashe of God the woorde. Then as (saith he) I liue by the Father, who is life, so he that eateth me, shal liue by me, beeinge tempered with me, as also beinge transelementated into me, who haue Power to viuificate or giue life. VVhich last woordes

Theophylacte contrary to these Defenders.

This similitude of firy yrō quite ouerthroweth the whole fantasie of Transubstantiation.

Theophylacte. To eate God.

your owne Doctour Oecolampadius hathe thus turned, *Dum quodammodò miſcetur, & transelementatur in me, qui vinificare poteſt*, corruptinge the ſeconde Doctrine of the writer with his forged * *Quodammodò*, whiche he founde not in the Greeke there placed, and breakinge the congruitie of the Latine ſpeache, by puttinge that in the thirde Perſon, that oughte to be in the firſte. If faithe wrought al this mater, then after your meaninge, mighte wee eate God, which Theophylacte denieth. He ſaithe, he that eateth Chriſtes fleaſhe, is tempered togeather with him, and tranſelemented into him, ſo as he is made one Body with him as Cyrillus expounderh the place of S. Paule to the Epheſians: where he ſaithe, that wee be *Concorporalis*, that is to ſaie, of one Body with Chriſt. And an other where, fleaſhe of his fleaſhe, and bone of his bones. Cap. 3. Epheſ. 5.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Of Theophylactes Authoritie, wee neuer made any great accoumpte. He is but a very late writer, in comparison of the Ancient Fathers. For the moſte part of that he writeth, he is but an Abbridger of Chryſoſtome. He writeth againſt the Churche of Rome, ſtoutly mainteininge a knowen Hereſie, concerninge the Proceedinge of the Holy Ghoſte. Notwithſtandinge, in this place wee alleged his wordes to good pourpoſe. For, as he ſaith, VVee are Tranſelemented, or Tranſnatured, and chaunged into Chriſte, euen ſo, and none otherwiſe, wee ſaie, The Breade is Tranſelemented, or changed into Chriſtes Body. But, notwithſtanding this change, wee remaine ſtil in Subſtance, as wee were before: Therefore wee ſaie, Notwithſtandinge the like change, The Subſtance of the Breade in like manner remaineth ſtil.

But, what fanſie came in your heade, M. Hardinge, thus to allege, and ſo vehemently to force this place of Theophylacte? What one worde ſpeaketh he, either of your Tranſubſtantiation, or of your Real preſence, or of your Corporal, and Fleaſhly Eatinge? Verily, as, by any his expreſſe wordes, he nothinge aideth you, ſo by his example of Fiery yron, he ſeemeth quite to ouerthrowe you. For, if we compare the Sacramente with a peece of Burninge yron, (whiche neuertheleſſe was not Theophylactes meaninge: and therefore ye are therein muche deceiued) then, as the yron, althoughe it be fiery, yet notwithſtandinge in Nature, and Subſtance is yron ſtil: Euen ſo the Breade, althoughe it be made the Sacramente of Chriſtes Body, and ſo the Inſtrumente of the Grace of God, yet, that notwithſtandinge, in Nature, and Subſtance is Breade ſtil.

Here, leaſt you gruing ouer your Tranſubſtantiation, as knowing it to be onely a late founde fantaſie, ſhould hope neuertheleſſe by this Example of Fiery yron to eſtabliſhe your Real Preſence, and to ſaie, that, as the fiere is Really, and in deede in the yron, ſo the Body of Chriſte is in deede, and Really in the Sacramente: It maie pleaſe you to cal to minde, that in the Holy Learned Fathers, the ſame example, & like Fourme of ſpeache, is vſed alſo of the Sacramente of Baptiſme. In the Councel of Nice it is written thus: Vides Aquam: Cogita de virtute Dei, quæ latet in Aqua. Cogita, Aquam eſſe plenam Ignis Diuini: *Thou ſeeſte the Water: Thinke thou of the Power of God, that* lieth in the VVater: *Thinke thou, that the Water* is ful of Heauenly Fiere. Yet, I trowe, ye wil not haue vs beleeue, as an Article of our Faithe, that this Fiere, whereby is ment the Bloude of Chriſte, is in deede, and Really in the Water.

Concil. Nicen. πλήρη τοῦ θείου πνεύματος νῦν τὰ ὕδατα.

These, and ſuche other the like, maie not alwaies be taken, as phraſes of Preciſe Truthe: but rather, as Amplifications, or heates of ſpeache, the better to ſtirre vp, and to enflame the mindes of the Hearers. And in this ſorte, and ſenſe, to leaue other Authorities, Hoſius, your owne Doctour ſaithe, Opera noſtra reſperſa ſunt Sanguine Chriſti: *Our workes be* ſprinkled with the Bloude of Chriſte. So ſaith Pope Innocentius. 3. Virtutes noſtræ Crucis Chriſti Sanguine Purpurantur: *Our Vertues* are died, as readde as Purple, *in the Bloude of the Croſſe of* Chriſte.

Hoſius in Conf. Petricouien. Cap 48

Innocen. De Myſteriis Miſſ. Li. 2.

Thus onely, M. Hardinge, and none otherwiſe, the Holy Fathers ſaie, *The Breade of the Holy Miſteries, and the Water of Baptiſme are ful of fiere.*

Further Theophylacte ſaithe, *The Body of* Chriſte, *is Eaten: But the* Godhead is not Eaten: *becauſe it is vntoucheable, and vncomprehenſible vnto our ſenſes.* Hereof you woulde ſeeme to reaſon thus: If Faithe wrought al this matter, then mighte wee Eate God. For by Faith we beleeue in God.

Pſalm. 33.

Firſte, touchinge the Eatinge of God, God him ſelfe ſaithe, Guſtate, & videte, quòd

To eate God.

quòd suauis est Dominus: Taste, *and see, that the Lorde is delectable*. S. Augustine saith, Panis est, & Panis est, & Panis est: Deus Pater, Deus Filius, & Deus Spiritus Sanctus: *It is Breade, It is Breade, and it is Breade: God the Father, God the Sonne, and God the Holy Ghoste*. Againe he saithe, Deus Panis intus est animæ meæ: God is the Inwarde Breade *of my Soule*. Therefore it is not so thorowly, and vndoubtedly true, that you saie, The Nature of God cannot be Eaten.

1. Pet. 2. Augustí De Verb. Domini Secund. Lucam. Serm. 29 Aug. Conf. Li. 1.

Notwithstandinge, for sparinge of wordes, and time herein, I will refer you to my Former Replie. There shal you finde this whole Obiection fully answeared.

Artic. 8. Diui. 16

You saie, Theophylactes reason standeth thus, God cannot be Eaten: bicause he cannot be comprehended, either with eies, or with teeth. But Christes Body maie be eaten: Therefore it muste folowe in the Conclusion, that with our eies wee maie see it: and with our teeth wee maie receiue it. Here would I faine learne of you, M. Hardinge, When ye sawe Christes Body visibly in the Sacrament with your eies, or when ye pressed it with your teeth? If your teethe can receiue it, why saithe S. Augustine, Quid paras Dentem, & Ventrem? *Why prepareste thou thy* Toothe, *and thy Belly?* If your Bodily eie can see it, why saie you, It is Inuisible? If it be Inuisible, how is it seene? If it be seene, how is it Inuisible? It appeareth, that either Theophylacte, the Maister, or you, the Scholar, are deceiued, or one of you vnderstandeth not the others meaninge. Certainely, as Christes Body is seene in the Sacrament, so is it Eaten in the Sacrament. But it is not Really, or Fleshly seene: Therefore it is not Really, or Fleshely Eaten.

Aug. in Iohan. Tract. 25.

To auoide errour herein, it behoueth vs to vnderstande, that, To eate God, is to haue the fruition of the Diuine Nature, & to be Incorporate into God. But the Maiestie of God so far surmounteth the capacitie of man, that as he is in him selfe in Nature, and Godhed, no mortal creature is hable to conceiue him but onely in the Face, and sight of Iesus Christe the Sonne of God. Therefore S. Paule saithe, Christus est Splendor Gloriæ, & Character Substantiæ Dei: Christe *is the Brightnesse of the Glorie, and the expresse Image of the Substance of God*. S. Augustine saithe, Tu quomodò contingis Deum? Quia Verbum Caro factum est, & habitauit in nobis: *Howe doest thou* touche God? He answeareth) *Bicause the Woorde became Fleashe, and dwelt in vs*. Againe he saithe, Si Christus sic veniret, vt Deus, non agnosceretur: *If* Christe *came so*, as he is God, noman coulde know him. S. Gregorie saithe, Dominus murus nobis non esset, si forinsecùs non fuisset: Intus nos non protegeret, si exteriùs non appareret: *Our Lorde were no wal vnto vs, If he had not benne in the* Fourme of Man: *He coulde not inwardely defende vs, if he had not* outwardely *appeared*. So saithe Dionysius, Si cupimus Communionem habere cum Deo, oportet nos in Diuinissimam illius vitam, quam egit in Carne, intueri: *If wee desire to haue Communion with God, wee muste beholde that Heauenly life*, that he leade in the Fleashe. Thus, as God is God, in Maiestie, and in him selfe, wee vnderstande him not, wee conceiue him not, wee knowe him not: That is to saie, wee haue no fruition of him, wee eate him not. Therefore S. Augustine saithe, Iesum Christum secundum id, quod erat Verbum apud Deum, Paruuli non capiunt. Quomodò ergo capiunt, qui Lac capiunt? Iesum Christum, inquit, & hunc Crucifixum. Suge, quod pro te factus est: & cresces ad id, quod est: *Litle ones vnderstande not* Iesus Christe, *accordinge to that he was the Woorde with the Father. Howe then doo they receiue him, that receiue milke?* S. Paule *saith, they receiue* Iesus Christe Crucified. Sucke that thinge, that he was made for thee: *and thou shalt growe to that he is*.

Hebr. 1. Aug. in Psal. 134 Aug. in Iohan. Tract. 2. Grego. in Ezech. Lib. 1. Homil. 14. Eccles. Hierar. Cap. 3. Augusti. in Psal. 119.

Thus in the Holy Mysteries there is presented vnto vs, not the Diuine Nature of Christe, whereby he is Equal to the Father: But his Death, and Humilitie, whereby he abased him selfe, and was made Equal vnto vs. This is the Spiritual Meate, and Drinke, and the onely feedinge of the Soule. Thereof S. Paule saithe, *As often as ye shal eate of this Breade, and drinke of this Cuppe, ye shal publishe* (not the Diuine Nature, or Godhed, but) *the Lordes Deathe vntil he comme*. So saithe Hesychius, Comedimus hunc Cibum, sumentes eius memoriam Passionis: *Wee Eate this Foode, receiuinge the* memorie (not of his glorie, but) of his Passion. So saithe S. Ambrose, Quia Morte Domini liberati sumus, huius rei memores, in Edendo, & Potando, Carnem, & Sanguinem, quæ pro nobis oblata sunt significamus: *Bicause wee are delinered*

1. Cor. 11. Hesych. in Leui. Lib. 1. Cap. 2. Ambrosi. in 1. Cor. 11.

by our Lordes Deathe, beinge mindeful thereof, in Eatinge, and Drinkinge. Wee Signifie, or Represente the Fleashe, and Blonde, that were offered vp for vs. Thus in the Holy Mysteries wé Eate, and Drinke the Sacramente of Christe Crucified in the Humilitie of his Fleashe. But his Diuine Nature in Godhed, and Maiestie cannot be Represented, or expressed by any Sacramentes.

It was al vaine, and loste labour for you, M. Hardinge so earnestly to proue, that Christes Body quickeneth, and geeueth life. Wé knowe it: Wé Confesse it: Wé féele it: Christe him selfe saithe it: *I am the Breade of Life: He, that eateth of this Breade, shal liue for euer.* Iohan. 6.

This talke empeacheth noman, but your selfe. For you tel vs, and woulde haue it holden, as an Article of your Faithe, not onely, That the wicked man without Faithe, but also that the doumbe creature voide of Reason, maie receiue the very Body of Christe, and that Substantially, Verily, and in deede. Thus you diuide and sunder Christes Body, from his Spirite: and, contrarie to Theophylacte, and to al the Ancient Fathers, and to Christe him selfe, ye saie, It maie be Really receiued without Life.

But wé saie, with S. Ambrose, Qui accipit hunc Panem non moritur morte Peccatoris: Quia hic Panis est Remissio Peccatorum: *Who so eateth this Breade* (not the Sacramente of Christes Body, but Christes Body it selfe) dieth not *the deathe of a Sinner: For this Breade is the Remission of Sinnes.* Wé saie with S. Augustine, Qui Carnem Domini non sumit, non habet vitam: &, qui eam sumit, habet vitam, & hanc vtique æternam: *He, that receiueth not the Fleashe of Our Lorde,* hathe no Life: and, he that receiueth it, hathe Life, *and the same Euerlastinge.* Againe wé saie with S. Augustine, Huius rei Sacramentum de Mensa Dominica sumitur, quibusdam ad vitam, quibusdam ad Mortem: Res verò ipsa, cuius Sacramentum est, Omni homini ad vitam, Nulli ad exitium: quicunque eius Particeps fuerit: *The Sacramente* (of Christes Body) *is receiued from the Lordes Table, to some vnto Life, to some vnto Deathe:* But the thinge it selfe, (that is, the Body of Christe, whereof this is a Sacramente) is to al menne vnto Life, and to no man vnto Death: VVho so euer shalbe Partetaker of it.

Ambros. De Benedictionib. Patriarch. Cap. 6.
Augu. in Iohan. Tracta. 26.
Augu. in Iohan. Tracta. eodem.

For some Further declaration hereof, it appeareth by the witnesse of the Ancient Learned Doctours, and Fathers, that wé are Really, and Corporally ioined, and vnited vnto Christe, not onely by the Mysteries of the Holy Supper, but also by Faithe, by Baptisme, by the Sprite of God, by Loue, and other waies. Of Faithe S. Augustine saithe thus: Per Fidem Adcorporamur in Iesu Christo Domino nostro: *By Faithe* wee are incorporate *in* Christe Iesu *our Lorde.* And againe, Qui venit ad me, Incorporatur mihi: *He, that commeth vnto me, is* Incorporate *into me.* S. Chrysostome saithe, Quid nobis esse non vult, omnibus modis nos sibi conglutinans, & coniungens? *What wil not* Christe *be vnto vs? For by al manner meanes he* cleaueth, and fasteneth *him selfe vnto vs.* Againe in plainer sorte he saithe, Dominum ipsum amplecteris, & Commisceris, & subuectus coniungeris Corpori illi, quod sursum sedet in Cœlis: *Thou* embraceste *the Lorde him selfe, and* arte mingled with him, *and, beinge here beneath, arte ioined to that Body, that sitteth in Heauen aboue.*

Augus. Epist. 31.
Augu. in Iohan. Tracta. 25.
Chryso. in Epist. ad Rom. Hom. 25
Chryso. in Epist. ad Colos. Hom. 6
Chryso in Epist. ad Ephe. Hom. 20

In like manner he writeth of the Sacramente of Baptisme: Quomodò ex Carne eius sumus, & ex Ossibus eius? Quemadmodum ille sine Virili Congressu natus est ex Spiritu Sancto, ita nos illud efficimur in Lauacro: *Howe are wee of his Fleashe, and of his Bones?* He answeareth, *As* Christe *was borne by the Holy Ghoste without the knowledge of Man, euen so in the Fonte* (of Baptisme) wee are made the same (that is, his Fleash, and his Bones).

Leo. De Natiuitate Domi. Sermo. 3.

So saithe Leo, Sicut Dominus Factus est Caro nostra nascendo, ita nos facti sumus ipsius (Caro) Renascendo: *As our Lorde was made our Fleashe, by that he was Borne:* so are wee made his Fleashe, *by that wee are newe borne.*

Hieronym. De Viro Perfecta.

So saithe S. Hierome, De Carne eius sumus, & de Ossibus eius: Ipse enim est Caput Corporis Ecclesiæ: *Wee are* of his Fleashe, and of his Bones: *For that he is the Heade of His Body, whiche is the Churche.*

Thus, M. Hardinge, wé are ioined togeather, and tempered with Christe, not onely by the Holy Mysteries, but also by the Sacramente of Baptisme, and by Faithe.

And

Quodammodò.

And Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Ne ſimpliciter teneamus Chriſtum, ſed etiam illi conglutinemur. Nam, ſi quicquam ſeceſſerimus ab eo, Perimus: *Let vs not onely holde Chriſte, but alſo let vs be* faſte glewed vnto him. *For, if wee falle any thinge from him, wee are vtterly loſte.* Muſte wée therefore conclude, M. Hardinge, that the VVater of Baptiſme is Tranſubſtantiate, no parte of the Subſtance thereof remaininge ſtil: or, that Chriſtes Body is Really, and groſſely Preſente in that Sacramente, as you haue imagined of the other?

Chryſoſtom. in 1. Cor. Hom. 8.

Wée finde greate faulte with Oecolampadius, for corruptinge, as wée ſaie, the ſounde Doctrine of Theophylacte with his forged, *Quodammodò*, and for breakinge the Congruitie of the Latine ſpeache, by puttinge the thirde Perſone, in place of the firſte. Of the Latine Congruitie, I wil ſaie nothinge. The Learned thinke, that Oecolampadius was as ſkilful, bothe in the Latine tongue, and in the Greéke, as M. Hardinge. But for the forginge of, *Quodammodò*, why do you not as wel finde faulte with Theophylacte him ſelfe? For, if it be a forgerie, he him ſelfe hath likewiſe forged the ſame, Quodammodò: and, if that maie be called Corruption, he hath alſo corrupted his owne Doctrine. Theſe be his wordes: Qui manducat me, hic viuet propter me, dum Quodammodò miſcetur mihi, & tranſelementatur in me: *He, that eateth me, ſhal liue by me: for as muche as*, after a ſorte, *he is* mingled *with me, and* tranſelemented, *or* changed *into me.* If wée doubte, whether, ὥσπερ, in Greéke, maie be expounded by, Quodammodò, then is not your ſkil herein ſo greate, as ye haue thought. Here, you ſée, that, not onely Oecolampadius, but alſo Theophylactus him ſelfe ſaithe Quodammodò.

Theophylact. in Iohan. Cap. 6. ὁ τρώγων μὲ ζήσει δι ἐμὲ, ἀναμιγνύμενος ὥσπερ, καὶ μεταστοιχειούμενος εἰς ἐμέ.

Why finde wée not faulte with S. Auguſtine, for ſaieinge the like? Omnes in illo, & Chriſti, & Chriſtus ſumus: quia Quodammodò totus Chriſtus, & Caput, & Corpus eſt: *In him wee are al Chriſtes, and* Chriſte *him ſelfe: For* after a ſorte *whole* Chriſte *is bothe the Heade* (of the Churche) *and alſo the Body.* And againe, Qui in Chriſtum credit, credendo in Chriſtum veniet, & in eum Chriſtus, & quoquo modo vnitur in eum, & Membrum in Corpore eius efficitur: *He, that beleeueth in* Chriſte, *by beleeuinge commeth into* Chriſte, *and* Chriſte *into him, and* after a ſorte is vnited into him, *and is made a Member in his Body.* And againe, Paulum Chriſtus voce mactauit, & in ſuum Corpus traijciens, Quodammodò manducauit: Chriſte *killed* Paule *with his voice, and* after a ſorte, *did eate him, ſwalowinge him downe into his Body:* Why finde ye not the ſame faulte with Cyrillus writinge thus, Decebat ergo eum Quodammodò Vniri Corporibus noſtris? *It was meete, that* after a ſorte Chriſte *ſhoulde be Vnited vnto our Bodies:* Or, with S. Chryſoſtome, writinge the like: Chriſtus nos ſecum in vnam, vt ita dicam, Maſſam reducit: Chriſte mouldeth *vs*, if I maie ſo ſaie, *into one lumpe with him ſelfe.*

Auguſt. in Pſal. 26.

Auguſt. in Ioan. Sermon. 61.

Auguſt. Epiſt. 120. Cap. 18.

Cyrill. ad Caloſyrium.

Chryſoſt in Matthæ. Homil. 84.

Why ſaie wée not, theſe, and other like Holy Fathers were Sacramentaries, and Heretiques? Why ſaie wée not, that S. Auguſtine, S. Cyril, S. Chryſoſtome, with theire Forged *Quodammodò*, corrupted the ſounde, and Catholique Doctrine of the Churche?

Woulde wée rather, for the better faſinge, and colouringe of your Doctrine, wée ſhoulde ſtrike out this, Forged *Quodammodò*, and amende it thus, Qui manducat me, Reipſa Miſcetur mihi, & tranſelementatur in me? Woulde wée haue vs to beléeue, that wee are wholy, and thorowly changed into Chriſtes Body, and that wée are made very Chriſte, God, and Man, the ſame, that was borne of the Virgine, and nailed to the Croſſe: and that, not, *Quodammodò*, after a ſorte, or by ſomme peculiare phraſe of ſpeache: but Subſtantially, Really, Verily, and in déede? I reckon, your Doctrine is not fully ſo fonde.

S. Paule ſaithe, Sumus alter alterius Membra: VVee are Members one of an other: Cyrillus ſaithe, Nos inter nos vnimur Corporaliter: *Wee are* Corporally vnited *togeather emonge our ſelues:* S. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Si quis exuat impudicarum mulierum animas, videbit malum Dæmonem illis admixtum: *If any man wil open the Soules of vnchaſte, or filthy Weemen, he ſhal ſee the Diuel* tempered *togeather, and* mingled *with them.* And thinke you, M. Hardinge, that theſe, and other like ſpeaches of the

Roma. 12.

Cyrill. in Iohan. Lib. 11. Cap. 16.

Chryſoſtom. in 1. Cor. Homil. 18.

Quodammodò.

the Holy Fathers, cannot stande without your Transubstantiation, and Real Presence? Or, that the Godly be Substantially, and in deede in their Bodies ioined togeather? Or, that the Vngodly be verily vnited, and mingled with the Diuel: without any *Quodammodò?*

You might rather haue remembred, that, touchinge this vnspeakeable Vnitie betwéne Christe, and the Faithefull, that is to saie, betwéne the Heade, and the Body, S. Cyprian writeth thus: Nostra, & Christi Coniunctio nec miscet Personas, nec vnit Substantias: sed affectus consociat, & confœderat voluntates: *The Coniunction, that is betweene vs, and Christe,* neither mingleth Persones, nor vniteth Substances: but ioineth affections, and knitteth willes. Likewise saithe S. Cyril, Initium, & fundamentum in Sanctificatione Christus est, Per Fidem, scilicet, & non aliter: Hoc enim modo in nobis habitat: *The Beginninge, and Fundation of our Holinesse is* Christe: *By Faithe, I meane,* and none otherwise. *For in this sorte Christe dwelleth in vs.* Likewise Lyra, one of your owne late Doctours: In quantum per Sacramentum Eucharistiæ vnimur Deo, viuimus Spiritualiter: Nostra autem vnio apud ipsum est per Fidem, & Dilectionem: *So farre forthe, as wee are vnited vnto God by the Sacramente of Thankesgeeninge, wee liue Spiritually:* But the Vnion, that is betweene him, and vs, is by Faithe, and loue. And, expoundinge these woordes of S. Paule, Qui adhæret Deo, vnus Spiritus est: *He that cleaueth vnto God, is one Sprite with God:* He saithe, Vnus, non secundum rem, sed secundum affectionem: *He is One Sprite with God,* not One in deede, *or, accordinge to the Truthe: but,* One *in affection, or accordinge to Loue.*

Cyprian De Cœna Domini.

Cyrill. in Iohan. Lib. 4. Cap. 29.

Nicol. Lyra in Iohan. Cap. 6.

Nicol. Lyra. 1. Cor. 6.

And yet, sommewhat farther to remoue you from your fantasie of your Real Presence, S. Chrysostome saithe, as he is alleged before: Dominum ipsum amplecteris: cum illo commisceris: & subuectus Coniungeris Corpori illi, quod sursum sedet in Cœlis: *Thou* embracest *the Lorde him selfe: thou arte* tempered *with him: and beinge carried vp* (by Faithe, and affection) *thou arte ioined with that Body, that sitteth in Heauen.* In like sense saithe Leo: Christus ineffabili modo cœpit esse Diuinitate Præsentior, qui factus est Humanitate longinquior: Christe *by vnspeakeable meanes beganne to be* the neare to vs by his Diuinitie, the further he is made from vs by his Humanitie.

Chryso. in Epist. ad Colos. Hom. 6

Leo, De Ascensione Domini, Sermon. 3.

I doubte not, M. Hardinge, but ye maie easily sée, that hitherto your Real Presence is but weakely proued.

M. Hardinge.

Againe wee maruel with what face ye dare allege Theophylacte for you, who in moste euident woordes ouerthroweth your Figuratiue, Tropical, and Energical Doctrine touchinge this blessed Sacramente. For he saithe vpon this sixthe Chapter of S. Iohn: Marke wel that the Breade, whiche is eaten of vs in the Mysteries, ✶ *is not onely a certaine Figure* of our Lordes Fleashe, but the Fleash it selfe of our Lorde. For he saide not, the Breade that I shal geue is the Figure of Fleashe, but it is my Fleashe. For the Breade is with secrete woordes through the Mystical blessinge and comminge vpon of the Holy Ghoste, changed into the Fleashe of our Lorde.

Not a Figure, but the Fleashe it selfe of our Lorde. Transubstantiation.

✶ Vntruthe. For he manifestly affirmeth a Figure. His woordes be these, *It is not onely a Figure. Ergo* he graunteth, It is a Figure.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Theophylacte saithe, The Breade is not onely a certaine Figure of oure Lordes Fleashe, but the Fleashe it selfe of our Lorde. This Obiection in my Former Replie is many wheres answeared. We graunte, The Breade is not a bare, or naked Figure: but by waie of Sacramente, or Mysterie, it is the Body of Christe it selfe. So the VVater of Baptisme, is not an emptie Figure of the Blonde of Christe: but it is Christes Blonde it selfe, bicause it is the Sacramente of Christes Blonde. And therefore S. Bernarde saithe, Lauemur in Sanguine eius: *Let vs be washed,* (not in VVater, but) *in the Blonde of* Christe. S. Augustine geueth this generall Rule, as I haue often reported, In Sacramentis videndum est, non quid sint, sed quid Significent: *In Sacramentes wee muste consider,* not, what they be (in Substance, and Nature) but what they Signifie. Tertullian saithe, Christus acceptum Panem, & Discipulis suis distributum, Corpus suum illum Fecit dicendo, Hoc est Corpus meum, hoc est, Figura Corporis mei: Christe *hauinge taken the Breade, and hauinge deliuered the same to his Disciples,* Made it his Body, *saieinge, This is my Body,* That is to saie, This is a Figure of my Body. And to appointe a corruptible Creature to this vse, and to make it an effectual instrumente of sutche highe, and hidden Mysteries, it is

Bernard. super Missus est. Hom. 3

August. Contra Maxim. Lib. 3.

Tertull. Contra Marcion. Lib. 4.

it is not the Worke of any mortal man, but the onely Power, and worckinge of the Holy Ghoste: as it shal farther appeare in the nexte Clause. In mine answeare to the wordes of S. Ambrose. Beda saithe thus, Panis, & Vini Creatura in Sacramentum Carnis, & Sanguinis Christi ineffabili Spiritus sanctificatione transfertur: *The Creature of Breade, and Wine, by the vnspeakeable Sanctification of the Holy Ghoste, is changed* (not into the very Real Body, and Bloude, but) into the Sacramente *of the Body, and Bloude of* Christe. Beda *In Octavis Epiphaniæ.*

M. Hardinge.

Neither maketh S. Ambrose, whiche also yee bringe in, any better for you. VVoulde God yee woulde admitte him for Vmpeere in this pointe. Verily in the booke, and chapter, that ye reserre vs vnto, he disputeth as it were of pourpose againste you, as though he foresawe the time, when the Churche shoulde be troubled with the Heresie of Sacramentaries. *Tu fortè dicis, &c.* Perhappes thou sayest. My Breade is common: But this Breade is Breade, before the woordes of the Sacramentes: so soone as consecration commeth, of Breade is made the Fleashe of Christe. Let vs then auouche this, howe that, whiche is Breade, maie be the Body of Christe? By Consecration. Then with what woordes and speache is consecration made? Euen with those of our Lorde Iesus. For what so euer els is saide (he meaneth at the Masse) it is praisegeuinge to God, and prayinge for the people, for Kinges, for the reste. VVhen the Priestе commeth to the Consecration of the honorable Sacrament, there he vseth not his owne woordes, but the VVoordes of Christe. Therefore it is the woorde of Christe, that maketh the Sacramente. (a) VVhat woorde of Christe? Soothely that same woorde whereby al thinges be made. Our Lorde Commaunded, and Heauen was made. Our Lorde Commaunded, and Earthe was made. Our Lorde Commaunded, and the Seas were made. Our Lorde Commaunded, euery Creature was engendred. Seest thou then, howe woorkeful is the woorde of Christe? VVel then, if there be so great Power in the woorde of our Lorde Iesus, that thinges beganne to be, whiche were not: how mutche more is it woorkeful, (b) *Ut sint, quæ erant, & in aliud commutentur*, That thinges be whiche were, and be changed into an other thinge? Here, Sir Defender, Constrewe me these woordes, and what sense can you drawe foorthe of them, but this: If by the workinge Power of our Lordes woorde, thinges haue a beinge, whiche before were nothinge, and had no beinge at al, as Heauen, Earthe, and Seas: howe mutche more Power hath it to woorke, that thinges whiche were before, and had a beinge, nowe also be, or haue a beinge, but be changed into an other thinge, *in Aliud*, (c) into a thinge of an other Substance? For by this phrase is signified a Substantial chaunginge, whiche aptly is called Transubstantiation: And, I praie you, good Sir, who saithe, that the Elementes, I meane Breade and VVine, passe quite awaie, and go to nothing? Though you so belie vs, wee saie not so: God forbid. VVee saie, that after consecration they be: But what? (d) Not the selfe same they were, whereby the Former Substance is excluded, but the Body and Bloude of our Lorde. Againe in that we saie with *S. Ambrose, In aliud commutantur*, They be chaunged into an other thinge: foloweth it not thereof by good Logike, *Ergo* they be? VVil not this argumente holde in Schoole, the Verbe Passiue beinge resolued, (e) *Sunt commutata, Ergo sunt?* For that whiche ceasseth to be, or goeth to nothing, ye cannot properly saye of it, that it is chaunged: but rather that it is ended, or perisheth. Nowe syr, I reporte me to euery man, that hath any sense, whether I maie not lawfully geue you the Menti, as for manners sake I maye vse the Italian terme, and chalenge you in plaine termes of a Lie, for vtteringe this vntruthe, vpon that Holy Doctour S. Ambrose, specially speakinge as you doo in your Englishe Translation, by your selfe allowed thus: For what can be saide more plainely, then that, whiche Ambrose saithe, Breade, and VVine remaine stil the same they were before, and yet are chaunged into an other thinge? Zeale moueth me to saie beyonde the modestie of my natural disposition, VVhat is iugglinge, what is lieinge, what is falsebed, what is falsefieinge, what is wickednes of falsaries, if this be not?

De Sacr. Li. 4. Ca. 4. De Pane. Consecration.

Operation. These be the wordes alleged by the Defender.

The Elementes after Consecration be, or haue a beinge. Not a Figure, but the Flesshe it selfe of our Lorde. Transubstantiation.

(a) God maie wel be Omnipotente, without either Transubstantiation, or Real Presence.

(b) S. Ambrose saithe, The Breade, and VVine are the same thinges, they were before Consecration: notwithstandinge they be now made a Sacramente.

(c) Vntrue exposition. That were contrarie to S. Ambrose. For then were they not the same thinges, they were before.

(d) O fonde folie. VVhat Beinge haue thinges, when their Substance is gonne?

(e) A vaine Vntruthe. See the Answeare.

M. Hardinges modestie.

Neither is the saieinge, wherewith this Defender belieth S. Ambrose, al onely false, and contrary to the Catholike Faithe, but also absurde, vnreasonable, and foolishe. For if Breade, and VVine remaine stil after Consecration, the same they were before, howe then are they chaunged into an other thinge?

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Here, M. Hardinge, onlesse ye had made S. Ambrose a Prophete, ye thought, he coulde not so handesomely haue serued your tourne. But what, and of whom he prophesied, and howe far he sawe before, we shal se hereafter. Verily, if that be the Heresie, that you imagine, then he needed not greatly any Spirite of Prophesie in that behalfe. For he foretolde vs of no newe Heresie, that was to comme: but rather tolde vs of his owne Heresie, that then was presente. Doubtlesse, the woordes, that we reporte, are not ours: they are his owne.

But S. Ambrose saithe, *The Omnipotente Power of the Woorde, wherewith God made Heauen and Earthe, the same Omnipotente Power of the same woorde, he vseth nowe in the Consecration of the Sacramente.* Therefore (saithe M. Hardinge) it muste needes be

be geathered, he meante Transubstantiation, and Real Presence: as if without these newe fantasies, God coulde not be Omnipotente. I maie wel answeare these menne, as S. Ambrose vpon the like occasion sommetime answeared the wilful blindenesse of the Iewes: Atramentum vident: Spiritum Dei non vident: *They see the Inke* (of the Letter written) *but the Sprite of God they see not:* Euen so M. Hardinge, and others of that side weighe the wordes of S. Ambrose: but his sense, and meaninge they weighe not.

Ambros. De Ncē & Arca.

Certainely God sheweth his Omnipotente Power, as wel in the Sacramente of Baptisme, as in the Sacramente of Thankesgeuinge. Hereof I haue saide sommewhat, as occasion was offered, in my Former Replie to M. Hardinge. Leo saithe thus, Christus originem, quam sumpsit in Vtero Virginis, posuit in Fonte Baptismatis. Dedit Aquæ, quod dedit Matri: Christe *laide in the Fonte of Baptisme the same beginninge, that he tooke in the Virgin's Wombe.* He gaue the same preeminence to the VVater, that he gaue to his Mother. Euen so Chrysostome, Angeli, qui adfuerunt (in Baptismo) tam inenarrabilis operis modum minimè possunt enarrare. Adfuerunt tantùm, & viderunt: nihil tamen operati sunt: Sed Pater tantùm, & Filius, & Spiritus Sanctus: *The Angels, that were presente at the Baptisme, are not hable to vtter* the manner of that vnspeakeable VVoorke. *They were Presente onely, and sawe: but they did nothinge: but onely the Father, the Sonne, and the Holy Ghoste.* Likewise he saithe, Ex Spiritu, & sensibili Aqua omnia hæc admirabilia, & humanam excedentia cogitationem, exoriuntur: *All these* woonderful *Woorkes* (wrought in Baptisme) so far exceedinge the thought of man, *springe of the Sprite, and of Sensible Water.*

Articulo. 5. Division. 4. Leo in Natiuitate Domini. Sermon. 5. Chrysost. in Ioban. Homil. 24. Chrysost. in Ioban. Homil. 24.

Thus the Holy Fathers vsed oftentimes to auance, and to magnifie the Holy Mysteries, the better to bringe theire Hearers to the deepe, and inwarde consideration of the same: and therefore, as S. Augustine saithe, Sacramenta tantæ rei, non nisi eiusdem rei vocabulo nuncuparunt: *They expressed the Sacraments of so greate a thinge, none otherwise, then* by the name of the same thinge. So S. Paule saithe, The Rocke was Christe: So an other saithe, as I haue otherwheres alleged, The Oile is Christe: and an other, Manna erat Christus, qui descendit de Cœlo: The Manna (that rained in the Wilderneste) was Christe, *that came downe from Heauen.* Thus are we taught, that Manna was Christe, that the Oile was Christe, and, that the Rocke was Christe. And these saieinges are true. And yet in deede, and Verily, in Nature, and Substance, neither the Manna, nor the Oile, nor the Rocke was Christe.

August. Ad Bonifaciū. Epist. 23 1. Cor. 10. Pachymer. In 4. Cap. Hierarch. S. Germanus, De Corpor. & sangui. Christi.

So saithe S. Chrysostome, reportinge the Storie of Dauid: Accipiens Aquam allatam bibere noluit: Sed semetipsum reprehendit, & Domino eam libauit. Non enim Aqua erat, sed Sanguis: Dauid *receiuinge of the Water,* (that his menne had gotten with greate daunger from the middes of theire enimies) *woulde not drinke of it: But founde fault with him selfe, and powred it out vnto the Lorde:* For it was not VVater, but Bloude.

Chrysostom. in Psalm. 50.

I beseeche thee, good Christian Reader, marke wel these Wordes. The Storie is cleare. It was in deede onely a Cuppe of Water, & nothinge els. Yet Chrysostome saithe, It was Bloude: It was no VVater.

2. Reg. 23.

In those daies, it was no daunger, thus to saie. The people was instructed, and wel acquainted with this phrase, or manner of speache, and knewe the meaninge. They were taught, that the Rocke, the Oile, & the Manna in the Wilderneste, were onely Sacramentes of Christe: and that, notwithstandinge they were called by the name of Christe, yet in deede, and in Substance they were not Christe.

Therefore I maie answeare M. Hardinge herein, as S. Augustine sommetime answeared the Pelagian Heretiques: Vobis Pelagianis nondum litigantibus, securiùs loquebantur Patres de his Articulis: *Before that you the* Pelagians *beganne to quarrel, the Fathers, and Doctours spake without feare, and freely of these Articles.* Athanasius saithe of the Arian Heretiques, Incorporalia Corporaliter excipientes, quæ probè dicta erant, interpretationibus deprauauerunt: *Takinge Spiritual thinges in a Corporal, or Fleashely meaninge* (as doothe M. Hardinge, and others his felowes) *by theire*

August. Contra Iulianum. Lib. 1 Athanasi. Contra Arian. Sermon. 4.

interpreta-

interpretations they haue depraued the thinges, that were rightly spoken.

S. Ambrose saithe of the Breade, and the VVine, Sunt, quæ erant, & in aliud mutantur: They remaine the same, that they were, *and are changed into an other thinge.* Nowe is the fielde wonne: M. Hardinge bloweth a Paigne Triumphe. Here (saith he) Sir Defender, Construe me these VVoordes. Sothely, good Reader, I distruste not greately, but this poore Defender might easily Construe these VVoordes, were he neuer so simple a Clerke. The Natural Creatures of the Bread, and VVine in the Supper of our Lorde (saithe S. Ambrose) remaine still in Substance, as they were before: yet are they changed into an other thinge, that is to saie, they are made the Sacramente of the Body, and Blonde of Christe: whiche before they were not.

It is Christe.

Notwithstandinge this shorte Construction, beinge cleare, and plaine, maie seeme sufficient, yet, for that M. Hardinge so depely appeleth vs, and willeth vs to Construe him these VVoordes, wee will bothe Construe, and Pars them to, for his pleasure.

Therefore, to warrante our former Construction, S. Augustine saithe thus: Accedat Verbum ad Elementum: & fit Sacramentum: *Lette the Woorde be added to the Elemente, or outwarde Creature: and it is made a Sacramente*, that is to saie, an other thinge. Againe he saithe, Sacramenta sunt Signa rerum, Aliud existentia, Aliud Significantia: *Sacramentes are Signes, or Tokens of thinges*, being by Substance One thinge and Significinge an other thinge. So saithe Chrysostome of the Water of Baptisme, Cùm hoc Elementum acceperit Spiritum Sanctum, fit Sacramentum: Et iam non erit Aqua Potationis, sed Sanctificationis: Non erit Aqua communis, sed Refectionis: *When this Creature of Water, hath receiued the Holy Ghoste, it is made a* Sacramente: *and nowe it is not Water* to drinke, *but Water* to Sanctifie: *Not common Water, but Water to Refreshe.*

Augu. in Iohan. Tractat 80.
Augustin. contra Maximi. Lib 3. Cap. 2.
Chrysostom. in Psalm. 22.

Thus the Elemente, or outwarde Creature bothe remaineth, and is changed: It remaineth in proper and plaine kinde of speache: It is changed vnproperly, that is to saie, by the waie of a Sacramente, or mysterie. So M. Hardinges owne Glose saithe vpon the Decrees: Cœleste Sacramentum dicitur Corpus Christi, sed Improprie. Vnde dicitur, Suo modo: Non rei veritate, sed Significante Mysterio: vt sit sensus, Vocatur Corpus Christi, id est, Significat Corpus Christi: *The Heauenly Sacramente is called the Body of Christe, but* vnproperly (that is to saie, not in plaine, a simple manner of speache.) *Therefore* S. Augustine *saithe, It is so called* after a sorte: *that is*, not in truthe of mater, but by a Mysterie signifieinge: *that the sense maie be this, It is called the Body of Christe, that is to saie*, It signifieth the Body of Christe. So saithe S. Augustine, De Signis disserens, hoc dico, Ne quis in eis attendat, quòd sunt, sed potiùs, quòd Signa sunt, id est, quòd Significant: *Intreatinge of Signes* (or Sacramentes) *thus I saie: Lette noman consider in them*, that they be in Substance, *but rather, that they be* Signes, *that is to saie*, that they Signifie (somme other thinge). In this sense, and meaninge S. Augustine saithe againe, Dominus ait, Ipse (Iohannes) est Elias: Iohannes autem ipse ait, Ego non sum Elias. Rectè ergo Iohannes propriè respondit: Nam Dominus Figuratè: *Our Lorde saide of* Iohn *the Baptiste*: This is Elias: *But* Iohn *him selfe saithe*, I am not Elias. *Therefore* Iohn *answeared wel in* plaine manner of woordes: *For our Lorde spake in a* Figure. Thus in sundrie sortes of speache, Iohn is Elias: and the same Iohn is not Elias: and bothe are true.

De Con. Dist 2. Hoc est. La Chose.
Augustin. De Doctrina Christia. Lib. 2. Cap. 1.
Augustin. in Iohan. Tractat. 4

But what better Expositoure of S. Ambrose can we finde, then S. Ambrose him selfe? I truste, M. Hardinge wil not saie, that so Holy a Father was a Falsifier, and a Lier, specially in declaringe his owne minde. Thus therefore he saith, Ante Benedictionem Verborum Cœlestium, alia species nominatur: post Consecrationem, Corpus Christi Significatur. In comedendo, & potando, Carnem, & Sanguinem, quæ pro nobis oblata sunt, Significamus. In Similitudinem accipis Sacramentum. Est Figura Corporis, & Sanguinis Domini. Similitudinem pretiosi Sanguinis bibis: *Before the Blessinge of the Heauenly woordes*, it is called an other Kinde: *After the woordes of Consecration, the* Body of Christe is Signified. *In Eatinge, and Drinkinge, wee*

Ambros. De iis qui initiantur, Cap. 9.
Ambros. 1. Corinth 11.
Ambros. De Sacrament. Lib 4. Cap. 4 & 5.

Changed into an other thinge.

Signifie the Body, and Bloude, *that were offered for vs. Thou receiueſt the Sacramente for a* Similitude, *or for a likeneſſe. It is a* Figure *of the Body, and Bloude of our Lorde. Thou drinkeſt the* likeneſſe of the pretious Bloude.

The like fourme of woꝛdes the ſame S. Ambroſe vſeth of the Sacramente of Baptiſme: Vidiſti Aquam? Sed non omnis Aqua ſanat: Sed Aqua ſanat, quæ habet Gratiam Dei. Aliud eſt Elementum: Aliud Conſecratio: *Haſte thou ſeene the Water? But al Water healeth not. But that Water healeth, that hath the Grace of God.* The Elemente (oꝛ Creature of Water) is one thinge: and the Conſecration is an other thinge.

Ambroſ. De Sacramen. Lib. 1. Cap. 5.

Thus the Bꝛeade remaineth: and thus it is changed. It remaineth in Subſtance: It is changed in Myſterie.

But M. Hardinge beauſly pꝛeſſeth theſe Woꝛdes, Mutantur in aliud: That is (ſaithe he) into a thinge of an other Subſtance. For by this phraſe is ſignified a Subſtantial changinge, whiche aptely is called Tranſubſtantiation. I wil not here vſe your courteous eloquence, M. Hardinge: noꝛ ſaie vnto you, as you ſaie to others, I praie you, good Sir: but thus I ſaie, I pꝛaie you, M. Hardinge, who gaue you this rule? who taught you this Leſſon? De Cœlo eſt, an ex Hominibus? *Came it from Heauen, or is it of Menne?* Haue the Holy Fathers thus taught you, oꝛ is it onely your owne fantaſie? What Gramnar, What Logique, What Philoſophie, What Diuinitie euer tolde you, that, Aliud, euermoꝛe ſignifieth a thinge of an other Subſtance? If yꝛ haue an Authour, why comme you without him? If it be onely of your ſelfe, why ſhould wꝛ beleeue you?

If, Aliud, ſignifie onely a Subſtance, and nothinge els, why dothe S. Auguſtine ſaie, as it is beſoꝛe alleged, Sacramenta ſunt Signa rerum, Aliud exiſtentia, aliud Significantia? Why ſaithe S. Auguſtine againe, Aliud eſt Sacramentum, Aliud Virtus Sacramenti? Why ſaithe S. Ambroſe, Aliud eſt Elementum, Aliud Conſecratio? Foꝛ by your Diuinitie the Sacramente, the Fourme, the Conſecration, be Accidentes onely, and maie not be taken foꝛ the Subſtance. Verily foꝛ ought, that I can learne, Aliud, is nothinge els, but Res alia, an other thinge, whether it be the Subſtance, oꝛ the Accidente. Foꝛ, I thinke, ye haue not foꝛgotten the Olde rule, Vnumquodque in ſuo genere eſt quid.

Auguſt. Contra Maximi. Lib. 3. Cap. 22.

Auguſt. in Iohan. Tract. 26.

Ambroſ. De Sacram. Li. 1. ca. 5.

M. Har. fo. 347. b

Addition. ☞ M. Hardinge, VVho would thinke, that a man of your ſtudie, and learninge, and of that place, woulde ſaie, and maineteine it, that S. Ambroſe meaneth, Breade, and VVine after Conſecration to remaine ſtil in Subſtance, that, whiche they were before. Addition ☞

The Anſweare. Who would thinke, that a man of your Learninge, M. Hardinge, woulde be ſo vaine, oꝛ ſo wilful? Haue you foꝛgotten, that Gelaſius ſaithe, Non deſinit eſſe Subſtantia, vel Natura Panis, & Vini? *It ceaſeth not to be the Subſtance, oꝛ Nature of Breade, and Wine?* Haue you foꝛgotten, that S. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Natura Panis remanet in Sacramento? *The Nature, oꝛ Subſtance of Breade remaineth ſtil in the Sacramente:* Oꝛ, that Theodoretus ſaithe, Chriſtus Naturam Panis non mutat: Chriſte *changeth not the Nature of the Breade.* Who woulde thinke, you would refuſe to expounde one Father by an other?

Gelaſius contra Eutychetem. Chryſoſtom. ad Caſarium. Theodoret. Dialo. 1.

M. Har. fo 348. b.

M. Hardinge. I wil conſtrue theſe woordes for him, and wil ſhewe his extreeme blindeneſſe. *Ergo*, then, *Si tanta vis eſt*, If ſo greate ſtrength be, *In Sermone Domini Ieſu*, In the ſpeeche of our Lorde Ieſus, *Vt*, that &c. M. Iewel ſupplieth, Breade, and VVine, to be the Nominatiue caſe to the Verbe, *Sint*, Be, oꝛ rather, to the Verbe, *Sunt*. He beginneth the Conſtruction with the Verbe, *Sint*, where as, *Quæ erant*, ſhoulde goe before. Againe, bitweene, *Quæ*, and *Erant*, M. Iewel conueigheth in a Pronoune Demonſtratiue, whiche hath no place there, ſaieinge, whiche they were &c. Is, *Sunt*, to be Engliſhed, they remaine the ſame? *Sunt* is no more, but they be &c. Al S. Ambroſe reaſon proceedeth to proue, that Goddes VVoorde is of force to change Creatures: And he meaneth of change in Subſtance. For al his Compariſon conſiſteth aboute the woordes, *Non eſſe*, and *Eſſe*: and *Eſſe*, and *Aliud eſſe*, &c. And who would not wounder to ſee S. Ambroſe labour ſo vehemently, to proue, that Goddes VVoorde is hable to change a Creature in qualitie, as though a man were not hable to change a thinge in qualitie? &c. VVhen Conſecration is comme vnto it, *De Pane*, from of Breade it is made Chriſtes Fleaſhe.

Fol. 349. a.

Fol. 349. b.

The Anſweare. Good Reader, the woꝛdes, that I haue already written, maie ſuffiſe

Changed into an other thinge.

ſuffile thée for Anſweare in this behalfe. But, wherras M. Hardinge ſéketh to preuaile by his prety Constructions, and thus nicely teacheth thée to expounde S. Ambroſe, *Ergo*, Then: *Si*, If: *Vt*, that: *Sunt*, Be, that is to ſaie, haue a beeinge, *Quæ erant*, ſhoulde goe before: *Sint*, ſhoulde folowe after, his dealinge herein is Lighte, and childiſhe, as thou maiſte ſée, and not worthy of Anſweare. *The Breade, and the Wine*, ſaithe S. Ambroſe, *are ſtil, that they were: And yet are changed into an other thinge*. Here M. Hardinge crieth out, Theſe woordes, Breade, and VVine are not in S. Ambroſe. Theſe woordes M. Iewel hath ſupplied, to be the Nominitiue caſe to the Verbe, *Sint*. To Anſweare your Grammatical Diuinitie, M. Hardinge, if S. Ambroſe meante not Breade, and VVine, I praie you telle vs, what thinges meante he? If ye ſaie, He meante nothinge, the children wil laughe at you: If ye ſaie, He meante any other thinges, then Breade, and VVine, it muſte nédes folowe, that ſomme other thinges, beſides Breade, and VVine, are changed into Chriſtes Body: whiche woulde be the ouerthrowe of al your Doarine. S. Ambroſe ſaithe, by your owne Translation, as cleare as midnight, *The thinges that were, be, or haue a beeinge, and they are changed into an other thinge*. What thinges were they? what thinges haue a béeinge? What thinges are changed? Once againe I ſaie vnto you, If S. Ambroſe meante not Breade, and VVine, I praie you, telle vs, what thinges meante he? If Breade, and VVine be not changed, where is then your Tranſubſtantiation of Breade, and VVine? If the Breade, and VVine remaine not, howe ſaie you, that the Breade, and VVine haue a béeinge? Will you ſaie, They haue a beeinge, and yet be nothinge? Leaue theſe diuiſes, M. Hardinge: They becomme you not. Why ſhoulde you ſo vainely encoumbre the worlde with ſutche folies. S. Ambroſe ſaithe, *They are changed into an other thinge*. So maie they be, though the former Subſtance, & Nature of Breade, and VVine remaine ſtil. But you ſaie, Al S. Ambroſes reaſon proceedeth, to proue, that Goddes VVoorde is of force to change Creatures, meaninge, as you ſaie, of change in Subſtance. How knowe you that, M. Hardinge? Verily S. Ambroſe him ſelfe ſéemeth not to knowe it. Beholde his woordes: Thus he ſaith, Moſes *lifted vp his rodde, and the water was diuided, and ſtoode as a Walle: The water of* Iordaine *turned his Courſe, and contrarie to Nature flowed backewarde to his Heade. Is it not cleare, that Nature was changed &c.* Nowe telle vs, M. Hardinge, calle you this a change in Subſtance? was not the water bothe of the Reade Sea, and of Iordaine, in Nature, & Subſtance as it was before? by theſe, and ſutche other like eramples it appeareth, that, notwithſtandinge S. Ambroſe ſaie, *The Nature is Changed*, yet he meante a change in qualitie onely, and not in Subſtance. But he ſaithe, *Of Breade is made Chriſtes Body*. So Chryſoſtome ſaithe, *The Baptiſme of Chriſte, is Chriſtes Bloude*. But S. Ambroſe ſaithe not, The Breade is no lenger Breade: Or, the Breade is Really changed into Chriſtes Body. His woordes agrée thorowly with the woordes of Tertullian, that liued before him. For as S. Ambroſe ſaithe, *Of the Breade is made Chriſtes Body*: Euen ſo ſaithe Tertullian, Chriſtus accepit Panem, & Corpus ſuum illum fecit, dicendo, hoc eſt Corpus meum, hoc eſt, Figura Corporis mei: Chriſte *tooke Breade, and made it his Body*, ſaieinge, *This is my Body, that is to ſaie, This is a Figure of my Body*. The Breade, ſaithe he, is made the Body of Chriſte. What thinge can there be more plainely ſpoken? But he thought it good, further to open his owne meaninge, leaſte any man ſhould be deceiued. *He made it his Body* (ſaithe he) *that is to ſaie, He made it a Figure, or a Sacramente of his Body*. Euen ſo meante S. Ambroſe: and the ſame meaninge he hathe many wates plainely vttered, as I haue ſaide before. Theſe be his woordes, *The Body of Chriſte is Signified: wee Signifie the Fleaſhe, and Bloude of Chriſte: Thou receiueſt the Sacramente for a likeneſſe: Thou drinkeſt the Similitude of the pretious Bloude: It is a Figure of the Body, and Bloude of our Lorde*. In this ſenſe S. Ambroſe ſaith, *The Breade is made Chriſtes Body*. You muſte géeue him leaue of Courteſie, M. Hardinge, to expounde his owne meaninge: onleſſe you knowe it better, then he him ſelfe.

M. Har. fo. 349. a

Fol. 349. b.

Ambroſ. De illis qui initian. Cap. 9.

Chryſoſtom. ad Hebræ. Hom. 16.

Tertull. Contra Marcion. Lib. 4.

You ſaie, VVho woulde not woonder, to ſee S. Ambroſe labour ſo vehemently, to proue, that Goddes woorde is hable to change a Creature in qualitie, as though a man were not hable to change a thinge in qualitie? And maruelle you ſo mutche hereat, M. Hardinge? It ap-

M. Har. fo. 349. b

Changed into an other thinge.

peareth, yᵉ haue not so aduisedly considered the Holy Fathers. S. Cyprian speakinge onely of the Holy Oile, saithe thus, Sanctificatis Elementis iam non propria Natura præbet effectum, Sed virtus Diuina potentiùs operatur: Adest Veritas Signo, & Spiritus Sacramento: *When the Elementes* (of the Oile) *be Sanctified, it is not the Nature thereof that geueth effecte: But the Power of God woorketh more mightily: The Truthe is presente with the Signe: And the Holy Ghoste is presente with the Sacramente. It is not Nature,* he saithe: *It is the Power of God.* So earnestly he laboureth to proue a change: And yet is it a change, not in Substance, as you knowe, but onely in qualitie. Suche extraordinarie speaches be very common in the Ancient Writers. Betramus, that liued aboute eight hundred yeres paste, saithe thus, Christe *of the* Manna *that fille from Heauen in the Wildernesse, inuisibly, made his owne Body: And of the Water, that flowed from the Rocke, inuisibly he wrought his owne Bloude.* Theise woordes be vehemente, as none maie be more. Yet was this change in Qualitie onelye, & not in Substance. So saithe Beda, Panis & Vini Creatura in Sacramentum Carnis, & Sanguinis Christi, ineffabili Spiritus Sanctificatione transfertur: *The Creature of Breade, and Wine by the vnspeakeable Sanctification of the Holy Ghoste, is turned into the Sacramente of Christes Fleashe, and Bloude.* He saithe not, It is changed in Substance, or, it is Really turned into Christes Fleashe, and Bloude: but onelye, *It is turned into the Sacramente of Christes Fleashe, and Bloude.* And therefore S. Ambrose, after al other his vehemente woordes, saith thus, Vera vtique Caro Christi, quæ Crucifixa est, quæ sepulta est: verè ergo Carnis illius Sacramentum est. Ipse clamat Dominus Iesus, Hoc est Corpus meum. Ante Benedictionem verborum Cœlestium alia species nominatur: Post Consecrationem Corpus Christi Significatur: *That was the very true Fleashe of Christe, that was Crucified, and that was Buried: Therefore this is verily a Sacrament of that Fleashe. The Lorde Iesus him selfe saithe, This is my Body. Before the Benediction of the Heauenly woordes, it is named an other kinde: After the Consecration, the Body of Christe is Signified.*

Cyprian. De Vnctione Chrismatis.

Betram. de Sacram. Eucha.

Beda in Octauis Epiphaniæ.

Ambros. De illis qui initian. Cap. 9.

And leaste any man should wonder at these strange kindes of speaches, like as S. Ambrose speaketh of the Changinge of the Breade in our Lordes Supper, euen so he speaketh of the Changinge of the Water in the Sacramente of Baptisme. Theise be his woordes: *Firste of al the Apostle teacheth thee, not to beholde* (in Baptisme) *the thinges, that are seene, but the thinges, that are not seene &c. Beleeue therefore the Presence of the Godhed: Beleeuest thou the woorke, and beleeuest thou not the Presence? &c. Beleeue not onely the eies of the Body. That thinge is better seene, that is not seene. &c. This is that Mysterie, that eie neuer sawe, that eare neuer harde, that neuer entred into the harte of Man. &c. To them of the Iewes, an Angel came downe: vnto thee commeth downe the Holy Ghost. Vnto them the Creature of the Water was sturred: vnto thee* Christe *him selfe woorketh, that is the Lorde of the Creature: &c. Beleeue therefore, that our Lorde Iesus is presente in Baptisme at the Praier of the Priestе. &c. Saie not, howe are wee Regenerate? I knowe not here the vse of Nature. The order of Nature is not there, where as is the excellencie of Goddes Grace.* These, and suche other like woordes S. Ambrose vttereth, onely touchinge *The Sacramente of Baptisme. Beleeue not,* (saithe he) *thy Bodily eies: Goddes Woorde is woorkeful: Here is no order of Nature: Grace excelleth: Nature yeeldeth:* Christe *is the Lorde of the Creature: God is Presente:* Christe *is Presente.* So earnestly he laboureth to proue this change. And yet is it a change, not in Substance, but onely in Qualitie. Suche change is there in the VVater. Suche change is there in the Breade, and VVine.

De illis qui initiant. Cap. 3.

Cap. 4.

Cap. 5.

Cap. 9.

Laste of al, where as I haue thus Englished theise woordes, *Sunt, quæ erant,* They remaine the same, that they were, yᵉ charge mᵉ with false Translation. Is, *Sunt,* (saie you) to be Englished, they remaine the same? *Sunt,* is no more, but, they be. If S. Ambrose woulde haue saide, as you vntruely translate him, his woordes had benne these, *Manent eadem.* Your obiection is pretty, M. Hardinge. Wᵉ wil not here dispute of the proprietie of woordes. Bᵉ it, that, *Est,* maie not commonly be Englished, to remaine. Yet sommetimes perhaps, and in somme sentence, it maie wel beare this Englishe. Hieremie saithe, Rachel plorat Filios suos, quia non sunt: Dauid saithe, Laudabo Dominum quandiu sum: What if a man woulde thus Englishe theise woordes. Rachel *bewaileth her Children, because they remaine not:* I wil Praise the Lorde, while I

M. Har. fo 349. 4

Hieremi. 31.

Psalm. 117.

remaine

remaine aline? woulde you therefore condemne him of Hereſie? Or, woulde you ſaie, *Sunt*, maie not be Engliſhed, To remaine? As for the place of S. Ambroſe, it ſeemeth, it maie wel ſo be Engliſhed. *Sunt, quæ erant:* They remaine, that they were before. If this miſlike you, we wil folowe your owne Engliſhe, and ſaie thus, They are, that they were before. Nowe, I praie you, what aduantage haue you gotten by this exchange? But you ſaie, If S. Ambroſe had thus meante, he woulde haue ſaide, *Manent eadem*. That maie wel be doubted. For S. Ambroſe is not alwaies moſte curious in choiſe of wordes. Howe be it, although he ſaie it not, yet others haue ſaide it. For, as it is alleged before, S. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Natura Panis remanet in Sacramento: *The Nature of Breade remaineth in the Sacramente.* And Gelaſius ſaithe, *It ceaſeth not to be the Subſtance, or Nature of Breade, and Wine.* If it ceaſe not to be, then muſte you confeſſe, It remaineth ſtil. And thus haue you founde that very ſame worde, that ſo hath offended you.

Sunt quæ erant.

Chryſ. ad Cæſarium.

Gelaſius Contra Eutycheten.

We ſaie, The Nature, and Subſtance of the Breade, and VVine, is not clearely changed, or conſumed into Nothinge, as many haue dreamed in theſe later daies. Here M. Hardinge commeth roughly in, as his manner is, and ſaithe, yee belie vs: wee ſaie not ſo: God forebid. Thus he crieth out, before he be ſtriken: Salomon ſaithe, Impius fugit, nemine perſequente: *The gilty fleeth, before he be chaſed.* For, notwithſtandinge there be multitudes of folies in his Doctrine, yet with this folie we charge him not. But, whether any of his Felowes haue ſo ſaide, or no, I reporte me to his Maiſter, Peter Lombarde. His wordes be theſe, Quid ergo fit de Subſtantia Panis, & Vini? Illi dicunt, vel in præiacentem materiam reſolui, vel in nihilum redigi: *What then becommeth of the* Subſtance of the Breade, and VVine? *They ſaie, either that it is reſolued into the mater, that was before, or els, that it is* conſumed into nothinge.

Prouerb. 28.

4. Senten. Diſt. 11. Quidam.

What? Into nothinge? Mary God forebid, ſaithe M. Hardinge. So coye, and ſo careful he is, for his holy Fourmes, and his kingdome of Accidentes. He ſaithe, The whole Subſtance of the Breade is cleane aboliſhed, not one parte thereof remaininge: yet maie it not be turned into nothinge. And, as if the mater were wel worthe ſomwhat, he aſſureth the ſame ſadly with a great deteſtation, God forebid: God ſhield the Bread. Here of ſomethinge might be ſaide, if it were any thinge worthe the hearinge. But, good Reader, thou ſhalt loſe nothinge by the ſilence: For, I aſſure thee, verily it is worth nothinge.

Yet M. Hardinge firſte geueth vs his courteous Menti: and afterwarde, in his familiare manner, chargeth vs by plaine termes with a Lie: and ſuddainely crieth out, as he ſaithe, beyonde the modeſtie of his natural diſpoſition, VVhat is Iugglinge: what is Lieinge: what is Falſehedde: what is Falſifieinge: what is wickedneſſe of Falſaries, if this be not? I might ſaie: O Sirs, Holde the man. Good Chriſtian Reader, in al theſe Whattes, thou wilte happily thinke, there ſhoulde be ſomwhat. Howbe it, in deede it is but a pangue of M. Hardinges Rhetorique. He ſpeaketh not thus of his owne Natural diſpoſition, as he him ſelfe ſaithe, but of Arte, & ſtudie: leaſte thou ſhouldeſt thinke, that hauinge ſpente ſo many waſte wordes, in the ende he had ſaide nothinge.

But, what is the mater, M. Hardinge? What moueth you, to make this piteous outerie? For ſothe bicauſe we ſaie, *The Breade, and Wine remaine the ſame, they were before.* But theſe be S. Ambroſes owne wordes: they be not ours: we make them not: we change them not: but reporte them ſimply, as we finde them. As they were written in Latine by the Authour, theſe they are: (Panis, & Vinum) ſunt, quæ erant, & in aliud mutantur: The Breade and VVine are the ſame, that they were: *and are changed into an other thinge.* Therefore, it appeareth, al theſe Exclamations, of what is Iugglinge? what is Lieinge? &c. perteine vnto S. Ambroſe the Authoure hereof, and not vnto vs.

Nowe, for ſo muche as, it hathe pleaſed M. Hardinge ſo earneſtly to calle vs forthe to conſtrue him theſe woordes, I beſeeche thee, good Reader, marke wel, what Conſtructions he, and his Felowes haue imagined, and fanſied vpon the ſame. Firſt of al Lanfrancus, the chiefeſt Champion of that ſide, thought it the wiſeſt waie, vtterly to denie theſe wordes, and to ſaie, They were neuer written by S. Ambroſe.

Changed into an other thinge.

For thus he ſtormeth againſte Berengarius: O mentem amentem: O hominem impudenter mentientem: O puniendam temeritatem! Ambroſium accire teſtem præſumis, quòd Panis, & Vinum Altaris, per Conſecrationem non deſinant eſſe, quod erant, ſed commutentur in aliud, quod non erant? Et quidem ſi de Sacramentis, ſeu de cæteris, de quibus Ambroſius ſcripſit, omnes reuoluat Libros, quos Eccleſia in vſu nunc habet, tale quid ab Ambroſio dictum, taliterq; expoſitum, nuſquam reperire valebit: *O madde minde: O impudent Lier: O raſheneſſe woorthy of puniſhment: Dareſt thou to allege* S. Ambroſe *for a witneſſe, that the Breade and Wine of the Aultar leaue not by Conſecration, to be that they were before: but are changed into an other thinge, that they were not? Nowe truely if he peruſe al the Bookes, that* S. Ambroſe *hath written, either of the Sacramentes, or of other maters, I meane ſuche Bookes, as the Churche hath nowe in vſe, he ſhal* neuer finde any thinge ſo written by S. Ambroſe, *and ſo expounded.*

Lanfrancus, De Euchariſt.

But M. Hardinge thought, he might not wel thus dw without empeachment of his modeſtie. For the very ſame wordes are to be founde extante, and apparent in euery Boke. Therefore allowinge the wordes, he thought it beſte to folowe his Maiſter Peter à Soto, **and to delaie, and qualifie the ſame with ſome Conſtruction.**

Thus therefore he ſaithe, Sunt, quæ erant, & in aliud mutantur: Doothe it not folowe by good Logike, Mutata ſunt, ergo ſunt: They be changed: *Ergo,* they be? **In** Louaine, **perhaps: In other Vniuerſities, I doubte, whether it haue hitherto benne allowed, or no. For by this** Logique, **whereas** S. Hierome ſaithe, Superbia mutata eſt in Humilitatem, **M. Hardinge maie conclude, as he dothe nowe,** Superbia mutata eſt: Ergo eſt: *Pride is changed into Humilitie:* Ergo *Pride is, or remaineth ſtil.* **And where as** S. Paule ſaithe, Commutauerunt Veritatem Dei in mendacium: By this Logique **M. Hardinge maie ſaie,** Mutata eſt, Ergo eſt: *The Truthe of God is changed into a Lie:* Ergo, *It is Goddes Truthe ſtil notwithſtandinge.*

Hieronym. in Matthæ. Cap. 18

Rom. 1.

And, to take further viewe of M. Hardinges Conſtruction, **thus he ſaithe,** Panis, & Vinum ſunt, quæ erant, id eſt, qualia erant: *The Breade, and Wine be in* Subſtance the ſame, *that they were: that is to ſaie,* They be in qualities, or Accidentes, *as they were.* **They are changed,** in Aliud, **into an other thinge: that is, Into an other** Subſtance. **They are** Changed: **that is, They are** Tranſubſtantiate. They be: **that is,** They be not: **That** they were: **that is,** that they were not. **Thus** Subſtance, **is** Accidens: Accidens, **is** Subſtance: Beinge, **is** not Beinge: Not Beinge, **is** Beinge: Remaininge, **is** not Remaininge: Changinge, **is** not Changinge: **And the** ſame thinge, **is** not the ſame.

With ſuche pretty Conſtructions **M. Hardinge can teache vs to expounde the Anciente Fathers. Theſe be their Keies of the Kingedome of Heauen. Herewith there is nothinge ſo cloſe ſhutte, but they can open it: There is nothinge ſo open, but they can ſhut it. Here might I conclude with M. Hardinges owne wordes, and rightly ſaie, as he ſaithe,** what is Iugglinge? what is Lieinge? &c. **But it ſhalbe beſte to leaue his owne eloquence, and modeſtie, to him ſelfe.**

M. Hardinge.

The places of Gelaſius, and Theodorite in apparence ſeeme to make muche for you, and more then any other Doctours. And though theſe twoo Doctours were altogeather of this opinion, that after Conſecration the Subſtance of Breade and VVine remaineth, what reaſon is it, they onely in ſo greate a matter ſhould preiudicate al other Holy and learned Fathers, and whiche is more, the generall Counce's, and (a) the whole Churche of Chriſte? The Catholike Faithe we finde in them both within fewe lines after the woordes of this Defenders obiection, firſte by Gelaſius thus expreſſed: *Sacramenta Corporis & Sanguinis Domini in diuinam tranſeunt, Spiritu Sancto perficiente, Subſtantiam: permanent tamen in ſua proprietate Naturæ:* The Sacramentes (ſaithe he) of the Body and Bloude of our Lorde paſſe ouer into a Diuine Subſtance by the woorkinge of the Holy Ghoſt. Yet remaine they ſtil in the proprietie of theire owne Nature. By diuine Subſtance he meaneth the Fleaſhe of our Lorde aſſumpted of the VVoorde. Nowe ſaithe Theodoritus, the Myſtical tokens, be vnderſtanded to be the thinges, whiche they be made, and are beleeued, and adored, as beinge the thinges whiche they are beleeued to be. But euery man knoweth they are beleeued to be made the Body and Bloude of Chriſte, and therefore be duely adored and woorſhipped: ſo after the minde of Theodorite, they be the Body and Bloude in deede, not Breade and VVine, as before Conſecration.

(a) Vntruth. For this fantaſie was neuer allowed through the whole Churche of Chriſte: as it ſhal appeare.

The truthe cõfeſſed by Theodorit' Dialog. 2

The Subſtance or Nature of Breade and VVine ceaſſeth not to be, ſaith Gelaſius: (VVhereas your interpreter

interpreter addeth of his owne heade this woorde So) (b) wee telle you and him, in Theodorite it is not so. *Ergo*, it remaineth, saie yee. VVee graunte the Substance, or Nature of Breade and VVine remaineth after Consecration, so as Celasius vnderstandeth by the name of Substance, (c) which is no thinge elles but the very Nature (as commonly wee speake of Nature) that is to saie, the natural properties of Breade and VVine: for so he expoundeth him selfe afterwarde, saieinge, Yet they remaine in the propertie of their owne Nature. They remaine (likewise saithe Theodorite) in their Former Substance, Figure, and Forme, and be seene and felte as before.

And thereto maie Damascenes definition of Substance perteine, who saithe, that Substance is euery that, what so euer by it selfe is beinge, and hath not beinge in an other. And therefore (d) sithe the Accidentes haue theire beinge by them selues in this Sacramente, and be not staied on any other thing, in this consideration. Substance of them maie so be reported, as if them selues were Substance. VVhich (e) substantial consistinge of the Accidentes lackinge a propre name, becawse it is the mighty and extraordinarie hande of God, is also extraordinarely called of Gelasius, and Theodoritus by the name which the thing had before, to witte, the Substance of Bread and VVine. And no marueil if thei spake not in (f) moste exacte wise of this secrete pointe of Doctrine (**of Fourmes & Accidentes**) at what time it was not as yet by the Church so clearely, and fully discussed: (**as it was neuer yet vntil this daie**). But sithence of the Schoolemen (**ignorante and Fantastical Sophisters**) it hathe benne more distinctly named the existence of Accidentes without theire Subiecte, that is, without an other thinge whereupon they might staie.

Againe, whereas Breade and VVine by theire nature doo nourrishe, (g) this vertue also remaineth in the Accidentes geeuen to them by the Almightie VVoorde of God, who changeth Creatures to theire betteringe, not to theire impairinge. This was the meaninge of Gelasius, and Theodoritus, where they saie, the Breade and VVine to remaine in their Former Substance or Nature. Otherwise shoulde they be contrary to them selues, as they, whiche also doo acknowledge the Nature of Breade and VVine to be changed into a more excellente Substance, by the worke ful VVoorde of Christe.

(b) VVntruthe, VVithout question it is so. For the wordes be, *Non desinut esse* Substantia Panis.

(c) A peuishe vntruthe. It had benne too great a folie.

(d) Vntruthe manifeste: Reade the Answeare.

(e) Substantial consistinge of Accidentes: O folie.

(f) O exacte folie. A heape of Vntruthes with out sense.

(g) Vntruth. M. Hardinge by one dreame expoundeth an other.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

As for theise two Fathers, Gelasius, **and** Theodoretus, **notwithstandinge M. Harding would seeme to make smal accoumpte of them, for that they be, as he saithe, but onely twoo, yet he rather catcheth holde in somme darke, or doubte ful worde by them vttered, then he woulde seeme vtterly to geue them ouer.** Gelasius saithe, *The Sacramentes passe ouer into a Diuine Substance.* **If he had saide,** *They passe ouer into a Diuine Accidente*, **it woulde somewhat better haue shadowed theise mennes pourpose. But other** Diuine Substance **M. Hardinge can imagine none, sauing onely Christes Body Substantially, and Really conteined vnder the Fourmes of Breade, & Wine. And this fantasie, notwithstandinge** Gelasius **neuer knewe it, muste nedes be allowed againste al, that** Gelasius **him selfe can saie to the contrarie.**

But if M. Hardinge had better remembred the placinge, and meaninge of this worde, Substantia, **and, that as wel** Gelasius, **as other Learned Fathers vse the same as Diuines, and not as Natural Philosophers, he shoulde easily haue founde his owne erroure.**

It maie please thē therefore, good Christian Reader to vnderstande, That the promise of Mercie, The Grace of God, Our Faithe in Christe, **Goddes Worde, and the Holy Sacramentes, that are the aides, and healpes of our Faithe, are of the Holy Ancient Writers called a** Substance. **So** S. Cyprian saithe, Substantiam Salutis amittunt: *They lose the* Substance *of Saluation*. **So saithe** Irenæus, Quamuis sint in Operibus materialibus, tamen putant se non amittere Spiritualem Substantiam: *Although they liue in worldly, or filthie woorkes, yet they thinke, they lose not the Spiritual Substance*. **Likewise againe he saithe of the folies, and Vanitie of the** Valentinian **Heretiques,** Insubstantatiuum ostendit figmentum ipsorum: *He shewed, that their Inuentions, and Diuises were voide of* Substance. **So** S. Chrysostome, Fides dat Substantiam rebus: Imò potiùs non dat Substantiam, sed ipsa est Substantia earum: *Faithe geeueth thinges theire* Saubstance: *Or rather, it geeueth not* Substance *vnto thinges, but it selfe is their* Substance. **In like manner saithe** Tertullian, Deus Idololatriæ Substantiam cohibuit: *God forebade the* Substance *of Idolatrie*. **So saithe** Abbate Panormitane, Continentia non est de Substantia Ordinis: *Single, or sole life is not of the* Substance *of Holy Orders*. **And an other saith,** Enim, non est de Substantia Consecrationis: *This woorde* Enim, *is not of the* Substance of Consecration. **By these, and other like examples, it maie appeare, that in cases of Religion,** Substance **is not euermore taken for**

Cyprian De Simplicit. Prælatorum.

Irenæ. lib 1. ca. 1

In eodem Cap. Ἀνύπαρκτον, Ἀνυπόστατον,

Chrysostom. in Epist. ad Hebræ. Homil. 31.

Tertull. Aduersus Marcion. Lib 2.

Abbas, Extra. De Clericis Coniugatis. cum Olim Papilla Oculi. Pag. 14.

Christes Body coured with Accidentes.

If al these examples wil not yet suffice, to growe neare to our pourpose, S. Ambrose saithe, Quid est Ieiunium, nisi Substantia, & Imago Cœlestis? *What is Fastinge, but a* Substance, *and an Heauenly Image?*

Ambros. De Elia & Ieiunio. Cap 3.

Likewise Tertullian calleth Baptisme, Diuinam Substantiam, *A Diuine* Substance. His woordes be these, Quid festinat innocens ætas, ad Remissionem Peccatorum? Cautiùs agitur in sæcularibus: vt cui Substantia terrena non creditur, Diuina credatur: *Why hasteth this innocent age* (He meaneth Children) *to the Remission of theire Sinnes? Wee are mutche more wary in worldly thinges. It is meete, wee shoulde commit the Sacramente of Baptisme, whiche is a* Diuine Substance, *vnto them, vnto whome wee would not commit the* Substance *of the Earthe?*

Tertull. De Baptismo.

This is one of Tertullians errours.

By these wee maie see, in what sense Gelasius calleth the Sacrament of Thankesgeuinge, A Diuine Substance. Verily none other waies, but euen as S. Ambrose, calleth Fastinge, A Heauenly Substance. And as Tertullian calleth the Sacrament of Baptisme, by the same woordes, A Diuine Substance. And what can al this auaile M. Hardinge, to proue, either his Transubstantiation, or his Real Presence?

But why dealeth he so doubly? Wherefore dissembleth he the woordes of Gelasius, that immediately in the same sentence weute before? For Gelasius him selfe so clearely, and plainely expounded his owne minde, as no Louanian Doctour can do it better. Thus he saith, Non definit esse Substantia Panis, vel Natura Vini. Et certè Imago, & Similitudo Corporis, & Sanguinis Christi in Actione Mysteriorum celebratur: There leaueth not to be the Substance of Breade, or the Nature of Wine. *And in deede the* Image, or Representation, and likenesse *of the Body, and Bloud of Christ is published in the Ministration of the Mysteries.* And againe in the woordes next immediately folowinge, Sacramenta transeunt in Diuinam, Spiritu Sancto perficiente, Substantiam: permanent tamen in suæ proprietate Naturæ: *The Sacramentes, by the woorkinge of the Holy Ghoste, passe into a Diuine* Substance: *yet notwithstandinge, they* remaine stil in the propertie of theire owne Nature.

Gelasius contra Eutychetem.

This Image, or Representation, or Likenesse, or Memorie of the Body, & Bloude of Christe is it, that Gelasius calleth the Diuine Substance.

And in like sense S. Augustine calleth the same, Cœlestem Panem: The Heauenly Breade. Thus he writeth, as he is alleged by Gratian: Cœlestis Panis, qui Caro Christi est, suo modo vocatur Corpus Christi: cùm reuerà sit Sacramentum Corporis Christi: *The* Heauenly Bread (of the Sacrament) *which is the Fleashe of* Christ, after this sorte *is called the Body of* Christe: *whereas* in deede *it is the Sacramente of* Christes *Body.*

De Conse. Dist. 2. Hoc est, quod dicimus.

Likewise saith S. Cyprian, Diuersa Nomina, vel Species ad Vnam reducuntur Essentiam: & Significantia, & significata eisdem vocabulis censentur: *Diuerse names, or kindes* (of things) *are brought vnto one* Substance: That is to saie, *The thinges, that doo* Signifie, *and the thinges, that be* Signified, *are reckened bothe by one name:* That is, as the Body of Christ is called Breade: so is the Breade called Christes Body.

Cyprian. de Vnctione Chrismatis.

To be shorte, as Gelasius calleth the Sacramente, A Diuine Substance, euen so Gratian saithe to the same pourpose, Quidam non improbabiliter exponunt hoc loco, Carnis, & Sanguinis Veritatem, ipsam earundem efficientiam, id est, peccatorum Remissionem: *Somme there be, that in this place, not without good reason, by these woordes,* The Truthe of Christes Fleashe, and Bloude, vnderstande the Effecte, or woorkinge of the same, *that is to saie, The Remission of Sinnes.*

De Conse. Dist. 2 Species.

For answeare vnto Theodoretus, it maie please thee for sparinge of time, to reade my Former Replie to M. Hardinge. It is true, that Theodorete saithe, *The Mystical tokens* (that is to saie) *the Sacramentes, be vnderstoode to be the thinges, whiche they be made, and beleued.* That is, That they be Mysteries of Christes Body: or, that in a Mysterie, or by waie of a Sacramente, they be the Body of Christe. But it is true also, that he saithe, bothe immediately folowinge in the same place, and also before: Signa Mystica post Sanctificationem non recedunt à Natura sua: Manent enim in Priori Substantia, & Figura, & Forma: The Mystical Tokens (or Sacramentes) after the Consecration departe not from theire owne Nature. *For they remaine*

Arti 8. Diuis. 26. Et Artic. 10. Diuis. 4.

Theodoret. in. 2. Dialogo, Inconfusus.

maine stil in theire Former Substance, *and Fourme, and Figure*. And, as I haue often alleged out of S. Augustine, In Sacramentis videndum est, non quid sint, sed quid Significent: *In Sacramentes wee muste consider*, not what they be (in deede, and of theire owne Nature) *but what they* Signifie. *Augustl Contra Maximin. Lib. 3 Cap 22.*

So saithe S Chrysostome, Antequàm Panis Sanctificetur, Panem eum nominamus: Diuina autem illum Gratia sanctificante, mediante Sacerdote, liberatus est quidem ab appellatione Panis: Dignus autem habitus est Dominici Corporis appellatione: Etiamsi Natura Panis in illo remanserit: *Before the Breade be Sanctified, we cal it Breade. But, after that, by the meane of the Priest, the Heauenly Grace hath hallowed it, it is discharged from the name of Bread, and is vouchesaued to be called by the name of our Lordes Body*: notwithstandinge the nature of the Breade remaine stil. *Chrysostom. Ad Cæsarium.*

So saith Theodorete him selfe, Seruator noster commutauit nomina: & Corpori quidem Symboli nomen dedit, Symbolo verò nomen Corporis: *Our Sauiour hathe made exchange of the names: And vnto his Body hath geuen the name of* (Breade, whiche is) *the Sacramente: and* vnto the Sacramente hathe geuen the name of his Body. *Theodoret. Dialogo. 1.*

Neuertheless, notwithstandinge these wordes bothe of Theodoretus, and of Gelasius (The Substance of Breade, and VVine, after the woordes of Consecration remaineth stil) be so plaine, that noman without blusshinge maie denie them. Yet hathe M. Hardinge one good shifte leafte in store. The Substance (saithe he) sommetimes is vsed for the Accidente. Euen as discretely, and to so good pourpose, as if he had said, Fiere is Water, or, Lighte is Darkenesse. And so by this Construction, Substance sommetimes is no Substance. This is M. Hardinges owne peculiare Diuinitie, without the witnesse of any of al the Learned Fathers, Greeke, or Latine, one, or other. For, good Reader, thou maiste not thinke, that any man, either wel aduised, or Learned, woulde saie the like.

The Fathers (saithe he) spake not hereof in moste exacte wise. Perhappes they had not Learned their Logique Rules, or vnderstode not the Principles of Natural reason, no not so mutche, as a childe maie easily vnderstande: but vsed Substance, for Accidentes: Accidentes for Substance: and one thinge for an other: as menne that knewe not what they saide. In deede, M. Hardinge, this is not, as you saie, Exacte wise: It seemeth rather to be, Exacte folie.

Ye adde further, Damascene saithe, Substance is euery that, what so euer by it selfe is being, and hathe no beinge in an other. What needed you here to allege Damascene? Children knowe, that Aristotle, and others longe before him wrote the like. Notwithstanding to this Maior, ye set a Minor of your owne. The Accidentes (saie you) haue their Beeinge by them selues: and be not staide in any other thinge. O, M. Hardinge, this thinge woulde haue had somme better proufe. Why allege you not, either S. Augustine, or S. Ambrose, or S. Chrysostome, or S. Hierome, or somme other Catholique Father to this pourpose? Your simple worde is no good warrante. Ye proue that thinge, that is Universally confessed, and needed no proufe: but that ye shoulde proue, ye leaue vnproued. This in Sophistrie is called Petitio Principij. The simplest shifte, that can be vsed. Damascenes Maior is Confessed, and true. But your Minor, and Conclusion, are bothe Untrue. For whereas you saie of your selfe: The Accidentes haue theire Beeinge by them selues: We saie, The same Accidentes haue their Being in the Breade and Wine, as in their Subiectes. Sundrie of your owne felowes haue saide, Accidentia illa sunt in Aëre, tanquam in Subiecto: These Accidentes are in the Aire, as in theire Subiecte. Therefore by their iudgement, They haue not theire Beinge, (as you saie) by them selues: You maie also remember, that your Maister him selfe neuer durste prectisely to determine this mater: but onely passeth it ouer darkely, and doubtefully, as beinge not wel resolued, what to saie. His wordes be these: Mihi videtur fatendum, Accidentia illa existere sine Subiecto: *It seemeth vnto me, or, as I can gheasse, these Accidentes haue theire Beinge without a Subiecte*. Suche is the assurance, and certaintie of your Doctrine. *De Conse. Dist. 2. Species. In Glossa.* *4. Senten. dist. 12. Si autem.*

M. Hardinge.

VVee muste not beholde, saithe Euthymius, a Greeke Doctoure, the Nature of the thinges, which

Nature. Vertue.

whiche be set before vs: * but the vertue, or power of them.

*VVhat is the Vertue, and Power of your Accidentes?

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Euthymius, although one of the meanest Doctours, saith right wel, and as the Learned Fathers saide before him. But, M. Hardinge, do you take your Authours at al aduentures, as they comme to hande: or do you consider, what they saie? Tel vs, I beseche you, in your fantasie, what are those thinges, that Euthymius saithe, are set before vs? Whether are they the Body, and Bloude of Christe, or els your Accidentes? If it be Christes very Body and Bloude substantially, Really, and in deede, VVhy should wee not consider the Nature of them? What haue they offended you? Or what imperfection finde you in them? Cyrillus saithe, Caro Christi Natura viuifica est: *The Fleashe of* Christe *by* Nature *hath power to geeue Life.* And Christe him selfe saithe, *My Fleashe is* Verily *Meate: and My Bloude is* Verily *Drinke.* Therefore the Nature hereof is wel worthy to be considered. But if there be nothinge els there set forth, but onely your bare, and naked Accidentes, What Power, What Vertue is there in them? What Doctour, or Father euer taughte vs, that we shoulde haue Remission of Sinne, and be saued by your Accidentes?

Cyrill. In Iohan. Lib. 4. Cap. 12.

But, as I saide, Euthymius writeth wel, folowinge herein the Doctrine of the Ancient Learned Fathers. S. Basile saithe, Si qua Gratia est in Aqua, ea non est ex Natura Aquæ, sed ex præsentia Spiritus: *If there be any Grace in the Water* (of Baptisme) *it is* not of the Nature of the VVater, *but of the presence of the Sprite.* Cyprian, speakinge of the Oile, saithe thus, Sanctificatis Elementis iam non propria Natura præbet effectum: Sed Virtus Diuina potentius operatur: *It is not* Nature, *that geeueth effecte, or force vnto the Elementes, beinge Sanctified: but the* Diuine Power *woorketh more mightily.* So saithe S. Chrysostome, Petra erat Christus: Non enim ipsius Petræ Natura Aqua scaturiebat: Sed alia quædam Spiritualis Petra omnia operata est, hoc est Christus: *The Rocke was* Christe. *For it* was not by the Nature of the Rocke, *that the Water gushed out: but a certaine other Spiritual Rocke wrought al these thinges, that is to saie,* Christe. In like manner the Ancient Father Origene, speakinge of the Power, and Vertue of Our Lordes Supper, saith thus, Illud, quod Sanctificatur per Verbum Dei, & per Obsecrationem, non suapte Natura sanctificat vtentem: *The thinge, that is Sanctified by the Woorde of God, and by Praier: sanctifieth not him, that vseth it,* by the Nature of it selfe. By these, and other like aduertisementes, these Godly Fathers meante to withdrawe Our mindes from the outwarde corruptible Creatures, to the Spiritual, and Inwarde vnderstandinge of the Sacramentes. Therefore Euthymius in the same place saithe, Panis habet similitudinem quandam ad Corpus, & Vinum ad Sanguinem: *The Breade hathe a certaine* Likenesse *vnto the Body, and the Wine a certaine* Likenesse *vnto the Bloude.*

Basilius, De Spiritu Sancto. Ca. 15 ἐν ἐκ τῆς φύσεως ἐστὶ τὸ ὕδατος.

Cyprian. De Vnction. Chrismatis.

Chrysost. 1. Cor. Homil 18.

Origen. in Matthæ. Cap. 15.

Euthymius in Matthæ. Ca 64.

M. Hardinge.

VVhen it pleased our Saueour Christe at his laste Supper to institute this Blessed Sacramente, at whiche he tooke Breade and VVine, and turned them into his Body and Bloude, he woulde in suche wise aduance these Creatures to a mutche excellenter condition, as they shoulde lose no whit of their former Vertues. * For the Sonne of man came not to destroie, but to saue, as S. Augustine saithe, is not cause that any thinge tende vnto not beinge.

The Doctrine of transubstantiation.

Li. 83. qua.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

*Vntruthe, fonde, & Childish. As though Christ had died to saue Accidentes.

Luke. 9.

At the laste M. Hardinge hathe founde somme Scripture: and that, God wote, ful aptely he applieth to serue his pourpose. The Sonne of Man (saithe he) came not to destroie, but to saue: *Ergo*, The Breade, and VVine lose no whit of their Former Vertues.

Here, I beseche you, M. Hardinge: what came the Sonne of Man to saue? Muste we beleeue, he came from Heauen, to Saue your Accidentes? Was this the cause of Christes comminge? Is this the Religion, ye haue Learned in Louaine? S. Paule saithe, Nunquid de bubus cura est Deo? *Hathe God any special care for Oxen?* Might not one mutche better saie to you, *Hathe God any care for your* Fourmes, *for your* Shewes, *for your empty* Accidentes?

1 Cor. 6.

Perhappes ye wil saie, I presse you ouer heauily. Ye meante, that Christ came to Saue Breade, and Wine, and not onely Accidentes. Howe be it, so ye cannot saie: For by your owne doctrine, the Nature and Substance of the Breade, and the VVine,

by

Change in Accidentes.

by the comminge, and preſence of Chriſte, is quite aboliſhed, nothinge remaininge, but onely the Accidentes. But be it, that Chriſt came, to ſaue theſe Creatures, then is your Religion mutch like vnto the Diuinitie of the Olde Heretiques called the Manichees. Of them S. Auſtuſtine writeth thus: Herbas, atque arbores ſic putant viuere, vt ea & ſentire credant, & dolere, cùm læduntur: nec aliquid inde ſine cruciatu eorum quenquam poſſe vellere: *They thinke, that Herbes, and Trees haue life, ſo farre forthe, that they beleeue they haue ſenſe, and feelinge, and ſuffer griefe and paine, When they be hurte: and that noman can pul, or plucke ought from them without theire ſmarte.* And againe he ſaithe, Nec Oua ſumunt, quaſi & ipſa, cùm franguntur, expirent: *They Eate no Egges, imagininge, that, When they be broken, theire life, or Soule paſſeth from them.* Butche a careful conſideration, it appeareth, yᵉ haue for your ꝑre Accidentes.

Augmſt ad Quæduit dum

Ibidem.

Theſe be mere folies, M. Hardinge. Chriſte him ſelfe ſaith, He came to Saue, not your Accidentes, but Sinners: not Breade, and VVine, but the thing that was loſte. And wil ye telle vs, that your Accidentes were loſte? Or, that Breade, and VVine were ſutche ſinful Creatures, as coulde not otherwiſe be ſaued, then by the Blonde of Chriſte?

O, M. Hardinge, haue more reuerence to Goddes Worde. It is Holy: It is it, wherebp you ſhalbe Iudged. Haue better regarde hereafterth, to that ye write. Chriſte him ſelfe ſaithe, Filius Hominis non venit, vt perdat Animas Hominum, ſed vt ſeruet: *The Sonne of Man came*, not to deſtroie the Soules of menne, *but to Saue them.* Here in fauoure of your caſe, yᵉ haue leafte out the Soules of Menne, whiche was the knot of the whole, and haue truſte in Accidentes. And ſo there muſte nedes appeare in you, either groſſe ignorance, wherewith you charge others, or wilful corruption.

Luke. 9.

M. Hardinge.

Change in ſubſtance.

Seeinge then there is a change by al conſente, (a) and certaine it is, that the change is not in the Accidentes, becauſe wee ſee them remaine as they were before, and God deceiueth not our ſenſes in theire true and proper obiecte, whiche is coloure, taſte, ſmel, &c. It muſte needes be, that the change be in ſubſtance, (b) whiche is to ſenſe incomprehenſible.

(a) Vntruthe, euidente, and ſenſible. Reade the Anſweare.

(b) Vntruthe, triflinge, and Sophiſtical. For Subſtance is perceiued by the ſenſes, althoughe by meane of the Accidentes.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

There is a change in the Breade (ſaith M. Hardinge) But not in the Accidentes thereof: *Ergo*, in the Subſtance. In the like order of reaſon he might haue ſaid, It is not a Frarnbuſhe, Ergo, it is a Fore. Ye maie not looke, M. Harding, to ſcale thus awaie with ſo ſimple Sophiſmes. This ꝑre ſhifte emonge Children is called Petitio Principij.

Your Minor, wherein ſtandeth the whole doubte, and whiche by ſomme Authoritie, or ſhewe of reaſon, one waie, or other, ye ſhould haue ꝓued true, ye haue paſſe ſlelly ouer without any manner of ꝓuofe at al, and ꝓeſume it onely to be true. And ſo the whole weight herof ſtandeth not by Truthe, or Reaſon: but hangeth onely by ꝓeſumption.

The Doctrine of tranſubſtantiati. Li. 83. qua.

For what Doctour, or Father euer tolde you, or made you ſo certaine, that in the Breade there is no change touchinge the Accidentes? Ye ſaie, Your ſenſes telle you, that the Accidentes remaine ſtil, as they were before. And the ſame ſenſes maie alſo tel you, as S. Auguſtine ſaithe, that the Subſtance of the Breade remaineth ſtil, as it was before. But wil you ſo ſuddainly forſake your olde Leſſon? Wil you nowe put this mater in Compromiſſe to your ſenſes? Howe often, and howe ſadly haue you tolde vs, That theſe be caſes of Onely Faithe, and that in the Iudgement hereof, bothe Senſe, and Reaſon muſte be abandoned? And haue you forgotten that Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Nihil ſenſibile traditum nobis eſt a Chriſto. Quæcunque Chriſtus tradidit, inſenſibilia ſunt: *There is no* ſenſible thinge *deliuered vnto vs by* Chriſt (in theſe Myſteries). And againe, *What ſo euer thinges* Chriſte *hath geeuen vs, they are* vnſenſible. If they be thinges vtterly vnſenſible, howe then can they be iudged by your ſenſes? Why comme yᵉ not forth with the Learned Doctours, and Catholique Fathers, of whome, yᵉ ſaie, yᵉ haue ſutche plentie. If it be true, as you ſaie, That there is no change in Accidente, why is it not ꝓoued? If it be falſe, why is it auouched? Tel vs, howe longe ſhal wᵉ be bounde to your bare worde?

Ad Infantes: Quodvideris, Panis eſt: quod etiam oculi renuntiant. Chryſo in Matthæ. Homil 83.

Verily,

Change in Accidētes

Verily, S. Augustine woulde haue tolde you, that this change is in Accident, and not in Substance. For thus he saithe, as it hathe benne often remembred, Nisi Sacramenta Similitudinem quandam haberent earum rerum, quarum Sacramenta sunt, Omninò Sacramenta non essent. Ex hac autem Similitudine plærunque rerum ipsarum nomina accipiunt: *Onelesse Sacramentes had a certaine* likenesse *of the thinges, of Whiche they be Sacramentes, then in deede they were no Sacramentes. And of this* likenesse *oftentimes they beare the names of the thinges them selues, that are represented by the Sacramentes.* Againe he saith, Secundum quendam modum Sacramentum Corporis Christi Corpus Christi est: *The Sacramente of Christes Body*, after a certaine manner is Christes *Body*. And againe, Non dubitauit Dominus dicere, Hoc est Corpus meum, cùm daret Signum Corporis sui: *Our Lorde doubted not to saie, This is my Body, when he gaue* a token of his Body. Likewise saithe Tertullian, expounding, and opening the meaninge of Christes wordes, Hoc est Corpus meum, Hoc est, Figura Corporis mei: *This is my Body, that is to saie,* This is a Figure of my Body. You knowe, M. Hardinge, that Modus, Simile, Dissimile, Signum, and Figura, be in the Predicamente of Qualitie: and therefore pertcine to Accident, and not to Substance.

August. ad Bonifactam. epist. 23

In eadem Epist.

August. contra Adimantũ. ca. 12

Tertull. Contra Marcionem, Li. 4

So Chrysostome, where as he amplifieth the Change of the Breade in the Sacramente of Thankesgiuinge, he addeth immediately withal, Sic etiam in Baptismo: Euen so is it, (that is to saie) *The like change there is in the* VVater of Baptisme. In these Mutations, the Substance as wel of the Breade and Wine, as of the Water, remaineth stil: But the Respecte, or Qualitie, or Accidente, is changed. And this is it, that S. Ambrose saide before, Sunt, quæ erant: & in aliud mutantur: (*In* Substance) *they are the same, they were before: But (in* Accident, *or* Qualitie) *they are turned into an other thinge.*

Chrysost. in Mat. Homil. 83.

Ambros. De Sacrament. Lib. 4 Cap. 4

M. Hardinge.

And here we putte you in minde of your falsefieinge of Theodorites woordes, in that ye make him to saie in your Englishe, The Mystical Signes to remaine in theire former Substance, Fourme, and Kinde, where he saithe * not so, but in theire Former Substance, Figure and Shape. Ye knowe pardy, there is greate difference betweene the Kinde of a thinge, and his Shape. The oftener yee vse that falsched, as ye vse it very often, the more shal ye be espied to be false teachers, and growe out of credite, where truthe is loued.

Theodorite falsefied by the Defender.

*Vntruth. Euen so he saithe. Otherwise M. Hardinge hath a Substance without Kinde.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

If there be any falsehode, or faulte herein, by your owne Confession, it is the Interpreters, and not the Authours. You knowe wel, Our Contention is not of the Shape of Breade, but of the Substance. Theodoretus saithe, The Breade departeth not from his owne Nature, but remaineth stil in the former Substance, Figure, and Fourme: Saie you, as Theodoretus saithe: Confesse plainely, as he dothe, that the Substance of the Breade remaineth stil, and with good leaue take the Shape vnto your selfe.

And yet I see no greate cause, why ye shoulde so mightily crie out, False Teachers, Falsched, Falsifieinge, for that the Interpreter hathe expounded this Latine worde, Forma, by this Englishe worde, Kinde. For, as it is proued before, by sundrie examples more at large, in the Ancient Fathers these two wordes, Forma, and Natura, are often vsed for one thinge. Athanasius saithe, Natura, Essentia, Genus, Forma, vnum sunt: Nature, Substance, Kinde, and Forme be al one. Certainely, if the very Substance of the Breade shoulde remaine, as Theodoretus saithe, and yet the Kinde of the Breade shoulde not remaine, it were a wonder. For, as there is no Kinde without Substance, So is there no Substance without Kinde.

Before. In the seconde parte. 1. Ca. 1. Diuision. Athana. De Definitionib.

M. Hardinge.

The woordes which ye recite out of S. Augustines Sermon Ad Infantes, we finde in Bede vpon the tenthe Chapter of the first Epistle to the Corinthians. The whole place is this: This thinge which yee see in the aulter of God, ye haue sene it also in the night passe But what it was, what it meaneth, the Sacramente of howe greate a thinge it conteineth, as yet ye haue not hearde. That then whiche ye sawe, is Breade and Chalice, whiche euen your eies tel you. But that whiche your Faithe requireth to be instructed of, Breade is the Body of Christe, the Chalice his Bloude. If the Substance of Breade remained, as before Consecration, what neede had they to learne, what it were? For of them selues, they might knowe the thinges proponed to be Breade, and VVine. But S. Augustine, ye saie, calleth that they sawe Breade, and VVine. Yea Sir, so it was, so farre as their eies tolde. But what their faithe ought to tel them, he instructeth them, saieinge: Breade, to witte, is the Holy Body of Christe. To this Construction muste we stande, by S. Augustine him selfe so set foorthe.

Answere to the place alleged out of S. Augustine.

The

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

S. Augustines **wordes are plaine enough: howe so euer it like you to shadowe them with your** Glose**s. Thus he saithe,** Quod vidistis, Panis est, & Calix: quod vobis etiam oculi vestri renuntiant: *The thinge, that you sawe, is the* Breade, *and the* Cuppe: *whiche thinge* your eies doo *reporte vnto you.* **Where also maie be noted, as by the waie, that** S. Augustine, **contrarie to your Doctrine, M. Hardinge, referreth the Iudgemente hereof to the reporte, and trial of the senses. And againe he saithe of him selfe in the like case,** Vereor, ne ipsis sensibus nostris facere videamur iniuriam, quando id loquendo suademus, vbi omnes Vires, officiumque Sermonis facillimè superat euidentia Veritatis: *I feare me, we should doo wronge vnto* our Senses, *if we woulde goe aboute to proue that thinge by speakinge, wherein the euidence of the Truthe it selfe passeth all dewtie, and power of Speache.* *August ad Dardanum Epist. 57*

Howe be it, S. Augustine **saithe further,** Quod autem Fides vestra postulat instruenda, Panis est Corpus Christi, Calix Sanguis: **This Obiection maie be answeared by that is saide before. These two sayeinges are bothe true.** Hesychius **saithe,** Mysterium nostrum simul & Panis, & Caro est: *Our Mysterie is bothe* Breade, *and* Fleashe. *Hesych. in Leuit. Lib. 12. Cap. 8.* **It is** Breade **in Substance, and in deede: It is also the** Body of Christe, **not in** Substance, **but in a** Mysterie. **Your owne** Glose **saithe, as it is before alleged:** Dicitur Corpus Christi, sed impropriè: Vt sit sensus, Vocatur Corpus Christi, id est, Significat Corpus Christi: *It is called the Body of* Christe: *but* vnproperly, *or, not in dewe and vsuall fourme of speache: The meaninge thereof maie be this: It is called* Christes *Body, that is to saie,* It signifieth Christes Body. *De Conse. dist. 2 Hoc est quod in Glossa.*

In a Sacramente we muste beholde, not onely the outwarde Elemente, but also the thinge it selfe, whereof it is a Sacramente. S. Augustine **saithe,** Si ad ipsas res visibiles, quibus Sacramenta tractantur, animum conferamus, quis nesciat, eas esse corruptibiles? Si autem ad id, quod per illas res agitur, quis non videat, non posse corrumpi? *If wee consider the* Visible Creatures, *wherein the Sacramentes are ministred, who knoweth not, they be* thinges corruptible? *But if we consider the thinge, that is wrought thereby, who seeth not,* It cannot be corrupted? *Auguste. De Baptismo contra Donati. 7. Lib. 3 Cap. 10.*

And in the same place before alleged, S. Augustine **fully expoundeth his owne meaninge, in what sence the** Breade **maie be called the** Body of Christe. **These be his wordes,** Christus leuauit Corpus suum in Cœlum, vnde venturus est, vt iudicet viuos, & mortuos. Ibi est modò sedens ad Dextram Patris. Quomodò est Panis Corpus eius? Et Calix, vel, quod habet Calix, quomodò est Sanguis eius? Ista, Fratres, ideo dicuntur Sacramenta, quia in eis aliud videtur, aliud intelligitur: Christe *hathe lifted vp his Body into Heauen: from whence he shal comme to Iudge the quicke, and the deade. There is he nowe sittinge at the Righte Hande of the Father.* Howe then is the Breade his Body? *And the Cuppe, or that is in the Cuppe, howe is it his Bloude?* **His answeare is this:** *O my Brethren, these be called Sacramentes, for that in them* one thinge is seene, and an other thinge is vnderstanded. *August. in Serm. ad Infantes.*

Thus therefore, the thinge, that we se with our Bodily eies, is the very Nature, and Substance of Breade: But the thinge, that we se with oure Faithe, is the very Natural Body of Christ **sittinge in Heauen, and represented vnto vs in the Mysteries.**

Nowe, I beseeche the, good Christian Reader, marke, what Discante M. Hardinge plaieth vpon these wordes. S. Augustine **saithe,** Beleeue the Iudgemente of your eies: **M. Hardinge saithe,** Senses be deceitful, Beleeue not the Iudgemente of your eies. S. Augustine **saithe,** The thinge, that you see is Breade: **M. Hardinge saithe,** It is not so: it is no Breade. **So handsomely this** Glose **groweth to the Texte.**

The Apologie.

Or, that, whiche Origene **saithe, The Breade, whiche is Sanctified by the Woorde of God, as touching the Material Substance thereof, goeth into the Belly, and is caste out into the priuie.**

M. Hardinge.

In alleginge Origene, Sir Defender, ye plaie, your accuſtomed falſe plaie, (a) corruptinge his ſentence, and falſifieinge his woordes. For they be not as you recite them, but thus: *Ille cibus, qui ſanctificatur per Verbum Dei, perq; obſecrationem, inxta id quod habet materiale, in ventrem abit, & in ſeceſſum ejcitur:* That meate, whiche is conſecrated by the VVoorde of God, and by Praier, accordinge to that Material, whiche it hathe, it goeth into the Belly, and is voided foorthe into the Prieuie. Here neither nameth he (b) Breade, as you doo (to cauſe the people to thinke it is but very Bꝛead) but meate. And that you haue in your Latine, *Quad quidem ad materiam attinet:* whiche is by your Interpreter, As touchinge the material Subſtance thereof, (c) it is not Origens, but your owne forged ſtuffe, to deceiue the ignorant withal, to thende they mighte be moued by your falſe handlinge of that Doctour, to beleeue, the mater and Subſtance of very Breade to remaine. He ſpeaketh not of the (d) mater of Breade, but of that whiche is Material in this Sacramente, meaning the Accidentes, or Qualities remaininge after Conſecration, whiche be Material, but not the mater it ſelfe of Breade (as Mater is taken for the one parte of a perfecte Subſtance) (e) and the ſame Accidentes be voided foorthe, as Origene had good cauſe by occaſion of Chriſtes woorde to declare, you had none to recorde the ſame. But it liked your filthie ſprite with vile woordes to bringe that Holy Myſterie, and bleſſed Sacramente into contempte. VVherein ye doo the Diuel, Authoure of Hereſies, the greateſt ſeruice, that maie be deuiſed.

(a) Vntruth. For wee haue Corrupted, neither woorde nor Sentence.

To that Material: A propre tranſlation.

(b) Vntruth. For he nameth it Breade ſeuen times in that one place.

(c) Vntruthe, Onleſſe ye wil rather cal it the Material Accidente.

(d) Vntruth. For in the ſame place he ſaithe, Nec Materia Panis.

(e) Vntruthe, vaine, & voide of ſenſe. For what Accidents be voided foorthe.

Origens woorde examined. Origene falſified by the Defender.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Hereſies, Falſe plaie, Falſhedde, Falſifieinge, Vile woordes, Filthy Spirites, are nowe becomme M. Hardinges Ordinarie, and Vſual Eloquence. Here haue wee corrupted (as he ſaithe) and belied Origine, for that wee place this woꝛde, Panis, in ſtede of Cibus: And, for that wee ſaie, Panis, quod ad Materiam attinet, in ſtede of theiſe woꝛdes, Cibus iuxta id, quod habet Materiale. This, (ſaithe M. Hardinge) is Forged ſtuffe: This is Horrible, and ſhameful corruption to deceiue the ignorante. He that knewe not M. Hardinges modeſtie, and manner of writinge, woulde thinke, theſe Tragical termes ſhoulde beare ſomme weighte. For ſober menne ſeldome vſe thus to crie, whithout ſomme cauſe. Touchinge theiſe woꝛdes, Cibus, Panis, Materiale, Materia, if there be any thinge, that maie miſlike him, it ſhalbe lawful for him to reſourme the ſame, and to vſe either the one woꝛde, or the other at his pleaſure. We ſtande onely vpon the Subſtance of Mater, and ſeke no ſutche wanton aduantages by ſhifte of woꝛdes.

Neuertheleſſe, Origen him ſelfe, as it appeareth, was not ſo dangerous in the caſe. For, whereas M. Hardinge ſo ſharpely ouerloketh vs, for once vſinge this woꝛde, Panis, in ſtede of Cibus, Origene him ſelfe vſeth the ſame woꝛde, Panis, Seuen times togeather in the ſelfe ſame place, without reꝛponſe: Like as S. Paule alſo fiue times in one place calleth it, Panis: And S. Cyril calleth the poꝛtions thereof, Fragmenta Panis: peeces of Breade: And yet were none of theiſe euer condemned therefoꝛe, as Corrupters, and Falſifiers.

1. Corin. 11. Cyril in Iohan. Lib. 10. Cap. 13.

But, I beſeeche you, M. Hardinge, if this woꝛde, Cibus, Meate, whiche Origene vſeth, and you ſame to allowe, were not Breade, what kinde of Meate then wil you cal it? Fleaſhe, Fiſhe, oꝛ Fruite, I trowe it was not. You ſaie, Origen meante thereby, your Fourmes, and Accidentes, and Shewes of Breade. Nowe verily, this was but a quaiſy Meate: And I marueile, that euer any wiſe man woulde calle it Meate. Irenæus ſaithe, *Of the ſame Meate is increaſed, and conſiſteth the* Subſtance of our Fleaſhe. And Rabanus ſaithe, Sacramentum in alimentum Corporis redigitur: *The Sacramente (whiche is the Breade) is turned into Our* Bodily nouriſhemente. Shewes, and Accidentes, are but a ſimple foode, to increaſe the Subſtance of our Bodies.

Irenæ. Li. 5. Augetur & conſiſtit Carnis noſtræ Subſtantia. Rabanus Mauꝛus. Li. 1. Ca. 31.

Touchinge the other fowle faulte, M. Hardinge ſaithe, his Accidentes, and Qualities be thinges Material: but the mater it ſelfe, (he ſaith) they be not. But where learned he this ſtrange Doctrine? What Diuine, what Philoſopher, what Logician, what Sophiſter, what Wiſe man euer taughte him thus to ſaie? Who euer ſaide, that Accidentes are thinges Material? It is wel knowen, that Materia euermoꝛe is Subſtantia, and neuer otherwiſe. Therefoꝛe M. Hardinge might as eaſily haue ſaide, Accidentes be thinges Subſtantial. Certainely Accidentes, and Qualities, be Accidentales Formæ, and in the Schooles are called, thinges Formal: whiche

are

Vile speache.

are as farre from thinges Material, as Fire from Water. Notwithstandinge, these menne haue power to make of Accidentes, Substance: Of Fourmes, Maters: Of thinges Formal, thinges Material: and of one contrarie, to make another: and al this onely of them selues, without any manner other Authoritie.

M. Hardinge saithe, that the Meate, whereof Origene speaketh, is a Material, (for this is the lighte, and clearenesse of his Eloquence) but not Materia: and by this prettie distinction, he thinketh, the whole mater is fully discharged. And emongst the ignorante, that cannot iudge, perhaps he maie seme to sate sommewhat. But Origene him selfe, that beste vnderstode his owne meaninge, calleth the same Meate, in the same place, by expresse, and plaine woordes, not onely a thinge Material, or, A Material, as M. Hardinge rather deliteth to calle it, but also the very Mater of Breade it selfe: his woordes be theise: Nec Materia Panis, sed super illum dictus sermo est, qui prodest non indigne Domino comedenti: It is not the Mater of the Breade, *but the woorde spoken ouer it, that profiteth him, that Eateth not vnworthily for the Lorde.* *Origen. in Mat. Cap. 15.*

Nowe Iudge thou indifferently, Gentle Reader, howe iuste causes M. Hardinge had, to moue these Tragedies.

Further he saithe, It liked our filthy Sprite, with vile woordes to bringe the Holy Mysteries into contempte, and therein wee doo the Diuel great seruice. O, M. Hardinge, somme other speache woulde better becomme a man of your grauitie. Suche liquore seldome floweth from the Spirite of God. We neither increase, nor diminishe, nor any waie alter the woordes of Origene, but late them forth plainely, and simply, as we finde them. For thus he writeth, Ille Cibus, qui sanctificatur per verbum Dei, & per Obsecrationem, iuxta id, quod habet Materiale, in ventrem abit, & in secessum eijcitur. Cæterum iuxta precationem, quæ illi accessit, pro portione Fidei fit vtilis: *The Meate, that is Sanctified by the Woorde of God, and by Praier, according* to that Material parte, *that is in it*, passeth into the Belly, and so foorth into the Priuie, &c. If there be any Filthinesse, or Villanie herein, it is this Ancient Fathers, whome ye ought not so vncourteously to reuile, for Uncleanenesse of Spirite: it is not ours.

Howebe it, this is not Origens onely Iudgemente: but the general, and agreable Doctrine of al others the Catholique Fathers. And to allege one in stede of many, S. Augustine saithe, as he is before alleged, Si ad res ipsas, quibus Sacramenta tractantur, animum conferamus, quis nesciat, eas esse corruptibiles? Si ad id, quod per illas res agitur, quis non videat, non posse corrumpi? *If we consider the thinges them selues, wherein the Sacramentes be Ministred, who knoweth not, that they be* thinges corruptible? *But if wee consider the thinge, that is wroughte thereby, who seeth not, that it* cannot be corrupted? The Holy Fathers speake not thus of Christes Body, but of the Breade, whiche is the Sacramente of Christes Body. So saithe S. Ambrose, Non iste Panis, qui vadit in Corpus: sed Panis Vitæ Aeternæ, qui animæ nostræ Substantiam fulcit: (The Breade that I meane, is) *not* this Breade (of the Sacrament) that passeth into the Body: *but the Breade of Euerlastinge Life, that mainteineth the Substance of the Soule.* *Augustin. de Baptismo contra Donatis. Lib. 3. Cap. 10.* *De Con. Dist. 2. Non iste.*

Nowe, if there were suche Filthinesse, as you haue imagined, in the Holy Learned Bishoppes, and Doctours of the Churche, for vtteringe these, and other like woordes, of the corruptible Creatures of Breade, and Wine, what cleane Spirite then is there in them, that speake so filthily of Christes Body it selfe, beinge nowe Uncorruptible, and Glorious, at the righte hande of the Father? Hereof I had occasion to speake somewhat in my Former Replie. *In the 23. Article.*

Alexander of Hales saith, Quidam dicunt, vbicunq; ponantur Species, siue in mundo loco, siue in immundo, siue in Ventre Muris, ibi est Corpus Christi: *Some saie, Where so euer the* Fourmes, *or* Accidentes *be laide, whether the place be cleane, or vncleane, yea althoughe it be in the* Mouses belly, *yet there is* the Body of Christe. Againe he saithe, Si Canis, vel Porcus deglutiret Hostiam Consecratam integram, non video, quare Corpus Domini non simul traijceretur in ventrem Canis, vel Porci: *If a* Dogge, *or* Hogge *shoulde swallowe downe the Hoste Consecrate beinge whole, I see no cause to the contrarie, but the* Body of Christe *maie passe withal into the* belly of the Dogge, or of the Hogge. *Alexand. Halen. par. 4. quæ. 25. Mem. 1.*

Vile ſpeache.

Likewiſe your owne Clemens, whom ye ſo often cal the Apoſtles Felowe, writeth thus, Ne murium ſtercora inter fragmenta Dominicæ Portionis appareant: *Let not Miſe dounge be founde emonge the fragmentes, or peeces of the Lordes portion.* By whiche Portion, he meaneth the Sacramente. Your owne Catholique allowed Gloſe ſaith, Corpus Chriſti poteſt euomi: *The Body of Chriſte maie be* vomited vp *againe.*

Clemens. Epiſt. 2.

De Con. Diſt. 2. Si quis in Gloſſa

It abhorreth my harte, to vtter theſe wordes: They be ſo horrible, and ful of Filthe. Yet this, M. Hardinge, is your owne Doctrine: This is your Sprite: This is it, that ye haue ſo longe maintained with Fire, and Swerde. By ſuche vncleane, and vnciuile ſpeache, ye bringe Chriſtes Body it ſelfe into contempte, and lotheſomenelle in the hartes of the people.

But, that you maie the better ſée the conſente, and certaintie of your owne Doctrine, whereas you are wel contente to expounde theſe wordes of Origine, as vndoubtedly ſpoken of the Sacramente of Chriſtes Body, your Inſtructer, and Maiſter, Doctour Gardiner telleth you, that the ſame wordes pertcine nothinge at al vnto the Sacramente: And yet, vnto what thinge els they ſhoulde pertcine, it ſéemeth by the doubtefulneſſe of his anſwere, he was neuer wel reſolued. His wordes be theſe, Non de Euchariſtia loquitur Origenes, ſed de Pane ſanctificato per Verbum Dei, & Orationem, quem communiter manducamus: vel de eo, qui ſolebat dari Catechumenis, de quo Auguſtinus: Origene *ſpeaketh not* (theſe wordes) *of the Sacramente: but either of the Breade, that is Sanctified by our Lordes Woorde, and by Praier: Whiche wee commonly vſe to Eate: or els he ſpeaketh of the Breade, that was geeuen to the Nouices, called Catechumeni, Whereof* S. Auguſtine *ſpeaketh.* If this tale be true, then is yours Untrue, M. Hardinge, and al your longe Commentarie of Fourmes, and Accidentes, is but in vaine. It were good, ye toke a daie, that ye maie be better agreed vpon that, ye tel vs.

Mar. Anton. Conſtantius. ad obiectum. 166.

And, whereas, to ſhifte the matter, ye put your poore Spiritual Fourmes, and Holy Accidentes to al the paines, to paſſe into the belly, and to ſoothe into the draught, and auouche the ſame in ſuche ſober wiſe, as if ye partely vnderſtode, what ye ſaide, it maie pleaſe you to vnderſtande, that by the Judgemente of your owne Schoolefelowes the Canoniſtes, ye are foulp deceiued. For thus they determine the matter, quite againſte you: Species illæ alijs cibis non permiſcentur: Non enim in ſtomachum deſcendunt: quare per ſeceſſum non emittuntur: *Theſe Fourmes, or Accidentes are not mingled with other meates.* For they goe not downe into the ſtomake: and therefore they paſſe not into the Priuie. Nowe, M. Harding, if the Breade be vtterly conſumed, and haue no beinge at al, and if the Accidentes paſſe not into the Priuie, what other thing els remaineth there, to paſſe that waie? It is a ſtrange kinde of paſſage, whereas is nothinge to paſſe.

De Con. Diſt. 2. Tribus gradibus, in Gloſſa.

Hereby it maie appeare, that either the Gloſe, or M. Hardinge, is in errour. But the Gloſe is allowed, and countped Catholique: therefore the errour muſte be M. Hardinges. Howe be it, to ſaie the truthe, M. Hardinge, and his Gloſe to, are bothe in errour.

The Apologie.

Or, that, whiche Chriſte him ſelfe ſaide, not onely after the Bleſſinge of the Cuppe, but alſo after he had Miniſtred the Communion, I vvil drinke nomore of this Fruite of the Vine. It is wel knowen, that the Fruite of the Vine is Wine, and not Bloude.

M. Hardinge.

Chriſte (ſaie they) him ſelfe ſaide, not onely after the bleſsinge of the Cuppe, but after he had Miniſtred the Communion, I wil drinke nomore of this Fruite of the Vine. Hereunto they adde of theire owne heades, (a) It is wel knowen, that the Fruite of the Vine is VVine, and not Bloude. By this they woulde ſignifie, that in the Chalice we haue not Chriſtes Bloude, as him ſelfe ſaide, but mere VVine, as againſte Chriſte they labour to perſwade.

(a) Vntruth. For theſe be S. Chryſoſtomes woordes, and not ours. This is M. Har. Vndoubted Certaintie.

But wee ſaie, that thoſe woordes (I wil not drinke from hencefoorthe of this generation of the Vine) either were ſpoken (b) onely before the Communion, (c) or onely after, (d) or in bothe times. If they were ſpoken before the Communion, (whiche opinion is the more probable) it is very clearely Cap. 22.

proued

proued by them, that wine remaineth not, as it shal hereafter be deduced.

For these causes it maie wel be saide, that we should rather folow the order of Luke, who witnesseth that Christe spake these woordes before his maundie, (e) then Matthewe, and Marke, who tel it, as spoken after. Secondly, the order of Luke is confirmed by the circumstance of the thinges, that he describeth, more then the other Euangelistes. Nowe, because in the Chalice of the Olde Lawe, there was certainely not Bloude, but VVine, (whereas Christe teacheth, that in his Chalice his owne Bloude is (f) conteined) let the discrete reader iudge, whether we muste not rather thinke, that these woordes of Christe, I wil not from hencefoorthe drinke of this generation of the Vine, doo not rather pertaine to the Cuppe of the Olde Lawe, (as Luke placeth them,) then to the Chalice of Christe after the Consecration, whereof Mathewe, and Marke reherse them.

(e) M. Hardinge refuseth S. Mathewes, and S. Markes Order.

(f) As by waie of a Sacrament. Otherwise it is Vntrue.

Fourthly, and lastly, when Mathewe, and Marke reherse that Christe saide, he would not from hencefoorthe drinke of that generation of the Vine, they both, in mutch like sorte of speakinge adde thereunto these woordes, (whiche in the Apologie are guilefully lefte out) Vntil that daie, when I wil drinke it newe with you in the Kingedome of God my Father. If Christe spake of a Newe drinking, whiche is to comme, by likelyhoode the drinke paste is Olde. VVhat exclamation woulde be sufficient to expresse, that in this (g) weighty pointe of Saluation, our Englishe Clergie are content (h) to blinde the people, the righte worshipful, yea the Honorable of our Counttie, in so vile a sorte, that after many Fathers woordes misreported, and wrongfully wrested, they doubte not to attempte the same in Christes owne sayinges, and in those sayinges of his, whiche euidently proue the contrary.

Matth. 26. Mark. 14. New drinke.

(g) A weighty point of Saluation. Yet M. H. him selfe by his Confession, vnderstandeth it not.

(h) Vntruthe, vaine and arrogant.

But nowe let vs graunt of our free liberalitie, contrarie to so many good and stronge reasons, that Christe saide after Consecration, I wil not from hencefoorthe drinke of this generation of the Vine, vntil the Kingedome of God come, then it muste be further vnderstanded, that the Kingdome of God is taken in Scripture sommetime for the presente state of the Churche, after Christes resurrection of this worlde, accordinge to that is saide oftentimes in Scripture, The Kingedome of God draweth nighe: sommetimes also for the ioie of Heauen: as when Christe saithe, I dispose for you a Kingedome, as my Father hathe disposed for mee, that yee maie eate and drinke at my table, &c. Nowe if we take these woordes of Christ, spoken before Consecracion, it is not vnconuenient, to vnderstande them of either of bothe Kingedomes: that is to saie, of the Kingedome of Resurrection, or of Glorie, as Chrysostome and other doo witnesse, becaus bothe were to come at that time. But if we take them spoken after Consecration, as we rather vpon confidence of the truthe, then for necessitie, at this time doo graunte, then these woordes (Vntil the Kingedome of God come) are to be meante onely of the Kingedome of Glorie. For these Holy Mysteries belonge to the Kingedome of Christes Resurrection, and Ascension. Neither were they practized by the Apostles in the Church of Christe, vntil the Holy Ghoste came downe vpon them.

The Kingdome of God taken two waies. Matth. 3. Luke 22.

And so the newenes of it there, is fruition of it, not vnder the fourmes of Breade, and VVine, (i) as wee haue it nowe, but face to face without al figure and fourme. Then is it to be noted, that Christe saide not, I wil drinke nomore of the Fruite of the Vine, But, I wil not from hencefoorthe drinke of this generation of the Vine: Of this I saie, whereof nowe I haue drunken, (k) whiche is vnder the fourme of wine my Bloude, whiche am the true Vine. For whereas this Apologie saithe, (it is wel knowen, that the Fruite of the Vine is VVine, and not Bloude) it seemeth to declare, that the Authours thereof are ignorante in the Holy Scriptures, where (l) they mighte haue founde the Fruite of some Vine to be called Bloude. For Iacob saide to his sonne Iudas, bearinge the Figure of Christe, He shal washe his robe in VVine, and his Cloke in the Bloude of a Grape. Lo, a Grape hath his Bloude: a Grape is the fruite of the Vine: and therefore it is not wel knowen, that the Fruite of the Vine is not Bloude. The Holy Ghoste did in these woordes of Iacob prophecie, that Christe, the true Vine shoulde geue the Grape of his Body to be pressed vpon the Crosse, from whence the VVine was shedde, (m) whiche is in our Chalice, as Chrysostome also noteth. And nowe it is no wonder, if we expounde the woorde (Vine) mystically.

(i) Vntruthe, grounded vpon a mere folie.

(k) Vntruthe, threapte vpon Christ him self.

(l) A fond cauil. For we speake onely of a Natural Vine.

(m) As in a Mysterie. Otherwise it is Vntrue.

Gene. 49. 1. Cori. 10.

O what strength truthe hathe? howe plainely she dareth to shewe her face, not nippinge the Scriptures, nor misenglishinge them, nor dissemblinge any iote, that maie seeme to make againste her?

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Marke, gentle Reader, howe mightily M. Hardinge wrastleth, and what paines he taketh, to drawe this place to his purpose. Firste he assureth vs for certaine, That Christe spake these woordes before the Consecration, and that therefore they pertaine nothinge to the Sacramente. **Neuertheless, afterwarde he graunteth, as he saithe,** of his free liberalitie, That Christe spake the same woordes After the Consecration, and that they pertaine specially to the Sacramente. **And yet againe vpon further affiance, and boldenesse of the cause, he semeth to saie,** It maie be, that Christe spake the same woordes at bothe times: **that is, as wel After the Consecration, as Before.**

1. 2. 3.

Againe he saithe, S. Lukes rehersal is more likely, then S. Mathewes, For that S. Luke writeth eche thinge in Order: and S. Mathewe out of Order. 4.

Againe, One Cuppe is first the VVine of the Olde Testament: **And immediately after,** The same Cuppe is the VVine of the Newe Testamente. 5.

Againe, The Kingedome of God, **sometime is the state of the Churche, some-** 6.

Cc iij time

The Fruite of the Vine.

time it is the state of Glorie. Againe, The Fruite of the Grape, sommetime is very Natural wine, sommetime it is the very Bloude of Christe. Notwithstandinge, Steuen Gardiner saithe, that neither the Natural Wine, nor Christes very Bloude, but the Accidentes, and Fourmes are the Fruites of the Vine. Yet againe he saith, Christe Dranke his owne very Bloude at the Supper: and euen nowe him selfe Drinketh the same his owne Bloude in the Kingedome of Heauen.

7. Anton. Constantius ad obiectum 27.

8. In the ende, M. Hardinge, after he hathe wel wandred, and walked him selfe, bothe Before, and After: In Order, and out of Order: This Waie, and that Waie: with the Olde Cuppe, and with the Newe: and hathe wel stated him selfe by coniectures, and likelihodes: at the laste he bloweth vp the Triumphe, with a lolly courage, and crieth out with an ende of an Olde Songe, O what strength Truthe hath, and howe plainely she dareth to shewe her face.

Before.

After.

Here, by the waie, a man mighte demaunde of M. Hardinge, notwithstandinge the greate Confidence he pretendeth to haue in his cause: If Christe spake these wordes Before the Consecration, of the very Natural Wine of the Grape, and of the Ceremonial Cuppe of the Olde Lawe, howe dranke he then afterwarde of the same Natural Wine of the Grape, after a Newe Sorte: or how was the same Natural Wine fulfilled in the Kingedome of God? If Christe spake the same wordes After the Consecration, the Substance of Wine, by these mennes fantasie, beinge vtterly abolished, and nothinge there remaininge, but onely the Accidentes, howe was it then the Fruite, or generation of the Vine? Thus, howe so euer he take it, either Before, or After, he shal hardely be hable to shifte his handes.

But, to leaue these vnfruiteful gheasles, vntil M. Hardinge haue better agreed with him selfe vpon somme certaintie, wee saie that the Cuppe of Blessinge, whiche Christe calleth the Cuppe of the Newe Testamente, notwithstandinge it were made in a Mysterie the Sacramente of Christes Bloude, yet in Nature, and Substance, was very Wine stil, and, as Christe him selfe calleth it, The very Fruite, and generation of the Grape, as it was before.

Matthe. 26.

The wordes of the Euangelistе S. Mathewe are very plaine: *He toke the Cuppe: and, when he had geuen thankes, he gaue it them, saieinge, Drinke yee al of it: For this is my Bloude of the Newe Testamente, that is shedde for many, for the Remission of Sinnes. I saie vnto you, that I wil not Drinke hencefoorth of* this Fruite of the Vine, *vntil that daie, when I shal Drinke it Newe with you in the Kingedome of my Father.* To auoide the manifeste truth of this rehersal, M. Harding saith, S. Mathewe vttered one thinge for an other: the Later for the Former: the Cuppe Consecrate, for the Cuppe Vnconsecrate: and placed his maters out of order. And by this poore shifte, he thinketh the plaine Storie of the Gospel is fully answeared.

But let vs see, what the Learned Fathers haue iudged, and written in this behalfe. So shal the weight of these coniectural gheasles and the Face of M. Hardinges Truthe, whiche he so mutch magnifieth without cause, the better appeare. Clemens Alexandrinus hereof writeth thus, Quòd Vinum esset, quod benedictum est, Christus ostendit, dicens Discipulis: Non bibam ex Fructu Vitis huius, donec bibero ipsum vobiscum in Regno Patris mei: *That* it was VVine, *that was Blessed* (at the Supper) Christe *him selfe shewed his Disciples saieinge:* I wil nomore Drinke of the Fruite of this Vine, *vntil I shal Drinke it with you in the Kingedome of my Father.*

Clemens in Pedagogo, Lib. 2. Cap. 2.

Basil. contrà Eunom. Lib. 2.

S. Basile saithe, Fructus terræ genituras, & genimina, non Natos appellamus: Non enim bibam, inquit, de genimine Vitis huius: *We calle the Fruites of the Earthe, the Generations, or Springes of the Earthe: But the Children of the Earthe we doo not calle them. For so saithe* Christe: I wil nomore drinke of the generation of this Vine. Here the Wine, that Christ had Blessed, is called by S. Basile, after the time of Consecration, not onely the Generation of the Vine, but also the Fruite of the Earthe. What so euer it shal please M. Harding to thinke of the sense hereof, he must nedes confesse, the wordes are very plaine. Likewise saithe S. Cyprian, Dominus Sanguinem suum Vinum appellauit, de botris, & acinis plurimis expressum, atq; in Vinum coactum: The VVine pressed out of clusters, and many Grapes, and so made VVine, *Our Lorde called his*

Cyprian. Lib. 1. Epist. 6.

Bloude.

The Fruite of the Vine.

Bloude. S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Et Vinum fuit in Redemptionis noſtræ Myſterio, cùm Dominus diceret, Non bibam amodò de hoc genimine Vitis: There was VVine in the *Myſterie, or Sacramente of Our Redemption, when Our Lorde ſaide*, I wil nomore Drinke hencefoorthe of this Fruite of the Vine. *Auguſtin. De Eccleſiaſt. Dogmatibus, cap. 73.*

Here note thou, good Reader, howe handſomely S. Auguſtine, and M. Hardinge agrée togeather. S. Auguſtine ſaithe plainely, It was the Sacramente: M. Hardinge ſaithe plainely, It was not the Sacramente. S. Auguſtine ſaithe, *Theſe woordes were ſpoken after the Conſecration*: M. Hardinge findeth faulte with S. Mathewes Order, and ſaithe, They were ſpoken before the Conſecration. S. Auguſtine, folowing the plaine woordes of Chriſte, ſaithe, It was VVine: M. Hardinge, folowinge his owne woordes, againſte bothe S. Auguſtine, and Chriſte to, ſaithe vndoubtedly, It was no VVine.

Againe S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Dominus per Vini Sacramentum, commendat Sanguinem ſuum. Quid enim aliud, Nouum Vinum, niſi immortalitatem renouandorum Corporum intelligere debemus? *Our Lorde by the Sacramente*, (not of Fourmes, or Accidentes, but) of VVine, *commendeth vnto vs his Bloude. For what other thinge maie wee vnderſtande the* Newe VVine to be, *but the immortalitie of our Bodies, that ſhalbe renewed?* S. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Cùm Dominus hoc Myſterium traderet, Vinum tradidit. Et iam poſt Reſurrectionem ſine Myſterijs in ſimplici menſa Vino vſus eſt. Ex genimine, ait, Vitis: quæ certè Vinum, non Aquam producit: *Our Lorde when he deliuered this Myſterie*, deliuered (not Accidentes, but) VVine. *And after his Reſurrection, beeinge at a plaine Table without the Myſteries*, he vſed VVine. *For ſo he ſaithe*, Of the Fruite of the Vine: VVhiche Vine ſurely beareth, not VVater, but VVine. *Auguſtl. Quæ. Euangelicar. Lib. 1 Cap. 43.* *Chryſoſ. in Mat. Homil. 83.*

M. Hardinge ſaithe, VVho ſo euer expoundeth theſe woordes as ſpoken of the Myſteries, belieth bothe the Holy Fathers, and Chriſte him ſelfe. S. Chryſoſtome expoundeth the ſame woordes, as ſpoken of the Myſteries, and to that pourpoſe applieth the woordes of Chriſte. Therefore, by M. Hardinges Concluſion, He belieth bothe the Holy Fathers, and Chriſte him ſelfe.

In like manner S. Hierome ſaithe, Chriſtus in Typo Sanguinis ſui non obtulit Aquam, ſed Vinum: Chriſt *in the* Signification of his Bloude, *offered, not Water, but Wine*. By theſe fewe, I truſte, it maie eaſily appeare to the indifferente Reader, howe iuſte cauſe M. Hardinge had, thus to proclaime, and publiſhe the Face, as he ſaithe, of his Truthe: and with ſuche courage, and countenance to crie out, that wee haue wilfully corrupted the woordes of Chriſte. *Hiero. aduerſus Iouinian. Lib. 2.*

M. Hardinge ſaithe further, Theſe Defenders adde of their owne heades, It is wel knowen, that the Fruite of the Vine is VVine, and not Bloude. I thought, M. Hardinge woulde not haue piked ſo ſimple a quarrel to theſe woordes, of whoſe heade ſo euer they had benne added. For, I trowe, he hathe but ſeldome heärde, or ſäene, that a Natural Vine hath borne Natural Bloude. Howe be it, theſe woordes proceéded not altogeather of our owne heades. S. Chryſoſtome alſo of his heade vttereth the ſame. For thus he writeth, Ex genimine Vitis: quæ certè Vinum producit, non Aquam: *Of the* Fruite of the Vine: *Whiche Vine verily bringeth foorthe, not Water, but Wine*. S. Cyprian ſaithe, Inuenimus Vinum fuiſſe, quod Dominus Sanguinem ſuum dixit: *Wee finde, it was Wine, that our Lorde called his* Bloude. And Dionyſius, Lyra, and other like Doctours of M. Hardinges owne ſide, ſaie, De hoc genimine Vitis: id eſt, de Vino, quod generatur in Vinea: *Of this Fruite of the Vine: that is to ſaie, Of the Wine, that groweth of the Vine*. *Chryſoſ. in Mat. Homil. 83.* *Cyprian. Lib. 2. Epiſt. 3.* *Dionyſius & Lyra. in Mat. Cap. 26.*

Againe, M. Hardinge ſaithe, It is to be noted, that Chriſte ſaide not, I wil drinke nomore of the Fruite of the Vine: But, I wil not from henceforth drinke of this generation of the Vine: as if there were ſomme maruelous greate difference betwéene theſe two woordes, Fruite, and Generation. And this thinge, (he ſaithe) is wel woorthy to be noted: Verily, the difference betwéene theſe two woordes, is as greate, as is the difference betwéene Enſis, and Gladius: Or, Liber, and Codex: Betwéene whiche woordes, ſounde onely excepted, it is harde to diſcerne, whether is other. M. Hardinges ſaithe.

The Fruite of the Vine.

It is to be noted, that Chriſte ſaide not, I wil drinke nomore of the Fruite of the Vine. Yet S. Hilarie ſaithe, Bibentes ex Vitis iſtius fructu: *Drinkinge of the* Fruite *of this Vine*. If theſe wordes, as beinge doubtefully ſpoken, maie be ſhifted into ſome other ſenſe: Yet Clemens Alexandrinus, as he is before alleged, and as he is tranſlated by Gentianus Heruetus, ſaithe plainely, Non bibam de hoc Fructu Vitis: *I wil nomore Drinke of* this Fruite *of the Vine*. And S. Cyprian ſomme what in plainer wiſe ſaith, Non bibam ex iſta Creatura Vitis: *I wil nomore Drinke of this* Creature *of the Vine*. Therefore, I thinke, M. Hardinge him ſelfe wil ſaie, This note was not greatly worthe the notinge.

Hilari. in Mat. Canon. 30.

Clemens in Pedagogo, Lib. 2. Cap 2.

Cyprian. Lib. 2. Epiſt. 3.

Yet farther he ſaithe, These Defenders ſeeme to be ignorante of the Holy Scriptures: VVhere they mighte haue founde the Fruite of ſomme Vine to be called Bloude. For Iacob ſaide of Chriſte, He ſhal waſhe his Robe in VVine, and his Cloke in the Bloude of a Grape. It is a harde ſhifte, M. Hardinge, ſo ſuddainely to conuerte the mater from ordinarie vſe of ſpeach, vnto an Allegorie. We ſpeake of a Natural growinge Vine, whiche, we ſaie, bareth not Bloude, but onely Wine. But, as touchinge, that we ſaie, Chriſte is ſometimes called a Vine in the Holy Scriptures, it is onely an Allegorie, or a Figure of ſpeache. And in that ſorte he is called alſo ſommetimes a Lambe, and ſommetimes a Rocke. For, although Chriſte, for certaine properties, maie be reſembled vnto a Vine, yet is he not therefore verily, and in deede a Natural growinge Vine: nomore then he is a natural Lambe, peaced of a Pewe, or a natural growing Rocke. Therefore it was great violence, thus to force the wordes of the Scriptures to this pourpoſe. Otherwiſe, by the like phraſe of ſpeache, one ſaithe, Lachryma eſt quidam animæ Sanguis: A teare is a certaine Bloude *of the Soule*. And S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Vident Sanguinem Corporum: Animarum Sanguinem non vident: *They ſee the Bloude of the Bodies*, but the Bloude of the Soules they ſee not. An other called Wine, Terræ Sanguinem: The Bloude of the Earthe. Yet maie not M. Hardinge therefore ſaie, that either the Soule of Man, or the Moulde of the Eathe, in deede hathe Natural, and Real, and verye Bloude. These be onely certaine Figures, and Fourmes of ſpeache. But Chriſte, when he ſaide, *I wil nomore Drinke of this* Fruite *of the Vine*, ſpake plainely, and ſimply, and without Figure. And therefore Chryſoſtome ſaith, as it is alleged before, Ex genimine Vitis: quæ certè Vinum producit, non Aquam: *Of the* Fruite of the Vine: *whiche Vine, verily bringeth foorthe, not Water, but Wine*. But Chryſoſtome ſaithe, *The Wine, that was ſhedde from Chriſtes Body, that is to ſaie, the Bloud of Chriſte, is in the Cuppe*. This is true, as in a Myſterie, or by a Figure of ſpeache: becauſe Chriſtes Bloude is repreſented in the Cuppe. Otherwiſe, if we ſpeake ſimply, and plainely, and without Figure. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, In Vaſis Sanctificatis non eſt ipſum Corpus Chriſti: ſed Myſterium Corporis eius continetur: *In the Sanctified Veſſelles, there is* not the very Body of Chriſte in deede: *but a Myſterie of that Body is therein conteined*.

Androcides.

Chryſoſt. in Mat. Homil. 83.

Chryſoſt. 1 Cor. 10

Chryſoſt. in Opere imper. Hom 11

The Apologie, Cap. 14. Diuiſion. 1.

And in ſpeaking thus, we meane not to abaſe the Lordes Supper, or to teache, that it is but a colde Ceremonie onely, and nothinge to be wrought therein: (as many falſely ſclaunder vs, we teache). For wee affirme, that Chriſt dooth truely, and preſently geue him ſelfe wholy in his Sacramentes: In Baptiſme, that we maie put him on: and in his Supper, that wee maie Eate him by Faithe, and Spirite, and maie haue Euerlaſtinge Life by his Croſſe and Bloude. And wee ſaie not, this is donne ſleightly, or coldely, but effectually, and truely. For, although we doo not touche the Body of Chriſte with teethe, or mouthe, yet wee holde him faſte, and eate him by Faithe, by Underſtandinge, and by Spirite. And it is no vaine Faithe, that comprehendeth Chriſt: neither is it receiued with colde deuotion, that is receiued with Underſtandinge, Faithe, and Spirite. For Chriſte him ſelfe altogeather

is ſo

is so offered, and geuen vs in these Mysteries, that wee maie certainely knowe wee be Fleashe of his Fleashe, and Bone of his Bones: and that Christe continueth in vs, and vvee in him.

M. Hardinge.

By whom is our lords Supper more abased, by the Defenders, or by the Catholikes

It is easy to be perceiued, who abaseth more our Lordes Supper, whether ye, that teache it to be very (a) Bakers Breade and VVine with the (a) onely Figure of Christes Body and Bloude, or wee who beleeue it to be his true Body and Bloude, with the onely Fourmes of Breade and VVine. **(Of whiche Fourmes neither Christe, nor his Apostles euer tolde vs one worde).** VVhether ye, that wil haue it a Figure of Christes whole Body absent, or wee, who wil haue Christes Body presente in deede, with a Figure of his Deathe, whiche (b) Deathe is absente onely. VVhether ye, that cal it an (c) Idol when it is woorshipped, or we that doo accordinge to our duetie Adore it, becaus that Royal Body (as Chrysostome saithe) whiche is sette before vs (d) to be seene nowe in Earthe, is woorthy of the moste highe Honoure. But whether of those twoo is the colder Ceremonie and more simple Supper, to haue Breade and VVine with a Signe onely of Fleashe and Bloude, or to haue Real Fleash and Bloude with such formes of Breade and VVine, as (e) by the Power of God doo nolesse bodily nourishe vs, then the Substance it selfe would haue done: we doubte not of wise mens iudgement. Ye haue your carnal Bankettes fatte and ful inough of the beste fleashe, and it is with you superstitious to Eate drie and Lenten Meates. But ye wil haue your spiritual Bankettes so leane, and Carrien, as a man may wel discerne whether ye haue more phãtasie to your Fleash, or to your Spirite.

(a) Vntruthes two togeather: For we neuer called it either Bakers Bread, or onely Figure.

(b) Vntruth. For Christes Death is as Present, as his Body.

(c) VVhat so euer corruptible Creature is honoured as God, it is an Idole.

(d) Vntruthe, standinge in wronge Exposition. For Chrysostome saithe, *Ascende ad Cœli portas: imò non Cœli, sed Cœli Cœlorum.*

The Sacramentaries teache nothinge to be wroughte in their Lordes Supper. 1. Corin. 11

Ye write, that many falsely sclaunder you, sayenge that ye teache nothinge to be wroughte in the Lordes Supper, whereas ye affirme, that Christe dothe truely and presently geue his owne selfe in his Supper, that we may eate him by Faithe and Spirite. And other worke in the Lordes Supper ye shewe none. And this whiche ye shewe, a man may doubte, whether it be a thinge wrought in the Lordes Supper or no. VVel may ye saie, that it is a thinge wrought in them which come to the Supper: but that it is wrought in the Supper it self, ye shewe it not: the Supper beinge that which is called *Cœna*, to witte, the meate receiued, not *Cœnatio*, whiche is the acte of Suppinge. For sithe that Supper is nothinge els but meate and drinke set vpon the Table to be receiued by suche as come vnto it, that whiche is wrought in the Lordes Supper, muste be wrought (f) in the meate and Drinke whiche our Lorde hath at his table. And as the mater whereof our Lordes Supper is made, is Breade and VVine: so the Supper made thereof is our Lordes Body and Bloude, into whiche the Breade and VVine by the Almighty power of the VVoorde is changed. So that if ye wil shewe Christe him selfe to be (g) made or (h) wrought in our Lordes Supper, ye muste shewe Breade and VVine to be changed into Christe him selfe, and so to be Eaten of his faithful at his Table. But whereas there are three things, Christ that maketh the Supper, the Communicantes that receiue the Supper, and the Supper it selfe: ye saie, that Christ for his parte geueth his owne self verily present, likewise that the Communicantes for their parte Eate him by Faithe and spirite. And so yee shewe, that the maker of the Supper worketh, and that the Cõmunicantes worke. But al this while ye shew vs not what is wrought in the matter of the Supper, that is to saie, in the Breade and VVine, nor what is made of them. O great sclãder that ye were charged withal, whiche not so muche as by your owne worde ye are discharged of.

What is Supper properly.

(f) The Bread is for vs, not wee for the Breade.

(g) Christe made: Christ wroughte: A straunge Diuinitie.

The proper woorke of our Lordes Supper.

Howe muche sounder is the (i) Catholike Doctrine, which teacheth the proper woorke of our Lordes Supper to be the turninge of the Substance of Breade and VVine into his Body and Bloude? VVhiche woorke becaus ye wil not confesse, ye haue deuised a woorke of your owne woorkinge, whiche is not propre to our Lordes Supper. For if I can receiue Christe in my house at home by Faith and Spirite, howe is that woorke (k) proper to his Supper, whiche maie be wrought without his Supper? Or can I not beleue in Christe, or lifte vp my Spirite vnto him, (l) excepte I come to Supper? Or if I doo calle for Christe, dothe he not geue him selfe by grace vnto me?

(h) Vntruth. For M. Hardinge wel knoweth, that this sonde folie was neuer Catholique.

(i) Vntruth. For Abraham, and Isaak receiued Christes very Body, before the Sacramente was ordeined. It is not peculiar to the Supper.

How make the Defenders Christ verily Present in his Supper.

But (saie ye) at the Lordes Supper Christe geueth him selfe verily presente. To what pourpose, I praie you? That wee maie Eate him (saie ye) by Faithe, and Sprite. VVel reasoned forsoothe. Haue ye foregotten the geeuinge to eate, and eatinge that, whiche is geeuen, to be Relatiues, one of them hauinge relation to the other? If Christe doo exhibite him selfe verily presente, as your Latine Texte bath, or geuen his owne selfe verily and presently, as your Interpreter telleth your tale for you: (m) dooth not he so exhibite or geue him selfe, as he wilbe receiued? Or doothe he shewe in one hande a piece of Breade, and with the other strike vs on the heade with a stone? If he geue him selfe verily present, as ye saie, we take him verily Presente. And then (Onlesse ye meane by him selfe, his grace whiche is of Christe, and not of Christe him selfe) wee eate him verily Present, not onely by Faithe, and Sprite, but by takinge him into (n) our Mouthe, and Body. If it please him at any time to be Eaten by Faithe and Sprite alone, (after whiche sorte he is daiely eaten by those that humblie cal vpon him) then he geueth not him selfe verily Present, but by Faithe and sprite, otherwise named grace, or some spiritual effecte of his woorkinge. But in our Lordes Supper the Scripture requireth a special and peculiar presence of Christe, to witte, of his fleashe, so as it may be Eaten. If then he geue him selfe verily presente, as ye saie, he is present in his owne person, God and Man, with Body, with Bloude, with Soule, with Godhed. If ye meane the very presence of his Godhed, that presence belongeth nomore to Christe, then to the Father, and to the Holy Ghoste. And so haue ye not declared any peculiar presence belonginge to his Supper. For by Presence of his Godhed he is alwaies verily presente, as wel before Supper, as at, or after Supper: becaus he filleth Heauen and Earthe.

(k) Such vnchristian scornes, against Christes ordinances are very vnseemely.

It is

It remaineth that either ye vnderſtande not your ſelues, or wilfully deceiue that infinite number of Soules, for whoſe ſake Chriſte hathe ſhedde his Bloude.

(n) Your erroure in makinge the Preſence of Chriſte in Baptiſme like to his preſence in the Supper is to groſſe. For althoughe Chriſte woorke bothe our Regeneration and our nouriſhemente by his Diuine Sacramentes, yet in Baptiſme our Regeneration is by name attributed in the Goſpel to the Holy Ghoſte alſo, to ſhewe that Chriſtes preſence there is ſpiritual. But his Supper conſiſteth of his Body and Bloude, whiche are ſo vnited to Chriſt, as they are peculiar to the ſeconde perſone in Godhed. Againe, for as mutche as they are receiued into vs, as foode to nouriſhe our Bodies to Reſurrection, (o) as the Goſpel ſaithe, and nomans Body is otherwiſe nouriſhed then by Eatinge in deede that meate whereof he is nouriſhed, and the Fleaſhe of Chriſte, as him ſelfe ſaith, is meate in deede, and his Bloude Drinke in deede: VVee are forced to beleeue an other manner of preſence in the Sacramente of the Aultar, then in Baptiſme. And therefore ye haue handled this mater too ſleightly, and coldely.

VVhereas ye ſaie, we doo not touche the Body of Chriſte with Teethe and Mouthe, (p) are ye ſo accuſtomed to ſwallowe downe whole morſels, as ye neuer touche them with your Teethe? Or haue ye learned to eate that, whiche ye touche not with your Mouthe? If Chriſte ſaide, Take, Eate this is my Body, and the Apoſtles tooke and Eate the ſame, neither coulde they take and Eate without touchinge: it ſeemeth ye handle eatinge too ſleightly and coldely, when yee wil haue it without touchinge. Chryſoſtome a more Subſtantial handler of thinges then any of you is, ſaithe of Chriſtes Body, *Quod omnium maximum eſt, atque principuum, in terra non conſpicaris tantùm, ſed tangis: neque ſolùm tangis, ſed comedis, & eo accepto, domum redis.* Of al thinges that be in earthe, what is the greateſt, and the chiefeſt, (q) that doeſt thou not onely ſee, but toucheſt: neither onely doeſt thou touche it, but alſo eate it, and hauinge receiued it, thou goeſt home againe. Howe wee touche it we knowe, for it is not nowe a mortal and corruptible Body, wherein wee maie faſten our Teeth, but glorious, and immortal, (r) and therefore wee touche it by the reaſon of the Accidentes of Breade and VVine, with whoſe Formes (as S. Auguſtine ſpeaketh) it is couered or vailed, and ſo commeth it to our Teeth, and to our Mouthe, and nouriſheth bothe our Bodies and Soules to life Euerlaſtinge. Nay but we (ſaie ye) holde him faſte, and Eate him by Faith, by Vnderſtandinge, and by the Spirite. I praie you be not too haſtie to holde him, before ye haue him. How came ye by him? His grace he geeueth diuerſe waies, but him ſelfe bodily and preſently as man, he neuer promiſed to geeue otherwiſe, then when he ſaide, Take, Eate, this is my Body. And then Iudas (s) (who had but a very meane Faithe) bicauſe he receiued the Sacramente, receiued him alſo. And our Bleſſed Lady althoughe ſhe had a moſte perfite Faithe, receiued him not after that ſorte, becauſe then ſhe receiued not the Sacramente. Howe can ye aſſure your ſelues, that your Faithe taketh the Body of Chriſte, (t) whiche was neuer promiſed to your Faithe? If your Faithe take him not as he is in the Sacramente, howe can your Faithe holde him faſte there? As here before ye haue ſaide mutche, and proued litle againſte the Real Preſence, wreſtinge and ſtretchinge certaine Fathers ſentences, and the Scripture it ſelfe to that pourpoſe, not wholy and Faithefully, but by peecemeale and patchedly alleaged, ſo as ye mighte beſte make them ſerue to the maintenance of your falſe Doctrine: righte ſo in the concluſion of that parte of your Apologie, with a like grace ye heape a number of mangled auctorities togeather, whereby to perſwade, that forasmuche as the Fathers haue aduertiſed vs to liſte vp our mindes to Heauenwarde, wee ſhoulde not thinke wee Eate the Fleaſhe of Chriſte as beeinge here preſente with vs vnder the Forme of Breade. Therfore whereas ye laie to the Catholiques charge, as thoughe by theire Sacriledge the people were bereſte of a greate benefite, in that they be taughte to be contente with the one kinde, vnder the ſame receiuinge noleſſe then if they had bothe: Howe mutche more woorthily are ye to be charged with the crime of Sacriledge, that (v) robbe them of the greateſt Treaſure that is in the Churche, ſo mutche as in you lieth, the Body and Bloude of our Lorde: and in ſteeede thereof pretende to deliuer vnto them a piece of Bakers Breade, and a Cuppe of VVine? But let vs ſee what good reaſon, or auctoritie ye bringe out of the Fathers againſte the true preſence of Chriſte in the Bleſſed Sacramente.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

O M. Hardinge, your conſcience knoweth, and wil teſtifie againſte your ſelfe, that we neuer called the Holy Sacramente of Chriſtes Body, Bakers Breade, no more then we cal the Sacramente of Baptiſme, a Paile of VVater. We haue alwaies ſpoken honourably, and reuerently thereof, as it was mete we ſhoulde ſpeake of the Myſteries of the Deathe of Chriſte, and as the Holy Catholique Fathers haue euermore vſed to ſpeake before vs.

Theſe wilde, and wanton, and vnſeemely ſpeaches, agree rather with your Doctrine. For, calle your owne woordes a little to remembrance. In your firſt Anſweare, we calle the Holy Sacramente, as it is vſed, and miniſtred by vs, according to the Order of the Holy Fathers, A peece of Breade not woorthe a pointe: In this place ye calle the Holy Miniſtration, ſo vſed by vs, A leane, and a Carrien Banket: In the nexte diuiſion, ye calle it A Toie. Theſe be your woordes, M. Hardinge,

(l) Chriſte offereth him ſelfe vnto our Faith: and by our Faith he is receiued.

(m) This is the Caniballes Diuinitie S. Ambroſe ſaithe, *Non hic panis, qui vadit in ventrem.*

(n) Vntruth. For the fineſt, and beſte Learned Fathers haue mainteined the ſame: As ſhal appeare.

(o) Vntruth. For there is no ſuch worde in al the Goſpel.

(p) Heatheniſhe and vnchriſtian ſcoffinge.

(q) As you ſee Chriſtes Body in the Sacramēt euen ſo yee touch it, and ſo ye eate it, and none otherwiſe S. Ambroſe ſaithe, *Fide Chriſtus Tangitur: Non tangitur Corpore.*

(r) Vntruthe, Childiſhe, and vnſauery. The learned Fathers neuer knewe thoſe folies.

Iudas had a very meane Faithe.

(t) Vntruthe. As ſhal appeare. But where was Chriſtes Body promiſed to your Mouthes.

(v) Vntruth. For we robbe them not, but offer them in deede, and verily the Body of Chriſt: and ſhewe thē where, and wherewith they maie receiue it.

The preſence of Chriſte in Baptiſme, and in the Supper is diſtincte, which the Defenders makes be like.

That wee touch chriſtes Body, and eate it with our mouthe, and howe.

In 1. Cor. Homil. 24.

In Lib. Sententt. prolo.

The Deſiderius nare holdinge of chriſt, holdeth not Chriſte, as he is in the Sacrament Matth. 26.

Hardinge,

Bakers Breade.

dinge, and mate wel ſtande, both with the Sobꝛietie of your Spꝛite, and alſo with the whole Subſtance, and tenoure of your Religion.

Wee calle it, The Sacramente of Thankeſgeuinge, and the Sacramente of Chriſtes Body, and Bloude. And with the Holy Father S. Auguſtine wee ſaie, In Sacramentis videndum eſt, non quid ſint, ſed quid ſignificent: *In Sacrametes wee muſte conſider*, not, what they be (in them ſelues) *but what they Signifie*. *Auguſt. contra Maximin. Lib. 3 Cap. 22.*

Wee haue no ſpecial regarde to the Bꝛeade, Wine, oꝛ Water: Foꝛ they are Creatures Coꝛꝛuptible, as wel after Conſecration, as they were befoꝛe: But wee directe our Faithe Onely vnto the very Body, and Bloude of Chriſte: not as being there Really, and Fleaſhly Pꝛeſente, as ye haue imagined: but, as ſittinge in Heauen at the Righte Hande of God the Father. The Holy Father Chryſoſtome ſaith, althoughe in general woꝛdes, not ſpeakinge ſpecially of this Sacramente: Oculi Fidei, quando vident hæc ineffabilia bona, ne ſentiunt quidem hæc viſibilia. Tantum inter hæc, & illa intereſt: *The eies of our Faithe, when they beholde theſe vnſpeakeable good thinges, they doo not ſo mutche, as marke theſe outwarde thinges, that wee ſee with our Bodily eies*. So greate is the difference bitweene theſe thinges. And herein reſteth the groſſeneſſe of your erroure, that ye diuide not the one thinge from the other. *Chryſoſ. in Geneſ. Homil. 24.*

S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Aliud eſt Sacramentum, aliud res Sacramenti: *The* Sacrament *of Chriſtes Body is one thinge: and the* Subſtance of the Sacramente, (oꝛ Chriſtes Bodye Repꝛeſented by the Sacramente) *is an other thinge*. And againe he ſaithe, Ea demùm eſt miſerabilis animæ ſeruitus, Signa pro rebus accipere: *To take the* Signes (oꝛ Sacramentes) *in ſteede of the* thinges them ſelues, (that be Signified, as M. Hardinge doth) *is the miſerable bondage of the Soule*. In like manner Origene ſaithe, Simpliciores neſcientes diſtinguere, ac ſecernere, quæ ſint, quæ in Scripturis Diuinis Interiori homini, quæ verò Exteriori deputanda ſint, vocabulorum ſimilitudinibus falſi, ad ineptas quaſdam Fabulas, & figmenta inania ſe contulerunt: *Simple menne, not hable to diſcerne in the Holy Scriptures, what thinges oughte to be applied to the* vtter Man, *and what to the* Inner, *beeinge deceiued by the likeneſſe of woordes, haue turned them ſelues to a ſorte of* peeuiſhe Fables, and vaine Fantaſies. *Auguſt. in Iohan. Tracta. 26. Auguſt de Doctrina Chriſtiana. Lib. 3. Cap. 5. Origen in Prologo in Cantica Canticor.*

You calle our Doctrine, naked, and colde, foꝛ that wee ſaie, The Sacramente is a Figure. And yet bicauſe ye cannot in any wiſe denie, but the ſame woꝛde, Figure, to the ſame pourpoſe is commonly vſed of al the Anciente Catholique Fathers, and Doctoures of the Churche: Thereforꝛe ye thoughte it good to qualifie, and to mince the mater, and to ſaie, It is a Figure, not of the Body, but of the Deathe of Chriſte. And here it is a woꝛlde to ſee, howe pitifully ye trouble your ſelfe with your varietie, and change, and ſhifte of Figures.

Firſte you ſaie, The Sacramente, by the iudgemente of Damaſcene, is called a Figure befoꝛe the Conſecration, that is to ſaie, befoꝛe the Sacramente be a Sacrament. Foꝛ befoꝛe Conſecration, it is no Sacramente. Afterwarde vpon better aduiſe ye ſaie, The Fourmes onely, and the ſhewes, and Accidentes are the Figure of Chriſtes Body. Againe you ſaie, Chriſtes Body Inuiſible, is a Figure of Chriſtes Body viſible: that is to ſaie, A thinge vncertaine, is a Figure of a thinge moſte certaine. Nowe laſte of al ye ſaie, as I thinke, noman euer ſaide befoꝛe, The very Body of Chriſte it ſelfe is a Figure of the Deathe of Chriſte. Thus many pꝛetty ſtrange vnknowen Figures, ye are dꝛiuen to diuiſe, thereby to auoide one ſimple, plaine, vſual, and common Figure. Foꝛ, to leaue an infinite numbꝛer of other Ancient Fathers, S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Dominus, Figuram Corporis ſui Diſcipulis ſuis commendauit, & tradidit: *Our Lorde commended, and deliuered to his Diſciples a* Figure (not as ye ſaie, of his Deathe, but) of his Body. *M. Hard. Artic. 12. Diuiſion. 2. Auguſ. in Pſal 3.*

Whereas you ſaie, The Body of Chriſt is preſent in deede, and that his Death is abſent onely: If yée liſte to cauille, as yée doo, and as your manner is, idlely to plaie with the woꝛdes, and pꝛaſes of the Anciente Fathers, ye mighte as wel, and by as good warrante ſaie, that Chriſtes Deathe is as Pꝛeſent, as his Body. Foꝛ S. Cyprian ſaithe, Paſsio Chriſti eſt Sacrificium, quod offerimus: *The Sacrifice, that wee offer, is* the Paſsion of Chriſte. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, In Myſterijs Mors Chriſti perficitur: The Deathe of Chriſte *is wroughte in the Myſteries*. S. Hierome ſaithe, Chriſtus nobis quo- *Cyprian. Lib. 2. Epiſt. 3. Chryſo in Acta. Homil. 2. Hieronym. in Pſal. 97.*

Figure. Christes Deathe. Absente, or Present

bis quotidiè Crucifigitur: *Unto vs, Christ is Crucified euery daie.* And S. Gregorie saith, Christus iterum in hoc Mysterio Moritur: *In this Mysterie* (of the Holy Communion) *Christe is put to Deathe againe.* By these wordes, thus prested, and rackte, as your maner is, ye maie easily proue, not onely that Christes Body, but also that his Passion, and Deathe, and Bloudeshedinge is verily Presente.

De Con. Dist. 2. Quid sit.

Ye saie, Ye Adore the Sacramente with godly Honour. We answeare you, as Christe sometime answeared the woman of Samaria, Vos Adoratis, quod nescitis: *Ye Adore and woorshipp, yee knowe not what.* For who euer willed you thus to Adore the Sacramente? Who taught you, who bade you so to do? What Prophete? What Apostle? What Father? What Doctour of the Churche?

Iohan. 4.

But here, M. Hardinge, ye do vs greate wronge, to saie, wee calle Christes Body an Idole, sauinge that ye haue a Chartare, to speake what ye liste. For we knowe, and haue euermore Confessed with Chrysostome, *that the Body of Christe is woorthie of the highest Honoure:* and we Adore it, and woorshipp it, euen as the very Body of the Sonne of God. Howe be it, as it is saide before, Christes Body is one thinge, and the Sacramente is an other. The Sacramente is in Earthe: Christes Body is in Heauen, at the Righte hande of God the Father. And therefore Chrysostome saithe in the same place, Ascende ergo ad Cœli portas, & diligenter attende: imò non Cœli, sed Cœli Cœlorum: & tunc, quod dicimus intueberis: *Mounte vp therefore vnto the* gates of Heauen, *and diligently consider: Naie, I saie not, vnto the* gates of Heauen, but vnto the gates of the Heauen of Heauens: *and so shal ye see the thinges that wee speake of.*

Chryso. 1. Corin. Homil. 24.

Chrysost. in eadem Homil.

But, what meante you, M. Hardinge, thus out of season to presse in with your Lenten Argumente, and to saie, It is Superstitious with you, to eate drie, and Lenten Meates? If ye saie, there can be no Superstition in choise of meates, either ye are deceiued your selfe, or els ye seeke occasion by the waie, to deceiue others.

Tertull. in epist. de Cibis Iudaicis.

Tertullian saithe, Deus ventre non colitur, nec cibis, quos Dominus dicit perire, & in secessu, naturali Lege purgari. Nam, qui per Escas Dominum colit, prope est, vt Dominum habeat ventrem suum: *God is not honoured with the* Belly, nor with meates, *whiche the Lorde* Christe *saithe, doo perishe, and are purged in conueiance by Naturall Order.* For who so by meates honoureth the Lorde, in a manner maketh his Belly to be his Lorde. S. Hilarie saithe, Hæretici sicco Panis Cibo viuunt. Sed quis tandem otiosi huius propositi profectus est? Totum hoc inanè, atque ridiculum est, & cum ipsis Superstitionis causis miserabile: *Heretiques liue by* drie Breade: *But what profite is there in this* idle pourpose? *It is altogeather* vaine, and foolishe, and in respecte of the causes of theire Superstition, it is also Miserable.

Hilar. in Psa. 64

Hyeronym. ad Neporianum.

S. Hierome saithe, Quid prodest oleo non vesci, & molestias quasdam, difficultates q; ciborum quærere, Caricas, Piper, Nuces, Palmarum fructus, Similam, Mel, Pistacia? Audio præterea, quosdam contra regulam, hominumq; Naturam, aquam non bibere, nec vesci Pane: sed sorbitiunculas delicatas, & contrita olera, betarumq; succum, non Calice sorbere, sed Concha: Prò pudor. Non erubescimus istiusmodi ineptijs? nec tædet Superstitionis? Insuper etiam famam abstinentiæ in delicijs quærimus: *What auaileth it, to eate no Oile, and with paine, and muche adoe, curiously to seeke for meates, Figges, Peper, Nuttes, Dates, fine white Breade, Honny, and Pistacia? Beside this, I heare saie, there be some, whiche contrarie to the common order, and Nature of menne, wil neither drinke Water, nor eate Breade: but seeke for delicate suppinges, and Herbes sliddē togeather, and the iuice of Beetes, and receiue the same, not out of a Cuppe, but out of a shelle.* Phy for shame, Doo wee not blushe at suche foolishnesse? Are wee not weery of such Superstition? *And yet beside al this, liuinge in suche curious delicacie, wee looke to be praised for our Fastinge?* To leaue al others, Erasmus, a man of great Iudgement, saith, Maior est in his rebus Superstitio apud Christianos, quàm vnquam fuit inter Iudæos: There is more Superstition herein *emonge Christians, then euer was emonge the* Iewes.

Erasm. in Annot. in 14. ad Rom.

We weighe not the choise of Fishe, or Fleashe: but the burthen of the minde, and the snare of the Conscience.

But, to passe ouer your nedelesse Lenten talke, the Feaste, that we sette before

Pre-ſente, ſore the people, is neither drie, nor carrien, (notwithstandinge it liketh you, by your vncouthe termes, so to calle it) but Spiritual, Holy, and Heauenly: I meane, the very Body of Iesus Christe the Sonne of God, to the comforte, and reliuinge of Body, and Soule. And yet, for as muche as it so wel delighteth youre eares, to calle it carrien, wee refuse not the name. Chryſoſtome likewise, although in more reuerend, and Ciuile ſenſe, calleth it Carrien. Theie be his wordes, Vbi eſt Cadauer, ibi ſunt Aquilæ. Cadauer Domini Corpus eſt propter Mortem. Aquilas autem appellat, vt oſtendat, ad alta eum oportere contendere, qui ad hoc Corpus accedit, & nihil eum terra debere illum habere commune, nec ad inferiora trahi, & repere, ſed ad ſuperiora ſemper volare, & in Solem Iuſtitiæ intueri, mentiſque oculum habere acutiſsimum. Aquilarum enim, non Graculorum, eſt hæc Mensa: *Where as the* Carrien *is, there are the Egles. The* Carrien is the Body of Chriſte, *in reſpecte of his Deathe. But he nameth Egles to ſhewe, that, who ſo wil approche to this Body, muſte mounte aloſte, and haue no dealinge with the Earthe*, nor be drawen, and creepe downewarde: but muſte euermore flee vp, *and beholde the Sonne of Iuſtice, and haue the eie of his minde, quicke, and ſharpe. For this is a Table of* Egles, (that flie on highe) *not of* Iaies (that creepe beneathe.) *Chryſoſtom. 1. Corin. Homi. 24.*

We adde further, But, ſaie yee, at the Lordes Supper Christe geueth him ſelfe verily preſente. To what pourpoſe? I praie you. That wee maie eate him (ſaie yee) by Faithe, and Sprite. VVel reaſoned ſoſoothe. Nowe ſoreſwothe, M. Hardinge, this is Hicke Scorners Logique, farre vnmete for a man of your grauitie.

Haue yee forgotten (ſaie you) the geuinge to eate, and eatinge that, whiche is geuen, to be Relatiues, one of them hauinge Relation to the other? If Chriſte doo exhibite him ſelfe verily preſent, doothe not he ſo exhibite, or geue him ſelfe, as he wilbe receiued? If he geue him ſelfe verily preſent, wee take him verily Preſente, and then wee eate him verily Preſente, not onely by Faithe, and Sprite, but by takinge him into our Mouthe, and Belly. Uerily, M. Hardinge, this, of your parte, was not very wel reaſoned. For a man maie haue Chriſte verily Preſent, although he haue him not in his mouthe. S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Habes Chriſtum In Præſenti, per Signum: In Præſenti, per Fidem: In Præſenti, per Baptiſmatis Sacramentum: *Thou haſte* Chriſte *in the time* Preſente, *by his Signe, or Token: In the time* Preſente, *by Faithe: In the time* Preſent, *by the Sacrament of Baptiſme.* Thus manye wates wee haue Chriſte Preſente, and verily Preſente. And S. Auguſtine imagineth Chriſte thus to ſaie vnto the people of Capernaum, Non hoc Corpus, quod videtis, manducaturi eſtis: Yee ſhal not eate (with youre bodily mouthe) *this* Body *of mine, that you ſee.* Wee remember wel the relation, that is betweene Geeuinge, and Receiuinge: and therefore wee marueile ſo muche the more, that you ſo vnſkilfully woulde abuſe it. For, as Chriſte offered his Body Spiritually to our Faithe, and Sprite: Euen ſo Spiritually, by our Faithe, and Sprite, wee receiue it. And where yee ſaie, VVee take Chriſtes Body into our Mouthes, and Bodies, as hauinge forgotten that Chriſt ſaith, *The woordes, that I haue ſpoken, be Sprite, and Life.* S. Auguſtine woulde ſone haue removed you from this groſſe errour. For thus he ſaithe vnto you, Quid paras Dentem, & Ventrem? Crede, & manducaſti: *What preparest thou thy Toothe, and thy Belly?* (This Eatinge is Spiritual.) Beleeue (in Chriſte) and thou haſte eaten. *Auguſt. in Ioan. Tract. 50.* *Augu. in Pſal. 98*

S. Ambroſe ſaithe, Fide tangitur Chriſtus: Fide videtur. Non tangitur Corpore: non oculis comprehenditur: By Faithe Chriſte is touched: By Faithe he is ſeene. He is not touched with Body: *He is not ſeene with eie.* *Ambroſ. in Lucam, Li. 6. ca. 8.*

Likewiſe ſaithe Gregorius Nyſſenus S. Baſiles Brother, Ego aliam Eſcam agnoſco: quæ ſimilitudinem quandam proportionis eſcæ huius Corporis gerat: Cuius voluptas, atque ſuauitas ad animum ſolummodò tranſeat: *I knowe an other kinde of Meate, bearinge the Likeneſſe, and reſemblance of our bodily Meate:* (for that this inwardely feedeth the minde, as the other outwardly feedeth the Body) *The pleaſure, and ſweeteneſſe whereof* goeth not into the mouthe, or Belly, but) paſſeth onely into the Soule. Thus wee vnderſtande our ſelues, M. Hardinge, and deceiue not, as you ſaie, the Soules that Chriſte hathe boughte. God forgeue you, and others, that ſo haue donne, that the Bloude of many be not required at your handes. *Gregor. Nyſſen. De Creatione Hominis. ca. 20.*

Your errour (yée ſaie) in makinge the Preſence of Chriſt in Baptiſme, like to his Preſence in the

Supper, is too grosse. Here is one erroure more, then any of the Learned Catholique Fathers ever noted. S Chrysostome saithe, *In the Sacrament of Baptisme wee are made Fleashe of Christes Fleashe, and Bone of his Bones.* S Bernarde saithe, Lauemur in Sanguine eius: Let vs be washed in his Bloude. Leo saithe, Christi Sanguine rigaris, quando in Mortem ipsius Baptizaris: *Thou arte* washte in the Bloude of Christe, *when thou arte Baptized in his Deathe.*

Chrys. in 1 Epist. ad Iphe. Hom. 20
Bernard. Super Missus est hom. 3
Leo in Sermon. de 4 Feria. a. 1.

By these fewe it maie appeare, that Christe is Presente at the Sacramente of Baptisme, euen as he is Presente at the Holy Supper: Onelesse we will saie, we maie be made Fleashe of Christes Fleashe and be washt in his Bloude: & be partakers of him: and haue him Presente, without his Presence. Therefore Chrysostome, when he hathe spoken vehementlye of the Sacramente of the Supper, he concludeth thus, Sic & in Baptismo, Euen so as it also in the Sacrament of Baptisme. The Body of Christe is likewise Presente in them bothe. And for that cause Beda saithe, Nulli est aliquatenus ambigendum, tunc vnumquenque Fidelium Corporis Sanguinisque Dominici participem fieri, quando in Baptismate Membrum Christi efficitur: *No man maie doubt, but euery Faithfil man is then made* partetaker of the Body, and Bloude of Christe, when in Baptisme *he is made the Member of Christe.* As for your Real, and Fleashly Presence, it hathe benne often talkte of on your parte, but neuer proued.

Beda in 1 Cor. 10

We saie, VVee touchen not Christes Body with our Mouthe, or Teethe. VVhat (saie you) be yee vsed to swallo we downe whole Morselles? Suche Childishe, and wanton talke, M. Hardinge, specially in the debatinge of matters of Religion, woulde better becomme some lighter person. We knowe, that, as S. Augustine saithe, Gratia Christi non Consumitur morsibus: *The Grace of Christe is* not Consumed by morsels. We might haue made the like answeare to S. Augustine: For he saithe to you, as I haue alleged him before: *What prepar est thou thy* Toothe *and thy* Belly? M. Hardinge, the Eatinge of the Body of Christe, is a worke Spiritual, and nedeth neither brusinge of tothe: nor swallowinge of the throte: nor healpe of the outwarde, and bodily mouthe. If we knowe thus muche, why do you dissemble it? If we knowe it not, we commen to rathe, to speake of these thinges.

Augu. in Iohan. Tractat. 27.
Augu in Iohan. Tractat. 25.

S. Basile saithe, Est Spirituale Os Interioris Hominis, quo nutritur recipiens Verbum vitæ, quod Verbum est Panis qui descendit de Cœlo: There is a Spiritual Mouth of the Inner Man, *by whiche he is nourished by receiuinge* (Christe) *the Woorde of Life, whiche is the Breade that came from Heauen.*

Basil. in Psal. 33
Εἰ καὶ νοητὸν τὸ στόμα τοῦ ἐνδόν ἀνθρώπου.
Basil. in eund. Psalm.
Ἐπειδὴ ἄρτος ἀληθείας ὁ κύριος ἡμῶν, καὶ ἡ σὰρξ αὐτοῦ ἀληθὴς βρῶσις, ἀναγκαῖα τὴν γλῶτταν τῆς εὐφροσύνης τοῦ ἄρτου δι' ἣν γεύσεως ἡμῖν νοητῆς ἐγγένηται.

Againe he saithe, Gustate, & videte, quòd suauis est Dominus. Sæpè obseruauimus, vires animi habere nomina ab aliqua similitudine Membrorum Corporis. Quoniam ergo Dominus noster est Verus Panis, & eius Caro est Verus Cibus, necesse est, eam voluptatem, quæ ex illius Panis delectatione affertur, in nobis per gustum existere Spiritualem: *Taste yee, and see, that our Lorde is gracious. Wee haue oftentimes marked, that the Powers of the minde haue theire names, from somme likenesse of the partes of the Body. Therefore seeinge our Lorde is Breade in deede, and his Fleashe is Verily Meate, it cannot be chosen, but the pleasure, and sweetenesse of that Breade muste be wroughte in vs* (not by our bodily mouthe, but) by the Spiritual taste of the Soule.

Cyprian De Cœna Domini.

S. Cyprian saithe. Esus Carnis eius, quædam est auiditas, & quoddam desiderium manendi in eo: *The Eatinge of that Fleashe is a certaine* greedinesse, *and a certaine* desire *to dwel in him.* S. Augustine saithe, Ipse est Panis Cordis nostri: Christe *is the Breade* (not of our Belly, but) of our Harte. And againe, Intus Esuri, Intus Siti: Hunger thou VVithin: Thirste thou VVithin. Likewise againe he saithe, Videte, Fratres, panem Cœlestem: Spirituali Ore manducate: *O my Brethren, beholde this Heauenly Breade: Eate it with the* Spiritual, or Inner Mouthe of the Minde.

Aug. in Psal. 48
Augu in Iohan. Tractat. 26.

Thus are we taughte to eate that Spiritual Meate, without chewinge, or swallowinge, or vse, or office of the bodily Mouthe. Therefore S. Augustine saithe, Non manducans, manducat: & manducans, non manducat: *He that eateth not, eateth: and he that eateth, eateth not.*

4. Sentē. dist. 10. secundum hos.

But Chrysostome saithe, Quod omnium Maximum est, atque Præcipuum, in terra non conspicaris tantùm, sed etiam tangis: nec tangis tantùm: sed etiam comedis:

Chrysost. in 1. Cor. Homil. 24.

The

Spiritual Eatinge. Iudas.

The greateſt, and woorthieſt thinge, that is, thou dooſte not onely beholde in the Earthe, but alſo touchest it: Neither dooſte thou onely touche it, but alſo eateſt it. Here, I beſeche you, M. Hardinge, diſſemble no lenger: but ſpeake plainely. Howe doo you beholde the Body of Chriſte in the Sacramente? With what ſenſes? With what eies doo you ſee it? If ye ſaie, with your bodily eies, why ſaie you, Chriſtes Body is there Inuiſible, couered with Accidentes, and cannot be ſeene? If ye ſaie, (as it is in deede) that ye ſee the ſame Body onely with the Spiritual eies of your Minde, then ye allege Chryſoſtome directly, and plainely againſte your ſelfe.

But S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Habet Fides oculos ſuos: Faithe hathe her eies, to ſee withal. And S. Bernarde ſaith, Viſio animæ, intellectus eſt: The ſeeinge of the Soule, is vnderſtandinge. With theſe eies wee ſee Chriſte, that is to ſaie, wee vnderſtande Chriſte, or beleue in Chriſte. S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Velamen poſitum erat contra faciem eorum, ne viderent Chriſtum in Scripturis: *There was a Vele laide ouer theire face, that they ſhoulde* not ſee Chriſte in the Scriptures.

Aug. Epiſt. 84. Bernard. Meditation. Cap. 6. Aug. in Euangelium ſecund. Lucam. Serm. 49

Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Non tantum præſtare poſſunt Corporales oculi, qui viſibilia cernunt, quantum oculi Spiritus, qui ea, quæ non videntur, neque ſubſiſtunt, videre poſſunt: *Theſe bodily eies, that ſee thinges viſible, cannot doo ſi mutche, as the* eies of the Sprite. *For theſe eies are hable to ſee the thinges, that* be not ſeene, and haue no beeinge. Likewiſe againe he ſaith, Oculi animi, etiamſi Parietes, etiamſi mœnia, etiamſi Montium moles, etiamſi Cœlorum Corpora compererint obſtantia, omnia facilè prætercurrunt: *The eies of the minde, notwithſtandinge they finde* VValles, *or* Mountaines, *or the* Bodies of the Heauens *to ſtande againſte them, yet wil they eaſily paſſe throughe them al.* VVith theſe eies, ſaithe Chryſoſtome, wee ſee that moſte woorthy, and moſte glorious Body of Chriſt. Therefore he ſaithe, Credamus, & videmus Præſentem Ieſum: Let vs beleeue, and wee ſee Ieſus Preſent before vs. Likewiſe S. Hierome ſaithe, Eſt intelligentia Spiritualis, qua Chriſtus cernitur: *There is a Spiritual vnderſtandinge,* wherewith Chriſt is ſeene. Otherwiſe S. Ambroſe ſaithe, Chriſtum nunc ſecundum Veritatem videre non poſſumus: *As nowe*, accordinge to the Truthe, (with bodily ſighte) wee cannot ſee Chriſte.

Chryſo. de Verb. Eſaiæ. Vidi Dominum, Homil. 3. Chryſo. in Marcum Homil 6. Hieronym. in Amos. Lib. 3. ca. 9 Ambroſ. in Oratione. De Fide Reſurrectionis, Ambroſ. in Lucam. Li. 6. ca. 8.

Nowe, as the Body of Chriſte is ſeene, ſo is it touched: and, as it is touched, ſo is it Eaten. But it is not ſeene with Bodily eies: It is not touched with bodily fingers: For S. Ambroſe ſaithe, Fide tangitur Chriſtus: Fide Chriſtus videtur: *By Faithe Chriſte is* touched: *By Faithe Chriſte is* ſeene. Therefore the Body of Chriſte is not Eaten with the bodily mouthe, but onely by Faithe, whiche is the Spiritual mouth of the Soule.

Iudas (ye ſaie) who had but a meane Faithe, becauſe he receiued the Sacrament, receiued him alſo. O, howe mutche is your Iudas beholden to theſe menne? Chriſte calleth him the Childe of Perdition. S. Iohn ſaithe, *The Diuel was entred into him.* Againe Chriſte ſaithe, *He was a Diuel.* Therefore this Meane Faithe, that you allowe him, muſte nedes be a very litle pretty Faithe: euen ſutche a Faithe as ye mighte wel allowe the Diuel.

Iohan. 6. Iohan. 13.

Yet with the ſame Meane Faithe (ye ſaie) receiuinge the Sacramente, he receiued Chriſte alſo. Firſt, it is not wel, and thorowly agreed vpon, that Iudas receiued the Sacrament, or was preſente at al at the Laſte Supper. S. Hilarie ſaithe plainely, *He was gonne forth about his wicked pourpoſe, and Receiued it not.* But be it, that S. Hilarie were deceiued, and that Iudas in deede receiued the Sacramente. Yet, as it is ſaide before, Chriſtes Body is one thinge: and the Sacrament of Chriſtes Body is an other thinge.

Hilar. in Matth. Canon. 30.

S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Diſcipuli manducabant Panem Dominum: Iudas Panem Domini, contra Dominum: *The Diſciples did eate the* Breade, whiche is the Lorde: *But* Iudas *did eate* (not the Lorde, but) *the* (Sacrament, whiche is the) Breade of the Lorde, *againſte the Lorde.* And yet in plainer ſorte he ſaithe, Chriſtus adhibuit Iudam ad Conuiuium, in quo Corporis, & Sanguinis ſui Figuram, Diſcipulis ſuis Commendauit, & tradidit: Chriſte *admitted* Iudas *vnto his Table, wherat he gaue, and deliuered vnto his Diſciples* a Figure of his Body.

Aug. in Iohan. Tractat. 59. Aug. in Pſal. 3 Aug. De Ciuit. Li. 21. ca. 25.

Againe S. Auguſtine ſaithe, as in the Perſon of Chriſte, Qui in me non manet, &

Promisse made to Faithe.

in quo ego non manco, ne se dicat, aut existimet manducare Corpus meum, aut Sanguinem meum bibere: *He that abideth not in me, and I in him*, let him not saie, or thinke, *that he either eateth my Body, or drinketh my Blonde*.

The obiection, that we make of the Resurrection of our Bodies, is light, and vaine, and to smal pourpose. For if noman shal haue parte in the Resurrection, but onely they that haue receiued the Sacramente of Christes Body, then are al the Holy Fathers, Patriarches, and Prophetes of the Olde Testamente, Abraham, Isaac, Iacob, Moses, Aaron, and sutche others: then are infinite numbers of Christian Children: then are many Godly Martyres, whiche, bringe Baptized in the Blonde of Christe, were taken out of this life, before they coulde receiue the Sacramente, vterly excluded for euer from al hope of Resurrection, whiche were a thinge too horrible, to enter into Christian eares. But Christe, when he spake these Wordes, meante not the receiuinge of the Sacramente, but the Spiritual Eatinge of his Very Body, and the Spiritual Drinkinge of his Very Blonde: Wherefor he is made partetaker vnto Resurrection, and Life Euerlastinge, who so euer beleeueth in the Deathe of Christe. And therefore S. Basile saithe of the Sacrament of Baptisme, Baptisma est vis, & efficacia ad Resurrectionem: *Baptisme is a* Power, *and a* strengthe *vnto Resurrection*. But herof we shal haue occasion offered to saie more hereafter.

Basil. de Sancto Baptismate. Τὸ δὲ βάπτισμα δύναμις ἐστὶ πρὸς τὴν Ἀνάστασιν.

Further, Howe can yee assure your selues (saie you) that your Faith receiueth the Body of Christe, whiche was neuer promised to your Faithe? By the waie, I beseeche you, M. Hardinge, when, or where was Christes Body euer promised to your Mouthe? Verily Christe promised his Body to be receiued by Faithe, and by Faithe Onely, and none otherwise. For thus he saithe, Ego sum Panis ille Vitæ: qui venit ad me, non esuriet: & qui credit in me, non sitiet vnquam: *I am that Breade of Life: He that* commeth vnto me, *shal neuer hunger: and he that* Beleeueth in me, *shal neuer thirste*. Here haue you, M. Hardinge, a plaine promisse made vnto your Faithe. But of youre Mouthe, we heare nothinge. If you haue oughte to shewe out of the Scriptures, Doctoures, or Councelles, let it appeare, and that in plaine wordes, without colour. Otherwise, if ye cauil in wordes, we muste saie, ye haue nothinge. Therefore the Ancient Father Origen saithe, Idcirco dicitur Panis Vitæ, vt habeat Gustus Animæ, quod degustet: *Therefore is* Christe *called the Breade of Life, that* (our Faithe, whiche is) *the* Taste of our Soule, *maie haue, what to taste*.

Origen in Cantica. Homil. 2.

Clemens Alexandrinus saithe, Comedite Carnes meas, & Bibite Sanguinem meum: Euidenter Fidei, & Promissionis, quod est Esculentum, & Poculentum dicens Allegoricè: *Eate my Fleashe, and Drinke my Blonde: Meaninge hereby vnder an* Allegorie, *or by* waie of a Figure, *the Meate, and Drinke, that is of* (our) Faithe, *and* (his) Promisse.

Clemens Alexandrinus in Pædagogo. Lib. 1. Cap. 6.

Tertulhian saithe, Eundem Sermonem Christus etiam Carnem suam dixit: quia Sermo Caro factus est. Proindè in causa Vitæ recipiendus: Deuorandus auditu: Ruminandus intellectu: & Fide digerendus est: *The same Woorde*, Christe *called his Fleash: For the Woorde was made Fleashe. Therefore he muste be receiued in cause of Life:* He muste be Deuoured by hearinge: He muste be Chewed by vnderstandinge: He muste be Digested by Faithe.

Tertul. de Resurrectione Carnis.

S. Cyprian saithe, Quod est esca Carni, hoc est Animæ Fides: *As Meate is to the Fleashe, so is* Faithe vnto the Soule. S. Augustine saithe, Credere in eum, hoc est, Manducare: Illud Bibere, quid est, nisi viuere? To Beleeue in him, *is to* Eate *him. That* Drinkinge *of him, what is it els, but to* liue by him?

Cyprian de Cœna Domini. Aug. in Iohan. Tract. 26. Aug. De Verb. Apostol. Serm. 2

I truste, M. Hardinge, it maie appeare hereby, there is somme Promisse made herof vnto our Faithe. Now shewe you as euident Promisse made to your Mouth, and Belly: and then your Reader happily will beleeue you.

The Apologie, Cap. 14. Division. 2.

And therefore in celebratinge theise Mysteries, the People are to good pourpose exhorted, before they comme to receiue the Holy Communion, to lifte vp theire Hartes, and to directe theire mindes to Heauenwarde: bicause he is there, by whom wee muste be sedde, and liue.

M. Hardinge.

I praie you, whiche theſe Myſteries meane you? Thoſe that ye haue in your newe Communion, or thoſe that wee haue at the aultar of God in the Catholike Churche of Chriſte? If yee meane your owne newe diuiſed toye, thereof yee cannot bringe any ſufficient reaſon againſte the Churche pardy, whiche condemneth the ſame. If ye meane the Holy Myſteries of the Catholike Churche, yee miſreporte the mater. For by that exhortation, ye ſpeake of, (a) the people are not prepared to receiue the Communion onely, nor chiefly: but to diſpoſe them ſelues accordingely, and as it becommeth them to praie: for that end be theſe woordes, *Surſum Corda*, vp with your hartes, pronounced by the Prieſt in the Preface before praier. Reade S. Cyprian in Sermone 6. De Oratione Dominica. And yee ſhal finde him to referre the whole to Praier. But what if we admitte your woordes, refuſinge your Heretical meaninge? VVee graunt, the people are to good pourpoſe ſo exhorted, as yee ſaie, and that he is in Heauen, whoſe fleaſhe wee feede on in this Sacramente, thereby to attaine to life euerlaſtinge. VVhat conclude yee of this? Ergo, he is not here? For at that marke yee ſhoote, euery man Maie ſee. Here wee tel you, that your Rhetorike is better ſtuffe, then your Logike: for your argumente is fooliſhe. VVith the one ye maie leade the ſimple perhaps, with the other ye moue the Learned to laugh at you. For Chriſte is in Heauen, and alſo here, as Chryſoſtome ſaithe, *Et hic plenus exiſtens, & ille plenus, Vnum Corpus*. (b) He is here fully, and there fully, one Body. Theſe twoo propoſitions, Chriſte is in Heauen, and Chriſte is here, maie wel ſtande together, without iuttinge the one the other out of place. He is there at the righte hande of the Father viſibly, he is here vnder the Formes of Breade and VVine, inuiſibly: there in glorie, here in Maieſtie: yet as truely and fully here, as there, concerninge his (c) Subſtance, as Chryſoſtome ſaithe. Yee proceede foorth, and ſaie.

(a) Vntruthe. Here M. Harding miſreporteth his owne Maſſebooke.

A fooliſhe Argument In Epiſt. ad Hebr. Homil. 17. Chriſte is bothe in Heauen & alſo here in the Sacrament.

(b) Chriſte is in Heauen by the Subſtance of his Body: and here by woorkinge, or by Grace.

(c) Vntruth. For Chryſoſtome neuer, neither wrote ſo, nor meante ſo. *Socrat. lib. 3 ca. 22 Chriſtianorum ſibi ridiculi. & nugaces ſi cum Iuliani Libru conferãtur.*

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

It maie becomme you, M. Hardinge, as wel to calle the reuerende Miniſtration of Chriſtes Holy Myſteries, a Toie, as to cal the Goſpel of Chriſt, Errour, & Hereſie. So likewiſe Libanius the Heathen, althoughe a man, I trowe, not of your Profeſſion, ſaide ſommetime, that al the Bookes, either of the Scriptures, or of any of the Chriſtian Fathers, in compariſon of Iulianus the Renegates Bookes, were Toies, **and** Triſles. **Howe be it, Our** Toies **be the ſame** Toies, **that were once vſed, and alowed vniuerſally throughout the Catholique Churche of God, before youre Maſſe was euer knowen, and were then thought to be no** Toies.

Touchinge theſe woordes, *Surſum Corda*, Liſte vp your Hartes (**ye ſaie**) they were applied in olde times vnto praier, and not only, or chiefly to the Miniſtration of the Sacrament, and that, (**as ye ſeeme to ſaie**) by the witneſſe of S. Cyprian. **As for theſe emptie woordes, Onely, or Chiefely, ye vſe them Onely as a falſe lighte, to blinde your Reader. For in our** Apologie **ye founde them not.**

Touchinge S. Cyprian, **Ye thought it beſte to diſſemble, & to ſhifte his woordes, and to commaunde him to ſilence. For thus he ſaithe, euen directely againſte the whole practiſe of your Churche:** Sacerdos ante Orationem, Præfatione præmiſſa, parat Fratrum mentes, dicendo, Surſum Corda: vt dum reſpondet Plebs, Habemus ad Dominum, admoneatur, nihil aliud ſe, quàm Dominum, cogitare debere: *Before Praier, the Prieſte with a Preface prepareth the hartes of the Brethren, ſaieinge vnto them,* Liſte vp your Hartes: *that, when the* People anſweareth, VVee liſte them vp vnto the Lorde, *they maie be put in minde, to thinke of nothinge els, but of the Lorde.* **Where is this Order, M. Hardinge, where is this Eccleſiaſtical Tradition nowe becomme? Throughout youre whole Territorie of** Rome, **in what Churche, in what Chaple is it keapte? Where doth your people anſweare the Prieſte at the Common Praier? Or, where dothe the people vnderſtande, either the meaninge of the Sacramentes, or any thinge, that is pronounced by the Prieſte? Or, why are you ſo vnadviſed, to allege manifeſte Authorities againſte your ſelfe?**

Cyprian in Oratione Dominí.

Ye ſaie, The people was taught by theſe woordes, not to conſider, what was meante onely by the Sacraments, but to geue attendance vnto the Praier? **Wherein your owne** Maſſebooke **is eaſily able to controlle you. And in the** Greeke Liturgies, **not before any other publike Praier, but immediately before the** Holy Miniſtration, **the Prieſt ſaithe,** Ἄνω σωμεν τὰς καρδίας. *Let vs liſte vp our Hartes.* **And** Chryſoſtome ſaith, Clamamus in conſpectu Sacrificij, Surſum Corda: *Wee crie alowde in the ſighte of the oblation,* Liſte vp your Hartes. S. Auguſtine **ſaithe,** Surſum Corda habeamus. Si Reſurrexiſtis cum Chriſto, dicit Fidelibus Corpus, & Sanguinem Domini accipientibus, dicit, Si Reſurrexiſtis cum Chriſto, quæ ſurſum ſunt, ſapite: vbi Chriſtus eſt in dextra Dei ſedens:

Chryſo. ex variis locis in Matthæ. Homil. 9. Aug. in Pſal. 39.

Chriſtes Body in one place.

surſum Corda

Quæ ſurſum ſunt, quærite: non quæ ſuper terram: Let vs lifte vp our Hartes. *If yee be riſen againe with Chriſte, he ſaithe vnto the Faitheful, he ſaithe vnto them, that* receiue the Body, and Bloude of our Lorde, *If yee be riſen againe with Chriſte ſauer thoſe thinges,* that are aboue: *where Chriſte is at the Righte hande of God: Seeke for* the thinges, that be aboue: *not for the thinges, that be in Earthe.* **Againe he ſaithe,** In Sacramentis Fidelium dicitur, vt Surſum Corda habeamus ad Dominum: *At the* Miniſtration of the Sacramentes of the Faitheful, it is ſaide, Let vs lifte vp our Hartes vnto the Lorde.

Auguſt. De Bono Perſeuran. Li. 2. Cap. 13.

Likewiſe againe, Inter Sacra Myſteria Cor habere Surſum iubemur: *In the* time of the Holy Myſteries, *wee are commaunded* to Lifte vp our Hartes.

Auguſt. De Bono Viduitatis. ca. 16.

But, what nede we to rehearſe the Ancient Fathers? Your owne late Newe Doctours haue ſaide the like. And, to leaue the reſte, your owne Manipulus Curatorum, that is to ſaie, the Ordinarie, and Direction of al youre whole Clergie, ſaithe thus, Sacerdos ante Canonem dicit, Surſum Corda: Quaſi dicat, quòd volens ſumere iſtud Sacramentum, debet habere Cor ſuum eleuatum ad Deum: *Before the Canon, the Prieſte ſaithe,* Lifte vp your Hartes: As if he woulde ſaie, who ſo wil receiue this Sacramente, ought to haue his Harte lifted vp vnto God.

Alexander Haſſen. 4. Quæſt. 37 Mem. 1. Artic. 3. Par. 1. Cap. 9.

Theſe woordes be plaine, and can in no wiſe be denied. It were wiſedome, M. Hardinge, in ſutche caſes to auouche nomore, then we knowe. Otherwiſe youre woordes wil goe for Toies.

Howe be it, the matter beinge graunted, that theſe woordes perteine to the Holy Miniſtration, yet if wee woulde reaſon thus, Chriſtes Body is in Heauen. Therefore it is not Really, and Fleaſhely in the Sacramente, **We ſaie,** VVee ſhoulde make a fooliſhe Argumente: Our Rhetorike is better ſtuffe, then our Logike.

This Argument, M. Hardinge, is taken of the Nature of Chriſtes Humanitie: whiche beinge the Very Natural Body of a Man, by the Iudgement of the Ancient Fathers, muſte nedes be in one onely place at one time, and can reache no further. For otherwiſe it were not a Very Natural Mannes Body. Therefore S. Auguſtine **ſaithe,** as he is alleged by Gratian, Corpus Domini, in quo Reſurrexit, in Vno loco eſſe oportet: *The Body of our Lorde, wherein he roſe againe,* muſt needes be in One place.

De Conſ. Diſt. 2. Prima.

Likewiſe againe he ſaithe, Chriſtus ſecundum Præſentiam Corporalem, ſimul & in Sole, & in Luna, & in Cruce eſſe non potuit: *Touchinge Bodily Preſence,* Chriſte coulde not be *in the* Sonne, *in the* Moone, *and vpon the* Croſſe, *al at once.*

Auguſt. contra Fauſtum. Li. 20. Cap. 11.

And againe, Chriſtus vbique eſt, Virtute, non Opere: Diuinitate, non Carne: Chriſte *is euerywhere, By his Power,* not in deede: *By his Godhed,* not by his Fleaſhe.

Augu. Epiſt. 121

Cyril. in Iohan. Lib. 9. Cap. 22.

S. Cyril **ſaithe,** Chriſtus cum Diſcipulis ſuis, etſi non Corpore, tamen Virtute Deitatis ſemper futurus eſt: Chriſte *wil euermore be with his Diſciples, by* the Power of his Diuinitie: althoughe not in his Body. **Therefore, to conclude,** S. Auguſtine **ſaithe,** Videte Aſcendentem: Credite in Abſentem: Sperate Venientem: Tamen per Miſericordiam occultam etiam ſentite Præſentem: *Beholde* Chriſte *Aſcendinge: Beleeue in* Chriſte *beinge* Abſente: *Truſte in* Chriſte, *that ſhal comme againe. And yet by his* Priuie Mercie feele him Preſente. **Beleeue, ſaithe** S. Auguſtine, **in Chriſte, beinge now** Abſente, **and not here.**

Augu. in Pſa. 46

Thus the Ancient Catholique Fathers were bolde reuerently to reaſon of Chriſtes Humanitie: yet was not M. Hardinge yet borne, that ſhoulde ſo bitterly charge them with Fooliſhe Argumentes. **Nay, rather** Ruffinus **ſaithe,** Stulta adinuentio Calumniæ eſt, Corpus Humanum aliud eſſe putare, quàm Carnem: *It is but a* Fooliſh *finding of a Cauil, to ſaie,* that the Body of a Man, is any other thing, then Fleaſhe.

Ruffin. in Hieronym. Inuectiua Prior.

But Chryſoſtome **ſaithe,** Chriſte *is whole here, and whole there.* **But** Chryſoſtome **in the ſame place many waies expounderh his whole meaninge: For thus he ſaithe, if it woulde haue pleaſed M. Hardinge to haue ſeene his woordes,** Offerimus quidem, ſed ad Recordationem facientes Mortis eius: Hoc Sacrificium Exemplar illius eſt: Hoc, quod nos facimus, in Commemorationem fit eius, quod factum eſt. Idipſum ſemper offerimus: Magis autem Recordationem Sacrificij Operamur: *Wee offer in deede: But in* Remembrance *of his Deathe. This Sacrifice is a* Token, *or* Figure *of that Sacrifice. The thinge, that wee doo, is donne in* Remembrance *of that thinge, that was*

Chryſo. in Epiſt. ad Heb. Hom. 17

donne

Christes Body in one place. Artic. 6. Diuis. 8

danne before. VVee offer alwaie the same thinge (**that Christe offered**). *Nay rather, wee woorke the* Remembrance *of that Sacrifice* (**that Christe offered**). **Notwithstandinge, to spare time, this Obiection is answeared moze at large in my Fozmer Replie to M. Hardinge.**

But, whereas M. Hardinge saithe, Christes Body is as fully here, as it is in Heauen, concerninge the Substance, as Chrysostome saithe, **He would, vnder the name of that Holy Father, wilfully warrante a greate Untruthe. Foz** Chrysostome saithe not, Christes *Body is Presente in Substance:* **He hathe no sutche woꝛdes: He saithe not so: He saith the contrarie: as namelye, where he saithe, as it is befoze alleged,** *The very Body of* Christe it selfe is not in the Holy Vesselles: *but the Mysterie, or Sacramente thereof is there conteined.*

Chrysostom. in Matth. Homi. 11.

Touchinge these woꝛdes, Onlesse ye can diuise a Newe Grammare, and make Susum, **to be** Deorsum, **and contrarie to Nature, turne al thinges vpsidedowne, and thus make youre Construction,** Surſum Corda, Looke downewarde, **they will but meanely make foz youre pourpose.** S. Hierome saithe, Secundus Aduentus Saluatoris in Gloria demonstrandus est. Stultum est ergo illum in paruo, aut abscondito loco quærere, qui totius est Mundi Lumen: *The Seconde comminge of our Sauceour shalbe declared in Glorie. Seeinge therefore he is the Lighte of the Worlde,* it is greate folie, to seeke him in any smal Corner. **Here, M. Hardinge, S.** Hierome **saithe,** *It is greate folie to seeke* Christe, *as you seeke him.*

Hieronym. in Matthæ cap. 14.

The Apologie, Cap. 14. Diuision. 3.

Cyrillus saithe, when wee comme to receiue theise Mysteries, al grosse imaginations muste quite be banniſhed.

M. Hardinge.

VVhy doo yee not by your quotation directe vs to the place, where this saieinge of Cyril maye be founde? * Know ye not that wee haue good cause to suspecte your dealinge? Doo we not almoste euerywhere finde you in manifest lies? If yee meane plaine Truthe, why deale ye not plainely? Christes saieinge must needes be true, VVho euil dooth, hateth light. Bicause ye knewe the place maketh directly againste you, and subuerteth your whole Sacramentarie Doctrine, yee thoughte it good policie, to take a woorde or twoo for your pourpose, and leaue the reste, trustinge it should not be espied. VVherein yee doo like the Scorpion, that casteth foorthe his venim with the spirte of his taile, and foorthewith creepeth awaie into a hole. VVoulde God as ye abuse the name of Cyril, so yee woulde stande to the Truth by him euen in that place, which yee allege, Substantially declared. VVho listeth to see the place, let him reade Cyrilles answeare to Theodorites reprehension of the eleuenth Anathematisme againste Nestorius. There he sheweth, that Nestorius destroied the meane of the Vnion of bothe Natures in Christe, to the intente the Body of Christe might be founde but a common Body as men haue, and not a Body proper of the VVoorde, hauing power to viuificate, or quicken al thinges. (a) For Nestorius diuided Christe, and taughte the VVoorde to be the Sonne of God, not of Marye: and Christe Man the Sonne of Mary onely, as Man: and dissolued the whole mysterie of the incarnation so, as Christe shoulde be an other certaine Sonne beside the VVoorde. And becawse the (b) Nature of Godhed cannot be eaten, thereof he talked vainely, and prophanely, that in the Sacrament we eate Fleasshe, and not Godhed. For confutation of this detestable Heresie, Cyril bringeth him to the consideration of the Blessed Sacramente, and opposeth him, whether he thoughte, that in the Sacrament Christe beinge (by his Doctrine) Man besides God the VVoorde, wee eate a man, as one would saie, after suche sorte, as the Barbarous people of the newe founde Lande America, called Caniballes, eate one an other. But becawse that were absurde, and beastly, Cyril saith that we eate not a common Body, though the nature of Godhed (c) properly be not eaten, but that Body which is *Propriũ verbi*, the proper Body of the VVoorde, whiche quickeneth al thinges, by receiuinge whereof (d) we receiue whole Christe, God, and Man. And here Cyril laieth to Nestorius charge, as though he draue menne to grosse cogitations touchinge this Sacramente. The woordes be these: *Num hominis comestionem, &c.* VVhat dooste thou pronounce this our Sacramente to be eatinge of a man (the Greeke is ἀνθρωποφαγίαν) and driuest vnreuerently the Minde of them as haue beleued vnto grosse imaginations, and attemptest with humaine imaginations, to treate of those things, which are attained by an onely, pure, and exquisite Faith? These be the grosse imaginations, which Cyril would to be banniſhed at the receiuinge of this Sacrament, and that we eate the Body of Christe, not as beinge a common Body, as the Body of euery mortal Man: And though the Nature of Godhed be not eaten, that yet wee eate that Body, whiche is the proper Body of the VVoorde, that quickeneth al thinge. Nowe as (e) wee haue not that grosse imagination of eatinge a common Body, (whiche of the Greekes, by a terme plainer to the learned, is called ἀνθρωποφαγία) when wee receiue this Sacramente: so it is euidente by Cyril, that in the same (f) wee eate verily, and in deede the Body of Christe, the VVoorde incarnate.

Cyril guilefully alleged. Iohan. 5.

The place of Cyril turned vp. on the Defenders.

The Heresie of Nestorius.

The grosse imaginations that Cyril woulde to be eschewed in receiuinge the blessed Sacramente.

(a) Nestorius Heresie stoode neither in Transubstantiation, nor in Real Presence.

(b) The meaninge is this: VVee cannot be fedde, or nourished by Christe, as he is in his Diuine Nature: but only by the Faithe that wee haue in his Fleasshe Crucified.

(c) Vntruthe, guilesfully enclosed: for neither the Fleash of Christe in proper speache can be Eaten.

(d) VVe receiue whole Christe, God, and Man, not with our Mouthe, but by Faithe, and Sprite.

(e) A fond euasion. For the grosseneſſe herof stoode not in Christes Body, but in the manner of Eatinge.

(f) VVith our mouthe we receiue Onely the Sacramente: with our Faith wee eate the

Apud Cyrillum.

*This is a quainte cast of M. Hardinge.

Body of Christe Incarnate, verily, & in deede.

incarnate. For otherwise his saieinges had not made oughte againste the Heresie of Nestorius. And thus receiuinge Christes Body in the Sacramente, wee receiue it truely, and with Faithe, and without grosse imaginations. Al this weighed, howe proue yee nowe, Christe to be so lodged in Heauen, that notwithstanding his owne VVoorde, (g) wee lacke him here in these Holy Mysteries? But let vs consider your other Authorities.

(g) O fonde grossenesse. VVee lacke not Christe: Althoughe wee haue him not Fleashely Presente in our mouthes.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Touchinge the quotation in the Margine, escaped in the Printe, that faulte, I truste, shalbe amended. But howe wil you amende youre faulte, M. Hardinge, so often allegeinge sutche thinges, as youre Conscience knoweth, to be moste Untrue? I wil not wander farre, to put you in minde. In the laste line of your Former Diuision, ye auouche that vpon Chrysostome, that, you knowe, Chrysostome neuer, neither Wrote, nor meante. As for the manifeste Lies, wherewith ye so sharpely, and so often charge vs, thoughe there were some Truthe in your chalenge, as there is none, yet mighte not we therein in any wise compare with you. Concerninge the affiance, ye woulde farme to haue in theise woordes of Cyril, ye thoughte it good skil, thus to crowe out with somme courage before the fighte.

In what sense the Godhed maie be eaten, or not eaten, I haue already saide so

Artic. 8 Diui. 16.

mutche, as then seemed sufficiente, in my Former Replie to your Firste Answeare. The meaninge of Cyrillus is this, We cannot, neither knowe, nor beleeue on, nor feede vpon the Diuine Maiestie of God, as it is pure, and Simple, and in it selfe: But al our knowledge, and al our Faithe, whiche is our Spiritual Feedinge, and Life, is deriued vnto vs throughe Jesus Christe, and standeth onely, and wholy in this, that the Sonne of God hathe taken the Very Nature, and Substance of our Corruptible Fleashe, & ioined the same in One Persone vnto his Godhed. Therefore S. Hilarie saithe, Cognitus fieri Deus hominibus, nisi assumpto Homine, non potuit. Quia Incognoscibilem cognoscere, nisi per Naturam nostram, Natura nostra non potuit: God coulde not be knowen *vnto menne, but by the Receiuinge of Man vnto him. For God that surmounteth al knowledge, Our* Nature *coulde not knowe, but by the meane of our* Nature. So saithe S. Augustine, Quærebam viam comparandi roboris, quod esset idoneum ad fruendum te: Nec inueni, donec amplecterer Mediatorem Dei, & Hominum, Hominem Christum Iesum: *I soughte a waie, to geate strengthe, whereby I might be hable to enioie thee: But I founde it not, before that I* embraced Iesus Christe, which is the Mediatour betweene God, and Man. Againe he saithe, Christus Cibum, cui capiendo inualidus eram, miscuit Carni: Quoniam Verbum Caro factum est, vt infantiæ nostræ lacteseceret Sapientia tua: Christe tempered, and mingled *his Meate (whiche is his Godhed)* with his Fleashe: *which Godhed otherwise I was not hable to receiue.* For the VVoorde was made Fleashe, *that thy Wisedome (ô God) mighte becomme* milke *vnto our* childehoode.

Hila. in Psal. 143

Augustin. Confessionū, Li. 7. ca. 18

Nestorius Heresie stoode not either in Transubstantiation, or in Real Presence: but onely in the dissolution of the Personne of Christe, in that he diuided the Manhed of Christe from his Godhed: and so concluded in the ende, that Christe was onely a bare Natural Man, in al respectes, as others were. If it had benne so, then coulde we not haue benne saued by the Deathe of Christe, nomore then by the Deathe of Codrus, and Decius: who beinge nothinge els, but Very Natural Menne, gaue them selues to Deathe for the saferie of theire Countries. Neither coulde we beleeue in Christe Crucified: that is to saie, we coulde not Eate, nor Feede vpon the Body of Christe, or haue Life by it. Cyrillus saithe, Quomodo purgabit nos ab operibus mortuis? Sanguis enim Communis Hominis nihil habet maius, quam Sanguis Tauri, aut Hirci: *Howe then shal Christ deliuer vs from deadly woorkes? For the Blonde of a* Common Man *hathe nothinge more* (to worke Saluation) *then the Blonde of a* Bulle, *or a* Goate. And therefore the same Cyril imagineth Christe thus to saie: Mortalem Carnem assumpsi: Sed quia Naturaliter Vita existens habito in ea, totam ad meam Vitam reformaui: *I haue taken Mortal Fleashe vpon mee selfe. But, for as mutche, as I* Naturally *beinge Life, dwel in the same,* I haue reformed that whole Fleashe vnto my Life. So saithe Leo, Verus venerator Dominicæ Passionis, sic Crucifixum Iesum Oculis Cordis aspiciat, vt illius Carnem suam esse cognoscat:

Hieronym. ad Ephesios. cap. 1

Cyrillus ad Reginas: ex Epist. ad Hebræ.

Cyril. in Iohan. Lib. 4. cap. 18.

Leo de Passione Domini, Serm. 13

Let

Spiritual Eatinge.

Let the true Woorshipper of our Lordes Passion so beholde Christe Crucified with the eies of his harte, that he maie vnderstande, that the Fleashe of Christe is his Fleashe. But hereof, I trowe, M. Hardinge will moue no greate question.

Further it is fully confessed of either side, that wee by Faithe Eate the very Body of Christe, not as the Body of any other Common Natural Man, but as the Body of the Sonne of God: and, that the same Body so eaten by Faithe, and none otherwise, geueth Life. But, howe that Body maie be Eaten, therein standeth the whole doubte. Hereunto S. Cyril answereth thus: Num Hominis Comestionem hoc nostrum Sacramentum pronuntias? Et irreligiose ad Crassas Cogitationes vrges mentem eorum, qui crediderunt? Et attentas humanis rationibus tractare ea, quæ Sola, Pura, & Exquisita Fide accipiuntur? *Dooest thou saie, that our Sacrament is the* Eatinge of a Man? *And dooest thou vnreuerently, and without Religion force the minde of the Faithful* vnto grosse (and Fleashely) cogitations? *And goest thou aboute with Natural imaginations to deale those thinges, that be receiued* by Onely, Pure, and Perfite Faithe? Cyril. Anathe. matismo. 11.

Onely by Faithe.

These woordes seme plaine, and free from quarrel. Yet hereof maie growe an other doubte. For, by M. Hardinges Judgemente, to thinke, that Christes Body is to be receiued into our Mouthes, and Bellies, is no manner grosse Imagination. But wee saie, as Cyrillus saithe, to auoide al suche vncomely, and Fleashely Vanities, Christes Body, and Bloude, are a Spiritual foode, and must be receiued, not with Mouthe, or Teethe, but with Onely, Pure, and Perfite Faithe.

Concerninge M. Hardinges fantasie, Pope Nicolas vnder a Solemne Protestation woulde haue vs to saie, Ego Corde, & Ore, profiteor, non tantùm Sacramentum, sed etiam Corpus Christi in Veritate, sensualiter manibus Sacerdotum tractari, frangi, & dentibus Fidelium atteri: *I professe with Harte, and Mouthe, that, not onely the Sacramente, but also the Body of Christe it selfe in very Truthe, and in deede is* sensibly touched *and* broken *with the Priestes* handes, and torne with the Teethe of the Faitheful. But this talke is so fonde, and so vtterly voide of discretion, that the very Barbarous Glose is faine to control it in this sorte: Nisi sanè intelligas (ista) Verba Berengarij, in maiorem incides Hæresim, quàm ipse habuit: *Onlesse thou wisely vnderstande these Woordes of* Berengarius, *thou wilt falle into a greatter* Heresie, *then euer he helde any*. De Conf. Dist. 2. Ego Berengarius

S. Cyrilles woordes be plaine, Sola, Pura, & Exquisita Fide accipiuntur: *These thinges be receiued* (not by Mouthe, but) *by* Onely, Pure, *and* Perfite Faithe. Likewise againe he saithe, Initium, & Fundamentum in Sanctificationem, & Iustitiam, Christus est, per Fidem, scilicet, & non aliter. Hoc enim modo in nobis habitat: Christe *is the Beginninge, and Fundation vnto Holinesse, and Righteousnesse: I meane* by Faithe, and none otherwise. For by Faithe Christe dwelleth in vs. So saithe Clemens Alexandrinus, Hoc est Bibere Iesu Sanguinem, participem esse incorruptionis eius: *This is the* Drinkinge of the Bloude of Iesus, *to be made partetaker of his immortalitie*. Origene saithe, Est ergo ipse vulneratus: Cuius nos Sanguinem bibimus, id est, Doctrinæ eius verba suscipimus: *He was wounded*, whoes Bloude wee Drinke, *that is to saie*, the wordes of whoes Doctrine wee receiue.

Sola, Pura, Exquisita Fide. Cyril. in Iohan. Lib. 4. Cap. 39. Clemens in Pædagogo. Lib. 2. Cap 2. Origen in Numer. Homil. 16.

But, what is there so plaine, as these woordes of Athanasius? Quot Hominibus sufficisset Corpus eius ad Cibum, vt Vniuersi Mundi alimonia fieret? Propterea Ascensionis suæ in Cœlum mentionem fecit, vt eos à Corporali intellectu abstraheret: *Vnto howe many menne coulde Christes Body haue sufficed for Meate, that he shoulde be the Foode of al the Worlde? Therfore he made mention of his Ascension into Heauen: that he might* withdrawe them from Corporal, and Fleashely vnderstandinge. Athana. in illud Euangelij: Quicunque dixerit verbum.

Here, M. Hardinge, I beseeche you, telle vs by the waie, when wee teache vs, that Christes Body is Fleashely presente: that it is receiued into the Mouthe: that it is chewed, and bruised with Teethe: and that it passeth further into the Belly, howe do you withdrawe our mindes from Fleashely, and Corporal vnderstandinge? If this Eatinge be Spiritual, what Eatinge maie be coumpted Corporal? If this be Ghostely, what is Fleashely?

Hereof S. Augustine saithe thus, Cùm videritis Filium Hominis Ascendentem, vbi erat priùs, Certè vel tunc videbitis, quòd non eo modo, quo putatis, erogat Corpus suum: Augusti. in Iohan. Tractat. 27.

ſuum: Certè vel tunc intelligetis, quòd Gratia eius non conſumitur morſibus: *When yee ſhal ſee the Sonne of Man Aſcendinge vp, where he was before. Then ſhal yee ſee, that he geueth not his body* (to be Eaten) in ſutche ſorte, as you imagine: *Then ſhal yee vnderſtand, that his* Grace is not conſumed by morſelles. And therefore againe he ſaithe, Nolite Fauces parare, ſed Cor: *Prepare not your* lawes, *but your* Harte.

Auguſt. de Verbis Dom. Secũd. Luc. Sermon. 33.

This is the Very, True, Spiritual, and Onely Eatinge of Chriſtes Body: and, what ſo euer fantaſie M. Hardinge hathe diuiſed beſides, of his Mouthe, and Teethe, is, as S. Cyril ſaithe, a Vaine, Vnreuerende, Groſſe, and Fleaſhely Imagination.

The Apologie, Cap. 14. Diuiſion. 4.

The Councel of Nice, as it is alleged by ſome in Greeke, plainely forebiddeth vs to be baſely affectioned, or bente towarde the Breade, and Wine, whiche are ſette before vs.

M. Hardinge.

As for the former parte of the ſentence, whiche ye bringe out of the Nicene Councel, (a) ſoundeth nothinge againſte the Catholikes, (for they alſo teache the ſame): (a) ſo the later parte is directly contrary to your Doctrine, whiche yee thought good to leaue out, leaſt thereby yee ſhoulde haue marred your whole matter. Suche nippinge, and roundinge of ſentences hathe euer benne taken for a marke to knowe Herenikes by. Among wiſe men ſuche practiſe woorthily bringeth you into ſuſpicion of Vntruthe. The woordes of the Councel truely reported be theſe: Let vs not at the Diuine Table baſely beholde the Breade and Cuppe ſette before vs: but liftinge vp our minde, let vs by Faith vnderſtande on that Holy Table to be laide the Lambe of God, that taketh awaie the ſinnes of the worlde, of prieſtes Sacrificed vnbloudely. And receiuinge his precious Body, and Bloude verily, let vs beleue theſe to be the pledges of our Reſurrection. For in conſideration hereof we take not muche, but a litle, that wee maie knowe, wee receiue not to fillinge (of the Body) but to Sanctimonie. Take the ende with the beginninge, and what maketh this Decree of that Holy Councel for defenſe of your Sacramentarie Doctrine? And here, who be more baſely affectioned and bente towarde the thinges ſette on that Table, yee that make them but Breade, and VVine, or wee, that after Conſecration, beleue vnder the formes of Breade, and VVine verily to be made Preſente the Body, and Bloude of Chriſte? VVhether is a baſer exercise, to feede on (b) common Breade, and VVine, and to dwel in the iudgement of the ſenſes, or to eate the very Fleaſhe of Chriſt, the Breade of Life, that came downe from Heauen, to immortalitie of the Body, and Soule, to forſake the ſenſes, and folowe the vnderſtandinge of (c) Faithe? VVel wee agree with you, not to be ouer baſely intente to the Breade, and Cuppe. But why doo not ye performe that, as followeth there after your owne allegation out of that Councel? VVhy doo yee not with thoſe 318. Holy Fathers, and with the whole Churche of Chriſte vnderſtande by Faithe on that Holy Table to be laid the Lambe of God, that taketh awaie the ſinnes of the worlde? VVhy doo yee not recante your wicked Doctrine againſte the Bleſſed Sacrifice of the Maſſe? Reade the whole ſentence, ioininge the ende to the beginninge. Saie not al thoſe Holy and Learned Fathers, the Lambe of God, on this Sacred Table (they meane the Aultar) to be Sacrificed of the Prieſtes vnbloudely? Againe, why bringe ye the Chriſten people from the Body of Chriſt whereby they are redeemed, to a (d) bare peece of Breade, teachinge it to be but the Figure of his Body? Saieth not this Councel, that wee receiue the precious, Body, and Bloude of our Lorde (e) ἀληθῶς, that is, verily, and in deede, (f) whereby in deede al your Tropes, and Figures be quite excluded? Againe, if theſe were but Breade, and VVine, as yee teache, woulde the Councel ſaie, that we take them not to ſacietie, but to Sanctimonie and Holineſſe? VVhat Holineſſe can wee haue of Breade, and VVine? VVhat Holineſſe obteine wee not by eatinge of the Body of Chriſte, beinge the proper Body of the VVoorde, or God the VVordes owne Body, that hathe Power to viuificate, and quicken al thinges? Thu[illegible]e comme within you, Defenders, as it were, and claſpinge with you, wringe youre (g) weapon o[illegible]t of your handes, and with the tother ende of it ſtrike you downe. As it is not harde to vs by Learninge to ouerthrowe you, ſo wee beſeeche God to ſtrike downe the pride, and ſtubbernesſe of your hartes, as he did Paule, wherewith ye reſiſte the manifeſt Truthe.

(a) Vntruthes, two togeather. Reade the Anſweare.

A marke to knowe Herenikes by.

The woordes of the Nicene Councel truely reported.

(b) Vntruthe, vile, and ſclaunderous: VVee feede not vpon Common Breade, and VVine: VVee feede vpon the Very Body, and Bloud of Chriſt

(c) Your Faithe, without Gods VVoorde, is no Faithe.

(d) Vntruth. For wee teache neither bare Bread nor bare Figure Reade the Anſweare.

(e) VVe receiue Chriſte Verily, and in deede: al though neither Fleaſhely, nor with bodily mouthe.

(f) Vntruth: For the Learned Doctours, and Fathers vſed commonly the ſame Tropes, and Figures.

All Tropes & Figures of the Sacramentaries be excluded by Verdict of the Nicene Councel.

(g) O braue Captaine.

Acts.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

We allege this place, although briefly, yet ſimply, and truely, and without any manner fraude, or guile. But if roundinge, and clippinge of the Holy Fathers be the marke of an Heretique, as it is here auouched, then haue we one marke more whereby to knowe M. Hardinge. For this is his ordinarie vſage, and practiſe of courſe.

Touchinge either the Beginninge, or the Ende of this Decree, there is no cauſe, wherefore any Woorde therein written ſhoulde of our parte be diſſembled. The Holy Fathers in that Councel teache vs, vtterly to withdrawe our eies from the Breade, and Wine, beinge nothinge els, but Creatures tranſitorie, and corruptible: and by Faithe to beholde the very Body of Chriſte, whiche is Repreſented in the

The Lãbe laide vpon the Table.

in the Mysteries. To like purpose S. Augustine saithe, as it is alleged before, Ea demùm est Miserabilis animæ Seruitus, Signa pro Rebus accipere: & supra Creaturam Corpoream oculum Mentis ad hauriendum Aeternum Lumen leuare non posse: *This is the* Miserable Bondage of the Soule, to take the Signes in steede of the thinges, that be Signified: *and not to be hable to lifte vp the eie of the Minde, aboue the Corporal Creature, to receiue the Lighte Euerlastinge.* And therefore immediately before the Holy Ministration, the Priestе saithe vnto vs, as it is saide before, Lifte vp your Hartes. In this sorte the same Fathers spake of the Water of Baptisme: Baptisma nostrum Oculis Sensibilibus spectandum non est, sed Oculis intellectus. Vides Aquam? Cogita Vim, & Potestatem Dei, quæ in Aquis latet: *Our Baptisme maie not be considered with the Sensible, or Bodily Eies, but with the Inner Eies of the Minde. Seest thou the Water? Thinke of the Mighte, and Power of God,* that lieth hidden in the VVater. Thus, as in the One Sacramente, they withdrawe vs from the Water, euen so in the Other Sacramente, they withdrawe vs from the Breade.

Augustin. De Doctrina Christiana. Lib. 3. cap. 5.

Concil. Niceн. ὕδωρ ὁρᾷς: νόησον πῦρ ἐν τοῖς ὕδασι κρυπτόμενον τὴν θεῖαν δύναμιν.

But it followeth in the same Decrée, *Lette vs by Faithe vnderstande, on that Holy Table to be laide the Lambe of God, that taketh awaie the Sinnes of the Worlde.* If the Ancient Fathers, to the ende to sturre vp, and to enflame the Hartes of the people, had not sommetime vsed vehemente phrases, and extraordinarie kindes of Speache, M. Hardinge mighte many times spare his penne, and kepe silence. But he dothe the Fathers great wronge, that presseth onely their bare wordes, and dissembleth their meaninge. Gregorie Nyssene S. Basiles Brother discretely, and learnedly openeth this whole mater. Thus he writeth: Cùm in habitudine loci alicuius, vel negotij in loco existentis, intelligibilium aliquod extiterit, Abusiuè id ibi esse dicimus, propter operationem eius, quæ ibi est, locum pro habitudine, & operatione accipientes. Cùm enim dicere deberemus, Ibi Operatur, dicimus, Ibi est: *When any Spiritual thinge is in the consideration of sомme place, or els in consideration of sомme mater beeinge in a place, Wee saie, the same Spiritual thinge is there, by an Abuse, or by an Extraordinarie vse of speache: bicause of the effecte of that Spiritual thinge, that there is wroughte: takinge the place in steede of Consideration, or Wookinge in the Place. For, where wee shoulde saie,* There it VVoorketh, *thus wee saie,* There it is. Euen so where as these Fathers shoulde haue saide, The Effectes, or Graces, that wée haue by Christes Body, are laide before vs vpon the Table, by Abuse of Speache they saie, the Body of Christe is laide vpon the Table. Likewise saithe Gratian, Quidam non improbabiliter exponunt, Carnis, & Sanguinis Veritatem, Ipsam eorundem efficientiam, hoc est, Remissionem Peccatorum: *Somme menne not without good reason, by the* Truthe of Christes Fleashe, and Bloude, *vnderstande the Effecte, or Woorkinge of the same, that is to saie, the Remission of Sinnes.*

Cregor. Nyssen. De Anima, ca. 11

De Cons. Dist. 1 Species.

And as these Fathers saie, *Christe is Laide vpon the Table,* euen so, by like phrase of speache, S. Gregorie saithe, *Christe is Killed vpon the Table:* Christus iterum in hoc Mysterio moritur: Eius Caro in populi salutem patitur: *Christe dieth againe in this Mysterie: His Fleashe suffereth for the Saluation of the people.* So saithe Chrysostome, Vt in Cœlo cœlatur Deus, sic in Scripturis absconditur. Non omnes intelligunt Deum Veritatis, positum in Scripturis: *As God is couered in Heauen, so is he couered in the Scriptures. Almenne vnderstande not God, that is laide in the Scriptures.* So saithe Athanasius, Est etiam in Verbis Scripturarum Dominus: *Our Lorde is in the Woordes of the Scriptures.* So saithe S. Hierome, Supra nudam metuis humum exesa Ieiunijs membra collidere. Sed Dominus tecum iacet: *Thou arte afraide to laie thy Body, worne out with Fastinge, vpon the bare grounde. Yet the Lorde Lieth there with thee.* Againe, Nudus, atque esuriens ante fores nostras Christus in paupere moritur: *Christe naked, and hungrie, lieinge before our gate, dieth in the poore.*

De Cons. Dist. 2. Quid sit.

Chrys. in Matth. Homil. 4.

Athana. De Interpreta. Psalm.

Hieronym. De Vita Eremitica, Hieronym. ad Gaudentium.

And to leaue other like sayinges, and sentences of the Anciente Fathers, Pope Adrian saithe in youre late Councel of Nice, In Scripturis Sanctarum Imaginum Agnus Præcursoris digito ostensus, depingitur: *In the Scriptures of the Holy Images, is painted the Lambe of God, that* Iohn *Baptiste shewed with his finger.*

De Cons. Dist. 3 Sextam Sancta.

These sayinges muste be qualified with a gentle Exposition: and maie not be racked

racke extremely to the sounde, and rigoure of the Letter. Chrysostome thus expoundeth theise wordes of S. Paule to the Galathians: Quibus Christus ante Oculos
Chryso. in Epis. ad Galat. Cap. 3 priùs depictus erat, in vobis Crucifixus. Atqui Christus non apud Galathas, sed Hierosolymis fuit Crucifixus. Quomodo igitur dicit, in vobis? Vt ostendat vim Fidei, quæ potest etiam procul disita cernere: indicans, quòd illi oculis Fidei, exactiùs cernerent, quàm nonnulli, qui præsentes adfuerant, eaque, quæ gerebantur, conspexerant: *Vnto whom Christe was painted out, and Crucified emonge you before your Eies. Yet was not Christe Crucified in Galathia, but at Hierusalem. Howe then saithe S. Paule vnto the* Galathians, Christe was Crucified emongst you? *His meaninge was, to shewe the* strengthe of Faithe, whiche is hable to see thinges, thoughe they be farre awaie: *and that they by the Eies of Faithe, sawe the Deathe of Christe more plainely, and perfitely, then many, that were presente at his Deathe, and sawe al that was donne.*

Thus the Fathers in this Councel saide, Christes Body is laide foorthe vpon the Communion Table, that is, not vnto our bodily Eies, or senses, but vnto the eies of our Faithe: I meane by waie of a Mysterie, or Sacramente: but not verily, or in deede. In this sense S. Augustine saithe vnto the people, Vos estis in Mensa: Vos
De Con. Dist. 2. Quia passus. estis in Calice: *You are laide vpon the Table: You are in the Cuppe.* As the people is laide vpon the Table, so is Christes Body laide vpon the Table: And as the people is in the Cuppe, so is Christes Bloude in the Cuppe. The people is there by waie of a Mysterie: euen so is Christes Body and Bloude there by waie of a Mysterie, and none otherwise. Thus, M. Harding, wee withdrawe not ỳ people of God, as pe vntruely saie, from Christes Body to a pece of Breade: But rather wee leade them, as the Anciente Fathers euer did, from the Creature of Breade, to the Beholdinge, Receiuinge, and Eatinge of Christes very Body, and Bloude.

In what sorte, and sense Christe is nowe Vnbloudily Sacrificed by the Priestе,
Art. 17. Diuis. 14. for shortenesse sake, gentle Reader, I muste referre thee vnto my Former Replie to M. Hardinge.

Howe the Holy Mysteries be pledges of our Resurrection, it hathe partely bene saide before, and partely shalbe saide hereafter more at large.

Howe wee maie receiue the Body of Christe in deede, and verily, without either Transubstantiation, or Real Presence, I haue bothe touched before in this
Artic. 4. Diuis. 8 Treatie, and also in my Former Replie. Certainely S. Augustine saithe, The Receiuinge of Christes Body in deede, and the Receiuinge of the Sacramente, are sondrie thinges. Thus he writeth, Ostendit Christus, quid sit, non Sacramento tenus,
Augustī. De Ciuit. Li. 21. Ca. 21. sed re vera Corpus Christi Manducare, & eius Sanguinem Bibere: *Christe sheweth, what it is, to Eate his Body, and to Drinke his Bloude*, not by waie of Sacramente, but verily, and in deede. For the Eatinge of the Sacrament with Mouthe, and Teethe, is not the very True Eating of Christes Body: but a token, or Mysterie of the same. S. Augustine saithe, Qui Manducat Intus, non Foris: qui Manducat in Corde, non qui premit Dente: *He, that Eateth* VVithin, *not he, that Eateth* VVithout: *He, that Eateth*
Augustin. in Iohan. Tract. 26. (Christes Body) in his Harte, *not he that bruiseth* (the Sacramente) with his Toothe. Who so by Faithe receiueth the Body of Christe, receiueth it Substantially, Really, Verily, and in deede: and dwelleth in Christe, and Christe in him. Thus is Christes Body receiued, as these Holy Fathers saie, not to the filling, or contentation of the Body, but vnto the Holinesse, and Sanctification of the minde.

Thus yee comme within vs, M. Hardinge, as pe saie: and claspe with vs: and ouerthrowe vs by Learninge: and wringe our weapon out of our handes: and with the other ende thereof yee strike vs downe. Me thinketh, I heare one saie, Denique metuebant Omnes iam me:
Theoph. in Eunucho. If some handsome Gnato stode by you, I trowe, wee should haue a prety plaie. But vnsensible menne are wee, that feele none of these deadly blowes. I wil answeare you, as S. Augustine sommetime answeared Pascentius the Arian Heretique, Facile
Augustī. ad Pascent. Epist. 174. est, vt quisque Augustinum vincat: videris, vtrum Veritate, an Clamore: *It is an easie matter to ouercome* Augustine: *But see you, whether it be by* Truthe, *or by* noise of woordes. And againe, Non bonum Homini est, Hominem vincere: Sed bonum est Homini, vt cum Veritas vincat volentem: quia malum est Homini, vt eum Veritas vincat inuitum,

tum. Nam ipsa vincat necesse est, siue negantem, siue confitentem: *It is not good for a man, to conquere a man: but it is good for a man, that the* Truthe maie Conquere him with his good wil. *For it is il for a man, that the Truthe shoulde conquere him againste his wil. But whether he wil, or wil not,* the Truthe muste needes Conquere him.

To Receiue, or Beare Christe.

The Apologie, Cap. 14. Diuision. 5.

And, as Chrysostome very aptely writeth, wee saie, that the Body of Christe is the Deade Carkesse, and vvee our selues muste be the Egles: meaninge thereby, that wee muste flie on highe, if wee wil comme to the Body of Christe. For this Table, as Chrysostome saithe, is a Table of Egles, and not of Iaies. Cyprian also: This Breade, saithe he, is the foode of the Soule, and not the meate of the Belly.

M. Hardinge.

In deede Chrysostome saithe, as ye reporte. But Sirs, what meane ye? To Eate the Body of Christ, whiche is the deade Carcas, in respecte of his deathe (for onlesse he had fallen, wee had not risen againe) muste wee so be Egles, as we vse no office of mans Body to this kinde of Eatinge? Muste wee flie so hie, as we looke not to finde this Body in Earthe? Can wee not Eate this Body, excepte wee flie vp to Heauen? Can we not come by it, but there? Can we not Eate him, but there? Yes forsothe. (a) VVee needs not goe out of the Earthe for the matter. For Chrysostome him selfe in the same Homilie, from whence ye fetche this, saithe, that whiles wee be in this life, this Mysterie is cause, that the (b) Earthe to vs is become Heauen. He that desireth to knowe, what Egles wee muste be, and how hie wee muste flie to come to the Eatinge of this Body woorthely, let Chrysostome euen there expounde Chrysostome. He nameth Egles (saithe he) to shewe, that he muste get him vp on highe, that commeth to this Body, and that he muste haue nothinge to doo with the Earthe, neither be drawen downeward to base thinges, and creape, but alwaies flie vpwarde, and beholde the Sonne of righteousnesse, &c. VVill yee yet heare him more plainely declare, what he meaneth by this highe Egles flight? VVipe awaie (saithe he) all filthe from thy Soule, prepare thy minde to receiue these Mysteries. If the Kinges Childe arraied in purple and Diademe were deliuered vnto thee to beare, wouldest thou not caste downe on the grounde all that thou holdest, and receiue him? But nowe, when thou receiuest not the Kinges Childe, (c) but the onely begotten Sonne of God, tell me, I praie thee, arte not afraide? And doest not caste awaie all loue of worldly thinges, and garnishe thy selfe with him onely, but doest thou yet looke downe on the Earthe, arte thou yet in loue of thy money? arte thou yet geuen to the Earthe? If it be so, what forgeuenesse, what excuse shalte thou finde? This spirituall flyinge vp requireth Chrysostome: and yet in that Homilie he declareth (d) the Body of Christe to be presente here in Earthe, meaninge in this Holy Sacramente, yea that very Body, whiche was Nayled, Beaten, whiche was not ouercome by Deathe, whiche the Sunne seinge Crucified, tourned awaie his beames, for whiche the vaile of the Temple was rente asunder, stones, and all the Earth quaked, the Body that was made al Bloudy, and being thruste in with a speare, powred foorth Fountaines of Bloude and VVater to al the worlde healthful. Thus ye see, howe farre Chrysostome is from your strange Doctrine, concerninge the very and (e) Real presence of Christes Body in the Sacramente of the Aulter. Of whiche Aulter, and of the Sacrifice of that Body made and offered by the Priestes, and of the Adoration due thereto, in that Homilie he speaketh moste plainely. That to proue your ponrpose, yee muste seeke for an other Homilie, whiche yee are neuer like to finde: for Chrysostome serueth not your turne. As neither Cyprian, whome yee alleage, and againste whome, God knoweth. Verely wee confesse with Holy Cyprian, and the Fathers of the Nicene Councel, that the Body of Christe, whiche wee receiue in the blessed Sacrament, is the foode of the Soule, and not common meate to fille the panche. And therefore of the outwarde Formes we take but litle, (f) accordinge to the Nicene Decree, acknowledginge, that spiritual foode to serue to Sanctimonie, not to Sacietie. Lastely ye bringe for you S. Augustine in these woordes.

1. Cor. C. 10. Homil. 24. What Egles muste wee be, and howe hie muste wee flie to come to the Eating of Christes Body.

What is meante by the hie Egles Flight.

Chrysostome acknowledgeth Christes very Body Presente in the Sacrament.

Cyprian alleaged by the Defenders to no purpose.

(a) O Earthly Diuinitie: Then haue you litle to doo in Heauen.

(b) Not by pullinge Christe downe to vs: but by liftinge vp our Hartes to him.

(c) VVith thy Faith, not with thy Mouthe.

(d) Vntruth. For Chrysostome speaketh onely of the Presence of Grace: of this grosse & fleashly Presence, he saith nothinge.

(e) Vntruth. For Chrysostome not once nameth Real Presence. Reade the Answeare.

(f) Vntruth. For the Nicene Councel maketh no mentiō of any sutch Fourmes. And, beinge but idle Fourmes, and Shewes, howe are they a Spiritual foode, or how can they serue to make you Holy.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Here M. Hardinge casteth his colours, to shadowe that thinge, that wil not be hidde. Whereas Chrysostome saithe, *Thou receiuest not the Kinges childe, but the onely begotten Sonne of God*, **he so racketh, and presseth these woordes, as if the Fathers in their writinges had neuer vsed any kinde of Figure: and as if we were bounde vnder paine of damnation, to receiue what sentence so euer they haue spoken, accordinge to the very rigoure, and extremitie of the Letter.**

But the better to disclose the sensible grossenesse of this stroure, I truste, Gentle Reader, **it shal not be, neither paineful, nor vnprofitable for vs, to consider a fewe other sutche examples, and phrases of speache, commonly, and familiarely**

To Receiue, or Beare Christe.

vsed by the Catholique Learned Fathers to like pourpose. Therefore, as Chrysostome saithe, wee receiue in the Holy Mysteries the Onely begotten Sonne of God, meaninge by Faithe Onely, not by Mouthe, euen so he writeth of the Sacramente of Baptisme, Si quis tibi Purpuram, aut Diadema dedisset, nónne præ quouis auro accepisses? Ego verò tibi non Ornatum Regium tribuam, sed ipsum Regem induendum exhibeò. Et quomodò, inquies, Christum poterit quis induere? Audi, quid Paulus dicat: Quotquot in Christum Baptizati estis, Christum induistis: *If any man had geeuen thee a Princely Robe, or a Crowne, wouldest thou not set more by it, then by any Golde? But I wil geeue thee, not a Princely Robe, but* the Prince him selfe, *to put vpon thee. Thou wilte saie, howe maie a man put on Christe vpon him? Heare, what* S. Paule *saithe: As many of you, as are Baptized in Christe, haue put on Christe.* Here Chrysostome teacheth vs, that in Baptisme wée receiue, not onely the Kinges princely Robe, but also the Kinge him selfe.

Chryso. in Epist. ad Colossen. Homil. 10.

S. Cyril saithe, Discant omnes, ne, antequam firmiores sint Catechumeni, Christum eis, antequam oporteat, Baptismi Mysterio commendent: *Let al menne take heede,* that they deliuer not Christe, *in the Sacramente of Baptisme, vnto the Beginners, or Nouices, before they be stronge in the Faithe, and before it be conuenient.*

Cyrill. in Iohan. Lib. 2. Cap. 36.

S. Augustine saithe, Sancti Christum accipiunt in Manu, & in Fronte: *Holy men* receiue Christe *bothe in their Hande, and in their Foreheade.* S. Chrysostome saithe, Adest Sacerdos, non Ignem gestans, sed Spiritum Sanctum: *The Priest is present,* Bearinge, *not Fire, but* the Holy Ghoste.

August. in Apocalyp. Homil. 11. Chrysost. De sacerdot. Lib. 3.

S. Ambrose saithe, Portant in Typo Christi munera: portaturi in Euangelio munerum Largitorem: *They carrie Christes giftes in a Figure: In the Gospel they shal* carrie (Christe him selfe) the geuer of the giftes. And againe, Mortem non timebis, si geras Christum: *Thou shalte not feare Deathe, if* thou beare Christe.

Ambros. De Ioseph o Patriarcha.

Ambros. De Fuga Seculi. Ca. 9.

Athanasius saithe, Apud nos seruatur Puerulus ille, quem Herodes interficere satagebat: The same Childe is keapte emongest vs, *whome Herode laboured so earnestly to destroie.* S. Chrysostome saithe, Credo Apostolo Paulo, Christum in se loquentem circumferenti: *I beleeue the Apostle* Paule, carrieinge Christe aboute speakinge within him.

Athan. Oration. Prima Contra Arianos.

S. Augustine saithe, Concionatores tradunt Christum Discentibus: *The Preachers* deliuer Christe vnto their Learners. S. Cyril saithe, Verum Manna Christus erat: qui per Figuram Mannæ Priscis illis à Deo dabatur: *Christe was the very true Manna: whome vnder the Figure of Manna* God gaue vnto the Fathers *of the Olde Testamente.* It is written in M. Hardinges owne Legende, Christophorus portauit Christum in Humeris, & in Ore per Confessionem: Christopher *bare Christe on his shoulders: and he* bare Christe in his Mouthe by his Confession.

Chrysost. in 2. Timoth. Hom. 2. August. De Doctrina Christiana. Li. 4. Ca. 16. Cyrillus, in Euang. Iohan. Lib. 3. Cap. 34. Historia Longobardica, Legenda. 59.

An other of his Doctours saithe, Christus venditus fuit in Iosepho: Ligatus in Sampsono: Suspensus in Botro, & in Serpente Aeneo: Crucifixus in Isaaco: *Christe* was solde *in Iosephe: He* was bounde *in Sampson: He* was Hanged *vp in the Cluster of Grapes, and in the Brasen Serpente: and he* was Crucified *in Isaac.*

Fortalitium Fidei. Lib. 1.

Chrysostome saithe, Quocunque quis peruenerit, Paulum videbit vbique in omnium Ore circumferri: *Whither so euer a man come, he shal see* Paule carried aboute euery where, in the Mouthe of euery man. And to ende this longe rehearsal, S. Augustine saithe, Detractor Diabolum portat in Lingua: *The Sclaunderer* carrieth the Diuel vpon his tongue.

Chrysostom, ad Populum Antiochen. Homil. 16.

I doubte not, but M. Hardinge wil better bethinke him selfe, and not require vs, to take al these saieinges, without any manner of fauourable exposition, barely, and nakedly, as they lie. Otherwise he must néedes encombre him selfe with a great number of inconueniences.

Augu. De Salutaribus Documentis, Cap. 26.

Of these phrases, and manners of speache, S. Augustine géueth his iudgemente in this sorte: Omnia significantia videntur quodammodò earum rerum, quas Significant, sustinere personas: *Al* Signes, *or* Tokens seeme *in a manner to* beare the persones *of the things them selfe*, that they Signifie. As for example he saithe, Sicut dictum est ab Apostolo. Petra erat Christus: quoniam Petra illa, de qua hoc dictum est, Significabat Christum: *So the Apostle saithe, The* Rocke was Christe: *For that the*

August. De Ciuitate Dei, Lib. 18. Cap. 48.

Rocke,

Rocke, whereof it was spoken, Signified Christe.

Likewise Athanasius **saithe**, Qui Regis Imaginem videt, Regem videt: & dicit, En tibi Regem. Neque tamen duos Reges constituit: neque Imaginem particulam esse Regis, neque Regem particulam Imaginis esse iudicat: *He, that seeth the* Image of a Kinge, seeth the Kinge: *and saithe*, Beholde there is the Kinge. *And yet* (so saieinge) *he maketh not twoo Kinges: Nor thinketh he, either that the Image is a parcel of the Kinge, or that the Kinge is parcel of the Image.* *Athan. Oratio. Contra Gabellij Gregales.*

S. Gregorie **in plainer wise saithe thus**, Eundem Agnum Iohannes ostendendo, Esaias præuidendo, Abel offerendo loquutus est. Et quem Iohannes in ostensione, quem Esaias in loquutione, Hunc Abel Significando in Manibus tenuit: Iohn the Baptiste *by* pointinge *with his finger*, Esaias *by* foreseeinge, Abel *by* offeringe, *spake al three of One Lambe*. **And** Abel by Signifieinge, helde the same Christe in his handes, *whome* Iohn *helde by pointinge, and whome* Esaias *helde by Propheseieinge*. **Againe he saithe**, Intus ad Christum respicit, quem per considerationem portat in Corde: *Inwardely he beholdeth Christe, whom by Meditation he* Beareth in his Harte. *Gregor. in Iob. Lib. 29. Cap. 16.* *Gregor. in 1. Regum. Ca. 2. Li. 2.*

Suche Amplifications, and vehemente, and extraordinarie speaches, notwithstandinge in some cases they maie be dangerous, yet oftentimes they seme necessarie, the better to quicken the dulnesse, and negligence of the people. And therefore Chrysostome **saithe**, *Beholde*, The Lambe of God is slaine: The Bloude euen nowe is drawen from his side: *and the whole people is coloured, and made redde, and Bloudy with the same*: **Not for that it was so in deede: but to lifte vp, and to withdrawe the Hartes of the people, from the outwarde Corruptible Creatures of the Breade, and Wine, to a Spiritual, and Mystical vnderstandinge, that is to saie, to the Eatinge, and Drinkinge of the very Body, and Bloude of Christe. And to that ende he saithe,** Aquilas appellat, vt ostendat, ad alta eum oportere contendere, qui ad hoc Corpus accedit: *He calleth vs* Egles, *to shewe, that* he muste mounte on highe, and flee aloste, *who so wil approche neare to that Body*. **Likewise he saithe**, In Cœlum vocat nos, ad Magni Regis Mensam: Christe calleth vs vp into Heauen, *vnto the Table of the greate Kinge*. **And againe**, Illum Sursum sedentem hic degustamus: *Wee beinge here beneath, taste him* sittinge in Heauen aboue. **So saithe** S. Hierome, Ascendamus cum Domino in Cœnaculum Magnum, stratum, atque mundatum: & accipiamus ab eo Sursum Calicem Noui Testamenti: *Let vs Ascende vp with our Lorde into that greate Dininge Chamber adourned, and made cleane: and* there aboue *let vs receiue of him the Cuppe of the Newe Testamente*. *Chryso. in 1. Corin. Homil. 24.* *Chrysost. ad Popul. Antiochen. Homil. 61.* *Hieronym. ad Hedibiam.*

So saithe S. Augustine, Vbi fuerit Corpus, illuc Congregabuntur Aquilæ, id est, in Cœlum: Illuc Congregabuntur Aquilæ: dictum est de Spiritualibus, qui eius Passionem, Humilitatem q imitando, tanquam de eius Corpore saturantur: *Where as the Carkesse shalbe, thither shal the Egles resorte togeather: that is to saie*, Into Heauen: *Thither shal the Egles resorte togeather: This is spoken of the Spiritual Faitheful menne, that folowinge his Passion, and Humilitie*, be filled, *as it were*, with his Body. *August. Quæst. Euangelicar. Lib. 1. Cap. 42.*

So saithe Leo, Circa hoc Corpus Aquilæ sunt, quæ alis circumuolant Spiritualibus: *Aboute this Body there are* Egles, *that* flee aboute with Spiritual whinges. *De Con. Dist. 2. In quibus.*

Thus are the Faitheful made Egles: **Thus is the** Earthe become Heauen: **Not for that Christes Body is pulled downe, as M. Hardinge imagineth, but for that our mindes, and affections be lifted vp. For so** Chrysostome **him selfe expoundeth his owne meaninge:** Hodiè nobis Terra facta est Cœlum, non stellis de Cœlo in Terram descendentibus, sed Apostolis ad Cœlum Ascendentibus. Quia effusa est Copiosa Gratia Spiritus Sancti: & vniuersum Orbem operata est Cœlum: non immutans Naturam, sed voluntatem emendans: *This daie the Earthe is made Heauen: not by the Starres comminge downe vpon the Earthe: but by the goeinge vp of the Apostles into Heauen. For the aboundante Grace of the Holy Ghoste is powred out, and* hath turned the whole VVorlde into Heauen: not by changinge of Nature, but by correctinge the wil of Man. **Likewise againe he saithe,** Apostoli in Terra constituti, in Cœlo conuersabantur. Et quid dico, in Cœlo? Altiores erant Cœlo: etiam alio Cœlo: Et ad ipsum Dominum peruenerunt: *The Apostles, dwellinge in the Earthe, had theire conuersation* *Chrysost. in Homil. De Pentecoste.* *Chryso. ad Hebræos. Hom. 16.*

To touch, to Holde Chriſte.

in Heauen. But what ſaie I, In Heauen? They were higher then Heauen: yea then the Seconde Heauen: and came euen vnto the Lorde him ſelfe. Againe he ſaithe, Dauid Terram in Cœlum vertit: & Homines facit Angelos: Dauid turneth the Earthe into Heauen: *and of Menne he maketh Angels.* Againe he ſaithe in this ſelfe ſame place by M. Hardinge alleged: Vt Terra nobis Cœlum ſit, facit hoc Myſterium. Aſcende igitur ad Cœli Portas, & diligenter attende: Imò non Cœli, ſed Cœli Cœlorum: & tunc, quod dicimus, intueberis: *This Myſterie cauſeth, that vnto vs the Earthe is Heauen.* Aſcende vp therefore vnto the Gates of Heauen: *and marke diligently. Naie, I ſaie not, Vnto the Gates of Heauen:* but, Vnto the Gates of the Heauen of Heauens. *And ſo ſhalt thou ſee the thinges, that I tel thee.*

Chryſo. De Tæniten. Homil. 6.

Chryſo. in 1. Corinth. Homi. 24.

Nowe iudge thou, good Chriſtian Reader, howe true it is, and howe agreéable with S. Chryſoſtomes Doctrine, that M. Hardinge ſaithe, Muſte wee flee ſo highe, that wee looke not to finde this Body in Earthe? Can wee not Eate this Body, excepte wee flee vp into Heauen? Can wee not comme by it, but there? Can wee not Eate him, but there? Yes forſoothe: VVe neede not goe out of the Earthe for the mater. If it be ſo, then maie you reſte in the Earth, and tarrie there ſtil, and neuer trouble your eies, to loke vp to Heauen.

Uerily, Chryſoſtome, when he ſaithe, *Wee receiue the Sonne of God,* maketh mention, neither of Tranſubſtantiation, nor of Real, and Fleaſhely Preſence, nor of Eatinge with Mouthe, or Téethe: But onely ſendeth vs to the Force, and Worckinge of Faithe, and Spirite: whereby onely, and by no waie els, wée receiue and Eate in déede, and Uerily the Body of Chriſte.

The Apologie, Cap. 14. Diuiſion. 6.

In Iohan. Tract. 50.

And S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Howe ſhal I holde him, beinge Abſent? Howe ſhal I reache my hande vp to Heauen, to laie holde vpon him ſittinge there? He anſweareth, Reache thither thy Faithe, and then thou haſte laide holde on him.

M. Hardinge.

Vpon theſe woordes of S. Iohn, The Biſhoppes and Phariſeis gaue Commaundemente, that if any Knewe, where Ieſus were, he ſhoulde ſhewe it, that they might apprehende him, S. Auguſtine expoundinge the ſame, in a contrary ſenſe, ſaithe: Let vs nowe ſhewe the Iewes, where Chriſte is: woulde God they woulde heare, and laie holde on him. VVhere he ſpeaketh not of receiuinge Chriſte, ſo as wee receiue him in the Sacrament, * but of receiuinge him by Faithe Onely. And there he wiſheth and exhorteth the Iewes to comme to the Faithe, and teacheth them howe they maie profitably laye holde on Chriſte, whome theire Forefathers laide holde on with violent handes to theire damnation. Lette them comme to the Churche (ſaithe he) let them heare, where Chriſte is, and laie holde on him. After certaine woordes, he maketh this obiection to him ſelfe: VVel, the Iewe anſweareth me, howe ſhal I holde him, that is Abſente: Howe ſhal I reache vp my hande to Heauen, that I maie laie holde on him, whiche ſitteth there? Reache thither thy Faithe (ſaithe Auguſtine) and then thou haſte laide holde on him. Then foloweth in the ſame line, that, which plainely declareth all this to be meante of layinge holde of Chriſte by Faithe, * not by receiuinge the Communion. *Parentes tui tenuerunt carne, tu tene corde.* Thy Forefathers (thou Iewe) tooke holde on Chriſte in Fleaſhe: take thou holde on him in thy Harte. There he ſheweth howe Chriſte maie bé holden, though concerninge the Viſible and Senſible preſence of his Body, he be in Heauen at the Right hande of the Father. All this, and what ſo euer is ſaide there, vpon the Texte before recited, implieth not ſo mutche as any colour of argumente againſte the Truthe of Chriſtes very Body in this moſte Bleſſed Sacramente. And thus all your allegations and reaſons concerninge this mater be ſufficiently anſwered.

Ioha. 12.

S. Auguſtine ſpeaketh not of receiuinge Chriſte in the Sacramente, but by Faithe onely.

* And by Faith Onely wee receiue Chriſte in the Sacrament.

* He ſpeaketh not of the receiuinge of the Sacrament: but he ſpeaketh of the receiuinge of the Very Body of Chriſte: whiche is wrought onely by Faithe.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

It is true, that M. Hardinge ſaithe, S. Auguſtine in this place ſpeaketh nothing of pourpoſe and ſpecially of the Sacramente. Certainely it had benne greate vanitie for him, to will his Hearers, to take for the Sacramente in Heauen aboue. But he ſpeaketh of the embracinge, and holdinge the very Body of Chriſte, beinge nowe in Heauen. Whiche thinge is wrought onely by Faithe, and none otherwiſe: Whether it be in the Sacramente, or without the Sacramente. Infinite ſentences haue benne vttered by the Holy Fathers to like pourpoſe.

Auguſt. Aduerſus Iudeos. ca. 9

S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Accedite ad eum, & illuminamini: Quid eſt, Accedite, niſi, Credite? *Comme vnto him, and receiue the Light: What is,* Comme *vnto him, but,* Beleeue, *in him?*

Faithe receiueth, &c.

in him? **Againe,** Ambulando non laborabitis: Ibi enim Acceditis, vbi Creditis: *Your walkinge shal not be paineful to you: For there yee* Comme *to him, where yee* Beleeue *in him.*

Againe he saithe, Exijt de Manibus eorum: Non enim apprehendere eum potuerunt, quia Manus Fidei non habuerunt? *Christe departed out of their handes. For they could not laie holde on him, bicause they had not* the Handes of Faithe. **Againe,** Christus non rectè tangitur: id est, non rectè in eum Creditur: *Christe is not* wel touched: *that is to saie, Christe is not wel* Beleeued. **Likewise againe he saithe,** Sunt in Corde Spirituales Manus: *There be certaine* Spiritual Handes *in the Harte.* **And therefore** S. Ambrose **saithe,** Stephanus in Terris positus, Christum tangit in Cœlo: Steuin *beinge in the Earthe,* (by **Faithe**) toucheth Christe *beinge in Heauen.*

But as S. Augustine **so often saithe,** wee Embrace, and Holde Christe by Faithe: **so is not M. Harding able to shewe, that he euer once saide,** We **holde Christe with** Mouthe, **or** Teethe, **or receiue him downe into** Our Bellies. **And therefore** S. Ambrose **saithe,** Non Corporali tactu Christum, sed Fide Tangimus: VVee touche not Christe by Bodily touchinge: but wee touche him by Faithe. **And againe,** Fide Christus Tangitur: Fide Christus videtur. Non Corpore Tangitur: non Oculis comprehenditur: By Faithe Christe is touched: By Faithe Christe is seene. *He is not touched with our Bodies: He is not holden with our Eies.* **Likewise** S. Augustine **saithe,** Dominus consolatur nos, qui ipsum iam in Cœlo sedentem Manu contrectare non possumus: Sed Fide contingere (possumus). *The Lorde Comforteth vs, that* cannot nowe Touche him with Hande, sittinge in Heauen: But by Faithe wee maie touche him.

Ambrosius Sermone. 58.

Ambrosius in Lucam. Lib. 10. Cap. 14.

Ambr. in Luc. Lib. 6. Cap. 8.

August in Epist. Iohan. Tract. 1.

Nowe, for as mutche as M. Hardinge saithe, S. Augustine in this place maketh no mention of the receiuinge of Christes Body in the Sacramente, **it shal not be from the pourpose to consider, what he hath written otherwheres, touchinge the same. Thus he saithe,** Christus est Cibus noster, quo nihil dulcius: Sed si quis habeat Palatum sanum in Corde: *Christe him selfe is our Meate, then whiche meate there is nothinge more sauery: so that a man haue a* sounde taste in his Harte. **Againe he saithe,** Dominus dixit se Panem, qui de Cœlo descendit, hortans vt Credamus in eum. Credere enim in eum, hoc est Manducare Panem viuum. Qui Credit in eum, Manducat: Inuisibiliter Saginatur, quia Inuisibiliter renascitur. Infans Intus est: Nouus Intus est: vbi nouellatur, ibi satiatur: *Our Lorde called him selfe the Breade, that came from Heauen, exhortinge vs, to* Beleeue in him. For to Beleeue in him, that is to Eate the Breade of Life. *He Eateth, that Beleeueth in him. He is fidde Inuisibly, bicause he is newe borne Inuisibly. Inwardely he is an Infante: Inwardely he is Newe. Where he is renewed, there is he filled.*

August. in Iohan. Tract. 7.

August. in Ioh an. Tract. 26.

So saithe Eusebius Emissenus, **as he is alleged by** Gratian: Cùm ad Reuerendum Altare Cœlestibus Cibis satiandus accedis, Sacrum Dei tui Corpus, & Sanguinem respice, Honora, Mirare: Mente Continge: Cordis Manu Suscipe: & maximè haustu Interiori assume: *When thou commest vnto the Reuerende Aultare,* (or **Communion Table**) *to be Fedde with the Heauenly Meates, beholde the Holy Body, and Blonde of thy God: Honoure it: Woonder at it:* Touche it (**not with thy Bodily Mouthe, but**) with thy minde: *Receiue it* (**not with thy Bodily Hande, but**) with the Hande of thy Harte: *and specially take it with thy* Inner taste.

De Con. Dist. 2. Quia Corpus.

Therefore S. Augustine **saithe,** Quisquis cum Fide, & timore Verbum Dei audis, consolatur te Fractio Panis. Absentia Domini non est Absens. Habeto Fidem: & tecum est, quem non vides. Ideò Dominus absentauit se Corpore ab omni Ecclesia, & Ascendit in Cœlum, vt Fides ædificetur: *Who so euer thou be, that with Faithe, and Feare heareſt the Woorde of God, the Breakinge of Breade doothe Comforte thee.* The Absence of our Lorde is not Absente. Haue thou Faithe: *and he, whome thou seest not, is with thee: Therefore our Lorde,* as touchinge his Body, hath Absented him self from al his Church, *and is Ascended into Heauen, that our Faithe maie be edified.*

August. Feria 2. Paschatis.

Christe absente from al his Churche.

And in this selfe same place, that M. Hardinge saithe, maketh so litle for our pourpose, he saithe thus: Quomodò tenebo Absentem? Quomodo in Cœlum manum mittam, vt ibi sedentem teneam? Fidem mitte: & Tenuisti. Parentes tui tenuerunt Carne: Tu tene Corde. Quoniam Christus Absens, etiam præsens est. Nisi Præsens, esset, à nobis ipsis teneri non posset. Sed, quoniam verum est, quod ait, Ecce ego vo-

August. in Iohan. Tract. 50.

biscum sum vsque ad Consummationem Sæculi, & abijt, & hîc est: Et redijt, & nos non deseruit. Corpus enim suum intulit Cœlo: Maiestatem autem non abstulit Mundo: *Howe shal I holde Christe, beinge Absent? Howe shal I thruste my hande into Heauen, that I maie holde him Sittinge there: Sende vp thy Faithe: and thou holdest him. Thy Fathers* (the Iewes) *helde him in Fleashe: Holde him thou in thy Harte.* For Christe, beinge Absente, is also Presente. *Onlesse he were Presente, wee coulde not holde him. But, for as mutche as it is true, that he saithe, Beholde, I am with you vntil the ende of the worlde, Therefore* he is gonne, and yet is here. *He is comme againe, and hath not forsaken vs.* For he hath auanced his Body into Heauen: but he hath not withdrawen his Maiestie from the VVorlde.

Al these thinges wel considered, whereas M. Hardinge in the ende concludeth with these woordes: Thus al your allegations, and Reasons, concerninge this mater, be sufficiently answeared. **I doubte not, but his discrete, and indifferent Reader wil thinke, He crewe longe, before it was daie.**

The Apologie, Cap. 15. Diuision. 1.

Neither can wee awaie in our Churches with these Shewes, and sales, and marketes of Masses, nor with the carrieinge aboute, and woorshippinge of the Breade: nor with sutche other Idolatrous, and Blasphemous fondnesse: whiche none of them can proue, that Christe, or his Apostles euer ordeined, or leafte vnto vs. And wee iustly blame the Bishoppes of Rome, who without the Woorde of God, without the Authoritie of the Holy Fathers, without any example of Antiquitie, after a Newe guise, doo not onely set before the People the Sacramental Breade to be woorshipped as God, but doo also carrie the same aboute vpon an amblinge Palfraie, whither so euer them selues iourney: in sutche sorte, as in olde times the Persians fier, and the Reliques of the Goddesse Isis were solemnely carried aboute in Procession: and haue brought the Sacramentes of Christe to be vsed now as a stage plaie, & a solemne sighte: to the ende, that Mennes eies shoulde be fedde with nothinge els, but with madde gasinges, and foolishe gaudes, in the selfe same mater, wherein the Deathe of Christe ought diligently to be beaten into our Hartes, and wherein also the Mysteries of our Redemption ought with al Holinesse, and reuerence to be executed.

In Ceremonias rio Roma. Eccle.

M. Hardinge.

The thinges, whiche it liketh your Sathanical Sprite with blasphemous woordes to (a) dishonour, and bringe in contempte, are suche, as neither your praises can make more praise woorthy, nor your vpbraidinges any whit of lesse estimation. If any by the stinkinge breathe of your vile woordes be puffed awaie into your damned side, who so euer they be, they shewe them selues to haue benne lighte Chaffe, not founde wheate. Yet for good folkes sake, that I maie leaue your vile eloquence to your selues, and answeare the matter by you railed at, and belied, and otherwise not disproued: I praie you, good Sirs, the (b) Masse beinge the highest and moste Honorable Seruice, that is donne to God in his Churche (whiche otherwheres I einge already proued, I treate not of in this place), why shoulde not a Prieste, by whome onely it is, and maie be donne, (c) beinge called to that vocation, and state of life, haue rewarde, and liuinge for it? Raile againste the Masse, and Prieste s seruinge at the Aulter of God vntil your tongues burne in your heade in Helle Fire: VVee telle you, Prieste s of the Catholike churche sell (d) not the Fruite and Merite of Christes Bloude offered in the Masse, but onely for theire ministerie and labour require necessarie sustenance of Life.

But for your Defence, yee confesse that yee cannot awaie with the carryinge aboute and woorshippinge of Breade. No more cannot wee. To whose charge laie yee this? Be there any sutche Idolaters now, that woorshipp Breade? They would be knowen. (e) God forebid wee shoulde suffer Idolaters to liue amongst vs. Soothely in the Catholike Churche we know none. If yee cannot awaie with the Honoure whiche * al deuoute Christen people doo to the * blessed Sacramente, (wee meane to Christes Body, and Christ him self * presente in substance vnder * the Formes of Breade) then can not wee take you for Christians. Mocke, scoffe, ieste, and raile at vs with the Iewes, wee dare not, but Honoure our Lorde Christe, where so euer our Faithe findeth him verily and in Substance presente.

(a) Vntruth. For we honour the Holy Mysteries: and you profanely dishonour them.

(b) Vntruth. For as it is nowe vsed, there is no viler dishonour nor greater Blasphemie.

(c) Vntruth. For Christe neuer called his Disciples, or sente them abroade, to saie Masse.

(d) Alas, they haue it not. Otherwise for moonie it should awaie.

(e) God forebid, there should be water in the Sea.

* Vntruthes, & moste fonde, and blasphemous folies.

If

If through feruent zeale (as sometime it happeneth) abuses in certaine places haue creapte in, no good Catholique man (f) defendeth them. Mary we knowe al is not to be abrogated that misliketh your corrupte taste. (g) And mutch is right Holy Deuotion pleasant in the sight of God, and therefore allowed in the Church, which your hote sprite calleth Idolatrous, and blasphemous fondnesse. And though the Ceremonie and manner, whereby sutche deuotion is shewed, cannot be proued by ordinance of Christe or of the Apostles expressed in Scripture, yet Christen people doubte not but God accepteth their good hartes.

The Bishop of Rome ye blame vniustely, I might saie also proudely. For procuringe *Honour and woorshipp to Christe in the Blessed Sacramente, he hathe the * woorde of God, * the authoritie of al Holy Fathers, and the examples of antiquitie, as (h) I haue at large proued in my answeare to your companion Maister Iuel his eight negatiue Article. But the amblinge Horse offendeth you. VVhy be ye not also offended with the Asse and her fole, that bare the (i) same Body at Ierusalem, whiche the Horse beareth at Rome? Then visible and weighty, now Inuisible, and of no weighte? That was donne in Pompe to the honour of Christe, and so is this. Ye saie this is donne after a newe guise. So then was that. Neither is it true which ye saie, that the Bishoppes of Rome doo carrie aboute with them the Sacramente whether so euer they iourney. (k) Ye mighte haue learned in that Booke, out of which ye alleage that mater to scoffe at, that sutche a solemnitie is vsed specially, when the Pope rideth in *Pontificalibus*. Then (as the Booke telleth) a white Palfrey trapped, gentil, and faier, with a cleare soundinge bel hanginge at his necke, is leade, whiche carrieth the Monstrance, or Pixe with the moste Holy Body of Christe, ouer the whiche noble Citizens shal beare a Conapie. Thus the Booke of Ceremonies.

(l) And I praie you, what euil is this? If it be good to carrie about that moste Holy Body, by whiche as Christe once redeemed vs, so by the same deuoutely honoured of faithful people, and carried abroade and broughte to certaine places, hathe in olde times (as yet also doothe continually) to the greate comforte and healpe of sundrie persons beinge in distresse, wrought miraculously healthful remedies: If the Israelites founde healpe at Goddes hande by (m) bringinge the Arke into the fielde with them, as they marched forewarde againste the Philistians: if the Philistians cried out for feare when they perceiued the Arke to be in the Israelites armie, and saide, *Venit Deus in Castra. Va nobis*, God is come into theire Tentes. Alas we are vndone, &c.

And concerninge the order of the Ceremonie, whereas (n) the people be desirous to beholde the Body of their Redeemer with theire Faith by their carnal eie directed to the Forme of Breade, no man is hable to holde vp on hie the Sacramente, so as conuenient it were to be donne bothe to satisfie theire Deuotion, and to maintaine theire Faithe: for the Pope him selfe commonly is an aged man, and therefore ouer weake (o) for that seruice, specially arraied in Pontificalibus, as in sutch solemnities he is. Againe the instrumente that serueth for that pourpose is so great and weighty (for so it apperteineth to the honoure of Christe) the waie so longe, the ayer for the more parte there so hote: as no other man is wel able for lacke of strength to beare it, so as meete it is to be borne. In this case (o) why maie not a Horse be put to that seruice, to supply that which by natural weakenesse faileth in man? VVherein he serueth not, as one that beareth a male, but as the Asse that bare Christe, as the Kine that drewe the Arke.

Neither ought the custome of bearinge the most Holy Body of Christe, where the Pope goeth, seeme Newe and Strange: For we Reade in the life of the Blessed Martyr Steuen the firste, who was Pope of Rome aboue thirtene hundred yeeres paste, that Tharsitius the Deacon (who at lengthe also suffered deathe for Christe) bare our Lordes Body, at what time he attended vpon the Blessed Man, Pope Steuen, as he wente to his Martyrdome. VVho desireth to see this described at large, the same maie he finde in (**that Great fonde Fabulare**) Simeon Metaphrastes a Greeke writer, wel approued, and highly esteemed in the Greeke Churche. *In vita Stephani Primi*.

For witnesse whereof we haue S. Ambrose, who describeth howe certaine faithful persons carried (p) this blessed Sacrament with them, when they wente to the Sea, of whom his Brother Satyrus obteined the same in a Shipwracke, and by helpe thereof, hanginge it in a stole about his necke, seekinge for none other succoure, cast him selfe into the Sea, and miraculously escaped safe to lande. Neither is the same by him donne without a special Mysterie, thoughe vnknowen to the more part. Although, saith a learned Pope, a reason cannot be geuen of al thinges, what so euer haue bene brought in vre by our Forefathers: yet I thinke, quoth he, that therein lie hidden profounde Mysteries.

I reporte me nowe to the secrete Consciences of good Christen people, whether the Bishoppes of Rome vse not the Blessed Sacramente reuerently and honorably or no, but rather (q) as the Persians Fire, and the Reliques of the Goddesse Isis, as a stage Plaie, mad gasinges, and foolishe Gaudes, as it liketh this wicked Chammes broode to raile. VVherein they folowe the steppes, whiche Iulian the Apostata, Lucian, Porphyrius, Celsus, and sutche other prophane Helhoundes haue trodden before them. For after the like manner they railed at the Holy Mysteries of Christen Religion, namely Celsus, who as Origene writeth of him, obiected to the Christians the Sacrifices of Mithra, (whiche was an Idol that the Persians woorshipped, and called by the name of the Sunne) from whence he (saide they) had taken al their Sacramentes, Rites, and Ceremonies. And right so, (as wee finde in S. Augustine writtinge againste the Manichees) the Paynimes found faulte with the Christen people for *Honour done to the *Body and Bloude of Christe vnder *Formes of Breade and VVine, saieinge that they Honoured Bacchus and Ceres.

(f) Yet not one of your Catholique Prelates amēdeth them.
(g) Vntruthe, fonde and Heathenish, for god himselfe saithe, In vaine they woorshipp mee.
*Vntruthes foure together. For he dishonoureth Christ. He hath neither Gods woorde, nor the Authoritie of al the Fathers, nor the examples of Antiquitie.
(h) Note, that in the same one litle Article, M. Hardinge hath sente vs twelue great vntruthes
(i) Vntruth. For this is onely the Sacrament of that same Body
(k) Dooth M. H. scoffe at these games, or speaketh he in earnest?
(l) VVhy should a wise man speake so fondly? Reade the Answeare.
(m) They did it against Goddes wil: and spedde therafter. Reade the Answeare.
(n) Graue Considerations.
(o) A Horse supplieth the Popes office.
(p) It was a great abuse of the Sacrament: & yet without either Pixe, or Pompe: And therefore was afterwarde vtterly takē away throughout the whole Churche of God.
*Moste vaine Vntruthes. For S. Augustine speaketh neither of Adoration, nor of Christes Body, nor of fourmes

(k) Ceremoniarum Ecclesiæ In Sectione 12. ca. 1. Iuliachinum. 1. Reg. 4. 1. Reg. 5. In the order of this Ceremonie nothinge appeareth to a Christē man vnfeemely or vnreasonable. The custome of conueinge the Sacramēt, where the Pope goeth, is neither Newe nor Strange. (q) If yehad not these games frō thence, thē tel vs, from whence ye had them. This Defender followeth Iulian, Luciā Porphyri⁹, Celsus, and sutche other wicked Infidels. Cōtra Celsum, Lib. 6. De Mithra vide Suidā in dictione

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Concerninge these Satanical Sprites, and stinkinge breathes, and vile woordes, and suche other like flowers of your Eloquence, M. Hardinge, I confesse me selfe to be farre inferiour, and neuer able to make you answeare. It is true, that ye saie, The woorkeman is woorthy of his hiere. S. Paule saithe, *The Lorde hathe appointed, that who so Preacheth the Gospel shoulde liue by the Gospel.* But where did Christe euer saie vnto you, *Goe into al the worlde, and saie Priuate Masse, and offer me vp vnto my Father, for Remission of Sinnes?* What Apostle, what Prophete, what Doctoure, what Father euer taught you so to do? If ye set your selfe a worke without Commission, and renne forth, when noman biddeth you, then are ye your owne menne: and of reason, ought to paie your selues.

Constitution. Othonis Legatione. Folio. 143. If your Masses, as you saie, were neuer set to open sale, wherefore then was this Decree written in the Councel of Oxforde, Venalitatem Missarum districtè inhibemus? VVee streitly forbidde the sale of Masses. Thinke you, that so many wise Fathers woulde forebidde that thinge, that neuer was vsed? In the late Conference holden at VVoormes, the Bishop of Sidon, beinge there present, durste not saie, as you dare saie, there was no suche vnlawful Sale, but onely saide, It was out of season to talke thereof. His woordes be theise, Quid attinebat de Missis venalibus, de Mercatu Indulgentiarum, &c. mentionem intempestiuam inducere? *What was it to the pourpose, to speake of the* Sellinge of Masses, and Pardonnes, *out of season?*

In Colloquio VVormatien. Concessa. 5. The Priestes (ye saie) of the Catholique Church sel not the fruite, and Merite of Christes Bloude. No maruele: For they haue it not to sel. But if ye had Christe him selfe, ye would sette him to sale, as other your Fathers haue donne before you. Suche a one was he, of whome S. Gregorie writeth, Iesum Christum Dominum nostrum Hæretico, accepta Pecunia, venundedit? *He tooke Monie, and* solde Iesus Christe our Lorde vnto *an Heretique.* And, when the Bishop of Rome selleth his Pardonnes, what other thinge woulde he fame to sel, but onely the Fruites, and Merites of the Bloude of Christe?

Gregor. Lib. 2. Epist. 33. Ye saie further, God forebidde, wee shoulde suffer Idolaters to liue emongest vs. And yet your neare friendes haue thought, ye haue not benne farre from the maintenance of Idolatrie. Polydorus Vergilius, intreatinge of the worshipping of Images, saithe thus, Eò, insaniæ deuentum est, vt hæc pars Pietatis parum differat ab Impietate: *They are so farre proceeded in madnesse, that* this parte of Holinesse is not far from wickednesse. And Ludouicus Viues saithe, He seeth no greate difference betweene certaine Christians Worshippinge theire Images, and the Olde Heathens adoringe theire Idolles.

Polydor. De Inuentorib. Rer. Lib. 6. Cap. 13. Ye saie, The Carrieinge about of the Sacramente is right Holy Deuotion, pleasant in the sight of God: and Christian People doubt not, but God accepteth theire good Hartes. Euen so, no doubt, as when he saide sommetime vnto the Iewes, Quis requisiuit ista de manibus vestris? *Who required these thinges at your handes?*

Psal. 1. August. De Consen. Euangelist. Lib. 1. Cap. 18. S. Augustine saithe, Socratis sententia est, Vnumquenque Deum sic coli oportere, quomodo se ipse colendum esse præceperit: *The Iudgemente of* Socrates *is this, That euery God oughte so to be woorshipped,* as he him selfe hathe commaunded. Againe he saithe, Constat, Fidem stultam non solùm minimè prodesse, sed etiam obesse: *It is certaine, that* a Foolishe Faith, *not onely dooth not good, but also hurteth.*

Aug. in quæst. ex veteri Testament. quæst. 43. Chrysostom. in Acta. Homil. 49. Chrysostome saithe, Tales sunt Diabolo venandi artes: qui prætextu Pietatis, laqueos tegit: *Suche sleightes of huntinge, hathe the Diuel. Vnder the Colour of Holinesse he hideth his snares.*

But, as touchinge the solemnitie of carrieinge the Sacramente, your owne Doctoure Gabriel Biel coulde haue tolde you, Christus non dedit Discipulis Sacramentum, vt ipsum honorificè conseruarent: sed dedit in sui vsum, dicens, Accipite, & Manducate: *Christ gaue not the Sacramente to his Disciples to the ende* they should keepe it with Honoure, *But he gaue it to them for theire vse, saieinge to them,* Take, and Eate.

Gabriel. Lect. 26 Likewise saithe Humbertus, Christus non tantùm Benedixit Panem, & reseruauit frangendum in crastinum: nec fregit tantùm, & reposuit: sed fractum statim distribuit:

Citatur à Cassandro in Liturgijs.

Vaine Deuotion

buit: *Chriſte did not onely Bleſſe the Breade, and reſerue it to be broken the nexte daie: Nor did he onely Breake it*, and laie it vp: *but beeinge broken*, ſtraighte waie *he deliuered it*.

Al this ſtrange ſolemne Feſtiual guiſe, Pope Vrbanus the fourthe learned, not of Chriſte, or Paule, but onely by the Reuelation of Dame Eue, **the Anchoriſſe: and by her good aduiſe founded the Newe Feaſte of** Corpus Chriſti, **and cauſed the Sacramente to be borne about in Procеſſion.**

But the Ancient, and worthie Father Chryſoſtome **ſaithe,** Diſcamus Chriſtum ex ipſius voluntate honorare: Nam qui honoratur, eo maximè honore lætatur, quem ipſe vult: non quem nos optamus: *Lette vs learne to honour* Chriſt after his owne wil. *For he, that is honoured, deliteth moſte in that honour*, that he him ſelfe woulde haue: *not in that honoure, that wee can Fanſie*. **Notwithſtandinge, when the Sacramental Breade is carried onely vpon a horſe, and the Pope him ſelfe is borne aloſte, in a Chaire of Golde, vpon the ſhoulders of ſixe, or eighte Noble menne, I praie you whether of them hathe greater Honoure?**

Chryſo. in Matthæ. Homil. 51.

For the reſte, The Pope (**ſaithe M. Hardinge**) is an olde Man: he rideth in his Pontificalibus, he is loden with Apparel: The Pixe is weightie: The VVeather is hoate: there is none other Creature to ſupplie his roome: **Therefore it is lately concluded in Louaine, in great ſolemne ſadneſſe, that a Horſe muſte be had in, to plaie the Popes parte, and to carry the Monſtrance.**

Here, for as mutche as M. Harding hath purpoſely made mention of the Popes ridinge in his Pontificalibus, **and the Solemnitie, and Pompe thereof is knowen to fewe, it ſhal not be impertinente, briefely to diſcloſe the order thereof. Thus therefore it is written in the** Ceremoniarie of Rome: Sic Papa equitat in Pontificalibus in aliquam ciuitatem. Cardinales deſcendunt ex equis, & accedunt reuerenter ad Papam, & oſculantur illi pedem. Epiſcopus Ciuitatis accedit ad Papam cum debitis reuerētijs, & offert illi Crucem oſculandam: quam Pontifex reuerenter, cum Mitra tamen, oſculabitur. Non enim commodè poterit ei abſtrahi equiti ab equeſtribus. Si tamen placuerit & Mitram deponere, non erit inconueniens. Deinde Prælatus incipiat Antiphonam, Ecce Sacerdos Magnus: *Thus the Popes Holineſſe rideth into any Cittie in his* Pontificalibus. *The Cardinalles light from their Horſes, and comme reuerently vnto the Pope, and* kiſſe his foote. *The Biſhop of the Citie commeth likewiſe to the Pope with dewe reuerence, and offereth him the* Croſſe to kiſſe: *which the Pope ſhal kiſſe reuerently*, keepinge on his Miter notwithſtandinge. *For while he ſitteth on horſe backe, his horſemenne cannot very eaſily take of his Miter, and ſette it on againe. Howe be it, if it ſhal like him to put of his Miter, it ſhalbe no greate inconuenience. Afterwarde the Biſhop ſhal beginne this Antheme*, Beholde the Greate Prieſte. **And ſo he prikketh forth alonge in his** Pontificalibus.

Ceremoniar. Sect. Elion, 12. Cap. 5.

The carrieinge out of the Arke of God into the fielde, in the time of Eli **the Highe Prieſte, boadeth no very good Argumente for the carrieinge of the Sacramente. For at that time the Armie of Iſrael was ouerthrowen, thirtie thouſande Souldiers were ſlaine, and emongeſt them the two Sonnes of** Eli: **The** Arke **was taken: Eli him ſelfe fel backe from his Chaire, and brake his necke. Therefore, M. Hardinge, ye ſhal haue mutch adoe, to make good your Procеſſion by this example.**

1. *Reg.* 4.

This mater (ye ſaie) hathe benne proued by ſundrie Miracles. **Firſte, whether there haue benne any ſuch Miracles wrought, or no, it is vncertaine. But were it graunted, yet maie not your Miracles alwaies ſtande for good proufes. Your owne Doctoure** Alexander de Hales **ſaithe,** Miracula fiunt aliquando humana procuratione: aliquando Diabolica operatione: *Miracles be wroughte ſommetime by the* woorkinge, *and* procuremente of menne: *and ſometime by the* conueiance of the Diuel.

Alexand. Halen. Parte. 4. queſt. 33 Mem. 4. Artic. 3.

The tales, that ye allege of Tharſitus, **and** Satyrus, **make nothing, either for the Adoration of the Sacrament, or els for the Popes Palfraie. Women, and Children, and Laie menne vſed then to carrie home the Sacramente in theire Napkinnes, and to kepe it in forcelettes, as in my Former Replie it is largely ſhewed. But theſe were Abuſes of the Myſterie: and therefore afterwarde were aboliſhed.**

Articulo 1.

It greeueth you mutche, that we ſaie, The Pope cauſeth, the Sacramental Breade

The carrieinge of the Sacramente.

Breade to be carried before him vpon a Horſe, as the Kinges of Perſia vſed in olde times to carrie the Fiere, whiche they called Orimaſda, and imagined the ſame to be theire God. And therefore yͤ crie out in your Paſſion, Chammes broode, Helhoundes, and, what ſo euer might ſerue you beſte: euen with like Sobrietie, and modeſtie, as they, whoe ſometime in the like caſe cried out, Magna Diana Epheſiorum: Great is Diana of the Epheſians. Howe be it, other example more agreeable to reſemble your folie, wͤ coulde finde none.

Act. 19.

Neither make you iuſtly, and truely ſaie, ye haue receiued none of your Orders, and Vſages from the Heathens. Your owne Gloſe noteth vpon the Decrees, Clerici euntes ad Tumulos mortuorum, portabant ſecum Sacramenta Corporis, & Sanguinis Chriſti: & ſuper tumulos ea diſtribuebant. Et hæc Conſuetudo facta fuit à Gentibus: *The Clerke* (or Prieſtes) *goinge to the graues of the deade, carried with them the* Sacramentes *of the Body, and Bloude of Chriſte: and made diſtribution thereof ouer the graues. And* this ſame Cuſtome was vſed emonge the Heathens. Nicolaus Leonicenus ſaith, Iſidis Sacerdotes in Aegypto vtebantur Lineis veſtibus, & ſemper erant detonſo capillo: quod etiam per manus traditum ad noſtra vſque tempora peruenisſe videtur. Siquidem ij, qui apud nos Diuino Cultui, & Sacris Altaribus præſident, barbam, comamq; nutrire prohibentur: & in Sacris vtuntur lineis amictibus: *The Prieſtes of the Goddeſſe* Iſis *in* Egypte, *vſed to weare* linen ſurpleſſes, *and euermore had theire* heade ſhauen: *Whiche thinge ſeemeth to haue benne deriued from them vnto our time, from hande to hande. For they, that emonge vs Miniſter Goddes Seruice, and ſerue the Holy Aultares, are forebidden to ſuffer the heare of theire heade, or their beard to growe: and in their Diuine ſeruice they vſe Linen Garmentes.* Epiphanius ſaithe, that the Heretiques called Collyridiani, vſed to ſet forth, and to carrie aboute Breade (no doubt, but the Sacramente) in the Honoure of the Bleſſed Virgine Marie. Nazianzenus ſaieth thus to complaine of ſome ſutche vnſemely behaueours in his time: Quid referam, ſaith he, τὰ μυστήρια κωμῳδούμενα? *What ſhal I ſpeake of the Holy Myſteries turned now* into a plaie, *or a* Comedie? For ſo Claudius Du Sainctes, your owne Doctoure expoundeth theſe wordes, Myſteria in Comœdias conuerſa.

De Con. Diſt. 1. Non oportet. In Gloſſa.

Nicol. Leonicenus, In Varia Hiſtoria. Lib. 2. Cap. 21.

Epiphan. Lib. 3. Hæreſi. 51. De Collyridiani, Ἄρτου προτιθέασι καὶ ἀναφέρουσιν εἰς ὄνομα Μαρίας.

Nazianzen. ad Hieronem.

Claud. Du Sainctes, De Liturgijs, In Præfat.

Of the like diſorder of the Heathens, Apuleius ſaieth to ſaie, Dicimus Deos incedere humanis pedibus: *Wee tel you, that our Goddes goe on mennes feete.* The whole difference betweene you, and them, in this behalfe, ſtandeth onely in this, that your God goeth on Horſe ſete, and theire on mannes ſete.

Apuleius, Lib. 1.

But the Holy Sacrament of Chriſtes Deathe was neuer appointed vnto vs to this ende, to be carried thus about in open ſhewe: but onely to be receiued as Chriſt him ſelfe commaunded, in remembrance of his Body, and Bloude. And therefore S. Cyprian ſaithe, Recipitur, non includitur: It is receiued: it is not ſhut vp.

Cyprian. De Cœna Domini.

That ye allege, as out of S. Auguſtine, That the Painimes founde faulte with the Chriſtian people, for Honour donne to the Body, and Bloude of Chriſte, vnder your Fourmes of Breade, and VVine, It is an open, and a manifeſte Untruth. For S. Auguſtine in that place ſpeaketh not one worde, neither of the Body, and Bloude of Chriſte: nor of your Fourmes, and Accidentes: nor of any manner Adoration, or honoure donne vnto the Sacramente. It ſhal behoue you to write hereafter more aduiſedly: Otherwiſe the Learned wil ſaie, ye either knowe not, or care not, what ye write. This Obiection of S. Auguſtine is anſweared more at large in my Former Replie.

Auguſt. Contra Fauſtum. Lib. 20. Cap. 13.

Touchinge the mater it ſelfe, S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Deus meus vbique Præſens eſt, vbique totus, nuſquam incluſus: qui poſsit adeſſe ſecretus, abeſſe non motus: *My God is euerywhere Preſent, euerywhere whole,* ſhut vp, or incloſed nowhere: *Hable ſecretly to be Preſente, and to be Abſente without mouinge.* And S. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Magnum, crede mihi, bonum eſt, Scire, quid ſit Creatura, & quid ſit Creator: & quæ ſint Opera, quis verò Opefex. Si enim hoc diligenter ſcirent diſcernere Hæretici, nunquam vtiq; omnia Confunderent, &, quæ Surſum ſunt, facerent Deorſum. Non dico, quòd Cœlum, & Stellas deorſum, terram autem ſurſum ducerent: ſed quòd Regem ab excelſis Sedibus deducentes cum Creaturis, & Operibus collocauerint: Creaturam verò Diuinis honoribus affecerint: *Beleeue mee, it is a greate mater, to vnderſtande, what is the* Creature,

Artic. 8. Diui. 24

Auguſt. De Ciuitate Dei, Lib. 1. Cap. 29.

Chryſoſt. De Ieiunijs, & Lectione Geneſeos.

Creature, *and what is* God the Creatour: *what are the* VVoorkes, *and what is the* VVoorkeman. *For, if these Heretiques coulde make* diligente difference hereof, *they woulde not thus make confusion of al thinges, nor place those thinges* beneath, *that* be aboue. *I meane not, They either pulle downe the Heauen, or the Starres, or set vp the Earthe* (in theire place): *But that they pulle downe the* Kinge him selfe from his highe Throne, and place him emongest his woorkes and Creatures: and of the other side, woorship a Creature with Godly Honoure.

The Apologie, Cap. 15. Division. 2.

Besides, where they saie, and sommetime doo persuade fooles, that they are hable by theire Masses to distribute, and applie vnto menne commoditie al the Merites of Christes Deathe, yea, although many times the parties thinke nothing of the mater, and vnderstande ful litle what is done, this is a Mockerie, a Heathenishe fansie, and a very tote. For it is our Faith, that applieth the Death, and Crosse of Christ to our benefite, and not the Acte of the Massinge Priest. Faithe had in the Sacramentes (saithe Augustine) doothe iustifie, and not the Sacramentes. **And** Origene saithe: Christ is the Priest, the Propitiation, and Sacrifice: vvhich Propitiation commeth to euery one by meane of Faithe. **And so, by this reckeninge, wee saie, that the Sacramentes of Christe, without Faithe, doo not once profite these, that be aliue: a greate deale lesse doo they profite those that be deade.**

Origen. ad Roma. Li. 3. Cap. 3.

M. Hardinge.

(a) Leaste any piece of your Apologie shoulde be without a witnes, for prouse that yee are his children, who is the father of lies: ye make vs to affirme, that by our Masses we distribute and applie to menne indifferently, howe so euer they be disposed, for so ye meane, as it appeareth partely by that ye saie here, and specially by your Doctrine otherwheres vttered, al the Merites of Christes Deathe. But tel vs, (b) who euer taught this Doctrine in the Catholique Churche?

(a) Vntruthe enclosed. For this is your Catholique Doctrine, as shal appeare.

(b) Your owne Scholastical Catholique Douctours, M. Harding. Reade the Answeare.

Yea, God is so good, and prone to bestowe his mercie, that, not onely when a man is through Faithe prepared for it, he geueth it abundantly vnto him: but also thoughe he as of his owne parte haue no faithe presently, yet for others sake, whiche are Goddes dearely beloued friendes, he fareth the better, and hathe that gifte obteined to him. (c) As, when S. Steuen praied at his deathe for those that persecuted him, for whome praied he then, but for those, who had no faithe at al in Christe? And when this grace was geeuen vnto them, as that from their Iewishnes they came to the Faithe of Christ, who shal exclude that blessed Martyr from this woorship and honour, that through his praier, as by one special meane, that grace was applied vnto them?

(c) A proper shifte. VVee speake of Sacramentes. M. Hardinge answeareth vs of praier.

VVhat effecte his praier tooke, if any man thereof doubte, he maie thinke it to haue wroughte mutche for the benefite of others of lesse malice, seinge that it did so mutche in Paule. VVho as the Scripture saithe, yet breathinge out threateninges and slaughter againste Christes Disciples, was so changed, and conuerted, that of a Persecutoure he became an Apostle. For, as S. Augustine writeth, *Si Sanctus Stephanus sic non orasset, Ecclesia Paulum non haberet*: if S. Steuen had not praied so the Churche shoulde not haue had Paule. Nowe, if those that be no Priestes, without publike Auctoritie of Consecratinge the Body and Bloude of Christe, yet by waie of praier doo obteine, that menne be conuerted to the Faithe, whiche is the applyinge of one fruite of Christes merites, mutche more the publike Minister, and Bishop, which assumpted from amonge meane, is ordeined for men, in maters belonginge to God, that he maie offer vp giftes and Sacrifices for sinnes.

And nowe, if ye liste to learne what kinde of applyinge we vse in our Masses, wee doo offer vp vnto God firste, (d) his Sonne, representinge his passion, and celebratinge the memorie of the same (e) accordinge to Christes institution.

(d) Vntruthe, Blasphemous, and horrible.

(e) Vntruth. For Christe neuer bade you to offer him vp vnto his Father.

But what measure of good we procure them, to God onely is that knowen. If (as the Learned Bishop Prosper saithe) the grace of our Saueour passe ouer some Persons (as wee see it to happen) and if the Praier of the Churche (wherein the Sacrifice is conteined, after S. Augustines Minde) be not admitted for them: it is to be referred to the Secrete iudgementes of Goddes iustice, and it is to be acknowledged, that the depth of this secrete maie not be opened in this life.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Thus ye saie, M. Hardinge: Ye make vs to affirme, that by our Masses wee distribute, and applie to menne indifferently the Merites of Christes Deathe: howe so euer they be disposed, in token, that ye are the Children of him, who is the Father of lies, **Therefore ye saie,** Tel vs, who euer taughte this Doctrine in the Catholike Churche?

If you

The Applieing of Christes Deathe.

If you be so vnskilful, M. Hardinge, and so far to seke in your owne Doctours, then it maie please you to understande, that the moste Catholique Pillers of your Catholique Church, haue euen thus taught vs. Thomas de Vio, otherwise called Caietanus, a Catholique Cardinal of your Catholique Churche of Rome, in the Conference, he had at Augusta in Germanie, with Doctour Luther, said thus, Fides non est necessaria accessuro ad Eucharistiam: Faithe is not necessarie for him, *that will receiue the Sacramente of thankesgeeuinge.* Notwithstandinge otherwheres he acknowledgeth, this was an errour: and confesseth, it was commonly receiued, and beleeued of manye, euen in your Catholique Churche of Rome. Thus he writeth, In hoc videtur communis multorum Error, quòd putant, hoc Sacrificium ex solo Opere Operato habere certum Meritum, vel certam satisfactionem, quæ applicatur huic, vel illi: *Herein standeth the* Common Errour of many, *that they thinke, this Sacrifice hathe a certaine Merite, or Satisfaction, whiche is applied to this man, or to that man,* (not by meane of the Faithe of the receiuer, but) *by the Onely meane of the Woorke, that is wroughte* (by the Priestes). Gabriel Biel saithe, *The Priestes receiueth the Sacramente: and the* Vertue thereof passeth into al the Members *of the Churche.* Iacobus de Valentia saithe, The Priestes *is the* Mouthe of the Body. *Therefore, when the Priestes receiueth the Sacramente,* al the Members are refreashed. Againe he saith, Nos Communicamus Ore Sacerdotis: *Wee, that be of the People, doo Communicate, or receiue the Sacramente,* by the Mouth of the Priestes. Thomas of Aquine, your Angelical Doctour saithe thus, Sicut Corpus Domini semel oblatum est in Cruce pro debito Originali, ita offertur iugiter pro quotidianis delictis in Altari: *As the Body of our Lorde was once offered vpon the Crosse for* debt of Original Sinne, *so it is daily offered vpon the Aultare for the* debte of Daily Sinnes.

Paralip. Vrsper. Anno. 1518.

Cardinal. Caietanus. De Vsu Spiritualium. Quæst. 3.

Biel. Lection. 18. Iacob. de Valentia. Serm. 2. De Epiphania.

Thom. De Venerabil. Sacrament. Alt. Cap. 1.

Addition. ☞ M. Hardinge. You haue corrupte S. Thomas woordes with false translation, Englishinge, *Pro quotidianis delictis,* for the debte of Daily Sinne: where debte is not in the Latine.

M. Hard. fo. 356. Addition ☞

The Answeare. What meaneth this Childishenesse M. Hardinge? Was this the greatest corruption, ye coulde espie? Can you imagine, any Sinne to be without debte? I beseeche you: Wherefore saithe Almightie God, *Your Sinnes haue made Diuision betweene you, and me?* Wherefore dothe the wasteful Sonne crie out, *O Father, I haue offended againste Heauen, and againste thee?* Wherefore saithe S. Paule, *Deathe is the rewarde of Sinne?* Wherefore hathe Christe taughte vs to saie, Dimitte nobis debita nostra: *O Lorde, forgeeue vs our debtes?* But onely in respecte of Debte, that is due to Sinne? Regarde better, what ye write. Why shoulde suche folies comme from Louaine? ☜

Esai. 59. Luke. 15. Roman. 6. Matthæ. 6.

This Doctrine, not longe sithence, was holden for Catholique, and was strongly maintained by your Catholique Doctoures. Catharinus, one of the worthies of your Late Chapter of Trident, saithe, Apparet, quòd pro peccatis sub Nouo Testamento, post acceptam Salutaris Hostiæ in Baptismo efficaciam commissis, non habemus pro Peccato Hostiam illam, quàm Christus obtulit pro Peccato Mundi, & pro delictis Baptismum Præcedentibus: Non enim nisi semel ille Mortuus est: Et ideò semel duntaxat Hostia illa ad hunc effectum applicatur: *It appeareth, that for the Sinnes committed vnder the Newe Testamente, after that wee haue receiued in Baptisme the Power of the Healthful Sacrifice,* wee haue nomore that Sacrifice for Sinne, whiche Christ once offered for the Sinne of the VVorlde, *and for Sinnes committed before Baptisme. For Christe neuer died but once. And therefore that Sacrifice of Christe Crucified,* is applied vnto vs once onely *to this effecte.*

Catharinus. De Incruento Sacrificio Noui, & Æterni Testamenti.

Hereby, M. Harding, ye maie see, that this doctrine lacketh no defense emongst your Catholiques. The summe, and meaninge hereof is this, That our Sinnes committed after Baptisme, are not forgeeuen by the Deathe of Christe, but Onely by the Sacrifice of the Masse. Whiche thinge, what it semeth to you, I cannot tel: But vnto al Godly eares it semeth an horrible greate blasphemie.

Here, to speake of Prayers, specially in so large a sorte, it was far impertinent to your pourpose, as beinge vtterly no parte of this question.

The Merites of Christes Deathe, whereof wee entreate, are conueied vnto vs by

The applieing of Christes Deathe.

vs by God, & receiued by vs. God conueieth them to vs onely of his Mercie, and we receiue them Onely by Faithe. But the waies, whereby either to procure Goddes Mercie, or to enkendle our Faithe, are many, and sundrie. Gods Mercie is procured sometime by Prayer, sometime by other Meanes. But to breed, or encrease Faithe in vs, there are moe waies, then can be reckened. Somme men are moued onely by the Hearinge of Goddes Worde: Somme others by the beholdinge, and weighinge of Goddes Miracles. Iustinus the Martyr was first allured to the Faithe by the crueltie of the Tyrannes, and by the Constancie, and Patience of Goddes Saincts. S. Cyprian saithe, Tanta est vis Martyrij, vt per illam credere etiam cogatur, qui te vult occidere: *So greate is the Power of Martyrdome, that thereby euen he is forced to beleeue, that wouldе kille thee.* S. Augustine saithe, He was sturred vp to comme to Christe, by readinge a Heathen Booke written by Cicero, called Hortensius. Thus he saithe, Ille Liber mutauit affectum meum, & ad te ipsum, Domine, mutauit Preces meas: *That* (Heathen) *Booke changed my minde, and turned my Praier, ô Lorde, vnto thee.*

Euseb. Li. 4 ca. 8

Cyprian De Laude Martyrij.

Aug. Confess. Lib. 3. ca. 4

Emonge other causes, the Sacramentes serue specially to direct, and to aide our Faithe: For they are, as S. Augustine calleth them, Verba Visibilia, Visible VVoordes: and Seales, and Testimonies of the Gospel.

Augustt. Contra Faustum, Lib. 19 Cap. 16.

Al this notwithstandinge, we saie, It is neither the Worke of the Priestе, nor the Nature of the Sacramente, as of it selfe, that maketh vs partetakers of Christes Deathe, but onely the Faithe of the Receiuer. S. Augustine saithe, Vndè est ista tanta Virtus Aquæ, vt Corpus tangat, & Cor abluat, nisi faciente Verbo? Non quia dicitur, sed quia creditur: *From whence hathe the Water this greate Power, that it touchеth the Body, and washeth the Harte sauinge by the* VVoorkinge of the VVoorde? Not for that it is pronounced, but for that it is beleued.

Augustt. in Iohan. Tract. 80.

So saithe Hesychius, Gratia Dei comprehenditur Sola Fide: *The Grace of God* (of our parte) is receiued by Onely Faithe. So saithe Cyrillus, Sicus Fidei nostræ Formam habet. Si enim Fidem obtuleris, tanquam Precium, à Christo, velut Ariete immaculato in hostiam dato, accipies Remissionem Peccatorum: *The Sicle hathe the Fourme of our Faithe.* For if thou offer vp thy Faith, *as the Price, thou shalt receiue Remission of thy Sinnes, from Christe that vnspotted Ramme, that was geeuen for a Sacrifice.*

Hesych. in Leuit. Lib. 4. cap. 14. Cyril. in Leuit. Lib. 3.

Where we saie, Yee offer vp Christe, the Sonne of God, Really, and Substantially vnto God the Father, If we speake in your Dreame, it is a very pleasante phantasie: but if we be awake, and knowe, what we saie, then is it a greate blasphemie: as in my Former Replie it maie appeare more at large.

The Apologie, Cap. 16. Diuision. 1.

And, as for their Braggеs, they are woonte to make of theire Purgatorie, though wee knowe, it is not a thinge so very late risen emongst them, yet is it no better then a blockishe, and an Olde Wiues diuise.

M. Hardinge.

Purgatory acknowledged by the Defenders to be of Antiquitie Apoc. 21. 2. Cor. 7.

Purgatorie seemeth not to vs a thinge, that wee shoulde muche bragge of, no more then yee wil bragge of Hel. VVee tremble at the remembrance of it rather then bragge of it. VVel, howe so euer it be, wil yee, nil yee (wee see) * ye be driuen to confesse the same to be no newe thinge.

In deed if you cal them Papistes, among whom the Doctrine of prayinge for the deade, (a) wherof necessarely foloweth the Doctrine of Purgatorie, is deliuered, taught and holden: then are the Apostles, who deliuered it by Tradition, (as Chrysostome and Damascene report) Papistes. First (b) forasmuch as nothinge that is defiled commeth into the Kingedome of Heauen, and somme depart out of this Life, thoughe in the Faithe of Christe, and Children of the Euerlastinge Kingedome, yet not throughly and perfitely cleane: it remaineth, that suche after this Life before they come to the place of Euerlastinge ioie, haue theire Purgation. Furthermore the Apostle saithe, Seeinge then wee haue these promises dearely beloued, let (c) vs cleanse our selues from al filthinesse of the Fleashe, and Spirite, makinge perfite our satisfaction in the feare of God. VVho seeth not hereof to folowe, that to many, which be iustified, somewhat of satisfaction, and Holinesse lacketh? VVhiche if they be taken from hence before they atteine to the measure of Holynesse requisite, be they not then after this Life in state to be purged and cleansed?

* No marueile. It was receiued of the Painims longe ere the Apostles were borne.

(a) Vntruthe. Reade the Answeare.

(b) This fantasie were somme-what, if we had no Purgatiō in Christes Bloud.

(c) A doughty Argumente, to proue Purgatorie.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Here are wee comme to the Paper VValles, and Painted Fieres of Purgatorie.

For so it liked M. Hardinge, not longe sithence, pleasantly to sporte at it in the Pulpites, as a bugge mete onely to fraie Children. Yet nowe, vpon better aduise, and deeper studie, he trembleth, God wote, and quaketh for feare, to remember the tormentes, that somme body hathe sithence tolde him to be there. Howe be it, Let him not so mutche dismate him selfe. The Pope, as he either firste made it, or receiued it by handes from the Heathens, and first allowed it, euen so hathe he the whole Iurisdiction, and Power ouer it, and commaundeth in, and out at his pleasure.

Whether yée make bragges hereof, or no, I leaue it in question. Certainely for this, and other like causes, One of your fellowes saith, Excepto Peccato, Papa potest quasi omnia facere, quæ Deus potest: Sinne *excepted, the* Pope *can doo in a manner al thinges, that God can doo.* An other saithe, Animæ existentes in Purgatorio, sunt de Iurisdictione Papæ: & Papa, si vellet, posset totum Purgatorium euacuare: *The Soules beinge in Purgatorie, are* (in the Popes Peculiare, and) vnder the Popes Iurisdiction: *and the* Pope *if it might stande with his pleasure, were able* (to make goale deliuerie, and) to auoide al Purgatorie. And to this pourpose, The Pope him selfe Commaundeth, and Chargeth the Angelles of God, to fetche forthe from thence, whom so euer, and howe many so euer he wil haue deliuered, as hereafter in a place more conueniente it shal better appeare. If these seme to be no bragges, then let them hardely be called by somme other name, that maie seme to please you better.

Yée take good holde, in that we Confesse, This Imaginatioh of Purgatorie is no Newe fansie. Howe be it, your aduantage herein is not so greate. There haue bene errours, and greate errours from the beginninge. S. Augustine saithe, Origenes ipsum Diabolum, atque Angelos eius post grauiora pro Meritis, & diuturniora supplicia, ex illis Cruciatibus eruendos, atque sociandos Sanctis Angelis credidit: *The Ancient Learned Father* Origen *beleeued, that the Diuel him selfe, and his Angelles, after greate, and longe punishemente suffered for their wickednesse, shalbe deliuered from theire tormentes, and shalbe placed* (in Heauen) *with the Holy Angelles of God.* Origene him selfe saithe, *There were somme, that thought, that Christe shoulde goe downe into Helle, and there be* Crucified againe *to saue them, that by his Preaching, and Former Deathe could not be saued.* Againe the same Origen saithe of him selfe, Ego puto, quòd post Resurrectionem ex mortuis indigebimus Sacramento eluente nos, atque Purgante: *I thinke, that* after wee shal rise againe *from the Deade,* wee shal haue neede of the Sacramente (of Baptisme) *to washe vs, and to Purge vs cleane.*

Augu. De Ciuitate Dei. Lib. 11. cap. 17.

Origen in Epist ad Romanos 6. Lib 5.

Origen in Lucã Homil. 14.

S. Augustine saithe, Quidam nullas Pœnas, nisi Purgatorias, volunt esse post Mortem: *Some men wil haue no Punishement to be after Deathe, but* onely the Paines of Purgatorie.

Augu. De Ciuitate Dei. Lib. 21. cap. 13.

Euen in Paules time there were somme, that, beinge aliue, were Baptized for the deade. And by the Councel of Carthage it appeareth, there were somme, that vsed to thruste the Sacramente into the Mouthe of the Deade Body, meaninge thereby, as it maie be thoughte, to procure somme relefe for the Soule. The wordes be these: Placuit, vt Corporibus Defunctorum Eucharistia non detur. Dictum est enim à Domino, Accipite, & Edite. Cadauera autem nec Accipere possunt, nec Edere: *Wee thinke it good, that the Sacramente be not geeuen to* the Bodies of the Deade. *For our Lorde saithe, Take, and Eate. But Deade Bodies can neither Take, nor Eate.* These were Ancient Errours in Olde times, as it is easie to be séene.

1. Corinth 15.

Concil. Carthag 3. Canon 6

As for the fantasie of Purgatorie, it sprange firste from the Heathens, and was receiued emongest them in that time of darkenesse, longe before the comminge of Christe, as it maie plainely appeare by Plato, and Vergile, in whom yée shal finde described at large, the whole Common Weale, and al the Orders, & Degrées of Purgatorie. S. Augustine saithe, The Olde Heathen Romaines had a Sacrifice, whiche they called, Sacrum Purgatorium, A Purgatorie Sacrifice.

Plato in Timæo. Æneid. 6. August de Ciuitate. Lib. 7. ca. 7.

You saie, If they be Papistes, that Defende Purgatorie, then muste Christes Apostles needes be Papistes. For they haue taughte vs Purgatorie, (not by any thinge, that euer they wrote, but) by Tradition. This is as true, as that S. Peter sate Pope in Rome with a Goulden Cope, and a Triple Crowne. Onlesse perhappes somme man wil thinke,

where

The Antiquitie of Purgatorie.

where as S. Paule saithe, Homines Priuati Veritate, existimantes quæstum esse pietatem: *They be wenne voide of Truthe, thinkinge that their gaine is Godlinesse:* Or, where as S. Peter saithe, Per auaritiam fictis sermonibus negotiabuntur de vobis: *Through couetousnesse by fained talke they shal* make sale of you, That by these wordes they gaue vs warninge of the very Fourme, and Doctrine of your Purgatorie. For better Authorities, then these be, I reckon, ye can lightly finde none. 1. Timoth. 6. 2. Petr. 2.

As for Praier for the Deade, whiche (ye saie) yee haue receiued by Tradition from the Apostles, notwithstandinge it were graunted to be true, yet dothe it not euermore impoute Purgatorie. For Chrysostome, and Basile in theire Liturgies make theire Publique, and solemne Praier in this sorte: Offerimus tibi rationalem hunc cultum, pro in Fide requiescentibus, Maioribus, Patribus, Patriarchis, Prophetis, & Apostolis, Præconibus, & Euangelistis, Martyribus, Confessoribus, &c. Præcipuè verò pro Sanctissima, immaculata, super omnes benedicta, Domina nostra Deipara, & semper Virgine Maria: *Wee offer, O Lorde, vnto thee this reasonable seruice for them, that reste in Faithe,* Our Elders, Our Fathers, the Patriarkes, the Prophetes, the Apostles, the Preachers, the Euangelistes, the Martyres, the Confessours, &c. *Specially for the most Holy, without spotte, blessed aboue al, our Lady Goddes Mother,* and euer Virgine Marie. *Basil & Chrys. in Liturgijs.*

S. Cyprian saithe in like manner, Sacrificamus pro Martyribus, *Wee make Sacrifice* for the Martyrs. Yet, I trowe, ye wil not conclude hereof, that the Patriarkes, Prophetes, Apostles, Preachers, Euangelistes, Martyrs, Confessours, and the Blessed Virgine Marie, were al in Purgatorie. Otherwise ye woulde mutche enlarge the Popes Dominion. *Cyprian Lib. 3. Epist. 6.*

Of the other side, in your Masses for the Deade, ye haue vsed to praie thus: Libera eos à Tartaro: è profundo Lacu: ex Ore Leonis: *Deliuer them, O Lorde* (not from Purgatorie, but) *from* Hel: *from that* deepe Dungeon: *from the* Lions Mouthe. I trowe, ye are not so mutche thral vnto the Pope, that for his sake ye wil turne, the Lions Mouthe, the Deepe Dungeon, and al the Worlde, and Helle it selfe, into Purgatorie.

Thus ye se, M. Hardinge, by your owne Doctrine, ye maie praie for the Deade, and yet be neuer the neare of your Purgatorie.

But to healpe forewarde the mater, at the leaste by somme Natural reason, ye saie thus, For as mutche as nothinge, that is defiled, commeth into the Kingedome of Heauen, and somme departe out of this Life, thoughe in the Faithe of Christe, and Children of the Euerlastinge Kingedome, yet not throughly and perfitely cleane, it remaineth, that sutche, after this Life, before they comme to the place of Euerlastinge ioye, haue theire Purgation. To warrante your Minor in this Argumente, ye bringe in the wordes of S. Paule, as rightly, and as wel to your purpose, as youre manner otherwise is commonly to handle the Scriptures: *Thoughe our outwarde man be corrupted, and weakened* (whiche wordes S. Ambrose expoundeth thus, By Oppression, by Stripes, by Hunger, by Thirste, by Colde, by Nakednesse) *Yet our Soule is renewed, and made stronger daie by daie.* And againe, *Let vs cleanse our selues from al filthinesse of Fleashe, and Sprite.* Ergo, (saie ye) We must confesse by force of these Woordes, that there muste needes be a place, wherein to purge vs cleane after this life. 2. Corinth. 4. 2. Corinth. 7.

Here maie we a litle put you in remembrance by the waie: If we cleanse our selues, according to these wordes of S. Paule, from al manner filthinesse, bothe of Fleashe, and of Sprite, I beseeche you, what remaineth there then further, to be Purged in Purgatorie.

Howbeit, to proue the Imperfection, and Corruption of Nature, that euermore hangeth in our Fleashe, ye mighte, in my Iudgemente, haue alleged manye other Authorities, farre more pregnante, and clearer, then these. Esai saithe, *Al our Righteousnesse is likened vnto a fowle stained clowte:* Iob saithe, Inter Sanctos eius nemo est Fidelis: Et Cœli non sunt mundi in conspectu eius: *Emonge the* Sainctes *of God, there is none Faithful: The* Heauens *are not cleane in his sighte.* S. Paule saithe, I knowe, there is no good thinge in my Fleashe. S. Augustine saith, Let the Apostles of Christ them selues saie, *O Lorde, foregeeue vs our offenses.* *Esai. 64.* *Iob. 15.* *Rom. 7.* *Aug. in Psal. 143*

Sutche Imperfections, and Corruptions, while wee liue, wee euermore carrie in our Fleashe. Therefore, saie you, To be Purged hereof, that we maie be cleane, and fitte to

Vncleansyd.

enter into Heauen, wee must needes passe through the Fieres of Purgatorie. By this meane ye haue wel enlarged the Popes Iurisdiction. For this being true, neither is there, nor neuer was there any Creature, neither Prophete, nor Apostle, nor Martyr, nor Angel, nor Archangel, nor Heauen it selfe, Christe onely excepted, but of force muste nedes be cleansed in your Purgatorie. And therefore Origen, a great fautour of this errour, saithe thus, Vt ego arbitror, omnes nos necesse est venire in illum Ignem: etiamsi Paulus aliquis sit, vel Petrus: *As I suppose*, al wee muste needes comme into that Fiere: Yea althoughe it be Paule, or Peter. And therefore he saithe, as it is alleged before, Ego puto, quod & post Resurrectionem ex Mortuis, indigebimus Sacramento eluente nos, atque Purgante. Nemo enim absque sordibus Resurgere poterit. Neque vllam puto posse animam reperiri, quæ vniuersis statim vitijs careat: *I thinke, that after the* Resurrection from the deade, wee shal neede the Sacrament (of Baptisme) to washe vs, and to make vs cleane. For noman can rise againe without filthe. Neither doo I thinke, there can any Soule be founde, voide from al manner of Sinne.

Origen in Psal. 36. Homil. 3.

Origen in Lucã. Homil. 14.

But al these be vaine fantasies: I meane, as wel these of M. Hardinge, as also the other of Origen. S. Iohn saithe, Sanguis Iesu Christi Filij Dei purgat nos ab omni Peccato: The Bloude of Iesus Christe the Sonne of God Purgeth vs, and maketh vs cleane from al our Sinnes. The Prophete saithe, *In what houre so euer a Sinner shal repente, and mourne for his sinnes, he shalbe safe.* Esai saithe, *If your Sinnes shalbe as redde as Scarlet, yet shal they be made as white, as Snowe.* S. Paule saithe, Christus Purgationem Peccatorum nostrorum fecit: Christe (by his Bloude) hathe wrought the Purgation of our Sinnes. Therefore S. Cyprian saithe, Sanguis tuus, Domine, non quærit vltionem: Sanguis tuus lauat crimina, Peccata condonat: *Thy Bloude, ô Lorde,* seeketh no reuenge: *Thy Bloude* washeth our Sinnes, *and* Pardoneth our trespasses.

1. Iohan. 1.

Esai. 1.

Hebræ. 1.

Cyprian de Passione Christi

And, whereas you telle vs, out of somme Heathenishe fantasie, that Sinnes cannot be washte awaie, but with longe tracte of time, and paine in Purgatorie, S. Cyprian saithe, In eodem Articulo temporis, cùm iam anima festinat ad exitum, & egrediens ad labia expirantis emerserit, Pœnitentiam Clementissimi Dei benignitas non aspernatur. Nec Serum est, quod Verum est: In that very moment of time, euen when the Soule is ready to passe, *and is euen at the lippes of the partie ready to yeelde vp the Sprite, the goodnesse of our moste Mercifull God, refuseth not repentance.* And what so euer is truely donne, is neuer too late.

Cyprian De Cœna Domini.

S. Chrysostome saithe, Latro in Cruce neque vno die opus habebat. Et quid dico, vno die? Neque breui hora. Tanta est Dei erga nos Misericordia: *The Thiefe on the Crosse needed not so muche as* one daie, *to repente him selfe. What speake I of one daie? No,* he needed not one houre. *So greate is the Mercie of God towarde vs.*

Chrysost. In Genes. Homil. 27.

Of the other side, if any man departe hence without repentance, S. Augustine saithe, Imparatum inueniet illum Dies Domini, quem Imparatum inuenerit suæ Vitæ huius vltimus dies: *Him shal the daie of the Lorde finde vnprouided, whom the laste daie of this Life findeth vnprouided.* S. Ambrose saithe, Qui hic non accipit Remissionem Peccatorum, ibi non erit: *He that here in this Life receiueth not Remission of his Sinnes,* shal not be there. And S. Hierome expounding these wordes of Christe, *Thou shalte not goe forthe hence, vntil thou haue paide the laste farthinge,* saithe thus, Significat semper non exiturum esse: quia semper soluat nouissimum quadrantem, dum sempiternas Pœnas terrenorum Peccatorum luit: Christes *meaninge is, that he shal* neuer comme out: *for that he muste* euermore paie the laste farthinge, *whiles he suffereth* Euerlastinge Pounishmente *for his Sinnes committed in this worlde.*

Augu. Epist. 80.

Ambrosi. De Bono Mortu.

Hierony. in Lamentatiques Hieremiæ. Li. 1. Cap. 1.

So saithe S. Augustine, Donec soluas nouissimum quadrantem: Miror, si non eam significat pœnam, quæ vocatur Aeterna: *Vntil thou paie the laste farthinge: I maruelle, but he meaneth that paine,* whiche is called Euerlastinge.

August. De Sermon. Domini in Monte Lib. 1.

Hereby, M. Hardinge, I thinke, it maie partly appeare, that you maintcine your painted Fiere, and Paper VValles, with painted Authorities, and Paper Reasons. Verily the Christian people of the Easte Churche of God, whiche sommetime was as greate, and as famous, as the Churche of the Weaste, notwithstandinge they beleeued in God, and his Christe, and knewe, there was bothe Helle, and Heauen, yet in

your

your Purgatorie they had no skil. **One of your Doctours saithe,** Vsque in hodiernum diem Purgatorium non est à Græcis creditum: Vntil this daie of the Grecians, or of the Easte Churche, Purgatorie was neuer beleued. **Therefore ye cannot iustly saie, that your fantasie herein was euermore accoumpted Vniuersal, or Catholique.** *Alphonsus De Hæresibus l. 8. De Indulgentijs.*

The Apologie, Cap. 16. Diuision. 2.

Augustine in deede sommetime saithe, there is sutche a certaine place: sometime he denieth not, but there maie be sutche a one: sometime he doubteth: sommetime againe he vtterly denieth, there is any at al, & thinketh, that men are therein deceiued by a certaine Natural good wil, they beare their friendes departed. But yet of this one Errour hath there growen vp such a harueste of those Massemongers, **that, the Masses beinge sold abroade commonly in euery Corner, the Temples of God became shoppes, to geate money: and selie soules were borne in hande, that nothinge was more necessarie to be bought. In deede there was nothinge more gaineful for these menne to selle.** *Augu. in Psal. 85*

M. Hardinge.

VVel railed. If your reasons, or Authorities were so piththy, as your mockes and scoffes be spiteful, yee were to be hearde. But thankes be to God, that suche shrewed beastes haue shorte hornes. Nowe to S. Augustine. And as Festus saide to S. Paule, Haste thou appealed to Cæsar? to Cæsar shalt thou goe. So saie wee to you, thoughe not hauinge that auctoritie ouer you, whiche Festus had ouer S. Paule: To Augustine ye referre this mater, and by Augustine shal ye be iudged. Act. 25.

I woulde allege vnto you sundrie places of the (a) Scriptures, whiche maie sufficiently proue Purgatorie to a Christen man, that is not contentious, but that wil we doo hereafter as occasion serueth. Nowe to S. Augustine. VVee saie plainely, that S. Augustine affirmeth Purgatorie, and that it (b) cannot be shewed where he doubteth of it, muche lesse where he vtterly denieth any suche to be. In sundrie places of his woorkes he expoundeth the woordes of S. Paule to the Corinthians of Purgatorie, where the Apostle saithe, that the woorkes, whiche be builded vpon the fundation (which is Christe) shalbe tried by Fiere. In the 21. Booke De Ciuitate Dei, after that he hathe declared his iudgemente touchinge paines of diuers sortes, whiche menne suffer for Sinnes committed, he saithe thus: But paines temporal somme suffer in this life onely: somme after their Deathe: somme bothe nowe and also then, yet before that most seuere and laste iudgemente. 1. Augustine affirmeth Purgatorie in plaine and expresse wordes. 1. Cor. 3.

Maie it therefore please you Sirs, to reade S. Augustine in some such places (for to reade al that he hath written to that ende were very much, and a great let to your Domestical cares) and that I thinke verely ye wil secretely agree in iudgement with vs, thoughe for shame and consideration of the stage ye plaie your parte on, openly the same ye wil not confesse. And therfore in his Booke *De Hæresibus ad Quoduultdeum*, he condemneth Aërius of Heresie (and so consequently al others that be of his opinion) bicause to the Heresies of the Arians he had added this also, that none oughte to praie, or make oblations for the deade.

VVhere ye make S. Augustine very vncertaine in this pointe, as though he saide sometime there is such a certaine place, sometime there maie be such a one, sometime he doubted of it, sometime plainly denied any suche to be: either yee vnderstande not S. Augustine, or yee saie contrary to your owne knowledge. Verily ye be too bolde with him. (c) First that he denieth Purgatorie, that is false. And where ye allege Hypognostica in the margent of your Booke, reade it once againe at my requeste, and your felues wil saie, the place proueth not your pourpose. The Authour of that woorke, whether he were S. Augustine, which Erasmus beleueth not, or who so euer he was, denieth not Purgatorie: but that after the daie of general iudgement there is any place of Euerlastinge reste, or paine, but Kingdome of Heauen, and Hel, that he denieth. VVhiche wee also denie. And there he speaketh againste the Pelagians, who, as S. Augustine writeth of them ad Quoduultdeum, promised to infantes dyinge without Baptisme a certaine euerlasting and blessed life without and bisides the Kingedome of God. VVhiche Heresie in sundrie places he reproueth. It seemeth the woorde Purgatorium, noted in the margent of that Booke (d) by thunlearned Printer begiled you. VVhiche sheweth howe profoundly ye be seene in the Doctours. The thing he doubted of, touching this mater, is this: VVhether those temporal paines doo onely pouniſhe for the (e) Satisfaction of the Iustice of God, or also doo purge and correcte the Soules of the deade in suche wise, as temporal paines are woonte to doo in this life. But nowe, whether the smarte, and sorowe of thinges leafte behinde, whiche proceeded in this life of Carnal affection, remaine also to the soules after their departure from the Body, whereof S. Augustine sheweth him selfe to stande in doubte in Enchiridio ad Laurent. ca. 68. & 69. and whether the fiere whiche soules feele in Purgatorie as it paineth them, (f) so also doo by degrees diminish and correcte those Venial and Secular affections, whiche they carried with them at their Deathe, or whether death it selfe doo so ende them, as there remaine not any correction of the minde yet beinge vicious, but

Lib. 5. Hypognosticon. Rubr. 11. What is that S. Augustine doubted of touching Purgatory.

(a) It was a good pointe of skil, with a good countenance to passe them ouer.
(b) Vntruthe. It shalbe shewed. Reade the Answeare.
O, so careful this good man is for our cares.
(c) vntruth. Manifest. Reade S. Augustines woordes in the Answeare.
(d) Vntruth. For the margine was so noted by Erasmus.
(e) Vntruthe, blasphemous againste the Bloude of Christe. Reade the Answeare.
(f) O graue Cõmentarie: and a wise mater to be called in question.

onely the pouniſhmente of the ſinne paſte: that is the thinge, whereof S. Auguſtine (g) ſeemeth to haue doubted. In effecte his queſtion is, whether the Fire of Purgatorie be not (h) double. The one whiche pouniſheth the venial ſinne paſte: the other whiche diminiſheth and taketh awaie th'affection of ſinne yet remaininge. Of the firſte he doubteth not: of the other he ſaithe, *Non redarguo, quia forſitan verum eſt*, I ſaie not againſte it, for peraduenture it is true. De Ciuit. Dei. Lib. 21. Cap. 26.

(g) This whole mater is concluded with ſeming, and likelyhoode.

(h) Double Fire in Purgatorie: Double Folie.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

VVee raile at you, M. Hardinge, euen as Chriſte railed at certaine others, in whoes ſteppes ye ſeme to treade, for that they had made of the Houſe of God a Caue of Theeues.

The places of the Scriptures, whiche yée thoughte it beſte to paſſe ouer, and whereby your Purgatorie by your iudgement vndoubtedly maie be proued, if a man be not verie contentious, I trowe, be theſe: *Verily, Verily, I ſaie vnto you, he that heareth my Woorde, and beleeueth in him, that ſente me, hathe Euerlaſtinge Life: and ſhal not comme into damnation: but hathe paſſed from Deathe vnto Life.* Or, that Eſai the Prophete ſaithe of Chriſte: *He was wounded for our tranſgreſſions: He was broken for our iniquities: The chaſtiſemente of our Peace was vpon him: and with his ſtripes wee were made whole.* Or, that S. Paule ſaithe, *Chriſte hathe taken the Obligation, that was againſte vs, and hathe faſtened it vnto his Croſſe.* Or, that S. Iohn ſaithe, *Bleſſed be the Deade, that die in the Lorde. Euen ſo ſaithe the Sprite. For they reſte from theire laboures: and theire woorkes folowe them.* He ſaithe not, they be in Purgatorie: but, they reſte from theire Labours. And againe, *They ſhal hunger nomore: They ſhal thirſte nomore. For the Lambe, whiche is in the middes of the Throne, ſhal gouerne them, and ſhal leade them* (not into Purgatorie, but) *vnto the liuely Fountaines of Waters: and God ſhal wipe awaie al teares from their eies.* Theſe, or ſuche other like Places, I trowe, they be, whereby yée aſſure your ſelfe ſo certainely of your Purgatorie.

Iohan. 5. Eſai. 53. Coloſſ. 2. Apocal. 14. Apocal. 7.

But vnto S. Auguſtine wee haue appealed: and to S. Auguſtine (yée ſaie) wee ſhal [illegible]. Howe be it, if yée conſider the mater wel, yée ſhal finde, that our appeale lieth not vnto S. Auguſtine. It had benne more indifferente dealinge, to haue ſaide with S. Bernarde, Ad Euangelium appellaſti: & ad Euangelium ibis: Yee haue appealed vnto the Goſpel: and to the Goſpel yee ſhal goe.

Bernar. in Cantica, Serm. 65.

As for S. Auguſtine, notwithſtandinge his Authoritie be greate, and his Learninge déepe, yet in theſe caſes, as it ſhal wel appeare, he can be but a doubtful Iudge. And a doubtful Iudge, ſo farre forthe, as he doubteth, is no Iudge. Youre owne Canon telleth you, In erroris Labyrinthum nonnulli intricando impingunt, cùm ante iudicant, quàm intelligant: *Many menne geuinge Iudgemente before they can vnderſtande, by entanglinge them ſelues, fal into a Maze of errour.* For howe can he pronounce ſentence of that, he confeſſeth, he knoweth not? Or howe can he aſſure vs, that is not hable to aſſure him ſelfe? Touchinge the certainetie of this Doctrine, to allege one, or two places out of many, S. Auguſtine writeth thus: Tale aliquid, etiam poſt hanc Vitam fieri, incredibile non eſt: &, vtrùm ita ſit, quæri poteſt: *Some ſuche thinge* (he meaneth the Fiere of Purgatorie) *to be after this life*, it is not incredible: And whether it be ſo, or no, ‡ It maie be a queſtion. Againe, Quòd Spiritus Defunctorum, &c. Ignem tanſitoriæ Tribulationis inueniant, non redarguo: quia Forſitan Verum eſt: *That the Sprites of the Deade finde a Fiere of tranſitorie Tributation, I reproue it not:* For ⋆ Perhaps it is true. Againe, Siue ergo in hac Vita tantùm hominesiſta patiuntur, ſiue etiam poſt hanc Vitam talia quædam iudicia ſubſequuntur: non abhorret, ‡ Quantum Arbitror, à ratione Veritatis iſte intellectus huius ſententiæ: *Therefore whether men ſuffer ſuche thinges onely in this Life, Or els ſomme ſuche Iudgementes folowe euen after this Life*, ⋆ As mutche as I thinke, *the vnderſtandinge of this ſentence diſagreeth not from the order of the Truthe.*

Auguſt. ad Laurenti. ca. 67. & Diſ. 29. Sciendũ

Augu. in 8. qu. ad Dulcitiũ. q. 1. ‡ It maie be a queſtion.

Augu. De Ciuit. Lib. 21. Cap. 27. ⋆ Perhaps it is true.

Aug. de Fide, & Operib. cap. 16. ‡ Quantum arbitror. ⋆ As mutche as I thinke.

Augu. De Ciuit. Lib. 21. Cap. 27. ‡ Non potui.

And againe he ſaithe, Quis ſit iſte modus, & quæ ſint iſta Peccata, quæ ita impediant peruentionem ad Regnum Dei, vt tamen Sanctorum amicorum meritis impetrent indulgentiam, difficilimum eſt inuenire: Periculociſsimum definire: Ego certè vſq; ad hoc tempus, cùm inde ſatagerem, ad eorum indaginem peruenire ‡ non potui: *What meane this is, and what Sinnes theſe be, whiche ſo lette a man from commynge vnto the*

Kingedome

De Ciuit. Dei. Li. 21. Cap. 16.

Kingedome of God, that they maie notwithſtandinge obteine Pardonne by the Merites of Holy frendes, it is very harde to finde: and very dangerous to determine. Certainely I mee ſelfe, *notwithſtandinge greate ſtudie, and trauaile taken in that behalfe,* coulde neuer atteine to the knowledge of it. Thus, touchinge Purgatorie, S. Auguſtine ſaithe, *Whether there be any ſuche place after this life, or no, It maie be a queſtion: Perhaps it is true: As mutche, as I thinke: I cannot telle: I coulde neuer attaine to the knowledge of it.*

S. Auguſtine doubteth. I coulde neuer attaine to the knolwedge.

By theſe it is plaine, that S. Auguſtine ſtode in doubte hereof, whether there be any ſuche Purgatorie Fiere, or no. Therefore vndoubtedly he toke it neither for an Article of the Chriſtian Faithe (for therof it had not benne lawful for him to doubt) nor for any Tradition of the Apoſtles.

Yet ſaie, *S. Auguſtine* neuer doubted, whether there were any ſuche place of Purgatorie, or ſuche Fiere, or no: But onely, whether the tormentes there do ſatisfie the Iuſtice of God for Sinne, or no: and, whether the ſame tormentes doo by degrees diminiſhe the Venial Sinnes, and Seculare Affections, whiche the Parties carried with them, or no. Theſe, you ſaie, were S. Auguſtines doubtes. Notwithſtandinge what ſhoulde any queſtion be raiſed hereof? Plato, and Vergile, and other Heathen Writers, from whom this Doctrine firſte flowed abroade, woulde ſone haue put you quite out of doubte. Vergile hereof emongeſt others ſaithe thus:

Æneid. 6.

Quin & ſupremo cum lumine vita reliquit,
Non tamen omne malum miſeris, nec funditus omnes
Corporeæ excedunt peſtes: Penituſque neceſſe eſt
Multa diu *concreta modis inoleſcere miris.*
Ergo exercentur pœnis, *veterumque malorum*
Supplicia expendunt: Aliæ panduntur inanes
Suſpenſæ ad ventos: alijs ſub gurgite vaſto
Infectum eluitur ſcelus, *aut* exuritur igni.

But reade you S. Auguſtine, M. Hardinge: you, I ſaie, that, to diſe youre owne wordes, are ſo profoundely ſeene in al the Doctoures, that ye maie boldely deſpiſe al others what ſo euer: Reade, I ſaie, S. Auguſtine: examine better the Places, and weighe the wordes: And ye ſhal finde, that he neuer, neither mentioneth, nor toucheth any of theſe your pretty fantaſies: but ſaithe plainely, VVhether it be ſo, or no, it maie be a queſtion: I reproue it not: For perhaps it is true.

And are ye ſo Profoundely ſeene in al the Doctoures, and Scriptures, M. Hardinge, that ye thinke, there is either Fiere, or VVater, or any other Creature, wherewith to ſatiſfie the Iuſtice of God againſte Sinne, ſauinge onely the *Blonde of the Lambe of God, that taketh awaie the Sinne of the Worlde?* Or, thinke you, that S. Auguſtine woulde turne vs from the Satiſfaction of Chriſte, and ſende vs to ſeke for any other? Certainely S. Auguſtine him ſelfe ſaithe, Valeat mihi ad Perfectionem liberationis tantùm Pretium Sanguinis Domini mei: Let onely the Price of the Bloude of my Lorde *auaile me to the Perfection of my deliuerie.*

Auguſtin. in Pſalm. 25.

Againe he ſaithe, Quando aliquis ſe conuerterit ad Deum, prorſus illi omnia dimittuntur. Nemo ſit ſollicitus, quòd aliquid ei non dimittatur: *When ſo euer any man turneth him ſelfe vnto God, al thinges vtterly are forgeeuen him. Let noman be doubteful, leaſte* any thinge happily be not forgeeuen. Chryſoſtome imagineth God thus to ſaie of a Sinner: Vnum tantùm requiro, vt confiteatur Peccata, & ab eis deſiſtat: Nec vltrà Infero Pœnam Peccatis: This thinge onely (ſaithe God) I require *of a Sinner, that he confeſſe his Sinnes* (vnto me) *and leaue the ſame.* Afterwarde I laie no more Pouniſhmente vpon his Sinnes. Likewiſe againe he ſaithe, Ego Fideiubeo: Si quis noſtrum recedat à Peccatis ex animo, & verè Promittat Deo, ſe ad illa non rediturum,

Augu. De Verbis Domini, Serm. 59.

Chryſoſt. in Geneſ. Homil. 44.

Chryſoſt. De Philogonio.

nihil Deum requisiturum ad Satisfactionem: *I will stande bounde in Goddes behalfe: If any of vs forsake his Sinnes with al his harte, and make true promisse vnto God, that he wil no more returne vnto them, that then* God shal require nothing els vnto Satisfaction. He, that knoweth not thus muche, hathe no greate cause, to vaunt him selfe of his profounde knowledge in the Doctours. But, if Goddes Justice againste your sinne be fully satisfied by the Bloude of Christ: If the Onely price of our Lordes Bloud, haue wrought the perfection of your deliuerie: If there remaine nothinge vnforegeeuen: If God require no further pounishmente: What shoulde you seke for other Satisfaction in your painted Fieres, and smokes of Purgatorie.

To conclude, ye saie thus, In effecte, S. Augustines question is, whether the Fiere of Purgatorie be not double. O, M. Hardinge, if ye were simple, and meante simply, ye would not so vainely double the pointe. I beseche you, what double Fiere of Purgatorie meante S. Augustine? Or where was he euer so double in dealinge? By your double Diuinitie, and profounde knowledge in the Doctours, ye haue at the laste shilfully founde out a Double Purgatorie Fiere, and a Double Purgatorie. Howe be it, as you are nowe troubled aboute the Fiere of youre Purgatorie: so were somme others of youre frendes, not longe sithence, as muche troubled aboute the VVater. Sir Thomas Moore saide, and held for certaine, that in al Purgatorie there is no VVater: no, not one droppe. And that, he saide, he woulde proue by the wordes of the Prophete Zacharie: Eduxisti vinctos tuos de Lacu, in quo non erat Aqua: *Thou hast deliuered thy Prisoners out of the Dungeon, wherein* there was no VVater.

Sir Thomas Moore.

Zachar. 9.

The Bishop of Rochester

Psalm. 65.

Of the other side, Roffensis saithe, *Yes, there is in* Purgatorie *good stoare of* VVater. And that, he saithe, he can proue by the Prophete Dauid: Transiuimus per Ignem, & Aquam: & eduxisti nos in refrigerium: *We haue passed through* Fire, *and* VVater: *and thou hast broughte vs forthe into a place of refreashinge.* Albertus, and Roffensis saie, The Executioners, and Ministers of Purgatorie, be Holy Angelles: Sir Thomas Moore saithe, Out of doubte, they be no Angelles, but very Diuelles. So handesomely these dreames agree together.

To returne to the mater, where ye saie, VVe muche mistooke the place of S. Augustine, being deceiued by the ignorant note in the Margine, where also ye so pleasantly sporte your selfe with out Profounde knowledge in the Doctoures, the wordes of S. Augustine, that ye meane, be these, Primum Locum Fides Catholicorum, Diuina Authoritate, Regnum credit esse Cælorum: vnde non Baptizatus excipitur: Secundum, Gehennam: vbi omnis Apostata, & à Christi Fide alienus Aeterna Supplicia experietur: Tertium Penitùs ignoramus: imo nec esse in Scripturis Sanctis inueniemus: *The Firste Place the Catholique Faithe, by Goddes Authoritie, beleeueth to be the* Kingedome of Heauen: *From whence, who so euer is not Baptized, is excluded:* The Seconde Place, *the same Catholique Faithe beleeueth to be* Hel: *Where al Renegates, and who so euer is without the Faithe of Christe, shal taste Euerlastinge Pounishmente.* As for any Thirde Place, wee vtterly knowe none: neither shal wee finde in the Holy Scriptures, that there is any suche. If these wordes make not againste youre Purgatorie, yet truely in any appearance, they make but slenderly for your Purgatorie. S. Augustine saithe, Any other Thirde Place (after this Life, bisides Heauen, and Helle) wee vtterly knowe none. Neither can wee finde in the Holy Scriptures, that there is any sutche.

August. Hypognosti. Lib. 5.

No Thirde Place.

But, if al these thre places, Heauen, Helle, and Purgatorie, had benne certainely knowen, and Universally receiued in the Churche, and yet bisides theise three places, the Pelagian Heretiques woulde haue diuised, as you imagine, an other seuerall Place, to receiue the Soules of sutche Childzen, as departed out of this life without Baptisme, then coulde not S. Augustine haue truely saide, Tertium locum ignoramus: VVee knowe no Thirde place: But rather he shoulde haue saide, Quartum locum ignoramus: Fourthe place *wee knowe none.* For, by youre iudgemente, the doubte had benne, not of the Thirde place, but of the Fourthe. And it had benne a greate ouersighte for S. Augustine, in the recheninge onely of Foure places, to haue forgotten One: and specially sutche a One to, as hathe benne founde more gainefull of late yeres, then the other Three: But his wordes be plaine: Heauen

Fourthe Place.

wee

wee knowe: and Helle wee knowe: But any Thirde place bisides Heauen, and Helle, wee knowe none.

Auguſtine denieth purgatory

This worde, Purgatorium, was noted in the Pargine, not by the Printer, as you ſaie, but by Eraſmus, a man of famous memorie: whoſe name for learninge, and iudgemente, hathe at al times emonge the Learned, benne mutche eſteemed: with whom your yong Louanian Clergie mate not wel compare, in the profounde knowledge of the Doctours, without greate blusshinge. And thus mutch touchinge this one Place of S. Auguſtine, wherein it hathe pleaſed you ſo deerely to charge vs with groſſe ignorance. But for better trial of his iudgemente herein, ye ſhoulde haue conſidered, what he hathe written other wheres to like pourpoſe.

In his Epiſtle to Heſychius he ſaithe thus: In quo quenque inuenerit ſuus nouiſſimus dies, in hoc eum comprehendet mundi nouiſsimus dies. Quoniam qualis in die iſto quiſque moritur, talis in die illo iudicabitur: *In what ſtate* his owne laſte daie *ſhal finde eche man, in the ſame ſtate* the laſte daie of the worlde *ſhal finde him. For ſuche as euery man* in this daie *ſhal die, euen ſuche in that daie ſhal he be iudged*. Againe, Qualem inuenit Dominus, cum hinc vocat, talem & iudicat: As our Lorde findeth a man, when he calleth him hence, euen ſo he iudgeth him. And againe, Qui in hac vita Deo non placuerit, habebit quidem Pœnitentiam in Futuro Sæculo de malis ſuis: ſed indulgentiam in conſpectu Dei non inueniet. Quia etſi erit ibi ſtimulus pœnitudinis, nulla tamen erit correctio voluntatis: *Who ſo in this life ſhal not pleaſe God, ſhal in the World to come haue Repentance for his Sinnes:* But Pardonne in the ſighte of God he ſhal not finde. *For although there ſhalbe there the pricke of Repentance, yet there ſhalbe no amendemente of the wil.* Againe he ſaithe, Vnuſquiſque cum cauſa ſua dormiet, & cum cauſa ſua reſurget: *Euery man ſhal die with his owne cauſe, and* riſe againe with his owne cauſe. Olympiodorus ſaithe, In quocunque loco, &c. deprehendetur homo, cùm moritur, in eo gradu, atque ordine permanet in Aeternum: *In what place, or ſtate ſo euer a man ſhalbe founde, when he dieth*, in the ſame ſtate, and degree ſhal he remaine for euer.

Aug. Epiſt. 80.

Auguſt. in Apocalyp. Homil. 11. *Auguſt. ad Petrum Diacon. Cap.* 3.

Auguſtin. in Iohan. Tract. 49. *Olympiodorus in Eccleſiaſt. Cap.* 9.

But to reckon vp al, that mighte be ſaide in this behalfe, it woulde be longe. A ſimple man, W. Hardinge, without any profounde knowledge of the Doctours, mate eaſily ſee, that theſe ſaieinges wil hardely ſtande with your Doctrine of Purgatorie. Your owne Roffenſis ſaithe, Nemo nunc dubitat Orthodoxus, an Purgatorium ſit: De quo tamen apud Priſcos, vel nulla, vel quàm rariſsima fiebat mentio. Sed & Græcis ad hunc vſque diem non eſt Creditum: Quamdiu enim nulla eſſet cura de Purgatorio, nemo quæſiuit indulgentias: *No Catholique man nowe doubteth of Purgatorie: Wherof notwithſtandinge emonge the Ancient Fathers* there is either no mention at al, or very ſeldome. Yea euen vntil this daie the Grecians beleue it not. For, ſo longe as there was no care for Purgatorie, noman ſought after Pardonnes. By which witneſſe it appeareth, that Pardonnes, and Purgatorie were brought in iointely bothe togeather. And, as the caſe nowe ſtandeth, and as moſte menne thinke, the Pope coulde be contented to loſe bothe Heauen, and Helle, to ſaue his Purgatorie.

Poly. dor. De Inuentorib. Lib. 8. *Cap.* 1.

The Apologie, Cap. 17. *Diuiſion.* 1.

As touching the multitude of vaine, and ſuperfluous Ceremonies, wee knowe, that S. Auguſtine did greeuouſly complaine of them in his owne time: and therefore haue wee cutte of a greate number of them: bicauſe wee knowe, that menne conſciences were encombred aboute them, and the Churches of God ouerladen with them. Neuertheleſſe wee keepe ſtil, and eſteeme, not onely thoſe Ceremonies, which, wee are ſure, were deliuered vs from the Apoſtles: but ſomme others too biſides, whiche wee thoughte mighte be ſuffered without hurte to the Churche of God: for that wee had a deſire, that al thinges in the Holy Congregation mighte, as S. Paule commaundeth, be donne with comelineſſe, and in good order. But, as for al thoſe thinges, whiche, wee

wee sawe, were, either very superstitious, or vtterly vnprofitable, or noisome, or mocarries, or contrarie to the Holy Scriptures, or els vnseemly for sober, and discrete people, whereof there be infinite numbers nowe a dates, where the Romaine Religion is vsed, these, I saie, wee haue vtterly refused without al manner exception: bicause wee woulde not haue the righte woorshippinge of God to be any lenger defiled with sutche folies.

M. Hardinge.

S. Augustine, whom ye allege wrongefully againste the Ceremonies of the Catholike Church, speaketh onely of the cuttinge awaie of sutche manners, and rites, as be crepte into some one particulare Countrie, neither conteined in Holy Scriptures, nor established by Councelles of Bishoppes, nor confirmed by Custome of the whole Churche. But howe prone you by that place, that you maie pul downe Aultars, and Images: disallowe the Vowe of Pouertie, Lente, Oile? &c. S. Augustine referreth the takinge awaie of any Custome, or manner vnto dewe Authoritie, exhortinge it to be donne, *Vbi facultas tribuitur:* VVhere Power is geuen to doo it. Neither els maie it be donne lawfully at al, &c. Ye thinke, wee haue many ridiculous, and fonde thinges, in our Cerimonies. If wee had, (a) as in deede wee haue not, woulde ye laughe at them, as Cham did at the nakednesse of his Father Noe: &c. Laughe on ye cursed Chananees: but we wil daunce before the Arke: we wil (b) shire our heade with Paule, &c.

(a) Vntruth. For S. Augustine speaking of his time, saithe, *Tam multis Præsumptionibus ita plena sunt omnia, &c.*

(b) Then be yee circumcised, as Paule was. For this was only a Iewishe Ceremonie.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

This mater had benne ouer colde, had not M. Hardinge a litle enflamed his Choler in the ende, and cried out vpon his Cursed Chananees. His Aultars, his Images, his Vowes, his Lentes, & his Oiles, be answeared sufficiently otherwheres. S. Augustines wordes, concerninge this mater, are pregnante, and plaine: Hoc nimis doleo, quia multa, quæ in Diuinis Libris saluberrime præcepta sunt, minùs curantur: & tam multis Præsumptionibus sic plena sunt omnia, &c. *This thinge greeueth me, that so many thinges, wholesomely commaunded in the Holy Scriptures*, are not regarded: *and al thinges are ful of so many* Presumptions, &c. And againe, Quamuis ista contra Fidem non sint; tamen ipsam Religionem, quam Paucissimis, & Manifestissimis Celebrationum Sacramentis Misericordia Dei liberam esse voluit, seruilibus oneribus ita premunt, vt tolerabilior sit conditio Iudæorum: qui etsi tempus libertatis non agnouerint, Legalibus tamen sarcinis, non humanis Præsumptionibus subijciuntur: *Al be it these thinges be not againste the Faithe, yet with* seruile burthens they so oppresse *our very Religion, Whiche God of his Mercie woulde haue to be free, vnder* very fewe, *and* mosle manifeste *Sacramentes of Diuine Seruice*, that the state of the Iewes is mutche more tolerable (then the state of the Churche of Christe). *For the* Iewes, *notwithstandinge they knewe not of the time of Libertie, yet were they subiecte to the Packes, and burthens of the Lawe* (of God): *and not vnto the* Diuises, and Presumptions *of Menne.*

Augustin. in ead. Epistol.

Of sutche Diuises, and Presumption, Chrysostome saithe, Non dicunt, Cur Legem Mosi, sed Cur Traditionem Seniorum transgrediuntur? Vnde patet, eos multa innouasse, cùm Deus contra vetuisset, ne quid adderent, aut minuerent Sed illi, cùm timerēt, ne Principatum amitterent, ceu Legum Latores, vt maiores esse viderentur, plurima innouarunt. Quæ res ad tantam peruenit nequitiam, vt præcepta sua custodirent magis, quàm præcepta Dei: *The Pharisees saie not vnto Christe, Wherefore doo thy Disciples breake the Lawe of Moses, but, Wherefore doo they breake the* Traditions of the Elders? *Whereby it appeareth, that they had altered many thinges: whereas God had commaunded, that they shoulde neither adde, nor diminishe. But fearinge, leaste they shoulde loose their Authoritie, as if they had benne Lawe Makers, to thende they might seeme the greater, they altered mucbe. Whiche thinge* (in the ende) *greewe to sutche a wickednesse, that they keapte* their owne Commaundementes, *more then the* Commaundementes of God.

Chryso. in Matthæ. Homil. 52.

In like manner saithe S. Cyril, Vellent suam Doctrinam, & Paternas Traditiones ab hominibus potius suscipi, atque in admiratione, honoreque haberi. Quicquid igitur Christo credentium accesserit, sibi detractum putant: *The Pharisees* woulde that *menne shoulde receiue, and magnifie* theire Doctrine, *and the* Traditions of the Fathers:

Cyril. in Iohan. Lib. 8. Cap. 1.

Therefore

Therefore howe many so euer Faithefull came vnto Christe, they thoughte so many were losse from them.

It is not true, that we saie, Traditions maie not be changed, or abolished without the general Consente of the whole Churche. For Ceremonies, as they neuer grewe tograther at one time in al places, so can they not lightly be abolished tograther at one time in al places. Socrates saithe plainely, Videtur mihi, Multa modo in his regionibus, modo in illis Consuetudinem obtinuisse: *It seemeth vnto me, that many thinges haue benne receiued by Custome,* nowe in one Countrie, and nowe in an other. Againe he saithe, In vniuersum certè, & in omnibus Obseruationibus piarum precum, non possunt duæ Ecclesiæ inueniri, quæ prorsus inter se consentiant: *Verily to speake Vniuersally, in al maner of Obseruations, or Fourmes of Common Praier,* there cannot two Churches be founde, that agree thorowly bitweene them selues. S Augustine saith plainly, Omnia talia, &c. vbi facultas truibuitur, sine omne dubitatione resecanda existimo: *Al suche thinges, in my iudgemente ought to be cutte of: as soone as iuste occasion, or Power is geuen,* without any manner of doubtinge. So saithe Pope Steuin, Si nonnulli ex Prædecessoribus, & Maioribus nostris fecerunt aliqua, quæ illo tempore potuerunt esse sine culpa, & postea vertuntur in errorem, & Superstitionem, sine tarditate aliqua, & cum magna Authoritate à posteris destruantur: *If sundrie of our Predecessours, or Elders haue donne certaine thinges, which at that time might wel be donne without hurte, and afterwarde are turned into errour, and Superstition,* without any staggeringe, *and* with greate Authoritie *let them be destroied, and abolished by the Successours.* And Pope Damasus saithe, Quod ratione caret, extirpare necesse est: *What so euer wanteth reason, muste of necessitie be rooted out.*

Socrates. Lib. 5. Cap 22. Ἐμοὶ δὲ φαίνεται ὅτι πολλὰ κατὰ χώρας συνήθειαν ἔλαβεν. Socrates eod. loco.

Augu. Epist 119.

Dist. 63. Quæ sancta.

VVee laughe not, as we saie, M. Hardinge, at the nakednesse of our Father. Our Father is in Heauen, the Father of Lighte, the God of Glorie: and in him there is no nakednesse. We laughe not at anye of these thinges, but we saie with S. Augustine, as it is alleged before, Hoc nimis doleo, &c. *This thinge very muche greeueth me, that so many thinges wholesomely commaunded in the Holy Scriptures, are not regarded: and that al thinges are ful of so many presumptions:* And that, as S. Chrysostome saithe, *These thinges are called vpon, and more regarded, then the Lawes, and* Commaundementes of our Father. Our Father saithe of you, and of your Fellowes: Volunt facere, vt obliuiscatur Populus meus Nominis mei propter somnia sua: *They wil cause, that my People shal forgeate my Name,* for loue of their Dreames. Our Father saithe, *Two euilles haue my People donne: They haue forsaken me the Fountaine of the Water of Life: and they haue ripte vp to them selues broken Cesternes, that can holde no Water.* Our Father saithe, *What is Chaffe vnto the Corne? Who hathe required these thinges at your handes?* To be shorte, hereof Christe him selfe saithe thus, *Euery plante, that my* Heauenly Father *hathe not planted, shalbe pluckte vp by the rootes.*

Dist. 68. Chorepiscopi.

Augu Epist. 119.

Chryso. in Matthæ. Homil. 52.

Hieremi. 23.

Hiere ut 2.

Hieremi. 23.

Esaie. 1.

Matthæ. 15.

The Apologie, Cap. 18. Diuision. 1.

Wee make our Praiers in that tongue which al our people, as meete is, maie vnderstande, to thende they maie (as S. Paule counselleth vs) take common commoditie by Common Praier: euen as al the Holy Fathers, and Catholique Bishoppes, bothe in the Olde, and Newe Testament did vse to Praie them selues, & taught the people to Praie too: least, as S. Augustine saith, Like Parots, and Ouels vve should seme to speake, that vvee vnderstande not. Neither haue weee any other Mediatoure, & Intecessoure, by whome wee maie haue accesse to God the Father, but onely Iesus Christe, in whose onely name al thinges are obteined at his Fathers hande. But it is a shameful parte, and ful of Infidelitie, that wee see euery where vsed in the Churches of oure aduersaries, not onely in that they wil haue innumrable sortes of Media-

Mediatours, & that vtterly without the Authoritie of Gods Woord: (So that, as Ieremie ſaithe, the Sainctes be nowe as many in number, or rather aboue the number of the Citties: and poore menne cannot tel, to whiche Sainete it were beſte to turne them firſt: And though there be ſo many, as they cannot be tolde, yet euery one of them hathe his peculiare Duetie, and office aſſigned vnto him by theſe folkes: what thinge they oughte to aſke, what to geeue, and what to bringe to paſſe) But beſides this alſo, in that they doo not onely wickedly, but alſo ſhamefully cal vpon the Bleſſed Virgine Chriſtes Mother, to haue her remember, that ſhee is the Mother, and to commaunde her Sonne, and to vſe a Mothers authoritie ouer him.

Ierem. Cap. 2. & 11.

M. Hardinge.

VVee haue but onely one Mediatour to Saluation Ieſus Chriſte, by whoſe merites God is reconciled vnto vs. But where ye ſaie, that beſides the ſame one Mediatour, ye haue none other, that (a) may praie or make interceſsion for you, that pointe of falſe beleſe ye maie keepe for your ſelues. VVe had rather holde with (b) S. Paule, who as he is praied for of al Chriſten men, ſo he doubted not to ſaie to the Corinthians, that he hoped to eſcape daunger, *Adiuuantibus vobis in Oratione pro nobis*, By the healpe of you in praier for vs. If one good man maie healpe an other in this life by Praier, whiles he hath yet ſomewhat of his owne to be careful for: much more the Sainctes, whiche are diſſolued, and reigne with Chriſte, can helpe vs with their perfite Praier. Ye can tel (I trowe) that S. Hierome made this argument within litle of twelue hundred yeeres paſt. Neither make wee them Gods, as ye woulde ſeeme to ſaie by the place (which beinge ſpoken by the Prophete Hieremie of very Idols) ye applie to the frendes of Chriſt. VVhom Dauid ſaith to be vnto him moſt honorable, and their dominion to be moſte ſtronge. There is no cauſe why ye ſhoulde woonder, if diuers Cities doo gladly acknowledge ſome one Holy Angel, Apoſtle, Martyr, or Confeſſour, as their cheſe Patron, and frend. For if (as it is written) Michael the Archangel was once Prince of the Iewes, and ſtoode alwaies for the children of Goddes people: it is not to be doubted but that Chriſten people haue nowe alſo theire (c) Patrones. To this pourpoſe (d) ſome applie that whiche is written, *Fulgebunt iuſti, & tanquam ſcintillæ in arundineto diſcurrent, iudicabunt nationes, & dominabuntur populis, & regnabit dominus illorum in perpetuum:* The iuſte menne ſhal ſhine, and like ſparkes of fire in drie kickes ſtral runne abrode: they ſhal iudge nations, and beare rule ouer peoples, and our Lorde ſhal raigne ouer them for euer. S. Ambroſe is of that opinion plainely, where he ſaithe, writinge vpon S. Luke, *Sicut Angeli præſunt, ita & ij qui vitam meruerint Angelorum.* As the Angelles be ouer Nations, ſo they alſo whiche deſerue the Life of Angelles.

(a) This is M. Hardinges legierdumaine. For we ſpeake only of ſutche Mediatoures, as wee oughte to praie vnto.

(b) As if S. Paule had euer willed vs, to praie to Sainctes.

(c) Vntruthe, proceedinge of vaine dotage.

(d) A graue Authoritie, taken out of the very Portuiſe.

There is but one Mediatour of Saluation who is Chriſt only. But the Sainctes in frendes le Mediatours of Interceſsion. 2. Corin. 1. Pſalm. 138. Sainctes be peculiare Patrones of certaine places. Sapien. 3. In fine lib. 8. comment. in Lucam.

Concerninge the offices that, ye ſaie, wee appointe vnto the Sainctes, ye muſte vnderſtande, that as God hathe ſhewed by any Myracle, what good wookes he hathe wroughte by this Saincte, rather then by that: ſo the people deſire to obteine of God by the ſame Sainctes Praier that thinge, wherein they maie (e) coniecture, that God hathe geuen him moſte grace. And bicauſe our Lady the bleſſed Virgine Mary hathe more grace geuen to her, then any other Creature (except ye can name (f) a greater grace then to be the Mother of God): therefore al Chriſten Nations are moſte bolde to deſire in Praier to be reliued by her Interceſsion, and Mediation of her Praier made to her Sonne Ieſus Chriſte, who (wee doubte not) heareth her moſte gladly, as no leſſe intendinge to doo good by her continually to vs, then wee are ſure, that by her he hathe donne for vs thoſe greate benefites, whiche continually wee doo receiue, for ſo muche as he tooke fleaſhe of her. And ſeeinge that Chriſte is the firſte begotten amonge many Brothers, wee that are called into one Heretage with him and by him, maie take harte to accompt Chriſtes Mother, for our Mother, ſpecially whereas he ſaide vnto Iohn his Diſciple, and in him to al the children of Grace, beholde thy Mother.

(e) This is the certaintie of M. Hardings Praier It hangeth of a blind cõiecture

(f) It is a greater Grace to be the Childe of God.

Interceſsion of the bleſſed Virgin Mary. Romans 1. Marie Mother to al that loue Chriſte. Iohan. 19.

If nowe any Spiritual man ſuche as S. Bernarde was, deepely conſideringe the greate honour and dignitie of Chriſtes Mother, doo in exceſſe of minde (g) ſpiritually ſporte and dally (as it were) with her, biddinge her to remember, that ſhee is a Mother, and that thereby ſhee hathe a certaine righte to commaunde her Sonne, and require in a moſte ſweete manner, that ſhee vſe her righte: is this either impiouſly, or impudently ſpoken? Is not he rather moſte impious and impudente, that findeth fault therewith? If euer any of you had practiſed in contemplation any of that ſweeteneſſe, whiche is in *Canticis Canticorum*, ye ſhoulde haue founde, that there the ſpiritual Soule is bolder with God her Creatour and Spouſe, then S. Bernarde euer was with our Lady, beinge but a Creature, and a member of the ſame Churche with him.

(g) Open Blaſphemie is Spirituall dalliance. O when wil M. Hardinge confeſſe a faulte?

Spiritual familiaritie with the Mother of God, in exceſſe of minde, and ſouerayne deuotion.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Ye ſaie, There is One onely Mediatoure of Saluation: but there are many Mediatours

Mediatoures of Intercesion. And thus with this prety simple distinction, pe conueighe your selfe awaie inuisibly in a clowde. But to cut of quarrels, M. Harding, Let vs haue that one onely Mediatoure of Saluation: and then afterwarde take to you your other Mediatoures of Intercesion at your pleasure. Mediatour of Intercesion.

Howe be it, if Christe onely be the Mediatoure of Saluation, wherefore then do you thus calle vpon the Blessed Virgine Christes Mother, Salua omnes, qui te glorificant? Saue thou al them, *that Glorifie thee*. Here you intrude vpon Christes office: and make the Holy Virgine a Mediatoure, not onely of Intercesion, as you saie, but also of Saluation.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ M. Hardinge. A VVrangler wil neuer lacke woordes, &c. VVhen wee saie to the Virgine, Saue vs, wee meane thus, Praie for vs to God, that wee maie be saued. M. Har *fo.* 358. *a.*

The Answeare. It appeareth wel by you, M. Hardinge, that a Wrangler wil neuer lacke shifte of woordes. To desire Saluation of any Creature, and that for glorificinge, and praisinge of the same, it is nothinge els, but vaine, and Childishe blasphemie. We can desire nomore of God him selfe. And yet by wrangling woordes it muste be holpen. When ye saie to the Blessed Virgine, Saue vs, your meaninge is this, as you saie, Praie for vs to God, that wee maie be saued.

Firste we telle you, as S. Paule hathe taughte vs: *There is one Mediatoure bitweene God, and Man, Christe Iesus beeinge Man.* Hereunto you make answeare: There are twoo Mediatoures, the one of Saluation, whiche onely is Christe: The other of Intercession, or Praier, whiche (you saie) maie belonge to the Sainctes of God. Here I replie, I shewe you by your owne Praiers, and by the practise of your Churche of Rome, that contrarie to your owne Distinction, you desire Saluation of our Lady, and so make her a Mediatoure, not onely of Praier, but also of Saluation. Vnto this you answeare, that by these woordes, Saue vs, pe meane nothinge els, but Praie for vs. Thus you can shifte Praieinge into Sauinge, and Sauinge againe into Praienge, at your pleasure. Al this notwithstandinge, we muste thinke, you deale plainely, and wante woordes, and are no Wrangler. 1. *Timoth* 2. Mediatoure.

But, if you craue nothinge of our Lady, but onely her Praier, what shal we then do with Meritis, & Precibus suæ piæ Matris? Here are, not onely Praiers, but also Merites. Muste we thinke, that Merite and Praier, in your Diuinitie, is al one thinge? What shal we do with theise woordes, that were wonte to ringe in al your Churches, Monstra te esse Matrem: *Shewe thee selfe, to be the Mother. And let him knowe it.* That is to saie, *Commaunde him: He is thy Sonne.*

Howe be it, Here perhappes you wil likewise turne Commaundemente into Praier: And thus, when you liste, Saluation is Praier, Merite is Praier, and Commaundemente is Praier. So easily an il thinge maie be smothed. And al this can you Defende, and saue vpright, without wranglinge. ☜ ℄

Wherefore saie ye thus of Thomas Becket, of whose Sainctehode, for ought that I knowe, pe maie wel stande in doubte: Tu per Thomæ Sanguinem, quem pro te impendit, Fac nos Christe scandere, quo Thomas Ascendit: O *Christe, make vs to Ascende vnto Heauen, whither* Thomas *is Ascended, euen* by the Bloude of Thomas, *that he sheadde for thy sake.* Here you seeke, not onely Intercesion, but also Saluation in the Bloude of Thomas.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ M. Hardinge. This is an Obiection for a Cobler, as the other was, and not for a Diuine, whoes duetie it were to depende of thinges, and not of woordes, &c. Nowe bicause, wee knowe, it was a moste graceous gifte of God, that he gaue S. Thomas grace, to die for his Honoure, when wee desire to be holpen by his Bloude, representinge the Memorie of S. Thomas vnto Christe, &c. Your woordes be faire, M. Iuel, but your Harte vnwares to your selfe, doothe Honoure the Idole Caluine, more then Christe Iesus, &c. The trimme Strumpet of Caluines settinge out pleaseth you wel. It is that fowle, and blinde harte of youres, that shal condemne you, &c. M. Har *fo.* 358. *b.* 359. *a.* 363.

The Answeare. Alas, good Christian Reader, that euer man shoulde thus wastfully bestowe his woordes. I am afraide, we se a Member of him, of whom Daniel saithe, Consurget Rex impudens facie: *There shal rise vp a Prince with an impudente face*, that shal neuer be ashamed of any thinge, what so euer he saie, or do. *Daniel* 8. Antichriste.

Actor. 4. S. Peter saith, *There is no other name, or Creature geuen to men vnder Heauen, whereby wee shalbe saued, but onely the name of Christe Iesus:* And therefore, the Ancient Father Origene saithe, Ipse solus est Hostia pro peccatis: & ipse est Hostia, Sancta Sanctorum: *Christe onely is the Sacrifice for sinnes: He is the Sacrifice, the Holy of the Holy.* Leo saithe, Nullius insontis occisio propitiatio fuit mundi: *The Deathe of no Innocente was the Sacrifice, or Redemption of the worlde.* Yet here wee are taught, to seeke our Saluation in the Blonde of Thomas Becket, of whoes Vertue, and Innocencie wee maie wel stande in Doubte. Notwithstandinge you tel vs, This was an obiection for a Cobler.

Origen. in Leuitic. Homil. 7. Leo Epist. 81.

But it was a most gracious gyfte of God (you saie) that he gaue this Thomas grace to Die for his honoure. For his honoure, saie youe Nowe for shame, M. Hardinge, aduise youre selfe better, what you write. Perhaps somme man of simplicitie wil beleeue you. The very true cause of Thomas Beckettes Deathe, was his Ambition, and Vanitie, and wilful maintenaunce of manifeste wickednesse in the Clergie, to the greate dishonoure of Goddes Holy name, as by the writers of that time, it dothe wel appeare. For proufe whereof, it maie please you to reade the Storie of Guilielmus Neubrigensis, that liued in the same age.

Guilielm. Neubrig. li. 2. ca. 16.

It is written, that this Thomas Beckettes Father was a Iewe, and a Bere Brewer of London, and that from his House beganne a fire in the time of Kinge Steuin, that consumed al the one side of London, from the Bridge, where he dwelte, vnto Temple Barre. Neubrigensis saith, that Kinge Henry the Seconde, *tooke him into his special fauoure, and beinge onely the Archedeacon of* Canturburie, *made him Lorde Chancellare of his Realme, and so intreated him with al kinde of Honoure, that he seemed to Raigne, as wel as the Kinge: And, that afterwarde he promoted him to the Archebishoprike of* Canturburie, *and sente him to the Councel of* Toures, *then holden in* France. *Beinge there, as vpon some remorse of Conscience, he misliked, and secretly refused the Kinges gifte, and resigned his Archebishoprike vnto the Pope, and receiued it againe at his handes, and so secretly, and in couerte, betraide his Princes Righte vnto a stranger. At his returne, there grewe a great question within this Realme, touchinge the Prerogatiue of the Clergie. The Iudges complained, that there were many Robberies, and Rapes, and Murthers, to the number of one hundred then presently committed within the Realme, by Ecclesiastical persons, and therefore made requeste in Parlamente, that there might be somme good consideration had of it, for that they themselues beeinge Temporal Ministers, had neither Lawe, nor Iurisdiction to deale against them. As for the Bishoppes (saith* Neubrigensis) *whoes parte it was, to see suche Disorders corrected, of so many thousand wicked Priestes, they neuer disgraded, nor punished so muche, as one. For they (saith he) seeking more carefully, howe to mainteine, the Dignitie, and Liberties of their Clergie, then the correction of their manners, thinke they doo good seruice to God, and his Church, if they mainteine wicked Priestes against the good Order of common Weales: Whereby (saith he) it commeth to passe, that the Priestes, that should shine, as Starres in the Heauens, hauinge free Libertie to doo what they liste, care neither for God, nor for Man. For redresse hereof, the Kinge was earnestly minded to take Order by his Parlament. Al the reste of the Bishops, not one excepted, agreed thereunto, and confirmed the same vnder theire Seales. Onely* Thomas Becket, *the Archebishop of* Canturburie *stoode stiffe, and stoute, and would not yelde. Afterwarde, when he sawe the Kinges displeasure grewe against him, in the morning before he should come to make his answeare, He caused the Masse of* S. Steuins *office, solemnly to be songe before him, with this Preface,* Sederunt Principes, &c. *The Kinges sate downe to speake against me, and the wicked soughe to persecute me. This done, he tooke his siluer Crosse in his hande, and got him boldly to the Court. But perceiuing, that the King was much moued, and misliked his stoutnesse, the next night folowing, he fled ouer into* France, *and afterwarde sought aide of the Pope. At the last, being reconciled vnto his Prince, and returning againe into* England, *He brought with him the Popes Suspension, and therby Suspended al the Bishops of this Realme, and would neuer agree to release them. By meane whereof, the whole Countrie beinge sore disordred shortly after ensued his death.* This is the true Storie of Thomas Becket. So stoutly he maintained the Robberies, the Rapes, the Murthers, & open wickednesse of his Clergie, and

Centum Homicidia intra fines Angliæ à Clericis commissa.

Tot millia talium.

Vsque ad Vmm.

Mediatour of intercession

and woulde not suffer any Lawe to passe againste them. Neubrigensis saithe, *This stoutnesse in him, I can in no wise commende. He boiled* (saithe he) *with zeale of Iustice, but whether it were accordinge to knowledge, or no, God onely knoweth.* Al this notwithstandinge, M. Hardinge, you tel vs, That God gaue him a special Grace, to die for his Honoure, and that by his Bloude wee shal be holpen, and saued, and comme to Heauen. Put hereto what sense ye wil: verily, to vse your owne wordes, this Diuinitie is mutch fitter for a Cobler, then for a graue man of your profession.

Wherefore doth S. Ambrose saie, if it were S. Ambrose that wrote the Booke, Reddere debemus Sanctis honorificentiam, qui nobis Salutem profusione sui Sanguinis pepererunt: qui tam Sacra Hostia pro nostra propitiatione Domino sunt oblati: *Wee muste yeelde honour vnto the Sainctes*, which haue procured Saluation for vs, by the sheaddinge of their Bloude? *Whiche also were offered vp vnto the Lorde*, so Holy a Sacrifice for our Saluation. If we haue Saluation in the Bloude of Saincte, then is not Christe the Onely Mediatoure of our Saluation. *Ambros. in sermone 6. De S. Margareta.*

He is no indifferent Vmpere, that firste diuideth Offices equally betweene two, and afterwarde allotteth bothe Offices to One alone.

Notwithstandinge, the Ende, and Office, as wel of Intercession, as also of Saluation, is, to reconcile vs vnto God, & to procure vs Mercie. But this is Christes onely Office: He reconcileth vs vnto God: He presenteth vs vnto the Throne of Grace. And therefore, as S. Paule saithe, he euermore maketh Intercession for vs. And for that cause also he saithe, Vnus est Mediator Dei, & Hominum, Homo Christus Iesus: *There is* One Mediatoure *betweene God, and Man, Christe Iesus beeinge Man.* *Roman. 8. 1. Timoth. 2.*

S Paule (you saie) Requireth the people to make Intercession and to praie for him. This is true. And God hathe commaunded, that al the Faithefull shoulde Praie one for an other. But S. Paule neuer required the people to praie to Saincte. S. Augustine saithe, Paulus non facit se Mediatorem inter Populum, & Deum: Sed rogat, vt pro se orent inuicem omnia Membra Corporis Christi: Paule maketh not him selfe a Mediatoure *betweene God, and the People: but requireth, that they Praie alone for another, beeinge al the Members of the Body of Christe.* Againe he saithe of S. Iohn, Si Iohannes ita diceret, Hoc Scripsi vobis, vt non peccetis: Et si quis peccauerit, Mediatorem me habetis apud Deum, & ego Exoro pro peccatis vestris, Sicut Parmenianus quodam loco Mediatorem posuit Episcopum inter Populum, & Deum, quis eum ferret bonorum, atque Fidelium Christianorum? Quis sicut Apostolum Christi, & non sicut Antichristum intueretur? If S. Iohn *woulde saie, This haue I written vnto you, that yee Sinne not: and if ye Sinne*, ye haue me your Mediatoure *before God, and* I wil intreate *for your Sinnes*, As Parmenian (the Heretique) *in a certaine place, made the Bishop a* Mediatoure *betweene God, and the People, and good, what Faitheful Christian* Man coulde abide him? *Who woulde looke vpon him, as the* Apostle of Christe: *and not rather thinke him to be* Antichriste? *August. contra Epist. Parmeniani. Lib. 2. Cap 8. Augustin. in eod Lib.*

Here, M. Hardinge, your selfe distinction of Intercession, and Saluation, can not saue you. For Parmenian neuer thought, the Bishop was a Mediatoure of Saluation. And yet S. Augustine saithe, If S. Iohn woulde haue saide so mutche of him selfe, he had not benne the Apostle of Christe: but rather shoulde haue benne iudged, and taken for Antichriste.

Ye thinke, The woordes of the Prophete Hieremie spoken of Idolles, and False Goddes, maie not iustely be applied to the Sainctes of God. And verie of the Sainctes parte, it were greate blaspheme, to calle them Idolles. For they se God face to face, and euermore be with God in Glorie. But in respecte of your horrible Abuses, and vaine fantasies, the Wordes of the Prophete be rightly applied. For you, in your Imagination, of the Sainctes of God, haue made Idolles: and haue so multiplied, and encreased the same, that the number of them hathe farre passed the number of al your Townes, and Cities. And therefore the Ancient Father Epiphanius applieth the like wordes of the same Prophete Hieremie, vnto the Blessed Virgine Marie, beinge then idolatrously abused by the Heretiques, called Collyridiani, euen

as the ſame Bleſſed Virgine, and other Saincte are by you abuſed nowe. Thus he writeth: Ne quis comedat de errore, qui eſt propter S. Mariam. Tametſi enim pulchrum ſit lignum, tamen non eſt ad Cibum. Etſi Pulcherrima eſt Maria, & Sancta, & Honorata: at non ad Adorationem. Hæ verò Mulieres, colentes Mariam, rurſus renouant Fortunæ Mixturam, & præparant Menſam Diabolo, non Deo: Quemadmodum ſcriptum eſt, Paſcuntur Cibo impietatis. Et rurſus, & Fœminæ terunt Pollinem, & Filij colligunt ligna, vt faciant Placentas oleo ſubactas Reginæ Cœli. Compeſcantur à Hieremia tales Mulieres: & ne turbent Orbem terrarum. Ne dicant, Honoramus Reginam Cœli: *Lette noman Eate of this Erroure, touchinge* S. Marie. *For thoughe the tree be faire, yet is not this Fruite to be Eaten. Althoughe* Marie *be Bewetieful, and Holy, and Honourable,* yet is ſhee not to be Adoured. *But theſe Women,* VVoorſhippinge S. Marie, *reneme againe the Sacrifice of Wine mingled in the Honoure of the* Goddeſſe Fortuna, and prepare a Table for the Diuel, and not for God. *As it is written in the Scriptures,* They are fedde with the Meate of VVickedneſſe. *And againe, Theire Women boulte Flower, and theire Children geather ſticks, to make fine Cakes in the Honoure of the* Queene of Heauen. *Therefore lette ſuche Women be rebuked by the Prophete* Hieremie: *and lette them nomore trouble the worlde. And lette them not ſaie,* wee VVoorſhip the Queene of Heauen.

Epipha. Lib. 3. Hæreſ. 59.

Ἀνακαπίζουσι τῇ τύχῃ τὸ πέμμα.

Here wée ſée, the wordes, that were ſpoken of the Heatheniſhe Idolles, are applied by Epiphanius vnto the Mother of Chriſt: not to deface the Bleſſed Virgin, but to declare the fonde errours of thoſe Heretiques.

As for the diſtribution of Offices, and ſeuerall dueties, limited, and appointed to eche Saincte in his degrée, it ſhalbe beſte for modeſties ſake to ſaie nothinge. S. Auguſtine ſpeakinge of the Heathens, from whome, this parte of your Diuinitie, M. Hardinge, was firſte derined, ſaithe thus, Dicebat, ita eſſe vtilem cognitionem Deorum, ſi ſciatur, quam quiſque Deus vim, aut poteſtatem habeat, cuiuſque rei. Ex eo enim poterimus, inquit, ſcire, quem cuiuſque rei cauſa Deum aduocare, atque inuocare debeamus: ne faciamus, vt Mimi ſolent, & optemus à Libero Aquam, à Lymphis Vinum: Varro *ſaide, the knowledge of the Goddes is Profitable, if a man vnderſtande, What Power, and Authoritie eche God hath in euery thinge. For ſo ſaithe he, wee maie knowe, Whome to calle vpon, and whome to praie vnto: Leaſte happily wee doo, as certaine* Mimi *are woont to doo: that is to ſaie, Leaſte of* Bacchus, the God of Wine, wee begge VVater, or of Lymphæ, the Goddeſſe of Water, wee begge VVine.

Auguſti. de Ciuitat. Li. 4. ca. 22

These thinges hauinge theire beginninge emonge the Heathens, haue ſithence benne brought euen into the Churche of God: and al the Saincte in Heauen haue benne appointed, eche One in Order to his Seueral Office: Leaſte any one ſhoulde intrude into an others roume. Antoninus ſaithe, in his time, where S. Paule, and Frére Dominike were painted tograther, the manner was, vnder the Image of S. Paule to write theſe wordes, Per hunc itur ad Chriſtum: *Wee maie come to Chriſte by this Saincte:* But vnder the Image of Frére Dominike, they wrote thus, Sed magis per iſtum: Yet mutche rather by this Saincte. Whereby was meante, that Frére Dominikes Office, and Authoritie before God, was ſomme what better, and of more credite, then S. Paules.

Whereas wé teache the people thus to praie vnto the Bleſſed Virgine, Monſtra te eſſe Matrem: Commaunde thy Sonne: Vſe thy Motherly Authoritie ouer him: Let him knowe thee to be his Mother: This, you ſaie, is no blaſphemie, but a Spiritual dallieinge. Nowe verily, M. Hardinge, this muſte néedes be a bleſſed kinde of Diuinitie, that can turne Praier into Dalliance.

One of your Beaupéres of Louaine, as a man carrieinge his face in his hande, ſaithe boldely, *Theſe wordes were neuer vſed in your Churche.* And therefore he ſaithe with good courage, Interim à bonis iſtis viris quæro, Cur non nominant illas Eccleſias, quæ Virginem Matrem tam impudenter appellant? Cur eas inquam non nominant? *In the meane ſeaſon* (ſaithe he) *this queſtion I demaunde of theſe honeſte menne: Why name they not thoſe Churches,* whiche ſo impudently cal vpon that Virgine Chriſtes Mother? *I ſaie, why doo they not name them?* Your modeſtie herein, M. Hardinge,

Copus Dialog 3. Pag. 340.

Mother of God. Childe of God.

dinge, is moze praise worthie. You are contented to graunte the facte: and pleasantly to excuse it by a Spiritual Dallieinge.

But ye maie tel your saide Felowe, that this kinde of Prater was Universally vsed throughout al your whole Churche of Rome: that Wenne, Women, and Childzen, Learned, and Unlearned were taughte, and forced thus to praie: Thou arte the Queene of Heauen: Thou arte the Lady of Angelles: Commaunde thy Sonne: Shewe thee selfe to be the Mother. Ye maie tel him, that Cardinal Bembus, sometime the Popes Secretarie, calleth the same Blessed Virgine, Dominam, & Deam nostram: Our Lady, and Goddesse. Tel him, that Ambrosius Catharinus in your late Chapter at Tridente, representinge, as you saie, your whole Catholique Church, calleth the same Blessed Virgine, Goddes Felowe, by these wordes, Fidelissima eius Socia: Goddes moste Faithefull Felowe.

Bembus in Epist. ad Carolum 5. Concil Trident. Sessione 2.

And therefore perhappes Nicolaus Cusanus a Cardinal of Rome saithe, Hoc cedit ad laudem Dei, & Virginis Mariæ Matris, quòd ipsa sub Principatu Authoris Mortis nullo vnquam tempore fuit. Non indiguit Virgo Liberatore qui ipsam absolueret à sententia in Adam, & in posteros lata Maria non est deleta de Libro Mortis: quia nunquam in eo scripta fuit: *This thinge turneth to the praise of God, and of the* Virgine Marie *the Mother, that she was neuer at any time, vnder the Princehoode of the Authoure of Deathe. That* Virgine *needed no Deliuerer, that shoulde Redeeme her from the Sentence pronounced againste* Adam, *and his posteritie.* Marie *was neuer rased out of the Booke of Deathe: for shee was neuer written in it.* Here we are taught, that Marie the Virgine is our Lady, and Goddesse, that she is Goddes Felowe, and that she had no neede to be saued by the Deathe of Christe. What is blasphemie, if this be none? Yet this is the Diuinitie of the Clergie of Rome.

Ni. Cusan Excitation. Lib. 8. Hoc cedit.

Ye maie further tel him, that in your Councel of Oxford, Christes name is quite forgotten, and leafte out: and Our Ladies name put in place: For thus it beginneth, Authoritate Dei Patris, & Beatæ Virginis, & omnium Sanctorum, &c. By the Authoritie of God the Father, and of the Blessed Virgine, and of al Saincles. Notwithstandinge ye maie wel answeare, as before, that al this was no manner blasphemie againste God, but onely a Prety Spiritual Dalliance: euen lutche Dalliance, I trowe, as S. Paule meaneth by these wordes, Sedit populus ad manducandum, & bibendum: & surrexerunt ad Ludendum: *The people sate downe to eate, and drinke: and rose vp againe to* Plaie, or Dallie, that is to saie, to committe Idolatrie.

Concil Oxoniense.

1 Cor. 10

You saie, Our Lady, the Blessed Virgine hathe more grace geeuen her, then any other Creature, excepte ye name a greatter Grace, saie you, then to be the Mother of God. Uerily, M. Hardinge, to be the Childe of God, it is a greate deale greatter Grace then to be the Mother of God. S. Augustine saithe, Beatior ergo Maria fuit, Percipiendo Fidem Christi, quàm Concipiendo Carnem Christi. Materna Propinquitas nihil Mariæ profuisset, nisi fœliciùs Christum Corde, quàm Carne gestasset: *Marie was more Blessed* (or fuller of Grace) *in that she* Receiued the Faithe of Christ, *then in that shee* Conceiued the Fleashe of Christ. *Motherly kinreade coulde haue donne Marie no good, onlesse shee had borne Christe more Blessedly in her Harte, then shee bare him in her Fleashe.* And againe he saithe, Mater mea, quam appellastis Fœlicem, inde Fœlix est, quia Verbum Dei custodiuit: Non quia in illa Verbum Caro factum est: *My Mother, whome ye haue called Blessed, therefore is Blessed, bicause shee hathe keapte the Woorde of God:* Not bicause the VVoorde in her was made Fleashe.

Augustin De Sancta Virginitate Cap. 3.

Aug. in Iohan. Tractat. 10.

Therefore saithe Epiphanius, Christus dixit, Quid mihi, & tibi est Mulier? Non dum venit hora mea. Quò non putarent aliqui, magis eximiam esse Sanctam Virginem, Mulierem eam appellauit: veluti prophetans, quæ essent futura in terra Sectarum & Hæresεon genera: vt ne aliqui nimium admirati Sanctam, in hanc Hæresim, eiusq; deliramenta dilabantur. Est enim Ludibrium tota res, & anicularum fabula, &, vt ita dicam, tota Hæresis tractatio: *Christe saide vnto his Mother, Wooman, What haue I to doo with thee? My houre is not yet comme. Leafte any man shoulde thinke,* Our Lady was of greatter excellencie, he called her VVoman: *as it were propheseinge of the Kindes,* and Sectes of Heresies, *that were to comme in the Worlde.* Leafte any man hauinge too

Epiphani Li. 3. Hæres 79 Contra Collyridian.

greate opinion of that Holy Saincte, shoulde fal into this Heresie, and into the dotage of the same. *For in deede the whole mater is but a* mockerie, *and an* Olde VViues tale, *and soothely to saie, nothinge els, but the* handelinge of an Heresie. Origene hereof saithe, Si mensuram transcenderit Charitatis, & qui diligit, & qui diligitur, in Peccato est: *If* Loue passe the measure of Charitie, *as wel he, that Loueth, as also he, that is Loued, is in Sinne.*

Origen. in Lucam, Homil. 25.

Ambros. ad Roman. Cap. 1.

But touchinge the mater it selfe, S. Ambrose saithe, Ideò ad Reges itur per Tribunos, & Comites: quia homo vtique est Rex: & nescit, quibus debeat Rempublicam credere. Ad Deum autem, quem nihil latet, Omnium enim Merita nouit, Promerendum, suffragatore non est Opus, sed mente deuota. Vbicunque enim talis loquutus fuerit ei, respondebit illi: *Therefore wee are brought vnto the presence of Kinges by Lordes, and Officers: bicause the Kinge is a Man, and knoweth not to whome he maie committe his Realme.* But to obtaine Goddes fauoure, *from whome nothinge is secrete, as knowinge, what euery man is meete to haue,* wee neede no spokesman, but a deuoute minde, *For where so euer suche a one speaketh vnto God, God wil answeare him.*

The Apologie, Cap. 10. Diuision. 1.

Wee saie also, that euery persone is borne in Sinne, and leadeth his life in Sinne: that no body is hable truely to saie, his Harte is Cleane. That the moste righteous persone is but an vnprofitable Seruaunte: That the Lawe of God is perfite, and requireth of vs, perfite, and ful Obedience; That wee are hable by no meanes to fulfil that Lawe in this worldly life: That there is no one mortal Creature, whiche can be iustified by his owne deserues in Gods sighte: And therefore that our onely succoure, and refuge is to flie to the Mercie of our Father by Jesu Christe, and assuredly to perswade our mindes, that he is the obteiner of forgeueneesse for our sinnes: And, that by his Bloude, al our sportes of Sinne, be vvasshed cleane: That he hathe pacified, and set at one, al thinges by the Bloude of his crosse: That he by the same One onely Sacrifice, whiche he once offered vpon the Crosse, hathe brought to effecte, and fulfilled al thinges, and that for that cause he said, when he gaue vp the Ghoste, It is finished, as though he would signifie, that the price, and ransomme was now ful paide for the Sinne of Mankinde. If there be any, that thinke this Sacrifie not sufficient, lette them goe in Goddes name and seeke a better. Wee verily, bicause wee knowe, this to be the Onely Sacrifice, are wel contente with it alone, and looke for none other: and, for asmuche as it was to be offered but Once, we commaunde it not to be renewed againe: and, bicause it was ful, and perfite in al pointes, and partes, wee doo not ordeine in place thereof any continual succession of offeringes.

(a) A vaine foly. For Gods Lawe was written for Men in Earthe, not for Angels in Heauen.

(b) A horrible Heresie. S. Augustine saithe, *Deus iubet aliqua, quæ non possumus facere.*

(c) A fond question. For God pounisheth Impossible to a man in grace.

M. Hardinge.

Ye make a Sophistical argumente, when ye teache, because the Lawe of God requireth of vs ful obedience, that therefore it cannot be satisfied in this life by any meanes. For when ye saie, It requireth of vs ful obedience, if ye meane (a) suche ful obedience, as is required onely in this life, then conclude ye falsely, that wee can by no meanes satisfie it. But if ye meane suche ful obedience, (a) as God is onely perfourmed in Heauen, then ye conclude wel, that we in this life cannot fulfil suche perfection, as is required in Heauen. But then haue ye saide nothinge to the pourpose. For wee knowe, not that what Marke ye shoote at, by your doctrine vttered in other places. Your meaning is (b) that no man in this Life is able by the Grace of God to fulfil the Commaundementes. VVe beleue, God commaundeth vs nothinge impossible to vs. (c) Otherwise howe coulde he iustly punishe for not dooinge that Commaundemente, whiche by no meanes wee are able to fulfil? VVee are sure that God pu-

(a) God commaundeth

nisheth

Posſibilitie of the Lawe.

niſheth noman vniuſtly: for *Non eſt apud Dominum Deum noſtrum iniquitas:* There is no iniquitie in Our Lorde God.

Deut. 30. Rom. 10. Matthe. 11. 1.Ioha. 5. Moyſes ſpeakinge of the fulfillinge of the Commaundementes of God, whiche alſo S. Paule repeteth, ſaithe that they are not aboue vs in Heauen, neither farre from vs beyonde the Sea: but harde by thee (ſaithe he) is the woorde in thy mouthe and in thy harte, that thou maiſt doo it. And Chriſt ſaithe, *Iugum meum ſuaue eſt, & onus meum leue:* (d) My Yoke is ſweete, and my burden lighte: and S. Iohn, His Commaundementes be not heauie. He then, that ſaithe, wee can by no meanes fulfil the Lawe of God, maketh (e) God vniuſte, and euil, or impotent, and not hable to geue ſo muche grace, as maie healpe to fulfil his Lawe. Let the diſcrete reader iudge, what blaſphemie your woordes conteine. Belie vs nomore hereafter. This is our Doctrine, better founded in the woorde of God, and in the tradition of the Apoſtles, and in the cuſtome of the whole Churche, then that yee ſhal euer be hable to ouerthrowe it. Blaſpheme, and barke againſte it ye maie: ouercome it ye cannot.

fantes for their Original ſinne: yet are they by no meanes able to auoide it.

(d) The cauſe hereof, is Gods Mercie S. Auguſtine ſaithe, *Omnia mandata facta deputantur, quãdo quicquid non factum eſt ignoſcitur.*

(e) Vntruth. For we make not God vniuſte: but we Cõfeſſe our ſelues to be ſinners.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Al other thinges here by you touched, M. Hardinge, I wil paſſe ouer: thinkinge it ſufficient, to note a fewe woordes of the Poſsibilitie, and perfourmance of the Lawe: **and ſo mutche the more, for that ye ſame therein in ſomme parte, to renewe the** Pelagian **Heretiques Olde condemned erroure.**

As touchinge that ful and perfite Obedience, that is required of vs by the Lawe, ye anſweare, There are ſundrie ſortes of Perfection: **namely, that there is** Perfection **in Children:** Perfection **in Penne:** Perfection **in Angelles: and** Perfection **in God. And further ye ſaie,** That in this life wee cannot fulfil ſuche Perfection, as is required of the Angelles of God in Heauen. **And this anſweare ye make, touching the Obedience, and Perfourminge of the Lawe: As if ye woulde ſaie, The Lawe of God was geuen to Angels: and is to be perfourmed, not in the Earthe, but Onely in Heauen: And, as if God had ſaide to thoſe Bleſſed Spirites,** Thou ſhalt not Kil: Thou ſhalt not commit Aduouterie: Thou ſhalt not ſteale: Thou ſhalt not couete, &c. **In your ſundrie** Perfections, **of Children, Penne, Angels, and God, I haue no ſkil. The Apologie meante onely of that** Perfection, **that is required in Man. Howe be it, in euery kinde they ſaie,** Perfectum eſt, cui nihil deeſt: *That thinge is Perfite, that is ful, and abſolute, and wanteth nothinge.*

And here, leſte ye ſhoulde deceiue your ſelfe by wronge meaſure, God him ſelfe hathe ſhewed you, what Perfection **he requireth in man. Thus he ſaithe,** *Thou ſhalt loue the Lorde thy God with al thy Harte, with al thy Soule, and with al thy Power: Thou ſhalt not turne, neither to the Righte hande, nor the Lefte: Accurſed is he, that ſtandeth not in euery thinge, that is written in the Lawe, to perfourme the ſame.* **And** S. Iames **ſaithe,** *Who ſo offendeth in one Commaundemente, is guiltie of al.* **And Chriſte ſaithe,** *Be ye* Perfite **(not meaſuringe your ſelues by your owne habilitie, but)** *as your Father is Perfite, whiche is in Heauen.* **And yet hereby he meaneth not the** Perfection, **that is in God, and his Angels, but onely that** Perfection, **that is required in man.**

Deuter. 6. Matthe. 22. Deuter. 17. Deuter. 27. Galat. 3. Iacob. 2. Matthe. 5.

S. Hierome **ſaithe, The** Pelagian **Heretiques in Olde times, vſed the ſame ſhiftes, that you vſe nowe. For where as the Catholique Learned Fathers ſaide,** *Noman is* Perfite, *and voide of Sinne,* **they anſweared euen then euen in ſutche ſorte, as you do nowe, Noman is** Perfite **in ſutche degrée of** Perfection, **as God is** Perfite. S. Hieromes **woordes be theſe,** Aiunt, ad Comparationem Dei, nullum eſſe Perfectum: Quaſi Scriptura hoc dixerit: *They ſaie* (**euen as you, M. Hardinge, ſaie**) *that in Compariſon of God, noman is* Perfite: *As though this were the ſaieinge of the Scriptures.* **And therefore he ſaithe vnto them,** Nunquid præcepit mihi Deus, vt eſſem, quod Deus eſt? Vt nihil inter me eſſet, & Dominum Creatorem? Vt maior eſſem Angelorum faſtigio? Vt haberem, quod Angeli non habent? *I beſeeche you, hath God commaunded me, that I ſhoulde bee* the ſame, that God is? *That there ſhoulde be no difference* (in Perfection) *betwene me, and my Lorde the Creatour? That I ſhoulde be aboue the Highneſſe of Angels? Or that I ſhoulde haue, that the Angels haue not?* **It was in vaine therefore M. Hardinge, thus to borrowe the** Pelagians **Weapons, and to make mater of this** Perfection. **For wee ſpeake not of Angelles, but onely of Penne.**

Hieronym. ad Teſiphont. contra Pelagianos.

Further, to intreate of the Perfite fulfillinge, **and accompliſhinge of the Lawe, I meane, ſo farre, as the Lawe requireth, the** Pelagian **Heretiques herein alſo**

saide, euen as you saie: and none otherwise. S. Augustine thereof reporteth thus: Magnum aliquid Pelagiani se scire putant, quando dicunt, Non iuberet Deus, quod Sciret ab homine non posse fieri. Quis hoc nesciat? Sed ideò iubet aliqua, quæ non possumus, vt nouerimus, quid ab ipso petere debeamus: *The* Pelagians *thinke them selues Cunninge menne, when thei saie,* God woulde not commaunde that thinge, that he knoweth, a man is not hable to doo. *And who is there, that knoweth not this? But therefore God commaunded vs to doo some thinges,* that wee are not hable to doo, *that wee maie vnderstande, what we ought to craue of him.*

August. De Gratia & libero Arbitr. ca. 4.

S. Hierome saith vnto one of the same Pelagians, Facilia esse dicis Dei mandata: & tamen nullum proferre potes, qui vniuersa compleuerit: *Yee saie Goddes Commaundementes be easie: And yet ye are hable to shewe vs noman, that euer fulfilled them altogeather.*

Hieronym. ad Ctesiphont. contra Pelagianos.

Therefore againe he saith vnto them, Noli ponere in Cœlum os tuum, vt per Esse, & Esse posse, stultorum auribus illudas. Quis enim tibi concedet, posse hominem facere, quod nullus vnquam hominum potuerit? *Sette not thy face againste Heauen, to mocke fooles eares with these woordes,* Be, *and* Can be. *For who wil graunte you, that a man can doo that thinge, that noman euer was hable to doo.*

Hieronym. contra Pelagianos, Lib. 1.

Likewise S. Augustine saithe, Dixi fieri posse, vt sit homo sine Peccato, si Voluntas ei non desit, ope Diuina adiuuante: Sed tamen præter Vnum, in quo omnes viuificabuntur, neminem vel fuisse, vel fore, in quo hic viuente esset ista Perfectio: *I saide,* It is possible, that a man maie be without Sinne, *if he wante not wil, the Power of God assistinge him: And yet I saide, that besides Onely Christe, in whome al menne shalbe quickened to Life,* there was neuer man, nor neuer shalbe, *who beeinge in this life, shal haue this* Perfection. S. Augustine saith, *Noman can attaine to this* Perfection: and he speaketh of the Perfection, that is required, not of Angels, but of Menne.

Augustin. De Spiritu & Litera. ca. 1.

We wil saie, as the Pelagians did, wherefore then dothe Christe saie, *Be yee* Perfite? Wherefore dothe S. Paule saie, *As many of vs, as be* Perfite, &c. Hereto S. Hierome answeareth thus: Quid ergo sapimus? Imò quid sapere debemus, qui Perfecti non sumus? Imperfectos nos esse confiteri, & nondum compræhendisse, nec dum accepisse. Hæc est hominis vera Sapientia, Imperfectum esse se nosse. Atq; vt ita loquar, Cunctorum in Carne Iustorum Imperfecta Perfectio est: *What then doo wee thinke, or what ought wee to thinke, that be* not Perfite? *Wee ought to* Confesse, that wee are Vnperfite, *and that wee haue not yet gotten, nor taken* (that Perfection) *that is required. This is the true Wisedome of a Man, to knowe* him selfe to be Vnperfite. *And as I might saie, the* Perfection of al Iuste menne liuinge in the Fleashe is Vnperfite.

Matthe. 5. Philip 3. Hieron. aduers. Pelagianos. li. 1.

Againe he saithe, Iusti appellantur, non quòd omni Vitio careant, sed quòd Maiori parte Virtutum commendentur: *They are called Iuste menne, not for that they be voide of* al manner Sinne, *but for that they are furnished with the* greatter parte of Vertues. So likewise saithe S. Augustine, Virtus, quæ nunc est in homine Iusto, hactenus Perfecta nominatur, vt ad eius Perfectionem pertineat etiam ipsius Imperfectionis, & in Veritate agnitio, & in humilitate Confessio: *The Vertue, that is nowe in a iuste man, so farre forthe is called* Perfite, *that it perteineth to the* Perfection therof, bothe in truthe to know, and in humilitie to confesse, that it is Vnperfite.

Hieronym. ad Ctesiphont.

August. ad Bonifacium, Lib. 3. Cap. 7.

Againe he saithe, Omnia mandata facta deputantur, quando, quicquid non fit, ignoscitur: *All the Commaundementes of God, are accounpted to be donne, when that thinge, that is not donne, is forgeuen.*

Augustin. Retracta. li. 1. ca. 19.

To conclude, he saithe, Multùm in hac vita ille profecit, qui quàm longè sit à Perfectione Iustitiæ, proficiendo cognouit: *Hee hath muche profited in this life, that by his profitinge hath learned, howe* farre he is from the Perfection of Rightuousnesse.

Augustin. De Spiritu & Litera. Cap. 55.

Yet nevertheless wee maie truely vse S. Hieromes woordes, vttered in the defense, and righte of this same cause: Hæc dicentes, non adulamur Vitijs: sed Authoritatem sequimur Scripturarum, quòd nullus homo sit absque Peccato. Sed concluſit Deus omnia sub Peccato, vt Omnium misereatur: *Notwithstandinge wee saie thus, yet wee flatter not Vices: but wee folowe the Authoritie of the Scripture,* that there is noman without Sinne. *But God hathe shutte vp al thinges vnder Sinne, that hee maie haue Mercie of al.*

Hieronymus ad Algasiam.

Againe he saithe, Perspicuum est, omnem hominem, quamuis ad Perfectionem venerit, tamen indigere Misericordia Dei: & plenam Perfectionem ex

Hieronym. in Ezechiel. li. 14. c. 46.

Gratia,

Merite, and Mercie.

Gratia, non ex Merito poſsidere: *It is moſte certaine, that euery man, yea although hee be growen to* Perfection, yet needeth the Mercie of God: *and that he enioieth ſul* Perfection, not of his owne Deſeruinge, but of Grace. Euen ſo S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Ipſa Iuſtitia noſtra tanta eſt in hac vita, vt potiùs peccatorum Remiſsione conſtet, quàm Perfectione Virtutum: *Our very Righteouſneſſe it ſelfe is ſo greate in this Life, that it ſtandeth rather in* Forgeueneſſe *of Our Sinnes, then in* Perfection *of Righteouſneſſe.* *Aug. De Ciuit. Li. 19. ca. 27.*

The Apologie, Cap. 20. Diuiſion. 1.

Beſides, though wee ſaie, wee haue no meede at al by our owne woorkes, and deedes, but appointe al the meanes of Our Saluation to be in Chriſte alone, yet ſaie wee not, that for this cauſe menne ought to liue looſely, and diſſolutely: nor that it is enough for a Chriſtian, to be Baptized onely, and to Beleeue: as though there were nothinge els required at his hande. For true Faithe is liuely, and can in no wiſe be idle. Thus therefore teache wee the people, that God hath called vs, not to folowe riot, and wantonneſſe, but, as S. Paule ſaithe, vnto good vvoorkes, to vvalke in them: **That wee are deliuered from the** Power of Darkeneſſe, to the ende that vvee ſhould ſerue the Liuinge God: **to cutte awaie al the remnantes of Sinne, and** to vvorke Our Saluation in feare, and tremblinge: **that it maie appeare, that the Spirite of Sanctification is in Our Bodies, and that Chriſte him ſelfe dwelleth in Our hartes.** *M. Hardinge.*

VVith what face can theſe Defenders affirme, that they teache the people to walke in good woorkes, whereas beginninge the treatiſe of woorkes in this preſente Apologie, they ſaie, that wee haue (a) no helpe, or aide in our woorkes, and deedes? For ſo theire Latine woorde *Præſidium*, doothe ſignifie, whiche in the Engliſhe, is tourned into Meede. VVhat, Maiſters, is this the waie to make menne woorke wel, to tel them before hande, that theire woorkes be nothinge woorthe, and that they healpe them neuer a whitte? VVhy then let the Labourers Prouerbe take place, I had rather plaie for nothinge, then woorke for nothinge. (b) Is there any Labourer ſo madde, as to woorke for nothinge? Firſte ye tel the Labourers, that there is no healpe for them in their woorkes, and then ye crie vnto them to laboure: (c) yea forſoothe, as harde as they liſte. Is not this to mocke God, and the worlde? VVhereas yee ſpeake to Chriſtian men, to thoſe that be Baptized, to ſuche as haue Faithe: Yet ye tel them, they maie woorke as muche as they wil, (d) but al in vaine, &c. Ergo then, although a liuely Faithe cannot be idle, and ſomme true Faithe is liuely, yet in an other ſenſe, (e) there is a true Faithe whiche is not liuely, but idle. VVhiche true Faithe ſhal becomme liuely and haue greate aide in woorkes, if it wel learne to leaue idleneſſe, and practiſe that in wil and harte, whiche it beleueth in vnderſtandinge.

(a) No aide, or helpe vnto Saluation. Otherwiſe this report is Vntrue.

(b) *Nazianze. Si mercenarius es, tantùm expecta mercedem. De Sancto Baptiſmo.*

(c) Is not this a folie, M. Hard. Goddes Truthe is no mockerie.

But whereas theſe Defenders woulde no helpe or aide to be in Chriſtian mennes woorkes, that (f) Hereſie maie not ſo eſcape. Chriſt beinge demaunded of one, what good he ſhould doo to obteine Euerlaſtinge Life, ſaide: If thou wilt enter into Life, keepe the Commaundementes. To keepe the Commaundementes is a woorke: to enter into Life is ſomme helpe to a man. Therefore it is falſely ſpoken, that in our woorkes there is no helpe for vs. Againe Chriſte ſaithe, VVho ſo euer forſaketh his houſe, or brothers, or ſiſters, or father, or mother, or wife, or children, or landes for my ſake, he ſhal receiue an hundred folde, and ſhal enherite Life Euerlaſtinge. S. Paule ſaithe, God wil render to euery man accordinge to his woorke. To thoſe that ſeeke for glorie, and honoure, and incorruption, accordinge to the ſufferance of good woorkes, (he wil render) Life Euerlaſtinge.

(d) Vntruth. For we ſay with S. Paule, your woorkes ſhal not be in vaine in the Lorde.

(e) Vntruthe. Reade the Anſweare.

(f) Vntruth. For it is no Hereſie: it is the Faithe of Chriſt. Reade the Anſweare.

Luc. 17.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Here ye triſle, M. Harding, although not mutche beſides your common wonte, yet ſommewhat aboue your ordinarie. Our Doctrine herein is grounded vpon theſe wordes of Chriſte, *When yee haue donne al, ſaie, that yee be vnprofitable Seruantes, and therefore haue deſerued nothinge.* **In deede of late yeares this hath benne the** General **Doctrine of your Scholes:** Vita Aeterna eſt Merces debita pro noſtris Meritis: Vita Aeterna, niſi eſſet Merces debita, eſſet incerta. Quia debitum certum eſt: Miſericordia incerta: *Euerlaſtinge Life is a reward dewe for our deſeruinges. If Euerlaſtinge Life were not a dewe reward, it were vncertaine. For dewe debte is certaine: Mercie, or fauoure is vncertaine.* **Thus haue you vtterly drowned the Grace of God, and the Saluation that we haue onely in Jeſus Chriſte: & haue turned the moſt Comfortable Doctrine of the Goſpel into a dungeon of Deſperation.**

Then

Merite, and Mercie.

Then (ſaie you) leete the Labourers Prouerbe take place, I had rather plaie for nothinge, then woorke for nothinge. Uerily, M. Hardinge, when other reaſon couldе not ſerue you, it was reaſon, your Labourers idle reaſon ſhoulde take place. Howe be it, if ye wil do nothinge at Goddes requeſte, of good wil, without rewarde, but muſte be hyered onely for your Penny, then maie your Labourer, be he neuer ſo ſimple, eaſily tel you, ye are not the Childe of God, but onely a Hyrelinge, and a Labourer. For the Natural louinge Childe wil Obeie his Father, not for rewarde, but of loue, onely bicauſe hée is his Father.

Gregor. Nazian. De Sancto Baptiſmate. ἔργασαι καλὸν, ὅτι καλὸν τῷ πατρὶ πείθεσθαι· κἂν ἴδῃ σοι μισθὸν ἐσόμενον μέλλοι, τοῦτο αὐτὸ μισθός, τὸ τῷ πατρὶ χαρίζεσθαι.

Gregorie Nazianzene ſaithe, Si Seruus es, time plagas: Si Mercenarius, tantùm ſpecta Mercedem. At, ſi ſupra hos es etiam Filius, reuerere tanquam Patrem tuum. Benefacito, quia pulchrum eſt obſequi Patri. Et, quamuis nihil aliud futurum ſit, tamen vel hoc ipſum erit Merces tua feciſſe quod gratum eſſet Patri: *If thou be a* bonde Slaue, *then feare the whippe: If thou be a* Hyrelinge, *then looke onely for thy rewarde: But ouer, and beſides theſe, if thou be a* (Natural) Childe, *then reuerence* (GOD) *as thy Father.* Doo wel, bicauſe it is good to Obeie thy Father. Yea, and although thou ſhalt haue nothinge els, yet euen this ſhalbe thy rewarde, that thou haſte benne Obediente to thy Father.

Hilari. in Pſal. 118.

S. Hilarie ſaithe, Nos, ſi ſemel ieiunamus, ſatisfeciſſe nos arbitramur: Si aliquid ex horreo domeſticarum facultatum inopi damus, impleuiſſe nos iuſtitiam credimus, &c. Sed Propheta totum à Deo ſperat: totum à miſericordia eius expectat: *If wee faſte once, we thinke, wee haue ſatisfied: If out of the barnes of Our houſholde ſtoare we geue ſomewhat to the Poore, we beleeue, we haue fulfilled the meaſure of Righteouſneſſe. But the Prophete* hopeth al of God: and truſteth al of his Mercie. Chriſte ſaithe to his Diſciples, *Lette your Lighte ſo ſhine before menne* (not that ye maie be rewarded, but) *that they maie ſee your good woorkes, and glorifie your Father, whiche is in Heauen.* S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Minus diligit te, qui diligit aliud præter te: *O God, he the leſſe loueth thee, that loueth any other thinge, beſides thee.* Likewiſe S. Baſile ſaithe, Qui non fidit ſuis rectè factis, nec expectat ex operibus iuſtificari, Solam habet ſpem ſalutis, Miſericordias Dei: *He that truſteth* not to his owne good deedes, nor hopeth to be iuſtified by his woorkes, hathe the Onely hope of his Saluation, the Mercies of God.

Matthæ. 5. Auguſtin. Confeſſion. Baſil. in Pſal. 32. μόνην ἔχει τὴν ἐλπίδα τῆς σωτηρίας τοὺς οἰκτιρμοὺς τοῦ θεοῦ.

Further ye ſaie, A true Faithe maie be idle, and vtterly without woorkes: and therefore ye thinke it not true, that wée ſaie, *A true Faithe is liuely, and can in no wiſe be idle.* Here perhaps ye wil ſette Faithe vpon the Laſte, and Racke her to a larger ſiſe. For ſo Latomus, one of your Felowes ſaithe, that Socrates, and Plato, and other Heathen Philoſophers had as good vnderſtandinge, and Faithe in Chriſte, as had Abraham. And Andradius, an other of your Felowes ſaithe, that the Heathen, & Infidel philoſophers had the Rightouſneſſe of Faithe, and Euerlaſtinge Life. His woordes be theſe, Philoſophi, qui ab inani Deorum multitudine abhorruerunt, &c. Illos, tu illa Fide, Deity cognitione deſtitutos dices, per quam, ſcilicet, impius iuſtificatur, & ex qua iuſtus viuit? *The Philoſophers, that abhorred, and ſhunned the vaine multitude of Goddes, &c. Wilt thou ſaie, they lacked that* Faithe, and that knowledge of God, *whereby the wicked is iuſtified, and whereby the Righteous liueth?* An other of your neare Felowes ſaithe, Petrus, non Fidem Chriſti, ſed Chriſtum, Salua Fide, negauit: Peter *denied, not the Faith of Chriſte: but he denied Chriſte, his* Faithe neuertheleſſe beinge ſafe. If ye call this True Faithe, M. Hardinge, that maie be founde in Heathens, and Infidels, and maie wel, and ſafely ſtande with the abiuringe of Chriſte, then, without queſtion, your True Faithe maie be without good woorkes. But S. Paule, whoſe woordes wée ought rather to credite, ſaithe farre otherwiſe: *Hee, that hath no regarde to his owne, ſpecially ſuche, as be of his houſholde, hath* denied the Faithe, *and is woorſe, then an Infidel.* Againe he ſaithe, *They ſaie, they knowe God: but by theire woorkes* they denie God. S. Iohn ſaithe, *Who ſo ſaithe, he knoweth God, and keepeth not his Commaundementes,* is a Lyer, and the Truthe is not in him. S. Iames ſaithe, Faithe *without woorkes* is deade: *And* the Diuel beleueth, *and trembleth for feare.* But a Deade Faithe is nomore a True perfite Faithe, then a Deade Man, is a True perfite Man. As for the Faithe of Diuels, in déede, and verily it is no Faithe.

Illyricus De Secta Pag. 93. Kemnitius in examine Tridét. Conſilij. Pag. 335 Copus Dialo. 1. Pag. 51.

1. Timoth. 5. Fidem abnegauit. Tit. 1. 1. Iohan. 2. Iacob. 2.

Auguſtin. in E-

Certainely S. Auguſtine ſaith, Qui Fidem habet ſine ſpe, & dilectione, Chriſtum eſſe

esse credit: non in Christum credit: *Hee that hathe Faithe without Hope, and Charitie, Beleeueth, that there is Christe:* but hee Beleeueth not in Christe. Againe he saithe, Inseparabilis est Bona Vita à Fide, quæ per dilectionem operatur: imò verò ea ipsa est bona Vita: Good Life can neuer be diuided from Faithe, *whiche woorketh by Loue: Nay rather that same very Faithe it selfe is good Life.*

S. Ambrose saithe, Vbi quis cœperit luxuriari, incipit deuiare à vera Fide: *As sone as a man beginneth to liue wantonly, he beginneth to* flee from the True Faithe. Origen saithe, Omnis qui credit in eum, non erubescit: Erubescit autem omnis, qui peccat: Ergo, qui adhuc ruborem peccati incurrit, credere non videtur: *Who so euer Beleeueth in God, blusheth not: But euery man blusheth, that woorketh Sinne: Therefore hee, that yet blusheth for his Sinne,* seemeth not to Beleeue. Againe he saithe, Male credit, quicunque peccat: *Who so euer sinneth,* Beleeueth il.

To be shorte, S. Cyprian saithe, Quomodo dicit, se credere in Christum, qui non facit, quod Christus facere præcepit? *Howe dooth he saie, He Beleeueth in Christe, that dooth not the thinge, that Christe Commaunded?*

If ye wil beleeue none of al theise, beinge Ancient, and Learned Fathers, yet beleeue your owne Doctoure Cusanus, a Cardinal of Rome. Thus he saithe, Non potest Mens scire Deum, & non diligere: Non potest esse vera scientia Dei, vbi non est Charitas: *The Minde cannot knowe God, and not loue him: There can be no true knowledge of God, where there wanteth Charitie.*

Herby it is plaine, that True Faithe is liuely, and woorkeful: and, that an Idle Faithe is in deede no Faithe at al.

Merite, and Mercie.

Angel. Iohan. Sermo. 61. Augustin. De Fide. & Operib. Ca. 23. Ambros. Li. 6. Epist. 36. Origen. in Epist. ad Roman. Li. 8. Ca. 10. Origen. in Ezechiel. Homil. 9.

Nicola. Cusan. Excitationum. Lib. 5.

Addition of *Addition.* M. Hardinge. Did not you knowe the Answeare, M. Iewel? Nothinge is more common. You belie the Scripture. That is the Answeare to you. And your forefathers euen vp to Luther haue alwaies belied it: and beeinge tolde of it, wil not yet amende, nomore then the Diuel, whom they folowe. Al thinge maie be deade in two sortes, either bicause it had life in it of his owne, or els bicause it had it of an other thinge &c. Nowe it is to be considered, whether Faithe hath life in it selfe, of his owne Nature, as a man hath (for then a deade Faithe is no Faithe) or els, whether Faithe haue life, of an other thinge, to witte, of Charitie, and then a deade Faithe is a true Faithe &c. S. Iames geeueth vs to vnderstande, that Faithe hath Life of an other thing, like as the Body hath Life of the Soule: For he saithe, *Sicut enim Corpus sine Spiritu mortuum est, ita & Fides sine operibus mortua est:* As the Body without the Soule is deade, so is Faith deade without workes. Not as the man is deade without the Soule, but as the Body is deade without the Soule, so is Faithe deade without woorkes. But the Body beinge without the Soule, is stil a true natural Body: Therfore Faithe, beeinge without good VVoorkes, is stil a true Real Faithe. And so M. Iewel is tried a Lier.

M. Hard. 370. b. 371. a.

A man without a Soule.

The Answeare. I am weary of your Folies, M. Hardinge. And were it not for some satisfaction of the simple, I would not vouchsaue them of any answeare. Whereas I onely allege theise woordes of S. Iames, *Faithe without Woorkes is deade,* you telle me, that I belie the Scripture. And this (you saie) shal be mine Answeare. Of suche hasty Answeares you haue good store. I thanke God. I beleeue the Scriptures: I belie them not. I would not willingely belie a Childe: muche lesse the Euerlastinge Woorde of God: For, I knowe, it is Holy.

Iacob. 2.

But how, & wherein haue I so folwly belied the Scriptures? You answeare me: A thinge maie be deade in two sortes: either bicause it had Life in it of his owne, or els bicause it had it of an other thinge. Faithe hath Life of it selfe: and Faithe hath Life of Charitie. Al this maie be graunted. But what conclude you hereof, M. Hardinge? If Faithe haue Life of it selfe, haue I therefore belied the Scriptures. Beholde S. Iames woordes: Thus he saithe: *Faithe without Woorkes is deade:* of the other side beholde my woordes: Thus I saie, Faithe without woorkes is deade. Nowe compare these woordes together. I increase nothinge: I minishe nothinge: I alter nothinge: I repoorte S. Iames woordes plainely, and simply, as he spake them. With what good Countenance then can you so vnciuilly telle me, that I haue belied the Scriptures? Your Reader, be he neuer so friendely bente vnto you, muste needes doubte somewhat of your dealinge. If ye proceede accordingly, you wil be hable shortly to telle vs, that S. Iames him selfe hath belied the Scriptures. For the woordes, that I speake, and you condemne, be S. Iames.

Faithe (you saie) hath Life of an other thinge: like as the Body hathe of the Soule Not as the man

man is deade without the Soule, But as the Body is deade without the Soule, ſo is Faithe deade without good VVoorkes. Thus you ſaie. But healpe vs, I praie you, that wee maie better vnderſtande your meaninge. Ye ſpeake in parables: We nede a Commentarie. A man (ſaie you) deade without a Soule? what meaneth this talke, M. Hardinge? ye laie the waie for vs, I trowe, and woulde entrappe vs in the darke. Who euer hearde of a Man without a Soule? I haue ſommetimes hearde of a Man without witte, and of woordes without ſenſe, or reaſon: But of a Man without a Soule, hitherto I neuer hearde, onleſſe happily you meane the Man in the Moone.

Nowe let vs viewe the handſomneſſe of your diſtinction. Theiſe be your woordes: Not as a Man is deade without a Soule, but as a Body is deade without a Soule. A man, that had any Soule, would thinke, there ſhould be ſomme difference betweene theiſe ſpeeches. Not as the one (you ſaie) but as the other. But what if the One, and the Other be bothe one? Conſider better of your woordes, I beſeeche you. What is a Man without a Soule, but onely a bare deade Body? Or what is ſuche a deade Body, but onely a Man without a Soule? where was your Soule, M. Hardinge, when you diuiſed theiſe diſtinctions without a difference?

Yet ye telle vs, A Body, beeinge without a Soule, is ſtil a true Natural Body: *Ergo* (ſaie you) Faithe beinge without good woorkes, is ſtil a true Real Faithe. Firſte, M. Hardinge you knowe, it is commonly ſaide in al Schooles, Omnis Similitudo claudicat. You might ſone haue founde the fœbleneſſe of this Reaſon. It will ſerue you onely, to mocke Children. Howe be it, let vs vſe your owne graunte. You ſhal ſee them conclude againſte your ſelfe. For a Body without a Soule, notwithſtandinge it be a true natural Body, yet hath it neither ſenſe, nor Life, but is in deede, and verily a deade Body. Euen ſo your Faithe without good woorkes, notwithſtandinge any truthe, or Realtie, ye can geeue vnto it, hath in it neither life, nor ſenſe, but in deede, and verily is a deade Faithe, and therefore no Faithe at al.

But who taught you to ſhape out theiſe prety Similitudes, and ſo vnſkilfully to liken Faithe vnto the Body, and good woorkes vnto the Soule? The wiſe, and learned haue rather likened True Faithe to the Soule, and good VVoorkes to the Body. For as the Body hath no life of it ſelfe, but onely of the Soule, euen ſo woorkes haue no Life of them ſelfe, but onely of Faithe.

Yet you ſaie, Faithe without woorkes is neuertheleſſe a true and a Real Faithe. Verily, M. Hardinge, ſo is fiere without heate, a true, and a Real fiere. Of ſuche a Faithe, S. Iames ſaithe, Dæmones credunt, & contremiſcunt: *Diuels beleeue, and quake for feare*. If the wicked, without good woorkes, haue a true, and a Real Faithe, then maie you alſo ſaie, that the Diuel likewiſe hath a true, and a Real Faithe. This Faithe, is no Faithe, M. Hardinge. It is onely an imaginarie, and a Mathematical phantaſie. It is not that Faithe, whereby we are made the Children of God. Hereof S. Paule ſaithe thus, Habent ſpeciem pietatis: virtutem autem eius abnegant: *They haue a ſhewe, and a face of godlineſſe: but the vertue, and power thereof they forſake vtterly*. Of ſuche a Faithe the Angel ſaithe in the Apocalyps: *Thou haſte a name of life, and yet arte thou deade*. Suche is Faithe without VVoorkes, A Face without Godlineſſe, a Shewe without Subſtance, a name without Life.

Iacob. 2.

2. Timoth. 3.

Apocal. 3.

M. Iewel (you ſaie) is tried a Lier. And why ſo? Becauſe he ſaithe, as S. Iames ſaithe, *Faithe without Woorkes is deade*, and therefore, as S. Auguſtine ſaithe, *No Faithe at al*. But, M. Hardinge contrarie to S. Iames expreſſe, and plaine woordes, telleth vs, that Faithe without VVoorkes is a true, and a Real Faithe, and is liuely, and forceable in it ſelfe: And yet is he tried a truſty Man.

Yet you ſaie, Good VVoorkes haue theire rewarde: and therefore (ye ſaie) This Hereſie maie not ſo eſcape. Whether Good Workes ſhalbe rewarded, or no, it was no parte of Our queſtion. For we vndoubtedly beleeue the woordes, that are written by S. Iohn, Opera illorum ſequuntur illos: *Theire Woorkes followe after them*: We beleeue the woordes, that Chriſte ſaithe to his Diſciples, *He, that geeueth a Cuppe of colde Water to any of theſe litle Ones for my ſake, ſhal not loſe his rewarde*. We beleeue that, that S. Paule ſaithe, *Your Woorke ſhal not be in vaine in the Lorde*. We graunte, Good

Apocalyp. 14.

Matthæ. 10.

1. Corinth. 15.

VVoorkes

Merite, and Mercie.

VVoorkes haue theire Rewarde: But the same Rewarde standeth in Mercie, and Fauoure, and not in Dewtie.

Thus therefore we saie, Considering the weakenesse, and sinful corruption of Our Nature, there can be no Workes in vs so pure, & perfite, that we make thereby of right, and of dewtie, deserue Euerlastinge Life. And this, M. Hardinge, is no Heresie, but the very plaine Sense, and Substance of Godes Worde, and the vndoubted Doctrine of the Ancient Catholique Fathers of the Churche.

Iob saithe, Si Homo velit contendere cum Deo, non poterit ei respondere vnum pro mille: *If a man wil dispute with God, he is not hable to answeare him one for a thousand.* Iob. 9.

And therefore he saithe, Verebar omnia Opera mea: *I stoode in doubte, and was afraide of al my Woorkes.* Iob. 9.

Againe he saithe, *Although I were perfite, yet my soule shal not knowe it: If I woulde iustifie mee selfe, mine owne Mouthe shal condemne me.* The Prophete Esaie saithe, *Al our Righteousnesse is like a fowle stained clowte.* Esai. 64.

Therefore S. Augustine saithe, Non intres in Iudicium cum Seruo tuo. Quid est, Non intres in iudicium cum Seruo tuo? Non stes mecum in iudicio, exigendo à me omnia quæ præcepisti, & omnia quæ iussisti. Nam me inuenies reum, si in iudicium intraueris mecum Opus ergo est Misericordia tua, potiùs, quàm liquidissimo iudicio tuo: *O Lorde, enter not into iudgemente With thy Seruaunte. What meaneth that, Enter not into iudgemente With thy Seruaunt? Thus mutche it meaneth: Stande not With me in iudgemente, requiringe of me al that thou haste commaunded. For if thou enter into iudgemente With mee, thou shalte finde me guilty. I haue neede therefore, not of thy vpright* Iudgemente, *but of thy* Mercie. August. De Tempore, sermo. 49.

Againe he saithe, Merita quorumlibet hominum quæ sunt? Quandoquidem ille, qui, non cum Mercede debita, sed cum gratuita Gratia venit, Omnes peccatores, solus a peccato liber, & liberator, inuenit: VVhat be the Merites of any men? *For Christe that came,* not with his dewe rewarde, but with his Grace, that was not dewe, *founde al menne sinners, beinge him selfe onely free from sinne, and a deliuerer of Sinners.* August. Epist. 52 ad Macedon.

Againe he saithe, Coronat te in Misericordia, & Miserationibus. Hoc fiet in iudicio: vbi cùm Rex iustus sederit in Throno, redditurus vnicuique secundum opera eius quis gloriabitur, castum se habere Cor? Aut quis gloriabitur, mundum se esse à peccatis? Ideò illic necessarium fuit commemorare Misérationem, & Misericordiam Domini, &c. *God crowneth thee With Fauour and Mercie. That shalbe donne in the laste iudgemente: where as, when the Iuste Kinge shal sitte in his Throne, to render to euery man accordinge to his woorkes, who shal boaste, that his harte is chaste? Or, who shal boaste, that he is cleane from Sinne? Therefore it was needeful to make mention of the* Pitie, and Mercie of Our Lorde. Augustin. De spiritu, & Litera, Cap. 33.

And againe, Opera manuum mearum non Commendo. Timeo enim, ne cùm inspexeris, plura inuenias peccata, quàm Merita: *Lorde, I commende not the woorkes of my handes. For I am afraide, leste, When thou shalte beholde them,* thou shalte finde moe sinnes, then good deseruinges. August. in Psalm. 137.

So saithe S. Hierome, Si consideremus nostra Merita, desperandum est: If wee beholde our owne Merites, wee muste be driuen to desperation. Hieronym. in Esai. Cap. 64.

So saithe Origen, Ego vix mihi persuadeo, vllum opus esse posse, quod ex debito remunerationem deposcat: *I doo scarcely beleeue, that there can be any woorke,* that maie of dewtie require rewarde. Origen. ad Rom. Li. 4. Cap 4.

Againe he saithe, Dicite, vos esse Seruos inutiles. Nam etsi Omnia fecerimus, quæ præcepta sunt: non tamen bonum aliquod fecimus. Nec enim, si verè bona essent, essemus inutiles. Omne autem bonum nostrum, non propriè, sed abusiuè bonum dicitur: *Saie yee* (saithe Christe) *that yee be vnprofitable Seruauntes. For notwithstandinge wee haue donne al thinges, that are commaunded,* yet haue wee donne no good thinge. *For, if our dooinges were good in deede, then were wee not vnprofitable. But any good deede of ourres is called good,* not rightly, or dewly, but by abuse of speache. Origen. in Matthæ. Tract. 8.

So saithe S. Augustine, Si Deus vellet pro Meritis agere, non inueniret, nisi quod damnaret: *If God woulde deale With vs accordinge to that wee haue deserued, he shoulde finde nothinge, but that he mighte condemne.* Therefore, M. Hardinge, VValdensis, one of your greate Doctours, hauinge wel, and circumspectly weighed the mater of euery side, at the laste concludeth thus, Quid dignum facimus, vt participes Cœlestibus fieri inueniamur? Apostolo dicente, Existimo, quòd non sunt condignæ August. in Psalm. 94. VValden. contra VViclefum. Roman. 8.

 passiones

passiones huius temporis ad futuram gloriam, quæ reuelabitur in nobis: Reputo igitur saniorem Theologum, fideliorem Catholicum, & Scripturis Sanctis magis concordem, qui tale Meritum simpliciter abnegat: *What woorthy thinge doo wee, that wee maie be founde in the Felowshippe of the Heauenly Spirites? The Apostle saithe, I iudge, that the afflictions of this time are not woorthy of that Glorie, that shalbe reueled in vs.* Therefore I take him to be the founder Diuine, the Faithefuller Catholique, and more agreeable to the Holy Scriptures, that vtterly denieth al sutche kinde of Merite.

But ye wil saie, If wee finde Our selues voide of Merite, howe then shal wee stande, and be iustified before God? S. Iohn **saithe**, *Blessed are they, that haue washed theire Roabes* (**not in their owne** Merites, **but**) *in the Bloude of the Lambe.* **And** God **saithe**, *I wil geeue the thirsty to Drinke of the Wel of Life* (**not for his** Desertes, **but**) for nothinge. **The Ancient Father** Origen **saithe**, Quia Omnia conclusa sunt sub peccato, nunc non in Meritis, sed in Misericordia Dei Salus Humana Consistit: *For as mutche as al menne are shutte vp, and Closed vnder Sinne*, now the Saluation of Man standeth, not in mans Merites, but in Goddes Mercie.

Apocalyp. 22.

Apocalyp. 21.

Origen. ad Roma. Li. 9. Ca. 12.

S. Augustine **saithe**, Deus in fine Coronabit nos in Misericordia, & Miserationibus: *God in the ende wil crowne vs* (**not with the price of our deseruinges, but**) with Fauour, and Mercies.

Augustin. Epist. 105. ad Sixtum.

Againe he saithe, Pro nihilo saluos facies eos. Quid est, Pro nihilo saluos facies eos? Nihil in eis inuenis, vnde salues: & tamen saluas. Quia nihil inuenis, vnde salues: & multum inuenis, vnde damnes: For Nothinge *thou shalt saue them. What is meante by these woordes*, For Nothinge *thou shalt saue them? (This is the meaninge)* Thou findest Nothinge in them, wherefore thou shouldest saue them: and yet thou sauest them. *Thou findest nothinge, wherefore thou shouldest saue them: but thou findest mutche, wherefore thou shouldest condemne them.* **And againe**, Omnes in Mortem pœna debita præcipites ageret, nisi inde quosdam indebita Dei Gratia liberaret: *Deserued paine would throwe al menne into Deathe, onlesse the* Vndeserued Grace *of God deliuered some from it.*

Augustin. De Verbis Apostoli, Sermo. 15.

Augustin. De Ciuitate, Li. 14. Cap. 1.

S. Basile **saithe**, Non erit Iudicium sine Misericordia: Quia non potest homo purus inueniri à sorde: ne si vnus quidem tantùm dies sit ab eius natali: Iudgement shal not be without mercie: *For noman can be founde pure, and cleane from al filthe: no, though he be but one daie olde.* **Againe he saithe**, Hæc est nostra integra, & perfecta gloriatio in Deo, quando propriæ Iustitiæ nos inopes agnoscimus: Sola autem Fide in Christum Iustificari: *This is our ful, and perfite reioicinge in God, when wee acknowledge, that wee are voide of any Our owne Righteousnesse*, and are Iustified by Onely Faithe in Christe.

Basil. in Psal. 32

Basil. De Humilitate.

So saithe S. Hierome, In Christo Iesu Domino nostro: in quo habemus fiduciam, & accessum, & confidentiam per Fidem eius: non per nostram Iustitiam, sed per eum, cuius Fide nobis peccata dimittuntur: *In Christe Iesu Our Lorde: in whome wee haue boldenesse, and libertie to comme* (**to God**), *and truste, and affiance by the Faithe of him: not through Our Righteousenesse, but through him, in whose name Our Sinnes be forgeuen.*

Hieron. in Epist. ad Ephes. ca. 3.

Hereof S. Bernarde **in moste godly, and comfortable wise concludeth thus**, Meritum meum Miserationes Domini. Non sum ego inops Meriti, quam diu ille non est inops Miserationum. Si Miserationes eius multæ, multus ego sum in Meritis. Hoc totum est Hominis Meritum, si totam spem suam ponat in Domino: *My Merite is the Mercie of God. So longe as God is not poore of Mercie, so longe cannot I be poore of Merite. If his Mercies be greate, then am I greate in Merites.* This is the whole Merite of Man, if he put his whole affiance in the Lorde.

Bernar. in Psal. Qui habitat.

This is these Defenders Horrible Heresie, **M. Hardinge**, whiche (**you saie**) mought not so escape your handes.

The Apologie, Cap. 21. Diuision. 1.

To conclude, wee Beleue, that this our selfe same Flesche, wherein we liue, although it die, and comme to duste, yet at the laste shal returne againe to Life, by the meanes of Christes Spirite, whiche dwelleth in vs: and that then verily, whatsoeuer we suffer here in the meane while for his sake, Christe wil wipe awaie al teares, and heauinesse from our eies:

The cause of Resurrection.

cies: and that wee thzough him shal enioie Euerlastinge Life, and shal foz euer be with him in Glozie. So be it.

M. Hardinge.

Laste of al, ye beleeue (as ye saie) that this very Fleashe shal returne to Life, and that for the Spirite of Christe, whiche dwelleth in vs. There is no doubte but the Spirite of Christe is sufficient to raise vp theire bodies, in whome he dwelleth. But wee saie, that the raisinge of our Fleashe is also assigned in Holy Scripture * to the Real, and Substantial eatinge of Christes Fleashe, because it is written: He that eateth my Fleashe, and drinketh my Bloude, hath Life Euerlastinge. And I wil raise him againe in the laste daie. Therefore the Resurrection of the Fleashe is not onely assigned in Holy Scripture to the Spirite of Christe, but also to the woorthy eatinge of his Fleashe. And thus we haue confuted the Doctrine, wherein ye declare your Faithe: and the chiefe groundes, whereon yee builde your Newe Gospel, we haue disproued.

* Vntruthe. For so the Fathers of the Old Law & al Christian Infants should be vtterly excluded from Resurrection.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

The wozdes, wherein pée finde faulte, M. Hardinge, are not oures, but S. Paules. If they be false, why did he wzite them? If they be true, why do you blame them? Here pe séme to checke S. Paule, and not onely vs. Pée saie, The raisinge of our Fleashe is also assigned in the Holy Scripture to the Realle, and Substantial Eatinge of Christes Fleashe. But whence had pée these wozdes, M. Hardinge? Where founde pée these Scriptures? Dissemble no longer: Deale plainely, and simply: It is Goddes cause. Foz a shewe, pée allege these wozdes of Chzistе, written by S. Iohn: He that Eateth my Fleashe, and Drinketh my Bloude, hath Life Euerlastinge: And I wil raise him vp againe in the laste daie. These wozdes wée knowe: and the Eatinge of Chzistes Fleashe, wée knowe: But where is your Real, and Substantial, and Carnal Eatinge? Where did S. Iohn euer tel you, that Chzistes Body is Eaten with Teethe, and conueied further, in sutche grosse, and fleashely wise into the belly? S. Augustine expounadinge the same wozdes, saithe thus, Crede, & Manducasti: Credere in Christum, hoc est Manducare Panem Viuum: Iste Panis Interioris Hominis quærit esuriem: Beleeue thou (in Chzistе): and thou haste Eaten (Chzistе). To Beleeue in Christe, that is the Eatinge of the Breade of Life: *This Breade requireth the Hunger of the Inner Man.* And Nicolas Lyra, one of your owne Doctours, saithe, These wozdes of S. Iohn pertеine nothinge to the Sacramente. Thus he saithe, Hoc Verbum nihil directè pertinet ad Sacramentalem, vel Corporalem Manducationem: *This Saieinge* (of the firthe of Iohn) *perteineth nothinge directly to the Sacramental, or Corporal Eatinge.* It was some ouersight of your parte, M. Hardinge, to sécke to proue the Eatinge of the Sacramente by sutche wozdes, as, by your owne Doctours iudgement, perteine nothinge to the Sacramente.

Iohn. 6.

August. in Ioh. Tract. 25.
Idem. Tract. 26.

Nicola. Lyra in Psalm. 110.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* ☞ It was more ouersight of you, M. Iewel, to blemisshe your credite by belieuinge my Doctoure, if Lyra be my Doctoure. For Lyra neuer saide the woordes, that you allege &c. It appeareth, howe falsely you haue belied Lyra. The woordes, whiche you allege, are not the woordes of Nicolas Lyra, mine owne Doctoure, as you saie, but of one Matthias Doringe &c. You haue deceiued your Reader with false forgerie &c. You haue also fowly corrupted this poore Doctour Doringe, with cuttinge of his woordes, pretendinge him to speake of these woordes of S. Iohn, He that Eateth my Fleashe, and drinketh my Bloude, hath Life euerlastinge, and I wil raise him againe in the laste daie, whiche I alleged, whereas in deede he spake onely of theise special woordes of S. Iohn, *Nisi manducaueritis Carnem Filij hominis &c.* That the truthe maie be knowen, and your falsehed detected &c. The woordes, that you allege, be not Lyras, but one Doringes &c.

M. Hard. fol. 374. b. 375. a.

The Answeare. Sutche Erroures, sutche Ouersightes, sutche Blemishinge of credite, sutche Belieinge of Doctours, sutche Deceiuinge of Readers, sutche Corruption, sutche Falsehed, sutche Forgerie. Either there was somme maruellous great cause, M. Hardinge, why pée shoulde thus raise the Countrie with Hue, and Crie, oz els your Reader muste nédes thinke, your heade was disozdered with somme vanitie. What was the cause then of al this sturre? You saie, I haue alleged Nicolas Lyra in stéde of Matthias Doringe. This was an erroure: I wil easily graunte you. But Falsehed, oz Forgerie, oz Belieinge of Doctours, oz Deceiuinge of Readers, I beléeue, fewe sober menne would haue called it. Foz, what if I mistooke Lyra in stéde of Doringe? what coulde I haue gained by al that Forgerie? Is not the Authozitie of Matthias Doringe as good, as the Authozitie of Nicolas Lyra? were

Matthias Doringe.

they not bothe Franciscane Freeres, of one Order, of one Religion, and of one Profession? You knowe, that Nicolas Lyra, Paulus Burgensis, and Matthias Doringe are al three so ioined togeather, not onely in one Booke, but also oftentimes in the one side of one leafe, that, onlesse a man be very watcheful, he maie sone take one of them for an other. And yet, whom so euer a man shal happen to take of these three, there is smal choise in the takinge. Suche poore aduantages must be faine to healpe you, M. Hardinge, when you finde your selfe shanted of better shiftes.

But (you saie) I haue also fowly corrupted this poore Doctoure Doringe. What Pouertie you finde in him, I cannot telle. Wise menne weighe Learninge neither by Pouertie, nor by Richesse. Notwithstandinge I doubte not, but poore Doctoure Doringe in his time was thought to be as good a Doctoure, as Doctoure Hardinge. But wherein haue I so fowly corrupted him? Verily, M. Hardinge, I haue neither changed any one of his wordes, nor altered any parte of his meaninge. He saithe, *The woordes spoken by* Christe *in the sixte Chapter of* Iohn *belonge not Directly to the receiuinge of the Sacramente:* and to that pourpose I haue alleged him. Now therefore M. Hardinge, for the better trial of your credite, let vs suffer Matthias Doringe to telle his owne tale. Thus he saithe, Illud dictum ex litera non habet Fundamentum. Ideò de Sacramentali Communione, nec quoad Clerum, nec quoad Laicum habet vim præcepti ad omnes, secundum verum eius intellectum: quia ex eodem contextu literæ, declaratur, de qua manducatione, & potatione intelligi debeat, videlicet de Spirituali: Quia sequitur, qui manducat meam Carnem, & bibit meum Sanguinem, in me manet, & ego in eo. Quod Beatus Augustinus exponens ait, Hoc est Manducare illam escam, & bibere illum Potum, in Christo Manere & Christum manentem in se habere: quod nihil est aliud, quàm esse in Charitate Christi. Hoc autem nihil directè pertinet ad Sacramentalem, vel Corporalem manducationem. Nam hoc verbum fuit dictum antequam Sacramentum Eucharistiæ esset institutum. Ex illa igitur Litera de Sacramentali Communione non potest fieri Argumentum efficax. Primùm enim id, de quo agitur, debet esse in rerum natura. De Eucharistia igitur Sacramentali, quę non dum fuit, tam alta sententia proferri non potuit: nisi quis curiosus Hæreticus diceret, illa verba dicta de vsu Sacramenti Eucharistiæ Prognosticè per modum Prophetiæ. Sed sic dicere, non potest in aliquo passu Sacræ Scripturæ fundari. Eadem igitur facilitate contemnitur, qua probatur: præsertim quum constet ex Euangelij rotundo textu, quosdam huic præcepto satisfeciisse, quos constat nunquam Sacramentaliter Communicasse. Ideo Augustinus ait, has Propositiones simul esse veras. Non Manducans, Manducat: & Manducans, non Manducat. Dato opposito, sequeretur, neminem esse in charitate, nisi Sacramentaliter Communicantem: quod est erroneum dicere: *That saieinge hathe no fundation, or warrante in the woordes written by* S. Iohn. *Therefore to speake of receiuinge of the Sacramente, in true vnderstandinge, it hath no force of commaundemente, neither touchinge the Clergie, nor touchinge the Laitie. For in the same course of woordes it is opened sufficiently, of what Eatinge, and Drinkinge it ought to be taken: I meane* (not of the Sacramental, but) *of the Spirituall Eatinge, and Drinkinge. For it followeth, He* that Eateth my Fleashe, and Drinketh my Bloude, abideth in mee, and I in him. *Whiche woordes* S. Augustine *expoundeth thus*, This is the Eatinge of that meate, and the drinkinge of that drinke, for a man to dwelle in Christe, and to haue Christe dwellinge in him: *whiche is nothinge els, but to be in the Loue of Christe. But this perteineth nothinge directly to the Sacramental, or Bodily Eatinge. For this was spoken longe, before the Sacramente was ordeined. Therefore out of those woordes they can make no good proufe, touchinge the Communion of the Sacramente. For firste it is needeful, that the thinge, whereof wee speake, haue a presente beeinge. Therefore so Heauenly a saieinge coulde not then be spoken of the receiuinge of the Sacramente, for that at that time the Sacramente as yet had no beeinge: Onlesse simme curious Heretique wil saie, that the saide woordes in the sixthe of* Iohn *were spoken of the Sacramente by waie of Pronostication, or by a Propheisie. But that saieinge can haue no Fundation in any parte of the Scriptures. And therefore it is as easily despised, as it maie be proued: for as much as it appeareth euidently by the Gospel, that certaine haue satisfied this Commaundemente* (and haue eaten Christes Fleashe, and dronken his Bloude) *that certainely were neuer*

Matthias Doringe. in Psalm. 110.

Nothinge directly to the Sacramente.

No proufe touching the Sacramente.

Coulde not be spoken.

By waie of Pronostication.

The cause of Resurrection.

neuer partetakers of the Sacramente. For that cause S. Augustine *saithe, These twoo saieinges be bothe true,* He that Eateth not, Eateth: And, He that Eateth, Eateth not. *Otherwise it woulde folowe, that noman can be in the Loue of Christe, onlesse he be partetaker of the Sacramente: whiche thinge to saie, it were greate erroure.* Nowe, M. Hardinge, let your Reader iudge indifferently betweene vs, touchinge this Forgerie. Matthias Doringe saithe, *Your saieinge hath no warrante of the Scripture:* He saithe, *Theise woordes* (in the sixthe of Iohn) *cannot directly perteine to the receiuinge of the Sacramente,* for that the Sacramente at that time was not ordeined: He saithe, *You are a Curious Heretique,* if you thinke, these woordes were spoken by Pronostication, or by Prophesie: He saith, *Wee maie as wel despise your phantasie, as you can proue it:* He saithe, *That to applie theise woordes to the receiuinge of the Sacrament, it were greate erroure.* And, for proufe of his owne Iudgement herein, he allegeth the Authoritie of S. Augustine. I cannot see, in what kinde of speeche he coulde more clearely haue expressed his meaninge.

It were great erroure.

But you wil saie, Matthias Doringe spake not of the woordes, that you allege. Whiche are these, *He that eateth my Fleashe, and drinketh my Bloude, hath life Euerlastinge, and I wil raise him againe at the laste daie:* But onely, and specially of theise woordes, *Onlesse yee eate the Fleashe of the Sonne of Man, you shal haue no life in you.* Of theise woordes (you saie) Matthias Doringe spake, and not of the other. What fonde folie is this, M. Harding? Why should you so vainely deceiue the worlde? What difference finde you betweene these twoo sentences? Were they not bothe vttered in one Chapter, in one place, at one time, by one Mouthe, and to one pourpose? If the one parte perteine to the Sacrament, what hath the other offended, that it maie not likewise perteine to the Sacrament? What cause, what reason, what Authoritie, haue you to the contrarie? If you haue any, let it appeare: Otherwise, your Reader wil thinke, you talke without grounde, yea care not what. I protest before God, It pitieth me to see your follies.

M. Hard. fol. 375. a.

Matthias Doringe speaketh not onely, or specially of one, or twoo woordes, as you saie, but generally of al the woordes, that Christe spake in the sixthe Chapter of S. Iohn, *Touchinge the Eatinge of his Fleashe, and Drinkinge of his Bloude:* Whiche woordes, he saithe, *Perteine not directely to the receiuinge of the Sacramente.* And his reason is this: *For,* saithe he, *When Christe spake theise woordes, the Sacramente as yet was not ordeined.* I beseeche you, doth not this reason include as wel the one sentence, as the other? When Christe spake theise woordes, Nisi ederitis carnem Filij Hominis, &c. *The Sacramente* (saithe Matthias) *was not yet ordeined.* And was it suddainely ordeined, before he coulde vtter the nexte woordes folowinge? The nexte woordes are theise, that you haue alleged, *He that Eateth my Fleashe, and Drinketh my Bloude, hathe life Euerlastinge, and I shal raise him vp at the laste daie.* Neither theise woordes, nor the former perteine directly to the Sacramente.

As Matthias Doringe saithe, euen so saithe Michael Vehe, an other of youre owne Doctoures: Quam nihil firmitatis habeat hæc ratio, hinc claret, quod verbis Christi abutitur in peregrino sensu. Quæ enim de Spirituali manducatione &c. *How weake this reason is, it appeareth hereby, that he abuseth Christes woordes, in a strange meaninge. For the woordes, that were spoken of the Spiritual Eatinge, he wreasteth to the Eatinge of the Sacramente: of whiche Eatinge of the Sacramente, Christe in theise woordes in the sixthe Chapter of* S. Iohn, *speaketh nothinge. Whiche thinge is wel proued by this reason: For many haue Spiritual Life by the Grace of God, and be liuely Members of Christes Body, that were neuer partetakers of the Sacramente &c.*

Michael. Vehe, contra Luther. tract. 5.

In a strange meaninge.

VVreasteth.

Christ spake nothinge of

So likewise saithe Eckius, speakinge of the sixthe Chapter of S. Iohn, Ad Sacramentum hic oculus non est habendus: *In this Chapter wee maie haue no eie vnto the Sacramente.* I coulde allege moe of your owne Doctours to like pourpose. But my Heade is weary of your wranglinge.

Eckius, De triplici specie.

Christe saithe further, *Onlesse yee Eate the Fleashe of the Sonne of Man, and Drinke his Bloude, yee shal haue no Life in you.* If there be none other Eatinge of Christes Body, wherebye we shal liue, but onely your Fantastical, and Fleashly Eatinge with Mouthe, and Teethe, then I beseeche you, what Life hathe Abraham, Isaac, Iacob, Moses, Aaron, and other Holy Patriarkes, and Prophetes, that were be-

Iohan. 6.

fore the comminge of Christe? What Life haue a great number of Holy Martyrs? What Life haue Christian Children, that, being Baptized in the Bloude of Christ, departe this Life before they can receiue the Sacramente: that is to saie, by your strange Exposition, before they haue Really, and Substantially Eaten the Fleashe of Christe? Will ye saie, They haue no Life? Or, will ye condemne them al to Everlastinge Deathe? Or, muste wee thinke, they shal neuer rise againe? Certainely S.

Aug. in Iohan. Tract. 26. Augustine saithe precisely, Qui Manducat, habet Vitam: & qui non Manducat, non habet Vitam: *Who so Eateth* (the Fleashe of Christe) *hathe Life: and who so Eateth it not, hathe no Life.* Hereof wee muste nedes conclude by your Diuinitie, that Abraham, Isaac, Iacob, Moses, and other Godly Fathers, that neuer receiued the Sacramente, haue no Life, but are deade for euer, without hope of Resurrection.

1. Cor. 15. But to leaue your Fantasies, M. Hardinge, the cause of Our Resurrection, as S. Paule saithe, is the Spirite of God, that dwelleth in vs. Origen saithe, Resurgemus propter Spiritum habitantem in nobis: Necesse est enim Spiritui reddi habitaculum suum: *Wee shal rise againe bicause of the Sprite, that dwelleth within vs: For of necessitie the Sprite muste haue his House restoared vnto him.* S. Augustine saithe, Hæc mea tota Spes est, & omnis fiducia. Est enim in ipso Iesu Christo Domino nostro Vniuscuiusque nostrum portio, Caro, & Sanguis. Vbi ergo portio mea regnat, ibi ego me regnare credo: *This is my Whole hope, and al my truste. For in Christe Iesu our Lorde is Fleashe, and Bloude, whiche is a Portion of eche of vs.* Therfore where a Portion of mine reigneth, there I beleeue, that I reigne too.

Cyrill. in Iohan. Lib. 4. Cap. 15. S. Cyril saithe, Quamuis Mors propter peccatum in Naturam nostram insilijt, tamen, quia Filius Dei Homo factus est, omnes profectò Resurgemus: *Although Deathe be fallen into our Nature bicause of Sinne, yet* bicause the Sonne of God, is made Man, *doubtlesse wee shal al rise againe.* Likewise againe he saithe, Sic vos effeci participes Diuinæ Naturæ, cum Spiritum meum fecerim habitare in vobis. Christus enim in nobis est per Spiritum, Corruptionem nostram in Incorruptionem Commutans: *So I made you Partetakers of the Diuine Nature,* when I caused my Sprite to dwel in you. For Christe is in vs by his Sprite, *changinge our Corruption into Incorruption.* Thus the Spirite of God is the Cause, and the worker of our Resurrection. And, to comme neare vnto you, the Sacramentes of Christe are also Meanes, and Instrumentes, and Seales hereof: but not the causes.

Cyrill. in Iohan. Lib. 12. Cap. 58. S. Cyril saithe, Quod Mystica Communio Resurrectionis quædam sit Confessio, verbis Christi ipsius probatur. Ait enim, Hoc est Corpus meum: Hoc in Memoriam Mei facite: *That the Mystical Communion is a certaine Confession of the* Resurrection, *it is proued by the woordes of Christe him selfe. For he saithe, This is my Body: Doo this in Remembrance of mee.* And therefore in the Councel of Nice, the Holy Mysteries are called

Concil. Nicen. De Conse. Dist. 2. Non iste. Resurrectionis nostræ Symbola: *The Pleadges, or Tokens of our* Resurrection. And S. Ambrose, speakinge distinctly hereof, saithe, Non iste Panis, qui vadit in Corpus, sed Panis Vitæ Aeternæ, qui animæ nostræ Substantiam fulcit: *It is not this Breade* (of the Sacramente) *that passeth into the Body: but it is the Breade of Euerlastinge Life,* (that is to saie, the very Body of Christe it selfe,) *that sustaineth the Substance of our Soule.*

And, to put the mater further out of doubte, the same force vnto Resurrection, that is applied vnto the Sacrament of Christes Body, is also, and in as ample forte geuen to the Sacramente of Baptisme.

Basil. De Sancto Baptismate. Τὸ δὲ βάπτισμα δύναμις ἐστὶ πρὸς τὴν Ἀνάστασιν. *Ignatius ad Trallien. Concil. VVormatien. Cap. 5.* S. Basile saithe, Dies Paschatis est Pignus Resurrectionis: Baptisma verò est potentia, & vis ad Resurrectionem: *Easter Daie is a pleadge of* Resurrection: But Baptisme is a power, and strengthe vnto Resurrection.

Againe he saithe, Resurrectionis Gratiam in die Resurrectionis excipiamus: Vpon the daie of Christes Resurrection, Let vs receiue (Baptisme, whiche is) the Grace of Resurrection.

Ignatius saithe, Vt Credentes in Mortem eius, per Baptismum participes eius Resurrectionis efficiamini: *That beleeuinge in his Deathe,* by Baptisme *ye maie be made Partetakers of his Resurrection.* Therefore in the Councel of VVoormes it is written thus: In aquas demersio, in Infernum descensio est: Et rursus, ab Aquis emersio,

Resur-

Resurrectio est: *The dippinge into the Water, is th egoinge downe into Hel: and the* comminge out from the VVater, is the Resurrection.

In the ende, M. Hardinge, ye blowe vp merily your owne Conquest: And thus pe sate, VVee haue confuted the Doctrine, wherein yee declare your Faithe: and the Chiefe groundes, whereon yee builde your Newe Gospel, wee haue disproued: But, with so simple proufes, and so many Untruthes, M. Harding, as, for Honours sake, male not wel be shewed in your Triumphe.

Here endeth the Seconde Parte.

The Thirde Parte.

The Apologie, Cap. 1. Diuision. 1.

BEholde, theise are the horrible Heresies, for the whiche a good parte of the Worlde is at this daie condemned by the Bishop of Rome: And yet were neuer hearde to pleade theire cause. He shoulde haue commenced his suite rather against Christ, against the Apostles, and against the Holy Fathers. For these thinges did not onely procede from them, but were also appointed by them: Excepte perhappes theise Menne wil sate (as, I thinke, they wil in deede) that Christ neuer instituted the Holy Communion, to be diuided emongest the Faithefull: Or, that Christes Apostles, and the Auncient Fathers saide Priuate Masses, in euery corner of the Temples, nowe tenne, nowe twentie togeather in one daie: Or, that Christe and his Apostles banished al the Common People from the Sacramente of his Bloude: Or, that the thing, that they themselues doo at this daie euery where, and do it so, as they condemne him for an Heretique, whiche doothe otherwise, is not called of Gelasius theire owne Doctour plaine Sacrilege: Or, that theise be not the very woordes of Ambrose, Augustine, Gelasius, Theodorete, Chrysostome, and Origene, The Breade and VVine in the Sacramentes remaine stil the same, they were before: The thing, which is seene vpon the Holy Table, is Breade: There ceaseth not to be stil the Substance of Breade, and Nature of VVine: The Substance, and Nature of Breade, is not changed: The selfe same Breade as touchinge the Material Substance, goeth into the Belly, and is caste out into the priuie: Or, that Christe, the Apostles, and Holy Fathers praied not in that tongue, whiche the people mighte vnderstande: Or, that Christ hath not perfourmed al thinges by that one offeringe, whiche he once offered vpon the Crosse: Or, that the same Sacrifice was Unperfite, so that nowe wee haue neede of an other.

M. Hardinge.

VVhat crake ye of a good parte of the VVorlde? The greater is the number of thoſe ye haue ſeduced, the more grieuous ſhal be your Iudgement. There be not yet many yeeres paſte, that ye boaſted of your poore ſmal flocke, alludinge to the fewneſſe of Flocke, that liued with Chriſt in Fleaſhe, and made their fewneſſe an argument of the ſincere truthe. But nowe that throughe your euil teachinge (a) the worlde groweth more to be diſſolute and wicked, ye boaſt of your number. This is certaine, touching groundes of truthe, the Church erreth not, as that which enioyeth Chriſtes promiſe: and your Congregation teachinge the contrarie, muſt therefore be taken for the Children of the Father of lies. Though tenne, or twentie Maſſes were not ſaide in one daie by Chriſte, the Apoſtles, or Fathers, as ye ſcoffe, when the Faith was firſte Preached, (b) and fewe beleued, no Churches (whiche here not without prophane malice ye name Temples, yet beeinge builte: this is no ſufficient reaſon, why wee maie not nowe, where the Faith is generally receiued, haue ſundrie Maſſes in one Church in one daie. Ye make mutch a doo about both Kindes, and to aggrauate the mater, yee vſe the odious terme of banniſhinge the people from the Cuppe. VVee teache the people for (c) good cauſes to be contente with one Kinde, doeinge them to vnderſtande, they receiue the whole Body of (d) Chriſte) Fleaſhe and Bloud, no leſſe, then if thei receiued both Kindes. The Sacrilege which Gelaſius ſpeaketh of, conſiſteth (e) in diuidinge Chriſte, and the ſame he imputeth to the Manichees, as I haue an other where declared. And therefore as that toucheth not vs, who doo not diuide Chriſt, but in the Sacramente geeue to the people whole Chriſte, ſo it ſheweth you to be either ſclaunderous, or ignorante. To M. Iuel. Chalenge. Artic. 2.

As for the tongue of the Churche Seruice, (f) howe ſo euer Chriſte, the Apoſtes, and Holy Fathers praied, the vſe of the Latine tongue vſed in the Seruice of the Latine Churche, is not by any reaſon or Authoritie yee can bringe yet, ſo farre diſproued, that the Church ought to condemne the order (g) from the beginninge receiued, and hitherto continewed.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Wée make no crakes of our numbers, M. Hardinge, but humbly géue God thankes, that, maugre al your practiſes, and policies, hath publiſhed, and proclaimed the name of his Sonne in euery place throughe the worlde. The ſorth, ſorce therof greeueth you nowe, as it did others your Fathers beſore you, that cried out in an agonie, *What ſhal wee doo? All the worlde renneth after him.* **Of them** S. Cyril ſaithe, Quicquid Chriſto credentium acceſſerit, ſibi detractum putant: *As many Faithefal Beleeuers, as are gotten to Chriſte, ſo many, they thinke, are loſte from them ſelues.*

Notwithſtanding, the Truthe of God hangeth neither of many, nor of fewe. Liberius **the Biſhop of** Rome, **ſaide ſometime to the** Arian **Emperoure** Conſtantius, Non, ſi ego ſolus ſum, idcirco minor eſt ratio Fidei: *Although I be alone, yet the accompte of Faithe is therefore no white the leſſe.* Chriſte **compareth the Kingedome of God vnto a péece of Leauen, whiche beinge litle in quantitie the woman taketh, and laieth in a great Lumpe of dought, vntil the whole be al Leauened.**

Chryſoſtome ſaith, Nemo paucitatem veſtram deploret. Magna enim eſt virtus Prædicationis. Et quod ſemel fermentatum eſt, rurſus fermentum ad cætera efficitur: *Lette noman bewaile the ſmal number of you. For greate is the Vertue of Preachinge. And who ſo is once Leauened, is him ſelfe made Leauen to Leauen others.*

It is noted in the Gloſe **vpon the** Clementines, Veritas pedetentim cognoſcitur: *Truthe is knowen by Litle, and by Litle.* **And** S. Ambroſe, Conſtat Diluuium eodem numero, quo cumulatum eſt, eſſe diminutum: *It is knowen, that the Flouddе in the time of* Noë, *as it grewe by degrees, ſo by degrees it abated.* Origene **ſaithe,** Ego concitabo eos in non Gentem. Nos ſumus non Gens: qui pauci ex iſta Ciuitate credimus, & alij ex alia. Et nuſquam Gens integra ab initio credulitatis videtur aſſumpta: *I ſhal prouoke them by them, that are no people. Wee are they, that were no people, that Beleeue in Chriſt, a fewe in this Cittie, and a fewe in an other. And neuer was there any Nation, that was taken whole at the firſte beginninge of the Faithe.* **The meaninge hereof is this, that God calleth meenne, not al togeather, but nowe a fewe, nowe moe, as vnto his ſecrete wiſedome ſéemeth beſte. So it is written in the late** Councel of Baſile, Spiritus Sanctus non illuminat omnes eodem tempore: Sed vbi vult, & quando vult, ſpirat: *The Holy Ghoſte doothe not geeue lighte to al meenne at one time: but breatheth where it wil, and when it wil.*

This is the Counſel and the hande of God, M. Hardinge. Wé maie ſaie vnto you, as Tertullian ſaide ſometime **vnto the Heathens:** Exquiſitior quæque crudelitas veſtra, illecebra eſt magis Sectæ, Plures efficimur, quoties metimur à vobis. Semen eſt Sanguis Chriſtianorum: *Your earneſt cruelties is an entiſemente, and a prouo-*

cation

(a) VVho ſo wanteth diſſolution, and wickedneſſe, maie ſeeke it at Rome

(b) Vntruth. For in the time of Auguſtine, Ambroſe, Hierome, &c. there were moe Chriſtians in the worlde, then be at this preſente.

(c) Good cauſes againſte God.

(d) One dreame to proue an other.

(e) Vntruth. For it ſtoode in diuidinge of the Sacramente.

(f) How ſo euer Chriſte, and his Apoſtles did, the Pope, and his Cleregie can not doo amiſſe.

(g) Vntruthe, plaine, and ſenſible. For this Order was not from the beginninge.

Iohan. 12.

Cyril. in Iohan. Lib. 8. Cap. 1.

Theod. li. 2. ca. 16 ἐυθὺς τὸ ζύμου μὲ μόνον, ὁ τῆς πίστεως ἐλαττοῦται λόγος.

Matthe. 13.

Chryſoſ. in Matthe. Homil. 47.

In Proœmio.

Clemen. in Gloſſ.

Ambroſ. de Noë, & Arca. Ca. 17.

Origen. in Pſal. 36. Homil. 2.

In Concil. Baſil. in Epiſt. Synodali. Pag. 152.

Tertull. In Apologet.

Fewe, or many. Churche. Temple.

cation vnto this Selte: As often as ye recken vs, ye finde vs moe and moe. The Seede hereof is Christian Blonde. Arnobius saide sommetime vnto the enimies of the Crosse of Christe, Nonne hæc saltem fidem vobis faciunt argumenta credendi, quòd iam per omnes terras, in tam breui tempore, & paruo, immensa nominis huius Sacramenta diffusa sunt: *As the leaste, doo not these prouses make you beleue, that, ye see, the great Secretes of this Name (of Christe) are powred abroade in so shorte space throughe al Countries?* Arnobius ad uer Gentes. Li. 1.

Fight not againste God, M. Hardinge. There is no Wisedome, there is no Councel againste the Lorde. Prouerb. 21.

This is certaine (ye saie) touchinge the groundes of Faithe, the Church erreth not. Whether your Churche haue erred, or no, and in what groundes it hath erred, it shal better appeare hereafter. Truely S. Bernarde saith of your Church, euen of your Church of Rome, Intestina, & insanabilis facta est plaga Ecclesiæ: *The wounde of the Churche is within the bowels, and paste recouerie.* And againe, Hæc sunt infœliciſsima tempora, quæ præuidit Apostolus, in quibus homines sanam Doctrinam non sustinent: *These be the vnhappy daies, that the Apostle sawe before, when Menne cannot abide sounde Doctrine.* This was S. Bernardes iudgemente of your Churche: that it woulde heare no sounde Doctrine: and that it for that cause seemed vtterly paste recouerie: Therefore so certainely to assure your selfe of a thinge vncertaine, it was no wisedome. We maie saie of your Popes, and Bishops, whome onely ye meane by the name of your Churh, as S. Hierome saide sommetime of certaine others your Fathers longe agoe: Non tam indignentur nobis hæc exponentibus, & Prophetis vaticinantibus, quàm Dominum deprecentur, & studiosè agant, ne de Sacerdotibus, qui violant Sancta Domini, esse mereantur: *Let them not take stomake againste vs, that expounde these thinges: nor againste the Prophetes, that foretolde these thinges: But let them praie vnto God, and take good heede, that they be not of those Priestes, that defile the Holy thinges of the Lorde.* Bernard. ad Clerum In Concil. Rhemen. Bernard. sup. v Salue Regina. Hieronym. in Sophoni Ca. 3.

Churches (ye saie) not without profane malice, ye cal Temples. Malice comme vnto him, M. Hardinge, that Malice meaneth. The Prophete Dauid saithe, The Lorde in his Holy Temple: S. Paule saith, *Your Bodies be the* Temples *of the Holy Ghost: Knowe ye not that ye be the* Temple *of God: If any man defile the* Temple *of God, the Lorde wil destroie him. Ye are the* Temple *of the Liuinge God: What agreement is there betweene the* Temple *of God, and an Idole?* So many times S. Paule nameth Temples togeather in one place: and yet, I thinke, without any great profane Malice. But it shalbe lawful for you, M. Harding, to make newe Sinnes, and to saie, The Apostles of Christe were malicious, and wicked, onely for that they called the Church of God by the name of Temple. Would God, ye had not turned Goddes Temple into the Synagoge of Sathan. We se by your practise, it is true, that S. Chrysostome saith, Sicut de Templo omne bonum egreditur, ita etiam de Templo omne malum procedit: *As euery good thinge proceedeth from the* Temple, *so euery il thinge proceedeth likewise from the* Temple. Psalm 10. 1. Corinth. 3. 2. Corinth. 6. Chrysost. in Matthe. Homil. 38.

In defense of your Halfe Communion, ye saie, For good causes yee teache the people to be contente with one Kinde. And thus ye force the poore people, contrarie to the expresse Worde of Christe, contrarie to the example of the Apostles, and al the Holy Fathers in the Primitiue Churche, and contrarie to the general vse, and order of a whole thousand yeres, to geue care to your good causes. But these causes, no doubt, are great, and worthy: Otherwise ye woulde not weighe them againste God. But wherefore are they dissembled? Why are they not tolde vs? Your owne Doctours, Alphonsus de Castro, and Iohn Gerson, haue laide them out in this wise Particularely, and at large: *The daunger of sheaddinge: The carrieinge from place to place: The fowlinge of the Cuppes: The trouble of Mennes Beardes: The reseruinge for the Sicke: The turninge of the Wine into Vineger: The engendringe of Flees: The Corruption, or Putrefaction: The Lothesomenesse that maie happen, for so many to Drinke of one Cuppe: The impossibilitie of prouidinge one Cuppe, that maie be sufficiente to serue al the People: In somme places Wine is deare: In somme places the Wine wil be sowre.* Alphons. Aduers sus Hæres. Lib 6 De Eucharist. Section vltima. Iohan. Gerson. De Communione Laicor. Concil. Trident. De Communi sub vna specie. Ca 2.

These, M. Hardinge, be the fairest, and greatest of your good causes. And yet haue you thus concluded in your late Chapter at Tridente, Si quis dixerit, Sanctam Ecclesiam Catholicam non iustis causis, & rationibus adductam fuisse vt Laicos, atque

atque etiam Clericos non conficientes, ſub Panis tantummodò ſpecie Communicaret, aut in eo erraſſe, Anathema ſit: *If any Man ſhal ſaie, that the Holy Catholique Churche, without* iuſte cauſes, and reaſons *her mouinge, dooth Communicate bothe the Laitie, and alſo Prieſtes, onleſſe they Miniſter, vnder the onely Fourme of Breade, or that the Church haithe erred in the ſame, Accurſed be he.* Therefore Tertullian ſaith rightly of you: Credunt ſine Scripturis, vt Credant contra Scripturas: *They Beleeue* without the Scriptures, *that they maie Beleeue* againſte the Scriptures.

Tertull. De Præſcription. Hieronym. in Sophoni. Ca. I.

But ſpecially, I beſeeche you, M. Hardinge, conſider wel theſe wordes of S. Hierome, and ſee, whether ye maie applie them to your ſelues, or no: In conſummatione Mundi ſcrutabitur Dominus Hieruſalem, id eſt, Eccleſiam ſuam cum Lucerna, & vliſcetur ſuper viros Contemptores, qui noluerunt Seruare Cuſtodias ſuas, id eſt, Mandata Domini Contempſerunt: & inſuper Ratione ſe peccare dicentes, blaſphemauerunt in Cordibus ſuis: *In the ende of the Worlde our Lorde ſhal ſearche Hieruſalem, that is to ſaie, his Church with a Candel, and ſhal wreake him ſelfe vpon the Deſpiſers, that would not keepe their watches, that is to ſaie, that deſpiſed the Commaundementes of God: and ouer, and beſides this ſaieing, thei had* good Cauſes, and Reaſons, wherefore they ſhould offende, (and breake Goddes Commaundementes) they blaſphemed in their Hartes.

That ye ſurmiſe of Gelaſius, is moſte vntrue. He ſpeaketh not one Worde there, of the diuidinge of Chriſte, as you imagine: nor had he any cauſe ſo to ſpeake. But he ſaith in moſte plaine wiſe, It is Sacrilege to doo the ſame thing, that you doo, that is to ſaie, to diuide the Sacramente, and to Miniſter the One parte, as ye doo, without the other. Loke better on your Bookes: and Confeſſe the Truthe, as ye ſhal finde it. The wordes be theſe: Aut integra Sacramenta percipiant, aut ab integris arceantur. Quia diuiſio vnius eiuſdemq; Myſterij ſine grandi Sacrilegio non poteſt peruenire: *Either let them receiue the* whole Sacramentes, *or els let them be driuen* from the whole. *For the Diuiſion of one and the ſame Myſterie,* (or Sacramente) *cannot happen without greate Sacrilege.* He ſpeaketh not of the Diuiſion of One Chriſt, as you tel vs, but of the Diuiſion of One Myſterie.

De Conſe. Diſt. 2. Comperimus.

Otherwiſe, touchinge Chriſte, we ſaie with S. Paule, Vnus Dominus Ieſus Chriſtus, *There is One Lorde Ieſus Chriſte:* And we proteſte with the Biſhoppes of the Eaſte in the Councel of Chalcedon, Accurſed be he, that parteth Chriſte: Accurſed be he, that diuideth him.

1. Corinth. 8. Euagri. Lib. 2. Cap. 17. Conci. Chalcedon. Actio. 2. Ἀνάθεμα τῷ μερίζοντι: ἀνάθεμα τῷ διαιρέτῃ.

That you ſaie, The order of your Latine Seruice hathe euermore benne vſed in the Latine Churche from the beginninge. It is vtterly vntrue. For proufe wherof, I remitte you to my Former Replie in the thirde Article, and the fifteenth Diuiſion.

The reſte, that ye allege, is not worthe the anſwearinge.

The Apologie, Cap. 1. Diuiſion. 2.

All theſe thinges muſte they of neceſſitie ſaie, onleſſe perchaunce they had rather ſaie thus, That al Lawe, and Righte is locked vp in the Treaſurie of the Popes breaſte, **and that, as once one of his ſoothinge Pages, and Clawbackes did not ſticke to ſaie, the** Pope is able to diſpenſe againſte the Apoſtles: **againſte a** Councel, **and againſt the** Canons **and Rules of the** Apoſtles: **and, that he is not bounde to ſtande, neither to the Examples, nor to the Ordinaunces, nor to the Lawes of Chriſte.**

M. Hardinge.

To ſaie, that al Lawe and righte (your Latine terme is *Fas*) is locked vp in the treaſurie of the Popes breaſte, it were abſurde and vnreaſonable. Mary to ſaie, that the Lawes reſte in the Popes breaſte, after a certaine meaninge, as hereafter ſhalbe declared, it is * not altogeather beſide truthe and reaſon. But Sirs, what if ſome meane writer, or Gloſer vpon the Canon Lawe ſpeake ſomwhere Diuinely out of ſquare, if al ſhoulde be exactly tried by the Scripture, wil yee laie that to our charge? Shal the reputed Faithe of the Catholique Churche thereby be called in doubte and queſtion? We take not vpon vs make good to Defende al that the Canoniſtes, or Schoolemen ſaie or write, &c. In this kinde or order be many what so thinges, whiche maie rather be called Rules of maners, then Principles, or ſuche as wee terme euer is

*Not altogeather beſide truthe: A Colde Defenſe.

Axiomata,

Diſpenſe againſte Goddes VVoorde

Axiomata, of our Faithe. Theſe althoughe they be founde written in the Scripture, for as mutch as they haue benne commaunded by an occaſion, and for ſome cauſe, they maie for cauſe, and occaſion, and as wee finde in C. *Lector*, for neceſsitie, by Goddes deputie, and Vicare be ſupplied, holpen, expounded. And if the caſe ſo require, he in the ſame for a certaine cauſe, with a certaine perſon, for a certaine time, with certaine circumſtances maie diſpenſe, by the ſame ſpirite, they were firſt founded and inſtituted withal, and with the ſame intention, to witte, for ſomme ſpecial good, and furtherance of Godlineſſe. Sutche adminiſtration of Goddes Lawe, and ſutche diſpenſation thereof, as of a precious Treaſure, not free or at Libertie and pleaſure, but an euen, iuſte, and good diſpenſation, they doo attribute to Goddes Vicare, whom this Defender calleth the Popes Paraſites, Pages, and Clawbackes, him ſelfe a very Page, Slaue, and clawebacke to the Diuel.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Here, M. Hardinge, ye rome, and wander, and goe maſket, as a man, that were benighted, and had loſte his waie. In ſomme caſes (ye ſaie) the Pope maie diſpenſe againſte Goddes VVoorde: In ſomme caſes he maie not. **Faine woulde ye, for ſhame, ſomewhat limite, and reſtraine his Immoderate Authoritie: but ye knowe not, where to laie the boundes. Ye make ſmal accoumpte of your** Schoole Doctoures, **and** Canoniſtes, **that is to ſaie, of the** Principal Pillers **of your Catholique Churche: and thinke them not worthy to be your guides. How be it, your labour cannot al be loſt: For they wil thinke as light of you.**

But, for as mutche, as, ye ſaie, They flatter not the Pope, nor be his Pages, or Paraſites: **but ſpeake roundly to him, and tel him his owne, it ſhal not be mutche amiſſe, to herken a litle, what they ſaie.**

One of them ſaithe thus, Papa poteſt Diſpenſare contra Ius Naturale: *The Pope maie Diſpenſe againſt the* Lawe of Nature. **An other ſaithe,** Papa Diſpenſat contra Canones Apoſtolorum: *The Pope Diſpenſeth againſt the* Canons, or Rules of the Apoſtles. **An other ſaith,** Papa poteſt mutare formam Verborum in Baptiſmo: *The Pope maie change the* fourme of VVoordes in Baptiſme. **An other ſaithe,** Priuilegium dari poteſt contra Ius Diuinum: *The Popes Priuilege maie be graunted againſte the* Law of God. **An other ſaithe,** Papa ex Maxima Cauſa poteſt Diſpenſare contra Nouum Teſtamentum: *The Pope vpon a very great Cauſe, maie Diſpenſe againſte the* New Teſtament. **An other ſaithe,** Papa poteſt Diſpenſare de omnibus præceptis Veteris, & Noui Teſtamenti: *The Pope maie Diſpenſe for* any commaundemente of the Olde, or Newe Teſtamente. **An other ſaithe,** Papa poteſt Diſpenſare contra Epiſtolas Pauli: *The Pope maie Diſpenſe againſte the* Epiſtles of S. Paule. **And, ſomme what to qualifie the outrage of the mater, An other ſaithe,** Papa poteſt Diſpenſare contra Ius Diuinum in Particulari, non in Vniuerſali: *The Pope maie Diſpenſe againſte the* Lawe of God, *in* Particulare, *not in* General. **And againe,** Papa poteſt tollere Ius Diuinum ex Parte, non in Totum: *The Pope maie* aboliſhe the Lawe of God, *in* parte, *but* not in whole. **An other ſaithe,** Martinus Papa 5. Diſpenſauit cum quodam, qui acceperat Germanam ſuam in Vxorem: *Pope* Martine, *the* 5. *Diſpenſed with a man, that had* taken to VVife his owne Siſter. **Whether this repoꝛte be true, oꝛ falſe, I referre mée ſelfe to the credite of the Authoure. Verily, that the** Natural Brother **ſhoulde marrie his owne** Natural Siſter, **it woulde néede a good ſtronge Diſpenſation: For God him ſelfe hathe by moſte expreſſe woꝛdes commaunded the contrarie. An other ſaithe,** Papa poteſt Diſpenſare cum omnibus Perſonis, niſi cum Patre, & Matre: *The Pope maie Diſpenſe* with al Perſonnes (**touchinge Marriage**) ſauinge onely with Father, and Mother (to Marrie, or to be Married to theire Children). **An other ſaithe,** Papa poteſt ſupra Ius Diſpenſare: Et de Iniuſtitia poteſt facere Iuſtitiam: & Sententiam, quæ nulla eſt, facere aliquam: Et de nihilo, facere aliquid: *The Pope maie Diſpenſe* aboue the Lawe: *The Pope of* VVronge, maie make Righte: *The Pope of no Sentence, maie make a Sentence: The Pope of* nothinge, *maie make* ſommethinge. **The cauſe herof, as an other ſaithe, is this,** Quia Papa poteſt, excepto Peccato, quaſi omnia facere, quæ poteſt Deus: *Sinne onely excepted, the Pope maie doo in a manner,* what ſo euer God maie doo.

An other ſaithe, Papa habet Authoritatem declarandi Scripturas, ita, vt non liceat oppoſitum tenere, vel opinari: *The Pope hathe Authoritie ſo to expounde, and to declare*

Ij q. 6. Authoritatem. In Gloſſa. Diſ. 82. Preſbyter Felin. De Conſtitutionib. Cap. Statuta Canonū, Colum 6. 6 q. 1. Quicunq;. In Gloſſa. Panormit Extra De Diuortijs. Cap. Fin. Summa Angel in Dictione Papa. Felin. De Conſtitution. Ca. Statuta Canonum. Felin. De Maioritate, & Obedient. Cap. 2. Idem De Maioritate & Obedient Cap. fin. Summa Angel. in Dictione pp. Panormit. Extra De Electione & Electi poteſt. Venerabilem. De Translatione Epiſco. Quanto. Hoſtien. De Tranſlatione, Epiſc. Quanto. Heruæus. de Poteſtate Papæ.

Dispense againste Goddes VVoorde

declare the Scriptures, that it maie not be lawful for any man to holde, or to thinke the Contrarie. For Cardinal Cusanus saithe, as it is saide before, Scripturæ ad tempus adaptatæ sunt, & variè intellectæ, ita, vt vno tempore secundum currentem Vniuersalem ritum exponantur: mutato ritu, iterum sententia mutetur: *The Scriptures are applied vnto the time, and are diuersly vnderstanded: so that at one time they are taken according to the Vniuersal Currente order: Whiche order beinge changed, the meaninge of the Scriptures is changed too.*

Cardin. Cusan. ad Bohemos, Epist. 2.

An other demaundeth a question, Vtrum Papa ex Plenitudine Potestatis possit omnia: *Whether the Pope by the Fulnesse of his Power maie doo* al thinges.

Francis. De Maron. in 4. Dist. 19. q. 1. Articul. 2. 9 que 3. Nemo in Glossa.

An other saithe, Si totus Mundus sententiet contra Papam, videtur, quòd standum esse sententiæ Papæ: *If* al the VVorlde woulde geeue sentence contrarie to the Pope, yet it seemeth, wee oughte to stande to the sentence of the Pope. Theise, M. Hardinge, by your Iudgement are neither Pages, nor Parasites: but good, sadde, and earnest frendes: suche as loue roughly, and plainely to vtter their minde, without flatterie.

Daniel. 7.

This doubtlesse is it, that Daniel so longe before Prophesied of him, Dabitur illi os loquens grandia: *He shal haue a mouthe geeuen him, vtteringe greate, and presumptuous maters.* For in deede, notwithstandinge al this glorious glitteringe of painted Authoritie, yet one of the Popes owne menne saithe, Pape non potest facere de quadrato rotundum: *The Pope* (notwithstandinge his Priuileges, and al his Power) *cannot make a square thinge, rounde.* S. Bernarde saithe, An Regula non concordat cum Euangelio, vel Apostolo? Alioqui Regula iam non est Regula: quia non est recta: *Dooth not the* Rule *agree with the Gospel, or with the Apostle? Otherwise that* Rule *is no* Rule *at al: for it is crooked, it is not streight.*

Iohan. Andreas. De Iudicijs. Cùm venissent. Bernard. In Apologia ad Guliel. Abbatem.

And therefore Pope Zosimus in more sober wise saithe thus, Contra Statuta Patrum condere aliquid, vel mutare, ne huius quidem Sedis Authoritas potest: *The Authoritie of this See cannot order or change any thing, contrary to the orders of our Fathers.*

Inter Decreta Zosimi.

Isidorus saithe, Is qui præest, si præter voluntatem, vel præter quod in Scripturis Sanctis euidenter Præcipitur, vel dicit, aliquid, vel imperat, tanquam Falsus Testis Dei, & Sacrilegus habeatur: *He, that is in Authoritie, if he speake, or commaunde any thing, besides the Wil, or meaninge of Gods Woorde, or otherwise, then is expressely commaunded in the Scriptures, let him be taken as a* Churchrobber, and as a false witnesse againste God.

11. q. 3. Si is qui.

The Apologie, Cap. 1. Diuision. 3.

Wee, for our parte, haue learned theise thinges of Christ, of the Apostles, of the Deuout Fathers: and doo sincerely with good faith teache the people of God the same. Whiche thinge is the onely cause why wee at this daie are called Heretiques of the chiefe Prelate, (no doubte) of Religion. O immortal God, hathe Christe him selfe then, the Apostles, and so many Fathers, al at once gonne astraie? Were then Origene, Ambrose, Augustine, Chrysostome, Gelasius, Theodoretus, forsakers of the Catholique Faithe? Was so notable a consent of so many Anciente Bishoppes, and Learned menne, nothing els but a conspiracie of Heretiques? Or, is that nowe condemned in vs, whiche was then commended in them? Or, is the thinge nowe, by alteration onely of one mans affections, suddainely become Schismatique, whiche in them was coumpted Catholique? Or shal that, whiche in times paste was vndoubtedly true, nowe by and by, bicause it liketh not these men, be Iudged false? Let them then bringe foorth an other Gospel, and let them shewe the causes, why theise thinges, which so longe haue openly benne obserued, and wel allowed in the Church of God, ought nowe in the ende to be called in againe. Wee knowe wel enough, that the same

Woorde

woorde, whiche was opened by Christe, and spreadde abroade by the Apostles, is sufficiente, bothe to our Saluation, and also to vpholde, and maintene al Truthe, and to confounde al manner of Heresie. By that woorde onely do we condemne al sortes of the Olde Heretiques, whome theise menne sate, we haue called out of Hel againe. As for the Arians, the Eutychians, the Marcionites, the Ebionites, the Valentinians, the Carpocratians, the Tatians, the Nouatians, and shortely al them, whiche haue a wicked opinion either of God the Father, or of Christe, or of the Holy Ghoste, or of any other pointe of Christian Religion, for so mutche as they be confuted by the Gospel of Christe, wee plainely pronounce them for detestable, and damned Persons, and defie them euen vnto the Diuel. Neither doo wee leaue them so, but wee also seuerely, and streightly holde them in by Lawful, and Politique pounishementes, if they fortune to breake out any where, and bewraie them selues.

M. Hardinge.

VVee for our parte knowe, as nowe wee haue proued, that yee haue not learned theſe thinges of Chriſte, nor of the Apoſtles, nor of the Fathers: but of Luther, Zwinglius, Oecolampadius, Caluine, Peter Martyr, Bucer, and ſutche other Apoſtates: and that ye doo moſte falſely, and wickedly leade the people into the Pitte with you. And therefore yee are iuſtly condemned by the Churche, and deemed Heretikes, &c.

Howe condemne yee the Donatiſtes, ſeeinge with them ye breake, and throwe downe the Holy Aultars of God, on whiche (as Optatus writeth) the Body and Bloude of Chriſte was wonte to be laide? &c.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Hereto, M. Harding, the whole groſſe ſumme of your Anſweare in effect is this: Ye falſely, and wickedly leade the people: ye are Apoſtates: ye are Heretiques: ye are Impudent, and rebellious Children: ye are Deſpiſers of God: Mockers of your Mother: and peruerters of the Apoſtles: ye vtter lies: ye ſpeake blaſphemies. At the laſt ye ſate, The Diuel dwelleth in our hartes, as in his ſhoppe. This is a haſty kinde of Logique, M. Hardinge: He muſte nedes be harde harted, that wil not yelde to ſutche Argumentes.

To leaue other your waſte woordes, of Vigilantius, Iouinian, Manichee, Aërius, and ſutche others, in the ende we pronounce your Definitiue Sentence, as a Iudge, and condemne vs for Heretiques, for that we haue taken downe your Shoppes, and gaineful Bothes, whiche ye cal the Holy Aultars of God. Verily, this muſte nedes be thoughte, either extreme rigoure, or greate folie, of the remouinge of a ſtone to make an Hereſie. Suche Hereſies, I trowe, S. Auguſtine, S. Ambroſe, Optatus, and other Learned Fathers knewe but fewe.

Neither is there any good ſufficient reaſon to be ſhewed, wherefore it ſhoulde more be Hereſie in vs to take downe your nedeleſſe, and Superſtitious Walles, whiche ye had erected of your ſelues, without Commiſſion, then it was lately in you, to teare in ſunder, and to burne our Communion Tables: in the erection, and vſe whereof we had the vndoubted example, both of Chriſte him ſelfe, and alſo of the Anciente Catholique Fathers. I ſaie nothinge of your Crueltie in burninge ſo many Bibles, and Bokes of Gods Holy Woorde: ſo many of your Brethrens Bodies: ſo many Temples of the Holy Ghoſte.

As for the Aultars, whiche, Optatus ſaithe, the Donatiſtes brake downe, they were certainely Tables of VVoode, ſutche as we haue, and not Heapes of Stones, ſutche as ye haue: as in my Former Replie, made vnto you, it maie better appeare. S. Auguſtine reportinge the ſame storie ſaithe, *The Donatiſtes in theire furie brake downe the Aultare Bourdes:* His woordes be theiſe, Lignis eiuſdem Altaris effractis. Likewiſe ſaithe Athanaſius of the like furie of the Arians: Subſellia, Thronum, Menſam Ligneam, & Tabulas Eccleſiæ, & cætera, quæ poterant, foras elata, combuſſerunt: *They carried forth, and burnte the Seates, the Pulpite,* The VVoodden Bourde,

Artic. 3. Diuis. 26
Auguſt. Epiſt. 50. Ad Bonifacium.
Athanaſ. in Epiſt. ad ſolitariâ vitam agentes.

Bourde, *the Churche Tables, and ſutche other thinges, as they coulde geate.*

B. Rhenan. in Epiſtola præfixa Liturgiæ Chryſoſtom.

Touchinge your Stone Aultars, Beatus Rhenanus ſaithe, In noſtris Baſilicis Ararum Superaddititia ſtructura nouitatem præ ſe fert: *In our Churches the* building vp of Aultars, added to the reſte, declareth *a noueltie*. This Learned Man tellety you, M. Harding, that your Stone Aultars are but newely brought into the Church of God: and, that our Communion Tables are olde, and ancient, and haue benne vſed from the beginninge.

We haue ſutche Aultars, M. Hardinge, as Chriſte, his Apoſtles, S. Auguſtine, Optatus, and other Catholique, and Holy Fathers had, and vſed, whoes examples to folowe, we neuer thought it to be ſutche Hereſie.

But Optatus ſaithe, *The Body, and Bloude of Chriſte was woonte to be laide* vpon the Aultare: and with theſe wordes ye woulde faine aſtonne your ſimple Reader, as if Chriſtes Body laie there Really, Fleaſhely, Verily, and in deede. But ye ſhoulde remember, that S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Sacramentum Corporis Chriſti ſecundum quendam modum Corpus Chriſti eſt: Et Sacramentum Sanguinis Chriſti ſecundum quendam modum Sanguis Chriſti eſt: *The Sacrament of Chriſtes Body* (not verily, and in deede, but) after a certaine manner of ſpeache is Chriſtes Body: *and the Sacramente of Chriſtes Bloude*, after a certaine manner of ſpeache, is the Bloude of Chriſt. This manner of Speach your owne Gloſe thus expoundeth, Vocatur Corpus Chriſti, id eſt, Significat Corpus Chriſti: *It is called the Body of Chriſte, that is to ſaie*, It Signifieth the Body of Chriſte. And, as Optatus ſaithe, *Chriſtes Body and Bloude were laide vpon the* Aultare, *or Communion Table*. Euen ſo S. Auguſtine ſaithe, *The whole people was in the Communion Cuppe, and laide vpon the Holy* Table. Theſe be his wordes, Vos eſtis in menſa: Vos eſtis in Calice: You are vpon the Table: You are in the Cuppe. As the people is vpon the Table, ſo is Chriſtes Body vpon the Table. The People is not laide there verily, and in deede, but onely in a Myſterie: Euen ſo the Body of Chriſte, as Optatus ſaithe, is laide there, not verily, and in deede, nor in Real, and Fleaſhely Preſence, but in a Myſterie.

Auguſt. ad Bonifac. Epiſt. 23.

De Con. Diſt. 2. Hoc eſt quod in Gloſſa.

Augu. ad Infantes. Citatur à Beda in 1. Cor. 10

The Apologie, Cap. 2. Diuiſion. 1.

In deede wee graunt, that certaine newe and very ſtrange ſectes, as the Anabaptiſtes, Libertines, Menonians, and Zvvenckfeldians, haue benne ſtirringe in the Worlde, euer ſithence the Goſpel did firſte ſpringe. But the World ſeethe nowe right wel, thankes be geeuen to our God, that wee haue neither breadde, nor taughte, nor keapte vp theiſe Monſters. In good fellowſhippe, I praie thee, who ſo euer thou be, reade our Bookes, they are to be ſolde in euery place. What hathe there euer benne written by any of our companie, that mighte plainely beare with the madneſſe of any of thoſe Heretiques? Naie, I ſaie vnto you, there is no Countrie this daie ſo free from theire Peſtilent infections, as theſe be, wherein the Goſpel of Chriſte is freely, and commonly preached. So that if they weighe the very matter with earneſt, and vpright aduiſemente, this thinge is a greate Argumente of our parte, that this ſame Doctrine, whiche wee teache, is the very Truth of the Goſpel of Chriſte. For lightly neither is cockle woonte to growe without the wheate, nor yet the claſſe without the Corne. For from the very Apoſtles times, who knoweth not, howe many Hereſies did riſe vp euen togeather, ſo ſoone as the Goſpel was firſte ſpreadde abroade? Who euer had hearde tel of Simon, Menander, Saturninus, Baſilides, Carpocrates, Cherinthus, Ebion, Valentinus, Secundus, Marcoſius, Colorbaſius, Heracleo, Lucianus, Seuerus, and other like

like, before the Apostles were sent abroade? But why stand we reckeninge vp theise? Epiphanius rehearseth vp foure score sundrie Heresies: and Augustine many moe, which sprange vp euen together with the Gospel. What then? was the Gospel therefore not the Gospel, bicause Heresies sprange vp withal? Or, was Christe therefore not Christe? Or, was Christe, and his Gospel the cause of theise Heresies?

And yet as wee saide, doothe not this greate croppe, and heape of Heresies growe vp emongest vs, whiche doo openly, abroade, and frankely teache the Gospel. These poisonnes take their beginninges, theire encreasinges, and strengthe emongest Our Aduersaries, in blindenesse, and in darkenesse, emongest whome Truthe is with Tyrannie, and Crueltie keapte vnder, and cannot be hearde, but in Corners, and secrete meetinges. But lette them make a prouse: Let them geeue the Gospel free passage: Let the Truthe of Jesus Christe geeue her cleare light, and stretche foorth her brighte beames into al partes: and then shal they foorth with see, howe al theise shadowes streighte wil vanishe, and passe awaie at the lighte of the Gospel, euen as the thicke Miste of the nighte consumeth at the sighte of the Sonne. For whilest theise Menne sitte stil, and make merry, and doo nothinge, wee continually represse, and put backe al those Heresies, whiche they falsly charge vs to nourishe, and mainteine.

M. Hardinge.

As for Libertines, what other Substance hath your Gospel, bisides carnal Libertie, and licentious liuinge: To breake the vowe of Chastitie solemly made to God, by whose grace, and your endeboure it might wel haue benne keapte, and to breake it for wantonnesse, and to satisfie luste: is not that proper to Libertines? To geue ouer fasting, watching in praier, and Confession of Sinnes, which should be made to a Priest, by *whom onely (except in case of necessitie) God promised forgeuenesse: To regarde no Tradition, though it came from the Apostles: briefly, to teache that al kinde of outwarde Godlinesse is superstitious, and Pharisaical, and that euery man muste without staggatinge, or doubtinge beleeue, that him selfe shalbe saued, if he haue Faithe, *doo he what him liste, is this no point of Libertie? VVhat made so many maleperte Prentises, pleasant Courtiers, discoursinge Parlamente Machiauellistes, and al other what so euer fleashewoormes, Merchantes, idle artificers, to embrase your Gospel, rather then the grauer and deuouter sorte of men, whiche be weaned from the pleasure of this life: but that it was plausible to the VVorld, and pleasant to the Fleashe, from which that kinde of menne are moste hardly drawen? And yet foresoothe doo not ye foster vp Libertines.

*Moste Vaine Vntruthe. See the Answeare.

VVho can recken the Sectes that be in Germany, beeinge * sixteene or moe professed in some one towne? *Bemelande is almoste as ful of Heresies, as of Houses. * Silesia is as bad, and * Moravia a Countrie there adioininge, is neuer a whit better. And yet doo not these sectes bud, where your Gospel is freely, and openly preached?

*Vntruth, foloned with vile sclaunder.

*Foure greate Vntruthes altogether.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Here, M. Hardinge, I haue pourposely leafte out a great heape of your talke, not thinkinge it nedeful, to answeare al your voide wordes. Hauinge nomore regarde, what ye saie, it was no hard mater for you to cal vs Libertines, and to saie, The Gospel that we preach, hath none other Substance, but Carnal Libertie, and Licenceous Liuing. If ye had remembred, either the Cittie of Rome, where ye haue bene, or the Towne of Antwarpe, or Louaine, where ye nowe dwel, ye coulde not wel, without blushinge, haue charged vs with Carnal Libertie.

Our VVantons, and Fleashewoormes, for so it liketh you to calle them, haue benne contented to forsake Fathers, Mothers, Wiues, Children, goodes, and Liuinges, and meekely to submit them selues to the extreme terroure of al your Crueltie, and to yelde their Bodies vnto the Deathe: to be sterued for hunger: and to be burnte in Fiere: Onely for the name, and Gospel of Jesus Christe. So delicate Fleashewoormes, and sutche VVantons are they. Ye wil saie, as your woonte is, when ye haue nothinge els to saie, They died stubbernly in wilful errour. Yet, I

recken, ye will not saie, *They died in great pleasance, or* Carnal Libertie. It is a strange kinde of Fleashely VVantonnesse, to a man to denie him selfe, and to take vp his Crosse, and to folowe Christe. And yet is this the whole Substance of our Gospel.

Iustinus the Martyr, notwithstanding he was an Heathen, and thought then, euen as you do nowe, that the Professours of the name of Christe, were nothinge els, but a sorte of VVanton, and wilful people, yet when he sawe, howe Constantly they died, and howe patiently they suffered, what so euer was laide vpon them, he was at length conuerted him selfe, and by theire Example, became a Christian: Thus Eusebius reporteth his wordes, Ego ipse Platonis Disciplinis delectatus, &c. *I mee selfe, takinge pleasure in* Platoes *Doctrine, and hearinge the Christians il spoken of, and seeinge them to goe courageously, and boldely to theire Deathe, and to suffer al sutche thinges, as were thought moste terrible, I thought it a thinge impossible, that sutche menne shoulde liue wickedly, or in* VVantonnesse.

Eusebius Li. 4. ca. 8. Ἐπεισὲν ἀδύνατον εἶναι ἐν κακίᾳ καὶ φιληδονίᾳ ὑπάρχειν αὐτούς.

So likewise writeth Sozomenus, touchinge the same, *The Christians being spoiled of theire goodes, and regardinge nothinge, that they hadde, beinge hanged on gibettes, and sufferinge al manner tormentes so without care, or sense, as if theire bodies had not benne their owne, neither allured with flatterie, nor amazed with threates, they gaue al menne hereby to vnderstande, that they suffered theise thinges* (not of VVantonnesse, but) *for somme greate reworde.*

Sozom. Li. 1. ca. 1. Δῆλον πᾶσιν ἐποίησαν, ὡς ὑπὲρ μεγίστου ἄθλων τὸν ἀγῶνα τοῦτον ὑπομένουσι.

The Prophete Dauid saithe, In quo corriget adolescens viam suam? In custodiendo Sermones tuos: *Whereby shal a yonge man* (not growe to be a Fleashely VVanton, but) *amende his life, and correcte his waie?* He answeareth: (O Lorde) *by the keping of thy woordes.*

Psal. 119.

Therefore we maie iustely saie to you, as Cyrillus saide sometime to Iulianus the Regenerate in like case, Etiam pueri in Sacris Literis enutriti, statim fiunt religiosissimi, etiamsi minùs eloquentes: *Euen our Children beeinge brought vp in the Holy Scriptures, streightwaie becomme moste godly: althoughe not so eloquente, or welspoken.*

Cyril. Contra Iulian. Lib. 7. Pag. 162.

If there be any sutche Fleashewoormes, and VVantons this daie, they be not the Gospellers, whiche worde so mutch offendeth you: they be of you, and of yours, M. Hardinge, that is, not the professours, but the Pockers, and wilful despisers of the Gospel.

Ye saie, Confession shoulde be made vnto the Prieste, by whome Onely (ye saie) God hath promised forgeueneesse of Sinne. I beseeche you, where finde you this Promisse? Shewe the wordes: Allege the Place: Regarde your Credite. Otherwise, ye wilbe noted of Untruthe. Where did God, or Christe, euer saie, Forgeueneesse of Sinne is geeuen onely by the Prieste? If it be so in deede, then why dothe Chrysostome saie, Nunc necessarium non est, Præsentibus Testibus confiteri? Solus Deus te confitentem videat: *Nowe it is not needeful, to make Confession in the* Presence of witnesses. *Lette* God Onely *See thee makinge thy Confession.* Why doth S. Hierome saie, Apud Deum, non Sententia Sacerdotum, sed reorum vita quæritur: *It* is not the Sentence, or Absolution of the Prieste, *but the Life of the Sinner, that is regarded before God.* Howe be it, hereof we haue sufficiently saide before.

Chrysost. De Pœnitent. & Confessione.

Hierom. in Matthæ. Cap. 16.

Luther (ye saie) Firste procured, that menne should acknowledge no One Head, and Iudge *Whome* (as by your reporte, S. Cyprian saithe) *they mighte obeie, as the* Vicare of Christe. Of this One Heade, and One Iudge, neither Christe, nor his Apostles euer tolde vs. S. Cyprian, as it is saide before, saithe thus, Christus Parem dedit Apostolis omnibus potestatem: *Christ gaue vnto al his Apostles* Equal Power. And S. Chrysostome saithe, Quicunque desiderat Primatum in Terra, inueniet in Cœlo Confusionem: VVho so euer seeketh the Primacie in Earthe, he in Heauen shal finde Confusion.

Cypri. De Sim. Prælatorum. Chrysostom. in Matthæ. Hom. 33.

The place of S. Cyprian, touchinge One Heade, and One Iudge, is wel alleged by you, M. Hardinge: but il applied. It is true, that S. Cyprian saithe, The People oughte to obeie One Iudge, or One Heade, as the Vicare of Christe. But that by the same One Heade, or Iudge, be meante either the Bishop of Rome, or any one other certaine seuerall Bishop, it is moste vntrue. S. Cyprians meaninge is, as

one Head.
one Iudge
In the Former Replie, Artic. 4. Diui. 5.

is, as I haue otherwhere moze largely declared, that in euery Dioceſe the People ought to knowe One Biſhop, as Heade, and Iudge, and him to obeie, as the Vicare of Chriſte. One Heade, or Iudge, I ſaie, in euery Dioceſe: Not One Vniuerſal Heade *ouer al the worlde*. For proufe whereof, M. Hardinge, reade S. Cyprians Epiſtle vnto Florentinus Pupianus: and ye ſhal finde, that he vſeth the ſelfe ſame wordes of him ſelfe, and not of the Pope: and I doubte not, but ye wil mutche marueile, and miſlike your owne erroure. His wordes be theſe, Vnde Sciſmata, & Hæreſes obortæ ſunt, & oriuntur, niſi dum Epiſcopus, qui Vnus eſt, & Eccleſiæ præeſt, Superba quorundam præſumptione contemnitur? *Wherehence haue Schiſmes, and Hereſies ſprunge vp, or wherehence doo they ſpringe, onleſſe it be, that the Biſhop, whiche is* One, *and ruleth the Churche, by the prowde preſumption of certaine is deſpiſed?*

Cyprian Lib. 4. Epiſt. 9.

Here S. Cyprian calleth him ſelfe that One Biſhop, and that One Heade, and Iudge of the Churche. Yet was he onely the Biſhop of Carthage in Aphrica: and not the Pope, or Biſhop of Rome. Hereof I haue ſpoken moze at large in my Former Replie.

Artic. 4. Diui. 5.

Touching the Pope, wherein he maie be knowen for Chriſtes Vicare, it were harde to ſaie: Onleſſe it be for that, where ſo euer the Pope is preſent, there Chriſt is awaie. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Qui vanam gloriam non deſiderat, ille debet Chriſti Vicarius factus, Chriſti Iuſtitiam prædicare: *He that deſireth not vaine glorie*, beeinge made Chriſtes Vicare, *ought to preache the Iuſtice of Chriſte.*

Chryſoſ. in Matthe. Homil. 6.

The Apologie, Cap. 3. Diuiſion. 1.

Where they ſaie, that wee haue fallen into ſundrie Sectes, and woulde be called, ſomme of vs Lutherans, & ſomme of vs Zuinglians, and cannot yet wel agree emonge oure ſelues, touchinge the whole Subſtance of our Doctrine, what woulde theſe Menne haue ſaide, if they had benne in the firſte times of the Apoſtles, and Holy Fathers: when one ſaide, I holde of Paule: an other, I holde of Cephas: an other, I holde of Apollo? When Paule did ſo charpely rebuke Peter? When vpon a fallinge out, Barnabas departed from Paule? when as Origene mentioneth, the Chriſtians were diuided into ſo many factions, as that they keapte nomoze, but the name of Chriſtians in common emonge them, beeinge in no manner of thinge els like to Chriſtians? when as Socrates ſaithe, for theire Diſſenſions, and ſundrie Sectes, they were laughed, and ieſted at openly of the people in theire ſtages, and common gameplaies? When, as Conſtantine the Emperoure affirmeth, there were ſutche numbers of Variances, and braulinges in the Churche, that it might iuſtly ſeeme a miſerie farre paſſinge al the former Miſeries? When alſo Theophilus, Epiphanius, Chryſoſtome, Auguſtine, Ruffine, Hierome, beinge al Chriſtians, beinge al Fathers, beinge al Catholiques, quarrelled one againſte an other, with moſte bitter, and moſte remedileſſe contentions without ende? When, as ſaithe Nazianzene, the partes of one Body were conſumed and waſted one of an other? When the whole Eaſte parte of the Church was diuided from the VVeaſte, onely about leauened Bread, and onely for the keepinge of Eaſter daie: whiche were in deede no greate maters to be ſtrined for? And when in al Councelles Newe Creedes, and Nevve Decrees continually were diuiſed?

Diſſenſions emōg the Fathers.

*A manifeſte Vntruthe of M. Hardinger.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

The ſumme of M. Hardinges anſweare hereto is this, That the bitter diſſensions, that in Olde times fel out emongeſt the Learned, and Godly Fathers, ſtoode rather * in maters of manners, and other ſmal quarrels, then in caſes, and queſtions of the Faith. For trial of the truth herein, it maie pleaſe you to conſider wel theſe fewe.

Papias, Apollinarius, Victorinus, Tertullianus, Irenæus, Lactantius, and others, defended the Hereſie of the Chiliaſtæ, that ſaide, Chriſte after the General Iudgemente ſhould dwel here a thouſande yeeres togeather vpon the Earthe. Irenæus holde, that Man at the beginninge, when he was firſte created, was vnperfite. Clemens Alexandrinus, and Iuſtinus holde, That the Angels fel, and offended God, in that they deſired the compante of Wemen. But it ſhalbe in vaine to ſtande longe herein. For of ſutche examples there is great ſtoare.

Hieronym. in Hierem. Lib. 4. Iren li 4. ca 73. Clemens Strom. Lib. 3. & 5. Iuſtinus in Apologia.

To comme neare the pourpoſe, Theophilus calleth Epiphanius, Hæreſiarcham, that is, *The Grande Captaine, and Father of Heretiques.* Gennadius ſaithe, S. Auguſtine was not farre of from bringe an Heretique. S. Hierome writinge vnto S. Auguſtine, ſaithe thus: In Epiſtola tua, quædam Hæretica eſſe iudicaui: *I iudged, that there were certaine Heretical errours in your Epiſtle.* Pope Bonifacius. 2. ſaide, that Auguſtine the Biſhop of Carthage, and S. Auguſtine, and other Godly, and Learned Fathers in the Councel of Aphrica, were prickte on, and inſpired by the Diuel. S. Auguſtine willeth S. Hierome to acknowledge his erroure, and to recante. Thus he ſaithe, Accipe Seueritatem Chriſtianam ad illud opus corrigendum, atque emendandum: & παλινῳδίαν, vt dicitur, Cane: *Take vnto you Chriſtian Seueritie, to correcte, and amende that Booke* (of yours): and recante your Erroure.

Eraſm. in Vita Chryſoſtomi. Gennadius. De Eccleſiaſt. ſcriptoribus. Hieronym in Epiſtola ad Augu. Bonifac. 2. in Epiſt. ad Eulalium. Auguſt. ad Hieronym. Epiſt. 9.

Thus mutche I thought good briefely to touche: not meaninge thereby to deface the Authoritie of the Auncient Fathers: but ſomme what to open the truthe of M. Hardinges tale, and to ſhewe, that theſe, and other like Biſhops, and Fathers, notwithſtandinge they were Learned, and Godly, and worthy Members of the Churche of God, yet were they not voide of theire infirmities.

Eraſmus, a man of greate Iudgemente, ſaithe thus, Illis temporibus ingeniosa res fuit, eſſe Chriſtianum: *In thoſe daies it was a great pointe of cunninge, to knowe, howe to be a Chriſtian Man.*

Eraſm. in Præf. in Tom. 2. Hieronymi.

And againe, Illa ætate in Chartis erat Fides potiùs, quàm in animo: ac penè tot erant Symbola, quot Profeſſores: *At that time* (of the Anciente Fathers) *the Faithe was in Bookes rather, then in the Harte. And in a manner there was* as many ſundrie Creedes, as there were Profeſſours of the Faithe.

Ibidem.

Therefore Clemens Alexandrinus ſaithe, The Heathens thus vpbraied the Chriſtians, for the ſtriues, and diſſensions, that were emonge them: Vos Chriſtiani diſsidetis inter vos, & tot Sectas habetis quæ licet omnes Chriſtianiſmi titulum ſibi vendicent, tamen alia aliam execratur, & condemnat. Quare veſtra Religio vera non eſt: nec à Deo originem ducit: *Yee Chriſtians diſſente emonge your ſelues: and mainteine ſo many Sectes. Whiche Sectes, notwithſtandinge they al Claime the title of Chriſtian Religion, Yet one of them curſeth, and condemneth an other: Therefore your Religion is not true, nor hath her beginninge, or grounde from God.*

Clemens Strom. Lib. 7.

The Apologie, Cap. 4. Diuiſion. 1.

What woulde theſe Menne (trowe ye) haue ſaide in thoſe daies? Whiche ſide woulde they ſpecially then haue taken? And which would they then haue forſaken? Whiche Goſpel woulde they haue beleeued? Whome woulde they haue accoumpted for Heretiques, and whome for Catholiques? And yet, what a ſtirre, and reuel keepe they this daie, onely vpon the twoo poore Names of Luther, and Zvvinglius? Bicauſe theſe twoo menne are not yet fully reſolued vpon ſomme one certaine pointe of Doctrine, therefore woulde they needes haue vs thinke, that bothe of them were deceiued: that neither of them had the Goſpel:

Gospel: and, that neither of them taught the truthe aright.

M. Hardinge.

After many thinges by these Defenders alleaged, for proufe of Dissension to haue bene among the Apostles, the faithful people in S. Paules time, the Bishops, and Holy Fathers of the primitiue Churche, whereby they woulde perswade, if they coulde, that theire owne diuision into sectes, and dissensions, is not a marke of false Doctrine: at length, as though they had wonne the fielde, and tried them selues proper men, triumphinge ouer vs, as though wee had nothinge to saie, with a great courage they demaunde this question of vs, whiche though it be but one in effecte, yet with a kinde of braueric they seeme to diuide into sundry branches, and thus they saie: VVhat woulde these men (they meane the Papistes) then, trowe yee, haue saide in those daies? VVhiche side woulde they then haue taken, and whiche woulde they haue forsaken? VVhiche Gospel woulde they haue beleeued? VVhom would they haue accounpted for Heretikes, and whom for Catholikes?

Foure answeres to foure questions.

Touchinge these foure interrogatories, if we had then bene aliue, beinge of the minde we be nowe of, we would haue requitted you with foure answeares of the Holy and moste Learned Fathers S. Hierome, and woulde haue saide, as in the like state of times in a Learned Epistle he saide to the Learned Pope Damasus, touchinge the Heresies, which he founde in Syria at his first comminge thither from Rome. Firste, *Mihi Cathedram Petri, & fidem Apostolico ore laudatam censui consulendam: inde nunc mea anima postulans cibum, vnde olim Christi Vestimenta suscepi.* VVhiche woordes, takinge vpon me the Person of al Faithful and Catholike folkes, thus, I Englishe: In these controuersies, I haue thought good for counsel (what I ought to beleeue) to repaire to the Chaire of Peter, and to the faithe of the Romaine Churche, praised by Paule the Apostles owne Mouthe. And from thence nowe require I the foode of my soule, from whence I receiued the garmentes of Christe. To speake the same more shortely, and more plainely. In the Catholike Churche I looke to haue the foode of my soule to euerlastinge Life, in whiche I was firste Christened.

The seconde answeare.

Secondely we woulde with him haue saide, one speakinge for al, directinge our woorder (as he did) to those that be of the Catholike faithe, whom ye cal Papistes: *Vos estis lux mundi, vos sal terræ, vos aurea vasa & Argentea: hic testacea vasa vel lignea, Virgam ferream, & Æternum operiuntur incendium.* Ye are the Light of the VVorlde, ye are the Salte of the Earthe, yee are Golden and Siluerne Vessels: here (emonge the Gospellers) are the Earthen and VVoodden Vessels, whiche muste abide the yron Rodde, and flame Euerlastinge.

The thirde answeare.

Thirdly with him (one likewise beatinge the person of al) wee woulde haue saide to Pius the fourth that nowe sitteth in Peters Chaire, as he then saide to Damasus: *Ego nullum primum nisi Christum sequens, beatitudini tuæ, id est, Cathedræ Petri, Communione consocior. Super illam Petram ædificatam Ecclesiam scio. Quicunque extra hanc Domum agnum comederit, Prophanus est: Si quis in Arca Noe non fuerit, peribit regnante Diluuio.* Makinge none, but Christe firste of al whom to folowe, I ioine in felowship of Communion with thy holines, that is to saie, with the see of Peter. Vpon that Rocke I knowe the Churche is builded. VVho so euer eateth the Lambe without the compasse of this house, he is Prophane. If any remaine without the Arke of Noe, he shalbe loste, when the floudde taigneth.

The fourth answeare.

Fourthly touchinge the Authours of this Newe Gospel, with the same Hierome we saie, al vnder the Person of one: *Non noui Vitalem, Meletium respuo, ignoro Paulinum. Quicunque tecum non colligit, spargit, hoc est, qui Christi non est, Antichristi est.* *Vitalis* I knowe not, *Meletius* I refuse, *Paulinus* I wote not what he is (these were heade Heretikes in S. Hieronies time). VVho so euer gathereth not togeather with thee (Holy Pastour) he scattereth abroade, that is to witte, who is not of Christes side, he is of Antichristes side. To transferre this to our selues, the names changed, the case remaininge like, for our answeare to our Gospel prelates, wee saie: *Luther* wee knowe not. *Zuinglius, Oecolampadius, Bucer, Peter Martyr, Latimer, Ridly, Cranmer, Hooper,* we reiecte and refuse: *Caluine, Beza, Iewel, Pilkinton, Grindal, Horne,* and theire felowes, what they are, wee wote not. VVe see they are not gatherers with the supreme Pastor of the Catholike Churche, but scatterers.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

It appeareth by that, hath benne already saide, that the Gospel of Christ is now mislyked, & doubted of you, as it was in Olde times of the Infidels, and Heathens. Chrysostome therof saithe thus, Venit Gentilis, & dicit, vellem fieri Christianus: Sed nescio, cui adhæream. Multæ inter vos sunt pugnæ, Seditiones, ac tumultus. Nescio, quod dogma eligam, quod præferam. Singuli dicunt, Ego Verum dico: *The Infidel, or Heathen commeth, and saithe,* I woulde be a Christian man: but I knowe not, whome I should folowe. There is muche strife, and dissension, and trouble emongest you. I cannot tel, what Doctrine to chuse, to set before other. For euery one of you wil saie: I saie the Truthe. As ye agree wel with them in Foulnie of Wordes, so, I praie God, ye agree not with them in Faithe, and Spirite, and contempte of God. The same Chrysostome speakinge, not onely of the Heretiques, but also of the Faithful Christians, that were in his time, saithe thus, Hanc ob causam ridiculi

Chryso. in Act. Homil. 33.

facti ſumus, & Gentibus, & Iudæis: dum Eccleſia in mille partes diſcinditur: *For this cauſe wee are ſcorned, and laught at, bothe of Iewes, and Gentiles: While as the Churche is rente* into a thouſande partes.

Chryſo. in Epiſt. ad Galat. Ca. 1.

Therefore it was not amiſſe, M. Hardinge, to demaunde you this queſtion, whiche of theſe ſides ye woulde haue folowed: and whiche of al theſe Goſpelles ye woulde haue beleued. For it maie wel be thought, that beinge minded as they were, ye would haue anſwearedas they did.

But ye ſaie, ye woulde rather haue ſaide, as S. Hierome ſommetime ſaide to Pope Damaſus, touchinge the Hereſies, whiche he founde in Syria.

If ye woulde vſe S. Hieromes anſweare, M. Hardinge, and woulde ſaie vnto the Pope, as S. Hierome ſaide, Perhaps ye ſhould deſerue no greate thankes for your laboure. For S Hierome in that ſelfe ſame place, bidde ſundrie others, vtterly denieth the Primacie of the Biſhop of Rome. His wordes be plaine, Ego Nullum Primum, niſi Chriſtum, ſequens, Beatitudini tuæ, id eſt, Cathedræ Petri Communione Conſocior: I folowinge no Firſt Man, (that is to ſaie, No Heade, or Chiefe) but Onely Chriſte, am ioined as a felowe in Communion *vnto thy Bleſſednesſe, that is to ſaie, vnto Peters Chaire.* S. Hierome telleth the Pope, he knoweth No Firſte, No Chiefe, No Heade, no not the Pope him ſelfe, but onely Chriſte. Againe, he ſaithe not, I am thyal, and ſubiecte to thy commaundementes: But, I am ioined, as a Felowe, in Communion vnto thy Bleſſednesſe. Felowſhip will hardely ſtande with that Vniuerſal power, whiche you imagine, the Pope ought to haue ouer the whole Churche of God. Verily the Pope him ſelfe would take it in ſcorne, if you this laie woulde folowe S. Hierome, and cal him your Felowe.

Hieronym. ad Damaſum. Nullum Primũ.

Beatitudini tuæ Communione Conſocior.

But S. Hierome ſaithe, He agreeth in Faithe, and Religion with Damaſus. And what greate maruelle is this, that beinge a Godly Learned man, he woulde leaue Vitalis, and Meletius, and other Heretiques, and rather ioine him ſelfe to that Biſhop, whome he knewe to be Godly, and Catholique? Hereof he writeth thus him ſelfe, Vineam Chriſti exterminant vulpes: Vt inter lacus contritos, qui aquam non habent, difficilè, vbi Fons Signatus, & Hortus ille Concluſus ſit, poſsit intelligi. Ideò mihi Cathedram Petri, & Fidem Apoſtoli Ore laudatam cenſui conſulendam: *The Foxes deſtroie the Vineyarde of Chriſte: ſo that emonge theſe broken ceſternes, that haue no Water, it is harde to vnderſtande, where is that Sealed Fountaine, and that Encloſed Orchard. Therefore I thought it good, to herken to* S. Peters Chayre, *and to that Faithe, whiche was commended by the Apoſtles mouthe.*

Hieronym. ad Damaſum.

S. Hierome from his youthe was brought vp in Rome: He was Chriſtened in Rome: He had benne a Studente in Rome: He had taught a Schole in Rome: He had benne Secretarie to Damaſus the Biſhop of Rome: He was a Prieſte of Rome: And of late they haue furniſhed him alſo with a Cardinalles Hatte, as if he had benne a Cardinal of Rome: And as it is thought by ſomme, ſauinge for ſomme diſpleaſure, that certaine of the Clergie had conceiued againſte him, he was like to be choſen the Biſhop of Rome. What greate maruele therefore is it, if he had ſomme ſpecial affection to the See of Rome? Alphonſus de Caſtro ſaithe, That the Franciſcane Freers be ſworne to Duns: and that he hearde a Dominicane Freere ſaie openly in his Sermon, That he was to be ſuſpected, as an Heretique, that in any thinge diſſented from Thomas of Aquine. There is noman lightly, but hathe a ſpecial credite in ſomme One man before al others.

In Vita Hieron.

Alphonſus Adverſ. Hæreſ. Li. 1. Cap. 7.

But howe holdeth this Argumente, M. Hardinge: S. Hierome ioined with a Godly Biſhop: Ergo, We muſte ioine with a wicked Biſhop: Or, S. Hierome agreed in Faithe, and Religion with Damaſus: Ergo, we muſte agree with one, that dothe al thinges of purpoſe contrarie to Damaſus. So mighte you ſaie, The Godly people of the Iewes, were bounde to obeie Aaron, and Moſes: Ergo, al others, that folowed afterwarde, were likewiſe bounde to obeie Annas, and Caiphas.

The Faithe of Chriſte, M. Hardinge, goeth not alwaies by Succeſsion. The Biſhoppes of Rome haue benne Arians, Neſtorians, Monothelites, and otherwiſe founde in horrible Hereſies: as hereafter ſhalbe ſhewed. Woulde ye in ſuche caſes haue

Recourse to Peters Chaire.

haue recourse to lutche a one, onely for that he sitteth in Peters Chaire? Woulde ye saie to lutche a one, *You are the Salte of the Earthe: You are the Lighte of the Worlde?* Would ye saie, *This is the Faithe, that was commended by the Apostles Mouthe?*

Truely, S. Hierome him selfe, when he sawe Abuses, or Errours maynteined in the Churche of Rome, made smal accoumpte of S. Peters Chaire. For thus he saithe, Quid mihi profers Vnius Vrbis Consuetudinem? Potentia Diuitiarum, & paupertatis humilitas, vel sublimiorem, vel inferiorem Episcopum non facit. Cæterùm omnes Apostolorum Successores sunt: VVhat tellest thou me of the Custome of that One Cittie (of Rome)? *The Power of Richesse, and the humilitie of Pouertie, cannot make a Bishop either Higher, or Lower. Al Bishoppes are the Successours of the Apostles.* *Hieronym. ad Euagrium.*

As for *Luther, Zuinglius, Peter Martyr, Caluine,* and others (ye saie) ye know them not. Neither dothe it so greatly force, whome you liste to knowe. God giue you Grace to knowe your selues. The Lorde is able to knowe his owne. 2. *Timoth.* 2.

Touchinge the dissensions in Religion, whiche ye imagine to be emongest vs in the Churche of Englande, I wil saie nothinge. It greueth you ful soare, to see, that in al the Articles of the Faithe, and in the whole Substance of Doctrine, we do so quietly ioine together. The Ancient Father Leo, of the like case, saithe thus, Diabolus Gentium vocatione Cruciatur, & quotidiana potestatis suæ destructione torquetur: dolens vtique se deseri, & Verum Regem in locis omnibus adorari. Parat fraudes: Fingit dissensiones: *The Diuel is soare greeued with the callinge of the Heathens* (to the Faithe) *and with the daily decreasinge of his power: sorowinge to see him selfe forsaken, and* (Christe) *the True Kinge to be woorshipped in al places.* Therefore he diuiseth guiles: and imagineth dissensions. *Leo in Epiphania, Serm. 6.*

The Apologie, Cap. 5. Division. 1.

But Good God, what manner of felowes be these, whiche blame vs for disagreeinge? And doo al they them selues, weene you, agree wel together? is euery one of them fully resolued, what to folowe? Haue there benne no striues, no quarelles, no debates emongst them selues at no time? why then doo the Scoristes and the Thomistes, aboute that they calle Meritum Congrui, & Meritum Condigni, no better agree together? why agree they no better emonge them selues, conterninge Original Sinne in the Blessed Virgine: Concerninge a Solemne Vowe, and a Single Vowe? why saie theire Canonistes that Auriculare Confession is appointed by the positiue Lawe of man: and their Scholemen contrariewise, that it is appointed by the Lawe of God? why doothe Albertus Pius dissente from Caietanus? Why doothe Thomas dissente from Lombardus, Scotus from Thomas, Occamus from Scotus, Alliacensis from Occamus? And why do their Nominalles disagree from theire Realles? And yet saie I nothinge of so many diuersities of Freeres, and Monkes: how somme of them put a greate Holinesse in eatinge of Fishe, and somme in eatinge of Herbes: somme in wearinge of shooes, and somme in wearinge of Sandalles: somme in goeinge in a Linnen garmente, and somme in Woollen: somme of them called white, some blacke: somme beinge shauen broade, and somme narrowe: somme stalkinge vpon Patens, somme goeinge barefooted: somme girte, and somme vngirte. They ought yewis to remember, there be somme of theire owne companie, whiche saie, that the Body of Christe is in his Supper Naturally: Contrarie, other somme

somme of the selfe same companie denie it vtterly. Againe, that there be others of them, whiche saie, the Body of Christe in the Holy Communion is rente and torne vvith teethe: and somme againe, that denie the same. Some also of them there be, whiche write, that the Body of Christe in the Sacramente is quantum, that is to saie, hath his perfite quantitie in the Sacramente: Somme others againe saie, naie. That there be others of them, whiche saie, Christe did Consecrate with a certaine Diuine power: somme, that he did the same with his Blessinge: somme againe that saie, he did it with vttering Fiue Solemne chosen woordes: and somme, with rehearsinge the same woordes afterwarde againe. Somme wil haue it, that, when Christe did speake those Fiue woordes, the Material wheaten Breade was pointed vnto by this Demonstratiue Pronoune, Hoc: Somme had rather haue, that a certaine vagum indiuiduum, as they terme it, was meante thereby. Againe, others there be, that saie, Dogges and Mise maie truely, and in very deede eate the Body of Christe: and others againe there be, that stedfastly denie it. There be others, whiche saie, that the very Accidentes of Breade and wine maie nourishe: others againe there be, whiche saie, that the Substance of the Breade retourneth againe by a Miracle. What neede I saie more? It were ouer longe, and tedious, to recken vp al. So vncertaine, and ful of doubtes is yet the whole Fourme of these mennes Religion, and Doctrine, euen emongest them selues, from whom it sprange, and grewe vp firste. For hardly at any time doo they wel agree betweene them selues: except it be peraduenture, as in times paste, the Phariseis, and Saduceis: or as Herode and Pilate, accorded togeather againste Christe.

M. Hardinge.

VVhat so euer ye bringe, for somme shewe of diuersitie and dissension to be founde emonge the Catholikes, it maie be reduced to twoo heades. The one conteineth a diuersitie in pointes of learninge: the other in trades of Life. Concerninge matters of learninge, thanked be our Lorde, for that the very enimies of the Catholike Churche, cannot charge the Catholikes with dissension in any of the groundes, and Articles of our Faithe. As for final matters, and questions disputable on bothe sides, they maie therein dissent one learned man from an other without blame, the Faithe remaininge inuiolated. The dissensions, with which the Defender charge the Catholike Churche.

But, good sir Defender, what meante you to name the Nominals and Reals? Vnderstande you what they be? If a man should vpon the suddaine demaunde of you that question, (a) perhaps you would be to seekinge of an answeare. Sir if you be an Oxforde man, as I suppose you be, you maie remember, if euer you learned your Logike after that trade it was taught in, when wee resorted to the *Paruis* there, what adoo was made in daiely disputations for exercise of younge wittes, aboute *Genus* and *Species*, and the reste of the Vniuersals: VVhether they were *termini Prime*, or *Secunde intentionis*, whether they were *entia Realia*, or *Rationis*. VVhiche is a matter perteininge to Logike, not to Diuinitie. Nowe somme Schoolemen be of the opinion, that the fiue Vniuersals be *termini*, or *nomina secunde intentionis*: And they be called thereof Nominals. Some holde opinion, they are *entia realia*, and thereof they be named Reals, &c. In the behalfe of those Holy Religious menne, wee telle you, ye are to blame to belie them. For what Discipline and order of Life so euer they haue addicted them selues vnto, for better oportunitie to serue God: truthe is truthe, they put not greate Holinesse (as yee saie) in eatinge of Fishe, nor of Hearbes: in Shooes, nor in Sandals: in Linnen, nor in VVollen garmentes: in white, nor in blacke: in broade, nor in narrowe Crownes: in goeinge on Patens, nor on the bare grounde: in girdinge them selues, nor in beinge Vngirded. They be not so ignorante, as to putte Holinesse in suche outwarde thinges though their obedience performed in the humble obseruation of these ourwarde thinges accordinge to their rule, be an Holy thinge. These thinges they vse for restrainte of their wil, and for discipline, accordinge to the

(a) A greate doubteful question. Euery poore Logician maie easily knowe it.

The Catholike Religious men put no holinesse in outwarde obseruances

To what ende be made obseruers of the Religion. Leu. 19. Iohn Baptist. Matth. 3.

to the order, and rule, vnder which, the better to serue God, they haue promised obediently and humbly to liue. Neither put they more Holinesse in the thinges by you scoffed at, then Elias did in his Mantel and letherne girdle, wherewith he girded his loines: then Iohn Baptiste did in Eatinge of Locustes and wilde Honie, in wearinge a garmente of Camelles heare, and in girdinge him selfe aboute the loines with a skinne.

But I praie you, Sirs, who be yee? if wee woulde folowe your lightnes, haue wee not like matter of diuersitie in outwarde thinges, to twite you withall: but that your diuersitie is with breache of due order, and Lawe, and that of religious men is accordinge to order, and rule? If yee thinke diuersitie in thinges of theire owne Nature indifferente, as Meates, Apparel, Shauinge, &c. woorthy to be reprehended, and deduce from thence an argumente of mutuall dissention: amonge your mihistringe Clergie is not likewise diuersitie founde? Doo not somme amonge you weare square Cappes, somme rounde Cappes, somme butten Cappes, somme onely Hattes? Doo not somme weare side gownes hauinge large sleeues, with Tippettes, whiche is not wel liked of your secte, somme of more perfection Turkey gownes, Gaberdeines, Frockes, or nighte gownes of the moste laye fashion for auoidinge of Superstition? The thinge is indifferente, and maie be yelded vnto, saithe the one secte: They be the Popes ragges, and maie not be worne, saithe the other Secte. And therefore they wil rather be iustly put from that whiche iustly they cannot keepe, then yelde one iote. Neither her Maiesties commaundemente, nor theire Metropolitans decree eate they for. They had rather seeme to the people, whome they vse for their Clawebackes, and to whose iudgement they stande or fall, stoute Champions of their owne Gospell, then meeke folowers of Christes Gospel. Suche mighty Samsons, suche constant Laurences, your ioyly Gospel breedeth.

Christes Body borne with teeth, how is it vnderstanded? Inuisible Incarnation.

Somme saie, the Body of Christe in the Communion is torne and crushed with Teethe, some denie it. Yea forsoothe, and bothe meane right well. The hundred and thirtene Bishoppes assembled in Councel at Rome vnder Pope Nicolaus the seconde, prescribed suche forme of Recantation to Berengarius the firste Auctor of the Sacramentarie Heresie, openly there to pronounce, acknowledge, and with subscription to ratifie, as he shoulde confesse the very true Body of Christe, not onely the Sacramente thereof, sensibly and in veritie to be handled with the handes of the Priestes, (b) to be broken and crushed with Teethe of the Faithefull. By whiche woordes these Fathers minde was to expresse a veritie of Reall Presence, (c) a true Eatinge of Christes Body in deede, and to exclude the onely spirituall eatinge, so as the olde Fathers did Eate Christe in theire Manna. Neither is this Doctrine dissonant from the Fathers, specially from Chrysostome, who hathe the like woordes, *Homilia. 45. in Iohan.* How so euer our Sauiour Christ consecrated, with a certaine diuine power, or with his Almightie Blessinge, or with vtterance of woordes, or with repetinge the same woordes; what so euer the Pronoune (*Hoc*) pointeth or signifieth in the woordes of Consecration: what so euer your Dogges, and Mise haue Eaten, or your selues haue troden vnder your wicked feete: whether the Accidentes doo nourishe, or Substance retourne: what narrowe pointes so euer the Schoolemen after tossinge of argumentes too and fro, as their manner is, haue agreed or disagreed vpon: the matter is subtile and curious, neither determined by definitiue sentence of the Churche in any Councell. And therefore sithe it conteineth no Article of our Faithe, let vs not be offended with the whettinge and sharpeninge of theire subtile wittes in matters neither to the Truthe of Gods woorde prejudiciall, nor to the vnderstandinge and iudgement of any man, hurtefull.

(b) This was a blasphemous, and horrible errour.

(c) The true Eating of Christes Body is Spirituall: This imagined Eatinge with Mouthe, and Teethe, is Heathennisshe, and Fantastical, and hathe no truthe.

Curious questions are determined by the Churche in any Councell.

The Bishop of Saresburie.

Touchinge your Nominalles, **and** Realles, **M. Hardinge, if ye had benne so cunninge, and skilful, as ye make your selfe, ye would not haue sente vs backe to learne your** Firste, **and** Seconde Intentions **emongest Children. But, that ye maie vnderstande your owne errour, and certainely see, that these two Houses, your** Nominalles, **and your** Realles **haue here tofore keapte a sturre, not onely in** Logique, **but also in your** Scholastical **maters of** Diuinitie, **without further searchinge of the bottome thereof, I praie you onely to consider these fewe Authorities.**

Vesselus.

Vesselus, **sommetime for his greate fame in Learninge, named** Lux Mundi, **writeth thus,** In Nominalibus si quid Fidei contrarium putarem, hodiè remearem, vel ad Formales, vel ad Reales: *If I thought there were any thinge in the* Nominals contrarie to the Faithe, *I woulde presently leaue them, and goe, either to the* Formalles, *or to the* Realles.

Illyricus De sectis, pag. 80.

An other saithe, Ex Sententiarijs, alij Terminales, aut Nominales esse volunt: alij Reales: *Of the Doctours of the* Scholastical Diuinitie, *somme wilbe called* Terminales, *or* Nominales, *and somme* Reales. **An other saithe,** Citiùs è Labyrinthi temet explices, quàm ex inuolucris Realium, Nominalium, &c. in quibus omnibus tantum est eruditionis, vt putem Apostolis ipsis opus fore alio Spiritu, si cogerentur istis de rebus cum hoc Nouo Theologorum genere conserere manus: *Yee maie sooner winde your selfe out of a Maze, then out of the shiftes, and Corners of* these Realles, and Nominalles &c. *in whome there is sutche abundance of Learninge, that, I thinke, the Apostles them selues should haue neede of an other Sprite, if at any time they should be driuen to encounter*

Erasm. in Moria.

encounter with this Newe kinde of Diuines. Here, M. Hardinge, your Nominalles, and Realles, are called a Newe kinde, not of Logicians, but of Diuines. And if ye conſider wel Vdalrichus Zaſius, ye ſhal finde, that your ſaide Nominalles, & Realles haue intruded them ſelues, not onely into Diuinitie, but alſo into the Ciuile Lawe. Therefore it was ſomewhat out of ſeaſon, to tel vs this tale, of your Seconde, and Firſte Intentions.

Vdal. Zaſius. De Generum obligatione.

Concerning Apparel (ye ſaie) ye ſette not great Holineſſe neither in ſhooes, nor in Sandales, &c. Whereby ye woulde ſeme to geue vs to vnderſtande, that ye ſette ſomme Holineſſe in theſe thinges, although not Greate. Neither doth it appeare, that the Phariſeis euer made any greate accoumpte of Holineſſe of theire garmentes. Yet notwithſtandinge vnder the coloure, and ſhadowe therof, they deceiued the people. And therefore Chriſte ſaithe vnto them, *Woe be vnto you, yee* Scribes, and Phariſeis: And vnto the people he ſaithe, *Beware of them, that loue to goe in longe Roabes.* Of ſutch menne, Seneca ſaithe, Perſonam habere malunt, quàm faciem: *They wil rather weare a Viſarde, then a Natural face.* An other ſaithe, Doloſi Hominis, doloſæ veſtes: Crafty man, Crafty Coate.

Matthe. 23. Marc. 12. Luk. 20. Seneca, Macrobius.

But if noman euer reckened any Holineſſe to be in your apparel, wherefore then was this Decree ſo longe agoe written in the Councel of Gangra, Si quis Virorum putauerit Sancto propoſito, id eſt continentiæ, conuenire, vt pallio vtatur, tanquam ex eo Iuſtitiam habiturus, &c. Anathema ſit: *If any man thinke it agreeable to his holy pourpoſe, of Continent life, to weare a Cloke*, as though thereby he maie be Iuſtified, *&c. Accurſed be he.* Or, wherefore doth S. Chryſoſtome crie out againſt ſutch folie, vſed, as it maie appeare, in his time? O impietatem: Maiorem Sanctitatem in veſtimentis ſuis volunt oſtendere, quàm in Corpore Chriſti &c. Vt deſperans de Miſericordia Dei, confidat in veſte Hominis: *O the wickednesse hereof: They wil ſhewe* more holineſſe in their owne apparel, *then in the Body of Chriſte, &c. That he, that deſpaireth of Goddes Mercie ſhoulde* put his truſte in the garmente of a Man.

Concil. Gangren. Cap. 12.

Chryſo. in Matthæ. Homil. 43.

Or, wherefore doth Thomas of Aquine tel vs ſo certainely, that the wearinge of Franciſe, or Dominikes Cowle had power to remoue Sinne, as wel as the Sacramente of Baptiſme? Or, wherefore dothe your Biſhop, in halowinge the Prieſtes Veſtimentes, ſaie thus, Vt Sacerdotes tui hac Sacra Veſte induti, ab omnibus impulſionibus, ſeu tentationibus malignorum Spirituum muniti, & defenſi eſſe Mereantur: *That thy Prieſtes wearinge this Holy veſture, maie deſerue to be ſhielded*, and defended from al aſſaultes, and tentations of the wicked Sprites.

Thom. Aquinas.

In Pontifical. in Benedic. ad Veſtimenta Sacerdotal.

Your Doctoure Durande furniſheth out your Prieſte at Maſſe in his Complete harneſſe, à Capo, à Pie. Amictus eſt pro Galea, &c. *His amice* (ſaithe he) *is his Headpeece*: His *Albe*, is *his Coate of Maile*: His *Gyrdle*, is *his Bowe*: His *Subcingle*, is *his Quiuer*: His *Stole*, is *his Speare*: His *Maniple*, is *his Clubbe*: His *Chiſible*, is *his Targette*. And in the ende he ſaithe, Hæc ſunt Arma, quibus Pontifex, vel Sacerdos armari debet, contra Spirituales nequitias pugnaturus: *Theſe be the Pieces, wherewith the Biſhop, or Prieſte muſte be Harneſſed*, that wil fighte againſte the Spiritual wickedneſſe. Thus mutche, I trowe, he woulde not haue ſaide, without ſomme opinion of ſpecial Holineſſe.

Durand. in Rationali, Lib. 3. Cap. 1.

To be ſhorte, wherefore do your Doctours kepe ſutche hote Scholes emongſt them ſelues, whether, if the Sextine happen to mende his halowed Veſtimente with a threede vnhalowed, the whole Veſtimente be not thereby becomme vnhalowed? Howe coulde theſe ſo doubtful maters euer haue fallen in queſtion emongſt your Felowes, if ye had benne fully, and thorowly perſuaded, that there is no Holineſſe in your Apparel? The Anciente Father Lactantius ſaithe, Veſtes, Gemmas, & cætera, quæ habentur in pretio, ſi quis putet Deo chara, is planè, quid Deus ſit, neſcit: *If any man thinke, that Apparel, Pretious Stones, or other like thinges, that wee haue in eſtimation, are pleaſant, or delectable vnto God, vndoubtedly he knoweth not, what is God.*

Extra De Conſ. Eccle. vel Altaris. Quod in dubijs. Lactant. Lib. 6. Cap. 25.

But (ye ſaie) what ſo euer your Apparel be, yet your Obedience is very Holy. The Obedience, ye meane, is, to do what ſo euer your Abbate ſhal bidde you do: as, to carrie baſkettes from Paleſtino to Damaſco: To ſitte Seuen yeres togeather in ſilence,

In vita Iohannis Damaſceni.

silence, without speakinge of any worde: For the space of twelue monethes, twise euery daie to water a deade tree: and briefely, to do what so euer londe businesse ye be commaunded: As it is written of one, that at the Commaundemente of his Abbate, threwe out his childe into the streame. This, I trowe, is that Obedience, that ye commende to be so Holy. Cassianus. Lib. 4. Cap. 27.

But S. Paule saithe, *Ye are bought with price: Make not your selues Sclaues vnto Menne.* And S. Ambrose saithe, Serui Hominum sunt, qui humanis se subijciunt Superstitionibus: *They are the Sclaues of Menne, that make them selues subiecte vnto* Mennes Superstitions. God him selfe saithe vnto you, *Who required these thinges at your Handes?* S. Hierome saithe, Viros fuge, quos videris Cathenatos: quibus fœminei, contra Apostolum, sunt crines: hircorum barba: nigrum pallium: & nudi Patientia frigoris pedes. Hæc omnia argumenta sunt Diaboli: *Flee those menne, that thou shalte see goe in Chaines: that, contrarie to the Apostles commaundemente, weare longe heare, as Weemen: that are bearded like Goates: that haue vpon them a blacke Cloke: that goe barefoote, patiently bearinge the colde.* Al these be tokens of the Diuel. Alphonsus de Castro, one of your owne, saithe, Paulus quidem iussit Captiuare intellectum nostrum, sed in obsequium Christi, non autem in obsequium Hominum: *In deede* Paule *hath Commaunded vs to submitte our vnderstandinge, but* vnto the Obedience of Christe, not vnto the Obedience of Menne. 1. Corinth. 7. Ambros. 1. Corinth. 7. Esai. 1. Hieronym. ad Eustochium, De virginitate seruanda. Alphonsus Adu. Hæres. Lib. 1. Cap. 7.

The Godly learned menne, at whose persones it pleaseth you so rudely to scoffe, that refuse either to goe in your Apparel, or otherwise to shewe them selues like vnto you, haue age sufficient, and can answeare for them selues. Notwithstandinge, thus mutche I maie saie, in their behalfe: Neither do they commende any manner of Apparel, as Holy: nor do they condemne any Apparel, as Unholy. That is your proper, and peculiare erroure, M. Hardinge, to make so depe accounpte of outwarde Shewes.

They know, that Eusebius saithe, Iustinus Martyr *Preached the Gospel of Christe, beeinge apparelled as an Heathen Philosopher:* And yet the Philosophers weede was no hinderance to the Gospel. They knowe, that Iohn the Euangelistе preached Gods worde at Ephesus, wearinge vpon him the Bishoppes Brouche, as if he had benne a Bishop of the Iewes. S. Augustine saithe, Nihil sanè ad istam pertinet Ciuitatem, quo Habitu, vel more viuendi, si non est Contra Diuina præcepta, istam Fidem, qua peruenitur ad Deum, quisque Sectetur. Vnde ipsos quoq; Philosophos, quando Christiani fiunt, non Habitum, vel consuetudinem victus, quæ nihil impedit Religionem, sed falsa Dogmata mutare compellit: *It perteineth nothinge vnto this Cittie (of God), in* what kinde of Apparel, or in what order *of Life, so that it be not againste God, any man sieweth this Faithe, whereby wee comme vnto God. Therefore, when Philosophers becomme Christians, the Churche compelleth them not to change* theire Apparel, or manner of Liuinge, *whiche can nothinge hinder Religion, but onely shee compelleth them to change theire False Opinions.* S. Hilarie saithe, Ad Ecclesiæ decus detracta à Diabolo Gentium spolia diuiduntur: *The spoiles of the Heathens, taken from the Diuel, are diuided to the Furniture, and Ornamente of the Churche of God.* S. Hierome saithe, Episcopus, Presbyter, & Diaconus, & reliquus Ordo Ecclasiasticus in Administratione Sacrificiorum, Candida Veste procedit: *The Bishop, Priestе, and Deacon, and the other Ecclesiastical Companie, at the Administration of the Sacrifice, comme forthe in* white Apparel. S. Chrysostome vnto the Priestes, and Deacons saithe thus, Hæc est dignitas vestra, hæc Corona: non quia, induti Tunicam candidissimam, per Ecclesiam ambulatis: *This is your dignitie: this is your Garlande: not that yee walke through the Churche in* white Apparel. Euseb. Lib. 4. Cap. 11. Ἐν φιλοσόφου σχήματι περιβέβλητο τὸν λόγον. Euseb. li. 3. cap. 41. ὁ τὸ πέταλον περιφορικός. Augustin. De Ciuitat. Lib. 19. Cap. 19. Hilar. in Psalmum 67. Hieronym. Aduersus Pelagia. Lib. 1. Chrysostom. in Matth. Hom. 83.

They saie not therefore, that the Apparel is either Holy, or Vnholy. But they maie truely saie, The same Apparel of your parte hath benne fowly abused to filthy peurposes. They maie iustly saie, they woulde not gladly in any appearance shewe them selues like vnto them, that haue so vntruely, and so longe deceiued the worlde. And herein they are not without sundrie Authorities, and Examples of the Godly Fathers. S. Augustine saithe, His Mother leafte bringinge of VVine, and Cakes to the Churche, not for that it was vngodly, or vnlawful of it selfe so to

August. Confess. Lib 6. Cap 2.

dw, but onely for that shé was warned, It was a resemblance of the superstition of the Heathens: and therefore shé leaste it. S. Gregorie, speakinge of the three Sprinklinges, or Dippinges into the Holy Fonte, saithe thus, In Vna Fide nihil efficit Consuetudo Ecclesiæ diuersa. Tamen, quòd Hæretici id facerent, negant idem esse à Catholicis faciendum: *The Faithe beinge One, the diuersitie of Customes hurteth nothinge. Yet, for as muche, as* Heretiques haue thus donne, *they saie, that the Catholiques maie in no wise doo the same:* Not, for that the thinge it selfe was il of it selfe, but for that they woulde not seme to folowe Heretiques.

Quòd superstitioni Gentilium essent similima. Gregor. Lib. 1. Epist. 41.

Gabriel Biel saithe, the Churche of Rome thought it good, to vse common Leauened Breade at the Ministration of the holy Mysteries, leste in vsinge vnleauened Breade, they should be thought to folowe Ebion the Heretique. Tertullian reasoneth vehemently, that a Christian man ought not to goe with a Laurel Garlande vpon his Heade: and that for none other cause, but onely for that, the Heathens vsed so to goe. Whereupon Beatus Rhenanus geueth this note: Non solùm ab his temperandum fuit, quæ manifestam præ se ferrent impietatem, sed etiam ab illis, quæ possent indifferentia vocari, hoc est, quæ essent, neque Bona, neque Mala: partim, ne quisquam infirmior ex Christianis offenderetur: partim, ne Ethnici in suis erroribus confirmarentur, dum rectius putant esse, quod etiam Christianos obseruare vident: *It was meete for them to refraine, not onely from suche thinges, as haue a manifeste shewe of wickednesse, but also from suche thinges, as* might be called indifferente, *that is to saie, neither Good, nor il: partely, leaste any of the* weaker Christians *shoulde be offended: partely also,* leste the Heathens should be encourraged in theire errours, thinkinge that thinge, for that the Christians *them selues doo it, to be the better.* Againe Tertullian saithe, De hoc primo consistam, An cum ipsis quoque Nationibus Communicare in huiusmodi Seruus Dei debeat: siue habitu, siue victu, vel quo alio genere lætitiæ eorum: *Herein will I firste stande, whether it be lawfull for the Seruaunte of God, to Communicate with whole Nations in suche thinges:* either in Apparel, or in Diet, or in any other kinde of theire Mirthe.

Gabriel Lectio. 38. Tertul. De Corona Militis.

B. Rhenan. in Librum De Corona Militis.

Tertul. De Idololatria.

And S. Basile saithe, Σιγάσθω τὰ περιττὰ ἐν ἐκκλησίᾳ θεοῦ: *Let needelesse, and superfluous thinges be put to Silence in the Churche of God.* To be shorte, Origen saithe, Quærendum est, quid hoc sit, quod sequitur, Non fiant ei reliquiæ: Ne aliqua, inquit, rescindatis Chaldæorum, aliqua reseruetis. Ob id iubet, ne pusillum quidem relinquatur in ea: *Wee muste examine, what is meante by this, that followeth,* Leaue her no manner of remnante. *The meaninge is this, Abolishe not certaine of the Superstitions of the* Chaldees, *reserninge certaine: Therefore he commaundeth, that nothinge be leafte in her,* be it neuer so litle. Howe be it, I take not vpon me to enter into the Conscience of others: *Let eche man abounde in his owne sense.*

Basil. De Natali Christi. Origen. in Hieremi. Homil. 3. Roman. 14.

Yet, M. Hardinge, for as muche as ye make suche a reckeninge of your Antiquitie, as if al your Orders, and Ceremonies had vndoubtedly benne conueied ouer vnto you from Christe him selfe, and his Apostles, maie it therefore please you to vnderstande, that at the beginninge there appeareth no suche distinction, or difference of Apparel in the Ministerie. Valafredus Abbas saithe, Veteres Communi indumento vtentes Celebrabant Missas: *The olde Fathers saide Masse* (that is to saie, Ministred the Holy Communion) *hauinge on* theire owne common Apparel.

S. Augustine in his Rule to his Clerkes, or Monkes, writeth thus, Ne sit Notabilis habitus vester: *Let not your Apparel be Notable.* S. Hierome, describinge the order of the Churche at Bethleem, saithe thus: In veste, nulla discretio: nulla admiratio: Vtcunque placuerit incedere, nec detractionis est, nec laudis: *In Apparel, there is no difference: there is no woonderinge. How so euer any man liste to goe, it is neither sclandered, nor praised.* And Pope Cœlestinus the firste saithe, Discernendi sumus à plebe, Doctrina, non Veste: Conuersatione, non Habitu: Mentis puritate, non Cultu. Si enim studere incipiemus Nouitati, Traditum nobis à Patribus ordinem calcabimus, vt locum vacuum Superstitionibus faciamus. Docendi potiùs sunt rudium animi, quàm illudendi. Nec Imponendum est illorum oculis, sed Mentibus infundenda præcepta sunt: *Wee muste be knowen frem the Laie people, by our Doctrine,* not by our Coate: *By our Conuersation,*

Augustin. In Regula Monachor. Hieronym. ad Marcellam. vt commigret Bethleem. Cœlestin. 1. in Epistola ad Episcopos Galliæ, Ca. 1

Conuersation, not by our Apparel: *By the pureneſſe of our Minde*, not by the attiere of our Body. *For if wee once beginne to diuiſe Nouelties, wee ſhal treade our Fathers Orders vnder foote, and make roome for Superſtition. The myndes of the ignorante ought to be taught, and not to be mocked. Neither maie wee goe aboute to daſel theire eies: but rather ought to powre Wholeſome Doctrine into theire Hartes.* Here you ſée, by the Popes owne iudgemente; that your ſuperſtitious choiſe of apparel ſerueth not for encreaſe of Holineſſe, but rather for the deceiuinge, and mockinge of the people. To conclude, it is noted in your owne Gloſe vpon the Clementines, Clerici Sæculares non habent certum habitum, cùm non ſit expreſſum in iure de Colore, vel Forma: per quæ, vel quorum alterum oportet habitum diſcerni: *Seculare Prieſtes haue no certaine Apparel appointed them, for as muche as there is no expreſſe mention made, neither of the Coloure, nor of the Fourme: by whiche twoo differences, or by the one of them, Apparel muſte be diſcerned.* *Clem. 1. De Elect. Ca. 1. Gloſſ. vltima.*

Goddes name be Bleſſed. The Religion of Chriſte maie ſtande bothe with, and without theſe thinges. But without ſuche proppes, the whole rooffe of your Religion muſte nedes comme downe: as hauinge nothinge els, but ſhewes, and vanities, to beare it vp.

But leſte ye ſhould conceiue ouer great opinion of ſo ſmal a mater, and thinke, there can be none other Apparel mete, & comely for the Clergie, but onely yours, or, that without the ſame, the whole Churche of Chriſte muſte nedes goe to waſte: maie it like you therfore to remember, what the Ancient Father Origen hath written of you in this behalfe: Non ſolùm apud Iudæos, ſed etiam apud nos, multos eſt inuenire, peccata huiuſmodi peccantes, & glutientes Camelos, in eo, quòd maxima delicta committunt. Et oportet huiuſmodi homines frequenter conſiderare, Quomodò in rebus minimis Religionem ſuam oſtendant: Et bene eos Hypocritas appellat: *Wee maie finde, not onely emongeſt the Iewes, but alſo emongſt our ſelues, menne that offende in ſuche faultes, ſwalowinge downe whole Camels, in that they Commit greate offenſes. And wee ought wel to marke ſuche manner of Menne, howe they countenance out theire Religion with ſmal maters.* Very wel, and iuſtly Chriſte calleth them Hypocrites. *Origen. in Matth. Tract. 23.*

Poſidonius, writinge the life of S. Auguſtine ſaithe thus, Veſtis eius, & calceamenta, & lectualia ex moderato, & competenti habitu erant: nec nitida nimium, nec abiecta plurimùm. Quia his plerunque vel iactare ſe nimium homines ſolent, vel abijcere: ex vtroque, non quæ Ieſu Chriſti, ſed quæ ſua ſunt, quærentes: *Auguſtines Apparel, Shoes, and Beddinge were of a Competente, and meane makinge: neither ouer freaſhe, nor ouer homely. For in ſuche thinges menne vſe oftentimes, either to vaunte, or to abaſe them ſelues aboue meaſure:* in either ſide ſeekinge theire owne, and not that perteineth to Ieſus Chriſte. *Poſidoni. in vita Auguſt.*

S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Ex cæteris eius operibus poteſt conijci, vtrùm hoc Contemptu ſuperflui cultus, an Ambitione aliqua faciat. Quia & ſub ouina pelle cauendos Lupos Dominus præcepit: *Wee maie geather by the reſte of his woorkes, whether he doo thus* (attiere him ſelfe) *in contempte of Superfluous Apparel, or els for Ambition, that he maie be noted. For our* Lorde hathe commaunded vs to beware of the VVoulfe, euen vnder the Sheepes ſkinne. Againe he ſaithe, Illum parcum habitum, ac neceſſarium etiam Simulatores ſæpius vſurpant, vt incautos decipiant: *That homely kinde of Apparel, ſtandinge onely in neceſſaries, Hypocrites, and diſſemblers doo for the more parte counterfeite, to the ende they maie deceiue menne, before they be ware.* Thus muche onely by the waie, leſte ye ſhould thinke more of your Coate, then it is worthie. *Auguſt. De ſermon. Domini in Monte. Lib. 2.* *Auguſt. in eodem Libro.*

Somme ſaie, *The Body of Chriſte in the Sacramente is Torne, and cruſhed with Teethe: and ſimme denie it.* Yea forſooth (ſaie you) and bothe meane right wel. Thus would ye not ſaie, M. Hardinge, if ye knewe, what it were to Eate the Body of Chriſte.

S. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Iſte Panis replet Mentem, non Ventrem: *This Breade fedeth the Minde, and not the Belly.* We Eate it with the Spiritual Tothe of our Faithe, not with the Material Tothe of our Body. Your very Gloſe, be it neuer ſo blinde, was hable to ſée, that theſe woordes, To teare, and to Cruſhe Chriſtes Body with your bodily Teethe, can hardely haue ſo Catholique, and ſo good a meaninge, as you imagine. The woordes thereof be theſe, Niſi ſanè intelligas verba *Chryſoſtomus ex variis locis in Matth. Hom. 82.*

Chriſtes Body Torne, & Cruſhed vvith Teethe.

Berengarij, in Maiorem incides Hæreſim, quàm ipſe habuit. Et ideò omnia referas ad Species ipſas: *Onleſſe thou diſcretely vnderſtande theſe woordes of* Berengarius, *thou ſhalte fal into a greater Hereſie, then he had any. Therefore theſe woordes muſte haue relation to the Fourmes,* and not vnto Chriſtes very Body. It folowethe therefore that the Catholique Conſtruction, that you geather hereof, muſte nedes be this: *Chriſtes Body is Cruſhed, and Torne With Teethe,* that is to ſaie, *Chriſtes Body is not Cruſhed, nor Torne with Teethe.* Germans lippes be not ſo farre aſunder, but ye maie eaſily ioine them togeather by ſutche Conſtructions.

De Con. Diſt. 2. Ego Berengar. in Gloſſa.

But Chryſoſtome ſaithe in likewiſe, Dentes inſerimus in Carnes Chriſti: *Wee thruſt our Teethe into the Fleaſhe of Chriſte.* O M. Hardinge, you can not be ignorant of Chryſoſtomes extraordinarie, and vehement manner of ſpeache: and therefore ye are the more to blame, thus of pourpoſe, and wittingly to abuſe your Reader. For, as Chryſoſtome ſaith, VVe thruſte our Teethe into Chriſtes Fleaſhe. So he ſaith likewiſe, Chriſte is ſlaine vpon the Communion Table, and his Bloude is powred from his ſide. Likewiſe he ſaithe vnto a ſclaunderer of his neighboure, Linguam tuam humano Sanguine rubefeciſti: *Thou haſte died thy tongue redde in Mannes Bloude.* So S. Hierome ſaith, Detractatores viuis Carnibus Saturantur: *Selaunderers are filled with liue Fleaſhe.* So ſaithe S. Cyprian, Cruci Hæremus: Sanguinem fugimus: & intra ipſa Redemptoris noſtri vulnera linguam figimus: *Wee Cleaue to the Croſſe: and ſucke the Bloude: and wee faſten our Tongues within the Woundes of our Redeemer.*

Chryſoſtomus in Encæniis. Chryſo. ad Roman. Homil. 2. Hierony. in Iobum. Cap. 19. Cyprian. De Cœna Domini.

Theſe, and other like phraſes commonly vſed in the Anciente Fathers, maie not be racked to the extremitie of the woordes: but rather oughte fauourably to be applied to the meaninge: whiche was, by the Material Tothe, and Tongue of the Body, to expreſſe the Spiritual, and inwarde Eatinge, and ſuckinge of the Minde. So S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Figura ergo eſt, præcipiens Paſſioni Domini communicandum, & ſuauiter, atque vtiliter recondendum in memoria, quòd Caro Chriſti Crucifixa pro nobis, & vulnerata ſit: *Therefore it is a Figure, or a Figuratiue phraſe of ſpeache: Commaundinge vs to be Partetakers of Chriſtes Paſſion, and comfortably, and profitably to laie vp in our Hartes, that his Fleaſhe was Crucified, and Wounded for our ſakes.*

Auguſt. De Doct. Chriſtian. Lib. 3. Cap. 16.

As for your Conſecration, Corpus quantum, Non quantum, Non per modum quanti, Individuum Vagum, &c. Whiche lately were the Subſtantialleſt pointes of al your Doctrine, it is ſufficiente for you nowe to ſaie, They are no Articles of your Faithe. Sutche Grace haue you, for aduantage, to make your Faithe more, or leſſe, at your pleaſure. Touchinge your Dogges, and Miſe, whether they Eate the very Body of Chriſte, or no, and that Subſtantially, Verily, and in deede, ye ſæme ſtil to ſtaie in doubte, as not yet beinge wel aſſured of this Article of your Faithe. But this is a moſt certaine, and vndoubted Article of our Faith, that no Creature can Eate the Body of Chriſte, but he, that is a member of Chriſtes Body. S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Hoc eſt manducare illam eſcam, & illum potum Bibere, in Chriſto manere, & Chriſtum Manentem in ſe habere: *This is the Eatinge of that meate, and the Drinkinge of that Drinke: for a Man to dwel in Chriſte, and to haue Chriſte dwellinge within him.* And therefore wee ſaie, who ſo euer wil holde, that a Dogge, or a Mouſe maie Eate the very Body of Chriſte, and that Really, and in deede, or who ſo ſtaggereth, or doubteth, whether it maie be ſo, or no, Accurſed be he.

Aug. in Ioan. Tract. 26.

You ſaie your Contentions bitwæne your two contrarie Armies, the Thomiſtes, and the Scotiſtes, and other Schoolemen, ſtand onely in certaine termes Metaphyſical. As, Vtrùm Ens, & Vnum differant ratione, an reipſa: The Truth wherof is very agreeable to the reſte of your Doctrine. For, to leaue a whole worlde of the endleſſe contentions that are emonge you, Alphonſus, one of your owne Doctoures, ſaith, that one of your Thomiſtes doubted not to pronounce openly in the behoufe of his Maiſter, Quiſquis à B. Thomæ ſententia diſceſſerit, ſuſpectus de Hæreſi eſt cenſendus: *Who ſo euer forſaketh the iudgement of* Thomas of Aquine, *muſte be taken, as ſuſpected of Hereſie.* I thinke, ye vſe not to place your Hereſies in termes Metaphyſical.

Alphonſ. de Hæreſib. Lib. 1. Ca. 7

Eraſmus, that liued in that age, and wel vnderſtode of the furies of your Schooles, ſaithe thus, Qui Thomam ſequuntur, & à Scoto, & à Gerſone diſſentiunt,

Eraſmus contra Lutherum.

eos

eos, penè habent pro Hæreticis: *They that folowe* Thomas, *and dissente from* Duns, *and* Gerson, *accounpte them in a manner* as good, as Heretiques.

Dominicus à Soto, and Catharinus, were bothe Learned menne: bothe of your syde: bothe swoorne to the Pope: bothe presente at your late Chapter at Tridente. Yet thus doth the one of them grate the other: Tu permanes in sensu damnato per Synodum: *Thou remaineſt ſtil in a ſenſe condemned by the Councel.* Catharinus condemneth Cardinal Caietane for two hundred sundrie erroures, and somme of them he calleth wicked, and Antichristian. Theise Termes muste nedes be very Metaphysical, M. Hardinge, that can perde you suche Heretical, and Antichristian erroures. *Dominicus à Soto Contra Catharinum.*

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuision. 1.

They were beste therefore to goe, and sette peace at home rather amonge them selues. Of a truthe, Vnitie, and Concorde doothe best becomme Religion: Yet is not Vnitie the sure and certaine marke, whereby to knowe the Churche of God. For there was the greatest Vnitie, that mighte bee, amongest them, that woorshipped the Golden Calfe, and amonge them, whiche with one voice iointly cried againste our Saueour Jesus Christe, Crucifie him. Neither, bicause the Corinthians were vnquieted with priuate dissensions: or bicause Paule did square with Peter, or Barnabas with Paule: or bicause the Christians vpon the very beginninge of the Gospel, were at mutual discorde, touchinge somme one mater, or other maie wee therefore thinke, there was no Churche of God amongest them. And, for those persons, whome they vpon spite calle Zuinglians, & Lutherans, in very deede they of bothe sides be Christians, good Friendes, and Brethren. They varie not bitwixte them selues vpon the Principles, and Fundations of our Religion, nor as touchinge God, or Christe, or the Holy Ghoste, or the meanes of Justification, or of euerlastinge life, but vpon one onely question, whiche is neither weighty, nor greate: neither mistruste wee, or make doubte at al, but they wil shortly be agreed. And if there be any of them, whiche haue other opinion, than is meete, wee doubte not, but ere it be longe, they wil put aparte al affections, and names of parties, and that God wil reuele the Truthe vnto them: so that by better consideringe, and searchinge out of the mater, as once it came to passe in the Councel of Chalcedon, al causes, and seedes of dissension shal be throughly pluckte vp by the roote, and be buried, and quite forgotten for euer. Whiche God graunte.

M. Hardinge.

These Defenders be like in conditions to suche honest women, as commonly wee cal Scoldes. Because Vnitie pleaseth you not, as beinge that through lacke whereof your newe Churche is of al good menne detested, and of the meanest very muche suspected, yee saie, it is not a sure and a certaine marke, whereby to know the Churche of God. Yes, Maisters, amonge other notes and markes of the true Churche Vnitie is one. Not euery Vnitie, but Vnitie in the Holy Ghoste, whiche geueth life to that one Body the Churche, whereof euery faitheful is a member, and Christe the Heade, and powringe Charitie abroade in our Hartes, so linketh al right beleeuers, togeather in the bonde of peace, as they al saie one thinge, thinke one thinge, sauer one thinge. The Vnitie, that is the note and marke of the true Churche, whereof wee speake, is that, for which the Churche is called one, and beinge gathered and knitte togeather, professeth Vnitie of Faithe, of good wil and mutual loue togeather, and of Sacramentes. The Vnitie of them, who woorshipped the Golden Calfe, and with one consente againste our Sauiour cried, *Crucifige*, was farre distant from the Vnitie, whiche is a note of the Churche, and is the woorke of the Holy Ghoste. Suche is the Vnitie of the Deuils, who conspire againste Christe and al his with one consent. Suche Vnitie is oftentimes in Theeues:

 suche

suche Vnitie is founde in you, and al your sectes. For be ye neuer so diuerse and at variaunce within your selues, yet yee ioine togeather in wicked amitie and Vnitie against the Churche of Christe. And therefore S. Augustine compareth you, and al suche as ye be, to Samsons foxes, that were sundred by the heades, and tied togeather by the tayles.

Neither saie wee that amonge them, who varie in smal pointes, and thinges not perteininge to the groundes of Faithe, there is no Churche. For al that certaine of the Corinthians in the Primitiue Churche were at square, how so euer Paule tolde Peter that he thought good, though Barnabas and Paule agreed not aboute Iohn. Marke, yet were they of Christes Church: what els? But where ye bringe this for excuse of the Lutherans and Zuinglians, and other sectes sprange out of them, the cause is not like pardie. For saie on what ye liste, and lie so longe as ye liste, their dissentions cannot be dissembled: muche lesse can they be accorded, &c. 1. Cor. 1. Galat. 2. Act. 15.

Yet leste they, whose fortune is not to see ought thereof written els where, shoulde mistruste my reporte, as al doo espie your lyinge: the woordes of Nicolaus Gallus your owne Doctour of Luthers scoole, here I wil rehearse: *Non sunt leues inter nos concertationes de rebus leuibus, sed de sublimibus doctrinæ Christianæ articulis, de lege, & euangelio, de iustificatione, & bonis operibus, de Sacramentis &c.* The striues (saithe he) that be amongest vs, be not light, nor of light maters, but of the highe Articles of Christian Doctrine, namely of the lawe, and of the Gospel, of iustification, and of good woorkes, of the Sacramentes, &c. Here, as ye see, he reckeneth vp a greate many of the weightiest pointes, of our Religion, whereof they dissent amonge them selues. But I doubte, what I maie cal weight, and greate, seinge these good felowes cal the controuersie, whiche is betwixte the Lutherans, and the Zwinglians, concerninge the Body of our Sauioure Christe, neither weighty nor greate. But as they make a foule lie therein, so doo they also in saieinge, they vary not betwixte them selues, but vpon one onely question. Of the dissension that is betweene the Lutherans, and Zwinglians, thus pitifully complaineth Nicolaus Amsdorffius in his Booke entituled *Publica confessio pura Doctrina*, him selfe beinge an earnest Lutheran: The worlde goeth with vs worse and worse daiely. Al thinges doo prognosticate the vtter ruine of the Gospel, and that in place of the Gospel, wee shal haue nothinge but mere errours, and the same very notable. (Then after a fewe woordes) nowe Brentius (saithe he) and the Adiaphoristes (they be a special secte of the Lutherans) beinge at the Communication or conference at VVormes, would not condemne Zwinglius and Osiander, bicause they were trimme menne in the tongues, and wel seene in Humanitie. And as for vs and our side, because we refused to agree vnto that communication onlesse they were condemned, they dressed vs vily with theire scoffes and railinges, thruste vs out of the communication, and compelled vs to goe awaie, &c. Item after a fewe. In Thesi & Hypoth. positum, fol. vlt.

There be that say, they condemne Zwinglianisme, but the preface of Brentius to Maister Iames the Minister of Goppingen his booke, witnesseth farre otherwise. For there they goe aboute (a Gods name) to conciliat good father Luther and Zwinglius, and make them friendes one with an other. *Quod planè impossibile est. Quis enim vnquam audiuit contradictoria posse redigi in concordiam?* VVhiche is impossible: for who euer hearde, that contradictions may be accorded? (But the Maisters of the Apologie make no doubte at al, but they wil shortely be aggreed.) Suche childishe and impossible thinges they sticke not to set foorthe, who woulde be coumpted the teachers of the worlde, as though we were but blockes, and Asses. But as for the heresies and errours of Zuinglius and Osiander, with a quiet conscience we can not embrace. Neither can wee subscribe and yelde to their departinge awaie, and newe guegawes, whiche haue diuided them selues from Luther. Thus sai Amsdorffius, and muche more there to the same purpose, whiche here I leaue to blot the paper withal. To conclude, thus al menne maie plainely see, howe the maisters of this defence be conuinced of foule lyinge by their owne Doctours and scholefelowes, beside the thinge it selfe, that geueth manifest euidence against them. But suche stuffe in their writinges and Preachinges is not geson. Leauinge others, I reporte me to M. Iuelles late sermon made at Paules Crosse on the Sondaie before Ascension daie laste, in whiche (if vniforme reporte made by sundrie there present be true) he abused certaine Honorable, and woorshipful personages, and of common people a greate multitude, with lies woorthy rather to be chastised by lawes, then to be confuted with woordes. But be it as it is written, *Qui in sordibus est, sordescat adhuc.* Apoc. 22.

The Bisshop of Sarisburie.

It pitieth me, M. Hardinge, to sée your trifling. If ye thought it so good shil, for aduantage of your cause, to compare vs to Scoldes, wherefore then did not you, although not through your whole Booke, yet at leaste in this selfe same place, where ye so direpely charge vs with scoldinge, refraine better from sutche wilde speaches, as might séeme to proue your selfe a scolde? For, I beséeche you, cal your woordes a little to remembrance: and consider indifferently, what wémen they be, that commonly vse the like. Thus yée saie, Euen so, good Sirs: proudely, wickedly, and fondely yee obiecte: yee shewe your Clerkely prowes: yee Bragge: yee boaste? Nowe haue you tolde your scoldinge tale: Yee ioine in wicked amitie against the Church of Christe: The founders of your Church: The Apostles of your Gospel: Yee are conuinced of foule lieinge: Al men doo espie your lieinge: lie

on so

on so longe, as ye liste: He that is filthy, let him be filthy stil. Theise be your woordes, M. Hardinge, altogeather in one place. If you can finde so many the like in al our whole Apologie, condemne vs hardely, and cal vs Scoldes.

Vnitie wee loue, and honoure it, as the greatest comforte of Christian hartes. But if Vnitie be the onely, and vndoubted token of the Churche of God, woe then be to you, and to your felowes. For by that token, agreeinge so il emongest your selues, yee shoulde seeme to haue no Churche.

But, as wee haue saide. Al they, that agree togeather, are not therefore euermore of the Churche. Herode, and Pilate, were made friendes, & agreed togeather. Dauid saith, *The Kinges and Princes of the earthe haue mette, and agreed togeather against the Lorde, and against his Christ*. S. Iohn saithe of the friendes, and fauourers of Antichriste, Hi vnum Consilium habent, & vires, ac potestatem suam tradent Bestiæ: hi pugnabunt cum Agno: *These shal* haue al one Counsel (and one Minde: *and shal deliuer ouer their strength, and theire power vnto the Beaste: and shal fight against the Lambe*. Luk. 23. Psalm. 2. Apoc. 4. 17.

Chrysostome saithe, Expedit & ipsis Dæmonibus, obaudire sibi inuicem in Schismate: *It is good euen for the Diuels themselues, to be obedient one of them vnto an other in theire Diuision*. Symmachus, and other like maintainers of the Heathenishe Idolatrie, saide, Aequum est, quicquid omnes colunt, vnum putari: *It is meete, that, what so euer al menne woorship, be counted* One. And thus the Heathens, and Infidels woulde they seeme to holde by Vnitie. Chrysost. in Matth. Homil. 29. Ambros. Lib. 5. Epist. 30.

If your Vnitie, M. Hardinge, be so sounde, and so certaine, as ye would seeme to make it, why then do you condemne your selues, one an other, of Heresie? Certainely Heresie importeth Diuision, and not greate Vnitie. The whole shewe, and substance, or your Vnitie standeth in this, To geeue eare to your selues, and to put Christe to silence. But the true, and Christian Vnitie is this, That the whole Flocke of Christe, heare the voice of the onely Shephearde, and folowe him. The bande of Vnitie, is simple Veritie: Whiche, M. Hardinge, for as mutche as ye haue forsaken, ye haue no great cause to talke mutche of Vnitie. Iohan. 10.

As for Sampsons Foxetailes, it seemeth, ye lackte sommewhat, to plaie withal. Otherwise they serue you here to no greate pourpose. For, if there be any dissension emongest vs, it is not in any Article of the Faithe, but onely in somme particulare pointe of learninge: The like whereof hath benne betweene S. Augustine, and S. Hierome, and others the Learned, Godly, and Catholique Fathers of the Churche. And thus, contrarie to Sampsons Foxes, notwithstandinge one, or other haue benne diuided in somme certaine Conclusion, as it were in the Tailes, yet wee ioine thoroughly altogeather in one Heade, in one Gospel, in one waie of Saluation, and in one summe of Religion: and altogeather with one Mouthe, and one Spirite wee glorifie God, the Father of our Lorde Iesus Christe.

Concerninge the disagreemente, that is betweene the Lutherans, and the Zuinglians, touchinge the Beeinge of the Body of Christe in one onely place, or in many, wee saie, that in respecte either of Saluation, or of other Article, of God the Father, or of the Sonne, or of the Holy Ghoste, or of any other the Groundes, and Principles of the Christian Faithe, it is not weighty. In that respecte wee speake it onely. Otherwise wee saie, the erroure is weighty. Sutche erroures in sundrie the Auncient Fathers haue benne dissembled, and past in silence. S. Hilarie seemeth to saie, *That Christe receiued not Fleashe of the Blessed Virgine:* And, *That the same Fleash of Christe was impassible, and coulde feele no griefe*. Hilar. De Trinitat. Lib. 10. Hominis habitus est: Origo non Hominis. Natura non habens ad dolendū. Origen. Ad Roman. Cap. 6. Li. 5 Brentius. August. Epist. 57. Ad Dardan.

Origene saith, Quidam putant, Christum in Futuro Sæculo iterum pati oportere, &c. *Somme menne thinke, that in the worlde to comme* Christe muste suffer in his Body, or be Crucified againe. Brentius seemeth to holde, that Christes Body is infinite, and in al places, as is the Godhed: whiche erroure, it seemeth, was defended by somme in S. Augustines time. And therefore he saith, Cauendum est, ne ita Diuinitatem astruamus Hominis, vt Veritatem Corporis auferamus: *We muste take heede, wee doo not so mainteine the Diuine Nature of Christe, beeinge man*, that wee take awaie the Truthe of his Body. Theise Erroures, notwithstandinge they were greate

in them selues, yet in respect of other greater errours, haue benne dissembled. And therefore Iacobus Andreas, al be it he coulde not be ignorant of this dissension, bringe him selfe a partie to the same, yet he saithe, Quòd vociferantur, nostros de summa Euangelij nondum consentire, mendacium est: *Whereas they crie out,* (as M. Hardinge dothe) *that wee cannot agree emonge our selues, aboute the Substance of the Gospel, it is a very great Vntruthe.*

Iacob. Andr. de Authorita. Scripturæ. Pag. 178.

But you saie, The Maisters of the Apologie tel vs, They doubt not, but these parties wilbe reconciled. And yet *Nicolaus Amsdorfius* (**with whose wordes ye are ashamed to blotte your paper**) taketh the mater to be impossible. **And here, ye thinke, ye haue driuen vs neare the wal, specially findinge vs so farre disagreeinge in Iudgemente from a Doctoure, as you cal him, of our owne.**

But, M. Hardinge, ye might better haue considered, that Amsdorfius, **and we speake of sundrie maters, and therefore our saieinges maie wel stande togeather.**

Amsdorfius saithe, **the** Doctrine, **and** Termes **standinge stil, as they do, it is not possible by any manner of Construction, to make the parties agree. But our truste in God is, that they, that are deceiued, shal finde theire owne erroure, and alter theire** Termes, **and correct theire Iudgementes, and submit them selues vnto the Truthe, and so ioine togeather al in one.**

Augustin. in Secunda Disputatione contra Fortunatum. Augustin. contra Faust. Li. 24. ca. 2

So S. Augustine saithe, Rectè dicitur, Glacialem niuem calidam esse non posse. Nullo enim pacto, quàm diu nix est, calida esse potest: *It is wel saide, Snowe frorne, or congeled, can neuer be hote. For, as longe, as it is Snowe, it is not possible to make it hote.* **And yet the liquoure that nowe is frozne, maie afterwarde be resolued, and made hote.**

So likewise he saithe of the Heretiques named the Manichees: Sic delirant Manichæi: sed recipiscant, & non sint Manichæi: *Thus fonde are the* Manichees: *But let them amende theire errours, and no more be* Manichees.

Malach. 4.

What is there so contrarie in iudgement, as a Iewe, and a Christian? Yet God hathe promised, *That he wil turne the hartes of the Fathers* (the Iewes) *vnto theire Children: and the hartes of the Children* (the Christians) *vnto theire Fathers.* **And** S. Paule saithe, Iudæi, si non permanserint in incredulitate, inserentur. Potens enim est Deus

Rom. 11.

iterum inserere eos: *The Iewes shalbe graffed into the Tree, if they abide not in Vnbeliefe. For God is hable to graffe them in againe.* **What is there so contrarie, as Light, and** Darkenesse? Yet the Prophete saithe, Illumina tenebras meas: *O Lorde, lighten thou my darkenesse.* **To conclude, what is so contrarie, as the Kingdome of the Pope, and the Kingedome of Christe? And yet, wee truste, it is not impossible, but the Pope him selfe maie once turne to God, and confesse his errours, and professe the Gospel of Christe, that he nowe oppresseth.**

Psalm. 17.

Theise thinges considered, M. Hardinge, it was no deadly Sinne, to saie, we truste, that these maters of variance betweene the Lutherans, and the Zwinglians, wil once be accorded: and that al causes, and seedes of dissension shalbe thorowly pulled vp by the rootes, and be buried, and quite forgotten for euer. This change God hathe already begonne to worke, not onely in sundrie Learned Penne, but also in greate Cities, in good Vniuersities, and in whole Countries. Therefore, wee truste, our hope is not in vaine.

§ As for the Lies, whiche (**it liketh you wel to saie**) M. Iewel made openly at Paules Crosse, **I doubte not of your modestie, but ye woulde haue blased them better, if ye had thought them worthe your colours. Suche general, & so great exclamations, vpon so simple reportes, stande not alwaies with greatest wisedome. He is to rashe to be a Iudge, that pronounceth before, he knowe the cause. What I saide there, for as mutch as ye touche nothinge in particulare, it is needeles to make rehearsal. But wel I remember, I might truely haue said, M. Harding commonly** Misallegeth, misreporteth, misconstrueth, corrupteth, wreasteth, **and** Falsifieth **the Ancient Councels, and Holy Fathers. I could haue saide, M. Harding is oftentimes directly contrarie to him selfe. I coulde haue saide, M. Hardinge in one Worke hath vttered two hundred fiue and fiftie great Vntruthes. Theise, M. Hardinge, your Conscience knoweth, had benne no Lies: and therefore not meete to be chastised by any Lawes.**

The Apolo-

The Apologie, Cap. 7. Diuision. 1. & .2.

But this is the heauiest, and most greeuous parte of their sclaunders, that they cal vs wicked and vngodly Menne, and saie wee haue throwen awaie al care of Religion. Thoughe this oughte not to trouble vs mutche, whilest they them selues that thus haue charged vs, knowe ful wel, howe spiteful, and vntrue their sclaunder is. Iustine the Martyr is a witnesse, that al Christians were called ἄθεοι, that is, a Godlesse people, as soone as the Gospel firste beganne to be published, and the name of Christe to be openly declared. And, when Polycarpus stood to be iudged, the people stirred vp the President to slea, and murder al them, whiche professed the Gospel, with theise woordes, αἶρε τοὺς ἀθέους, That is to saie, Ridde out of the vvaie these vvicked and Godlesse creatures. And this was, not bicause it was true, that the Christians were Godlesse in deede, but bicause they woulde not woorship stones and stockes, which were then honoured as God. The whole woorlde seeth plainely ynoughe already, what we and ours haue endured at theise mennes handes for Religion, and our onely Goddes cause. They haue throwne vs into Prison, into Water, into Fire, and haue embrued them selues in our blonde: not bicause wee were either Idulterers, or Robbers, or Murtherers, but onely for that wee confessed the Gospel of Jesus Christe, and put our confidence in the liuinge God: And for that wee complained too iustly, and truely (Lorde thou knowest) that they did breake the Lawe of God for theire owne moste vaine Traditions: And that our aduersaries were the very foes to the Gospel, and enimies to Christes Crosse, so witingely, and willingely, and obstinately despisinge Goddes Commaundementes.

Wherefore, when theise menne sawe they coulde not rightly finde faulte with our Doctrine, they woulde needes pike a quarrel, and inueighe and raile againste our manners, surmisinge, that wee doo condemne al wel dooinges: that wee sette open the doore to al licentiousnesse and luste, and leade awaie the people from al loue of vertue. And in very deede, the life of al men, euen of the deuoutest, and moste Christian, bothe is, and euermore hathe benne sutche, as one waie alwaies finde somme lacke, euen in the very beste, and purest conuersation. And sutche is the inclination of al creatures vnto euil, and the readinesse of al Menne to suspecte, that the thinges, whiche neither haue benne donne, nor once were meante to be donne, yet maie be easily bothe heard, and credited to be true. And like as a smal spotte is soone espied in the neatest and whitest garmente, euen so the leaste staine of dishonestie is easily founde out in the purest, and sincerest life. Neither take wee al them, whiche haue at this daie embraced the Doctrine of the gospel, to be Angels, and to liue clearely without any mote, or wrinkle: nor yet thinke wee theise Menne neither so blinde, that if any thinge maie be noted in vs, they are not hable to perceiue the same euen through the leaste creuice: nor so friendly, that they wil construe oughte to the beste: nor yet so honeste of nature, or courteous, that they wil looke backe vpon them selues, and weigh our liues by theire owne.

If

If so be wee liste to searche this mater from the bottome, wee knowe, that in the very Apostles times there were Christians, throughe whome the name of the Lorde was blasphemed, and euil spoken of emonge the Gentiles. Constantius the Emperour bewaileth, as it is written in Sozomenus, that many waxed woorse and woorse after thei had fallen to the Religion of Christe. And Cyprian in a lamentable oration setteth out the corrupt manners of his time: The wholesome Discipline, saith he, which the Apostles left vnto vs, hath idlenes, and longe rest nowe vtterly marred; euery one studied to encrease his liuelyhode: And cleane forgettinge, either what they had done before whiles they were vnder the Apostles, or what they oughte continually to doo hauinge receiued the Faithe: Thei earnestly laboured to make greate theire owne wealthe with an vnsatiable desire of couetousnesse. There is no deuoute Religion, saithe he, in Priestes, no sounde Faithe in Ministers, no charitie shewed in good woorkes, no fourme of Godlynesse in theire conditions: Menne are becomme effeminate, and weemens bewtie is countrefeited. And, without reckninge of many moe writers, Gregorie Nazianzene speaketh thus of the pitieful state of his owne time: We, saithe he, are in hatred emonge the Heathen for our owne vices sake, wee are also becomme nowe a woonder, not onely to Angels, and menne, but euen to al the vngodly. In this case was the Churche of God, when the Gospel firste began to shine, and when the furie of Tyrannes was not as yet cooled, nor the Swerde taken of from the Christians neckes. Surely it is no newe thinge that menne bee but menne, although they be called by the name of Christians.

M. Hardinge.

Loe, a greeuous, and a heauie case, that the worlde calleth you wicked, and vngodly menne, Iwis they be to blame for it. And so be they that calle them theeues, whiche come to be promoted to Tiborne. For, God knoweth, litle haue you deserued, so to be called, &c.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

All this, with the reste, is onely Hicke Scorners eloquence, not worthy of answeare.

Here endeth the Thirde
Parte

The

The Fourth Parte.

The Apologie, Cap. 1. Diuision. 1.

BVT wil these menne, I praie you, thinke nothinge at al of them selues, whilest thei so maliciously accuse vs? And hauinge leasure to beholde so farre of, and to see, what is donne bothe in Germanie, and in Englande, haue thei either forgotten, or can they not see, what is donne at Rome? Or wil they accuse vs, theire owne life beinge such, as noman is hable to make mention thereof but with shame? Our pourpose here is, not to take in hande at this presente, to bringe to lighte, & open to the worlde those thinges, whiche were meete rather to be hidde and buried with the workers of them. It beseemeth neither our Religion, nor our modestie, nor our shamefastenesse. But yet hee, which geueth commaundemente, that he shoulde be called the Vicare of Christe, and the Heade of the Churche, who also heareth, that such thinges be donne in Rome, who seeth them, who suffereth them, (for wee wil goe no further) maie easily consider with him selfe, what maner of thinges they be. Let him in Goddes Name calle to minde, and let him remember, that they be of his owne Canonistes, and Schoole Doctoures, whiche haue taughte the people, that Fornication betweene single folke is no sinne: (as though thei had fet that doctrine from Mitio in Terence) whose woordes be: It is no sinne (beleue me) for a yong man to haunt Harlots. Let him remember they be of his owne, which haue decreed, that a Priest ought not to be put out of his cure for Fornication. Let him remember also, howe Cardinal Campegius, Albertus Pighius, and others many moe of his owne, haue taughte, that the Priest, which keepeth a Concubine, dooth liue more holyly, and chastely, then he, vvhiche hathe a VVife in Matrimonie. I truste, he hathe not yet forgotten, that there be many thousandes of Common Harlottes in Rome: and that he him selfe doothe geather yeerely of the same Harlottes aboue thirtie thousande Ducates, by the waie of an annual pension. Neither can he forgeate, that he him selfe dooth maintaine openly Brothel houses, and by a moste filthy lucre dooth filthily, and lewdely serue his owne luste. Were al thinges then pure, and holy in Rome, when Iohane a VVoman, rather of perfite age, then of perfite life, was Pope there, and bare her selfe as the Head of the church: And after that, for twoo whole yeeres, in that holy See shee had plaid the naughty packe, at laste goeinge in Procession about the Cittie, in the sighte of al her Cardinalles, and Bishoppes felle in trauaile openly in the streates?

M. Hardinge.

Firste who seeth not, * what a notorious lye they make in the preface and entrie to the mater? *By the Answeare it wil

appeare, that this lie is plaine Truthe.

Saie they not, they take not vpon them, at this time to bringe to lighte and to the shewe of the world those dooinges, whiche ought rather together with the Auctoures of them to be buried? And that so to doo, their Religion, their shamefastnes, their blushinge doothe not beare it? VVhat is a lye, if this be not? Doo they not in deede, that they denie in woorde? Yea, saie they not that thinge, which they affirme they saie not?

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

I doubte not, good Reader, but perusinge these fewe folowinge, thou shalte plainely se, that the Authoures of this Apologie spake not al, that they might wel haue spoken. But, if thou happen to reade Dantes, Petrarcha, Boccase, Mantuan, Valla, and others like, the Popes owne Derlinges, thou wilt certainely saie, that euen nowe, beinge thus chalenged, and called forth, and required to speake, yet we haue rather geuen an inklinge hereof, then opened the particulare secretes of the mater. For thereof S. Bernarde saithe thus, Quæ in occulto fiunt ab Episcopis, turpe est vel dicere: *It is shame to vtter the thinges, that Bisshoppes doo in theire secretes.* And therefore he saithe further, euen as did the Writer of the Apologie, Melius itaque arbitror super hoc dissimulare: *Touchinge suche maters, I thinke it better to dissemble.* Franciscus Petrarcha calleth Rome the VVhoore of Babylon, the Mother of al Idolatrie, and Fornication, and saith, that al shame, and reuerence is quite departed thence. Baptista Mantuanus saithe:

Bernard. ad Clerum in Synodo Rhemen.

Eodem loco.

Fran. Petrar. Epist. 10.

Franc. Petrar. Cantilena 92.

Onde fugita ogni vergogna.

Viuere qui Sanctè cupitis, discedite Roma:
Omnia cùm liceant, non licet esse bonum.

Al ye, that woulde liue godly, be packinge from Rome. For there al thinges els are Lawful: but to be good it is not Lawful. And againe, as it is alleged once before,

Baptist. Mantuanus.

Sanctus ager scurris, venerabilis Ara Cynædis
Seruit, honorandæ Diuûm Ganymedibus Ædes.

Hereby, M. Hardinge, ye maie easily se, that we of pourpose dissembled, and couered your shame, and spake muche lesse, and farre otherwise of you, then we might haue spoken.

Erasmus in vita Augustini,

Erasmus, writinge of S. Augustines dealinge against the Manichees, saithe thus, Obscœna Mysteria Manichæorum protraxit in lucem. Nam hæc prodidisse, erat vicisse: *He opened, and published the filthy Mysteries of the* Manichees. *For the very openinge thereof, was sufficiente to ouerthrowe them.* But happy are they, that liue in such sorte, that no man maie wel reurle their life without blushinge.

Here, M. Hardinge, ye charge vs plentifully with Fables, and Sclaunders, and heapes of Lies, greate, fowle, lewde, and shameful, in one companie, al togeather. Wherein it was no great Papistrie for you to be so liberal: for that hereof ye want no stoare.

But if we shalbe hable clearely, and plainely to auouche, and iustifie eche thinge, that we haue spoken, then we doubte not, but ye wil take al these Lies home againe, and bestowe them freely emonge your selues.

M. Hardinge.

Crimes laide to the Popes charge by the Defenders.

They be the Popes Canonistes (saie they) that haue taughte the people, that simple Fornication is no sinne. A grieuous offense, and woorthy to be punished. And verily if any Pope euer knew, that his learned menne in the Canon lawe haue taught the people suche heathenishe, and diuelishe Doctrine, (a) though no man in Earthe be his iudge, yet he maie be thought vnwoorthy the roome of so greate charge. But if the Pope neuer knewe suche Doctrine preached by the Canonistes, and if at no time there haue benne any suche, then is he cleare, and yee are proued slaunderers, and false backebyters. VVee denie it vtterly. Howe proue ye it? Mary Sir, saie ye, looke in the margente of our Apologie, and there yee shal finde one *John de Magistris*, noted for an Offender in that behalfe. VVel, if it were so, he was but one man. Yee speake of Canonistes, which woorde signifieth a number. And howe proue ye that he the saide *John de Magistris*, (for nowe, I wil spare you, and wil not saie they) taught the people that simple fornication was no sinne? &c.

(a) Vntruth. For the Canonistes themselues confesse, that the Councel maie iudge, and depose the Pope.

Nowe wee tel you, that wee cannot finde, where euer *Johannes de Magistris* wrote so impiously, as yee reporte. Is it not *Martinus de Magistris* that yee meane? It is a greate rashenesse, if ye haue

Simple Fornication.

haue not reade it your selues, to beleue such (b) pelting writers, that be of your sectes, as yee doo by whome ye seeme to be most shamefully, and most dangerously deceiued, &c. What wil be thought & saide of you, if wee shewe plainly, that ye haue forged a fowle lie, and a most false slaunder vpon Martinus de Magistris? For so wil we cal him, vntil ye proue it of Iohannes.

This Martinus de Magistris was no Canonist, as ye say, but a Doctour of Diuinitie, wel learned for his time & order of studie, as a scholeman. In a treatise, that he made, *De temperantia & de luxuria*, he disputeth after such manner, as the Scholastical Doctours commonly vse. Wherfore he that saieth that he taught the people, sought by vntruth, how to make the matter more detestable. (c) For disputing in Schooles and teaching the people be far asunder. Saith this Doctour Martin after the guise of schooles, *Quæritur vtrùm simplex fornicatio sit peccatũ mortale*, that is to say, It is a questiõ, whether simple fornication be mortal sinne. (d) This Defender knewe what hee did, when he left out the word mortal. For being disposed to lie, he thought best, to lie for a vantage. Now this is to be vnderstood, how the maner of the scholastical Doctors is, first to propoũd a questiõ, next to argue, obiect & reason against the truth of the question: Thẽ to auouch & proue the truth: After that to soile the obiections brought against the truth: Lastly to bring conclusions for confirmation of the Trueth. Then in prosecuting of his question, *Arguitur quòd non*, I reason against it, saith he, and argue it is not so. And there after the schoole maner, he maketh an argument against the trueth. Which argument who soeuer taketh for his purpose, and alloweth it, admitteth that the Doctor goeth against & disproueth. After this he commeth to proue the trueth. And there it foloweth, *In oppositum. Simplex fornicatio excludit, &c.* To the contrary (saith hee) Simple fornication excludeth from the kingdome of God, Ergo, it is mortal sinne. Then he saith further. It is to be noted, that the (e) opinion of Thomas is, that simple fornication vndoubtedly is mortal sinne. Who so euer readeth further in Martinus, he shal finde, after he hath wel disputed Pro and Con, as they terme it in Schooles, that is to say, for, & against the trueth, that he putteth sixe conclusions, of which the fourth beginneth thus, *Ideò, &c*, Therefore simple fornication is mortal sinne, bicause it is forbidden by Gods lawe, &c. And in the ende of the sixth, he saith: Hereof the falsehod of their opinion is made euident, who say, that simple fornication is not mortal sinne. Which opinion is condemned in the Articles of them of Paris, Error. CLXXXVI. Then hee saith further. Guido the Carmelite saieth in a Chapter *Contra Errores Græcorum*, that the errour of the Greekes, saying simple fornication betweene a single man and a single woman not to be mortal sinne, openly conteineth Heresie against the holy scripture, and that he proueth by foure reasons, &c.

(b) *This pelting writer is Alphonsus de Castro, one of M. Hardings greatest Doctors.*

(c) *He that teacheth in scholes, is teather of teachers.*

(d) *Note by the way, that by M. Hardings secrete conclusion, Fornication is not a mortal, but a Venial sinne.*

(e) *Ergo, by lykelihood the opinõ of others was otherwise. For trial of this Conclusion, see the answeare.*

By this, and much more there expressed, it is sufficiently proued, that Martinus de Magistris in his scholastical disputations in the saide treatise, saith not that simple fornication is no sinne: much lesse can it be reasonably, or with any colour of honestie said, that so he taught the people. And therefore it is falsely and slaunderously imputed vnto him.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Here ye saie, We lie: we backbite: we slaunder, &c. For answeare hereunto, first we saie, It is no new diuise, to make light, and simple accompt of your simple Fornication. **For** Aetius **the olde Heretique vsed thus to saie,** Dormire cum muliere extra coniugium, non magis est peccatum, quàm aurem scalpere: *To haue the companie of a Woman out of marriage, is no more a sinne, then it is for a man to clawe his eare.* **Likewise the Heretique** Prodicus saide, Licet palam, & apertè Fornicari: It is lawful *to commit open fornication.* **Likewise not long sithence wrote** Laurentius Valla, **in earnest, or in game, I cannot tel: but thus he wrote: and he wrote it in Rome, being himself one of the** Canons **there:** Omninò nihil interest, vtrùm cum Marito coeat Mulier, an cum Amatore: *Vndoubtedly there is no difference, whether a Womã keepe company with her Husbande, or with her Louer.* Richardus de sancto Victore **saieth,** Paulus præuidebat, multos fore, qui Fornicationis malum non adeò damnabile putarent: S. Paule *foresawe, there should be many, that would thinke,* the il of Fornication not to be so damnable a matter. **To like purpose** Socrates **writeth of the corrupt iudgement of sundrie of his time:** Scortationem indifferentem esse putant: De Festis verò diebus, perinde atque pro animabus suis dimicant, inuertentes Mandata Dei, &c: *They take* Fornication, or whooredom **to** bee a thing indifferent, (**that is to saie, neither good, nor il, but left at libertie**): *But they fight for the keeping of their holy dayes, as for their Soules.* **From these fathers, as it appeareth, issued out the Pope, and his Romaine Clergie, who haue learned so readily to swalow a Camel, and so nicely, and solemnely to straine a Gnatte.**

Epiphan. lib. 3 Hæres. 36. & Clemẽs Stromat. Li. 3. Laur. Valla, De voluptate Lib. 1. cap. 18 Rich. de Sancto victore, Par. 2. Fol. 73. Socrat. lib. 5. cap. 22.

But, yee wil say, Al this hithertoo perteineth nothing vnto the Canonistes, specially in the plural number.

Simple Fornication.

Let vs therefore see the practise of the Churche of Rome: which is the life, and seule of the Canonistes. Thus therefore it is noted in the Decrees, Qui nno habet Vxorẽ, loco illius cõcubinam debet habere: *He that hath not a* Wife, *in steede of her* must haue a Concubine. Ye wil say, There is errour in the print. Be it so. Yet thus is it extant in many Copies, and it is wel agreeable to your common practise. For the best that you can make of the same place, is this: Is, qui non habet Vxorem, & pro Vxore Concubinam habet, a communione non repellatur: *He, that hath no* Wife, *and in steede of a* Wife hath a Concubine, let him not be remoued from the Communion.

Dist. 34. Is qui Parisijs. anno. 1305.

Concil. Tolet. 1. cap. 17.

Addition ☞ Heere is good geare, M. Iewel, for you to iuggle withal. And how can it be, but that your selfe doo knowe, that you doo impudently? You peruerte the text: you misconster it: you leaue out that goeth before, and that foloweth immediately after. You dissemble the circumstance of the place, and omitte the Chapter, that in Gratian goeth immediately before: in which Chapter he declareth what in that place, and certaine other there by him alleged is meant by a Concubine, saying, *Concubina hic intelligitur, qua, cessantibus Legalibus instrumentis, Vnita est, & coniugalis affectu asciscitur. Hanc Coniugem facit affectus: Concubinam verò Lex nominat*, &c. Yea the Canons also doo name such a woman a Concubine sometimes, and not a wife, vntil the Marriage bee solemnized &c. In this sentence therfore he expoundeth, how the woorde Concubine is to be taken in those Canons, as much to say, for a wife priuately taken, without publike solemnization &c. As soone as that wryting was made, and publike solemnitie was performed, the Children borne before, were accompted lawfully borne, and the Concubine too haue beene a wife from the beginning. And this woman the lawe nameth in the meane time a Concubine, and not a whoore, &c.

Addition.

M. Hard. 396. a.

397. a.

This is as much as no wyfe at all. Then before the Solemnization of mariage she was no wyfe.

Shee may be called a Concubine, which in deede is a true wife before God, and so shal you finde *Concubina* vsed in the scriptures.

The Answeare. O, what a doo haue you made vs heere, M. Harding, in defense of your Concubines? If the matter had beene good, I doubt not, but you would haue mainteined it a greate deale better. A Concubine, you say) the solemnization onely excepted, is taken for a very lawefull wyfe: And for proofe hereof, you haue brought vs Scriptures, Doctours, Gloses, and Canons: and all this, as it may bee thought, in defense of your Priestes Concubines. A Concubine (you sait) is a wyfe in affection, a wife before God, and a very wyfe indeede. I maruelle much at your strange Commentaries, M. Harding: For your Texte is directly too the contrary. And heere I bid you not ouer much too trouble your eies, and too espie, either what goeth before, or what followeth after. In the very selfe same woordes, that I haue alledged, you may easily finde difference betweene a wyfe, and a Concubine. For thus it is written, Is, qui Vxorem non habet, & pro Vxore habet Concubinam, a Communione non repellatur: *Hee, that hath not a wyfe, but in steede of a wyfe, hath a* Concubine, *let him not bee put from the Communion.* You say, a wyfe, and a Concubine are both one thing. But your booke saieth, Neither a Concubine is a wyfe, nor a wyfe is a Concubine. Marke well the woordes. Thus they stande: *Hee that hath not a* wyfe, *but in steede of a* wyfe, *hath a* Concubine. It were a very straunge kinde of speache, too saie, *Hee, that hath not a* wyfe, *but in steede of a* wyfe, *hath a* wyfe: Yet thus must you needes say, if a wyfe, and a Concubine bee both one thing. But all this is easily answeared. For you say, That a woman is a Concubine, that is taken priuately, and not Married solemnely in the face of the Churche. Fye, M. Harding, why shoulde you thus vainely abuse your friendes? Is this your meaning, that a Concubyne is married, although not solemnely, and openly in the Churche? Who euer tolde you of such a Marriage? Or, howe can you so suddainely forgette your selfe? See not these your owne woordes, in this very selfe place? A Concubine is a woman, kepte at bedde, and at bourde, as a Wyfe with intent of Wedlocke? If shee bee wedded already, howe is shee kepte with intent of Wedlocke? If shee bee not a Wyfe in deede, howe is shee kepte in bedde, and at bourde, as, or in steede of a Wyfe? Verily, M. Harding, a Concubine, while shee was a Concubine, was neuer married: neither openly, nor priuately, as it shall appeare: but afterwarde, beeing once married, shee was no longer called a Concubine.

398. b.

Dist. 34. Is qui.

With intente of Wedlocke.

And that you may the better vnderstande, howe substantially we haue dealt in this

Simple Fornication.

in this case, it maie please you to knowe, that the Lawe saith, Concubinatus est inter Solutum, & Solutam: Concubinatus *is* (not betweene Man, and VVife, but) *betweene a Single Man, and a Single Woman*. And, he that kepeth a Concubine, is not in ỳ Lawe called Maritus, but Amasius, that is to saie, *Not a Husbande, but a Louer*: and the same Louer might either refuse his Concubine, or be refused of her, when either of them would, without any Diuorse, or other solemnitie, at their pleasures. The Children betweene them begotten, onelesse Patrimonie folowe, are not Legitimate, but liue in Bastardie. It is written, Concubina æquiparatur Vxori, affectu, non honore Matrimonij: *A* Concubine *is compared with a Wife in affection of Loue, but not in honour of Matrimonie*. A Concubine maie be receiued as a VVitnesse for her Louer, but a Wife maie not be receiued as a Witnesse for her Husbande. The very state, wherein they liue, is called in the Lawe, Crimen Concubinatus, that is, *The Sinne of that trade of life*: For the Lawe presumeth, they cannot liue honestly. And, if any man defile an other mannes Concubine, he is not thoughte in Lawe to committe Adulterie, neither can he, that kepeth a Concubine, enter an Action againste him, that hathe defiled her, onlesse he, that kepeth her, be his Patrone, or his Lorde. I dare not, to note theise places severally in the Margine: for then, M. Hardinge, you woulde rebuke me, as your manner is, for shewinge my greate skille in Canon Lawe.

Single Amasius. Foresake. *ff. De Concubinis.* Bastardie. Affection. VVitnesse. Sinne. No Adulterie. *Nisi sit Concubina Patroni.*

But nowe, I beseche you, what kinde of Marriage can you imagine to be, inter Solutum, & Solutam, that is to saie, *betweene a* Single Man, *and a* Single VVoman? If they be bothe Single, howe be they Married? If they be Married, how be they Single? Or, wil you saie, that a Woman that neuer was Married: that maie lawfully refuse her Paramour when she wil, and be lawfully refused of him at his pleasure: that liueth without the honoure of Marriage: that by presumption of Lawe cannot liue honestly: whoes Life is infamous: whoes Children are al in state of Bastardie: that maie be defiled by any other wicked man, without committinge Adulterie: Al theise thinges notwithstandinge, wil you saie, that suche a woman is a good, and a Lawful VVife? Or, wil you bringe vs Scriptures, & Doctours to proue the same? If your Mother had benne suche a Wife, M. Hardinge, yewis you coulde not haue benne made a Priestе, without a special Dispensation. Verily, as you saie, A Concubine is a Lawful VVife, so maie you likewise saie, A Lawful VVife is a Concubine. To be shorte, if a VVife, and a Concubine be bothe one thinge, why dothe the Pope so easily allowe a Priestе to kepe a Concubine, and so straitely forbid him to haue a VVife?

But you saie, I haue fowly corrupted mine Authour, and haue pourposely leafte out, bothe, that went before, and also that folowed after in the same Distinction. Therefore let vs better consider these wordes, bothe backewarde, and forewarde, and of euery side. First, Gratian in the Chapter goeinge immediately before, as you your selfe haue alleged him, saithe thus, Concubina hic intelligitur, quæ, cessantibus legalibus instrumentis vnita est, & coniugali affectu ascisitur: *Here a* Concubine *is suche a woman, as is coupled vnto a man, without lawful instrumentes, or solemnization of Matrimonie, and is taken with intent, and affection of Marriage*. Marke wel these wordes, M. Hardinge: *A Woman that is taken with intente, and affection of Marriage*. These be your owne wordes, although vntruely, and guilefully Englished. Notwithstandinge, we wil take them, as they be. If a Concubine be taken with intente of Marriage, then, I trowe, as yet she is not Married. For no wise man intendeth to do that thinge, that is donne already. Nowe, if a Concubine be not married, but onely keapt with intente to be married, I praie you, M. Hardinge, what maie we calle her? Certainely your Doctoures saie, Secundum Canones semper præsumitur Adulterium, nisi apareant Legales Solemnitates: *Onlesse the Solemnities of the Lawe maie appeare, by the* Canon Lawe *it is euer presumed to be Adulterie*, and therefore no Marriage. Thus mutche for the Chapter, that wente before. In the Chapter immediately folowinge, it is written thus, Christiano non nisi vnam tantùm habere licet, aut Vxorem, aut certè, loco Vxoris, Si Coniunx deest, Concubinam: *It is Lawful for a Christian man to haue onely one woman, either his* VVife, *or in steede of a* VVife, *his* Concubine. Here a

VVith intente of Marriage.

Dist. 34. *Is qui in Glossa.*

Dist. 34. *Christiano.*

A Concubine. A vvhore. In ſteede of a VVife.

Concubine is not a VVife, but a woman taken in ſteede of a VVife. That poure Gloſe here telleth vs of Mutual conſente, is but a toie. For, notwithſtandinge any manner Conſente, that maie be betweene them, a Concubine, while ſhe is a Concubine, is not married: and beinge not married, ſhe is no VVife. Therefore S. Auguſtine ſaithe, euen as you haue alleged him: Etſi non habetis Vxores, tamen non licet vobis habere Concubinas, quas poſteà dimittatis: *Although you haue no Wiues, yet is it not lawful for you, to haue Concubines, whome yee maie afterwards putte from you.* If Concubines be nothinge els, but VViues, why is it not lawful for menne to haue them? Is it not lawful for Chriſtian menne to haue Wiues? Yet poure Rubrike, vpon the ſame Diſtinction ſaithe thus, Qui non habet Vxorem, loco illius Concubinam habere licet: Geue hereto the beſte Engliſhe ye can deuiſe: The woordes be plaine: *It is lawful for him, that hathe no* VVife, *in ſteede of her to haue a* Concubine.

Aug. Li. 50. Homil. Homilia. 49

Diſt. 34. Is qui

But S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Dicet aliquis, Meretrix non eſt, quam habeo: Concubina mea eſt: *Somme man will ſaie, The Woman that I keepe is not my Harlot: ſhee is my* Concubine. Hereto S. Auguſtine anſwereth thus: Bene: velis, nolis: illa, quæ præter Vxorem tecum dormit, eſt Meretrix: *Wel, wel: whether thou wilte, or wilte not, ſhee that ſleepeth with thee beſides thy Wife,* is thy Harlot. S. Hierome ſaithe, Vnde ſine Nuptijs, aliud nomen Vxorum? Imò vnde nouum Concubinarum genus? Plus inferam. Vnde Meretrices vniuiræ? Eadem domo, vno cubiculo, Sæpè vno tenentur & lectulo &c. *From whence haue wee an other kinde of Wiues without Marriage? Nay, from whence haue wee this newe kinde of Concubines? I will ſaie more: From whence haue wee Whores betaken to one man? They liue togeather in one Houſe, in one Chamber, and oftentimes in one bedde.*

Aug. de tempore Serm. 164.

Thy Harlot.

Hieronym. ad Euſtochium. de Cuſtodia Virginita. Tom. 1.

Nowe, M. Hardinge, you telle vs, that Concubina, is not a VVhoore. But S. Auguſtine telleth you, Velis, nolis, eſt Meretrix: *Whether yee wil, or nil, ſhee is a* VVhoore. And S. Hierome telleth you, that Concubina eſt Meretrix Vniuira: *That a* Concubine *is a* VVhoore *betaken to one man.* If Meretrix, be a VVhoore, it is eaſie to Engliſhe Concubina.

Theſe be fowle maters, M. Hardinge: you cannot mainteine them without ſomme blemiſhe of your credite.

Likewiſe it is noted in the Gloſe vpon the Conſtitutions of Otho: Videtur quòd hoc Crimen Meretricij Eccleſia ſub diſſimulatione tranſire debeat: *It ſeemeth, that the Churche oughte to paſſe ouer the* Crime of VVhooredome vnder diſſimulation (and not to ſée it). In whiche Gloſe ye ſhal finde theſe woordes, Si non caſtè, tamen cautè: If you doo it not chaſtely, yet doo it charily.

Conſtit. Othonis De Concubinis Clericor. remouendu. Licet ad profugandum. in Gloſſa.

Addition. M. Hardinge. As for thoſe woordes, *Si non caſtè, tamen cautè,* they are there rehearſed, as a Common ſayinge, not as a Rule, or Precept of the Canon Lawe, neither perteine they to Clerkes, more then to the Laye ſorte. The circumſtance of the place conſidered, and weighed, al thinges maie ſeeme there to be wel, and diſcretely ſaide. Of twoo, that committe Fornication, he doothe leſſe euil, that doothe it ſecretely, then the other that doothe it openly &c. Howe ſhal not that vulgare ſaying ſeeme to geue good counſel, *Si non caſtè, tamen cautè:* whereby a man is not animated at al to doo il, but (if he hap to doo his vncleane luſte, or wil not be ſtaide from it) is admoniſhed to doo it charily, thoughe not chaſtely.

Addition.

M. Har. 399. b

Not as a Rule.

Good Counſel.

The Anſweare. Theſe woordes (yée ſaie) perteine no more to Clerkes, then to the Lay ſorte. Here, M. Hardinge, ye muche forgeate your ſelfe. The very bare title of that Conſtitution wil ſone reproue you. Thus it is written, De Concubinis Clericorum remouendis: *Of remouinge Prieſtes Concubines,* not the Concubines of others of the Laie ſorte, as you haue imagined. For of Laie menne, and their Concubines, there is not one woorde ſpoken in al that whole Conſtitution. Contrariwiſe a litle before, in the ſame place you maie finde theſe woordes, Clerici huiuſmodi Concubinas tenent Communiter, apparatu honeſto, nomine appellationis Sororiæ: *Prieſtes Commonly keepe ſuche Concubines, in honeſt apparel, vnder the name of their Siſters.* Of ſuche Concubines, M. Hardinge, and of none other, your Booke intreateth. But, it maie be lawful for you, to make vs large Commentaries beſide youre Texte. Of poure Prieſtes Concubines, M. Hardinge, and of none other, your Doctour ſaithe, Si non caſtè, tamen cautè: *If they deale not chaſtely, yet let them deale charily.*

But

Simple Fornication.

But this (pou ſaie) was onely a Common ſaieinge, and not a Rule. And is not this ſufficient, thinke pou? Can pou imagine, that the Common ſpeache of the people is nothinge worthe, or groweth of nothinge? It was no Rule, pou ſaie. But the worlde ſawe, pée liued ſo, as if it had benne pour onely Rule. Uerily, by the Teſtimonie of al pour owne Writers, the whole Life of the Clergie, was out of Rule. Howe be it, pou telle vs, The circumſtance conſidered, al this maie ſeeme, to be wel, and diſcretely ſpoken. For, pou ſaie, If a man happen to doo his vncleane luſte, he is thereby admoniſhed to doo it chaſtely, thoughe he doo it not chaſtely. And this (pou ſaie) is good counſell. No doubt, M. Hardinge, good, and diſcrete, and fatherly Counſel. But S. Paules Counſel is mutch better, Ad euitandum Fornicationem vnuſquiſque Vxorem ſuam habeat: melius eſt nubere, quàm vri: *For auoidinge of Fornication, let euery man haue his owne Wife: Better it is to marrie, then to burne in deſires.* 1. Corinth. 7.

Likewiſe ſaithe Petrus Rauennâs, one of pour notable Canoniſtes, vpon the Decretalles, Quamuis tactus, & oſcula ſunt præludia incontinentiæ in Laicis, ſecùs tamen eſt in Clericis. Nam Clericus præſumitur iſta facere pro charitate, & bono zelo: *Notwithſtandinge handelinge, and kiſſinge in* Laie Perſones *be the occaſions, or beginninges of incontinente behaueour, yet in* Prieſtes *it is farre otherwiſe*. For a Prieſte is preſumed to doo theſe thinges of charitie, and of good zele. In eadem Gloſſa Extra. De Immunita Eccleſiæ. Petr. Rauennâs

Likewiſe it is noted in pour Gloſe, Si Clericus amplectitur Mulierem, (Laicus) interpretabitur, quòd cauſa benedicendi eam hoc faciat: *If a* Prieſte *embrace a Woman, a* Laie man *muſte iudge of it thus, that he doothe it to thintente to bleſſe her*. Where alſo pée ſhal finde this ſpecial note, ſet out in the Margine for the pourpoſe, Clericus amplectens mulierem præſumitur bene agere: A Prieſte embracing a woman is preſumed to doo wel. 11. quæ. 3. Abſit. in Gloſſa. ibidem in Margine.

Theſe be pour Canoniſtes: theſe be pour Schoolemaiſters: theſe be pour Doctours, M. Hardinge: thus they write, not onely in the Singulare, but alſo in the Dual, and Plural number. Thei would neuer ſo lightly haue iudged hereof, if thei had thought, pour Simple Fornication had benne Sinne.

S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Clamor Sodomorum, & Gomorrhæorum multiplicatus eſt: Quia non ſolùm iam apud eos non puniebantur illa flagitia, verùm etiam publicè, velut lege, frequentabantur: *The crie of* Sodome, *and* Gomorrha *is multiplied: For that ſuche vices then, not onely were not pounished, but alſo were openly vſed, as it had bene by the aide, and Authoritie of the Lawe.* Auguſt. in Enchiridio ad Lauren. ca. 80.

Somme what it muſt nédes be, that in pour Late Councel of Baſile, enforced the Biſhops there to Decrée, that Fornication ſhoulde be Sinne. For onleſſe ſomme had thought the Contrarie, what ſhoulde wée haue néded that Newe Decree? Or, why ſhoulde they ſo ſolemnely determine, that Fornication is Sinne, Onleſſe ſomme had ſaid, It is no Sinne? Eraſmus, a man of ſingulare Learninge, & Iudgemente, ſaithe, *Bona pars eorum, quos vulgus integros, & incorruptos appellat, Simplicem Fornicationem, & moderatum voluptatis vſum, vt leue commiſſum, neutiquam refugiunt: *A great many of them, whom the common ſorte taketh for good, and godly men, not a Whit abhorre* Simple Fornication, *and a ſober vſe of pleaſure, reckening it to be but a litle petite fault.* So ſaithe Iacobus De Valentia, Tam Iudæi, quàm Saraceni, & mali Chriſtiani, vt deteſtabilem vitam ſuam excuſent, & defendant, aſſerunt, Fornicationem Simplicem eſſe licitam: *As wel* Iewes, *as* Saracens, *as alſo* il Christian Men, *to the intente to excuſe, and defende theire wicked life, ſaie*, Simple Fornication maie be lawfully vſed. Concil. Baſil. Seſſion. 20. Eraſmus in Enchirid. milit. chriſtiani. ca. 14. * He meaneth ſomme of the beſte of the Romaine Clergie. Iacobus De Valentia in Pſa. 118

So ſaithe Antoninus, the Archebiſhop of Florence, Confutatur error dicentium, Simplicem Fornicationem non eſſe Peccatum: *Hereby is reproued the errour of them, that ſaie*, Simple Fornication is no Sinne. Alexander of Hales, by waie of Diſputation, doubteth not to allege the wordes of S. Ambroſe, to this pourpoſe: Etiamſi aliquis lubricum Carnis patiatur, ſine dubio vapulabit: ſed non peribit: *If a man ſuffer the Frailtie of the Fleaſhe, without doubte he ſhalbe pounished:* but periſhe he ſhal not. Antoninus in Sum par. 4. titu. 22. ca. 2. § 3. Alexander Halenſis par. 3. qua. 35. Mem. 5. Ambroſius, 1. Timoth. 4.

Thus haue pou, M. Hardinge, not onely, what poure Canoniſtes, but alſo what pour Schoole Doctours haue taught, and thought of Simple Fornication.

But there is noted in the Margine of the Apologie, Iohannes de Magiſtris, in

Simple Fornication.

M. Har. pag. 46. Reade the B. of VVincheſtr vnto N. Feckham. Pag. 111. Vint. Con. Cantu. Li. 3. De Euchar. M. Har. pag. 93. Chryſoſtom ad Romanos. 1. Chryſ. ad Galat. 4. Hitronym. in Marcum, cap. 2. Matthæ. 27. De Reſcriptis, Significauit, Abb. Alphonſus Contra Hæreſ. Li. 5. Coitus.

ſtæde of Martinus. And herof haue you made youre ſelfe a pleſante Conqueſte. VVee reade not (you ſaie) theſe Bookes our ſelues: wee beleeue ſuche peltinge writers of our ſectes: wee are ſhamefully, and dangerouſly deceiued. Howbe it, M. Hardinge, I require but your indifferente Judgemente: Speake vprightly. Wherefore is it more deadly Sinne for vs, to name Iohannes, in ſtæde of Martinus, then it was for you, in this ſelfe ſame Woke, to name Captaine Ioſue, in ſtæde of the Prophete Oſee? Or, for one of your Brethren, to allege Hoſius, for Athanaſius? Or, for D. Steuin Gardiner, in ſtæde of Theophylactus, to allege Theophylus? Cicero alſo allegeth Aiax, in ſtæde of Hector: Agamemnon, in ſtæde of Vlyſſes: Eupolis, in ſtæde of Ariſtophanes. Ariſtotle allegeth Calypſo in ſtæde of Circe. Your Gratian allegeth Aniceus, for Anicetus: Ambroſius, for Auguſtinus: and by your owne Confeſſion, Calixtus, for Anacletus. S. Chryſoſtome nameth Abacuk, for Sophonias: and Agar in ſtæde of Sara. S. Marke allegeth Abiathar, for Abimelech. S. Mathewe nameth Hieremias, for Zacharias.

It had benne no greate prejudice vnto youre cauſe, to haue diſſembled ſo ſmal a mater, ſpecially findinge your ſelfe ſo often guilty in the ſame. Your own Doctours ſaie, Error in nomine non habet vitiare, modò conſtet de Corpore: *Errour in name marreth not the mater, ſo the Bodie, or partie be knowen.*

But this ſame Martinus (pæ ſaie) neuer denied Fornication to be deadly Sinne: but by expreſſe woordes affirmeth the contrarie. For trial hereof, it maie pleaſe you to geue ſome credite to Alphonſus de Caſtro your owne Doctour. His woordes be theſe, Græci, vt Guido illis impingit, dicunt, Simplicem Fornicationem non eſſe peccatum. Martinus de Magiſtris in ſuo libro, De Temperantia, quæſtione ſecunda de Luxuria dicit, ſe fateri, Fornicationem Simplicem eſſe Peccatum Mortale. Tamen dicit inſuper, quòd oppoſitum credere, non ſit Hæreticum: quia, vt dicit, Teſtimonia Scripturæ Sacræ non ſunt expreſſa: *The* Greekes, *as* Guido *chargeth them ſaie, that* Simple Fornication is no Sinne. Martinus de Magiſtris *in his Booke, Of Temperance, and in the ſeconde queſtion, diſputinge of Lecherie, graunteth in deede, that* Simple Fornication is deadly Sinne. *And yet he ſaith,* It is no Hereſie to beleeue the contrarie: *for that, as he ſaithe, the Teſtimonies of the Scriptures* (touchinge this mater) *are not plaine.* Here, M. Hardinge, pæ haue your owne Doctours minde. Martinus ſaithe, It is no Hereſie, to beleue, that Simple Fornication is no Sinne: And this he ſaithe euen in the very ſame Woke that he hathe written, De Temperantia. So dangerouſly, M. Hardinge, and ſo ſhamefully are wee deceiued, in alleginge your peltinge Doctours.

And therefore Alphonſus concludeth thus, Sed cum pace illius dixerim, ego credo, Martinum, alioqui virum Doctum, in hac parte erraſſe: *But, to ſpeake with his fauour, I beleeue, that* Martinus de Magiſtris *in this behalfe was muche deceiued.*

M. Hardinge.

After this fowle lie foloweth an (a) other. Let him remember (ſaie theſe Defenders) that they be his men that haue decreed, that a Prieſte for Fornication ought not to be remoued from his cure. To this may wee ſaie, that althoughe he be not depriued of his cure, yet he maie be pouniſhed otherwiſe. But let vs ſee, howe they woulde proue that they ſaie. (b) By theire note in the Margent they ſende vs for prouſe to the canon Lawe. *3. quæſt. 7. Lata. Extra de Bigamis. Quia circa.* As touchinge the chapter, *Lata*, in the Decrees wee finde none ſuche. And, in *Cauſa 3. quæſt. 7.* there is nothinge to this pourpoſe. The *Paragraphe Quia circa. Extra.* is vnderſtanded of them, who beinge in the ſtate of Bigamie, are not to be promoted to Holy orders, and not of one who is already made Prieſte, that he be not for Fornication remoued. But, to vnderſtande, what was donne to a Prieſte, that had committed fornication, by order of Lawe, (c) in caſe any Biſhop, or Prieſte, or deacon, after degree of deaconſhip taken, had benne conuict of fornication, or aduouterie, he was depoſed, and caſte out of the Churche, and enioined to doo penance emonge the laitie. VVhiche thing S. Sylueſter at lengthe mercifully changed, enioininge (d) tenne yeeres penance after a preſcripte forme, whiche to our newe Cleregie woulde ſeeme very harde, and ſtraite.

Yea further the Lawe of the Churche in this caſe ſo litle beareth with the ſinful life of Clerkes, that, (e) if any Biſhop in his Dioces had conſented and borne with the fornication of Prieſtes, or Deacon, or with the crime of inceſt, for money, or praier, or had not by auctoritie of his Biſhoply Office duely pouniſhed ſuche faultes committed: the ſame ſhoulde be ſuſpended from his Office. And this muche wee haue ſhewed touchinge the remouinge of a Prieſte, not onely from his Benefice, but alſo from his Office, for cauſe of fornication: wherein theſe menne moſte falſely haue ſlaundered the Churche,

(a) Vntruth. For this lie wil ſone be founde a Truthe.
(b) VVho beſtowed theſe quotations in the Margine, I cannot tel. But the Lawes are plaine: as it ſhal appeare. This was in old times. Now it is quite foregotten.
(d) An Hipocritical folie. For he maie redeme al this whole tenne yeeres faſte, by paying of a penny. Reade the Anſweare.
(e) Vntruth manifeſt, and a Canon of M. Hardings owne makinge.

Churche, as nowe to any man it maie (f) appeare.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Here, M. Hardinge, yé shewe your selfe to be mutche vnskilful in youre owne Canons. The simplest Proctoure in your Courtes coulde sone haue tolde you, that yé are ouer farre deceiued. For thus it is written by expresse wordes in your owne Glose vpon the Decrees: Dicunt, neminem hodiè propter Fornicationem esse deponendum, nisi in ea perduret: *They saie, that for* Fornication, *noman oughte this daie to be deposed, onlesse he continewe in the same.* And, leaste yé shoulde in any wise mistruste, or doubte your Glose, it is also thus noted of purpose in faire greate Letters in the margine, Fornicationis causa hodiè nemo est deponendus: Nowe a daies noman maie be deposed for Fornication. Were there nothing els to be saide, yet this thinge onely were sufficiente.

Not Deposed for Fornication.

(f) Ful clearely God wote. See the Answeare.

Dist. 82. *Presbyter.*

But Panormitane also your greatest Canoniste likewise saithe, Ad varietatem temporum debent mutari statuta humana: Ideò hodiè ex Simplici Fornicatione Clericus non deponitur: *The Lawes of Menne oughte to be altered accordinge to the change of times: And therefore nowe a daies* for Simple Fornication no Priest is deposed from his Benefice. Likewise ye haue it noted vpon your Decrees, Communiter dicitur, quòd pro Simplici Fornicatione Clericus deponi non debet: Quia pauci sine illo Vitio inueniuntur: *It is commonly saide, that* for Simple Fornication no Priest ought to be depriued: For that fewe Priestes are founde without that faulte.

Extra. De Consanguinita. & affinita. Non debet Abb. Dist. 81. Maximianus Glos.

Againe Panormitane saithe to like effecte, Clericus Concubinarius in officijs vitandus non est, nisi sit notorius: *A Priest, that keepeth a Concubine, onlesse he be notorious, maie not be refused in his Seruice.*

Extra. De Cohabita. Clericor. & Mulier. Si autem Abb.

Sundrie other suche like Authorities, your power Proctour could haue brought you.

Howe be it, you saie, S. Sylvester in suche cases enioineth tenne yeeres penance. This was true in deede, M. Hardinge. But it was true in Olde foorne péeres, about twelue hundred péeres agoe. Nowe Sylvester is paste quite out of minde, and his Lawe with him. Your owne folke nowe can saie, Nunc aliud tempus, alij pro tempore Mores.

Martinus Pœnitentiarius saithe, Ecclesia multos huiusmodi Canones exufflauit: quia oneros sunt: *The Churche hathe blowen awaie many suche Canons, for that they be too burthenous.* Loke better on your Bookes, M. Hardinge. Your owne Lawe saithe, Fornicationis causa nemo hodiè deponendus est: Quia Corpora hodiè sunt fragiliora: *Noman nowe a daies oughte to be depriued for* Fornication: *and that, bicause our Bodies are frailer, then they were woont to be.* And therfore, touchinge that cruel tenne yeeres Faste, appointed by Sylvesters Constitution, the Glose there saith thus, Potest ieiunare per alium: vel potest dare nummum pro Ieiunio: *He maie Faste by somme other man: or els, he maie geeue a* good Penny, *and so redeeme his whole tenne yeeres Faste.* But there is graceously added a special Prouiso in the behalfe of him, that shal receiue this Penny: Sed debet iste denarius esse talis, quòd non euincatur ab illo, cui donatur. Aliàs non contingeret liberatio: *But it must be suche a Penny, that it be neuer euicted againe by Lawe from him that receiued it. Otherwise he shoulde not be discharged of his penance.*

Martinus Pœnitentiarius in Dictionario.

Di 82. Presbyter. In Glossa.

In like manner saithe Pope Pelagius, Defectus nostri temporis, quibus Corpora ipsa hominum defecerunt, districtionis illius non patitur manere censuram: *The weakenesse of our time, by meane whereof the very Bodies of menne are decaied, dothe not suffer the rigour of that Lawe to continewe.*

Dist. 34. Fraternitatis.

Otho in his Constitution Legantine saithe, Remoueant ipsas intra Mensem: vel ipsas, vel alias de cœtero nullatenus detenturi: *Let Priestes put awaie theire Concubines within a Monethes respite: afterwarde to hold neither them, nor any others in any wise.* Wherupon the Glose, with greate conscience, and ful discretely saithe thus, Detenturi, scilicet, per Mensem. Alioqui diceremus, quòd propter quancunque momentaneam possessionis detentionem sequentem, hanc grauem pœnam incurreret. Quod nimis esset rigorosum, attenta fragilitate nostri temporis: *They maie not afterwarde holde* (neither the same Concubines, nor any other). *Whiche woordes you muste thus vnder-*

De Concubinis Clericor. remouendis. Licet ad profugandum.

Not Deposed for Fornication.

ſtand: That by the ſpace of a whole moneth togeather he maie not holde them. Otherwiſe wee ſhoulde ſaie, that a Prieſte ſhoulde renne into this greuous pouniſhmente, for any ſhorte holdinge of his Concubine in poſſeſſion folowinge afterwarde. Whiche thinge in deede were marueilous rigorous, ſpecially conſideringe the frailtie of our time.

In eadem Titulo

Againe the ſame Otho ſaithe, Ordinamus, vt, ſi contra hoc præſumpſerint venire, ab officio, & beneficio ſint ſuſpenſi: *Wee ordeine, that, if any Prieſte doo contrarie hereunto,* (ſtuinge incontinently, contrarie to this Conſtitution) *that then he be ſuſpended, as wel from his Benefice, as from his Office.* Hereunto youre Gloſe addeth, Riogoroſa quoque eſſet hæc pœna, niſi eſſet pro Adulterio, vel inceſtu: Etiamſi Epiſcopus eſſet huiuſmodi labens: *And this Pouniſhmente alſo were ouer rigorous, onleſſe it were for Aduouterie, or Inceſte: For he maie not ſo be pouniſhed for* Fornication) *Yea althoughe the partie ſo fallinge were a Biſhop.* And againe in the ſame Gloſe, Propter ſolam Simplicem Fornicationem, de benignitate Canonica, non debet Clericus deponi, vel Priuari: Licet ſecùs fortè de Canonis rigore: *By the Courteſie of the Canons, onely for* Simple Fornication, *a Prieſte maie not be depoſed from his Office, or deprined from his Benefice: Al beit, perhaps by the rigoure, or extremitie of the Canons, it woulde be otherwiſe.* The very true cauſe hereof, is more plainely expreſſed in your owne Gloſe vpon the Decretalles:

Extra. De Purgatione Canonica accepimus: In Gloſſa.

Quia pauci ſine vitio Carnis inueniuntur: *For without the vice of the Fleaſhe there are but fewe* (Prieſtes) *to be founde.*

At this notwithſtandinge, ye ſaie, If the Biſhop winke, and diſſemble, and beare with the wickedneſſe of the Prieſte in this behalfe, that then he him ſelfe oughte to be puniſhed by ſuſpenſion from his Office. This, M. Hardinge, is a Canon of youre owne makinge: for other Authoritie ye allege none. But howe maie it ſeme likely, that ye ſo cruelly pouniſh your Biſhoppes, for fauourable dealinge herein, ſeinge your Highe, and alonely Biſhop, and the Biſhop of al Biſhoppes, is ſo wel contente, vpon agreemente for money, to licence bothe Biſhoppes, and Prieſtes to keepe Concubines.

Extra. De Iudicijs, ca. 4. § De Adulterijs.

If ye miſtruſte the truthe hereof, beſides your Common practiſe, as you knowe, your owne Pope Gregorie him ſelfe wil ſone telle you, De Adulterio, & alijs Minoribus Criminibus, Epiſcopus poteſt cum Clericis poſt pœnitentiam diſpenſare: *Touchinge* Aduouterie, and other ſmal faultes, *the Biſhop after penance donne, maie diſpenſe with a Prieſte.* Where alſo it is to be noted, that Aduouterie in your Diuinitie is reckened emonge ſmal faultes, and petite Sinnes. Likewiſe againe it is to be noted in your Gloſe, Cum Presbyteris habentibus plures Concubinas, Epiſcopus poteſt diſpenſare, vt ſuum Officium exequantur: *With Prieſtes hauinge* ſundrie Concubines, *the Biſhop maie diſpenſe, that they maie neuertheleſſe doo theire Office.* Wherein ye ſeme ſommewhat to ouerreache the Emperoures Courteſie touchinge the ſame: For thus he writeth, Vnam Concubinam qui habet, non plures, Caſtè viuit: *He, that keepeth one Concubine onely, and no moe, liueth Chaſtely.* And in the ſaide former Gloſe, ye ſhal finde an other ſpecial note of your own, wel worthy to be written in ỹ Popes priuie Caſterte in Letters of Golde: Nota, quòd plures Concubinas habens non incurrit irregularitatem: *Marke wel, that he, that keepeth ſundrie Concubines, is not thereby made irregulare.* And againe, Nota, Mirabile: quòd cum eo, qui peccat, diſpenſatur: & cum eo, qui non peccat, non diſpenſatur: *Mare wel: Here is a marueilous ſtrange reckeninge: The Biſhop diſpenſeth with him that offendeth* (hauinge ſundrie Concubines): *but with him, that offendeth not* (hauinge married two Wiues) *he diſpenſeth not.* And further he ſaithe,

Extra. De Bigamis. Quia Circa: In Gloſſa. Authen. De Trien. & Semiſ. Colla. 3.

Extra. De Bigamis: Quia Circa. In Gloſſa. In eadem Gloſſa

Id eadem Gloſſa

Plus habet hic Luxuria, quàm Caſtitas: *Here Lecherie hathe more Prleuilege, then Chaſtitie.*

Againe in your Decrees it is written thus, Quæcunque Clericis taliter coniunctæ ſunt, auferantur ab Epiſcopo, & venundentur: *What ſo euer weemen haue ſutche companie with Prieſtes, let them be remoued by the Biſhop, and ſolde, and made ſlaues.* Unto this Laine beinge in it ſelfe ouer rigorous, the Gloſe addeth this fauourable Conſtruction: Venundentur: verum eſt, ſi contrahunt cum illis, tanquam cum Vxoribus. Aliàs non concedo, poſſe vendi propter Simplicem Fornicationem: *Lette them be ſolde, and made ſlaues. This is true,* if the Prieſtes marrie with them, as with theire VVriues. *Otherwiſe I graunte not, that for* Simple Fornication *they maie be ſolde.*

Diſt. 81. Quidam Clerici. In Gloſſ.

Likewiſe

Not deposed for Fornication.

Likewise againe it is noted in your Glose, Nota, Frequentationem tantùm Viduarum, & Virginum prohiberi: *Marke wel, that it is not the commune to Widowes, or Maides, but the often hauntinge vnto them, that is forebidden.* Otho in his Legantines **saithe thus**, Qui detinet publicè Concubinas, &c. *The Priest, that* Openly *keepeth Concubines, let him be deposed.* **Hereupon** your Glose saithe thus, Tu dic, Publicè, quando Multitudini se patere non expauit. Secùs ergo, si secretè intra domum propriam, vel alienam detineat hanc Concubinam. Nam tunc pœnam huius Constitutionis non incurret. Domus enim rem secretam, non autem publicam denotat. Dic ergo, Publicè, id est, Communiter, & coram multis. Non ergo sufficit, quòd semel, vel bis talis publicè videatur: He that Openly keepeth Concubines, &c. *Understande thou by this woorde,* Openly, *if he be not afraide, though he appeare vnto the people. It is otherwise, if he keepe his Concubine secretely, whether it be in an other mannes house, or in his owne. For so he commeth not within the danger of this Lawe. For a house betokeneth, not an open matter, but a secrete. Thus therefore expounde thou this Constitution: If he keepe his Concubine* Openly, *that is to saie, If he keepe her Commonly, and in the sighte of many. Therefore, if suche a Concubine twise, or thrise be seene Openly, it is not sufficiente.* **In the same Glose of yours, yée haue these woordes, that I haue alleged before,** Si non Castè, tamen Cautè.

De Concubinis Clericor. removendis. Licet ad profugandum.

And, whereas you saie, If a Bishop shewe fauour herein he him selfe shalbe suspended. **Your owne Doctour** Abbate Panormitane **woulde haue tolde you the contrarie:** Episcopus non tenetur deponere Clericum Concubinarium: *The Bishop is not bounde to deprive a Priest, that keepeth a Concubine.*

De Cohabita. Clericorum, & Mulier. Si autem Abb.

To make shorte, yée haue also of greate prouidence, diuised a special Premunire, **to embolden your** Priestes in Fornication, **and to warrante them free from al danger of any your Lawes, made in that behalfe.** For **thus you saie,** Si Laicus, instigante Diabolo, accuset Clericum incontinentiæ, statim repellitur. Laici in accusatione Episcopi audiendi non sunt: *If a Laie man, by the instigation of the Diuel, accuse a Priest of incontinente Life, straightwaie he is thruste backe, and put to silence. The Laie sorte maie not be hearde in the accusation of a Bishop.* **And againe,** Laicus non potest Clericum de Fornicatione accusare: *A Laie man maie not accuse a Priest of Fornication.* **This is that extremitie, and Unmercifull rigour, M. Hardinge, that yée shewe youre Priestes in theise cases.** No Laie man maie accuse them: No Bishop maie depriue them: No Lawe maie touche them.

2. Quæ. 7. Laici.

Dist. 84 Maximianus. In Gloss

M. Hardinge.

The thirde lye is, that Cardinal Campeius, Albertus Pighius, and certaine others haue taughte, that a Priest liueth more Holily and more chastely, that keepeth a Concubine, then he that hathe taken a wife in Matrimonie. VVhy doo ye not tel vs, where they haue taught so? VVil ye that wee beleeue your bare woorde? Howe can wee, hauinge taken you tardie in so many and so manifeste lies? Aristotle once asked, what a common lier gained by his lyinge. (a) that (quoth he) when he telleth truthe, no man wil beleue him. VVisedome would Sirs, that ye tooke good heede, that ye proue not suche gainers. Nowe wee require you to bringe foorthe proufe of that ye charge these learned menne withal. VVee are sure ye cannot.

(a) This Answeare mutche toucheth M. Hardinge him selfe.

The woordes of Pighius be these: But put case (saith he) they, which haue vowed chastitie, al doo not that they maie and ought to doo, to atteine the grace of continencie: and therefore they be not only tempted, but also ouercome with temptation for the more parte. VVhat then? Shal it be a lesse euil for them to marie? For to saie it is better, thou maiest not, which the Apostle imputeth to damnation, if they breake their Firste Faithe. For these (I saie) shal it be lesse euil, and lesse damnable to marie then to be ouercome with lustes?

(b) Vntruthe. For S. Augustine saithe, *Qui dicunt, talium Nuptias non esse Nuptias, sed potius Adulteria, mihi non videntur satis acutè, ac diligenter considerare, quid dicant. De Bono Viduita. Cap. 19.*

Therefore where ye impute vnto him that he maketh the keepinge of a Concubine to be a more Holy and a more chaste life in a Priest, then takinge of a wife in Matrimonie, it is a fowle lie, and a false slaunder. Neither is there in that Doctrine any filthinesse at al, whiche Philip Melanchthon, whom here ye folowe, chargeth him withal.

Touchinge that pointe of Doctrine it selfe, S. Paule confirmeth it, to whom the Mariage of those that be bounde to vowe of continencie, seemed so wicked and hainous a Sinne, that he pronounceth the wil to marie to be damnable. Nowe your Coniunctions with your yokefelowes, (we meane only so many of you as haue vowed chastitie (b) are not in deede VVedlockes, but Incestuous Aduouteries. And right so wee finde them named by Cyprian, Basile, Chrysostome, Ambrose, Hierome, Photius, and other Holy and learned Fathers.

But perhaps ye saie, bothe are Aduoutries, whether a vowed personne marie, or committe Fornication. Let it be so. (c) Yet is not that sinne more greeuous whiche a man committeth of sette and determined pourpose, then that whiche he falleth into by humaine frailtie? And that euil whiche

(c) O sage Considerations.

Fornication better then Mariage.

contineweth, is it not muche wooꝛſe, then that whiche hath intermiſſion (and no ende)?

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

The Apologie ſaithe, that Campegius, Pighius, and others moe of youꝛ ſide, haue tolde vs, *That a Prieſte keepinge a Concubine, lineth more Holily, and more chaſtely, then a Prieſte, that hathe a Wife, and lineth in Matrimonie.* Here ye crie out, as youꝛ woonte is, Sclaunders, Lies, fowle Lies, and I knowe not what. For thus onely they ſaie (ſaie you) That Fornication in this caſe is leſſe il, then Matrimonie. Howe be it, M. Hardinge, latcinge al Cauilles, and ſhiftes aſide, the leſſe il, in vſe of ſpeache is commonly called the greatter good. And in this ſenſe it is written, Better *it is to Die, then to Waute.* And againe, Better *is the iniquitie of a Man, then a woman dooinge wel.* So Ionas ſaithe, Deathe vnto me is better then Life. So S. Peter ſaithe, Better had it benne *for them not to haue knowen the waie of Righteouſneſſe, then knowinge the ſame, to be turned backe from the Holy Commaundemente, that is geeuen vnto them.* Theiſe, and other like phꝛaſes are often vſed in the Holy Scriptures, not foꝛ that Deathe, oꝛ Iniquitie, oꝛ Ignorance of Goddes Iuſtice, be good thinges in deede, but foꝛ that in compariſon of other wooꝛſe thinges, they ſeeme to impoꝛte ſomme leſſe il.

Ecclc. 40.
Eccle. 42.
2. Pet. 2.

Fornication (ye ſaie) is not better then Marriage: But Marriage is wooꝛſe then Fornication. Thus it ſeemeth you good, to ſhadow youꝛ maters by ſhifte of wooꝛdes from wooꝛſe to better, and from better to wooꝛſe. And yet in plaine mennes iudgementes, If Marriage be wooꝛſe then Fornication, then is Fornication better then Marriage.

But, to let you vnderſtande, we haue dealte ſimply, and plainely herein, Hulderichus the Biſhop of Auguſta in Germanie, wꝛitinge vnto Pope Nicolas againſte the reſtrainte of Pꝛieſtes Marriage, aboue ſeuen hundꝛed yeeres paſt, vſeth the like manner of ſpeache, as we haue vſed. Thus he ſaithe, Huius Imperij, ne dicam, conſilij, tam fatuam, tamq; turpem addunt ſuggeſtionem, vt dicant, Honeſtius eſt, Pluribus occultè implicari, quàm apertè in hominum vultu, & conſcientia cum vna ligari. Quòd profectò non dicerent, ſi ex illo, & in illo eſſent, qui dicit, Væ vobis Phariſæis, qui omnia facitis propter homines: *Vnto this Commaundemente, I wil not ſaie, vnto this Counſel, they ſette ſo fooliſhe and ſo ſhameful a ſuggeſtion, that they ſaie,* It is an * Honeſter thinge for a Prieſt to be entangled with many Concubines, in Secrete, and priuily, then Openly, and in the ſighte, and knowledge of the worlde, to be ioined in Marriage with one VVife. *Whiche thinge verily they woulde not vtter, if they were either of him, or in him, that ſaithe, Woe be vnto you, yee Phariſeis, that doo al thinges to pleaſe menne.*

Hulderichus Epiſcop. Auguſtianus. The ſame Epiſtle is founde in Ancient Recorde vnder the name of Voluſianus Epiſcopus Carthaginenſis.

In like ſoꝛte the Councel of VVoormes wꝛote ſommetime againſte Pope Hildebrande, foꝛ that he had diuiſed great rigour, and tyꝛannie, to ſunder Pꝛieſtes from their Wiues: Scorta pudicis Coniugibus: Stupra, Inceſtus, Adulteria caſto Connubio præfert: *He placeth Strumpettes before honeſt Wiues: and Fornication, Inceſt, Aduoutrie before chaſte Marriage.* Notwithſtandinge youꝛ Doctour Hoſius ſaithe, Turpis Philippo videtur hæc oratio: Catholicis autem honeſtiſsima: *Theſe woordes vnto* Philip Melanchthon *ſeeme ſhameful: but vnto the Catholiques they ſeeme moſte Honeſte.*

Concil. VVormatien. Ex Auctino Hoſius in Petricouien. Confeſ. Cap. 56.

What neede we many wooꝛdes in ſo cleare a caſe? The whole pꝛactiſe of youre Church, M. Hardinge, pꝛoteſteth the ſame. If a Pꝛieſte marrie a Wife, ye ſuſpende him: ye Excommunicate him: ye Depꝛiue him: ye diſquiet, and trouble the whole Churche. But if he kepe a Concubine, one, two, oꝛ moe, ye are then contented, and ready, not onely to diſſemble it, but alſo with fauour to excuſe it. Foꝛ ſo ye ſaie, as it is alleged before, Clericus Concubinarius in officijs vitandus non eſt, niſi ſit notorius: *A Prieſte, that keepeth a Concubine, onleſſe he be very notorious, maie not be eſchewed in his Seruice.* Againe ye ſhal finde this Leſſon ſpecially noted in youꝛ Rubrike, as it is ſaide before, Qui non habet Vxorem, loco illius Concubinam debet habere: *He, that hath not a Wife, in ſteede of her ought to haue a Concubine.* Ye wil ſaie, There is an Errour in youꝛ printe: whiche thinge maie eaſily be graunted, ſpecially the whole Booke being otherwiſe ſo ful of errours. But would God youꝛ errour in Life, and Doctrine were no greater. How be it, it foloweth immediately in the ſame Decree, Is qui non habet Vxorem, & pro Vxore Concubinam habet, à Communione non repellatur: *Who ſo hath no Wife, and in ſteede of a Wife hath a Concubine,* let him not be remoued from

Extra. De Cohabita. Clerico & Mulier. ca final. Abb. Dis. 34. Is qui.

the

the Communion. In these wordes, I trowe, yee wil say there is no errour.

Vppon the Legantine Constitutions of Otho, yee maie finde these wordes noted in the Glose, Nunquid compelli potest Clericus Concubinam abiurare? Videtur, quòd non. Resolutio. Si Clericus duxit Vxorem de facto, eo casu iuramentum exigitur: *Whether may a Priest be forced to forsweare his Concubine? It seemeth he may not. The resolution hereof is this: If a Priest haue in deede married a wyfe, in this case he is forced to forsake her by an othe.* Therfore we may say to you, as S. Augustine said sometime to the Manichees, Non Concubitum, sed, vt longè antè ab Apostolo dictum est, verè Nuptias prohibetis: *Ye forbidde not Copulation: but, as it was long agoe foresposen by the Apostle, in deede ye forbid very marriage.*

Fornication better then Mariage. *Constit. Othonis De Concubinis Clericor. remouendis. Licet ad profugandum. August. De Moribus Manichæorum Li. 2. ca. 18. Concil. Trident. Session. 1. Hermannus Riddus De vita & honest. Cleri. Paralip. Vrspergen in Clemen. 5.*

Nowe, for as much, as ye say, Yee are no Angelles, and your infirmities ought too bee considered, and too bee borne withal, It shal not bee amisse, shortly too see, what your owne frendes haue thought of these Infirmities. And heere too passe ouer other Authorities, your owne Doctor the Bishoppe of Bitonto, beeing present at your late Chapter at Tridente, of your whole Single Life, which yee call Chastitie, pronounceth thus: Quibus turpitudinum monstris, qua sordium colluuie, qua peste non sunt corrupti, non fœdati in Ecclesia sancta Dei, & Populus, & Sacerdos? A Sanctuario Dei incipite, Patres, si vllus iam pudor, si vlla pudicitia, &c. Dicunt in corde impio, & Ore impuro, Non est Deus: *With what monsters of filthinesse, with what villanie, with what pestilence are they not corrupted, and defiled in the churche of God, both the people, and the Priest? My Lordes, begin euen with the Sanctuarie of God: if there be any shame, if there bee any honest life. They say with wicked hart, and filthy mouth, There is no God.*

Another saith, Propter multitudinem luxuriæ, alia vitia quasi non peccata reputantur: *For the multitude of Lecherie* (that is in Priestes) *other faultes are taken for no sinne.*

Another saith, Defecit iam omnis Disciplina & Religio in Cardinalibus: Et tres radices vitiorum Superbia, Auaritia, Luxuria, validissimè dominantur: *In the Cardinalles nowe all Discipline, and Religion is decaied: And three rootes of Sinnes*, Pride, Couetousnesse, and Lechery *doo most mightily prenaile.* S. Bernard saith, Fingunt, se amore castitatis ista dicere, cùm ea magis causa turpitudinis fouendæ & multiplicandæ adinuerint: *They beare vs in hande, that they speake these things for loue of Chastitie: Whereas in deede they haue deuised the same, to the end to nourish, and to encrease their filthinesse.* This M. Harding, is your Infirmitie, which, in your iudgement, Courtesie, and Charitie, we ought to beare withal.

Bernar. in Cantic. Sermon. 66.

The places of S. Cyprian, S. Basile, S. Chrysostome, S. Ambrose, S. Hierome, and others, that may seeme much to make with you in this case, and to condemne this kinde of marriage, are weighed, & answeared before in a place more conuenient. Verily, S. Augustine saith, Grauiter peccant, qui tales diuidunt: *They sinne grieuously, that deuide them, that be so married.*

The. 2. parte. the. 8. Chapt. the. 1. Dimissõ Dist. 27. Quidam.

M. Harding.

Where yee say, there be many thousandes of common Harlottes in Rome, wee thinke there bee many there in deede. Whether there be many thousandes, wee dout. What number soeuer there is, they be too many. Those Courteghianes the Churche of Rome dooth (a) tolerate, not nourishe, trusting and looking, that by sermons, exhortations, and other conuenient meanes, they may be called backe to repentance, and to the way of saluation.

(a) Not nourish, but tolerate. A proper excuse & a sore punishmẽt of open vvhore-dome.

That the Pope gathereth about a thirty thousand Ducates yeerly of these Courteghianes by way of an annual pension, which these Defenders affirme, (b) it is vtterly false. Cornelius Agrippa, who fauoured not the See of Rome, and was imbrewed with Heresies, that sprang vp in his time, was the first Author of this slaunder. If they pay the common taxes, which bee leuied to the Pope who only hath ciuil Dominion ouer that Citie, they (c) pay not for that they may be suffered to continew that sinful trade of life, but so as the whole City payeth by polles, for that there they haue their abode, & habitation.

(b) Vntruth. For it is most true, as it shall appeare.

(c) Vntruth manifest. For vnlesse they pay, they shall not occupie.

First it is common to al greate Cytles in those hote Countries, not too bannishe from among them that filthy generation of harlottes, not by way of suffring as a thing commendable in it self, but for the auoyding of a greater mischiefe. As (d) God suffered the harde necked Iewes too hate their enimies, and pinche them with vsuries. Lykewise Moyses permitted a libel of diuorce, not that these thinges were honest, but to the intent by that meanes yet they might the rather loue their Brethre, and lende them mony freely, and absteyne from murdering theyr wyues. Euen so men nowe adayes so little apply theyr endeuour to restrayne the pronesse which is in their flesshe too al riot and carnal concupiscence, that if some way were not (at the least concerning outwarde and ciuil punishement

(d) The Pope may dispense as vvel as God.

(e) winked

Fornication better then Mariage.

(e) winked at, whereby the fleshly men might obteine some part of their vnruly desire: it were more then likely, that in this great decay of vertue in general, the furious rage of that vice would leaue neither wedlocke vndefiled, nor virginitie vnassaulted, nor a woorse enterprise, which nature abhorreth, vnattempted. Would God experiéce had not taught many Cõtries this to be to true an obseruatiõ.

S. Augustine heereof saieth, (f) *Quid sordidius, &c.* What can bee saide more vncleane, more voide of comelinesse, more ful of turpitude, then harlottes, baudes, and such other lyke pestilences? Take harlottes from among men, ye shal disturbe al thinges with lecherous lustes. Put the same in the steede of Matrones, ye shal dishoneste (al thinges) with spot and shame. And why is the Bishop of Rome to be blamed for that they be in Rome, more then the Frenche King, the King of Spaine, or any other Prince, for suffering them in their dominions?

(e) *This is a worthy Catholique Diuine.*

(f) *S. Augustine wrote these Bookes, de Ordine, before hee was baptized.*

It remaineth, wee seeke whether they haue also the lowest and vilest place in that Citie, or no: lest perhaps although they be a (g) necessary euil, yet beeing promoted aboue their degree, they make an euil shewe in the body, where they rest. Their places may bee considered twoo wayes, in respect of the Temporal, or of the Ecclesiastical order or lawe. For Temporal order thus they stande: Not too haue free libertie of dwelling in the most haunted streates, and Palaices, where them list, but (h) only to be in such corners, and bylanes, and smal outhouses, as are most fitte shops for the vile marchandize of such occupiers. Againe they cannot without a very great forfeite ride in (i) Coches, or Chariottes, as Matrones there doo, but are constreined either to keepe their homely homes, or too walke a foote in the streetes. And then also by order they must be (k) in such apparel, that as Iewes by their red cappes, so they by their shorte vailes (a note of dishonestie) be knowen too al, and bee subiect too all shrewdnesse of the boyes of the streetes, who vse commonly to mocke and reuile them.

(g) *A vile vntruth. They are not necessary.*

(h) *Vntruth. For the Cardinalles themselues say,* Habitant insignes Ædes.

(i) *Vntruthe. For the Cardinalles say,* Mula vehuntur.

(k) *Vntruthe. For the Cardinals say,* Incedunt vt Matronæ.

And heere I can not but mislike with that malice which appeareth to bee in the makers of this Apologie. For (l) it is a vertue in the Prince to set great burdens and paimentes vpon so filthy a profession, to the ende hee may feare women from it, and make them the sooner weary of it, &c. In good sooth maisters ye are too yong to control the Citie of Rome in her doo ings.

(l) *This is one of the Cardinal vertues of Rome, to take tolle of Bawdry.*

Besides al this, if in that sinneful state they continewe to their end without repentance, (m) it is not lawful for them to make any testament or last wil for bestowing of their goods, but as condemned and infamous persons, they must leaue al too bee confiscated and disposed at the Princes pleasure. But on the other side, if they turne and repent, there are houses called Monasteries of the Cõuertites, and special prouision and discipline for them, where they are taught howe too bewaile their vnchaste life so sinnefully past ouer.

(m) *Vntruthe, See the Answeare.*

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Touching the number of your Courteghianes of Rome, whether they be twenty thousand, or more, or lesse, we wil not striue. They bee leased out in fee ferme: The Popes rentes are alwaies certaine. For Fornication is sueable in Rome, and a good saleable kinde of sinne. But this (you saie) is another Lie, as false, and as slanderous, as the rest. For (yee saie) they pay no yeerely pension for their sufferance in that trade of Life: but only the commõ taxes, which are likewise raised vpon other Citizens. **Whether it be so, or no, M. Harding, it is sufficient for you, for to saie. Otherwise, the Pope raising such fines vpon Baudrie, might wel be thought to bee the Baude.**

Howe bee it, your owne Doctours herein will soone condemne you. For thus it is written by them in your owne Glose: Videtur, quòd crimen Meretricij Ecclesia sub dissimulatione transire debeat. Nam & Mareschallus Papæ de facto exigit tributum à Meretricibus: *It seemeth, that the Churche ought to dissemble the fault of Whoredome. For the Popes Marshal in deede receiueth a* tribute, or pension of Whoores.

Const. Otho-nis. De Concubinis Clericor. remittendis.

Whereas yee saie, Cornelius Agrippa was the first Author of this slaunder, **it is vntrue. For your owne** Glose last before alledged, auoucheth it by the Authoritie of Iohannes Andreas, a notable Canoniste, that liued wel neare twoo hundred yeeres, before Agrippa was borne. And Nicolaus de Clavengijs, that liued in the time of the Emperour Sigismunde, in his Booke entituled, De Corrupto Ecclesiæ statu, hath one special Chapter. De Exactionibus pro Concubinis tolerandis, *Of exactions for the suffering of Concubynes.*

Joã. Andreas mortuus est Anno. 1348.

Nicolaus de Clavengijs: In Paralipo. Vrspergen. Anno. 1417.

But al this yee wipe away easily with one woorde. For yee saie, The Courteghianes in Rome pay these impositions, not as a portion of their vnthriftie gaines, but only as a punishment for their wicked life. **For it is not lawful there to commit sinne freely, without paiement. And thus is the matter of your parte wel defended.**

14. qua. 5. *Quodverò.*

So it is noted vppon your Decrees, Quòd dicitur, Sacerdos non potest percipere mercedem prostibuli, potest dici, quòd non debet recipi Oblatio Meretricis:

In Glossa.

licet

Stewes in Rome.

licet Eleemosyna posit inde fieri: *Whereas it is saide, The Priest maie not receiue the reward,* or Oblation of the Stewes, *wee maie saie, that the* Oblation *of an Harlot maie not be receiued: notwithstandinge wee maie make* an Almouse of the same. That is to saie, A Harlottes monie maie be taken by the waie of Almouse, but not by the waie of Oblation. Thus are wee taught, and it behoueth vs to beleeue, that the Pope maie liue, not by the Oblations of his Courteghianes, but by theire Almouse. *Et Dist. 90. Oblationes. in Glossa*

Nowe, for as mutche as M. Hardinge woulde so faine haue this mater to passe by the name of a pounishmente of theise il weemenne, I beseeche thee, good Reader, to consider, howe grieuously, and with what extremitie, and rigoure of Lawe they haue diuised, to haue them pounished. In a Prouincial Councel holden at Oxforde it is written thus, Concubinæ Sacerdotum moneantur ab Archidiacono, &c. Let Priestes Concubines be warned by the Archedeacon &c. If they wil not amende, then let them be forebidden to Kisse the Pax, and to take Holy Breade in the Churche. With sutche extremitie, and crueltie they kepe the people from doinge il. *Constitu. prouin. Edmundi Cantuar. Archiepiscopi.*

It was neither for your profession, M. Hardinge, nor for your grauitie, to becomme a Proctoure for the Stewes. Although it might wel becomme Leontium, an heathen Courteghiane of lewde conditions, that waie to bestowe her witte, and Eloquence againste Theophrastus, in the defense of that filthy state, yet maie not the same likewise becomme a Christian man, and a professoure of Diuinitie. Ye calle your Courteghianes a Necessarie Euil: but by what Authoritie of the Scriptures, I cannot tel. That the whole trade, and life of them is il, wee take it, as your graunt: But, that they be Necessarie in any Christian Common wealthe, I recken it very harde for you to proue. Yee allege the heate of the Countrie: as if that were a sufficient warrante for your Stewes. And yet, I trowe, the towne of Louaine, and the Countrie of Brabante, where ye nowe inhabite, is not so hote. The heates of Iewrie are thought farre to passe al the heates of Italie. Yet God saithe vnto the Iewes, Non erit vlla Meretrix de filiabus Israel: nec Scortator de Filijs Israel: *There shalbe no Whoore of the Daughters of Israel: Nor Whoorekeeper of the Sonnes of Israel.* And euen nowe, where so euer the Gospel of Christe is openly, and frelye receiued, notwithstandinge the heate of the Countrie, your Stewes, and Bordelles flee awaie, as the night clowdes before the Sunne. But after that your Priestes were once forbidden laweful Marriage, then was it needful, that your Necessarie il shoulde comme in place. Howe be it, S. Paule saithe, *Let vs not doo il, that good maie folowe. For iuste is the damnation of them, that so saie.* *Deutero. 23.* *Roman. 3.*

But S. Augustine standeth ful of your side: S. Augustine hathe written in the behouke of the Stewes: S. Augustine saithe, *Take Harlottes awaie from emonge menne, and yee fil al the Countrie with ribaudrie, and villanie.* In deede the very name of S. Augustine is great, and Reuerende. But what if S. Augustine, when he wrote these wordes, were not S. Augustine? What if he wrote that Booke, De Ordine, beinge as yet a very ponge man, and but a Nouice in the Faithe: not yet wel instructed: not yet Baptized in the name of Christe: him selfe as yet kepinge a Concubine, and liuinge in whoredome? Shal sutche a one, so ponge, and so youthful, goe for a Saincte? Or shal his bare name, and vnseasoned fantasies stande you in stede, to proue your Stewes? *Augustin. De Ordine, Lib. 2.*

Verily, the same S. Augustine, beinge afterwarde fully instructed, and Christened, saithe thus, Istam in vsu scortatorum terrena Ciuitas licitam fecit turpitudinem: *The worldly Citie* (not the Churche of God) *hath made this filthinesse of harlottes to be laweful.* And Ludouicus Viues, writinge vpon the same, saithe, Satis aperte Augustinus testatur, Iure Ciuili veteri Romano multa esse permissa, quæ sint contraria Legibus Diuinis. Hoc isti volunt, qui, dum Gentilitatem coniungere, & coaptare Christianismo laborant, corrupto vtroque, & alterius impatiente, nec Gentilitatem, nec Christianismum retinent: S. Augustine *plainely witnesseth, that by the olde Ciuile Romaine* (and Heathen) *Lawe, many things were suffered, whiche were contrarie to the Lawes of God. This thinge wil not these menne allowe, who while they studie* (as you, M. Harding, do) *to ioine Heathennesse, and Christianitie bothe togeather, bothe beinge corrupted,* *Augusti. De Ciuitate. Lib. 14. Cap. 18.* *Ludo. Viues in Librũ De Ciuitate, Li. 14. ca. 18.*

and the one not ſtandinge with the other, keepe now neither Heathennesse, nor Chriſtianitie.

Therefore we maie mutche better exchange theise wordes of S. Auguſtine, ſpoken in his youthe, before he had wel learned to ſpeake: and maie mutche better ſaie thus, Permitte Lupanaria: & implebis omnia libidinibus: *Suffer, and allowe the Stewes: and yee ſhal fil al the Countrie with Ribaudrie, and Villanie.* And in this ſense S. Bernarde ſaithe, Tolle de Eccleſia honorabile Coniugium, & thorum immaculatum: Nónne reples eam Concubinarijs, inceſtuoſis, ſeminifluis, mollibus, maſculorum Concubitoribus, & omni denique genere immundorum? *Take once from the Churche honorable Marriage, and the Bedde vndefiled: and dooſte thou not fil the ſame Churche ful of brothelles, keepinge Concubines, &c. and with al ſortes of filthy perſons.*

Bernard in Cantic. Serm. 66.

Further yée ſaie, And wherefore is the Biſhop of Rome more to be blamed for maintenance of his Stewes, then the Frenche Kinge, or the Kinge of Spaine? This is but a ſimple reaſon for a Doctour of Diuinitie. It is an olde ſaieinge:

Nil iuuat exemplum, quod litem lite reſoluit.

Chriſte bade not his Apoſtles, to be leadde by the example of worldly Princes. If it be il in them, it is mutche worſe in him, that woulde be called the Vicare of Chriſte, the Heade of the Churche, and the Holy one of Iſrael.

An other parte of theire pouniſhment is (as you tel vs) that they maie not ride ſumptuouſly in Coches, or Charettes, or dwel in the open faire ſtreetes, and in the ſight of the Cittie: but are forced to goe a foote, and to hide them ſelues in corners, and in outhouſes, and bylanes: And that, by your deſcription, in ſutche ſimple, and poore, and beggerly ſorte, as if they were the vileſt, and ougleſte of al the people, and had not a good clowte to couer theire bodies. Certainely, M. Hardinge, your Courteghianes, if they vnderſtode hereof, woulde thinke them ſelues litle beholden to ſutche a Proctoure.

Doctoure Peter Martyr, of whom I cannot ſpeake without greate reuerence, hauinge good cauſe to knowe the ſtate of Rome, as feiwe menne better, hereof writeth thus, Nunc, O Deus bone, quomodò Romæ coercentur Meretrices? Habent ornatiſsimas domos: vehuntur per publicum habitu principum: Sedent in equis gradarijs: habent ſecum Torquatos, & Laruatos Comites, interdum etiam Cardinales, præſertim noctu: & ancillarum ſumptuoſiſsimum gregem: *Nowe a daies, O good God, howe are the Courteghianes pouniſhed in* Rome? They dwel in the faireſt houſes: They are caried with honoure throughe the Cittie, as if they were Ladies: They are mounted on amblinge palfraies: *They are attended with chaines of golde, and perſonnes diſguiſed, and ſometimes Cardinalles, and ſpecially in the night ſeaſon: and haue a ſumptuous ſorte of Maides to waite vpon them.*

Petrus Martyr. in Lib. Iudicium Cap. 16.

If ye ſhal happen to doubte M. Martyrs repoꝛte in this behalfe, yet I truſte yée wil geue ſomme credite to your owne Friendes, the Cardinalles of the Churche of Rome. Theire wordes hereof be theiſe: In hac etiam Vrbe Meretrices, vt Matronæ, incedunt per Vrbem ſeu Mula vehuntur: quas aſſectantur de Media die Nobiles, familiares Cardinalium, Clericiq. Nulla in vrbe vidimus hanc corruptionem, præterquam in hac omnium exemplari. Habitant etiam inſignes ædes: *In this Cittie of Rome the Courteghianes paſſe through the ſtreetes, or ride on theire Mules, like honeſt Matrones, or Ladies: and in the middeſt of the daie,* Noble menne, the Cardinalles deere friendes, and Prieſtes *attende vpon them. Wee neuer ſawe ſutche corruption, but onely in this Cittie, which is the example, and paterne of al others. Moreouer they dwel in faire and notable houſes.*

Concilium Delectorum Cardinalium Concil. tom. 3. Pag. 823.

Anno. 1538. This Information was preſented vnto Pope Paule the thirde by certaine of his graueſt Cardinalles, appointed thereto by ſpecial Commiſſion.

Nowe, good Chriſtian Reader, I beſeeche thée, conſider the Conformitie of theiſe tales. M. Hardinge ſaithe, The Courteghianes of Rome goe onely a foote. Theſe Cardinalles ſaie, *They ride on their Mules.* M. Hardinge ſaithe, They haue a ſpecial apparel of diſhoneſtie, to be knowen by: Theſe Cardinalles ſaie, *They goe, or ride, as honeſt Matrones, or great Ladies, or Noble Weemenne.* M. Hardinge ſaith, They be deſpiſed, and reuiled of the people: Theſe Cardinalles ſaie, *They haue Prieſtes, Noble men, and the Cardinalles friendes to attende vpon them.* M. Hardinge ſaithe, They dwel onely in out houſes, and backe lanes:

Theiſe

Stewes in Rome.

Theſe Cardinalles ſaie, Habitant inſignes ædes: *They dwel in faire, and notable Houſes.* So many vntruthes it is no harde mater for M. Hardinge to vtter in ſo ſhorte a tale. Nowe, beinge ſo fine Dames, and ſo richly attired, it were greate ſclaunder to ſaie, They ſerue onely for Verlettes, or common raſcalles. If the reporte be true, vpon Twelueth daie at night, in the yere of our Lorde, 1564. there were ſene Seuentene Coches of Courteghianes arriuinge togeather euen into the Popes owne Palaice. If any man ſhal thinke this report incredible, yet Luitprandus, of the like hereof, ſaithe thus, Lateranenſe Palatium, Sanctorum quondam hoſpitium, nunc eſt Proſtibulum Meretricum: *The Popes Palaice at* Laterane, *ſommetime the harbourre of Holy Sainctes, is nowe becomme a ſtewe of Whoores.*

Anno. 1564.

Luitprandus, Lib. 6. Cap. 6.

An other parte of theire pounichmente, ye ſaie, is this, That as condemned, and infamous perſons, at their ende they can make no Teſtamente, nor take order with that they haue. If this were true, it were a good token that the Pope is Couetous to haue theire goodes, more then deſirous to ſaue theire Soules. Howe be it, the beſte Learned, and moſte notable Canoniſtes, that ye haue, affirme the contrarie. For proufe wherof Reade Cynus Piſtorienſis in L. Cum te. C. De Condictione ob turpem cauſam: Reade Baldus L. 1. C. in eodem capite: Reade Bartholus in L. Idem. ff. eodem Ca. Abbas Panormitane after longe diſputation had touchinge this mater, thus ſaithe his Judgemente in the ende: Conclude ergo ex omnibus premiſsis, quòd Meretrix turpiter non recipit dona, vel promiſsionem: & quòd poteſt de illis ad libitum diſponere: *Of al theiſe premiſſes conclude you thus, That a Harlot maie receiue rewardes, or promiſſes, without infamie, or ſhame* (of the Lawe): *and that of the ſame ſhee maie diſpoſe at her pleaſure.* Therefore, M. Hardinge, this tale woulde haue benne better ſtudied. For this pounichmente, that ye haue here imagined, by the Judgement of the Learned, is no pounichmente at al.

Cynus Piſtorien. Baldus. Bartholus. De Immunita. Eccleſiar. Ca. 14. Abb.

In good ſoothe Sirs, ye ſaie further, Ye are to yonge too Controlle the Citie of Rome in her dooinges. Yet, in the rebukinge of open vice, noman ought to be thought to ponge. But of what age then are you M. Harding, that are hable thus to defende the Cittie of Rome in open Whoredome? Primaſius ſaithe, Nemo periculoſiùs peccat, quàm qui peccata defendit: *Noman ſinneth with more danger, then he, that ſtandeth in defenſe of Sinne.* S. Paule ſaith, *Let noman deceiue you with vaine woordes. For becauſe hereof the anger of God commeth vpon the Children of infidelitie. Be not therefore partakers with them.*

Primaſius ad Roman. Cap. 2. Epheſ. 5.

And whereas you ſaie, This policie is thought neceſſarie, for the eſchewinge of a greater il, your Lawe telleth you, Abijcienda ſunt falſa remedia, quæ Veris, & manifeſtis periculis ſunt grauiora: VVee muſte abandon vaine remedies, that are more greeuous, then the true, and manifeſte dangers.

Extra. De Celebra. Miſſ. De homine.

S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Non vult Deus tale lucrum compenſari tali damno: *God wil not haue ſutche a gaine to be recompenſed with ſutche a loſſe.* S. Paule ſaithe, as we haue alleged before: *They ſaie, Let vs do il, that good maie folowe.* But he addeth withal, *Therefore iuſte is theire Damnation.* Tertullian ſaithe, Lupanaria execrabilia ſunt coram Deo: Stewes are accurſed before God. And therefore to conclude, the Emperoure Iuſtinian notwithſtandinge al your Neceſſities, and Policies, ſtreitely commaundeth, that Harlottes be banniſhed out of al Townes.

Roman. 3. Tertullian. De Anima. Anthen. De Lenonibus.

But here, good Chriſtian Reader, this one thinge I beſeche the vprightly, and indifferently to conſider: what thinge wil not theſe menne defende, that can thus boldely defende confeſſed filthineſſe? Or, when wil they reſourme the Churche of God, that in ſo longe time cannot yet reſourme theire open Stewes?

Theſe Harlottes (yet ſaie) ſommetimes repente them, and amende theire liues. God of his mercie graunte, that you, M. Hardinge, maie once do the like: Leſte the woordes of the Prophete falle vpon you, Frons Meretricis facta eſt tibi. God graunte, that *Harlottes, and Sinners goe not before you in the Kingedome of God.*

Hierem. 3. Matthæ. 21.

M. Hardinge.

That ye tel of a VVoman named Ioane, beatinge the worlde in hande, ſhe was Pope of Rome, it is a fonde and a vaine fable. VVere ye ſo wiſe, as ye be malicious, ye would neuer haue brought your credite in hazarde by reportinge ſutche vanitie. This I accoumpte for one of your accuſtomed lies. By this men maie iudge, what litle floare of true thinges yee haue to obiecte againſte vs. VVho liſteth

Dame Iohane the Pope.

(a) Onuphri* is a man yet liuinge, hired of purpose to face out this mater.

(b) Semiramis, beinge a womā was of longe time taken for a man. Yet mennes eies were not bewitched.

(c) God hath suffered others as very mōsters to sitte in that See, as euer was Pope Iohane.

(d) Vntruth. For there were others before him, that wrote the same.

* Vntruthes, twoo together.

(e) Vntruthes 2. Reade the Answeare.

(f) This Diuiser dwelt in Rome, & liued aboue fiue hundred yeeres agoe.

(g) Vntruth. For they liued 500. yeres before vs: and were the beste writers of that time.

Not Registred.

to see a Learned discourse written hereof, him maie it please to reade the annotations, of (a) Onuphrius Pamuinius vpon *Platina, de vitis pontificum*, printed in Venis. And he shal easily beleeue the whole matter to be fabulous. In Vita Iohan. 8.

After Anastasius, they that in their writinges recite an exacte rewe and order of Popes, as Ademarus, and Annonius of Paris, Regino, Hermannus Schafnaburgensis, Otho Frisingensis, Abbas Vrspergensis, Leo Bishop of Hostia, Iohannes of Cremona, and Godfridus Viterbiensis, of whiche some wrote three hundred, some foure hundred yeeres paste, al these make no mention at al of this VVoman Pope Ioane. Againe there be in *Bibliotheca Palatina*, at Rome, sixe or seuen tables of the Popes names written in sundry bookes, before the time of Innocentius the fourthe. Mary in the margent of Pandulphus this fable is put in betweene Leo the fourthe, and Benedicte the thirde, written in a hande farre different from the olde characters of thar Auncient Booke, added by somme man of later time. VVhiche maketh the matter to be the more suspected, and taken for a fable.

Though men had at that time ben so farre bewitched, and distract of their siue wittes, (b) as they could not haue knowen a woman from a man, (which no wise man I wene beleueth), yet (c) it is not to be thought, that God him selfe, who appointed and ordeined the Seate of Peter, wherof he would the whole Church to be directed, would departe so farre from his merciful prouidence, towarde the Churche, as to suffer the same to be polluted by a woman, whiche is not of capacitie for holy orders.

(d) The first Authour of this fable was one Martinus Polonus, a Monke of the order of Cisterce: VVho wrote longe after the time that Pope Iohane is fayned to haue liued in. VVhose manner of writinge if wee consider, wee shal finde it vaine, and nothinge like to be true. It beginneth thus, *Iohannes Anglicus natione, Maguntinus, sedit annos duos, menses vnum, dies quatuor, &c.* Iohn an Englishe man by Nation, of Maguntia, sate (in the Romaine See) twoo yeeres, one mooneth, and foure daies, aliās, siue monethes, and three daies. VVhat a foolishe speache is this, an Englishe man Maguntine, or of Maguntia? It foloweth in the fable, as the saide Martine telleth. This (as it is saide) was a VVoman, and in the younge age of a girle, shee was brought to Athenes by one that was her Louer in a mans apparel, and there profited so muche in diuerse sciences, as none was founde to be compared with her. To Athenes was shee brought, saithe the fable. And why? For learninge. Very wel. VVhereas at that time * neither any Athenes stoode, * neither was there any place of learninge there any lenger: but al the countrie of Attica became Barbarous, and vtterly voide of learning, as we vnderstande by the writers of that time. The authour reporteth, that from thence she came to Rome, and there professed learninge openly, and had great Doctours to her Scholers, and for opinion of learninge and good life, by one consente of al was made Pope. VVhiche is soone confuted as false: (e) for there was no learninge at those daies openly professed at Rome, as (e) the Stories declare.

It foloweth in the fable. Beinge in the Popedome she is begotten with childe of her Seruaunt. And not knowinge the time of her deliueraunce, as she wente from S. Peters to Laterane, streined with paines, betweene Collosseo and S. Clementes Churche, she broughte foorthe, and died, and was (as they saie) there buried. Here is to be marked, howe the (f) deuiser of this fable bewrayeth him selfe, and thinketh the matter harde to be beleeued. And therefore in the beginninge saithe, she was a VVoman *(vt asseritur)* as folkes saie: and nowe he saithe, she was buried, *vt dicitur*, as it saide. So he dothe not affirme it to be true, but referreth al to heresaie. By whiche testimonie lies commonly be soothed.

And as it is false, that euer there was any suche Pope, so is it not true, that ye note in the margent of your booke touchinge the image, whiche ye saie it is to be seene yet in Rome, resemblinge that woman Pope lieinge in trauaile. The image, whiche ye meane, I haue seene my selfe at Rome, grauen in a stone, after the manner of a tombe stone, pitched vpright not farre from the Colosseo. It resembleth no suche thinge ye speake of.

Neither is it of any more truthe, whiche some haue ignorantly written of the Popes refrainninge to go that waie, when he goeth thereby in solemne processions: nor that which I haue reade in some of your (g) Schoolefelowes peeuishe bookes of the stoole of easemente, that is at Laterane made of faire porphyry stone, whiche they haue reported to be kepte there for an vnseemely vse at the creation of the Popes, for proufe of their *Humanitie*. Thus, wee truste, wee haue brought your greate matter of Pope Ioane to nought.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Here, in your Iudgemente, is an other of our fowle shameful accustomed Lies. And that ye proue by the Authoritie of one Onuphrius, one of the Popes late pages, specially hired, and procured, to healpe out this mater. Of the Truthe, and certainetie hereof, wee shal consider further in the ende. Nowe let vs examine this Newe Coniectural Doctour with his gheasses.

Firste, he saithe, Dame Iohane **is not registred in the Calendare emonge the Popes: Ergo, it is but a vaine Fable, that euer** Dame Iohane **was Pope in Rome. This Coniecture, M. Hardinge, is very simple. For I doubte not, but ye maie wel remember, that Bishoppes names, as wel in Rome, as otherwheres, haue vpon sundrie occasions benne oftentimes quite striken out of the** Calendare.

So was Chrysostomes name vpon displeasure, quite striken out of the Table

of

of the Bishoppes of Constantinople, as if he had neuer benne Bishoppe there.

And Chrysostome him selfe, writinge vnto Cyriacus in his owne defense, saithe thus, Siquidem hoc feci, expungatur nomen meum ex albo Episcoporum: & non scribatur in Libro Orthodoxæ Fidei: *If I haue thus done, let my name be rased out of the Bishoppes Calendare: and let it not be registred in the Booke of the Catholike Faithe.*

And afterwarde his name beinge so defaced, and rased out, was restoared againe by Theodotus at the vehemente requeste, and instaunce of the people. So Acacius, the Bishop of Constantinople, rased out the name of Pope Fœlix of Rome. So Innocentius, the Bishop of Rome, rased out the name of Arsacius the Bishop of Constantinople. And this is it, that S. Augustine meaneth, writinge to the people of Hippo, Quid obest homini, quòd ex illa Tabula non vult eum recitari humana Ignorantia, si de Libro viuorum non eum delet iniqua Conscientia? *What hurte is that vnto a man, that the Ignorante people wil not suffer his name to be readde out of that* Table, *if wicked conscience blotte him not out of the Booke of Life?*

Dame Iohane the Pope.

In Vita Chryso.
Chrys. Epist. 3. ad Cyriacum.
Nicepho. Li. 14. Cap. 16.
Celestius ad Episcopos Dardaniæ.
Nicephor. Li. 13 Cap. 34.
Augu. Epist. 137.

So writeth Iohannes de Parisijs of Pope Cyriacus: Cyriacus Papa renuntiauit officio, vt cum Vrsula, & Virginibus palmam Martyrij susciperet, Sed iste Cyriacus in Catalogo Paparum non annumeratur: quia credebant, ipsum non propter deuotionem, sed propter oblectamentum virginum dimisisse Episcopatum: Pope Cyriacus *gaue ouer his Bishoprike, that with* Vrsula, *and other Maides he might receiue the Crowne of Martyrdome. But this* Cyriacus is not reckened in the Calendare of the Popes: *for that it was beleeued, he had geuen ouer his Bishoprike, not of deuotion, but for somme fantasie towardes the Maides.*

Iohan. De Parisijs, De Potestate, Regia & Papali. Ca. 24.

But, to camme neare the pourpose, & to the forze of pour gheasses, therefore was Pope Iohanes name leafte out of the Calendare of the Bishoppes of Rome, not for that there neuer was any fatche Pope there: but onely for shame, leste it should appeare in recorde, & afterwarde be reported for euer, that a wooman, and fatch a wooman, had benne Bishop of Rome: or, that the Bishop of Rome had benne with Childe.

So saithe Marianus Scotus, Huius Iohannæ nomen Authores Pontificij non ponunt, propter turpitudinem rei, & muliebrem sexum: *The Chroniclers, that write of the* Popes, *leaue out the name of* Pope Iohane, *bothe for the shame of the mater, and also for the Wooman kinde.* So saithe Martinus, Iohanna non ponitur in Catalogo Sanctorum Pontificum, tam propter Muliebrem sexum, quàm propter deformitatem facti: Pope Iohanne is not reckened in the Calendare of the Holy Popes, *as wel for that shee was a Wooman, as also for the shame of the mater.* So saithe Sabellicus, Nullus Defunctæ honor habitus. Fama tenet, ob tam fœdæ rei memoriam: *There was no honoure bestowed at her burial: The reporte is, for the remembrance of her filthy acte.* So saithe Iohannes de Parisijs: So saithe Fasciculus temporum. Therefore this firste reason is but a very blinde Coniecture, and beareth no forze.

Marian. Scotus.
Martinus Poloonus.
Sabellicus Enead. 9. Lib. 1. Pag. 469.
Iohan. de Parisijs, De Potestate, Regia & Papali.
Fasciculus temporum.

An other of pour gheasses is this: Menne had bene bewitched, and distracted of their wittes, if they coulde not haue knowen a VVoman from a Man. This reason, M. Hardinge, beareth as greate weight, and substance, as the former. For your owne Amphilochius, that wrote the Life of Thomas Becket, coulde haue tolde you, that Euphrosyna, that Holy Maide, dwelte fyre and thirtie yeares in Monkes apparel emonge Monkes, and was neuer otherwise taken, but for a Monke.

M Hardinges Amphilochius.

Likewise Vincentius, and Petrus de Natalibus, and others your Writers, and Recorders of Fables, coulde haue tolde you, that Tecla sommetime addressed her selfe in Mannes apparel, and, had shee not benne forebidden by S. Paule, would haue folowed him in companie, as a Man. Rauisius Textor writeth the like of one Marina, that dissemblinge, what shee was, liued many yeares in an Abbie as a Monke. The like he writeth of Lasthenia, Axiothea, and others, that beinge Women, came into the Schole in Mannes apparel, to heare Plato. The like writeth your owne Fabulare Simeon Metaphrastes, of Eugenia. And if we lacke other Authorities of truste, and credite, One of your owne Companions of Louaine auoucheth the same of Melania, and Papula. And yet, I thinke, he was not bewitched (as you saie) nor thorowly bereft of his wittes.

Vincentius, Li. 9 Cap. 47.
Petr. De Natalib. Li. 8. Ca. 110.
Rauisius Textor in Officina: Mulieres Virilem habitum mentitæ.
Simeon Metaph.

Dame Iohane the Pope.

The quarrel, that yͤ pike to the Name, and Surname, is nothinge els, but a childishe cauil. For yͭ shee was not called Iohane Englishe, by the name of the Countrie, for that shee was an Englishe Woman, borne in Englande, as you ful fondely imagine, but onely by the Surname of her Father. So are there many knowen this daie by the names of Scot, Irishe, Frenche, VVelshe, VVestfalinge, Norman, Gascoingne, Brabante, Hollande: and yet not borne in any of al these Countries, but onely in Englande. So Matthias Parisiensis, as it is supposed, notwithstandinge his name, was borne in Bohemia.

phrast. in Eugenia.

Copus, Dialo. 2. Pag. 236.

Anglicus.

Therefore, whereas ye woulde haue the wordes vainely, and without sense, to be reade, & pointed thus, Iohannes Anglicus natione, Moguntinus, &c. Iohn an Englishe man by nation, of Moguntia, &c. ye plaie, and toie, and trifle vnsemely, and mocke your Reader. For the wordes are cleare, and plaine, and lie thus: Iohannes Anglicus, Natione Moguntinus, &c. Iohn Englishe, (so Surnamed) borne at Mens.

Goddes Sufferance.

Further yͤ saie, God would neuer haue so forsaken Peters Chaire, as to suffer it to be polluted by a VVooman, whiche is not of capacitie for Holy orders. This gheasse, M. Harding, presumeth ouer far of Goddes Prouidence. And therefore Antoninus the Archebishop of Florence, when he had opened this whole Storie of Pope Iohane, beinge astonned with the strangenesse, and admiration of the mater, coulde not refraine him selfe from crieinge out, O altitudo Sapientiæ, & Scientiæ Dei. Quàm incredibilia sunt iudicia eius: O the Deapthe of the VVisedome, and knowledge of God. Howe incredible be his iudgementes? In like manner the Prophete Esaie crieth out, Quomodò facta est Meretrix Ciuitas fidelis? Howe is that Faithful Cittie becomme an Harlot?

Antonin. Par. 2. Ti. 16. Ca. 1. § 7.

Esai. 1.

And why might not Pope Iohane, beinge a Woman, haue as good right, and interest vnto the See of Rome, as afterwarde had Pope Iohn. 13. who, beinge Pope, had wicked companie with two of his owne Sisters: or others, whom for their horrible vices, and wickednesse, Platyna calleth Monstra, & Portenta, *Monsters againste kinde, and ilshapen Creatures?* Luitprandus saithe, as it is before reported, Lateranense Palatium nunc est prostibulum Meretricum: The Popes Palaice of Laterane in Rome, is nowe becomme a Stewe of whoores.

In Epistola Othonis Imper. ad Iohan. pp. Platyn. in Iohan. 13. Luitprand. Li. 6 Cap. 6.

Al this notwithstandinge, saithe Antoninus, Nulli ex hoc Salutis præiudicium fuit. Quia nec Ecclesia tunc fuit sine Capite, quod est Christus, vnde percipit influxum Gratiæ: *Noman had hinderance of Saluation by meane hereof. For* (although the Pope were a Woman, yet) *the Churche was not without a* Heade. For that Heade is Christe: *From whom shee receiueth influence of Grace.* Yea, although Antichriste geate him selfe into the See of Rome, yet shal the Churche of God neuertheless continewe still: Although in horrible confusion, and vnder greate persecution.

Antonin. par. 2. Ti. 16, ca. 1. § 7.

Further yͤ saie, To Athenes was shee brought, saithe the Fable. And why? For Learninge. Very wel. VVhereas at that time, neither any Athenes stoode, nor was there any place of Learninge there any lenger: but al the Countrie of Attica became Barbarous, as wee vnderstande by the writers of that time.

Athenes.

The Cittie of Athenes was then ouerthrowen (yͤ saie) and Learninge there vtterly decaied. And therefore al this is but a Fable. And good reason it is, that wͤ beléeue you, for that your Onuphrius hath so tolde you. But for your credites sake, M. Hardinge, leste al menne espie your Vanitie, tel vs, by whome was that Noble, and so Populous, and mighty Cittie of Athenes thus laide waste? By what Kinge? By what Captaine? By what forraine nation? At what time? Howe longe agoe? Hauinge not one poore Authour to allege, no not so mutche, as one, howe coulde ye pretende the names of so many without blushinge?

Lumen. & Μέγιστον Ἑλλάδος Ruffinus in Apologia pro Origine: Apud Hieron. Tom. 4. Georgius Patriar. in vita Iohannis. Ruffin. li. 2. ca. 9

The Cittie of Athenes had then continewed welneare twelue hundred yéres: And for knowledge in Philosophie, and renowme of Learninge, was called the Eie, and Vniuersitie of al Græcia. Origen writeth of him selfe, that he was sommetime a Student in Athenes. Chrysostome beinge eighténe yéres olde, for Learninges sake, was sente to Athenes. S. Basile, and his Brother Gregorie, afterwarde the Bishop of Nyssa, were Studentes at Athenes togeather thirténe yéres.

Dame Iohanne Pope.

yéres. Your owne Amphilochius, whoes Authoritie ye maie not in any wise denie, saithe thus of S Basile, Apprehendit Matrem Literarum Athenas: He came to Athenes, whiche is the Mother of Learninge. Boetius of Rome planted him selfe in Athenes for Learninges sake, about the yére of our Lorde 520.

M. Hardinges Amphilochius.

In the yére of our Lorde 680. the Bishop of Athenes was présente at the Councel holden at Constantinople, called Synodus Sexta. After that, in the yére of our Lorde 742 at the seconde Councel of Nice, a greate number of the Bishops of Græcia were présente in theire persones al togeather. Within fewe yéres after whiche time, folowed Pope Iohane, in the yére of our Lorde 853.

Theodorie. Li. 1. In Epist. ad Boethium.

It appeareth in the subscriptiõs of the 2. Nicene Con. Anno. 742.

Hitherto the whole Countrie, and Churche of Græcia continewed in safetie: and the Emperours of Christendome made their continual aboode in those partes. And haue you, M. Hardinge, so suddainely throwen downe al togeather, bothe Churche, Countrie, Towne, & Castle, onely to kéepe Pope Iohane from her Studie?

Ye saie, The whole Countrie of Attica was then becomme Barbarous. This tale is your owne, and hangeth onely vpon your owne credite. Yet Platyna, Sabellicus, and others moe, that wrote this Storie, and knewe, what they wrote, were not so Barbarous. But Barbarous is he, M. Hardinge, that wil beléeue your simple worde without warrante.

At that time (ye saie) the Cittie of Athenes was not standinge. But Paulus Aemylius saithe, that longe after that time, in the Reigne of Philip the Frenche Kinge, Gottofredus one of the House of Tricasses, was appointed, and made Dux Athenarum, & Princeps Achaiæ, The Duke of Athenes, and the Prince of Achaia. If there had benne then no Athenes standinge at that time, as you telle vs, howe then coulde Gottofredus haue benne made Duke of Athenes? If ye saie, as ye maie do mutche by your Coniectures, that, notwithstandinge the Cittie of Athenes were rased, and made waste, yet the dignitie, or name of honoure remained stil, yet wil the same Aemylius once againe reproue your Errour. For, writinge afterwarde of certaine Pirates, that had inuaded the Countrie of Græcia, he saithe thus, In terram Atticam delati, Athenarum Ducem Brennæ Nobilitatis virum occiderunt, Vrbemq; ceperunt: Inuadinge the Countrie of Attica, they tooke, and slewe the Duke of Athenes, one of the house of Brennus, and tooke the Cittie.

Paulus Æmylius Lib. 6. An. Domi. 1220.

Paulus Æmylius, Lib. 8. An. Dom. 1288.

In the yére of our Lorde, 1206. Michael Choniates, Brother vnto Nicetas Choniates, was the Bishop of Athenes: Nicephorus Gregoras about the yére of our Lorde, 1300. maketh mention of sundrie Dukes of Athenes: Leonicus, Chalcocondyla saithe, that one Izaulus, a ponge Gentleman of Italie, married the Duchesse of Athenes, and gotte the Cittie: And, that the reste of the Grecians leuied their powers againste the Atheniens: and that afterwarde about the yére of our Lord, 1440. Machumet the Emperoure of Turkie toke the Cittie of Athenes, and subdued it vnto him selfe, and hauinge it in possession, maruelled at the bewtie of the Castle, and at the force of the Walles.

Nicetas. Pag. 74 Nicephor. Gregor. Lib. 4. & 6. Chalcocon. Li. 4. Chalcocon. Li. 7. Chalcocon. Li. 9.

These thinges happened, as it is easie to recken, many hundred yéres after the time of Pope Iohane. Nowe therefore, I beséeche you, M. Hardinge, consider indifferently with your selfe: If there had benne no Cittie of Athenes then standinge, howe could these Pirates then, howe could Izaulus, how coulde Machomet inuade, and take the Cittie of Athenes? Shal we saie, They leuied an armie, and disquieted the Countrie, and troubled them selues, and came so farre to catch a shadowe?

No Vniuersitie in Rome

Thus hitherto it appeareth not, but if Dame Iohane would haue gonne to Athenes, there was rome sufficiente to receiue her.

After that shee came to Rome, and there professed Learninge openly. This (you saie) is soone confuted as false. For there was no Learninge at those daies professed at Rome, as the Stories doo declare. This is very sone confuted, M. Harding: and specially by him, that recketh so litle, what he saie. The Stories (you saie) doo declare it. Leaue, leaue this Hypocrisie: dissemble nomore: It is not manly: Tel vs in good sothe, what Writers, what Stories declare these thinges? your credite faileth ouer mutche: your worde is no sufficient warrante.

Dame Iohanne Pope.

Yée ſaie, There was no Learninge in thoſe daies profeſſed in Rome. And why ſo? Wil ye nowe ſaie of Rome, as ye earſte ſaide of Athenes? Wil yée ſaie, There was no Citie of Rome then ſtanding? Wil ye ſaie, Learning there was then vtterly deaded and the whole Countrie becomme Barbarous? If there were no ſtudie, nor place of Learninge then in Rome, where then was there any ſtudie in al Chriſtendome? For the Vniuerſities of Pariſe, Orleance, Tolouſe, Salerne, Padua, Bononia, Praga, Salamanca, were erected longe afterwarde. And therefore ye ſéme to ſaie, that al the whole worlde then was Barbarous.

But that yée maie the better ſée your ouerſighte, S. Hierome, writinge of Victorinus, and Donatus, ſaithe thus, Victorinus the Rhetorician, and Donatus the Grammarian, *my Schoolemaiſters, are accoumpted notable in* Rome. And againe, he ſaithe, Victorinus natione Apher, Romæ ſub Conſtantio Principe Rhetoricam docuit: Victorinus borne in Aphrica, taughte Rhetorique in Rome in the time of the Emperoure Conſtantius.

Hierony. In Appendice Annalium Euſebij. Hierony. in Catalogo Scriptor. Illuſtrium.

Eraſmus, writinge the Life of S. Hierome, ſaithe thus, Romam miſſus eſt, velut ad primariam eo ſæculo tum Religionis, tum Eruditionis Magiſtram, Liberalibus ſtudijs erudiendus: quod ipſe declarat enarrans. 11. Caput Ezechielis: Hierome was ſent to Rome, as to the Principal Schoolemaiſtreſſe in thoſe daies, bothe of Religion, and alſo of Learninge: *as he him ſelfe declareth, expoundinge the eleuenth Chapter of Ezechiel.* S. Auguſtine ſaith, Egiſti mecum, O Deus, vt mihi perſuaderetur, Romam pergere, & potius ibi docere, quod docebam Carthagine: *O God, thou mouedſt my minde to goe to* Rome, *and there rather to profeſſe openly the ſame Learninge, that I had profeſſed at* Carthage. And further he ſaith, Audiebam quietius ſtudere ibi adoleſcentes, & ordinatiore Diſciplinæ correctione ſedari: I hearde ſaie, that yonge menne there wente more quietly to their bookes, and were keapte in orderly obedience to theire ſtudies.

Eraſmus in Vita Hieronym. Auguſt. Confeſſ. Lib. 5. Cap. 8.

And in the Tripartite woorke ioined vnto the Councel of Laterane, ye maie finde the Storie hereof recorded thus: Primò Athenis Romam tranſlatum eſt ſtudium Philoſophicum: Deinde Roma Pariſios tempore Caroli, vt dicunt Hiſtoriæ: *Firſt the ſtudie of Philoſophie was tranſlated from* Athenes, to Rome: *and afterwarde, as the Stories ſaie, in the time of the Emperoure Charles, it was tranſlated* from Rome, to Paris.

In Opere Tripar. Lib. 2. ca. 10

What ſhal I more ſaie? The Pope him ſelfe in his owne Decretalles ſaithe, Rome is an Vniuerſitie, Theſe be his wordes, Curia Romana habet Studium Generale, & eius priuilegia: The Court of Rome hath an Vniuerſal Studie, and the Priuileges of the ſame. And againe, Pope Clemens ſaith, In Studijs Romanæ Curiæ, Pariſijs, Oxonij, Bononiæ, Salamancæ debent eſſe Profeſſores Linguarum, Hebraicæ, Chaldaicæ, Arabicæ: *In the Vniuerſities of* Rome, *of* Pariſe, *of* Oxforde, *of* Bononie, *and of* Salamanca, *there muſte be Profeſſours of the Hebrewe, Chaldee, and Arabique tongues.*

Extra. De Priuilegijs. Li. 4. Cùm de diuerſis. In Sexto. Clemens, Lib. 5. De Magiſtris.

To be ſhorte, Theodoricus Niemus, ſometime the Popes Secretarie, & therefore hauinge good cauſe, to knowe the truthe hereof, and, for ought that I knowe, hauinge no cauſe to diſſemble, of this whole mater writeth thus: Et nunc eſt Titulus, Cardinalis prædictæ Scholæ. Et olim in ea legebantur Septem Artes Liberales, & præcipuè Rhetorica: & etiam in ea legit quandoque Beatus Auguſtinus: & Iohannes, vocatus de Anglia. Et fuit Mulier de Maguntia nata, quæ ſtuduit Athenis ſub virili habitu: & in tantum profecit in Artibus, vt tandem veniens Romam, per biennium in eadem Schola Artes Liberales legerit: & adeò ſufficiens fuit, vt etiam Maiores, & Nobiliores vrbis eius Lectiones frequenter audiuerint. Et poſteà in Papam eligitur, &c. *Euen nowe, a* Cardinal *beareth the Title of the ſaide Schoole, or Vniuerſitie of* Rome. *And in olde times the Seuen Liberal Sciences, and ſpecially Rhetorique, were readde in the ſame. There alſo ſommetime readde* S. Auguſtine: *and one, that was called* Iohn of Englande. *This Iohn was a Woman, borne at Mens* (in Germanie) *and had ſtudied at* Athenes, *in the apparel of a Man: And had ſo profited in the Artes, that at laſte comminge to* Rome, *twoo yeeres togeather ſhee profeſſed the Liberal Sciences in the ſame Schoole. And her gifte in teachinge was ſutche, that the Elders, and Nobles of the Cittie reſorted often to heare herreade. Afterwarde ſhee was choſen Pope, &c.*

Theodoric. Niemus. Citatur ab Illyrico in Teſtibus Veritatis.

Thus manie waies, M. Hardinge, haue we foude an Vniuerſitie, or Schoole in Rome:

Dame Iohane Pope.

in Rome: and no cause to the contrarie, but Dame Iohane, beinge so wel learned, as it is saide, mighte wel be a Reader there.

But yée saie, VVhy keapte shee not her selfe in? Her midwike mighte better answeare this question. But what if shée were soddainely preuented before her time, as many be? Or, what if God wouldе haue sutche a mater so openly knowen, to the euerlastinge Detestation, either of the Persone, or of the Place? Certainely, Antoninus the Archebishop of Florence, beinge astonied with the horrour hereof, as it is saide before, crieth out, *O the deapthe of the wisedome, and knowledge of God. O howe vnsearcheable be his Iudgementes?*

The Popes time of trauaile.

The Authour hereof (saie you) durste not to auouche the mater for an vndoubted Truthe: but onely saithe, *Vt asseritur*, as it is saide: and so referreth al the whole to hearesaie. Notwithstandinge, M. Hardinge, many there be, that write this Storie, as a certaine Truthe, without doubtinge, or credite of hearesaie. And Platyna, al be it he wouldе not séeme to auouche ouer mutche, for the honour of the See of Rome, yet thus he saithe, Quod ferè omnes affirmant: *Whiche thinge in a manner al menne doo affirme.* And Rauisius Textor saith, Scitum est ex Chronicis, & à Maioribus scriptum: It is knowen by the Chronicles, *and written by our Elders.* It is knowen, saith one: It is affirmed in a manner by al menne, saith an other. But for the space of eighte hundred yéres, and more, there was no Writer, I trowe, so impudente, that wouldе condemne it for a Fable, as you doe, and vtterly denie it to be true.

Antonin. Par. 2. Titulo. 16. Cap. 1. § 7.

Vt asseritur.

Platyna in Iohan. 8.

In Officinâ.

Touchinge the Marble Image representinge a woman in childe bearinge, and the Popes suddaine breakinge of his waie, in his solemne procession, lette eche man weighe theise thinges, as him listeth. But, where ye compare that Image to one of the greate ragge stoanes at Stonage, or Longe Compton, as if it were vtterly vnwrought, and without shape, yée séeme wilfully to auouche, as your manner is, a great Untruthe. Uerily, Theodoricus Niemus, the Popes Secretarie, saith, Et adhuc vetus Statua Marmorea, illic posita figuratiuè monstrat (hoc factum). Vnde Summi Pontifices, dum ad Lateranum de Basilica Principis Apostolorum, & contrà vadunt, illud iter rectum non faciunt. Imò per alias vias per indirectum transeunt, illud aliquantulum prolongando: *Euen vnto this daie*, an olde Marble Image *there erected, vnder a Figure sheweth this mater. Therefore the Popes, when they passe from* S. Peters Churche to Laterane, *or backewarde, they take not their iorney streigth forthe, but passe vndirectly by other streetes, makinge theire waie somewhat the longer.* Leaste they shoulde be forced to their shame to beholde that Image. This therefore is not an olde VViues dreame, as you saie, but the Iudgemente of sundrie the wisest, and beste Learned in Rome, who might beste knowe the matter.

The Marble Image.

Theodoricus Niemus.

As for the Chaire of Porphyrie stoane, whiche otherwheres ye cal the Chaire of ease, it is to vile to be answeared. Sabellicus saithe, Spectatur adhuc in Pontificia domo Marmorea Sella, circa medium inanis: qua Nouus Pontifex continuò ab eius Creatione residet: vt sedentis genitalia ab vltimo Diacono attrectentur.

The holowe Chaire.

Sabellicus Enneadu. 9. Lib. 1.

But, let Truthe be Falsehedde: and let Stories be Fables. Yet, M. Hardinge, it maie please you to remember, that the same Fable was raised firste in Rome, & from thence onely, and from no place els, was published abroade into the worlde. But let the Popes owne Secretaries, and al the people there be deceiued: and, to shadowe the shame of that See, let Rome it selfe be the Mother of lies. Let noman knowe the certaine Truthe of maters, but onely Onuphrius, the Popes Parasite, and M. Hardinge. Yet neither wouldе so many Chronicles haue recorded, nor would the whole worlde so vniuersally haue beléeued theise thinges of the Pope, more then of any other Bishop, had there not benne wonderful corruption of maners, and dissolution of life, and open horrour, and filthinesse in that onely See, aboue al others.

Howe be it, good Christian Reader, that thou maiste wel, and clearely vnderstande, that our dealinge herein is plaine, and simple, and that wée haue not imagined theise maters, or any parcel thereof, our selues, maie it please thée to reade Platyna in Iohanne. 8. Sabellicus, Enneadis. 9. Lib. 1. Leonicus Chalcocondyla, a Greeke writer, Li. 6. Marianus Scotus, that liued about the yére of our Lorde, 1028. Sigibertus

Testimonies for the proufe of Pope Iohane.

Dame Iohane Pope.

Sigibertus Gemblacensis, that liued aboute the yére of our Lorde, 1100. Martinus Polonus, the Popes Penitentiarie, whome M. Hardinge so mutch defaceth: that liued about the yére of our Lorde, 1320. Rauisius Textor in Officina, Ca. Fœminæ habitum virilem mentitæ: Antoninus the Archebishop of Florence, par. 2. ti. 16. Volaterranus: Nauclerus: Carion: Constantinus Phrygio: Christianus Massæus: Matthæus Palmerius Florentinus: Anselmus Rid: Iohannes Parisiensis ca. 20. Supplementum Chronicorum: Chronica Chronicarum: Fasciculus temporum, and others moe. Of these, somme liued foure hundred, somme fiue hundred yéres agoe: and haue euer benne coumpted worthy of somme Authoritie: Notwithstandinge, for your Dame Iohanes sake, you M. Hardinge, beginne nowe to clippe theire credite. Howe be it, what so euer they were, certaine it is, They were no Lutheranes. All these with one consente agrée togeather, that Dame Iohane was Pope of Rome.

Notwithstandinge, somme of your owne Felowes of Louaine, coulde haue taught you, to haue dealte herein more discretely: and not so pretisely, & peremptorily to haue denied the whole Storie: specially being sent to you from your frendes in Rome, and confirmed by so many. And therefore one of your Louaniens woulde séeme handesomely to excuse, & shifte the mater by possibilitie of Nature. For thus he saithe in effecte, VVhat if the Pope were Hermaphroditus, an Herkinalson, that is to saie, a Man, and a woman bothe in one? Or, if this healpe wil not serue, he séemeth further to saie, VVhat if the Pope, beinge firste a man, were afterwarde changed into a woman? And thus for wante of better Diuinitie, he forceth Ouides Metamorphoses to serue the turne. If ye woulde haue taken this mannes aduise, out of doubt with suche a prety, VVhat if, ye mighte sone haue put vs out of countenance. His wordes be these, Neque ego hic quicquam dico de Hermaphroditis, & ἀνδρογύνοις, de quibus veterum libri pleni sunt. Et ne à nostri temporis memoria longiùs abeam, non ignoro, monumentis literarum esse traditum, Mulierem quandam nomine Aemyliam, Antonio Spensæ Ciui Ebulano nuptam, post duodecimum à nuptijs annum in virum transijsse. Legi etiam alteram Mulierem, vbi puerum peperisset, in marem fuisse mutatam: *I wil here saie nothinge of suche personnes, as be called* Hermaphroditi, and are bothe Man, and VVooman, al in one: *whereof in olde Writers wee finde mutche mention. But not to goe further, then to the remembrance of our owne time, I knowe, it is written, that a certaine woman named* Aemylia, *married vnto one* Antonius Spensa a Citizen of Ebulum, *tenne yeeres after shee had benne married, was turned into a man. I haue likewise readde of an other woman, that, when shee had benne broughte a bedde,* afterwarde became a Man. These notable Stories he alleged, to answeare the mater of Pope Iohane. Thus he thinketh it a greate deale the safer waie, to make the Pope an Herkinalson, or by Miracle to turne him from a Man into a VVoman, then simply, and plainely to confesse, that euer Dame Iohane was Pope in Rome.

Hermaphroditus.

Copus Dialog. 1. Pag. 47.

If you had taken this same waie, then al this Storie had benne a Fable, and a woman had benne a man: and we had vtterly benne confounded.

The Apologie, Cap. 2. Diuision. 1.

But what neede we rehearse Concubines, and Bawdes? For that is nowe an ordinarie, and a gaineful sinne in Rome. For Harlottes sitte there nowe a daies, not as they did in times passe, without the Cittie walles, and with theire faces hid and couered: but they dwel in Palaices and faire Houses: thei stray aboute in Courte, & market, and that with bare and open face: as who woulde saie, they maie not onely lawefully doo it, but oughte also to be praised for so dooinge. What shoulde we saie any more of this? Theire vicious & abominable life, is nowe thoroughly knowen to the whole worlde. Bernarde writeth roundly & truely of the Bishop of Romes house, yea & of the Bishop of Rome

Genes. 38.

of Rome him ſelfe. Thy Palaice, ſaith he, taketh in good men, but it maketh none: naughty perſones thriue there, and the good decaie. And who ſo euer he were, whiche wrote the Tripartite vvoorke, annexed to the Councel of Laterane, he ſaithe thus, So exceſsiue at this daie is the riote, aſvvel in the Prelates and Biſhoppes, as alſo in the Clerkes and Prieſtes, that it is horrible to be tolde. But theſe thinges be not onely growen in vze, and ſo by cuſtome and continuance of time wel allowed, as al the reſte of theire dooinges in manner bee, but they are nowe waxen olde, and rotten ripe. For who hath not heard, what a hainous acte Peter Aloiſius, Pope Paule the thirdes Sonne, committed againſte Coſmus Cherius the Biſhop of Fanum: what Iohn Caſa, Archebiſhop of Beneuentum, the Popes Legate at Venice, wrote in the commendation of a moſte abominable filthineſſe: and how he ſet foorthe with moſte lotheſome woordes, and wicked eloquence, the mater, whiche ought not once to proceede out of any bodies mouthe? To whoſe eares hath it not come, that Alphonſus Diazius a ſpaniard, beinge pourpoſely ſent from Rome into Germanie, ſo shamefully and diueliſhly murthered his owne Brother Iohn Diazius, a moſte Innocente, and a moſt Godly man, onely bicauſe he had embraced the Goſpel of Jeſus Chriſte, and woulde not returne againe to Rome?

But it maie chaunce, to this they wil ſaie: Theſe thinges maie ſometime happen in the beſte gouerned Common Wealthes, yea and againſte the Magiſtrates willes: & beſides, there be good Lawes made to pouniſhe ſutche. I graunt, it be ſo: But by what good Lawes (I woulde knowe) haue theſe greate miſchieues bene pouniſhed emongeſt them? Petrus Aloiſius, after he had donne that notorious Acte, that I ſpake of, was alwaies cheariſhed in his Fathers boſome Pope Paule the thirde, and made his very dearelinge. Diazius, after he had murthered his owne Brother, was deliuered by the Popes meanes, to thende he mighte not be pouniſhed by good Lawes. Iohn Caſa the Archebiſhop of Beneuentum is yet aliue, yea and liueth at Rome, euen in the eie and ſighte of the moſte holy Father.

M. Hardinge.

Courtiſanes weare abroade, ſo as the Matrones doo: ſome rode on Mules, ſomme dwelled in goodly houſes. VVhiche particulare diſorders, * as there they continewed not many yeeres, * ſo in theſe daies they haue benne reformed. VVherein ye folowe the Father of your Hereſies, and ſcholemaiſter of your malice the Deuil, who in Scripture is called *Accuſator Fratrum noſtrorum*, the accuſer of our Brethren. Apoc. 12.

But Sirs, howe leape ye from Rome to Placentia, from the Clergy to a temporal Duke, whom ye cal the Popes Sonne, though he was not his Sonne beinge Pope, but by lawful Matrimonie before holy Orders taken? For ſutche a one was Peter Aloiſius of whome yee ſpeake. Be it, that he was an euil man, VVhat maketh that againſte the Church? what for Defence of your newe Goſpel? If Iohannes Caſa beinge yet a yonge ſpringal, before he came to be a Clerke, and longe before he was either Biſhop or Legate, made certaine amourous Sonettes in Italian rime, folowing the Italian poete Petrarcha, to which kinde of exerciſe the good wittes of Italy in youthe are muche geeuen, and without naminge any perſone, flatteringly ſmoothed that heinous facte, rather then praiſed, wherin neuertheleſſe he did euil, wee confeſſe, and for the ſame ouerſighte of his youthe, was notwithſtandinge his other excellent qualities kepte backe from the dignitie of Cardinalſhip duringe his life: al this beinge graunted and conſidered, what hindereth it the eſtimation of Chriſtes Churche? And what furthereth it your falſe Doctrine, your Schiſmes, and your Hereſies? Touchinge the Deathe of Iohn Diazius the Spaniard, ye tel * many lies at once. Caſa.

*Vntruthes, greate and notorious.

O, a faire Boonegrace, to bewtifie open and knowen wickedneſſe.

*Vntruthe. For we tel no Lie. Reade the Anſwere.

The

Petrus Aloisius the Popes Sonne.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

We leapte not so lightly to Placentia, M. Hardinge, but rather reaste at Verona, and saie the Truthe. For Pope Paulus, that should haue punished his wicked Sonne, and haue burnte him to deathe for his abominable outrage, remoued not to Placentia, but remained stil in Rome. Iohannes Sleidanus saith, that the ponge Gentleman, the Bishop of Fanum, vpon whome Petrus Aloisius the Popes Sonne, had shewed that horrible villanie, shortely after died for shame, and heauinesse. Yet (he saithe) it is thought of somme, that Petrus Aloisius, after his wicked acte committed, gaue him poison, and so killed him, leaste he should make complainte thereof vnto the Emperoure. He addeth further, Paulus nihilò secius impensè amabat Filium: & ad ipsius amplificationem omne studium conuertit. Et cùm de eius flagitijs nonnunquam audiret, fertur non admodum ægrè tulisse: & hoc solùm consueuisse dicere, Hæc illum vitia non se commonstratore didicisse: Pope Paule neuertheless fauoured his Sonne aboue measure: *and bestowed al his care, to encrease him in Honoure. And, whereas he hearde sometime of his shameful actes, the reporte is, that he was not mutche offended therewith: but vsed onely thus to saie, Wel,* yewis he neuer learned these vices by my example. So cruel, and terrible is the Pope in reprellinge of Sinne.

Iohan. Sleidan. Lib. 19.

Iohan. Sleidan. Lib. 19.

But God of his Iustice would not suffer such abomination to escape vnpounished. Certaine of the Nobles of his owne Cittie, not longe after, arose againste him, and slewe him in his owne Palaice, and hunge out his vile Carkesse in shameful sorte, by a chaine ouer the walles, and afterwarde threwe it ouer into the mote. The people of al sortes ranne gladly to the fighte: and stabbe him in on euery side with their Daggers: and trodde him filthily vnder theire fete.

Ye saie, The particulare disorders of your Courteghians in these daies at the laste haue bene Refourmed. And yet by very credible reporte, euen within these two yeres, whiche was in the yere of our Lorde 1565. by a perfite viewe taken, there were found in Rome to the number of eight and twentie thousande women of that sorte. If this be the Reformation of the Churche of Rome, what was it then, before it was thus Refourmed?

As for that moste horrible Booke of Iohannes Casa, so vile, and so lotheseme, that no Heathen eares coulde abide to heare it. O howe fauourably, and howe frendly it is excused? He was then (ye saie) but a yonge man: but a springal: no Bishop: no Clerke: He named no persone: It was but a kinde of exercise: an ouersighte: an Amorous Sonet: The good wittes of Italie be mutche geuen to it: He praised not that faulte, but onely smoothed it. O M. Harding, what abomination is there vnder Heauen, but ye can diuise waies, howe to smothe it?

But he was pounished (yée saie) ful soare for his ouersight. For he coulde neuer be made Cardinal, during his life. Yea, good M. Hardinge: And al this must wée beleeue, bicause you speake it. The Pope made him the Archebishop of Beneuentum, and Legate a Latere, and thereby one of his Secrete Counsel, in parte of this cruel pounishement. But, thoughe he vpon that, or somme other occasion, were keapte backe from beinge Cardinal, yet were there others made Cardinalles, in al respecte as bad, as he. Reade Andreas Alciatus, that notable Ciuilian: And ye shal finde, what a minion was made Bishop of Comum, when Paulus Iouius was put biside. Reade Paulus Iouius in the Life of Clemens. 7. and learne, what pretty folkes then were made Cardinalles, and for what causes. As for your owne Onuphrius, he speaketh Parables, and casteth colours, and woulde séeme to meane more hereof, then he durste to vtter.

Andre. Alciatus in Epist. præfixa Historiæ Pauli Iouij.

Paulus Iouius.

Onuphrius in Iul. 10. 3.

Sueton. Tranquil. in Tiberio.

Tricongium vno spiritu.

The Emperoure Tiberius sommetime placed Nouellius Tricongius in moste highe and Honorable rowme, and made him Proconsul, in parte of recompense of his good seruice, for that he was hable to drinke three pottles of Wine togeather with one breathe. This was not the worthiest cause of promotinge suche Magistrates to suche a rowme: yet was there more honoure, and honestie in this cause of preferrmente, then hath benne thought to be in the preferringe of sundrie Cardinalles.

Touchinge the murtheringe of Iohannes Diazius, by his owne Brother Alphonsus, wherein, ye saie, wee haue tolde you so many lies at once, wée referre our

selues

Iohannes Diazius.

ſelues to the Storie thereof truely written by Iohannes Sleidanus: the effect wherof in ſhorte is this: One Iohannes Diazius a Spaniarde, and a Doctour of Sorbona in Pariſe, after that God had geuen him Grace to vnderſtande the Truthe of the Goſpel, departed from thence, and came into Germanie, and reaſted at Nuburge in the Dominion of Otho Henricus Countie Palatine. His Brother Alphonſus Diazius, beinge then in Rome, and vnderſtandinge hereof, immediately toke Horſes, and with al ſpede came into Germanie, mindinge to withdrawe his Brother from his purpoſe. And findinge him conſtant, and ſteadfaſte, and not likely any waies to be remoued, in the ende he fained him ſelfe, by the weight of his reaſons, to be perſuaded to the ſame Religion: and deſired him to returne with him into Italie, for that he ſhoulde do more good there, then he could in Germanie. But ſeinge him for ſundrie cauſes firmely bente to ſtaie there, he toke his leaue, and departed thence, and exhorted him to continewe conſtante in the Truthe, and came to Auguſta, fiue Dutche miles from Nuburge. The nexte daie, as hauinge forgotten ſome ſpecial mater, he had to ſaie to his Brother, he retourned backe againe from thence to Nuburge, and by the waie boughte a Carpenters Axe, and entringe into the Towne, vpon the .27. of Marche, he came to his Brothers lodginge at the breake of the daie, and him ſelfe watchinge beneath, ſent vp his ſeruante with the Axe to do the deede. The ſeruante, after he had called forthe Iohannes Diazius, and had deliuered him a letter from his Brother Alphonſus, and ſawe him turned towardes the lighte to reade the ſame, came ſuddainely behinde him, and ſtroke him in the heade with his Axe, and leauinge it ſticking in the wounde, came awaie together with Alphonſus his Maiſter. This is the very true ſtorie hereof, M. Hardinge, and in al theſe wordes there is no lie. Touchinge your Courthegianes (ye ſaie) the Pope of late hathe made a general Reformation. For nowe they are bothe remoued from their faire Palaices, wherein they dwelte, and alſo put from their Mules: As if the faulte had ben onely in their Mules, or Houſes, and not rather in their whole trade of life. Certainely, the ſame wemen continewe ſtil, euen in the Cittie of Rome, & that vnto the number of eight & twentie thouſand, as it is ſaide before. Sutche is the Reformation of the Church of Rome.

Iohan. Sleidan. Lib. 17. An. 1546.

The Apologie, Cap. 3. Diuiſion. 1. & .2.

They haue killed infinite numbers of our Brethren, onely becauſe thei beleeued truely, and ſincerely in Jeſus Chriſte. But of that greate and foule number of Harlottes, Fornicatours, Adulterers, what one haue they at any time (I ſaie not, put to deathe) but either Excommunicate, or once attached? Why? Volupteouſneſſe, Adulterie, Ribaudrie, Whoredome, Murtheringe of Kinne, Inceſte, and others more abominable partes, are not they coumpted Sinne at Rome? Or, if they be Sinne, ought Chriſtes Vicare, Peters Succeſſoure, the moſte holy Father, ſo lightly, and ſtiely to beare them, as though they were no Sinne, and that in the Cittie of Rome, & in that Principal Tower of al Holineſſe? O holy Scribes, and Phariſeis, whiche neuer knewe this kinde of Holineſſe. O, what a Holineſſe, what a Catholique Faithe is this? Peter did not thus teache at Rome: Paule did not ſo liue at Rome: they did not practiſe Brotheirie, as theſe doo openly: thei made not a yeerely reuenewe, and profite of Harlottes: They ſuffered no common Adulteroures, and wicked Murtherers, to goe vnpounished. They did not receiue them into their Familiaritie, into their Counſel, into their houſeholde, nor yet into the companie of Chriſtian men. Theſe menne ought not therfore ſo vnreaſonably to triumphe againſt our liuinge. It had benne more wiſedome for them, either firſt to haue

proued good theire owne life before the worlde, or at the leaste, to haue cloked it a litle more cunningly. For wee doo vse stil the Olde, and Anciente Lawes, and (asmuche as menne maie doo, in the manners vsed at these daies, al thinges beinge so wholy corrupte) we diligently, and earnestly put in execution the Ecclesiastical Discipline: wee haue not common Brothel houses of Strumpettes, nor yet flockes of Concubines, nor Heardes of Harlotte haunters: neither doo wee preferre Adulterie before Matrimonie: neither doo we exercise beastly sensualitie: neither doo wee geather ordinarie rentes, and stipendes of Stewes: nor doo wee sutfer Inceste, and abominable naughtinesse, nor yet sutch Aloisians, Casians, and Diazians to escape vnpounished. For if these thinges woulde haue pleased vs, wee needed not to haue departed from these mennes felowship, emongest whome sutche enormities be in their chiefe pride and price. Neither needed wee for leauinge them, to renne into the hatred of menne, and into moste wilful daungers.

Paule the fourthe, not many monethes sithence, hadde at Rome in prison certaine Augustine Freers, many Bishoppes, and a great numbre of other deuoute men, for Religions sake. He racked them, & tormented them: to make them confesse, he leaft no meanes vnassaied. But in the ende how many Brothels, how many Whoremongers, howe many Adulterers, how many Incestuous persones coulde he finde of al those?

M. Hardinge.

This yee denie as impudently, as yee affirmed the other matter of Diazius falsely. Wherefore what punishement is due to slaunderers, that ought this Defender to haue for this false slaunder. Then commeth me your Secretarie, and praiseth him selfe, and al you his holy companions, besides al witte and modestie. And saith muche in commendation of your Ministershippes goodnesse, for that ye keepe and vse stil the Olde and Anciente Lawes, forsoothe, and Discipline of the Churche.

A braue, and a lusty kinde of Eloquence.

For shame, for Conscience, for regarde of the worlde, for feare of Gods wrathe, for auoidinge euerlastinge fyre, retourne to the Catholike Churche, from whence yee are broken out like the fatte Bulles of Basan, put awaie your moste vnlawful yokefellowes. Leaue your selues to be abominable, before with sutche spiteful railinge ye reprehende our *Infirmitie.

*Fornication, Open Stewes, and Incestе, are M. Hardinges *Infirmities.*

The Apologie, Cap. 2. Diuision. 3.

Our God be thanked, although we be not the men, we ought, and professe to be, yet whosoeuer, and whatsoeuer wee be, compare vs with these men: and euen our own life, & Innocencie wil soone proue vntrue, & condemne their malicеouse surmises. For we exhorte the people to al vertue, & wel dooing, not onely by bookes and preachinges, but also by our examples, & behaueour. We also teach that the Gospel is not a boasting, or bragging of knowlege, but that it is the Lawe of life, & that a Christian man (as Tertullian saith) ought not to speake honorably, but oughte to liue honorably: nor that they be the hearers of the Lawe, but the dooers of the Lawe, which are iustified before God.

M. Hardinge.

Nay, nay, Syrs, for that thinge ye crake so mutch of, be not too hasty to thanke your God. What peculiare God yee meane, we knowe not. That phrase your Secretarie much vseth, as though ye had an other God beside him that is God of al. Compare your selues with whome yee liste, your owne life and innocencie is so wel knowen, as by reprouinge your vices and horrible sinnes, no man lightly shal seeme a slaunderer. In deede if your continual aduouterie and Incestе were lawful Matrimonie, if your filthy yokefellowes were your true wedded Wiues, if your robbinge, and throwinge downe of Churches were almose, and buildinge of places for praier to the encrease of Goddes Honoure, if ignorante rashenesse were Godly discretion, if your woorde of the Lorde, were Goddes woorde, if your pretensed Gospel, were Christes true Gospel, if your biblebable and railinge were holsome Preachinge, if the Sprite of Sathan, that is in you, the same also beinge a lieinge Sprite in your mouthes, coulde be meeke, humble, obedient, and would tel Truthe, finally if euil were good, if darke-

*Is this the modestine of the Sprite of God?

Our God our Lord.

if darkenesse were lighte, if sower were sweete, if the fruites of your so naughty a tree were good, we woulde also soothe you, and vpholde your immoderate crakes. VVee saie plainely of you at one woorde, whiche wee wil to be a watchewoorde for al Christen people to beware of you, your Doctrine is Heresie, your Life is iniquitie, your endenoure tendeth to the subuersion of Soules.

The Bisshop of Saris burie.

It is no great Crake, M. Hardinge, to geue God thankes. But what vncourteous dealinge is this of your parte? Sir Defender, and his Felowes muste comme to you, and learne to speake. Notwithstandinge for ought, that maie appeare, ye are not yet very wel aduised, howe to speake your selfe. Nowe because we saie, wee thanke our God, our Secretarie hathe made him selfe a Seueral God. Howe be it, you maie saie, Our Lorde, and thinke him not Catholique, that wil saie otherwise: and yet make you not your selues thereby any Seueral Lorde. God geue you Grace, ye be not seuered from the Lorde. But wherefore it should be more lawful for you, to saie, Our Lorde, then for vs, to saie, Our God, I thinke it a highe pointe of cunninge for you to open.

Thus ye woulde haue vs sommetimes to saie, Our Lorde: sommetimes, The Lorde: sommetimes neither. It were a skilful Cooke, that knewe your diete. Howe be it, The Prophete Dauid saithe, Deus noster refugium, & Virtus: Our God, *our Refuge, and our Strengthe:* Singe Psalmes vnto Our God: Our God is the God of Saluation: Our God *is in Heauen*, My God, O My God, *I wake earely vnto thee:* Thou arte My God: *I truste in thee: My lottes are in thy handes.* S. Paule saithe, *I thanke* My God *alwaies: I geeue thankes vnto* My God. Thus was it lawful then for the Apostles, and Prophetes to speake without rebuke: Neither was there any M. Hardinge, then so vncourteous, to saie, They made them selues a peculiare God. *Psalm. 46. Psalm. 64. Psalm. 113. Psalm. 63. Psalm. 15. Psalm. 67.*

S. Paule saithe, *Wee are iustified in the name of Iesus Christe* Our Lorde, *and in the Sprite of* Our God. S. Augustine saithe, Contra istos Mirabiliarios cautum me fecit Deus Meus, dicens, In Nouissimis diebus surgent Falsi Prophetæ: My God *hathe willed mee to beware of these Mungers of Miracles, tellinge mee, that in the laste daies there shal rise vp False Prophetes.* Againe he saithe, Deus Meus vbique præsens est: Vbique totus: nusquam inclusus: My God *is euerywhere present: euerywhere whole: nowhere inclosed, or shut vp.* Chrysostome saithe, Christo meo testificabantur & Venti, & Mare: *Bothe the Windes, and the Sea bare witnesse to* my Christe. S. Hierome saithe, Ego non Patrem, non Matrem, non Germanum aduersus Christum meum audiam: *I wil not heare neither Father, nor Mother, nor Brother, againste* my Christe. S. Cyprian saith, Hic est Deus noster, id est, non omnium, sed Credentium, & Fidelium Deus: *This is* Our God, *that is to saie, not the God of al, but the God of the Beleeuers, and of the Faithful.* Sedulius saithe, Deus Natura omnium est: Voluntate verò paucorum: *God by Nature, is the God of al: but by wil, he is the God of Fewe.* But what shal we neede many Doctours, the cause beinge so cleare? You your selfe, M. Hardinge, in this selfe same Booke, either of pourpose vpon somme better aduise, or vnwares, haue written the same. Consider wel your owne woordes: Thus ye saie, There is no iniquitie in Our Lorde God. Yet, I trowe, by theise woordes, ye make not to your selfe a peculiare God. *Lib. 1. Cap. 29. Chrysost. in Psal. 96. Hierony. Aduersus error. Iohan. Hierosolymitan. Cyprian. De Bono Pœnitentiæ. Sedulius, In 2. Cor. 6. M. Har. fo. 124. b.*

S. Paule saithe, *I liue in the Faithe of the Sonne of God, whiche hath loued me, and hath geeuen him selfe for my sake.* Which woordes S. Chrysostome, writinge vpon the Genesis, expoundeth thus: Qui dilexit me, &c. Vt proprium vsurpas commune beneficium. Profectò, inquit: Nam licet pro omni hominum genere Sacrificium oblatum sit, tamen propter amorem in eum, id, quod factum est omnibus, proprium mihi facio. Ita & Prophetis mos est, & facere, & dicere, Deus, Deus Meus: quamuis totius Orbis sit Deus, Sed peculiare hoc est amori, vt ex communibus propria faciat. Qui dilexit me. Quid dicis? An te dilexit solum? Omnem, inquit, hominum Naturam dilexit. Sed ego illi Gratias debeo, quasi me Solum dilexisset, & tradidisset semetipsum pro me Solo. S. Paule saith, *Christe hath loued mee.* O Paule, *The benefite, that is common to al, thou vsest as peculiare to thee selfe. Yea verily, saithe* S. Paule: *For al be it, that Sacrifice were offered for al Mankinde, yet for the Loue, that I beare towardes him, the thinge that was donne to al, I accoumpt as proper, and seuerall to mee selfe Alone. Thus the manner of the Prophetes is to doo, and to saie,* O God, my God: *notwithstandinge he is the God of al the World.* *Galat. 2. Chrysost in Genesim. Homil. 34.*

But this is the ſpecial, and alonely office of Loue, of thinges common to make thinges peculiare. Thou ſaiſte, Chriſte hath Loued mee. What ſaieſt thou? Hathe Chriſte loued thee Onely, and woman elſe? No ſaithe Paule, *He hath loued al Mankinde.* But I owe him thankes, as if he had loued mee Alone, and had geeuen him ſelfe Onely for mee.

Henceforth, M. Hardinge, it male pleaſe you to geue vs leaue to ſpeake as the Prophetes, the Apoſtles, the Holy Fathers, and Doctours haue ſpoken before vs.

The Apologie, Cap. 4. Diuiſion. 1.

Beſides al theſe maters, wherewith they charge vs, they are woonte alſo to adde this one thinge, which they enlarge with al kinde of ſpite: that is, that wee be menne of trouble, that wee pluche the Swoorde, and Scepter out of Kinges handes: that wee arme the people: that we ouerthrowe iudgemente places, deſtroie the Lawes, make hauoke of poſſeſſions, ſeeke to make the people Princes, turne al thinges vpſide downe: and, to be ſhort, that wee woulde haue nothing in good frame in a Common Wealthe. Good Lorde, howe often haue they ſet on fiere Princes hartes, with theſe woordes, to the ende they might quenche the lighte of the Goſpel in the very firſte appearinge of it, and that menne mighte beginne to hate the ſame, ere euer they were hable to knowe it, and to the ende that euery Magiſtrate might thinke, he ſawe his deadly enimie, as often as he ſawe any of vs. Surely it ſhoulde exceedingly greeue vs, to be ſo maliceouſly accuſed of moſt hainous Treaſone, onleſſe wee knewe, that Chriſte him ſelf, the Apoſtles, and a number of good Chriſtian menne, were in time paſte blamed, and reuiled in like ſorte. For althoughe Chriſte taught, they ſhoulde geue vnto Cæſar, that vvhiche vvas Cæſars: yet was he charged with ſedition, and was accuſed to diuiſe ſome Conſpiracie, and to ſeeke waies to geate the Kingedome. And thereupon they cried oute with open mouthe againſte him in the place of Judgemente: If thou lette this manne eſcape, then thou arte not Cæſars friende.

And though the Apoſtles did likewiſe euermore, & ſtedfaſtly teach, that Magiſtrates ought to be obeied, that euery Soule oughte to be ſubiect to the Higher Powers, not onely for feare of vvrathe, and pouniſhemente, but euen for conſcience ſake, yet bare they the name to diſquiet the people, and to ſtir vp the multitude to rebelle. After this ſorte did Haman ſpecially bringe the Nation of the Jewes into the hatred of Kinge Aſſuerus, bicauſe, ſaide he, they vvere a rebellious and ſtubborne People, and deſpiſed the ordinaunces, and commaundements of Princes. Wicked Kinge Achab ſaid to Elie the Prophete of God, It is thou, that troubleſt Iſrael. Amaſias, the Prieſte at Bethel, laide a conſpiracie to the Prophet Amos charge, before King Ieroboã, ſaieing, See, Amos hath made a conſpiracie againſt thee, in the middeſt of the houſe of Iſrael. To be briefe, Tertullian ſaithe, This was the general accuſation of al Chriſtians, whiles he liued, that they were Traitours, that thei were Rebelles, & the enimies of Mankind. Wherfore, if nowe adaies the Truthe be likewiſe euil ſpoken of, & beinge the ſame Truth, it was then, if it be nowe like deſpiteſully vſed, as it was in times paſt, though it be a greeuous and vnkinde dealinge, yet can it not ſeeme vnto vs a newe, or an vnwoonted matter. *M. Har.*

3. Reg. 18.

Amos. 7.

Tertull. in Apologetico.

M. Hardinge.

Howe farre ye haue attempted (I meane the ſectes of your Brotherhed) in ſundrie Countries, to wreaſt the Sworde out of Princes handes, to tranſpoſe theire Scepters at your pleaſure, and to alter ſtates and ſignories, though we holde our peace, (a) the worlde Iudgeth, the bloude of ſo many thouſandes ſlaine ſpeaketh, Englande repenteth, Scotlande mourneth, Germanie roareth, France bewaileth, Sauoie weepeth, al Chriſtendome lamenteth. (b) VVere the hundred thouſand Boures of Germanie conſumed by the Swoorde of the Nobilitie there for their obedience? The Duke of Saxonie, and Lantgraue of Heſſe, were they ouerthrowen in fielde and taken captiue for ſtandinge in Defence of their Soueraigne? VVere ſo great multitudes of people deſtroied at Munſter for their loialtie? Your Sacramentarie Suitzers of Berna, who robbed the quiet Olde Duke of Sauoye of his Townes, and Countries, from the farther ſide of the lake of Geneua vnto the Alpes, did they this for maintenance of his righte, and to ſet him at reſte with litle? VVhat meante ye, when ye laide your Heades togeather, being at Geneua in Queene Maries daies, the Faithful (c) Brothers of Englande, and Scotlande, and deuiſed a moſt Seditious and Traiterous Booke againſt the monſtrous regiment of VVoomen?

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Here, M. Hardinge, for wante of mater, ye thought it good policie, to furniſhe your tale with ſtoare of wordes: The world iudgeth: Bloude ſpeaketh: Englande repenteth: Scotland mourneth: Germanie roareth: France bewaileth: Sauoie weepeth: Chriſtendome lamenteth. If ye had dot wel ſtudied your Copia Verborum, ye coulde neuer haue benne halfe ſo copious, nor haue benne hable, ſo many waies to vtter nothinge. Ye might happily haue ſaide, Your Cardinalles crie, and your Pope roareth, and your Friendes ſtande aloofe, and teare theire beare, and ſaie, as it is written in the Apocalyps, Vę, væ Babylon, Ciuitas illa Magna: *Alas, alas Babylon, that Greate Cittie.* *Apoca. 18.*

God be thanked, The Kingedomes, and Princehodes of the worlde ſtande nowe in as ſafe, and in as quiete, and floriſhinge ſtate, as euer before. Therefore this Tragical Rhetorique might better haue ſerued you ſomme other where.

The Boures of Germanie, of whome ye ſpeake, for the greateſt part, were Aduerſaries vnto Doctour Luther, and vnderſtode no parte of the Goſpel: but conſpired togeather, as they ſaide, onely againſt the crueltie, & tyrannie of theire Lordes: as they had donne two and twentie yeares before in the ſame Countrie, in the Conſpiracie, called Liga Sotularia, fifténe yeares before Doctour Luther beganne to Preache: The parteners of which Conſpiracie had for their watch worde the name of Our Lady: and in the honoure of her, were bounde to ſaie fiue Aue Maries euery daie. Certainely, touching theſe Later Rebelles, it is knowen, that Luther ſharpely and vehemently wrote againſt them. And they them ſelues being demaunded therof, vtterly denied bothe the partetakinge, and alſo the knowledge of the Goſpel. *Liga Sotularia, An. 1503. D. Luther began to Preache. An. 1518. Ioan. Sleidan. Lib. 4. & 5. Paralipomen. Vſpergen. Anno 1525. Nicol. Cerbellinus Thorizenſis.*

The Princes of Germanie raiſed not their Powers (as ye ſaie) againſte the Emperoure Charles the fifthe: but beinge wrongefully, and contrarie to the Lawe of armes inuaded by him, they were forced, beinge frée Princes, by the Lawe of Nature, to drawe their Sworde in their owne Defenſe.

The Rebelles at Munſter were not Goſpellers, as yé ſéme to meane, but frantique Anabaptiſtes, & Heretiques, as ye bée: and therefore enimies vnto the Goſpel.

The Lordes of Berna neuer were Subiectes to the Duke of Sauoie. That they toke certaine of his Caſtles in theire Confines, they did it rightly, and by the Lawe of Armes, beinge forced thereto by daiely inuaſions, and robberies, and not hable otherwiſe to liue in reaſte. But in déede the ſaide poore Duke was thorowely ſpoiled of his whole Dominion: of the one halfe, by his Brother in Lawe the Emperoure Charles. & of the other half, by his Neuewe Franciſe the Frenche Kinge, by the counſel of Pope Clemens. & after theire great enterute we at Marſiles. And therof was deuiſed a prety Paſquil, declaringe the miſerable caſe of the poore Duke, Diuiſerunt ſibi veſtimenta mea, & ſuper veſtem meam miſerunt ſortem: *They haue diuided my apparel emongeſt them ſelues: and they haue caſte lotes for my Coate.*

The Heades of Englande, and Scotlande, that (as ye ſaie) were laide togeather at Geneua, touchinge the gouernemente of VVeemen, beinge wel accompted, were nothinge ſo many, as yé woulde ſéme to imagine. For if there had benne but one leſſe, for ought, that I haue hearde, there had benne but one at al. Suche boate Amplifications it liketh you to make of ſo ſmal a number. We wil defende noman in his erroure.

The Boures in Germanie.

(a) Vntruth, notorious, and manifeſt to al the worlde.

(b) Theſe Boures for the greateſt parte were enimies vnto Luther.

(c) Al this greate multitude of Englande, and Scotland, ſtood onely in twoo perſons. VVee knowe no moe.

Let euery man beare his owne guilte. M. Caluine, M. Martyr, M. Musculus, M. Bullinger, and others, whome you cal the Faithfull Brothers of Englande, misliked that enterprise, and wrote against it.

We know, that God hath determined this mater longe sithence: For thus he saithe, Si Homo moriatur absque Filio, ad Filiam eius transibit Hæreditas: *If a Man die without a* Sonne, *his enheritaunce shal passe vnto his* Daughter. Numer. 27.

And S. Augustine saithe, Lata est Romæ Lex illa Voconia, Ne quis Hæredem Fœminam faceret, nec Vnicam Filiam. Qua Lege quid iniquius dici, aut cogitari possit, ignoro: *There was a Lawe made in* Rome, *called* Lex Voconia, *That noman shoulde conueie his* Enheritaunce vnto a woman, *no not vnto his onely Daughter*. Then whiche Lawe I knowe not, what maie be more wickedly thought or spoken. August. de Ciuit. Lib. 3. C. 4. 21

But, God be thanked, that of his Mercie, hath nowe raised vp vnto vs a Woman of suche VVisedome, Learninge, Clemencie, Grauitie, Iudgemente, Gouernemente, and other Noble, and Princely Vertues, as haue not benne seene in manye Wenne. God encrease her daiely with his Holy Spirite, and make her an olde Mother in Israel. Amen.

Of your sturdy blastes, and Secrete breathinges, M. Hardinge, I wil sale nothinge. Ye maie yet remember, whiche of your Louanian companie it was, that in the time of that Noble Prince of Blessed Memorie, Kinge Edwarde the. 6. saide in open Parlamente, *Woe be to that Kingedome, the Prince whereof is a Childe*. And afterwarde, seinge the Queenes Maiestie, that nowe is, placed in her estate, boldely, and openly confessed a great ouersighte, and matche folie in your former dwinges, for that in the late time of your vnruely gouernemente yee had hewen downe the boughes, and leafte the Stocke standinge stil. Goddes Secrete Prouidence, M. Hardinge, breathed against you, and confounded your dwinges. Power onely ye lacked: but god wil ye lacked none.

M. Hardinge.

For answeare to al this, yee ioine your selues with Christe and his Apostles, as though ye were gilty herein nomore then they. Presumptuously saide. But the mater is not so answeared. And yet ye runne at large in that common place, and very vainely, or rather Luciferlike, compare your selues with the Apostles. But Sirs, staie here, runne no farther. Yee are soone stopped. The case is not like pardie. These be but your woordes. In the Apostles was the Truthe in deede, so was it in the Holy Prophetes, and those firste Blessed meane of the Churche. The Truthe ye boaste and crake so much of, is not that Truthe. Talke lesse like Rhetoricians, and proue vs that ye haue Truthe, like honeste menne. And then talke on: but that can yee neuer doo, so longe as ye remaine out of the Churche, and enimies to the Churche. * But what spende I woordes in vaine? Your hartes be hardened, your Eies be blinded, your Eares be stopped.

*O Vaine brauerie.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Here is profound stuffe, M. Harding, for a Doctour of Diuinitie. To answeare you with your owne vaine woordes, in deede ye spende your woordes in vaine.

The Apologie, Cap. 4. Diuision. 2.

Fourtie yeeres agoe, & vpwarde, it was an easy thinge for them to diuise against vs these accursed speaches, & other too, soarer then these: when in the middest of the darkenesse of that age, first began to springe, and to geue shine somme one glimmeringe beame of Truth, vnknowen at that time, and vnhearde of: when also Martin Luther, & Hulderike Zvvinglius, beinge moste excellente menne, euen sente of God, to geeue lighte to the whole Worlde, Firste came vnto the knoweledge, and preachinge of the Gospel: when as yet the thinge was but newe, and the succesle thereof vncertaine: and when mennes mindes stoode doubtful and amased, and theire eares open to al sclaunderous tales: and when there couldе be imagined against vs no facte so detestable, but the People then woulde soone beleeue it, for the noueltie & strangenesse of the matter. For so did Symmachus, so did Celsus, so did Iulianus,

Iulianus, so did Porphyrius the old foes to the Gospel, attempt in times paste to accuse al Christians of Sedition & Treason, before that either Prince, or people were able to know, who those Christians were, what they professed, what they beleeued, or what was theire meaninge.

M. Hardinge.

As ye runne foorth your race, and with lieinge amplification boaste and bragge of the Truthe of your Doctrine, and of the Innocencie of your demeanour ye fal into a great inconuenience and ouersight. VVas the light extinguished in al Israel, til that lewde Friere came, and Zuinglius (a) the swarte Rutter? Shal wee nowe change the olde songe of Micheas the Prophete, Out of Sion shal come the Lawe, and the woorde of our Lorde from Ierusalem, and singe a new Songe, Out of (b) VVittenberg is come the Gospel, and the woorde of the Lorde from Zurich, and Geneua? If Luther and Zuinglius firste came to the knowledge and preachinge of the Gospel, what meante Christe to breake his promise, who saide, I wilbe with you al daies til the ende of the worlde?

Againe how forgate ye the olde prouerbe, a lier it behoueth to be mindeful? Remember ye not howe this is (c) contrarie to al your owne Doctrine? For saie ye not otherwheres, that God had alwaies his number of the electe, and his inuisible Churche? Therefore this muste ye recante and cal backe againe, or els shal ye pulle al the rabble of sundrie your owne sectes vpon your shoulders, whose filthy railinges, and vile vpbraidinges poore soules ye shal neuer be able to abide.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

It is not woorthe the while, to answeare him that saithe nothinge. Sion, from whence, ye saie, the Lawe of God issued firste, was in those daies, as mutche disdeigned of your Fathers, as is this daie of you Geneua, or VVittenberg. Origen saithe of Celsus the Heathen, Christianum Dogma affirmat à Barbaris cepisse ortum, hoc est, à Iudæis: *He saithe, that the Christian Faithe tooke her firste beginninge from* Barbarous *people, that is to saie, from the* Iewes. Cicero saithe, Iudæi, & Syri, Gentes natæ seruituti: *The* Iewes, *and* Syrians, *Nations borne to Bondage.*

And Chrysostome speakinge of Iulianus the Renegate, saithe thus, Galilæos nos, pro Christianis, in Edictis suis appellauit: *In his proclamations, in the steede of* Christians, *he called vs scornefully* Galileans: Nothinge thereby the vileneste of the place, from whence the Gospel of Christe firste proceded. But Nazianzene saithe, Honora paruam Bethleem, quæ te induxit in Paradisum: (Despise not, but rather) *Honour that* litle Bethleem, *that hathe leadde thee into Paradise.*

The sounde of this simple, Barbarous, despised people, was hearde throughout the whole worlde. *God causeth his Light to shine out of the Darke:* His Holy Spirite *breatheth, where he thinketh good:* He hathe *no regarde of Persons, or choise of places*, but, as S. Peter saide vnto Cornelius, *In euery Nation, who so euer feareth him, and woorketh righteousnesse, is accepted before him. God chuseth the weake thinges of the worlde, to confounde the stronge.* Goddes Holy Name be blessed, that of so litle, and so simple a despised Mustarde sede, hathe nowe raised vp so greate a tree: *and triumpheth the Gospel of Christe his Sonne in euery place throughout the worlde.*

VVhat meante Christe (saie you) to breake his promise? Nay, what meante you, M. Hardinge, so shamefully to breake Christes Commaundemente, & yet to charge him with his Promise? *God is true in al his promisses, and shal preuaile, when he is so lewdely iudged.* There is no fault in God, or his Christ: The fault is in you, that haue made of the House of God, a Caue of Theeues. Christe neuer made any suche special Promise vnto the Pope, that, what so euer it shoulde please him to saie, or do, he should neuer erre, or do amisse. Ye presume ouer mutch of Goddes Promisses. Nay, though Antichriste shoulde be Pope, yet shoulde Christes promisses be true stil.

It is true, that God hath alwaies a Churche Inuisible, and a number of Electe, knowen onely to him selfe alone. Neither is this our onely saieinge. S. Paule also saithe the same: Firmum stat Fundamentum Dei, habens hoc sigillum, Nouit Dominus, qui sint sui: *This Foundation standeth sounde, and firme, hauinge this Seale,* The Lorde knoweth, who be his owne. Elias thought, al the Godly in Israel had benne slaine: and not one leafte aliue. But God saide vnto him, *I haue saued vnto mee selfe seuen thousande menne, that neuer bowed theire knee before* Baal. God knewe them: but Elias knewe them not. To the iudgement of man, they were inuisible. Therefore

(a) Vntruthe, maliceous, and sclaunderous. For Zuinglius was a Godly Preacher, and no Rutter.

(b) This Blasphemie toucheth Goddes Prouidence. For why not as wel from VVittenberg, as from Rome?

(c) Vntruthe sonde, and childishe. This is M. Hardings sobrietie.

Origen. Contra Celsum, Lib. 1.
Cicero. De Prouin. Consul.
Chrysost. Contra Gentes.
Nazianzen. De Natali Christi.
καὶ τὴν βηθλεὲμ τιμήσου τὴν μικρὰν.
Psalm. 19.
Iohan. 2.
Acter. 10.
Matth. 13.
1. Corinth. 1.

2. *Timoth. 2.*

1. *Reg. 19.*
Roman. 11.

VVittenberg. Churche Inuisible.

S. Augustine saithe, Secundum occultam Dei Prædestinationem, plurimæ sunt foris Oues: plurimi Lupi intùs. Nouit enim, ac signatos habet, qui nec eum, nec se norunt: *Accordinge to Goddes Secrete Predestination, there be many Sheepe without the Churche: and many woolues within the Churche. For he knoweth them, and hath them marked, that know neither them selues, nor God neither.*

Aug. in Iohan. Tract. 45.

Addition. ☞ As for the whole Body, and Companie of al them, that be called Christians, reckened vniuersally togeather, whiche you cal the Churche Catholique, Cardinal Cusanus calleth it, Ecclesia Coniecturalis, *A Churche Coniectural*, for that wee knowe it, not by certainetie, but by Coniecture. For in this Churche, thus largely taken, they, that seme Predestinate before Penne, are oftentimes wicked, and reprobate before God: And they, that before Penne seme the Members of Christe, are oftentimes before God the Members of Antichriste. Cusanus wordes be theise, Oportet in Sensibili Mundo Sensibilibus Signis de ipsa Christi Ecclesia Coniecturam sumere, cùm aliter attingi nequeat rationis veritas &c. *In this Sensible worlde, that is here beneath, wee muste learne by Sensible Tokens to know the very Churche of Christe: For otherwise wee are not hable to reache the Truthe. Therefore this* Coniectural Churche *in this Sensible worlde, accordinge to suche a shorte knowledge, as this worlde maie yeelde, is in deede the true Churche: Notwithstandinge accordinge to the* Coniecture, *that we geather by Tokens, it receiue as wel the Godly, that be ioined to Christe, as also the vngodly, that be diuided from Christe. This Churche standeth of them, that declare by Sensible, and Outwarde Tokens, that they be partetakers of Christe, as they be, that Confesse Christe to be the Sonne of God. And therefore, this Churche hath certaine Holy Tokens, or Sacramentes,* (as the Sacramente of Baptisme, and the Sacramente of our Lordes Supper) *ordeined to that ende, that thereby wee maie know them, that be of Christe, so far forthe, as by suche Tokens* Coniectural knowledge *maie be geathered. Therefore I saie, That this Churche of Christe* (in this general takinge) *by this* Coniectural Iudgemente *is Coumpted holy, notwithstandinge wicked Menne, and Hypocrites couer them selues vnder the same Outwarde Tokens, and receiue Baptisme, and the Lordes Supper, as wel, as the Godly.* Thus the General, or outwarde Churche of God is Visible, and maie be sene: but the very true Churche of Goddes Electe, is Inuisible, and cannot be sene, or discerned by man: but is onely knowen to God alone. ☜

Nicol. Cusanus De potestate Ecclesiæ Romanæ, Epist. 1.

Thus the number of Goddes Electe, yea before the comminge of Christe, in the time of darkenesse, was euermore certaine: yet afterwarde the knowledge of the Gospel, by the Mouthes of the Apostles, was abundantly carried abroade into the endes of al the worlde.

Bothe these partes, M. Hardinge, maie stande wel togeather: and are nothinge contrarie to our Doctrine. Be the number of the Faithful more, or lesse, yet the Truthe of God is one for euer.

The Apologie, Cap. 5. Diuision. 1.

But nowe, sithence our very enimies doo see, and cannot denie, that wee euer in al our woordes, and writinges haue diligently put the people in minde of their duetie, to obeie their Princes, and Magistrates, yea though they be wicked, (For this doothe very trial and experience sufficiently teache, and al mennes eies, who so euer, and where so euer they be, doo wel see, and witnesse for vs) it was a foule parte of them to charge vs with these thinges: and, seeinge they could finde no newe and late faultes, therefore to seeke to procure vs enuie, onely with stale and outworne lies. Wee geeue our Lorde God thankes, whose onely cause this is, there hathe yet at no time benne any suche example in al the Realmes, Dominions, and Common Weales, which haue receiued the Gospel. For wee haue ouerthrowen no Kingedome: wee haue deraied no mannes Power, or right: We haue disordered no Common Wealth. There continue in their owne accustomed state, and Ancient Dignitie, the

Ciuile magistrate.

the Kinges of our countrie of Englande, the Kinges of Denmarke, the Kinges of Suecia, the Dukes of Saxonie, the Counties Palentine, the Marquesses of Brandeburgh, the Lantsgraues of Hessia, the common Wealthes of the Heluetians, & Rhetians, and the Free Cittes, as Argentine, Basile, Frankforde, Vlme, Augusta, & Norenberg, doo al, I saie, abide in the same Authoritie, and estate, wherein thei haue benne heretofore: or rather in a mutche better, for that by meanes of the Gospel they haue their people more obediente vnto them, then euer they had before. Let them goe, I praie you into those places, where at this present, through Goddes goodnesse, and Mercie, the Gospel is taught. Where is there more Maiestie? where is there lesse Arrogancie, & Tyrannie? where is the Prince more honoured? where is the people lesse vnruly? where hathe there at any time either the Common Wealthe, or the Churche benne in more quiet? Perhaps, ye wil saie, from the first beginninge of this Doctrine, the Common sorte euerywhere beganne to rage, and to rise throughout Germanie. Allow it were so: yet Martine Luther, the publisher, and setter forewarde of this Doctrine, did write maruelous behemently and sharpely, againste them, and reclaimed them home to peace, and obedience.

M. Hardinge.

Your impudencie of lieinge hath no measure nor ende. But wee wil saie litle here, hauinge saide yenough already in reprouse of your falsehed. VVee leaue you to the wide worlde, who seeth, and almoste feeleth your lies.

But I maruel not a litle, that in this place specially, where yee speake of the good order, that your Gospel breadeth, ye be not ashamed to make mention of Martin Luther. Good God howe muche coulde wee, if wee were so disposed, alleage out of his seditious and Heretical bookes by him *written againste the Power of lawful Magistrates? At this time let one place suffise for al. Luthers woordes be these: *Inter Christianos nullus neque potest, neque debet esse magistratus, sed &c.* Amonge Christen menne none can nor ought to be a magistrate, but eche one is to other equally subiecte: After the Apostles saieinge, Thinkinge al others better then your selues, &c. Againe, Be ye humble al one to an other. VVhereto Christe accordeth when he saithe, VVhen thou arte called to the mariage feaste, goe, and sitte downe lowest of al. Amonge Christen menne, none is superioure saue one, and onely Christe. And what superioritie or Magistrate can be there, where al be equal, and haue right power, riches, and honoure al alike? Furthermore, none coueteth to be ouer other, but al wilbe vnder one an other. VVhere suche menne be, though one woulde, yet can he not make a Magistrate to beare rule ouer others, sithe that nature suffereth not to haue superiours, where no man wil, nor maie be a superioure. And where suche kinde of menne is, there be they not Christen menne, after the true sorte of Christen menne. This farre Martin Luther.

*Vntruthe, maliceous, and slaunderous. Reade the Answeare.

He persuaded them to peace, when there was scarsly any lefte, that coulde beare a clubbe. Firste he *stirred vp his Disciple Thomas Munzer in Thuringia, who was the rebelles preacher. After that he excused him of seditious preachinge to the Duke of Saxonie Prince Electour, trustinge, if Munzer were let alone, the mater should wel goe forewarde.

*Nothinge els, but mere Vntruthe. For Luther called him the preacher of Satan.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

To dissemble the rest of your Untruthes, and your immoderate & vnciuile bitternesse, M. Hardinge, proceedinge from the vnquiet, & vnsauery humoures of your harte: where ye saie, Doctour Luther admitteth no Ciuile Magistrate, and note the same so specially in your margine, I maruelle mutche, that your paper blusshed not in your behalfe. Reade his bookes throughout, and consider the quiet gouernemente, bothe of the Common Wealthes, and also of the Churches of Germanie: and ye shal finde, that noman euer, neither by woorde, nor by example more auaunced the Authoritie of the Ciuile Magistrate. To leaue al other his notable Sentences to this pourpose, againste the Rebelles, of whom ye speake, beinge then in the fielde againste their

theire Lordes, he wrote thus: God commaundeth *al menne vniuersally to obeie the* Magistrate *with feare, and reuerence, &c.* Againe, *Tee take the Swerde, and withstande the* Magistrate, whome God hathe appointed. *Is not this rashely to* abuse the Name of God?

Iohan. Sleidanus Lib. 5.

But he saithe, Emonge Christians neither maie be, nor ought to be any Magistrate. D. P. Hardinge, nothinge coulde haue founde faulte herewith, but onely intemperate, and mere malice. For Luther speaketh not these wordes of the outwarde Ciuile Gouernement, wherof onely we speake nowe, but onely of our Inwarde Bande, and Obedience towardes God. And in this respecte, there is no Kinge, nor Prince in deede, nor maie be any. In this sense S. Paule saithe, *There is no* Iewe, *there is no* Gentile: *There is no* Lorde, *there is no* Seruaunt: *There is no* Man, *there is no* VVooman: *For al you are one in Christe Iesu.* S. Paule denieth not, but Iewe, Gentile, Lorde, Seruaunte, Man, and VVooman, remaine stil in theire seuteral states, and kindes, as they were before. But in Christe Iesu, he saithe, there is no regarde of any suche difference. In Ciuile Gouernement a Kinge is a Kinge, and so hath God commaunded him to be knowen. But after that we be once come to the reuerence, and obedience of Goddes wil, there God onely is the Kinge: and the Kinge, be he never so mighty, is but a Subiecte. So saithe S. Ambrose to the Emperoure Valentinian,

Galat. 3.

Coloss. 3.

Ambros. Lib. 5. Epist. 33.

Noli te extollere, Imperator: Sed, si vis diutius Imperare, esto Deo subditus. Scriptum est, Quæ Dei, Deo: quæ Cæsaris, Cæsari: *Oonly Lorde, auance not your selfe: But if ye wil remaine longe in Empiere, be subiecte vnto God. It is written*, Geeue to God, that belongeth to God: Geeue to Cæsar, that belongeth to Cæsar.

Sozom li. 6. ca. 7

So saithe the Emperoure Valentinian the Elder of him selfe, Ego sum in sorte plebis: I am (in this respecte) as one of the people. To like poorpose Iulius Cæsar, beinge an Heathen Prince, saide sommetime of him selfe at Rome in the Counsel house, Equidem ad alia omnia, quæ pro vobis gerenda sunt, & Consul sum, & Dictator: quod autem ad iniuriam cuiquam faciendum attinet, sum priuatus: *Touchinge al other affaires, that ought to be taken in hande for your sake, I am both the your* Consul, *and your* Dictator: *But as touchinge any wronge to be donne to any man, I am as a priuate man, without office.* So saide the Heathen Renegate Iulianus the Emperoure, Principes, vbi ad limen Delubri venerint, perinde sunt, atque Priuati: *When the Princes, and* Magistrates *once comme within the entrie of the Temple, they are none other, but as Priuate Menne.* And this is al that trailterous, and horrible Iudgemente, that, as it pleaseth you to saie, Luther had of the Ciuile Magistrate.

Dion. Lib. 43. πρὸς δὲ τὸ κακῶς ποιῆσαί τινα, ἰδιώτης ἄρχ. Sozom. li. 5. ca. 16

Where ye saie, he sturred vp his Disciple Thomas Munzer in Thuringia, to be the preacher to the Rebelles, it is no strange mater, to se your tongue to renne riat. Luther him selfe writinge thereof vnto the Rebelles, saithe thus, Satanas sub Euangelij prætextu, multos hoc tempore seditiosos, & planè sanguinarios Doctores excitauit: Satan *vnder the* pretense of the Gospel, *hath sturred vp in theise daies many seditious, and Bloudy Doctours:* Meaninge thereby Munzer, and other like his companions. So far was Luther from the encourraginge of Munzer to that wicked pourpose, that he saide, He was sette a woorke by the Diuel.

Iohan. Sleidanus Lib. 5.

The Apologie, Cap. 5. Diuision. 2.

But, whereas it is woonte sommetime to be obiected by persons wantinge skil, touchinge the Heluetians chaunge of state, & killinge of Leopoldus the Duke of Austria, & restoaringe by force their Countrie to liberte, al that was donne, as appeareth plainely by al Stories, for twoo hundred & threescore yeres paste, or aboue, in the time of Pope Boniface the Eight, when the Authority of the Bishop of Rome was in greatest tollitie, about twoo hundred yeres before Huldericus zuinglius, either beganne to teache the Gospel, or yet was borne. And euer sithence that time, they haue had al thinges stil & quiet, not onely from forreine Enimies, but also from al ciuile dissension. And if it were a sinne

in the

in the Heluetians, to deliuer theire owne Countrie from forreine gouernemente, specially when they were so proudely and tyrannously oppressed, yet to burthen vs with other mennes faultes, or them with the faultes of theire Forefathers, it is against al right, and reason.

M. Hardinge.

Nowe your sprite is not contente with that yee haue railed already againste the Pope, and Holy Churche, but it moueth you againe to raue and crie out. But whether with more malice or reason, let vs indifferently consider.

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuision. 1.

But O immortal God: and wil the Bishop of Rome accuse vs of Treason? Wil he teache the People to obeie and folowe theire Magistrates? Or, hath he any regarde at al of the Maiestie of a Prince? Why dooth hee then, as none of the olde Bishoppes of Rome euer did, suffer him selfe to bee called of his flatterers, Lorde of Lordes, as though hee would haue al Kinges and Princes, who, & what so euer they be, to be his vnderlinges? Why doothe he vaunte him selfe to be Kinge of Kinges, & to haue Kingely Roialtie ouer his Subiectes? Why compelleth he al Emperours, and Princes to sweare to him fealtie, and true obedience? Why dooth he boaste, that the Emperours Maiestie is a thousande folde inferioure to him: and that for this reason specially, bicause God hath made two lightes in Heauen: and bicause Heauen and Earthe were created, not in two Beginninges, but in one? Why hathe he, and his felowes (like Anabaptistes and Libertines, to the ende they might renne on more licenceously and carelesly) shaken of the yoke, and exempted them selues from beinge vnder a Ciuil Power? Why hath he his Legates (asmuche to saie, as moste suttle spies) lieinge in waite in al Kinges Courtes, Councelles, and Priuie chambers? Why dooth he, when he liste, sette the Christian Princes one againste an other, and at his owne pleasure trouble the whole worlde with debate and discorde? Why dooth he Excommunicate, and commaunde to be taken as a Heathen and a Pagan, any Christian Prince, that renounceth his Authoritie? and why promiseth he his Indulgences and his Pardons largely to any, that wil (what waie so euer it be) kil any of his enimies? Dooth he mainteine Empires, and Kingdomes? Or doothe he once desire, that common quiet should be prouided for? You muste pardon vs, good Reader, though wee seeme to vtter these thinges more bitterly and bitingly, then it becommeth Diuines to doo. For both the shamefulnesse of the matter, and also the desire of rule in the Bishop of Rome is so exceedinge, and outrageous, that it coulde not wel be vttered with other woordes, or more mildely. For he is not ashamed to saie in open assemblie, that al Iurisdiction of al the Kinges and Princes of the vvorlde dependeth of him selfe. And to feede his Ambition, & greedinesse of rule, he hath pulled in peeces the Empiere of Rome, and vexed and rente whole Christendome asunder: Falsely and traiterously also did he release the Romaines, the Italians, and him selfe too, of the othe, whereby they, and he were streitly bounde to bee true to the Emperoure of Græcia,

Augu. Steuchus.

Antonius de Rosello.

De Maior. & Obedien. Solita. De Maior. & Obedien. Vnam sanctam.

Clemens. 5. in Concil. Viennen. Leo Papa. 3.

and

and ſtirred vp the ſame Emperoures Subiectes to forſake him: and
Zacharias papa. callinge Carolus Magnus out of Fraunce into Italie, made him Emperour: ſutche a thinge, as neuer was ſeene before. He put Chilperichus the Frenche Kinge, beinge no euil Prince, biside his Realme, onely becauſe he fanſied him not, and wrongefully placed Pipine in his roume. Againe, after he had caſte out Kinge Philip, if he coulde haue brought it to paſſe, he had determined, & appointed the Kingedome of Fraunce to Albertus the Kinge of Romaines. He vtterly deſtroied the ſtate
Clemens. 7. of the moſte flouriſhinge Cittie, and Common Weale of Florence, his owne natiue Countrie, and brought it out of a free, and peaceable ſtate, to be gouerned at the pleaſure of one man: hee brought to paſſe by his
Idem Clemens. procurement, that whole Sauoy on the one ſide was miſerably ſpoiled by the Emperour Charles the fifthe, & on the other ſide by the Frenche Kinge, ſo that the poore vnfortunate Duke had ſcante one Cittie leafte him, to hide his heade in.

M. Hardinge.

It is a great eie ſore to the Miniſters of Antichriſte, to ſee the *Vicare of Chriſt aboue Lordes and Kinges of this worlde: to ſee Princes and Emperours promiſe and ſweare obedience vnto him.* But they that are the faithful ſubiectes of the Churche of God, thinke it no abſurditie, that the Shepherde be ſette, not onely aboue the Lambes and Ewes of the Churche, but alſo aboue the VVethers and Rammes them ſelues. It is a very greate folie for them to finde faulte with the ſuperioritie of the Biſhop of Rome, who can neuer proue, that he is not the Vicare of Chriſte. If he were not his Vicare, yet being a Biſhop he is aboue any temporal Prince (a) concerning his Prieſtly office. But ſithe Chriſte ſaide to Peter, Vpon this rocke I wil builde my Church, and hel gates ſhal not preuaile againſt it, (b) *Barke vntil your bellies breake, ye that be the helhoundes of Luthers and Zuinglius litour, or rather of Sathans your and their chiefe maiſter,* ſhal not preuaile againſt the Apoſtolike ſee of Peter. It hath withſtanded al Diuels and Heretikes a thouſand fiue hundred yeeres: and thinke ye that your ſelues be ſtronger then Arius? It greeueth you, that the Pope is higher then the Emperour, not for any loue ye beare to the Emperour, nor for hatred that ye haue to the Popes perſon, whom ye know not, but your quarrel is againſt Chriſte, whoſe perſon the Pope beareth. Or tel vs, I praie you, dooth he cal him ſelfe any Princes or Emperours vicegerent, and not rather the (c) Vicare of Chriſt alone? VVhom impugne ye then but Chriſte in his Vicare? Haue ye not readen, *Qui vos ſpernit, me ſpernit:* He that Luke 10. deſpiſeth you, deſpiſeth me? Ye thought the Pope had no better text for his primacie and ſupreme auctoritie, then two lightes, which God made in Heauen. But if malice had not blinded you, in the very ſame chapter of Innocentius the thirde, (from whence like a ſpider ye ſucked that yee thought was wooрſte) ye might haue ſeene an other reaſon goinge before, where he ſaide, *Pontifex in Spiritualibus antecellit, qua tanto ſunt temporalibus digniora, quanto anima præfertur corpori.* The Biſhop (ſaide Innocentius) in ſpiritual maters paſſeth (the Emperoure): whiche ſpiritual thinges are ſo muche aboue the temporal, by how muche the ſoule is preferred before the bodie. How like ye that reaſon? VVithin a litle after Innocentius bringeth foorth an other proufe: VVhere it was ſaide to Ieri- Hierem. 1.
mie the Prophete, who came (d) of the Prieſtes race, and was a Prieſte him ſelfe, (e) beholde I haue ſet thee ouer Natiõs and Kingdomes, to the intent thou maieſt pul vp and ſcater, and builde, and plante.

Then after that Innocentius had (f) by natural reaſon and holy Scripture proued the higheſt Biſhoppes ſuperioritie aboue Princes, he commeth in the thirde place not nowe to proue, but to make his former ſaieinge already proued more plaine, by alludinge to that is written in the beginninge of Geneſis: VVhere Moyſes declareth how God made twoo lightes in the Firmamente of the Heauen, a greater, and a leſſer. But this cannot ſounde in the eares of our newe preachers. They woulde not haue the guide of heauenly thinges aboue the guide of earthly cares. They loue the Earthe, the fleaſh, the worlde too wel, to be of that minde, and therefore doo aſke, why the Popes of Rome like Anabaptiſtes and Libertines haue ſhaken of the yoke, and exempted them ſelues from al ciuile Power. VVhat yoke meane ye? The yoke of infidels and Paynimes?

(a) So is euery Simple Prieſte.
(b) A litle witte had benne better, then al this ſo great adoo.
(c) So he calleth him ſelfe. But whē did Chriſt euer cal him ſo?
(d) As if Hieremie had benne a Pope.
(e) A very profounde Reaſon. Reade the Anſweare.
(f) By Natural Reaſon. O Natural Folie.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

We are not the Miniſters of Antichriſte, **M. Hardinge, but the witneſſes of**
2. Theſſ. 2. **the** Truthe of Chriſte. **He is** Antichriſte, **as** S. Paule **ſheweth you**, that ſitteth in
Gregor. Lib. 4. Epiſt. 30. the Temple of God, and auanceth him ſelfe aboue al that is called God. **And**, to **ſpeake more particularely of the mater**, by S. Gregories **Judgemente**, **he is** Antichriſte,

Pope aboue Kinges and Emperoures.

christe, or the Forerenner of Antichriſte, that calleth him ſelfe, The Vniuerſal Biſhop: And vaunteth him ſelfe, as the Kinge of Pride: And hath an Armie of Prieſtes prepared for him: And ſetteth him ſelfe, as Lucifer, aboue al his Brethren. Theſe be the wordes of S. Gregorie: By ſutche colours he blaſed out the kingedome of Antichriſte. Of him Cardinal Franciſcus Zabarella ſaith thus, Papa facit, quicquid libet, etiam illicita: & eſt pluſquam Deus: *The Pope doothe*, what him liſteth, yea thoughe it be vnlawful: and is more then God. This is Antichriſt, M. Hardinge, by the Judgemente of the wiſe, and godly: and the ſuppoſters of him, who ſo euer, and where ſo euer they be, are the Miniſters of Antichriſte. It is greate Arrogancie, to auance a Biſſiop aboue a Kinge: Notwithſtanding in ſome good meaninge it maie be true. So a Iudge, in knowledge of the Lawe: ſo a Doctour of Phiſike, in his profeſſion: ſo a Pilote, in knowledge of the Sea, and guidinge of a ſhippe: ſo a Captaine, in Martial affaires is aboue any Kinge: And it behoueth a Kinge, be he neuer ſo wiſe, or mightie, in euery of theiſe ſeuerall faculties, to be guided by them. And thus is the Kinge inferiour, not onely to a Biſhop, as you ſaie, but alſo to euery Inferiour Prieſte.

Gregor. Lib. 4. Epiſt. 38.

Franciſ. Zabarella.

So S Chryſoſtome ſaithe of Chriſtes Apoſtles: Omnem Terrarum Orbem peruaſerunt, & omnibus Principibus fuerunt magis propriè Principes Regibus potentiores: *The Apoſtles roaued ouer the whole worlde, and were more Princelike in deede, then the Princes themſelues, and more puiſante, and mightie, then the Kinges.*

Chryſ. in Pſal. 44

So ſaide the Emperoure Valentinian vnto the people of Millaine, Eum collocate in Pontificali Solio, cui nos quoque moderatores Imperij, noſtra Capita ſubmittamus: *Place yee ſutche a man in the* Biſhoppes Chaire, *vnto whom wee our ſelues, that gouerne the Empiere*, maie ſtoope our Heade.

Theodoretus, Lib. 4. cap. 5. ἀυτῶ τὰς ἡμετέρας ὑποκλίναμεν κεφαλάς.

For the Prince is bounde to the Obedience of Goddes VVoorde, no leſſe, then if he were a priuate Subiecte. And, if he refuſe to heare, and to reuerence the ſame, as the declaration of Goddes Holy Wil, he is accurſed. But what is this, M. Hardinge, to your purpoſe? Woulde you therefore, that the Kinge ſhoulde ſweare his Obedience, and allegeance vnto the Biſhop?

In this reſpecte, by your owne Learninge, any Simple Prieſte maie wel be aboue the Pope. So ſaithe your owne Doctoure Panormitane, Papa tenetur Confiteri: & in eo actu Sacerdos eſt Maior illo: *The Pope is bounde to confeſſe him ſelfe: And in that acte of Confeſſion*, the Prieſte is aboue him. And againe, Papa non poteſt cogere Sacerdotem, vt reuelet Confeſsionem: quia in illo actu Sacerdos eſt Maior, quàm Papa: *The Pope cannot compelle a Prieſte, to open that hathe benne ſaide vnto him in Confeſſion.* For in that acte, the Prieſte is greater, then the Pope. Yet, I trowe, ye woulde not therefore, the Pope ſhoulde ſweare Obedience to a Prieſte.

Extra. De Pœniten. & remiſſ. Omnis vtriuſq; Abbas.

This therefore, M. Hardinge, it is, that grieueth vs, to ſée the poore Stoole of Humilitie, whereon S. Peter ſate, blowen vp nowe into a Mounte of Pride: and the Pope to require Homage, and Fealtie of Kinges, and Emperours, as of his Subiectes. It grieueth vs to ſée you, and others your felowes, in reſpecte of the Pope, ſo mutche, not onely to abaſe, but alſo vilely to abuſe the Maieſtie of them, vnto whom Chriſte, and his Apoſtles were alwaies obedient. Remember, what one of yours hath written, and publiſhed to the worlde in this behalfe. Staniſlaus Orichouius ſaithe thus, Tantùm Sacerdos præſtat Regi, quantùm homo præſtat beſtiæ: Quantùm Deus præſtat Sacerdoti, tantùm Sacerdos præſtat Regi. Qui Regem anteponit Sacerdoti, is anteponit Creaturam Creatori: A Prieſte *is ſo mutche aboue a* Kinge, *as a Man is aboue a Beaſte: As mutche as God is better then the* Prieſte, *ſo mutche is the* Prieſte *better then the* Kinge. *He that ſetteth the* Kinge *before a* Prieſte, *ſetteth the Creature before the Creatoure.*

Staniſlaus Orichouius in Chimera. Fol. 97.

It grieueth vs, to ſée S. Gregories wordes, by S. Gregories Succeſſours, ſo proudely broken. For thus he wrote, welneare a thouſand yeres ſithence, vnto the Emperour Mauritius, againſt Iohn the Biſhop of Conſtantinople, claiminge then the ſame Vniuerſal Authoritie, that is nowe vſurped by the Pope: Ille coercendus eſt, qui Sanctæ Vniuerſali Eccleſiæ iniuriam facit: qui corde tumet: qui gaudere de nomine Singularitatis appetit: qui Honori quoque Imperij veſtri ſe per priuatum vocabulum ſuperponit: *Your Maieſtie muſte repreſſe him, that doothe this wronge vnto the Holy Vniuerſal*

Gregor. Lib. 4. Epiſt. 32.

Pope aboue Kinges and Emperoures.

Churche: that ſwelleth in harte: that deſireth to enioie a name of Singularitie: that alſo, by a Priuate Title, (callinge him ſelfe the Vniuerſal Biſhop) placeth him ſelfe ouer and aboue the Honour of your Empiere.

Touchinge the knowledge of Goddes Worde, and cafes of Religion, certaine it is, the Kinge is inferiour to a Biſhop. But, if the Biſhop be negligente, & do not his office: or, if he be wilful, and do it not rightly: or, if he be ignorant, and cannot do it: Then is the Biſhop vnder the Prince, Subiect to his checke, and by him maie be puniſhed. So writeth the Emperoure Conſtantinus vnto the people of Nicomedia: Si quis Epiſcoporum inconſulte tumultuatus ſit, Miniſtri Dei, hoc eſt, mea executione, illius audacia coercebitur: *If any Biſhop vnaduiſedly woorke trouble, his boldeneſſe ſhalbe repreſſed by the Order of* Goddes Miniſter, that is to ſaie, by my execution. Therefore S. Paule ſaithe, *Let euery Soule be Subiecte to the Higher Powers*. Whereunto S. Chryſoſtome addeth theſe wordes: Etiamſi Apoſtolus ſit, etiamſi Euangeliſta, etiamſi Propheta, ſiue quiſquis tandem fueris. Neque enim Pietatem ſubuertit iſta ſubiectio: *Althoughe thou be an* Apoſtle, *althoughe thou be an* Euangeliſte, *althoughe thou be a* Prophete, *or what one ſo euer thou be* (yet be thou Subiect to the Higher Powers). *For Godlineſſe is not hindered by ſuche ſubiection.*

Theodoretus. Lib. 1. cap. 19. Roman. 13.

Chryſoſt. ad Roman. Homil. 23.

Your quarrel (ye ſaie) is againſt Chriſt: For his perſon the Pope beareth. Haue ye not readden, He that deſpiſeth you, deſpiſeth me? Tel vs, I praie you (ſaie you) dothe the Pope cal him ſelfe any Princes, os Emperours Vicegerent, and not rather the Vicare of Chriſte alone?

It forceth not greately, by what title the Pope liſte to claime, he cannot lightly wante Authoritie, while he maie penne his owne Commiſſion. I trowe, we maie ſaie of him, as Cicero ſaide ſometime of one in Rome, Aſinius Senator Voluntarius, Lectus ipſe à ſe: Aſinius is a very willinge Senatour, him ſelfe appointed, and choſen by him ſelfe. Verily, Antichriſte to ſhal ſit in the Temple of God, euen in the place of Chriſte, and ſhal beare him ſelfe as Chriſtes Vicare.

2. Theſſ. 2.

Howe be it, Let the Pope do the duetie of a Biſhop: Let him Exhorte: Let him Preache: Let him diſpenſe Goddes Myſteries: Let him fulfil his Office: Let him do the parte of an Euangeliſte: And we will loue him, & reuerence him, although not, as Chriſtes Vicare General, yet at leaſte, as a Biſhop. Otherwiſe we muſte ſaie vnto him, as S. Gregorie ſaid ſometime to Cyriacus the Biſhop of Conſtantinople, Omnes Magnos eſſe, & Honorabiles cupio, quorum tamen Honor Honori Omnipotentis Dei non detrahat. Nam quiſquis ſe contra Deum Honorari appetit, mihi Honorabilis non eſt: *I wiſhe that al menne ſhoulde be Greate, and Honourable: ſo that their Honour be not preiudicial to the Honour of Almightie God. For who ſo euer ſhal deſire him ſelfe to be Honoured againſte God, ſhal not be Honourable vnto me.* One highe, and worthy Reaſon we alleged out of your Pope Innocentius the Thirde: The Sonne is higher, and greater, then the Moone: *Ergo*, the Pope is higher, and greater, then the Emperoure. This Pope Innocentius is he, that ſaide, Either he woulde looſe his Miter, or els he woulde pulle the Emperour Philips Emperial Crowne from his Heade.

Gregor. lib. 6. Epiſt. 28.

De Maior. & Obedien. Solita. Carion. in Innocen. 3.

Malice (ye ſaie) blinded vs: otherwiſe we mighte haue ſeene other his more ſubſtantial, and better Reaſons. So were it needeful, M. Hardinge: for certainely this Reaſon is very ſimple. But the beſte of his Reaſons, ye can finde, is this:

The Soule is aboue the Body,
Ergo, The Pope is aboue the Emperoure.

And howe like you this Reaſon? ſaie you. Verily, as a Reaſon without ſenſe, or Reaſon: ſuche as be many of your makinge. By the like Reaſon you maie ſaie,

The Cooke is alwaies aboute the Fiere:
The Fiere is the higheſt of al Elementes:
Ergo, Of al Sciences the Cookes occupation is the higheſt.

By the ſame Reaſon ye maie proue, that the Higheſt Emperour is Subiecte, not onely to the Pope, but alſo to euery Simple Prieſte. Yea further, of the ſame Reaſon there muſte needes folowe a greate inconuenience: That the Pope him ſelfe, for as muche as he Miniſtreth Sacramentes, Teacheth, Exhorteth, & occupieth him ſelfe in Spiritual affaires leaſte of al others, is therefore the loweſt, and baſeſt of al his

Pope aboue Kinges and Emperoures.

his Clergie.

Now, M. Hardinge, I beseeche you, consider the weight, and drifte of your owne Reason.

The Popes charge is Spiritual, saie you.

Ergo, The Emperoure is bound to sweare obedience to the Pope. By what Reason maie this Reason be proued? Uerily by the same good Reason ye maie saie, Euery Priestes Charge is Spiritual.

Ergo, The Kinge is bounde to sweare obedience to euery Priest. Yet by suche proper Reasons the Pope hath auanced him self aboue al the states, & Princes of the world.

But your Holy Father Innocentius, leste he should seeme to wante Scriptures, for proufe hereof, allegeth also the wordes of God spoken vnto the Prophete Hieremie: *Beholde I haue set thee ouer Nations, and Kingedomes, to the intente, that thou maiste pul vp, and scatter, and builde, and plante.* Ergo, he saithe, *the* Emperour *is subiect vnto the Pope.* Hierem. 1.

These proufes (ye saie) our Defenders coulde not finde. Further, ye saie, in your sober manner, VVhen wil you forsake the Schoole of lieinge? Truely, if there be any suche Schole, M. Hardinge, you maie claime of good right to be the Maister. We are as far from lieinge, as you are from saieinge the Truthe. But what make these wordes of Hieremie for the Bishop of Rome? Wil ye saie, that the Prophete Hieremie was the Pope? Or, that the Kinge then was sworne to be subiect, and loial vnto him? What Kinge, or Prince did Hieremie subdue? What People, or Countrie did he euer ouerthrowe? One of your owne Doctours saith, Hieremias nullum Regem deposuit. Sed intelligitur positus supra Gentes, & Regna, quasi habens Authoritatem super ea in annuntiando, & prædicando Vera. Non de destructione Regum Mundi, sed de destructione Vitiorum, & plantatione Fidei, & morum. Vt illud Pauli, Dei ædificatio estis: Dei Agricultura estis: Hieremie *deposed no* Kinge. *But wee vnderstande, that he was placed ouer Nations, and Kingdomes, as hauinge Authoritie ouer the same, in opening, and preachinge of the Truthe. He speaketh not of the ouerthrowinge of the Kingedomes of the World, but of the ouerthrowinge of Vices, and of the plantinge of Faithe, and manners. In this sense* S. Paule *saithe to the* Corinthians, Yee are Goddes buildinge: Yee are Goddes tillage. Iohan. De Parisijs, Cap. 15. 1. Cor. 3.

The very Glose it selfe saithe, Vt euellas Regnum Satanæ: vt plantes bona: vt ædifices Ecclesiam: *I haue placed thee, to roote vp* (not the Kingedomes of the worlde, nor the states of Common Weales, but) *the Kingedome of Satan: to plante good thinges: to builde vp the Churche.* His whole Commission was limited with these wordes, Posui Verbum meum in Ore tuo: *I haue put my Woorde in thy Mouthe*, saithe the Lorde. Hierem. 1.

Suche Authoritie had Elias ouer Kinge Achab: And therefore he saide vnto him, *It is not I, that trouble Israel, but thou, and thy Fathers house.* Suche Authoritie had Iohn the Baptiste ouer Kinge Herode: and therefore he saide vnto him, *It is not lawful for thee, to haue thy Brothers Wife.* 3. Reg. 18.

If it be true, that ye woulde seeme to saie, that the Popes Superioritie standeth onely in thinges Spiritual, wherefore then dothe Pope Nicolas saie, Christus Beato Petro Terreni simul, & Cœlestis Imperij Iura commisit: Christe *hathe geuen to Blessed* Peter, *the Righte as wel of the Worldly, as also of the Heauenly Empiere.* Wherefore then did Pope Adrian thus write vnto the Emperour Fredericus: Romæ nostra Sedes est: Imperatoris est Aquis in Arduenna, quæ est Sylua Galliæ. Imperator, quod habet, totum habet à nobis. Sicut Zacharias transtulit Imperium à Græcis ad Teutonicos: ita nos possumus illud transferre ab Alemannis ad Græcos. Ecce in potestate nostra est, vt demus illud, cui volumus. Propterea constituti sumus à Deo super Gentes, & Regna, vt destruamus, & euellamus, & ædificemus, & plantemus: *My Seate is in the Cittie of Rome. The* Emperours *Seate is at* Acon, *in* Ardenne, *which is a Forest in France.* VVhat so euer the Emperour hathe, he hathe it of vs. *As* Pope Zacharias *translated the Empiere from* Græcia *into* Germanie, *so maie wee againe translate the same from the Germaines to the Greekes. Beholde, it is in our power, to bestowe the Empiere vpon whom, wee liste. Therefore are wee appointed by God ouer Nations, and Kingedomes, to pulle downe, to roote vp, to builde, and to plante againe.* This Authoritie, I trowe, reacheth somme what further, then onely to Causes Spiritual. One of your owne Doctours saithe, Magis esset acceptum Diff. 22. Mediolanensis. Auentinus in Adrian. 4. Anno. 1154.

Deo, quòd per Solum Pontificem Mundus in Omnibus regeretur: *It were more acceptable vnto God, that the Worlde in al maters* (bothe Spiritual, & Temporal) *were gouerned Onely by the Pope.*

That Innocentius addeth, of the Sunne and the Moone (ye saie) is not a Reason, but a Similitude.

Iohan. De Paris. cap. 12.

This thinge maie easily be graunted. For in deede it is a Similitude **vtterly voide of either** VVitte, **or** Reason. **But who taught the** Pope, **so childishly to plaie with** Similitudes, **thereby to auance him selfe, and to abase the** Empiere **of the worlde? Who tolde him, that the** Pope **is the** Sunne, **and the** Emperour **the** Moone? **Or, that the** Emperour **is so farre inferiour to the** Pope, **as the** Moone **is inferiour to the** Sunne? Isidorus, **that liued fiue hundred yeres before** Pope Innocentius, **saithe quite contrarie,** Per Solem intelligitur Regnum, & per Lunam intelligitur Sacerdotium: By the Sunne wee vnderstand the Kingedome: and by the Moone wee vnderstand the Priesthoode: **Whereby he geueth vs to consider, contrarie to the iudgemente of your good Father** Pope Innocentius, **that, as the** Moone **is inferioure to the** Sunne, **so is the** Pope **inferiour to the** Emperoure.

In Glossa in Gene. Cap. 1.

Iohan. De Paris. Cap. 15.

M. Hardinge.

But when Constantine was Baptized, he gaue place to *S. Syluester then Bishop of Rome, and to al others Successours of S. Peter. O how that irketh your hartes, that so great an Emperour, and the firste that openly professed Christianitie, should by the same Holy Ghoste, who called him to the Faithe of Christ, be made to *depart from that Citie, which ruled the world, and to yelde his own Palaice partly a Church to our Sauiour Christ, partly a dwelling house for the Bishops of Rome? Aske of Constantine, why he submitted his necke to S. Syluester. VVe haue cause to thinke, that Constantius the Heretike, sonne of Constantine, was not very gladde of his Fathers dooinge. And yet God suffered him not to retourne, and dwel at Rome, but to leaue that Citie free to the Rulers of the Churche.

*Vntruthe, fonde, and peeuishe. For Syluester was dead longe before Constantinus was Christened *Vntruth, too vaine for a Childe. VVhy should M. Har. be so vaine? There is not one true worde in al this tale.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Constantine (yée saie) gaue ouer the Citie of Rome, and al the VVeast parte of the Empiere to the Pope, and to his Successoures for euer. And this thinge (yée saie) yrketh our hartes ful soare. **Yea verily, M. Hardinge, it irketh vs mutche in your behaike, to sée you, a man of Wisedome, and Learninge, to warrante sutche folies without blusshinge. This whole** Donation of Constantine, **whereupon yée builde the** Popes whole Kingdome, **hath not shewe sufficient to mocke a childe. The effect, and sense thereof is this, that** Constantinus **the** Emperour, **the thirde daie after he was Christened, in the honour of** S. Peter, **willingely leafte al the Weast parte of the Empiere, and departed to** Bizantium, **whiche is nowe called** Constantinople, **to dwel in the Easte: and that he gaue the whole** Emperial, and Ciuile Dominion, **not onely of the Citie of** Rome, **but also of** Italie, France, Spaine, Arragone, Portugal, Englande, Germanie, Scotlande, Irelande, Poole, Denmarke, Sueden, **and** Hungarie, **to the** Pope. **This doubtlesse beinge true, had benne a foule liberal, and a Princely gifte. And one of your frendes saith,** Volunt aliqui, quòd ratione huius Doni, Summus Pontifex Imperator est: & quòd potest instituere, & destituere Reges, sicut Imperator: *Somme saie, that by meane of this gifte, the* Pope is an Emperour, *and maie sette vp, and pulle downe Kinges, as an Emperoure.*

Iohan. De Paris. cap. 22.

But Pius Secundus, **beinge him selfe afterwarde Bishop of** Rome, **saithe,** Dicta Palea, Constantinus, falsa est: *The saide Decree* (**named** Constantinus, **conteininge** Constantine **the** Emperours Donation, or Chartar) *is vtterly false.* **So saithe** Antoninus **the Archbishop of** Florence, Valla, Volaterrane, Hieronymus Cathalanus, Otho Frisingensis, **and others moe. Of this Fable we shal haue occasion to speake hereafter. Here, M. Harding, the** Pope **him selfe telleth you, that you mainteine his Vanitie by a** False Decree.

Pius in Dialog. Fol. 21.

Constantius the Heretique, Sonne vnto Constantinus, **as you saie, muche misliked** his Fathers dooinge. **Naie, M. Hardinge, if** Constantius **were aliue, he would rather finde faulte in your discretion, that repoorte sutche Folies of his Fathers dooinges. Where ye saie,** God suffered him not to returne, and to dwel in Rome, **it passeth the déepthe of your Diuinitie, to searche vp the causes, and secretes of Gods sufferance. Although** Constantius, **beinge encumbred with dangerous warres, and greate affaires, were forced to staie in other Countries, & coulde not haue leasure to returne to** Rome, **yet he stil continued the Lorde of** Rome, **as also did a greate number of**

other

Legates. Pardōnes.

other Emperoures, that folowed after him. Therefore Pope Bonifacius thus wrote vnto the Emperour Honorius: Roma est Vrbs vestræ mansuetudinis: Rome is your Maiesties Cittie. Likewise Pope Agatho writeth vnto the Emperour Constantinus: Hæc est Vrbs Seruilis Maiestatis vestræ: This is youre Maiesties bonde Cittie: And Constantinus the Emperour him selfe saithe, Dono Archiepiscopo Antiquæ nostræ Romæ: *To* Donus *the Archebishop* of our Cittie of Olde Rome. But what nede moe wordes? The case is so cleare, that no man of Learninge can calle it in question.

Dist. 97. Eccle.

In sexta Synodo Constan. Act. 4.

In eadem Synodo, Actione. 1.

Briefely, touchinge this fonde Fable of Constantines Donation, Cardinal Cusanus saithe thus, Donationem diligenter expendens, reperi in ipsamet Scriptura manifesta argumenta Confictionis, & Falsitatis: *Diligently weighinge this* Donation of Constantine, *I haue founde in the very penninge thereof* manifest argumentes of forginge, and falsehed. These, M. Hardinge, be the Recordes, and Præsidentes of moste certaine, and moste ancient memorie, that ye woulde haue published vnto the world. By suche Monumentes your Pope claimeth the righte, and possession of the Empiere. And youre friendes maruele, that ye can defende suche falsehed, and forgerie, so wel knowen, and so manifeste, for very shame.

Nicol. Cusanus De Donatione Constantini.

M. Hardinge.

The beinge of the Popes Legates and Ambassadours in Princes Courtes, is a thinge nolesse conueniente, then it is meete for him, that hathe cure of many flockes of sheepe, to sette his seruantes as watchemen in euery parte, where suche flockes doo feede.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

In what stede these Legates stand the Churche of God, it maie appeare by these fewe vttered thereof by Camotensis: Legati Papæ ita debacchantur in Prouincijs, acsi ad flagellandum Ecclesiam, Satan egressus esset à facie Domini: *The* Popes Legates *doo so rage in al Countries, as if Satan were gonne out before the face of God, to scourge the Churche.* And Machiauel saithe, There haue benne fewe warres, or Commotions enflamed these many late yeres, but by the meane, and whispering of these Legates. What other Doctrine they teache, or what other good they do, it were harde to saie. And therefore the Fathers in the Councel of Aphrica refused vtterly, to haue any suche Legates sente emongest them: For thus they write vnto the Pope, Vt aliqui, tanquam à tuæ Sanctitatis latere, mittantur, nulla inuenimus Patrum Synodo constitutum: *That any* Legates *shoulde be sente vnto vs, as from your Holinesse side, wee finde it not appointed by any* Councel *of our Fathers.* Againe they saie, Executores Clericos Vestros quibusque Petentibus nolite mittere: ne fumosum sæculi typhum in Ecclesiam Christi videamur inducere: *Sende not your* Clerkes (or Cardinalles) *to put maters in execution, at any mannes requeste: Leaste wee seeme to bringe the* smokie pride of the worlde *into the Churche of Christe.*

Citatur ab Agrippa de vanitate, Scientiar. Nicol. Machiauel. in Historia.

Concil. Aphrica. cap. 105.

M. Hardinge.

Matth. 16.

* His indulgences and pardons depende vpon the power of bindinge and loosinge, which Christ gaue to Peter and his Successoures. Ye muste demaunde of Christe, * why he gaue that Power, and not be angrie with his Vicare for vsinge the same.

*Vntruthe. For thei depende of the deceitfulnesse of man: and not of the power of God.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

O, M. Hardinge, what should you meane with al these Vanities? Are ye so fully bente, to graunte no kinde of errour, neither in your Purgatories, nor in youre Pardonnes, nor in your Stewes? God geue you Humilitie of harte: leaste ye be an vnfit vessel to receiue Goddes Pardonne.

M. Hardinge.

Ye finde faulte with Leo the thirde for makinge an Emperour in the VVest. I dare saie it greueth you. * For if there had ben none in the VVest, the Turke might haue ben our Emperour er this, and to his Barbarous and wicked tirannie might haue subdued this parte of the worlde, specially Germanie, as he hathe subdued Greece, Asia, Egypte, Syria, and al the Easte Churche. Againste whiche mischiefe the Vicare of Christe by his Maisters merciful warninge with the Princes of the VVeaste made prouision, and at the length planted the Empire in this order, wee see it nowe in.

*Vntruthe. For Christe neuer gaue the Pope power to deale Pardonnes.

*Vntruthe, ioined with open folie. For this was the onely waie to strengthen the Saracenes.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

This policie practised by the Pope, losed the whole power of Christendome. For as the Empiere before, beinge vnited, and ioined in one, was stronge, and mightie, so beinge afterwarde diuided into two, and the East parte beinge sundred from the

weake, it became lame, & weake, and not able to helpe it selfe. By meane whereof a gate was opened, to receiue the Turke into al these Christian Dominions, which nowe he holdeth, without resistance: who otherwise, the Empere beinge one, and whole in it selfe, as it was before, coulde neuer haue growen to suche Power. Al this was wrought by the Practise, and Policie of the Pope. Notwithstandinge, the Pope him selfe by this bargaine lost nothinge. Therof Marsilius Patauinus writeth thus: Pipinus, Sonne vnto Charles the Frenche Kinge, after he had conquered Aristulphus the Kinge of Lumbardie, toke Rauenna, and al the fiue Cities of Romandiola, togeather with the Emperoures Lieutenantes Territorie called Exarchatus, and gaue al the same to the Pope. Pope Steuin findinge him selfe wel contented with these benefites, and seinge the weakenesse of the Greeke Emperoure, procured, that the Empiere should be translated from the Greekes vnto the Frenche, hauinge vtterly forgotten the benefites, that he had receiued of the Emperoure: to the intent, that the Greekes, beeinge vtterly oppressed, and the Frenche litle caringe for these thinges, he alone might rule in Italie at his pleasure.

Marsilius Patauinus.

The very true cause of the Diuision of the Empiere. Platyna in Leone 3.

Touchinge Pope Leo the Third, whose Prouidence, and Policie ye so mutche commende, the true report of the Storie, is this: The saide Leo, beinge by violence depriued of his Bishoprike in Rome, fledde for aide to Charles the Frenche Kinge, & by him was restoared. In consideration of whiche benefite, he proclaimed Charles the Emperoure of VVeaste. Sithence whiche time, the Empiere of Christendome hathe benne diuided, and weakened: the Pope enriched: and the Saracenes, & Turkes aboue al measure encreased.

M. Hardinge.

If the Pope Zacharias deposed Childerike (for so I finde him more commonly named) the Kinge of Fraunce, onely vpon his owne pleasure or displeasure, as yee saie, and placed Pipine for him, can yee tel that storie, and not see what a strength of auctoritie is in that See, whiche is able with a woorde to place and displace the mightiest Kinge in Europe? VVith a woorde I saie, For I am sure ye can shewe vs of no Armie, that he sente to execute that his wil. Is that the power of a man, trowe ye, to appoint Kingedomes? Can the Deuil him selfe at his pleasure set vp and depose Kinges? No surely. (a) And muche lesse can any member of his doo the same. Remember ye what Christe saide, when the Iewes obiected, that he did caste out Deuils in the name of the Prince of Deuilles? (b) Beware ye sinne not againste the Holy Ghost, who confesse that the Pope hathe pulled downe and set vp Kinges. VVhich thinge vndoubtedly he could not doo profitably and peaceably, but by the great power of God. And yet did that Line of Pipine and Charles the Greate, whiche the Pope did set vp, (c) florishe aboue any other stocke, that ye can name since the inclination of the Romaine Empiere. VVhiche in that transposed state of so greate a Kingedome, maketh no obscure argumente of Heauenly approbation and Diuine prouidence.

(a) Vntruth. For S. Gregorie saithe, *Antichristus ipsas summas huius Seculi Potestates obtinebit.*

(b) A newe Sinne againste the Holy Ghost

(c) Vntruth, easie to be seene. Reade the Answeare.

Neither did the Pope Zacharias depose Childerike, because he fansied him not, as ye slaunder, but onely consented to loose his Subiectes from bonde of Othe made to him, at the general and most earnest requeste and sute of the Nobilitie, and Communaltie of the whole Realme of Fraunce, findinge him very vnprofitable, and vnmeete for the Kingedome, as one, who beinge of no witte, and therfore commonly named *Stupidus*, as muche to saie, a dolte, was altogeather besides like a *Sardanapalus*, geuen wholy to belly cheere, and to filthy loue of women. Therefore in your owne woordes ye confesse a (d) Diuine power in the Pope, as by whom God directeth the willes of faithful Princes on the Earthe. The more suche examples ye bringe, the woorse ye make your cause. I woulde hyer you to ease me of the labour of prouinge suche a notable facte.

(d) A Diuine Power in the Pope.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Pope Zacharias deposed Childericus, as you cal him, or, as somme others cal him, Chilpericus, the Frenche Kinge. Therefore ye saie, we must needes acknowledge a Diuine power in the Pope: seinge him hable, by his woorde to place, and displace the mightiest Kinge in Europe. For can the Diuel (saie you) at his pleasure sette vp, and depose Kinges?

Verily, M. Hardinge, Christe him selfe calleth the Diuel the *Prince of this worlde:* and therefore we maie imagine, he maie doo somewhat in the worlde. And the Diuel, if ye wil beleue his woorde, when he had set Christe on highe vpon a mounte, and shewed him al the Kingedomes of the worlde, he saide vnto him, *Al these thinges wil I geeue thee, if thou wilte falle downe, and woorshippe mee.* This is that Power, that S. Iohn saithe, shoulde be geuen to Antichriste: Reges Terræ vires, & potestatem suam tra-

Iohan. 12. 14. 16.

Matthæ. 4. Apocalyp. 17.

dent

Deposing of Kinges

dent Bestiæ: &c. vt consentiant, dentque Regnum suum Bestiæ, donec compleantur verba Dei: *The Kinges of the Earthe shal geue their strengthe, and Power vnto the Beast, &c. that they maie agree together, and geeue their Kingedome vnto the Beaste, vntil the Woordes of God be fulfilled.* Againe he saithe, Mulier ea, quam vidisti, est Vrbs illa Magna, quæ habet Regnum super Reges terræ: *The Woman, that thou sawest, is that greate Cittie, that hathe a Kingedome ouer the Kinges of the Worlde.* And againe he saithe, Data est illi Potestas in omnem Tribum, & Gentem: & adorabunt eam (Bestiam) omnes incolæ terræ, quorum nomina non sunt scripta in Libro Vitæ Agni: *Power is geuen vnto that Beaste ouer euery Tribe, and Language, and Nation: and al the dwellers of the Earthe shal woorship the same Beaste, (whiche is* Antichriste) *whose names be not written in the Lambes Booke of Life.*

In eodem cap.

Apocalyp. 13.

S. Augustine saithe, Quia Antichristus ad tantum culmen inanis gloriæ venturus creditur, tanta ei licebit facere, & in omnes homines, & in Sanctos Dei, vt nonnulli infirmi arbitrentur, Deum res humanas negligere: *For that wee beleue, that* Antichriste *shal comme vnto suche a higthe of vaine Glorie, it shalbe lawful for him to doo suche thinges, bothe towardes al menne,* (Princes, and others) *and also towardes the Sainctes of God, that many weake menne shal thinke, God hathe foresaken the care of the worlde.* Againe he saithe, Ita traditur de Antichristo, quòd omnes Reges superaturus sit, & solus Regnum obtenturus: *Thus it is written of* Antichriste, that he shal conquere al Kinges, and obteine the Kingedome him selfe alone.

Augustin. in Psalm. 9.

Augustin. in eundem Psalm.

So saithe S. Gregorie, Antichristus veniens ipsas etiam summas huius sæculi Potestates obtinebit: Antichriste, *when he shal comme, shal conquere the highest Estates, and Powers of this worlde.*

Gregor. in Iob. cap. 41. Lib. 33. Cap. 22.

And al this shal comme to passe, as Chrysostome saithe, by the Dissolution of the Empiere, whereof wee haue spoken before. These be his woordes, Donec Imperij illius timor fuerit, nemo Antichristo statim subdetur. Quando verò istud Imperium destructum fuerit, vacantem Imperij Principatum inuadet, & tentabit ad se rapere & Hominum, & Dei Imperium: *As longe as the Empiere shalbe had in awe, noman shal streightwaie submitte him selfe to* Antichriste: *But after that* the Empiere shalbe dissolued, Antichriste *shal inuade the state of the Empiere standinge voide: and shal labour to pulle vnto him selfe the Empiere bothe of Man, and God.*

Chrysost. in 2. Thessalon. 2. Homil. 4.

This, I trowe it is, that the Pope proclaimeth him selfe the Heire Apparent of al Kingedomes: This it is, that Pope Nicolas saithe, Christus Beato Petro, Aeternæ Vitæ Clauigero, Terreni simul, & Cœlestis Imperij iura commisit: Christe *hathe committed vnto* Blessed Peter, *the Keiebearer of Euerlastinge Life, the Right bothe of the worldly, and also of the Heauenly Empiere:* This is it, that somme are so bolde to saie, Papa totius Mundi obtinet Principatum: *The Pope hath the Princehoode of al the whole Worlde:* And, that some others haue saide, Papa est Rex Regum, & Dominus Dominantium: *The Pope is the Kinge of Kinges, and Lorde of Lordes:* And, that Pope Adrian saithe of him selfe, as it is alleged before, Imperator, quod habet, totum habet à nobis. Ecce in potestate nostra est, vt demus Imperium, cui volumus: *What so euer the Emperour hath, he hathe it of vs. It is in our power to bestowe the Empiere vpon whom wee liste.* This, M. Harding, is that Diuine Power, that, as you saie, is geuen to the Pope. But as S. Iohn, S. Augustine, S. Chrysostome, and S. Gregorie saie, the selfe same Diuine Power is geuen also to Antichriste. And therefore it is wel noted in youre owne Glose, Papa stupor Mundi: The Pope is the woondermente of the VVorlde: that is to saie, the Pope maketh al the worlde Fooles.

Clemen. Lib. 2. De Appellationib. Pastoralis. Distin. 22. Omnes. In Sexto, Lib. 3. Ti. 16. De Statu Regularium. Antonius de Rosellis. Auentinus in Adriano. 4.

Clemen. in Proœmio. In Glossa.

But if it séeme so greate a mater, for a Pope to depose a Kinge, I doubte not, but ye maie wel remember, that Emperoures sommetimes haue deposed Popes. The Emperoure Constantius (an Arian, I graunte, but yet an Emperoure) deposed Pope Liberius: and afterwarde, restoringe Liberius, deposed Pope Fœlix. The Emperoure Otho the Firste deposed Pope Iohn 13. The Emperoure Iustinian deposed twoo Popes in order: firste Pope Syluerius, and afterwarde Pope Vigilius. And al this did they without leuieinge of armie, without raising of power, without disquiet, or trouble of the people. And a Doctoure of youre owne séminge fully to

Platyna in Liberio. 2. Tomo. Conciliorum. In Vita Syluerij. & Vigilij.

Do ity determine

determine the mater by a Booke case, saithe thus, Imperator, requisitus à Cardinalibus, debet procedere contra Papam: *The* Emperour, *beinge required by the Cardinalles, is bounde to proceede* (to Deprivation) *against the* Pope. An other saithe thus, Si quando Imperialis Legatus mitteretur à Principe, vt Romanus Pontifex proficisceretur Constantinopolim ad Imperatorem, omni neglecta occasione, ibat, etiamsi pro certo sciret, se iturum in exilium: *If at any time the Emperoures Embassadoure had benne sente from his Prince, to Wil the* Pope *to comme to* Constantinople *to the* Emperour, *al occasions sette aparte, he wente straighte waie, notwithstandinge he certainely knewe, he shoulde be banished.* Vrspergensis saithe, Henricus Rex Italiam ingressus, tres Papas indigne constitutos Synodaliter deposuit: Henrie *the Emperoure, commynge into* Italie, *deposed three Popes vnlawfully made, by order of Synode.*

Iohan. De Paris sys. cap. 14.

Appendix Eutropij: in Sylueio.

Vrspergen. Anno. 1045.

Nowe, M. Hardinge, if you, with youre Rhetorical furniture, maie crie out, O what a Diuine Power had the Pope, that thus coulde depose a Kinge: why maie not we likewise saie, *O what a Diuine Power had the Emperour, that thus coulde depose so many Popes?*

But, that ye maie the better se this wonderful Diuinitie, and Heauenly Power, wherewith ye woulde so faine enfeaffe the Pope, a Witnesse of youre owne saithe thus, Quòd dicitur, Papam deposuisse Regem Francorum, & loco eius instituisse Pipinum, Glosa ordinaria exponit, Deposuit, id est, deponentibus consensit. Non enim legitur, quòd Papa Zacharias Regem Franciæ deposuerit: *Where as it is saide, that the* Pope *deposed the Frenche Kinge, and placed* Pipinus *in his rowme, The* Ordinarie Glose *expoundeth it thus: He deposed him, that is to saie, He consented to them, that did depose him. For wee reade not, that* Pope Zacharie *in deede euer deposed the Frenche Kinge.*

Iohan. De Parisijs. cap. 15.

The truthe of the Storie is this, For as muche as Chilpericus the Kinge semed voide of Princely grauitie, and had geuen him selfe ouer to pleasure, and wantonnesse, and Pipinus his Lorde Marshal, a man ful of wisedome, and actiuitie, had the Gouernement, and burthen of al the Realme, the Nobles of France hauinge agreed emonge them selues, to depose the one, and to set vp the other, sente vnto Pope Zacharie, as vnto a wise man, to haue his answeare to this question, VVhether were meeter to be Kinge, He that carried onely the name, and did nothinge: Or he, that bare the burthen of the whole. The Pope was soone persuaded, to geue Sentence with Pipinus the Lorde Marshal, against the Kinge. Whereupon the Kinge was shorne into an Abbie, and made a Monke: Pipinus auanced vnto the state, gaue the Pope the Exarchate, or Princehoode of Rauenna, in parte of recompence for his good will.

Paulus Æmylius, Li. 2. Gaguinus.

Whether the Kinge hauinge nothinge peares ruled his Realme, were afterwarde depriued by righte, or by wronge, I wil not reason. Fasciculus Temporum saithe, *The Kingedome was remoued from the righte Heires.*

The Line of Kinge Pipine endured, and florished a longe while: And that (ye saie) was no obscure argumente of Heauenly Approbation, and Diuine Prouidence. By sutche Approbation, and Prouidence, the Turke maie claime. For he hathe bothe longer continued, and mutche more florished, and encreased his estate, then euer did the house of Pipine. But Cato was wonte to saie, Multum est caliginis in rebus Diuinis: *There is greate darkenesse in Goddes maters.*

Plutarch. in Catone Vtien.

Yet, leste any man of ignorance happen herein to be deceiued, this was the very true descente, and flourishinge Fortune of Kinge Pipines Rase.

The Firste thereof was Charles the Greate: In his time, saithe Benuenutus Imolensis, Laceratum est Imperium: *The state of the Empiere was torne in sunder.*

Benuenutus Imolensis in Augustali. Paulus Æmylius Lib. 3.

The Seconde was Ludouicus Pius: Against him his owne Sonne Lotharius arose, and caused him to be shorne as a Moncke, and to be thruste into an Abbie, and his owne Mother the Empresse to be made a Nonne.

The Thirde was Lotharius: He oppressed his owne Brethren by violence: and afterwarde was deposed, and made a Moncke.

The Fourthe was Ludouicus 2. He was vnfortunate in al his doinges: and was shamefully conquered by his Brother.

The

Deposing of Kinges Bonifacius 8.

The Fifthe was Ludouicus 3. Whome for his doughtie dædes, they commonly calle Ludouicus nihili: whiche is as mutche to saie, as Lewes Nobody.

The Sixthe was Carolus 2. named Caluus: as Benuenutus saithe, Vir lepore timidior: *A man more feareful, and more cowardly, then a hare.* He was shortly slaine with poison.

The Seuenth was Carolus 3. as Benuenutus saithe, Vir deficiens & animo, & Corpore: *A man wantinge bothe strengthe of Body, and wisedome of minde:* that is to saie, both a Cowarde, and a Fole.

The Eight was Arnulphus: He was eaten vp with Lise.

The Nienth was Ludouicus 4. by the reporte of Benuenutus, a man of no better Fortune, then his Father. In him that house had an ende. This is that Noble Pipines Rase, M. Hardinge, that coulde not so stande, and florishe, as you saie, without special Heauenly Approbation, and Diuine Prouidence.

Paulus Æmyl. in Chronico.

Benuenutus Iomolen. in Augustali. Nihilo fœlicior Patre. In eo dee fecit Imperium in gente Carolorum.

M. Hardinge.

Concerninge that ye saie of Kinge philip surnamed le Bel, if we maie beleue Paulus Aemylius the beste writer of the Frenche Chronicles, the cause was suche betwene Pope Bonifacius, and that King, that if he did not onely excommunicate him, but also offered gifte of his Kingedome to Albert the Emperour, as Platina your Authour herein writeth: he maie seeme therein to haue donne (a) not altogeather so euil as ye pretende. For, as bothe Aemylius and Platyna doo witnesse, the cause of theire fallinge out was, that whereas the Pope beinge firste sued vnto by Cassanus a Christian Prince, and a greate Conquerour in the Easte, to ioine with him for the recouery of the holy lande, sent the Bishop of Apamea to the Frenche Kinge for his necessarie aide in that so common a quarrel of al Christendome, he beinge offended, either that the sute was not firste made to him, either for that the saide Bishop had donne his Ambassade with shewe of more auctoritie, then the Kinge thoughte it became him, or vpon somme priuate grudge, did not onely vtterly refuse to sende any helpe towarde the voiage, but also contemptuously, beside common order, and cruelly, committed the Popes Legate to Prison, and there kept him, vntil suche time, as through the Popes interdict, the Kinge was compelled to set him at libertie. Nowe of geuinge awaie his Kingedome, this chiefe Frenche Historiographer maketh no mention. And if the Pope so did, why maie he not seeme to haue donne it (b) rather to feare him, and to reclaime his minde from disobedience? Verily Platyna writinge it, declareth, how before the Pope proceeded to that extremitie, the Frenche Kinge did what in him laie, (c) to withdrawe the people of France from the obedience of the Churche and See Apostolike.

(a) Not altogeather so euil. A proper qualification.

(b) A ioily way, to fraie a King.

(c) By this Diuinitie, if any Kingedome refuse to be subiecte, and thral to the See of Rome, the Pope may geue the same away at his pleasure.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Here, M. Hardinge, ye stammer in your tale, and knowe not wel, what to saie, If the Pope gaue awaie the Kingedome of France from the Prince, he did it (ye saie) to the intent to feare him. A prety diuise, to fraie a King, to pul the Crowne Emperial from his head.

Firste, this Pope Bonifacius is he, of whom it was saide, Intrauit, vt Vulpes: Regnauit, vt Lupus: Mortuus est, vt Canis: *He entred into the Popdome, as a Foxe: He reigned, as a Woulfe: He died,* (in prison) *as a Dogge.* In Solemne Procession he went attyred with the Crowne Emperial, and Robe of Maiestie, as an Emperour, and commaunded the Naked Swerde to be borne before him. In the Storie of his Life ioined with his owne Booke, named, Sextus Bonifacij 8. it is written thus, Moritur hoc modo Bonifacius, qui Imperatoribus, Regibus, Principibus, Nationibus, Populis terrorem potiùs, quàm Religionem injcere conabatur: *Thus died* Pope Bonifacius, *a man, that sought more to strike terrour into Emperours, Kinges, Princes, People, and Nations, then true Religion.*

Paralip. Vrspergen. In vita Bonifacij 8. In Sexto. Idem in Platyna

This Bonifacius, saithe Sabellicus, sente to the Frenche Kinge for monie, as he pretended, towardes the recourse of Hierusalem. The Bishop of Apamea, beinge his Legate in that behalfe, vttered certaine greate wordes in the presence of the Kinge, and threatened him, onlesse he woulde graunte it.

Sabell. Enneade. 9. Lib. 7.

The Kinge, not quietly bearinge suche presumptuous boldenesse, commanded the Apostolique Legate vnto warde. This iniurie so inflamed the Popes choler, that immediately he sente the Archebishop of Narbon to the Kinge, to require him, to sette his Legate at libertie: otherwise to trulle him, that for his wickednesse, *The right of his Kingedome was fallen to the Churche of Rome.* Thus Sabellicus, in fauoure of the Pope, thought it good somme what to shadowe the mater.

But others thereof haue written thus, Bonifacius 8. mandat Regi, se esse Dominum in Spiritualibus, & Temporalibus in Vniuerso Mundo: Vtly Rex recognoscat

Martinus Polonus.

Regnum

Philippus. Bonifacius 8.

Regnum Franciæ à se. Contrarium enim sentire, & tenere, Hæreticum esse: Pope Bonifacius 8. *sente vnto the Frenche Kinge, and tolde him, that he was Lorde bothe in Spiritual, and also in Temporal maters throughout the worlde: and therefore, that the Kinge shoulde holde his Kingedome at his hande. For otherwise to thinke, and holde, he saide, it was Heresie.*

Dist. 81. Si quis. In Glossa. Abbas Vrspergen.

This is it, that in the name of the Pope is noted in your Glose: Quicunque Præceptis nostris non obedierit, peccatum Idololatriæ, & Paganitatis incurrit: *Who so euer obeieth not our Commaundementes, falleth into the Sinne of* Idolatrie, and Infidelitie. **Herevf** Vespergensis **writeth thus**, Habes, Roma, quod sitisti: decanta Canticum: quia per malitiam, non per Religionem orbem vicisti: *O Rome, thou haste nowe, that thou haste so longe thirsted after. Nowe singe merily. For by thy malice, not by Religion, thou haste conquered the worlde.*

Paulus Æmyl. Platyna. Sabellicus. Nauclerus.

The Kinge beinge moued herewith, commaunded that none of his Clergie shoulde comme to the Popes Councel: **He openly burnte the** Popes VVrites: **He commaunded the** Popes Legate **to departe out of his Realme: He forbade that any monie shoulde be made thence to the Pope: He gaue out** Proclamations, **that none of his Subiectes shoulde goe to Rome: And in the Synode at** Parise, **he charged the Pope with** Pride, Ambition, Murder, Simonie, **and** Heresie.

Thus muche of the dealinge of the Crowne of France **vnto a stranger: that is to saie, of the** Faithe, and Reuerence, that the Pope beareth to Kinges, and Princes: **Here folowed somewhat of the spoilinge of the Duke of** Sauoie, **and of the alteringe of the state of** Florence: **whiche thinges I thought it beste to passe ouer, as not worthy of any Answeare.**

The Apologie, Cap. 5. Diuision. 4.

Wee are accloied with Examples in this behalfe, and it shoulde be very tedious to recken vp al the notorious practises of the Bishops of Rome. But of whiche side were they, I beseeche you, that poisoned Henrie the Emperoure, **euen in the receiuinge of the Sacramente? Whiche** poisoned Victor the Pope, **euen in the receiuinge of the Chalice? Whiche poisoned our** Kinge Iohn, Kinge of Englande, **in a drinkinge Cuppe? Who so euer at leaste they were, and of what secte so euer, I am sure, they were neither** Lutheranes, **nor** Zuinglianes.

M. Hardinge.

The Findes of Hel were not yet let loose, that begate Lutheranes, Zwinglians, and Caluinistes. And hereof wee vnderstande the youthe of your Churche, whiche hauinge diuided it selfe from the olde, and Catholike Churche, is no other but the malignant Churche, and Synagog of Satan.

To answeare your demaundes, VVho so euer they were, that poisoned these great personages, (if they were poisoned at al) good men were they not, neither the dooers, nor the Counsailours. Henry of Luxenburg it was, who was poisoned by reporte. VVhom your Latine Booke printed among the Huguenotes calleth Henry the Seuenth, M. Doctour Haddon in his answeare to Osorius, accompteth him the Fourthe, in bothe your Englishe translations (that I haue seene) he is called onely Henry. As he laide siege to the Citie of Florence, and had now brought the Citizens to despaire of their safetie: when manly courage might not serue, they betooke them to cowardly malice. First they poisoned (as it is saide) the minde of a Frier Dominican with Golde, that afterwarde he shoulde aduentere to poison the Emperours body with venime. Paulus Aemylius saithe, that he died of a sickenesse, whiche he fel into at Bonconuento, as he iourned from Pisa thither. Onuphrius, writinge of his deathe, saithe that he died at Bonconuento a towne in the territorie of Siena, and maketh no mention of his poisoninge. Cornelius Cornepolita writinge this storie, seemeth to geue litle credite vnto it. For he addeth an hearesaie, *Vt aiunt*, as they saie, as thoughe it were a mater anouched by no certaintie, but by Hearesaie. Nauclerus reporteth, that the order of those religious men is saide to haue a testimonial in writinge, witnessinge the foresaide Frier to haue ben Innocente, and that the whole was but a fained tale. Lib. 1. In Scholi. in Platin. In Chronograph.

Victor the third Pope is mentioned by Martinus Polonus, to haue ben poisoned by the malicious procurement of the Emperour Henry the third, because he stoode in defense of Gregorie the seuenth, whom the Emperour so muche hated, and persecuted. Vincentius holdeth contrarie opinion, that he died of a dysentery, as Platina reciteth.

Touchinge Kinge Iohn of England, they that write that he was poisoned in a drikinge Cuppe by Monkes, them selues make no better then a fable of it: and who so euer write it, referre them

selues

Poiſon in the Sacramente.

ſelues to heareſaie, and to the popular fame. The Authour of your Actes and Monumentes reporteth, that many opinions are amonge the Chornicle writers of his Deathe. As ye proceede in your malicious railinge againſte the Pope ye ſpitte out your poiſon, demaundinge certaine queſtions, ſhorte in woordes, but ful ſtuffed with falſe and cankered ſlaunders.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

The Poiſoninge of that Noble Emperoure Henrie of Lucenburg, **in the Sacramente, whereby it appeareth, howe farre forthe the States of the worlde ought to truſte you, ye woulde haue vs to paſſe lightly ouer, as a Fable. Of** your Onuphrius, **and** Cornelius, **and other like** Paraſites, **we make no reckeninge. The truthe of the ſtorie is reported by many.** Vrſpergenſis ſaithe, Quidam Religioſus porrexit Imperatori intoxicatam Euchariſtiam, &c. *A certaine Religious man miniſtred vnto the Emperoure* The Sacramente poiſoned. *The Emperoure hauinge receiued it, and returninge againe vnto his place, thought that a peece of colde fleſhe was paſte alonge throughe his body.*

Paralip. Vrſperg Anno. 1313.

Baptiſta Egnatius **ſaithe, it was wrought by the policie of** Robertus Kinge of Sicilia, **moued thereto, as** Auentinus ſaithe, **by** Pope Clemente 5. **The ſame we ſhal finde recorded in** Carion, **in** Supplemento Chronicorum, **in** Rauiſius Textor, **& ſundrie others.**

Bapt. Egnatius. Auentinus. Carion. Supplementum Chronicorum. Textor in Officina: Veneno extincti.

The like recorde there is founde of poiſoninge of Victor 3. **in the Chalice. For the more credite whereof it maie pleaſe you to reade** Martinus Polonus **the Popes Penitentiarie,** Volaterranus, Matthæus Palmerius, **the** Supplie of Chronicles, Faſciculus Temporum, Textor, **and others.**

Touchinge the Deathe of Kinge Iohn, **whether he were poiſoned by a Moncke, or no, I wil not ſtriue: referringe me ſelfe therein to the credite of our** Chronicles: **the common reporte whereof, togeather with the general opinion of the people, is this, That he was deſtroied with Poiſon. But what ſo euer were the cauſe of his deathe,** Matthias Pariſienſis **ſaithe thus,** Papa Innocentius ſententionaliter definiuit, &c. Pope Innocentius *determined by ſentence, that* Kinge Iohn ſhoulde be depoſed from his eſtate. *And he enioined the execution thereof to the Frenche Kinge, for Remiſſion of his Sinnes,* **promiſinge him alſo faithfully, that, if he ſo did, he, & his Succeſſours ſhoulde enioye the** Kingedome **of** Englande **for euer. So mutche is** Englande **bounde to reuerence, and obeie the** Pope.

Matthias Pariſien. Ann. 1211.

The Apologie, Cap. 7. Diuiſion. 2.

What is he at this daie, whiche alloweth the mightieſt Kinges, and Monarches of the worlde to kiſſe his bleſſed Feete?

M. Hardinge.

It is he (ſaie wee) that humbly for his owne perſon refuſeth ſuche honour, that calleth, and thinketh him ſelfe, *Seruum ſeruorum Dei*, the ſeruant of the ſeruantes of God. But when he ſeeth the great Powers and Princes of the worlde humble them ſelues to Chriſt, Lorde of al Lordes, and Kinge of al Kinges, in the perſon of him, whoſe Vicare on Earthe he is, and chiefe deputie in thoſe thinges, that be to Godwarde: not vnmindful what he is of him ſelfe, for the roomes ſake that he beareth, and for his honour whoſe Vicegerent he is, the rather alſo for (a) example of Humilitie, and Obedience, ſo to be taken and learned of others of inferiour degree: he ſuffereth that honour to be donne, whiche is more then a mere man can require. Neither is this the pride of Popes at theſe daies onely, as ye obiecte, but the example of ſuche humilitie in Princes wee can proue to be aunciente.

(a) A proper Schoole of Humilitie.

The greate Kinge Charlmaigne, who afterwarde was create Emperour, could not be withholden by the Pope Adrian the firſte, but at the firſte meetinge he woulde kiſſe his feete. Many other Emperours and Kinges haue of olde times donne likewiſe. And leaſt the Soueraintie of ſuche Honour exhibited vnto him ſhould in his owne conceite lifte him higher then for the degree of humaine condition (b) to that pourpoſe ſerueth the ſtoole of natural eaſmente at his creation, whereof your ſurmiſe is (c) very vile, to temper the higheneſſe of that vocation with the baſe conſideration of humaine infirmitie, and neceſsities.

(b) Fy for ſhame. Cannot the Pope learne Humilitie, but by a ſtoole of eaſemente?

(c) Vntruth. For it is not ſurmiſed by vs, but recorded by your owne writers. Sabellicus ſaithe, *Vt ſedentis genitalia ab vltimo Diacono attrectentur.* *Chryſoſtom. in Matthæ. Homil.* 74.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

What thinge is there, either ſo vile, or ſo horrible, but by ſuche proper excuſes maie ſone be ſmothed? Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Hæc etſi minima eſſe videantur, tamen magnorum ſunt cauſæ malorum. Nam & Ciuitates, & Eccleſias ſæpenumerò euerterunt. Propterea nec à Lachrymis abſtinere poſſum, cùm primos iſtos Confeſſus, & Salutationes audiam, ac in mentem veniat, quot, quantaque hinc mala in Eccleſia

Dei

Kisse the Popes foote.

Dei orta sint: *These thinges, notwithstandinge they seeme smal, yet are they the causes of greate euilles. For oftentimes haue they ouerthrowen bothe Cities, and Churches. Therefore I cannot abstaine from weepinge, when I heare these* Superioritie *and* Salutations: *and consider, howe many, and howe greate euilles haue growen thereof in the Churche of God.* S. Hierome, **much mislikinge the state of his time, saithe thus,** Episcopi, velut in aliqua sublimi specula constituti, vix dignantur videre mortales, & alloqui conseruos suos: *The Bishoppes, as if they were placed in some highe Castle, scarcely vouchesaue to looke vpon poore mortal men, and to speake vnto theire felowe seruantes.*

Hieron. in Epist. ad Galat. cap. 4.

Touchinge the Bishop of Rome, **it is not for naught, that** S. Gregorie **saithe,** Rex Superbiæ in foribus est: *The Kinge of Pride is euen at hand.* **In the** Popes owne Booke of the Ceremonies of Rome, **it is written thus,** Electus Imperator cum suis omnibus, seruato ordine, per gradus ascendit suggestum. Et vt primùm videt Pontificem, detecto capite, illum, genu terram contingens, veneratur: & iterum, cùm appropinquat ad gradus Sedis, genu flectit: demum, vbi ad Pontificis pedes peruenit, illos in reuerentiam Saluatoris Deuotè osculatur: *The Emperour Electe, goeinge in araie with al his traine, passeth vp the staires into the Scaffolde. And as soone as he seeth the* Pope, *he woorshippeth him with bare heade, touchinge the grounde with his knee: Againe, when he commeth to the foote of the Popes Throne, he kneeleth downe. Laste of al, when he commeth vnto the Popes Feete, he* kisseth them Deuoutely *in the reuerence of our Sauioure.* **This is ordered as a spicial Ceremonie, and appointed vnto the Emperour, as parte of his duetie.**

Gregor. Lib. 4. Epist. 38.

Ceremoniar. Li. 1. sectio. 5. ca. 3.

Deuotè Osculatur.

Likewise it is written of the Empresse, **as concerninge her duetie:** Imperatrix Coronata, mox osculatur pedem Pontificis: *The* Empresse *beeinge Crowned, immediately* kisseth the Popes foote.

Ceremoniar. Li. 1. sectio. 5 cap. 6.

Againe of the Pope **him selfe it is written thus,** Papa nemini omninò mortalium reuerentiam facit, assurgendo manifestè, aut caput inclinando, seu detegendo: *The* Pope *him selfe geeueth no maner of reuerence to any man aliue, either openly by standinge vp, or by boweinge downe, or by vncoueringe his Heade.*

Ceremoniarum, Lib. 3. cap. 2.

But the Pope (**saie you**) humbly, for his owne persone, refuseth sutche honoure, and hereby teacheth Kinges, and Emperours, and al theire Subiectes to be humble. **A strange case, to teache** Humilitie **in the** Schoole of Pride. **Sutche** Humilitie **taught** Iulius Cæsar, Diocletian, **and** Maximinus. Iulius Cæsar **raught out his Foote for** Pompeius Pœnus **to kisse, that folkes mighte se his Golden Slipper sette with stoanes.** Pomponius Lætus **saithe,** Diocletianus edicto sanxit, &c. Diocletian *commaunded by Proclamation, that al menne shoulde falle downe, and kisse his Feete: Whereunto also he added a certaine reuerence, adourninge his Shooes with Golde, and Diamondes.* Maximinus **also afterwarde did the like.**

Seneca. Pomponius Lætus in Diocletiano. Alexander. ab Alexandro.

Sutche Humilitie **shal** Antichriste **teache, auancinge him selfe aboue al that is woorshipped, or called God.**

2. Thessalon. 2.

Sutche Humilitie **the Diuel toke vpon him to teache, when he saide to Christe,** *I wil geeue thee al these thinges, if thou wilte falle downe, and woorship mee.*

Matthæ. 4.

Thus made the Pope calle him selfe Lorde of Lordes, Kinge of Kinges, **and sette his foote on** Emperoures **neckes: and yet neuertheless, if he can frame a newe title, and saie, He is** Seruus Seruorum Dei, *The Seruante of Goddes Seruantes,* **it is no** Pride: **it is but** Humilitie.

Antoninus **saithe,** Non minor honor debetur Papæ, quàm Angelis. Vnde Papa recipit à Fidelibus Adorationes, Prostrationes, & Oscula pedum: quod non permisit Angelus à Iohanne Euangelista sibi fieri: *There is no lesse honoure dewe vnto the* Pope, *then vnto the* Angelles of God. *Therefore the* Pope *suffereth the Faithful to Woorship him, and to falle downe before him, and to kisse his Feete: Whiche thinges the* Angel *of God would not suffer* S. Iohn the Euangeliste *to doo vnto him.*

Antoninus in Summa. Par. 3. tit. 22. ca. 5 § 4.

This, M. Hardinge, is no maliceous Railinge, **as yée cal it,** nor Spite, nor Poison, nor Vntruthe stuffed with false, and cankered Sclaunders. **By the reporte of youre owne Doctoures, and by your owne Confession, it is the Truthe.**

The Porphyry Stoole of easement serueth (**yée saie**) to put the Pope in minde of his Humanitie, **that is to saie, that he maie remember him selfe, in the middes of al his glorie, to be a man.**

a man. No, no, M. Hardinge, your owne Authoures, and Storyes can tel you, that Stole serueth, to put the Pope in remembrance of his Virilitie: that the world may knowe, he is no woman.

The Popes Bridle. The Popes Stirope.

But let your imagination stande for true. Yet may we thinke, your Popes are so forgeatful, or so dulheaded, or so blockishe, that they haue nede to be taught by so vile examples, to know them selues? Certainely this is a Mystical kinde of Stoole of easemente.

We cannot lightly lacke Mysteries at his handes, if so homely a place be so ful of Mysteries. Kinge Alexander the Greate vnderstode him selfe to be a Manne Mortal, as others were, and not a God, as he was borne in hande: for that he was sommetimes of natural necessitie forced to stirpe. But Christes Vicare: Peters Successoure: The Doctoure of al Doctours: The Father of al Fathers: The Maister, and Teacher of al the worlde, were it not for a Stoole of easemente, would quite forgeate his owne Humanitie, and coulde neuer remember him selfe to be a Man.

Plutarch. in Alexandro.

The Apologie, Cap. 7. Diuision. 3.

What is he, that commaundeth the Emperoure, to goe by him at his horse bridle, and the Frenche Kinge to holde his stirope?

M. Hardinge.

VVhat is he, (a) wee knowe not, (a) nor you neither, Sir Defender. This we knowe, that in these woordes moste impudently you belie the Pope. For neuer was there Pope that commaunded either Frenche Kinge, or Emperoure, to doo the seruice you speake of. Parte of that I haue readen perteininge hereunto, I wil here recite.

(a) Vntruthes twoo togeathet Reade the Answeare.

The woorthiest and greatest Prince that euer was in Earthe, Constantine the Greate, to witnesse openly the reuerence whiche he bare in his harte to Christe our Sauiour, and to S. Peter, whose Successour the Pope is, as likewise Christes Vicare in Earthe, disdained not to honour S. Sylvester Pope in his time, with dooinge (b) the office of a footeman to him, and with leadinge his Horse by the Bridle. VVherein he seemeth, as firste of al Emperoures he professed the Faithe of Christe openly, so firste of al Princes to haue geuen to the posteritie an example of Humilitie. That no man doubte of it, this muche I finde recorded by an olde Father of the Greeke Churche, Matthæus Hieromonachus, as vttered by Constantine him selfe: ἡμεῖς δὲ σράτερος ὀφφικιαρ ὑπελθόντες, καὶ τὰ χαλινὰ τοῦ ἵππου αὐτοῦ κατέχοντες, τῆς αὐλῆς τῷ ἱερῷ αὐτοῦ ἐξήμεν ἀνακτόρῳ, ἀσμοί, καὶ φόβῳ τὸ κυρίε μὴν τὸ ἁγίε συνεχόμενοι Πέτρου. VVhiche in Englishe is this mutche. Submittinge our selfe to the office of a footeman, and holdinge his Horse by the Bridle, wee leade him foorth out of his Sacred Palais, in the woorshipp and reuerence of S. Peter.

(b) Al this is a greate vntruth, and a peeuishe Fable. σράτορος ὀφφικιαρ. *This is Greeke euen for a Pope.*

That sithence bothe Emperours, and Frenche Kinges of Humilitie and deuotion, and to witnesse their humble obedience to Christe in his Vicare, haue donne the like seruice, yea though the Pope shewed him selfe neuer so vnwillinge thereto: wee finde it reported by sundrie good recordes. (c) But that he euer commaunded any suche seruice to be done vnto him, ye can neuer shewe it by any indifferente and credible witnesse. Paulus Aemylius an Italian of Verona, in the seconde Booke of his Chronicles, whiche bothe diligently and eloquently he wrote of Fraunce, describeth howe honorably Pipine that woorthy Kinge of Fraunce receiued Steuin the Pope, that succeeded Zacharias, when he came into his Realme. He bothe kissed his feete, and wente by him at his Horse bridell.

(c) Vntruthe moste manifest. For it is thus Ordred in the Popes owne Pontifical, and in his owne Booke of Ceremonies.

The like honoure of holdinge the Stirope would Charles the first the late greate Emperour haue donne at Bononia to Pope Clemente the seuenthe, had not the Pope with muche adoo put him from it.

The Bisshop of Sarisburie.

This thinge Sir Defender knoweth: notwithstandinge you, M. Hardinge, dissemble it cunningly, and wil not be knowen, that ye knowe it. Neither dothe Sir Defender, as you saie, by these woordes, impudently belie the Pope. For trial hereof, he referreth you to the Popes owne Booke of Holy Ceremonies: wherein it is particularely appointed, and laide out in order, to auoide confusion, what eche estate ought, and is bounde to doo.

Thus therefore it is appointed, Cùm Papa per Scalam ascendit, &c. *When the* Pope *taketh his staires to mounte on Horsebacke, the* greatest Prince, *that is presente,* whether he be Kinge, or Emperoure, *holdeth his Stirope: and afterwarde leadeth his Horse a litle waie forewarde by the* Bridle. *But if there were* twoo Kinges, *in presence, the more honourable of them shoulde holde the* Bridle *of the Righte side: and the other of the Lefte.*

Ceremoniar. Li. Ca. 8.

The Popes Bridle.

The Popes Stirope.

If there happen no Kinge to be presente, then let the woorthiest persones leade his Horse. But if the Pope *woulde not ride, but be borne on mennes shoulders in a chaire, then muste fiure of the woorthiest Princes,* yea the Emperoure him selfe, or any other mighty Monarche, *if he be presente, beare the Chaire,* Pope *and al, a litle waie forewarde vpon theire shoulders.*

Againe, Imperator, traditis Pomo, & Sceptro, &c. *The* Emperoure, *deliueringe ouer his Goulden Apple, and his Sceptre to one of his menne, commeth vnto the* Popes *Horse, and in honour of our Lorde Iesus Christe, whose persone in Earthe the* Pope *beareth, he holdeth the Stirope, vntil the* Pope *be mounted: and afterwarde he taketh the* Bridle, *and leadeth fiorthe his Horse. While the* Emperoure *dooth these* profitable offices, *the* Pope *ought modestly a litle to refuse the same: and yet afterwarde, with certaine good, and gentle woordes, takinge that honoure, as donne to Christe, and not vnto him selfe, he boldeth him selfe contented.*

Further it is appointed thus, Caudam pluuialis portabit Nobilior Laicus, qui erit in Curia, etiamsi esset Imperator, aut Rex: *The moste noble Laie man, that shal be in the Courte, shal beare vp the traine of the Popes Cope,* yea though it be an Emperoure, or a Kinge. **Againe,** ⁎ *Let the moste Noble Laie man,* whether he be Kinge, or Emperoure, *bringe water to washe the Popes handes. And, while the Pope* washeth, *let al the Bishoppes, and Laie menne kneele downe.*

Againe, Pontifice sedente, &c. ‡ *While the Pope is yet sittinge at the Table, the Noblest man within the Courte, be* he Emperoure, be he Kinge, *shalbe brought to the* Popes Credence, *to geue him Water.*

Againe, ⁎ Primum ferculum portabit Nobilior Princeps, siue Imperator sit, siue Rex: *The firste dishe the Noblest Prince shal carrie,* whether he be Emperoure, or Kinge. Againe, ‡ Rex in collatione portabit primum potum: *When the Pope is at Breakefaste,* the Kinge shal beare his firste Cuppe. **And againe,** Pocula portentur &c. *Let the Popes Cuppes be borne by the Noble menne, or Oratours beinge presente: and let the Clerke of the Ceremonies beginne with the woorthiest estate:* yea though he be Kinge, or Emperoure.

Nowe, I truste, M. Hardinge, of your courtesie, ye wil confesse, that Sir Defender, **in these woordes, hathe not so** impudently belied the Pope. **The Popes owne Booke of Ordinances, and Ceremonies, that directeth al others, saithe thus,**

The Emperoure **shal holde the** Popes Stirope:
Let the Emperoure **leade the** Popes Horse.
The Emperoure **muste beare the** Popes Chaire **on his shoulder.**
The Emperoure **shal beare vp the** Popes traine.
Let the Emperoure **bringe the** Water **and** Ewer to the Pope.
The Emperoure **shal geue the** Pope water.
The Emperoure **shal carrie the** Popes Firste dishe.
The Emperoure **shal carrie the** Popes firste Cuppe.

Thus maie we goe to the Pope to schoole, to learne Humilitie. **For excuse hereof, perhaps ye wil saie, These were the Abuses of Olde times: But nowe al suche disorders are wel reformed. Therefore it maie please you to remember, that the selfe same** Ceremonies, **touchinge Kinges, and Emperours duelies, haue benne lately renewed, and confirmed, & published abroade into the worlde, worde by worde, as they were before, without any maner alteration, euen in the Popes owne Pontifical, and that euen nowe newely printed at** Venice, **in the yere of Our Lorde a thousande fiue hundred three score and one, whereby it maie appeare, ye are ashamed of nothinge, be it neuer so shameful. What truthe therefore, M. Hardinge, is in your worde? Or, with what countenance, coulde ye so boldely saie,** That the Pope euer commaunded any suche Seruice to be done vnto him by the Emperoure, ye can neuer shewe it by any indifferente and credible witnesse? **I doubte not but the Popes owne** VVitnes **is vnto you of sufficient credite: and in his owne case it muste nedes to him selfe seme** indifferent. **Verily** Gregorius Haimburgensis **saith, that Pope** Adrian 2. **was highly displeased with the** Emperoure Fredericus, **for that he so vnskilfully, & so vnmanerly helde his Leafte** Stirope, **whereas his duetie had benne to holde the Righte: And therefore vtterly refused, to geue him his Blessinge, notwithstandinge he desired it**

Etiamsi Imperator aut quuis maximus Princeps adesset. Sellam ipsam cum Pontifice in humeris alte quantulum portare Debet. Ceremoniar. Li. 1. Sectio. 5. Ca. 4.

Dum Imperator haec vtilitatis Officia vult exhibere &c.

Tandem cum aliquibus bonis verbis recipiendo, permittit &c. Ceremoniarium. Lib. 1. Ca. 8.

⁎ Ceremoniar. Li. 1. Sectio. 3.

‡ Ceremoniar. Li. 2. Ca. 10.

Etiamsi Rex aut Imperator sit.

⁎ Ceremoniar. Li. 1. Sectio. 3.

‡ Ceremonia. Li. 1. Sectio. 13. Ca. 2.

Gregor. Haimburgen. in Appellatione Sigismundi.

red it humbly vpon his knée. Hereby it plainely appeareth, that in al Offices, and Seruices, the Pope vseth the Emperoure, as his man. Therefore Auentinus reporteth these two verses, written sometime of the Emperoure Lotharius the seconde.

Rex venit ad fores, iurans per Vrbis honores:
Pòst homo fit Papæ, sumit quo dante Coronam:

The Kinge, *or* Emperour *commeth to the gates, and sweareth by the honour of the Cittie: And afterwarde becommeth the* Popes Man, *at whose handes he receiueth the Crowne:*

That Pipinus so mutche abased him selfe to Pope Steuin, it is no marueile. The Prouerbe is common, One hande claweth an other. The Pope was auanced by Pipine: and Pipine was likewise auanced by the Pope. But hereof we haue spoken before.

Where yée say, The Emperoure Constantine the Greate was footeman to the Pope, I am mutche ashamed of your vanitie, that, beinge a man of wisedome, and learninge, ye shoulde thus seeke to mocke the worlde with Childishe Fables.

Ye allege Matthæus Hieromonachus, to proue a Fable by a Fable. If ye would dasle your Readers eies, for that ye alleage his wordes in Greeke, vnderstande you, that his peeuishe Greeke was taken out of your peeuishe Latine. And yet is the same Greeke so fonde, and so ful of folie, that ye were ashamed truely to turne it into Englishe. For thus it standeth, ἀιδοῖ, καὶ φόβῳ τῶ κυρίε μῶν τῶ ἁγίε συνεχόμενοι πέτρου: That is, *In the woorshipp, and feare* of my Lorde Blessed Peter. Ye durste not, to make the Emperoure Constantine so rude to saie plainely, that Peter was his Lorde: and therefore ye thought it better, to corrupt, & alter your Authours wordes. Yet sutche vaine Fables, and Trifles muste ye bringe in, to put vs, as ye saie, quite out of doubte. But hereof we shal saie more hereafter.

The Apologie, Cap. 7. Diuision. 4.

Who hurled vnder his table Francise Dandalus, the Duke of Venice, Kinge of Creta, and Cypres, faste bounde with Chaines, to feede of boanes amonge his Dogges.

M. Hardinge.

VVere not this Defender passed al shame, he woulde not make so many and so shameles lies. Malice hathe so far blinded him, that he seemeth not to see, what becommeth a man. Though he feare not to be accompted a lier, yet he shoulde be lothe to be accompted an vnhoneste man, yea and specially a foole. Let truthe and honestie goe, for in deede there is litle in these felowes? what foolishnesse is it, a man to bringe al his doctrine, and al his saieinges, touchinge thinges that he would so faine be beleued, into so greate and certaine discredite, by suche open and manifeste lies? The truthe hereof is this, as I finde it witnessed in Sabellicus, and in the chiefest Chronicles the Venetians haue, written by a Noble man of Venis, named Petrus Iustinianus. The Citie of Venis, beinge interdicted of the Pope, Frauncys Dandalus was sente by the Duke and Lordes of the Councel there, to sue for Absolution. At that time was he neither Kinge of Creta, nor of Cypres, nor Duke of Venis, as it pleaseth this Lyinge Defender to write of him, and that in the Defense of theire Englishe Churche written to al the worlde. *Johannes Superantius* then was Duke, and this Frauncys Dandalus was (a) but a priuate man for that time, as others there were. This Ambassadour Frauncys Dandalus findinge the Pope at his firste comminge not wel inclined to graunte his petition as he wished, the (b) qualitie of the offense deseruinge the same, to moue him to Clemencie and pitie, aduised with him selfe to plaie this Pagent. He caused an yron chaine to be tied aboute his necke. Therewith he came to the Pope as he sate at dinner, put him selfe to crepe on al foure, and like a Dogge laide him downe vnder the Table, so longe vntil the Popes displeasure beinge assuaged, he obteined Pardone for his Countrie. VVhereof, they saie, he had afterwarde the surname of Dogge geuen him, as Iustinianus writeth. VVho desireth to see the whole Storie, he shal finde it wel written by the saide *Petrus Iustinianus, Historiæ rerum Venetarum libro quarto*. Nowe let vs see, Syr Defender, howe many lies ye make in one sentence. That Frauncys Dandalus was by the Pope hurled vnder his table, this is one lie. That he was then Duke of Venis, Kinge of Creta and Cypres, there be twoo lies, beside the Notable lie, you seeme to be very ignorante of the state of Venis, in that

Sabellicus Decade. 2. l. 1. 1220. Historiæ rerum Venetarum lib. 4.

(a) Vntruth. For he was then a Senatour of very greate Honour: And at the next Electiõ was chosen Duke.

(b) The offence stoode onely in healpinge their Neighbour, beinge a bãnished man, into his Countrie.

The Popes Bridle.

The Popes Stirope.

Auentinus in Frederico. 1.

that you make the Duke an Ambaſſadour, who beinge once created Duke, goeth not out of the Citie. (c) Neither is euer any of their ſtate Kinge of Candy and Cypres. For their ſtate admitteth none to be a Kinge amonge them: howe be it at the time of Frauncys Dandalus Candy rebelled, and Cypres was not yet come to be vnder the gouernment of the Venetians, as you might haue learned in the eloquente Hiſtorie that Petrus Bembus wrote of Venis his Countrie. That he was faſte bounde with Chaines, there be three lies. For he was not faſte bounde, (d) onely he had caſte a chaine about his owne necke, whiche he might haue taken of at his pleaſure. That he was ſo throwen vnder the Table to gnawe boanes amonge the Popes Dogges, (e) there be foure lies. And that the Pope had Dogges feedinge vnder his Table, (f) I doubt not but it is an other lie. VVhether theſe fiue lies be not inough for one litle ſentence of three lines, I reporte me to whoſoeuer of your owne felowes lieth for the beſte game. I thinke verily this Defender if he be not very ſhameleſſe, wiſheth he had a thicker bearde to hide his ſilke cheekes from bluſhinge. Suche falſe cauſes muſte be defended by lyinge proctours. If they belied ſtories onely, and taught not alſo falſe Doctrine in the chiefe pointes of our Faithe, their lyinge were leſſe hurtful.

(c) Yet the right and ſtate of bothe theſe Kingedomes is in his hande.

(d) Al theſe maters be ful ſolemnely proued and are woorthy to be publiſhed by Proclimation.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

So many lies, M. Hardinge, and, as you ſaie, ſo farre paſte ſhame, and ſutche hote Tragedies, and the cauſe no greater? What ſturre wouldе ye haue keapte, if it had benne mater woorthy the hearinge? what if the Authour of the Apologie had benne ouerſéne in the repoꝛte of one péꝛe, oꝛ twoo, oꝛ in ſomme other like Circumſtance, the Subſtance of the Ꝺoꝛte neuertheleſſe ſtil reſerued? If ye had remembꝛed ſome of your owne often ouerſightes, ye couldе not foꝛ ſhame haue benne ſo terrible againſte others. Foꝛ it appeareth wel, by al, that ye haue hitherto ſente vs ouer, your inſight in maters is not ſo déꝛpe, but ye maie often, and foulye be deceiued.

Theſe woꝛdes of yours, M. Hardinge, are neither mannerly, noꝛ manly: notwithſtandinge they ſéeme wel to contente your pleaſante humoure. S. Hierome ſaithe, Non æquè inimici audiunt, & amici. Qui inimicus eſt, etiam in ſcirpo nodum quærit: *An Enimie, and a Frende heare not bothe of one ſorte. An Enimie wil* (cauſil, and quarrel, and) *ſeeke a knotte in a ruſhe.* The Subſtance of Goddes Religion ſtandeth not in the repoꝛtinge of a Ꝺoꝛte. S. Hierome ſaithe of ſutche Captious quarrellers: Audiant à me, non perichitari Eccleſiarum ſtatum, ſi ego celeritate dictandi verba aliqua dimiſerim: *Let them vnderſtande, that al be it I in haſte of penninge haue let eſcape a woorde, oꝛ twoo, yet that ſhal not hazarde the ſtate of the Churche of God.*

Hierony. aduerſus error. Iohã. Hieroſolymit.

Hierony. De optimo genere interpretandi.

But Franciſe Dandalus (ye ſaie) was not at that time Duke of Venice: He him ſelfe tied the Chaine aboute his owne necke: He came of his owne accorde vpon al foure, as if he had benne a Dogge, and laie downe willingly vnder the Popes Table: He laie not there to gnawe boanes: He founde no Dogge there to lie with him. Therefoꝛe, ye ſaie, This Defender is an vnhoneſt man, paſte al ſhame, a Lyer, and a Foole. Sutche Cholerique Concluſions, M. Hardinge, maie wel beſéeme a Doctour of your Diuinitie.

Not Duke.

Howe be it, the faireſt coloure, ye can laie vpon the mater, is this, That the Embaſſadoure of that Noble Common VVeale of Venice, laie as a Dogge, in a chaine, vnderneath the Popes Table, as you ſaie, and that, willingely, and with al his harte, by ſutche Submiſſion to appeaſe the Popes highe indignation, and to recouer his fauoure towardes his Countrie. It ſéemeth, he was either a very Arrogante man, oꝛ a maruelious angrie Pope, that wouldе by none other Submiſſion be reconciled.

But Dandalus at that time was not Duke of Venice. Neither was it ſo harde a mater, to knowe that, M. Hardinge: noꝛ was it ſo greate an Hereſie, to calle him Duke, foꝛ that ſhoꝛtely after he was made Duke. S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Dicimus Apoſtolum Paulum in Tharſo Ciliciæ natum. At ille tunc iam non erat Apoſtolus. Ita cùm audimus, Diſcipulos Chriſti inuitatos ad nuptias, non iam Diſcipulos, ſed qui futuri erant Diſcipuli, intelligere debemus: *Wee ſaie, that* Paule *the Apoſtle was borne at* Tharſus *in* Cilicia. *And yet* Paule *at that time, when he was borne, was no Apoſtle. Euen ſo, when wee heare, that Chriſtes Diſciples were bidden to the Marriage Feaſte at* Cana *in* Galilee, *wee muſte vnderſtande, that they were not then his Diſciples, but became afterwarde his Diſciples.*

Augu. De Conſenſu Euangeliſt. Lib. 2. Cap. 17.

Iohan. 2.

So S. Hierome calleth Pamphilus a Martyr: and yet at that time, whereof he meante, Pamphilus in déede was no Martyr. Therefoꝛe he ſaithe, Concedamus, vt Pamphili ſit, ſed nondum Martyris. Antè enim ſcripſit, quàm Martyrium perpete-

Hierony. De Eruth. Origenu.

Franciſcus Dandalus.

perpeteretur: *Let vs graunte, it was* Pamphilus *Booke: But that* Pamphilus *as yet was no Martyr. For he wrote his Booke firſte, and was Martyr afterwarde.* Like wiſe againe he ſaith, Nos pro, No, Alexandriam poſuimus per Anticipationem, quæ Græcè προλήψις appellatur: *Wee in ſteede of the Cittie*, No, *haue tranſlated it, the Cittie* Alexandria, *by a Figure called* Anticipation: *For that the Cittie, whiche before was called* No, *was afterwarde called* Alexandria. *Hierony. in Ezechielem. Li. 9. Ca. 30.*

So S. Auguſtine ſaithe, **It is written in the** Booke of Geneſis: Hi ſunt Filij Iſrael, qui nati ſunt ei in Meſopotamia: cùm Beniamin longè poſteà natus ſit, cùm iam tranſiſſent Bethel, & appropinquarent Bethleem: *Theſe be the* Children of Iſrael, *that were borne to him in* Meſopotamia: *And yet* Beniamin (**that there is reckened for one of his Children**) *was borne* (**not in** Meſopotamia, **but**) *longe afterwarde, whan they were nowe paſte* Bethel, *and drewe towardes* Bethleem, *that is in* Iewrie. **Yet hath there bene no man hitherto ſo vncourteous, that euer would vſe your eloquence, M. Hardinge, and calle either** Moſes, **or** S. Auguſtine, **or** S. Hierome, **Fooles, or Liers.** *Geneſ. 35. Augu. in quæſt. ſuper Geneſim. Quæſt. 117.*

If ye woulde but indifferently haue weighed the mater, ye might wel haue thought, wæ called Dandalus **Duke of Venice, for that he was ſone afterwarde choſen** Duke of Venice.

So wæ mate ſaie, Doctour Hardinge **in the time of** K. Edwarde **frælp, and fullp profeſſed the Goſpel, and preached vehementlp againſte the** Pope. **Neuertheleſſe, when he thus preached, he was not pet knowen bp the name of a Doctoure. For he was Doctoured afterwarde in the time of** Queene Marie.

Let vs graunte, there was ſomme erroure in the repozte of this Stozie. Pet muſte euery man be condemned for a Foole, **and a** Lier, **that mate be taken in like Erroure? If ſo, then wil M. Hardinge trouble his Godfathers, and cauſe them, to geue him a newe name.**

S. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, **There were twelue** Magi, **or** VViſemenne, **that came to Chriſte: And pet ye holde commonlp, thep were but** three. Clemens Alexandrinus ſaithe, **Chriſte preached** but one yeere: **pet others ſaie, he preached** three yeeres: **others ſaie, he preached foure. Somme ſaie, Chriſte was** three and thirtie **peres olde, ſomme ſaie, he was** foure and thirtie, **when he ſuffered. Pet** Tertullian **ſaith, he was** Onely thirtie yeeres **olde:** Irenæus **ſaithe, He was** more then fourtie. Chriſte **ſaithe,** *My Father is hable to geeue me* twelue Legions of Angels. S. Hilarie, **in the repozte thereof, a greate deale auanceth the number, and reckeneth** duodecim Millia Legionum, twelue thouſande Legions of Angels. **Your owne** Bleſſed Donation of Conſtantine, whiche (ye ſaie) ſo mutche irketh vs, **commaundeth the** Patriarke **of** Conſtantinople **to be ſubiecte, and obediente to the** Biſhop of Rome: **And pet at that time, when, bp your imagination, this Fable was diuiſed, there was** neither Patriarke, nor Churche in Conſtantinople, **nor any** Cittie **as pet builte, and knowen bp that name. Your Felowe** Dorman **allegeth full ſolemnelp the ſeuenth Booke of** Theodoretus: **And pet** Theodoretus **him ſelfe neuer wrote but onelp fiue. And ſo he leapte two whole Bookes beyonde his Authoure. And againe he telleth vs a proper tale, of the terrible Examples of twoo** Kinges, Ozias, **and** Oza: **And pet bothe he, and his Felowes mighte ſone haue learned, that** Oza **was onelp a poze** Leuite, **and no** Kinge. *Matth. 2. Chryſo. in Matthæ. Homil. 2. Clemens Stroma. 1. Tertul. contra Iudæos. Irenæus Lib. 2. Cap. 34. & 40. Matth. 26. Hilar. in Pſal. 54 Donatio Conſtantini. Dorman. Fol. 22. Dorman. Fol. 24.*

You your ſelfe, M. Hardinge, in this ſelfe ſame Booke ſaie, That the Councel of Nice was keapte in the time of Pope Sylueſter: **And pet** Athanaſius, **that then was preſente at the ſame** Councel, **ſaithe,** Sylueſter *at that time was not aliue:* **but that the Councel was ſummoned bp the Emperoure, and holden in the time of** Pope Iulius. **Againe you ſaie,** That at the very ſame time while the Councel was holden at Nice, Pope Sylueſter held likewiſe a Councel in Rome: **And ſo bp the Judgement of** Athanaſius, **pe ſaie,** that Pope Sylueſter helde a Councel after he was deade. *M. Hardinge, Fol. 308. b. Athanaſi. in Apolog. M. Har. fo. 309. 4*

And make al theſe, and other your like tales, M. Hardinge, paſſe vnder the name of Lies, and Folies?

This Gentleman (**pe ſaie**) was not ſo faſte bounde, as wee imagine: but fel downe meekely, and willingely of him ſelfe. **No doubte, M. Hardinge, who ſo knoweth an** Italian

courrage, wil ſone beleue, that Franciſe Dandalus, a Gentleman of ſutche Nobilitie, and the Embaſſadour of ſo Noble a Common Wealthe, was ſone, and eaſily, & willingly wonne, to comme crœpinge with an yron chaine on his necke, & to wallowe vnder the Popes Table, as a Dogge, to his owne immortal ſhame, and to the Euerlaſtinge diſhonour of his Countrie. Verily he would neuer haue pérded him ſelfe to ſutche Villanie, had it not benne to avoide ſomme other greatter villanie. For, I beſeche you, whether is it more cruelltie, for you to renne vpon a poore man with ſwerde drawen, & to ſtrike him through, and ſo to kille him: or els to force him, to laie cruel handes vpon his owne body, and to kille him ſelfe? In whether of theſe two acts is more crueltie? S. Chryſoſtome ſaith, A poore man oftentimes is content to wounde, or leaſter his owne fleaſhe, to the ende, to moue the riche man to ſomme pittie: Alij Capiti ſuo clauos acutos infigunt: alij per ipſum gelu nudo Corpore mendicantes petunt: Alij hiſce etiam grauiora ferentes, miſerabile de ſe præbent ſpectaculum. At dices, Nos illorum capita non configimus. Vtinam verò tu configeres. Non enim tam grauis fuiſſet calamitas. Nam, qui alium interimit, longè leuius peccat, quàm is qui iubet aliquem ſeipſum interficere: *Somme there be, that ſticke nayles in theire owne heades: Somme others goe begginge with naked bodies in the colde froſte: Somme others ſuffer other thinges of greater crueltie, and ſhewe them ſelues miſerable to beholde. But thou wilt ſaie, wee ſticke not theſe nayles in their heades. Woulde God, thou ſtickedſt them in. For then their miſerie were not ſo greuous. For he, that with his owne hande killeth an other, committeth a greate deale leſſe faulte, then he, that forceth a man to kille him ſelfe.*

Chryſoſtom. in 1. Corin. Homil. 11.

So ſaie we, it was far greatter grieſe vnto that Noble Gentleman, ſo vilely to diſhonour, and abaſe him ſelfe, then if he had benne driuen thereto through the force, and violence of his enemie. In this ſorte was the Emperoure Henrie the fourthe wel contente, willingely to waite vpon Pope Hildebrande at Canuſium, and three daies togeather to ſtande bareheaded, and barefote in the harde froſte at his gate, and as one ſaith, to be a gaſinge ſtocke bothe to menne, and Angels, before he might haue licence to comme neare. So was the Emperour Frederichus Aenobarbus contented, willingely to laie his necke vnder the Popes fote: as wée ſhal declare more hereafter. So was the poore Gentle woman contente, willingely to caſte a Halter aboute her owne Sonnes necke, and ſo to preſente him before Pope Hildebrande, whom he had offended, by ſutche humble Subiection to craue his pardon. In reſpect whereof, the Pope pardoned him his life: but commaunded his fote to be ſtriken of: of whiche wounde, the poore ponge Gentleman ſone after died.

Vrſpergen. Sabellicus Ennead. 9. Lib. 3.

Bens Cardinalis

Ye ſaie, It is a lie, that Franciſe Dandalus, ſo Noble a Gentleman was driuen vnder the Popes table to gnawe boanes. I thinke it wel, M. Hardinge: and therefore we wil rather ſaie, He laie there to geather vp the crummes, that fel from his Lordes Table.

Gnawe boanes.

No dogges vnder the Popes Table.

But vnder the Popes Table (ye ſaie) certainely there were no dogges. And this (ye ſaie) is an other lie. Notwithſtandinge, this Negatiue were very harde for you to proue. Howe be it, hereat I wil not greately ſtriue. And yet it had benne a more ſemely ſight, in my iudgemente, to ſée a Dogge lieinge there, then a man, and ſpecially a Noble Gentleman, the Embaſſadoure of ſo Noble a Cittie.

To conclude, this was the ſame Pope Clemens the fifthe, that thus pronounced of him ſelfe, and proclaimed the ſame vnto the whole worlde by a Lawe: Nos ſuperioritatem habemus ad Imperium: Nos, vacante Imperio, Imperatori ſuccedimus: *Wee haue the ſoueraintie ouer the* Empiere: *The* Empiere *beeinge voide, wee are Heires apparente to the* Emperoure. The Venetians had geuen aide, to reſtoare one Friſcus, a banniſhed man, vnto the Dukedome of Ferrara. Therefore Pope Clemens interdited them, and al that they had, and further ſignified his pleaſure vnto al the worlde, that whither ſo euer they, or any of them came, it ſhould be lawful for any man, not onely to take their bodies, and to ſel them for ſlaues, and to ſpoile their goodes, but alſo to kil them, whither it were by right, or by wronge. For ſo Sabellicus writeth, Vt eos fas eſſet vnicuiq; iure, & iniuria interficere. This was the cauſe of al this great a dw. And this highe indignation had neuer benne ſtaked, had not ſo noble a perſonage abaſed him ſelfe, to be tied by the necke in a chaine, and to crépe vnder the

Clem. Lib. 2. De Senten. & re iudica. Ca. 2.

Sabellicus Ennead. 9. Lib. 7.

Popes

Henricus Impera. 4.
Henricus Impera. 5.

Popes Table, vpon al foure, like a Dogge: This diſdigneful face, Sabellicus the Authoure reproueth vehemently, and with many woꝛdes, as immoderate Tyꝛanꝛie, and intollerable Pꝛide, and moſte ſhameful abuſinge of the ſtate of Pꝛinces. Yet M. Hardinge thinketh, it muſte be defended, as very wel donne: and he muſte nédes be damned, that wil finde faulte with it.

Laſte of al, where it liketh you, in the ende to refreaſhe your wittes with this Defenders thinne chaffe, and bluſhinge: verily, M. Harding, he bluſhed in déede, and is mutche aſhamed in your behalfe, to ſée your folies. God gráue you Grace, that you maie bluſhe at your miſuſinge of Goddes people: leaſte ye haue that face, that the Pꝛophete ſaith, Is paſte bluſhinge. I truſt, this Defender ſhal neuer bluſhe to ſaie, either with S. Paule, Non pudet me Euangelij Chriſti: Eſt enim virtus Dei ad Salutem: *I am not aſhamed of the Goſpel of Chriſte: For it is the Power of God vnto Salvation.* Oꝛ with S. Hierome, Non me pudet neſcire, quod neſcio: *I am not aſhamed, in that thinge, that I knowe not, to graunte mine ignorance.*

Rom. 1.

Hierony. Aduerſus Pelagianos, Lib. 1.

The Apologie, Cap. 7. Diuiſion. 5.

Who ſette the Emperial Crowne vpon the Emperoure Henry the ſixthes heade, not with his hande, but with his foote: and with the ſame foote againe caſte the ſame Crowne of, ſaieinge withal, I haue Povver to make Emperours, and to vnmake them againe at my pleaſure?

M. Hardinge.

VVee denie, that Celeſtinus, whome you note in your bookes margent, or any other Pope did this. * It is a vaine fable deuiſed rather of malice, then witte. Ye ſhoulde haue donne wel to ſhewe vs, with whiche foote the Pope did ſet on the Crowne vpon Henries heade, the righte, or the leafte, ſtandinge, ſittinge, leninge, or lieinge, barefooted, and vſinge the healpe of his great toe, or ſhodde: whether he had ſome iymme iamme made for him to take it vp, holde it, and put it on handſomely, or conueied it on by a vice, or howe it was donne.

*Vntruthe. For the ſtories be plaine. Reade the Anſweare.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

What nimbleneſſe, oꝛ cunninge the Pope hathe in his féete, moꝛe then other menne, I haue not hearde. What other ſleightes he hathe nowe, oꝛ hathe had in to times paſte to woꝛke ſutche feates, it behoueth his Magiſter Ceremoniarum to conſider. The ſtoꝛie is recoꝛded by Ranulphus, Rogerus Ceſtrenſis, and Rogerus Houedenus, that liued at the ſame time.

The Apologie, Cap. 7. Diuiſion. 6.

Who put in armes Henrie the Sonne againſte the Emperour his Father Henrie the Fourth, and woꝛought ſo, that the Father was taken pꝛiſoner of his owne Sonne, and beeinge ſhoꝛne, and ſhamefully handeled, was thꝛuſte into a Monaſterie, where with hunger, and ſoꝛowe he pined awaie to deathe.

M. Hardinge.

(a) It was not the Pope, that armed Henry the ſeconde againſte Henry the fourth, who by the accompte of ſome is Henry the thirde. Stories declare other cauſes of their fallinge out, and the more parte of the writers impute it to the iudgemente of God, for pounisheméente of his great wickednes. After that he was ouercome with al his power by the Saxons, in ſeuenteene daies he durſte not to appeare abroade. In the meane time his Sonne tooke vpon him foorthwith the adminiſtration of the Empiere, wente into Italie with an armie, woulde not ſurrender the ſtate whiche he liked wel, his Father beinge therewith offended, he tooke priſoner, (b) without any motion of the Pope, (c) with whome he was alſo at variance, and commiſted him to ſtraight cuſtody.

(a) Vntruthe, eaſily reproued by good Recordes.

Concerninge Gregorie the ſeuenth Pope, who before was called Hildebrandus, whome that Emperoure with endles malice perſecuted, becauſe he woulde (d) not ratifie his Simoniacal making of Biſhops, and geeuinge of Eccleſiaſtical benefices, and defended the Churche againſte his wicked attemptes: biſide ſundrie writers of Hiſtories in that time, as Lambertus Schafnaburgenſis, Leo Hoſtienſis, and afterwarde, Otho Friſingenſis, who ſo mutche commende him for ſundrie excellente vertues: no man hath ſo largely and ſo diligently ſet foorthe his woorthines, as (e) Onuphrius Panuinius, who hath written of him fiue Bookes.

(b) Manifeſte Vntruthe. See the Anſweare.

(c) Vntruth. For this was not the cauſe. But the Pope would haue geuen the ſame him ſelfe.

(d) Vntruthe. For then he was at no variance with the Pope.

(e) This Ancient Doctour is yet aliue, and writeth woorthily for his hiere.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

We maie eaſily beléeue you, M. Hardinge, that the Pope armed not Henrie

Henricus Impera. 4. Henricus Impera. 5.

the Seconde, as you saie, against his Father Henrie the Fourthe. It had benne a maruelous Monster in Nature, that the Fourthe should goe before the Seconde: or that the Neuewe should be borne before his Grandfather. But that the Pope raised vp Henrie the Fifte against Henrie the Fourthe, that is to saie, the Sonne against the Father, that ye might haue easily founde in your owne Recordes.

Gregor. Heimburgen.

Gregorius Heimburgensis saithe thus, Paschalis Papa Principes contra Henricum. 4. concitauit: imo eius Proprium Filium: quem etiam contra Patrem fecit permultos Episcopos Rheni in Regem coronari, & vocari Henricum Quintum: Pope Paschalis *raised vp the Princes of* Germanie *against* Henrie the Fourthe: *Naie rather he raised vp his* owne Sonne, *whome also he caused by many Bishoppes adioininge to the Rheine, to be crowned Emperoure against his owne* Father, *and to be called* Henrie the Fifte.

The case beinge cleare, this one Authoritie maie stande in stede of many. Hereof Henrie the Father pitiously complaineth in his Letters written to the French Kinge. Carion saith, Hunc Henricum Filium solicitarunt Episcopi, vt aduersus Patrem insurgeret, eumq; Imperio pelleret: *The Bishoppes entised this yonge Gentilman,* Henrie the Sonne, *that he shoulde rise* against his Father, *and put him from the Empiere.* But these Bishoppes, as Vrspergensis saithe, were Responsales Paschalis Papæ, *Pope Paschalis Agentes, or doeers in those Countries.* And Henrie the Sonne him selfe, when he stode in the fielde, neuer pretended any other coloure against his Father, but onely the obedience of the See of Rome.

Carion. An. 1103.

Vrspergen. Anno. 1105.

And, leaste any man should doubte of the Truthe hereof, the Pope, not longe before, had likewise raised vp Rodolphus the Duke of Suevia, against the same Emperoure Henrie the Fourthe: and, the better to encourage his Ambitious heade, and to traine him to his pourpose, had sente him a Crowne with this Poisie:

Petra dedit Petro, Petrus Diadema Rodolpho.

Vrspergen. eod. loco. Pag. 237.

Carion.

Whereby he meante, that, as Christ had geuen the state, and right of the Empiere vnto the Pope, so woulde the Pope now bestowe the same vpon Rodolphus, if he woulde aduenture, to raise his power against the Emperoure, his Liege Lorde. Likewise he had written to the Princes of Germanie, as Carion saithe, Vt Imperatorem alium designarent: *That they shoulde proceede to the* Election *of an other* Emperoure. Thus the Pope thought it but a plaie, to place, and displace the States of the worlde, at his pleasure. Of this Emperours Vertues I wil saie nothinge. As he is despraised by somme, so by others he is mutche commended. Auentinus saithe, In Pauperes, Monachos, Sacerdotes munificentissimum, &c. *His very enimies confesse, that he was moste* Liberal *vnto poore folkes, Monkes, and Priestes: that he was* Constant *in aduersitie:* Faithefull *to his Prisoners:* Gentle *to his foes:* Deuoute *towardes God:* wise and Politique *in Ciuile, and Martial affaires: Of a* Princely Maiestie *of countenance: wherein he excelled al others, and was* moste woorthy of the Empiere.

Auentinus.

Vrspergen. Pag. 239.

Vrspergensis saithe, *He was Noble, Doughty, and Venterous: and was seene three score and twoo sundrie times, in fought fielde: wherein he passed both he* Marcellus, *and* Iulius Cæsar, *and al other Kinges, and Emperours, that had benne before him.*

Carion.

The greatest cause of fallinge out betwene him and the Pope was this: Order was taken before, and had stil benne keapte from the beginninge, that the Election of the Pope, should be ratified by the Emperoure, otherwise not to stande. And Platyna saithe, The Pope Elected without the Emperours letters patentes was no Pope.

Platyna in Sexto Papa.

An other Aunciente order was this, that the Emperoure might bestowe al the Bishoprikes, and Abbies of the Empiere, when so euer they should happen to be voide. These Ancient Orders Pope Hildebrande presumed to breake. For neither would he suffer his owne Election to be ratified by the Emperoure: nor the Emperoure to bestowe the Bishoprikes, or Abbaies within his dominions. In these attemptes the Emperour withstode him, claiming vnto him selfe the same Right of enheritance, that al other Emperours his Predecessours had lawfully, and peaceably enioied before him. Therefore the Pope Excommunicated him: interdited his Lande: and called him Archepirate, Archeheretique, and Apostata: Therefore he deposed him:

raised

Pope Hildebrande.

raiſed vp the Duke of Sueuia, and al the worlde againſt him: and armed the Sonne againſt the Father: and wilfully diſquieted the whole State of al Chriſtendome. Auentinus ſaith, Multi tum priuatim, tum publicè, &c. *Many there were, that bothe priuately, and openly curſed Pope* Hildebrande: *and ſaide, that with his hatred, and ambition he troubled the world: and that vnder the coloure of* Chriſt, *he wrought the feates of* Antichriſt. Auentinus.

The Emperour toke a longe iourney into Italie to ſubmit him ſelfe vnto the Pope: and beinge at Canuſium, as it is ſaide before, in the deapthe of winter, and in the harde froſt, he waited patiently three dayes togeather with bare heade, and bare fote before the Popes gates, to winne his fauoure. In the ende Pope Hildebrande, beinge ſicke, and findinge him ſelfe in caſe not to liue, ſente vnto the Emperour, and beſoughte him Pardonne for al his Iniuries. After that, the Popes, that ſucceded, neuertheleſſe continewed this quarrel ſtil. And thus by the Popes entiſemente, the Sonne raiſed a power, and depoſed his Father: The Biſhoppes diſrobed him of his weede of State: and pulled the Crowne Emperial from his heade. The Ancient Reuerende Prince, hauing nowe continewed in his Empiere fiftie whole yeres, bare al theſe thinges quietly, and ſaide vnto them, Videat Deus, & iudicet: *Let God ſee, and iudge your dooinges*. At the laſte, beinge leaſte naked, and out of al, he turned him ſelfe to the Biſhop of Spira, and ſaid vnto him: Now I beſeeche you, for Goddes ſake, geue me a prebende in your Churche. For I am hable to reade, and can doo ſome good in the quiere. But he was keapte ſtil in cloſe priſon at Leodium, vntil he died. And beinge dead, he was keapt fiue whole yeres tageather aboue grounde, at the Popes commaundemente, and might not be buried: Sutche courteſie founde that worthy Emperour at the Popes hande, onely for claiminge of his right. Vrſpergen. Pag. 235. Sabellicus Enneadis. 9. Lib. 3 Carion. Helmoldus. Matth. Palmer.

Pope Hildebrande is commended by many for ſundrie vertues. But no man (ſaie you) hath more ſet foorth his woorthineſſe, then Onuphrius, a man yet aliue, and one of al men, that woulde be right lothe in any pointe to diſpleaſe the Pope. Perhaps he thought to winne ſome credite, by aduenturinge his wittes in a deſperate cauſe: as did he, that beſtowed ſo mutche eloquence in the praiſe of Baldeneſſe: or he, that praiſed the Feuer quartane: or Eraſmus, that of late yeres wrote ſo mutch in the praiſe of Folie.

The Heretique Ebion ſommetime praiſed Iudas aboue al the Apoſtles: And Libanius the Sophiſte beſtowed greate praiſes vpon Iulianus the Renegate. Certainely ſundrie Olde VVriters, of whome ſomme knewe Pope Hildebrande, and lined with him, haue not geuen him ſutche worthy praiſes. Beno Cardinalis ſaithe, Hildebrande, *beinge as yet but a* Cardinal, *beatte* Pope Alexander *with his fiſte, and keapte him priſoner*: Poiſoned ſixe Popes *his Predeceſſoures*: *Was a* Coniurer, *and a raiſer of Diuels*: *and threwe the* Sacramente *into the Fiere*. Syneſius. Plato. Socrat. Lib. 3. Cap. 22. Beno Cardinalis.

Auentinus, makinge his entrie to ſpeake of Pope Hildebrande, ſaithe thus: Scripturus ſum Reipublicæ Chriſtianæ, Occidentalis, Eccleſiæ, Romanæ Imperij Bella, Cædes, Homicidia, Parricidia, Simultates, Odia, Stupra, Furta, Peculatus, Sacrilegia, Diſſidia, Seditiones pluſquam Ciuiles, &c. *Nowe muſte I ſpeake of* VVarres, Slaughters, Murders, Killinge of Fathers, Striues, Hatreads, Fornications, Robberies, Spoilinges of Common Treaſure, Spoilinges of Churches, Debates, and Seditions more then ciuile, *whiche haue happened in the Chriſtian Common Weale, in the Weaſte Churche, and in the Empiere of Rome*. Theiſe were the fruites of Hildebrandes Popedome. Auentinus.

The Biſhoppes at the Councel of Brixia, touchinge Pope Hildebrande, pronounce thus: Nos eundem Hildebrandum procaciſsimum, &c. *The ſame moſte* Filthy, and ſhameleſſe Pope Hildebrande, *a maintainer of* Churcherobbinges, *and* houſeburninges, *a defender of* Murders, *and* Periuries, *callinge in queſtion the Catholique, and the Apoſtolique Faithe of* the body *and* Bloude of Chriſte, *an Olde Diſciple of* Berengarius *the Heretique, a Manifeſte* Coniurer, *loden with the* Sprite *of* Satan, *and therefore out of the trewe Faithe, wee iudge woorthy to be depoſed*. What ſo euer pointes of diſcante Onuphrius, your Scholefelowe, hathe lately learned to plaie hereupon, this, M. Hardinge, is that Holineſſe, and Worthineſſe, that ſundrie Olde VVriters haue iudged to be in Pope Hildebrande. Vrſpergen.

The Apo-

treadinge on the Emperous necke.

The Apologie. Cap. 8. Diuision. 1.

Who, so il fauouredly, and monstrously put the Emperoure Frederikes necke vnder his feete, and, as though that were not sufficient, added further this texte out of the Psalmes: Thou shalt goe vpon the Adder, and Cockatrice, and shalte treade the Lion and Dragon vnder thy feete: **Sutche an Example of scorninge, and contemninge the Maiestie of a Prince, as neuer before that time was hearde telle of in any remembrance: except, I weene, either of Tamerlanes the Kinge of Scythia, a wilde, and a Barbarous Creature, or els of Sapor King of the Persians. Al these notwithstanding were** Popes, al Peters Successours, al moste Holy Fathers: **whose seueral woordes wee muste take to be as good, as seueral Gospels.**

M. Hardinge.

Yee aske who put the Emperoure Frederikes necke vnder his feete, &c. Verily, who it was, I knowe not: neither your selues, I beleeue.

(a) As thoughe for the moste parte they liued like Angelles.

But what if ye bringe good authoritie for it? So farre as any man dothe euil, be he Pope, be he Bishop, Emperoure, or Kinge, or what so euer he be, wee defende him not. Popes them selues be men, and doo not at (a) al times behaue them selues like Angels. But what is that to your purpose? Our matter is *quæstio iuris, non facti*, once more I muste tel it you. And if that were a faulte in the Pope, wee acknowlege it to be as Tertullian saith, *Vitium conuersationis, non prædicationis*: The faulte of conuersation, not of doctrine (b) preached.

In præfat. pro Cone. Hann.

(b) VVhat fault can ye finde in the Popes preachinge? He neuer preacheth.

Al these (thoughe yee scoffe neuer so mutch) were Popes, al were Peters Successours, and notwithstandinge any thinge that yee can saie againste them to the contrary, without makinge a lie, (c) al were Holy Fathers. But theire seueral woordes wee be not bounde to esteeme for so good, as seueral Gospels. Neuertheless theire publike Decrees wee acknowledge and reuerence, and thinke they ought to be obeied.

(c) Vntruthe, shameless, as it shal appeare.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Carion.

The whole storie hereof is thus reported by Carion: Vsus est Frederichus deiectione, & summa humilitate, &c. *The* Emperoure Frederike *vsed al manner submission, and Humilitie. For he came to* Venice, *and at the gates of the Churche, fallinge downe groueling before the* Pope, *he suffered him selfe to be trodden on by the* Pope *with his Feete. In the meane while the* Pope *caused Proclamation to be made by these woordes of the* Prophete Dauid *spoken of* Christe, Thou shalt walke vpon the venemous Aspe, and the Basilisk: Thou shalte treade downe the Lion, and Dragon: *And so at the laste he Absolued him. The Emperoure in the meane while saide, he shewed that humilitie, not vnto* Pope Alexander, *but vnto* Peter. *Thereunto the* Pope *answeared*, Et mihi, & Petro, Bothe to me, and to Peter too: *placinge him selfe before* Peter.

Non tibi, sed Petro. Et mihi, & Petro.

Thus Carion **declareth the whole storie with some particulare circumstances: but whether of fauour, or hatred, I wil not Iudge. Neither maie it wel be thought, the Pope vsed the** Emperoure thus of any great fauoure. **But I thinke, that the Noble Cittie of** Venice, **that caused this whole Tragedie to be set forthe in Imageris in S. Markes Churche there, for the Euerlastinge remembrance of the facte, was not so carried awaie either with loue of the one side, or with hatred of the other, that they woulde so openly haue recorded a knowen Untruthe.**

Aurelius Victor. Pompeius Lætus.

Thus Sapores sommetime, the Proude Kinge of Persia, when he had conquered Valerianus the Romaine Emperoure, and taken him prisoner, vsed him afterwarde moste villanously, as his fotestoole: and made him lie downe groueling vpon the grounde, that he might sette his foote on his necke, when so euer it should please him to mounte on horsebacke.

Budæus de Asse. Matthias à Michouia. De Sarmatia, Cap. 12.

So Sesostris the great Kinge of Egypte, **poore Kinges, and Princes together in Chaines, and forced them by violence, to drawe his Wagon. So the** Emperoure Henrie the Thirde, **vpon the date of his Coronation, caused Foure Kinges of** Vindelicia, **beinge then his prisoners, to carrie Pannes, and Cauldrons to his kitchin.**

But,

The Pope is euer Holy.

But, yᵉ ſaie, So far, as a man dooth euil, be he Pope, be he Biſhop, ye defende him not. The Popes them ſelues (**yᵉ ſaie**) be Menne: and doo not alwaies behaue them ſelues, as Angelles. **Yet notwithſtaddinge, immediately after yᵉ ſaie further,** Al theſe were Popes, and Peters Succeſſours, and Holy Fathers. **This beinge true, it is no harde matter, for any** Pope **to be** Holy. Pope Iohn. 12. **was ſlaine in** Aduouterie: Pope Benedictus 9. **liued without either Lawe, or Reaſon, and defiled** Peters Chaire **with al kinde of ſhame.** Sine Lege, & Ratione vixit, & Petri Sedem omnibus probris fœdauit. **And in the ende he toke monie ynoughe, and ſolde the Popedome.** Platyna ſaithe, Popes **then were elected, not for theire Learninge, and Holineſſe, but in reſpecte of Monie and friendſhip. The Biſhoppes in the Councel of Conſtance pronounce thus of** Pope Iohn. 23. A tempore iuuentutis ſuæ fuit homo malæ indolis, inuerecundus, impudicus, &c. Et adhuc dicitur, tenetur, creditur, & reputatur pro tali, & vt talis: *From the time of his youth he hath euermore benne a man of il diſpoſition, vnſhamefaſte, vnchaſte, vnhoneſte, &c. And ſtil hitherto he is named, holden, beleeued, taken, and reputed for ſutche a one, and as ſutche a one.* **Somme of them haue liued filthily with theire owne Daughters, and ſomme worſe, and in more beaſtly diſorder.** Platyna **calleth them** Monſtra, & Portenta: *Monſters, and ougle, and horrible, and il ſhapen Creatures.* **Yet, ſaie you,** al theſe were Peters Succeſſours, and Holy Fathers. **And ſo muſte they nedes be coumpted, althoughe they had benne a greate deale worſe.** Dame Iohane, **I trowe, yᵉ wil haue ſoꝛepriſed out of this number. For notwithſtandinge ſhe were a Polp Pother, yet ye maie not wel calle her the** Holy Father.

Platyna. Textor in Officina. Platyna. Platyna in Sylueſtro 3. Conſtantien. Concilium.

In deede, thus yᵉ haue it prouidentely noted vpon your Decretalles: Eſt quædam Spiritualitas ſecundum ſtatum, quando eſt in ſtatu Sanctiſsimo, & Spiritualiſſimo: & in hoc ſtatu eſt Solus Summus Pontifex: *There is a certaine Spiritual Holineſſe accordinge to the ſtate moſte Holy, and moſte Spiritual: And in this ſtate is onely the* Higheſte Biſhop, *that is, the* Pope. **And a Special Statute of** premunire **in the** Popes **behalfe is written thus:** Papa de Homicidio, vel Adulterio accuſari non poteſt. Vnde Sacrilegij inſtar eſſet, diſputare de facto ſuo. Nam facta Papæ excuſantur, vt Homicidia Samſonis, Furta Hebræorum, Adulteria Iacob: *The Pope maie neuer be accuſed, neither of Aduouterie, nor of Murther. Therefore it were as badde, as Churcherobbinge, to reaſon, or moue mater of any his dooinges. For what ſo euer he doo, it is excuſed, as are the* Murthers *committed by* Samſon: *The* Robberies *in* Egypte *committed by the* Iewes: *and the* Aduouteries *of* Iacob. **And againe,** In Papa ſi deſint bona acquiſita per meritum, ſufficiunt quæ à loci Prædeceſſori præſtantur: *In the Pope if there wante good deedes gotten by his owne Merites, yet the good deedes donne* by S. Peter, *that was his Predeceſſoure in that place, are ſufficiente.*

De Maior. & Obedien. Vnam ſanctam. In Gloſſa. Diſt. 40. Non nos In Gloſſa. Diſt. 40. Non nos

But S. Hierome **ſaith far otherwiſe:** Non Sanctorum Filij ſunt, qui tenent loca Sanctorum, Sed qui exercent opera eorum: *They are not alwaies the children of* Holy men, *that ſitte in the places of* Holy men: *but they, that doo the woorkes of* Holy menne.

Diſt. 40. Non facile.

Therefore I maie ſaie to you, M. Hardinge, as S. Auguſtine **ſaithe to** Emeritus **the Heretique:** Noli Frater, noli obſecro: non te decet, etſi aliquem fortè deceat: ſi tamen quicquam deceat malos: Emeritum certè non decet defendere Optatum: *Doo not, my Brother, doo not, I praie you. It becommeth you not: Althoughe happily it maie becomme ſomme other Man, If any thinge maie becomme the wicked, Yet verily it becommeth not* Emeritus, *to defende* Optatus (*in open wickedneſſe*).

Auguſtin. Epiſt. 164. ad Emerit.

S. Hierome **ſaithe,** Si quis hominem, qui Sanctus non eſt, Sanctum eſſe crediderit, & Dei eum iunxerit ſocietati, Chriſtum violat, cuius Corporis omnes membra ſumus. Qui dicit, inquit, Iuſtum Iniuſtum, & Iniuſtum Iuſtum, abominabilis eſt vterque apud Deum. Et rurſus, qui dicit, Sanctum non eſſe Sanctum: & rurſus, non Sanctum eſſe Sanctum, eſt abominabilis apud Deum: *Who ſo beleeueth, that man to be* Holy, *that is* not Holy, *and ioineth the ſame man to the felowſhip of God, doothe villanie to Chriſte. For al wee are members of his Body. It is written,* Bothe he, that calleth a Iuſte Man VVicked, and he, that calleth a VVicked Man Iuſte, are bothe abominable before God. *Likewiſe, who ſo ſaithe,* a Holy man is not Holy, *or,* An Vnholy man is Holy, *is abominable before God.*

Hieron. in Epiſt. ad Philemonem. Prouerb. 17.

The Apolo-

The Apologie, Cap. 8. Diuision. 2. & 3.

If wee be counted Traitours, whiche do honoure our Princes, whiche geeue them al obedience, as mutche as is due to them by Gods woorde, and doo praie for them: what kinde of menne then bee these, whiche haue not onely donne al the thinges before saide, but also allowe the same for specially wel donne? Doo they then either this waie instructe the people, as wee doo, to reuerence theire Magistrates? or can they with honestie appeache vs as seditious Personnes, breakers of the common quiete, and despisers of Princes Maiestie?

Truely we neither put of the yoke of obedience from vs, neither doo we disorder Realmes: nor doo we set vp, or pul downe Kinges: nor doo wee translate Gouernementes: nor geeue wee our Kinges poison to drinke: nor yet holde foorth to them our feete to kisse: nor oppriobriously triumphe ouer them: nor leape into their neckes with our feete.

This rather is our Profession, this is our Doctrine, that euery soule, of what callinge so euer it bee, bee it Monke, bee it Preacher, be it Prophete, be it Apostle, ought to be Subiecte to Kinges and Magistrates: yea, and that the Bishop of Rome him selfe, onlesse hee wil seeme greater then Euangelistes, then the Prophetes, or the Apostles, ought bothe to acknowledge, and to cal the Emperoure his Lorde, and Maister: as the Olde Bishoppes of Rome, who liued in times of more grace, euer did. Our common teachinge also is, that we ought so to obeie Princes, as men sent of God: &, that vvho so vvithstandeth them, vvithstandeth Gods ordinance. This is our Doctrine: and this is wel to be seene bothe in our Bookes, and Preachinges, & also in the manners and modeste behauiour of our people.

Chrysost. in 13. ca. ad Romanos.

Gregor. sæpè in Epist.

M. Hardinge.

The Doctrine of obedience appertaineth specially to subiectes. The Bishop of Rome sittinge by due Succession in the Chaire of Peter, (a) in spiritual causes can haue no Superioure. In temporal matters it maie be, that in one age he hathe acknowledged the Emperoure, as the Lorde of that Prouince, where he liued, (b) as before Constantine al the Popes did liue in subiection: and in an other age he maie be Lorde thereof him selfe. Likewise S. Gregorie mighte cal Mauritius his Lorde, either of courtesie, or of custome: and yet our Holy Father Pius the Fourthe shal not be bounde to doo the like, in (c) consideration that the custome hathe longe since benne discontinewed. Neither did S. Gregorie by that title of honoure preiudicate vnto him selfe in any Spiritual Iurisdiction. For that name notwithstandinge, he Gouerned the (d) whole Churche, and complained that Maximus was made Bishop of Salonæ, a Cittie in Illyrico, without his Auctoritie, not regardinge that Mauritius the Emperoure was thoughte to haue willed it so to be donne. And therefore he writeth to Constantia the Empresse, that for as muche as neither he, nor his deputie was made priuie to it, that the thinge had benne donne, whiche neuer was donne before by any of the Princes, that were the Emperours Predecessours. Lib. 4. Ep. 32.

(a) Vntruthe Manifeste, as it shal appeare.

(b) Vntruthe enclosed: For they were subiecte likewise afterwarde.

(c) O Graue Consideratiõ.

(d) Vntruthe euidente vnto a childe.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

What nede you to speake so precisely, and so nicely of your Causes Spiritual, M. Harding? Ye knowe, that your Pope hathe claimed, and yet claimeth his Souerainetie, not onely in Spiritual Causes, but also in Temporal: as it shal appeare. He wil saie, ye are an il Procoure, and do him wronge, and goe aboute to abroge his right, that wil so lightly exclude that thinge, that he so gréedily wil haue included.

You saie, The Pope can haue no Superioure in Spiritual Causes. And yet by the Iudgemente of sundrie your Doctoures, euen in Causes Spiritual, the Councel is Superioure to the Pope, and maie summone him: and Iudge him: and geeue Sentence against him: and depose him: as hereafter it shalbe declared more at large. Thus it is noted of yourvose vpon your owne Decrees: Cùm agitur de Fide, tunc Synodus Maior est quàm Papa: *When the case is mooued in a mater of Faithe* (that is to saie, in a cause

Concil. Constant. Concil. Basilien. Dist. 19. Anastasius, In Gloss.

The Pope inferioure to the Prince.

cause Spiritual) *then is the* Councel *greater then the* Pope. And your owne Panormitane saithe, as it is allreged before, Papa tenetur confiteri: & in illo actu Sacerdos est Maior illo: *The Pope is bounde to make his Confession:* and in so *doinge, the* Priest is aboue the Pope. Againe he saith, Papa non potest cogere Sacerdotem, vt reuelet Confessionem: quia in illo actu Sacerdos est Maior, quàm Papa. Children knowe, that Faithe, and Confession are Spiritual Causes, and not Temporal. Yée sée therefore, M. Harolinge, by the Iudgement of your owne Doctoures, that the Pope maie haue a Superioure, euen in Spiritual causes. Extra. De Pœnitent. & Remiss. Omnis vtriusque Abb.

Nowe lette vs weighe the great force of your Reason. Thus you saie:

The Pope sitteth in Peters Chaire: *Ergo*, in Spiritual Causes he can haue no Superioure.

Who taught you thus to piece your Argumentes? What Childe, what Sophister woulde so reason? Who euer gaue suche Power, and Vertue to Peters Chaire?

In Temporal maters (yée saie) it maie be, that in one age the Pope hathe acknowledged the Emperoure, as Lorde of that Prouince, where he liued. Graceously considered. It was the Popes Courtesie, and Humilitie, no doubte: but not his duetie. Nowe be it, Aaron the High Bishop of Israel was contented to submit him selfe to Moises, and of duetie to calle him Lorde. Exod. 32.

Tertullian saithe thus, Colimus Imperatorem, vt hominem à Deo secundum, & Solo Deo Minorem. Sic enim Imperator Omnibus Maior est, dum Solo vero Deo Minor est: *Wee honoure the Emperours Maiestie, as a man nexte vnto God. For so is the Emperoure greater then All meune, While he is lesse then onely the True God.* Tertullian. ad Scapulam.

Origene saithe, Petrus, & Iohannes nihil habebant, quod Cæsari redderent. Dixit enim Petrus, Aurum, & Argentum non habeo. Qui hoc non habet, nec Cæsari habet quod reddat, nec vnde Sublimioribus Potestatibus subiaceat. Qui verò habet Pecuniam, aut Possessiones, aut aliquid in hoc sæculo, audiat, Omnis anima Potestatibus Sublimioribus subiaceat: Peter, *and* Iohn *had nothinge to geeue vnto the Emperoure. For* Peter *saide, Golde, and Siluer* I *haue none: whiche who so hathe not, hathe nothinge to geeue to* Cæsar, *nor wherein he shoulde be subiecte to the Higher Powers. But who so euer hathe, either Monie, or Landes, or any thinge in this worlde, let him heare what* S. Paule *saithe,* Let euery soule *submit it selfe to the Higher Powers.* Origene ad Roman. Ca. 13. li. 9. Actor. 3.

And for proufe of the practise hereof, Pope Leo thus submitteth him selfe humbly vnto Lewes the Emperoure: Nos, si incompetenter aliquid egimus, & in Subditis iustæ Legis tramitem non conseruauimus, vestro admissorum nostrorum cuncta volumus emendare iudicio. *If wee haue donne any thinge disorderly, and ouer our Subiectes haue not keapte the dewe trade, and course of Lawe, by* your Maiesties Iudgement wee wil redresse al our faultes. 2. Qu. 7. Nos si.

So likewise, longe before Pope Leo, Pope Gregorie wrote vnto the Emperoure Mauritius: Ecce per me Seruum vltimum suum, & vestrum, respondebit Christus: Sacerdotes meos manui tuæ commisi, &c. Ego quidem vestræ iussioni subiectus, Legem vestram per diuersas terrarum partes transmitti feci: *Beholde, thus wil Christe answeare you by me, beinge bothe his,* and your moste humble Seruaunte: I *haue committed my Priestes vnto thy hande. As for my parte,* I, beinge subiecte vnto your Maiesties Commaundement, *haue caused your Order to be proclaimed throughe diuers partes of the worlde.* Gregor. Lib. 3. Epist. 61. ad Mauritium Imperat.

Againe he saithe, Christus dominari Imperatorem, non solùm Militibus: sed etiam Sacerdotibus concessit: *Christe hathe geeuen Power vnto the* Emperoure, *to beare rule, not onely ouer Souldiours, but also* ouer Priestes. Gregor. Lib. 3. Epist. 64.

Againe he saithe, Et Imperatori obedientiam præbui: & pro Deo, quod sensi, minimè tacui: I *haue shewed my duetie towardes* my Lorde the Emperoure: *and touchinge God,* I *haue not conceled, What I thoughte.* Gregor. ad Mauritium Imperat.

And this is it, that S. Paule saithe, *Let euery soule be subiecte to the Higher Powers.* Upon whiche wordes S. Chrysostome saithe, Etiamsi sis Apostolus, etiamsi Euangelista, etiamsi Propheta, siue quisquis tandem fueris. Neque enim Pietatem subuertit ista Subiectio: *Thoughe thou be an* Apostle, *thoughe thou be an* Euangeliste, *thoughe thou be a* Prophete, *or what one so euer els thou be, yet be thou subiecte to the Higher Powers. For this Subiection is no hinderance to Godlinesse.* Chrysost. ad Roman. Homil. 23.

But afterwarde the Popes beganne to looke aloofte, and bothe to saie them

The Pope inferioure to the Emperoure.

ſelues, and alſo to cauſe others theire parasites to ſaie, Romanus Pontifex eſt ſupra Reges in Temporalibus: *The* Biſhop of Rome *is aboue Kinges, euen in thinges* Temporal. **Againe,** Papa totius orbis obtinet poteſtatem: *The Pope hath the Power of al the worlde.* **Againe,** Solus Papa eſt verus Dominus Temporalium: *Onely the* Pope *is the very true Lord of* Temporal thinges. **And againe,** Omnis poteſtas ſecularis immediatè data eſt Papæ: Al manner Temporal Power *is geeuen immediately to the* Pope.

Iohan. Maior. 4. sent. q. 2. diſt. 20
Sex. Lib. 3. Ti. 16
In Gloſſa.
Iohan. de Paris ſyr. de poteſtate Papæ. Cap. 20.

Wel ſaie, Pope Gregorie might cal the Emperoure Mauritius, his Lorde, (**not of dutie, but**) either of Cuſtome, or of Courteſie. Yet, (**ſaie you further**) our holy Father Pope Pius the Fourthe ſhal not nowe be bounde to doo the like. **Here, I beſeeche you, M. Hardinge, what ſtrange kinde of** Spiritual Power **hathe** Pope Pius **nowe gotten, that was not before in** Pope Gregorie? **What Learninge? what Vertue? what Worthineſſe? what Holineſſe? What good reaſon can ye allege, wherefore** Chriſte, **and his** Apoſtles, **and al other** Holy Fathers, **and** Martyrs, **ſhoulde be Subiecte to the Prince, and onely your late** Popes, **and** Cardinalles **ſhoulde ſtande ſo free?**

Wel ſaie, This Cuſtome hath longe ſithence ben diſcontinewed: And in one age the Pope maie acknowledge the Emperoure, as the Lorde of the Lande, where he dwelleth: and in an other age he maie be Lorde thereof him ſelfe. **That is to ſaie,** *In one age the* Pope *maie be ſubiecte to the* Emperoure? *and in an other age the* Emperour *maie be ſubiect to the* Pope. **This is your whole, and onely reaſon. Thus, wel ſir, your obedience towardes your Prince goeth not by** Goddes Voorde, **but onely by** Ages. **Therefore we maie ſaie to you, as** S. Hilarie ſommetime ſaide **to the** Arian Heretiques, Fides temporum eſt, non Euangeliorum: *Your Faithe paſſeth by Ages, and not by Goſpels.* **And yet it is written,** Veritas Domini manet in Aeternum: *The Truthe of our Lorde endureth* (**not for one age, or other, but**) *for Euer.* **It were a highe point of Learninge for an** Aſtronomer **ſkilfully to Prognoſticate, betweene the** Emperoure **and the** Pope, **whether of them ſhould be** Dominus Anni. **Howe be it, here maie I wel and iuſtly anſweare you with theſe wordes of** S. Bernarde: Omnis anima poteſtatibus ſublimioribus ſubdita ſit. Si omnis, & veſtra. Quis vos excepit ab vniuerſitate? Si quis tentat Excipere, conatur Decipere. Noli illorum acquieſcere conſilijs: qui cùm ſint Chriſtiani, Chriſti tamen vel ſequi facta, vel obſequi dictis probro ducunt. Ipſi ſunt, qui vobis dicere ſolent, Seruatæ veſtræ Sedis honorem, &c. Eſtis vos veſtro Prædeceſſore impotentiores? Si non creſcit per vos, non decreſcat per vos. Hæc illi. At Chriſtus aliter iuſsit, & geſſit. Reddite, inquit, quæ ſunt Cæſaris, Cæſari: & quæ ſunt Dei, Deo: *Let euery ſoule be ſubiecte to the Higher Powers. If euery ſoule, then is your ſoule ſubiecte, as wel as others, For* (**notwithſtandinge your Dignitie**) *yet who hathe excepted you from this generalitie? He that would excepte you from the Obedience of the Prince, ſeeketh to deceiue you. Geeue no eare to their Counſelles. For, notwithſtandinge they be Chriſtians, yet they thinke it ſhame, either to folowe Chriſtes deedes, or to obeie Chriſtes Woordes. They vſe to ſaie vnto you,* ô ſir, mainteine the honour of your See, &c. Are not you ſo good, as your Predeceſſour? If your See be not auaunced by you, yet lette it not be abaſed by you. *Thus ſaie they. But Chriſte hathe bothe taught, and wrought farre otherwiſe. For he ſaithe,* Geeue to Cæſar, that belongeth to Cæſar: and geeue to God, that belongeth to God.

Hilarius ad Conſtantium Imperat.
Pſal. 116.
Bernar. Epiſt. 42. ad Archiepiſco. Senonenſ.

Likewiſe he ſaith againe vnto Pope Eugenius, A te tamen Mos iſte, vel potiùs Mors iſta non cœpit: vtinam in te deſinat. Vides omnem Eccleſiaſticum zelum feruere ſola pro Dignitate tuenda? Honori totum datur, Sanctitati nihil, vel parum. Si cauſa requirente, paulò ſubmiſsiùs agere, ac ſocialiùs te habere tentaueris, abſit, inquiunt, Non decet: Tempori non congruit: Maieſtati non conuenit: Quam geras perſonam attendito: *But ye wil ſaie, this Manner, or rather, this* Deathe, *beganne not of you: Would God it might ende in you. Doo ye not ſee, that al your Eccleſiaſtical zele, and care ſtandeth onely in maintenance of Honoure? Vpon Honoure altogeather is beſtowed: vpon Holineſſe, either nothinge, or very little. If vpon occaſion, ye woulde ſomewhat ſubmit your ſelf, and deale familiarely,* O, doo not ſo, *ſaie they:* It is not meete: It is not agreeable to the time: It is not conuenient for your Maieſtie: Conſider wel, what ſtate ye beare. **Such good Leſſons, M. Hardinge, ye haue, wherewith to nourture, and to traine the Pope. And if he happen of him ſelfe to be a fole, by ſuche ſchoolinge ye are able to make him madde.**

Bernar. De Conſideratione, Li. 4.

But Gre-

The Pope limited to a parte.

But Gregorie (yet saie) beinge Pope, gouerned the whole Church of God. For he complaineth, that Maximus was made Bishop of Salonæ in Illyrico without his allowance. This Authoritie is answeared in my Former Replie. But howe holdeth this Argumente, M. Harding? *Gregorie* complaineth, that *Maximus* was made Bishop of Salonæ *in Illyrico*, without his allowance: *Ergo, Gregorie* ruled the whole Churche? *Gregor. Lib. 4. Epist. 34. Artic. 4. Diui. 25*

What Scholer will allowe you sutche Conclusions? It is knowen, that in the Nicene Councel the charge of the whole Churche was committed to three Principal Patriarkes, whereof the Patriarke of Rome was the First: The Seconde of Alexandria: The Thirde of Antioche. And eche of these three was limited seuerally to his owne peculiare portion. Nilus a Greeke Writer saithe, Cùm aliæ Regiones assignatæ sint Romano, aliæ Alexandrino, aliæ Constantinopolitano, non magis hi sub illo sunt, quàm ille sub hisce: *For as mutche as certaine Countries are limited to the Bishop of* Rome: *certaine to the Bishop of* Alexandria: *and certaine to the Bishop of* Constantinople, they are nowe no more vnder him, then he vnder them. *Nilus de Primatu Roman. Pon.*

As for the Churches of Illyricum, they were specially appointed to the Bishop of Rome, as it appeareth by the Epistle of Pope Damasus, written to the Bishoppes of Illyricum: Par est omnes, qui sunt in Orbe Romano, Magistros consentire: *It is meete, that al the Teachers, that be within the* Romaine Prouince, *agree togeather.* So saithe Athanasius, Roma est Metropolis Romanæ Ditionis: Rome is the Mother Churche (not of the whole worlde, but) of the Prouince of Rome. Nicephorus saith, Iustinianus decreuit, vt Iustiniana Prima haberet locum Sedis Apostolicæ Romæ: vtq; esset Caput sibi ipsi cum plena potestate: Iustinianus the Emperoure *appointed, that the Cittie called* Iustiniana Prima *shoulde haue the place of the Apostolique See of Rome: and that with ful power it shoulde be Heade vnto it selfe.* Neither durste your forged, and counterfeit Anacletus, to claime the Jurisdiction of al the whole worlde, but onely a portion of the same. For thus he saithe, Omnes Episcopi, qui huius Apostolicæ Sedis ordinationi subiacent: *Al Bishoppes* (not through the worlde, but) *that are Subiecte to the ordination of this Apostolique See of Rome.* So likewise S. Gregorie in his complainte vnto the Empresse, touchinge this same Maximus, the Bishop of Salonæ, speaketh not of al the Bishoppes, that were throughout the whole Churche of God, but onely of sutche Bishoppes, as were limited vnto his particulare charge. For thus he maketh his complainte, Si Episcopi mei me despiciant, &c. *If myne owne Bishoppes* (liuinge within myne owne peculiare Jurisdiction) *shal despise mee.* *Sozom. li. 6. ca. 2, 3. Athanas. ad Solitariam vitam agentes. Nicephor. Li. 17. Cap. 28. Anaclet. Epist. 3. Dist. 93. Iuxta Sanctorum. Gregor. Lib. 4. Epist. 34.*

Therefore your Diuinitie wanted Logique, M. Harding, when ye framed your Argumente in this sorte, *Gregorie* complained of *Maximus, &c. Ergo, Gregorie* gouerned the whole Churche.

The Apologie, Cap. 9. Diuision. 1. & 2.

But where they saie, we haue gonne awaie from the Unitie of the Catholique Churche, this is not onely a mater of malice, but bisides, thoughe it be moste vntrue, yet hathe it somme shewe, and appearance of truthe. For the common people, and ignorante multitude geeue not credite onely to thinges true, and of certainetie, but euen to sutche thinges also if any chaunce, whiche maie seeme to haue but a resemblaunce of truthe. Therefore wee see, that suttle, and craftie persones, when they had no truthe on theire side, haue euer contended, and hotely argued with thinges likely to be true, to the intent they which were not able to espie the very ground of the mater, might be carried awaie at leaste with somme pretence, and probalitie, or likelihoode of the Truth. In times paste, whereas the first Christians, our Forefathers, in makinge their Praiers to God, did turne them selues towardes the Easte, as for the moste parte the manner was, there were that saide, they vvoorshipped the Sonne, and reckened the same as their God *Tertull. in Apologetico.*

Againe, where our Forefathers saide, that as touchinge Immortal and Euerlastinge Life, they liued by none other meanes, but by the Fleashe, and Bloude of that Lambe vvithout spotte, that is to saie, of our Saueour Jesus Chriſte, the enuious Creatures, and Enimies of Chriſtes Crosse, whose onely care was to bringe Chriſtian Religion into sclaunder, by al manner of waies, made the people beleeue, that they were wicked persons, that thei sacrificed mennes Fleashe, and dronke
Ibidem. mennes Bloude. Also, where our Forefathers saide, that, before God there is neither Man, nor VVoman, and that for atteininge to the true Righteousnesse, there is no distinction at al of persons: and, whereas they called one an other indifferently by the name of Sisters, & Brothers, there wanted not menne, which forged false tales vpon the same, saieinge, that the Chriſtians made no difference amonge them selues, either of age, or of kinde: but like brute beastes, without regarde, had to doo one with an other. And, whereas, to praie togeather, and to heare the Gospel, they mette often togeather in secrete, and by places,
Ibidem. bicause Rebelles sommetime were woonte to doo the like, therefore Rumoures were euerywhere spreadde abroade, that they made priuie Confederacies, and tooke counsel togeather, either to kil the Magistrates, or to subuerte the Common Wealthe. And, whereas in Celebrating the Holy Mysteries after Chriſtes Institution, thei tooke Breade and VVine, they were therefore thought of many, to woorship, not Chriſte, or God, but Bacchus, and Ceres: forsomutche as those vaine Goddes were woorshipped of the Heathens in like sorte, after a
August. Contra Faust. li. 20. Ca. 13 prophane Superstition, with Breade, and VVine. Theise thinges were beleeued of many, not bicause they were true in deede, (for what could be more vntrue?) but bicause they were like to be true, & through a certaine shadowe of truthe might the more easily deceiue the simple. On this fashion likewise doo theise menne sclaunder vs as Heretiques, and saie that wee haue leafte the Churche, and felowship of Chriſte: not bicause they thinke it is true, for they doo not mutche force of that, but bicause to ignorante folke, it might perhaps somme waie appeare true.

Wee haue in deede put our selues aparte, not as Heretiques are woonte, from the Churche of Chriſte, but as al good men ought to doo, from the infection of naughty persons, and Hypocrites. Neuertheleſſe in this pointe they triumphe maruellously, that they bee the Church, that theire Churche is Chriſtes Spouse, the Piller of Truthe, the Arke of Noe; and, that without it there is no hope of Saluation. Contrariwise, they saie, that vvee bee Renegates: that vvee haue torne Chriſtes seate: that wee are plucked quite of from the Body of Chriſt, and haue forsaken the Catholique Faith. And, when they leaue nothinge vnspoken, that maie neuer so falsely and malitiously be saide againste vs, yet this one thinge are they neuer able truely to saie, that we haue swarued, either from the woorde of God, or from the Apostles

of

Departing from the Pope.

of Chriſte, or from the Primitiue Churche. Surely wee haue euer iudged the Primitiue Churche of Chriſtes time, of the Apoſtles, and of the Holy Fathers, to be the Catholique Churche: neither make we doubt to name it, Noes Arke, Chriſtes Spouſe, the Piller and vpholder of al Truthe: nor yet to fire therein the whole meane of our Saluation. It is doubtleſſe an odious mater, for one to leaue the felowſhip whereunto he hathe beene accuſtomed, and ſpecially of thoſe men, whoe, though they be not, yet at leaſte ſeeme to be, and be called Chriſtians. And, to ſaie truely, wee doo not deſpiſe the Churche of theſe menne (how ſo euer it be ordered by them nowe a daies) partly for the names ſake it ſelfe, and partely for that the Goſpel of Jeſus Chriſte hathe once bene therein truely, and purely ſet foorth. Neither had wee departed therefrom, but of very neceſſitie, and muche againſte our willes.

M. Hardinge.

VVee graunte, that in olde time ſlaunders were made vpon the Faitheful. But no like ſlaunder is made by vs vpon you in the mater, whereof ye ſpeake. For let vs graunt, that yee haue in deede put your ſelues aparte, and are gone from the contagion of naughtie perſones and Hypocrites. This is the very thinge, wee laie to your charge. For though wee were ſutche, as for a greate number ye ſhal neuer be hable to prooue, yet by Chriſtes owne ſentence ye muſte doo that, (a) which they that ſitte in the Chaire of Moſes bid you doo, althoughe they be Hypocrites, as the Scribes and Phariſeis were, of whome Chriſte ſpake, &c. But it ſhalbe yenough for you to doo, as the Succeſſours of Peter bidde you to doo, and ſo to folowe theire ſaieinge, and not theire dooinges.

The Primitiue Churche is continewed with our time, by the Succeſſoures of S. Peter, for whoſe Faithe neuer to faile Chriſte praied, and whome (b) onely he made Shepeherde to feede al his Flocke of Sheepe and Lambes. Chriſte (c) nowe requireth of you, not to obeie Peter and Paule, but to obeie him, who ſitteth in theire Chaire. VVhere yee ſaie, it is an odious mater to forſake vs, and yet haue foreſaken vs: where ye confeſſe that ye deſpiſe not the Churche, we be of, and yet graunt that ye haue departed from it: howe ſtandeth this togeather? Remember ye what yee ſaie? Knowe yee what ye doo? VVho wil regarde your woorde, whiche with one breathe ſaie, and vnſaie? If it be odious, why doo ye it? If ye deſpiſe not the Churche: why departe ye from it?

(a) The ſame Scribes, and Phariſeis commaunded the people to refuſe Chriſtes companie: Iohan. 9. &, 12. And was the people bounde to folowe them?

(b) Vntruth. For Chriſte neuer gaue Peter any ſutche ſpecial Priuilege.

(c) A ſtrange kinde of Diuinitie: ſutche as Peter, and Paule neuer knewe.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Chriſte ſaithe, *The Scribes, and Phariſeis ſitte in* Moſes *Chaire: Doo that they ſaie, but doo not, that they doo. Ergo,* (ſaie you) VVee maie not departe awaie from the Pope. How ſo euer it fare with your Concluſion, M. Hardinge, verily in your premiſſes ye compare the Pope and his Cardinalles with the Scribes, and Phariſeis. And yet the Scribes, and Phariſeis ſate in the Chaire, and taughte the Lawe: your Pope, and Cardinalles ſitte ſtil, and teache nothinge. Notwithſtandinge, lette vs wel allowe of this Compariſon. Yee maie remember, that Chriſte alſo ſaithe, *Woe be vnto you, yee* Scribes, *and* Phariſeis, *that ſhutte vp the Kingedome of Heauen before menne: and neither doo you enter in your ſelues: nor wil you ſuffer others, that faine woulde enter. Woe be vnto you, yee* blinde Guides: *Woe be vnto you, that haue taken awaie the* keie of Knowledge. Likewiſe he ſaithe of them vnto his Diſciples: *Beware of the Leauen of the* Scribes, and Phariſeis: Let them goe: Blinde they are, and the Leaders of the blinde.

Matth. 23.

Matth. 16.

Matth. 15.

To ſitte in Moſes Chaire, was, truely, and rightely to inſtructe the people, and to open vnto them the Lawe of Moſes. S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Hoc ipſum, quòd bona dicebant, & ea, quæ dicebant, vtiliter audiebantur, & fiebant, non erat ipſorum. Cathedram enim, inquit, Moſi ſedent: *That they ſpake good thinges vnto the people, and that the thinges, that they ſaide, were profitable to the hearers, and dooers of the ſame, it was not of them ſelues. For Chriſte ſaithe,* They ſitte vpon Moſes Chaire. Againe he ſaithe, Sedendo ſuper Cathedram Moſis, legem Dei docent. Ergo per illos Deus docet. Sua verò illi ſi velint docere, nolite audire: nolite facere. Certè enim tales ſua quærunt, non quæ Ieſu Chriſti: *Sittinge vpon* Moſes *Chaire, they teache the Lawe of God: Therefore it is God, that teacheth by the meane of them. But if they wil teache you thinges of their owne, then heare them not: then doo it not. For certainely ſutche menne ſeeke theire owne: and not the thinges, that perteine to Chriſte Jeſus.* Yee ſe therefore, M. Hardinge, wee are bound to

Auguſt. de Sermone Domi. in Monte, Lib. 2.

Augu. in Iohan. Tract. 46.

Departing from the Pope.

heare the Pope, and his Cardinalles, and other like Scribes, and Phariſeis, not abſolutely, or without exception, what ſo euer they liſte to ſaie: but onely ſo longe, as they teache the Lawe of God. Further then that S. Auguſtine ſaithe, VVee maie neither heare them, nor folowe their Counſel.

Hereunto we thought it good, to adde more force, as a ſupplie, to aide your wantes. Chriſt *ſaide vnto* Peter, *I haue praied for thee, that thy* Faithe *ſhal neuer faile. Ergo*, (ſaie you) The Pope can neuer erre. This waie of reaſoninge, I trow, we Learned of Peter de Palude, a worthy Doctour of your ſide. For ſo he reaſoneth: Ego rogaui pro te Petre, vt Fides tua non deficiat. Ex quo habetur, quòd Romana Eccleſia in fide errare non poteſt: nec de eius Fide dubitare licet: Sed in omnibus eſt ſequenda: Peter, *I haue Praied for thee, that thy Faith maie not faile. By theſe woordes we are taught, that the Church of Rome cannot erre in Faith. Neither is it lawful to doubte of the Faith of that Churche: but in al cauſes wee are bounde to folowe it.* But S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Nunquid pro Petro rogabat: pro Iohanne, & Iacobo non rogabat? Vt cœteros taceam: *To leaue the reſte, did* Chriſte *Praie for* Peter? *and did he not Praie for* Iohn, *and* Iames? Againe he ſaithe, Hac nocte poſtulauit Satanas vexare vos, ſicut triticum: & ego rogaui Patrem pro vobis, ne deficiat Fides Veſtra: *This night hath Satan begged to threaſh you, as if it were wheate: but I haue Praied to my Father* (not for Peter onely, but) for you, that your Faithe maie not faile. So ſaithe Origene, Nunquid audebimus dicere, quòd aduerſus vnum Petrum non præualituræ ſint portæ Inferorum: aduerſus cœteros autem Apoſtolos, ac Præfectos Eccleſiæ ſint præualituræ? An Petro Soli dantur à Chriſto Claues Regni Cœlorum? Nec alius Beatorum quiſquam eas accepturus eſt? Omnia, quæque prius dicta ſunt, quæque ſequuntur, velut ad Petrum dicta, ſunt omnium Communia: *Maie we dare to ſaie, that the gates of Hel ſhal not preuaile* Onely againſt Peter: *but ſhal preuaile againſt the other* Apoſtles, and Rulers of the Church? *Were the Keies of the Kingedome of Heauen geuen* onely to Peter? *And ſhal no Holy man els receiue the ſame? Nay, al the things, bothe that were ſaide before, and alſo that folowe after, as ſpoken to* Peter, *are Common, and belonge vnto al.* Therefore, as ye ſaie of the Churche of Rome, ſo maie we ſaie likewiſe of the Churche of Hieruſalem, where S. Iames was: and of the Churche of Epeſus, where S. Iohn was, and of other the like Apoſtolique Churches, notwithſtandinge they be now in the poſſeſſion of the Turke, and haue receiued the Religion of Mahomete, yet becauſe Chriſt hath once praied for them, *The Faith of them ſhal neuer faile.*

Petrus de Palude. de Poteſtate pp. Articul. 4.

Auguſt. de quæſt. Noui Teſtament. quæſt. 75.

Auguſt. De Verbis Domini in Euangel. ſecund. Lucam. Serm. 36.

Origene in Matthæ. Tract. 1

Nowe, if the Churches of Galathia, Corinthe, Epheſus, Hieruſalem, and of infinite other Noble Citties, and Countries, planted by Paule, by Iohn, by Iames, and by Chriſte him ſelfe, maie faile from the Faithe, what ſpecial priuilege then, maie we imagine, bathe the Churche of Rome, planted by Peter, that it onely of al others, can neuer faile. For Chriſte praied indifferently, as wel for the reſte of his Apoſtles, as for Peter, *That theire Faithe ſhoulde neuer faile.*

Further ye tel vs, It ſhalbe yenoughe for you, to doo, as the Succeſſours of Peter bid you to doo. Chriſte nowe (you ſaie) requireth not of you to obeie Peter, and Paule: but to obei him, that ſitteth in theire Chaire. If this waie be as ſure, as it is ſhort, then is there no doubt, but al is wel. Though we beleeue neither Peter, nor Paule, no: what ſo euer is written in Goddes Worde, yet, ſaie you, If wee folowe the Pope, we cannot erre. For thus mutche, M. Hardinge, ye are bable to warrante vs by your Goſpel, that Chriſte requireth not vs now, to be obedient to Peter, and Paule, but onely to the Popes Holineſſe, that kepeth Reſidence in their Chaire. This is your Diuinitie: theſe are your woordes. If ye euer recante the ſame, ye marre the flower of your Market. We néede not nowe to ſaie, Thus ſaith the Lorde: it ſhalbe ſufficient for vs, to ſaie, Thus ſaithe the Pope. Yet S. Paule ſo farre aduenturethe the Truthe, and certaintie of his Doctrine, that he doubteth not to ſaie, *If an Angel from Heauen Preache vnto you any other Goſpel, then wee haue Preached, accurſed be he.* Vpon whiche woordes S. Chryſoſtome hathe noted thus: Non dixit, Si Contraria annuntiauerint, at totum Euangelium ſubuerterint? verùm: Si paulum Euangelizauerint præter Euangelium, quod accepiſtis, etiamſi quiduis labefactauerint, Anathema ſint: S. Paule *ſaithe not, If they Preache contrarie to the Goſpel, or ouerthrowe the whole Goſpel: but, If they Preache any*

Galat. 1.

Chryſoſt. in 1. Cap. ad Galat.

little

departing from the Pope.

little thinge biſides the Goſpel, that ye haue receiued: if they ouerthrowe any thinge, what ſo euer it be, accurſed be they. Therefore S. Hierome ſaithe, Ea doceat Epiſcopus, quæ à Deo didicerit, non ex proprio Corde &c. *Let the Biſhop teache thoſe thinges, that he hath learned of God: and not of his owne harte, or fanſie.* Dist. 36. Ca fi nal.

Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Plus aliquid dicam: Ne Paulo quidem obedire oportet, ſi quid dixerit proprium, ſi quid humanum: ſed Apoſtolo Chriſtum in ſe loquentem circumferenti: *I wil telle you a greater mater: Wee maie not obeie, no not* S. Paule *him ſelfe, if he ſpeake any thinge of his owne, or if he ſpeake onely as a man: But wee muſte beleeue the Apoſtle of Chriſte, carrieinge Chriſte aboute ſpeakinge within him.* Chryſoſt. in 2. Timoth. Hom. 2.

And therefore Panormitane ſaithe, In concernentibus Fidem, etiam dictum vnius priuati eſſet præferendum dicto Papæ: ſi ille moueretur melioribus rationibus Noui, & Veteris Teſtamenti, quàm Papa: *In maters concerninge Faithe, the ſaieinge of one* Priuate man *were to be heard before the ſaieinge of the* Pope: *if the ſame* Priuate man *were moued with better reaſons of the Newe, and Olde Teſtamente, then the* Pope. De Elect. & Elect. potest. Significasti. Abb.

But, that wee ſhoulde no lenger obeie Peter, and Paule, but geeue eare onely to him, that is cropen into their Chaire, it is ſutche Diuinitie, as neither Peter, nor Paule euer taught vs.

Laſte of al, as vpon ſomme good aduauntage, yée beginne to Triumphe. Remember yee (ſaie yée) what yee ſaie? knowe yee, what yee doo? who wil regarde your woorde, whiche with one breathe ſaie, and vnſaie? If it be odious to leaue our felowſhip, why doo yee it? If yee deſpiſe not the Churche, why departe ye from it? To Saie, and Vnſaie, it is your propertie, M. Hardinge: it is not ours. Yée haue Saide, and Vnſaide, and yet, were it not for ſhame, it is thought, yée woulde be contented to Saie againe. Wée deſpiſe not the Churche: it is the Houſe of God: But wée miſlike your deſacinge, and diſorderinge of the Churche. Chriſte reproued the Prieſtes, and Phariſeis, for that they had turned the Temple of God into a caue of Theeues: And yet neuertheleſſe he deſpiſed it not: but ſaide it was his Fathers houſe. To leaue the wicked felowſhip of them, that beare a name, and ſhewe of Godlineſſe, it ſéemeth odious before men: but before God it is not odious. S. Iohn ſaithe, *Who ſo euer is ſutche a one, bid him not, God ſpeede. For who ſo ſaithe, God ſpeede vnto him, is partetaker of his il.* S. Paule ſaithe, *I warne you, that you receiue no meate with any ſutche.* And God him ſelfe ſaithe, *Comme out from her, ô my people, leſte yee be partetakers of her ſinnes, and leſte yee receiue of her Plagues.* Thus wée Saie not, and Vnſaie againe, as you ſaie, M. Hardinge. For the ſame thinge, wée Saide before, wée Saie ſtil. Matth. 21. 2. Iohan. 1. Corinth. 5. Apocal. 18.

The Apologie, Cap. 9. Diuiſion. 3.

But I put caſe, an Idole be ſette vp in the Churche of God, and the ſame Deſolation, whiche Chriſte prophecied to come, ſtoode openly in the Holy Place: What if ſomme Theefe, or Pirate inuade, and poſſeſſe Noes Arke? Theiſe folkes, as often as they telle vs of the Churche, meane thereby them ſelues alone, and attribute al theiſe titles to theire owne ſelues, boaſtinge, as they did in times paſte, that cried out, The Temple of the Lorde, The Temple of the Lorde: or, as the Phariſeis, & Scribes did, whiche craked, they were Abrahams Children. Thus with a gaie, and ioyly ſhewe deceiue they the ſimple, and ſeeke to choke vs with the bare name of the Churche. Mutche like as if a Theefe, when he hath gotten into an other mans houſe, and by violence either hathe thruſte out or ſlaine the owner, ſhoulde after warde alligne the ſame houſe to him ſelfe, caſtinge foorthe of poſſeſſion the righte Enheritour: Or, if Antichriſte, when he had once entred into the Temple of God, ſhoulde after warde ſaie, This

house is mine owne, and Christe hathe nothinge to doo withal. For theise menne nowe, after they haue leafte nothinge remaininge in the Churche of God, that hathe any likenesse of his Churche, yet wil they seeme the Patrones, and the valiaunt mainteiners of the Churche: Verily like as Gracchus emongeste the Romaines stoode sommetime in Defense of the Treasurie, notwithstandinge with his prodigalitie, and fonde expenses, he had vtterly wasted the whole stocke of the Treasurie. And yet was there neuer any thinge so wicked, or so farre out of reason, but lightly it might be couered, and Defended by the name of the Churche. For the Waspes also make honycombes, as wel as Bees, although there bee no hoony in them: and wicked menne haue companies like to the Churche of God. Yet for al that, They be not streight vvaie the people of God, vvhiche are called the people of God: neither be they al Israelites, as many as are comme of Israel the Father. The Arians, notwithstandinge thei were Heretiques, yet bragged they, that they alone were the Catholiques, callinge al the reste, nowe Ambrosians, nowe Athanasians, nowe Iohannites. And Nestorius, as saithe Theodorete, for al that he was an Heretique, yet couered he him selfe τῆς ὀρθοδοξίας προσχήματι, that is to wite, with a certaine cloke, and coloure of the true, and Right Faithe. Ebion, thoughe he agreed in opinion with the Samaritanes, yet, as saithe Epiphanius, he woulde needes be called a Christian. The Mahometistes at this daie, for al that al Historiens make plaine mention, and them selues also cannot denie, but they tooke theire firste begininge of Agar the bonde V Vooman, yet for the very name, and stockes sake, chuse they rather to be called Saracenes, as though they came of Sara the free V Vooman, and Abrahams true and lavvful V Vife. So likewise the false Prophetes of al ages, whiche stoode vp againste the Prophetes of God, and resisted Esaias, Ieremie, Christe, and the Apostles, at no time craked of any thinge so mutche, as they did of the name of the Churche. And for none other cause did they so fearcely vexe them, and cal them Renegates, and Apostates, then for that they had forsaken theire fellowship, and keapte not the ordinaunces of the Elders. Wherefore, if we woulde folowe the Judgementes of those menne onely, whoe then gouerned the Churche, and woulde respecte nothinge els, neither God, nor his Woorde, it muste needes bee confessed, that the Apostles were rightly, and by iuste Lawe condemned of them to deathe, bicause they felle from the Bishoppes, and Priestes, that is, you muste thinke, from the Catholique Churche: and bicause they made newe alterations in Religion, contrarie to the Bishoppes, and Priestes willes, yea, and for al theire spurninge so earnestly againste it.

Augustin. in Sermon. Contra Arianos. to. 6.

Augustin. in Epist. 48. ad Vincen.

Epiphan. Lib. 1. Here. 30.

Sozom. li 6. ca 38

M. Har-

M. Hardinge.

VVhat a fooliſhe putcaſe, and what a fonde whatif is that, to ſaie, VVhat if a pirate inuade the Arke of Noë? (a) As though God ſate not at the ſterne, and had the helme in his owne hande.

(b) Antichriſte cannot ſitte in the temple of God, (c) vntil the vicare of Chriſt, who keepeth poſ-
2. Theſſ. 2. ſeſſion, be throwen out, and then wil Chriſte come with his Angels to deſtroie the wicked man with
the breath of his mouthe: Ye that are the herbingers of Antichriſte, are not yet able to caſte out the
Luk. 24. lieutenant of Chriſte. Ye haue at the vnderminiſters. Your maiſter wil accompliſhe al iniquitie, and
he ſhalbe the deſolation that Chriſte ſpake of. VVee vnderſtande, what ye ſhoote at. But ye are aſha-
med to vtter plainely your blaſphemie. (d) Ye woulde ſaie (as it maie ſeeme) if ye durſte, that Chriſte
is the deſolation, and that Antichriſte is the true God. (e) In effecte I doo not greatly bliche you.

Neither if the Apoſtles might goe from the Biſhoppes of Moſes lawe, therefore maie yee departe from the Vicare of Chriſte. For the lawe of Moſes is changed, and the Prieſthoode of Aaron is tranſferred: But the lawe and Prieſthoode of Ieſus Chriſte tarieth for euer; as Dauid ſaide, Thou arte Prieſte for euer, accordinge to the order of Melchiſedech. Ye haulte too manifeſtly.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Antichriſte (yͤ ſaie) cannot ſitte in the Temple of God, vntil the Vicare of Chriſte, who keepeth poſſeſſion, be throwen out. **What ſaie you, M. Hardinge? Doothe Chriſtes Vicare kæpe poſſeſſion for Antichriſte? As for Chriſte him ſelfe, I doubte not, but he is able to kæpe his owne poſſeſſion. But ſo the olde Troians ſommetime ſaide, Theire Cittie coulde neuer miſcarrie, while theire Palladium remained amongeſt them. But who tolde you theiſe ſtrange newes, M. Hardinge? Who made the Pope Chriſtes Vicare generall throughout the whole Churche? Or, who haue him kæpe poſſeſſion in ſtæde of Chriſte? Muſte wæ nædes thinke, that the whole ſtate of Chriſtes Churche, hangeth onely of the Pope? Or, that, if the Pope were not the Pope, the Churche of Chriſte were not the Churche? Or, muſte your ſimple woorde nowe be taken for a Propheſie, that Antichriſte ſhal neuer enter into Goddes Temple, beſore the Pope be throwen out? This Fable woulde haue benne better furniſhed with more creedite.**

Verily, whereas wæ ſaie, wee put caſe, an Idole be ſette vp in the Churche of God: Or, whatif ſomme Theefe, or Pirate inuade, and poſſeſſe Noës Arke; **or ther is this, what if, ſo fonde as you woulde ſæme to make it: nor this,** Put caſe, ſo impoſsible. **For** S. Paule **ſaithe,** Antichriſte *ſhal ſitte in the Churche of God, and ſhewe him ſelfe aboue al that is woorſhipped, or called God:* **that is to ſaie, Beinge a** Theefe, **and a** Pirate, **he ſhal enter perforce into** Noës Arke.

Nowe, M. Hardinge, If Antichriſte **maie ſitte in the** place of God, **muche more maie he ſitte in the place of** Peter. **I wil not ſaie, the** Pope **is** Antichriſte. **God wil reuele him in his time: and he ſhalbe knowen.** S. Iohn **ſaithe,** *This is the wiſedome: who ſo hath vnderſtandinge, let him recken the number of the Beaſte.* **Vpon which woordes,** Irenæus **weineare fiftiene hundred yæres agoe, ſaithe thus:** *The name of* Antichriſt, *expreſſed by that number, ſhalbe,* Latinus: **And he addeth further,** Hoc valde veriſimile eſt. Quoniam veriſimum Regnum hoc habet vocabulum.

S. Gregorie **ſaithe,** *He is* Antichriſte, *that ſhal claime to be called the Vniuerſal Biſhop: and ſhal haue a* Garde of Prieſtes *to attende vpon him:* **Againe,** Irenæus **ſaithe,** Antichriſtus, cùm ſit Seruus, tamen adorari vult, vt Deus: Antichriſte, *notwithſtandinge he be but a ſeruaunt, yet, he wilbe woorſhipped, as if he were God.* Ioachimus Abbas **ſaithe,** Antichriſtus iampridem natus eſt Romæ, & altiùs extolletur in Sede Apoſtolica: Antichriſte *is longe ſithence borne in Rome, and yet ſhal be higher auaunced in the* Apoſtolique See.

Thus is he deſcribed, that ſhal ſitte in the place of Chriſte, **and ſhal mainteine poſſeſſion againſte Chriſte? But,** Chriſte ſhal comme with his Holy Angels, and ſhal deſtroie him with the breath of his **mouthe, Whiche is the Holy** VVoorde **of the Liuinge God.**

That yͤ allege of the Prieſthoode of Melchiſedech, **ſerueth you here to ſmal pourpoſe. Wæ knowe, that,** not the Pope, **but** Chriſte alone **is a Prieſte for euer, accordinge to the Order of Melchiſedech?** S. Auguſtine **ſaithe:** Ipſe eſt Sacerdos noſter in æternum, ſecundum Ordinem Melchiſedech, qui ſemetipſum obtulit holocauſtum pro peccatis noſtris: & eius Sacrificij Similitudinem celebrandam in ſuæ Paſsionis

To ſitte in the place of Chriſt.

(a) As though S. Paule had not warned vs, that Antichriſt ſhal ſitte, and ſhewe him ſelfe in the place of Chriſt.

(b) Ergo, Antichriſte ſhal ſitte in the Popes Chaire.

(c) But what if Chriſtes Vicare him ſelfe be Antichriſte?

(d) Vntruthe, Malicious, and ſclaunderous.

(e) Ergo ye belie vs, although not greatly.

2. Theſſ. 2.

Apocalip. 13.

Irenæus, lib. 5. cap. vltimo.

Gregor. li. 4 epiſ. 38. Sacerdotum paratus eſt exercitus.

Irenæ. Li. 5. ca. penulti.

Ioachimus Abbas.

2. Theſſ. 2.

Auguſt. in lib. 83. queſt. que. 61.

To ſitte in the place of Chriſt.

Paſsionis Memoriam commendauit: *Chriſte is our Prieſte for euer after the* Order of Melchiſedech, *whiche hathe offered vp him ſelfe a Sacrifice for our Sinnes: and hath deliuered vnto vs a Similitude, or Likeneſſe of that Sacrifice, to be donne in remembrance of his Paſſion.* Therefore if yᵉ wil ſaie, The Pope is a Prieſte for euer after the Order of Melchiſedech, then muſte you alſo ſaie, The Pope hath offered him ſelfe a Sacrifice for the Sinnes of the worlde.

In eadem quæſt. Likewiſe againe he ſaithe, Holocauſti eius Imaginem ad Memoriam Paſsionis ſuæ in Eccleſia celebrandam dedit, vt eſſet Sacerdos in æternum: non ſecundum Ordinem Aaron, ſed ſecundum Ordinem Melchiſedech: *Chriſte hathe geeuen an Image, or Reſemblaunce of that Sacrifice, to bee keapte in the Churche in Remembraunce of his Paſſion, that he might be a Prieſte for euer, not after the* Order of Aaron, *but after the* Order of Melchiſedech.

Artic. 17. Diui. 15 Howe be it, touchinge this whole mater, I haue anſweared more at large in my Former Replie.

The Apologie, Cap. 9. Diuiſion. 4.

Wherefore, like as it is written, that Hercules in olde time was forced, in ſtriuinge with Antæus that huge Giant, to lifte him quite vp from the Earthe, that was his Mother, ere he coulde conquere him: euen ſo muſte our Aduerſaries be reaued from theire Mother, that is from this vaine coloure, and ſhadowe of the Churche, wherewith they ſo diſguiſe, & defende them ſelues: otherwiſe they cannot be brought, to yelde vnto the woorde of God. And therefore ſaithe Ieremie the Prophete, Make not ſuche greate boaſte, that the Temple of the Lorde is with you. This is but a vaine confidence: theiſe are but lies. The Angel alſo ſaithe in the Apocalyps: They ſaie, they bee Ievves: but they bee the Synagoge of Sathan. And Chriſte ſaide to the Phariſeis, when they vaunted them ſelues of the kinred, and blonde of Abraham: *Ioban. 8.* Yee are of your father the Diuel: For you reſemble not your Father Abraham: Is mutche to ſaie, as, Ye are not the men, ye would ſo faine be called: ye beguile the people with vaine titles: and abuſe the name of the Churche, to the ouerthrowinge of the Churche.

M. Hardinge.

Heaue at vs, whiles ye wil, and whiles ye maie, ye ſhal neuer remoue vs. In whiche ſtedfaſtnes we truſte to ſtande by Goddes grace to the laſte breath. Heaue at vs with al the forces of your cunninge, of your malice, of your flatterie, of your policies, and with what ſo euer engins ye haue: ye ſhal neuer be able to ouerthrowe the houſe of our conſciences builded vpon the ſure rocke. Let the gourdes of raine come downe from you and al other Heretikes, let the floudes of worldly rages thruſte, let the windes of Sathans temptations blowe their woorſte, this houſe ſhal not be ouerthrowen. *Matth. 7.*

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Rom. 11. O ſir Hardinge, S. Paule ſaithe vnto you, Noli altum Sapere, ſed time: *Preſume not of your ſelfe: but ſtande in awe.* Suche woordes woulde rather haue becommed them, that ſaide ſommetime vnto the Prophete Hieremie, Verbum, quod locutus es nobis in Nomine Domini, non audiemus: Sed faciendo faciemus omne verbum, quod egredietur de ore noſtro: *Wee wil neuer heare the woorde, that thou ſpeakeſt vnto vs in the name of the Lorde. But wee wil ſurely doo, what ſo euer thinge ſhal paſſe out of our owne mouthes.* Thus it is written of them, that ſaide, *The Lorde ſhal not beare rule ouer, nor maiſter vs.* With like mildeneſſe of ſpirite the wilful Philoſopher ſaide, Non perſuadebis, etiamſi perſuaſeris: *Yet ſhal not make me beleeue it, no though I doo beleeue it.*

Hierem. 44.

Luke. 19. ὁ πείσεις, σὺδὲ ἂν πείσῃς.

As Conſtancie in good thinges is a vertue, ſo frowardneſſe, and wilfulneſſe is a vice. Howe not thus your owne deſtruction. He that is fallen, maie riſe againe. The Lorde is hable to raiſe you vp: and to make you a veſſel of his glorie.

ye knowe not, to what good pourpose God hath appointed you. Speake not ouer mutche of the strength of your Wounte. You knowe, vpon howe light occasions it hath benne moued. Folowe rather S. Paules counsel, and *with feare, and tremblinge woorke your owne Saluation*. The waie, ye walke in, is not your owne: Your harte is in the handes of God. Suffer Goddes Truthe to preuaile: and Understande, that the Kingedome of God is come vnto you.

I haue praied for thee, Peter &c. *Philip.2. Hierem.10. Luke.1.*

The Apologie, Cap.10. Diuision.1.

So that these mennes parte had benne, firste to haue clearely, and truely proued, that the Romishe Churche **is the true and righte instructed** Churche of God: **and that the same, as they doo order it at this daie, doothe agree with the Primitiue Churche of Christe, of the Apostles, and of the Holy Fathers, whiche we doubte not, but was in deede the True Catholique Churche.**

M. Hardinge.

Yee woulde vs to proue, that the Romaine Churche is the true Churche of God. Yee graunt, that once it was the true Churche of God. And the Gospel sheweth, that Christe praied for it in S. Peter, who made his successours there. * VVhat foloweth hereof, but that it muste needes abide as true, as euer it was, except Christes praier were not hearde? S. Paule likewise witnesseth, that the Romaine Faithe is preached in the Vniuersal worlde, geuinge a manifest prophecie, that the Romaine Faithe and the Catholike Faithe should be al one. S. Cyprian calleth the agreinge with the Bishop of Rome and communicatinge with him, *Catholicæ Ecclesiæ vnitatem, &c.* The allowinge and firme holdinge of the vnitie of the Catholike Churche. And writinge to Antonianus in the same booke, he accompteth it for one thinge, to communicate with Cornelius the Bishop of Rome, and to Communicate with the Catholike Churche. For you it is vaine to saie, that it hathe erred, * when the Holy Ghoste hath signified, that it can not erre.

*This is a very vaine hope. For Christe praied for the other Apostles no lesse, then for Peter.

* Vntruthe. For where did the Holy Ghoste euer make sutch promise?

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

I wil not saie, Where were your wittes, M. Hardinge, when ye wrote these thinges? But wel maie I saie, where was your Logique? **As for Diuinitie, it appeareth by your reckeninge, ye make no greate accompte of it.** Christe (saie you) praied for Peter: *Ergo*, the Romaine Faithe can neuer faile. **Fewe children woulde willingly make sutche Argumentes, Ye presume very mutche of the Simplicitie, and Ignorance of your Reader. For thinke you, that Christe praied onely for** Peter, **and for no body els? Or, thinke you, that Christes Praiers take place in none other of al the Apostles, but onely in** Peter? **Awake for shame: and shake of these dreames.** Christe **him selfe saithe,** *O Father, I praie* not onely for these, *but also for them, that by their woorde shal beleeue in mee*. **And** S. Augustine **thus reporteth the same Praier, as it is alleaged before:** Ego rogaui Patrem pro vobis, ne deficiat Fides vestra: *I haue praied vnto my Father,* (not for Peter onely, but) *for you, that your Faithe maie not faile*. **Againe he saithe,** Nunquid pro Petro rogabat: Pro Iohanne, & Iacobo non rogabat? *Did* Christe *praie for* Peter: *And did he not praie for* Iohn, *and* Iames? **Certainely** Origen **saithe, as likewise I haue before alleged,** Omnia, quæ prius dicta sunt, quæ sequuntur, velut ad Petrum dicta sunt omnium Communia: *Al the thinges, that either paste before, or folowe after, as spoken vnto* Peter, *are common vnto al the* Apostles.

Iohan.17.

Augu. De verbis Domi. in Euang. Secund. Lucam, Serm.36. Augu. in quæst. Noui Testamen. quæst.75. Origen. in Matthæ. Tract.1. Roman.1.

But S. Paule **saith vnto the** Romaines, *Your Faithe is spoken of throughout the worlde.* **And** S. Cyprian **saithe,** *The agreeinge with the* Bishop of Rome *was the Vnitie of the Catholique Churche*. **And yet it maie please you, to be remembred by the waie, that the same** S. Cyprian **reproued** Cornelius, **and** Stephanus, **bothe** Bishoppes of Rome: **and tolde them, they were bothe deceiued: and therefore woulde not agree vnto them. Nevertheless, hereof ye conclude thus,** *Ergo*, the Holy Ghoste hath signified, that the Churche of Rome cannot erre. **It pitieth me, M. Hardinge, in your behalfe, to see, into howe streite, and miserable holes ye are faine to crepe. For, what if the Faithe, and the Constancie of the** Romaines **in olde times, for the Nobilitie of that Empiere, and Citie, were then published throughout the whole worlde? Yet where did the** Holy Ghoste **euer telle you, that therefore the** Churche of Rome **shoulde neuer**

I haue praied for thee, Peter &c.

neuer erre? By what Worde? By what Promise? By what Reuelation? We saie, The Faithe of the Romaines was hearde of throughout the whole VVorlde. So was the Greate Capitol there: So was the bewtie of theire Princely buildinges. Whiche, notwithstandinge are nowe made smothe, and euen with the grounde. So likewise is it written of Hierusalem, De Sion exibit Lex, & Verbum Domini de Hierusalem: *The Lawe shal comme forthe from* Sion, *and the Woorde of God from* Hierusalem. So in the Cittie of Antioche the Faithful were first called Christians: And therefore Chrysostome calleth the same Cittie, Caput totius orbis, *The Heade of the whole worlde*. Thus was Eusebius Samosatensis called, Regula Fidei, *The Rule, and Standerde of the Faithe*: Thus was Athanasius called, Orbis oculus: & Fundamentum Fidei: *The Eie of the worlde, and the Fundation of the Faithe*. Woulde we hereof conclude, M. Hardinge, that therefore the Faithe of theise Churches can neuer faile? We know, that al this notwithstandinge, the Churches as wel of Hierusalem, and Antioche, as also of Asia, Syria, Græcia, and of al the Easte, are nowe subiecte to the Turke, and scarcely a fewe leafte there, that dare to professe the name of Christe.

Isai. 2.

Chrysost. ad Popul. Antio. Homel. 3.

Nazian. epist. 74

Nazian. ad Heronem.

As S. Paule saithe to the Romaines, *Your Faithe is spoken of throughout al the worlde*. Euen so saithe he to the Thessaloniens, *Your Faithe is carried abroade into al places*. In omni loco Fides vestra, quæ est in Deum, dimanauit: The wordes be like: The sense is one. Wil you therefore telle vs, *The* Thessaloniens Faithe *shal neuer faile*. Verily at this daie there is no sparkle of Faithe leafte there. For the Christians are banished, and thruste out: And the Cittie is fully possessed with Iewes, whiche are the enemies of the Crosse of Christe.

1. Thess. 1.

What a fonde Paradise is this, to saie, bicause ye had once the Faithe of Christe, therefore nowe ye can neuer erre? Suche a fantastical Paradise had they builte vnto them selues, that cried out in olde times, euen as you do nowe, The Temple of God: The Temple of God: VVee are the Children of Abraham. But who so euer wel considereth the storie of the time, shal sone finde, that then they cried moste, The Temple of God, when they had most shamefully abused, and defaced the Temple of God: and, that then they claimed moste to be called the Children of Abraham, when they had forsaken bothe the Faithe, and life of Abraham, and, as Christe saith vnto them, were becomme the Children of the Diuel.

Hierem. 7. Matthe. 3.

Suche a fantasie had they, that saide, Non peribit Lex à Sacerdote: Nec consilium à Sapiente: Nec Verbum à Propheta: *The Lawe shal not departe from the Prieste: Nor Counsel from the Wise: Nor the Woorde from the Prophete*. But God saithe vnto them, Obstupescent Sacerdotes, & Prophetæ terrebuntur. Lex peribit à Sacerdote, & Consilium à Senioribus. Nox vobis erit pro Visione: & tenebræ pro Diuinatione: *Your Priestes shalbe amased: and your Prophetes shalbe at theire wittes ende. The Lawe shal perishe from the Priestе: and Counsel shal wante in the Elders. Yee shal haue Night in steede of a Vision: and Darkenesse in steede of Propheſie*.

Iohan. 8. Hierem. 18. Ezech. 7. Mich. 6.

S. Paule saithe vnto the Galathians, *Yee begonne wel: who hathe thus bewitched you, that yee shoulde not obeie the Truthe?* S. Peter saithe, *As there were False Prophetes emongest the people in olde time, euen so emonge you there shalbe False Prophetes, bringinge in Sectes of Perdition*. Of suche a chaunge the Prophete Esaie complained, Quomodò facta est Meretrix Ciuitas Fidelis? *Howe is this Faithefull Cittie nowe becomme an* Harlot? Deceiue not thus your selfe, M. Hardinge, with vaine hope. Harken rather to the voice of our Lorde. Put nothinge to his Worde: take nothinge from the same: turne neither to the Right hande, nor to the Leafte. So shal ye be sure, ye shal not erre.

Galat. 3. 2. Pet. 2. Esai. 1.

The Apologie, Cap. 10. Diuision. 2.

For our parte, if wee coulde haue iudged, Ignorance, Errour, Superstition, Idolatrie, mennes Inuentions, and the same commonly disagreeinge with the Holy Scriptures, either to please God, or to be sufficiente for thobteininge of Euerlastinge Saluation: or, if we coulde ascertaine our selues, that the VVoorde of God was written but

for

for a time onely, and afterwarde againe ought to be abrogated, & put away: or els, that the Sayings, and Commaundementes of God ought to be subiect to mans will, that whatsoeuer God saieth, and commaundeth, except the Bishop of Rome wil, and Commaunde the same, it must be taken as void, & vnspoke: If we could haue brought our selues to beleue these things, we graunt, there had bene no cause at all, why we should haue left these mens Compante. Gods woorde mutable?

M. Harding.

God forbid, that either ye, or any Christen man shoulde iudge, that ignorance, errour, superstition, Idolatrie, mens inuentions contrarie to the Scriptures, either pleased God, or be sufficient to saluation. Because ye lay this to the Catholike Church (a) we can say no lesse of you, but that ye be false liers, and diuelish slaunderers. And * who teacheth, that Gods worde was written, but for a time onely? * That his commaundementes be subiect to mans will? * That Gods sayings and precepts be voyde, except the Bishop of Rome ratifie them? Here would I say vnto you at least, fie for shame, but that I thinke, I should preuaile no more, then if I cryde to an impudent and common Harlot, fie for shame. VVho may not plainely see, the Scripture verified on you. *Frons mulieris meretricis facta tibi vobis?* Ye haue gotten to you the impudent face of an Harlot.

(a) Vntruth inclosed, knowen, and wilfull. Read the answer.

* Thus partly M. Hardings doctors say: partly M. Harding himselfe. As it shall appeare.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Here, M. Harding, it hath pleased you to bestowe large liueries, of your False Liers: Diuelish Slaunderers: Impudent Faces: Common Harlottes: with Fies, and Shame, &c. Wherein no man may iustly grudge you, to bee so liberall of your owne. First, that by your Doctrine, Ignorance highly pleaseth God, and is sufficient to Saluation, besides the generall practise of your whole Church, ye may soone call to minde, that one of your dearest frendes, in most honourable Audience, not long sithence, openly published the same, in the name, and behouse of all his Brethren, as a Secrete Mysterie, and the verie bottome of your Diuinitie: Ignoraunce is the Mother of Deuotion. You knowe M. Harding, that a great manie, both woorthie and honourable, are able to witnesse, that this is, neither False Lie, nor Diuelish Sclaunder. You knowe, that Cardinal Cusanus teacheth you, Obedientia irrationalis est consummata Obedientia, & perfectissima, scilicet quando obeditur sine inquisitione rationis, sicut iumentum obedit Domino suo. Si igitur videas Pontificem tuum non Communicare alicui, neque tu illi Communices. Eccè quantùm peccant, qui detrahunt Pontifici &c. *Obedience without reason is the full, and most perfite Obedience, I meane, when a man is obedient to doe, whatsoeuer hee is commaunded without requiring of any reason, euen as a Horse is obedient to his Maister. Therefore, if thou see thy Bishop to refuse the Communion of anie man, refuse thou to Communicate with the same. O how much they offende that sclaunder their Bishop!* This, M. Harding, is your Doctrine of Simple Ignorance. Concerning Superstition, and Idolatrie, what neede wee manie woordes? The thing it selfe is too well hable to proue it selfe. Who so but looketh into your Churches, may easily, not onely see it with his eyes, but also feele it with his fingers. That Gods Holy Woorde, by your Learning, is mutable, and serueth onely for a time, your owne Doctour Cardinalis Cusanus would soone haue taught you: Notwithstanding, it may scarcely seeme lawfull for you, beeing so Learned a man, in the Substaunce of your owne Doctrine, to pleade Ignorance. Cardinall Cusanus woordes be these: Scripturæ adaptatæ sunt ad tempus, & variè intelliguntur: Ità vt vno tempore secundùm currentem vniuersalem ritum exponantur: mutato ritu, iterum Sententia mutetur: *The Scriptures are applied vnto the time, and may haue sundrie vnderstandinges: So that at one time they may bee expounded* (one way) *according to the vniuersall current order* (of the Church:) *and that the same order being broken, the meaning of the Scriptures may be chaunged.* Looke better on your bookes, M. Harding: and ye shall see, that herein is neither Lie, nor Sclaunder. That the Holy scriptures of God, by your Diuinitie, bee not authentical farther then they be ratified by the Pope, ye might haue learned of your Syluester Prierias, Maister of the Popes Palaice. Thus he writeth: A Doctrina Romanæ Ecclesiæ, & Romani Pontificis, Sacra Scriptura robur trahit, & authoritatem: *The Holy Scripture taketh strength, and Authorie of the*

Nicol. Cusanus Excita Li. 6 Vbi Ecclesia.

Cardi. Cusanus ad Bohemos Epist. 2.

Sylvester Prierias contra Lutherū.

Gods woorde mutable.

Doctrine of the Romaine Church, and of the Bishop of Rome. Againe he sayth, Indulgentiæ Authoritate Scripturæ non innotuere nobis: Sed Authoritate Romanæ Ecclesiæ, Romanorumque Pontificum, quæ Maior est: *Pardons are not knowne to vs by the Authoritie of the Scriptures, but by the Authoritie of the Romaine Church, and of the Bishoppes of Rome, which is greater then the Authoritie of the Scriptures.*

If ye say, these be Lies, and Slaunders, you offer great wrong to your owne Doctours, making them the Authours of Lies, and Slaunders. Neuertheless, if ye shall happen to crie out in the impacience of your Choler, Fie for shame: Impudent Faces: common Harlots: remember what you your selues haue written immediately before, touching the same. These be your owne woordes: Recant them yee may: but denie them yee may not. Thus you say: Christ now requireth of you, not to obey Peter, and Paul, (that is to say, the Worde of God) but to obey him, who sitteth in their Chaire. We forge not these woordes, M. Harding: They are your owne. Folkes will thinke, ye haue no Modest Matrones face, if ye speake willingly against your selfe.

M. Hard. fol. 192. b.

Now, ye see, M. Harding, who teacheth you, That Gods Worde was written onely for a time: And that Gods Commaundementes are no further Authenticall, but as they be ratified by the Pope: Therefore henceforth ye may spare these Lies, and Slaunders, and crie out, Fie, and Shame, when some occasion shall be offered. In deede Cardinal Cusanus sayth, Veritas adhæret Cathedræ. Quare Membra Cathedræ vnita, & Pontifici coniuncta, efficiunt Ecclesiam: *The* Truth cleaueth fast to the Popes Chaire *Therefore the Members vnited vnto that Chaire, and ioyned vnto the Pope make the Church.*

Cardinal Cusanus ad Bohemos, Epist. 2.

The Apologie, Cap. 11. Diuision. 1.

As touching that we haue now done, to depart from that Church, whose errours were prooued, and made manifest to the woorld, which Church also had alreadie euidently departed from Gods woorde, and yet not to depart so much from it selfe, as from the Errours therof, and not to doe this disorderly, or wickedly, but quietly and soberly, we haue done nothing herein agaynst the Doctrine, either of Christ, or of his Apostles. For neither is the Church of God such, as it may not be dusked with some spotte, or asketh not sometime reparation. Els, what neede there so many Assemblies and Councelles, without the which, as sayeth Egidius, the Christian Fayth is not able to stande. For looke (sayth he) howe often Councels are discontinued, so often is the Church destitute of Christ.

In Conc. Lateranens. sub Iulio. 2.

M. Harding.

That the Church in poinctes of our Fayth necessarie to saluacion erreth, we denie it: and *vpon warrant of Christe promise, we tel it you all assuredly, ye shall neuer be able to proue it.

Councels are kept, and Bishops be made by the same prouidence of God, which prouideth partly by that meanes, and partly by other, that the Romaine Fayth, Chaire, and Rocke, shall stand for euer. *Ad quos* (sayth S. Cyprian, speaking of them of Rome) *perfidia non potest habere accessum,* *To the which vnfaithfulnesse can not haue accesse, he sayeth not onelie, shall not haue accesse, but, cannot haue accesse.

*Vntruth. Yee make your owne warrant, For Christ neuer made such promise to the Church of Rome.

**Vntruth grounded vpon grosse ignorance. For M. Hard. fowly mistaketh Saint Cyprians whole meaning.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

It seemeth, M. Harding, yee haue beene brought vp vnder some poore vnskilfull Surgeon. For yee applie one Salue to euerie sore. Whatsoeuer but alleaged against you, it is sufficient for you to answere, The Church of Rome erreth not: The Church of Rome hath not erred: The Church of Rome cannot erre. And to this purpose yee haue brought vs in certaine woordes of Saint Cyprian farre beyonde the Authours meaning. Whereby it appeareth, that sometimes yee alleage Authorities of the Fathers, not considering, neither to what ende they spake, nor what they meant.

For

The Church of Roome may erre.

For whereas S. Cyprian saith, Vnto the Romaines vnfaithfulnesse can haue no accesse, hee speaketh not of the Vnfaithfulnesse of Faithe, or Doctrine, as you by errour haue imagined, but onely of the Vnfaithfulnesse of Reporte. The cause of writting that Epistle, in short, was this: Certaine lewde fellowes, refusing to stand to the iudgement of the Bishoppes of their owne Countrye of Aphrica, appealed further, and fled to Rome, with many vntrue, and forged tales, to winne some credite to their cause. Hereunto Saint Cyprian sayeth, The Romaines bee godly and wise men: they will soone be able to espye the ir falsehoode. *For vnfaithfull reportes, and lewde tales can haue no accesse vnto them.* If yee had considered, either the occasion of the writtinge, or the whole drifte of the letter, or the verie bare woordes as they lye, yee might easily haue seene, that this onely Saint Cyprians meaning

His woordes be these, Post ista, adhuc insuper Pseudoepiscopo sibi ab Hæreticis constituto, nauigare audent, & ad Petri Cathedram, vnde Vnitas Sacerdotalis exorta est, à Schismaticis, & profanis literas ferre: nec cogitare, eos esse Romanos quorum, Fides, Apostolo prædicante, laudata est: ad quos Perfidia habere non possit accessum: *Cyprian Lib. 1, Epist. 3.*

After this hauing a false Bishop appointed vnto them by Heretiques, they dare to take shipping, and vnto Peters Chaire, and vnto that Principall Church, from whence the Priestly Vnitie grewe first, to carry letters from Schismatiques, and lewde men: Neither consider they, that the Romaines *are that people, whose faith is praysed by* S. Paule *the Apostle:* vnto whome Vnfaithfulnesse (of Reportes and tales) can haue no accesse.

If yee doubte of this Exposition, reade these woordes touching the same, going before in the same Epistle: Romam cum Mendaciorum suorum merce nauigarunt. Quasi Veritas post eos nauigare non posset: quæ mendaces linguas rei certa probatione conuinceret: *In eadem Epistola.*

They saile to Roome with the Merchandise of their Lyes: as though the Trueth could not sayle after them, that by proofe of the certaintie, might controll their lying tongues. This is that Vnfaithfulnesse, that S. Cyprian speaketh off: and not the Vnfaithfulnesse of Faith and Doctrine.

Nowe, touching this Appealing, and fleeing to Rome, least you should thinke, by occasion of these woordes, that S. Cyprian, alloweth it, or thinketh well of it: yee shall finde in the same Epistle, that he vterly misliketh it, and condemneth it. For thus hee sayth, Aequm est pariter, & iustum, vt vniuscuiusque causa illic audiatur, vbi crimē admissum est: *Cyprian, in eadem Epist,*

It is meete and right, that euery mannes cause be pleaded in that Countrey, where the faulte was committed, &c. Againe, Oportet eos, quibus præsumus, non circumcursare: *It is not meete, that they, ouer whom we haue Iurisdiction, should runne about the worlde:* He meaneth to Rome.

And againe, Nisi paucis desperatis & perditis, Minor videtur esse Authoritas Episcoporum in Aphrica constitutorum, &c. *Vnlesse a fewe desperate, and wicked men thinke the Authoritie of the Bishops of* Aphrica *is lesse then the authoritie of the Bishoppes of* Rome. By these woordes S. Cyprian maketh the Bishop of Rome equall in authoritie with him selfe and other Bishoppes. Wherfore I must conclude with other woordes of Saint Cyprian in the same Epistle: Hæc est, Frater, vera dementia, non cogitare quòd Mendacia non diu fallant: Noctem tam diu esse, quoad illucescat Dies. *O my Brother, this is dedeit very madnesse, not to thinke, that Lyes cannot long deceiue: The night lasteth no longer, but vntill the Day begynne to spring.*

The Apologie, Cap. 12. Diuision. 1, & 2.

Or, if there bee no perill, that harme may come to the Churche, what neede is there to retaine to no purpose the names of Bishoppes, For so it is now commonly vsed among them. The names onely they beare, and doe nothing. For if there bee no Sheepe, that may stray, why be they called Shepeheardes? If there be no Citie, that may bee betraped, why be they called Watchmen? If there be nothing, that may run to ruine, why be they called Pillers? Anon after the

first creation of the worlde, the Church of God began to spread abroade, and the same was instructed with the heauenly word, which God him selfe pronounced with his owne Mouth. It was also furnished with Diuine Ceremonyes. It was taught by the Spirit of God, by the Patriarkes, and Prophets, and continued so euen til the time, that Christe shewed him selfe to vs in the flesshe. Thus notwithstanding, howe often, O good God, in the meane while, and how horribly was the same Church darkened, and decayed.

Where was that Church then, when all Flesshe vpon Earth had defiled his owne way? Where was it, when emongst the number of the whole World, there was only eight persons (a neither they al chast, and good, neither) whom Gods will was, should bee saued aliue from the vniuersall Destruction, and Mortalitie? When Elie the Prophet so lamentably, and bitterly made his mone, that onely him selfe was leaft of all the whole Worlde, which did truely and dewly worship God? And when Esaie saide, The Siluer of Gods people (that is of the Church) was become Drosse: and that the same Cittie which afore time had beene Faithfull, was nowe become an Harlot: And that in the same there was no parte founde throughout the whole body from the heade to the foote? Or else when Christ him selfe saide, That the house of God was made, by the Phariseis, and Priestes, a Denne of Theeues? Of a trueth, the Church, euen as a corne feelde, except it be eared, manured, tilled, & trimmed, will in steade of Wheate, bring forth Thistles Darnell, and Nettles. For this cause did God send euer among bothe Prophets, and Apostles, and laste of all his owne Sonne, who might bring home the people into the right way, and repaire anew the tottering Church after she had erred.

3. Reg. 13.

Esai. 1.

Math. 21.

M. Harding.

These and the like places haue beene already alleaged, of olde time against the Catholikes, by the Donatistes, as Saint Augustine therwith: and of late yeares by your Schoolemaister Iohn Caluine of Geneua. Wee needed not to study for newe answeres to the argument made out of these and such other places, much fitter for this purpose, then these are, sith that the same is so well answered by Saint Augustine. Often times (saith hee) Gods worde rebuketh the wicked sorte of the Church, &c, as though all were such, and none at all remained good. For thereby wee are warned, them in their certaine number to be called all, as much to say, all the Children of Hell. But Sir, what if the Church at the beginning of the worlde, and at the generall drowning, was of small number? And what if the Synagogue were sometime quite extinguished? Must it therefore followe, that the Church also after that GOD hath giuen to Christe his Sonne the endes of the worlde to be the endes of the worlde to bee his possession, may nowe be brought to a fewe, and to faile altogeather? Where was the Churche (saye yee) when of all the worlde there were but eight persons, and they onely saued alue from the vniuersall destruction? Forsooth they were in Noes Arke. And now haue wee? our Noes Arke also, in whiche who so euer abideth not, the same is drowned.

De Vnit. Eccl. Cap. 12.

Psalm. 2.

* But the same Arke is not the Church of Rome.

Neither were the Propetes and Apostles sent, nor Christe came him selfe to repaire a newe the Churche, which had in Faith wholy erred: but bothe they were sent, and he came, that he should not wholly erre.

The Bishop of Salisbury.

It is true that yee saye, In the holie Scriptures this woorde, All, is often vsed in steade of many. And thus (yee saye) is saued with the Synagogue of the Iewes: for that then the faithfull were few times brought vn-

to

sometimes brought vnto a small number: sometimes were vtterly decayed, and consumed to nought. And in this sense (ye say,) Elias complained, that the Prophetes of God were all slayne, and he onely left aline

But nowe (ye say,) the Churche may not bee brought to a fewe. For GOD hath geuen to Christe his Sonne the endes of the worlde to be his possession. Yet Christ himselfe, M. Harding, that best knewe the reache, and limites of his possession, saith thus, *When the* Sonne of Man *shall come, thinke you, he shall finde Faith in the worlde?* Wherevpon S. Ambrose saith, Tunc Fides rara: Vt ipse, quasi addubitans, Dominus ista dixerit: *Then shall Faith be geason: So that our Lorde spake these wordes, as doubting thereof, whether there shoulde bee any Faithfull left, or no.* And S. Iohn in his Reuelations saith, Mulier fugit in solitudinem, vbi habet locum paratum a Deo: *The woman* (whereby is meant, not the Synagogue of the Iewes, but the Churche of Christ) *fleeth into the wildernesse: where shee hath a place prouided of God.* By which wordes is meant, that in time of Ignorance, and Persecution, the Churche is without Countenance, and vnknowen. S. Paule saith, *Before the day of the Lorde, there shalbe a departing from the Faith of Christ.* By these it appeareth, the decay of the Churche shalbe Vniuersall: and that the remanentes shall not be many. Therefore Vincentius Lirinensis putteth the case on this wise: Quid si nouella aliqua contagio iam non potiunculam tantum, sed totam pariter Ecclesiam commaculare conetur? Tunc item prouidebit, vt Antiquitati inhæreat: *What if some newe corruption goe about to invade, not onely some portion of the Churche, but also the whole Vniuersall Churche altogether? Then must a Christian man settle himselfe to cleaue to Antiquitie:* That is to say to folowe the Primitiue Church of the Apostles, and Auncient Fathers. This case woulde he neuer haue moued, vnlesse he had thought, the Whole vniuersall Churche might happen by some errour to be deceiued. Surely S. Chrisostome speaking of the state of the Churche, that he sawe in his time, saieth thus: Videtur Ecclesia hodie Mulieri, quæ mansuetudine veteri exciderit, similis: qnæque Symbola tantum fœlicitatis illius quædam referat: Arcas, & Scrinia rerum pretiosissimarum adhuc retinens, Thesauro destituta, Huic mulieri Ecclesia hodie videtur similis: *The Churche this day is like vnto a woman, that hath quite lost all her olde modestie: and that beareth onely certaine badges, and tokens of her former felicitie: and that, beyng vtterly bereft of the treasures, keepeth onelie the Cases, and Boxes of the pretious thinges, shee had before.* To suche a woman the Churche this day may be likened.

The Churche in fewe.

3. Regum. 19 Luke. 21. Ambrosi. in Lucam. Lib. 10. Apocalyp. 12

2. Thessal. 2.

Vincentius. Lirinensis.

Chrysostom. in 1. ad Cor. Homil. 36.

Likewise S. Hierom speaking of that, he sawe by experience in his time, sayth thus: Ecclesia, postquam ad Christianos Principes peruenit, potentia quidem, & diuitiis maior, sed virtutibus minor facta est: *The* Churche, *after that shee is come to Christian Princes, in deede is greater in wealth, and riches: But in vertue, and Holmesse she is lesse, then shee was before.* Therefore sayth Chrisostome, Hæc dico, ne quis miretur Ecclesiam propter multitudinem: sed vt ipsam probatam reddere studeamus: *Thus muche, I tell you, not that we shoulde aduaunce the Churche bicause of the Multitude, and encrease of people: But that wee shoulde ende nour to adorne her with vertue.*

Hieronym. in vita Malchi.

Chrysostom. ad Populum Antiochen. Homil. 4.

Nowe where ye say, the Church nowe can neuer be brought to fewe. S. Bernard saith thus vnto God, by waye of moane: Coniurasse videtur contra te vniuersitas populi Christiani, a minimo vsque ad maximum: A planta pedis vsque ad verticem non est sanitas vlla. Egressa est iniquitas a Senioribus Iudicibus, Vicariis tuis qui videntur regere populum tuum. *O Lorde, the* Vniuersall Companie *of Christian people seemeth to haue conspired against thee* from the lowest vnto the highest. *From the sole of the foote, vnto the crowne of the Head, there is no whole place. Iniquitie, and wickednesse is gone foorth from thy Elder Iudges, that be thy Vicars, that are thought to rule thy people.*

Bernard in Conuersione Pauli, Serm. 1.

Againe he saith, Intestinalis, & insanabilis est plaga Ecclesiæ: *The wounde of the Churche is inwarde, and past recouer.* Likewise Baptista Mantuane complayneth vnto Pope Leo:

Sancte Pater succurre Leo, Respublica Christi
Labitur: ægrotatque Fides iam proxima morti.

Citatur ab Holcoto in Sapien. Lectio 23. Baptis. Mantuanus Fastor. 4.

The Church in fewe.

Helpe, Holy Father Leo: *Christes common wealth* (that is, the Churche) *is falling downe, the Faith is ficke, and like to to die.*

So likewise saith he, that wrote the Forte of Faith, Etsi in hoc Dæmonum bello cadant Religiosi Principes, & Milites, & Prælati Ecclesiastici, & Subditi, tamen semper manent aliqui, in quibus saluatur Veritas Fidei, & iustificatio bonæ conscientiæ. Et si non nisi duo homines fideles remanerent in mundo, in eis saluaretur Ecclesia, quæ est Vnitas Fidelium: *In this battell of Dauelles, notwithstanding the Godly Princes, the souldiers, the Ecclesiasticall Prelates, and Subiectes be ouerthrowen, yet euermore some remaine, in whom the Truth of Faith, and the Righteousnesse of a good conscience is preserued.* And, although there remained but two faithfull men in the worlde, *yet in the same two,* the Churche of God shoulde be saued: which Church is the Vnitie of the Faithfull. The Church of God is often compared to the Moone, which sometimes is full, and rounde and bright, and glorious: sometimes is wholly shadowed, and drowned in darkenesse: and yet notwithstanding is not consumed, but in substance remayneth still. Saint Augustine saith, Aliquando in Solo Abel Ecclesia erat: & expugnatus est a fratre malo, & perdito Cain. Aliquando in Solo Enoch Ecclesia erat: & translatus est ab iniquis: *Sometime the Churche was in* onely Abel: *and he was destroyed by his brother* wicked Cain. *Sometime the Churche was* onely in Enoch: *and he was translated from the wicked.* Your owne Panormitane saith: Possibile est quod Vera Fides Christi remaneret in Vno Solo: Atque ita verum est dicere, quod fides non deficit in Ecclesia. Hoc patuit post Passionem Christi, Nam fides remansit tantum in Beata Virgine. Quia omnes alii scandalizati sunt. Tamen Christus ante Passionem orauerat pro Petro, vt non deficeret fides sua Ergo Ecclesia non dicitur deficere, nec etiam errare, si remanet vera fides in Vno Solo: *It is possible, the true Faith of Christ may remayne in one alone: And so it is true to saie, that Faith faileth not in the Church. This thing appeared after Christes Passion. For then the faith remayned onely in the Blessed Virgin For all the rest (both the Apostles, and others were offended. Yet had* Christ *prayed for* Peter *before his Passion, that his faith should not faile.* Therefore we may not say, the churche faileth, or erreth, if the faith remaine but in one alone. Agayne, S. Augustine saith, Non tamen propter hos remanebit Christus sine Hæreditate. Nouit dominus, qui sint sui, &c. *Yet shall not Christ because of the wicked, remaine without his inheritance.* The Lorde knoweth, who be his owne.

Fortalitium Fidei, Lib, 5.

Aug. Epist. 48.

Aug. in Psal. 128.

Extra. de Electione, Significasti. Abb.

August. in Psal. 88.

The Apologie, Cap. 13, Diuision, 1.

But least some man shoulde saie, that the foresaide things happened onely in the time of Lawe, of Shadowes, and of Infancie, when the Truth laie hid vnder Figures, and Ceremonies, when nothing as yet was brought to perfection, when the lawe was not grauen in mens heartes, but in stone: (And yet were that but a foolishe distinction,) for euen at those dayes there was the verie same God, that is nowe, the same spirite, the same Christ, the same Faith, the same doctrine, the same Hope, the same Enheritaunce, the same Couenaunt, & the same Efficacie and vertue of Gods worde: Eusebius **also** saith, All the Faithfull, euen from Adam vntill Christ, were in deede very Christians **(though they were not so termed:) But, as I saied, least men should thus say still,** Paule the Apostle **founde the like faultes, and falles, euen then in the prime, and chiefe of the Gospel, in the greatest perfection, and in the light: so that he was compelled to write in this sorte to the** Galathians, **whom he had well before instructed:** I feare me (**quod he**) least I haue laboured amongest you to small purpose, and least ye haue heard the Gospel in vayne. O my little Children, of whome I trauaile anew, till Christ be fashioned againe in you. **And, as for the** Church of the Corinthians, **how fowly it was defiled, it is nothing needefull to re-**

rehearſe. Nowe tell me, might the Churches of the Galathians, and Corinthians goe amiſſe, and the Church of Rome alone may not fayle, nor goe amiſſe? The Church of Rome may erre.

M. Harding.

VVe anſweare, that in partes of the Churche, faultes may be founde, and ſundrie men that ſeeme to bee of the Churche, and be in the Churche in deede, may fall and periſhe: all this we graunt. * But that the whole Catholike, and Vniuerſal Church, whoſe faith we profeſſe, may erre, fall, and faile: that wee denie vtterly, which had bene this Defenders parte to proue, elſe he talketh to no purpoſe. And where S. Paule rebuketh all the Galathians in generall, as though all had forſaken their Faithe, he doeth it after the woont of the Prophetes, both in that and other Epiſtles, for the greater paines ſake, reprehending al, though ſome deſerue praiſe. As for the Corinthians, though manie among them were faulſie, yet who conſidereth how he beginneth his Epiſtle to them, ſhall finde that he * acknowledgeth a Church among them. For thus he writeth: Paule by vocation an Apoſtle, &c. to the Church of God which is at Corinth &c.

* VVe ſpeake not of the whole Vniuerſal Church, but onely of the Church of Rome.

* nay the ſame Church this day is ſubiect to the Religion of Mahomet, and is no Church.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

That in any particular Church faultes may be found, that (yee ſay) ye will confeſſe: But that the whole Catholike Vniuerſall Church may erre, and faile, that (you ſay) ye deme vtterly.

Notwithſtanding it is certaine, that the Churches of Corinth and Galathia, and ſundrie others, are nowe, not in any particular portion, but thoroughly departed from the Faithe, and are nowe wholy ſubiecte to the Turke.

This therefore muſte needes bee your meaninge, that albeit all other Particular Churches throughout the worlde happen to erre, yet the Churche of Rome, that is to ſaie, the Pope and his Cardinalles can neuer erre. This Leſſon, I trowe, ye learned of Petrus de Palude: For neither Chriſte, nor any of his Apoſtles euer taught it you. This worthy Doctour ſaithe thus: Tota Eccleſia Petri non poteſt a Fide deficere. Omnes autem Eccleſiæ Apoſtolorum omnium poſſunt deficere a Fide totaliter, indigentes ab Eccleſia Petri confirmari: *The whole Churche of* Peter, *cannot wholy faile from the Faithe. But al the other Churches of all the Apoſtles maie faile wholy from the Faithe, hauinge neede to be confirmed by the Churche of* Peter. And to this ende, you your ſelfe call the Romaine Faith, the Catholique Faith: making no manner difference betweene either other, as if Romaine, and Catholique, were al one. And therfore Pope Nicolas thus auaunceth, and thruſteth out his owne Authoritie: Non quælibet Terrena Sententia, ſed illud Verbum, quo conſtructum eſt Cœlum, & Terra, per quod denique omnia condita ſunt Elementa, Romanam fundauit Eccleſiam: *Not any Worldely Sentence, but the ſelfe ſame Woorde, wherby Heauen, and Earth was made, and whereby all the Elementes were created, hath it, that* founded the Churche of Rome. By whiche woordes he meaneth, that the Romaine Faithe ſhall ſtande as faſte, as the Foundations of Heauen, and Earth. Euen ſo Peter aſſured his Promiſhe vnto Chriſte: Although (ſaide he) *al others denie thee, yet I alone wil neuer deny thee, No, though I ſhould preſently die with thee, yet onely will neuer deme thee.* Neuertheles, when it came to trial, the ſame Peter denied him firſte.

Petr. de Palude De poteſtate curatorum Ar. 6.

M. Har. fo. 16. b. Diſt. 22. Omnes.

Matth. 26.

Nowe, that the Churche of Rome, whiche you call the Catholique Churche, maie erre, and be forſaken of God, it is euidente by the plaine woordes of S. Paule. For thus he writeth euen vnto the Churche of Rome: Quod ſi aliqui ex ramis fracti ſunt &c. *If any of the boughes be broken of, and thou, beinge a wilde Oliue tree art graffed into the naturall Oliue, and made Partaker of the roote, and of the fatneſſe thereof, boaſte not thy ſelfe againſt the boughes. If thou boaſte, (remember) thou beareſt not the Roote: but the Roote beareth the. Thou wilte ſaie, The boughes are broken of, that I might be graffed in. Wel, they are broken of for their Infidelitie: but thou ſtandeſt faſte by Faithe. Be not highe minded: but ſtand in awe. Seeinge God hath not ſhared the Naturall boughes, leſte happily he ſpare not the. See therfore the goodneſſe, and the ſharpeneſſe of God: His ſharpeneſſe towardes them, that are fallen away: but his goodneſſe towardes the, if thou continue, and remaine in goodneſſe.* Otherwiſe (thou being the Churche of Rome) ſhalt likewiſe be ſmitten of. Hereby it is plaine, that the Churche of Rome maie faile, and falle from God, no leſſe, then other like Churches. For otherwiſe this aduertiſment of S. Paule had bene in vaine.

Roman. 11.

Alioqui & in excideres.

The Churche of Rome may erre.

Therefore Hormisda, being himselfe the Bishop of Rome, writeth thus, Dilectissimi Fratres, continuas preces ad Dominum fundamus, & ingi deprecatione poscamus, vt & institutione, & opere illi, cuius esse membra cupimus, adhæreamus, nec vnquam ab illa via, quæ Christus est, deuio tramite declinemus: ne ab eo iuste, quem impie reliquerimus, deseramur: *My dearely beloued Brethren, let vs pray vnto God, that both by profession, and by order of life, we may cleaue to him, whose Members we desire to be: and that by ane crooked path we neuer turne from that way, which is* Christ: least wee (being the Church of Rome) be iustly forsaken of him, whom wickedly we haue forsaken. Thus would not the Pope himselfe haue written to the behoofe of the Church of Rome, if hee had thought the same Church could neuer haue erred.

Hormisda pp ad Episcopos Hespania.

Chrysostom de varijs locis in Math. Hom. 20.

To be short, Chrysostome sayeth, Ecclesia, quocunque modo egerit contra voluntatem Christi, abiici digna est. Non autem abiicitur propter longan imitatem Christi, nisi sola causa Transgressionis: *The* Church, *by what way soeuer she doe against the will of* Christ, *is worthie to be giuen ouer. Yet through the pacience of* Christe, *she is neuer giuen ouer, but onely for breaking his commaundements.*

The Apologie, Cap. 13. Division. 2.

Surely Christ prophesied long before of his Church, that the time shoulde come, when Desolation **shoulde stande in the Holie Place.** *2. Thessa. 2. Daniel. 8.* **And** Saint Paule **sayeth, that** Antichrist **shoulde once sette vp his owne Tabernacle, and stately Seate in the** Temple of God: **and that the time shoulde bee,** when men shoulde not away with Wholesome Doctrine, but bee turned backe vnto fables and lies, **and that within the verie** Churche. Peter **likewise telleth, howe there shoulde be** teachers of lies in the Churche of Christ: Daniel the Prophet **speaking of the latter times of** Antichrist, **Trueth, sayeth he,** in that season shalbe throwen vnder foote, and trodden vppon in the worlde. **And** Christ **sayeth, The calamitie, and confusion of thinges shalbe so exceeding great,** that euen the chosen, if it were possible, shalbee brought into errour: **and that these thinges shall come to passe, not amongest the** Gentiles, and Turkes, **but euen in the** Holy Place **in the** Temple of GOD, **in the** Churche, **and in the** Companie and Felowship **of those, which professe the** Name of Christ.

1. Petri. 2. Daniel. 8.

Math. 24.

M. Harding.

The Prophecie of Daniel concerning the Abomination of Desolation, whereof Christ spake in the Gospel, we thinke, with the * best learned Diuines, that it is to be referred, not to the ende of the worlde, nor to the driuing away of the fayth by Antichrist, as ye imagine, but to the consummation, and finall ending of the Synagogue.

Touching that ye say of Antichrist, it maketh nothing against the Catholiques, against whose Faith he preuaileth not. Marie, many good men thinke, that he hath already begunne to set vp his Tabernacle and stately seate in the hearts of many, which ought to bee the temple of GOD, by his forrenners, Martin Luther, Zwinglius, Caluine, and your their fellowes, with the rest of that wicked rable. Where he adde, **and that within the Churche,** it is * more then ye founde in S. Paule. But we vnderstande your good will, though we finde you without cause good reason. And yet we graunt, ye came out from vs, as S. Iohn saith, but ye were not of vs. For if he had beene of vs, ye woulde haue tarried with vs. So may the saying of S. Peter be referred to you, and likewise that of Daniel, which ye alledge, though the wordes be not in Daniel. For your Schoolemasters find you out a lumme of Antichrist, and ye labour what ye can, to ouerthrow and vnder mine the true Faith of the Churche, and the Catholike Religion.

* vntruth. For the best learned Diuines haue thought otherwise. As it shall appeare. * Vntruth. For S. Paule saith plainely, he shall sit in the Temple of God. 2. *Thessa. 2. 2. Thessal. 2. Nicol. Lyra Hieronim. ad Algasiam Hippolytus Mar.*

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

What needed you, M. Harding, to talke so muche in the fauour of Antichrist? Or, why shoulde you bee greeued, to beare him called the Abhomination of Desolation? S. Paule calleth Antichrist, *the Man of sinne:* Some say, *He shalbe wholly possessed of*

the

the Dwell. Your owne Hippolytus ſayeth, *He ſhall be the Dwell himſelfe.* Yet haue few men found themſelues grieued with ſuch ſayings. Abomination of Deſolatiō.

I knowe, the woordes of Chriſt, and of Daniel, by diuerſe expoſitions, haue beene diuerſly applied. Yet may wee not well thus condemne all their Iudgementes, that haue applied the ſame to Antichriſt. Origen, one of the moſt auncient Fathers of the Church, entreating of Antichriſt, contrarie to your Expoſition, ſayeth thus: Ipſe eſt Abominatio Deſolationis: Antichriſt *is the Abomination of Deſolation.* *Hippolytus Mar. Origen in Matth. Tract. 26.*

Saint Chryſoſtome ſaith, Hic Antichriſtus dicitur Abominatio Deſolationis: quia multorum Chriſtianorum animas facturus eſt deſolatas à Deo: *This* Antichriſt *is called the Abomination of Deſolatiō: for that he ſhal cauſe the ſoules of manie Chriſtians to be deſolate & forſaken of God.* Gregorius Nazianzen. ſaith, Antichriſtus veniet in Deſolatione Mundi. Eſt enim Abominatio Deſolationis: *Antichriſt ſhall come in the Deſolation of the Worlde: For he is the Abomination of Deſolation.* Saint Hierome ſayth, Abominatio Deſolationis intelligi poteſt omne dogma peruerſum: *By the Abomination of Deſolation we may underſtand anie maner peruerſe Doctrine* Whereof, no doubt, in Antichriſt ſhall want no ſtore. And againe, ſpeaking namely of the Man of wickednes, the Aduerſarie of Chriſt, which is Antichriſt, *that liſteth vp himſelfe aboue all, that is called God.* He ſayeth, Abominatio Deſolationum erit in Templo, vſque ad conſummationem temporis: *The Abomination of Deſolation ſhall ſtande in the Church, vntill the conſummation, or ende of time.* *Chry. in Opere imperfecto Homil. 49. Gregor. Nazian. Significatio in Ezechielem. Τὸ γὰρ ἰδίως τῆς ἐρημώσεως. Hieronym. in Mat. cap. 24.*

S. Ambroſe ſayth, Abominatio Deſolationis execrabilis Aduentus Antichriſti eſt: The abomination of Deſolation *is the curſed comming of* Antichriſt. *Amb. in Luc. Li. 10. ca. 21*

S. Hilarie expounding the ſelfe ſame woordes of Chriſt, *When yee ſhall ſee the* Abomination of Deſolation *ſtanding in the Holie Place*, ſayeth thus, De Antichriſti temporibus hæc loquutus eſt: Chriſt *ſpake theſe wordes of the time of* Antichriſt. Likewiſe ſayeth Theodoretus, writing vpon the Prophet Daniel, Abominationem Deſolationis ipſum vocat Antichriſtum. And beſides others, the moſt auncient, and moſt Catholique Fathers, likewiſe ſayeth Euſebius Emiſſenus in a ſpeciall Homilie to this purpoſe. Now M. Harding, where as yee ſo certainly aſſure your ſelfe, that theſe woordes of Chriſt may in no wiſe bee taken of the confuſion, and horrour, that ſhall bee at the ende of the worlde, beſides all theſe Learned, and Godly Fathers, I beſeech you, conſider the whole drift, and circumſtaunce of the place, and the woordes that Chriſt ſpake immediately before: The Apoſtles demaunded him this queſtion: *What ſe the token of thy comming* (to Iudgement) *and of the ende of the worlde?* To this queſtion Chriſt anſwereth in this wiſe: *Take heede that no man deceiue you: Manie ſhall come in my name, and ſhall ſay, I am Chriſt: and ſhall deceiue manie. Yee ſhall heare of warres, and talkes of warres: But be not ye troubled: All theſe things muſt happen:* Yet this is not the ende, &c. *Manie falſe Prophetes ſhall riſe, and ſhall deceiue manie. Iniquitie ſhall increaſe: Charitie ſhall waxe colde. Who ſo continueth vnto the ende, he ſhall be ſaued. And this Goſpel of the Kingdome ſhall be preached in all the worlde, for a witneſſe vnto all Nations*, And then ſhall come the ende. The nexte woordes that follow, are theſe: *Therefore when yee ſhall ſee the* Abomination of Deſolation, *that was ſpoken of by* Daniel, *&c.* *Matth. 24.*

Thus may yee ſee, M. Harding, by the verie courſe and tenour of Chriſtes anſwere, that, if the Iudgement, be the Iudgement: if the Ende, be the Ende: if the Worlde, be the Worlde, then muſt theſe woordes needes haue relation to the Ende of the Worlde: what ſo euer anie of your beſt Learned Diuines, of whome ye haue hitherto named none, haue taught, or ſaide to the contrarie. Whereas wee ſay, Antichriſt ſhall ſtande euen within the Church, That (ye ſay) *we ſaide not' ſi ſayde Paule.* Notwithſtanding, our good will (ye ſay) ye vnderſtande: although yee finde in vs neuer a good reaſon. As for the goodneſſe of our Reaſons, wee will not ſtriue. But whether Saint Paule ſaide, that Antichriſt ſhall ſtande in the Churche, or no, let vs be iudged by Saint Paule. His woordes be plaine, Adeò vt in Templo Dei ſedeat, tanquam Deus: *So that he will ſitte in the Church of God, as if he were God.* If the Church of God, be the Church, then doeth Saint Paule ſay, Antichriſt ſhall ſitte within the Church. In like ſenſe Chriſt ſayeth, Antichriſt ſhall ſitte in the Holie Place: By Antichriſt ſtanding in the Churche of God. *2. Theſſal. 2. Matthæ. 24.*

which

Abomination of Desolatiõ, which wordes manie of the best learned Fathers haue expounded, the Church of God. S. Augustine sayeth, Non enim Templum alicuius Idoli, aut Dæmonis Templum Dei Apostolus diceret: *For the Temple of an Idole, or of a Diuel, the Apostle would neuer call the* Temple of God. And he addeth further, Quidam putant rectius Latinè dici, sicut in Græco est, non in Templo Dei, sed, in Templum Dei sedeat: Tanquam ipse sit Templum Dei, quod est Ecclesia, Sicut dicimus, Sedet in amicum, id est velut amicus: *Some men thinke we should better read it in Latine, as it is in the Greeke, not, He sitteth in* the Temple of God, *but, he sitteth*, For, or, As the Temple of God: As if he himselfe were the Temple of God, which is the Church. *As we say, He sitteth for a Friend, that is, Hee sitteth as a Friend.* Here S. Augustine sayeth, Antichrist shall not onely sitte in the Church, but also shall shewe himselfe in outwarde appearance, as if hee himselfe were the Church it selfe. Nowe, M. Harding who this shoulde bee, I repoꝛt me to youꝛ owne Doctours, of whom one hath written thus, Papa quodammodo virtualiter est tota Ecclæsia: *The Pope in a manner, by waye of vertue, or power, is the whole* Vniuersall Church. Saint Hierome sayeth. Antichristus stabit in loco sancto, id est, in Ecclesia, & se ostendet, vt Deum: Antichrist *shall stande in the Holie place, that is to say, in the Church: and shall shewe himselfe as if he were God.* S. Chrysostome sayeth, Incident in Abomihationem Desolationis, quæ stant in sanctis Ecclesiæ locis: *They shall fall into the Abommation of Desolation, that standeth in the Holie places of the Church.*

August. De Ciuit. Dei li. 20. Cap. 19.

In eodem, ca. 2. Thessal. 2.

Hermans de Potest. Papæ. His præmissi.

Hieronym. in ca. 24. Mat.

Chryso. in Opere imperfecto, Hõ. 49.

S. Hillarie sayeth, Vnum moneo: Cauete Antichristum: Male enim vos parietum amor cœpit: male Ecclesiam Dei in tectis, ædificijsque veneramini. Anne ambiguum est, in iis Antichristum esse sessurum? *One thing I read you: Beware of* Antichrist. *For it is not well, that ye should be thus in loue with walles: It is not well, that ye shoulde honour the Church in houses and buildinges.* Is there anie doubt, but Antichrist shall sit in the same? S. Paule sayeth, Mysterium iniquitatis operatur: (Satan) *woorketh the Mysterie of Iniquitie:* That is to say, he openeth not him selfe, but what so euer he doeth, he doeth it in couert. Upon which woꝛdes Anselmus sayeth, Iniquitas eorum est Mystica, id est Pietatis nomine palliata: *The iniquitie of them is* Mysticall, *that is to say, it is cloked, and couered with the name of Godlinesse.*

Hilarius Cõt. Auxentium.

2. Thess. 2.

Anselmus.

Chrysost. in opere imperfecto. Hom. 49.

Therefore S. Chrysostome sayeth, Christiani qui sunt in Christianitate, volentes accipere firmitatem Fidei veræ, ad nullam rem fugiant, nisi ad Scripturas, &c. *The* Christians, *that be in Christendome, willing to haue the stedfastnesse of the true Faith, let them flee to none other thing, but onely to the Scriptures. Otherwise, if they looke to anie thing else, they shall be offended, and perishe, not knowing which is the true Church: And so shall they fall into the* Abomination of Desolation, that standeth in the Holie places of the Church.

The Apologie, Cap. 14. Diuision. 1 & 2.

Albeit these same warnings alone may suffice a wise man, to take heede, he doe not suffer himselfe rashly to be deceyued with the name of the Church, **and not to stay, to make further inquisition thereof by Gods Woorde, yet besyde all this, many Fathers also, many Learned and Godly men, haue often, and carefully complayned, howe all these things haue chaunced in their life time. For euen in the middest of that thicke myst of darknesse, God would yet there shoulde be some, who, though they gaue not a cleare and bright Light, yet should kindle, were it but some spake, which men, being in the darknesse, might espie.**

Contra Auxentium.

Hilarius, **when thinges as yet were almoste vncoꝛrupt, and in good case too,** Yee are ill deceiued **(sayeth hee)** with the loue of walles: yee doe ill woorshippe the Church: in that yee woorshippe it in houses, and buildinges, yee doe ill bring in the name of Peace vnder rooses.

Is

Is there anie doubt, but Antichriſt will haue his Seate vnder the ſame? I rather recken Hilles, Wooddes, Pooles, Mariſhes, Priſons, and Quauemires, to be places of more ſafetie: for in theſe the Prophetes either abiding of their accorde, or forced thither by violence, did prophecie by the Spirite of God.

Gregorie, **as one, which perceyued, and foreſawe in his minde the wracke of all things, wrote thus of** Iohn **Biſhop** of Conſtantinople **the firſt of al others, that commaunded himſelfe to be called by this new name, The** Vniuerſall Biſhop of Chriſtes whole Church: If the Church, ſayeth hee, ſhall depende vpon one man, it will ſoone fall downe to the ground. **Who is he, that ſeeth not, howe this is come to paſſe long ſithence? For long agone hath the** Biſhop of Rome **willed to haue the** whole Church depend vpon **himſelfe alone. Wherefore it is no marueyle, though it be cleane fallen downe long agoe.** *Gregor. lib. 4. ad Maurit.*

M. Harding.

Yee make a fowle lie, Sir Defender, vpon S. Gregorie. The woordes you recite, be your owne, not his. Is it not inough to lie your ſelfe, as you doe verie often, but that you father lies alſo vpon the Doctours? Thankes be to God, that ſo ye bewray the weakeneſſe of your cauſe. *Neither in any Epiſtle to Iohn Biſhop of Conſtantinople, as you ſay in your Apologie, nor in anie to Mauritius the Emperour, as you haue noted in the margent, writeth Gregorie, *that if the Church ſhall depende vppon one man, the whole ſhall fall to grounde, I ſee well, you woulde faine Gregorie had ſo written. And if he had, yet your argument had beene noughte. For you take not the right *Minor*, which ſhould haue beene this, The Church doeth depende vppon one man, if you woulde make your reaſon good, and after the rules of Logicke: For where your *Minor* ſpeaketh onely of the Popes will, thereof your concluſion followeth not. *Diſpoſe* your propoſitions in the forme of a Syllogiſme, and you ſhall eſpie your owne feeble reaſon. And if you make that your *Minor*, then graunt you that, which you denie.

The woordes whereof you gather this pretenſed ſaying of Gregorie, as I ſuppoſe, be theſe: If anie man hath caught vnto him ſelfe that name (of Vniuerſall Biſhop) in that Church (of Conſtantinople) then the whole Church, (which God forbid) fell from his ſtate, when hee that is called Vniuerſall, fell. Gregorie vnderſtandeth by the name, Vniuerſall Biſhop, as him ſelfe declareth in manie places, (a) ſuch a one, as is a Biſhop altogether and onely, ſo as there bee no other Biſhop beſides him. Nowe if it were graunted, that the Biſhoppe of Conſtantinople were this one, and onely Vniuerſall Biſhop, this inconuenience would followe, that with the fall of that Vniuerſall Biſhop, the Vniuerſall Church alſo fell. For where the Church is, there be Biſhoppes, and where be Biſhoppes, there is the Church: and a (b) Biſhop Vniuerſall, by Gregorie, is as much as all Biſhops. That this beeing graunted, the whole Church is fallen from the Fayth, thus he proueth. For (ſayeth hee) the Biſhoppes of Conſtantinople haue fallen into the gulfe of great and deteſtable Hereſies: as Neſtorius, who thinking Chriſte to bee two perſons, and beleeuing that God could not be made man, ranne to a Iewiſh Infidelitie: and as Macedonius, who denied the Holy Ghoſt to be God. Wherefore if the Biſhop of Conſtantinople be the Vniuerſall Biſhop, according to the ſenſe afore ſayde, then at the fall of him from the Fayth, as when thoſe two before named fell, the Church alſo falleth, as then by this reaſon, when they were Biſhops, it fell. Thus reaſoneth S. Gregorie in that Epiſtle to Mauritius. But becauſe to Gregorie it ſeemeth verie farre from reaſon, and incredible, that the Church ſhould fall from the Fayth, and faile: therefore he inueigheth againſt Iohn the Biſhop of Conſtantinople for chalenging that name of Vniuerſall Biſhop, and concludeth that the (c) Biſhop of that Sea in anie wiſe cannot ſo bee.

But if the woorde Vniuerſall, ſignifie a Soueraintie of charge, and Supremacie of Gouernement ouer the whole Church, (d) which Chriſt committed to Peter, and in Peter to his Succeſſours the Biſhops of Rome, when he ſayde, Feed my ſheepe: in this ſenſe it is not impious nor erronious, nor contrarie to the minde of S. Gregorie, to call the Succeſſour of Peter, Chriſtes Vicar in Earth, the Vniuerſall Biſhop, (e) that is to ſay, the higheſt of all, and hauing power ouer all other Biſhops, and Biſhop of the Vniuerſall Church. And, as Chriſt gaue to S. Peter and his Succeſſours, for the beneſite of his Church, a ſupreme authoritie and power: ſo for the ſame Churches ſake, for whoſe loue he deliuered him ſelfe to death, by petition made to his Father, hee obteyned for him and his Succeſſours the Priuiledge of this ſupreme and moſt excellent grace, that their Fayth ſhould neuer faile. In conſideration of which ſingular priuiledge, obteyned by Chriſt, and (f) graunted to the Sea Apoſtolike, and to none other, Gregorie rebuketh Iohn the Biſhop of Conſtantinople ſo much, as one that preſumptuouſly vſurped that newe name of Vniuerſall Biſhop againſt the ſtatutes of the Goſpel, and againſt the Decrees of the Canons.

To

* Vntruth. For he writeth it often. Read the anſwere.

(a) A manifeſt vntruth without witte.

(b) Vntruth more peeuiſh, then the former.

(c) Vntruth, fond and wilfull. For S. Gregorie ſpeaketh theſe woordes no more of the B. of Conſtantinople, then of the B. of Rome.

(d) Vntruth. For Chriſt neuer gaue out any ſuch Commiſſion.

(e) This ſame was it, that Gregorie reproued: For thus hee writeth. *Cunctis Chriſti Membris ſibi ſtatuere Vniuerſalis appellationis ſuponere: Greg. Lib. 4. Epiſt. 38.*

(f) Vntruth, vtterly voyde of ſhame.

The Vniuerſal Church falleth.

To conclude, if either Gregorie, or anie other man ſhould ſay, that the Church dependeth vpon one man: hee might ſeeme to ſay truth, meaning rightly, and that not alone, nor without good Authoritie. For ſuch a ſaying we finde vttered by S. Hierome. The ſafetie of the Church (ſayeth he) dependeth vpon the dignitie of the Higheſt Priеſt, who if we haue not authoritie peereleſſe and aboue all other, there will be ſo manie Schiſmes in the Church, as there be Prieſtes. VVhich peereleſſe authoritie aboue all other, as S. Hierome in that place doth attribute to (g) the Biſhop of euerie Dioces directly, ſo conſequently to Peters Succeſſour, to whom it was ſayd, Feede my Sheepe. For by what reaſon in eche Dioces it behoueth one Prieſt to be higheſt ouer other Prieſtes, by the ſame and in like proportion no leſſe it behoueth, that in the whole Church one Biſhop bee higheſt ouer other Biſhops. I meane, for auoyding of Schiſmes.

(g) Here M. Har. recanteth his error. For before he ſaid, Theſe wordes belong only to the Pope.

Corrupti ſenſus. Iohan. 5.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

If yee had better looked on your Bookes, M. Harding, yee woulde not haue beene ſo haſtie in dealing Lies. We falſifie not that good Fathers woordes: but report them truely, as we finde them. For thus he writeth in ſundrie places, of Iohn the Biſhop of Conſtantinople, that firſt auanced himſelfe aboue all his Brethren, and required to be called the Vniuerſall Biſhop of all the worlde: Vniuerſa Eccleſia à ſtatu ſuo corruit, quando is, qui appellatur Vniuerſalis, cadit: *The whole vniuerſall Church falleth from her ſtate, when he falleth, that is called the* Vniuerſall Biſhop. This is no Lie, M. Harding: Conferre the places: and ye ſhall finde the woordes, as we report them. It ſtandeth not, neither with your profeſſion, nor with your modeſtie, ſo vncurteouſly to vſe your tongue. We neither Lie our ſelues, nor further Lies vpon the Doctours. God be thanked, his cauſe is ſuch, as may well be maintayned without Lies.

Gregor. lib. 4 Epiſt. 32.

But, to put you further out of doubt, the ſence of theſe woordes ye may finde often vttered by S. Gregorie, in other places. Vnto Anaſtaſius, the Biſhop of Antioche, he writeth thus: Vt de honoris veſtri iniuria taceam, ſi vnus Epiſcopus vocatur Vniuerſalis, Vniuerſa Eccleſia corruit, ſi vnus vniuerſus cadit: *To diſſemble the iniurie done to your Honour, if one Biſhop be called* Vniuerſall, *then if that one Vniuerſall Biſhop fall, the whole Vniuerſall Church goeth to ground.* Againe hee ſayeth in the ſame Epiſtle, Vos eandem cauſam Nullam dicere non debetis. Quia ſi hanc æquanimiter portamus, Vniuerſæ Eccleſiæ Fidem corrumpimus: *Yee may not ſay, This is a matter of no importance. For if we paciently beare theſe thinges, we deſtroy the Faith of the Vniuerſall Church.* Againe hee ſayeth, In iſto Sceleſto vocabulo conſentire, nihil aliud eſt, quàm Fidem perdere: *To conſent vnto this wicked Name, is not hing els, but to looſe the Fayth.* Againe, Flens dico: Gemens denuntio: Quia cum Sacerdotalis Ordo intus cecidit, foris diu ſtare non poterit: *I ſpeake it with teares: I tell it with ſigh of heart: For ſeeing the Order of Prieſthood is fallen within, it cannot now ſtand long without.* Againe, Diabolus ità valide in quibuſdam Eccleſiæ neceſſariis Membris dentes figit, vt nulli ſit dubium, quin niſi vnanimiter, fauente Domino, cunctorum prouida paſtorum turba concurrat, omne, quod abſit, citius ouile dilaniet: *The Diuell ſo ſtrongly faſteneth his teeth in the neceſſary Members of the Church, that, onleſſe by Gods Grace, the prouident companie of all Biſhops ioyne together, there is no doubt, but he will ſoone deſtroy the whole flocke: which God forbid.* And againe he compareth the Pride of this Name with the Pride of Antichriſt: and ſayth, that the one ſhall worke the Confuſion of the Church, no leſſe, then the other. Thus he ſayth, Nunquid non, cùm ſe Antichriſtus veniens Deum dixerit, friuolum valdè erit? Sed tamen nimis perniciоſum. Si quantitatem vocis attendimus, Duæ ſunt Syllabæ: ſi pondus iniquitatis, Vniuerſa pernicies: *When* Antichriſt *ſhall come, and call himſelfe God, ſhall it not be a very trifle? Yet ſhall it be maruellous hurtfull* (to the Church.) *If ye weigh the quantitie of the worde, it ſtandeth in twoo Syllables: If ye conſider the weight of the wickednеſſe,* it is an Vniuerſall deſtruction. Theſe are no Lies, as liketh you to call them, M. Harding: they are verie plaine woordes: it is the vndoubted meaning of S. Gregorie. And therefore he calleth this claime of Vniuerſall power, a Superſtitious, a Profane, an Vngodly, and a Wicked Title: a name of Hypocriſie: and a name of Blaſphemie.

Gregor. lib. 6 Epiſt. 24.

Gregor. in eadem Epiſtola.

Gregor. lib. 4. Epiſt. 39.

Gregor. lib. 4 epi. 32. & 33.

Gregor. lib. 4 Epiſt. 36.

Gregor. lib. 6 Epiſt. 30.

Deus.

To anoyd theſe Authorities, being ſo pregnant, and ſo cleare, ye are faine to faine ſundrie prettie ſhiftes, ſuch as, neither Iohn, nor Gregorie was euer able to vnderſtande.

Firſt yee ſay, This Iohn the Biſhoppe of Conſtantinople, meant by this Title, veterly

One Onely Bishop.

bitterly to disgrade al Bishoppes, and Patriarkes, what so euer: and to make him selfe the Onely Bishop of al the worlde. It is a childishe labour, to sæke a knotte in a rushe, and to imagine doubtes, where the case is cleare. It is certaine, that the Bishop of Constantinople meante none other Vniuersal Authoritie, then that nowe is claimed by the Pope. Therefore it is thus noted in the Booke, called Chronicon Eusebij, Institutum fuit, vt Romana Ecclesia Caput esse Ecclesiarum omnium: cùm priùs Constantinopolitana id vsurpare tentasset: *Order was taken, that the* Churche of Rome shoulde be the Heade of al Churches: *whereas before, the* Churche of Constantinople *had attempted to vsurpe the same.* Whiche thinge is also noted by Matthias Palmerius of Florence, and that without any manner difference, or change of wordes. Sabellicus saithe, Bonifacius. 3. egit ab initio administrationis suæ cum Phoca, vt Romana Ecclesia esset omnium aliarum Caput. Estque id ægrè, nec sine multa contentione Apostolicæ Sedi datum. Græci id ad se decus trahentes, ibi Christianæ Pietatis Arcem esse oportere aiebant, vbi & Imperij: Pope Bonifacius *the thirde, at the firste entrie into his office, was an earneste suiter vnto the* Emperoure Phocas, *that the* Churche of Rome *might be the Heade of al other Churches. Whiche thinge hardly, and with greate labour was graunted to the Apostolique* See of Rome. *The* Græcians *drawinge the same honoure vnto them selues, saide, It was necessarie, the* Heade of Christian Religion *shoulde be there, where as was the Heade of the Empiere: whiche was at* Constantinople.

Chronicon Eusebij. Anno. 607.

Matthias Palmerius.

Sabellicus Ennead. 8. Lib 6.

¶ Thus it plainely appeareth, that the Bishop of Constantinople, and the Bishop of Rome craued bothe for one thinge. Whiche thinge, beinge wicked in the one, cannot wel be godly in the other.

Likewise writeth Vrspergensis: *At the requeste, and suite of* Pope Boniface, Phocas the Emperoure *appointed the See of the Apostolique Churche of Rome, to be the Heade of al Churches. For before that time, the Churche of* Constantinople *wrote her selfe the Firste, or Chiefe of al others.*

Vrspergensis in Phoca.

By these it maie appeare, M. Hardinge, it was greate folie for you, thus to cauil at the name. For the Power, and Iurisdiction, then claimed by the Bishop of Constantinople, and afterwarde vsurped by the Bishoppes of Rome, was al one. Therefore S. Gregorie saithe to Iohn the Bishop of Constantinople, Tu quid Christo Vniuersalis Ecclesiæ Capiti, in Extremi Iudicij dicturus es examine, qui cuncta eius membra tibimet conaris Vniuersalis appellatione supponere? *What answeare wilt thou make, at the trial of the Laste Iudgemente, vnto Christe the Heade of the Vniuersal Churche, whiche thus by the name of* Vniuersal Bishop, *seekeste to make al his Members subiecte vnto thee?* Euen the selfe same Vniuersal power claimeth nowe the Bishop of Rome: and sæketh to make al other Bishoppes through the worlde, and the whole Vniuersal Churche of Christe, thral, and subiecte vnto him selfe.

Gregor. Lib. 4. Epist. 38.

The Bishoppes of Constantinople selfe sommetimes into Heresies, t were detained. *But* Christe *hathe praied for* Peter, *that his Faithe shoulde not faile. Ergo,* saie you, The Bishop of Rome can neuer possibly be deceiued. O, M. Hardinge, let shame once force you to refraine these Vanities. I doubt not, but hereafter in place conuenient I shal be hable to shewe, that there haue benne moe Heretiques placed in S. Peters Chaire, then in the See of Rome, then you are hable to finde in any one See within Europe.

Iustly, S. Gregories reason, touchinge the daunger, and Confusion of the Churche, weigheth nomore againste the Bishop of Constantinople, then againste the Bishop of Rome. For thus he saithe, *If he, that is called the* Vniuersal Bishop, *happen to erre, then needes muste the whole* Vniuersal Churche *fal together with him into Erroure.* And therefore if ye had perused the Councel of Basile, ye shoulde haue founde this selfe same reason alleged there, not againste the Bishop of Constantinople, but againste the Pride, and Arrogancie of the Bishop of Rome. The wordes be these: Alioqui, errante Pontifice, sicut sæpè contigit, & contingere potest, tota erraret Ecclesia: *Otherwise, when so euer the* Pope *erreth, as he hathe often erred, and maie erre againe, the* whole Churche *shoulde erre with him.* Thus wrote the Bishoppes, and, by your owne Iudgemente, Catholique Bishoppes, in the Councel of Basile: yet had they not forgotten the Prayer, that Christe made for S. Peter.

Concil. Basil. in Epist. Synodal.

The Pope him selfe disclaimeth, &c.

And therefore Franciscus Zabarella, a notable Canonist, and Cardinal of the Churche of Rome, seinge the greate enormities, that grewe hereof, saithe thus: Papæ faciunt quicquid libet etiam illicita: & sunt plusquam Deus. Ex hoc infiniti sequuti sunt errores. Quia Papa occupauit omnia iura inferiorum Ecclesiarum: ita vt inferiores Prælati sint pro nihilo. Et, nisi Deus succurrat statui Ecclesiæ, Vniuersalis Ecclesia periclitatur: *The Popes doo now, what so euer they liste to doo, yea although it be vnlawful: and are becomme more then God. Hereof haue folowed infinite Errours. For the* Pope *hathe invaded, and entred vpon al the right of the Inferioure Churches:* so that the inferioure Bishoppes maie goe for nought: *And vnlesse God healpe the state of the Churche,* the Vniuersal Churche is in danger. Thus hitherto, M. Hardinge, ye haue founde no Lie.

Franciscus Zabarella citatur ab Illyrico, De Sectis.

Nowe, where ye would seme to saie, Gregorie so reproued the Bishop of Constantinople, that neuertheles he claimed the same Title, and Vniuersal Authoritie to him selfe: maie it therefore please you herein to stande to the Iudgemente of S. Gregorie him selfe, of whom, I reckon, ye do not doubt, but he vnderstode his owne meaninge. Doubtlesse, if ye had so diligently considered S. Gregorie, as ye beare vs in hande, ye shoulde haue founde, that, touchinge any his owne right herein, he Disclaimeth this Title, and refuseth it vtterly. For so he writeth to the Emperoure Mauritius: Nunquid ego in hac re, pijssime Domine propriam causam defendo? *O my moste Graceous Lorde, doo I herein quarrel for mine owne right?* Againe he saithe, Non mea Causa, sed Dei est: Non ego solus, sed tota turbatur Ecclesia: Quia piæ Leges, quia venerandæ Synodi, quia ipsa Domini nostri Iesu mandata, Superbi, atque pompatici cuiusdam Sermonis inuentione turbantur: *It is Goddes cause: It is not mine. Not I onely am troubled therewith, but also the Whole Churche. For the Godly Lawes, the Reuerende Synodes, and the very Commaundementes of our Lorde Iesu are broken by the inuention of a certaine prowde, and pompouse Name.* Againe, Nullus Romanorum Pontificum hoc Singularitatis Nomen assumpsit: Nullus Decessorum meorum hoc tam profano vocabulo vti consensit: Nos hunc honorem nolumus oblatum recipere: *None of al the* Bishoppes of Rome *euer tooke vpon him this name of* Singularitie, *to be called the* Vniuersal Bishop: *None of my Predecessours euer consented to vse this Vngodly style: We our selues wil not receiue this honoure, though it were offered.* Thus it appeareth by the Iudgement of S. Gregorie, that this Vniuersal Authoritie is vtterly vnlawful, not onely in other Bishoppes, but also euen in the Bishop of Rome.

Gregor. Lib. 4. Epist. 32.

In eadem Epist.

In eadem.

Gregor. Lib. 4. Epist. 36.

Touchinge the place of S. Hierome, I se, ye are contente to geue ouer, and to recante your former errour. For in your Firste Booke, ye saie, These woordes are Notable aboue others: and therefore might not be dissembled. And where S. Hierome saithe, The safetie of the Churche *hangeth of the Dignitie of the Highe Priestе* (meaninge thereby euery seuerall Bishop within his owne Limites) ye thought it good, thus to larde the same, by a proper parenthesis, with certaine other special stuffe, of your owne prouision: He meaneth the Pope, Peters Successour: as if this Highe Priest, of whom S. Hierome writeth, could be none other, but the Bishop of Rome. Now vpon some better aduise, and by waie of Retractation, ye saie thus, This peereles Authoritie aboue al others, S. Hierome dothe attribute to the Bishop of euery Diocese: Which in deede was the very meaninge of S. Hierome. Certainely, if S. Hierome, by these woordes, meante Onely the Bishop of Rome, as ye tolde vs before, then he meante not the Particulare Bishop of euery Diocese, as ye tel vs nowe. Therefore ye muste nedes confesse, that either nowe, or before, ye haue sought meanes to beguile your Reader. As for the Pope, Peters Successoure, S. Hierome meante nomore of him, then of any other Bishop. If it shal likewise hereafter please you, to calle in other your like ouersightes, ye shal publishe more truthe, and encumber your Reader with lesse Errour.

M. Hard. fol. 80.

The Apologie, Cap. 14. Diuision. 3.

Bernarde the Abbate, aboue foure hundred yeres paste, writeth thus: Nothinge is nowe sincere, and pure emongest the Cleregie: wherefore it resteth, that the Man of Sinne shoulde be reueled. The same Bernarde in his Treatie of the Conuersion of S. Paule,

It

It ſeemeth nowe, ſaithe he, that Perſecution hath ceaſed: no, no, perſecution ſeemeth but nowe to beginne, and that euen from them, whiche haue chiefe preeminence in the Churche. Thy friendes and neighbours, O God, haue drawen neere, and ſtoode vp againſte thee: from the ſole of the foote to the crowne of the heade, there is no parte whole. Iniquitie is proceeded from the Elders, the Iudges and Deputees, whiche pretende to rule thy people. We cannot ſaie nowe, Looke howe the people is, ſo is the Prieſte. For the people is not ſo il, as is the Prieſte. Alas, alas, O Lorde God, the ſelfe ſame perſons be the chiefe in perſecutinge thee, whiche ſeeme to loue the Higheſt place, and beare moſte rule in thy Churche. The ſame Bernarde againe vpon the Canticles writeth thus: Al they are thy friendes: yet are thei al thy foes: Al thy kinnesfolke: yet are they al thy aduerſaries. Beinge Chriſtes ſeruauntes, thei ſerue Antichriſt. Beholde in my reſte, my bitterneſſe is moſte bitter.

The Apologie, Cap. 15. Diuiſion. 1.

Roger Bacon alſo, a man of greate fame, after he had in a vehement Oration touched to the quicke the woeful ſtate of his owne time, Theſe ſo many errours, ſaithe he, require, and looke for Antichriſte. *In Libello de Idiomate linguarum.*

Gerſon complaineth, that in his daies al the Subſtance, and efficacie of Sacred Diuinitie was brought vnto a glorious contention, and oſtentation of wittes, and very Sophiſtrie. The poore menne, called pauperes à Lugduno, menne, as touchinge the manner of theire life, not to be miſliked, were woonte boldely to affirme, that the Romiſhe Churche (from whence alone al Counſel, and Order was then ſought) was the very ſame Harlot of Babylon, and rowte of Diuels, whereof is Prophesied ſo plainely in the Apocalyps.

M. Hardinge.

Nowe commeth me he in with a newe bande, whiche conſiſteth of tagge and ragge, and a weake companie, God knoweth, they be to ſhewe theire faces againſte the Catholike Churche, whiche (as the Holy Ghoſt ſpeaketh by Salomon) is terrible like an armie of men ſet in bataile raie.

Firſte frier Bacon the Coniurer, and Negromanſer, as commonly they ſaie of him, he is ſet in the forewarde, a man of greate fame forſoothe.

Then commeth in the good plaine father Gerſon, a writer in our Graundefathers time, he complaineth, that Friers and ſtudentes gaue them ſelues too muche to the vnprofitable ſubtilitie of Scholaſtical queſtions. What maketh this againſte the faithe of the Churche?

After theſe, this Defender placeth in an outwinge the falſe bretherne of Lions, commonly called Waldenſes, or *Pauperes de Lugduno*, notorious Heretikes condemned of the Churche. Theſe beinge deteſtable Heretikes condemned of the Churche, wee recken not what they ſaie, no more then what Luther ſaieth, what Zuinglius, what Caluine, what theſe Defenders them ſelues ſaie, what Antichriſte, what Sathan ſaieth. For the enimies of Goddes truthe maie not be admitted to geue witnes againſte the Truthe.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Of theſe laſte Authorities, whiche ye calle tagge, and ragge, we never made any greate accoumpte. Notwithſtandinge bothe Iohannes Gerſon, and Rogerus Bacon, were notable, and famouſe in theire times, and in al reſpectes comparable then with the beſte. Plaine Father Gerſon (for by ſutche wordes ye thought it beſte to quaſſe his credite, beinge otherwiſe counpted a ſuttle diſputer, and a profounde Schole Doctoure) was Chauncellar of the Vniuerſitie of Pariſe: and for his

wisdome, and Learninge, was thought worthy to be the Director of al the Bishoppes in the Councel of Constance, that is to saie, al the Bishoppes of the worlde. Sutche a Poore, Simple, plaine Father was Father Gerson.

Rogerus Bacon, as it appeareth by his Booke, De Idiomate Linguarum, was hable to iudge of the Latine, Greeke, and Hebrewe tongues: and bisides diuerse other Bookes, writeth also sundrie Epistles vnto Pope Clement: wherein he mutche complaineth of the ruine, and Confusion of the Churche. Certainely the weakest of these bothe, hath more weight, and substance, then either your Amphilochius, or your Abdias, or your Hippolytus, or your Leontius, or your Anacletus, or your Pope Clemens, whom ye so often cal the Apostles felowe.

Howe be it, there is no man so simple, but maie beare witnesse to the Truthe. Clemens Alexandrinus, Lactantius, Arnobius, Eusebius, S. Augustine, and other Holy Fathers, thought it no preiudice to theire cause, to allege the witnesse of the Frantique Sibylles: S. Paule allegeth the Authorities of the Heathen Poëtes, Aratus, Menander, Epimenides, that never knewe God: Christe thought it no scorne, to receiue witnesse at Infantes mouthes: No, he refused not the Deuels, when they beare witnesse with him, and saide, *Wee knowe, that thou arte Christe the Sonne of the Liuinge God.* Pauperes à Lugduno founde faulte with the Pride of the Pope: with the lewde life of the Cleregie: with Purgatorie: with Holy VVater: with Pardons: and with other your like deceiuinges of the people.

Æneas Syluius in Historia Boemica.

They translated the Bible: and prated in their natural knowen mother tongue. Theise were theire Errours: Therefore were they called detestable Heretiques: therefore were they condemned by your Churche of Rome. But Goddes name be blessed for euer. Sithence that time the Popes painted power hath stil abated: and theise poore detestable condemned Heretiques haue stil encreased.

The Apologie, Cap. 15. Diuision. 2.

I knowe wel ynoughe the Authoritie of theise foresaide persons wilbe but lightly regarded amongest theise menne. Howe then if I calle foorthe those for witnesse, whome they them selues haue vsed to honour? What if I saie, that Adrian the Bishop of Rome did frankly confesse, that al theise mischiefes braste out firste from the highe Throne of the Pope of Rome?

M. Hardinge.

* Here haue wee a man of strawe set vp, whome this defender nameth Adrian Bishop of Rome. He geueth him a waze of strawe in his hande, that a farre of seemeth to be a soare weapon, taken out of the armorie of Platyna (a) as is pretended. But when ye come neare and beholde what felow this is, and conferre with Platyna, touchinge his weapon, ye see it to be a fained thinge. For there is no suche saieing by Platyna attributed to any of the (b) sixe Adrians Bishoppes of Rome (b) whose liues he writeth. And moe there were not. Therefore where you saie, **what if I saie, that Adrian, &c.** I answeare thereto, that if you so saie, you saie a false lie.

(a) A great folie For Platyna was dead threescoare yeeres before Adrian. 6. was Pope.

(b) Vntruthe vaine, & vnaduised. For Platyna writeth not one worde of Adriane the sixthe.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Touchinge this prettie fantie of a man of Cloutes, and a waze of strawe, I see wel, M. Hardinge, ye thought it good policie, to clowte vp the mater, and to satisfie your Reader with a strawen answeare. The strawe was in your eies, M. Hardinge, and not in the man. Ye stode to far aluffe: your eies daseled: and therefore ye knew not, what ye sawe. If ye had drawen neare, ye should some haue founde your owne errour. It was no man of strawe, but Pope Adrian the firthe, I saie, that we speake of: Onlesse ye thinke the Popes Holinesse to be a man of strawe. For thus he pronounced at Norinberg in Germanie in the greate assemblie of the Empiere, by the mouthe of Cheregatus his Legate à Latere. A Sacerdotibus iniquitatem populi dimanare: multis nunc annis, grauiter, multisque modis peccatum esse Romæ: & inde à Pontificio Culmine malum hoc atq; luem ad inferiores omnes Ecclesiarum Præfectos defluxisse: Thus Pope Adrian bade his Legate saie, *That the iniquitie of the people grewe from the Priestes: And that nowe, for the space of many yeeres, there haue benne great, and grieuous offenses committed in Rome: And that al this plague, and mischiefe hath flowed vnto*

Iohan. Sleidanus Li. 4. Anno. 1523

al the

Rome the roote of il-

al the Inferioure Rulers of the Churche, euen from the Highe Throne of the Popes Holineſſe. This ſame ſtorie is alſo extante, printed at Colaine in a Booke called Faſciculus rerum Sciendarum.

Faſciculus rerũ Sciendarum.

Thus therefore once againe wee ſaie, M. Hardinge, that Pope Adrian 6 frankely confeſſed, that al theſe miſchiefes proceeded firſte euen from the Throne, or Seate of the Popes Holineſſe: and, ſaieinge the ſame, notwithſtandinge your vnciuile ſpeache, wee ſaie no Lie.

And, leſte ye ſhoulde thinke, this Legate Cheregatus, either of forgetefulneſſe, or of malice, did his errante otherwiſe, then he had in Commiſſion, the like wordes haue ſithence benne vttered in your owne late Chapter at Tridente, by Cornelius the Biſhop of Bitonto. Theſe they be: Effecerunt tandem, vt Pietas in Fucum, & Hypocriſim, &c. *They haue broughte to paſſe, that Godlineſſe is turned into Hypocriſie: and that the Sauoure of Life is turned into the Sauoure of Deathe. Woulde God they were not gonne wholy with general conſente, from* Religion to Superſtition: from Faithe, to Infidelitie: from Chriſte to Antichriſte: from God, to Epicure: *ſaieinge with wicked harte, and filthy mouthe, There is no God.* Neither hath there benne this greate while any Paſtoure, or Pope, that regarded theſe thinges. For they al (bothe Pope, and others) ſought their owne: and not ſo mutche as one of them (neither Pope, nor Cardinal) ſought for the thinges, that perteine to Ieſus Chriſte.

Cornel. Bitontinus in Concil. Tridenti.

Therefore, M. Hardinge, ye maie henceforthe ſpare your Vnſauery, and bitter ſpeaches: For in theſe reportes there is no Lie.

The Apologie, Cap. 15. Diuiſion. 3.

Pighius acknowlegeth herein to be a faulte, that many Abuſes are brought in, euen into the very Maſſe, whiche Maſſe otherwiſe he would haue ſeeme to be a moſte reuerende matter. Gerſon ſaithe, that throughe the number of moſte fonde Ceremonies, al the Vertue of the Holy Ghoſte, whiche ought to haue ful operation in vs, and al true godlineſſe is vtterly quenched, and deade. Whole Græcia, and Aſia complaine, howe the Biſhoppes of Rome with the martes of theire Purgatories & Pardonnes, haue bothe tormented mennes Conſciences, and piked theire purſes.

M. Hardinge.

In deede Pighius in his ſixthe controuerſie, ſpeakinge of priuate Maſſes, denieth not but certaine abuſes be creapte into that moſte Holy and moſte healthful thinge, for ſo he ſpeaketh. And addinge further, wee knowe (ſaithe he) to what man, and to what men it perteineth the ſame to correct. And let eche man acknowledge his one meaſure, and vnderſtande his dutie. As who ſhoulde ſaie, it is not meete for euery man to take vpon him to amende any thinge that is amiſſe aboute the Maſſe. For he meaneth not that the Maſſe it ſelfe is erroneous, as ful wel there he declareth: but that menne be faulty in abuſinge that moſte Holy Sacrifice. For many come to the Aulter, vnworthely. Many be preſente at it, that ought not to come within the Churche dores. Some Prieſtes be of ſo lewde liues, and of ſo vnreuerente behauioure at it, as it were better they abſtained. Albeit, I thinke, he meante rather ſutche abuſes, as the Learned Fathers of the prouincial Councel of Coulen woulde to be amended: to witte, certaine peculiar offices of Maſſes deuiſed by menne of late yeeres beſides the ordinance of the Ancient forefathers.

As for the other greate troupe ye bringe with you out of Græce and Aſia, firſte, wee require you to make them agree with your ſelues, and with the Catholique Churche aboute the proceſſion of the Holy Ghoſte, and then wee ſhal anſweare bothe you, and them concerninge your greuous matter of Purgatorie and Pardons. It is not our manner to take the ſaieinges of Heretikes for good and ſufficient Auctoritie.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

In deede, M. Hardinge, here ye hewe ouer bigbe. Ye take vpon you to make vs vnderſtande Pighius meaninge: and yet by your owne confeſſion it appeareth, ye neuer knewe your ſelfe, what he meante. Ye ſaie, He founde faulte with the vnworthineſſe, either of the Prieſtes, or of the people, **ye knowe not, whether:** or with ſomewhat els, noted in the late Chapter of Colaine, **ye knowe not, what. Yet what ſo euer it**

shal please you to imagine, ye thinke, you haue wronge, if we beleue you not immediately vpon your worde. But Pigghius him selfe, whose tale ye wouide so faine tel, saithe not, as you would make him saie, Abuses haue creapte into the Prieste, or people. But plainely, and simply he saithe, Errours haue creapte into the Masse.

Extra. de Translatione Episcopi Quãto in Glosſ. Extra. De Concess. prębende. Proposuit: In Glosſa.

Howbe it, These Errours (ye saie) what so euer they be, no man maie redresse, but onely the Pope. And good cause, why. For your Doctours saie, Papa ex nihilo potest facere aliquid: *The* Pope *of nothinge can make sommethinge*. And, what so euer he do, no man maie saie vnto him, Domine, cur ita facis? Syr, why doo you so? And the very barte, and rote of al your Diuinitie of Louaine, is this, Christe hathe praied for Peter: *Ergo*, the Pope can neuer erre. But if ye meane plainely, and, if there be no dissimulation, nor hypocrisie in your wordes, tel me, I beseche you, euen as you desire to be beleeued, Of al the Errours that Pigghius meante, for the space of these fourtie yeres, what one Erroure hath the Pope redressed?

There is no plainenesse in this dealinge, M. Hardinge. Your minde is not to seeke redresse, be the faulte neuer so euidente: but stil to continue your selues in credite, and the worlde in errour.

Dist. 22. Omnes.

Al the Christians of Græcia, and Asia (ye saie) be Heretiques: and therefore ye recke not, what they saie. No doubte: for they saie, The Pope is not the Heade of the Churche, Which thinge who so euer denieth, saithe Pope Nicolas, muste needes be holden as an Heretique. Thomas Aquinâs for that good affection, and reuerence, he bare towardes the Pope, saithe thus, Dicere, Papam non habere Vniuersalis Ecclesiæ Primatum, est error similis errori dicentium, Spiritum Sanctum à Filio non procedere: *To saie, that the Pope hath not the* Primacie of the Vniuersal Churche, *it is an Erroure like vnto the Erroure of them, that* (mainteine Heresie touchinge the Holy Trinitie, and) *saie*, The Holy Ghoste proceedeth not from the Sonne of God. Of your readinesse herein

Ludouicus Viues in Li. 13. De Ciuitate Dei, ca. 24

Ludouicus Viues witteth thus, Augustinum Vetustas sua tuetur. Qui si reuiuisceret cum Paulo, certè ille contemptui esset Rhetorculus, aut Grammaticulus: Paulus verò vel insanire, vel Hæreticus videretur: S. Augustine *is safe nowe bicause of his age. But if he, and* Paule *were aliue againe, he shoulde be shaken of as a bad Rhetorician, or a poore Grammarian*. But S. Paule shoulde be taken, either for a madde man, or for an Heretique. Wée maie saie of this generation, as S. Augustine saide of certaine in his time, Quicquid amant: volunt esse Veritatem: *What so euer thinge thei fansie, be it what it maie be, the same thei wil haue to be the Truthe.*

Augst. Cõfess. Li. 10. Ca. 23.

Nowe iudge you, M. Hardinge, what Churche of yours is this, where as S. Paule, the Apostle of Christe, if he were nowe aliue, shoulde goe for an Heretique. Vesputius, as I remember, after he had trauailed far, and had séene the Manners, and Religions of many Countries, saithe thus, Græci implicati sunt multis Erroribus: *The* Greekes *are entangled with many Errours:* But he addeth withal, Faxit Deus, ne & Latinis multæ irrepserint Stultitiæ: *God graunte, there be not many folies entred also into the Churche of Rome.*

Paulus Æmylius Pantaleon.

Surely, the Christian menne, that be this date in Græcia, and Asia, vtterly abhorre the Pope, with al the deformities of his Churche. The Greeke Emperoure Michael Palæologus, for that he had submitted him selfe to the Pope, in the Late Councel of Florence, was therefore afterwarde abhorred, and hated of his people, while he liued: and beinge deade, was forebidden Christian Burial. Isidorus the Archebishop of Kiouia in Rusia, for that, beinge returned from the saide Councel, he beganne for vnities sake, to moue the people to the like submission, was therfore deposed from his Bishoprike, and put to deathe. In suche reuerence the Churches of Asia, and Græcia haue this date the Churche of Rome.

Matthias à Michouia, in Nouo Orbe.

The Apologie, Cap. 16. Diuision. 1.

As touchinge the Tyrannie of the Bishops of Rome, and their Barbarous Persianlike Pride, to leaue out others, whome perchaunce thei recken for enimies, bicause thei freely, & liberally finde faulte with their vices, the same men, whiche haue leadde their life at Rome in the Holy Citie, in the face of the moste Holy Father, who also were

hable to see al theire secretes, and at no time departed from the Catholique Faithe, as for example, Laurentius Valla, Marsilius Patauinus, Fraunciſe Petrarke, Hierome Sauanorola, Abbate Ioakim, Baptiſte of Mantua, and before al these, Bernarde the Abbate, haue many a time and mutche complained of it, geeuinge the worlde also sommetime to vnderstande, that the Bishop of Rome him selfe (by your leaue) is very Antichriſte. Whether they spake it truely, or falsely, let that goe: sure I am, they spake it plainely. Neither canne any man allege, that those Authoures were Luthers, or Zvvinglius Scholars: for they liued not onely certaine yeeres, but also certaine ages ere euer Luther, or Zvvinglius names were heard of.

M. Hardinge.

If this Defender were compared to a mad dogge, some perhaps woulde thinke it rude, and an vnmanerly compariſon. Let the man be as he is, who so euer he be: verily the manner and fashion of bothe is like, howe so euer I be contente, his perſone be honoured with the due regarde of a man. For as the madde Dogge runneth vp and downe, here and there, and nowe byteth one thinge, and then an other, snappeth at man and beaſte, and reſteth not in one place. So this Defender, to deface the Churche, sheweth him selfe to haue a very vnquiet heade. Nowe he ronneth at the Biſhop of Rome, then at the whole Cleregie. Nowe he barketh at errours in Doctrine, and sheweth none, then he snappeth at manners, and backebyteth mennes liues. Nowe he bringeth foorth Scriptures, and them he ſtretcheth and racketh, but they reache not home. Then commeth he to the Doctoures, and maketh them of his side whether they wil, or no. From Doctours he runneth to Conjurers, to riminge Poetes, and to Heretikes them selues. I thinke they had rather run to the Turkes, then the Catholike Faithe shoulde be receiued. And here leauinge that he tooke in hande to proue, that the Churche erreth in neceſſary Doctrine, he flingeth at the Tyrannie and pride of the Biſhops of Rome, and bringeth in for witneſſe againſte them, white and blacke, good and bad. So he hurte them, he careth not howe, by what meanes, ne by what persons.

Firſte to geat credit, he vttereth a manifeſt lie, saying of them al, they leadde their life at Rome in the Holy Cittie vnder the noſe of the moſte Holy Father, and might see al his secretes, and neuer foreſooke the Catholike Faithe. His witneſſes be theſe. Laurentius Valla, Marsilius of Padua, Francis Petrarche, Hierome Sauonarola, Ioachim Abbot, Baptiſte of Mantua, and S. Bernarde, whome of spite he calleth Bernarde the Abbot. Nowe let vs see howe many lies here be made at once. VVhereas of al theſe (a) neuer a one leadde his life at Rome, but Laurence Valla, who was a Canon of Laterane, and this Defender saith that al did: there is one lie. That al theſe might see the Popes secretes, there be two lies. That none of theſe foreſooke the Catholike Faithe, (b) there be three lies. As for Laurence Valla, he was not in euery pointe very sounde, as it appeareth in his Booke of Free wil, and in his Annotations vpon the newe Teſtamente. In al thinges he handled, he shewed him selfe newe sangled, rather then groundedly learned, as wel in Grammer and Logike, as in Diuinitie.

But Marsilius of Padua, to pleaſe the Emperoure Ludouicus Bauarus, who liued aboue twoo hundred yeeres paſte, through malice conceiued againſte Pope Iohn the xxij. of whome the said Ludouicus was for iuſte cauſes excommunicate, went so farre in schiſme, (c) as at length he fel into Hereſie. And Abbote Ioachim, whiles he reproued Peter Lombarde, (d) vttered Hereſie contrarie to the Catholike Faithe, touchinge the Trinitie: and therefore his Booke was condemned by the Churche, though his perſone was not condemned, becauſe he ſubmitted him selfe, and his writinges to the iudgemente of the Holy Romaine Churche, as we finde in the Decretals. That al theſe haue greately and often complained of the Biſhoppes of Rome theire tyrannie and pride, (e) there be foure lies. That they declared the Pope him selfe to be very Antichriſte, (f) there be fiue lies. And whereas, to make this shameleſſe lie, you aske leaue, so wee aske leaue of you to telle it you, and to chalenge you of a lie, and saie plainely vnto you, that speakinge of them al, you belie them, and that you shal neuer be hable to proue that you saie of them.

Item, de Summa trinit. & fide Cathol. Cap. 2.

Francis Petrarch the Italian poete, and Baptiſte of Mantua the Latine Poete, speake like poetes, eche of them once in theire woorkes againſte the euil manners of the Courte of Rome. But what prouſe maketh al this, that the Romaine Churche, that is to saie, the VVeaſte Church, whiche onely remaineth, and euer hath remained whole and sounde of faithe, erreth in Doctrine? Or, what Argumente can you gather out of al theſe, I wil not saie againſte the life, but againſte the office, Auctoritie, and Dignitie of the Biſhop of Rome? The argumente you can make hereupon is this, Poetes reprehende the Vices of the Courte of Rome: *Ergo*, the Pope is Antichriſte. *Or, Ergo*, the Catholike Churche erreth, and is to be foreſaken. VVhat force is in this reason, euery reaſonable man, be he neuer so meane of witte, maie soone iudge.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Your Comparison of Madde Dogges, M. Hardinge, becommeth wel the reſte

Of itſ of your

(a) Vntruth. For Mantuane dwelt in Rome. Petrarcha was made Poete in Rome: Sauanorola was oftē in Rome, &c.

(b) Vntruth. Otherwiſe shewe wherein they foreſooke the Faithe.

(c) Vntruthe Otherwiſe shewe in what Article he was an Heretique.

(d) This is vncertaine Reade Luther touching the same.

(e) Vntruth. For this wil soone appeare.

(f) Vntruth. For by moſte expreſſe woordes they cal him Antichriſte.

of your Courteous eloquence. Who so shal marke, howe vainely you snappe at, what so euer ye can imagine, is in your waie: nowe at our Logique: nowe at our Rhetorique: nowe at our Greeke: nowe at our Latine: nowe at our Lamenesse: nowe at our leane Cheekes: nowe at our thinne Beardes: nowe at our Superintendentshippes: nowe at our Ministershippes: nowe at our Maistershippes: nowe at our Mathippes, (for this is the sobrietie, and grauitie of your speache:) and further howe grædily, and egrely ye fasten your tæthe, and fæde your selfe with Winde, and are stil snappinge, and catche nothinge: although in regarde of manhode he spare to calle you a Madde Dogge, as it liketh you to calle others, yet he maie wel thinke you scarcely to be a sober man.

Christe founde faulte, sommetime with the Bishoppes: Sommetime with the Priestes: Sommetime with the Scribes: Sommetime with the Phariseis: Sometime with the People: Sometime with their Religion: Sometime with their Traditions: Sometime with their Ignorance: Sometime with their Praiers: Sommetime with their Fastinges: Sometime with their Life: Sometime with their Hipocrisie: Sometime with their Crueltie: And thus in your fantasie, he ranne hither, and thither, vp, and downe. Yet, I trowe, ye wil not touche him with your Comparisons, nor saie therefore, as ye saie to vs, he had a very vnquiet Heade.

Who so hathe eies to see, and considereth the miserable Abuses of the Church of Rome, touchinge either Life, or Religion, cannot lightly waute iuste mater to reprone. Yée remember, what Churche it is, whereof S. Bernarde saithe, A planta pedis, vsque ad verticem Capitis, non est Sanitas vlla: Non est iam dicere, vt Populus, sic Sacerdos. Quia nec sic Populus, vt Sacerdos: *There is not one whole place from the sole of the foote, to the toppe of the Heade. Wee maie not nowe saie, As is the* People, *so is the* Priestе: *For the People is nothinge so il, as is the Priestе.*

Bernerdus in Conuersione Pauli, Serm. 1.

Ye saie, These witnesses dwelt not in Rome: and here in a smal mater, ye haue noted a great Lie. Howe be it, Bernarde the Abbate, that dwelt furthest of, was twise in Rome, and was Chiefe of Counсel with Pope Innocentius in his greatest affaires. Franciscus Petrarcha was made Poete in the Capitol, and keepte Laura his Concubine in the eie of the Pope, & had his moste aboade in Rome. Laurentius Valla was Canon of the Cathedral Church in Laterane, and leadde his Life, and died in Rome. Wickelp, S. Bernarde onelp excepted, al the reste were Italians, and dwelt neuer far from Rome: and, as it maie appeare by the plapneuesse of their speache, vnderstode somme parte of the deepest Secretes of the Churche of Rome.

Gulielm. Abb. in Vita Bernard. Raphael. Volaterran.

Marsilius Patauinus, ye saie, was an Heretique. But what one Heresie he defended, or before what Judge he was conuicted, or where he was either abiured, or pounished for the same, neither you, nor any of al your Fellowes haue hitherto tolde vs. Therefore we moste thinke, He was an Heretique without Heresie: As somme men be Doctours without Diuinitie.

Marsilius Patauinus.

Ioachimus Abbas founde faulte with the Bishop of Rome, And therefore he muste nedes be an Heretique. As for that he is charged in the Popes Decretalles with errour, touchinge the Trinitie, it is a greate vntruthe: as ye maie clearely perceiue by a Booke, that Martin Luther hathe pourposely written in his Defense.

Ioachimus Abb. Extra. De Summa Trinitate, & Fide Catholica damnamus.

Certainely Laonicus Chalcocondyla, a Greeke Writer, giueth vnto this Ioachimus a very worthy Commendation. For thus he saithe of him: De Pontificibus, Ioachimus Abbas, &c. Ioachimus *the Abbate, regarded emonge the Learned in* Italie, *as a man of a singulare gifte in Propheſie, foretolde many thinges of the Popes, how they shoulde comme to the Popedome, and howe they shoulde liue. And as he spake, euen so it came to passe. As touchinge his knowledge he seemed to be a Heauenly man.*

Laonicus Chalcocondyla, Li. 6.

But, to comme neare the mater, and to speake of the thinge, that most misliketh you, S. Iohn saithe, Antichriste *shal sitte in a Cittie builte vpon seuen Hilles:* (and so is the Cittie of Rome). Irenæus saithe, *The number of* Antichristes *Name shalbe expressed by this woorde* Latinus, whereby, it is likely, is meante the Bishop of Rome. Sibylla saithe, *The greateste terroure, and furie of his Empiere, and the greateste woe, that he*

Plane diuinus. Apocal. p. 17. Virgil. Septemq; vna sibi muro circumdabit Arces. Iren. li. 5. ca. vlt. Sibylla. Oratio-

shal

ſhal woorke, ſhal be by the banks of Tyber. And there is Rome. Theſe circumſtances ſæme plainely to paínte out the Cittie of Rome. S. Hierome ſaithe, Antichriſtus ſedebit in Templo Dei: vel Hieroſolymis, vt quidam putant: vel in Eccleſia, vt verius arbitramur: Antichriſte *ſhal ſitte in the Temple of God, either at* Hieruſalem, *as ſomme thinke:* or els in the Churche (of God) it ſelfe: whiche wee take to be the *truer meaning.* S. Gregorie ſaithe, Ego fidenter dico, quòd quiſquis ſe Vniuerſalem Sacerdotem vocat, vel vocari deſiderat, in elatione ſua Antichriſtum præcurrit: *I ſpeake it boldely: who ſo euer calleth him ſelfe the* Vniuerſal Prieſte, *or deſireth ſo to be called,* (as doth the Pope) *in the Pride of his harte he is the* Forerenner of Antichriſte.

ne 8. λυγρᾶις πραχθέϛοις ἄνος ὀχθαις. *Hieronymus ad Algaſiam. Gregor. Lib. 6. Epiſt. 30.*

And when Iohn, then Biſhop of Conſtantinople, had firſte entred his claime vnto this title, S. Gregorie made anſwcare vnto the ſame, Ex hac eius Superbia, quid aliud, niſi propinqua iam eſſe Antichriſti tempora deſignatur? *By this Pride of his, what thinge els is ſignified, but that the time of* Antichriſti *is euen at hande?*

Gregor. Lib. 4. Epiſt. 34.

Againe he ſaithe vpon occaſion of the ſame, Rex Superbiæ propè eſt: &, quod dici nefas eſt, Sacerdotum eſt præparatus exercitus: *The Kinge of Pride* (that is Antichriſte) *is commynge to vs: and an Armie of Prieſtes is prepared: whiche thinge is wicked to be ſpoken.* S. Hierome ſaithe, Antichriſtus omnem Religionem ſuæ ſubijciet Poteſtati: Antichriſte *ſhal cauſe al Religion to be ſubiecte to his Power.*

Gregor. Lib. 4. Epiſt. 34. Hieronymus ad Algaſiam.

I wil not here take vpon me to deſcrie, either the Perſone, or the dwellinge place of Antichriſt. Who ſo hath eies to ſée, let him ſée. Theſe Circumſtances agree not vnto many. S. Paule ſaith, Antichriſt *woorketh the Myſterie, or ſecrete practiſe of* Iniquitie. Whereupon the Gloſe ſaith, Myſtica eſt Impietas Antichriſti, id eſt, Pietatis nomine palliata: *The Wickednеſſe of* Antichriſte *is Myſtical: that is to ſaie,* (It is not plaine, and open, or eaſie to be eſpied of euery body, but) *cloked vnder the name of Godlineſſe.* And your Gloſe vpon S. Paule vnto Timothe, ſaithe thus, Habentes Speciem Pietatis, id eſt, Chriſtianæ Religionis: *Hauinge a ſhewe of Godlineſſe, that is to ſaie, a ſhewe of the Religion of Chriſte.* So Myſtical ſhal Antichriſte be in al his dealinge. And, for as mutche as M. Hardinge thinketh, wee miſallege theſe Writers, & violently force them to our ſide, whether they wil, or no. S. Bernarde ſaith thus, Beſtia illa de Apocalypſi, cui datum eſt os loquens Blaſphemias, & bellum gerere cum Sanctis, Petri Cathedram occupat, tanquam Leo paratus ad prædam: *The Beaſte, that is ſpoken of in the* Booke of Reuelations, *vnto which beaſte is geeuen a mouthe to ſpeake Blaſphemies, and to keepe warre againſt the Sainctes of God,* is nowe gotten into Peters Chaire, *as a Lion prepared to his praie.* Beholde, M. Hardinge, S. Bernarde telleth you, that Antichriſt is poſſeſſed in Peters Chaire. Howe be it, wee maie ſone finde a ſalue for this ſoare. For ye wil ſaie, Bernarde wrote theſe wordes againſt Petrus Luna, an Intruder, and Vſurper of the Sée of Rome, and not againſt Innocentius 7. that was Pope in déde. This is true, M. Harding, and not denied, nor any waie prejudicial to our pourpoſe: For hereby, wée maie ſée, by Bernardes iudgement, it is not impoſſible, but either by Election, or by Intruſion, by one waie, or by other, Antichriſte maie ſitte in Peters Chaire. Marke wel his wordes: Thus he ſaithe, Beſtia habens os loquens Blaſphemias, occupat Cathedram Petri. But, if you, M. Harding, or any other your frendes, ſhal hope to ſtarte out at this pore hole, what wil you then ſaie vnto Arnulphus, that ſaithe, *The very Pope him ſelfe, notwithſtandinge any his Canonical Election, if he wante Charitie, is* Antichriſte, *ſittinge in the* Temple of God. What wil you ſaie to Bernarde him ſelfe, that calleth the Popes of his time, Traitours, VVolues, Pilates, Diuels, and the Darkeneſſe of the worlde? Telle your frendes, M. Hardinge, that Bernarde ſpeaketh not theſe wordes of Intruders: This ſhifte wil not ſerue. He ſpeaketh them of very Popes in déde, of Chriſtes Vicares, of Peters Succeſſoures, and of the Heades of the Churche. Ioachimus Abbas ſaide aboue three hundred yeres ſithence, Antichriſtus iam pridem natus eſt Romæ: & altiùs ſe extollet in Sede Apoſtolica: Antichriſte is already borne in Rome: *and ſhal auaunce him ſelfe higher in the* Apoſtolique See.

Ioachim. Abbas, In Concilio Remenſi, Inter Opera Bernardi,

Arnulphius, in the Councel of Remes, ſaithe thus, Quid hunc, Reuerendi Patres, in ſublimi Solio reſidentem, veſte purpurea, & aurea radiantem, quid hunc, inquam,

quam, esse censetis? Nimirùm, si Charitate destituitur, solaq; Scientia inflatur, & extollitur, Antichristus est in Templo Dei sedens, & sese ostendens, tanquam sit Deus: *What thinke you, Reuerende Fathers, of this man* (he meaneth the Pope) *sittinge on highe in his Throne, glitteringe in Purple, and clothe of Golde? What thinke you him to be? Verily, if he be voide of Charitie, and be blowen vp, and auanced onely with knowledge*, then is he Antichriste sittinge in the Temple of God, *and shewinge out him selfe, as if he were God.*

Auentinus. The Bishoppes in the Councel at Reinspurg saie thus, Hildebrandus Papa sub specie Religionis, iecit Fundamenta Antichristi: Pope Hildebrande, *vnder a coloure of holinesse* (by forebiddinge Priestes marriage) *hathe laide the Fundation for* Antichriste.

Dantes in Cantione, 32. Francis. Petrarcha. Epist. 20. Concil. Lateran. sub Iulio. & Leone. Sess. 11. Dantes an Italian Poete, by expresse wordes calleth Rome the VVhoore of Babylon. Franciscus Petrarcha likewise saithe, Rome is the VVhoore of Babylon: *The Mother of* Idolatrie, *and* Fornication: *The Sanctuarie of* Heresie: *and the* Schoole of Erroure. I knowe, these wordes wil seme odious vnto many. Therefore I will staie, and spare the reste. The Pope him selfe, for that he sawe to whoes Persone, and credite these thinges belonged, therefore in his Late Councel of Laterane gaue straite Commaundement to al Preachers, that noman shoulde dare once to speake of the comminge of Antichriste.

In dede many places of the Holy Scriptures, spoken of Antichriste semed in Olde times to be darke, and doubtefol, for that, as then it appeared not, vnto what state, and gouernemente they might be applied. But nowe, by the Doctrine, and practise of the Churche of Rome, to them, that haue eies to see, they are as cleare, and as open, as the Sunne.

The Apologie, Cap. 17. Division. 1.

And what maruelle if the Churche were then carried awaie with erroures in that time, specially when neither the Bishop of Rome, who then onely ruled the roste, nor almoste any other, either did his duetie, or once vnderstoode, what was his duetie? For it is harde to be beleeued, whiles they were idle, and faste asleepe, that the Diuel also al that while either sel asleepe, or els continually laie idle. For how they were occupied in the meane time, and with what faithfulnesse thei tooke care of Goddes House, thoughe wee holde our peace, yet I praie you, let them heare Bernarde theire owne friende. The Bishoppes, (saithe he) vvho nowe haue the charge of Goddes Churche, are not Teachers, but Deceiuers: Thei are not Feeders, but Beguilers: Thei are not Prelates, but Pilates. These wordes spake Bernarde of that Bishop, who named him selfe the highest Bishop of al, and of the other Bishoppes likewise, whiche then had the place of Gouernemente. Bernarde vvas no Lutherane: Bernarde vvas no Heretique: he had not forsaken the Catholique Churche: yet neuertheles he did not let to calle the Bishoppes that then were, Deceiuers, Beguilers, & Pilates. Nowe, when the people was openly deceiued: and Christian Wennes eies were craftily bleared: and Pilate sate in Judgemente place, and condemned Christe, & Christes Members to Swerde, and Fire. O good Lorde, in what case was Christes Churche then? But yet tel me, of so many, and so grosse erroures, what one erroure haue these menne at any time reformed? Or, what faulte haue thei once acknowledged, and confessed?

M. Hardinge.

VVhy Sirs, are ye so wel learned, and so holy of life your selues, that ye take vpon you to iudge the Bi-

The state of the Churche of Rome.

the Bishop of Rome. Christes chiefe officer in earthe, and al other menne, before the time of your Apostates, and Renegate Friers, to haue ben both impious for not dooinge theire duetie, and ignorant for not knowinge what was their duetie? VVas al Vertue so far banished, al necessarie knowledge and Christian learninge so cleane put out, that wee muste nowe beginne to learne howe to beleeue, and howe to liue a Christian life of sutche light Preachers, wicked vowkreakers, lewde Lecherous Lurdens, and detestable Blasphemers, as your diuelishe rable is?

The Sprite of Modestie.

S. Bernardes woordes to Eugenius be these: *Age indagemus adhuc diligentius, quis sis, &c.* VVel goe too. Let vs somewhat more diligently examine, what manner a man thou arte, what person thou beareſt for the present time in the Churche of God. VVho art thou? The great Prieste, the higheſt Bishop. Thou arte the chiefe of al Bishoppes, thou art the heire of the Apostles: for Primacie thou art Abel, for Gouernement Noe, for Patriarkship Abraham, for holy order Melchisedech, for dignitie Aaron, for Auctoritie Moses, for iudgement Samuel, for power Peter, * for thy anointinge Christe. Thou arte he, to whome the Keis were deliuered, to whome the Sheepe were committed. There be also other porters of Heauen, and Pastoures of flockes. But thou so mutche farre passinge al other, as thou haste enherited bothe names mutche more indifferente. They haue theire flockes assigned vnto them, eche man one. Al are committed to thee, the one whole flocke to one. Neither arte thou onely the Pastoure of al the Sheepe, but also the onely Pastoure of al the Pastours.

* The Pope is Christe. This is wel to be marked.

VVherefore according to thine owne Canons, other are called into parte of care, thou into fulnes of power. The Auctoritie of others is restrained to certaine prescript boundes: thine is extended euen vpon those, who haue receiued power ouer others. Canst not thou, if there be cause why, close vp heauen gates againste a Bishop, depriue him of his Bishoprike, and geeue him vp to the Diuel?

Nowe heare an other reason whiche confirmeth that prerogatiue to thee, as wel as the other. The Disciples rowed, and our Lorde appeared vnto them on the shore, and that in his Body nowe againe restored vnto life, whiche was more comfortable vnto them. Peter knowinge that it was our Lorde, leapt into the sea, and so came vnto him, and the reste came by boate. VVhat meaneth this? Forsoothe it was a signe of the singulare Popedome of Peter, by whiche he tooke into his Gouernemente, not one onely one Ship, as the other did, eche man his owne, but the whole worlde.

S. Peter leapeth for the Popedome.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Apostates, Renegates, Lecherous Lurdaines, Detestable, Diuelishe rable? **D. W. Hardinge, the Vessel, that helde this liquore, was not cleane. We condemne not your Cleregie, either for life, or for Learninge: but onely repoze therein the iudgemente of others, your special friendes. And therefore, if any thinge mislike you herein, the faulte is in them, and not in vs.** S. Bernarde saithe, **Your** Bishoppes **in his time, were not** Doctours, **but** Deceiuers: **Not** Feeders, **but** Defrauders: **Not** Prelates, **but** Pilates. **Iudge you nowe, in what case the Churche of God stode then, when the** Bishops, **that were the Guides, and Leaders of the people, might be compared to** Pilate, **that gaue Sentence in Iudgemente againste Christe.**

Iohannes Vitalis, a Cardinal of Rome, **and therefore in no wise of your parte to be refused, saithe thus,** De Sacerdotibus modernis dicit Hieremias, Stupor, & mirabilia facta sunt in terra. Prophetæ predicabant mendacium: & Sacerdotes applaudebant manibus, & Populus meus dilexit talia: *Concerninge the Prieſtes, that nowe be,* Hieremie saithe, *Horroure, and woonders are wrought vpon the Earthe. The Prophetes haue preached Lies: the Prieſtes haue clapte theire handes at it for ioie, and liked it wel: and my people hathe loued sutche thinges.*

Iohan. Vitalis de Prælatis & Sacerdot. *Hiere. 5.*

Albertus Magnus saithe, Illi, qui modò præsunt in Ecclesijs, plurimum sunt Fures, & Latrones: plùs Exactores, quàm Pastores: plùs Spoliatores, quàm Tutores: plùs Mactatores, quàm Custodes: plùs Peruersores, quàm Doctores: plùs Seductores, quàm Ductores. Isti sunt Nuntij Antichristi, Subuersores Ouium Christi: *They that nowe gouerne the Churche, for the moste parte, be Theeues, and Murtherers: more Catchers, then Feeders: more Spoilers, then Defenders: more Killers, then Keepers: more Deceiuers, then Doctours: more Beguilers, then Guiders:. These be the* Vauntcurrers of Antichriste, the Subuerters of the Sheepe of Christe.

Albertus in Iohan. Cap. 10. EE.

VVilliam Holcote saithe, Sacerdotes moderni, sunt similes Sacerdotibus Baal: sunt Angeli Apostatici: sunt similes Sacerdotibus Dagon: sunt Sacerdotes Priapi: sunt Angeli Abyssi: *The Prieſtes of this time are like the Prieſtes of* Baal: *They are the Renegate Angels: They are like the Prieſtes of* Dagon: *They are the Prieſtes of* Priapus: *They are the Angels of Helle.* S. Bernarde saithe, Dicimini Pastores, cùm sitis Raptores. Fratres, Iesus hodie elegit sibi multos Diabolos Episcopos. Non sunt Pastores, sed Traditores: *Ye are called Bishoppes, but ye are Rauenners. O my Brethren, Iesus at this time hathe chosen vnto him many Diuels to be Bishoppes: they are not Feeders: they are Traitours.* Iohannes Sarif-

Guiliel. Holcote in Li. Sapientiæ, Lectio 182.

Bernard. in Concilio Remensi.

The state of the Churche of Rome.

Sarisburiensis saide boldely vnto Pope Adrian the fourth, Ideò mea opinione Papæ frequentius moriuntur, ne totam corrumpant Ecclesiam: *Therefore in my iudgement the Popes die the oftener, leste (if thei should continew long) thei should infect the whole church.*

Iohan. Sarisburien. in Polycratico. Li. 6. c. 24

Againe S. Bernarde saithe, Pudeat Successores Apostolorum, Lucem non esse Mundi, sed Modij: Mundi autem tenebras. Dicamus eis, Vos estis tenebræ Mundi: *Let it shame the Successours of the Apostles, nat to be the Light of the Worlde, but the Light of the Bushel: and rather the Darkenesse of the Worlde. Let vs therefore saie vnto them,* yee are the Darkenesse of the VVorlde.

Bernard. in Cantica. Sermo. 66.

Throughe these spectacles we maie beholde the state of the Churche of Rome. For Christe saithe, *If the Light in thee, be made* Darkenesse, *howe greate then wil the* Darkenesse *it selfe be?* Howe can the Cittie be keapte in safetie, if the Watcheman be blinde, and se nothinge? *If the Blinde leade the Blinde, bothe falle into the pitte.* Christe saithe, Dormientibus illis, creuerunt Zizania: *While the Husbandemenne were asleepe, then the Cokle, and Darnel grewe.* S. Hilarie saith, Ecclesiæ, intra quas Verbum non vigilat, naufragæ sunt: *The Churches, wherein Goddes Woorde watcheth not, suffer shipwracke, and are drowned.*

Matthæ. 6.

Matthæ. 15.

Matthæ. 13.

Hilarii. in Matthæ. Canon. 8.

But Bernarde, præ fate, stoutely mainteined the Supremacie. I graunte you. Neither did we euer allege him, to proue the contrarie. He defendeth also other greate, and grosse errours, as liuinge in a time of deepest Darkenesse. But the reasons he vseth, serue very weake, specially to winne so greate a mater. For thus he saithe, Peter leapte into the water, and came to Christe:

Bernard. De Consideratione ad Eugen. Lib. 2.

The reste of the Disciples came by bote:

Iohan. 21.

Ergo, The Pope hathe the Jurisdiction of al the worlde.

Suche other pretty Reasons, made in the Popes behalfe, ye maie finde many. Peter Crab, that lately compiled the Bookes of Councelles, reasoneth thus:

Concil. to. 1. Pagin. 10.

Peter *paide the tribute monie for Christe, and him selfe:*

Matthæ. 17.

Christe *saide vnto* Peter, *folowe thou mee:*

Iohan. 21.

Againe he saide, Lanche foorthe into the deepe:

Luc. 5.

Againe, Peter, *arte thou asleepe? Couldest thou not watche with me one houre?*

Marke 14.

And againe from hencefoorth thy name shalbe Peter:

Luc. 22.

And, Peter *drewe his Swerde, and cut of* Malchus *Eare:*

Iohan. 1.

Ergo, saithe he, *The Pope hathe* Vniuersal Authoritie *ouer the whole Churche of God.*

Matthæ. 26.

Here be Reasons euen for a Pope. He muste nedes be harde harted, that wil not yelde to them.

Notwithstandinge, howe so euer these Reasons holde, Bernarde saithe, *The Popes are the Heades of the Churche.* True it is. But againe the same Bernarde saithe, The same Heades are the Ministers of Antichriste, Deceiuers, Defrauders, Rauenners, Traitours, the Darkenesse of the Worlde. VVoulues, Pilates, and Diuels. And this was sufficiente for our pourpose. S. Gregorie saithe, Considerate, quid de Gregibus agatur, quando Lupi sunt Pastores: *When the* VVoulfe *is becomme the* Sheepehearde, *consider then, what maie becomme of the Flocke.*

Gregor. Homil. 17. in illa verba, Messis quidem multa,

As for that S. Bernarde saithe, The Pope is Abel: The Pope is Noë: The Pope is Abraham: The Pope is Melchisedeck: The Pope is Aaron: The Pope is Moses: The Pope is Samuel: The Pope is Peter: The Pope is Christe: I doubte not, but your owne Conscience wil answeare, it is to mutch. Yet of the two, that is a great deale more likely, that others haue saide, as I haue alleged before, The Pope is Antichriste. For bothe Heauen, and Earthe knoweth, he is not Christe.

The Pope is Christe.

The Apologie, Cap. 18. Division. 1.

But, forsomutche as these menne auouche the Vniuersal possession of the Catholique Churche, to be their owne, and cal vs Heretiques, bicause wee agree not in iudgemente with them, let vs knowe, I beseeche you, what proper marke, and badge hathe that Churche of theires, wherebye it maie be knowen, to bee the Churche of God.

Pewis

Yewis it is not so harde a mater to finde out Goddes Churche, if a manne wil seeke it earnestly, and diligently, and as he shoulde. For the Churche of God is sette vpon a highe, and glisteringe place, in the toppe of an Hille, and builte vpon the Fundation of the Apostles, and Prophetes: There (saithe Augustine) lette vs seeke the Churche: there lette vs trie our maters. And, as he saithe againe in an other place, The Churche muste be shevved out of the Holy, and Canonical Scriptures: and that, vvhiche can not be shevved out of them, is not the Churche. Yet for al this, I wote not howe, whether it bee for feare, or for Conscience, or despaire of victorie, these menne alwaie abhorre, and flee the VVoorde of God, euen as the Theefe fleeth the Gallowes. And no woonder truely. For, like as Menne saie, the Cantharus by & by perisheth, & dieth, as soone as it is laide in baulme, notwithstandinge, Baulme bee otherwise a moste sweete smellinge Ointemente: euen so these menne wel see, their own mater is damned, and destroied in the VVoorde of God, as if it were in poison. Therefore the Holy Scriptures, whiche our Saueoure Iesus Christe did not onely vse for Authoritie in al his speache, but did also at laste seale vp the same with his owne Blonde, these menne to the entente they mighte with lesse businesse driue the people from the same, as from a thinge dangerous, and deadly, haue vsed to calle theim a bare Letter, vncertaine, vnprofitable, Doumbe, Killinge, & Deade: whiche seemeth to vs al one, as if they shoulde saie, The Scriptures are to no pourpose, or as good as none at al. Hereunto they adde a Similitude not very agreeable, howe the Scriptures be like to a Nose of VVaxe, or a Shipmans Hose: howe they maie be fashioned, and plied al maner of waies, and serue al mennes turnes.

Augustin. De Vnitate Eccle. Catholicæ.

Albertus Pighius in Controuer. De Ecclesia.

M. Hardinge.

VVhere yee saie, the Churche is builded vpon the Fundation of the Apostles and Prophetes, and shewed by the Holy Canonical Scriptures: wee confesse the same with S. Augustine. VVhen yee adde, the Churche, whiche can not be shewed out of the Scriptures, to be no Churche, wee saie, that thoughe (a) S. Augustine haue no sutche woordes in the Chapters, whiche ye allege in the Margente, yet were it neuer so mutche graunted, that he had those woordes in that place, they shoulde make nothinge for your pourpose. S. Augustine in that Booke disputeth againste the Donatistes, who woulde restraine the Catholique Churche to the onely Countrie of Aphrike, denieinge other Christen menne to be members thereof. S. Augustine refutinge theire Heresie, declareth the Sonne of God to be Heade, and al the true Faithful to be the Body of the Churche: and that it is not sufficiente to holde with the Heade alone, or with the Body alone: but wee muste holde with bothe togeather, if wee wil be saued.

The Donatistes did graunte the Heade Iesus Christe, and denied his Body the Churche. For this cause saithe S. Augustine, *Ipsum Caput de quo consentimus, ostendat nobis Corpus suum, de quo dissentimus:* Lette the Heade, vpon whome wee agree, shewe vnto vs his Body, whereupon wee disagree. The Heade is Christe, who spake firste by his Prophetes, afterwarde by him selfe, and laste of al by his Apostles. *In his igitur omnibus quærenda est Ecclesia.* In al these (saithe he) the Churche muste be sought.

If thou marke good Reader, that, whiche I haue here rehearsed out of S. Augustine, it is to be seene, that he bindeth not the prouse of the Churche simply to the Holy Scriptures, (b) but onely in a case, when he hathe to doo with an Heretique, who wil not admitte the auctoritie of the Churche. Therefore (c) a true Churche maie be founde, whiche is not shewed in the Scriptures, so the contrarie thereof be not shewed in the Scriptures. Nowe if these Defenders wil haue that to be no Churche, which can not be shewed out of Scriptures, they shal vnderstande, that as therein they plaie the Donatistes, so wee muste needes folowe S. Augustine in bringinge Scriptures againste them, not as the (d) onely prouse in deede (whiche they falsely saie) but as a very good and chiefe

(a) Vntruth. For S. Augustine in the same places and elswhere, oftentimes saith the same.

(b) Vntruth. For S. Augustines woordes are general.

(c) Here M. Har. secretely confesseth, that his Churche of Rome cannot be shewed by the Scriptures.

(d) Vntruth. For S. Chrysostome saithe: *Nunc nullo modo cognoscitur, quæ sit vera Ecclesia, nisi* tantummodo *per Scripturas,*

Churche knowen by Gods VVoorde.

kinde of proufe, moste profitable in al cases, and necessarie at suche time, as the aduersarie wil admitte none other proufe, &c.

VVherefore it remaineth, that it is the Synagoge of Antichriste, and Lucifer. VVho as he fel out of Heauen like a lightninge, so he maketh a blase and shewe of a Churche in the Earthe for a time. But as wee can tel when it was not borne, so shal it not be longe, but that throughe Goddes power it wil vanishe awaie dispersed, and be scattered by the lightsome Maiestie of Christes true Churche, whiche from S. Peters time to this daie florisheth in her Heade the Bishop of Rome, and in her Members throughout the worlde, (e) whiche abide in the Vnitie of the same Bishop.

(e) In the Vnitie of the B. of Rome.

VVee esteeme and vnderstande the Scriptures to be the sense and the woorde. If they can pretende the bare woorde, they thinke them selues good inoughe to make a sense of theire owne. VVhiche bare woorde, as they misalledge it, Pighius perhappes compareth to a nose of waxe. But the Scriptures he neuer meante to dishonoure with that Similitude. If it were lawful for vs to vse Scripture after our owne interpretation, as they doo, wee shoulde not lacke sufficient mater in the Holy Bookes to ouerthrowe by our owne applieinge al theire false opinions and Heresies. (f) But wee are bounde to that religious awe, and reuerence of them, that, excepte wee haue an Authoure to auouche the sense, whereof wee take holde, wee dare bringe foorthe nothinge. And yet reade oure Bookes who wil, he shal lacke neither Scriptures in them, nor witnesses of our interpretation in any controuersie of this age. Lette it be agreed, that for decision of controuersies, suche sense of the Scriptures be taken for Scripture, which the Holy Ghoste hathe taught the Churche, and then let the worlde iudge, who flieth the woorde of God, as the Theefe doothe the Gallowes.

(f) Vntruth manifeste. For M. Har. knoweth that in the greatest cases, that lie in question, he can allege neither Scripture, nor Doctoure.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Contrarie to that, wee haue here alleged of S. Augustine, **ye saie,** A true Churche maie be founde, whiche is not shewed in the Scriptures. **Whereby it appeareth, ye are lothe, your Churche shoulde comme to the trial of this Standerde. But, for as mutche as this quarrel groweth of** S. Auguste, **let** S. Augustine **him selfe be the Judge. And to allege a fewe woordes in steade of many, thus he saith,** Vtrùm ipsi Ecclesiam teneant, Diuinarum Scripturarum Canonicis Libris ostendant. Ecclesiam Christi, sicut ipsum Caput Christum, in Scripturis Sanctis Canonicis debemus agnoscere: *Whether thei haue the Church, or no, let them shewe by the Canonical Bookes of the Holy Scriptures. Wee muste knowe the Church of Christ, euen as wee likewise knowe Christe, whiche is the Heade of the Churche, in the Holy Canonical Scriptures.* **Againe he saithe,** Ecclesiam sine vlla ambiguitate Sancta Scriptura demonstrat: *The Holy Scripture sheweth the Churche without any doubtfulnesse.* **Againe,** Quæstio est, vbi sit Ecclesia. Quid ergo facturi sumus? Vtrum in verbis nostris eam quæsituri, an in Verbis Capitis sui, Domini nostri Iesu Christi? Puto, quòd in illius potiùs Verbis eam quærere debemus, qui Veritas est, & optimè nouit Corpus suum: *The question, or doubte is, where the Churche shoulde be. What then shal wee doo? Whether shal wee seeke the Churche in our owne woordes, or in the woordes of her Heade? whiche is our Lorde Iesus Christe? In my iudgemente wee oughte rather to seeke the Churche in his Woordes: for that he is the Truthe, and beste knoweth his owne* Body.

August. De Vnitate Eccle. Ca. 16

August. Contra Cresconium Gram. li. 1. ca. 33.

August. De Vnitate Eccle. Cap. 2

Againe, Non audiamus, Hęc dico, Hæc dicis: Sed audiamus, Hæc dicit Dominus. Ibi quæramus Ecclesiam: Ibi discutiamus causam nostram: *Lette vs not heare these woordes, This saie? This saiste thou: But these woordes let vs heare:* Thus saithe the Lord: there let vs seeke the Church: *there let vs discusse oure cause.* **And againe,** Nolo Humanis Documentis, sed Diuinis Oraculis Sanctam Ecclesiam demonstrari: *I wil not haue the Holy Church to be shewed by Mannes iudgement, but by Goddes Woorde.*

August. De Vnitate Eccle. Ca. 3.

In eod. Capite.

Likewise saithe S. Chrysostome, Nunc nullo modo, cognoscitur, quæ sit vera Ecclesia Christi, nisi Tantummodò per Scripturas: *Nowe can noman knowe, whiche is the true Churche of Christe, but* Onely *by the Scriptures.* **Againe he saithe, in like fourme of woordes,** Volens ergo quis cognoscere, quæ sit vera Ecclesia Christi, vnde cognoscat in tanta confusione similitudinis, nisi Tantummodò per Scripturas? *If a man be desirous to knowe, whiche is the true Churche of Christe, howe can he knowe it in suche a confusion of likenesse, but* Onely *by the Scriptures?* **These woordes be so euident, so plaine, that noman with modestie maie wel denie them.**

Chrysost. in opere Imperfe. Homil. 49.

In eadem Hom.

And whereas you saie, Al this notwithstandinge, A true Churche maie be founde, which is not shewed in the Scriptures. S. Ambrose **saith,** Ecclesia fulget, non suo, sed Christi Lumine: *The Chuche shineth (or is knowen) not by her owne Light, but by the Lighte of Christ, whiche is, by the* VVoorde of God.

Ambros. Hexameron. li. 4. ca. 8

And Chrysostome **saithe,** Qui Sacra non vtitur Scriptura, sed ascendit aliunde, id est,

Chrysost. in Ioan. Homil. 38.

Vnitie of the church in one Pope.

id eſt, non conceſſa via, hic Fur eſt, & Latro: *Who ſo vſeth not the Scripture, but goeth vp an other waie, that is, by a waie, that is not lawful, he is a Theefe, and a Murtherer.* Againe he ſaithe, Hieruſalem hic ſemper Eccleſiam intellige, quæ dicitur Ciuitas Pacis: cuius Fundamenta poſita ſunt ſuper Montes Scripturarum: *Here by* Hieruſalem, *euermore vnderſtande thou the Churche, whiche is called the Cittie of Peace: The Fundatious whereof are laide vpon the Mountaines of the Scriptures.* *Chryſoſt. in Matthæ. Homil. 46.*

Ye magnifie your Churche of Rome, and ſaie, It ſhineth on high vpon the Mounte. Yet S. Bernarde ſaithe to the Pope, and his Cleregie, as it is alleged before, Vos eſtis Tenebræ Mundi: *Yee are the Darkeneſſe of the worlde.* Therefore we maie not wel vaunte your ſelues ſo muche of the brightneſſe of your Beames. As for that, we call our Church the Synagoge of Lucifer, and Antichriſte, we maie wel ſuffer it to blowe ouer, as the vaine vnſauery ſmoke of ſomme impatient Cholerique humour. Our cauſe is not the worſe, M. Hardinge, in the Iudgemente of the wiſe, for that you haue learned ſo readily to ſpeake il. *Bernard. in Cantica.*

But what Louanian Vanitie is this, to ſaie, The Members of the Churche of Chriſte abide in the Vnitie of the Pope? What Scripture, or Doctoure, or Father euer told you of ſuche Vnitie? S. Paule ſaithe, *Wee are al one,* (not in the Pope, but) *in Chriſte Ieſu.* And what ſo greate Vnitie, can you ſaie, there is, or hathe benne in your Popes? Platyna ſaithe, Poſt Stephanum ſemper hæc conſuetudo ſeruata eſt, vt acta Priorum Pontificum ſequentes aut infringerent, aut omninò tollerent: *It hathe benne an ordinarie cuſtome emonge the Popes euer ſithence the time of* Pope Steuin, *that the* Popes, *that folowed afterwarde, woulde euermore either breake, or aboliſhe the actes of the* Popes, *that had benne before them.* Eraſmus ſaithe, Iohannes. 22. & Nicolaus totis Decretis inter ſe pugnant, idq; in his, quæ videntur ad Fidei negotium pertinere: Pope Iohn. 22. and Pope Nicolas *in theire whole* Decrees *are contrarie the one againſte the other: yea, and that in maters, that ſeeme to belonge to caſes of the Faithe.* *Galat. 3.* *Platyna in Stephano.* *Eraſmus in Annotationib. in 1. Cor in 7.*

To be ſhort, the Popes, haue foule corrupted the Scriptures: thei haue corrupted the Decrées, and Canons of Councelles: they haue bene Sorcerers: Idolaters: Scribes, and Phariſeis: They haue bene Arian Heretiques: Neſtorian Heretiques: Monothelite Heretiques. Montaniſte Heretiques: they haue mainteined damnable Hereſies againſte the Godhed of Chriſte: againſte the Perſone of Chriſte: againſte the VVil of Chriſte: and againſt the Immortalitie of the Soule: they haue bene contrarie to them ſelues, one directly, and erpreſſely againſte an other: Yet muſte the Pope beare vp the whole Churche of God, euen as Atlas beareth vp the Heauens: and onleſſe al the worlde abide in him, is there no Vnitie in the Churche?

So ſaithe Hoſius, Vnum præeſſe toti Eccleſiæ, vſque adeò eſt neceſſarium, vt abſque hoc Eccleſia vna eſſe non poſsit: *It is ſo neceſſarie a thinge, that one haue the Gouernemente of the whole, that otherwiſe the Churche of God cannot be One.* *Hoſius in Petricouien. Confeſſ. Cap. 27.*

Likewiſe it is noted in the Popes owne Gloſes vpon his Decretalles, Conſtat Eccleſiam ideò eſſe Vnam, quia in Vniuerſali Eccleſia Vnum eſt Caput Supremum, ſcilicet, Papa: *It is plaine, that the* Churche *is One, for that in the Vniuerſal* Churche *there is One* Supreme Heade, *that is, the* Pope. Another of your Doctoures doubteth not to ſteppe yet a little farther, and thus to erpounde the woordes of Chriſte, Fiet Vnum Ouile, & Vnus Paſtor: Quod quidem de Chriſto intelligi non poteſt, ſed de aliquo alio Miniſtro, qui præſit loco eius: *There ſhalbe One Folde, and One Sheepeheard.* Theſe woordes wee maie not vnderſtande of Chriſte, *but of ſomme other Miniſter, that maie rule in his roome.* By whiche Doctoures Catholique Iudgemente, we finde, that the Vnitie of the Churche hangeth not of Chriſte, but of the Pope. *Clemen. 5. ad noſtrum in Gloſſa. Ioban. de Parriſijs. De Poteſtate Regia, & Papali. Cap. 3.*

But theſe be ouer vaine, and groſſe Vanities. For thoughe the Pope were no Pope, yea thoughe Antichriſte were the Pope, yet is Chriſte hable to holde his Churche in perfite Vnitie. S. Paule ſaithe, Chriſtus eſt Caput, ex quo totum Corpus coagmentatur, & connectitur: *Chriſte is the* Heade, *of whom the whole Body* (of the Churche) *is framed faſte, and ioined togeather.* Therefore S. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Ex hoc Capite Corpus habet, & vt ſit, & vt bene ſit. Quid relicto Capite Membris adhæres? *Of this* Heade (that is Chriſte) *the Body hathe bothe to be, and alſo wel to bee.* *Epheſi. 4.* *Chryſoſt. ad Coloſſen. Homil. 7.*

What cleauest thou to the Members, *and leauest the* Heade?

This is the Vnitie of the Churche, that the whole Flocke maie beare the voice of that One Sheepehearde, and folowe him. And that One Sheepehearde is Christe the Sonne of God, and not the Pope. Therefore S Augustine saithe, Per hanc Potestatem, quam solùm sibi Christus retinuit, stat Vnitas Ecclesiæ, de qua dictum est, Vna est Columba mea: *By this Power, whiche Christe* (he saithe not, hathe geuen ouer to the Pope, but) *hath reserued onely to him selfe, standeth the* Vnitie of the Church: *of whiche* Vnitie, *it is saide*, My Doue is One.

Aug. In Ioan. Tract. 6.

Yea saie, there appeareth in your Bookes sufficiente abundance of Scriptures, touchinge any controuersie of this age, and that accordinge to the very sense, and meaninge of the same, togeather with the consente, and Iudgemente of the Holy Fathers. But, for vs (yea saie) wee builde onely vpon the bare woordes, and make a meaninge of our owne.

In deede it is no greate Maisterie for you, to arme your selfe with some shewe of Scriptures. The Diuel was not altogeather voide of sutche furniture, when he came to tempte Christe. S. Cyril saithe, Omnes Hæretici de Scriptura diuinitus inspirata sui colligunt erroris occasiones: *All Heretiques out of the Heauenly inspired Scriptures geather occasion of their erroure.* Athanasius saithe, Hæretici Scripturarum verbis pro esca vtuntur: *Heretiques vse the woordes of the Scriptures for a baite.*

Matthe 4.
In Con. Chalced. Actione 1.
Athana. Contra Arianos Oratione 1.

Tertullian saithe, Fidem ex his impugnat, ex quibus constat: *An Heretique assaulteth the Faith by the same woordes of God, that breede the Faithe.*

Tertullian De Baptisa.

But for as mutche as yea saie, yea beare sutche awe, and reuerence vnto the VVoorde of God, and in the interpretation thereof, folowe onely the sense of the Holy Ghoste, and the Iudgemente of the Doctours, and Fathers of the Churche, for some trial of your truthe herein, let vs see, howe discretely, and reuerently yea haue vsed the same.

In your Late Councel holden at Laterane in Rome, one Simon Begnius, the Bishop of Modrusia, saithe thus vnto Pope Leo, Ecce venit Leo de Tribu Iuda, Radix Dauid, &c. Te Leo Beatissime Saluatorem expectauimus, &c. *Beholde the* Lion *is comme of the* Tribe of Iuda, *the Roote of* Dauid, *&c. O moste Blessed* Leo, *wee haue looked for thee, to be our* Sauecour. In your Late Chapter at Tridente, Cornelius the Bishop of Bitonto saithe thus: Papa Lux venit in Mundum: & dilexerunt homines tenebras magis quàm Lucem. Omnis, qui malè agit, odit Lucem, & non venit ad Lucem: *The Pope beeinge the Light, is comme into the Worlde: and menne haue loued the Darkenesse more then the Lighte. Euery man, that doothe euil, hateth* (the Pope, that is) *the Light, and commeth not to the Lighte.*

Concil. Lateran. Session 6. pa. 601
Concil. Trident. Cornelius Bitontinus.

Pope Adrian saith, Papa non iudicabitur à quoquam: Quia scriptum est, Non est Discipulus supra Magistrum: *No man shal iudge the* Pope: *for it is written, the Scholare is not aboue his Maister.*

Concil. to. 2. Decreta collecta per Adrianum. Pag. 613.
Paulus Æmylius Lib. 7.

The Pope suffereth the Embassadours of Sicilia to lie prostrate on the ground, and thus to crie vnto him, as if it had benne vnto Christe, Qui tollis Peccata Mundi, miserere nostri: Qui tollis Peccata Mundi, dona nobis Pacem: *O thou* (Holy Father) *that takest awaie the Sinnes of the Worlde, haue mercy vpon vs: thou, that takest awaie the Sinnes of the Worlde, geeue vs Peace.*

Concil. tomo. 1. In purgatione Sexti.

Pope Sixtus saithe, Who so accuseth the Pope, can neuer be forgeuen. And his reason is this, Quia qui peccat in Spiritum Sanctum, non remittetur ei, neque in hac vita, neque in futura: *He, that sinneth against the Holy Ghoste, shal neuer be forgeuen, neither in this Worlde, nor in the Worlde to comme.* And by these woordes of the Scriptures, so wel applied, he concludeth, that noman maie accuse the Pope. And is the Pope in deede, The Lion of the Tribe of Iuda? Is the Pope the Roote of Dauid? Is the Pope the Lighte? Is the Pope the Sauecour of Mankinde? Is the Pope that Lambe of God, that taketh awaie the Sinnes of the VVorlde? Was this the very sense of the Holy Ghoste? Was this the meaninge of the Scriptures? And to leaue a heape of other examples (for they are infinite), you your selfe, M. Harding, haue often vsed the Scriptures in like sorte.

M. Har. fo 99. a.

Thus yea saie, The Sonne of Man came not to destroie (the Soules of menne) but to saue:

ſue. Ergo, The Subſtance of Breade in the Sacramente is not annihilate, or conſumed to nothinge.

And this, ye ſaie, was the ſenſe and meaninge of the Holy Ghoſte. This is the Iudgemente of al the Doctours, and Holy Fathers. Sutche religious awe, and reuerence ye beare towardes the VVoorde of God. Yet ſaithe your Doctoure Hoſius, *The Scripture, As it is alleged by vs, is the Woorde of the Diuel: but as it is alleged, and handled by you, ſo onely it is the Woorde of God.* If ye had not vtterly wypte al ſhame from your faces, ye woulde neither make ſutche mockeries of Goddes Holy Woorde, nor ſo lewdely abuſe the people of God. Hoſius Contra Brentium, Lib. 4. Fol. 178. a.

The Apologie, Cap. 19. & 20. Diuiſion. 1.

Woteth not the Biſhop of Rome, that theſe thinges are ſpoken by his owne Minions? or vnderſtandeth he not, he hathe ſutch Champions to fighte for him? Let him herken then howe Holily, and howe Godly one Hoſius writeth of this matter, a Biſhop in Polonia, as he teſtifieth of him ſelfe: a man doubtleſſe wel ſpoken, and not vnlearned, and a very sharpe, and a ſtoute mainteiner of that ſide. Thou wilt marueile, I ſuppoſe, howe any good man coulde either conceiue ſo wickedly, or write ſo deſpitefully of thoſe woordes, whiche he knewe, proceeded from Goddes mouthe, and ſpecially in ſutche ſorte, as he woulde not haue it ſeeme his owne priuate opinion alone, but the common opinion of al that bande. Hee diſſembleth, I graunt you in deede, and hideth, what he is, and ſetteth foorthe the mater ſo, as thoughe it were not he, and his ſide, but the Zuenkfeldian Heretiques, that ſo did ſpeake. VVe (ſaith he) vvil bidde avvaie vvith the ſame Scriptures, vvhereof vvee ſee brought, not onely diuerſe, but alſo contrarie interpretations: and vvee vvil heare God ſpeake, rather then vve vvil reſorte to the naked Elementes, or bare vvoordes of the Scriptures, and appointe our Saluation to reaſte in them. It behoueth not a man to be experte in the Lavve, and Scripture, but to be taught of God. It is but loſt labour, that a man beſtovveth in the Scriptures. For the Scripture is a Creature, and a certaine bare Letter: This is Hoſius ſaieinge, vttered altogeather with the ſame Spirite, & the ſame minde, wherewith in times paſte the Heretiques Montanus, and Marcion were mooued, who, as it is written of them, vſed to ſaie, when with contempte they reiected the Holy Scriptures, that them ſelues knew many moe, and better thinges, then either Chriſte, or the Apoſtles euer knewe. Hoſius de Expreſſo verbo Dei.

What then ſhal I ſaie here, O ye principal poſtes of Religion, O ye Archegouernours of Chriſtes Churche: is this that your reuerence whiche yee geeue to Goddes Woorde? The Holy Scriptures whiche S. Paule ſaithe, came by the inſpiration of God, whiche God did commende by ſo many Miracles, wherein are the moſte perfite printes of Chriſtes owne ſteppes, whiche al the Holy Fathers, Apoſtles, and Angels, which Chriſte him ſelfe the Sonne of God, as often as was nedeful, did allege for teſtimonie and proufe: wil yee, as thoughe they were vnwoorthy for you to heare, bidde them Auaunte? That is, wil yee enioine God to keepe ſilence, who ſpeaketh to you moſte clearely by his owne mouthe in the Scriptures? Or, that VVoorde, whereby alone

as Paule saithe, we are reconciled to God, and whiche the Prophete Dauid saithe, is Holy, and Pure, and shal laste for euer, wil ye cal that but a bare, and deade Letter? Or wil ye saie, that al our laboure is loste, whiche is bestowed in that thinge, whiche Christe hathe commaunded vs diligently to search, and to haue euermore before our eies? And wil ye saie, that Christe, and the Apostles meant with subtletie to deceiue the people, when they exhorted them to reade the Holy Scriptures, that thereby they might flowe in al wisedome, & knowledge? No maruelle at al, thoughe these men despise vs, and al our doinges, seeinge they set so litle by God him selfe, and his infallible saieinges. Yet was it but want of witte in them, to the intente they might hurte vs to doo so extreeme iniurie to the VVoorde of God.

But Hosius wil here make exclamation, and saie, that wee doo him wronge, and that these be not his owne woordes, but the woordes of the Heretique Zvvenkfeldius. But howe then, if Zvvenkfeldius make exclamation on the other side, and saie, that the same very woordes be not his, but Hosius owne woordes? For telle me, where hath Zvvenkfeldius euer written them? Or, if he haue written them, and Hosius haue iudged the same to be wicked, why hathe not Hosius spoken so muche as one woorde, to confute them? Howe so euer the mater goe, althoughe Hosius peraduenture wil not allowe of those woordes, yet he doothe not disallowe the meaninge of the woordes. For welneare in al Controuersies, and namely touchinge the vse of the Holy Communion vnder Both Kindes, althoughe the woordes of Christe be plaine, and euident, yet doothe Hosius disdeinefully reiecte them, as no better, then Colde, and Deade Elementes: and commaundeth vs to geeue Faithe to certaine Newe Lessons, appointed by his Churche, and to, I wote not what, Reuelations of the Holy Ghoste. And Pigghius saithe, Men oughte not to beleeue, no not the moste cleare, and manifeste vvoordes of the Scriptures, onlesse the same be allovved for good by the Interpretation, and Authoritie of the Church: whereby he meaneth the Church of Rome.

M. Hardinge.

Howe ignorantly, wickedly, and stubbornely the Authour of this Apologie burdeneth the reuerende Father in God, and Honourable Prelate Cardinal Hosius with that he neuer saide, it is not vnknowen to al menne, who haue readen that Booke, whiche he wrote, *De expresso Verbo Dei*, of the expresse VVoorde of God. Here I aske so muche pardon, as to detecte an heretical touche or twoo, before I make directe answeare to the foule slaunderinge of Hosius.

First I note, with what fidelitie these newe Holy brethren do their thinges. It maie be thought that the Secretarie of this new Clergie at his penninge of the Apologie, sawe not Hosius Booke, of the expresse woorde of God. But as they haue ben conuersant in S. Augustine, Hierome, Chrysostome, and the Auncient Fathers, so vse they Hosius at this time. that is to saie, they reade neither the Olde Fathers with any diligence, neither the writers, of our time. But by snappes and pieces either them selues write out here and there a line or twoo, or vse that, which some of their owne secte hath taken out of them. So that for moste parte they neuer knowe the true meaninge of the place, whiche they alleage. But vsinge patched note bookes, and bringinge in scattered Authorities, they bee deceiued them selues, and deceiue others. And he that tooke the note, knew wel they were not the woordes of Hosius, and did but onely put the name of Hosius vnto them, because they were taken out of his Booke. The writer of this Apologie, not knowinge, nor not remembringe so muche when he found in the note booke the name of Hosius with suche woordes, he did rashly put them in printe,

to his

to his owne great ſhame, and diſcredite. If this excuſe be not true, wee muſte needes laie maruelous malice to the laide writer, who wittingly and of ſet purpoſe did impute the woordes to Hoſius, which he reported by waie of miſlikinge of them, and ſhewinge whoſe Hereſie they conteined.

Nowe let the Defenders choſe, whether they wil haue their Secretarie condemned of ignorance, or of malice. How ſo euer it be, marke yet the thirde pointe, whiche hereof wee wil gather. The Apologie was ſkante Printed and Publiſhed, but that groſſe errour was out of hande eſpied, and woorde thereof brought to the Authoure, I meane him, that penned it. But what did he? Did he confeſſe, that he was deceiued? Did he crie Hoſius mercie? No, no. That is not the woonte of Heretikes. They wil goe forewarde with the mater once begonne, what ſo euer come of it. VVhat did he then? VVhen it ſhoulde be ſet foorth in Engliſhe, and woorde came to him thereof, he made an excuſe, I warraunte you meete for an Heretike, whoſe propertie it is *Proficere in peius*, as S. Paule ſaithe, to proceede to worſe and woorſe, to take his degree backewarde, and of a greate faulte to make a farre greater. For whereas before (as Charitie moueth me to thinke) he had made an errour, ſuppoſinge Hoſius to haue ſaide that which he had not, afterwarde by ſtubborne mainteininge of it, he ſheweth what Spirite he is of. And when he might reaſonably haue excuſed his ignorance, choſe rather ſpitefully to diſcouer his malice: As it ſhal manifeſtly appeare by the circumſtance of the thinge. He laieth to Hoſius charge, and in his perſon to al our charges, that wee doo not eſteeme the Holy Scriptures. He proueth it by certaine woordes alleged out of a treatiſe made by Hoſius *De Expreſſo Verbo Dei*. The woordes are here put in the Apologie, as the Reader maie ſee. The true argumente of Hoſius booke is no other then to ſhewe, that al Heretikes haue alleged the woordes of God, as they be written: But none of them al haue taken the right vnderſtandinge of Goddes woordes, as they doo in deede ſignifie. For that onely the Catholike Churche atteineth vnto, becauſe onely it hath the Holy Ghoſte. Al Heretikes haue brought for their opinions the written VVoorde of God ſo longe, vntil at the laſte (ſaithe Hoſius) there were founde, who by the woordes of the Scriptures tooke vpon them to take awaie al Authoritie from Scriptures. *Natum eſt* (ſaithe he) *nouum quoddam Prophetarum genus, qui non ſunt veriti Scripturarum auctoritate Scripturis auctoritatem omnem detrahere. En quò perduxit rem tandem Satanas?* A certaine newe kinde of Prophetes is riſen, who ſticke not by the Authoritie of Scriptures to take awaie al auctoritie from Scriptures. See whether at the length the Deuil hath brought the mater.

Nowe afterwarde expoundinge this mater more at large, he declareth the Capitaine of that Hereſie to haue benne Zwenkfeldius. He ſheweth that by a Texte of Scripture, where Dauid ſaithe, I wil heare what our Lorde ſpeaketh in me: Zwenkfeldius wente aboute to wil menne to heare what God telleth euery man by inſpiration rather then to geue attendance to the written woorde of God. And whiles Hoſius reporteth, what Zwenkfeldius ſaide for the mainteinance of his fonde Hereſie, as amonge other his woordes theſe are, whiche he brought in this Apologie againſt Hoſius, and againſt the Catholikes: whereas it is neither Hoſius, nor any Catholike that ſpeaketh them, but onely Zwenkfeldius him ſelfe.

Hitherto wee haue ſhewed that the woordes alleaged in the Apologie vnder the name of Hoſius, make neither againſte him, nor againſte vs, as not beinge his woordes, nor ours, but onely the woordes of Zwenkfeldius. VVel, what credite maie wee geeue to this man in expoundinge the VVoorde of God, (whoſe true meaninge he maie falſifie at his pleaſure, becauſe wee can not bringe foorth God him ſelfe to declare his woordes) ſeeing he dareth to burthen Hoſius with theſe woordes, whiche Hoſius him ſelfe beinge yet aliue can declare to haue an other meaninge, as the Booke it ſelfe doothe witneſſe to al that laſte to reade the ſame. This was a greate faulte, to impute ſo horrible an Hereſie to Hoſius vniuſtly. This was a greate ignorance, to charge him with that Hereſie, whiche he refuteth and impugneth. They are great crimes, and yet ſuche, as might riſe of miſreporte and ignorance. But when he was tolde of them, he ſhoulde of reaſon haue corrected them. He ſhould haue repented with Peter, and not deſpaired with Cain and Iudas.

But what did he, when he vnderſtoode he had erred? He addeth a Gloſe farre more maliceous then the former errour was. For graunting that Hoſius ſetteth out the mater ſo, as though neither he, nor any of his ſide, but the Heretikes Zwenkfeldians ſpake ſo, this notwithſtandinge he burtheneth bothe him and the Catholikes with it, ſaieinge, that he diſſembleth, and hideth what he is. Sir, was this the waie to amende your faulte, to graunte that Hoſius ſpake againſt the Zwenkfeldians, and yet to beare menne in hande, he fauoured them? If he had fauoured their Hereſie, what needed he to refel it? But how ſaie you, that Hoſius diſſembleth and hideth what he is, ſithe that euen here in twoo places in moſte plaine woordes, you laie the Zwenkfeldian Hereſie to his charge? Reade your owne Booke. Before the allegation of Zwenkfeldius Hereſie, ſaie you not thus? VVe, ſaith he, wil bid away, &c. And after the allegation, haue you not theſe woordes, This is Hoſius ſayinge! Howe ſtandeth al this togeather? You haue forgotten the Prouerbe, that biddeth a lier to be mindeful. I cannot tel how to name this kinde of your dealinge, lieinge, or detraction, ſlaunderinge, or maliceous ſpeakinge. But Sir, if Hoſius haue ſpoken euil, why geue you not witneſſe againſt him of euil? If he haue ſpoken wel, euen by your owne confeſſion in reputinge the Zwenkfeldians for Heretikes, why finde you faulte with him for his good woordes, ſuch I ſaie, as your ſelfe confeſſe to be good? You reproue him, who ſpeaketh not againſt Zwenkfeldius: and againe you graunt he ſpeaketh againſt him: and yet becauſe you had once reproued him, you wil continewe in it without reaſon, learninge, or witte. But it muſte needes ſo be: for without pertinacie no man is either a perfite Heretike, or a perfite ſlaunderer.

If yet you ſtande in Defence of it, al the worlde wil accompte you for a deſperate perſon. For

no man that euer sawe Hosius workes, can thinke that he was guilty of that you burthen him with. But some man might thinke you were deceiued, and mistooke Hosius. But sithe you graunte, you doo not nowe mistake him, and yet charge him with auouchinge that, whiche he holdeth for Heresie: he that vnderstandeth thus muche of you, maie assure him selfe, that you are disposed to belie and slaunder Hosius, though it coste you the damnation of your Soule. For shame man, repente, and reuoke, that for whiche your owne conscience stinteth not to barke at you.

But Hosius (say they) peraduenture wil not allowe the woordes of Zwenkfeldius: yet he doothe not disallowe the meaninge of the woordes. VVel and clerkly reasoned. As though woordes were allowed or disallowed for any other so principal a cause, as for theire meaninge. And therefore he that disalloweth woordes, hath muche more disallowed the meaninge of them. Yet, (saie they) of the Holy communion vnder Bothe Kindes he reiecteth the plaine woordes of Christe, as Deade and colde Elementes. Verily a man mighte thinke this Booke was set foorthe by somme enimie of our newe Englishe Clergie, it is so muche to theire defacinge, had them selues at diuerse times acknowleged it for a whelpe of theire owne littoure. A man for his life can not finde one leafe in it without many Lies.

The Bisshop of Sarisburie.

I cannot greatly blame you, M. Hardinge, though you shewe your selfe hote, and vehement in defense of Hosius. For of him you, and somme of your Felowes maie saie, as Carneades **saide sommetime of** Chrysippus, Nisi Chrysippus fuisset, ego non essem: *If* Chrysippus *had not benne, then had I neuer benne*. **For had not Hosius benne good vnto you, and spared you parte of his furniture, suche as it was, your Diuinitie had benne ful bare.**

We saie, VVe reade neither the Olde VVriters, nor the Newe, **but are vtterly ignorant, and voide of al learninge: and, in respecte of the Beames of your knowledge, knowe nothinge. It were a very ambitious, and a childishe vanitie, to make bauntes of Learninge. For as mutche as we serme desirous of the fame of greate Readinge, ye shal haue the whole praise, and glorie of it, M. Hardinge, without contention.**

1. Cor. 2. **We wil rather saie with** S. Paule, *Wee knowe nothinge, but onely Iesus Christe Crucified vpon his Crosse*. **Yet notwithstandinge we are neither so ignorant, nor so idle, but that we are hable, and haue leasure to reade, as wel the** Olde Doctoures, and the Fathers **of the Churche, as also your light vnciuile Pamflettes, and blotted Papers: whiche, God wote, in al respectes are very Newe. And for either of them, we are mutche ashamed in your behalfe: For the** Olde Doctours, and Fathers, **to see them of your parte, either of wilfulnesse, or of forgetefulnesse, or of ignorance, so fowly misused: of your owne** Papers, and Nouelties, **to see them with vntruthe, and other vncourteous speache so fully freighted.**

But, touchinge Hosius, **we condemne vs vtterly,** either **of** ignorance, **or of** malice. **For the woordes, wherein we finde suche faulte, were vttered by him, as you saie, not as any parte of his owne Iudgement, but onely as in the person of the** Heretique Zuenkfeldius. **Therefore, ye saie,** VVe charge him wrongefully with the allowinge of that thinge, whiche he expressely, and plainely reproueth.

First of al, the Authoure, **of the** Apologie **protesteth, that, if there were any ouersight herein it proceded onely of** errour, **and not of** malice: **as it maie wel appeare, in that he was not deceiued alone. For if he were deceiued in mistakinge theise woordes, diuerse others, the beste Learned of this age, haue benne deceiued therein as wel, as he.** Nicolaus Gallus **hereof writeth thus,** Hosius Cardinalis Legatus Sanctissimi, & præsidens Concilij Tridentini, in suo Libro de Expresso Verbo Dei, ait, Nos verò Dei de Cœlo sententiam potiùs expectabimus &c. Non oportet Legis, aut Scripturæ esse peritum, sed à Deo doctum. Vanus est labor, qui Scripturis impenditur, Scriptura enim Creatura est, & egenum quoddam Elementum: Cardinal Hosius, Legate vnto the moste Holy Father, *and Presidente of the Counsel of Trident, in his Booke,* De Expresso Verbo Dei, *saithe thus: Wee wil rather waite for Goddes wil from Heauen, &c. It behoueth not a man to be skilful in the Lawe of God, or in the Scriptures, but to be taught of God. It is but loste labour, that is spente in the Scriptures. For the Scripture is a Creature, and a poore kinde of outwarde Elemente.* **Thus** Nicolaus Gallus **burtheneth your owne Catholique Friende** Hosius **with theise woordes, and not the** Heretique Zuenkfeldius.

Nicolaus Gallus.

Likewise saithe Flacius Illyricus, **speakinge of the same woordes of** Hosius,

Vnum

The mistaking of Hosius.

Vnum locum ex plurimis proferam, in quo Hosius alterius cuiusdam sententiam de hac re citans, comprobat: Nos Dei de Cœlo Sententiam potius expectabimus &c. vanus est labor, qui Scripturis impenditur: *One place I wil allege out of many, where* Hosius *bringinge in the saieinge of one certaine man* (meaninge Zuenkfeldius) alloweth wel of the same. Theise woordes, saithe Illyricus, Hosius vttereth in the name, and person of Zuenkfeldius: yet neuertheleſſe he alloweth them, as his owne.

Flacius Illyricus in Norma Concilij.

To like pourpose writeth Iacobus Andreæ: who, after he had reported al the foresaide woordes, in the ende concludeth thus: Hactenus Hosius: Quæ verba siue Hosius suo, siue aliorum nomine recitet, certè hanc esse Asoti, & Hosij de Sacra Scriptura sententiam, non est obscurum: *Thus farre* Hosius *whiche woordes, how so euer* Hosius *reporte them, either in his owne name, or in the name of somme other, without al doubte, This is the Iudgemente, that bothe* Asotus, *and* Hosius *haue of the Holy Scripture.*

Iacob. Andræ de Authorit. Sacræ Scripturæ.

So like wise saithe that moste Graue, and Learned Father Iohannes Brentius: Interea vociferantur, Sacram Scripturam esse Dubiam, Ambiguam, Præceptorem Mutum, Literam Occidentem, Literam Mortuam: adeoque, si Reuerendis illis Patribus libuerit, Aesopi Fabulas: *In the meane while they crie out, that the Holy* Scriptures are Blinde, and doubteful: a Doumbe Scholemaister: a killinge VVrite: a deade Letter: *yea, and, if it shal like theise Reuerende Fathers, no better, then* Esopes Fables. Perhappes we wil sate of theise Learned Menne, as we sate of somme others, They vsed onely their patched Notebookes, and scattered Authorites, by snappes, and peeces, here, and there a line, or twoo: and vnderstoode not, what they wrote. Notwithstandinge, what so euer it shal please you to sate, as therein your grace is very greate, yet you se by theise fewe, and muste nedes confesse, if the Authoure of the Apologie, touchinge this place of Hosius were happily ouerséne by erroure, yet he had so many of the beste Learned of this age, to kepe him companie in his erroure. Verily, they sate not, as you sate, Thus saithe Zuenkfeldius: They sate, as we sate, Thus saithe Hosius: If Hosius were hable to blinde so many, we muste thinke, he was a skilful Writter.

Iohan. Brentius in Præfatione in Iacob. Andreæ contra Hosium.

The fairest coloure, ye can sate hereon, is this: *Howe so euer theise woordes be vttered by* Hosius, *yet was this no parte of his meaninge.* Yet Iacobus Andreæ saithe, Hanc esse Asoti, & Hosij sententiam, non est obscurum: *Without doubte this is the very meaninge of* Asotus, and Hosius. And Illyricus saithe, Hosius alleginge the saieinge of one certaine man (whereby he meaneth the Heretique Zuenkfeldius) alloweth wel of the same.

Iacob. Andreæ.

Flacii. Illyricus Alterius cuiusdam sententiam de hac re citans, comprobat.

But, for as muche as we sate, This Glose is more maliceous, then the Former Erroure: and that therein wee spitefully discouer our Malice, without Reason, without Learninge, without VVitte: and require vs to repent for shame, as if it were a Sinne, not against Hosius, but against the Holy Ghoste, I beseeche you therefore indifferently to consider, with what reuerence, & modestie, not onely Hosius, but also sundrie others your Friendes of that side, haue vsed to speake, and write of the VVoorde of God.

Ludouicus a Canon of the Churche of Laterane in Rome, in an Oration openly pronounced in your late Chapter at Tridente, saithe thus: Ecclesia est Vnum pectus Christi: Scriptura autem est quasi Mortuum Atramentum: *The Churche is the Liuely Breaste of Christe: But the Scripture is, as it were,* Deade Inke. Likewise saithe the Bishop of Poiters in the same your Chapter: Scriptura est res inanimis, & muta, sicut etiam sunt reliquæ Leges Politicæ: *The Scripture is a Deade, and Doumbe thinge, as are al other Politique Lawes.* Albertus Pigghius saithe, Si dixeris, hæc referri oportere ad Iudicium Scripturarum, Communis te sensus ignarum esse comprobas. Sunt enim Scripturæ Muti Iudices: *If thou saie, Theise maters muste be put ouer to the Iudgement of the Scriptures, thou sheweſt thee selfe to be voide of common reason.* For the Scriptures are doumbe Iudges, and cannot speake.

Ludouic. Citatus ab Illyrico in Norma Concilij. Iohan. Sleidanus Lib. 23. Albert. Pigghius Controuer. 3. De Ecclesia.

Eckius calleth the Scriptures, Euangelium Nigrum, & Theologiam Atramentariam: The Blacke Gospel, and Inken Diuinitie. Againe Pigghius saithe, Ecclesia habet illam potestatem, vt possit Scriptis quibusdam impertiri Canonicam Authoritatem, quam nec ex se, nec ex suis Authoribus habent: *The Churche hath power to geeue Canonical Authoritie vnto certaine Writinges, whiche otherwise they haue not, neither of them*

Martinus Kemnitius in Examine Conc. Tridentini. Pag. 32. Martin. Kemnit.

The mistaking of Hosius.

them selues, nor of their Authours. There maie be certaine Bookes allowed for Scripture, saithe he, that haue no credite, nor Authoritie of them selues. Therefore the meaninge hereof muste nedes be this: *The Churche* (of Rome) *hath Authoritie to make Scripturas.* Againe he saithe, Sunt Scripturæ, vt, non minùs verè quàm festiuè dixit quidam, velut Nasus Cereus, qui se horsum, illorsum, & in quancunq; volueris partem, trahi, retrahi, fingiq; facilè permittit: *As one man bothe truely, and merily saide, the Scripture is like a* Nose of VVaxe, *that easily suffereth it selfe to be drawen backwarde, and forwarde, and to be moulded, and fashioned, this waie, and that waie, and how so euer yee liste.*

Hosius in ead. Examine. Pag. 140. Pighius Hierar. Li. 3. Cap. 3 Fol. 103.

Thus, M. Hardinge, ye teache the people to reuerence, & weigh the VVoorde of God. Ye calle it Deade Inke: a Liueleſſe mater: a doumbe Iudge, that cannot speake: a Blacke Gospel: Inken Diuinitie: a Nose of waxe: and a thinge vtterly voide of Authoritie of it selfe. Examine theise places: weigh theise woordes. They are no Lies: They are no Sclaunders. Iudge vprightly: remoue affection: ye shal finde, that Hosius, and Zuenckfeldius, & al the reste of your brethren, touchinge the Authoritie, and Creditе of Goddes VVoorde, accorde in one. For proufe wherof, when obiection was made, that Kinge Dauid, beinge, not a Bishop, but onely a Temporal Prince, had written the Psalmes, that is to saie, the very kete of the Scriptures, Hosius made answeare, Quid ni scriberet? Scribimus indocti, doctiq; poëmata passim: *Wrote* Dauid Psalmes? *And why should he not write them?* Horace saithe, *Wee write Ballades euery body, learned, and vnlearned: tagge, and ragge.* So vnreuerently, and like an Heathen, he scorneth, and scoffeth at the Scriptures of God, and likeneth the Heauenly Ditties of the Holy Ghoste, to a Vile, Heathenishe, Wanton ballade. This in Zuenkfeldius had benne great Blasphemie: Ye allowe it in Hosius, as a vertue.

Hosius Lib. 2. Contra Brentiũ.

S Luke saithe, Pharisæi, & Iurisperiti spreuerunt Consilium Dei in semetipsis: *The* Pharisees, *and Learned in the Lawe dispised the Counsel of God in them selues.* Irenæus saithe, Hæretici accusant Scripturas, quasi non rectè habeant, nec sint ex Authoritate, &c. *Heretiques finde faulte with the Scriptures, as if they were not wel written, and as if they were not of sufficient Authoritie, &c.* And thus they do, to the ende, to cause the people to lothe, and doubte the Worde of life, and so to becomme captiue to theire owne Traditions. Therefore Cardinal Cusanus saithe thus, Hæc est omnium sanè intelligentium sententia: qui Scripturarum Authoritatem, & intellectum in Ecclesiæ approbatione fundant: & non è conuerso, Ecclesiæ Fundamentum in Scripturarum Authoritate locant, &c. Dico, nulla esse Christi præcepta, nisi quæ per Ecclesiam pro talibus accepta sunt: *This is the Iudgemente of al them, that meane wel: whiche founde the Authoritie, and vnderstandinge of the Scriptures in the allowance of the Churche: But contrariwise laie not the Fundation of the Churche in the Authoritie of the Scriptures. Thus I saie, There are no Commaundementes of Christe, but onely suche, as by the Churche are allowed for Christes Commaundementes.* So saithe your highest Doctoure Albertus Pighius, Apostoli quædam conscripserunt, non vt Scripta illa præessent Fidei, & Religioni nostræ, sed potiùs vt subessent: *The* Apostles *wrote certaine thinges, not that theire Writinges shoulde be aboue our Faithe, and Religion, but rather, that they shoulde be vnder.* Iohannes Maria Verracius saithe, Determinatio Ecclesiæ appellatur Euangelium: *The Determination of the Churche is called the Gospel.*

Luke. 7.

Irenæ. Li. 3. ca. 2.

Nicol. Cusanus ad Bohemos Epistola. 2.

Albert. Pighius Hierar. Lib. 1. Cap. 2.

Iohan. Maria Verracius. Editus. Anno. 1561.

Therefore Hosius by his Episcopal Authoritie pronounceth Sentence Definitiue in this wise: Quod Ecclesia docet, Expressum Dei Verbum est: quod contra Sensum, & Consensum Ecclesiæ docetur, Expressum Diaboli Verbum est: *What so euer the Church teacheth* (by the Churche he meaneth the Pope, and his Cardinalles, and the Churche of Rome, &c.) *that is the Expresse Woorde of God: What so euer is taught against the Meaninge, and Consente of the Churche, that is the Expresse Woorde of the Diuel.*

Hosius. De Expresso Verbo Dei. Pa. 97.

This was sometime an ordinarie practise of sundrie Olde Heretiques, to scorne, and to disdeigne the Scriptures of God: and to grounde them selues vpon other Conclusions, and imaginations of their owne. So the Heretique Carpocrates saide, He knewe more, then either Christe him selfe, or his Apostles.

Epiphani. Lib. 1. Hæres. 27.

Tertullian saithe, Discipuli Montani dicunt Paracletum plura in Montano dixisse, quàm Christum in Euangelio protulisse: nec tantùm plura, sed etiam meliora

Tertullian. De Præscription.

atq;

The mistakinge of Hosius.

atque maiora: *The Disciples of* Montanus *the Heretique saide, that the* Holy Ghoste *vttered moe thinges in* Montanus *theire Maister, then euer* Christe *vttered in the Gospel: and not onely moe thinges, but also greater, and better thinges.* And againe they saide, Paulus ex parte sciebat, & ex parte prophetabat. Nondum enim venerat, quod perfectum est: Paule *knewe in parte, and prophesied in parte. For the perfection* (that was afterwarde in Montanus) *was not yet comme.* Therefore it is not vniuersally true, M. Hardinge, that you saie, *Al Heretiques haue alleged the Scriptures.* For somme Heretiques, in whoes steppes ye seeme to treade, haue made lighte of, and disdeigned the Scriptures, as wel, as you. But, as somme Heretiques haue alleged the Scriptures, as you do, without sense: euen so al Heretiques are euermore reproued by the Scriptures, as you be. And that is the cause, that you, and your felowes, for the moste parte, so fearefully shunne the Scriptures. *For he that doothe euil, feeth the Light.* — Augustin. ad Quoduultdeum.

Therefore, whereas, ye calle vs forthe, and bidde vs humbly to crie you mercie, firste bidde Hosius your Scholemaister to recante his Errours: wil him to speake more reuerently of Goddes VVoorde: for it is Holy: Let him confesse, and repente his Blasphemie in comparinge the Scriptures of God with Heathenishe Ballades. Recante you the Errours that Pigghius, Cusanus, Eckius, & others your Doctours, and Felowes haue set abroade: And the Authoure of the Apologie shal do, what so euer shal behoue him.

Remember also, howe vniuste, and vntrue reportes you your selfe, and your Felowes haue wittingly, and willingly published, and blased in writinge, not sparinge any man, whom it pleased you to touche with sclaunder. You your selfe in this selfe same Booke haue written thus: The Learned Gospellers of the Sea Townes in Saxonie teache, that there is no Helle at al. I beseeche you, M. Hardinge, where sawe you theise Heretiques? What were theire names? In what Sermone, in what Booke, in what Talke, opened they this Heresie? In what language spake they? what were theire woordes? who euer either knewe them, or sawe them, or hearde them, or dreamed of them, but your selfe alone, or somme other as idly occupied as your selfe? And dare you, so vainely to sclaunder a whole Countrie, without proufe, without witnesse, without grounde? Leaue this fondnesse. Noman beleeueth you: no, not your owne felowes: no, not your selfe. It is too childishe. Vnitie it selfe would not be so vaine. — M. Har. Fol. 141. b

An other of your Companie there, thus moste vniustly sclaundereth that godly Father Doctoure Peter Martyr: Petrus Martyr negat, Christum esse nostrum Deprecatorem: Peter Martyr *denieth, that Christe is our Intercessoure.* Likewise againe, with one general sclaunder, he miscreporteth al the Professours of the Gospel what so euer: Omnes Euangelici Pseudomartyres negant Christum venisse in Carne: *Al the Gospellers* (whom he thought it better, to calle the False witnesses of the Gospel) *denie that Christe euer came in the Fleashe.* I wil presse you no further with Examples of your immoderate sclaunders. As your vncourteous tongue hathe no bridle, so your waste woordes haue no ende. — Copus Dialo. 3. Pag. 331. — Copus Dialo. 6. Pag. 878.

Al theise, and other like reportes, your conscience knoweth, are moste vntrue. Yet haue ye not doubted, thus to hasarde your whole credite, and vainely with the same to fede the worlde. Suffer me therefore, M. Hardinge, to answeare you with your owne woordes: *For shame man, repente, and renoke that, for whiche your owne Conscience stinteth not to barke againste your selfe.*

The Apologie, Cap. 21. Diuision. 1.

And yet, as though this were too litle, they also burne the Holy Scriptures, as in times paste wicked Kinge Aza, or as Antiochus, or Maximinus did, & are woonte to name them Heretiques Bookes. And out of doubte, as it seemeth, they woulde doo, as Herode in olde time did in Ievvrie, that he might with more surety keepe stil his vsurped Dominion. Who beinge an Idumean borne, and a straunger to the — Eusebius. Lib. 1. Cap. 7.

the stocke, and kinred of the Ievves, and yet countinge mutche to be taken for a Ievve, to thende he might establische to him, and his Posteritie the Kingdome of that Countrie, whiche he had gotten of Augustus Cæsar, he commaunded al the Genealogies, and Petigrees to be burnt, & made out of the waie, so that there should remaine no recorde, whereby it might be knowen to them that came after, that he was an Alien in bloude: whereas euen from Abrahams time these monumentes had benne safely keapte emongst the Ievves, & laide vp in their treasurie: bicause in them it might easily, and moste assuredly be founde of what linage euery one did descende. So (in good faithe) doo these menne, when they would haue al their owne doinges in estimation, as though they had benne deliuered to vs euen from the Apostles, or from Christe him selfe: to thende there might be founde no where any thinge hable to conuince sutche theire dreames, and lies, either they burne the Holy Scriptures, or els they craftily conueigh them from the people.

M. Hardinge.

Pardon me, I praie thee, Reader, if I vse woordes somewhat vehemente, the cause so requiringe. This Defender crieth out. O ye pillours of Religion. But howe muche more iustly crie wee againe to him. O thou captaine lier, O moste woorthy, not the rewarde of a whetstone, but the iudgemente of a backebiter, of a slaunderer, of a cursed speaker, of a mocker, of the accuser of the brethren, of a Blasphemer: Is this the regarde thou haste, I saie not to God, or to Christen men, but to thine owne estimation, and common honestie of a man? Canste thou persuade thy selfe to geate credite by lieinge? To seeme sober by railinge? Honest by villanie? Charitable by slaunderinge? Vpright by deceite? Iuste by impietie? VVhy saiest thou of vs in general, that is to saie, of the Catholike Churche, that wee despise, hate, caste awaie, and burne the Holy Scriptures? Had wee not loued and kepte the Scriptures, howe couldest thou and thy fellowes haue comme by them? Had yee not them of vs? From the Apostles time to this daie wee haue kepte them (a) vnspotted and vndefiled: and ye within these fifty yeeres haue by your vulgare translations (b) corrupted them, that lamentable it is to consider. And when wee burned the same corrupte translations or any parte thereof, or any of your Heretical treatises, we burned not the Scriptures, (c) nomore then one dothe the Apple tree, that burneth the Caterpillers.

The Scriptures we honoure, and keepe moste reuerently and diligently. Therefore your comparinge of vs with the wicked Kinges Aza, Antiochus, Maximinus, and Herode, is false and slaunderous. For how saie you, Sir Captaine of liers, (d) had we not the Scripture in euery Monasterie, Cathedral Churche, College, in euery pouate library of any that was learned?

The like thinge was obiected to S. Augustine and the Catholikes in his time by the Donatistes, beinge then Heretikes, as yee are nowe. To whome he answeareth, as we wil answeare you: *Certè ille ignibus tradidisse credetur, qui eis lectis non consentire convincitur.* Let him be thought to haue caste the Holy Scriptures into the fire, who, when, they are reade, is conuict not to consente vnto them. VVee reade in the Holy Scriptures, that Christe saide, This is my Body. VVho beleeueth it, yee, (e) that denie it, or wee, who are contente to die for the defence of that his real body in the blessed Sacramente? S. Iames saithe, a man is iustified by woorkes, and not by Faithe onely. VVho beleeueth this, they, whiche saie that onely faithe iustifieth, or they whiche saie, that woorkes be required also to iustification? Christe saithe, * *Qui manducat hunc Panem, viuet in Æternum:* he that eateth this Breade, shal liue for euer. * VVho beleeueth this, they that saie bothe kindes be necessarie to laie men by commaundemente of Christe, or they, who saie, that one kinde is sufficient to saluation concerninge the eatinge of the Sacramente. Iohn 6.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Yée maie sone be pardoned, M. Hardinge, for speakinge ill: for as mutche as, for ought, that maie appeare by your speache, ye haue not yet learned to speake wel. Whether yée haue burnte the Scriptures of God, or no, bothe Heauen, and Earthe, and Sea, and Lande maie beare witnesse. For a poore excuse, ye saie, ye haue burnte, our Errours, and Heretical Translations, and not the Scriptures: as the Housbandeman vseth to burne the Caterpillers. Howe be it, he maie be thought an vnwise Housbandeman, that burneth vp his Caterpillers, and Trées to, bothe togeather: and, to weake him selfe

Al this is M. Hardinges sobrietie: It is no railinge.

(a) Vntruth. For the Old Latine texte hathe infinite corruptions.

(b) Vntruth. Otherwise let M. Harding shewe one pointe of Corruption.

(c) But he is a fooliſhe man, that burneth downe bothe the Trees and Caterpillers al togeather.

(d) You had it in your Libraries. But the poore people had it not.

(e) Vntruth. For we denie it not.

* A worthy Argumente, and ful wisely applied. Reade the Answeare.

Burninge of the scriptures.

ſelfe of the one, is contente to deſtroie the other. If al Bookes conteininge Erroure ſhoulde be burnte, then ſhould your Louanian Nouelties goe to wracke. For perils, M. Hardinge, contention, and vaine glorie ſet a parte, ye knowe right wel, they are ful of Errours. Moreouer ye knowe, there be Errours in S. Auguſtine: There be Errours in Origene, in Tertullian, in S. Ambroſe, in S. Hierome: There be Errours in euery of the Auncient Fathers: in the Greekes: in the Latines: in one, and other. There be Errours in your Schole Doctoures: There be Errours in your Canoniſtes: Briefely, your Holy Fathers Decrees and Decretalles are not voide of Errours. Yet is there no Booke worthy to be burnte, in reſpecte of Erroure, but onely the Booke of the Scriptures?

If there were ſuche Erroures in the Vulgare Tranſlations, ye ſhoulde haue diſcried them, although not al, yet for your credites ſake, one at the leaſte. Ye ſhoulde haue remoued the Errour, and haue reſtoared the Scriptures, to the vſe, and comforte of the people. But this is it, that troubleth you ſo ſoare: that the Scriptures are publiſhed in the Common knowen tongues, and that the ſimple people of al ſortes (whom otherwiſe ye cal Dogges, and Swine, and filthy brute Beaſtes voide of reaſon) maie vnderſtande them. This, M. Hardinge, is that greate, and horrible Errour: This is the Erroure of al Erroures. Therefore Irenæus ſaith, as it is alleged before, Hæretici, cùm ex Scripturis arguuntur, in accuſationem vertuntur Scripturarum: *Heretiques, when they be reproued by the* Scriptures, *then beginne they to finde faulte with the Scriptures.* And therefore S. Ambroſe ſaithe, Herodes conſcius ignobilitatis ſuæ, Scripturas incendit: ne qua Poſteris ſuis, vel de præſcripto Veteri quæſtio moueretur: exiſtimans, quòd ſi Iudicia de publico ſuſtuliſſet, nullis alijs Teſtimonijs clarere poſſet, quin de Patriarcharum, & Proſelytorum Veterum genere emanaret: Kinge Herode, *for that he wel vnderſtoode the baſeneſſe of his Houſe, therefore he burnte the* Scriptures: *leaſte that, by meane of ſuche Ancient Recordes, ſomme doubte mighte afterwarde be moued againſte his poſteritie. For he thought, if he had once remoued ſuche Monumentes, it coulde neuer be proued by any manner other witneſſe, but that he came by deſcente from the ſtocke of the* Patriarkes, *and Olde Proſelytes:* Whereas in deede he was a mere aliene, and a ſtranger to the Houſe of Iſrael, and a very tyrannous Vſurper of the Crowne, as beinge lineally deſcended, not from Iacob, but from Eſau.

M. *Hard. Anſwere. Arti.* 15. *Fol.* 155. *b.*

Irene. Li. 1. *ca.* 1.

Ambroſ. in Lucam. Li. 3. *Ca.* 3.

But ye ſaie, You haue keapte, and preſerued the Scriptures, in your Libraries, in veleme, and, I trowe, in letters of golde. Euen in like ſorte, and with like truthe ye might ſaie, that you haue keapte the Sunne, and the Moone: and, had it not benne for your kéepinge, they had benne loſte. It was God, M. Hardinge, that of his Mercie preſerued his Holy VVoorde: euen as he preſerued Daniel in the Caue of Lions: Ionas in the Whales belly: The three Children in the middes of the flaminge Fire. Ye kéepe the Scriptures as the Dogge kéepeth the haie: whiche neither eateth it him ſelfe: nor ſuffereth the poore hungrie cattle, that faine would eateit: Ye kéepe them in warde, in duſte, and moulde: as the Iewes, before the time of Kinge Ioſias, keapte the Booke of Deuteronomie cloſely in the corners, or emongeſt the treaſures of the Temple: ſo, that noman knewe, where to finde it. Had it not benne for Goddes ſpecial prouidence, notwithſtandinge your kéepinge, they might haue periſhed.

2. *Regum.* 22.

S. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Nunc neque an ſint Scripturæ quidam ſciunt: Spiritus tamen ita diſpenſauit, vt cuſtodiantur: *Nowe adaies there are ſomme, that cannot tel, whether there be any Scriptures, or no. Yet hathe the* Sprite of God *ſo prouided, that they are ſtil preſerued.*

Chryſoſt. in Epiſ. ad Hebræos Homil. 8.

Thus the Iewes made theire vauntes, that they were the keepers of the Lawe, and that the Chriſtians had al of them. S. Auguſtine ſaith, Iudæi dicunt, non Noſtra nos Lege vti, ſed Sua: *The* Iewes *ſaie, That wee haue no Lawe of our owne, but onely theires.* Likewiſe euen at this daie the Iewes kéepe, and vſe the Lawe of God with al reuerence: They neuer laie any other Booke vpon the Bible: They waſſhe their handes, before they touche it: They wil not ſit vpon the benche, where the Bible lieth: As often, as they either open it, or ſhutte it, they vſe to kiſſe it: when the Pope goeth through Rome to his Palace of Laterane, the Iewes méete him vpon the waie, and

Auguſt. In queſtionibus ex Veteri Teſtament. queſt. 44. *Paulus Phagius in Deut. Ca.* 17.

offer him the Bible, and desire him reuerently to embrace it, as though the Pope coulde haue no Bible, but onely of them. Al these thinges notwithstandinge, the Pope answereth them of course, euen as we make answeare you: Sanctam Legem, viri Hebræi, & laudamus, & veneramur: obseruantiam verò vestram, & vanam interpretationem damnamus, & improbamus: *Yee menne of the* Iewes *Profession, wee praise, and honoure the* Holy Lawe: *But your* Tradition, *and vaine* Interpretation *wee vtterly condemne, and reproue.*

Ceremoniar. Li. 1. Cap. 8.

Chryso. in Matt. Homil. 33.

For Chrysostome saithe, Nihil nunc apud Iudæos remansit, nisi Sola Scriptura Librorum, omni Legis obseruantia pereunte: *There remaineth nowe nothinge emonge the* Iewes; *but onely the writinge conteined in Bookes, for al the obseruation of the* Lawe *is paste from them.*

Chrysost. in Genesim. Homil. 8.

Againe he saithe, Literæ quidem Legis apud illos sunt: Sensus autem est apud nos: *The Letters of the* Lawe *are with the* Iewes: *But the Sense, and Meaninge is with vs.*

Chrysostom. in Psalm. 117.

Likewise he saithe vnto the Iewes, Vos complicatis membranas animalium mortuorum: Nos possidemus Spiritum viuificantem: *You turne the leaues of the Scriptures, made of the skinnes of deade Cattle: but wee haue the* Sprite, *that geueth Life.*

August. de Fide rerum inuisibil. Cap. 6.

So saithe S. Augustine: Iudæi in Libris suffragatores nostri sunt: in Cordibus hostes nostri: *The* Iewes *healpe vs, and aide vs with theire* Bookes: *But they are our enimies in their hartes.*

August. Contra Faustum Manichæ. Lib. 16. Cap. 21.

Againe he saithe, Magnum aliquid actum est in vsum nostrum de Infidelitate Iudæorum: vt ijdem ipsi, qui hæc propter se non haberent in Cordibus, ea propter nos haberent in Codicibus: *Somme greate good thinge is wrought to our vse by the Infidelitie of the* Iewes: *that they, that, to doo them selues good, had not these thinges in their hartes, yet for our sakes, to doo vs good, shoulde haue the same thinges in theire Bookes.*

Speake not therefore so mutche, M. Hardinge, of your safe keepinge of the Scriptures. For the Iewes haue keapte, and vntil this daie do kepe them as safely, as you. Yee keapte the Scriptures, as the Augures of Rome sommetime keapte the Sibylles Bookes: that is to saie, yee keapte them to your selues, in close prison, and in secretie: that the people shoulde knowe nothinge, but in al cases shoulde be forced to seeke to you. Thus yee keapte the Light in Darkenesse: and, as S. Paule saithe, yee keapte the Truthe of God in VVickednesse.

Roman. 1.

Chryso. in Matt. Homil. 35.

S. Chrysostome saithe, Quando vides Scripturas Prophetarum, & Euangelij, & Apostolorum traditas esse in manus Falsorum Sacerdotum, num intelligis, quod Verbum veritatis traditum est Principibus iniquis, & Scribis? *When thou seest the* Scriptures *of the Prophetes, of the Gospel, and of the Apostles to be delinered into the handes of* False Priestes, *doost thou not vnderstande, that the Woorde of Truthe is deliuered vnto the wicked Princes, and vnto the Scribes?*

Chrysostom. in 1. Corin. Hom. 37.

To be shorte, I maie answeare you with the woordes of Chrysostome, Arcas, & Scrinia rerum pretiosissimarum adhuc seruatis, Thesauro destituti: *Yee keepe stil the Cheastes, and boxes of moste pretious thinges: but the Iewelles, and Treasures be cleane gonne.* Therefore your safe keepinge of the Scriptures notwithstandinge, wee maie saie to you, as S. Augustine sommetime saide to the Heretique Petilian: Iudas Christum Carnalem tradidit: Tu Spiritualem: furens Euangelium Sanctum flammis sacrilegis tradidisti: Iudas *betraied* Christe Carnal: *thou haste betraied* Christe Spiritual: *for thou in thy rage haste deliuered the* Holy Gospels *vnto wicked fires.*

August. Contra Literas Petilia. Lib. 2. Cap. 7.

Yee replie, You rather haue burnte the Gospels for that you denie the woordes of the Gospel. For example yee allege theise woordes of Christe, This is my Body: whiche woordes (ye saie) of our parte are denied. God be thanked, as wee haue not burnte, so haue wee not denied any woorde, or parcel of the Gospel. Touchinge theise woordes by you alleged, wee embrace them, and reuerence them, and beleue them, euen as the VVoordes of Christe. But wee embrace them, not as you haue fondely rashte, and wrasted them, and fowly abused them, by your vaine Constructions: but as Christe meante them, and as the Auncient Catholique Fathers in the Olde times haue expounded them.

Chrysost. in Ioan. Homil. 14.

S. Chrysostome saithe, Sacræ Scripturæ Verba non vult Deus, vt Simpliciter, sed multa cum prudentia intelligantur: *God wil not, that wee shoulde vnderstande the* woordes *of the Holy Scripture simply and plainely, as they lie, but with greate wisedome, and discretion.*

Chrysost. in Ioan. Homil. 39.

Againe he saithe, Diligenter inuigilandum est: vel potius Diuina Gratia opus est, ne nudis verbis insistamus. Ita Hæretici in Er-

rorem

This is my Body.

rorem incidunt: *Wee muste take greate heede: or rather wee haue neede of the Grace of God, that we reaste not vpon the* bare VVoordes of the Scriptures. For by that meanes Heretiques fal into Erroure. S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Omne Figuratè, aut factum, aut dictum, hoc enuntiat, quod Significat: *Euery thinge that is either donne, or ſpoken in a* Figure, *ſheweth foorthe the ſame thinge, that it* Signifieth. S. Hierome ſaithe: Ne putemus in Verbis Scripturarum eſſe Euangelium, ſed in Senſu: *Let vs not thinke that the Goſpel ſtandeth in the* VVoordes of the Scripture, *but in the Meaninge.*

Auguſt. ad Conſentiũ. li. 1. ca. 10

Hierom. ad Galat. Cap. 1.

Againe he ſaithe, Cùm Seniores putentur in Eccleſijs, & Principes Sacerdotum, Simplicem ſequentes Literam, Occidunt Filium Dei: *Whereas they be taken for the Elders of the Churche, and the Chiefe of the Prieſtes, folowinge the Plaine Letter,* (as it is written, and not regardinge the meaninge) *they kille the Sonne of God.*

Hieron. in Matt. Cap. 16.

Let vs ſée therefore, in what ſenſe the Holy Catholique Fathers haue in Olde times expounded theſe Wordes of Chriſte, This is my Body.

Firſte, Tertullian ſaithe thus, Chriſtus acceptum Panem, & diſtributum Diſcipulis, Corpus ſuum illum fecit, dicendo: Hoc eſt Corpus meum, hoc eſt, Figura Corporis mei: Chriſte, *takinge the Breade, and dividinge it to his Diſciples, made it his Body, ſaieinge:* This is my Body, that is to ſaie, This is a Figure of my Body. S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Non dubitauit Dominus dicere, Hoc eſt Corpus meum, cùm daret Signum Corporis ſui: *Our Lorde doubted not to ſaie,* This is my Body, *when he gaue* a Token of his Body. I leaue infinite other Authorities to like pourpoſe. By theſe fewe wée maie eaſily perceiue, in what ſenſe the Holy Fathers in Olde time vnderſtoode theſe Wordes of Chriſte, This is my Body. Yet were they neuer therefore condemned of Hereſie, nor thought to denie any parcel of the Scriptures.

Tertullian. Contra Marcionem. Lib. 4.

Auguſt. Contra Adiman. Cap. 12

S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Solet res, quæ Significat, eius rei nomine, quam Significat, nuncupari: Hinc eſt, quod dictum eſt, Petra erat Chriſtus. Non enim dicit, Petra Significat Chriſtum: Sed, tanquam hoc eſſet, quod vtique per Subſtantiam non erat, ſed per Significationem: *The thinge that Signifieth, is Commonly called by the name of that thinge, that it Signifieth. Therefore is it, that* S. Paule ſaithe, The Rocke was Chriſte: *For he ſaithe not,* The Rocke Signified Chriſte (but, The Rocke was Chriſte) *As if the Rocke had benne Chriſte in deede: whereas, touchinge the Subſtance, it was not ſo: but ſo it was by Signification.*

Auguſt. in quæſtionib. in Leuit. quæſt. 57.

In this ſorte is the Breade, Chriſtes Body: not verily, and in déede: but, as S. Auguſtine ſaithe, after a certaine phraſe, or manner of ſpeache. And ſo is it noted euen in your owne Gloſes, Vocatur Corpus Chriſti, id eſt, Significat Corpus Chriſti: *The* Breade is called the Body of Chriſte: that is to ſaie, The Breade Signifieth the Body of Chriſte. Thus wee denie not Chriſtes VVoordes, M. Hardinge: But wée denie the fonde, and fantaſtical ſenſes, that you haue imagined of Chriſtes VVoordes. Therefore where you allege theſe wordes, as ſpoken by S. Auguſtine, *He is a burner of the Scriptures, that conſenteth not vnto the Scriptures,* Yée might haue remembred, that the ſame S. Auguſtine likewiſe ſaithe, Ille credatur Teſtamentum tradidiſſe flammis, qui contra Voluntatem litigat Teſtatoris: *He is to be thought, to haue deliuered the Teſtamente to the fire, that quarrelleth* (as you do) *againſte the Wil, and meaninge of him, that made the Teſtamente.* S. Gregorie ſaithe, Facilè in verbis agnoſcimus aliud eſſe, quod intimant, aliud, quod ſonant: Tanto autem quiſque notitiæ illius Extraneus redditur, quanto in Sola eius Superficie ligatur: *In woordes wee doo wel perceiue, that there is one thinge, that they Signifie, and an other thinge, that they ſounde. And the more a man bindeth him ſelfe to the* outwarde ſight, and ſhewe of the Letter, *the further of is he from the vnderſtandinge of the ſame.*

De Conſ. Diſt. 2. Hoc eſt. In Gloſſ.

Augu. Epiſt. 162.

Gregorius in Iob. Li. 4. Ca. 1.

The obiection of difference, that ye make betwéene S. Iames, and S. Paule, (S. Auguſtine ſaithe) is made by them that vnderſtoode, neither S. Iames, nor S. Paule. The whole ſorte thereof is anſweared before. It is eaſy to ſée, that S. Paule ſpeaketh of one kinde of VVoorkes, and S. Iames of an other: and againe, S. Paule of one kinde of Iuſtification, and S. Iames of an other. Therefore this difference is ſone auoided. Certainely wée denie neither S. Paule, nor S. Iames: nor thinke, the one of them to be contrarie to the other.

Auguſ in Lib. 83. quæſtionũ q. 76. Parte. 1. Cap. 10. Diui. 1.

This is my Body.

Touchinge the Woꝛdes of Chꝛiſte, that pe̅ haue alleged out of S. Iohn, it appeareth, pe were in ſomme haſte, and thereſoꝛe were faine to take, that came firſte to hande. Foꝛ I wil not ſaie, M. Hardinge, what Doctoure, oꝛ Father, but, what dꝛifte, oꝛ diſcretion of Common ſenſe euer taught pou to reaſon thus? *Chriſte ſaith*, He that Eateth of this Breade ſhal liue for euer: Ergo, *The people muſte receiue the Communion vnder One kinde?* Who euer taught pou thus to reaſon? Eckius pour Felowe reaſoneth with like diſcretion to like pourpoſe:

Iohan. 6.

Kemnitius in Examine Conci. Triden. Pag 598

Geue vs, ſaithe he, our daily Breade:

Ergo, VVee maie reſtraine the people from the Cuppe.

Perhaps pe wil ſaie, The name of Breade belongeth to Eatinge onelp, and not to Dꝛinkinge. This maie be graunted wel without pꝛeiudice. Notwithſtandinge, S. Cyprian doubted not to ſaie, Manducauerunt, & Biberunt de eodem Pane: *They did bothe* Eate, and Drinke of one Breade. And againe he ſaithe, Manducamus & Bibimus eius Sanguinem: VVee Eate and Drinke his Bloude. Here haue pou bothe Drinkinge of Breade, and Eatinge of Bloude.

Cyprian. De Cœna Domini. In eodem serm.

How be it, in deede theſe woꝛdes of Chriſte in the firſte of S. Iohn, belonge onelp to the Spiritual Eatinge, and dꝛinkinge of Chꝛiſtes Body, and Bloude (that, is woꝛought, not bp the Mouthe, but onelp bp Faithe) nothinge to the outwarde Miniſtration of the Sacramente. One of pour owne Doctours ſaithe, Hæc verba nihil directè pertinent ad Sacramentalem, vel Corporalem Manducationem. Nam hoc verbum dictum fuit, antequam Sacramentum Euchariſtiæ eſſet inſtitutum. Ex illa igitur Litera de Sacramentali Communione non poteſt fieri Argumentum efficax: *Theſe Woordes of Chriſte in the ſixthe Chapter of* S. Iohn, *directly perteine nothinge to the Sacramental, oꝛ Corporal Eatinge. Foꝛ theſe woordes were ſpoken longe before the* Sacramente *was ordeined. Therefore of this place there can be made no good ſufficiente Argumente, touchinge the Sacramental Communion.* Pou ſaie, pour pꝛoufe, taken of theſe woꝛdes is ſufficient, and therewith pe deceiue the Ignoꝛant. Pour owne Doctoure ſaithe, It is not ſufficient. Nowe let your indifferente Reader Judge, whether of pou twoo is deceiued.

Nicolaus Lyra, in Pſalm. 110.

And, whereas pe woulde ſeeme to ſaie, *Chriſte gaue no Commaundemente of* Bothe kindes, *to be receiued of the people*, Euen ſo, and with like truthe pe̅ mighte alſo ſaie, Chriſte gaue no Commaundemente, no not of one kinde at al to be receiued of the people. Foꝛ there was no man preſente, but onelp the Apoſtles, at the Inſtitution, as wel of the one kinde, as of the other. Therefoꝛe, that the people maie claime any one parte of the Sacramente, they haue it not of any right, but onelp of pour mere, and frꝛe liberalitie. Foꝛ otherwiſe of dewtie, bp your iudgemente, they ſhould haue nothinge.

Notwithſtandinge Chriſte ſaith, Bibite ex hoc omnes: *Drinke yee* (not onelp the Apoſtles, but) *Drinke yee al of this.* Whiche woꝛdes Paſchaſius expoundeth thus: Bibite ex hoc omnes, Hoc eſt, tam Miniſtri, quàm reliqui Credentes: Drinke yee al of this: that is to ſaie, as wel the Miniſters, as the reſte of the Faitheful. An other ſaithe thus, Bibite ex hoc Omnes: Omnes, ſcilicet, ſine perſonarum acceptione: *Drinke yee al of this:* Al, *that is to ſaie, without difference, oꝛ choiſe of perſonnes.*

Paſchaſius.

Gloſſa. Citatur à Caſſandro. de vtroq; Specie.

But hereof wee haue ſpoken moꝛe at large in other places.

The Apologie, Cap. 21. Diuiſion. 2. & 3.

Very rightly, and aptely doothe Chryſoſtome wꝛite againſt theſe menne. Heretikes, ſaithe he, ſhutte vp the gates againſte the Truthe: foꝛ they knowe ful wel, if the gate were open, the Churche ſhoulde be none of theires.

Theophylacte alſo, Goddes VVoorde, ſaithe he, is the Candel, vvhereby the Theefe is eſpied.

The Apologie, Cap. 21. Diuiſion. 4.

And Tertullian ſaithe, The Holy Scripture manifeſtly findeth out the fraude, and theafte of Heretiques. Foꝛ why doo thei hide, why

doo

Counterfeite Chaſtitie.

doo they keepe vnder the Goſpel, whiche Chriſte would haue preached alowde from the houſe toppe? Why whealme they that light vnder a Buſſhel, whiche ought to ſtande on the Candelſticke?

M. Hardinge.

The Scripture ſaithe, There ſhalbe menne ſtandinge in theire owne conceite, vnchaſte, louinge pleaſure more then God. VVho are vnchaſte? they that exhorte al menne to * Chaſtitie, and them ſelues abſtaine from wedlocke for the better meane to ſerue God: or ye, that bidde menne, whiche haue vowed chaſtitie, to breake theire vowes?

[Illegible].

*This Chaſtitie in the more parte is opē filthineſſe. They forebidde Marriage, & ſuffer Cōcubines, for the better meane to ſerue God. *Matth.* 23. *Hierony. in* Daniel. *Cap.* 11.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

I leaue your Chaſtitie to the iudgemente of the Worlde. Yet you maie remember, there were ſomme in olde times, whome Chriſte likened to Painted graues: outwardely in appearance faire, and glorious: but inwardly ful of ſtinking boanes. It appeareth by the whole courſe, and order of your liues, that Single Life, and Chaſtitie, are ſundrie thinges. S. Hierome ſaithe thus, Super Concupiſcentiam fœminarum non intelliget: De Antichriſto facilior interpretatio eſt: quod ideò ſimulet Caſtitatem, vt plurimos decipiat: *He ſhal haue no ſkil, touchinge the deſire of weemen: The better expoſition hereof, is to applie theſe woordes to* Antichriſte: *For that he ſhal* Countrefaite Chaſtitie, *to the ende to deceiue many.*

S. Auguſtine ſaithe of the Heretiques called the Manichees: Vitæ Caſtæ, & memorabilis continentiæ imaginem præferunt: *They beare a countenance of continent life, and notable* Chaſtitie. S. Ambroſe ſaithe, Multi ſunt Hæreticorum, qui prætendere volunt Corporis continentiam: *There be many Heretiques, that wil countrefeite, and pretende* Chaſtitie of body (*that by the witneſſe thereof they maie winne Credite to their Doctrine*). Therefore, M. Hardinge, when you thus vaunte your ſelues of this Coloure of Chaſtitie, ye make boaſte of that thinge, that other Heretiques, and Antichriſte him ſelfe ſhal haue, as wel as you.

Auguſt. De Moribus Eccleſiæ Catholi. li. 1. ca. 1. *Ambroſ.* De Noë & Arca, ca. 14.

S. Paule, where he foretelleth vs of the Diſciples of Antichriſte, emongeſt other markes, whereby they maie be knowen, ſaithe thus: Prohibentes nubere: whereby he meante, that Antichriſte ſhoulde geue out a greate ſhine of Chaſte life, and forbidde Marriage. Of ſuche S. Hierome ſaithe, Iactant pudicitiam ſuam impudenti facie: *They make bragges of their Chaſtitie with whoorifhe Countenance.*

1. *Tim.* 4. *Hieronym. in Hieremi. cap.* 7. *Lib.* 2.

The Apologie, Cap. 21. Diuiſion. 5. & 6.

Why truſte they more to the blindneſſe of the vnſkilful multitude, and to ignorance, then to the goodneſſe of theire cauſe?

Thinke they theire ſleightes are not already perceiued, and that they can walke nowe vneſpied, as though they hadde Gyges ringe to goe inuiſible by, vpon theire finger? No, no.

The Apologie, Cap. 21. Diuiſion. 7.

Al menne ſee nowe wel, and wel againe, what good ſtuffe is in that cheſte of the Biſhop of Romes boſome. This thing alone of it ſelf maie be an argument ſufficient, that they woorke not vprightly, and truely.

M. Hardinge.

You are muche troubled with the cheſte of the Popes boſome, wherein he is thought to haue al Lawes. At this you ſcoffe foure or fiue times in your Apologie, medlinge with a matter, that you vnderſtande not. For it is a Lawiers phraſe. VVho preſuppoſeth the Prince of euery common weale to knowe the lawe of the ſame, no leſſe then if it were written in his Breaſte. And therefore when he maketh a newe lawe, he repealeth the former Lawe, whereunto the latter is contrary.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

For as muche, as this matter of the Popes breaſte is ſo deepe, and ful of darkeneſſe, ſpecially beinge as you ſaie, a Lawiers phraſe, that no man maie ſafely enter into it, but onely you, that neuer were ſtudent in any Lawe, lette vs therefore ſee, what your owne Canoniſtes, and Lawiers them ſelues haue meante hereby.

Baldus 1. *Cap. Colla. vltima De Confeſſ.*

Firſte of al, Baldus of Peruſium ſaithe, Papa eſt Doctor vtriuſq; Iuris, Authoritate, non Scientia: *The Pope is Doctour of bothe Lawes* (as wel Ciuile, as Canon) *by*

The cheaste of the Popes bosome.

Authoritie, but not by knowledge. Here wée finde, how so euer the Pope be stoared of Learninge, yet at the leaste he is a Doctoure by Authoritie, and that a Doctour of Bothe Lawes. So easy a mater it is to fille his breaste.

9. que. 3. Neque ab Augusto. Dist. 19. Si Romanorum. In Gloss.

Dist. 40. Si Papa In Glossa.

Further your Glose saithe, Etsi totus mundus sententiaret in aliquo negotio contra Papam, tamen videtur, quòd standum sit sententiæ Papæ. Iura enim omnia in Scrinio pectoris sui habere videtur. Quod ergo Papa approbat, vel reprobat, & nos approbare, vel reprobare debemus. Quisquis ergo non obedit Statutis Romanæ Ecclesiæ, Hæreticus est censendus. Et Sacrilegij instar esset, disputare de facto Papæ: *Although al the worlde woulde iudge in any mater againste the* Pope, *yet it seemeth, wee ought to stande to the iudgemente of the* Pope. *For he seemeth to haue* al Lawes in the Cheaste *of his bosome: Therefore, what so euer the* Pope *either alloweth, or disalloweth, wee are bounde likewise to allowe, or disallowe the same. And who so euer is not obediente to the Lawes of the Churche of Rome, muste be deemed an Heretique. And it were as greate sinne as Churche-robbinge, to reason of any of the* Popes *doinges.*

Extr. De trãsla. Episcopi. Quãto In Glossa. Felin. De Rescriptis. Ad Audientiam, 2. ver.

Further, poure Lawiers saie thus, Papa dicitur habere Cœleste arbitrium: Vnde in his, quæ vult, est ei pro Ratione Voluntas. Nec est, qui dicat illi, Domine, cur ita facis? Quia sicut ex Sola Voluntate potest per Papam Lex creari, ita per Solam Voluntatem potest cum ea dispensari: *The* Pope *is saide to haue a heauenly iudgemente: Therefore in suche thinges, as he willeth, his Wil standeth in steede of Reason. Neither maie any man saie vnto him, O sir,* VVhy doo you thus? *Like as a* Lawe *maie be made by the* Onely VVil of the Pope: *so maie the same* Lawe *bee dispensed withal* onely by the wil of the Pope.

This, M. Hardinge, is the exposition of poure Lawiers phrase. Theise are the treasures, that wée are taught to séeke in the Closet of the Popes breaste. Thus maie wée set aparte Scriptures, Doctoures, Councelles, and what so euer is bisde: The Popes breaste maie serue for al.

The Apologie, Cap. 21. Diuision. 1.

Worthily ought that mater seeme suspicious, whiche fleeth trial, and is afraide of the light. For he that doothe euil, as Christe saithe, seketh darkenesse, and hateth the light. A conscience, that knoweth it selfe cleare, commethe willingly into open shewe, that the woorkes, whiche proceede of God, maie be seene. Neither bee they so very blinde, but they see this wel enough, that theire Kingdome streightwaie is at a pointe, if the Scriptures once haue the vpper hande: and that, like as menne saie, the Idolles of Diuels in times past, of whome menne in doubtful maters were then woonte to receiue answeares, were suddainely striken doumbe at the sighte of Christe, when he was borne, and came into the worlde: euen so they see, that nowe al theire subtle practises wil soone fal downe headlonge, euen vpon the sight of the Gospel. For Antichriste is not ouerthrowen, but by the brightnesse of the comminge of Christe.

The Apologie, Cap. 22. Diuision. 1.

As for vs, wee renne not for succour to the Fire, as these mennes guise is, but wee renne to the Scriptures: neither doo wee reason with the Swerde, but with the VVoorde of God: and therewith, as saithe Tertullian, doo wee feede our Faithe: by it doo wee stirre vp our hope, and strengthen our Confidence.

M. Hardinge.

Ye flie not to the Fire, as wee doo, saie yee, but vnto the Scriptures. Neither doo yee reason with vs with the sworde, but with the VVoorde of God. Ah good woorde of God, thou serueste to many purposes.

Hereti-ques to deathe.

pourpoſes. And is it in deede the woorde of God Sirs, that keepeth ſo many reuereade Fathers in priſon theſe many yeeres? Is it the woorde of God, that hath depriued ſo many menne, ſomme of theire liuinges, ſomme of their countries, whoſe life ye can not blame? Is it the woorde of God, that by crueltie of impriſonemente of late yeeres gaue moſte certaine occaſion of deathe to thoſe Holy, Learned, and woorſhipful menne, who for their ſingulare vertue beinge wel knowen, neede not here to be named? Is it the woorde of God, that made ſo mutche adoo in your late Perlamente for eſtabliſhinge of your bloudy lawe, whereby yee woulde haue power to put menne to deathe (a) for the Faithe of Chriſtendome? The Turkes and Saracenes haue alwaies ſuffered them to liue in their Dominions, but our Goſpellers by theire woorde of God are taught to kil them. Bleſſed be God, who hathe geeuen to our noble and moſte clement Queene Elizabeth a better ſpirite to vnderſtande his woorde in this pointe, (b) then theſe Goſpellers haue yet attained vnto.

If any of you doo ſaie, that the newe Superintendentes doo not keepe the olde Biſhoppes, and learned Cleregie in priſon, but the Lawe of the Realme: I anſweare, firſte, that the Lawe is a crabbe of your owne ſtocke: nexte that neither the Biſhoppes before time burnte Heretiques, but the Lawe of the Realme, the Lawe of the Prince, the Lawe of al Chriſtendome. Neither was the ſame made by Papiſtes of late yeeres, as yee woulde youre deceiued diſciples to beleeue, but of olde time thoughte (c) neceſſarie by Princes to be enacted, for the better maintenance of quiet in their Dominions.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

It is no newe practiſe (pée ſaie) to kil Heretiques. **I graunt you. Neither is it a new practiſe, to condemne goodly menne by the name of** Heretiques. **Your Fathers ſometime cried out againſte** Chriſte the Sonne of God, VVee haue a Lawe: and by the Lawe he oughte to dée. **And** Chriſte **him ſelfe ſaide ſommetime to** Hieruſalem, **the Cittie of Bloude,** O Hieruſalem, Hieruſalem, *that killeſte the Prophetes, and ſtoaneſte them to death, that be ſente vnto thee.* **But** S. Auguſtine **ſaithe,** Nullis bonis in Catholica hoc placet, ſi vſque ad Mortem in quenquam, licet Hæreticum, ſæuiatur: *It ſeemeth good vnto no good man in the Catholique Churche, that crueltie vnto deathe be ſhewed vnto any man, no thoughe he be an* Heretique.

Notwithſtandinge, it agreeth wel with your Religion, M. Hardinge, thoughe your mouthes now be mouſled, yet to rampe, and gape ſtil after bloude. Fulfil pée the meaſure of your Fathers. Let it not gréeue you, to heare, what Salomon **ſaithe,** Viſcera impiorum crudelia: *The very bowelles of the wicked are ful of crueltie.* **When your Fables, and lies be eſpied, then pée flée to Swerde, and Fire. Which beinge once wreſted from you, your whole Religion muſte néedes comme to grounde.** S. Hierome **ſaith of other your peeres,** Pugnant Epicherematis ex carnificum officinis: *They fight with Argumentes taken from the Bouchers ſhoppes.*

Pée haue wreakte your angre longe penough vpon innocent bloude. Beginne once to knowe the hande of God. It is harde for you, to kike ſtil againſte the pricke. Wée maie truely ſaie vnto you with S. Cyprian, Sacerdos Dei Euangelium tenens, & Chriſti Præcepta cuſtodiens, Occidi poteſt, Vinci non poteſt: *The Prieſte of God, holdinge the Goſpel, and keepinge the Commaundementes of* Chriſte, *maie wel be killed: But conquered he cannot be.* **Wée maie ſaie with** Tertullian, Crudelitas veſtra, Gloria noſtra eſt: Plures efficimur, quoties metimur à vobis: *Youre Crueltie is ourre Glorie. When yee comme to recken vs, yee finde vs moe, and moe.* Truthe aboue al thinges wil preuaile. There is no Counſel againſte the Lorde.

As for ourre parte, wée were neuer yet guiltie to one droppe of youre bloude. Wée ſeeke no aide at Fire, or Swerde. Wée wil rather ſaie with S. Hierome, Vtinam filios Hæreticorum, & omnium, qui decepti ſunt, interficiamus Sagittis Spiritualibus, id eſt, Teſtimonijs Scripturarum: *Woulde God wee maie rather kille the Children of Heretiques, and of al them, that be deceiued, with Spiritual Arrowes, that is to ſaie, with the Teſtimonies of the Scriptures.* **And with** S. Auguſtine, O ſi occidas eos de gladio bis acuto, & non ſint Hoſtes tui: Sic enim amo eos occidi ſibi, vt viuant tibi: *Woulde God, thou wouldeſt kille them, O Lorde, with the twoo edged Swerde* (**that is, with thy Holy Worde**) *That they maie no lenger be thine Enimies. For ſo I wiſhe them to bee killed vnto them ſelues, that they maie liue vnto thee.* **And againe,** Vindicet nos Deus de vobis, vt ipſum errorem veſtrum in vobis occidat, & nobiſcum de Veritate gaudeatis: *God ſo reuenge ourre cauſe againſte you, that he maie kille your errourre in you, that ye maie reioice together with vs of the Truthe.* **This, M. Hardinge, this is the reuenge, that wée ſeeke vpon you, as this daie it maie appeare.**

Al this nowe is extreme Crueltie. Not longe ſithence it had benne taken for great mercie.

(a) Vntruth. For it is either Idolatrie, or open folie: & no part of the Faithe of Chriſtendome.

(b) what Sprite then had you M. Harding, and your felowes that burnte ſo many?

(c) This mater thus vttered in generalitie, is a great Vntruthe.

Iohan. 19.

Luke. 13.

Auguſtin. Contra Creſcon. Gram. li. 3. ca. 52

Matthæ. 23.

Proverb. 11.

Cyprian. ad Cornel.

Tertul. ad Scapulam.

Tertul. in Apologetico.

2. Eſdr. 3.

Proverb. 21.

Hiero. in Eſai. li. 5. cap. 14.

Auguſtin. Conf. li. 12. ca. 14

Auguſtin. Epiſt. 166.

If an Angel from Heauē, &c.

The Apologie, Cap. 22. Diuision. 2.

For wee knowe, that the Gospel of Iesus Christ is the power of God vnto Saluation, and that therein consisteth Eternal Life. And as Paule warneth vs, vvee doo not heare, no not an Angel of God, though he comme from Heauen, if he goe aboute to pulle vs from any parte of this Doctrine.

M. Hardinge.

Boaste no more of the Gospel. VVee (I meane the Catholique Churche) had it, wee keapt it, and vnderstoode it, before yee were borne, and before your Heresie was hearde of.

But a Diuel comminge from hel (for who is authour of diuision but Satan?) hath caried you awaie into an other Gospel: whereas in deede there is but one true Gospel. And here let any indifferent man consider, howe vprightly you allege S. Paule. You write, that Paule warneth you not Galat. 1. to geeue eare to an Angel comminge from heauen, if he goe aboute to drawe you from any parte of this Doctrine. Of whiche this Doctrine meane you? Of this, whiche you haue declared in this Apologie? * Did S. Paule euer reade your Apologie? Howe then pronounced he of it that sentence? VVee meane (saie you) by this Doctrine, the Doctrine of the Gospel. If you meane so, wee saie the same. But wee telle you, that S. Paule spake not of euery Gospel generally, but of a certaine Gospel qualified. For he saithe, *Si quis vobis euangelizauerit praeter id quod accepisti is, anathema sit:* If any man preache a Gospel vnto you, besides that yee haue receiued, be he accursed. Heare you the Gospel S. Paule speaketh of? It is not euery Gospel. It is a Gospel preached and receiued. If yee preache that Gospel, whiche yee receiued, wee ioine handes with you. But if yee preache a Gospel whiche yee haue receiued of no Apostle, nor Apostolique preacher, and whiche was not hearde of in the earth, when Luther ranne out of his Cloister, and foresooke his Religion: then be yee assured, that ye are the menne, who are holden for accursed of S. Paule.

* And did S. Paule euer reade your late Chapter of Trente?

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Here, M. Harding, ye would faine scape awaie with a Childishe Cauill. Paule, ye saie, speaketh of a Gospel qualified: whereby ye meane a Gospel deliuered, and receiued: As if ye woulde saie, The Gospel of Christe, onelesse it be deliuered by you, is no Gospel. But S. Paule meante not the Doctrine deliuered from hande to hande, or from Pope to Pope: But the Doctrine deliuered, and receiued in the Scriptures. And in this sense he saithe of him selfe: Quod accepi à Domino, hoc & tradidi vobis: *The thinge, that I haue receiued of the Lorde, the same haue I deliuered vnto you.* **In like sorte he calleth him selfe an Apostle,** *not of menne, nor by men, but by Iesus Christe.* **Howe be it, what nede many wordes? The case is clare.** S. Augustine **saithe plainely,** Paulus ait, Si Angelus de Cœlo vobis annuntiauerit, præterquam quod in Scripturis legalibus, & Euangelicis accepistis, Anathema sit: If an Angel *from Heauen preache vnto you any other thinge, then ye haue receiued* (**not by** Tradition, **or by deliuerie from your Elders, but**) *in the Scriptures of the* Law *and of the* gospel, *accursed be he.* **These wordes be plaine, M. Harding, & quite disgrace al your** Gloses.

1. Cor. 11. Galat. 1.

August. Contra literas Petiliã. Lib. 3. Cap. 6.

Hereto Chrysostome **addeth further,** Non dixit Paulus, Si contraria annuntiauerint, aut totum Euangelium subuerterint, verùm, Si vel paulùm Euangelizauerint, præter Euangelium, quod accepistis, etiamsi quidvis labefactauerint, Anathema sint: S. Paule *saithe not, If they teache the contrarie, or, if they ouerthrowe the whole Gospel: But he saithe, If they preache any little smal thinge, besides the Gospel, that yee haue receiued, or, if they loose, or shake downe any thinge, what so euer it bee, accursed be they.* **These wordes, M. Hardinge, touche you very neare. Ye haue altered the whole fourme of the Churche of God. Therefore repente your selues, leaste ye remaine stil within the daunger of the Curse.**

Chrysost. in epi. ad Galat. Cap. 1.

S. Augustine **saithe,** Sancta Scriptura nostræ Doctrinæ Regulam figit, Ne audeamus plus sapere, quàm oporteat sapere: *The Holy Scripture hathe laide a rule vnto our Doctrine, that wee dare not to vnderstande more, then is meete for vs to vnderstande.*

Augustin. De Bono Viduitatis. Ca. 1. Rom. 12.

The Apologie, Cap. 22. Diuision. 1.

For, where these men bid the Holy Scriptures awaie, as doumbe, and sruteiesse, and procure vs to comme to God him selfe rather, who speaketh in the Church, and in their Councelles, that is to saie, to beleue their fansies, and opinions: this waie of findinge out the Truth is

very

The people cannot Iudge.

very vncertaine, and exceeding dangerous, and in manner a fantastical and madde waie, and by no meanes allowed of the Holy Fathers.

M. Hardinge.

VVhere they saie, we passe but litle on the Scriptures, as dumbe and vnprofitable, therein they *slaunder vs, as in other thinges. VVee doo not so. But wee saie, that as euery acte of Parlamente muste be executed by a lawful Iudge, so the holy Scriptures haue theire execution by lawful Iudges, who are the Bishoppes and Fathers, as wel in other places, as specially when they be lawfully assembled in generall Councelles. Nowe saie these menne, that waie is very vncertaine, dangerous, in maner madde, and not allowed of the Fathers. VVhosoeuer heard menne thought to haue theire righte wittes, talke after so loose a sorte? Did the Fathers* disproue the order of comminge togeather in generall Councelles? Or thought they the same to be a waie for menne to be the soner deceiued? If so many maie be deceiued with moste diligente studie, and mature iudgemente conferringe togeather, howe muche sooner may one or twoo alone leadde by priuate phansie and selfe wil, be caried away into errour? At the Nicene Councel came togeather, 318. Bishops. At the firste of Constantinople, 150. at the Ephesine Councel, 200. At that of Calchedon 630. Al these foure Councels sundrie Ancient Fathers, namely S. Gregorie, esteemed as the foure Gospels. Yea, but saithe he, I haue the woorde of God. But what if 300. farre holier, and better learned men saie, he hathe it not? Let the Reader be iudge saithe he, A meete Iudge in suche a cause. The Scholers maie reade, but iudge of their maisters, they maie not by Christes doctrine, who saide, *Non est discipulus supra magistrum*, The Scholer is not aboue his maister. VVhy not, for al that, saie you, if the Holy Ghoste inspire him? Sir, is it not to be thought, God dothe assiste his Churche represented in sutche solemne assemblies of three hundred or moe Fathers gouernours of Christen people, rather then one man?

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Whether yée cal the Scriptures of God a Dumbe thinge, or no, I repoyte mée to that, is saide before. One of you calleth it Mortuum Atramentum: Dead Inke. An other saith, Scriptura est res inanimis, & muta: The Scripture is a dead and a dumbe thinge. An other calleth the Scriptures, Nigrum Euangelium: *The blacke Gospel.* Now if the Scriptures be Deade, and Doumbe, and can not speake, then must it nedes followe, they are vnprofitable. Neither do wee despise the Authoritie of Councelles. Good Councelles be graue, and reuerende. But thus we saie, Councelles are often againste Councelles: And, if wee make rekeninge of number, the Arian Heretiques haue had moe Councelles, then the Christians. S. Hierome saith, Spiritus Sancti Doctrina est, quæ Cononicis literis prodita est: Contra quam si quid statuant Concilia, nefas duco: *That is the Doctrine of the Holy Ghoste, that is set abroade in the Canonical* Scriptures: *Against whiche Doctrine if Councelles determine any thinge*, I thinke it wicked.

Cap. 19. Dist. 1. Ludouicus in Con. Triden. Episco. Pictauien. in Con. Triden. Albert. Pigghe. Controuer. 3. Eckius. Hieron. in Epist. ad Galath.

S. Chrysostome saithe further in more earnest sorte: Plus aliquid dicam: Ne Paulo quidem obedire oportet, si quid dixerit proprium, si quid humanum: *I wil saie more: Wee ought not to beleeue, no not* Paule him selfe, *if he speake any thinge of his owne, or if he speake onely as a man.*

Chrysost. in 2. ad Timoth. Hom. 2.

And to encrease the vncertaintie hereof, the whole weight, and iudgement of Councelles hangeth nowe euermore vpon the Pope: as it maie appeare by these wordes of the Conclusion of the late Chapter at Trident: Salua semper in omnibus Sedis Apostolicæ Authoritate: *The Authoritie of the Apostolique See in al thinges euermore reserued.* Whereby it appeareth, that the Determination of Maters hangeth not of the Councel, but of the Pope. But Platyna saith, as it is alleged before, Acta priorum Pontificum sequentes Pontifices semper aut infringunt, aut omnino tollunt: *The* Popes, *that folowe, doo euermore either breake, or wholy abrogate the Decrees of the* Popes, *that were before.* And thus, being turned from al other Bishoppes vnto Councelles, from Councelles to the Pope, and from one Pope to an other, we that euermore builde vpon sande, and vncertaintie, and neuer be assured, where to stande.

Concil. Triden. Sess. 6. Platyna in Stephano.

VVhether the Scripture be wel alleged, or otherwise, therof (ye saie) the people maie not iudge. For Christe saithe, The Scholare is not aboue his Maister. Certainely, M. Harding, the simplest of al the people, notwithstanding, by your restrainte, he maie not iudge of the Scriptures, yet he maie easily iudge of you, either that ye vnderstande not, or that ye vnaduisedly abuse the Scriptures. VVhether it be the worde of God, or no, the people (ye saie) maie not Iudge. And that ye prone euen by the Scriptures, God knoweth, ful handsomely, and ful discretely applied: For the Scholare (ye saie) is not aboue his Maister. Thus we maie learne by the Logique of Louaine, that Populus is Latine for a Scholare: and that Scripture is Latine for a Maister. And thus by your vaine permisses

**Vntruthe. For these be youre owne Felowes woordes. Reade the Answeare. *Gregorius Nazianzenus saith He neuer sawe good comme of any Councel.*

without

The people cannot Iudge.

without ſenſe pe̓ precede vainely, and conclude nothinge.

O, M. Hardinge, haue ſome regarde to that ye wꝛite. The ſimpleſt maie ſone eſpie your doinges. Pe̓ can no longer thus mocke the wꝛolde with ſhewes of wꝛordes. Chriſte ſpake not theſe wꝛordes of the vnderſtandinge of the Scriptures: but of perſequution for the Scriptures. Marke wel the place. Thus the wꝛordes lie togeather: *When they ſhal perſecute you in one Cittie, flee into an other, &c.* The Scholare is not aboue his Maiſter: Nor the Seruante aboue his Lorde. *If they haue called the Maiſter of the houſe Beelzebub, howe muche more wil they ſo calle his houſholde ſeruauntes?* Matthe. 10.

Alas, where learned you to frame ſutche Argumentes, The Apoſtles, beeinge the Scholars, can nomore eſcape perſecution, then coulde Chriſte, that was the Maiſter: *Ergo*, The people cannot vnderſtande, what they reade in the Scriptures? Here is neither Antecedente, nor Conſequente, nor Sequele in Reaſon. For the honoure of the Vniuerſitie, haue better regarde vnto your Logique. Pe̓ bewaie the weakenelle of your cauſe, when pe̓ ſo ſclenderly abuſe the Scriptures.

The Apologie, Cap. 22. Diuiſion. 4.

Chryſoſtome ſaithe, There be many oftentimes, vvhich boaſte them ſelues of the Holy Ghoſte: but truely, vvho ſo ſpeake of their ovvne heade, doo falſely boaſte that thei haue the ſprite of God. For like as, ſaithe he, Chriſte denied, he ſpake of him ſelfe, vvhen he ſpake out of the Lavve, and Prophetes, euen ſo novve, if any thinge be preſſed vpon vs in the name of the Holy Ghoſte, ſaue the Goſpel, vvee ought not to beleeue it. For as Chriſte is the fulfillinge of the Lavve and Prophetes, ſo is the Holy Ghoſte the fulfillinge of the Goſpel. Thus farre goeth Chryſoſtome.

M. Hardinge.

They alleage out of Chryſoſtome, that who ſo euer ſpeake of theire owne, doo vntruely attribute to them ſelues the Spirite of God. But they remember not, howe they, who are gathered togeather in the name of Chriſte, doo not ſpeake of their owne, becauſe Chriſte, who is the truthe, hathe promiſed to be in the middeſt of them. Nowe if they telle vs, that the Fathers at Trente were not gathered together in the name of Chriſte, howe muche more truely maie wee reply to them, that the temporal menne aſſembled together at Auſpurg, at Marpurg, at VVormes, at Smalcald, at Baden, at VVeſtminſter, or any where els, came not together in the name of Chriſte? I require but a man of common ſenſe to ſitte Iudge in this cauſe. They can not poſſibly bringe any thinge out of the Scriptures, or Auncient Fathers, for maintenance of this theire greate caſe.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Pe̓ buſſe ouer boldely, M. Harding, on Chriſtes promiſſes. God is true, what ſo euer he promiſe: But oftentimes menne are falſe. Chriſte hathe promiſed to be preſente, where ſo euer two, or three be gathered togeather in his name: But it appeareth by the wꝛordes of the Prophete Dauid, *that Councelles oftentimes meete together againſte God, and againſte his Chriſte.* The Prophete Michæas ſaithe, Sic dicit Dominus de Prophetis, qui errare faciunt populum meum: Abominantur iudicium, & omne rectum peruertunt: Super Dominum requieſcebant, dicẽtes: Nunquid non eſt Dominus in medio noſtri? *Thus ſaith our Lorde of the Prophetes, that deceiue my people: They abhorre Iudgemente: they ouerthrowe al that is right. And yet they reaſte them ſelues vpon our Lorde ſaieinge, Is not our Lorde in the middeſt emongeſt vs?* Pſalm. 2. Actor. 4. Michæa. 3.

This is your defenſe, M. Hardinge. Whether the VVoorde of God be with you, or againſte you, yet pe̓ ſaie, Yee haue ſtil the Sprite of God: and our Lorde him ſelfe is in the middeſt emongeſt you. But this boldenelle, by Chryſoſtomes Iudgemente, is preſumptuous, and daungerous. And therefore his counſel is, that if any thinge be preſſed vpon vs by the name of the Holy Ghoſt, ſauinge onely the Goſpel of Chriſt, wee ſhould not beleeue it. In like ſenſe S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Sua illi ſi docere velint, nolite audire: nolite facere: *If they bringe any Decree, or Fantaſie of theire owne, heare it not: Doo it not.* Chryſoſtom. De Sancto & Adorando Spirit. Auguſt. in Ioan. Tract. 46.

Thus the Olde Frenetique, and Fanatical Heretiques, when they found them ſelues

ſelues conuinced by the euidente teſtimonies of Goddes VVoorde, they appealed to the Sprite of God: whiche, they ſaid, euen as pou ſaie, euermoze aſſiſted them, and could not faile them. Hereof S. Auguſtine wzitteth thus: Videtis ergo, id vos agere, vt omnis de medio Scripturarum authoritas auferatur: & ſuus cuiq; animus author ſit, quid in quaque Scriptura probet, quid improbet: id eſt, vt non Authoritati Scripturarum ſubijciatur ad Fidem, ſed ſibi Scripturas ipſe ſubijciat: Non vt ideò illi placeat aliquid, quia hoc in ſublimi Authoritate ſcriptum legitur: ſed ideò rectè ſcriptum videatur, quia hoc illi placuit: *Ye ſee therefore, this is your driſte, that al Authoritie of the* Scriptures *be remoued: that eche man maie be leade by his owne fantaſie, what he liſte, either to allowe in the Holy* Scriptures, *or to diſallowe: that is to ſaie, that he ſubmit not him ſelfe, touching his Faithe, to the Authoritie of the* Scriptures: *but that he make the* Scriptures *ſubiecte vnto him: Not that he wil allowe any thinge, bicauſe it is wzitten in that highe Authoritie of the* Scriptures: *but that he wil thinke it wel wzitten, bicauſe he alloweth it.* By meane hereof it commeth to paſſe, that S. Hilarie wzitteth, Qui, quæ ſcripta ſunt, negas, quid ſupereſt, niſi vt, quæ non ſcripta ſunt, probes? *For as mutche as thou denieſt the thinges, that be wzitten, what remaineth there, but that thou muſte allowe the thinges, that be not wzitten?*

Auguſt. Contra Fauſtum Manichæ, li. 30. ca. 18

Hilari. De Trinitate, li. 9.

Concerninge the Authozitie, and Credite of Councelles, wee ſhal haue cauſe to ſaie mozе hereafter. But, where yee require, but a man of common ſenſe, to ſitte as Judge in this cauſe, it appeareth, that either yee remember not, oz els ye weighe not, that yee immediately laide bekoze. Foz in this ſelfe ſame Chapter ye ſaie, The people maie not iudge of theire Biſhoppes. And that, as ye tel vs, by Chziſtes owne Doctrine: For the Scholare is not aboue his Maiſter. Yet nowe ſuddainely, as hauinge forgotten pour owne wozdes, yee calle forthe the Scholare, yea, and as it maie be thought, one of the meaneſt of al pour Schole, as a man onely endewed with common ſenſe, to ſitte in Judgement ouer his Maiſter.

Actor. 10. Iohan. 3.

Notwithſtandinge, God is no accepter of perſones. Goddes Holy Sprite is not bounde to Councelles, oz Companies: but bzeatheth freely, where it liſteth. And therefoze, as poure owne Doctoure Panormitane ſaithe, in caſes of Religion the Judgemente of one Simple plaine man oughte ſommetimes to be receiued bekoze the Judgemente of the Pope.

Extra. De Electi, & Electi poteſtat. Significaſt. Abb.

Here endeth the Fourth Parte.

The Fifthe Parte.

The Apologie, Cap. 1. Diuiſion. 1.

BVt here, I looke, they wil ſaie, thoughe they haue not the Scriptures, yet it maie chaunce, they haue the Aunciente Doctoures, and the Holy Fathers with them. Foz this is a highe bzagge they haue euer made, howe that al Antiquitie, and a Continual Conſente of al ages doothe make on theire ſide: and that al our caſes be but Newe, & yeſter daies woozke, and vntil theſe fewe late yeeres were neuer heard of. Queſtionleſſe, there can nothinge be mozе ſpitefully ſpoken againſte the Religion of God, then to accuſe it of Noueltie, as a mater lately founde out. Foz as there can be no change in God him ſelfe, ſo ought there to be no change in his Religion.

Yet

Olde. Newe.

yet neuertheleſſe, we wote not by what meanes, but we haue euer ſeene it come ſo to paſſe, from the firſte beginning, that as often as God did geeue but ſome light, and did open his Truthe vnto men, thoughe the Truthe were not onely of greateſt Antiquitie, but alſo from Euerlaſtinge, yet of wicked menne, and of the Aduerſaries it was called Newfangled, and of late diuiſed, That vngracious, and bloudthirſty Haman, when he ſought to procure the Kinge Aſſuerus diſpleaſure againſte the Ievves, vſed this accuſation againſt them: Thou haſt here (ſaithe he) a kinde of people, that vſeth certaine newe Lawes of their owne, but ſtifnecked, and rebellious againſte al thy Lawes. When Paule alſo began firſte to preach, and expounde the Goſpel at Athenes, he was called a Tidinges bringer of Newe Goddes: as mutche to ſaie, as of a Newe Religion. For (ſaide the Athenians) maie wee not knowe of thee, what Newe Doctrine this is? Celſus likewiſe, when he of ſet pourpoſe wrote againſt Chriſt, to the end he might more ſcornfully ſcoffe out the Goſpel by the name of Noueltie. What ſaith he, hath God after ſo many ages nowe at laſte, and ſo late bethoughte him ſelfe? Euſebius alſo writeth, that the Chriſtian Religion from the beginninge, for very ſpite, was called Καινὸν ξένον, that is to ſaie, Newe, & Strange. After like ſorte, theſe menne condemne al our maters, as Strange, & Newe: but they wil haue theire owne, what ſo euer they are, to be praiſed as thinges of longe Continuance.

Exther. 3.

Actor. 17.

Origen. Contra Celſum.

Euſeb. li. 1. ca. 4.

M. Hardinge.

They had ſaide ſomewhat, if they had proued, that the Doctrine (a) of Chriſte had ben called newe by them, who were the profeſſours, and folowers of it. But nowe reportinge that the Gentils, who knewe not God, as Aman, as the Athenians, as Celſus the Etnike, and ſutche the like, called the right and true Religion of God, newe: they ſaie nothing to any purpoſe. But let them ſhewe, that before the comminge of Chriſte, any ſutche Religion was allowed, that was newe: Or that ſithens Chriſtes incarnation, amonge Chriſtian men what ſo euer Religion was not ſhunned and reiected as Heretical, whiche was newe. Here are they domme. And yet for ſhewe of learninge in a mater not neceſſarie, they bringe foorthe theire ſtore, and declare, that the Doctrine and Religion of truthe was newe to them, whiche knewe not God nor Chriſte the Sonne of God, whiche no man denieth.

(a) A vaine diſtinction. For neither doo wee calle oure Doctrine Newe.

Thus al menne of any iudgemente maie ſee, howe ſondly they reaſon. VVe (b) tel them that al newe Doctrine nowe in the Churche of Chriſte is naught: and they proue, that infidelles haue in the time of Moſes lawe, and at the firſte preachinge of the Goſpel, impugned Goddes euerlaſtinge truthe with the odious terme and reproche of newnes. Newe doctrine was good to vs at our firſte converſion from infidelitie. But ſince that wee receiued the true Faith from S. Gregorie the Biſhop of Rome, (c) who conuerted the Realme of Englande to the faith by S. Auguſtine his Legate, and others ſent for that godly pourpoſe: woorthely wee ſhunne and abhorre al newe Goſpelles, newe Faithes, newe Doctrines, newe Religions.

(b) VVee tel you ye haue loſt the right names of thinges: and cal that Newe, that in deede is Old.

(c) Vntruth. For the true Faithe of Chriſte had bene planted and ſtil continewed in this Realme foure hundred yeeres, before the comminge of this Auguſtine.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

The Truth of God neither is furthered by the face of Antiquitie: nor hindered by the opinion of Noueltie. For oftentimes the thinge, that in deede is Newe, is condemned as Olde: and the thinge, that in deede is Olde, is condemned as Newe. If Newneſſe in Religion in al reſpectes, and euery waie were il, Chriſte woulde not haue reſembled his Doctrine to Newe VVine: nor would he haue ſaide to his Diſciples, *I geeue you a* Newe Commaundement: Neither would he haue called the *Cuppe of Thankesgeeuinge, The* Newe Teſtamente, *in his Bloude*. Arnobius ſaithe, Religionis Authoritas non eſt tempore æſtimanda, ſed numine: nec quo die, ſed quid colere coperis, intueri conuenit Quod Verum eſt, Serum non eſt: *The Authoritie of Religion muſte be weighed by God, and not by time: It behoueth vs to conſider, not vpon what daie, but what thinge wee beganne to woorſhip.* The thinge, that is true, is neuer too late.

Matthe. 9. Iohan. 13. Luke. 22. Arnobius contra Gentes. Li. 2.

S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Quod Anterius eſt, inquiunt Etnici, falſum eſſe non poteſt. Quaſi Antiquitas, & Vetus Conſuetudo præiudicet Veritati: *The Heathens ſaie, The Religion, that was firſte, can not be falſe: As thoughe Antiquitie, and Olde Cuſtome*

Auguſt. in quæſt. Noui & Veteris Teſtamenti, quæſt. 114.

coulde

coulde preuaile againſte the Truthe. Againe he ſaithe, Nec dici debet, quare modo? & quare Sero? Quoniam mittentis Conſilium non eſt humano ingenio penetrabile: *Neither maie wee ſaie, Why commeth it nowe? Why commeth it ſo late? For the Counſel of God, that ſente it, is vnſearchable to the wiſedom of man.* Ye ſaie, They were Infidels only, that charged the Religion of Chriſte with Noueltie. And further ye ſaie, VVee telle them, that al Newe Doctrine nowe in the Churche of Chriſte is naught. Hereto, M. Harding, wee ſone agree. And therfore wee tel you, that your Newe Fantaſies, which ye haue painted with the colour of Ancientie, & therewith haue deceiued the worlde, are vaine, & naught. As for vs, wee haue planted no Newe Religion, but onely haue renewed the Olde, that was vndoubtedly founded, & vſed by the Apoſtles of Chriſt, and other Holy Fathers in the Primitiue Churche: and of this longe late time, by meane of the multitude of your Traditions, and Vanities, hathe benne drowned. Auguſt. De Ciuita. Li. 10. ca. 32

Therefore wee maie ſaie with S. Bernarde, Nouitatem dico, propter linguas hominum impiorum: qui, cùm manifeſtum Lumen obnubilare non queunt, de Solo Nouitatis nomine cauillantur, &c. Sed hæc Nouitas non eſt nouella vanitas. Res enim eſt Antiquæ Religionis: Perfectè fundatæ in Chriſto Pietatis: Antiqua Hæreditas Eccleſiæ Dei: *I calle it* Noueltie, *bicauſe of the tongues of wicked menne: who beinge not hable to ſhadowe the manifeſte lighte of the Truthe, finde cauillations vpon the* Onely name of Noueltie. But this Noueltie is no new Vanitie (as is this late vpſtart Religion of Rome). For it is a mater of Olde Religion: of perfite Godlineſſe founded in Chriſte: The Aunciente Enheritance of the Crurche of God. The Olde Learned Father Tertullian ſaithe, Viderint ergo, quibus Nouum eſt, quòd ſibi eſt Vetus: Hæreſes non tam Nouitas, quàm Veritas reuincit. Quodcunque contra Veritatem ſapit, hoc eſt Hæreſis, etiam vetus Conſuetudo: *Let them therefore take heede, whiche coumpte that thinge Newe, that in it ſelfe is Olde. Hereſie is reproued, not ſo wel by* Noueltie, *as by* Veritie. *Whatſo euer thinge ſauereth againſt the* Truth, *the ſame is an Hereſie: Yea, although it be a* Cuſtome neuer ſo Olde. Ignatius ſaithe, Antiquitas mea Ieſus Chriſtus eſt: *My Antiquitie is Chriſt Ieſus.* For otherwiſe the Religion of Chriſt at that time was coumpted New, and in reſpecte of the Anciente Religion of the Heathens, euen for Noueltie ſake, Vniuerſally, and of al menne was commended. Bernardus De Vita Solitaria. Tertull. De Virginibus velandis. Ignatius ad Philadelphien.

That Auguſtine, the Monke of Rome, brought firſte the Faithe into this Lande, it is vtterly Vntrue. For, as I haue ſaid before, it appeareth plainely by ſundrie the Ancient Fathers, Origene, Tertullian, Chryſoſtome, Hilarie, Theodoretus, Euſebius, and others, that the Faithe of Chriſte had benne vniuerſally receiued, and perfitely rooted in this Realme many hundred yeres, before this Auguſtine the Monke was borne. In deede he brought in great heapes of ſtrange Noueltes, and Superſtitions, as Candles, Candleſtickes, Banners, and Holy VVater, & other like ſhewes: Whereof the Churche of God had no greate neede. And yet haue the ſame ſithence benne encreaſed by other Newe Diuiſes, and Vanities, aboue meaſure.

But, for as mutche as certaine of M. Hardinges Beaupeeres of Louaine haue lately founde them ſelues talke, and keapte greate Motes in the behoufe of theire Auguſtine, the Italian Monke, whom thei cal the Apoſtle of England, and wil needes haue to be receiued, and honoured, as a Sainct, I haue thought it therfore good briefly, and by the waie, to note a fewe wordes touchinge the ſame.

It ſeemeth, they be mutche offended, that ſo Vertuous a Manne, and ſo Holy a Sainct ſhoulde be charged with Pride, and Crueltie. With Pride, in ſo diſdeignefully deſpiſinge his Brethren, the Biſhops of this Ilelande of Britaine: With Crueltie, in procuringe the Deathe bothe of many thouſandes of Chriſtian people, and alſo ſpecially of the Innocente, and Vnarmed Monkes of Bangor: and al this, for that they refuſed to receiue him, as theire Metropolitane, and to agree with him in certaine ſmal pointes of the Romaine Religion. Howe be it, his Pride is wel blaſed by Beda, writinge pourpoſely of the ſame, in that he ſate ſtil in his Throne, and diſdeigned to riſe vp, and to geue any token of Reuerence vnto the ſeuen Biſhops, and other Learned, and graue menne of the Britaines, makinge theire appearance at his Councel. And therefore they ſaide, they woulde not harken to his demaundes, nor take him for their Archebiſhop, as hauinge otherwiſe of olde an Archebiſhop of Beda: Septem Britannor. Epiſc. & plures Viri Doctiſſimi.

their owne, to whom they ought their obedience. Their wordes, as they are reported by Beda, were theſe: Si modò nobis aſſurgere noluit, quantò magis, ſi ei ſubdi cœperimus, iam nos pro nihilo contemnet: *If euen nowe he diſdeigne to riſe vp vnto vs, howe mutche more will he deſpiſe vs, and regarde vs, as nothinge, when wee ſhal once be vnder his Iuriſdiction?*

Beda. li. 2. ca. 2.

But, to excuſe this Auguſtine of ſhameful Crueltie, leſte he ſhoulde ſéeme to be acceſſorie to the Murtheringe of ſo many, and ſo by their owne Lawes to be Irregulare, as a man of Blonde, they ſaie, *He neither enkendled the Warre againſte the Britaines, nor was preſente at the fighte: but was deade longe before.* Which thinge alſo they thinke, maie be proued by the expreſſe wordes of Beda. For thus he ſaithe, Quamuis ipſo Auguſtino iam multo antè tempore ad Cœleſtia Regna Sublato: *Notwithſtandinge Auguſtine him ſelfe, longe before the time of this Warre, were taken vp into the Kingedome of Heauen.* For the Truthe, and Certaintie hereof, it maie pleaſe thée, good Chriſtian Reader, to vnderſtande, that theſe laſte wordes of Beda, concerninge the Deathe of Auguſtine, are manifeſtly forged, and haue benne violently thruſte into the Texte, by a guileful Parentheſis, by them, that ſithence haue benne aſhamed of his Crueltie, and were neuer written by the Authoure, as by euidente proufes it ſhal plainely appeare.

Beda eodem loco

Thomas Graie. Auguſtine the inflamer of the warre.

But firſte of al, in an Olde Chronicle, written in Frenche aboue two hundred yéeres paſt, by Thomas Graie, yée ſhal finde it recorded thus: Auguſtine, *beinge thus refuſed of the Biſhops, and others the Learned of the Britaines, made ſuch complainte thereof to* Ethelberte the Kinge of Kente, *that ſforthewith he leuied his Power, and Marched againſte them, and ſlewe them in moſte Cruel wiſe, hauinge* (as he ſaithe) *no more regarde of Mercie, then a Woulfe hathe vpon a Sheepe.* Hereby it appeareth, that this Auguſtine was the Inflamer of the Warre, and ſo the cauſer of the Slaughter.

The true ſtorie of Beda. tranſlated by Kinge Alfrede. Auguſtine aliue in the time of the VVarre.

And whereas, by the wordes of Beda, as they be nowe commonly extante in the Latine, wée are tolde, this Auguſtine was deade, longe before the warre beganne, it appeareth plainely by the true Beda in déede, tranſlated aboue ſeuen hundred yéeres agoe into the olde Engliſhe, or Saxon tongue, by Alfredus, or Aluredus then Kinge of this lande, that the ſame Auguſtine was yet aliue, after the ſame Warre was ended, and that he afterwarde Conſecrated two Biſhoppes, Mellitus, and Iuſtus: Mellitus, to be Biſhop of London: and Iuſtus, to be Biſhop of Rocheſter. Which thinges thus declared, it foloweth orderly in the Storie, Then (theſe Warres beinge ended, and theſſe Biſhoppes Conſecrated) afterwarde died the beloued Father Auguſtine. After the VVarre he died, ſaithe he, and not before, as they ſithence altered it in the Latine. I trow, M. Hardinge, yée are not ſo mutche amazed with the admiration of your Auguſtine, that yée wil ſaie, he had power to Conſecrate Biſhoppes, and to vſe his Archiepiſcopal Authoritie, beinge deade.

As for theſe wordes, that wée finde reported by the Parentheſis, in the Latine, as written by Beda, (Quamuis Auguſtino iam multò antè tempore ad Cœleſtia Regna ſublato). For as mutche as they are quite contrarie to the very courſe, and order of the Storie, and ſpecially for that they are not once touched in the Aunciente Saxon Tranſlation, ſundrie Copies whereof at this preſente are extante, and to be ſéene, of ſutche Reuerende Antiquitie, as maie not iuſtely be called in queſtion, therefore wée haue good cauſe to iudge, that the ſaide wordes haue benne ſithence forced, and ſhifted in, by ſome good ſhift, and policie, leſte Auguſtine, ſo Holy a man, ſhould be found guiltie of ſo greate a Crueltie.

The

Auguſtine of Engelande.

The Abſtracte of Chronicles written.

The yere of our Lorde.	The yeeres of Auguſtines aboade in Englande.	
596	1	This yeere Auguſtine arriueth in Englande, and afterwarde contineweth Archebiſhop of Canturburie fiftiene yeeres: Polydorus, Lib. 4.
597	2	
598	3	
599	4	
600	5	
601	6	This yeere Auguſtine receiueth his Palle.
602	7	
603	8	
604	9	This yeere Auguſtine Conſecrateth Mellitus Biſhop of London, and Iuſtus Biſhop of Rocheſter, Beda. Lib. 2. cap. 3.
605	10	This yeere the VVarre was keapte againſte the Britaines, and the Monkes were ſlaine at Bangor. *The Saxon Cronicle of Peterburrough.* This ſelfe ſame yeere Auguſtine Confirmed the Kinges Chartare graunted to the Monaſterie of S. Peter in Canturburie.
606	11	This yeere Auguſtine Baptizeth tenne thouſande people in the water of Swale. Ranulphus Ceſtren.
607	12	
608	13	This yeere Auguſtine diethe 7. Calend. Iunij. Matthæus VVeaſtmonaſterienſis.
609	14	
610	15	This yeere dieth Auguſtine, as it is written by Polydore Li. 4. And therefore he was aliue fiue yeeres after the ſlaughter of the Monkes at Bangor.

Verily, in the Old Engliſhe Chronicle it is recorded, not onely, that this Auguſtine, the Italian Monke, by his complainte cauſed the Kinge of Kente to arme his people, againſte the true, and Faitheful Chriſtians of the Countrie, then beinge in Wales: or, that he was aliue at the time of the battaile, but alſo, that he was him ſelfe preſente in perſone goinge towarde the ſame. The wordes be theſe: Auguſtine *came againe, and tolde* Kinge Ethelberte, *that the* Britaines *woulde not obeie him. Wherefore the Kinge was wrothe, and ſente to* Elfrede the Kinge of Northumberlande *to comme to healpe him, to diſtreſſe the* Britaines of VVales. And (Auguſtine) the Archebiſhop of Canturburie mette with them at Leiceſter. *The* Kinge of Leiceſter *at that time was called Brocuale. He beeinge afraide of the two Kinges, fledde out of the Lande, and came nuer againe. And the two Kinges ſeiſed al his Landes, and departed them betweene them ſelues. And afterwarde they wente towardes* VVales. *The* Britaines *hearde of them, and ſente meune to them in theire ſhirtes, and barefoote, to aske mercie. But they were ſo cruel, that they had of them no pitie, &c.* Hereby it appeareth, that this Auguſtine, not onely enkendled this cruel Warre, but alſo was aliue, and preſente in the Armie.

Auguſtine aliue, and in companie with the Kinges marchinge towardes the fielde.

Addition ☞ *Addition.* But, to put bothe you, and your friendes quite out of doute, touchinge, as wel the truthe hereof, as alſo the manifeſte, and ſenſible Corruption of your Beda, I wil here ſhewe you the Copie of a Chartare, graunted by Ethelberte the Kinge of Kente, to the Abbie of S. Peter in Canturburie, and Confirmed by Auguſtine the blacke Monke, and Archebiſhop there, the ſelfe ſame yere, when the ſlaughter of the Monkes, whereof we ſpeake, was committed. Thus it beginneth,

✠ *In nomine Domini noſtri Jeſu Chriſti.* Omnem hominem, qui ſecundum Deum viuit, & remunerari à Deo ſperat, & optat, oportet vt puris precibus conſenſum hilariter ex animo præbeat: quoniam certum eſt, tanto facilius, ea, quæ ipſe à Domino poposcerit, conſequi poſſe, quanto & ipſe libentius Deo aliquid conceſſerit. *Quocirca ego Æthelbertus Rex Cantiæ* cum Conſenſu Venerabilis

Archiepiſcopi *Auguſtini*, ac principum meorum, do, & concedo Deo in honore Sancti Petri, aliquam partem terræ Iuris mei, quæ iacet in Oriente *Ciuitatis Dorobernia*. Ita duntaxat, vt Monaſteriũ ibi conſtruatur, & res quæ ſuprà memoraui in poteſtate Abbatis ſit, qui ibi fuerit ordinatus. Igitur aduro, & præcipio in nomine Domini Dei omnipotentis, qui eſt omnium rerum Iudex iuſtus, vt præfata terra ſubſcripta Donatione ſempiternaliter ſit confirmata, ita vt nec mihi, nec alicui Succeſſorum meorum, Regum, aut Principum, ſiue cuiuſlibet conditionis dignitatibus, & Eccleſiaſticis gradibus de ea aliquid fraudare liceat. Si quis verò de hac Donatione mea aliquid minuere, aut irritum facere temptauerit, ſit in præſenti ſeparatus à Sancta Communione Corporis, & Sanguinis Chriſti, & in die Iudicij ob meritum malitiæ ſuæ, à conſortio Sanctorum omnium ſegregatus. Circumcincta eſt hæc terra his terminis. In Oriente *Eccleſia S. Martini*: In Meridie vię *Othburhgat*. In Occidente, & in Aquilone *Drutinge* in Ciuitate *Doroueru*i in anno ab incarnatione Chriſti DCV. Indictione VIII.

✠ *Ego Æthelbertus Rex Cantiæ*, ſana mente, integróque conſilio Donationem meam ſigno ſanctæ Crucis, propria manu roboraui, confirmauique. Ego *Auguſtinus* Gratia Dei Archiepiſcopus teſtis conſentiens libenter ſubſcripſi. Ego *Eadbaldus* Regis Faui. Ego *Hemigiſilus* Dux Laudaui. Ego *Hocca* Comes Conſenſi. Ego *Augemundus* referendarius approbaui. Ego *Graphio* Comes Benedixi. Ego *Tangiſius* Regis Optimas Confirmaui. Ego *Pinca* Conſenſi. Ego *Geddi* Corroboraui.

This Chartare is extante, and maie be ſæne vnder Authentical Seales: And an other likewiſe bearinge the ſame Date, and like Inſcription. Marke wel the pære of our Lorde, M. Hardinge, and compare wel the times. This Chartare, as it is plaine, and euidente to the eie, was Sealed, and Dated in the pære of our Lorde 605. And the ſelfe ſame pære, as it appeareth by the Chronicle of Peterburrough, the Monkes were ſlaine, euen the ſelfe ſame pære, I ſaie, in whiche this Chartare was graunted by the Kinge, & confirmed by Auguſtine. Nowe, I beſeeche you, where is the credite of your vaine Storie? Howe can it poſſibly be true, that your corrupted Beda ſaith, Quamuis Auguſtino iam multò antè tempore ad Cœleſtia Regna ſublato? If Auguſtine were aliue ỳ ſelf ſame pære, how can it be true, I ſaie, that he was dead ſo long before? Do you not ſée manifeſt forgerie with your eies? Is not this corruption ſo groſſe, that pé maie fæle it with your fingers? If Auguſtine had ben deade ſo longe time, or ſo many pæres before, how could he confirme Chartares the ſame pære preſent? Wil you make him ſo Holy a man, that he was hable to write, & Seale, & confirme Chartares beinge deade? Your Beda, as he is by ſomme of your ſide guilefully corrupted, ſaith, Auguſtine *was dead a great longe while before the ſlaughter*. But Auguſtine him ſelf ſaith, he was aliue the ſelfe ſame pære, when the ſlaughter was made. And that he proueth not by coniectures, and Ghaſſes, as you do often, but by ſufficiente Recorde vnder the Kinges greate Seale. And I beſeeche you, what better euidence maie be ſhewed? It was an raſſe mater, by enterlardinge a fewe words, to falſifie the truthe of a Storie: And there was good cauſe, in regarde of your Auguſtines credite, why pé ſhould do it. But what cauſe can you imagine, why any man in this pointe ſhoulde corrupte, and falſifie the Kinges greate Seale? What gaine coulde he haue had therein? Or what hope of gaine? Or, if there had benne cauſe neuer ſo greate, yet what man coulde ſo eaſily haue wrought it? Nay Matthæus VVeaſtmonaſterienſis, that wrote Flores Hiſtoriarum, ſaithe, that Auguſtine *lined vntil the yeere of our Lorde 608*. And was aliue thre pæres after the Monkes were ſlaine. If he were aliue thre pæres after the ſlaughter, how is it true, that you ſaie, He was deade ſo longe a while before the ſlaughter?

Howe maie it be your choiſe, M. Hardinge, whether pé wil beleue Kinge Æthelberte, and your Auguſtine him ſelfe vnder theire owne Inſtrumentes, and Authentical Seales, or els your Storie of Beda, manifeſtly corrupted, & wreſted quite from the Original, as it is moſte eaſie to be ſæne.

Therefore, M. Hardinge, it ſhal beneefite the be good, both for you, and for your fellowes, not to aduenter ſo raſhely in iudgement, before pé knowe. Thus muche briefly, as anſweare vnto them, that ſo faine would haue their Auguſtine acquited of Pride, and Crueltie.

Anno. 605.

Matthæ. VVeaſt. monaſterien.

The

Pretense of Antiquitie.

The Apologie, Cap. 1. Diuision. 2.

Wherein they doo mutche like to the Coniurers, and Sorcerers nowe a daies, who wooꝛkinge with Diuels, vse to saie, they haue their Bookes, and al their Holy, and hid Mysteries from Athanasius, Cyprian, Moses, Abel, Adam, and from the Archangel Raphael: to the ende, that theire conninge beeinge thoughte to comme from sutche Patrones, and Founders, mighte be iudged the moꝛe highe and holy. After the same manner these menne, bicause they woulde haue their owne Religion, whiche, they them selues, and that not longe sithence haue bꝛought fooꝛth into the woꝛld, to be the moꝛe easily, and rather accepted of foolishe persones, oꝛ of suche, as caste litle, whereabout they, oꝛ others doo goe, they are woont to saie, thei had it from Augustine, Hierome, Chrysostome, from the Apostles, and from Christe him selfe. Ful wel knowe they, that nothinge is moꝛe in the peoples fauoure, oꝛ better liketh the common sooꝛte, then these names.

M. Hardinge.

Nay Sirs, your selues may with more reason be likened to Enchaunters, Necromancers, and VVitches. For as they saie, that they haue their Bookes, and their Mysteries from those Doctours, and first Fathers, and from Raphael the Archangel, but cannot shewe the deliuery thereof by any Succesion from hande to hande, as for example, who receiued the same from Raphael, from Adam, from Abel, &c. and who keapte them from time to time: So yee saie also, that ye haue your Gospel, and euery parte of your Doctrine from the Apostles, from Christ, from the prophetes, from the Patriarkes, from
Iosh. 1. Heauen, from Goddes owne bosome, who is Father of Lightes. But ye cannot shewe vs your lawful Succesion, by whom, and by whose preachinge, as by handes, it came downe alonge from Christe and his Apostles vnto you. (a) VVhere laie your Sacramentarie Doctrine hidden bitweene the time of your prophete Zuinglius, and your Patriarke Berengarius? How, and by what deliuery from hand to hande continued the same those fiue hundred yeeres? Shewe vs your Succesion. VVhere be your Bishoppes, where be your Churches?

The Doctrine, whiche the Catholikes of our Countrie holde, and professe, (b) as wel touchinge the Blessed Sacramente, as al other pointes of our faithe, they haue receiued it of their Bishoppes, and they of their Predecessours, by order vntil they reache to S. Augustine: S. Augustine receiued it of S. Gregorie: (b) he of others before him: (b) and they al one of an other by continual ascente vnto S. Peter: who receiued it of Christ: Christe of God his Father. (b) And this Doctrine we finde taught and plainely set foorthe in the Bookes that (c) S. Augustine, Hierome, Chrysostome, Ambrose, Basile, Cyprian, Dionyse, and the other Holy Fathers haue leaft to the posteritie. And so they be witnesses of the truthe of the Doctrine whiche our Bishoppes haue taughte vs.

(a) It laie in the Scriptures, and in the Bookes of the Holy Fathers.

(b) Vntruthes vaine. Reade the Answeare.

(c) Vntruth. For al this is but a shewe of empty names, and nothing in them.

Preache ye, and crie ye out neuer so muche, make so many Lawes in your Parlamentes, as ye list, imbrue your Swordes in the Bloude of the Catholike Christians, as ye crie for it in your Pulpites, yet
Iosh. 16. shal that rocke, whereon we staie, be too harde for you. Neither shal yee euer be able to ouerthrowe the Catholike Churche builded thereupon. For certaine we are, that neither al your power, nor Hel gates shal preuaile againste it.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Marcus Varro **was woonte to saie,** Vtile est Ciuitatibus, vt se viri fortes, etiamsi falsum sit, ex Dijs genitos esse credant: *It is very behoueful for Cities, and Common Weales, that men of valiant courrage beleeue them selues to be the Children of the Goddes, yea although in deede it be vntrue.* **Vnto which woꝛdes** S. Augustine **addeth these:** Hæc Sententia, cernis, quàm latum locum aperiat falsitati: *Yee see howe large a scope this saieinge doth open to the Maintenance of Falsehedde.* **Many vaine men, to auance the Nobilite of theire blonde, haue fette their petite gꝛees, some from Achilles, some from Æneas, somme from Hercules, and some from the Arke of Noë. The Heretique** Dioscorus, **to geate some credite to his Doctrine, woulde sæme to bꝛinge the descente thereof from al the Ancient Fathers of the Churche. Foꝛ thus he saide in the open Councel,** Ego testimonia habeo Sanctorum Patrum, Athanasij, Gregorij, Cyrilli, in multis locis. Ego cum Patribus eijcior: Ego defendo Patrum Dogmata: Non transgredior in aliquo: Et horum Testimonia, non simpliciter, neque transitoriè, sed in Libris habeo: *I haue the witnesse of the* Holy Fathers, Athanasius, Gregorius, Cyrillus, *in many places. I am throwen*

August. De Ciuitate Li. 3. ca. 4

Concil. Chalced. Actio. 1. Pa. 767.

 foorthe

foorthe with the Fathers: ℣ defende the Fathers Doctrine: ℣ ſwarue not from them in any
pointe: ℣ haue their witneſſe, not barely, nor by the waie, but in their Bookes.

Concil. Chalced. Actio. 1. Pa. 793. So ſaide the Heretique Eutyches, Ego legi Scripta Beati Cyrilli, & Sanctorum Patrum, & Sancti Athanaſij: *℣ haue readde the Bookes of* Cyrillus, *of the Holy* Fathers, *and of* Athanaſius. Concil. Chalced. Actio. 4. Pa. 877. So ſaide the Heretique Caroſus, Ego ſecundum expoſitionem trecentorum decem & octo Patrum, ſic Credo: ſic Baptizatus ſum: *Thus doo ℣ beleue, and thus was ℣ Baptized, accordinge to the Expoſition of the three hundred and eightiene Fathers in the* Councel of Nice. Thus the Arian Heretiques alleged the Authoritie of the Ancient Father Origen: thus the Pelagian Heretiques alleged the Authoritie of S. Auguſtine. As, vpon occaſion, it hathe benne ſaide before.

Socra. li. 4. ca. 26

Euen with ſutche truthe, M. Hardinge, are you wont to blaſe the Armes of your Religion. There is no toie ſo vaine, or ſo fabulous, but ye are hable by your conning to bringe it lineally, either from Chriſte him ſelfe, or from his Apoſtles, or from one, or other of the Ancient Fathers. The Biſhop of Sidon in the Late Diete of the Empire holden at Auguſta, auouched openly, that ye had your whole Canon from the Apoſtles of Chriſte, worde by worde, euen as it is prouiſhly written in your Maſſe Bookes. Andreas Barbatius proueth the Antiquitie of the Cardinalles of Rome, by theſe wordes, written in the firſt Booke of the Kinges, Domini ſunt Cardines Terræ: Et poſuit ſuper eos Orbem: *The corners of the Earth be the Lordes: and vpon them he hath ſette the Worlde.* Abbate Panormitane ſaithe, Cardinalatus eſt de Iure Diuino: Quia Papa per Sacerdotes Leuiticos intelligit Cardinales: *The* Cardinalſhip *ſtandeth by the Lawe of God: For the Pope by the Leuitical Prieſtes vnderſtandeth his* Cardinals. Hoſius ſeemeth to ſaie, that Monkes haue their beginning euen from the Apoſtles, meaning thereby, as one of your Companions there dothe, in fauour, I trowe, of Religion, that Chriſte him ſelfe was the Abbate. For thus he ſaithe, Chriſtus Dux, & exemplar vitæ Monaſticæ: *Chriſte was the Captaine, and ſamplare of Monkes Life.* And yet the ſame man afterwarde, as hauinge forgotten his former dreame, vtterly diſplaceth Chriſte, and geueth the whole honour hereof vnto Elias, and Elizæus. Theſe be his wordes, Elias, & Elizæus Duces inſtituti Benedictini: Elias, *and* Elizæus *were the Captaines of* S. Benets order, that is to ſaie, *they were* Blacke Monkes. By like wiſedome ye woulde ſeeme to fetche your Holy VVater from Elizæus: your Cardinalles Hatte from S. Hierome: your Monkes Cowle from S. Auguſtine. This was ſommetime a ſolly good waie to winne credite, ſpecially whiles, what ſo euer ye ſaide, the people was ready to geue you eare. So the olde Arcades ſaide in commendation of theire Antiquitie, that they were a daie, or two elder then the Moone. Saturnus, bringe in Italie, for that he was a ſtranger, and no man knewe, from whence he came, therfore was called Filius Cœli, and was thought to come from Heauen. Romulus, and Alexander, for that they were borne in baſtardie, and neuer knewe their owne Fathers, therefore to magnifie the Nobilitie of their blonde, woulde be called the Children of the Goddes: the one of Mars, the other of Iuppiter.

Anno. 1548.

1. Regum. 2. Polydor. De Inuentorib. Lib. 4. Cap. 9.

Extra. Qui Filij ſint Legitimi, per Venerabilem Abb. Hoſius in Confeſſione Petricouien. Cap. 88. Copus Dialog. 2 Pag. 194. Copus, Dialog. 2 Pag. 284. προσλαμβάνεσι,

Mutche hereof is alleged before.

With ſutche Truthe, and Fidelitie, M. Hardinge, your wonte is to painte out al the partes, and members of your Doctrine. For, be it neuer ſo vaine, or childiſhe, or lately diuiſed, yet ye dare vs in hande, That your Predeceſſours receiued the ſame (as you ſaie) of their Biſhops: and they of others their Predeceſſours by order, vntil they reache to your Auguſtine the Monke of Rome, whom ye haue ful worthily made a Sainct: Your Auguſtine (ye ſaie) receiued the ſame of Gregorie: Gregorie of others before him: and they al, one of an other by continual aſcent vnto S. Peter: and peter of Chriſte: and Chriſte of God his Father. No Heralde could lightly haue ſaide more in the mater. I trow, ye would proue by this Aſcente, and Deſcente, that God the Father made Holy VVater, and ſaid Maſſe.

In deede, as wel herein, as alſo in your emptie names of Auguſtine, Hierome, Chryſoſtome, Ambroſe, Baſile, Cyprian, Dionyſe, &c. As I tolde you once before, ye bringe vs onely a vaine ſhewe of painted bores, and nothinge in them. For in al theſe Holy Fathers, where finde you either your Priuate Maſſe: or your Halfe Communion: or your Accidentes without Subiecte: or the reſte of your like Vanities, wherewith ye haue ſo longe time deceiued the worlde? Leaue your diſſimulation:

ſette

Pretense of Antiquitie.

sette aparte your Conceaures, and blinde gheasses: and so: your credites sake, once shewe vs these thinges in the Ancient Holy Fathers: and shewe them plainely, and in deede: that we maie thinke, there is somme weight in your worde.

But your owne Glose, speakinge of the Ministration of the Holy Communion, whiche nowe in your Churches in a manner is wholy abolished, saithe thus: Hoc Antiquum est. Nam hodie videtur esse relictum: *This was the* Olde Order, that the people shoulde receiue togeather. *For, as it seemeth, nowe it is leafte.* Doctour Tonstal saithe, It was no Heresie, to denie your Transubstantiation, before your late Councel of Laterane. Erasmus, whoes iudgement, I thinke, ye wil not refuse, saith thus, In Synaxi Transubstantiationem sero definiuit Ecclesia: *In the Holy Ministration, it was longe, and very late, ere the Churche determined the Article of* Transubstantiation. Al this notwithstandinge, ye blushe not to saie, that bothe these, and al other your fantasies haue benne conueighed vnto you by moste certaine Succession, from hande to hande: from your Englishe Augustine: from Gregorie: from the Fathers: from the Apostles: from Christe: and from the bosome of God him selfe.

De Conse. Dist. 2 peracta. In Glos. Cuthbert. Tonstal. De Eucharistia. Lib. 1. Pag. 45. Anno 1215. Erasm. 1. Corin. 7

The Apologie, Cap. 1. Diuision. 3.

But howe if the thinges, whiche these men are so desirous to haue seeme Newe, be founde of greatest Antiquitie? Contrariwise, howe if al the thinges wel nigh, which they so greatly set out with the name of Antiquitie, hauinge benne wel and thorowly examined, be at length founde to be but Newe, and diuised of very late? Soothely to saie, no man that hathe a true, and right consideration, woulde thinke the Iewes Lawes, & Ceremonies to be Newe in deede, for al Hammans Accusation. For they were grauen in very Ancient Tables of greatest Antiquitie. And although many did take Christ to haue swarued from Abraham, and the Olde Fathers, and to haue brought in a certaine Newe Religion in his owne name, yet answeared he them directely: If yee beleeued Moses, yee vvoulde beleeue mee also. For my Doctrine is not so Newe, as you make it. For Moses, an Authoure of greatest Antiquitie, and one, to whom yee geue al honoure, hathe spoken of me. S. Paule likewise, Thoughe the Gospel of Iesus Christe be of many coumpted to be but Newe, yet hathe it (saithe he) a testimonie moste olde, bothe of the Lawe, and of the Prophetes. As for our Doctrine, whiche wee maie more rightely calle Christes Catholique Doctrine, it is so farre off from Newe, that God, who is aboue al moste Auncient, and the Father of our Lorde Iesus Christe, hathe leafte the same vnto vs in the Gospel, in the Prophetes, and Apostles woorkes, beeinge monumentes of greatest age. So that noman can nowe thinke our Doctrine to be Newe, onlesse the same thinke, either the Prophetes Faithe, or the Gospel, or els Christe him selfe to be Newe.

The Apologie, Cap. 2. Diuision. 1. & 2.

And as for their Religion, if it be of so longe continuance, as they woulde haue men weene it is, why doo they not proue it so by the examples of the Primitiue Church, & by the Fathers, and Councels of Old times? Why lieth so Ancient a cause thus longe in the duste, destitute of an Aduocate? Fiere, and Swerde they haue had alwaies ready at

hande: but as for the Olde Councelles, and Fathers, al Hum, not a woorde. They did surely againste al reason, to beginne firste with these so bloudy, and extreme meanes, if they coulde haue founde other more easy, and gentle waies.

And if they truste so fully to Antiquitie, & vse no dissimulation, why did Iohn Clemente a Countrie man of ours, but fewe yeeres paste, in the presence of certaine honest men, and of good credite, teare and caste into the fire certaine leaues of Theodorete the most Ancient Father, and a Greeke Bishop, wherein he plainely, and euidently taught, that the Nature of Breade in the Communion is not changed, or abolished, or brought to nothing? And this did he of pourpose, because he thought there was none other Copie thereof to be founde.

M. Hardinge.

Touchinge the mater you haue deuised vpon M. Clemente, he doothe onely denie it in woorde, that euer he burnte or otherwise destroied any leafe of Theodoritus, but also declareth by the whole order of his life, and by special regarde and loue he beareth to the tongue, whiche that learned Bishop wrote in, that he hathe euer benne, and yet is farre from the wil to burne or destroie any scrappe, syllable, or letter of Greeke, muche more certaine leaues of the Learned Father Theodoritus, where any suche thinge was written, as you imagine. Nay, wil ye haue the trothe? In very deede he saithe, and by suche waie, as a Godly and graue man maie auouche a trothe, protesteth, that he neuer had hitherto any parte of that Booke, neither in Greeke, or in Latine in written hande.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

This reporte was made in the presence, and hearinge of M. Peter Martyr, and sundrie other Learned menne, of whom certaine are yet alliue. The Reporter was bothe a Learned man, and a graue Father, and not longe sithence a Bishop in Englande: who saide, he was presente, and sawe the thinge donne with his eies. More to saie hereof, I am not able.

The Apologie, Cap. 2. Diuision. 3.

Why saithe Albertus Pigghius, that the Ancient Father S. Augustine had a wronge Opinion of Original Sinne? And that he erred, and lied, and vsed False Logique, as touchinge the case of Matrimonie, concluded after a Vowe made: whiche Matrimonie S. Augustine affirmeth to be perfite in deede, & that it maie not be vndonne againe, the Vowe, and Promisse notwithstandinge.

Dist. 27. Quidã. Augustl. De Bono Viduitat. Cap 10.

(a) M. Hardinge refuseth S. Augustines Authoritie.

(b) This Vntruthe is ouer colde, & vaine. For M. Harding wel knoweth the substance of his Doctrine standeth not by the Doctours.

(c) Promisse made vnto God without deliuerie. A folie of al folies.

(d) A Vowe made before the Bishop, or Abbate, is of more force then a Vowe made before God alone.

M. Hardinge.

(a) VVee neuer tooke our selues bounde to any priuate opinion of what so euer Doctour. For al our Faithe is Catholike, that is to saie, Vniuersal, suche as not one Doctour alone (b) but the Vniuersal number of Doctours haue taught, and Christen people haue receiued. If in a secrete pointe of Learninge S. Augustine or S. Cyprian teache singulerly, wee folowe them not. Muche lesse doo wee binde our selues to mainteine, what so euer Albertus Pigghius hathe written. Our Doctrine of Original sinne is to be readen in the fifthe session of the late Tridentine Councel. If Pigghius dissente from that, he dissenteth from vs. But if he stande onely vpon some pointe not yet determined by the Churche, his opinion maie be tolerated vntil the Churche define that question. VVhen you note the pointe, (For there are many pointes in that Doctrine) then wee wil shewe you further our minde therein. Sub Fin.

The Marriage, whiche is made after a simple Vowe of Chastitie, standeth in his force, by reason that there is more in marriage, then was in the bare Vowe. (c) For in the simple Vowe there is nothinge but a promise made to God, without any deliuerance of that thinge, whiche was promised. But in marriage the man and woman by presente acceptation of eche others bonde, doo make the mater to extende beyonde the nature of a promise. Therefore if likewise the Vowe made to God were not a simple promise, but also a delieringe of the thinge promised: then cannot the marriage folowinge make voide the Vowe, whiche was not onely promised, but also performed. (d) The performance is, when he that Voweth, doth professe him selfe in the handes of his Superiour by takinge the habite of some Religion, or by receiuinge Holy orders of the Bishop. For in that solemne acte he deliuereth vp al his owne righte and power, so that nowe he is not maister of him selfe to geue his Body to any personne in marriage, or otherwise. You shal knowe by the Lawe of Nature, if you

woulde

Vovve Simple & Solemne.

woulde consider it, that if I promise a Horse to one man, and afterwarde promise the same, and deliuer him to an other: that the seconde man is true Lorde of that Horse, although I haue done iniurie to him, to whom I made the firste promise. For the promise with the deliuerie, is more vaileable to transferre my right in the horse, then my promise alone. Euen so it is a great sinne to breake a simple Vowe of Chastitie made to God.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Howe lightly your Captaine General, Albertus Pigghius, weigheth the Authoritie of S. Augustine, it maie appeare by his wordes. For thus he writeth, Quòd non solùm incerta, sed etiam falsa sit Augustini Sententia, ita mihi demonstrari posse videtur: *Thus me thinketh, I am hable to proue, that S. Augustines Iudgement herein is not onely vncertaine, but also False.* And againe afterwarde in the Conclusion, Quòd Augustini Sententia non solùm incerta, sed etiam certò Falsa sit, satis mihi demonstratum videtur: *That S. Augustines Iudgement is, not onely vncertaine, but also certainely False, me thinketh I haue sufficiently proued.* And againe, Non multum me mouet Augustini Sententia: mihi non placet Augustini ea de re Definitio, & Sententia: *S. Augustines Iudgment dooth not greatly moue me: I like not S. Augustines Determination and Iudgement, touchinge this mater.* And againe, Ego omnium, non solùm Aduersariorum, sed etiam Catholicorum receptas in Scholis redarguo Sententias: *I doo reproue the Iudgementes, not onely of our Aduersaries, but also of the Catholiques allowed in the Schooles.* For these causes Ruardus Tapper of Louaine, and Lirienſis of Portugale haue namely written againste Pigghius. And, for as much, as ye are desirous to haue the pointe noted, wherin Pigghius so much misliketh S. Augustines Iudgment, Dominicus à Soto your own Doctour noteth it thus, Pighius de hoc malè audit, quasi peccata in nobis Originalia omninò inficietur: Pighius *is il reported of, as a man, that vtterly denieth Original Sinne.* Thus your Doctours weighe S. Augustines Authoritie, lighter, or heauier, as they liste.

Alber. Pigghius in 1. Controuersi.

De Peccato Originis.

Alber. Pigghius in eadem Controuersia.

Ruard. Tapper Lirienſis Episcopus Lusitanus Petrus à Soto, de Natura, & Gratia.

The mater of Marriage after a Vowe, is blowen awaie with a seely Distinction, of a Vowe Simple, and a Vowe Double, whiche yée commonly cal a Solemne Vowe: and al the same is substantially, and clearely proued by *the promise, and deliuerie of a Horse.* For this Example of al others, liked you beste. Surely, M. Hardinge, a very Simple Creature, and somewhat inferiour to a Horse, would hardely be tied to such Distinctions. For the better clearinge hereof, that yée calle a Simple Vowe, that is made before God alone: that Double, or Solemne, that is made in the presence of the Bishop, or Abbate. Nowe, it is plainely confessed by your owne Doctours, that your Simple Vowe, be it neuer so Simple, yet bindeth you as streitely before God, as the Double. For Pope Cœlestinus saithe, Votum Simplex apud Deum non minùs ligat, quàm Solenne: *The* Simple Vowe *before God, bindeth nolesse, then the* Solemne. And, touchinge the Promisse, and Deliuerie of your Horse, Iohannes Scotus saithe, Alia ratio est, quòd Vouens Solenniter mittit in possessionem illum, cui Vouet Solenniter: Vouens autem Priuatè, non: sed quasi promittit, Sed hæc ratio valet minùs, quàm secunda. Quia omnia, quę intrinseca sunt Voto, vt Votum respicit actum voluntatis, per quem obligat se vouendo, & transfert Dominium suum in alterum, omnia, inquam, ista sunt æqualia hinc inde. Igitur non magis datio hic, quàm ibi: nec promissio ibi, quàm hic: *An other reason, that they vse, is this: That he, that maketh a* Solemne Vowe, *putteth him, to whom he so Voweth, in possession. But so doothe not he, that maketh a* Simple Vowe: *but onely geueth his promisse. This Reason is woorse, and weaker, then the Seconde. For al thinges, that be of the* Substance of the Vowe, *(as a Vowe concerneth the Acte of the Minde, whereby the Minde bindeth it selfe by Vowinge, and transposeth the ownership of it selfe vnto an other)* al these thinges, I saie, are of like weighte, and equal of either side. Therefore there is no more performance of promisse in the Solemne Vowe, then in the Simple: nor more promisse in the Simple Vowe, then in the Solemne. Thus you se, M. Hardinge, with greate trauaile, and muche adoe, yée haue founde a difference without difference. Cardinal Caietane saithe, Eiusdem speciei est transgressio Voti Solennis, & Simplicis: Et differunt solùm secundum magis graue, & minùs graue: *The breakinge of a* Vowe Simple, and a Vowe Solemne, *is of one kinde, or Nature: And the difference is onely in more greuous, and lesse greuous,* that is, that the one is more grieuous, and offensiue, then the other.

Extra. Qui Clerici & vouentes. Item. Scotus in 4. Senten. Dist. 38. qu. 1.

Caietan. in Thom. Secund. Secundæ. quæst. 88. Artic. 7.

There-

Therefore Thomas of Aquine him selfe, the first Father, as it appeareth of this Distinction, saithe thus: Videtur, quòd Ecclesia possit dispensare in Voto Continentiæ Solennizato per susceptionem Sacri Ordinis: *It seemeth that the Churche maie dispense with a Vowe of Chastitie Solemnized by the receiuinge of Holy Orders.*

Augustl. de bono viduitatis ca. 10

And this is it, that S. Augustine saithe, Qui dicunt, talium Nuptias, non esse Nuptias, sed potius Adulteria, mihi non videntur satis acute, ac diligenter considerare, quid dicant: *They that saie, the Marriage of suche Men, or Weemen,* (as haue Vowed Chastitie (*is no Marriage at al, but rather Aduouterie,* (as M. Hardinge, and his felowes haue saide) *seeme vnto mee, not to consider discretely, or aduisedly, what they saie.* Thus therfore, M. Hardinge, notwithstandinge your Simple, or Double Vowe. S. Augustine saithe vnto you, *Yee speake Vnaduisedly, and Vndiscretely, and vnderstande not, What you saie.* But of this whole mater, we haue entreated before more at large.

The Apologie, Cap. 2. Diuision. 4.

Liber hodie extat & circumfertur mutilus.

Also, when they did of late put in Printe the Auncient Father Origenes woorke vpon the Gospel of S. Iohn, why leafte they quite out the whole sixth Chapter, wherein it is likely, yea rather of very suertie, that the said Origen had written many thinges concerninge the Sacramente of the Holy Communion, contrarie to theise mennes mindes, and woulde rather put foorthe that Booke mangled, then fulle and perfite: for feare it shoulde reproue them, and theire parteners of their errour. Calle yee this trustinge to Antiquitie, when yee rente in peeces, keepe backe, maime, and burne the Auncient Fathers?

M. Hardinge.

A wise man affirmeth nomore then he knoweth: a good man nomore then standeth with Charitie: a learned man, in maters of weight, nomore, then he can auouche by euidente * reasons, * sure proufes, or * sufficient auctorities. This Defender chardinge the Catholikes with manglinge of Origen vpon S. Iohns Gospel, as though of purpose they had left out the sixth Chapter, which he imagineth to conteine their Sacramentarie Doctrine contrary to the Catholike Faithe: for asmuch as he is vncertaine hereof, and thereby noteth a greate vntruth in the setters forthe of that woorke, neither by any meanes is able to proue the same: he sheweth him selfe a foole, a slaunderer, and an vnlearned man. VVe are like I perceiue, to heare of the faultes they knowe by vs, sith that they burthen vs with that, that they knowe not, and for the same can pretende but a slender coniecture. But Sir Defender, why complaine you not of the leauinge out of other Chapters, and partes of that woorke, as wel as of the sixthe Chapter? For whereas Origen wrote vpon Iohn nine and thirtie tomes, as S. Hierome witnesseth: the Latine translation Printed in Venis hathe but 32. lackinge the seuen laste tomes. Neither be al they whole and perfite, but many of them maimed and mangled.

Hereby M. Hardinge shaketh mutch the credite of his owne Learning

In prol. 39. Hom. Origen. Lucam.

VVhat manner a Doctrine of the Blessed Sacramente he hathe vttered vpon the sixth Chapter of Iohn, and howe Catholike he was in that pointe, it appeareth by diuers his other woorkes, that you haue no cause to belie him in that you neuer sawe. For the truth of Christes Body in the Sacrament, his testimonies be euidente. For credites sake, here wil I recite a couple. In one place he saithe thus: Yee knowe which haue benne woont to be presente at the Diuine Mysteries, howe that when ye take the Body of our Lord, ye kepe it with al warenesse and reuerence, that nowhit thereof fal down, that nothinge of the consecrated gyfte miscary. For ye beleue your selues to be gilty, and right wel doo ye so beleue, if by negligence ought fal downe. In an other place, writing vpon the Centurions wordes spoken to Christe, Matth. 8. VVhen (saithe he) thou takest that Holy meate, and that vncorrupt deintie, when thou enioiest that Breade and Cuppe of Life, thou Eatest and Drinkest the Body, and Bloud of our Lorde, then our Lorde entreth vnder thy roofe.

Hom. 13. Exod.

Hom. 5. in diuersos Euangelij locos.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

We saie not in the manlinge of this Auncient Father, as mater of sufficiente euidence, but onely as a greate conteaure of your Corruption, referringe the iudgemente thereof vnto the Reader. Certainely, M. Hardinge, we haue good cause manye waies, to doubte your dealinge: but in nothinge more, then in the handlinge of the Fathers. We remember, howe wickedly Pope Zosimus, the better to colour his Ambition, longe sithence corrupted the Nicene Councel. Neither can ye forgeate, what trifles, and fabulous Vanities, ye haue lately sente vs abroade vnder the olde smeky names of Abdias, Leontius, Amphilochius, Hippolytus, and Clemens, whom ye so solemnely cal the Apostles Felowe. In these vncleanely conueiances, to any wise

Concil. Aphric can. cap. 105.

wise man there can appeare no simple meaninge. Notwithstandinge ye thoughte it good policie, to deceiue the worlde by any shifte, or shadowe of Ancient Fathers.

What Origene thought of the wordes of Christe in the sixth Chapter of S. Iohn, it is easie to coniecture, by that he hathe written otherwheres. Upon the Leuiticus he writeth thus, Est & in Euangelio Litera, quæ occidit: Si enim secundum Literam sequaris illud, quod dictum est, Nisi comederitis Carnem Filij Hominis &c. ea Litera occidit: *Euen in the Gospel there is a Letter, that killeth: For where as Christe saithe,* Onlesse ye eate the Fleashe of the Sonne of Man, &c. *if yee take the same accordinge to the Letter, that Letter killeth.* This was Origenes iudgemente of the Sacramente: and the same in those dates was coumpted Catholique. *Origen in Leuiticũ, Hom. 7.*

Yée replie, Origene saithe, *When yee take the Body of our Lorde, yee keepe it with al wariness, and reuerence, that no parte thereof falle downe.* And againe, *When thou takest that Holy meate, then our Lorde entreth vnder thy roofe.* Bothe theise places in my Former Replie are fully answeared. But what Catholique Doctrine, M. Hardinge, can ye pike out of theise wordes? What Transubstantiation? What Real Presence? What Accidentes without Subiecte? Yée wil saie, Origene calleth the Sacramente Christes Body. So dothe Christe him selfe: so dothe Paule: so dw al the Ancient Fathers: so dw wée our selues, bicause it is the Sacramente of Christes Body. Youre owne Glose saithe, as it hathe benne often alleged, Vocatur Corpus Christi, id est, Significat Corpus Christi: *It is called the Body of Christe, that is to saie, it Signifieth the Body of Christe.* But the people (ye saie) receiued it warily, and with reuerence. So dw they nowe, euen in those Churches, that you moste mislike withal. *Origen in Exodum, Homil. 13. Origen in Diuersos Euangelij locos Homil. 5. De Consecra. Dist. 2. Hoc est.*

Ye saithe further, When thou receiuest that Holy meate, then our Lorde entreth vnder thy roofe. And what greate matée thinke you to winne hereby? Euen in the same place Origene saithe, Intrat etiam nunc Dominus sub tectum credentium duplici Figura, vel more: *Euen nowe the Lorde entreth vnder the roofe of the Faithefull after twoo manners, or sortes. For, when the Holy, and Godly Bishoppes enter into youre house, euen then throughe them our Lorde entreth.* Wil ye conclude hereof, that the Bishop is Transubstantiate into Christe? Or, that Christe is Really, and Substantially dwellinge in him? This is an Allegorie, M. Hardinge, or a Mystical kinde of Speache, wherein, as you knowe, that Learned Father was mutche delited. The Roofe, that he meaneth, is not Material, but Spiritual: that is to saie, not the Body of Man, but the Soule: Like as also the Commynge, or Entringe of Christe into the same, is not Bodily, but onely Spiritual.

So S. Augustine saithe, Prædicant Christum, & eum annuntiando venire faciunt in exhausta fame viscera Filij esurientis: *They Preache Christe, and by Preachinge, cause him to comme into the Bowelles of the hungrie childe, wasted with Famine.* Likewise againe he saithe of the Centurion, Tecto non recipiebat Christum: Corde recipiebat; quantò humilior, tantò capacior, tantò plenior: *He receiued not Christe into his house: he receiued him into his Harte: The more humble, the more roome had he to receiue him, and the fuller he was.* So saith Chrysostome, Qui vocant Dauid cum Cythara, intus Christum per ipsum vocant: *They that cal in* Dauid *with his Harpe, by meane of him* cal in Christe. Againe he saithe, Christus aut suscipitur, aut occiditur apud nos. Si enim credimus verbis eius, suscipimus eum, & generamus in nobis: *Christe either is receiued, or slaine within vs. For if wee beleue his Worde, wee receiue him, and begeate him within vs.* In suche sorte S. Hierome writeth vnto Paula, Ad talem clemens ingreditur Iesus, & dicit, Quid ploras? Non est mortua Puella, sed dormit: *Into suche a one Iesus entreth milde, and graceous, and saithe, Why weepest thou? Thy Damsel is not Deade: but lieth asleepe.* *Augustin. Quæstionum Euangel. Li. 2. Ca. 33. August. De Tempore, Sermo. 74. Chrysostom. in Psalm. 41. Chrysostom. in Matth. Hom. 46. Hieronym. ad Paulam De obitu Blesillæ.*

This manner of speache, as I saide before, is Spiritual, or Mystical: and mate not be taken accordinge to the outwarde founde of the Letter. So saithe S. Hierome, Secundum Mysticos intellectus, quotidiè Iesus ingreditur in Templum Patris: *Accordinge to the* Mystical *vnderstandinge, Christe entreth daily into the Temple of his Father.* In this sense Origene saithe, Christe entreth into our House. Which phrase, writinge vpon S. Matthewe, he expresseth in plainer manner: Tradunt, & ejciunt ab anima sua Saluatorem, & Verbum Veritatis, quod erat in eis: *They betraie, and throwe foorthe* *Hieronym. in Matth. lib. 3. ca. 11*

Images painted in Churches

Origen in Matthæ. Tractat. 35.

fforthe our Sauiour from out of their Soules (as do al Apostates, and Renegates, that denie the knowen Truthe of God) *and they betraie the Woorde of Truthe, that was within them.* Al this wil graunte, M. Hardinge: and al this maie stande, without either your Transubstantiation, or your Real Presence.

The Apologie, Cap. 3. Diuision. 1. & 2.

It is a woorlde to see, howe welfauourdly, and howe towardely, touchinge Religion, theise men agree with the Fathers, of whom they vse to vaunte, they be theire owne good.

The Olde Councel Eliberine made a Decree, that nothinge, that is honoured of the people, shoulde be painted in the Churches.

M. Hardinge.

The woordes of that prouincial Councel be these: It is thought good, that paintinges be not in the Churche: that what is woorshipped or Adored, it be not painted on walles. This expresse prohibition of paintinge, and that nought be painted in Churche walles, that is woorshipped or Adored, Elibe. C. 36. maie seeme bothe to presuppose a former vse of suche paintinges, and also to allowe the other sorte of Images. VVhether it doo or no, * it forceth not greately. The seuenth General Councel assembled at Nice againste the Imagebreakers, hathe not onely allowed the * Deuoute vse of Images commonly vsed in the Churches of Christen people: but also condemned al those that throw them down, and mainteine the contrarie opinion. Nowe we are taught that a Prouincial Councel ought to geue place to a general.

*It forceth not greately.

*Deuoute vse of Images.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

The Paintinge of Images in Churche Walles was forbidden in the Councel holden at Eliberis, or Granado in Spaine: *Ergo*, saie you, sutche Images were vsed before that Councel. Al this maie wel be graunted without prejudice. But yet sir plainely, they were forbidden in that Councel. One saithe, Ex malis moribus bonæ Leges ortæ sunt: *Of il manners came good Lawes.* Menne vsed (yet saie) before that time to painte Images in Churche walles. But this vse was naught. And therefore the Councel Decreed againste it: and that, as it maie be gathered by the woordes, for feare of Idolatrie.

But you saie, The Second General Nicene Councel allowed wel the deuoute vse of Images. And a General Councel ought to take place before a Prouincial: For that in a General Councel there are many Bishoppes: in a Prouincial, there are but fewe. Thus, I see, yet weighe your Religion, not by Truthe, but by Companie. Howe be it, this Rule is very lose, and maie sone deceiue you.

God Christian Reader, let no man beguile thee by the coloure of Councelles. Reade this Seconde Nicene Councel throughout, if thou be able. Thou wilte saie, there was neuer any Assemblie of Christian Bishoppes so vaine, so peruerse, so wicked, so blasphemous, so vnworthy in al respectes to be called a Councel. The blessed Bishoppes there agreed togeather with one consente, that Images in Churches are not onely to be allowed, but also deuoutely, and reuerently to be honoured, and that with the same Honour, that is dewe to God him selfe. One of them saithe, Venerandas Imagines recipio, & Adoro, & id perpetuò docebo: *I receiue, and Woorshipe the Reuerende Images: and this wil I teache, while I liue.* An other saithe, Sacras Imagines perfectè Adoro: qui verò secus confitentur, eos anathematizo: *I doo perfitely Adour the Holy Images: and I accurse al them, that holde the contrarie.*

Concil. Nicenum 2. Actione 2.

Concil. Nicenum 2. Actio. 4.

An other saithe, Non sunt duæ Adorationes, sed vna, Ipsius Imaginis, & primi Exemplaris, cuius est Imago: *There be not twoo kindes of* Adoration, *but one onely, dewe as wel to the* Image, *as to the Paterne of the* Image. This Holy Councel (yet saie) decreed againste Imagebreakers. But the Counsel of God decreeth againste Imagewoorshippers, and Imagemakers.

Augustin. de Consensu Euangel. Lib. 1. Cap. 10.

S. Augustine saithe, Sic omninò errare meruerunt, qui Christum, & Apostolos eius, non in Sanctis Codicibus, sed in Pictis Parietibus quæ fierunt. Nec mirum, si à Pingentibus Fingentes decepti sunt: *So were they woorthy to be deceiued, that soughte Christe, and his Apostles in the Bookes of Holy Scripture, but in Painted Walles. Neither maie wee maruele, if Fainers by Painters were deceiued.*

The

The Apologie, Cap. 3. Diuision. 3.

The Olde Father Epiphanius saithe, It is an horrible vvickednesse, and a Sinne not to be suffered, for any man, to set vp any Picture in the Church of the Christians, yea, thoughe it vvere the Picture of Christe him selfe. **Yet these menne stoze al their Temples, & eche cozner of them with painted, and carued Images, as thoughe without them, Religion were nothinge woozthe.**

Epiphan. in Epist. ad Iohan. Episcop. Hieros solymitan.

M. Hardinge.

To that ye pretende to allege out of Epiphanius, wee saie, firste, that althoughe he were of the minde you make him to be of, and said, as you reporte of him, yet is he but one man, whose singular opinion is not to be preferred before the (a) Iudgement of al other so many excellent Fathers, and the determination of the whole Church. (b) Now in deede you misreporte Epiphanius. For he saithe not so, as you write. He calleth not the hauinge of the Image of Christ, or of any Saincte in the Churche an horrible wickednesse, or a sinne not to be suffered: he hath no sutche woordes.

Epiphanius but one man.

Secondly, what if we saie, this place maketh nothinge at al againste the vse of Images, and that (c) he speaketh neuer a woorde againste the Image of Christe, or his Sainctes in the Churche, but onely againste one particulare Image, whiche he founde hanginge at a Churche dore in a Village of Palestine called Anablatha? And seeinge he (d) speaketh not generally againste al Images, but againste sutche as that was, whiche there he noteth by this special woorde, *Istiusmodi Vela*, vailes of this sorte: he geueth vs to vnderstande, that he misliked sommé qualitie or circumstance of that one Image, and not reproued the (e) common and receiued custome of the Churche in hauinge Images in due order. Nowe, what circumstance that was, it dependeth of so many particularities, whiche mighte happen either on the Images parte, as it is moste like, or on the peoples parte there inhabitante, and is so litle declared by Epiphanius in that place, that neither wee can saie any thinge determinately thereof, nor yee shoulde bringe sutche an obscure, and vncertaine matter to the disproufe of a veritie alwaies so wel in the Churche acknowledged and practised.

(a) Vntruth. For the Aunciente Fathers make no mention of Images.

(b) Vntruth. For we reporte him truely, as shal appeare.

(c) Vntruth. For his woordes be plaine, *Imaginē, quasi Christi, aut Sancti cuiusdā*

(d) A childishe, and a vaine shifte. For Epiphanius speaketh directly againste al images

(e) Vntruth. For Images then were not commonly receiued in the Churche. *Copus. Dialog. 5. Pag. 692.*

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

O, Howe many, and howe pretty shiftes here be diuised, if any would healpe, to serue the pourpose? One of the late Louanian Clergie, for that he sawe, these woordes were cleare, and might not be auoided by any Glose, therefore he thought it the wisest waie, Firste to bringe the Authoritie, and credite hereof in question, and to saie, 1 **that** Epiphanius **neuer wrote any sutche Epistle: Yerte he saithe,** 2 **The same Epistle was neuer translated by S. Hierome. But, for as mutch as he sawe, that his folie herein was open, and easie to be controlled, Thirdely he saith, that the Image, that** 3 Epiphanius **rente in sunder, was not the** Image, **either of** Christe, **or of any** Christian Sainete, **but the** Heathen Image of Iuppiter, or Hercules, or somme other Idole, **he knoweth not what. Fourthly he saithe,** 4 The saide Holy Father Epiphanius **was an** Heretique, **one of those, that were called** Anthropomorphitæ, **whose errour was, That God in his Diuinitie had the whole shape, and proportion of a Man. Howe be it, this folie far passeth al the reste. For it behoued those** Heretiques **moste of al others, for defense of their errour, to maintein** Images. **And yet it semeth a very vnciuile part, to condemne so Reuerende, and so Godly a Father of so grosse an Heresie, without proufe: and specially sutche a Father, as hath so learnedly written againste al Heresies. Fifthly he saithe,** 5 **euen as M. Hardinge here saithe,** Epiphanius was but a man, and one man, and his Iudgement singulare, and therefore the lesse to be esteemed. **Laste of al, he saithe,** 6 The same Holy Father Epiphanius was a Iewe: **and beinge a Christian, and a Reuerende Father, and a Christian Bishop, yet notwithstandinge mainteined the Religion of the Iewes, and therefore rente in sunder the** Image of Christ, **in despite of** Christe. **And for proufe hereof, he alleged** Simeon Metaphrastes, **a Doctoure as wise as him selfe.**

Copus. Pag. 703. Copus. Pag. 706, 707.

Simeon Metaphrastes.

M. Hardinge, for that he imagined, these shiftes were very vnsauery, & would hardly serue, therfore hath diuised to conueigh him selfe out some other waie. Firste he saithe, We falsifie this Holy Father, and allege his woordes otherwise, then they be. **Secondly he saith,** It was not the Image of Christ, that Epiphanius founde painted in the Vele. **but somme other pretty thinge, he knoweth not what. Lastely he saithe,** Epiphanius reproueth not generally al sutche Veles, so painted, but onely that one Vele, that he founde.

Epiphanius rente the Image &c.

For trial hereof, I referre me selfe to the Original. The wordes thereof be these: Inueni ibi velum pendens in foribus eiusdem Ecclesię tinctum, atque depictum, & habens Imaginem, quasi Christi, aut Sancti cuiusdam Non enim satis memini, cuius Imago fuerit. Cùm ergo hoc vidissem in Ecclesia Christi, contra Authoritatem Scripturarum, Hominis pendere Imaginem, scidi illud: & magis dedi consilium Custodibus eiusdem loci, vt pauperem mortuum eo obuoluerent, & efferrent, &c. Quæso, vt iubeas Presbyteros eiusdem loci præcipere, in Ecclesia Christi istiusmodi Vela, quæ contra religionem nostram veniunt, non appendi: Decet enim honestatem tuam hanc magis habere sollicitudinem, vt scrupulositatem tollat, quæ indigna est Ecclesia Christi, & populis, qui tibi crediti sunt: *I found there a Vele hanginge at the entrie of the Church, stained, and painted, and hauinge the* Image *as it were*, of Christ, or of somme Sainct. *For, whose Picture it was in deede, I doe not remember. Therefore, when I sawe the* Image of a man to hange in the Churche of Christe, contrarie to the commaundemente of the Scriptures, *I tare it in sunder: and gaue counsel to the Wardens of that Churche, that they shoulde winde, and burie somme poore body in it, &c. I beseeche you, charge the Prieستes of that place, that they geeue commaundemente that suche Veles, as be* contrarie to our Religion, *be no more hanged vp in the Churche of Christe. It behoueth your reuerence to haue care hereof, that this* Superstition, vnmeete for the Churche of Christe, *and vnmeete for the people to thee committed, be removed.* Nowe, iudge you, M. Hardinge, wherein we haue falsified this Learned Fathers wordes. You saie, He speaketh not one woorde againste the Image of Christe, or his Sainctes. I beseeche you then, againste what other Image speaketh he? Epiphanius saithe plainely, It had the Image, as it were, of Christe, or of somme Sainct: You saie, He founde faulte with that Vele onely, and not with any other. Once againe, I beseeche you, telle vs, what had the Image of Christe, or of his Sainctes offended Epiphanius, more then other Images? If the Image of Christ maie not be suffered in the Churche of Christe, what Image then maie be suffered? What cause of difference can you imagine, that any other Ueles shoulde be allowed rather, then this? Your answeare is this, VVee cannot saie any thinge determinately thereof. Whereby it appeareth, we woulde faine saie somme what, if we wiste what. Yet muste we be ouerruled by al and euery suche your determinations, yea although you your selfe confesse, ye can determinately determine nothinge.

Epiphanius ad Iohan. Hieroſol. Ymitan. Apud Hieron. Tom. 2.

Habens Imaginem, quaſi Chriſti, vel ſancti cuiuſdam.

Notwithstandinge, the Ancient Fathers of the Churche haue longe sithence Determinately, and plainely iudged againste you. Lactantius saithe in plaine wordes: Non est dubium, quin Religio nulla sit, vbicunque Simulachrum est: *Determinately and out of al doubte, there is no Religion, where so euer there is an* Image. Tertullian saithe, Idolum tam fieri, quàm coli Deus prohibet. Quanto præcedit, vt fiat, quod coli possit, tanto prius est, ne fiat, si coli non licet. Facio, ait quidam, sed non colo: quasi ob aliquam causam colere non audeat, nisi ob quam & facere non debeat: Scilicet, ob Dei offensam vtrobity. Imò tu colis, qui facis, vt coli possit: *God hathe firebidden an* Image, *or an* Idole, *as wel to be made, as to be woorshipped. As farre as makinge goeth before woorshippinge, so farre is it before, that the thinge be not made, that maie not bee woorshipped. Somme man wil saie, I make it: but I woorshippe it not: As though he durst not to woorship it for any other cause, but onely for the same cause, for whiche he ought not to make it. I meane bothe waies for Goddes displeasure. Nay rather, thou woorshippest the Image, that geuest the cause, for others to woorship it.*

Lactant. Lib. 2. Cap. 19. Tertul. De Idolatria.

Therefore S. Augustine, speakinge of the Image of God the Father, saith thus, Tale simulachrum Deo fingere, nefarium est: *To diuise suche an Image for God, it is abominable.*

Auguſt. De Fide & Symbolo, Cap. 7.

Theodorus the Bishop of Ancyra saith, Sanctorum Imagines, & Species ex Materialibus coloribus formari, minimè decorum putamus. Manifestum enim est, quòd vana sit huiusmodi cogitatio, & Diabolicæ deceptionis inuentum: *We thinke it not conuenient, to Painte the* Images of Sainctes *with Material, or Earthly colours. For it is euident, that this is a vaine Imagination, and the procurement of the deceitfulnesse of the Diuel.*

Creatur in Concil. Nicen. 2. Action 6.

To like pourpose writeth Epiphanius, Estote memores, dilecti Filij, ne in Ecclesias Imagines inferatis, neque in Sanctorum Cœmiterijs eas statuatis. Sed perpetuò

circum-

Images in churches.

circumferte Deum in cordibus vestris. Quin etiam neque in domo communi tolerentur. Non enim fas est, Christianum per oculos suspensum teneri, sed per occupationem mentis: *My deere Children, be ye mindeful, that yee bring no Images into the Churches, and that yee erecte vp none at the burialles of the Sainctes. But euermore carrie God in youre Hartes. Nay suffer not Images to be, no not in your priuate Houses. For it is not lawful, to leade a Christian man by his eies, but rather by the studie, or exercise of his minde.*

For this cause Epiphanius saithe, The Superstition of Images is vnfitte for the Churche of Christe.

The Apologie, Cap. 3. Diuision. 4.

Origen in Leui. Cap. 16. Chryso. in Matth. Homil. 2. Idem in Ioh. 32.

The olde Fathers Origene, & Chrysostome, exhorte the People to reade the Scriptures, to buye them Bookes, to reason at home betwixte them selues of Diuine maters: VViues with their Husbandes, and Parentes with theire Children: These menne condemne the Scriptures, as deade Elementes, and, asmutche as euer they maie, barre the People from them.

M. Hardinge.

(a) Partely it is true, partely false, that you saie. Origen exhorteth al, to resorte to the Churches in the Holy daies, and there to heare the woordes of God: and thereof afterwarde to thinke earnestly, and to meditate on the Lawe of God, and to exercise theire mindes in it daie and night, in the waie, in their house, in their bedde, and when they rise. This holde wee withal, and be desirous, the (b) people beare awaie that the true and Godly Preachers, teache them in the Churche, and that they thinke of it, and put it in dayly practise of life. For els to what serueth al our Preachinge?

Chrysostome Hom. 2. in Matth. speaketh againste them, whiche contemned the Scriptures, and saide, they were no Monkes, but had VViues and Children, and care of housholde. As thoughe it perteined not to married men to reade any parte thereof, but to Monkes onely.

If in our time the people mighte be induced to reade the Holy Scriptures, with sutche mindes, for sutche causes, to sutche intentes and purposes onely, as Chrysostome requireth. God forbid, wee shoulde by any meanes staie them therefrom. (c) But considering the maner of our time, and calling to due examination the curiositie, the temeritie, the vnreuerence, the contempte of al holy thinges, that now al men maie espie in the people: if we thinke it not good they be admitted to the readinge of the Scriptures freely and without any limitation, howe so euer you and your fellowes iudge of vs, wee doubte not of the accompte, wee haue to make of that our meaninge before our Lordes dreadful seate of iudgemente. Nowe to conclude, wee tel you, that you haue misreported bothe Chrysostome, and specially Origene. For how so euer they speake of the readinge, and meditation of the Scriptures, for amendemente of life, verely in the places by you quoted, (d) they exhorte not the people to reason, and dispute of diuine maters amonge them selues, specially the Husbandes with their VViues, the Parentes with their Children, as you saie they doo.

(a) Vntruth. For the whole hereof is true: and no parte false.

(b) O vaine excuse. Many of your people neuer heare Sermon in al theire liues.

(c) M. Hardinges fauourable opinion of the people.

(d) Manifeste vntruthe. Reade the Answeare.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

For as mutch as yée saie, Parte hereof is true, and parte false, **I truste, yée wil géue vs leaue frælp to vse the Truthe, vntil yœ shal finde your selfe better hable to proue the Falsehedde. It séemeth not greatly to mislike you, that the people haue some litle libertie, to reade some sutche parte of the Scriptures, as you maie best spare them, for the orderinge of their liues. Whereby it appeareth, that for quietinge of their consciences in maters of Religion, and causes of Truthe, yée thinke it beste, they reade nothinge.** And this (**yée saie**) ye are hable to answeare before the dreadful Seate of Goddes iudgemente. **Touchinge the Truthe hereof, to saie so mutche, as might be saide, it would require greate waste of time.** S. Augustine **saithe,** Si desit, aut ignoretur, qua eundum sit, quid prodest nosse, quò eundum sit? *If yee haue not, or knowe not, what waie to goe, what shal it profite you to knowe, whither to goe?* S. Hierome **saithe,** Vt maius est, voluntatem Domini facere, quàm nosse, ita prius est nosse, quàm facere. Illud Merito præcedit: Hoc ordine: *As it is more, to doo the wil of oure Lorde, then to knowe it: so the Knowledge of the same goeth before the Dooinge. In goodnesse, Dooinge goeth before, in order, Knowinge.* Againe S. Augustine **saithe,** Si Scripturas Diuinas aut non legimus ipsi, aut legentes alios non libenter audimus, ipsa nobis medicamenta conuertuntur in vulnera: & inde habebimus Iudicium, vnde potuimus habere remedium: *If we either reade not the* Scriptures *our selues, or be not desirous to heare others reade them*, then are our Medicines turned into woundes: and then, where wee might haue had remedie, we

Augustin. De Ciuita. Li. 11. Ca. 2. Hieronym. ad Demetriad. De Virginita. tuenda. Augustin. De Tempore, Serm. 55.

shal haue Iudgemente. Sutche saieinges are common, and ordinarie in S. Chrysostome. Thus he saithe, Librum Diuinum accipiat aliquis in manum: conuocatis proxunis, per Diuina eloquia riget & suam mentem, & conuenientium: vt sic Diabolicas insidias effugere valeamus: *Let one of you take in hande the* Holy Booke: *and let him calle his Neighbours about him: and by the* Heauenly woordes *let him water, and refreashe bothe their mindes, and also his owne.* Againe he saith, Poterimus & domi versantes, ante, & post Conuiuium, acceptis in manus Diuinis Libris, vtilitatem inde capere, & Spiritualem Cibum animæ prębere: *Beinge at home, wee maie bothe* before, and after meate, *take the* Holy Bookes *in hande, and therof receiue great profite, and Minister Spiritual foode vnto our Soule.* And againe, Etiam domi vacemus Diuinarum Scripturarum Lectioni: *Euen when wee bee at home, let vs bestowe our time in readinge the* Scriptures.

Chrysostom. in Genesim. Hom. 6.

Chrysostom. in Genes. Homil. 10.

Chrysostom. in Genes. Homil. 29. Origen in Esaiam, Homil. 2.

Origene saithe, Vtinam omnes faceremus illud, quod Scriptum est, Scrutamini Scripturas: *Woulde God wee woulde al doo, accordingly as it is written,* Searche the Scriptures.

But yée saie, VVee haue misreported bothe Chrysostome, and Origen. For they exhorte not the people (as you saie) to reason of Diuine matters emonge them selues, specially the Husbandes with their VViues, &c. Whether of vs bothe maketh truer reporte, let vs be tried by Chrysostome. Thus he saithe, Neque in hoc tantùm consessu, sed domi quoque, Vir cum Vxore, Pater cum Filio, inuicem de his frequenter loquantur: & vltro, citroq; suam & ferant, & inquirant sententiam: Velintq; hanc probatissimam inducere consuetudinem: *Hearken not hereto onely here in the Churche, but also at home, let the* Husbande *with the* VVife, *lette the* Father *with the* Childe, *talke togeather of these Maters: and, bothe to, and fro, let them bothe enquire, and geeue theire Iudgementes: And, woulde God they woulde beginne this good Custome.*

Chrysost. in Iohan. Homil. 2. Chrysost. in Matth. Hom. 78.

Here haue you, M. Hardinge, the Husbande communinge of Diuine maters with his VVife: and the Father with his Childe. Therefore so vnaduisedly to saie, wee haue misreported this Holy Father, it was of your parte a misreporte.

Likewise S. Hierome saithe, Hic ostenditur, verbum Christi non sufficienter, sed abundanter, etiam Laicos habere debere: & docere se inuicem, vel monere: *Here wee are taught, that euen the* Laie menne *ought to haue the* VVoorde of God, *not onely sufficiently, but also abundantly: and one to instructe, and to warne an other.* Againe he saith, Solent & Viri, solent & Monachi, solent & Mulierculæ hoc inter se habere certamen, vt plures ediscant Scripturas: *Bothe Married menne, and Monkes, and Wiues, commonly haue this contention emonge them selues,* who maie learne moste Scriptures.

Hieronym. in Epist. ad Colosss. Cap. 3. In illud Verbum Dei habitet in vobis. Hieronym. in Psalm. 133.

To conclude, Theodoretus saithe thus, Passim videas nostra dogmata non ab ijs solùm teneri, &c. *Yee maie commonly see, that our Doctrine is knowen, not onely of them, that are the* Doctoures *of the Churche, and the* Maisters *of the people, but also euen of the* Tailers, *and* Smithes, *and* VVeauers, *and of al* Artificers: *Yea, and further also of* VVeemen: *and that, not onely of them, that be Learned, but also of* Labouringe VVeemen, *and* Sewsters, *and* Seruantes, *and* Handemaides. *Neither onely the* Citizens, *but also the* Countriefolkes *doo very wel vnderstande the same. Yee maie finde, yea, euen the very* Dichers, *and* Deluers, *and* Cowehearde, *and* Gardiners Disputinge of the Holy Trinitie, and of the Creation of al thinges. Nowe iudge you, M. Harding, whether of vs two bathe erred in his reporte.

Theodoretus De Corrigen. Græcor. affectib. li. 5 De Diuina Trinitate, rerumq; omnium Creatione disserentes.

The Apologie, Cap. 3. Diuision. 4. & 5.

The Auncient Fathers, Cyprian, Epiphanius, and Hierome, saie, For one, who perchaunce hathe made a Vowe, to leade a sole life, and afterwarde liueth vnchastely, and cannot quenche the flames of luste, it is better to marrie a VVife, and to liue honestly in vvedlocke. And the Olde Father Augustine iudgeth, the selfe same Marriage to be good and perfite, and that it ought not to be broken againe. These menne, if a man haue once bounde him selfe by a Vowe, though

Cyprian. Epist. 11. Lib. 1. Epiphan. contra Apostolicos. Hæres. 61. Hieronym ad Demetriadem. August. De Bono Viduit. cap. 10

though afterward he burne, kepe queanes, and defyle himself with never so sinful and desparate a life, yet they suffer not that person too marry a wyfe: or, yf he chaunce to marry, they allow it not for mariage. And they commonly teach, It is much better, and more godly to keepe a Concubine or an Harlot, then to liue in that bande of marriage.

The old Father S. Augustine complained of the multitude of vaine Ceremonies, wherwith he euen then saw mens minds and consciences ouer charged: These men, as though god regarded nothing els but their Ceremonies, haue so out of measure increased them, that there is nowe almost none other thing left in their Churches, and places of prayer. *Aguſt. ad Ianuar. Epiſt. 118.*

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

All that M. Harding hath heere to say, hath been both alleadged, and also fully answered before in a place more conuenient. *In the 2. part, 8. Chap. 1. diuision. and 2. part. 17. Cap 1. Diuision.*

The Apologie, Cap. 3. Diuision. 5.

Againe, that olde Father S. Augustine denyeth it too bee lawful for a Monke, to spend his time slouthfully in idleneſſe, and, vnder a pretensed, and counterfeite Holines, to liue al vpō others. And who so thus liueth, the old Father Appolonius likeneth him to a Theefe. These men haue (I wote not whether to name them drones, or heards of Monks) who for al that they doe nothing, not yet once intend to beare any shew of holynes, yet liue they not onely vpon others, but also riot lauishly of other folkes labours.

M. Harding.

(a) We do not maintaine, that a Monke should liue idly. But we reproue you for accounting the seruice of God idleneſſe. Neither is that the thing only which ye can alledge in Defence of that your Brethren haue doone to Monasteries in the Countreis where your Gospel proceedeth. For yee haue remoued not onely such Monkes as were proued idle, but al Monkes generally, that would serue God according to that vow, which they made vnder the (b) approued rule of S. Benedict, S. Augustine, S. Francis, S. Dominicke, or of any other. You say, we haue droues, and heardes of Monkes, thereby signifying, they are beastes rather then men: Whereas S. Augustine calleth them *Seruos Dei*, the Seruants of God, in that very worke, which you alleadge. (a) *But S. Aguſt. calleth it worſe then idleneſſe.* (b) *Although Chriſtes Rule were beſt, yet were not ſufficient.*

Sith that our monkes (I meane all religious men) serued the Aulter, & were appointed to preach, minister the Sacraments, and bestow their time in prayer for their owne infirmities, and for the sins of the people: (c) by the doctrine of S. Augustine, they are not bounde to labour, as they, who for sowing spirituall things to the behoofe of others, may reape theyr temporall thinges to their owne necessary sustenance. (c) *Vntruthe plaine contrary to S. Auguſtine.*

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Monkes (ye say) be Gods Seruantes: and Monkes life is the seruice of God. And heerein ye vse such earnest talke, as though, if the whole generation of Monkes were remooued, God shoulde be without seruice. Inocent S. Augustine shewing vs, what good seruice the Monkes of his time did vnto God, saith thus, Illi non Deo seruiunt, sed his ventri. *Theſe Monkes serue not God but serue their owne belly.* Againe he saieth, Tantanta eo est periculosior, quo sub nomine Seruitutis Dei decipit. *Hypocriſie, or vaunting of holineſſe is the more dangerous, for that it deceiueth vnder the name of Gods seruice.* Againe hee saith, Fallit dolosa imagine Sanctitatis. *It deceiueth vs by the greene countenance, or Image of holineſſe.* Againe touching these Monkes, he saith, Non apparet, vtrum ex proposito Seruitutis Dei venerint, an ritam inopem, & laboriosam fugientes, vacui palci, & vtiliter volucrint. *It is not knowen, whether they became Monkes for purpose to serue God, or else being weary of their poore and painefull life, were rather lyke Drones, that liue idly, and clothed doing nothing.* And therefore hee calleth the Almes

Auguſt. de Opere Monach Cap. 12.

Auguſt. de Sermone Domini in mōte. Eodem loco.

Auguſt. de opere Monachō. cap. 22.

Auguſt. de Opere Monacho, cap. 28

Monkes Goddes Seruice.

that they geate, Sumptus lucrosæ egestatis: & Simulatæ pretium Sanctitatis: The charges of gainefull pouertie: and the price of feined holinesse. Againe he sayth, Venalem circumferunt Hypocrisim: *They carrie their Hypocrisie about to sale,*

August de Opere Monacho. cap. 31

S. Hilarie speaking of the same kinde of Holy People sayth thus, Conuiuia sub obtentu Religionis sumptuosa sectantur. Apothecas suas inutili Religiosorum obsequio defendunt: de quibus scriptum est, Comedentes domos uiduarum. Etiamsi Dominum se credant inuocare, tamen audient, quod est in Euangelio, Scimus, quia peccatores Deus non audit: *Vnder the colour of holynesse, they seeke for deintie and costly fare: They mainteine theyr Hoarehouses* by the vnprofitable seruice of Religious people: *of whom it is written,* They deuoure vp poore Widowes houses. *Although they thinke* they serue God, *yet the same answere shall be made them, that is written in the Gospell,* We know that God geueth no eare to sinners. Upon these woordes of the Gospell, Sell all, that thou hast, and geue it too the poore, and come, and followe me, Your very Ordinary Glose sayth thus, Bene operando: non mendicando: *Follow me in well doing not in begging,*

Hilari. in Psalmum. 52.

Matth. 23.

Iohn. 9.
Luk. 19.
Matth. 18.

And, least you shoulde thinke, wee speake onely of olde forren faultes, and that all suche thinges sithens those dayes haue beene reformed, Nicolaus Cusanus, a Cardinall of Rome, one of your newe Doctours sayth, Vix fallacia illorum, qui sub habitu Christi apparent, potest sciri ob suam varietatem. Nam alius quidem sub hac veste, alius sub capitio, alius sub hoc Religionis signo, alius sub alio, Christo se militare asserit: Licet penè omnes, non quæ Christi, sed, quæ sua sunt, quærant. Omnes enim student auaritiæ à maximo vsque ad minimum, Et in omnibus Vna doctrina comperit eorum fallaciam: scilicet, Ex fructibus eorum cognoscetis eos: *The deceitfulnesse of them, that shewe themselues vnder the apparell of Christ, because of their varietie can hardly be knowen. For one of them sayth, Hee serueth Christe vnder one weede, an other vnder another: One vnder a Hoode, another vnder one badge of Religion, an other vnder another. Notwithstanding they al for the most part seeke theyr owne, and not the things that perteyne too Christe Iesus: For they are al geuen to couetousnesse from the most to the leaste. And yet in al these diuersities, by this marke, or doctrine yee may descrie their falshood, By theyr woorkes yee shal knowe them.*

Nicol. Cusanus Excitation li. 7. Moneta

Wee graunt, the Seruice of God may not rightly be called Idlenesse. But what if Saint Bernarde say of your Monkes, Serui Christi, seruiunt Antichristo: *They pretende* Christes Seruice, *and* serue Antichriste. For where did God euer require you to doe him suche Seruice? S. Ierome sayth of them, In statu seruili, & abiection is esse abhorrent. Laborare recusant præ pigritia: Mendicare erubescunt validi: quia nihil daretur eis: *They are loth to be abiects, and in seruile state: For Idlenesse they wyl not labour: And to begge they are ashamed. For being valiaunt and lustie people, no man woulde geue them any thing.* Like wise sayth S. Augustine, Tanquam Conseruatricem Euangelii prædicant pigritiem: *They spoke much of theyr Idlenesse, as if it were the Keepe, and Castle of the Gospel.* Againe hee sayth, Contingit eis, quod in Viduis iunioribus indisciplinatis cauendum Apostolus dicit; Simul & otiosæ esse discunt; non solùm autem otiosæ, sed & curiosæ, & verbosæ, loquentes quæ non oportet: *The same thing happeneth vnto the, that S. Paul speaketh of young Widowes, liuing out of order: They learne to bee idle: and not onely idle, but also curious, and ful of woordes, speaking such thinges, as are not meete.* Thus yee see, M. Harding, that this pretence and colour of Gods Seruice hath often times of the Auncient Fathers beene called Idlenesse.

Bernardus in Cantica Canti. Hieronym. ad Eustochium.

August. de Opere Monacho. chap. 21.

August eodem Capite.

Yee saye, Monkes nowe serue the Aulter, and Minister sacramentes: and therefore are not bounde too Bodily labour. This is a fayre colour to shadowe theyr Idlenesse. For who euer gaue Monkes to serue the Aulter: or gaue them authoritie to Minister Sacramentes? What Doctour? What Father? What Ancient Councell? In olde times it was not lawfull for a Monke to bee a Priest. S. Gregory sayth, Nemo potest Ecclesiasticis Officiis deseruire, & in Monastica Regula ordinatè persistere: *No man can serue the Ecclesiastical Office, and orderly keepe the Rule of Monkery.* And S. Hierome sayth, Monachus non Docentis, sed plangentis habet officium: *A Monkes office is, not to preache, but to mourne.* Againe he saith, Alia causa est Monachi, alia Clerici: Clerici Oues pascunt: Ego pascor. *The state of a Monke is one thing, and the state of a Priest is another. Priestes feede the flocke: I beeing a Monke muste*

16. Question 1. Nemo.

Question. 16 1. Monachus.

be

Monkes bodily labour.

be fed. Whereupon the Gloſe ſaith, Ego Paſcor Sacramentis ipſorum: *I am fed with the Sacramentes of the Prieſtes.* Whereby it is euident, that the Monke himſelfe had no Authoritie, to Miniſter Sacramentes, no not ſo muche as priuately to himſelfe. But, touching bodily labour, *S.* Ierome ſaith, This was holden as a Law among the Monkes in Ægypt, *that, who ſo would not labour, ſhould not eate.* 16. *Queſt.* 1. *Alia Cauſa. Gloſſa.*

And Saint Auguſtine ſayth, as it is alleadged in his name, Nihil Dei ſeruis peius eſt otioſitate. Operentur ergo in nomine Domini: *Vnto the ſeruantes of GOD there is nothing woorſe then idleneſſe. Let them worke therefore in the name of the Lorde.* *Hieronymus ad Ruſticum. Et in vita Hilarionis.*

Of ſuche vile Monkes *S.* Auguſtine ſayth, Iſti manus otioſas, & repoſitoria plena habere volunt: *Theſe Monkes will haue idle handes and full Cellers.* A learned Father was wont to ſay, by the reporte of Socrates, *A Monke that laboureth not with his handes, may be reſembled vnto a theefe.* *S.* Bernarde ſayth, Reſtat, vt ſint in laboribus Dæmonum, qui in laboribus hominum non fuerunt: *They muſt needes be in trauailes of Diuelles, that were not in the trauailes of men.* *Auguſtin. ad Fratres in Eremo, Ser. 1. Auguſt. de opere Monachor. cap. 23.*

Of theſe S. Auguſtine ſayth, Diabolus tam multos Hypocritas ſub habitu Monachorum vſquequaque diſperſit. *Such a number of Hypocrites hath the Diuel ſcattered abroade euery where, vnder the colour of Monkes.* *Hiſtoria Tripartita, lib. 8. cap. 1.*

The firſt Suppreſſours of Monaſteries within this Realme, in our memory, were two of your deareſt friendes, Cardinall Woulſee, and Doctour Fiſher, the Biſhop of Rocheſter: either of them well warraunted thereto by the Authoritie of the Pope. Long before that time, the Godly learned Biſhop Letoius ouerthrewe and burnt the Meſſalians Monaſteries, and ſaide, they were Dennes of Theeues: and, as Theodoretus reporteth, chaſed the Woolues away from the Folde. *Bernardus in Pſalm. 32. Auguſt. de Opere Monachor. cap. 28. Theodoretus lib. 4. cap. 11.*

Of late yeeres, ſundry of the Cardinalles of Rome, amongeſt whom alſo was Cardinall Poole, being ſpecially appointed in Commiſſion by Pope Paulus the thirde, to viewe the diſorders, and deformities of the Church, returned theyr anſwere in this ſort: Alius abuſus corrigendus eſt in Ordinibus Religioſorum: quòd adeò multi deformati ſunt, vt magno ſint ſcandalo Sæcularibus, exemploque plurimum noceant. Conuentuales ordines abolendos eſſe putamus omnes: *An other abuſe there is to be reformed in* the orders of Monkes and Friers. *For many of them are ſo vile, that they are a ſhame vnto the Seculares: and with their example doe muche yll.* As for Conuentual orders we thinke it good, they be al aboliſhed. σπάλαικλαϛικά. Τοὺς λύκους ἐκ τῆς πόλεως ἐξέλασον

This M. Harding, was the iudgement of your owne frendes. And therefore yee haue the leſſe cauſe to bee offended with the ſuppreſſing of Abbeies. For your owne deare Catholique Fathers Cardinall Woulſee, Cardinall Poole, Doctour Fiſher, & others, partly haue ſuppreſſed them, themſelues, and partly haue conſented vnto the ſame. In the booke called Opus Tripartitum, ioyned vnto the Councell of Laterane, it is thus written: Totus ferè Mundus obloquitur, & Scandalizatur de tanta multitudine Religioſorum Pauperum, qui introierunt in Mundum: *Welneare the whole worlde crieth againſt, and is offended for ſo great a* multitude of begging Monkes, and Friers, *that are entred into the world.* *Concil. To. 3. Con. Delectorum Cardinali. pag. 812.*

Therefore was this Decree publiſhed in the Councell of Laterane, Ne nimia Religioſorum diuerſitas grauem in Eccleſiam Dei offenſionem inducat, firmiter prohibemus, ne quis de cætero Nouam Religionem inueniat: *Leſt ouer great diuerſitie of Religious folke bring great offence into the Churche of God, wee doe earneſtly forbid, that from hence foorth no man deuiſe any newe Religion.* Thus it appeareth, your Pope himſelfe, and his Cardinalles were ſo wearied, and accloyed with multitudes of Monkes, that they would haue them increaſe no further. Damaſus, ſpeaking of the order of them, that were Chorepiſcopi, ſayeth thus, Vnde iſte Tertius Ordo poceſſerit, ignoramus: & quod ratione caret, extirpare neceſſe eſt: *From whence this Thirde Order is come, we cannot tell. And the thing that wanteth reaſon, muſt needes be taken vp by the rootes.* *Concil. To. 2. pag. 1000. Operis Tripart lib. 3. cap. 3. Concil. Lateran ſub. Innocen. 3. cap. 13 Diſt. 62. Chorepiſcopi.*

The Olde Councell of Rome decreed, that no man ſhould come to the *Concil. Rom. Ca. 3.*

A Priest keeping a Cocubine.

Seruice saide by a Priest well knowen to keepe a Concubine. These men let Concubines to ferme to their Priestes, and yet constraine men by force, against their will, to heare their cursed paltry Seruice.

M. Harding.

(a) We finde no suche Canon in the olde Romane Councels. Your allegations noted in the margent be false for the more part as your Doctrine is. Yet finde we that Nicolaus and Alexander Popes haue willed no man to heare the Masse of that Priest, whom he knoweth vndoubtedly to keepe a Concubine. (b) But wise men in the lawe thinke onely that to be an vndoubted knowledge, whether the Iudge hath by open sentence published such a man to keepe a Concubine, or the fact it selfe is notorius.

(c) Whereas you say, wee let Concubines out to ferme to our Priestes, it is meete for you soo to say it, because it is false and slaunderous. (d) Neither was euer any man, or at this day is driuen too heare his Masse, who keepeth a Concubine. For if he will take vpon him to proue any Priest to keepe a Concubine, himselfe not being so infamous, as hee may not stande in iudgement, it is certaine, hee shall be heard. If he cannot proue it, then is not he out of doubt by order of Lawe, that this Priest keepeth a Concubine, and therefore he is bounde, as other Christian people be, too heare his Masse. * Which is no sacriledge as your sacrilegious heart thinketh, and blasphemous tongue vttereth, but the blessed and holy sacrifice, which Christ made at his last Supper.

(a) *Untruth. For it is easie to be found.*
(b) *Such wise men be the Proctors of Cokines.*
(c) *Untruth. Notorious & manifest vnto the world. The B. of Sarisburie hath a Flocke by the eares of many Priests, that keepeth a Concubine: and if she beare a childe, he hath foure.*
(d) *Untruth, vnder the answere. Concil. Romã sub Nicolao Concil. To. 2. pa. 793. & An. 880. Zachar. in Epist. ad Bonif. Dist. 40. Non nos, In Glossa. Dist. 81. maximianus, In Gloss. Dist. 32. Nullus.*

De Concubinis Clericor. remittendis. Licet ad præd. Gloss. in eundem titulum.

Dist. 32. Nullus.

Vntruth. For Pope Nicolaus decreed such Concubines to be remoued from the Church, and not to be suffered to heare Masse.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

If it had pleased you, better to haue perused your bookes, ye might soone haue founde these selfe same wordes in the Councell of Rome, holden there vnder Pope Nicolas the first: Which although it be not so olde, as may be compared with the auncient Fathers Councels, yet it is elder then some partes, and braunches of your newe Religion. To like purpose writeth Pope Zacharie, Quis sapiens iudicabit, eos esse Sacerdotes, qui nec à Fornicationibus abstinent? *What wise man will reckon them to be Priestes, that abstaine not so much as from Fornication?* If no wise man can iudge them to be Priestes, what man then is he, that will authorize them to Minister Sacraments?

Now of the other side M. Harding, consider you the common, and ordinarie practise of your Churche of Rome. First, touching the Pope himselfe, your Glose saith, Facta Papæ excusantur, vt Adulterium Iacob: The Popes *doings* (or) Aduouteries) *are excused, as the* Aduoutrie *of* Iacob. And againe, Communiter dicitur, quòd pro simplici Fornicatione quis deponi non debet: cùm pauci sine illo vitio inueniantur: *It is commonly saide, that a man may not be deposed, or depriued for Simple Fornication: For as much as* (Priestes) *be found without that fault.*

Againe, where as the wordes of the Decree are these, Nullus audiat Missam Presbyteri, quem scit Concubinam indubitanter habere: *Let no man heare the Masse of that Priest, whom he vndoubtedly knoweth to keepe a* Concubine. The Glose vpon the same saith thus, Hic Canon quandoq; fuit latæ sententiæ: Sed hodiè non est: *This Decree in olde times stood as a rulede case: but now it is not so.* Ideo licet notoria sit Fornicatio, tamen non est propter eam abstinendum ab officiis Presbyterorum: *And therfore, although the Fornication be notorious knowen, yet may we not therefore refraine from the Seruice of the Priest.*

Decretum terp well agreeth the Glose vpon Othoes Legantines: Quid ergo si Sacerdos inueniatur coire cum muliere? Respondeo: Adhuc dicitur occultum: nec propter hoc debet cum vitare in publico, nisi aliter Comperiatur: *What if a man finde the* Priest *in the manner with a woman? I answeare: All that notwithstanding, the fault is priuie: Neither may a man therefore auoide that Priestes Seruice, vnlesse he be otherwise conuicted.*

And againe, in the same Glose vppon these wordes, Qui publicè detinet Concubinas: it is noted thus, Tu dic Publicè, quando multitudini se patere non expauet. Secùs ergo: si secretè intra domum propriam, vel alicubi detineat hanc Concubinam. Nam tunc pœnam huius Constitutionis non incurret. Domus enim rem secretam, non autem publicam denotat: *By the contrarie Or els, [illegible] not afraide,*

A Prieſte keepinge a cõcubine.

afraide, leſte the worlde eſpie him. Therefore it is otherwiſe, if he keepe the ſame Concubine ſecretely, *whether it be in his owne houſe, or in ſomme other mannes*. For then he is not within the daunger of this Lawe. *For a houſe betokeneth a thinge to be* Secrete, *and not* open.

By this fauourable, and gentle Conſtruction, onleſſe the Prieſte kepe his woman openly in the Marketplace, he is without al daunger of Lawes, and Canons: and we maie not refraine to heare his Seruice.

It is no Sacrilege (you ſaie) but the Bleſſed, and Holy Sacrifice. Hereto I maie anſweare you with the wordes of S. Auguſtine: Quæ ſunt Sacrilegia, ſi illa erant Sacra? Aut quæ Inquinatio, ſi illa Lauatio? *What is Sacrilege, if this be a Sacrifice? Or, what is ſtainynge, if this be waſhinge?* Auguſt. De Ciuitat. Li. 2. Ca. 4

Verily your owne Pope Hildebrande hereof writeth thus: Imperamus vobis, ne eorum Officia, Orationes, & Cultus audiatis. Quia Benedictio eorum vertitur in Maledictionem, & Oratio in Peccatum: Teſtante Domino per Prophetam, Maledicam Benedictionibus veſtris. Qui verò huic Saluberrimo præcepto obedire noluerint, Idololatriæ pœnam incurrent: *Wee commaunde you, that you heare neither theire Offices, nor theire Praiers, nor theire Seruice. For theire Bleſſinge is turned into Curſinge, and theire Praier into Sinne. As the Lorde him ſelfe witneſſeth by the Prophete: I wil curſe your Bleſſinges,* ſaithe the Lorde. *And who ſo euer wil not obeie this wholeſome Commaundemente*, he ſhal fal into the paine of Idolatrie. Dist. 81. *Si qui.*

Judge pe nowe, M. Hardinge, whether this be Sacrilege, as we ſaie: or, as you ſaie, a Bleſſed and an Holy Sacrifice. If it be a Sacrifice, if it be Bleſſed, if it be Holy, why ſhould he be accurſed, as an Idolatoure, that wil comme vnto it?

The Apologie, Cap. 3. Diuiſion. 7.

The Olde Canons of the Apoſtles commaunde, that Biſhop to be remoued from his Office, whiche wil ſupplie the place bothe of a Ciuil Magiſtrate, and alſo of an Eccleſiaſtical perſone. Theſe meune for al that, bothe doo, and wil needes ſerue bothe places. Nay rather, the one office, whiche they ought chiefely to execute, they once touche not: and yet no body commaundeth them to be diſplaced.

M. Hardinge.

If wee oughte to ſticke at any one certaine worldely buſines, * whiche maie ſeeme vnſeemely for a Biſhop or a Prieſte, as too baſe for his dignitie, and too muche hinderance to his vocation, vndoubtedly marriage is of that ſorte. VVhome maie wee better credite for this caſe, then S. Paule? * He that is without a wife (ſaithe he) is careful for the thinges that be of our Lorde, howe he maie pleaſe God. But he that is coupled with a wife, is careful aboute the thinges, whiche are of the worlde, and is diuided.

*Vntruth vaine aboue meaſure. For it was not vnſeemely for Chriſtes Apoſtles to be married.

* S. Paule ſpeaketh thus, not onely of Prieſts, but alſo of euery priuate Chriſtian man. Ambroſ. 1. Cor. 11.

But with our fleaſhely Miniſters, this buſines is not fleaſhely, and worldely at al, but altogeather ſpiritual, bicauſe theire ſpirite is wholly occupied therein.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Chriſte thought ſo litle hinderance to be in Marriage towardes the Preachinge of the Goſpel, that of his twelue Apoſtles he chooſe eleuen, that were married. So S. Ambroſe ſaithe, as it is alleged before: Apoſtoli omnes, exceptis Iohanne, & Paulo, Vxores habuerunt: *Al the Apoſtles had Wiues, ſauinge onely* S. Iohn, *and* S. Paule.

But pe ſaie, VVith our fleaſhely Miniſters, thus buſines is not fleaſhely, but altogeather Spiritual: bicauſe theire Sprite is wholly occupied therein. It pitieth me, M. Hardinge, to ſe you ſo vainely to beſtowe your Spiritual Cogitations. Matrimonie is Goddes ordinance. God neuer ordeined Man to liue in villanie, and filthineſſe. S. Paule ſaithe, Matrimonie is honourable in al menne (as wel in Prieſtes, as in others) and the bedde vndefiled. But Aduouterers, and Fornicatoures the Lorde him ſelfe wil iudge. Heb. 13. Rom. 8.

And againe, writinge vnto the Married people of Rome, he ſaithe, Vos non eſtis in Carne, ſed in Spiritu: *You are not in the* Fleaſhe, *but in the* Sprite. They were married, and liued in the Lawes of Marriage: Yet S. Paule ſaithe, *They were not in the* Fleaſhe, *but in the* Sprite.

S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Sancta ſunt etiam Corpora Coniugatorum, Fidem ſibi, & Domino ſeruantium: *The Bodies of married people, keepinge faithe bothe to them ſelues, and to the Lorde, are Cleane, and Holy.* Origene ſaithe, Non ſolùm virgines, aut Continentes, Auguſt. De Bono Coniugali, ca. 11. Origen. in Epiſt. ad Roma. Ca. 12

Matrimonie chaste, and pure.

tinentes, offerunt Corpora sua Hostiam Sanctam: *Not onely Virgins, or others, that liue in Single Life* (but also Married folkes) *offer vp theire Bodies a Holy Sacrifice*. Chrysostome saithe, Sanctificationem Paulus vocat Pudicitiam, & Temperantiam Coniugalem: *The honest Chastitie, and Temperance, that is betweene Man, and Wife*, S. Paule *calleth* Holinesse. And againe, Carent Culpa Nuptiæ, nec à Virtute quicquam prohibent: Marriage *is voide of faulte: and is no hinderance vnto vertue.*

Chrysost. Ad Hebræ. Hom. 17.

Hereof we haue spoken before more at large. But touchinge the Chaste life of your Spiritual Cleregie, M. Hardinge, as sundrie your owne friendes haue recorded, and as the whole worlde is wel able to iudge, it is nothinge els, but a Spiritual filthinesse.

The Apologie, Cap. 3. Diuision. 8.

The Olde Councel of Gangra commaundeth, that none shoulde make suche difference betweene an Vnmaried Priest, and a Maried Priest, as to thinke the one more holy, then the other for Single Lifes sake. Theise menne put suche a difference betweene them, that they streight waie thinke al theire Holy Seruice to be defiled, if it be donne by a good, and honeste man, that hathe a Wife.

M. Hardinge.

(a) Vntruthe, fonde, and peeuishe. For this woorde, External, is not once named in al that Coūcel.

(b) The Coūcel of Gangra neuer once named the Masse.

(c) Vntruthe so Vaine, that I marueile, M. Hardinge can reporte it without blusshinge.

It was not for your pourpose, Sirs, to vse true dealinge, and to alleage the woordes as they are in that olde Councel. For they speake of an (a) external Sacrifice, (b) whiche the Churche calleth the Masse. The same it behoued you to dissemble, lest ye bewraied your cause. The woordes be these: If any man make a difference of a Priest, who hath ben married, as though when he sacrificeth, a man might not communicate with his oblation be he accursed. Those fathers spake euidently of a Priest, Can. 4. who hath sometime benne married, that is to saie, before his Priesthoode. (c) For after Priesthoode, it was neuer hearde sithens the time of Christe, that any Priest might marrie by the Lawe either of the Greeke, or of the Latine Churche. VVee therefore condemne the marriages of Priestes, whiche be made after the takinge of holy orders, and saie, that he is no good and honeste man, but an incestuous Aduouterer, that marrieth afterwarde.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Chrysost. ad Hebræ. Homil. 17. Hoc Sacrificium exemplar illius est.

Magis Recordationem Sacrificij operamur.

Plutarchus in Romulo.

Alexander ab Alexandro.

Pathymeres: λειτουργὸς λέγεται διακόνους, καὶ τοὺς νῦν ὑποδιακόνους λεγομένους.

Roman 13. Actor. 13.

Chrysost. in Act. Homil. 27.

To answeare al your trifles, M. Hardinge, it were too longe. We refuse not the names of Oblation, or Sacrifice. We knowe, that the Holy Ministration is commonly so called by the Auncient Fathers: For that, as Chrysostome saithe, it is the Memorie, the Remembrance, the Samplare, the Token of that one Sacrifice, that Christe once offered in his Body vpon the Crosse. Howbe it, the reason hereof, that ye woulde fayne wreaste out of the Greeke woorde, λειτουργήσαντος αὐτῶν, is very simple, and bewraieth in you, either wante of skil, or greate corruption. For, beinge learned in the Greeke tongue, ye muste néedes knowe, that λειτουργία signifieth not a Sacrifice, but a Ministerie, or publike Seruice. Plutarchus saithe thus, Lictores, quasi Litores dicebantur, quòd essent λειτουργοί. λειτὸν γὰρ τὸν λαὸν, ἃ τὴν δῆμον ἔτι καὶ νῦν οἱ Ἕλληνες ὀνομάζουσι. Hereby it appeareth, that the Common Hangeman of the Citie was called λειτουργὸς, and his office λειτουργία: Whiche, I trowe, M. Hardinge, ye woulde not haue to be called a Sacrificer, and a Sacrifice. Pachymeres, in his Annotations vpon Dionysius, saithe thus: λειτουργὸς, appellat Diaconos, aut eos, qui nunc Hypodiaconi appellantur: *He calleth them*, λειτουργὸς, *that are called* Deacons, *or* Subdeacons. S. Paule, speakinge of Kinges, and Ciuile Princes, saithe, λειτουργοὶ θεοῦ εἰσί: λειτουργοὶ, aut Ministri Dei sunt: I reckon ye will not saie, that either Deacons, or Subdeacons, or Kinges, or Princes had Authoritie to Minister the Holy Communion, or, as you saie, To offer vp the Daily Sacrifice. Where as S. Luke saithe, λειτουργούντων αὐτῶν, Ministrantibus illis: Chrysostome demaundeth this question, Quid est Ministrantibus, λειτουργούντων? He answeareth, Prædicantibus: Whereby it appeareth, that the Apostles Sacrificinge, was theire Preachinge. It had benne ouer mutche vanitie, to note theise thinges, had not your vaine quarrel geuen the occasion. Certainely there is no mention in the saide Councel of Gangra, either of your Masse, or of your External Sacrifice.

After Priesthoode (ye saie) it was neuer hearde sithence the time of Christe, that any Priest might

Marriage in Prieſthoode.

might Marrie by the Lawe, either of the Greeke, or of the Latine Churche. This warrante were vndoubtedly good, if euery your worde were a Goſpel. But what if your owne Gloſe, that is to ſaie, the very Grounde, and mother of your Diuinitie, ſtande againſte you, and ſaie, Ye warrante vnwiſely, or, if that miſlike you, vnaduiſedly, ye knowe not what? Verily, vpon the Popes owne Decrees ye ſhal finde it noted thus: Multi ex hac Litera dixerunt, quòd Orientales poſſunt contrahere in Sacris Ordinibus: *Of theiſe woordes many haue geathered, that the Prieſtes of the Eaſte Churche maie marrie, beinge within Holy Orders.* Nicephorus ſaithe, that Euplychius, beinge a Prieſte, and the Biſhop of Cæſaria in Cappadocia, married a Wife a litle before, that he was Martyred. The like he ſemeth to write of Apollinaris the Elder, that beinge a Prieſte, Married a Wife at Laodicea.

Diſt. 31. A liter: In Gloſſa. Nicephor. Li. 10. Cap. 10. Nicephor. Li 9. Cap. 17.

Here M. Hardinge wil anſweare vs boldely, as he hath donne before, that this Euplychius was neither Biſhop, nor Prieſte, but onely a gentleman of Noble Parentage: and for proufe thereof he wil allege Sozomenus, and Nicephorus. But let him reade the Seconde Councel of Nice. There ſhal he finde, that the ſame Euplychius is called Euplychius Presbyter: Euplychius the Prieſte: Let him reade the Auncient Learned Father Athanaſius. There ſhal he finde, that the ſame Euplychius, is called, Epiſcopus Cappadociæ, The Biſhop of Cæſaria in Cappadocia. Thus ſhal M. Hardinge finde, that Euplychius was bothe a Prieſte, and a Biſhop too. And I ſpeake of the ſame Euplychius the Martyre, and of none other. Therefore, good Reader, it maie pleaſe thee, to telle M. Hardinge, he deſerueth ſmal credite in his anſweare, that wil aduenture to anſweare, before he knowe.

Concil. Nicen. 2. Actione 6. Athanaſi. Contrà Arianos Orat. 1.

In the Councel holden at Ancyra there is a Canon written thus, Diaconi, quicunque ordinantur, ſi in ipſâ Ordinatione proteſtati ſunt, & dixerunt, velle ſe coniugio copulari, quia ſic manere non poſſunt, hi, ſi poſtmodùm vxores duxerint, in Miniſterio maneant, propterea quòd eis Epiſcopus licentiam dederit: *Deacons, that receiue orders, if, at the time of theire admiſſion, they make proteſtation, and ſaie, they wilbe married, for that they cannot otherwiſe continewe,* if they afterwarde Marrie, *let them remaine in the Miniſterie: for that the Biſhop hath already diſpenſed with them.*

Concil. Ancyrenum. Canon. 3.

Chryſoſtome, ſpeakinge of the Marriage of Biſhoppes, ſaithe thus, Quamuis Nuptiæ plurimum difficultatis in ſe habeant, ita tamen Aſſumi poſſunt, vt perfectiori vitæ impedimento non ſint, verùm id planè perquam rarò, atque difficilè: *Notwithſtandinge Marriage haue in it mutche trouble, yet ſo it maie be Taken, that it ſhalbe no hinderance to perfite life. But certainely that is a ſeldome thinge, and very harde.* He ſaithe, Marriage maie be taken, or choſen: And thus he ſpeaketh namely of the Marriage of Prieſtes, and Biſhoppes.

Chryſoſtom. in Epiſt. 1. ad Tim. Homil. 10.

Addition. ☞ VVhereas M. Iewel beareth thee in hande, that Chryſoſtome ſaithe, *Marriage maie be taken, or choſen, and that of Prieſtes, and Biſhoppes*, for of their Marriage he ſpeaketh, ſaithe this man, al this is falſe. For firſte, vnderſtande thou, this ſentence is not in Chryſoſtome at al: not in the Greeke, I ſaie, in whiche tongue onely he wrote. For I haue ſeene the Greeke, and diligently conferred it mee ſelfe. But it is added vnto his texte, either by the tranſlation, or by Falſehoode vſed at the printinge, as in theiſe corrupte times falſe printers haue corrupted many bookes of the olde Fathers. Againe theſe woordes are not ſpoken ſpecially of *Prieſtes Marriage*, but generally, and indefinitely of al Marriage.

M. Iew. fo. 305. a.

M. Iew. fo. 305. b.

The Anſweare. I ſaie, Chryſoſtome *ſpeaketh theiſe woordes namely of the Marriage of* Prieſtes, *and* Biſhoppes. M. Hardinge anſweareth mee gently, as his manner is, Al this is Falſe. Gentle Reader, I beſeeche thee, if thou be hable, conſider the whole place of Chryſoſtome, and weighe wel the cauſes of his writinge: ſo ſhalte thou be hable indifferently to iudge, whether M. Hardinge, or I, haue dealte vntruely. Firſte of al, Chryſoſtome erpounded theſe woordes of S. Paule, *A Biſhop muſte be the Huſbande of one Wife.* This is the grounde of the reſte, that foloweth. And ſpeakinge hereof vnto the people, he ſaithe thus, Cur non ait Paulus, Oportet Epiſcopum Angelum eſſe &c. *Why did not* S. Paule *ſaie, A Biſhop muſte be an Angel, ſubiecte to no infirmitie, or affection, or vice of man, &c. Why did he not ſaie, A Biſhop muſte goe out of the Worlde, and be aboue al the cares of this Life? &c.* He anſweareth, *Leſte the Miniſterie of the Churche ſhoulde be foreſaken,* S. Paule *required not in a Biſhop that vertue*

Chryſoſtom. in 1. Timoth. cap. 3. Homil. 10.

(of

(of Chaſtitie) *that is ſo highe, and ſo heauenly, but an other Vertue that is meane, and reaſonable, leſte the Churche ſhoulde be leafte without Biſhoppes.*

To be ſhorte, in that very ſame place, Chryſoſtome aboue foure and twentie times, hath the expreſſe names of Prieſte, and Biſhop. And yet muſte we beleeue M. Hardinge onely vpon his worde, that Chryſoſtome ſpeaketh theſe thinges, onely of the Marriage of al menne in general: and not one worde ſpecially of the Marriage of Prieſtes. Nowe for as muche as M. Hardinge telleth vs, Al this is Falſe. Iudge thou, good Reader, bitweene vs bothe, in whether of vs is the Falſehed. And, as thou findeſt him herein, ſo thinke of the reſte of al his dealinges.

M. Har. fo. 305. b. These woordes are not in the Greeke: I haue conferred it: It is Falſehood vſed at the printinge: False printers haue corrupted many Bookes.

The Anſwere. What Printers, M. Hardinge? What were theire names? Where dwelte they? What did they? Wil you pronounce your ſentence of Condemnation againſt them al, not knowinge, neither againſt whom, nor againſt how many, nor wherefore? You ſaie, Yee finde not theſe woordes in the Greeke. But what if your Greeke Bookes be corrupted, as in deede they are in ſundrie places. Certainely al the Latine tranſlations, that I haue ſeene, either Printed, or Written, or Olde, or Newe, haue this whole place euen worde by worde, as I haue alleged it. But, bicauſe you thinke the Greeke is beſte hable to direcie you, I wil finde you alſo the like ſentence in Chryſoſtome in the Greeke. Theſe be his wordes: Matrimonium non ſolùm nihil obſtat ad Philoſophandum Deo, ſi voluerimus eſſe ſobrij, ſed etiam magnam adfert conſolationem: *Marriage not onely hindereth vs nothinge from the ſeruice of God, if wee wil be ſober, but alſo bringeth vs greate comforte.* Theſe woordes bothe beare the ſame ſenſe, and alſo are founde in the Greeke. You maie conferre them at your pleaſure.

Chryſoſt. in Geneſin. Homil. 21.

You ſaie, Although it be thus written, Marriage maie ſo be taken that it ſhal be no lette vnto perfite Life, yet it followeth in the ſame ſentence, But certainely that is a thinge very ſeldome, and of greate difficultie. Al this, M. Hardinge, you your ſelfe haue already anſwered. For you ſaie, It is not in the Greeke, and therefore no parte of Chryſoſtome, but ſhifted in by the Falſehoode of the Printers. This is your anſweare: It maie wel be taken againſte your ſelfe. I graunte, there be many impedimentes in Wife, Children, Seruauntes, Familie, and worldely cares. But marke your vneauen, and partial dealinge. The ſame Chryſoſtome, euen in the ſame ſentence, ſaithe thus, *Abundance of richeſſe doethe hardly bringe a man into the Kingdome of Heauen: yet oftentimes many riche menne haue entred into it: ſo alſo doethe Marriage.* As Marriage hindereth, ſo dothe richeſſe: and no more the one, then the other. Chriſte calleth richeſſe Thornes and Brambles. I do not remember, that euer of Marriage he ſaide the like. Yet the Pope reſtraineth his Prieſtes onely from Marriage: and alloweth them Benefices, Prebendes, Abbies, Biſhoprikes vpon Biſhoprikes, with Monie, and Treaſure, as muche as they liſte, and thinketh it no hinderance to perfite Life.

Luke. 8. Matthe. 13.

Eraſmus Contra Beda. Pag. 157. Cornel. Agrippa contra Louanien. Artic. 18. Diſt. 84. Cùm in præterito. In Gloſſa. Caietan. in Quodlibeto.

Eraſmus ſaithe, The Prieſtes of the Greeke Churche this daie, notwithſtandinge theire Orders, Marrie VViues. The like writeth Cornelius Agrippa againſte the Louanians. Your owne Gloſe vpon the Decrees, as I haue alleged before, noteth thus, Dicunt quòd olim Sacerdotes poterant contrahere, ante Siricium: *They ſaie, that in olde times, before* Pope Siricius, *it was Laweful for Prieſtes, to contracte Matrimonie.* Likewiſe Cardinal Caietane ſaithe, Nec ratione, nec Authoritate probari poteſt, quòd, abſolutè loquendo, Sacerdos peccet, contrahendo Matrimonium: *It cannot be proued, neither by Reaſon, nor by Antheritie, ſpeakinge abſolutely, that a Prieſte offendeth God in Marrieinge a Wife.*

Nowe coulde he haue ſaide thus, if he had thought, the Vowe of Chaſtitie had benne annexed of neceſſitie, to the order of Prieſthoode?

M. Har. fo. 307. b.

Addition. ☞ Cardinal Caietane hathe his erroures. VVee are not bounde to mainteine, what ſo euer he ſaithe &c. Like as the order or habite of Monkes hath Chaſtitie annexed vnto it, and therefore he that receiueth it, is ſaide therewith to make a Vowe conſequently, euen ſo holy order in the VVeaſte Churche hath Chaſtitie annexed inſeparably &c. Addition ☞

The Anſweare. Here is harde ſhifte, M. Hardinge. Muſte theſe matters be proued

Marriage in Prieſthoode.

be proued by Freers Wædes, and Monkes Cowles? In the VVeaſte Churche (you ſaie) Chaſtitie is inſeparably annexed vnto Prieſthoode. I trowe, you meane not true Chaſtitie in dede, but onely the promiſſe, and Vowe of Chaſtitie. For otherwiſe bothe Eaſte, and Weaſte maie ſee by your Concubines, and other practiſes, that youre Prieſthoode, and Chaſtitie maie wel goe a ſunder. But, if the Vowe of Chaſtitie be neceſſarily annexed vnto Prieſthoode, as you haue tolde vs, why ſpeake you then more of the VVeaſte Churche, then of the Eaſte? Is theire Prieſthoode, and yours of ſundrie natures? Why ſhoulde you thus peſter the worlde with ſo mutche vanitie? Once againe I ſaie, If the Vowe of Chaſtitie be neceſſarily annexed to the Order of Prieſthoode, howe can Cardinal Caietane ſaie, *It cannot be proued, neither by Reaſon, nor by Authoritie, ſpeakinge abſolutely, that a Prieſte offendeth God in Marrieinge a Wife?*

So likewiſe ſaithe Anſelmus in a Dialogue bitwéne the Maiſter, and the Scholare, touchinge theiſe maters: Deſideramus certificari tua Solutione ſuper Vulgari in toto Orbe quæſtione, quæ ab omnibus penè quotidiè ventilatur, & adhuc lis indiſcuſſa celatur, Scilicet, An liceat Presbyteris, poſt acceptum Ordinem Vxores ducere: *Wee are deſirous by your Anſweare to be certified, aboute this common queſtion, that is nowe toſſed through the worlde, and as yet lieth vndiſcuſſed, I meane*, whether a Prieſte, beinge within Orders, maie Marrie a VVife. Hereby it appeareth, that in the time of Anſelmus, whiche was aboute a thouſande yéres after Chriſte, This mater laie in queſtion, and was not yet diſcuſſed. *Anſelm. Dialog. Inquiſitione Prima.*

Addition. Anſelme wrote three Dialogues, in whiche he maketh the Maiſter, and the Scholare to talke togeather. Moe Dialogues he neuer wrote, that maie appeare by the woorkes, that are printed in his name: And in theſe there is no ſuche Dialogue touchinge theſe maters. There is no ſuche thinge at al, emonge al his Dialogues. VVhether Freere Bale, or Illyticus, or ſome other ſuche gatherer of rifferaffe haue deceiued you, or your ſelfe haue vſed your owne inuention (I wil not cal it plaine lieinge) I knowe not. *M. Hardinge, fol. 308. a. b.*

The Anſweare. And wil you not cal it plaine Lieinge, M. Hardinge? There is the more courteſie in your dealinge. Sutche talke becommeth you ſo wel, as nothinge better. It is your manner to preſume boldely, before you knowe. Certainely there is ſutche a Dialogue of Anſelmus: There is ſutche a Dialogue. And although you ſawe it neuer, yet haue I ſéene it. And, if any your friende, for his better ſatisfaction, ſhal deſire the ſight thereof, I am hable to healpe him. If yée reſte onely vpon the credite of Printed Bookes, yée maie ſone be deceiued. For there are ſundrie Bookes written by Anſelmus, that neuer were printed. Abbas Trithemius, after he had made a longe rehearſal of his Bookes, in the ende ſaithe thus, Alia plura recepiſſe dicitur, quæ ad notitiam meam non venerunt: Anſelmus *hath alſo written many other Bookes, whiche neuer came to my knowledge.* *Trithemius De Scriptoribus Eccleſiaſticis.*

But, touchinge the number, and certaintie of Anſelmes Bookes, I ſée no cauſe, but Anſelme him ſelfe maie as wel be beléeued, as M. Hardinge. Anſelme him ſelfe ſaithe, he hathe written moe Dialogues, then thoſe foure, that you haue alleged: as you might eaſily haue ſéene by his Prologue before his Dialogue, De Veritate. One other Dialogue he wrote, De Paſsione Domini: the ſpeakers whereof are Anſelmus, and Maria. He wrote an other Dialogue bitwéne the Maiſter & the Scholare, beginninge thus, Plura ſunt de quibus tuam diu deſidero reſponſionem. There is an other Booke of Anſelmus, De Corpore Chriſti, and an other, De conceptione Beatæ Virginis Mariæ, beginninge thus, Principium quo ſalus mundi: whiche, and other like Bookes, I trowe, in your printed Colonian Tomes wil not be founde. There came lately abroade an other Dialogue of Anſelmes bitwéne the Maiſter, and Scholare, named Promptuarium, ſeu Elucidarium, printed at Pariſe, by Fridericus Morellus, anno Domini 1560. Your Coloniens in theire Tomes of Anſelmes woorkes, haue ſette forth one ſpecial Booke of his Epiſtles, conteininge in the whole thirtiene onely Epiſtles, and no moe. Yet notwithſtandinge, I can ſende you to two ſeueral Authentike Bookes of Anſelme, wherein you maie finde thrée hundred, thrée ſcoare and eight of his Epiſtles. Therefore M. Hardinge, if you ſatiſfie your ſelfe onely with the Recordes of Colaine, you maie happily be deceiued. You maie remember,

Anſelmus was the Archebiſhop of Canturburie, and Metropolitane of this Realme of Englande: whether euer he ſawe the Cittie of Colaine, or no, I haue not hearde. Therefore it were more wiſedome for you to ſeke his Bookes in Englande, then in Colaine. Haie your Coloniens them ſelues confeſſe, that they haue not printed al Anſelmes Bookes, but onely ſo many, as came to their handes. For thus they write in the Inſcription, or Title of the ſame: Operum Anſelmi, quæ quidem haberi potuerunt, omnium: And againe in the thirde Tome. Catalogus opuſculorum omnium D. Anſelmi, quæ ad hunc vſque Diem haberi potuerunt.

Spare therefore your vnmannerly ſpeches, of plaine Lieinge, M. Hardinge, and learne rather your ſelfe, to ſpeake the truthe. As for the mater it ſelfe, that the Prieſtes of Englande were commonly, and lawfully married in the time of Anſelmus, whiche was in the yere of our Lorde a thouſande and foure ſcoare, it is euidente by al, that haue written the Storie of that age.

Diſt. 34. Cum in præterito. In eadem diſt.

You maie adde further hereto the Example of Moſes, not the greate Captaine of Iſrael, but a Chriſtian Prieſte: who, as it appeareth by the Popes owne Recordes, beinge within Holy Orders, toke a wife, and lined with her without any manner offenſe of Lawe. Your Doctoures telle you, that vntil the time of Pope Siricius, that is to ſaie, for the ſpace welneare of foure hundred yeres after Chriſte, it was lawful for al Prieſtes to marrie without exception, neither Vowe, nor promiſſe, nor Lawe, nor Ordinance, nor other reſtrainte beinge then to the contrarie. Panormitane, your principal Canoniſte, ſaithe thus, Si clare conſtet de Matrimonio Papę, tunc aut Vxor inducetur ad continentiam, aut, ſi noluerit, reddat debitum, & nihilominus ſtet in Papatu. Quia non repugnat ſubſtantiæ Papatus, ſeu Clericatus. Nam & Petrus habebat Vxorem, cum promoueretur in Papam Continentia autem proceſsit ex Conſtitutione Eccleſiæ: *If it maie appeare clearely, that the Pope hath a Wife,* (as hauinge married her before he was Pope) *then either his wife ſhalbe perſuaded to liue Single, or if ſhe wil not, let the Pope yeelde her Marriage duetie, and yet neuertheleſſe remaine in the Popedome ſtil. For Marriage duetie is not contrarie to the Subſtance and office, neither of Popedome, nor of Prieſthoode. For* Peter *had a Wife, when he was promoted to be a Pope. As for the rule of Single Life, it was brought in by the ordinance of the Churche.* And therefore he ſaith further, Vnde videmus, quòd Presbyteri Græci ſinè peccato contrahunt Matrimonium: *Wee ſee that the Prieſtes of* Græcia, *beinge within Orders doo Marrie Wiues: and wee ſee they doo it,* ſine peccato, *without ſinne, or breache of Lawe, either of God, or of Man.* He goeth not by blinde peraduenture, as you do, M. Hardinge: but ſpeaketh of certaintie. VVe knowe it, ſaithe he, and wee ſee it.

Extra. De Electione c. licet de Vitanda Abb.

Nicol. Cuſan. ad Bohemos Epiſt. 2

An other of your Cardinalles, Nicolaus Cuſanus ſaithe, In Nouo Teſtamento, poſt aliquot tempora, viſum fuit irrationabile fore, quòd in Sacris Ordinibus exiſtentes contraherent, ſimiliter & ſolenniter Vouentes: *In the Newe Teſtamente, after a certaine time, it was thought, it ſhould not be reaſonable for Prieſtes, beinge within Holy Orders, to contracte Matrimonie: likewiſe it was thought of them, that had made Solemne Vowes.* After a certaine time, ſaithe he, this Decree was made. He meaneth the time of Pope Siricius, as we haue ſaide. Before whiche time it was lawful, as wel for Prieſtes, as alſo for them, that had made a Solemne Vowe of Chaſtitie, to Marrie lawfully without reſtrainte.

Thus, M. Hardinge, you ſee by your Canoniſtes, That the Prieſtes of the Eaſte Churche maie Marrie, beinge within Holy Orders: By the Auncient Councel of Ancyra, that Deacons, after proteſtation made, might lawfully Marrie: By Chryſoſtome, that Prieſtes and Biſhops maie ſo take the ſtate of Marriage, that it ſhalbe no hinderance to any perfection: By Cardinal Caietane, that, ſpeakinge abſolutely, a Prieſte offendeth not in Marrieinge a wife, his Orders, or Prieſthode not withſtandinge: By Anſelme, that .xj. hundred yeres after Chriſte, that is to ſaie, vntil within one hundred yeres ſithence the Conqueſt, this mater, not withſtandinge it had ben mutche beaten through the worlde, yet laie ſtil vndiſcuſſed: By Panormitane, Eraſmus, & Agrippa, that the Prieſtes of Græcia Marrie this daie, and that, Sine peccato, without Sinne: By others your Doctours, that vntil the time of Pope Siricius, it was lawful for al Prieſtes to Marrie: you ſee, that Moſes, beinge a Chriſtian Prieſte, and Eupſychius,

Eupſychius, beinge a Chriſtian Biſhop, and a Martyr, toke either of them a lawful Wife, & ſo liued in Marriage without offenſe. Yet al this notwithſtanding, can you ſaie againe without bluſhing, M. Hardinge, as you haue ſaide, VVee denie vtterly, that any man, after that he hath receiued Holy Orders, maie Marrie. Or wil you ſaie, It cannot be ſhewed, that the Marriage of ſuch was euer accounpted lawful in the Catholique Churche? M. Hard. fol. 180

If we knewe theſe thinges before, M. Hardinge, ye were to blame, to diſſemble them: if ye knewe them not, ye were to blame to controlle them. I doubte not, but it maie appeare by theſe fewe, that ſithence the time of Chriſtes Reſurrection, ſundrie Prieſtes, beinge within Holy Orders, haue married Wiues: and that, not onely in the Greeke Churche, but alſo in the Churche of Rome.

The Apologie, Cap. 3. Diuiſion. 9.

The Auncient Emperoure Iuſtinian commaunded, that in the Holy Adminiſtration, al thinges ſhoulde be pronounced with a cleare, lowde, and treatable voice, that the people might receiue ſomme fruite thereby. Theiſe menne, leſte the people ſhould vnderſtande them, mumble vp theire Seruice, not onely with a drowned, and hollowe voice, but alſo in a ſtrange, and Barbarous tongue. In Nouel. Conſtit. 123.

M. Hardinge.

Iuſtinian the Emperoure willeth praiers at the holy oblation (whiche theſe Defenders here tranſlate adminiſtration, as beinge aſhamed of theire owne Authour, becauſe they holde (a) againſte the ſacrifice of the Maſſe) to be made not in ſilence, but with an audible voice. Not meaninge as though praiers made in ſileace were vnfruiteful to the people, as theſe men woulde make vs beleeue. And therefore they corrupte his woordes, as what thinge doo they not corrupte, that cometh vnder their handes? They ſaie Iuſtinian made that Lawe, *Vt fructus ex ea re aliquis ad populum redire poſſet*, that ſome fruite might comme thereof to the people, as who ſhoulde ſaie, (b) no fruite were like to come, if praier were made in ſilence. But what ſaithe the Iuſtinian? His woordes be, *Quò maiore exinde deuotione in depromendis Domini Dei laudibus audientium animi efferantur.* To thintent the mindes of the hearers maie thereby with the more deuotion be lifted vp in ſettinge foorthe the praiſes of our Lorde God. He ſaithe, that the lowde voice helpeth to more deuotion, he ſaieth not, that ſome fruite, but, with more deuotion. (c) Some fruite is alwaie had euen by ſecrete praier, and more fruite ſometime, then by lowde praier.

Two faultes then are committed, or rather two lies made in Iuſtinians woordes: one that for oblation, they tourned adminiſtration, whiche falſehede M. Iewel vſeth in his printed Sermon, and in his replies to M. D. Cole. VVhether he be alſo guiltie of this? An other faulte is, that for more deuotion, they put ſome fruite. The thirde lie is, in that they ſaie, wee doo whiſper al our Seruice, ſo is the Latine, albeit this good Lady liketh better the terme of mumblinge. (d) I weene fewe who haue the ſenſe of hearinge, wil ſaie with them, that the ſinginge of Pſalmes, Hymnes, Epiſtle, Goſpel, Grailes, Offertories, Preface, and ſuche like Seruice vſed in the Catholike Churche, is whiſperinge, or mumblinge. The fourthe lie is, where they ſaie, we doo it ſo, leſte the people ſhould vnderſtande vs. (e) VVe wiſhe, that al the people vnderſtoode al our praiers. But we thinke it not conuenient, in a common prophane tongue, to vtter highe myſteries. Therefore we wiſhe, they woulde learne the (f) myſtical tongue, and gladly doo wee teache theire children the ſame. S. Dionyſe the Areopagite ſcholer to S. Paule, teacheth Timothe, and in him al vs, *Communicare ea, quæ vim perficiendi habent cum iis, qui perficiunt*, to communicate thoſe thinges, whiche haue power to make men perfite, with them, who make men perfite: (g) that is to ſaie, to publiſhe Prieſtly office of Conſecration, (for no thinge maketh vs more perfite) amonge them onely, who are Prieſtes, and not amonge others.

Laſte of al the fifth lie is to ſaie, that we pronounce our ſeruice, and our myſteries in a barbarous tongue. (h) As though the Latine tongue were barbarous, and not rather euery vulgare tongue. That tongue is moſte barbarous, whiche is moſte vſed of the vulgare ſorte, moſte priuate, moſte vnknowen in reſpecte of al. (i) VVhen Englande commeth to haue a ſeruice of theire owne, a tongue of their owne in Churches, and hath a Churche of their owne beſide the whole, then haue they loſte their parte with the Catholike Churche, whereunto God reſtoare it againe.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

O M. Hardinge, we corrupt not ſutche thinges, as come vnder our handes. The worlde ſeeth, that is your Ordinarie, & peculiare practiſe: It is not ours. Ye dubbe vs bothe here, and elſwhere, with your Lies vpon Lies. Suche is the Ciuilitie, and Courteſie of your ſpeache. Yet hitherto we haue not redubbed you with any one Lie. Sobrietie, and modeſtie rather becommeth them, that ſpeake of God.

Firſte, ye ſaie, wee haue corrupted Iuſtinians woordes. And yet, ye knowe, was alleged onely Iuſtinians meaninge, & otherwiſe not one of al his woordes. Ye ſaie, Iuſtinian

(a) Vntruthe, fonde, and peeuiſhe. For Iuſtinian ſpeaketh not of any Sacrifice of the Maſſe.

(b) Vntruth. For S Auguſtine ſaithe, *Quid prodeſt locutionis integritas, quam non ſequitur intellectus audientis.*

(c) Vntruth. For M. Hard. owne Councels expreſſe it by theſe woordes, Inſuſurrare, and Murmurare.

(d) Vntruth, notorious, & contrarie to their owne principal poſition.

Ignorance is the Mother of deuotion.

(e) Myſtical tongue. A Myſtical folie of al folies.

(f) Vntruth, & a gloſe contrarie both to the text and alſo to the continual praiſe of the Churche of Græcia. Iuſtinian Impe. Authen. Conſtit. 123. VVee comm

Praier in a strange tongue.

maunde al Bishoppes, and Priestes to ministre the holy Oblation &c. not vnder silence, but with a lowde voice, &c. that the hartes of the hearers maie be stirred to more deuotion. &c. Aug. in Psal. 99

Iustinian meante not, as though praiers made in silence were vnfruiteful to the people. For somme fruite (ye saie) there is alwaies had euen by secrete, and vnknowen Praier. But what fruite, or howe mutche, or howe ye knowe it, or can assure it, ye spare to tel vs. Yet S. Augustine saithe, Quid prodest loquutionis integritas, quam non sequitur intellectus audientis? Cùm loquendi omnino nulla sit causa, si, quod loquimur, non intelligunt, propter quos, vt intelligant, loquimur: *What profite is there in speache, be it neuer so perfite, if the vnderstandinge of the hearer cannot attaine it? For there is no cause, why wee shoulde speake at al, if they vnderstande not, what we speake, for whose sake wee speake, that they maie vnderstande vs.* Againe he saithe, Mens mea sine fructu est: Hoc ait, quando id, quod dicitur, non intelligitur: *My minde is without fruite: This the Apostle S. Paule saithe, when the thinge that is spoken, is not perceiued.* And againe, Si intellectum mentis remoueas, nemo ædificatur audiendo, quod non intelligit: *Set aparte the vnderstandinge of the Minde: And noman hathe fruite, or profite of that thinge, that he perceiueth not.* Likewise againe he saithe, Quid opus est iubilare, & non intelligere iubilationem: vt Vox nostra sola iubilet, & Cor non iubilet? Sonus enim Cordis intellectus est: *What needeth vs to singe, if wee vnderstande not, what wee singe: to singe with our* Voice, *and not with our Harte? For Vnderstandinge is the founde, or voice of the Harte.*

August. Doctrina Christ. Li. 4. ca. 1.

August. Genes. Litter. li. ca. 8.

M. Hardinge telleth vs sadly, The deuoute people is edified by the Latine Praiers, though they vnderstande not one woorde that is spoken: But S. Augustine saithe, *By that thinge, that hee vnderstandeth not, noman is edified.* M. Hardinge saithe, There is alwaies somme fruite euen by secrete, and vnknowen Praier. But S. Augustine saithe, *There is no fruite in speache, be it neuer so perfite, if the vnderstandinge of the harte cannot attaine it.* So properly S. Augustine, and M. Hardinge agree togeather.

Conc. Coloniens. Ca 5. Anno 1536.

Theise woordes, VVhisperinge, and Mumblinge, mislike you mutche. Yet your owne frendes, intreatinge hereof, haue often vsed the same woordes. In your Late Councel of Colaine, it is written thus, Vt Presbyteri Preces non tantum ore Murmurent, sed etiam Corde Persoluant, nunquam à manibus eorum Liber Legis, hoc est, Biblia deponatur: *That the Priestes maie not onely* Mumble *vp theire Praiers, but also pronounce them from theire Hartes, Let the* Booke of the Lawe, *that is to saie, the* Bible, *neuer be laide from theire handes.*

Regino. 2. Concilio Nanneti. fi.

Likewise Regino reporteth the woordes of the Councel of Nantes, Ridiculum est, Muris, aut Parietibus Insusurrare ea, quæ ad populum pertinent: *It is a peruise thinge,* to VVhisper *those thinges to the Walles, that perteine vnto the people.*

Authen. Constitu. 123.

Notwithstandinge, whether it be VVhisperinge, or Mumblinge, or by what soeuer name els it shal please you to calle it, that good Emperoures Commaundement, and meaninge was, that ye shoulde so vtter al thinges in the Congregation, Distinctly, and Plainely, with lowde, and Open Voice, that the people mighte vnderstande you, and answeare, Amen. Therefore S. Augustine saithe, Nos, qui in Ecclesia Diuina eloquia cantare didicimus, simul etiam instare debemus, esse quod scriptum est, Beatus populus, qui intelligit iubilationem. Proinde, Charissimi, quod Consona voce cantauimus, sereno etiam Corde nosse, & tenere debemus: *Wee, that haue learned to singe in the Churche the Heauenly woordes of God, muste also endeuoure to be that thinge, that is written,* Blessed is the people, that vnderstandeth, what they singe. *Therefore dearely beloued, that wee haue songe togeather with tuneable voice, wee ought also to know, and see with pure harte.* S. Ambrose, declaringe the Ecclesiastical order of his time, saithe thus, Responsorijs Psalmorum, Cantu Virorum, Mulierum, Virginum, Paruulorum, consonus vndarum fragor resultat: *With the answearinge of Psalmes, and with the* Singinge togeather of Menne, VVeemen, Maides, and litle Children, the Churche soundeth, as if it were the dasshinge, and beatinge of the Sea.

August. in Psal. 148.

Ambro. Mexauer. Li. 3. Ca. 5.

Leo. De Ieiunio Septimi Mensis, Sermo. 3.

To like pourpose Leo saithe, Totius Ecclesiæ vna est Oratio, & vna Confessio: *The whole Churche hath one Praier, and one Confession.*

That ye allege out of Dionysius, is vaine, and Childishe, as is the reste of your talke, and quite contrarie to the Authours minde, and therefore not worthy to be answeared. For Dionysius saithe not, as you haue imagined, M. Hardinge, that the Priestе shoulde talke alone in his Mystical vnknowen Tongue, as a sanglinge

Cymbal

Prayer in a ſtrange tongue.

Cymbal without ſenſe: but rather telleth you, that, by his order, the Prieſte, and the whole people ſhould ſinge togeather. These be his wordes, Percipiens ipſe, & alijs tradens Diuinam Communionem, poſtremò deſinit in Gratiarum actionem, vnà cum tota Eccleſiæ multitudine: *The* Prieſte *bothe receiuinge him ſelfe the* Holy Communion, *and alſo deliuringe the ſame vnto others, laſte of al endeth with thankes geuinge*, togeather with al the whole multitude, and Companie of the Churche.

Dionyſius Ca. 3. Μετὰ παντὸς τοῦ τῆς Ἐκκλησίας ἱεροῦ πληρώματος.

Thus out of one place, we haue alleged two manifeſt Teſtimonies againſte your ſelfe: The one, to condemne your Priuate Maſſe: The other, to condemne your Myſtical Prayers in Vnknowen tongue.

We ſaie, VVee wiſhe, the people woulde learne the Myſtical Latine tongue: and gladly doo wee teache theire Children the ſame. We ſaie, The Myſtical Latine tongue. O vaine man, & more vaine, then Vanitie it ſelfe: Why ſeeke you ſo fondely to deceiue Gods people? Who euer taught you theſe kindes of Myſteries? what Scripture? what Counſel? what Doctour? what Father? Howe knowe you, that the Latine tongue, that euery Childe maie ſo commonly, and ſo eaſily vnderſtande, ſhould be ſo Myſtical? And wherefore are al other Tongues, The Greeke, the Hebrewe, the Chaldee, the Arabike, the Italian, the Frenche, the Spaniſhe, the Iriſhe leaſte Myſtical, then the Latine? What haue theſe Tongues offended? What hath that Tongue deſerued? The Tongue is nothinge els, but a Tongue. It is the Mater, and meaninge of the wordes, that is Myſtical. S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Audimus hæc verba, Beata Vita: & rem ipſam omnes nos appetere fatemur. Non enim ſono delectamur. Nam hoc cum Latinè audit Græcus, non delectatur: quia ignorat, quod dictum eſt: Sicut etiam Latinus, ſi Græcè hoc audierit. Quoniam res ipſa nec Græca, nec Latina eſt: *We heare theiſe woordes*, Bleſſed Life, *or* the Life to comme. *And the thinge it ſelfe wee al confeſſe, wee deſire to haue. For we haue no pleaſure in the ſounde of the woordes. For when a* Grecian *heareth theiſe woordes ſpoken in* Latine, *he hathe no pleaſure in them: Becauſe he vnderſtandeth not, what is ſpoken. Neither hath the* Latine *any pleaſure if he heare the ſame ſpoken in* Greeke. *For the thinge it ſelfe, is neither* Greeke, *nor* Latine. It were a great Myſterie, to reache the bottome of your Myſteries. S. Paule calleth you, not the Hiders, or Couchers, but the Diſpenſers, and Stewardes of Goddes Myſteries. Your Myſtical policie is, to leade Goddes people through Myſte, and Darkeneſſe. We wiſhe the people would learne the Latine tongue, which you calle Myſtical. No doubte, a worthy, and a learned Wiſhe. We might as good cheape, and as wel haue wiſhed, that al the whole people, of al Countries, would learne to ſpeake Greeke, and Hebrewe. But your meaninge is, that vntil al the Plowemenne, and Artificers, and Labourers of the worlde be able to vnderſtande, and to ſpeake your Myſtical Latine tongue, they maie not in any wiſe be allowed, to vnderſtande any parcel of theire Prayers.

Auguſt. Confeſſ. li. 10. ca. 33.

Lactantius, ſpeakinge of the ſuttle practiſes, and policies of the Heathens, ſaithe thus, Hinc Fida Silentia inſtituta ſunt ab hominibus callidis: vt neſciret populus, quid coleret: *Therefore truſty ſilence, and ſecreſie was appointed by ſuttle, and falſe fautours: that the people* (ſtil beinge blinde) *ſhoulde neuer knowe, what they woorſhipped.*

Lactan. Li. 5. Ca. 20.

This is not the Myſterie of the kingedome of Heauen: It is rather the Myſterie of iniquitie: The ſame Myſterie, that S. Iohn mentioneth in his Reuelations: In Fronte eius Nomen ſcriptum eſt, Myſterium: Babylon Magna, Mater Abominationum, & Fornicationum Terræ: *A name was written in her Forcheade*, a Myſterie: *Greate* Babylon, *the Mother of the Abominations, and of the Fornications of the Earthe.* Of theſe Holy Myſteries, your Latine tongue, as ye haue vſed it, maie wel, and iuſtly be called Myſtical.

Matthæ. 13. 2. Theſſ. 2. Apoc. 17.

S. Hierome ſaithe of your Fathers in Olde time, De Domo Dei Scenam fecere Populorum: *Of the Houſe of God they haue made a Stageplaie of the People.* And ſpeakinge of the Valentinian Heretiques, he ſaithe, Barbaro ſimplices quoſq; terrent ſono, vt quod non intelligunt, plùs mirentur: *With a Barbarous vnknowen ſounde of woordes they feare the ſimple, that, What ſo euer they vnderſtande not, they maie the more eſteeme, and haue in reuerence.*

Hieron. in Epiſt. ad Epheſ. Ca. 5. Hieronymus ad Theodoram.

But the Latine tongue, we ſaie, is not Barbarous: and therein, as your wonte

Praier in a ſtrange tongue. 1. Cor. 4.

Is, ye haue noted a wonderful greate Lie in our Apologie. Yet vnto S. Paule, that tongue ſæmeth Barbarous, ỹ is vnknowen vnto the hearer, be it Latine, be it Greeke. Thus he ſaithe, Niſi ſciero vim vocis, ero illi, qui loquitur, Barbarus: & ille, qui loquitur, mihi Barbarus: *Onleſſe I vnderſtande the power, or meaninge of the woordes, I ſhalbe* Barbarous *to him, that ſheaketh: and he, that ſpeaketh* (in what tongue ſo euer he ſpeake) *ſhalbe* Barbarous *vnto mee*. Hereof I had occaſion to ſaie ſomme what in my Former Replie. S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Mallet quiſque cum Cane ſuo verſari, quàm cum homine ignotæ linguæ: *Any man woulde rather dwel with his Dogge, then with a man of an vnknowen tongue.*

Artic. 3. Diuil. 3. Ludoui. Viues De Traden. Diſciplinis, Lib. 3. Fol. 57.

To conclude, ye ſaie, VVhen Englande commeth to haue a ſeruice of theire owne, and a Tongue of their owne in Churches, then haue they loſte their parte with the Catholike Churche. Here, M. Hardinge, a litle more reaſon woulde haue geuen ſomme credite to your woordes. For, as touchinge the Publique Seruice of the Churche, I beſeeche you, euen in your owne time of Barbarous blindenesſe, what Seruice had the Churche of Englande, but Peculiare, ỹ Special to her ſelfe? Touchinge the varietie of Tongues,

Auguſt. Aduer. Iudæos, Oratio. 4.

S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Aſtitit Regina à dextris tuis in veſtitu deaurato, circundata varietate. Vbi ſignificatur Linguarum varietas in omnibus Gentibus: quarum tamen in vna eſt intus, & Simplex Fides: *The Queene ſtoode at thy right hande, apparelled in Clothe of Goulde, adourned with varietie. Hereby is ſignified the Diuerſitie of Tongues in al Nations: The Faithe whereof, that lieth within, is one, and ſimple.* Likewiſe againe he

Aug. in Pſal. 44.

ſaithe, Veſtitus Reginæ huius quis eſt? Et pretioſus, & varius eſt: Sacramenta Doctrinæ in Linguis omnibus varijs. Alia Lingua Aphricana: alia Syria: alia Græca: alia Hebræa: alia illa, & illa. Faciunt iſtæ Linguæ varietatem veſtis Reginæ huius. Quomodò autem omnis varietas veſtis in vnitate concordat, ſic & omnes Linguæ ad vnam Fidem. In veſte varietas ſit: ſciſſura non ſit. Ecce varietatem intelleximus de Diuerſitate Linguarum: & Veſtem intelleximus propter Vnitatem: *What is this Queenes apparel? It is pretious, and ful of varietie: The Myſteries of Doctrine in al ſundrie Tongues. There is one Tongue of* Aphrica: *an other of* Syria: *an other* Greecke: *an other* Hebrewe: *an other this, an other that. Theſe Tongues make vp the varietie of the Queenes apparel. But as al the varietie of colours in the apparel agreeth in Vnitie: euen ſo al Tongues agree in one Faithe. Let there be Varietie in the Apparel: But rente, or cutte there maie not be. Beholde, by the Varietie, wee vnderſtande the* Diuerſitie of Tongues: *and by the Apparel, wee vnderſtande the* Vnitie (of the Churche). Againe he ſaithe, Diſtant inter ſe Linguæ: Sed

Augu. in Iohan. Tract. 6.

Linguarum diſtantiæ non ſunt ſchiſmata: *Tongues are diuided, one from an other: But the Diuiſion of Tongues is no Schiſme, or Diuiſion in Religion.* Therefore, M. Hardinge, why ſende ye vs ouer this wanton talke? why tel you vs, that, when Englande hath a tongue of her owne in the Churches, then hath ſhee loſte her parte with the Catholike Churche. Beholde, S. Auguſtine ſaithe, *The diuiſion of Tongues, is no diuiſion in Religion.*

The Apologie, Cap. 3. Diuiſion. 10.

Cõcil. Carth. 3.

The old Councel at Carthage commaunded, that nothing ſhould be readde in Chriſtes Congregation, but the Canonical Scriptures: theſe menne reade ſutche thinges in their Churches, as them ſelues knowe for a Truthe to be ſtarke Lies, and fonde Fables.

M. Hardinge.

A man were better, I aſſure thee, good Reader, to make two newe Bookes, then to correcte one ſo ful of lies and falſified places, as this Apologie is. * This olde Councel of Carthage is newely falſefied by our newe Clergie. The woordes of the Councel are theſe. *Placuit, vt præter Scripturas Canonicas nihil in Eccleſia legatur ſub nomine Diuinarum Scripturarum:* It hathe ſeemed good vnto vs, that beſides the Canonical Scriptures, nothinge be readde in the Churche vnder the name of the holy Scriptures. They leauinge out theſe foure woordes, *ſub nomine Diuinarum Scripturarum*, Vnder the name of the diuine Scriptures, woulde beare men in hande, the Councel willed nothinge to be readde in the Churche, beſides the holy Scriptures. Are not theſe truſty men to whom ye maie commit the charge of your ſoules for your Faithe and ſaluation.

*Vntruth. For, if this old Coũcel be falſified, it was falſified twelue hũdred yeeres agoe, in the Councel of Hippo.

Concil. Carth. 3. c. 47.

It foloweth in the ſame decree, *Liceat etiam Legi paſſionis Martyrum, cùm anniuerſarij dies celebrantur:* Let it be lawful alſo for the Martyrdomes of Martyrs to be read, when their yeerely feaſtes

Scriptures onely to be reade in Churches.

ly ſeaſtes are keapte And yet dare they not only to ſaie, nothing muſte be read beſides the Scriptures, but alſo to allege that very place for that ſpecial lie, whiche ſaithe the contrarie. Looke in the Booke thy ſelfe good Reader, and ſee howe falſely they handle ſo holy matters. * An other lie is, when they ſaie, wee reade thoſe thinges in the Churches, whiche our ſelues knowe to be ſtarke lies, and fonde fables. VVhen they cannot them ſelues ſhewe that wee haue any ſutche, it is a vaine lieinge rhetorike to ſaie, wee doubte not of it, or knowe it our ſelues for a truthe. I wooder not if they bluſſhe not in belieinge vs, who haue belied ſo many Scriptures, Councelles, and Fathers.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

It ſtandeth wel with your Truthe, M. Harding, ſo often to charge vs with Lies, and Falſehedde. **I truſte, it wil appeare, yͤ had no greate cauſe, to kæpe ſo greate reuel vpon ſo poꝛe a Conqueſte. In dæde theſe woꝛdes be not expꝛeſſely founde in the thirde** Councel of Carthage. **Yet are they founde in the** Councel of Hippo, **whiche is the Abꝛidgemente of the thirde** Councel of Carthage, **as it appeareth by the Title of the ſame:** Concilij Hipponenſis Abbreuiationes factæ in Concilio Carthaginenſi Tertio.

The woꝛdes of the Councel of Hippo, **and, foꝛ ſo mutche, alſo of the thirde** Councel of Carthage, **be theſe:** Scripturæ Canonicæ in Eccleſia legendæ quæ ſunt: & præter quas alia non legantur: *The Scriptures Canonical, whiche are to be reade in the Churche: and biſides whiche nothinge maie be reade.* **Here haue you, M. Hardinge, the plaine woꝛdes of the** Councel of Hippo, **abbꝛidged out of the third** Councel of Carthage, That nothinge maie be reade in the Churche, but onely the Canonical Scriptures. **Judge you therefoꝛe, howe iuſte cauſe yͤ had, ſo vnaduiſedly, foꝛ I dare not ſaie, ſo vnlearned, to charge the** Apologie **with** Lies, **and** Falſehedde.

Concil. Hippon. Cap. 38.

Here maie we adde the like Decꝛee of the Councel **holden at** Laodicea: Sabbatis Euangelia cum alijs Scripturis legendâ eſſe cenſemus: *Wee agree that the* Goſpel, *with other* Scriptures, *be reade vpon the Sabothe daie.* **If theſe woꝛdes ſeme not ſufficient, it foloweth further in the ſame** Councel, Non oportet Libros, qui ſunt extra Canonem, legere, niſi ſolos Canonicos Veteris, & Noui Teſtamenti: *Wee maie not reade any Bookes, that be without the Canon,* but onely the Canonical Bookes of the Old, and New Teſtamente.

Concil. Laodice. Cap. 16. Concil. Laodice. Cap. 59.

To like effecte Chryſoſtome **ſaithe,** Ideò Chriſtus menſas nummulariorum euertit: Significans quòd in Templo Dei non debent eſſe nummi, niſi Spirituales, id eſt, qui Dei imaginem habent: *Therefore Chriſte ouerthrewe the Exchangers bankes: Meaninge thereby, that there maie be no Coine in the Churche, but onely Spiritual, that is to ſaie, that beareth the Image of God.* **Againe he ſaithe,** Lectorum officium erat, in Eccleſia, Sacra Legere ex Scriptis, vel Prophetarum, vel Apoſtolorum: *It was the* Readers *office, to Pronounce Holy thinges vnto the people, out of either the* Apoſtles, *or* Prophetes.

Chryſo. in Matth. Homil. 38.

Chryſ. in Act. Homil. 19.

Eraſmus **ſaithe,** Apparet, non niſi Apoſtolicas Literas olim Legi ſolitas in Templis, aut certè Virorum Apoſtolicæ Authoritatis: *It appeareth that in old time, nothing was vſed to be read in the Churches, but onely the Apoſtles Writinges: or at leaſte, the Writinges of ſutche others, as were of Apoſtolical Authoritie.* **Likewiſe ſaith** Abbas Anſigiſus, **repoꝛtinge the** Eccleſiaſtical Decrees **of the** Frenche **Kinges,** Lewes, **and** Charles: In Templis tantùm Canonici Libri, id eſt, Sacræ Literæ legantur: *Lette there be reade in the Churches onely the Canonical Bookes, that is to ſaie, the holy Scriptures.* **Hereby maie you ſæ M. Hardinge, if there were any want beſoꝛe, thus many waies it maie be ſupplied.**

Eraſm. in Hiero. De Eccl. Scriptoꝛib. Efrem.

Anſigiſus. Lib. 1. Cap. 19. Impreſſus Pariſijs Anno. 1550.

An other lie (**ye ſaie**) is this, when they ſaie, we reade thoſe thinges in the Churche, whiche our ſelues knowe, to be ſtarke Lies, and fonde Fables. **Foꝛ trial hereof, wæ ſhal not næde to trauaile farre. Your owne** Bookes, **and** Legendes, **are pꝛouke ſufficiente.**

Eraſmus **thereof ſaithe thus:** Hodiè quorumlibet ſomnia, imò muliercularum Deliramenta leguntur inter Diuinas Scripturas: *Nowe a daies euery fooles Dreames, yea very weemens dotinge fanſies are reade with the Holy Scriptures.*

Eraſm. in Annotation. in Hieronym. De Eccleſiaſticis Scriptoꝛ.

Likewiſe ſaithe Polydore Vergil, Multorum Diuorum vitas recitant, tametſi parùm ad Fidem Scriptas: *They reade many Sainctes Liues, although not written accordinge to the Truthe.* Ludouicus Viues **wꝛitinge of youꝛe** Legenda Aurea, **whiche was the Mother of al youꝛe deuoute** Eccleſiaſtical Stories, or Fables, **ſaithe thus,** Neſcio, cur Aurea dici debeat, cùm ſcripta ſit ab homine ferrei oris, & plum-

Polydor Vergil. in Oration. Dominicam. Leonard. Laudo

bei Cordis, & pleniſsima ſit impudentiſsimis Mendacijs: *I ſee no cauſe, why it ſhoulde be called the* Goulden Legende, *ſeeinge it was written by a man of an iron face, and a leddē harte*, and is freight ful of moſte ſhameleſſe hes. Yf ye knowe not theſe thinges, M. Hardinge, your friendes wil thinke, ye knowe nothing. Suche Truthes ye reade, and publiſhe deuoutly, and ſolemnely in your Churches. Yet maie we neither ſaie, nor thinke, ye mocke the people.

terius in Prouerbia Salomonis, Pag. 134.

The Apologie, Cap. 4. Diuiſion. 1.

But, if there be any, that thinke, theſe aboue reherſed Authorities be but weake and ſclender, bicauſe they were decreed by Emperoures, and certaine petite Biſhops, and not by ſo ful, and perfite Counceiles, takinge pleaſure rather in the Authoritie, and name of the Pope: let ſuche a one knowe, that Pope Iulius doothe euidently forebidde, that a Prieſte in Miniſtringe the Communion, ſhoulde dippe the Breade in the Cuppe. Theſe men contrarie to Pope Iulius Decree, diuide the Breade, and dippe it in the VVine.

M. Hardinge.

Yee maie be ſure, many men thinke this your homely ſtuffe not onely weake and ſlender, but alſo corrupt, venemous, and lothſome. But now by like ye wil amende your faulte. But howe? Surely by goinge from very euil, to as bad or woorſe, if ye can doo woorſe, then hitherto ye haue done. Iulius the Pope (ſaie ye) dothe euidently forbid, that a Prieſte in miniſtringe the Communion, ſhould dippe the Breade in the Cuppe. Nowe verily your former faulte of lying is wel amended. For where before ye left out, caſt in, or changed ſome of thoſe woordes, whiche ye pretende to allege, nowe yee make euery whit newe of your owne. VVhere hath Iulius theſe woordes? I ſpeake not of your falſe alleginge of places in your Bookes margent. I forgeue you the putting of *cùm enim nemo*, in ſtede of *cùm omne*. Theſe be ſmal and ſlipper faultes, which if they were alone might be winked at in ſuch ſlipper merchantes, as yet are. But let vs heare, what Pope Iulius ſaithe. *Alias quoq; audiuimus intinctam Euchariſtiam populis pro complemento communionis porrigere:* we haue hearde alſo of others, who geue to the people the Euchariſte dipped, or ſtiped, for making vp of the Communion. It is to be vnderſtanded, that whereas Chriſte gaue the bleſſed Sacramente of the Aultar to his Apoſtles, he gaue it vnder bothe kindes. And when the Prieſtes in ſome countries, either for lacke of wine at al times ready, either for ſome priuate fantſie, vſed to dippe or ſtipe the Sacred Body of oure Lorde vnder forme of Breade in the conſecrated bloude, and ſo to geeue it to the people. Pope Iulius findeth faulte therewith, for that neither Chriſte ordeined ſo, nor the Apoſtles left ſuche order to the Churche. So that Iulius meaneth nothinge els, but to reproue and reforme that vſe of dippinge, or ſtipinge the one kinde in the other in the Adminiſtration of the Communion vnto the people. Reade the place, who liſteth, he ſhal finde the ſame ſenſe more largely vttered a litle after.

But what ſenſe make theſe Defenders a Gods name? They ſaie, Iulius forebiddeth the Prieſtes, *ne dum peragit Myſteria, panem immergat in Calicem:* that in miniſtringe the Communion (ſo the Lady tourneth) he ſhoulde dippe the Breade in the Cuppe. There is no ſuche woorde in the whole decree. Iulius nameth *Euchariſtiā*, thei cal it bread. Iulius hath **intinctam porrigere populis*, that no Prieſte * geeue the Sacramente dipped to the people: they leauinge out, geeuinge it to the people, ſay he forbad the Prieſt to dippe it. Thei leaue out alſo the chiefe cauſe of the whole, which is, *pro complemento communionis*, for makinge vp of the Communion. For he forebiddeth to geeue vnto the people only the conſecrated hoſt dipped in the Chalice, as thoughe it were the whole communion, noles then if the bloude were geuen aparte. Theſe men (ſaie they) contrary to the decree of Pope Iulius, diuide the Bread, and dippe it in the wine. VVee in the Maſſe breake the hoſte in three partes, not without ſignification of a Myſterie: twoo we receiue aparte: the thirde wee put into the Chalice, and receiue it togeather with the bloude. VVhat haue ye to ſaie againſte this?

*A fonde vanitie. For if he forebidde the Prieſte to dippe the Sacrament, and to deliuer it, then he forebiddeth the Prieſte to dippe the Sacrament.

*Theſe Myſtical Significations, be myſtical folies. Reade the Anſweare.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Euery parte hereof, is largely anſweared in my Former Replie to M. Hardinge. True it is, the faulte, that Iulius here findethe in Dippinge, and Miniſtringe the Sacramente, agreeth not fully with the preſent diſorders of the Church of Rome. Yet notwithſtanding in condemninge the one, he muſte nedes condemne the other. Ye ſaie, we leaue out theſe woordes, Intinctam porrigunt Euchariſtiam populis: *They dippe the Sacramente, and deliuer the ſame vnto the people.* And againe theſe woordes, Pro complemento Communionis: *For the accompliſhemente of the*

Comun-

Communion vnder one kinde.

Communion. The more mater we haue leafte out, the more haue we conceled your faultes: and so mutche the more are you beholden to vs. For what meante you, M. Hardinge, to mention any of al these wordes? Do you deliuer the Sacrament vnto the people? Do you make it a Perfite Communion? What nede you to burthen your selfe with moe Abuses, and so mutche to bewraie your folie?

Iulius saithe, They dipped the Sacramente *into the Cuppe, and deliuered it vnto the people.* You dippe the Sacramente, as they did: but vnto the people ye geue nothinge. Iulius saith, They meante by dippinge, to make it a ful, and a perfite Communion: Contrarie wise, you defraude the people of the Holy Cuppe, and deliuer them onely the Halfe Communion. And therefore ye are mutche more blame worthy, then euer were they, whom Iulius reproued. For they offended onely of Simplicitie: and you of Wilfulnesse: they onely in one thinge: you in three thinges togeather in one place.

But, touchinge the mater it selfe, the faulte, that we finde with you, and the faulte, that Iulius founde with others your Predecessours, is al one. You dippe the Breade into the Cuppe: and so did they. They brake Christes Institution: and so do you. And therefore Iulius saide vnto them, Hoc quàm sit Apostolicæ, & Euangelicæ Doctrinæ contrarium, & consuetudini Ecclesiasticæ aduersum, non difficilè ab ipso Fonte Veritatis probatur, à quo ordinata ipsa Sacramentorum Mysteria processerunt: *How farre contrarie this is to the Apostolical, and Euangelical Doctrine, and to the Custome of the Churche, it is easie to proue by the Fountaine of the Truthe, by whome the Mysteries of the Sacramentes were ordeined, and from whome they first proceeded.*

Ye thinke the mater wel discharged, for that ye deliuer not the Sacramente so dipped vnto the people, but minister it onely vnto your selfe. Here by the waie, it were a mater of skil, to vnderstande, by what Authoritie, either of Scripture, or of Councel, or of Doctoure, it maie appeare, that it is lawful for the Priestе so to vse, and receiue the Sacramente, and vnlawful for the people. If the people maie not as safely, and as lawfully so receiue the Sacramente, as maie the Priestе, wherefore then are these wordes written in youre Masse Bookes, euen in the Canon, and Secretes of your Masse? Hæc Sacrosancta Commixtio Corporis, & Sanguinis Domini nostri Iesu Christi fiat mihi, & omnibus sumentibus salus animæ, & Corporis: *This Holy minglinge of the Body, and Bloude of our Lorde Iesus Christe, be vnto mee, and vnto al, that receiue it, the healthe of Soule and Body.* Verily these wordes, Omnibus sumentibus, cannot by any shifte possibly be expounded of One Onely Priestе, but muste nedes be extended vnto the people.

Ye woulde faine tel vs of certaine Special Mysteries, that ye haue founde out in the breakinge of the Sacramente, if ye wiste, what they were. But ye are in case, as sometime was Nabuchodonozor: ye are not hable wel to telle vs your owne dreame. Sometime ye saie, The Breade is broken: sometime ye saie, The Accidentes remaine alone by Myracle, and they are broken: sometime ye saie, Christes Immortal, and Impassible Body it selfe is broken: sometime ye saie, Our eies be deceiued, and nothinge is broken.

Daniel 2.
Senten. Lib. 4. Dist. 12.

Againe (ye saie) the First peece signifieth the Churche trauailinge in the worlde: The Seconde signifieth the Blessed Sainctes in Heauen: the Thirde signifieth the Soules in Purgatorie. But Pope Sergius, the Father of these fantasies, conueieth his Mysteries an other waie. For the Firste portion, saithe he, signifieth Christes Body after his Resurrection: The Seconde, Christes Body walkinge on Earthe: The Thirde, Christes Body in the Graue. These, M. Hardinge, be your Holy Significations, and Special Mysteries. With suche folies, and Mystical vanities ye mocke the worlde. In Olde times, the Breade was not broken, to buse mennes heades with Significations, but onely to be deliuered to the people: as in my Former Replie, I haue declared more at large. S. Augustine saithe, Panis benedicitur, & sanctificatur, & ad distribuendum Comminuitur: *The Bread is Blessed, and Sanctified, and broken in peeces, to the ende it maie be deliuered.*

Durandus Li. 4. Cap. 53. De Conse. Dist. 2. Triforme.

Artic. 11. Diui. 3. Augu. Epist.

The Apo-

The Apologie, Cap. 4. Diuiſion. 2.

Bothe Swerdes in one hande.

Pope Clement ſaithe, it is not lawful for a Biſhop to deale with Bothe Swerdes: For if thou vvilt haue bothe, ſaithe he, thou ſhalt deceiue bothe thee ſelfe, and thoſe that obeie thee. Nowe a daies the Pope chalengeth to him ſelfe Bothe Swerdes, and vſeth bothe. Wherefore it oughte to ſeeme leſſe maruele, if that haue ſoloweb, whiche Clemente ſaithe, that is, that he hathe deceiued bothe him ſelfe, and thoſe, vvhiche haue geeuen eare vnto him.

M. Hardinge.

If theſe felowes had not ſworne to belie al the worlde for maintenance of their Newe Goſpel, they woulde at this time at leaſte haue made a true reporte of S. Clementes woordes. S. Clemente ſpeaketh not of twoo ſwordes. The place truely alleged hath thus: (a)*Si mundialibus curis fueris occupatus, & teipſum decipies, & eos qui te audiunt.* If thou be occupied in worldly cares, thou ſhalt bothe deceiue thy ſelfe, and thoſe that liſten to thee. The Authoure of this Apologie, hauinge ſpite at the Churche, whiche is Chriſtes folde, and at the Pope, the heade Shephearde, enuienge at his auctoritie, forgeth a lie vpon S. Clemente, makinge him to ſaie, *Si vtrunque habere vis*, if thou wilt haue bothe ſwordes, thou ſhalt bothe deceiue thy ſelfe, and thoſe that obeie thee. (b) VVhereas Clemente ſpeaketh no woorde of the twoo ſwordes, but of worldly cares, wherewith what Biſhop ſo euer is entangled, ſhal (as he ſaithe) deceiue bothe him ſelfe, and others that harken to him. For whiche cauſe theſe Defenders beinge coupled with yoke felowes in pretenſed wedlocke, which ſtate 1. Cor. 7.
wrappeth a man in worldly cares, becauſe ſutche a one (c) careth for the thinges of the worlde, howe to pleaſe his wife, and is diuided, as S. Paule ſaithe: it muſte needes folowe, that hauinge taken the office of ſuperintendentes, and charge of Soules vpon them, (d) they haue deceiued them ſelues, and daiely doo deceiue ſo many as heare them, and folowe theire falſe Doctrine.

(a) Theſe words are partely Clementes, partely S Bernardes.

(b) Fonde and childiſhe. As thoughe a Biſhop may haue the Temporal Swerde, and execute a Temporal office without worldly cares.

(c) VVhat cares haue they that keepe Concubines?

(d) Eleuen of the Twelue Apoſtles, and many Holy Fathers, and Biſhoppes were Married, and yet deceiued not the people.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

O what a pleaſante grace M. Hardinge hathe, to talke of Lies? A man woulde thinke, it were ſomme good parte of his ſtudie. In this place twoo ſundrie Authorities, the one of Clemens, the other of S. Bernarde, I knowe not, by what errour, were ioined in one, and bothe alleged, and ſet forthe vnder the name onely of Clemens. I graunt, There was herein an ouerſight: But Lie, or Falſhedde there was none, as it ſhal appeare.

The woordes of Clemens, are as you repoſte them. The woordes of S. Bernarde, written vnto Pope Eugenius, are theſe: Planum eſt, Apoſtolis interdici Dominatum. I ergo tu, & tibi vſurpare aude, aut Dominans Apoſtolatum: aut Apoſtolus Dominatum. Plane ab alterutro prohiberis. Si vtrunq; ſimiliter habere velis, perdes vtrunque: *It is plaine, that vnto the Apoſtles of Chriſte, Lordeſhip, or Temporal Princehoode is forebidden. Goe thou thy waie therefore* (thus he ſaithe to the Pope) *and dare thou to vſurpe, either the Apoſtleſhip, beinge a Lorde: or a Lordeſhip, beinge an Apoſtle. From one of them vndoubtedly thou arte forebidden.* If thou wilt indifferently haue both, thou wilt looſe boothe.

Bernard. de conſideration. li. 2.

Of ſutche S. Hierome writeth thus, Militantes Chriſto, Obligant ſe negotijs Sæcularibus, & eandem imaginem offerunt Deo, & Cæſari: *Beinge the Souldiers of Chriſte, they binde them ſelues to worldly affaires, and offer vp one Image to God, and Cæſar.* In the Canons of the Apoſtles it is written thus, Non oportet Epiſcopum, aut Præsbyterum, ſe Publicis Adminiſtrationibus immittere: ſed vacare, & commodum ſe præbere vſibus Eccleſiaſticis. Nemo enim poteſt duobus Dominis ſeruire: *A Biſhop, or a Prieſte maie not entangle him ſelfe with Worldly Offices: but he ought reaſte, and ſhewe him ſelfe meete for the vſe of the Churche. For noman can ſerue twoo Maiſters.* Yet the Pope this daie claimeth the right of Bothe Swerdes, not onely of the Spiritual, but alſo of the Temporal. And Pope Bonifacius 8. in the Greate Iubilee, and in the open ſighte of the Worlde, when he had one daie ſhewed him ſelfe in his Pontificalibus, apparelled in Proceſſion as a Biſhop of Biſhoppes, the nexte daie he put vpon him the Emperours Roabes of Maieſtie, and had the Emperial Crowne vpon his heade, and the Swerde naked, and glitteringe borne before him.

Hieronym. in Sophoniam. ca. 1

Canon Apoſto. Canon. 80. Matthæ. 10.

De Maiorit. & Obedien. Vnam Sanctam. Parælipomena Virſbergenſis.

As for Pope Clemens, his Canon is eaſily ſhifted by a pretty Prouiſo. For thus ſaithe

saithe your Glose touchinge the same, Cessante causa, cessat effectus Verbi causa, Prohibetur, ne Presbyteri gerant tutelas, hac causa, vt melius vacent Diuinis Officijs. Hæc causa finalis est. Vnde, cessante hac causa, cessat effectus. Vnde, si non vacent Diuinis Officijs, poterunt gerere tutelas: *The cause endinge, the Effecte endeth too. For example: The Lawe commaundeth, that a* Priest shal not be charged with the VVardeship of a Childe in his nonage. *The cause hereof is this, that he maie the better applie his Diuine Service. This is the Final Cause. This cause removed, the Effect geueth place. Therefore if the Priest folowe not his Diuine Service, then he maie haue the Wardeship of a Childe.* Euen so, if the Pope ow not the Office of a Bishop, then mate he be a Temporal Prince. But by these meanes it commeth to passe, euen as Clemens saithe, He deceiueth bothe him selfe, and also them that heare him.

Extra de Iureiurando. Etsi Christus. In Glossa.

Touchinge this vaine obiection of the charge, and cares of Marriage, it is fully answeared before, in a place more conueniente.

Part. 3. Cap. 3. Division 7. And Part. 2. Cap. 8 Division 2.

The Apologie, Cap. 4. Division. 3.

Pope Leo saith, Vpon one daie it is lavvful to saie but one masse in one Churche: These menne saie daiely in one Churche commonly tenne Masses, twentie, thirtie, yea oftentimes moe. So that the poore gaser on can scante tel, which waie he were beste to turne him self. Pope Gelasius saithe, It is a wicked deede, and subiecte to Sacrilege in any man, to diuide the Communion, and when he hath receiued one kinde, to abstaine from the other. These men, contrarie to Gods VVoorde, and contrarie to Pope Gelasius, commande, that one kinde onely of the Holy Communion bee geeuen to the people: and by so dooinge, they make theire Priestes guiltie of Sacrilege.

M. Hardinge.

(a) There is no smal number of men, whiche are moued to suspecte, that this Apologie was deuised by some Catholike man, intendinge to mocke this newe Cleregie of Englande, and to put them quite out of estimation and credite. (b) And to that very ende this innumerable companie of Lies to them seemed of pourpose to be set out. For noman hauinge his fiue wittes would thinke good, for maintenance of his owe parte, to affirme so many thinges, the contrarie whereof to his greate discredite and shame, by searche is easily found. (c) Leo saith cleane contrarie to that is here in his name auouched, that when so euer a newe multitude filleth the Churche, so as al cannot be presente at the Sacrifice at once, that the Oblation of the Sacrifice be without castinge any doubt done againe.

(a) A solemne fansie. They muste needes be wise men, that so wil thinke.

(b) Here M. Hard. confesseth, that he, and his Felowes can sette foorth Lies.

(c) Vntruth manifest. Reade the Answeare. *Articul. 13. Division 4.*

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

I beseeche thee, Gentle Reader, for shortenesse sake, and for thy better satisfaction herein, to consider my answeare made hereunto in my Former Replie to M. Hardinge. Verily Leo speaketh not one worde, either of Priuate Masse, or of Sole Receiuinge, or of any other like Superstitious, and pæuishe vanitie: but onely of the General Communion of the whole Churche. His Counsel therefore vnto Dioscorus is, that if vpon occasion of resort, the multitude of Communicantes were so greate, that they coulde not haue conueniente roume in the Churche, to receiue al togeather at one Communion, then the Priest, after he had ministred vnto the firste Companie, and had willed them to departe forthe, and geeue place to others, and sawe the Churche replenished againe with a newe Companie of aftercommers, shoulde without feare, or remorse of Conscience beginne the whole Communion againe, and so Ministre vnto them, as he had donne vnto the Former. More then this out of Leoes wordes cannot be geathered. Here, M. Hardinge, haue you found a good warrante for the Holy Communion, and a plaine condemnation of youre Priuate Masse.

The Apologie, Cap. 5. Division. 1.

But, if they wil saie, that al these thinges are worne nowe out of vse, and nighe deade, and perteine nothinge to these presente times.

yet

yet to the ende al folke maie vnderstande, what Faithe is to be geeuen to theise menne, and vpon what hope they calle togeather their General Councelles, lette vs see in fewe woordes, what good heede they take to the selfe same thinge, which they them selues, these very laste yeeres, (and the remembrance thereof, is yet newe, and freashe) in theire owne General Councel, that they had by order called, haue Decreed, and commaunded to be deuoutely keapte. In the Laste Councel at Tridente, scant fouretiene yeeres paste, it was ordeined by the common consente of all degrees, That one man shoulde not haue twoo Benefices at one time. what is becomme nowe of that Ordinance? Is the same too soone worne out of minde, and cleane consumed? For these menne, yee see, geeue to one man, not twoo Benefices onely, but sundrie Abbaies many times, sometimes also twoo Bishoprikes, sommetime three, sommetime foure, and that not onely to an vnlearned man, but oftentimes also euen to a man of Warre.

In the said Councel a Decree was made, that al Bishops should Preache the Gospel. These menne, neither Preache, nor once goe vp into the Pulpite, neither thinke they it any parte of theire Office. What great pompe, and crake then is this, they make of Antiquitie? Why bragge they so of the names of the Auncient Fathers, and of the Newe, and Olde Councelles? Why wil they seeme to truste to their Authoritie, whom, when they liste, they despise at their pleasure?

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Hereto, M. Harding answeareth thus, With what face finde they faulte? Ye beleue none of the Councelles: Sir Iohn Hooper, a Martyr of theire owne Canonization: youre Lienge Booke: your vile stuffe: your Newe vpstarre Churche: your Heresies: your incredible Lies: your maliceous Lies: your sclaunderous Lies, &c. He is very harde harted, that wil not be moued with so valiant proufes.

The Apologie, Cap. 5. Diuision. 2.

But I haue a special fansie to common a woorde or twoo, rather with the Popes good Holinesse, and to saie theise thinges vnto his owne face.

M. Hardinge.

Here pricketh foorth this hastie Defender, as pearte as a Pearemonger, and faine would he talke with the Pope him selfe forsoothe face to face. But Sir, I pray you, be not too hasty in takinge youre iourney to Rome. Tel vs before yee goe, maie not a meaner man serue in steede of the Pope, for your masship to talke withal? This felowe hathe a special fansie, and wil needes to the Pope him selfe, and talke with him of his highe matters presently to his owne face. I praie you syr, may not a poore man heare your tale before hande? By often tellinge of it, you shal haue it in better readinesse, when you come there.

Modestie, and grauitie meete for a Doctour. Masship.

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuision. 1.

Tel vs, I praie you, good Holy Father, seeinge yee doo crake so mutche of al Antiquitie, and boaste your self, that al menne are bounde to you alone, whiche of al the Fathers hathe at any time called you by the name of the Highest Prelate: the Vniuersal Bishop, or the Heade of the Vniuersal Churche.

M. Hardinge.

What the Pope him selfe wil saie vnto you, when you come before him, I knowe not. Bicause you

Summus Sacerdos.

you make no haſte (I ſuppoſe) as yet to goe vnto his perſone, maie it pleaſe you in the meane time to be anſweared by an other man, thus nowe til then? Touching the firſte parte of your firſt queſtion (a) reade S. Hierome *ad Damaſum*, and *aduerſus Luciferianos*, where he calleth the Pope (b) *Summum Sacerdotem*. And if yee require a woorde of greater ſound, reade S. Auguſtine, where he ſaith, *In Romana Eccleſia ſemper viguit Apoſtolica Cathedra Principatus*: In the Romaine Church, the Princedome of the Apoſtolike chaire hathe alwaies floriſhed. For the ſeconde parte, looke in the (c) *Councel of Chalcedon*. For the thirde, reade Victor in his ſeconde Booke *De Perſecutione Vandalorum*. And for a ful reſolution of this mater, reade mine anſweare to M. Iewels chalenge in the fourthe Article. There ſhal you finde your demaunde fully anſweared: **Beſide two and thirtie greate Untruthes in the ſame one Article.**

(a) And there ſhal ye finde nothinge.
(b) This name was common to euery Biſhop; and therefore is fondly appropriate to the Pope.
(c) And there is nothinge.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Here it liketh you, M. Hardinge, for the time, although vnworthy, to ſupplie the Popes perſone. Howe be it, as doubtinge, either the ſufficiencie of your Commiſſion, or the diſcretion of your anſweare, ye ſaie, Thus nowe, til then.

Where we demaunde of you, which of al the Ancient Fathers, and Doctours euer called the Pope Summum Sacerdotem, *The Higheſt Prieſte*: **We anſweare vs,** S. Hierome **ſo called him in the Boke** Contra Luciferianos. **For his woordes be plaine,** Summus Sacerdos, *The Higheſte Prieſte*. **But what if it be found, that theſe woordes belonge no more to the Pope, then to any other particulare Biſhop? Wil ye then confeſſe, that either ye were farre ouerſene, or els, that ye ſought vnder we meanes, vnder the name of S. Hierome, to mocke your Reader? You ſaie, S. Hierome by theſe woordes,** Summus Sacerdos, **meante onely the Pope. But, M. Harding ſaith, S. Hierome by the ſame woordes, meante any one Biſhop, what ſo euer he were, and not onely the Pope. If you be, M. Hardinge, and if theſe thinges be true, then are you of late ſowly fallen out with your ſelfe.**

For trial hereof, cal to your remembrance, M. Harding, your owne woordes, vttered, not els where, but euen in this ſelfe ſame Boke. The woordes of S. Hierome **be theſe,** *The ſafetie of the Churche, hangeth vpon the Dignitie of the* Higheſt Prieſt. **Hereupon, M. Hardinge ſaithe,** This peereleſſe Authoritie S. Hierome in that place doothe attribute to the Biſhop of euery Dioceſe.

M. Har. 104. b. Hierony. contra Luciferianos.

M. Hardinge directly contrarie to him ſelfe.

And thus, by M. Hardinges owne Expoſition, not onely the Pope, but alſo the Biſhop of any other Dioceſe, is called by S. Hierome, **the Higheſte Prieſte. Thus one M. Hardinge ſaithe,** S. Hierome by theſe woordes meante onely the Pope: **An other M. Hardinge ſaithe,** S. Hierome by the ſame woordes meante any one Biſhop, and not onely the Pope. **It were a deede of Charitie, to reſolue your Reader, whether of theſe two contrarie M. Hardinges he maie beleeue. Verily, here ye allege** S. Hierome for the Pope, **where as, by M. Hardinges Confeſſion,** S. Hierome **ſpake nothinge, no not one woorde of the Pope. Iudge is the weighte, and credite of your Authorities.**

But for thy better ſatiſfaction, good Chriſtian Reader, it is wel knowen to any meane ſtudente in Diuinitie, that, not onely the Biſhop of Rome, but alſo euery other Biſhop within his owne Dioceſe was commonly called the Higheſt Prieſte, for that within his owne Dioceſe, of al other Prieſtes he was the Higheſte. Tertullian **ſaithe,** Dandi Baptiſmum ius habet Summus Sacerdos, qui eſt Epiſcopus: *The* Higheſte Prieſte, *that is, the Biſhop, hathe Authoritie, to Miniſter Baptiſme*. S. Auguſtine **ſaithe,** Quid eſt Epiſcopus, niſi Primus Presbyter, hoc eſt, Summus Sacerdos? *What is a Biſhop, but the Firſte Prieſte, that is to ſaie, the* Higheſte Prieſte?

Tertullian, De Baptiſmo. Augu. in queſt. ex vtroque Teſtamen. que. 101

S Ambroſe, writinge, not vnto the Pope, but vnto Fœlix, the Biſhop of Comum in France, ſaithe thus, Suſcepiſti gubernacula Summi Sacerdotij: *Thou haſte taken the gouernemente of the* Higheſte Prieſtehoode.

Ambroſ. Li. 1. Epiſt. 5.

Againe he ſaithe, ſpeakinge likewiſe of any one Biſhop, Vidiſti Summum Sacerdotem Interrogantem, & Conſecrantem: *Thou ſaweſt the* Higheſt Prieſte *examininge the people, that was to be Baptized, and Conſecratinge the Water*.

Ambroſ. De iis qui initiantur. Cap. 3.

I leaue out ſundrie other like Authorities of Origene, of Lactantius, of Athanaſius, of Leo, of Victor, of Meltiades, and of others. Euagrius **calleth the Euphemius,**

Summus Sacerdos.

and Gregorius the Bishop of Antioche, Summos Sacerdotes, The Higheste Priestes. Ruffinus calleth Athanasius, the Bishop of Alexandria, Pontificem Maximum: *The Greateſt, or Higheſt Bishop*. By these, I truste, it maie appeare, that the Title, or Dignitie of the Higheste Priestehoode, was general, and common to al Bishoppes, and not onely closed vp, and moreted onely in the Pope.

Euagrius Lib. 3. Cap. 32.

Ruffinus, Lib. 2. Cap. 13.

Besides al this, ye bringe vs a woorde, ye saie, of Greater sounde: In Romana Ecclesia semper viguit Apostolicæ Cathedræ Principatus: *In the Romaine Churche, the* Princehoode of the Apostolique Chaire, *hathe alwaies flouriſhed*. In deede, Princehoode, and Apostolike, be verie large woordes, and carry greate sounde, almoste as greate as the Belle of Frideswise, vnto the sounde of whiche Belle, ye wisshed once in your Sermone in Oxeforde, that your voice had benne comparable, that you might, as you saide then, Ringe out in the dulle eares of these Papistes. These were your woordes: Ye maie not forgegeate them.

Aug. Epist 162.

But faine woulde ye haue, the Bishop of Rome shoulde be a Prince, to make vp the sounde. Notwithstandinge, in the Councel of Aphrica it was decreed thus, Primæ Sedis Episcopus non appelletur Princeps Sacerdotum: *Lette not the Bishop of the* Firste See, *be called the* Prince of Priestes.

Dist. 99. Prima Sedu.

But, what if the sounde of these woordes weighe no heauier, then the former? Or, what if this woorde, Princehoode, be nomore peculiare to the Pope, then is the other of Higheſt Priesthoode? Paulinus, writinge vnto Alypius, not the Greate Bishop of Rome, but the poore Bishop, as I remember, of Tagasta, saithe thus, Deus in Ciuibus Ciuitatis suæ Principalem te cum Principibus populi sui, Sede Apostolica collocauit: *God hath placed thee emongeſte the Citizens of his Cittie, in the* Apostolique See, *beeinge a* Principal, *or a* Chiefe *with* (other Bishoppes, that is to saie, with) *the* Princes of his people. Here haue you founde the Princehoode of the See Apostolique, not onely in Rome, but also in the poore Cittie of Tagasta. Likewise S. Chrysostome saithe, Ad orandum nos assidue prouocat (Paulus) Apostolorum Princeps: Paule *the Prince of the Apoſtles calleth vpon vs, to be alwaies praieinge*. So saithe S. Gregorie, Paulus obtinuit totius Ecclesiæ Principatum: Paule *obteined the* Princehoode *of the whole Churche*. So saithe Leo, Iuuenalis Episcopus, ad obtinendum Palestinæ Prouinciæ Principatum, &c. *Bishop* Iuuenal, *that he might obteine the* Princehoode *of the Prouince of* Palestine, &c.

Inter Epistolas Aug. Epist. 35.

Chrysost. de Orando Deum. li. 1.

Grego. in 1. Reg. ca. 10. li. 4. cap. 4.

Leo. Epist. 62.

Wickedly your owne singulare Doctours Amphilochius, writeth thus, not of the Pope, but of S. Basile, the Bishop of Cæsarea: Additus est Principibus Sacerdotum Magnus ipse Princeps Sacerdotum: Basile, *beeinge deade, was laide with other Bishoppes the Princes of Prieſtes, beeinge him ſelfe the* Greate Prince of Priestes. It was greate folie therefore, M. Hardinge, these Titles thus lieinge in common, to encroche the same onely to the Pope. Notwithstandinge, ye saie, Thus nowe til then. Verily, when the Pope him selfe shal beginne to consider, and to weighe your pleadinge, then wil he saie, he had a very vnskilful Proctoure.

Amphilochius,

For answeare to the reste, I remit you to my Firste Replie.

Artic. 4. Diuis. 30. & 32.

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuision. 2.

Whiche of the Auncient Fathers, or Doctoures euer saide, that bothe the Swerdes are committed vnto you?

M. Hardinge.

Lette S. Bernarde, writinge to a Pope, answeare for the Pope. (a) He is a sufficiente witnesse. Where your selfe doo allege him mutche against the Pope, you can not by the lawe iustely refuse him, speakinge for the Pope. The spiritual swoorde you denie not, I trowe. Of the Temporal swoorde, belonginge also to the Pope, thus saithe S. Bernarde to Eugenius. He that denieth this swoorde to be thine, seemeth to mee, not to consider sufficiently the woorde of our Lorde, saieinge thus (to Peter thy Predecessoure). (b) Put vp thy Swoorde into the scaberde. The very same then is also thine to be drawen foorthe perhaps at thy becke, thoughe not with thy hande. Els if the same belonged in no wise vnto thee, where as the Apostles saide, Beholde there be twoo Swoordes here: Our Lorde woulde not haue answeared, It is yenoughe, but, It is too mutche. So bothe be the Churches, the Spiritual Swoorde, and the Material. But this is to be exercised for the Churche, and that of the Churche. That by the hande of the Priestе, this of the Souldioure, but verily at the becke of the

(a) Vntruth. For his Authoritie is not sufficient as it shal appeare.

(b) Put vp thy Swerde: *Ergo*, The Pope hath bothe Swerdes: A simple Argumente.

Bernard. De Considera. Lib.

of the Prieſte, and commaundement of the Emperour. Thus, touchinge the Popes bothe Swoordes, you are fully anſweared by S. Bernarde.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

The Pope hath power, to claime Authoritie without ſhame. Emongeſt others his vnadviſed, and vaine Wordes, thus he ſaith: Chriſtus Beato Petro, Vitæ Eeternæ Clauigero, Terreni ſimul, & Cœleſtis Imperij Iura commiſit: *Chriſte hath committed vnto* Peter, *the Keiebearer of Euerlaſtinge Life, the righte bothe of the* VVorldly, *and alſo of the* Heauenly Empiere: That is to ſaie, The Pope is Emperour bothe of Heauen, & of Earthe. And therefore Pope Bonifacius 8. as it is ſaide before, in the ſight of the worlde, ware the Crowne Emperial on his heade, and commaunded the naked Swerde to be borne before him: and Proclamation to be made: Ecce duo Gladij hic: *Beholde, here are the twoo Swerdes.* I meane the ſame Pope Bonifacius, of whome it is written, *He entred as a Foxe: He reigned as a Woulfe: He died as a Dogge.* Herof it is written in Concilio Vangionum, Vtrunque, & Imperium, & Pontificatum, ſicuti Decij, & Falſorum Deorum Cultores factitare conſueuerunt, vſurpat: *The* Pope *wrongefully vſurpeth bothe togeather, as wel the Worldly Empiere, as the Biſhoprike, as* Decius, *and the woorſhippers of Falſe Goddes were woont to doo.* Dist. 22. Omnes. Paralipom. VIII ſpergenſis. Carion. Auentinus.

Yet S. Bernarde ſaith, The Pope hathe Bothe Swerdes: But S. Bernardes Authoritie in this caſe is but ſimple. He liued Eleuen hundred yeres after Chriſtes Aſcenſion, in the time of Kinge Henry the Firſt, the Kinge of England, in the middes of the Popes route, and Tyrannie. How be it, touchinge his Judgement, & Credite herein, let vs rather heare one of your owne Doctours. Heruæus therefore ſaithe thus, Bernardus ponit, quòd Papa habet Gladium Materialem in nutu. Sed iſtud, cum hoc, quòd non eſt magnæ Authoritatis, magis eſt contra eos, quàm pro eis: Bernarde *ſaithe, that the* Pope *hathe the Material, or Temporal Swerde at his commaundemente. But this ſaieinge of* Bernardes, biſides that it is of ſmal force, *maketh alſo more againſte them, then with them.* Againe he ſaithe, Vnum iſtorum Gladiorum Petrus non tetigit, ſcilicet, Sæcularem, qui ſuus non erat: *The one of theſe* twoo Swerdes, Peter *neuer touched: I meane the* VVorldely, or Temporal Swerde: *For that Swerde was none of his.* Iohan. De Pariſiis, De Poteſtat. Regia, Cap. 11. Iohan. De Pariſiis, Cap. 19.

Likewiſe yée maie finde it written in your owne Decrees, vnder the name of S. Cyprian, Chriſtus actibus proprijs, & dignitatibus diſtinctis, Officia Poteſtatis vtriuſque diſcreuit: *Chriſte* (hathe not committed Bothe theiſe Swerdes to one mans hande, but) *by ſeueral Dueties, and ſundrie Dignities, hathe ſeuered the Offices of either Power.* Wherevpon your owne Gloſe ſaithe thus, Ergo, eſt Argumentum, quod Papa non habet vtrunque Gladium: *This therefore is a proufe,* that the Pope hath not Bothe the Swerdes. Dist. 10. Quæſtio. am idem.

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuiſion. 3.

Whiche of the Auncient Fathers euer ſaide, that you haue Authoritie, and right to calle Councelles?

M. Hardinge.

VVho hathe Authoritie to commaunde the partes of the body, but the heade? (a) And that the Pope is head, where it is amply declared, ye hearde euen now. VVhere you aſke, which euer ſaid, that the Pope hath authoritie to calle Councelles, if you knowe not ſo mutche. (b) wee telle you, that Socrates the writer of the Eccleſiaſtical hiſtorie ſaith ſo, not ſpeakinge in his owne perſone, but reportinge an olde rule of the Church in theſe woordes. *Sed neque Iulius interfuit maximæ Romæ preſul, neque in locum ſuum aliquem deſtinauit, cùm vtiq; regula Eccleſiaſtica iubeat, non oportere præter ſententiam Romani Pontificis (c) conſilia celebrari.* But neither Iulius the Biſhop of great Rome was preſente, (at the Councel of Antiochia) neither ſente he any man in his place, where as the Eccleſiaſtical rule commaundeth, that without the aduiſe and wil of the Pope of Rome, no Councelles be keapte. And, as Socrares witneſſeth of the callinge of Conncels, ſo dooth Sozomenus witneſſe of the thinges donne in them. *Cùm Sacerdotali lege conſtitutum ſit, pro irritis haberi debere, quæ præter ſententiam Epiſcopi Romani geruntur.* VVhere as (ſaithe he) it hathe benne ordeined by a lawe of Biſhoppes, that what thinges be donne (in any Councel) beſides the aduiſe and wil of the Biſhop of Rome, they ought to be taken for none, and voide. If you wil ſee more for this Authoritie of callinge Councelles, reade *Reſcriptum Iulij Papæ contrà Orientales: Epiſt. Athanaſij & Ægyptiorum Pontificum ad Fœlicem Papam,* This mater is alſo fully anſweared.

(a) Vntruthe great and manifeſte, for this was yet neuer proued.
(b) Vntruth. For Socrates ſaith not ſo.
(c) Vntruthe, ſtandinge in falſe Tranſlation. Reade the Anſweare.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Here hathe M. Hardinge brought in a ſhewe of greate authorities without ſenſe. For anſwcare whereof, it maie pleaſe thē, Gentle Reader, to conſider the fourthe Article of my Former Replie. Notwithſtandinge, emongeſte al theſe wordes of Pope Iulius, Socrates, Caſſiodorus, and forged Athanaſius, there is not one worde of power, and Authoritie to calle Councelles. Onely thus muche they ſaie, *No Decree maie paſſe in* Councel *without the agreemente, and conſente of the Biſhop of Rome:* for that he was one of the Foure Principal Patriarkes, and ought to haue his voice there, as wel as others. It is a Principle ruled in Laws, Quod omnes tangit, ab omnibus debet approbari: *That toucheth al, muſte be allowed by al.*

Artic. 4. Diui. 16

Μὴ λεγόντων κατὰ τῶν ἐκκλησιῶν. *Regula iuris.*

But, leaſte you ſhoulde thinke, this was the Popes onely prerogatiue, and belonged to none other beſides him, the ſame Socrates writeth the very like wordes as wel of the Biſhop of Conſtantinople, as of the Pope. Thus he ſaithe, Et hoc fecerunt, contemnentes Legem, qua cauetur, ne quis eligatur præter ſententiam Epiſcopi Conſtantinopolitani: *Thus did they, not regardinge the* Decree, *whereby order was taken, that no Biſhop ſhoulde be choſen without the conſent of the* Biſhop of Conſtantinople. Yet maie not, M. Hardinge, conclude hereof, that therefore the Biſhop of Conſtantinople had Authoritie to calle Councelles.

Socra. li. 7. ca 28 ἀμελήσαντες τοῦ νόμου κελεύοντος παρὰ γνώμην τοῦ ἐπισκόπου Κωνσταντινουπόλεως χειροτονίαν μὴ γίνεσθαι.

Æneas Syluius, that afterwarde him ſelfe was Pope, named Pius the Second writeth thus, His Authoritatibus mirum in modum putant ſe armatos, qui negant, Concilia fieri poſſe ſine conſenſu Papæ. Quorum ſententia, ſi, vt ipſi volunt, inuiolata perſiſtat, ruinam ſecum Eccleſiæ trahit: *They, that ſaie, no Councel maie be keapte without the conſente of the* Pope, *thinke them ſelues marueilouſly fenſed by theſe Authorities. But if theire ſaieinge holde, and take place, as they woulde haue it,* it wil drawe with it the decaie, and ruine of the Churche.

The Foure firſte greate Councelles, of Nice, of Epheſus, of Chalcedon, of Conſtantinople, and the reſte, as it ſhal afterwarde more largely appeare, were alwaies called by the Emperours, and not by the Pope. As for the Pope, he had not yet the whole worlde at his commaundemente, nor any ſuche Vniuerſal Authoritie, to calle Councelles: but rather was commaunded him ſelfe, as other Biſhoppes were, by the Emperoures Authoritie, to comme to Councelles, as it ſhal appeare.

Therefore, where you woulde conclude thus, The Pope was Heade of the Church: *Ergo,* he had Authoritie to calle Councelles: We maie rather, and muche better turne your tale backewarde, and ſaie thus, The Pope had no Authoritie to calle Councelles: *Ergo,* he was not Heade of the Churche.

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuiſion. 4.

Whiche of the Auncient Fathers, or Doctoures euer ſaide, The vvhole V Vorlde is but your Dioceſe?

M. Hardinge.

He that ſaide to Peter, feede my Lambes, and, feede my Sheepe, *whiche Lambes and Sheepe al Chriſten menne be through the worlde. Ioha. 21.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

The Canoniſtes, that is to ſaie, the Popes Pages of Honoure, haue not doubted to inſeaffe their Maiſter with the poſſeſſion of al the worlde. One ſaith thus, Dominus Papa eſt Ordinarius omnium hominum: *Our Lorde the Pope is the Ordinarie, or Biſhop of al menne.* An other ſaithe, Papa totius mundi obtinet Principatum: *The Pope hath the Princehoode of al the World.* An other ſaithe, Papa eſt Epiſcopus totius Orbis: *The Pope is the Biſhop of the whole worlde.* An other ſaithe, Papa, etiam ceſſante negligentia Prælatorum, poteſt conferre beneficia totius Orbis: Quia ipſe eſt Ordinarius totius mundi: *Thoughe there be no defaulte, or negligence in any Biſhop, yet maie the Pope beſtowe the benefices of al the worlde: For that he is the Biſhop of al the worlde.* Therefore when the Chiefe Deacon inueſteth, or enrobeth the Pope at his Conſecration, he ſaith vnto him, Ego inueſtio te de Papatu, vt præſis Vrbi, & Orbi: *I doo inueſte thee with the* Popedome, *that thou maiſte rule bothe the Cittie, and the worlde.*

* God knoweth here is a ſheepiſhe reaſon.

Extra. De Appellation. Vt debitum. in Gloſſa. Extra. De ſtatu Regularium periculoſo. In Gloſ. Extra. De Foris Farisciu. In Gloſ. Extra. de Cõceſſ. Præbende. & Eccleſiæ non vacantu. Quia diuerſitatem Abb. Ceremoniar. Li. 1

Of this infinite Ambition, and inordinate Tyrannie many good menne haue often complained. Franciſcus Zabarella, beinge him ſelfe a Cardinal of Rome, ſaithe

the vvhole vvorlde is the Popes Diocese.

saithe thus: Ex hoc infiniti sequuti sunt errores: Quia Papa occupauit omnia iura inferiorum Ecclesiarum: Et nisi Deus succurrat statui Ecclesiarum, Vniuersa Ecclesia periclitatur: *Hereof haue ensued infinite errours: for that the* Pope *hathe inuaded the right of al inferioure Churches. And, onlesse God healpe the state of the Churches, the Vniuersal Churche is in ieoperdie.* Franc. Zabarel.

The Learned Lady Anna, Daughter vnto the Emperoure Alexius, and Irene, in her Storie, that she wrote in Greeke, emonge many other thinges to like pourpose, writeth thus: Papa est Dominus totius mundi, quemadmodum Latini quidem putant, & prædicant: Est enim etiam hæc pars quædam illorum insolentiæ: *The Pope is the Lorde of al the world, as the Latines thinke, and speake of him. For this is one peece of their Ambition.* Anna in Historia Græca: ἐσὶ γὰρ καὶ τᾶτο τῆς ἀλαζονείας αὐτῶν. Histor. ecclesiast. Lib. 1. Cap. 6.

This hath bene the late wanton Claime of the Popes Canonistes. Otherwise the Ancient Learned Fathers haue euermore bounded, & limited the Pope within his owne particulare Iurisdiction. Ruffinus saithe, the Fathers in the Councel of Nice, appointed the Pope to ouersée the Churches of his owne Suburbes: Vt Romanus Episcopus Suburbicarum Ecclesiarum sollicitudinem gerat. Athanasius saithe, Roma est Metropolis Romanæ ditionis: *Rome is the Mother Churche* (not of al the vniuersal worlde, but) *of the Romaine* (particulare) *Iurisdiction.* The Bishops in the Councel of Rome write thus to the Bishops of Illyricum, Par est, omnes, qui sunt in Orbe Romano, Magistros conuenire: *It is conuenient, that al the Bishops, that be within the Iurisdiction of Rome, should accorde together.* Flauianus the Archebishop of Constantinople writeth thus to Leo, the Bishop of Rome, Dignetur Sanctitas vestra indicare impietatem Eutychetis omnibus Episcopis sub Beatitudine vestra degentibus: *Lette your holinesse Vouchesaue to make knowen the wickednesse of* Eutyches *to al the Bisshoppes, that liue vnder you.* To al the Bishoppes, he saithe, that liue vnder you: Not vnto al Bishops through the worlde. S. Hierome speakinge of the vsage, and order of the Churche of Rome, saithe thus, Quid mihi profers Vnius Vrbis Consuetudinem? *What allegest thou vnto me the Custome of one Cittie?* So mutche he abbrigeth the Popes Iurisdiction, that he extendeth it, not vnto the Littes, and endes of al the worlde, but restreineth it onely to the limites of one Cittie. Likewise againe, speakinge of the Bishop of Rome, he saithe thus, Non solùm Vnius Vrbis, sed etiam totius Orbis errant Episcopi: *Then, not onely the Bishop of One Towne* (whiche was the Bishop of Rome) *but also the Bishoppes of al the worlde are deceiued.* Concilium Nicenum. Ca. 23. πάντας τὺς ἐν ἑπαρχίᾳ τῆς μητροπόλεως δεῖ συνκαλεῖσθαι τοὺς ἐπισκόπους. Hieronym. ad Enagrium. Inter Epistolas Leonis Epist. 9. Hieronym. ad Enagrium. Hieron. aduersus Vigilantium.

Thus therefore writeth Gennadius, together with the Councel of Constantinople, vnto the Bishop of Rome, Curet Sanctitas tua Vniuersas tuas Custodias, tibiq; subiectos Episcopos: *Let your Holinesse see vnto* (not al the whole worlde, but) *al your owne charge, and suche Bishoppes, as be subiecte vnto you.* Gennadius ad omnes Metropolitanos, & ad Papam Romæ.

By these fewe wée sée, the Bishop of Romes power was, not Vniuersal, or infinite, ouer al the Churches, and Kingedomes of the worlde: but certaine, and limited within his owne particulare Iurisdiction.

As for the reasons, wée vse for proufe hereof, I marueile, ye would euer trouble the worlde with so Childishe folies. Christe saide vnto Peter, Feede my Sheepe: *Ergo*, saie you, the whole worlde is the Popes Diocese. A good Sharpe would haue made a better Argumente.

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuision. 5.

Which of the holy Ancient Fathers euer saide, that al Bishoppes haue receiued of your fulnesse?

M. Hardinge.

Besides others, so hathe *S. Bernarde saide in his Booke *De consideratione ad Eugenium*. VVhere he saithe, that he is called *in plenitudinem potestatis*, into the fulnesse of power. *A Simple Authoritie.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

There is no folie so vaine, but by somme shifte maie be mainteined. In your Glose, M. Hardinge, it is written thus: Omnes subiecti sunt motioni Papæ, & sunt in illo, quasi Membra de Membro: *Al menne are subiecte vnto the* Popes *wil, and are in him as members of a member.* An other saithe, Ecclesia non habet potestatem aliquam Clemen. Li. 5. De Hæreti. Aduersus. In Glossa. Petrus de Palus

Al receiue of the Popes fulneſſe.

quam Iuriſdictionis, niſi à Petro: *The Churche hath no Power of Iuriſdiction*, but onely from Peter. And againe, A Petro, poſt Chriſtum, Spiritualis Gratia, & Poteſtas deriuatur: *Next after Chriſte, Spiritual Grace, and Power is deriued from Peter.* And therefore an other of your Doctoures ſaithe, Omnes Epiſcopi deſcendunt à Papa, quaſi Membra à Capite: & de eius Plenitudine omnes accipiunt: *Al Biſhoppes are deriued from the* Pope, *as Members from the Heade: and al they receiue of his fulneſſe:* that is to ſaie, Power of his Power, and Grace of his Grace. Al theſe vanities, M. Hardinge thinketh, maie be wel borne out by two bare woordes of S. Bernarde.

de de Poteſtate Papæ.
Petrus de Palu. callata Apoſtol.
Durandus. Li. 2. De Miniſtris & Ordinib.

But, S. Auguſtine, many hundred yeres before Bernarde was borne, wrote thus: Nos quidem accipere poſſumus hoc donum pro modulo noſtro: Fundere autem illud ſuper alios non poſſumus. Sed, vt hoc fiat, Deum ſuper eos, à quo hoc efficitur, inuocamus: *In deede wee maie receiue the gifte of God accordinge to owre portion: but to powre the ſame vpon others, wee are not hable. Notwithſtandinge, in their behalfe wee cal vpon God, that is the worker hereof, that he wil doo it.*

Auguſt. De Trinitá. li. 15. ca. 26.

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuiſion. 6.

Whiche of al the Auncient Doctoures euer ſaid, that al Power is geeuen to you, as wel in Heauen, as in Earthe?

M. Hardinge.

*Vntruthe, vndiſcrete, and vaine. For no Ancient Doctour, or Father euer vttered ſo fonde woordes.

*Al they whiche ſpeake of the miniſterial Power, whereby vnder Chriſte the militante Church by him is gouerned. But if you meane abſolutely, as your woordes ſeeme to ſounde, ſo no diſcrete Catholike man euer ſaide or thought.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Here by a prety diſtinction of Power Abſolute, & Power not Abſolute, Chriſte, and his Vicare are ſet togeather, to parte Tenures. Howe be it, what manner of Power it is, that the Pope claymeth, his owne Proctours, & Counſellers can tel vs beſte. Cardinal Hoſtienſis ſaithe, Excepto peccato, Papa poteſt, quicquid Deus ipſe poteſt: *Sinne onely excepted, the* Pope *hath Power to doo, what ſo euer God him ſelfe can doo.*

Extra. De tranſlatione Epiſcopi Quãto. Hoſtien. M. Hard fo. 67. a

Addition. ☞ M. Hardinge. This is falſe, and ſclaunderous. This is a moſte manifeſte, and out of al queſtion, foule corruption. Certainely Hoſtienſis ſaithe not ſo. But hauing reckened certaine thinges, wherein the Pope hathe Authoritie vnder God, as Chriſtes high officer, He concludeth with theſe woordes, *Breuiter, excepto peccato, quaſi omnia de iure poteſt, vt Deus:* Briefly, excepted ſinne, He hathe power, as a man woulde ſaie, in al thinges, of right, as God. Thus ſaithe Hoſtienſis, and not as M. Iewel beliefth him, &c. It is ſaide by the Learned Canoniſtes, that the Conſiſtorie of God, and of the Pope is one Conſiſtorie: As a Biſhoppes and his Chauncellours Conſiſtorie is one, and the ſame Conſiſtorie. Nowe let vs conſider the impudencie of this falſe Miniſter. Firſte he auoucheth his ſhameleſſe lie boldely, as thoughe, where truthe faileth, for ſhewe of truthe, the mater might be ſtouted out. The woordes, ſaithe he, be moſte manifeſte, and out of al queſtion: *Excepto peccato, Papa poteſt, quicquid Deus ipſe poteſt:* That is to ſaie, the Pope can doo, as mutche as God him ſelfe can doo, ſinne excepted. But what if theiſe woordes be not moſt manifeſte? Is it not then a moſte manifeſte impudencie, ſo to affirme of them? Is not this Miniſter a Miniſter of Lies? &c. Firſte he hath nipte awaie this woorde, *Breuiter.* Then this woorde *Quaſi*, whiche mitigateth, and qualifieth the ſaieinge: Then againe thoſe other woordes of neceſſarie importance, *Omnia, de iure*, and, *vt*. Nexte he corrupted the ſentence by puttinge to theſe woordes of his owne, *Quicquid*, and *Ipſe*, &c. VVho euer ſawe one little poore ſentence ſo nipte, ſo hakte, ſo hewed, and mangled, ſo turned, and caſte in a newe moulde?

Addition ☞

fol. 67. b.

The Anſweare. It fareth with you, M. Hardinge, as it did ſommetime with a good honeſt plaine man, that tolde his friende vpon a reckeninge, that he would not be anſweared with fiue poundes, but would haue fiftiene good Nobles, euery penie; and that he would not be ſo mockte. For although there be ſomme alteration in theiſe woordes, yet in ſenſe, and meaninge there is as great odds, as is betweene fiftiene Nobles, & fiue pounde. You ſaie, I haue nipte, and hakte, and hewen theſe woordes, and haue leafte out this woorde *Breuiter:* Howe verily, M. Harding, any wiſe man maie thinke, this is a very ſimple quarrel for a man of your Learning. For, if I had nipte of this woorde, Breuiter, as in deede I haue not, yet what woulde that make to the darkninge, and bewinge of the ſenſe? But you ſaie, I haue leafte out other woordes beſides, as Omnia, De iure, and vt, woordes, as you tel vs, of neceſſarie importance. I beſeeche you, M. Harding, if you haue any ſuitch fanſie to theiſe woordes, put them al in

In againe, ſ mutche good maie they do you. So ſhal your ſentence be this, Papa poteſt omnia de iure, vt Deus poteſt: *The* Pope *maie doo al thinges of right, as beinge God: or, as God can doo*. Ye thinketh, hereby the mater is but courſly mended. It ſæmeth worſe, then it was before. For thus muſte you ſaie, The Pope of Right maie doo al thinges, as God maie doo. So mutche haue you gained by addinge of theiſe neceſſarie & ſpecial wordes, De iure, and, Vt. Notwithſtandinge, in Abbas Panormitanus, out of whom I alleged theiſe wordes of Hoſtienſis, yée ſhal finde, neither, Breuiter, nor, De, nor, Iure, nor, Vt, neither. So neceſſarie is their importance. Thus haue you thæ ſt your greateſt Canons eaſily diſcharged with little ado: Onleſſe you will likewiſe ſaie, ſ Abbas Panormitanus is alſo a False Miniſter, and impudently belieth Hoſtienſis. Wherein certainely, M. Harding, you haue a ſpecial grace to ſpeake at pleaſure.

Al Povver geeuen to the Pope.

Of the other ſide, you ſaie, I haue added vehemente woordes of mine owne, to enforce the mater. For whereas Hoſtienſis ſaithe onely, Deus, God: I haue imagined him to ſaie, Deus ipſe, God him ſelfe. And I praie you, M. Hardinge, What difference finde you betwæne God, and God him ſelfe? Is God him ſelfe one, and God an other? I thanke God, I knowe none other God, but God him ſelfe. This then, I trowe, muſte be your meaninge, The Pope can doo al thinges (not that God him ſelfe can doo, for that you ſaie, were blaſphemie, but) that God can doo.

Againe (you ſaie) I haue leafte out this woorde, *Omnia*. But you might eaſily haue ſæne, that in ſtæde thereof I placed, Quicquid. And I woulde thinke, that, Quicquid, were as mutche, as, Omnia quæ: onleſſe you can ſhewe vs ſomme prety newe Louanian Grammare to the contrarie.

Once againe you ſaie, I haue leafte out this woorde, *Quaſi*, whiche woorde (you ſaie) mitigateth, and qualifieth the ſaieinge. Then, I trowe, this ſaieinge is ſutche, as hathe nede of ſome Mitigation. Howe be it in dede this is but a Quaſi quarrel, M. Hardinge. If your Pope maie not be God him ſelfe, yet at the leaſte, yée would haue him to be a Quaſi God. It ſhameth mæ, thus to encumber the woorlde with ſutche vanities. But your importunitie, M. Hardinge, enforceth me further, then I woulde.

The very woordes in Abbas Panormitanus, reported out of Hoſtienſis, are theſe: Papa, & Chriſtus faciunt vnum Conſiſtorium: ita quòd, excepto peccato, poteſt Papa quaſi omnia facere, quæ poteſt Deus: *The* Pope, *and* Chriſte *make one Conſiſtorie, or one Judgemente ſeate: ſo that ſinne excepted, the* Pope *in a maner maie doo al thinges, that God maie doo*. Theiſe be the woordes, M. Hardinge: Let ſomme Lawier turne your bookes: You ſhal finde them ſo. And here, once againe I telle you, you haue, neither, Breuiter, nor, De, nor, Iure, nor, Vt, nor any other ſutte cauſe, why yée ſhoulde fare ſo terribly with poore Miniſters.

Extra. De tranſlatione prælati, C. Quãto Abbas

Where as Hoſtienſis ſaithe, *The* Pope, *and* Chriſte *make one Conſiſtorie*, This (you ſaie) is wel ſaide by the Learned Canoniſtes: as a Biſhoppes, and his Chauncelloures Conſiſtorie, is one, and the ſame Conſiſtorie. Your meaninge herein, I trowe, is this: That God is the Biſhop, and the Pope his Chauncelloure: and as there lieth no appeale from the Chancelloure to the Biſhop, ſo there lieth no appeale from the Pope to God, for that the Pope, and God haue one onely Conſiſtorie: And the Lawe ſaithe, Ab vno ad ſeipſum non eſt appellatio.

M. Hard. 67. b.

Extra. in Sexto Lib. 1. De Conſuetudine, Non paramus.

But why ſhewe you your ſelfe ſo ſquamiſhe, ſ ſo daungerous in theiſe woordes, The Pope maie doo what ſo euer God maie doo? You maie remember, that your Canoniſtes haue moued queſtions, VVhether the Pope be God, or no. You maie remember, that the Pope hathe ſuffered him ſelfe to be called God. For thus one ſaide vnto him preſently before his face in the Councel of Laterane without rebuke, Tu es alter Deus in Terris: *Thou arte an other God in the Earthe*. You maie remember, that the Pope ſuffereth his Canoniſtes thus to publiſhe, and to blaſe his Godhed to the woorlde in printed Bookes: Dominus Deus noſter Papa: *Our Lorde God the Pope*. Thus, and euen with theiſe ſelfe ſame erpreſſe woordes hath it benne printed often, and in ſundrie places. Yet haue I not hearde of any Pope, that euer founde faulte with the printinge. You maie remember, that where as S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Quis audeat dicere Deo: *Who dareth to ſaie thus to God*. Your Canoniſtes haue made

Extrauagan. Iohan. 22. Cum inter. printed at Pariſe anno 1514. And at Lions, anno, 1555.

vp, and bettred the mater in this sorte, Quis audeat dicere Deo, vel Papæ? *Who dareth to saie thus to* God, *or to the* Pope? Thus thei saie, as if there were somme equalitie betwene the Pope, and God. You maie remember, It is written in the Ceremoniarie of the Churche of Rome, Moderatio Imperij Romani pertinet ad Papam, Dei vices gerentem in Terris, tanquam ad eum, per quem Reges Regnant: *The Gouernemente of the Romaine Empiere belongeth to the* Pope, *beinge Goddes Vicare in Earthe, as vnto him, by whome Kinges rule, and weare theire Crownes.* And what is he, M. Hardinge, by whom Kinges be Kinges, and haue their Authoritie, but onely God? You maie remember these wordes were spoken in a Councel holden in Rome, in the Popes owne Palaice of Laterane euen in the presence, and hearinge of the Pope: In Papa est omnis potestas, supra omnes potestates tam Cœli, quàm Terræ: *In the* Pope *is al maner of power, aboue al powers, as wel of Heauen, as of Earthe.* I beseeche you, good M. Hardinge, what Power maie this be, but onely the Power of God him selfe.

De Præsiten. dist. 3. Quamuis. Ceremoniar. li 1. Cap. 2.

Concil. Lateran. Sub Leo. 10. In oratione Stephani Patracensis.

You maie remember, Franciscus Zabarella saithe, Papa facit, quicquid libet, etiam illicita, & est plusquam Deus: *The* Pope *doothe, what so euer he lusteth, yea although it be vnlawful, and is more then God.* Thus, you see, M. Hardinge, your Pope is a God of the Earthe: Your Pope is Lorde, and God: Your Pope is he, by whome Kinges are Kinges: Your Pope hath Power aboue al Powers, either in Heauen, or in Earth: Your Pope is more then God. Geeue these wordes what sense, or incense maie like you beste: Embawme them with your moste fauourable, and swetest Constructions, yet shal neuer be hable to make them fauourie: when al your Doctrine is lifted, the bottome thereof is this, Sinne onely excepted, the Pope in a maner maie doo al thinges, that God maie doo. Therefore, M. Hardinge, calle not the Ministers of Goddes Truthe, the Ministers of Lies. He hath of longe time Ministred Lies vnto the worlde, that, beinge a wretched sinful man, hath stalled him selfe in the place of God. And you, forcinge al your wittes, and learninge to vpholde, and swethe him in his blasphemie, muste nedes be a Minister of open Lies.

Fran. Zabarella.

Stephanus the Bishop of Patraca, in your late Councel at Laterane in Rome, saithe thus, In Papa est omnis Potestas supra omnes Potestates, tam Cœli, quàm Terræ: *Al Power is in the* Pope *aboue al the Powers, as wel of Heauen, as of Earthe.*

In Concil Lateran. sub Leone, 10. Sessione. 10. Citatur in codē Concil. Lateran. Extra. de Cōstitutionibus, ca. 1.

And, to make the mater plaine, your owne Bernarde him selfe saithe, Tibi data est omnis Potestas: in qua, qui totum dicit, nihil excludit: *Al manner of Power is geeuen to thee: He that saithe,* Al, *excepteth nothinge.*

And, Abbate Panormitane saithe, Plenitudo Potestatis superat omnem Legem positiuam: Et sufficit quòd in Papa sit pro Ratione Voluntas: *The fulnesse of Power passeth al Positiue Lawe: and it is sufficient in the Pope, that Wil stande in steede of Reason.*

This is that Power, that M. Hardinge here hathe so closely conueied in, vnder the Cloude of his Distinction.

Baldus,

But, Baldus, that by experience sawe the practise hereof, saithe thus: Hæc Plenitudo Potestatis, est Plenitudo Tempestatis: *This Fulnesse of Power, is a Fulnesse of Tempeste.*

Iohan. de Paris. Ca. 18.

An other of your Doctoures saithe: Bernardus nullam Potestatem ponit in Papa, quam non ponit in Prælatis inferioribus: licet in Papa ponat Summam: Bernarde *alloweth no* Power *vnto the* Pope, *but he alloweth the same to other inferioure Bishoppes: Notwithstandinge, he alloweth the greateste* Power *vnto the* Pope. S. Bernarde him selfe saith to like purpose, Sic factitando probatis, vos habere plenitudinem Potestatis: Sed Iustitiæ forte non ita: *Thus doinge, and dealinge, yee shewe your selfe to haue the Fulnesse of Power: but perhaps not likewise the Fulnesse of Iustice.*

Bernard. De Cōsideration. li. 3.

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuision. 7.

Which of the Ancient Fathers euer saide, that neither Kinge, nor Prince, nor the vvhole Cleregie, nor al the people togeather are hable to be Iudges ouer you?

M. Hardinge.

(a) VVoorthy reasons.

(a) VVhat Sheepe shalbe iudges ouer theire shepherde? For as the Fathers of the moste ancient Councel

The Pope vvithout Checke.

Councel of Sinneſſa ſaide, in the cauſe of (b) Marcellinus the Pope, *Nemo vnquam iudicauit Pontificem:* No man euer iudged the Pope, nor any Prelate his highe Prieſte. *Quoniam prima ſedes non iudicabitur à quoquam:* * becauſe the firſte See ſhal not be iudged of any body.

(b) This Marcellinus beinge Pope, had committed open Idolatrie, in makinge Sacrifice vnto Diuelles. Iohan. De Paris ſijs. De Poteſta. Regia. & Papali, Diſtinct. 40. Si Papa.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

In theſe two pointes ſtandeth the Popes Garde of truſte, and the kepe, & Caſtel of al his Power. Firſt, the Churche of Rome, what ſo euer wate ſhe take, can neuer erre: Nexte, the Pope, what ſo euer he do, nate neuer be called to any rechentinge. Theſe two pointes beinge graunted, the reſte is ſure. One of your Doctours ſaithe thus: Omne factum Sanctiſsimi Patris interpretari debemus in bonum. Et, ſiquidem fuerit furtum, vel aliud ex ſe malum, interpretari debemus, quòd Diuino inſtinctu fiat: *Wee muſte expounde euery acte of the* Holy Father *for the beſte. And, if it be theafte, or any other thinge, that of it ſelfe is euil* (as Aduoutrie, or Fornication) *wee muſte thinke, it is donne by the ſecrete inſpiration of God.* An other ſaithe, Si Papa innumerabiles populos cateruatim ſecum ducat mancipio Gehennæ, cum ipſo plagis multis in æternum vapulaturos, huius culpas arguere præſumat mortalium nullus: *If the Pope drawe infinite Companies of people by heapes togeather with him ſelfe into Hel, to be pounished with him with many ſtripes for euer, yet let no mortal man preſume to reproue his faultes.*

9. Quæſti. 3. Cuncta. Diſt. 40. Nonnos. In Gloſſ. Petr. de Paſude. De Poteſt. Papæ. Arti. 4. Idem eodé loco.

An other ſaithe, Papa ſolutus eſt omni Lege Humana: *The Pope is exempted from al Lawe of Man.* An other ſaithe, Sacrilegij inſtar eſſet, diſputare de facto Papę. Facta Papæ excuſantur, vt homicidia Samſonis: vt furta Hebræorum: vt adulterium Iacob: *It is a ſinne, as greate, as Sacrilege, or Churche robbinge, to reaſon of any the* Popes *dooinges. For his Actes are excuſed, as* Samſons *Murders: as the* Iewes *Robberies: and as the Aduouteries of* Iacob. An other ſaithe, Nec Totus Clerus, nec totus Mundus poteſt Papam iudicare, aut deponere: *Neither al the Cleregie, nor al the whole Worlde, maie either Iudge, or Depoſe the Pope.* And againe, Papa in nullo caſu, quamdiu eſt Papa, propter quodcunque crimen poteſt deponi, nec à Concilio, nec à tota Eccleſia, nec à toto Mundo: *The Pope, while he is Pope, cannot in any caſe, for any offenſe by him committed, be depoſed, neither by the General Councel, nor by al the Churche, nor by the whole Worlde.*

In Epiſtola Nicolai Papæ: Inter decreta Adriani Papæ, Diſt. 21. Inferior. Iohan. de Paris ſijs. Ca. 20. Concil. Tomo. 1. In purgatione Sixti.

And al this they are wel hable to proue by good ſubſtantial Authoritie of the Scriptures. For thus they reaſon, The Scholare is not aboue his Maiſter: The Seruante is not aboue his Lorde: And againe, The Axe boaſteth not it ſelfe againſt the Carpenter, that heweth with it: *Ergo,* no man maie accuſe the Pope.

Therefore, an other of your Doctours ſaithe: Iudicare de factis Papæ, hoc aliqui dicunt eſſe, Tangere Montem, & ponere os in Cœlum: *To Iudge of the* Popes *deedes, this, ſomme meane ſaie, is to touche the Holy Mounte* (wherein God gaue the Lawe, and ſhewed him ſelfe to Moſes) *and to ſet the face againſte the Heauens.* And the Pope him ſelfe ſaithe, *The accuſinge of him is the Sinne againſte the Holy Ghoſte, whiche ſhal neuer be forgeuen, neither in this Worlde, nor in the Worlde to comme.*

Thus maie the Pope depoſe Kinges, and Princes, and trouble the whole ſtate of the worlde, and do what he liſte, without Controlmente. Yet maie no man dare ſate vnto him, Sir, why doo yee ſo? Therefore the Accuſers of Pope Symmachus ſaide in the preſence of Kinge Theodoricus, Succeſſores Petri vnà cum Sedis Priuilegijs peccandi quoque licentiam accepiſſe: *The* Pope *maketh his boaſte, that togeather with the Power of teachinge, he hathe receiued free libertie to doo il.*

Ennodius.

Pope Marcellinus, whoſe name ye haue alleged, out of the Councel of Sinneſſa, for defenſe herein, was an Apoſtata, and had forſaken Chriſte, and beinge Pope in Rome, had made Sacrifice vnto Diuels. Al this notwithſtandinge, ye ſaie, no mortal man mighte accuſe him. Thus hathe the Pope a Special Prerogatiue, and Premuntre, to forſake Chriſte, and to committe open Idolatrie, and to geue Honour, and Sacrifice vnto Diuels, without Controlmente.

Concil. Tomo. 1. In Marcellino.

Yet S Paule accuſed S Peter, euen vnto his face, in the preſence of many. And S. Cyprian ſaithe, Petrus ſe non Vindicauit, ſeu aliquid inſolenter aſſumpſit, vt diceret, ſe Primatum tenere, & obtemperari ſibi à nouellis, & poſteris oportere: Peter (beinge thus checked openly by S. Paule) *neither reuenged him ſelfe, nor tooke any thinge prondely vpon him, as to ſaie, that he had the Primacie, or that others, that were but Nouices,*

Gala. 2. Cyprian. Ad Quirinum.

and

The Emperour receiueth his povver of the Pope.

and after commeth (as Paule *was) ought to be obediente vnto him.* Mena, **the Bishop of Constantinople, Judged, and Excommunicated** Pope Vigilius. **The Bishoppes of the Easte Churche, Judged, and Excommunicated, and deposed** Pope Iulius. **One of youre Doctoures** saithe, Si Papa committat crimen Depositione dignum, debet puniri, acsi esset vnus rusticus: *If the* Pope *committe an offence, wherefore he shoulde iustly be deposed, he ought to be punished, as if he were a Clowne of the Countrie.* **Your neighbours of Leodium, in their Epistle against** Pope Paschalis, **write thus:** Remoto Romanæ Ambitionis typho, cur de grauibus, & manifestis, non reprehendantur, & corrigantur Romani Episcopi? Qui reprehendi & corrigi non vult, pseudo est, siue Episcopus, siue Clericus: *Settinge aparte the Pride of Romishe Ambition, the Crimes beinge greate, and manifeste, why maie not the* Bishoppes of Rome, *bothe be reproued, and also corrected? He, that fleeth rebuke, and correction, is a false man, whether he be Priest, or Bishop.*

Nicephor. Li. 17. Cap. 26.
Sozomenus, li. 3. cap. 11.
Felinus in Repertorio. Dignitas.
Concil. Tomo. 2. Epist. Leodien. contra Paschalem Pap.

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuision. 8.

Which of the Ancient Fathers euer saide, that Kinges, and Emperours, by Christes vvil, and Commaundemente, receiue theire Authoritie at your handes?

M. Hardinge.

VVhat is to be answeared hereto,* you maie gather of that is alleaged before out of S. Bernarde, speakinge of bothe swordes.

*There maie you finde nothinge to proue nothinge.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

It is euident by the recorde, and generall consente of al Ancient Writers, that the Pope hathe neither possession, nor sute of Landes, nor House to dwel in, nor the name of Vniuersal Bishop, nor Chartar, nor Libertie, nor Jurisdiction, but that he hath receiued, either of the Frenche kinges, **or of the** Emperours. **Yet would he now beare the worlde in hande, that the** Emperoure **hath nothinge, neither Landes, nor Honour, nor Power, nor Right, nor Swerde, nor Jurisdiction, but onely from him. If any man doubte hereof, besides other testimonies of Antiquitie, let him reade that moste vaine, and Childishe** Donatian, **that the** Pope **him selfe hathe forged vnder the name of the** Emperoure Constantine. S. Ambrose saithe, Si non vis esse obnoxius Cæsari, noli habere, quæ sunt Mundi. Si habes diuitias, obnoxius es Cæsari: *If thou wilte not be subiecte to the Prince, then possesse not the thinges, that be of the Worlde: If thou haue worldly richesse, then arte thou subiecte vnto the* Prince. **Likewise** S. Augustine, Dices, Quid mihi, & Regi? Quid tibi ergo, & possessioni? Per Iura Regum possessiones possidentur: *Thou wilt saie,* (**as the Pope saithe**) *what haue I to doo with the Prince? What then haste thou to doo with Landes? For possessions are holden* (**not by the Popes righte, but**) *by the right of Kinges, and Princes.*

Nicephor. lib. 7. Cap. 46.
Carió in Bonif. 3
Sabellicus in Phoca.
Ambros. in Lucam, li. 9. ca. 20.
August. in Iohannem. Citatur in Epist. Leodiè contra Paschalè. Concil. Tomo. 2.
Citatur ab Illyrico inter Testes veritatis, Pa. 102

Charles the Frenche Kinge, **Newe we to** Charles the Great, **wrote thus vnto** Pope Adrian: Imperatores Ius distinguendorum negotiorum Episcopis Sanctis iuxta Diualia Constituta permiserunt: non autem Episcoporum Villici extiterunt: Emperours, *by their Commissions vnder their greate Seales, haue graunted vnto Bishoppes Authoritie to heare Causes: but they them selues were neuer Stewardes, or Bailifes vnto Bishoppes.* **One of your owne late Doctours saithe,** Papa habet gladium (Ciuilem) ex Commissione, & permissione Principis: *The* Pope *hath the* Temporal Swerde, or Ciuile Iurisdiction, *by the Commission, and Sufferance of the* Prince. **Therefore it seemeth greate folie to saie,** The Prince hathe his Swerde, or Iurisdiction onely by the Commision of the Pope.

Johan. de Parisijs. De Potestate Regia, Ca. 19.

Your owne Barbarous Glose saithe, Imperator in temporalibus habet Potestatem à solo Deo. Et imperium fuit, antequam Apostolatus esset: *The* Emperoure *in Temporal thinges hathe his Authoritie* (**not from the** Pope, **but**) *from God onely. And the Empiere was, before the Apostles were.* **Againe,** Imperator non habet gladium à Papa: Sed Imperium est à solo Deo: *The* Emperoure *hath not his Swerde of the* Pope: *but the Emperoure is onely from God.* **Againe,** Ex sola electione Principum, dico, verum esse Imperatorem, antequam confirmetur à Papa: *I saie, that the* Emperoure *is a very righte, and perfite* Emperoure, *by the onely Election of the Princes, yea, before he be confirmed by the Pope.*

Extra. De Maiorit. & Obedi. Vnam Sanctam. In Gloss.
Dist. 96. Cum ad Verum. In Gloss.
23. 7. 4. Quæsitum.
Dist. 96 Cum ad Verum. In Gloss.

What

The Emperour receiueth his povver of the Pope.

What shal wée néede moe witnesses? Youre very Ceremoniarie of Rome saithe thus, Hoc affirmamus, ante Carolum Magnum, neminem Imperij Romani Coronam ex Manu Romani Pontificis Romæ suscepisse: *Thus wee saie, that before the Emperoure Charles the greate (that is, for the space of eight hundred yeeres after Christe) no man euer receiued the Crowne of the Romaine Empiere at Rome, by the Handes of the Bishop of Rome.* S. Bernarde hereof thus writeth vnto the Pope: Esto, vt alia quacunque ratione hoc tibi vendices: non tamen Apostolico iure: Nec illud tibi dare, quod non habuit, Petrus potuit: *Be it, that yee claime this right by sómme other meanes. Yet by the Apostles right yee cannot claime it: Neither coulde* Peter *geeue you that right, that he him selfe neuer hadde.*

Ceremonia. li. 1. Section. 5. ca. 7. Bernardus De Consideratæ, li. 2.

The Emperoure Ludouicus the fourthe saithe thus: Mea Potestas non pendet à Papa, sed à Deo immediatè. Et vanum est, quod dici solet, Papam non habere Superiorem: *My Power hangeth not of the Pope, but immediately of God alone. And it is but a peeuishe vaine tale, that they saie, the Pope hathe no Superioure.* Iohannes Maior saithe, Bonifacius Octauus multùm apparenter definiuit, quòd Romanus Pontifex est supra Reges in Temporalibus: quod tamen oculatissimi Theologi dicunt esse falsum: Pope Bonifacius. 8. *hathe concluded with greate shewe of reason, that, euen in Temporal Causes, the Pope is aboue Kinges. But I maie tel you, the* VViseste Diuines *saie, it is but a false tale.* Iohannes de Parisijs saithe, In Temporalibus, Potestas Sæcularis maior est Potestate Spirituali, nec, quoad ista, est ei subiecta in aliquo: *In Temporal Causes the Temporal Power, is greater then the Spiritual Power, and, touchinge the same, is not subiecte to it in any pointe.* Againe he saithe, Si Imperator habet Potestatem suam immediatè à Papa, Ergo, Imperator est Minister Papæ: *If the Emperoure receiue his Power immediately from the Pope, then is the Emperoure the Popes Seruante.*

Paralipomena Vrspergen. in Ludouico. 4. Iohan. Maior. 4. Senten. Dist. 20. quæ. 2. Iohan. De Parisijs. De Potesta. Regia & Papali. cap. 5. Iohan. Parisien. Ca. 11.

All these Authorities notwithstandinge, the Pope him selfe saithe of him selfe, *The Emperoure hath no right, nor Authoritie, but onely of mee.* And, touchinge the laste Obiection of Parisiensis, that the Emperoure shoulde be the Popes Seruante, he thincketh, it maie be wel admitted without any greate inconuenience. For thus saithe one of his Prisule Counsel, Iste Romanus Imperator, est Procurator, & Defensor Romanæ Ecclesiæ: *This Romaine Emperour is* (nothinge els, but) *the Procloure, and Stewarde of the Churche of Rome.* Cardinal Hostiensis saithe, Imperator est Feudatarius Romanæ Ecclesiæ: *The Emperoure is a Vasal, or a Feede man of the Churche of Rome.* And Pope Innocentius saithe, Imperator tenet Imperium à Papa. Vnde tenetur præstare Papæ Iuramentum Homagij, scilicet, quod Vasallus præstare solet Domino suo: *The Emperoure holdeth his Empiere of the Pope: And therefore he is bounde to sweare Homage and fealtie to the Pope, as the Vasal is bounde to his Lorde.* I thinke, the Pope wil desire to haue nomore. The Emperoure is brought, to be his man.

Dist. 98. Si Imperator. In Glos. Lapoldus De Iurib Regni & Imperij. In Præc. Extra. De foro competen. C. licet. Iohan. de Parisijs. De Potest. Regia & Papali. Ca. 5.

Likewise saithe Iohannes de Parisijs, Dicunt, quòd solus Papa est Verus Dominus Temporalium: ita vt possit auferre ab alio, quod aliàs suum est: & tenet factum eius, licet peccet. Sed Prælati cæteri, & Principes, non sunt Domini, sed Tutores, Procuratores, & dispensatores: *They saie, that onely the Pope is the right Lorde of Temporal possessions: so, that he maie put any man from his owne. And although he offende in so doinge, yet his doinge taketh place. As for other Bishoppes and Princes, they be not Lordes, but Ouerseers, Bailifes, and Stewardes.*

Therefore Pope Adrian namely thus auaunced him selfe aboue the Emperoure Fredericus. 1. Imperator per nos imperat: Vnde habet Imperium, nisi à nobis? Ecce in Potestate nostra est, vt demus illud, cui volumus: Propterea constituti sumus à Deo super Gentes, & Regna: vt destruamus, & euellamus, & ædificemus, & plantemus: *By meane of vs, the* Emperoure is Emperoure: *For, whence hathe he his Empiere, but of vs? Beholde, it is in our hande, to bestowe the Empiere, vpon whome wee liste. And to that ende are wee placed by God, ouer Nations, and Kingdomes: that wee should destroie, and plucke vp, And builde, and plante.* Suche proude vauntes the Pope maketh of him selfe, without either shame of the worlde, or feare of God.

Auentinus. Lib. 6. Pag. 636.

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuision. 9.

Whiche of the Anciente Learned Fathers, with so precise, and Mathematical

The Pope aboue the Empe-roure.

Mathematical Limitation, euer surueied, and determined you to be seuentie, and seuen times greater then the Mightiest Kinges?

M. Hardinge.

A pleasant Mathematical Diuinitie.

Some mery felowe, or other, whiche thought he might be bolde to speake Mathematically, so he kepte him selfe within compasse, and without iuste reprehension. For where as the spiritual power so farre passeth the Temporal, as the Soule dothe excelle the Body, and the Heauens surmounte the Earthe, as S. Clement saithe, and Gregorie Nazianzene: * you should not so greatly be offended with the seuenty and seuen times greater dignitie, and we neede not condemne him as an Heretike, which woulde be pleasaunt in his algorisme, especially Iohannes Andreæ in the same place referringe the mater to the Astronomers.

Clemens Cō. Apo li. 2. ca. Nazianz Ad popu Nazianz De Mag & Obed Solinz.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Somme Mery felowe, I warrante you, yᵉ saie. And thus, nowe in mirthe, now in sadnesse, yᵉ haue of longe time mocked the worlde, and forced Kinges and Emperours to be your sclaues. As for your newe Doctours, Iacke of Andrewe, and Sir Clement, as you euermore cal him, the Apostles felowe, we weighe them none otherwise, then they be worthy. But, touchinge Gregorie Nazianzene, it is true, that he saith, *The Truthe, and Mighte of Goddes Woorde infinitely passeth al worldly Power.* But, what maketh al this for the Pope, that wallowth onely in his Temporalities, and worldly cares, as wel in Preaching Goddes Worde, and ministringe the Sacramentes, as also in other Spiritual exercises, is as farre inferioure to any meane Priestе, as the Earthe is inferioure to the Heauens?

Iohan. de Parisijs, Ca. 11.

Howe be it, that it maie appeare, what prety Mirthe yᵉ haue made herewith, one of youre owne Felowes saithe thus: Ecclesiastici debent iudicare per contemptibiles, id est, per Laicos, Secundum tenorem, & debitum Terreni Iuris: *The Ecclesiastical Officers, or Bisshoppes, ought to iudge by them, that be Vile, and Contemptible, that is to saie, by the Laie Magistrates, accordinge to the tenoure, and order of the* Temporal Lawe. Here in your Mirthe, and pleasance, in comparison of your selues, ye calle Princes, and Temporal Magistrates, Vile, and Contemptible, and so would ye haue them regarded emonge the people.

Iohan. de Parisijs, Ca. 11.

Againe, yᵉ saie, Patet, Regnum, siue Regimen Regale non esse acceptum à Deo. Sed ipsum solùm permisit indignatus. Et magis esset acceptum Deo, quòd per solum Papam Mundus in omnibus regeretur: *It is plaine, that the state of* kingedome, or kingly gouernement *came not from God, For God onely suffered it in his anger. And it were more acceptable vnto God, that the whole Worlde were in al things gouerned by the Pope alone.* It were good, ye should tel vs, whether ye speake this onely in Mirthe, and Game, or els in earnestе, and good sadnesse.

Isidorus in Cloſ. in Geneſim. Iohan. De Parisijs, Ca. 4.

Verily, when yᵉ so proudely compare the Pope to the Sunne, and the Emperoure to the Moone, youre meaninge is, that as the Moone hathe no lighte, but onely from the Sunne, so the Emperoure hath no Authoritie, but onely, that he receiueth from the Pope. Notwithstandinge, in this comparison, Isidorus youre owne Doctour saithe, yᵉ are sowly ouerseene. For thus he writeth, Per Solem intelligitur Regnum, & per Lunam intelligitur Sacerdotium: *By the* Sunne, *is meante* Kingely Dignitie, *and by the* Moone, *is meante* Priesthoode. Nowe therefore Iacke Andrewe, your mery man, by this reckeninge maie caste your accoumptes backewarde, and saie, The Emperoure *is seuentie, and seuen times greater, then the* Pope.

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuision. 10.

Whiche of the Anciente Fathers euer saide, that more ample Authoritie is geeuen to you, then to the residue of the Patriarkes?

M. Hardinge.

* A whole heape of Vntruthes and forgeries hudled togeather.

* The Fathers of the Nicene Councel, by witnes of * Iulius the firste, who then liued, * and those of the Councel of Sardica, * Athanasius, and the Bishops of Aegipt, Thebaida, and Lybia, and the Fathers of certaine other Councelles.

(a) Vntruthes, without any woorde or shewe of truth.

Aboue al other moste specially the firste Christian Emperoure (a) Constantine the greate. VVho beinge fully instructed of the moste godly and learned Bishops of his time, (a) what authoritie the successour of Peter, had by (a) commission of our Sauiour Christe, thought good by his

(a) Emperial

(a) Emperial Commaundemente and decree, to confirme, ratifie, and for his owne persone to yeelde vnto (b) Blessed Sylvester then Pope, and to his Successours Bishoppes of Rome, the same authoritie, and Superioritie, not onely ouer Bishoppes, and Patriarkes, but also Power and Honour, higher and greater, then that of Kinges, and Emperours. The woordes of (c) his solemne decree in that behalfe made, are these, which as they are founde in sundrie other Greeke writers, so most plainely in (d) Matthæus Hieromonachus. Θεσπίζομεν σύμπασι τοῖς σεβεσμίοις καὶ τῇ συγκλήτῳ τῆς ἡμῶν βασιλείας τὴν Ρώμης ἐπίσκοπον, καὶ διάδοχον τοῦ πρωτοφανοῦς τῶν ἀποστόλων, καὶ κυρίου μου πέτρου, πλείονα τῆς βασιλείας ἔχειν ἐξουσίαν καὶ πᾶσαν τὴν οἰκουμένην, καὶ παρὰ πάντων πολλῷ πλέον ἢ τὸν βασιλέα τιμᾶσθαι καὶ σέβεσθαι, κεφαλήν τε εἶναι τῶν τεσσάρων πατριαρχικῶν θρόνων, κρίνεσθαι τε παρ' αὐτοῦ καὶ διαλύεσθαι τὰ τῇ ὀρθοδόξῳ συμβαίνοντα πίστει. Whiche in our mother tongue is this muche to saie. Wee geue in decree and commaundemente to al Lordes, and to the Senate of our Empiere, that the Bishop of Rome, and the Successour of S. Peter chiefe of the Apostles, haue Authoritie and Power in al the worlde more then that of the Empire is, and that he be honoured and woorshipped more then the Emperour, and that he be Heade of the foure Patriarchal Seates, and that thinges apperteininge to the righte Faithe, be of him iudged and determined. Iustinian the Emperoure likewise made an expresse decree, that the moste Holy Pope of the elder Rome (for these be his very woordes) be taken accordinge to the determination of the Holy Councels, to be the (e) firste and principal of al Bishoppes. It were not harde to allege muche more for prouse hereof, of good and sufficiente authoritie: but in a matter not doubtful this maie suffice.

Constantines Donation.

(b) Vntruth. For Sylvester was dead longe before these maters are imagined to be done.

(c) This solēne Decree is nothing els, but a solemne folie.

(d) For shame: hathe the Pope none other Recorde to proue his Chartar by, but onely one poore, hungrie, forged Grecian, that neuer saw Rome?

(e) Firste, and Principal in Councelles, we confesse: But Lorde and Maister of al other Patriarkes, that woulde be proued.

Iohan. De Parisijs. De Potestate Regia, Cap. 22.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

This is a folie of al folies. Yet is there no folie so greate, but by woordes, and countenance it maie be maintained. It shameth me to bestowe woordes herein: and so mutche the more, for that you saie, the case is so cleare, and out of doubte. **I assure you, M. Hardinge, of al other poure innumerable** Louanian Vanities, **concerninge the practise of the Churche, and storie of time, this one** Vanitie **is the vainest.**

But leste any man, by Simplicitie, or Ignorance shoulde be deceiued, not vnderstandinge the Mysteries of this Donation, or Chartare, **by the iudgement of your owne Doctours, the meaninge thereof is this:** Volunt aliqui quòd ratione huius Doni, Papa est Imperator, & Dominus Mundi: & quòd potest Reges instituere, & Destituere, sicut Imperator: *Somme thinke, that by force, and vertue of this* Donation, *the* Pope *is the* Emperour, *and the* Lorde *of the world: And that hereby he hath Power bothe to set vp, and also to put downe* Kinges, *as an* Emperour. **Therefore I cannot blame you, M. Hardinge, for that you stande so stiffely to this** Donation. **For if ye lose this, ye lose the Empiere of the worlde.**

The Fable hereof is so perished, that the wisest, and beste learned of your very friendes, Platyna, Cardinal Cusanus, Marsilius Patauinus, Laurentius Valla, Antoninus Florentinus, Otho Frisingensis, Hieronymus Paulus Catalanus, Volaterranus, Nauclerus, Capnion, Mullinæus, **and others haue openly reproued it vnto the worlde, and haue written against it, and are mutche ashamed of your folies.**

And, to allege **one in stede of many,** Cardinal Cusanus **hereof hathe written thus:** Donationem Constantini diligenter expendens, reperi ex ipsamet Scriptura manifesta argumenta Confictionis, & Falsitatis: *Aduisedly weighinge this* Donation, *or* Graunte of Constantine, (**whereby the Pope claimeth al his Temporal Power**) *euen in the penninge thereof, I finde manifeste tokens of Falsehed, and Forgerie.*

Nicolaus Cusanus. de Concordantia Catholica. Lib. 3. ca. 2.

Againe he saithe, Sunt, meo iudicio, illa de Constantino, Apocrypha: Sicut etiam fortasiis quædam alia longa, & magna Scripta Sanctis, Clementi, & Anacleto Papæ ascripta. Ipsæ enim Epistolæ, applicatæ ad tempus illorum Sanctorum, seipsas produnt: *By my iudgemente these Chartares of* Constantine *are forged: as perhaps are also other longe, and greate Letters, that beare the name of* S. Clemente, *and* Pope Anacletus. *For the Letters them selues, applied vnto the time of these Holy Fathers, betraie them selues.*

Nicol. Cusa, eodem loco.

Againe, the same Graunte of Constantine, euen in Gratian the Popes owne Register, is founde onely in the Palea, & not in the Original allowed text. And in many Olde Bookes, that haue no Glose, it is not founde. And in the Glose vpon the same it is noted thus, Palea ista non legitur in Scholis: in qua continetur Priuilegium, quod Constantinus concesit Romanæ Ecclesiæ: Scilicet, vt Primatum inter omnes Ecclesias obtineret: This patche *is not read in the Scholes: wherein is conteined the Priuilege,*

Dist. 96. Constantinus.

Glosa eodē loco.

that Constantinus the Emperour *graunted to the* Churche of Rome: *that is to saie, that the saide Churche shoulde haue the Souerauntie ouer al Churches.*

Pius 2. in Dialog.

And, to put the mater out of doubt, euen Pope Pius him selfe thereof saithe thus, Dicta palea Constantinus, falsa est: *The saide patche, that so beginneth,* Constantinus, is starke false. Here, M. Hardinge, the Pope him selfe telleth you, that your Donation, whereby the Pope holdeth his Kingedome, and Triple Crowne, is nothinge els but a false forgerie, craftily clowted vp by some of your Parasites for the purpose. Whereunto Felinus your Canoniste addeth these wordes: Et inuehit contra miseros Legistas, qui laborant in disputando, an valuerit id, quod nunquam fuit: *And the same* Pope Pius *rageth earnestly against the poore Lawiers, for that they take suche paines to reason, whether that thinge maie be good, and anaileable in Lawe, that neuer was made.*

Felinus de Maioritate, & Obedien. Solita. Colum. 3.

And againe, the same Doctours, that woulde séeme moste frendly, and fauourably to speake of this Donation, by theire owne iudgemente, do quite condemne it. For thus they saie, In Donatione illa audita est Vox Angelorum in aëre dicentium, Hodiè Venenum effusum est in Ecclesiam: *At the time of the Conferminge, and passinge of this* Donation, *there was a Voice of Angelles heard in the aire saieinge, This daie Poison is poured into the Churche.* Thus you se, notwithstanding your Donation were good, and true, yet, by the Testimonie of the Angels of Heauen, it were nothinge els, but the poison, and destruction of the Churche of God. Briefly, to touche some parte of the Contentes, & Substance of the same, the foolishe Body, that forged it, was so simple, and voide of witte, that he knewe not whether Constantinople stode in the Easte from Rome, or in the Northe: Whether Byzance were a Cittie, or a Countrie: Whether the Emperial Diademe were made of Silke, or of Coulde. He telleth a tale of the Patriarke of Constantinople, that he should be boner, and buxum to the Bishop of Rome: and yet at that time, when, as he imagineth, the Graunte was made, the Cittie of Constantinople was not builded, nor any suche name as yet knowen in the worlde. Nowe consider also what a special grace this Clerke hathe in the Latine tongue. These be his flowers, Signa, & Banna: Decernere disponenda: Concedere permanenda: Licentiam dare: Equos equitare, &c. And Clericare in his language, is good Latine to make Priestes. This is suche Latine, as, I wil not saie, Constantine him selfe, but Constantines Cooke woulde neuer haue spoken.

In vita Syluestri Iohan. De Paris sijs Cap. 22.

And yet is the Marginal Glose hereupon, as good, and as substantial, as the Text. For, where as the Texte saithe, Contradimus Beato Sylueſtro phrygium nostrum, id est, mitram: *Wee deliuer vnto* Blessed Sylueſter our phrygium, that is to saie, our Miter, there shal you finde this pretty note in the Margine, Nota, quòd Phrygium factum est ex pennis pauonum: *Marke wel, that this* Phrygium, *or Miter, was made of a Peecocks taile.* No doubte, a worthy gifte for an Emperour: and a méete Miter for a Pope. All theise thinges, M. Hardinge, you knowe to be true: and yet haue you a penne, and a mouthe to defende them. But, as I saide before, it shameth me, in so Childish a Fable, to stand so longe.

Concil. Tomo. 1. Pag. 217. Phrygium.

As for your Greeke Doctoure, Hieromonachus, he shalbe stalled together with your Clemens, Leontius, Amphilochius, & other like your worthy and Weighty Doctours. For shame, what shoulde yée bringe vs this one sirly pyze Greeke witnesse, whose name yée neuer hearde before, to testifie of Grauntes, and Conueiances made in Rome? Can your Pope finde out neither Councel, nor Doctour, nor Father, nor any other Writer of likely recorde, to healpe him in so greate a case, but onely one pyze raskal Grecian, that knewe no more of the mater, then you your selues? It bewraieth the nérdinesse of youre cause. He that durste so lewdely to falsifie suche a Graunte, thereby to intrude him selfe into the possession of the Empiere, woulde not blushe to falsifie somme Beggerly Witnesse, to auouche the same.

Nowe, where yée woulde séeme to saie, The other Foure Patriarkes stoode euermore at the Commaundemente of the Bishop of Rome: not onely the saide three Patriarkes, whiche neuer neither yéelded, nor knewe any suche Obedience, but also the general practise of the worlde wil some reproue you.

Nilus De Primatu Romani

Nilus a Greeke VVriter saithe, Vt liquidiùs appareat, Papam non imperare alijs omnibus

omnibus Episcopis, legatur Sextus Canon Synodi Nicenæ, quo disertè præcipitur, vt alijs Ecclesijs Alexandrinus, alijs Romanus, alijs Antiochenus præsit: Vt non liceat alteri, alterius Prouinciam inuadere: *That it maie wel and plainely appeare, that the* Pope *hathe no* Power, *or* Gouernement, *ouer al other Bishoppes, reade the Sixthe Canon of the* Nicene Councel. *There it is expressely commaunded, that the Bishop of* Alexandria *shal haue the rule ouer certaine Churches, and the Bishop of* Rome *ouer certaine, and the Bishop of* Antioche *likewise ouer certaine: And that it shal not be lawful for any one of them, to inuade the* Iurisdiction *of an other.*

The Emperour Iustinian **saithe**, Ecclesia Vrbis Constantinopolitanæ Romæ Veteris prærogatiua lætatur: *The Churche of the* Cittie of Constantinople *enioieth now the prerogatiue of* Rome the Elder. Nicephorus **saithe**, Romano, & Constantinopolitano Episcopo ex æquo paria sunt & dignitatis præmia, & honorum iura: *The title of dignitie, and right of honour, geuen to the Bishop of* Rome, *and the Bishop of* Constantinople, are one, and equal. **So likewise it was determined by Decree in the** Councel of Constantinople: Definimus Sedi Constantinopolitanæ paria Iura, & Priuilegia cum Sede Veteris Romæ: *Wee decree, that the See of Constantinople shal haue Rightes, and Priuileges equal with the See of Olde Rome.* **Nowe consider wel this mater, M. Hardinge. If the** Patriarke of Constantinople **were the Popes** Equal, **howe was he his** Subiecte? **If he were his** Subiecte, **howe was he his** Equal? **Wil shal hardely forge these thinges, to frame togeather. Therefore, as it is saide before,** Gennadius, **togeather with the** Councel of Constantinople, **wrote thus vnto the** Bishop of Rome: Curet Sanctitas tua Vniuersas tuas Custodias, tibique Subiectos Episcopos: *Let your Holinesse see vnto al your owne Cures, and to the Bishoppes that be subiecte vnto you.*

S. Cyprian, Cyrillus, Athanasius, **and others, writinge, either of, or vnto the** Bishop of Rome, **cal him, not their** Lorde, **and** Maister, **vnto whom of duetie they ought** Obedience, **but their** Brother, **and their** Felowe Seruaunte. **Yea the** Pope **him selfe, in somme cases hathe rather offered his** Obedience **vnto other** Bishoppes. **For thus writeth** Pope Liberius **vnto** Athanasius **the** Bishop of Alexandria: Quæso vt huic Confessioni subscribas, vt ego securior efficiar, & tua mandata inhæsitanter obeam: *I beseeche thee, to subscribe to this* Confession, *that I maie be out of doubt,* and maie doo your Commaundementes without grudginge. **Yet nowe the** Bishop of Rome, **to maintcine his** Title **by a** Waie **of** Righte, **for as muche as the** foure principal Patriarkes **of the** worlde **haue forsaken him, appointeth out** foure of his ordinarie Chaplaines, **and geueth them the names of** foure Patriarkes: **The firste for** Constantinople: **the seconde for** Alexandria: **the thirde for** Antioche: **the fourth for** Hierusalem. **And thus, hauinge these foure at Commaundemente, in his pleasante fansie, he ruleth, and gouerneth the whole worlde. In sutche a solemne braueric, the greate** Cham of Tartarie **at this date, after he hathe dined him selfe, soundeth out a** Trumpet, **and geueth al the** Kinges, **and** Emperours **of the worlde leaue to goe to dinner: and in this imagination, and folitte, he continueth his claime to the** possession **of al the worlde, euen by as good right, and title, as doethe the** Pope. **And when so euer the** Pope **him selfe, in his owne persone, openly, and solemnely saithe his** Masse, **he commaundeth the** Gospel, **and** Epistle **to be readde in** Greeke. **Wherupon his owne** Maister of Ceremonies **saithe thus:** Hanc Consuetudinem hinc ortam puto, vt appareat Romanam Ecclesiam in se continere vtramque Gentem: *Hereof I thinke, this Custome firste proceeded, that hereby it maie appeare, that the* Churche of Rome conteineth in it Bothe Nations, as wel Greekes, as Latines.

Al this not withstandinge, Antoninus **saithe,** Hoc Græci non credunt: *For al this, the Greekes beleue it not.*

The obiections of Iustinian, **and of the** Councel of Sardica, **are answeared in my** Former Replie **to M. Hardinge.**

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuision. 11.

Whiche of the Auncient Holy Fathers euer called you Lorde **and** God?

Constantines Donation.

Pontificu. καὶ ὡς ἂν ἔξεσιν ἑτέρῳ τῆς ἀλλοτρίας ἐπιβλεπῖν.

Cod. De Sacros. Eccle. omni innouatione.

Nicephorus. lib. 12. Cap. 13.

Concil. Constant. 2. cap 36. τῷ ἰσῳ ἀπολαβεῖν τρεσβεῖων.

Gennadius ad omnes Metropolitanos. & ad Papam Roman.

Cyprianad Cornelium.

Athanasius ad Epi. Aphricanos Epistola Liberij ad Athanasium.

Ceremonia. li. 3. cap. 7.

Antoni. in Summa par. 3. tit. 22 cap. 6.

Artic. 4. Dist. 8.

Artic. 4. Dist. 7

The Pope is God.

*A vaine forgerie.

* Theſe wordes are ſpoken of Princes and Magiſtrates.

M. Hardinge.

None that wiſe is, ſo ſpeaketh abſolutely: neuertheleſſe in ſomme certaine ſenſe, * S. Clemente calleth euery Biſhop. *Terrenum quendam Deum*, a certaine earthely God, as it is written, * I haue ſaide, yee are Goddes, &c.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

So that yᵗ make not the Pope an Abſolute God, yᵗ thinke, yᵗ mate otherwiſe cal him God ſafely, and without prꝛiudice. A prꝛoper ſhifte, to maintcine a vaine man in the poſſeſſion of his Godhed. In ſutche a pleaſant imagination Antiochus ſometime the Kinge of Syria, entituled him ſelfe by the name of God. So the Emperoure Domitian vſed to aſſigne his Prꝛoclamations: Dominus Deus veſter Domitianus: *Your Lorde God* Domitian. So the Emperour Caligula called him ſelfe, Deum optimum Maximum, & Iouem Latialem: *The beſte, and moſte mightie God, and the greate* God Iuppiter of Italie: So Sapores the greate Kinge of Perſia, called him ſelfe, Fratrem Solis, & Lunæ: *The Brother of the* Sunne, *and the* Moone: So the pꝛuiſhe Phyſition Menecrates called him ſelfe Iuppiter: So Nicoſtratus called him ſelfe Hercules: So Nicagoras made him ſelfe a paire of whinges, and would nꝛdes be called the God Mercurius: So Manichæus the Heretique called him ſelfe the Holy Ghoſt: So the Romaines in olde times erected vp an Image in the honour of Simon Magus the Soꝛcerer, with this Inſcription, Oꝛ Polæ, Simoni Sancto Deo: *In the honoure of* Simon the Holy God. By this your ſo handeſome Diſtinction, M. Hardinge, of God Abſolute, and God not Abſolute, I ſée not, but euery of theſe might wel, and ſafely haue mainteined his title without blame.

Hierony. *in* Daniel. *cap.* 3.

Αντιοχος ὁ θεός.

Suetonius *in* Domitiano.

Suetonius.

Pompon. Lætus

Athenæus, *li.* 7.

Chryſoſt. *de Spi. Sancto.*

Auguſt. Contra Fauſtum, *Lib.* 13. *cap.* 17.

Euſeb *li* 2 *ca* 13.

Diſt. 96. Satis euidenter.

Chriſtoph Marcel. *in Con. Laterа. Seſſ.* 4.

Cardillus *pro Concil. Trident.*

Iudith 5.

Certainely, in this arrogante vanitte, ſcarcely any of al theſe was euer comparable to the Pope. Pope Nicolas ſaithe, Conſtat Summum Pontificem à Pio Principe Conſtantino Deum appellatum: *It is wel knowen, that the* Pope, *of the Godly Prince* Conſtantine, *was called* God. Likewiſe the Pope was wel contente, to ſuffer one of his Paraſites to ſaie vnto him, in the late Councel of Laterane, Tu es alter Deus in terris: *Thou arte an other* God *in Earthe.* Likewiſe Cardillus the Spaniarde in Defenſe of the Popes late Chapter at Tridente, oftentimes calleth the Pope, Terrenum Deum: An Earthely God. By the ſame ſtile, and righte, whereby Holophernes ſommetime ſaide, Nabuchodonoſor eſt Deus Terræ: Nabuchodonoſor *is the* God *of the Earthe.*

Upon the Popes owne Clementines, yᵗ ſhal finde the mater thus taken vp, and qualified with greate indifferencie, and modeſtie, & thus ſpecially noted in the Margine, *Papa nec Deus eſt, nec Homo. And, to leaue other his like blaſphemous, and fonde ſtiles, in an other like Gloſe yᵗ ſhal finde it written thus, Credere, Dominum Deum noſtrum Papam non potuiſſe ſtatuere, prout ſtatuit, Hæreticum cenſeretur: *To beleue, *that* Our Lorde God the Pope *might not decree, as he decreed, it were a mater of Hereſie.* Here haue wᵗ founde by expreſſe, and plaine wordes, euen in the Popes owne Authentical, and allowed Booke, Our Lorde God the Pope.

Extrauag. Iohan. 22. Cùm inter in Cloſſa. Impreſſ. Lugduni. An. 1555. Pariſijs. An. 1513.

* Theſe thinges might ſéeme vncredible, had not S. Paule foꝛetolde vs, that the Man of Sinne ſhoulde ſitte in the Temple of God, and ſhewe him ſelfe, as if he were God. S. Gregorie, writinge of Antichriſte, ſaithe thus, Cùm ſit damnatus Homo, & nequaquam Spiritus, Deum ſe eſſe mentitur: *Whereas he is a damned man, and not a Spirite, by lieinge, he faineth him ſelfe to be God.* Anſelmus ſaithe, Simulabit ſe Religioſum, vt ſub ſpecie decipiat Pietatis: Imo ſe Deum eſſe dicet: & ſe Adorari faciet: atque Regna Cœlorum promittet: Antichriſte *ſhal faine him ſelfe to be Holy, that he mait deceiue menne vnder the Colour of Holineſſe. Yea, and he ſhal cal him ſelfe* God: *and ſhal cauſe him ſelfe to be* Woorſhipped: *and ſhal promiſe the Kingedome of Heauen.* Nowe telle vs, M. Hardinge, who euer did, oꝛ attempted to dꝛw theſe thinges, but onely the Pope.

2. Theſſalon. 2. Gregor. *in* Iob. *ca* 34. *li* 25. *ca* 14 Anſelmus *in* 2. Theſſalon. 1.

Euſebius ſaithe, Hoc eſt Argumentum, eos odiſſe Deum, quòd velint ſeipſos appellari Deos: *This is a token that they hate* God, *for that they wil haue them ſelues called by the name of* God.

Euſebius de Præparat. *li.* 7.

Δεῖγμα τὸ τῶν τῆς θεο-ἐχθείας, τὸ

Likewiſe ſaithe the Ancient Father Irenæus, Antichriſtus exiſtens Apoſtata, & Latro, quaſi Deus, vult Adorari: & cùm ſit Seruus, Regem ſe vult præconiari: Antichriſte,

θέλῃ σφᾶς ἀυτοὺς θεοὺς ἀναγορεύεσθαι.

tichriſte, beinge a Renegate, and a Theefe, yet wilbe Woorſhipped as a God: and, beinge but a ſlaue, yet he wilbe Proclaimed, and publiſhed, as a Kinge. Therefore, although the Pope be not, as you ſaie, an Abſolute God, or an Abſolute Chriſte, yet without any greate inconuenience, I trowe, he maie wel be an Abſolute Antichriſte.

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuiſion. 12.

Whiche of the Auncient Holy Fathers euer ſaide, that you are not a mere Natural man, but a certaine Subſtance made, and grouen togeather, of God and Man?

M. Hardinge.

Can you bringe him before his face, that ſhal ſaie ſo vnto him? I warrante you (Maiſter Defender) he ſhal either be reproued for his flatteringe, or proued to vnderſtande no more by it, then *a certaine diuine power aboue the Natural ſtate of men, * or warned, that he be more circumſpecte in his gloſinge, when Hereſikes are ready to ſlaunder the whole Churche, becauſe of one priuate mannes affection.

* A fainte excuſe.
+ A certaine Diuine Power in the Pope.
* A ſore puniſhmente for open Blaſphemie.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

He that maie calle him ſelfe, Lorde, and God, maie eaſily Claime him ſelfe to be more, then a Man. In the Popes owne Decretalles, it is noted thus in the Margine, Papa non eſt Homo: The Pope is not a Man. Your Gloſe vpon the Popes owne Clementines, allegeth theſe wordes out of one of your allowed Poetes, Papa ſtupor Mundi: *The Pope is the Woonder of the Worlde.* And againe, Nec Deus es, nec Homo: quaſi neuter es inter vtrunque: *Thou arte neither God, nor Man: In a manner thou arte neither of bothe: but rather a meane betweene bothe.*

In Sexto: De Electione. & Electi. Fundamenta. In Gloſſa. Clemen. In Proœmio. In Gloſſ.

By the Authoritie of this Doctoure, it appeareth, that the Pope is neither God, nor Man. Angel, I trowe, he is not. What other Creature yée maie make of him, I leaue to you further, to conſider. But bringe him foorthe (yée ſaie) that thus hathe ſpoken. Bringe him before the Popes face, that he maie be pouniſhed. For he ſhalbe warned, as he is, to be more circumſpecte in his gloſinge. So cruelly, M. Hardinge, yée pouniſhe, and tormente, and crucifie them, that enleaſe a poore miſerable ſinful creature with the glorious name of God Immortal.

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuiſion. 13.

Whiche of the Inciente Fathers euer ſaide, that you are the onely Headſpringe of al Lawes?

M. Hardinge.

VVho ſo euer ſaithe it, ſpeaketh not without euident reaſon, conſideringe that of the principal of euery gouernemente, al lawes, belonginge to the ſame, be deducted and deriued.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Here haue yée brought vs a ful ſimple reaſon, as God knoweth. But to haue brought vs ſomme Authoritie of Doctoure, or Councel, it had benne better. Wée haue no doubt of your pretty reaſons. Wée demaunded onely, VVhiche of the Anciente Fathers euer ſaide ſo?

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuiſion. 14.

Whiche of the Anciente Fathers euer ſaide, that you haue Povver ouer Purgatorie?

M. Hardinge.

* O that ye woulde firſte beleue a Purgatorie, and then ſhoulde ye vnderſtande, what diſpenſation of looſinge and bindinge is committed to the Vicare of Chriſte. For, as Eſaie ſaithe, Excepte yee beleue, ye ſhal not vnderſtande: and the conſequente doctrine muſte needes be obſcure, as longe as the principal grounde thereof is wickedly denied.

Eſa. 7.

* No doubte, it were a worthy mater. VVIſely.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Of youre Purgatorie fantaſies, wée haue ſufficiently ſaide before. Where yée wiſhe, wée would beleeue, there is a Purgatorie, Verily wée beleeue conſtantly, what ſo euer God hathe willed vs to beleeue. S. Paule ſaithe, *Faithe commeth by hearinge: Hearinge commeth by the* VVoorde of God: and thereby onely is Faithe directed. As for your Folies, and Mockeries, they are ſubiecte to Fanſie, and not to Faithe. S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Nemo de Chriſto credat, niſi quod de ſe credi voluit, Chriſtus: *Let no*

Roman. 10. Augu. De Tempore Sermon. 143 Item. 3. Paſchat.

The Popes Povver ouer the Angelles of God.

man beleue of Christe, but that, that Christe hathe commaunded him to beleue of Christe. Againe he saithe, Constat Fidem stultam non prodesse, sed potiùs obesse: *It is certaine, that* Fooliſhe Faithe *doothe no good, but rather hurteth.* Notwithstandinge thoughe al your Liſtes, and gaineful Territories of Purgatorie were fully graunted, yet shoulde it be very harde for you to proue, either by Scripture, or by Doctour, that the Pope beareth any greater Authoritie, or Swea there, to commaunde in, or out at his pleasure, then any other simple Prieste. Al be it, one of youre allowed Doctoures saithe, Purgatorium est peculium Papæ: *Purgatorie is the peculiare possession of the* Pope. I trowe, as beinge a College onely of his owne Fundation.

Augustin. in quæstionib. veteris Testam. quæ. 43. Angelus Paris. insis.

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuision. 15.

Whiche of the Auncient Fathers euer saide, that you are hable to Commaunde the Angelles of God, as yee liste your selfe?

M. Hardinge.

*Vntruthe, manifest. As shal appeare.

Nor olde Father, * nor newe Doctour. And what so euer he be, that shal so tel you, beleue him not. He speaketh not Catholikely: and you muste make no scruple in suche maters.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Here, at laste, M. Hardinge, for shame, yée are faine to yélde. No Doctour (yée saie) euer thus saide, neither Olde, nor Newe. Howe be it, hereto yée haue laide a very good exception, with a special sauinge: If any man haue so saide (saie yée) what so euer he were, he spake not Catholikely. And yet againe yée tel vs further, Howe so euer it be, wee shoulde neuer be scrupulous in suche maters.

But, what if the Pope him selfe, the Father of al Fathers, and Doctoure of al Doctours, bothe Newe, and Olde, haue not blushed to saie the same? Nate wée saie, as you saie, The Pope him selfe was not Catholique? Or, if wée so saie, wil you beleue it?

Herodotus.

In deede Kinge Xerxes, the greate Kinge of Persia, when he had brought ouer his huge Armie into Græcia, sent out his letters of defiance vnto the great Mounte Athos, that is in Macedonia, and commaunded him to stande stil, and not to sturre a foote, nor to worke any displeasure, either to him selfe, or to his Armie, vpon paine of his highe indignation. Euen by like Authoritie, and with as good discretion, the Pope hathe vsed to sende out his Preceptes, and Princely Summones, to commaund Angels, Archangels, and al the Powers of Heauen, to comme, to goe, to fetche, to carrie, and to be ready do do his wil. Therefore is he the better contente, to beare his friendes tel him thus, Tibi data est omnis potestas, supra omnes potestates, tam Cœli, quàm Terræ. Qui totum dicit, nihil excludit: *To thee is geuen al manner of Power, aboue al Powers, as wel of Heauen, as of Earthe. He that saithe,* Al, *excepteth nothinge.*

In Concil. Lateranen. sub Leone 10. Sess. 10. Extra. De Constitutionib. Statuta Canonum.

Felinus your Doctour saithe thus, Ne dum circa Cœlestia, Terrestria, & Infernalia Papa gerit Vicariatum Christi, sed etiam super Angelos, Bonos, & Malos: *The Pope hathe Christes Lieutenantship, not onely ouer thinges in* Heauen, *ouer thinges in* Earthe, *and ouer thinges in* Hel, *but also ouer the* Angels, bothe Good, and Badde.

Felin. Felinus eodem loco.

Innocentius the Pope him selfe saithe, Vicario Creatoris omnis Creatura Subiecta est: *Vnto the Creatours Lieutenante euery Creature is Subiecte.* Youre owne Doctour Antoninus, the Archebishop of Florence, saithe, Potestas Papæ maior est omni alia potestate creata, aliquo modo extendens se ad Cœlestia, Terrestria, & Infernalia: vt de ea verificari possit, quod dictum est, Omnia Subiecisti sub pedibus eius: *The* Popes Power *is greater, then any other Power, that God euer made: and after a sorte stretcheth it selfe vnto thinges in* Heauen, *thinges in* Earthe, *and thinges in* Helle: *so that, of that* Power *the woordes maie be verified, that are written by the* Prophete Dauid, *Thou haste made al thinges subiecte to his feete.* Camotensis saithe, Papa Angelis præcepit, & potestatem habet in Mortuos: *The* Pope *commaundeth the* Angelles (of God) *and hath Power ouer the Deade.* Gregorius Haimburgensis saithe, Vt terminis vtar suorum Adulatorum, Papa Angelis habet imperare: *To vse the woordes of his Flatterers, the* Pope *hathe* Power *to commaunde the* Angelles. Therefore, if any man happen to die vpon the waie, as he passeth in Pilgrimage towardes Rome, Pope Clemente 6. commaundeth the Angelles of God, to be at hande, and to carrie his soule immediately into Heauen.

Antoni. in Sum. par. 3. titu. 22. Cap. 5. ante §

Agrippa de Vanitate Scientiarum.

Gregor. Haimburgen. in Appellatione Sigismundi Ducis Austriæ.

Hereto

The Pope Kinge of Kinges.

Vesalius. Agrippa de Vanitate Scientiar.

Hereto, and to al other the like, M. Hardinge saith, These Popes, these Doctours, these Fathers, these Pages, these Parasites, in these poyntes were not Catholique.

Notwithstandinge, he saithe further, If the Pope for his sause, take some what vpon him, and sommetimes be a litle ouer bolde with Gods Angels, to Commaunde them, and Countermaunde them, at his pleasure, in sutche cases we ought not to be ouer scrupulous.

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuision. 16.

Whiche of the Auncient Fathers euer saide, that you are the Lorde of Lordes, and Kinge of Kinges?

M. Hardinge.

He vseth the cleane contrarie Title, callinge him selfe *Seruum Seruorum Dei*, the Seruante of the Seruantes of God. Yet if he, for the largenesse of his Iurisdiction, haue a number of Lordes and Kinges within his folde, although he him selfe doothe not boaste of it, yet in a right good sense, that Title maie be geuen to him.

In a righte good sense.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Notwithstandinge the Pope cal him selfe the Kinge of Kinges, and the Lorde of Lordes: Notwithstandinge he saie, The Emperour is so far inferiour vnto him, as the Moone is inferiour vnto the Sunne: Notwithstandinge he saie, The Emperour is but his Bailife, his Stewarde, and his Man: Notwithstandinge he saie, He hath power to set vp, and to put downe Kinges, and Emperours at his pleasure. Yet, saithe M. Hardinge, Al this maie be spoken in righte good sense: for the Pope vseth a cleane contrarie Title, and calleth him selfe, *Seruum Seruorum Dei*, The Seruante of Goddes Seruantes. Thus he thinketh it sufficiente, to weighe maters onely by Title, and not by Truthe.

Extra. De Maiorita. & obedientia. Solitæ. Dist. 58. Si imperator. In Glossa. Auentinus in Adriano.

Howe be it, al this is but plaieinge vnder a Visarde. The Diuel seldome sheweth his hornes: but rather changeth him selfe into an Angel of Lighte. Touchinge this Title, as the Pope calleth him self a Seruant, euen so doth the Emperour likewise abase him selfe to the name of a Seruante. If ye doubte hereof, reade your owne Glose vpon your Decretals. The wordes there be these: Etiam Imperator seipsum appellat Seruum: Likewise againe the same Glose saithe, Papa se Seruum appellat, & Imperator vocat se Seruum Vltimum Ecclesiæ: *The* Pope *calleth him selfe a* Seruante, *and the* Emperour *calleth him selfe the* Vilest Seruante *of the Churche.*

2. Corinth. 11.

In Decretal. Gregor. in Præmio. In Glossa.

Al this is nothinge els, but a politique kinde of dissimulation, and Hypocrisie. For if these be Seruantes in deede, I praie you then, who be the Lordes?

Extra. De Frebend. & Dignitatib. Iohan. 22. Execrabilis. In Glossa. Iohan. de Parisijs. cap. 13. August. de Verbis Apostoli.

Heruæus, one of your owne Doctours, hereof saith thus, Dicere, quòd talia dicunt Summi Pontifices ex Humilitate, est omninò pernicioſum. Et hoc est ponere os in Cœlum. Philosophus dicit, hoc esse peccatum Ironiæ, quod opponitur virtuti. Et addit, tales humiles non esse virtuosos, sed timidos, & blanditores. Et Augustinus ait, Cùm Humilitatis causa mentiris, si non eras peccator antequam mentireris, mentiendo peccator efficeris: *To saie, that the* Pope *spake these wordes of* Humilitie, *it were very hurteful. And this is, To set the face againste the Heauens.* Aristotle *saithe, This is the sinne of* Dissimulation, *or* Hypocrisie, *whiche is contrarie vnto vertue. And saithe further, that* sutche humble menne are not vertuous, *but feareful, and flatteringe. And* S. Augustine *saithe, When so euer thou speakest vntruthe vnder the colour of* Humilitie, *if thou were not a sinner before, yet by tellinge vntruthe thou arte made a Sinner.*

Epistola Nicolai Papæ. Inter Decreta Adriani Papæ. Concil. Tomo. 1. In Purgatione Sixti.

Good Reader, pul of this painted Visarde: and vnder this vaine Title of, Seruant of Seruantes, thou shalt finde a Lorde of Lordes: and sutche a Lorde, so Lordelike, and so princely, as seldome thou shalte finde emonge the Heathens. For proufe hereof, thus the Pope him selfe saithe, *Neither* Emperoure, *nor* Kinge *maie iudge the* Pope. And his reason is this, Non est Seruus supra Dominum: For (the Emperour beinge a) Seruante, is not aboue (the Pope, that is) his Lorde.

Thus præ sæ, he that so humbly calleth him selfe the Seruante of Seruantes, if præ touche him, or anger him, wil suddainely change him selfe into the Kinge of Kinges, and Lorde of Lordes. For in these wordes he plainely, and expresselye calleth the Emperour the Seruante, and him selfe the Lorde. And, what so euer be saide to the contrarie, verily the Popes Exposition muste nedes be more Authentical, then M. Hardinges.

He maketh the Emperoure to holde his Stirope: He maketh the Emperoure to leade his Bridle: He maketh the Emperour to kisse his Foote: He maketh the Emperour to lie downe groueling, and setteth his foote on his Necke: And yet stil calleth him selfe, The Seruante of Seruantes. Fewe good Seruantes wilbe so homely with their Maisters. Doctoure Bonner saithe thus, *Notwithstandinge the Pope be a very Rauninge Woulfe, dressed in Sheepes clothinge, yet he calleth him selfe,* The Seruante of Seruantes.

Doct. Bonner in Præfa. in Libel. Stephani Gardiners, De Vera Obedientia.

The Apologie, Cap. 7. Diuision. 1.

Wee can also goe further with you in like sorte. What one, emongest the whole number of the Olde Bishoppes, and Fathers, euer taughte you either to saie Priuate Masse, whiles the people stared on, or, to lifte vp the Sacramente ouer your heade, in whiche pointes consisteth nowe al your Religion: Or els, to mangle Christes Sacramentes, and to bereue the people of the one parte thereof, contrarie to Christes Institution, and plaine expresse woordes? But that wee maie once comme to an ende: What one is there of al the Fathers, whiche hathe taughte you to distribute Christes Bloude, and the Holy Martyres Merites, and to selle openly your Pardonnes, and al the roumes, & lodginges of Purgatorie, as a gainful kinde of marchandise.

M. Hardinge.

Your obiections of Priuate Masse, of liftinge vp the blessed Sacramente, of ministringe the Communion vnder one Kind, be as common with you, as Lise be with Beggars, and Lies with Heretikes. For in deede your questions be but beggerly and heretical. Touchinge the same, I haue saide (a) so muche in my answeare to M. Iewel your nearest frinde his Chalenge, as here to rehearse it againe, it is needelesse. You maie seeke it there. The Doctrine of Pardonnes I iudge verily you vnderstande not. Here is no oportunitie to discusse it. The ful treatise of the same requiringe a longe processe, maie wel to an other time be differred. Of Purgatorie I haue saide some deale here before. These be the maters, wherein you and your ignorant felowe ministers gladly shewe your vile railinge, and scoffing eloquence. Yet concerninge the Doctrine of Pardonnes (b) leaste I seeme to saie nothinge, this much I haue thought good to saie here.

(a) Note, that M. Hardinge, in his saide three Articles of Answeare to M. Iewel, hath publisshed three scoare & niene greate Vntruthes.

Artic. 1. 4.

Fol. 117.

(b) And al the same is lesse then nothinge.

In the Sacramente as wel of Baptisme, as of penaunce, al the bandes of sinne are loosed, and the whole euerlastinge paine due to sinne is forgeuen. At Baptisme no temporal paine is enioined to vs, because Christe moste freely bestoweth the benefite of his deathe vpon vs at our firste entrie into the Churche. (c) But if afterwarde wee abuse his mercie, returninge againe to filthy sinne, Christe would our seconde, thirde, and al other reconciliations from thence foorthe, to be with due satisfaction, not of his dreadful anger, (whiche onely his bloude, and the Sacramente of penaunce, by due contrition and confession in deede or in vowe receiued, is able to remoue) but with satisfaction of suche temporal paine, as his merciful iustice required bothe of al others from the beginninge, and (d) namely of Kinge Dauid: To whom confessinge his faulte Nathan saide, Our Lorde hathe put awaie thy sinne, thou shalt not die. Beholde the forgeuenesse of the Mortal sinne, and of the euerlasting paine due to the same. But yet so is it forgeuen, that withal it is transferred into a temporal satisfaction. VVhat was that? It foloweth in the storie, that because Dauid through his aduouterie and murther had caused the enimies of God to blaspheme his holy name, the childe borne of the wife of Vrias shoulde surely die. And so it came to passe. If the deathe of a sonne be so greeuous a pounishment to a good Father, that Kinge Dauid was contente to praie, to faste, to lie on the grounde, afflictinge him selfe seuen daies, onely to trie whether he might as it were by exchaunge bye out this deathe of his Sonne, and yet so could not obteine his desire: we maie be moste certaine, that the very best frindes of God, sinninge after Baptisme (or circumcision, whiche in the olde lawe stoode in place thereof) muste by ordinary course satisfie with some temporal affliction that iuste iudgemente of our merciful Maker, and Redeemer, if farther grace be not founde by some other waie. This satisfaction hath bene therefore iustely called the thirde and laste parte of penaunce. VVhiche if it be not fulfilled in this life, vndoubtedly it shalbe straightly exacted in the worlde to come in the fire of Purgatorie. For that sinnes maie be in an other worlde forgeuen to those who die not in the deadly bondes of them, (e) our Sauiour hathe geuen vs to vnderstand, saieinge, That the sinne against the Holy Ghoste shal not be forgeuen, neither in this worlde, nor in the worlde to come, whereof it appeareth that some other sinnes maie be forgeuen in the worlde to come.

2. Reg. 12.

(c) Vntruthe auonched vpon Christe. See the Answeare.

Matth. 12.

VVel, this satisfaction maie notwithstandinge be fulfilled more then one waie. For a man beinge

The Popes Pardones.

beinge once by the Sacramente of penaunce iuſtely reconciled to the myſtical Body of Chriſte, which
Eſa. 118. is his Churche, wherein (as the Prophete ſaithe) a faithful man is made partaker of al that feare God and keepe his commaundementes: wee haue in that bande of peace ſuche an vnitie of Spirite communicated to vs al, that the defecte of one maie be in ſpiritual cauſes (f) ſupplied out of the plenty of al others his felowe members, accordinge as the Apoſtle ſaithe, (g) Beare ye one an others burdens.
Gala. 6. And becauſe the Heade (whiche is Chriſte) is the chiefe member of al, and farre more then al the reſt, ſuche influence is from him deriued throughout his myſtical Body, that euen his deathe maie as wel inwardly by charitie, as outwardly by an other waie alſo be applied to vs for the pardoninge of that temporal ſatisfaction, whiche after the Sacramente of penaunce is lefte vnforgeuen. And that is by ſuche authoritie, as Chriſte gaue to Peter, ſayinge: To thee I wil geue the Keies of the Kingedome of
Matth. 16. Heauen, and what ſo euer thou bindeſt in Earthe, it ſhalbe bounde alſo in Heauen, and what ſo euer thou (h) looſeſt in Earthe, it ſhalbe looſed alſo in Heauen. Lo, what ſo euer Peter looſeth in Earth, it ſhalbe looſed in the ſighte of God. If therefore the Pope, who ſucceedeth Peter, doo by iuſte cauſe looſe not onely the mortal ſinne by the Sacramente of penaunce, but alſo the bande of Temporal paine, whiche remaineth, yet due to the ſinne: it is vndoubted, that ſuche paine is looſed in the ſight of God. The cauſe of looſinge muſte be, not onely the wil of the Pope (who is put in authoritie to builde, and not to deſtroie: to diſpenſe, and not to lauiſhe) but a reaſonable change of recompence ſubſtituted in that behalfe, ſuch as apperteineth to the Honour of God, or to the profite of ſoules: As mainteininge warre and fightinge againſte infidels for the defence of Chriſtendome, recouery of the Sepulchre of Chriſt, ſuccoringe widowes, Orphanes, and other poore perſons, the buildinge or mainteininge of Holy places, the viſitinge of Priſons and Martyrs toumbes, or any like Deuoute and Charitable deedes. VVhich whiles the Faithful Chriſtian doth obediently performe (although otherwiſe the thinge enioined be not great) he maie obteine remiſsion alſo of that temporal ſatisfaction, which
1. Cor. 5. was lefte in penaunce vnremitted. This kinde of Pardon S. Paule gaue to that notorious ſinner, who at Corinth had his Fathers wife, and was for that faulte ſeparated from the Churche of God, to be afflicted temporally in his fleaſhe. But when the Corinthians had informed S. Paule of his earneſt and true repentance, and had ſhewed theire owne fauour and good willes towarde him: the Apoſtle anſweareth, VVhom ye forgeue ought, I alſo (forgeue) for I alſo in that I haue forgeuen, if I haue forgeuen ought, for your ſakes in the perſon of Chriſte, I haue forgeuen it. VVel, we are aſſured the Apoſtle ſpeaketh of forgeuinge ſuche afflictions, as the partie was in, by reaſon he was deliuered out of the defence of holy Churche, to that ſtate, where the Diuel, as S. Chryſoſtome vpon that place noteth,
2. Cor. 2. *Pro ſolutione Peccatorum*, for payment of his ſinnes, might vexe him: and wherein ſuche perſones
2. Cor. 5 beinge put to their penaunce, vſed to remaine for a certaine ſpace of moneths or yeeres, vntil their pe-
Leuit. 25. naunce were donne and expired. Nowe the reconcilinge of the man not yet hauinge donne due ſatisfaction before his ordinarie time is a pardon. VVhiche the Apoſtle ſaith, he dothe geue in the perſon of Chriſte, as hauinge auctoritie of him to doo it: and for the Corinthians ſakes, as who were able by their Holy Praiers and common ſorowe (whereof the Apoſtle ſpeaketh) to make recompence for that whiche lacked on the behalfe of his owne ſatisfaction. If this muche doo not ſatisfie any man, deſiringe to be fully reſolued herein, let him reſorte to the Latine woorkes of that holy and learned Biſhop of Rocheſter.

(f) A folie paſſinge al other folies.

(g) A texte ful wiſely applied to prooue Pardonnes.

(h) O fond man Chriſte ſaithe, VVhat ſo euer thou looſeſt in Earthe, and not in Purgatorie.

And thus M. Hardinge awaked out of his dreame.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Theſe obiections, yée ſaie in your pleaſante homely compariſon, are as common with vs, as Life with Beggars. **And yet to my remembrance, neither youre** Priuate Maſſe, **nor your** Halfe Communion **was euer touched in this whole** Apologie, **more then once, before this place: the** Liftinge vp, **or** Shewinge of the Sacramente, **not once at al. Yée ſhoulde haue weighed your aduantages better, M. Hardinge, before yée thus beſtowed your lothſome quarrelles.**

But thought you in déede, M. Hardinge, I wil not ſaie, as you ſaie (that with ſo Lowſy, and Beggerly, but) that with ſo poore, and ſimple ſtuffe yée ſhoulde be hable to mocke the world: Many fonde tales both you, and your felowes haue ſent vs ouer: but a fonder tale, then this tale is, of your Pardonnes, **and** Purgatories, **yée haue ſent vs none. I muſte ſaie to you, as** S. Auguſtine **ſommetime ſaide to** Iulianus **the** Pelagian **Heretique:** Neceſsitate compellitur Talibus pannis indui tam magna etiam Veſtra ſuperbia: *Your Pride, be it neuer ſo greate, euen for very poore neede, and beggerie, is faine to couer it ſelfe with ſuche ſoary clowtes.*

Auguſti. contra Iulianum, Lib. 5. cap. 1.

I beſeeche you, conſider, how aduiſedly, & reuerently ye vſe Gods Holy VVorde. **Thus you ſaie,** Nathan **ſaide vnto** Dauid, Our Lorde hathe put awaie thy ſinne: thou ſhalt not die: Chriſte ſaith, *The ſinne againſt the Holy Ghoſte ſhal not be forgeuen, neither in this Worlde, nor in the Worlde to comme:* **Or, as** S. Marke **ſaithe,** *He that ſinneth againſt the* Holy Ghoſte, *hathe no remiſſion* for Euer: *but ſhalbe guilty of* Euerlaſtinge Sinne: S. Paule **ſaithe,** *Beare yee one an others burthen:* Chriſte **ſaithe to** Peter, *To thee wil I geue the Keies of the Kingedome of Heauen, &c.* S. Paule **ſaid of him, that had liued in ſhameful in-**

2. Reg. 12. Matthe. 12. Marci. 3. Galat. 6. Matth. 16.

ful incestе with his Fathers wife, *Let such a one be geuen ouer to Satan.* Theise be your Scriptures, M. Hardinge: ful properly applied, and to good pourpose: herein ye ful discretely, and Learnedly Conclude thus: *Ergo*, The Pope hathe a warrante sufficiente to graunte his Pardonnes, and that, as wel to the deade, as to the quicke.

1. Cor. 5.

O, M. Hardinge, God is not to be mocked: Feare his Iudgementes: Abuse not his Name, or VVoorde in vaine. Ful wel you knowe, that neither Dauid, nor Nathan, nor Christe, nor Paule were Pardonmongers. What should I further saie to him, that with so greate a countenance, and so mutche adoe, can saie nothinge? Let S. Augustine briefly answeare al these vanities. Thus he saithe, Hoc quid est aliud, nisi diligenter pro humana suspicione contendere, & Scripturas Sanctas negligenter attendere? *What thinge els is this, but stoutely to striue for mannes fansie: and negligently to consider* Goddes Holy VVoorde?

August. De Ciuit. li. 13. ca. 24.

The Prophete Dauid, vpon whom ye woulde seme to grounde these folies, answereth you thus, Narrauerunt mihi iniqui fabulationes: Sed non vt Lex tua Domine: *The wicked haue tolde me many foolishe tales: But, O Lorde, their tales are nothinge to thy Lawe.* S. Augustine, if he were nowe aliue, woulde saie of other your Predecessours, O Vanitas, vendens Vanitatem, Vanitatem audituris, Vanis, & Credituris: *O Vanitie, sellinge Vanitie, to them that wil heare Vanitie: and Vaine are they, that wil beleeue it.*

Psalm. 118.

August in Li. 50 Homil. Hom. 36.

Leo saithe, In hanc insipientiam cadunt, qui cùm ad cognoscendam Veritatem aliquo impediuntur obscuro, non ad Propheticas voces, non ad Apostolicas Literas, nec ad Euangelicas Authoritates, sed ad semetipsos recurrunt: *Into this folie they falle, that, when they be hindered by somme darkenesse from the knowledge of the Truthe, goe not to the Voices of the Prophetes, nor to the Writinges of the Apostles, nor to the Authorities of the Gospelles: but onely haue recourse vnto themselues.*

Leo ad Flauianum. Epist. 10.

Nowe, somme what to saie particularely of the mater, touchinge your Pardons, your owne Doctoure Sylvester Prierias, Maister of the Popes Palaice, writeth thus: Indulgentiæ Authoritate Scripturæ non innotuere nobis: Sed Authoritate Ecclesiæ Romanæ, Romanorumque Pontificum, quæ maior est: *Pardonnes are not knowen vnto vs by the Authoritie of the Scriptures: But by the Authoritie of the Churche of Rome, and of the Popes, whiche is greater, then the Authoritie of the Scriptures.*

Sylvester Prierias contra Luthe.

Therefore, M. Hardinge, by this Doctoures iudgemente, it was greate folie to allege so many Scriptures for proufe of your Pardonnes. For here ye are taught in good sadnesse, that your Pardonnes can neuer be proued by any Scriptures. It had benne mutche better for you, to haue alleged onely the Popes Authoritie. For that, as your Sylvester teacheth you, farre passeth al the Authoritie of the Scriptures.

Roffensis saithe, Ego respondeo, non satis certò constare, à quo primùm Indulgentiæ tradi cœperint. Apud Priscos vel nulla, vel certè quàm rarissima fiebat mentio de Purgatorio. Quàm diu autem nulla esset cura de Purgatorio, nemo quęsiuit Indulgentias. Nam ex illo pendet omnis Indulgentiarum ęstimatio. Si tollas Purgatorium, quorsum Indulgentijs opus erit? Cœperunt Indulgentiæ, postquàm ad Purgatorij Cruciatus aliquandiu trepidatum est: *Thou? answeare: It cannot wel appeare, from whom* Pardonnes *firste beganne. Emonge the Olde Doctours, and Fathers of the Churche, there was tither no talke at al, or very litle take of* Purgatorie. *But as longe, as* Purgatorie *was not cared for, there was no man that soughte for* Pardonnes. *For the whole price of* Pardonnes *hangeth of* Purgatorie. *Take awaie* Purgatorie, *and what shal wee neede of* Pardonnes? Pardones *beganne, when folke were a litle fraide with the paines of* Purgatorie.

Roffensis contra Lutherum. Volydor. De Inuentorib. Lib. 8. Cap. 1.

Iohannes Maior saithe, De Indulgentijs pauca dici possunt per certitudinem, quia Scriptura de illis expressè non loquitur. Nam quod dicitur Petro, Tibi dabo Claues, &c. certum est, quòd oportet intelligere illam Authoritatem cum sale. Fatuæ ergo & Superstitiosæ sunt quędam Indulgentiæ viginti millium annorum: *Of* Pardones *litle maie be saide of certaintie: for the* Scripture *expressely saith nothinge of them. Touchinge that Christ saithe vnto* Peter, *Vnto thee wil? gene the Keies &c. wee must vnderstand this Authoritie with a corne of Salte* (other wise it maie be vnsauery). *Therefore certaine of the* Popes Pardonnes, that promise twentie thousande yeeres, are foolishe, and Superstitious.

Iohan. Maior. in 4. Sent. Dist. 20. quæst. 2.

Your

The Popes Pardõnes.

Your Schoole Doctours them selues were wonte sommetime to saie, Inuentio Indulgentiarum est pia fraus, & dolus non malus, quò populus officioso errore trahatur ad Pietatem: *The diuisinge of* Pardonnes *is a godly guile, and a hurteleſſe deceite: to the intente, that by a deuoute kinde of errour the people maie be drawen to godlineſſe.* *Veſelus.*

Here, M. Hardinge, you sée, the Antiquitie, Authoritie, and beste countenance of your Pardonnes: That they flowed firste out of the sinkes of your Purgatorie, as one Clanitie floweth out of an other: You sée, that your Pardonnes sometimes maie be Superstitious, and ful of folie: You sée, that the Sale of youre Pardonnes is a Godly guile, and a deuoute kinde of errour, to leade the people. This is the faireſt colour, yée can diuise, to laie vpon it. But miserable is that people, that thus muste be leadde by guile, and errour.

Alphonsus de Castro saithe, Nulla res est, quàm minùs apertè Sacræ Literæ prodiderint: & de qua minùs vetusti Scriptores dixerint. Non est mentio vlla de Indulgentijs: *There is nothinge that the* Scriptures *haue leſſe opened, or whereof the Old Learned Fathers haue leſſe written, then of* Pardonnes. *Of* Pardonnes (in the Scriptures, & Doctours) there is no mention. *Alphons. de Castro. Li. 8. Indulgentiæ.*

Of the shameleſſe Marchandize, and Sales hereof, many Godly men haue complained, yée haue turned Godlineſſe into gaine: and, as S. Peter saithe, *Throughe couetouſneſſe, by fained ſpeache, yee haue made Martes, and Marketes of the people.* One of your owne friendes saithe thus, In multis Breuibus continentur tot Indulgentiæ, vt boni Viri mirentur, vnquam de Conscientia Papæ, vel alicuius boni viri potuisse illa procedere: *In many of their Bookes there are conteined ſo many daies, and yeers of* Pardone, *that good menne marueile, that they coulde euer comme out, by the conſente either of the Pope, or of any other good man.* 1. Timoth. 6. 2. Petri. 2. *Opus Tripart. coniunctum cum Concil. Lateran. Lib. 3. Cap. 8.*

To conclude, wée will saie with S. Augustine, Fratres, Iesum Christum Iustum habemus Aduocatum apud Patrem. Ipse est propitiatio pro peccatis nostris: Hoc qui tenuit, Hæresim non fecit: Hoc qui tenuit, Schisma non fecit. Vnde enim facta sunt Schismata? Cùm dicunt homines, Nos iusti sumus: Nos Sanctificamus immundos: Nos iustificamus impios: Nos petimus: Nos impetramus: *My Brethren, wee haue Ieſus Chriſte the Righteous our Aduocate with the Father. He is the Propitiation, or* Pardonne *for our ſinnes. He that helde this, neuer made Hereſie: He that helde this, neuer made Schiſme. For whereof doo Schismes comme? Hereof they comme: when menne saie,* (as now the Pope saithe) *Wee are righteous: wee doo make Holy the vnholy: wee doo iuſtifie the Wicked: wee doo Praie: wee doo obteine* Pardonne *for others by our Praier.* *Augu. in Epist. Iohan. Tract. 1.*

The Apologie, Cap. 8. Diuision. 1.

These menne are woonte to speake mutche of a certaine secrete Doctrine of theirs, and of theire manifolde and sundrie readinges. Lette them therefore bringe foorthe sommewhat nowe, if they can, that it maie appeare, they haue at leaſte readde, or doo knowe sommewhat. They haue often stoutely noised in al corners, where they went, that al the partes of theire Religion be very Olde, and haue benne approued, not onely of the multitude, but also by the consent, and continual obseruation of al Nations, and times. Let them therefore once in their life, shewe this their Antiquitie: Let them make appeare to the eie, that the thinges, whereof they make suche a doo, haue taken so longe, and large encreaſe: Let them declare, that al Christian Nations haue agreed by consente to this their Religion.

Nay, nay, they turne their backes, as wee haue saide already, and flee from theire owne Decrees, and haue cutte of, and abolished againe within a shorte space, the same thinges, whiche but a fewe yeeres before, them selues had eſtablished, for euermore, forsoothe, to continewe. Howe shoulde one then truste them in the Fathers, in the Olde Councelles,

celles, and in the woordes spoken by God. They haue not, good Lorde, they haue not (I saie) those thinges, whiche they boaste, thei haue: they haue not that Antiquitie, they haue not that Vniuersalitie, they haue not that Consent, neither of al places, nor of al times. And though they haue a desire rather to dissemble, yet they them selues are not ignorant hereof: yea, and sommetime also they let not to confesse it openly. And for this cause they saie, that the Ordinaunces of the Olde Councelles, and Fathers be sutche, as maie nowe, and then be altered, and, that sundrie, and diuers Decrees serue for sundrie, and diuers times of the Churche. Thus lurke they vnder the name of the Churche, and beguile seely creatures with their vaine glosinge. It is to be marueiled, that either menne be so blinde, that they cannot see this: or, if they see it, that they can be so patiente, so lightly, and so quietly to beare it.

M. Hardinge.

Here is muche a doo, and as some saie, greate boaste, and smal roaste: many woordes, litle matter. The sense of these woordes (if I be not deceiued) resembleth M. Iewelles chalenginge sprite, as like as an Ewe resembleth a sheepe. VVhat we can bringe foorthe, we saie not. *Neither thinke we it necessarie at your requeste, to shewe, what we haue readde, and what we knowe. Boasting and bragginge shewes we leaue to you: that you require, hathe benne sufficiently declared otherwheres. Al thinges are not to be saide at al times. Yet twoo of your lowde lies beside other that you make here, I wil be so bolde, as to discouer. The Decrees of the late Tridentine Councel (for that is it that you meane) although they be not yet in al places moste exactely obserued, yet be they not repealed, cut of, and abolished againe, as you saie.

* It is good policie, for him, that hathe nothing to shewe, to holde his peace.

* And what a fowle lie is that other, where you saie, that our selues acknowledge and confesse openly, that the Faithe and Doctrine, whiche wee holde, is not Ancient, and Vniuersal, for times, places, and consente of al? VVhat els meane wee, when wee chalenge vnto vs and claime the Catholike Faithe? but this is your accustomed slender Rhetorike, when prouses and argumentes of truthe saile you, to vse the figure of impudente lyinge, and saie, that wee our selues confesse it to be true, whiche you impute vnto vs. VVhat so euer you saie in this place, wee maie of righte retourne it euer to you. So wee doo, and so take you it, &c. And for oughte that I can see yet, as our Synagog had of late the beginninge, so it is like shortely to make an endinge.

* For trial hereof, consider only the wordes of Roffensis Maior, and Alphonsus, alleged in the former Diuisiō.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Of al these woordes, and others moe, so vaine, as many, there is not one woorde woorthe the answeringe. What affiance M. Hardinge, and his friendes haue in their Antiquitie, it maie appeare by the laste Diuision.

The Apologie, Cap. 9. Diuision. 1.

But, whereas they haue commaunded, that those Decrees shoulde be voide, as thinges nowe waxen too olde, and that haue loste theire grace, perhaps they haue prouided, in their steede, certaine other better thinges, and more profitable for the people. For it is a common saieinge with them, that, If Christe him selfe, or the Apostles vvere aliue againe, they coulde neither better, nor more Godly gouerne Goddes Churche, then it is at this presente Gouerned by them. They haue put sommewhat in theire steede in deede: but it is chaffe in steede of vvheate, as Hieremie saith: and such thinges, as according to Esaie the Prophetes woordes, God neuer required at theire handes. They haue stopped vp (saith he) al the vaines of the cleare springing vvater, and haue digged vp for the people deceiueable, and puddelike pittes, ful of mire, and filthe, vvhiche neither haue, nor are hable to holde pure vvater. They haue plucked awaie from the people the Holy Communion, the VVoorde of God, from whence al comforte

Hierem. 23. Esai. 1.

shoulde

Christes gouernemente no better then the Popes.

should be taken, the true VVoorshippinge of God also, and the right vse of Sacramentes, and Praier: and haue geeuen vs of theire owne to plaie withal in the meane while, Salte, VVater, Oile, Boxes, Spittle, Palmes, Bulles, Iubilees, Pardonnes, Crosses, Sensinges, and an endelesse rabble of Ceremonies, and (as a man might terme them with Plautus) pretty games to make sporte withal.

M. Hardinge.

Raile and reuel whilesye wil, the Churche is gouerned by (a) woorde, and by (a) discipline. If Christe him selfe or his Apostles were aliue againe, the woorde, that is to saie (b) the Doctrine of our beleefe, nowe preached and receiued in the Catholike Churche (b) neither shoulde be altered, (b) nor coulde be bettered. (b) For it is the same, he taught him selfe. And that we doubte not of it, accordinge to his promise, he hath sente the holy Ghoste, to enforme the Churche of al truthe. Remember you not who saide, I am God, (c) and am not changed? againe, that the woorde of God remaineth for euer? *Mark. 3. Esai. 11.*

This beinge true, it is euidente, that we haue the sounde and weighty wheate, whiche no persecution of tyrauntes, no blastes of Heretikes, no contagion of euil manners, for these fiftene hundred yeeres coulde either blowe from the floore of our Lordes berne, the Churche, or corrupt. VVee haue accordinge to the Apostles counsel, keapte that hath benne committed vnto vs. VVee haue enioyed the fountaine of the water of life. *Apocalip. 3.*

Yee charge vs soare, that wee haue plucked awaie from the people the holy communion, the VVoorde of God, the true woorshippinge of God, the righte vse of the Sacramentes, and Praier. VVho so euer taketh these siue awaie, wherein chiefly standeth our Saluation, the same (d) is Antichriste. VVere not that yee haue already donne so muche for vs, as the worlde maie take you for impudente liers, wee woulde not quietly beare so greeuous a matter. But nowe, that yee haue tried your selfes so false of your woorde, wee litle esteeme it: your railinge is no slaunder. Lastly concerninge praier, what hathe benne ordeined by our holy forefathers (e) of al ages, directed with the sprite of God, for the maintenance and encrease of it to Goddes honoure, al that in fewe yeeres by the instincte of Sathan, to promote his Kingedome, yee haue vtterly abolished, and by wicked violence brought the people from (f) deuotion to a careleste idleneste, from speaking to God with hartes and lippes, to (f) a spiritual dumneste, from praiers (f) to chapters, from holy thinkinge to (f) vnprofitable harkeninge.

Ye can not abide Salte, VVater, Oyle, Palme, the Crosse, Incense, &c. no maruel. No more can not the Deuil, who possesseth you, and rideth you, and after his owne wil driueth you from truthe, from Christen Religion, and from al Godlines. VVere it so that your sprite coulde awaie with those thinges, then were it not agreeinge with his sprite. Vntil yee geue place to the sprite of God, who maie driue out of you the spirite of Sathan, wee looke to heare no better tidinges of you.

(a) But the Pope vseth nether of them bothe.
(b) Vntruthes, without either measure, or regarde of shame
(c) O folie. The Change is in you, and not in God.
(d) The Gospel in your mouth. For al these siue thinges the Pope hathquite taken awaie.
(e) Vntruth. For your Barbarous vnknowen Praiers, in the time of the Anciente Learned Fathers, were neuer knowen.
(f) Vntruthes ioined with opē Blasphemie.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Ye were somewhat angrie, M. Hardinge, when ye thus besturred your selfe. It pitieth me in your behalfe. Christe, and his Apostles (**ye saie**) neuer ruled the Churche in better order, then it is now ruled by the Pope, and his Cardinalles. **Euen so mighte they haue saide, that had tourned** *The House of God into a Caue of Theeues.* **One of your frendes saith,** Apostolorum temporibus rudis adhuc erat Ecclesia: *In the time of the Apostles, the Churche as yet was rude, and Barbarous, and out of order.* **And, beinge afterwarde reproued for his blasphemous speache, he answeared lewdely in his pleasance.** *Matth. 21. Lauonius De Vtraque Specie, Iacobus Andreæ aduersus Hosium. Pag. 70. Dist. 19. Sic omnes.*

Rudis, indigestaque moles.

Others of you saie, Christus in Cœlo præsidet: Papa in Terris residet: *Christe ruleth in Heauen: the Pope in Earthe.* **An other saithe,** Omnes Sanctiones Sedis Apostolicæ sic accipiendæ sunt, tanquam ipsius Diuina voce Petri firmatæ: *Al the Lawes of the Apostolique See of* Rome *muste so be taken, as if they were confirmed by the Diuine voice of* Peter *him selfe.* **An other saithe,** Sicut ostium regitur Cardine, ita Ecclesia Romana regitur Consilio Cardinalium: *As the doore is ruled by the hooke, so is the Churche of* Rome *ruled by the Counsel of* Cardinalles. *Andreas Barbarius Siculus ad Bessarionem. Polydor. Vergil. de Inuentoribꝰ. Lib. 4. Ca. 9. Ceremoniar. li. 1. sect. 8. Ca. 6.*

Therefore the Pope him selfe saithe thus vnto them, Vos eritis Senatores vrbis, & Regum similes, veri Mundi Cardines, super quos militantis ostium Ecclesiæ voluendum, & regendum est: *Yee shal be the Senatours of my Cittie, and like vnto* Kinges, *the very hookes, and staies of the worlde, vpon whom the very doore of the Churche Militante muste be turned, and ruled.* **Suche are they, whome S. Hierome imagineth thus to**

saie, Non est vir in domo. Non est Christus Corporaliter in Ecclesia. Surgens enim à mortuis, Ascendit in Cælum: nobisq; Ministerium gubernandæ Ecclesiæ, suam, videlicet, Domum reliquit: *My Husbande is not at home. (That is to saie) Christe is not nowe Corporally in the Churche. For, beinge risen from the deade, he is Ascended into Heauen: and hath leafte vnto vs the gouernement of his* Churche: *that is, the whole orderinge of his* House.

Hierony. in Prouerb. 7.

Malach. 3. Psal. 118. Matth. 15. Malach. 2.

True it is, as you saie, *God is one, and is not changed. And his Woorde endureth for euer.* But the Change is in you, M. Hardinge, and not in God. Goddes Worde is the Worde of Life: your Worde is the Worde of Vanitie. God the Father hathe not planted it: Therefore it shalbe plucked vp by the rootes. God saith by the Prophete Malachie: *The lippes of the Priest shal keepe knowledge: and the people shal require the Lawe at his mouthe. For he is the Angel of the Lorde of Hostes.* Vos autem recessistis de Via, &c. But you are gonne backe from the VVaie: you haue offended many a one in the Lawe: you haue broken the Couenante of Leui, saithe the Lorde of Hostes. And therefore haue I made you to be despised.

Ye haue changed the moste parte of the Apostles Doctrine: And of al, that euer they ordeined, ye haue in a manner leafte nothinge standinge. S. Bernarde saithe of your owne Churche of Rome, A planta pedis vsq; ad verticem Capitis, non est sanitas vlla: *From the sole of the foote, vnto the Crowne of the heade, there is not one whole place.* And yet ye beare vs strongely in hande, that Christe, and his Apostles neuer ruled the Churche in better order, then it is nowe ruled by the Pope, and his Cardinalles.

Bernard. in Conuersione Pauli.

Al the reste of youre emptie talke is answeared sufficiently before. Yet one pange of your eloquence, I maie not in any wise leaue vntouched. Thus ye saie, By the instincte of Satan, yee haue brought the people from deuotion to careleſſe idleneſſe: from speakinge to God with hartes, and lippes, to a spiritual doumbeneſſe: from Praiers, to Chapters: from Holy thinkinge, to vnprofitable hearkeninge. If I were not wel acquainted with your spéche, M. Hardinge, I coulde not thinke, ye woulde so vnaduisedly bestowe your wordes. I doubte not, but euen hereby it shal soone appeare, whether of vs hathe wilfully broken the Apostles Orders, and refused the Godly examples of the Holy Primitiue Churche of God. Ye telle vs, that the Readinge of the Scriptures vnto the people, in the Churche of God, is a Spiritual doumbeneſſe, and a thinge vnprofitable, as onely deuised of our selues, and that, as you saie, by the instincte of Sathan, and neuer before, either knowen, or vsed by any Catholique Learned Father.

So litle regarde you, what you saie. Any man, that hathe benne conuersante in the Ancient Fathers, maie easily reproue your folie.

Origen. in Iosua Homil. 15.

Origen saithe, Iudaicarum Historiarum Libri traditi sunt ab Apostolis, Legendi in Ecclesijs: *The Bookes of* (the Olde Testamente, whiche are called) *the storie of the Iewes, were deliuered by the Apostles, to be* readde in the Churches.

Dionysius Eccle. Hierar. Ca 3. ἀγιογράφων ἐλέτων ἀνάγνωσις.

Dionysius saithe, Deinde ordine habetur Sacrorum Librorum Lectio: *Afterwarde folowe in order the Lessons of the Holy Bookes.*

Iustinus Martyr Apologia. 2.

Iustinus Martyr saithe, Die Solis omnes, qui in oppidis, vel in agris morantur, vnum in locum conueniunt: Commentariaque Apostolorum, vel Prophetarum Scripta leguntur. Deinde, is, qui præest, admonet omnes, & hortatur, vt ea, quæ lecta sunt, bona, imitentur. Deinde surgimus omnes, & comprecamur: *Upon the Sondaie, the Christian people, that dwel in towne, or Countrie, meete togeather in one place.* There the Epistles of the Apostles, or the Prophetes VVritinges are pronounced vnto vs. *Afterwarde, he that is the Chiefe, or Minister, warneth, and exhorteth al the reste, that they wil folowe those good thinges, that thei haue heearde readden. That donne, wee rise vp al, and praie togeather.*

Cyprian. Lib. 2. Epist. 5.

S. Cyprian saithe, Lector personat Verba sublimia: Euangelium Christi legit: A Fratribus conspicitur: Cum gaudio Fraternitatis auditur: *The Reader soundeth out the highe, and Heauenly Woordes: He readeth out the Gospel of Christe: He is seene of the Brethren: He is heearde with ioie of (al) the Brotherhoode.*

Concil. Constantinopo. 5. Actio 1.

The Fathers in the Councel of Constantinople saie thus, Tempore Diptychorum cucurrit omnis multitudo cum magno silentio circumcirca Altare, & audiebant: *At the time of Readinge* (of the Chapter) *al the multitude of the people with greate silence drewe rounde aboute the Aultare, or Communion Table, and gaue eare.*

Concil. Laodice. Can. 16.

In the Councel of Laodicea it is written thus, In Sabbatis Euangelia cum

alijs

Reading of Chapters.

alijs Scripturis legi conuenit: *Vpon the Sabbothe daie it is conuenient, that the* Goſpels, *and other* Scriptures *be readde* (**in the Churche vnto the people**). Leo **ſaith**, Solennitati Sacratiſsimæ Lectionis ſubiungatur exhortatio Sacerdotis: *After the ſolemne Readinge of the moſte Holy Leſſon, let there ſilowe the Sermon, or Exhortation of the Prieſte.*

Leo, de Reſurrectione Domini, Sermo. 2.

S. Chryſoſtome **ſaithe**, Stat Miniſter, & Communis Miniſter, & alta voce clamat. Poſt illam vocem Lector incipit Prophetiam Eſaiæ: *The Miniſter, and Common Miniſter ſtandeth vp, and crieth out with lowde voice* (**ſaieinge**, keepe ſilence, and geeue eare). *After that, the Reader beginneth the Propheſie of* Eſaie. S. Ambroſe **ſaithe**, Non poſſum ego à me facere quicquam: ſicut audio, & iudico. Audiſtis Lectum: Ego non accuſo vos: Moſes vos accuſat: Audiſtis Lectum: (Chriſte **ſaithe**) *I cannot doo anye thinge of mee ſelfe: As I heare, ſo I iudge.* Ye haue hearde it readden: *I accuſe you not: it is* Moſes, *that accuſethe you.* Yee haue hearde it readden.

Chryſoſtome Homil. 19.

Ambroſ. Lib. 5. Epiſt. 20. Iohan. 5.

S. Auguſtine **ſaithe**, Audiſtis, cùm Euangelium legeretur: Modò, cùm legeretur, ſi intenti fuiſtis Lectioni, Audiſtis: Audiuimus in Lectione, quæ lecta eſt, Fratres dilectiſsimi: *Yee hearde, when the* Goſpel *was* readde: *Ye hearde erewhile, when it was* readde, *if yee gaue eare to the* Readinge: *Dearely beloued, wee haue hearde in the* Leſſon, that hathe benne readde.

Aug. in Pſal. 36. Auguſt. in. 50. Homil. Hom. 49. Auguſt. de Tempore, Sermo. 2.

Hereby, I thinke, it maie appeare, that the Readinge of Leſſons, **and** Chapters, **is no Newe Diuiſe in the Churche of God.**

And yet wil you tel vs, M. Hardinge, that al this is onely a Spiritual doumbneſſe, **and an** vnprofitable Hearkeninge, broughte in by the inſtincte of Sathan, to promote his Kingedome? **Or if you dare ſo to tel vs, muſte wee beleeue you?**

Verily, Iſidorus **ſaith**, Lectio eſt non parua audientium ædificatio. Vnde oportet, vt quando Pſallitur, Pſallatur ab omnibus: quando Oratur, Oretur ab omnibus: quando Lectio legitur, facto ſilentio, æquè audiatur à cunctis: The Leſſon (**in the** Church) bringeth great profite to the hearers. *Therefore, When Singinge is, let al Singe togeather: When Praier is, let al Praie togeather:* And, when the Leſſon, or Chapter is readde, let ſilence be made, and let al heare togeather. Tertullian **ſaith**, Coimus ad literarum Diuinarum Commemorationem: Fidem Sanctis Vocibus paſcimus: Spem erigimus: Fiduciam figimus: *We comme togeather to the readinge of the Holy Scriptures: Wee feede our Faith with thoſe Heauenly Voices: We raiſe vp our affiance: Wee faſten our hope.* **Againe he ſaithe,** Vbi fomenta Fidei de Scripturarum Lectione? *Where is the feedinge of Faithe, that commeth by the open pronouncinge, and Readinge of the Scriptures?*

Iſidor. de Eccleſ. Offic. li. 1. ca. 10

Tertullian, in Apologetico. Tertullian. ad Vxorem, Li. 2.

Origene **ſaithe**, Non fuiſſet neceſſarium, Legi hæc in Eccleſia, niſi ex his ædificatio aliqua audientibus præberetur: *It had not benne Neceſſarie to haue theſe thinges readde in the Churche, onleſſe thereof might growe ſomme profite to the hearers.*

Origen, in Leuiticum. Hom. 5.

Leo **ſaith**, Sacram Dominicæ Paſsionis Hiſtoriam Euangelica, vt moris eſt, narratione decurſam, ita omnium veſtrum arbitror inhæſiſſe pectoribus, vt vnicuique audientium, ipſa Lectio quædam facta ſit viſio: *I thinke, that the Holy ſtorie of oure Lordes Paſſion, whiche we, as the manner is, haue readde vnto you, is ſo faſtened vnto al youre hartes, that the very hearinge it ſelfe vnto euery of the Hearers is a kinde of ſeeinge.* Chryſoſtome **ſaithe, The manner was, that before euery ſutche** Leſſon, **or** Chapter, **the Miniſter ſhoulde ſaie vnto the people, with a loude voice,** Attendamus: *Let vs Marke.*

Leo de Paſſione Domin. Serm. 19.

Chryſoſt. in Acta Homil. 19.

S. Auguſtine **ſaithe**, Epiſtolæ Apoſtolicæ, non tantùm illis Scriptæ ſunt, qui tempore illo, quo ſcribebantur, audiebant, ſed etiam nobis. Non enim ob aliud in Eccleſia recitantur: *The Apoſtles Epiſtles were not written onely to them, that hearde them at the ſame time, when they were written, but alſo to vs. For to none other pourpoſe are they readde openly in the Churche.*

Auguſt. Contra Creſconium, li. 1 Cap. 9.

This therefore is no Spiritual Doumbneſſe, **M. Harding: This is no** Vnprofitable Hearkeninge: **This is no** Inſtincte, **or** VVoorke of Sathan. S. Auguſtine **ſaith,** Vide Formicam Dei: Surgit quotidiè: Currit ad Eccleſiam Dei: Orat: Audit Lectionem: Hymnum cantat: ruminat, quod audit: Apud ſe cogitat: recondit intùs grana electa de Area: *Beholde Goddes Emote: Shee riſethe daiely: Shee rennethe to the Churche of God: Shee Praieth: Shee* heareth the Leſſon, *or* Chapter: *Shee ſingeth the Pſalme: Shee cheweth, or remembrethe, that ſhee hathe hearde: Shee muſeth vpon it within her ſelfe: And*

Aug. in Pſal. 66.

Readinge of Chapters.

Within Shee laieth vp the Cornis choſen from the floore.

Nowe maie you bethinke your ſelfe, M. Hardinge. Howe can you ſo vainely ſaie, that the Readinge of the Holy Scriptures, or Chapters is a newe diuiſe in the Churche of God? You ſæ, al the Ancient Learned Fathers with one conſente beare witneſſe againſte you. What ſhal wæ thinke, is the VVoorde of God, if the Hearinge of Goddes Worke, be the VVoorke of Sathan? What wil you cal Spiritual ſpeakinge in the Churche, if the Publiſhinge of Goddes Holy Will, be Spiritual Doumbeneſſe? Acknowledge your errour. Gæue glorie to God. What wiſe man wil beléeue you further?

But, here maie you calle to minde, the Spiritual Speaches, and Heauenly ſoundes of your Churches. There maie you heare, Aue Mater Anna, plena melle Canna: Dic nobis Maria, quid vidiſti in via? And at the Halowinge of your Agnos Dei, in commeth a Poſte in haſte, and ſweatinge, and telleth the Pope, Domine, Domine, Domine: Iſti ſunt Agni nouelli, qui annuntiauerunt Allelua. Modò venerunt ad fontes &c. Here is prety geare to comforte the Conſcience, as good, as a ſonge of Robin Hoode. Better were it for you, to ſitte doumbe in the Churche of God, then thus to ſpeake.

Durandus. Li. 6. Sabbato ſancto.

Your Churches, your Churches, M. Hardinge, are ful, not onely of Spiritual, but alſo of Corporal, and Horrible doumbneſſe. Of al, that is ſaide, or donne there, be it neuer ſo londe, the poore Godly People knoweth nothinge. S. Auguſtine ſaith, Si intellectum mentis remoueas, nemo ædificatur, audiendo, quod non intelligit: *If yee remoue the vnderſtandinge of the minde, noman is edified, or taketh profite by hearinge, that he cannot vnderſtande.* Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Perdiderunt audiendi laborem, & tempus. Nam qui non intelligit, quod audit, perdit quod audit: *They haue loſte bothe theire laboure in hearinge, and alſo the time. For he, that vnderſtandeth not, that he heareth, looſeth the thinge, that he heareth.* Therefore the Pope him ſelfe in his Pontifical, gæueth this ſpecial Charge vnto the Reader, Stude Lectiones Sacras diſtinctè, & apertè proferre ad Intelligentiam, & ædificationem fidelium: *Endeuoure thee ſelfe to pronounce the* Holy Leſſons (or Chapters) *diſtinctly, and plainely* (not to a Spiritual doumbeneſſe, but) *to the vnderſtandinge, and profite of the Faithefol.*

Auguſt. de Gen. ad Literam. Li. 12. Ca. 8.

Chryſ. in Matth. Hom. 131.

In Pontificali.

Touchinge the Prayers, that the ſimple people maketh in a tongue vnknowen, Chriſte ſaith, *This people honoureth me with their lippes: But their hartes are farre from mee.*

Matth. 15.

The Apologie, Cap. 9. Diuiſion. 2.

In theſe thinges haue they ſet al theire Religion, teachinge the people, that by the ſame, God maie be duely pacified, Spirites be driuen awaie, and mennes conſciences wel quieted.

M. Hardinge.

VVhat ſhal I ſaie to al this, but that ye lie? I would ſaie, as the manner is, Sauinge your woorſhippes: but that your often and vnſhameſaſte lieinge hath quite taken awaie from you al opinion of honeſtie. Al Chriſtes Religion whiche wee profeſſe, conſiſteth not in theſe thinges, * neither by theſe be mens conſciences quieted. By certaine of theſe, euil and impure ſprites be driuen awaie in deede. VVhiche here by ſundrie Auncient recordes and Teſtimonies I woulde declare to be moſte true, were it not wel yenough knowen by daily experience. But as for you, whereas neither Breade, nor VVater, nor Croſſe drieth you awaie, it ſeemeth yee are woorſe to be coniured, then the deuil him ſelfe. Many of your ſecte Catholike Princes haue founde ſo ſtubborne, as they coulde yet neuer ridde theire Countries of them, but by coniuration of fire.

**Vntruthe. For hereby ye profeſſe to quiet mennes conſciences. Reade the anſweare.*

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Yæ ſaie, yee neuer ſought to quiet mens Conſciences by Oile, VVater, Palmes, &c. And therefore ye ſtande vp a tippe toe, and in your familiare manner, crie oute, yee lie. For ſhorte trial hereof, one example maie ſuffiſe, in ſtæde of manye. Auguſtine Steuchus, one of your ſpecial, and worthy Doctoures, ſaithe thus, Aquas Sale, & Orationibus Sanctificamus, vt ad earum Aſperſum noſtra deleantur delicta: *Wee halowe Water with Salte, and Prayers, that by the Sprinklinge thereof our ſinnes maie be foregeeuen.* Reade your owne Pontifical: and ye ſhal finde in the halowinge of your VVater, your Aſhes, your Palmes, your Candels, &c. this clauſe euermore in the ende, Vt ſint nobis ad Salutem Animæ, & Corporis: *That they maie be to vs to*

Augu. Steuchus in Librum Numeror. Ca. 19. Sinnes foregeeuen by Holy VVater.

In Pontificali.

the

Readinge of Chapters.

the Saluation of Body, and Soule.

Whereas in the ende yee vaunte your selfe of your Crueltie, and so pleasantly make Sporte with the Bloude of poure Brethren, take it not for ill, if I answeare you with the wordes of Salomon, Viscera impiorum crudelia: *The bowelles of the wicked be alwaies cruel.* Therein, M. Hardinge, standethe poure greatette puissance. If yee were no better armed with Fire, and Swerde, then yée be with Scriptures, and Doctours, no wise man woulde greatly feare your force. Prouerb. 11.

Wée maie saie of you, as Cardinal Cusanus saithe of the Turke, Omnium, quæ in Alchorano continentur, vltima resolutio est Gladius: *The laste resolution and trial of al thinges that are conteined in the* Alchoran, *is the Swerde.* Nicola. Cusan. Cribrationum. Li. 3. Ca. 3.

As for vs, wée maie answeare you nowe, as S. Cyprian sommetime answeared the Heathens: Nobis ignominia non est, pati à Fratribus, quod passus est Christus: neque vobis gloria est, facere, quod fecit Iudas: *It is no shame for vs, to suffer of our Brethren the same violence, that Christe suffered: neither is it any praise for you, to doo the same thinge, that* Iudas *did.* Cyprian. Li. 1. Epist 3.

Tertullian saithe vnto youre Fathers, Crudelitas vestra, gloria nostra est: Semen est Sanguis Christianorum: *Your crueltie, is our glorie: The Bloude of Christians, is the seede of the Gospel.* I praie God, al that innocente Bloude, that hathe benne sheadde in this cause, be not required at your handes *in the daie of Wrathe, and at the declaration of the iuste iudgemente of God.* Tertullian in Apologetico. Roma. 2.

The Apologie, Cap. 10. Diuision. 1.

For these, loe, be the orient coloures, & Pretious sauoures of Christian Religion: these thinges doothe God looke vpon, and accepteth them thankefully: these muste comme in place to be honoured, and must put quite awaie the Institutions of Christe, and of his Apostles. And, like as in times paste, when wicked Kinge Ieroboam had taken from the people the righte seruinge of God, and had brought them to woorship the Goulden Calues, leste perchance they mighte afterwarde change theire minde, and slippe awaie, geatinge them againe to Ierusalem to the Temple of God there, he exhorted them with a longe tale, to be stedfaste, saieinge thus vnto them: O Israel, these Calues be thy Goddes. In this sorte commaunded your God, you should woorship him. For it should be wearisome, and troubulous for you, to take vpon you a iourney so farre of, and yeerely to goe vp to Ierusalem, there to serue, and honour your God: Euen after the very same sorte, when these menne had once made the Lawe of God of none effecte, through theire owne Traditions, fearinge that the people shoulde after warde open theire eies, and fal an other waie, and shoulde somewhence els seeke a surer meane of their Saluation, Iesu, how often haue they cried out, This is the same woorshippinge, that pleaseth God, & which he straitly requireth of vs, and wherewith he wil be turned from his wrathe: that by these thinges is conserued the Unitie of the Churche: that by these al sinnes be cleansed, and consciences quieted: and that, who so departeth from these, hath leafte vnto him selfe no hope of Euerlastinge Saluation. For it were wearisome, and troublous (saie they) for the people to resorte to Christe, to the Apostles, and to the Anciente Fathers, and to obserue continually, what their wil, and commaundement should be. This, yee maie see, is to withdrawe the people of God from the weake Elementes of the worlde, from the Leauen of the

Scribes, and Phariſeis, and from the Traditions of menne. It were reaſon, no doubte, that Chriſtes Commaundementes, and the Apoſtles were remoued, that theſe theire heſtes, and deuiſes might comme in place. O iuſte cauſe, I promiſe you, why that Ancient, and ſo longe allowed Doctrine ſhould be nowe abolished, and a newe Forme of Religion be brought into the Churche of God.

M. Hardinge.

It ſhoulde haue becomme Scoggin, Patche, Iolle, Hary Patteſon, or VVil Sommer, to haue tolde this tale muche better, then your Superintendentſhips. And if ye woulde needes haue plaied the parte your ſelues, it had bene more conuenient to haue done it on the ſtage, vnder a vices cote, then in a booke ſet abroade to the worlde in defenſe of al your new Engliſhe Church, ye ſhall neuer make any reaſonable man beleeue your Scoffinge tale. VVe eſteeme litle your railinge comparison, with your ſpiteful woordes, and ſo muche deuliſhe villany.

The Apologie, Cap. 10. Diuiſion. 2.

And yet, whatſoeuer it be, theſe menne crie ſtil, that nothinge ought to be changed: that mens mindes are wel ſatisfied herewithal; that the Churche of Rome, the Churche, which cannot erre, hath decreed theſe thinges. For Sylueſter Prierias ſaithe, that the Romiſhe Churche is the Squire, and Rule of Truthe, and that the Holy Scripture hath receiued from thence Authoritie, and Credite. The Doctrine, ſaithe he, of the Romaine Churche, is the infallible Rule of Faithe, from the vvhiche the Holy Scripture taketh her force. And indulgences, and Pardonnes (ſaithe he) are not made knovven to vs by the Authoritie of the Scriptures, but thei are made knovven to vs by the Authoritie of the Romaine Churche, and of the Biſhoppes of Rome, vvhiche is greater, then the Scriptures. Pigghius alſo letteth not to ſaie, that without the licence of the Romaine Churche, wee ought not to beleeue the very Plaine Scriptures. Muche like as if any of thoſe, that cannot ſpeake pure, & cleane Latine, and yet can babble out quickely, & readily a litle ſomme ſuche Lawe Latine, as ſerueth the Courte, would needes holde, that al others ought alſo to ſpeake after the ſame waie, that Mammetrectus, & Catholicon ſpake many yeeres agoe, and whiche themſelues doo yet vſe in pleadinge in Courte: for ſo maie it be vnderſtoode ſufficiently, what is ſaide, and mennes deſires maie be ſatisfied: and that it is a fondeneſſe, nowe in the later ende, to trouble the worlde with a newe kinde of ſpeakinge, and to cal againe the olde fineneſſe, and eloquence that Cicero, & Ceſar vſed in their daies in the Latine tongue. So mutch are theſe men beholden to the folie: and darkeneſſe of the former times. Many thinges, as one writeth, are had in eſtimation oftentimes, bicauſe they haue benne once dedicate to the Temples of the Heathen Goddes: Euen ſo we ſee at this daie, many thinges alowed, and highly ſet by of theſe menne, not bicauſe they iudge them ſo mutche woorthe, but onely bicauſe they haue benne receiued into a cuſtome, and after a ſorte dedicate to the Temple of God.

C. Plinius.

M. Hardinge.

Yee haue neuer done with the Churche of Rome. I cannot blame you. For ſo longe as that ſtan-

deth,

deth, without ye repente and turne, (a) ye ſhal neuer be taken but for ſuche as ye be, Schiſmatikes, and Heretikes. But alas poore ſoules, what thinke ye to ouerthrowe that Churche builded vpon the Rocke (b) Peter, againſte which hitherto neither Tyrantes, nor Heretikes farre paſſinge you in learninge, and honeſtie of common life, coulde euer preuaile? Trowe yee to extinguiſhe that Faithe of the Romaine Churche, (c) whiche is the ſame that was the Faithe of Peter, for whiche Chriſte praied, that it ſhoulde neuer faile? Ye labour in vaine. VVel maie Sathan winne you: the Church which our Lorde praied for, by you ſhal he neuer winne. Geeue ouer therefore your vaine and wicked attemptes. Truſte not in the patches, that falſely ye allege out of Canoniſtes Gloſes, Scholemenne, riminge Poetes, Heretikes, and who ſo euer, be they neuer ſo bad. Somme ignorante perſons maie ye deceiue, whoſe ſinnes deſerue the ſame.

VVhat Sylueſter Prieriâs ſaith, I minde not here to diſcuſſe. (d) Neither where he ſaith, that you alleage, haue you thought good to tel vs, leſte, by peruſinge the place, we ſhould take you in a lie, as we haue almoſte in al your other allegations. The like ſinceritie you vſe in alleginge Pighius. VVee binde our ſelues neither to the woordes of Sylueſter, nor of Pighius. If they erre, what is that to vs? Let them beare their owne burthen. If they tel truth, we beleeue them for truthes ſake. If otherwiſe, we leaue that parte for you to carpe. If Sylueſter Prieriâs ſaide, that for pointes of beleefe, the Doctrine of the Romaine Churche is a ſquire to trie their truthe by: the ſame (e) beinge wel vnderſtanded it is right true. Likewiſe if Pighius ſaie, that the Romaine Churche ſheweth vnto vs, which be the approued and vndoubted Scriptures, and whiche be not: this is ſo true, as your ſelfe (I ſuppoſe) wil yeelde thereunto. As for that the ſcripture receiued from the Churche of Rome Authoritie, credite, and force: (f) if in your meaninge you exclude God, that is your lie, not Sylueſters ſentence. If relation be made to vs, that we ought not geue credite vnto it, (g) onles it had benne ſhewed to be holy ſcripture by the Romaine Church, which is the true Church of Chriſte: in this ſenſe, be it Sylueſter, or who els ſo euer ſaith it, it is a true ſayinge, and agreeable to S. Auguſtine, who ſaide, *Ego Euangelio non crederem, niſi me Catholica Eccleſia commoueret Authoritas:* I would not beleeue the Goſpel, except the Authoritie of the Catholike Church moued me. And for that you allege out of him, touchinge indulgences, truthe it is, the ful, and whole knowlege of them is not plainely opened vnto vs, by expreſſe and euident wordes of Scripture, no more then the myſterie of the Bleſſed Trinitie, baptizinge of infantes, and many other truthes: but rather by the doctrine of the Romaine Churche.

VVhere you tel vs of Pighius, that he letteth not to ſaie, that without the licence of the Romiſhe Churche (for in that woorde you pleaſe your ſelfe wel) wee oughte not to beleeue the very plaine ſcriptures: (h) wee wil proclaime you a lyer, vntil you ſhewe vs, where he ſpake ſo far beſide reaſon, and learninge. The Holy Churche doth not wil vs to ſtaie from beleefe of the Scriptures, vntil wee haue licence: but by al waies and meanes inuiteth and ſtirreth vs to beleeue the truthe in the Scriptures vttered.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

The greateſt weighte hereof hangeth vpon two of your Doctours, Sylueſter Prieriâs, **and** Albertus Pigghius. **Whoes credite notwithſtandinge yée would faine otherwiſe ſaue vpright, yet here, as it ſéemeth, yée are contente, for ſhame to géeue them ouer.** VVee binde our ſelues (**yée ſaie**) neither to the woordes of Sylueſter, nor of Pigghius. If they erre, what is that to vs? **This ſhorte, and blunte anſweare, notwithſtandinge it ſéeme to like wel you, yet perhaps** Prieriâs, **and** Pigghius **it woulde not like. I ſée no greate cauſe to the contrarie, but either of them mighte as wel renounce youre Authoritie, and ſaie of you,** VVee are not bounde, neither to M. Hardinges woordes, nor to his felowes. **For that ye doubte the Truthe of our allegations, reade** Sylueſter Prieriâs, **Maiſter of the Popes Palaſce, in his Booke intituled,** Contra præſumptuoſas Martini Lutheri Concluſiones, de poteſtate Papæ. **His woordes there emongeſt others be theſe,** Quicunque non inititur Doctrinæ Romanæ Eccleſiæ, ac Romani Pontificis, tanquam Regulæ Dei infallibili, à qua etiam Sacra Scriptura robur trahit, & Authoritatem, Hæreticus eſt: *Who ſo euer leaneth not to the Doctrine of the Romaine Churche, and of the Biſhop of* Rome, *as vnto the* infallible Rule of God, of which Doctrine the Holy Scripture taketh force, and Authoritie, *he is an Heretique.*

Sylueſter Prieriâs, contra Lutherum.

Here, M. Hardinge, this Doctoure teacheth you, that the Authoritie, and credite of the Scriptures **hangeth of the allowance of the** Pope, **as without whiche, the** Scriptures **of God, ſhoulde be no** Scriptures.

Againe he ſaithe, Authoritas Romanæ Eccleſiæ, Romanique Pontificis maior eſt, &c. *The Authoritie of the Romaine Churche, and of the Biſhop of Rome is greater,* (**then the Authoritie of Goddes woorde**). **If this ſuffiſe you not, M. Hardinge, I knowe not, what thinge maie ſuffice you.**

As for that, is here alleged of Pigghius, **it is the very ſounde, and ſenſe of the greateſt parte of his** common **place,** De Eccleſia. **Of whoes iudgemente herein,**

The Churche aboue Goddes woorde.

(a) So was Chriſte taken of the Phariſeis.

(b) The fundation of the Churche of God, is not Peter, but Chriſt.

(c) Vntruth. For generally it is contrarie to the Faithe of Peter.

(d) It is eaſily founde in his Booke, *Contra Lutherum.*

(e) A commentarie beſide the Texte.

(f) A proper Gloſe.

(g) Vanitie of Vanities: For the Scriptures were knowen, and beleeued, before there was any Churche in Rome.

(h) It is no hard mater to finde it. Reade the Anſweare.

The Churche aboue Goddes vvoorde.

M. Caluin writeth thus, Pighius ait, Nullius Scripturæ Authoritate, quantumlibet Claræ, noſtro quidem iudicio, & euidentis, aduerſus Claram, conſonantemq; Orthodoxorum Patrum Sententiam, & aduerſus communem Eccleſiæ Definitionem, aliquid credere cuiquam licere: Pighius *ſaithe, that noman maie lawfully beleeue any thinge, by the Autheritie of any Scripture, be the ſame, in oure Iudgemente, neuer ſo plaine, and euident, againſte the cleare, and agreeable iudgemente of the Catholique Fathers, and againſte the Common determination of the Churche.* By whiche he meanethe onely the Churche of Rome. Therefore, M. Harding, it maie pleaſe you nowe a litle to ſpare your voice, and to ſtaie your Proclamation.

Alber. Pighius, in locu Communib. De Eccle.

But for as mutche as pe ſéme, ſo litle to eſtéme theſe two Doctoures, Priériâs, and Pighius, bringe otherwiſe, not longe ſithence, the chiefe Leaders, and Captaines of al youre bandes, pe maie therefore ioine others to them, to better their credite, and to encreaſe the Companie. And, for as mutche as we ſpeake of the Church of Rome, let vs heare the Iudgement of a Cardinal of the Church of Rome, notwithſtandinge otherwiſe alleged before.

Nicola. Cuſan. ad Bohemos, Epiſt. 2.

Cardinal Cuſanus therefore hereof ſaith thus, Hæc eſt omnium, &c. *This is the iudgement of al them, that thinke rightly, that founde the Autheritie, and vnderſtandinge of the* Scriptures *in the allowance of the* Churche: *and not contrariewiſe, laie the Fundation of the* Church *in the Autheritie of the* Scriptures. *There be no commaundementes of* Chriſte, *but ſuche onely, as ſo be taken, and holden by the* Churche. *Therefore the* Scriptures folowe the Churche: but contrariewiſe the Churche foloweth not the Scriptures. Likewiſe ſaith Iohannes Maria Verraſtus, Humiliter confitemur, Eccleſiæ Authoritatem eſſe ſupra Euangelium: *Wee doo humbly confeſſe, that the* Authoritie of the Churche, is aboue the Authoritie of the Goſpel. Likewiſe Albertus Pighius ſaith, Apoſtoli quædam ſcripſerunt: non vt Scripta illa præeſſent Fidei, & Religioni noſtræ, ſed potiùs, vt ſubeſſent. Scripturæ ſunt Muti Iudices: Scripturæ ſunt veluti Cereus Naſus: *The* Apoſtles *haue written certaine thinges: not that theire ſaide Writinges ſhould rule oure* Faithe, *or* Religion: *but rather, that they ſhoulde be vnder, and bee ruled by our* Faithe. The Scriptures are doumbe Iudges: The Scriptures are like a Noſe of waxe.

Iohan. Maria Verraſtus. Editus eſt, Ann. 1561.
Alber. Pighius, Hierar. li. 1 ca. 2.
Albert. Pighius, in controverſijs, De Eccle.

By theiſe, and other like vnreuerente, and godleſſe ſpeaches, they ſéke to leade the poꝛe ſimple deceiued people from the Holy Scriptures, and Voice of God, to the Authoꝛitie of theire Churche: by whiche Churche, they vnderſtand onely the Pope, and his Cardinalles of the Churche of Rome.

Deuter. Cap. 17.

But pe ſaie, Theſe be the Prieſtes of the Houſe of Leui: The Pope is the Iudge for the time, in the place, that our Lorde hath choſen. Somme others of you ſaie, Papa eſt tota Eccleſia Virtualiter: *The* Pope *is by Power, and Vertue, the whole Churche.* What ſo euer theiſe ſhal happen to ſaie, wee maie not ſwarue from theire Iudgement, neither to the Righte hande, nor to the Leafte hande. Whereupon the Hebrewe Gloſe noteth thus, Si dixerint tibi, quòd Dextra ſit Siniſtra, aut quod Siniſtra ſit Dextra, talis Sententia tenenda eſt: *Although they tel thee, that the Right hande is thy Leaſt hande: or, that thy Leaſt hande is thy Right hande, yet ſuche a Sentence muſte be holden as good.*

Hermann. de Poteſt. Papæ, cap 23

Nicol. Lyra in Deuter. Cap. 17.

Auguſtin. contra Epiſt. Fundam. Ca. 5.

S. Auguſtine, pe ſaie, holdeth harde of your ſide. He ſaith, Non crederem Euangelio, niſi me Eccleſiæ Catholicæ Authoritas commoueret: *I woulde not beleeue the* Goſpel, *excepte the* Authoritie *of the* Catholique Churche *moued mee.* Theiſe feiwe poꝛe woꝛdes, haue bene tofſed of your parte, and wꝛonge, and preſſed to the vttermoſte, to péide out that, was neuer in them. For hereby pe woulde faine pꝛoue, that the Authoritie of the Churche, whereby pe euermoꝛe vnderſtande youre Churche of Rome, and none other, is aboue the Authoritie of Goddes VVoorde: that is to ſaie, that the Creature is aboue the Creatour, that made Heauen, and Earthe.

Augu. in Pſal. 57
Augu. de Vnitat. Eccleſiæ. ca 2.
Auguſti. Contra Creſconi. Grammat. Lib 2. ca 33.

But what if S. Auguſtine, as he ſaithe, I beleeue the Goſpel bicauſe of the Churche, haue likewiſe ſaide, I beleeue the Churche bicauſe of the Goſpel? Then, I trowe, pe muſte turne your tale, and ſaie, The Goſpel is aboue the Churche. His woꝛdes be plaine, Ex ore Veritatis, Eccleſiam agnoſco participem Veritatis: *By the Mouthe of* God, *that is) the* Truthe, *I knowe the* Churche, *that is partetaker of the* Truthe. Againe he ſaithe, Nolo, Humanis Documentis, ſed Diuinis Oraculis Eccleſiam San-

Ram

The Churche aboue Goddes vvoorde.

ctam demonſtrari: Eccleſiam quærere debemus in Verbis Chriſti, qui eſt Veritas, & optimè nouit Corpus ſuum: Eccleſiam ſine vlla ambiguitate Sancta Scriptura demonſtrat: In Scripturis Sanctis Eccleſia manifeſtè cognoſcitur: Eccleſiam, ſicut ipſum Caput, in Scripturis Sanctis Canonicis debemus agnoſcere: *I would, the Churche ſhoulde be ſhewed, not by the Decrees of Menne, but by the Heauenly* Oracles, *or* VVoordes of God: *We muſte ſeeke the Church in the* VVoordes of Chriſt, *which is the Truthe, and beſt knowethe his owne Body: The* Holy Scripture *ſheweth vs the Churche without doubtinge: In the* Holy Scriptures *the Churche is plainely knowen: Wee muſte knowe the Churche by the* Holy Canonical Scriptures, *as wee knowe (Chriſte, that is) the Heade.*

Auguſtin. de Vnitate Eccle. ca. 16

Auguſt. eodem loco.

Likewiſe ſaithe Chryſoſtome, Nullo modo cognoſcitur, quæ ſit Vera Eccleſia, niſi Tantummodò per Scripturas: *It is not any waies knowen, whiche is the* True Churche of Chriſte, but Onely by the Scriptures.

Chryſoſtom. in Matt. Homi. 49.

And thus, for as mutche as we knowe, bothe Chriſte **by the** Churche, **and the** Church **by** Chriſt, **the one geuinge euidence to the other, by this reckening, M. Hardinge, and by your ſhiftinge of turnes, we muſte ſommetimes place** Chriſte **aboue the** Churche, **and ſommetimes the** Churche **aboue** Chriſte.

Howe be it, S. Auguſtines **minde was not, to commence an Action betwéne** Chriſt **and his** Church, **in Compariſon of their Dignities, or for trial, and kéepinge of theire bounds: or, to teache vs, that the** Truthe of God **taketh Authoritie of the** Churche: **but onely, to ſhewe vs, that the** Churche **is a Witneſſe to** Goddes Truthe. **And certainely it hath greate weighte of perſuaſion, to moue the Conſcience of any man, to ſée ſo many Kingedomes, & Countries to ioine togeather in the profeſſion, & obedience of one** Truthe. **And I doubt not, but euen this daie, many thouſandes are the ſoner leadde, to humble them ſelues vnto the Goſpel of Chriſt, for that they ſée, the whole worlde, that is to ſaie, the whole** Church of God, **is contented ſo willingly, and ſo humbly to embrace the ſame.** Dauid, **to teſtifie the** Truthe, **and certaintie of the** Goſpel, **ſaith thus,** *The ſounde of the Apoſtles wente out into al the Earthe, and the Woordes of them into the endes of al the Worlde. This is the turninge of the right hande of God.*

Pſalm. 18. Roman. 10. Pſalm. 76.

Therefore S. Auguſtine **ſaithe vnto** Fauſtus **the Heretique,** Cur non potiùs Euangelicæ Authoritati, tam Fundatæ, tam ſtabilitæ, tanta gloria diffamatæ, atque ab Apoſtolorum temporibus, vſque ad noſtra tempora, per Succeſsiones certiſsimas commendatæ, te non ſubdis? *Why dooeſt thou not rather ſubmitte thee ſelfe vnto the Authoritie of the Goſpel, beeinge ſo grounded, ſo ſtabliſhed, Preached, and publiſhed with ſo great glorie, commended, and deliuered vnto vs by moſte certaine Succeſſions from the time of the Apoſtles, vntil our time?*

Aug. contra Fau. Lib. 32. ca. 19.

Likewiſe in this ſame place by you alleged, S. Auguſtine **ſaithe,** Ego non crederem Euangelio, niſi me Catholicæ Eccleſiæ commoueret Authoritas. Quibus ergo obtemperaui dicentibus, Credite Euangelio, Cur eis non obtemperem dicentibus, Noli credere Manichæo? *I woulde not beleue the Goſpel, onleſſe the Authoritie of the Catholique Churche moued me. Seeinge therefore I haue obeied them ſaieinge to mee,* Beleue the Goſpel, *Why ſhoulde I not alſo obeie them ſaieinge vnto mee,* Beleeue not Manichee?

Auguſti. contra Epiſt. Fundam. Cap. 5.

Thus the conſente of the Churche **beareth witneſſe to the** Goſpel: **without whiche witneſſe notwithſtandinge, the** Goſpel **neuertheleſſe were the** Goſpel **ſtil. Therefore** Chryſoſtome **ſaithe,** Si dixerint, in ipſis Veris Eccleſijs Chriſtum apparuiſſe, nolite eis credere dicentibus iſta de me: Quia non eſt digna Diuinitatis meæ notitia hæc: *If they ſhal tel you, that Chriſte hathe appeared, yea euen in the very True Churches, yet beleeue them not ſaieinge thus of mee: For this is no meete knowledge for my Godhed.*

Chryſoſtom. in Matth. Hom. 49. in Opere Imper.

To conclude, M. Hardinge, we wil ſaie to you, as S. Auguſtine **ſommetime ſaide to the** Donatian **Heretiques, auancinge theire onely** Churche in Aphrica, **euen as you nowe auance onely your** Churche of Rome: Nos poſt vocem Paſtoris noſtri, per ora Prophetarum, per os proprium, per ora Euangeliſtarum nobis apertiſsimè declaratam, voces veſtras non admittimus, non credimus, non accipimus: *After the voice of our* Sheepehearde, *vttered moſte plainely vnto vs by the mouthes of the Prophetes, by his owne mouthe, and by the mouthes of the Euangeliſtes, if ye bringe vs youre owne voices, wee allowe them not, wee beleeue them not, wee receiue them not.*

Auguſt. De Vnitate Eccleſiæ, Ca. 11.

The Apo-

The Apologie, Cap. 11. Diuision. 1.

Our Churche, saie they, cannot erre. Thei speake that (I thinke) as the Lacedæmonians longe sithence vsed to saie, that it was not possible to finde any Adulterer in al their Common Wealthe: whereas in deede they were rather al Adulterers, and had no certaintie in theire Marriages, but had theire wiues in common amongest them al: Or, as the Canonistes at this daie, for theire bellies sake, vse to saie of the Pope, that, for so muche as he is Lorde of al Benefices, though he selle for monie, Bishoprikes, Monasteries, Priesthoode, Spiritual Promotions, & parte with nothing freely, yet bicause he counteth al his owne, he cannot committe Simonie, thoughe he vvoulde neuer so faine. But, howe strongely, and agreeably to reason these thinges be spoken, wee are not as yet hable to perceiue, excepte perchance these menne haue plucked of the winges from the Truthe, as the Romaines in olde time did proine, & pinion their Goddesse Victoria, after thei had once gotten her home, to the ende, that with the same winges she should neuer be hable to flee awaie from them againe.

Summa Angelica in dictione Papæ.

Theodoricus de scismate.

Thearchus.

M. Hardinge.

Towarde the ende of your Apologie, Syr Defender, who so euer you be, that peiced it togeather, you doo but trifle. Of like your stuffe is spente. For here litle saie you, that you haue not saide already. VVherefore I craue Pardon of the Reader, if accordinge to the slenderneſse of matters obiected, my (a) confutation seeme also slender. Syr, you doo now but patche peeces togeather, which you haue gathered out of youre note Bookes, into the same inforced somme out of the Canonistes, somme out of the Scoolemen, and them not of the greatest estimation, most of al out of Humanitie Bookes, wherein you be pretely seene. And that seemeth to be your chiefe profession. As for Diuinitie, there appeareth no greate knowledge in you. VVhat ye rehearse of the Lacedemonians, it perteineth to your owne companies, no lesse, then to them, I meane onely your Apostates, Monkes, Friers, Priestes, and Nonnes.

(a) This is good plaine dealinge. For in deede this Answeare is very slender.

You finde greate faulte in the Canonistes that be at this daie, and name in your Margente *Summa Angelica*, the Authour whereof died many yeeres paste. If he, Theodoricus, what so euer he was, or any other Canonistе offende you, as for his bellies sake, speakinge of the Pope, that shoulde set your teethe anedge: what pertaineth that to vs, who defende the Catholike Faithe, not the saieinge of euery Canonistе? You were beste, seeinge you make so mutche adoo with them, to Article theire errours, and either write a railinge Booke againste them, whiche ye (b) can easily doo, or sende one of your beste learned superintendentes to Bononia, there in open schoole with disputations to confute them. And so doubteleſse ye shal either conuerte them, whiche were a woorthy acte: or proue your selues fooles, whiche were greate pitie.

(b) VVith M. Hardinges good instructions.

But to answeare your obiection, wee saie, first, that you allege *Summa Angelica* falsely. Nothinge is founde foundinge to that yee burthen the Pope withal, in the place by you quoted, in *dict. Papa.* Nexte, whereas it is written *in Summa Angelica, In Curia Romana titulus de Simonia non habet locum:* you Syr Defender, either not knowinge what folowed, or of malice abusinge the place, haue reported the same, as if it were precisely saide without any distinction. VVhereas in deede the selfe same Summe vseth this Distinction, saieinge, *Verum est in ijs qui sunt Simoniaca de iure positiuo solum: Sed non in ijs quæ sunt Simoniaca de iure Diuino.* VVhereby he meaneth that the Pope is not vnder the rules of Simonie concerning (c) sutch lawes and paines, as him selfe, or his predecessours haue made in that behalfe. For they haue made many thinges belonginge thereto, as you maie wel knowe your selfe, who are so pretely seene in the Canon Lawe, as it maie appeare by the often and cunninge allegations whiche you bringe out of the Gloses. But concerninge (d) that Simonie, whiche properly is so called, the Pope is noleſse subiecte thereto by the true iudgement of *Summa Angelica*, (e) whiche you haue shamefully belied, then any other man.

(c) A woorthy distinction. Hereby the Pope maie selle Bishoprikes, & Benefices without Simonie.

(d) This kinde of Simonie standethe onely in sellinge of Orders, and Sacramentes, &c.

(e) Vntruthe, shameleſse, as shal appeare.

In dict. Simonia. Ver. verum Auctorita.

You ieste at Goddes blessed Truthe alwaies remaininge in his Holy Churche, and prophanely resemble it to a birde proined and pinyoned, that it flie not awaie. As thoughe the Churche kepte truthe with sutche policie, as the olde Romaines are fained, to haue kepte theire Goddesse Victorie. VVel Syr, wee tel you in sadneſse, wee are assured of the Truthe, that it is in the Churche, and that it shal neuer departe from thence. And if ye cal this, cuttinge awaie of her winges, that it neuer flie from the Churche: wee graunte they be cut in sutche sorte, as shee shal keepe the Churche for euer, as her owne neast. And wil you knowe who telleth vs this? Euen God him selfe, saieinge in his Prophete Esaie to Christe of his Churche: I wil make this couenant with them, saithe our Lorde: My spirite

The Pope cannot commit Simonie.

ſpirite whiche is in thee, and my woordes which I haue put in thy mouthe, (f) ſhal not departe from thy mouthe, and from the mouthe of thy ſeede, and from the mouthe of thy ſeedes ſeede, ſaith our Lorde, from this time foorthe for euermore.

Againſte this Truthe, what ſo euer yee bringe in reproufe of Popes liues, whome notwithſtandinge moſte impudently yee belie, what vndiſcrete ſaiſinges, or flateries ſo euer yee burthen the Canoniſtes with, al tourneth to nothinge. The Truthe remaineth vnſhaken: your ſpirite of lieinge ſcoffinge, and malice thereby is diſcyfred.

(f) Ful diſcretely and wel applied: As if theſe woordes had benne meant of the Pope, and his Succeſſours.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Here, pẽ ſaie, Syr Defender is prettely ſeene in Humanitie: For that (**pæ ſaie**) ſeemethe to be his chiefe profeſſion. **Uerily, M. Hardinge, Wẽ are wel pleaſed, to take ſuche, and ſo muche learninge, as you maie ſpare vs. Wẽ contende onely for Truthe, and not for** Learninge. **What ſo euer our** Learninge **be, if it maie pleaſe God, to vſe it to his glorie, it ſhalbe ſufficient, be it neuer ſo litle. Howe be it, had you not had ſomme good likinge in your owne** Learninge, **pẽ woulde not vpon ſo ſimple occaſions haue vpbraided others.**

Touchinge that, ſundrie of your Doctours haue ſaide, the Pope cannot commit Simonie, **firſte it ſhalbe neceſſarie in that behalfe, to conſider the eſtate, and practiſe of the** Churche of Rome. S. Bernarde, **writinge vnto** Pope Eugenius, **ſaithe,** Limina Apoſtolorum Ambitio iam plùs terit, quàm deuotio. Vocibus Ambitionis veſtrum toto die reſultat Palatium: Ambitio in Eccleſia per te regnare molitur: *The Apoſtles Entries, or Gates in* Rome, *are nowe more worne with* Ambition, *then with* Deuotion. *All the daie longe your Palace ringethe with the ſounde of* Ambition. *By thy meanes,* Ambition *ſeeketh to reigne in the* Churche of God. **Againe he ſaithe,** Sacri gradus dati ſunt in occaſionem turpis Lucri: & quæſtum æſtimant Pietatem: *The Holy degrees, or Eccleſiaſtical roumes are geeuen ouer to occaſion of filthy gaine: and the ſame gaine they compte Holineſſe.* Ludouicus Viues **ſaithe,** Romæ, cum omnia propè vendantur, & emantur, nihil tamen agas ſine Lege, ac Formula, atque etiam Sanctiſsimi iuris: *At* Rome, *notwithſtandinge al thinges be bought, and ſolde, yet maie yee doo nothinge there without Fourme, and Order, and that of moſte Holy Religion.*

Bernardus de Conſideratione, Lib. 3.

Bernardus in Conuerſione Pauli. Sermo 1.

De Ciuitate Dei Li. 18. cap. 22. Viues.

Your owne Gloſe **ſaithe,** Roma eſt Caput Auaritiæ. Ideo omnia ibi venduntur: Rome *is the Heade of Couetouſneſſe. Therefore al thinges there are boughte and ſolde.* **Where as alſo** Iohannes Andreæ, **your** greate Canoniſte, **notethe this Uerſe, alluding to the name of** Rome:

In Sexto, De Electione, & lect. poteſt. Fundamenta. In Gloſſa.

Roma manus rodit: quos rodere non valet, odit.

Durandus **ſaithe,** Simonie ſo reighnethe in the Churche of Rome, as though in deede it were no Sinne. **To be ſhorte, theſe two Uerſes were commonly ſpreadde of** Pope Alexander:

Durandus, de modo celebrandi Concil. Li. 20. Maſculus in Ioan. Cap. 6.

Vendit Alexander Claues, Altaria, Chriſtum,
Vendere iure poteſt: Emerat ipſe priùs.

Pope Alexander *maketh ſale of his Keies, of his Aultars, and of Chriſt him ſelfe. Wel maie he ſelle theſe thinges: for he him ſelfe paied wel for them.*

Notwithſtanding, pẽ doubte not, but al this, by a prety ſoary diſtinction, maie ſome be excuſed. For thus pẽ ſaie, *Uerum eſt in iis, quæ ſunt Simoniaca de iure Poſitiuo ſolùm: Sed non in iis, quæ ſunt Simoniaca de iure Diuino.* VVhereby (**pæ ſaie**) the Authour meanethe, that the Pope is not vnder the Rules of Simonie, concerninge ſutche Lawes, and paines, as he him ſelfe, or his Predeceſſours haue made, and prouided in that behalfe. **And therefore, as your modeſte manner is, pẽ ſaie,** wee haue falſely alleged, and ſhamefully belied *Summa Angelica.* **But why doo you not better open the ſeuerall partes of youre** Diſtinction, **M. Hardinge? Why doo ye not better teache vs to vnderſtande, what is** Simonie by Lawe Poſitiue: **and what is** Simonie by the Lawe of God? **And why doo ye not declare eche parte by plaine Examples? Seinge you thus to ſteale awaie in the darke, wee haue ſomme cauſe to doubte your dealinge.**

Summa Angeli. in Simonia.

Howe be it, to make the matter plaine, your owne Gloſe **ſaithe thus,** Simoniaca de ſui natura, ſunt, quæ Nouo, aut Veteri Teſtamento prohibita ſunt: vt, Emere, vel Vende-

Extra, De Offic.

The Pope cannot commit Simonie.

Vendere Sacramenta. Simoniaca de Iure Positiuo, sunt, quæ solùm sunt Spiritualia ex Constitutione Ecclesiæ: vt sunt Tituli Beneficiorum Ecclesiasticorum, &c. *These thinges are* Simoniacal of their owne Nature, *that are forebidden in the Olde, and New Testamente: as to* buie *or* selle Sacramentes. *These thinges are* Simoniacal by Law Positiue, *whiche are Spiritual onely by the ordinance of the Churche. Suche are the* Titles of al Ecclesiastical Benefices, and Dignities: As be Bishoprikes, Deanries, Abbies, Archedeaconries, &c. **Thus, M. Hardinge, if your** Pope selle Sacramentes, **whiche wil yelde him but litle monie, he maie be charged with** Simonie. **But if he selle** Bishoprikes, Deanries, Abbies, Archedeaconries, Prebendes, Personages, **neuer so many, yet by the shift of your pretty** Distinction, **noman maie charge him. For al these thinges are** Spiritual, **onely by the** Popes owne Positiue Lawe, **that is to saie,** by the ordinance of the Churche. **And thinke you not, so good a** Distinction **was wel worthe the findinge out? One of your owne Companie,** *speakinge hereof,* **saith thus,** O Petre, quantam animarum multitudinem cateruatim transmisit, & transmittit ad Infernum hæc Superstitialis, & Damnanda Distinctio? Multis est occasio, & viam aperit ad ruinam Damnationis æternæ: O Peter, Peter, *howe many Soules hath this Superstitious, and Damnable Distinction sente by heapes, and yet doothe daiely sende into Helle? It is an occasion vnto many, and openeth the waie vnto the fal of Euerlastinge Damnation.*

Aureum Speculum.

To make the mater plaine, Baldus **saithe,** Simonia non cadit in Papam recipientem: *Though the* Pope *take monie, yet no* Simonie *can touche him.* **In like sorte saithe his felowe** Bartolus, Papa non dicitur facere Simoniam, conferendo beneficia, & Dignitates, accepta Pecunia: *The* Pope *is not saide, to committe* Simonie, *although he take Monie for the Benefices, and Dignities of the Churche.*

ff. De Offi. praetoru, L. Barbarius Colum. 2. *ff.* Eod. Titulo, Rad. L. Bartolus.

Theodoricus **saithe,** Papa non potest committere Simoniam. Sic tenent Iuristæ. Quia Simonia excusatur per Authoritatem eius: *The* Pope *cannot committe* Simonie. *So holde the* Canonistes. *For* Simonie *by his Authoritie is excused.*

Theodoricus, De Schismate inter Vrban. & Clem. li. 1 ca. 32.

Felinus **saith,** Ista Glosa videtur dicere, quòd Papa non committit Simoniam in recipiendo Pecuniam pro collatione Beneficiorum ex quo non ligatur proprijs Constitutionibus. Tamen Moderni tenent indistinctè, quòd Papa non inuoluatur Crimine Simoniæ: Et ita ego teneo: Et sic est seruanda communis opinio. Ergo Papa potest dictam prohibitionem Simoniæ firmatam in Vniuersali Ecclesia, limitare respectu Apostolicæ Sedis. Et si diceres, Requiritur in talibus apparens causa, dico, hic esse causam apparentem. Nam cessante tali reditu, qui maximus est, attenta hodierna Tyrannide, Sedes Apostolica contemneretur: *This* Glose *seemeth to saie, that the* Pope *committeth not* Simonie, *receiuinge Monie for the bestowinge of Benefices: for as mutche as the* Pope *is not bounde to his owne Constitutions. Yet nowe adaies the Lawiers holde, without any sutche Distinction, (of* Lawe Positiue, and Lawe of God) *that the* Pope *cannot in any wise come within the danger of* Simonie. *And so I mee selfe doo holde: and so the common opinion muste be holden. Therefore, notwithstandinge the Lawe that forebiddeth* Simonie, *take place in the whole Vniuersal Church, yet in respecte of the* Apostolique See of Felinus de Officio Iudicu delegati ex parte N.

A iuste, and a reasonable cause wherefore the Pope maie selle Bishoprikes, Deanries, Abbies &c.

Rome, *it maie be restrained. But thou wilt saie, In suche cases there ought to be somme apparente cause. I tel thee, that there is a cause apparente. For this reuenewe (of* Simonie) *whiche is very great, beinge once cutte of, considering the Tyrannie, that nowe is, the* Apostolique See *would be despised.* **By this Authoritie it appeareth, The** Pope **is not able to mainteine his Estate, and Countenance, nor to saue al thinges vpright, without** Simonie.

Extra. De Simonia Ca. 1. Numero 5. Fo. 8. Abb. Archidiacon. in Tract. de Hæres. Et quia tanta est.

Panormitane **saith,** Etsi Papa accipiat pecuniam pro collatione alicuius Prælaturæ, aut Beneficij, tamen Dominus Cardinalis ait, Non committitur Simonia: *Notwithstandinge the* Pope *take monie for the bestowinge of a Bishoprike, or of a Benefice, yet my* Lorde Cardinal *saith, there is committed no* Simonie. Archidiaconus Florentinus **saithe,** Papa recipiendo pecuniam, non præsumitur animo vendendi recipere: Sed vt illa pecunia ad vsum suum conuertatur: cùm Papa sit Dominus Rerum Temporalium, per illud dictum Petri, Dabo tibi Omnia Regna Mundi: *The* Pope *receiuinge monie (for Bishoprikes, or Benefices) is not thought to take it by waie of sale: but onely, to turne the same monie to his owne vse. For the* Pope is Lorde of al worldly goodes, *as it appeareth by the wordes of* Peter (**whiche wordes notwithstandinge** Peter **neuer spake, for they were**

The Diuels VVoordes alleged vnder the name of S. Peter.

spoken

The Pope cannot commit Simonie.

ſpoken by Sathan). *Vnto thee wil I geeue al the Kingedomes of the Worlde.*

Againe Felinus ſaithe, Quod datur Papæ, datur Sacrario Petri: nec eſt proprium Papæ: Sed prodeſt danti, tanquam facienti opus piiſsimum: *What ſo euer is geeuen to the* Pope (for Biſhoprike, or Benefice, by waie of Simonie) *it is geeuen to* S. Peters Treaſurie. *Neither is it the Popes owne ſeuerall goodes. But it is anaileable to the geeuer, as vnto one, that doothe a moſte Godly deede.* Butche a ſpecial grace hathe the Pope. Of moſte Diueliſhe Vice, he is hable to make moſte Godly Vertue. And for the better furtherance of the matter, S. Peter muſte be made acceſſorie to the Simonie. *Felinus de Offi. Iudicis delega. Ex parte. N.*

The Pope changeth Vice into Vertue.

Hoſtienſis ſaithe, Papa poteſt vendere Titulum Eccleſiaſticum, vt Epiſcopatum, Abbatiam, &c. *The* Pope *maie ſelle any Eccleſiaſtical Title, or Dignitie, as a Biſhoprike, or an Abbie, without danger of* Simonie.

But, what ſpeake we of the Pope? Your Cardinalles them ſelues, by your fauourable Conſtructions, and Godly orders, are likewiſe Priuileged, to committe Simonie, ſafely, and freely, and without blame. Panormitane ſaithe, Cardinalis, pro Palafreno à nobili viro recepto, non præſumitur committere Simoniam: *A Cardinal, for receiuinge a Palfraie of a Noble Man,* (for a Benefice, or a Biſhoprike) *is not thought to committe* Simonie. *Extra. de Simonia. ca. 1. Hoſti. Extra. De Simonia. Etſi queſtiones.*

Thus, whereas Chriſte drawe Buiers, and Sellers out of the Churche, you by your proper diſtinctions, haue receiued in Buiers, and Sellers, and thruſte out Chriſt. S. Hierome ſaithe, Per nummularios ſignificantur Beneficij Eccleſiaſtici venditores: qui Domum Dei faciunt Speluncam Latronum: *By the Exchangers are ſignified the Sellers of Eccleſiaſtical Beneſices: whiche make the Houſe of God, a Denne of Theeues.* *Hieronymus.*

In your owne Decrees it is written thus, Tolerabilior eſt Macedonij Hæreſis, qui aſſerit, Spiritum Sanctum eſſe Seruum Patris, & Filij. Nam iſti faciunt Spiritum Sanctum, Seruum ſuum: *The Hereſie of* Macedonius, *that ſaide, the* Holy Ghoſte *is Seruante, and ſclaue to the Father, and to the Sonne, is more tolerable, then is the Hereſie of theiſe* Simoniſtes. *For theiſe menne make the* Holy Ghoſte *theire owne Seruante.* *1. Quæſt. 1. Eos qui.*

Yet, yée ſaie, yée are wel aſſured, that the Truthe is in the Churche of Rome, and ſhal neuer departe from thence, notwithſtandinge any diſorder, or faulte what ſo euer, there committed. And for proufe thereof, yée allege, as yée ſaie, the Wordes of God him ſelfe in the Prophete Eſaie. Al be it, in that whole Prophete, there is not one worde expreſſely mentioned of the Churche of Rome. Butche a fantaſie, as it appeareth, was ſommetimes in the Heretiques, called the Manichees. For thus they ſaide, A Principibus Gentis Tenebrarum Lumen, ne ab ijs aufugeret, tenebatur: *The Princes of the Nation of Darkeneſſe holde faſte the Light, leaſte it ſhoulde flee from them.* For euen ſo dothe the Pope, and his Cardinalles holde the Truthe, as the Princes, or Powers of Darkeneſſe holde the Lighte. And what are the Popes & theire Cardinalles, but onely the Powers, and Princes of Darkeneſſe. It was harde dealinge for you, to binde Chriſte in Recogniſance, not to departe from the Pope: yée ſhoulde rather haue bounde the Pope, not to departe from Chriſte. *Eſaie. 59. Auguſt. de Natura Boni. ca. 46*

S. Hierome ſaithe, Prophetæ Hieruſalem non habent in ore Prophetiam: Et in Domino requieſcunt, & dicunt: Non venient ſuper nos mala. Quorum cauſa Speculatorium Dei hoſtili aratro diuiditur: Et locus, quondam pacis ruinis plenus fit: & Templum Domini in vepres, ſpinasq; conuertitur, & eſt Habitaculum beſtiarum: *The Prophetes of* Hieruſalem, *haue neuer a woorde of Propheſie in theire mouthes. Yet they reaſte them ſelues vpon the Lorde, and ſaie: There ſhal no euil comme vpon vs. For theire ſakes the Watche Tower of the Lorde is turned vp with the enimies Ploughe: The place of peace is ful of ruine: The Temple of the Lorde is turned into Breeres, and Thornes: and is becomme a ſtable of wilde beaſtes.* *Hieronym. in Michæam. ca. 4.*

The Apologie, Cap. 11. Diuiſion. 2.

But what if Ieremie telle them, as is afore rehearſed, that theiſe be Lies? What if the ſame Prophete ſaie in an other place, that the ſelf ſame men, who ought to be Keepers of the Vineyarde, haue brought *Hieren. 12.*

to nought, and destroied the Lordes Vineyarde? Howe if, Christe saie, that the same persons, who chiefely ought to haue a care ouer the Temple, haue made the Lordes Temple a denne of Theeues?

Matthe. 21.

M. Hardinge.

*Learnedly proued.

Here come you in with your whatisses, whiche commonly you vse, when other Rhetorike faileth you. VVee tel you plainely without any isses, that * Ieremie meante of you, and suche as you be, and calleth your whole newe fangled Doctrine, *Verbum mendacij*, the woordes of lieinge, earnestly geeuinge warninge, that menne geeue no credite to them. His other rebuke perteineth also to you. VVhen were euer suche Theeues in the Churche of God, as yee are?

The Apologie, Cap. 12. Diuision. 1.

If it be so, that the Churche of Rome cannot erre, it muste nedes folowe, that the good lucke thereof is farre greater, then al theise menne s policie. For suche is theire Life, theire Doctrine, and theire Diligence, that for al them, the Churche maie not onely erre, but also vtterly be spoiled, and perishe. No doubte, if that Churche maie erre, whiche hathe departed from Goddes VVoordes, from Christes Commaundementes, from the Apostles Ordinaunces, from the Primitiue Churches Examples, from the Old Fathers, and Councelles Orders, and from theire owne Decrees, and whiche wil be bounde within the compasse of none, neither Olde, or Newe, nor theire owne, nor of others, nor Mannes Lawe, nor Goddes Lawe, then it is out of al question, that the Romishe Churche hathe not onely had power to erre, but also that it hathe shamefully, and moste wickedly erred in very deede.

M. Hardinge.

The Churche of Rome is the whole Catholique Churche.

A man woulde haue thought, you woulde haue brought some substantial Argument, whereby to proue, that the Churche erreth. Neither make you excuse in that, you speake of the Romaine Churche. In this accoumpte wee make no difference betwene the Romaine Churche, and the Churche. But al your prouses depende vpon your isses, whiche beinge denied, you haue nomore to saie. No doubte (saie you) if that Churche maie erre, whiche hathe departed from Goddes VVoorde, from Christes Commaundementes, &c. then it hath erred in very deede. But Syr, what if a man denie your suppos al, and staie you in your firste if? VVhat haue you to proue it? Al that you haue saide hitherto, we knowe, and of litle force it is. But no doubt, saie you, if that Churche maie erre, whiche hath departed from Goddes VVoorde, &c. Yea forsoothe, if al isses were true, then if Heauen fel, wee shoulde catche Larkes. And if a Bridge were made betwene Douer and Calys, wee might goe to Boleine a foote, as VVilliam Somer once tolde Kinge Henry, if it be true, that I haue hearde saie.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Here is nothinge els, but onely the Canonization of poore VVilliam Somer. While your Bokes, M. Hardinge, shal liue, al his sage sawes shal neuer die.

The Apologie, Cap. 12. Diuision. 2.

But saie they, ye haue bene of our Felovvship, but novv ye are becomme foresakers of your profession, and haue departed from vs. It is trewe: wee haue departed from them, and, for so doinge, we bothe geeue thankes to Almightie God, and greatly reioice in our owne behalfe. But yet for al this, from the Primitiue Churche, from the Apostles, and from Christe wee haue not departed. True it is: wee were brought vp with theise menne in darkenesse, and in the lacke of the knowledge of God, as Moses was brought vp in the Learninge, and in the bosome of the Egyptians. VVee haue benne of your

your Companie, saithe Tertullian, I confesse it, and no marueile at al: For, saithe he, menne be made, and not borne Christians.

Tertullian. in Apologetico.

M. Hardinge.

VVee saie, (as ye reporte) that yee haue benne once of our Felowship, but nowe ye are become Apostates and forsakers of your Profession, and haue wickedly departed from vs. By the name of vs, wee meane not some one particulare companie, but Christes Catholike Church. VVe saie of you, as S. Iohn saide of the like, whome he calleth Antichristes: *Ex nobis exierunt, sed non erant ex nobis. Nam si fuissent ex nobis, permansissent vtiq, nobiscum.*: They are departed from out of vs, but they were not of vs. For if they had benne of vs, they had doubteleſſe remained stil with vs.

1 Ioan 2.

By this whole discourse, Christe, and his Apostles maie be condemned.

But what is your answeare hereunto? It is desperate, foolishe, and lieinge. First, ye confesse the thinge, and not onely that, but also thanke God for it, and greatly reioice in it. And therein yee folowe the woorse sorte of Sinners, of whome Salomon saithe, *Lætantur cùm male fecerint, & exultant in rebus pessimis*: They be glad when they haue donne euil, and reioyce in the woorste thinges that are. Yee haue diuided the Churche of God, ye haue rente our Lordes nette, yee haue cut his whole wouen cote, whiche the wicked Souldiers, that Crucified him, coulde not finde in theire hartes to doo. Dionysius Alexandrinus, writinge to Nouatus the greate Heretique, who did as yee haue donne, saithe thus vnto him, as Eusebius reciteth, whereby ye maie esteeme the greatnesse of your crie: Thou shouldest haue suffered what so euer it were, that the Churche of God mighte not be diuided. And martyrdome suffered for that the Churche shoulde not be diuided, is no lesse glorious, then that whiche is suffered for not dooinge Idolatrie. Yea in mine opinion, it is greater. For there one is martyred for his owne onely Soule, and here for the whole Churche. Thus it foloweth, that by your Apostasie, and by your diuidinge of Goddes Churche, ye haue donne more wickedly, (a) then if ye committed Idolatrie.

Prouerb. 2.

Euseb. Hist. Lib. 6. ca. 5. in Græcis.

(a) A good excuse of Idolatrie.

But yet for al this (saie they) from the Primitiue Church, from the Apostles, and from Christ we haue not departed. VVhat can be saide more foolishely? VVhy Syrs, (b) is not the Primitiue Churche and this of oure time one Churche? Doothe it not holde togeather by continual Succession til the worldes ende? VVhat, hath Christ moe Churches then one? Is the Primitiue Church quite done, and nowe muste there beginne a newe? Is not Christ, his Apostles, and al true beleeuers, in what time or place so euer they liue, his one mystical Body, whereof he is the Heade, al other the members? As Christ is one, the Holy Ghost one, one Faith, one Baptisme, one Vocation, one God: so is the Church one, which beganne at the firste man, and shal endure to the laste: whereof the liuinge parte on earth before the comminge of Christ into Fleashe, was sometime brought to smal number: after his comminge, after that the Apostles had Preached and spreade the Gospel abroade, the number neither was euer, nor shalbe other then greate (though sometime accompted smal in respecte of the vnbeleeuers) vntil the cominge againe of the Sonne of Man, what time he shal scantly finde Faith, specially that which worketh by Charitie, in the Earth. Against which time busely ye make preparation.

(b) Yes verily: Euen as the house of God and the Caue of Theeues were al One Temple: Matthæ. 21.

Luc. 18.

For some parte of excuse of your forsakinge the Churche, ye saie, ye were brought vp with vs in darkenesse, and in the lacke of knowledge of God, as Moses was among the Egyptians: For that ye bringe out of Tertullian, helpeth you nothinge at al. I praie you Sirs, what darkenesse meane yee: Speake ye of Sinne? VVe excuse not our selues. But when tooke ye out the beame of your owne eies, that ye espie the mote of our eie? It were wel ye proued your selues honest men, before ye required vs to be Angels. If ye meane the darkenesse of ignorance, as peraduenture ye doo, and the lack of knowledge of God: Now that ye are departed from vs, and haue set chaire againste chaire, (I see no cause why to saie, Aultar against Aultar) what more and better knowledge of God haue ye, then we haue, and euer haue had: Doo we not knowe the Articles of our beleefe? Tel vs, which doo we lacke? This is life Euerlastinge (saith our Sauiour in the Gospel) to knowe thee God alone, and whome thou hast sente Iesus Christe. So farre as God lightneth our vnderstandinge with the Supernatural lighte of his grace, thus mutch we knowe. For whiche Peter the Sonne of Iona was accompted blessed of Christ, the same wee sinneful Papistes throughe Goddes grace, also knowe and confesse. The Commaundementes of God we knowe: what is good, what is euil, which be sinnes, which be Vertues, what is to be folowed, what is to be shunned, so farre as is behoouful, we be not ignorant.

Here M. Hardinge saith out his heapes of Learninge.

Ioan. 17. Matth. 16.

VVhat is the darkenesse then, for which ye would needes be gonne from vs? And what is that woorthy knowledge ye haue wonne by youre departure? Tel vs, that wee maie bie the Bookes, and goe to scoole with you. Truely without ye haue some hidden and secrete knowledge, which ye haue not vttered to the worlde hitherto, as we beleeue ye haue not, beinge sutche boasters as ye are: wee see litle cause, ye shoulde twite vs of ignorance, and bragge of your owne knowledge. This wee see ful wel, they that runne awaie from vs to your side, be they Monkes or Friers, Tinkers, or Tapsters, Coblers, or Bodgers, white or blacke, by and by in your Synagoges they be great Rabbins. And yee, the superintendentes admitte them to be your Ministers and Preachers of the woorde, and tel them they can doo wel, and they beleeue no lesse them selues. But the people take them for sutche, as they knewe them before they tooke sutche degree, and many times for theire good behauiour, they foregette their Holy Ministerie, and Christen them by theire common name, whiche was not geeuen them at the Fonte. Yet al this prooueth not either oure ignorance, or youre marueilous and rare knowledge. Neither shal ye euer be able to prooue to any man of learninge and iudgemente, that in any liberal sciences, or right knowledge of the Scriptures, ye are comparable to the learned menne of

departing from the Churche of Rome.

the Catholike Churche. Though aboute fifty yeeres paste and vpwarde for a space, the studies of Eloquence and of tongues were intermitted, yet then and before those times was there no smal number of menne, who had profounde knowledge of al good Artes, and specially of the Holy Letters. I reporte me to Thomas VValden, who very learnedly confuted the Heresies of your greate Graundefather Iohn VVickleff, to Alcuinus in the greate Charles time, to Beda before that, al three Englishe men, to Anselme and Lanckfrancke Bishoppes of Englande, though strangers borne, to S. Thomas of Aquine, S. Bernarde, Rupertus, and hundreds moe, whiche here is no place to recken. VVere not they by confession of al, greate Clerkes? doo not the beste learned of oure time, in obscure matters, fetche light of them? To saie the Truthe, in comparison of theire cleare lighte, youre il sauouringe snoffes maie scantly seeme to yeelde a darke smoke. Many talke of youre painted sheath, who, were they learned in deede, woulde soone perceiue neither that to be very freash and gaie: for, as for your swoorde, what rusty and beggerly metal it is, the wiser parte of the worlde seeth. * Therefore ye shal doo wel, Syrs, to speake no more of the darkenesse and ignorance of the Catholike Churche, and to boaste lesse of your greate cunninge, and knowledge.

*A very Learned, and a worthy Conclusion. But woe be to them, that calle Light Darkenesse, and Darkenesse Light: Esaie, 5.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Your head was very idle, M. Hardinge, when it could so easily yelde vs suche idle talke. If ye thinke it in no case to be lawful, to departe from them, what so euer they be, that beare the shewe, and countenance of the Churche, **then must ye néedes condemne the Apostles, and** Prophetes, **and most specially** Christe **him selfe. But let vs consider, from what companie we are departed. So maie the causes of oure departure the better appeare. For the** Pope **him selfe saithe not nay, but, vpon iuste considerations,** any Churche may leaue the Church of Rome. **His owne wordes be theese,** Nulli agere licet, sine discretione Iustitiæ, contra Disciplinam Romanæ Ecclesiæ: *Without discretion of Iustice, it is lawful for no man, to doo any thinge contrarie to the order of the Churche of Rome.* **By this the Popes owne Decree,** with discretion of Iustice, **it is lawful to doe contrarie to the Orders of the Churche of Rome.**

Dist. 12. Non Decet, in Rubric.

But, for a shorte, and general viewe of that whole Churche **in this behalfe,** S. Bernarde **saith thus,** Parum est nostris Pastoribus, quòd non seruant nos, nisi & perdant. Non parcunt suis, qui non parcunt sibi, Perimentes pariter, & Pereuntes: *It is not sufficient for our Bishoppes, that they saue vs not, onlesse they also doo destroie vs: Sparinge not them selues, they spare not their people. They doo bothe perishe them selues, and kille others.* **Againe he saith,** Non custodiunt hoc tempore Sponsam, sed perdunt: Non custodiunt Gregem Domini, sed mactant, & deuorant: *They keepe not this daie the Spouse of God, that is, his Church, but they destroie her: They keepe not the Flocke, but they kille, and deuoure.* **He that writeth** Paralipomena Vrspergensis, **in the note of the** Councel of Constance, **saithe thus,** Spiritum extinguebant: Prophetias aspernabantur: Christum in Membris suis persequebantur: Erat & planè Persequutrix Ecclesia: *They oppressed the Sprite of God: they defied the Voices of the Prophetes: they persequuted Christe in his members. And in deede the* Churche *was geeuen to woorke persequution.*

Bernardus in Synodo Remensi.

In eadem Synod.

Paralipom. Vrspergen. Pa. 396.

Æneas Syluius, **that afterwarde was** Pope Pius. 2. **saith,** Refriguit Charitas, & Fides omnis interijt: *Charitie is waxen colde, and al Faith is deade.*

Æneas Sylui. in Epist. ad Casparem Schlickium

In the life of Pope Clemens. 5. **it is written thus,** Hic fuit Publicus Fornicator. Ab eo tempore defecit omnis Disciplina, & Religio in Cardinalibus, & tres Radices vitiorum, Superbia, Auaritia, Luxuria, valdissimè dominantur: *The Pope was an open Whooremaister. From that time forewarde, al kinde of Discipline, and Religion decaied in the* Cardinalles: *and three rotes of vices,* Pride, Auarice, and Lecherie, *mightily bare the swaie.*

Paralipom. Vrspergen. in Clem. 5.

In Concil. Trid. Antonius Marinarius.

Antonius Marinarius, **at youre late** Chapter at Tridente, **saithe thus of the** Churche of Rome, Si Euangelica Fides nostræ vitæ Regula esset, re ipsa Christiani essemus. Nunc Titulo, & Ceremonijs vocamur Christiani: *If the Faithe of the Gospel were a Rule vnto our life, then shoulde wee be Christians in very deede. As nowe, by Titles, and Ceremonies, wee beare onely the name of Christians.* **To like pourpose saithe** Nicolaus Cusanus **a Cardinal of Rome,** Si rectè respicimus, omnis Religio Christiana, paucis demptis, degenerauit in apparentiam: *If wee marke it wel, al our Christian Religion, a fewe excepted, is growen out of kinde vnto a shewe.*

Nicol. Cusanus Excita. Lib. 9.

At the saide Chapter, **the** Bishop of Bitonto **saide thus, as I haue reported before:** Quibus turpitudinum Monstris, qua sordium Colluuie, qua Peste non sunt fœdati, non corrupti in Ecclesia Sancta, & populus, & Sacerdos? A Sanctuario Dei incipi-

Concil. Trident, Epis. Bitontinus.

cipite: Si vllus iam pudor, si vlla pudicitia, si vlla supereſt bene viuendi vel ſpes, vel ratio: *With what Monſters of Filthineſſe, with what Villanie, with what Peſtilence be they not corrupted, and defiled in the* Holy Churche (**of Rome**) *as wel the Prieſte, as the People? Beginne euen with the Sanctuarie of God: if there be any Shame, if there be any regarde of Honeſtitie, if there be any Hope, or waie to liue wel.*

An other ſaithe, O nos miſeros, qui Chriſtiani dicimur. Gentes agimus ſub nomine Chriſti: *Miſerable are wee, that are called* Chriſtians. *Wee liue as* Heathens, *vnder the name of* Chriſte. **An other ſaithe,** O lugenda Roma, quæ noſtris Maioribus clara Patrum Lumina protuliſti: noſtris temporibus, monſtroſas tenebras, futuro ſæculo famoſas, offudiſti: *O miſerable Rome, which in the time of our Elders haſte brought foorthe the lightes of Woorthy Fathers, but in our daies, haſte brought foorthe Monſtrous Darkeneſſe, ſhameful, and ſclaunderous to the time to comme.* Petrarcha **calleth** Rome a Schoole of Erroure, and a Temple of Hereſie.

Franciſc. Zephyrus in Apologeticum Tertull. Arnulphus, aut Bernardus in Concil. Remen. Petrar. in Rithmis Italicis: Schola di Errori: è Tempio de Ereſia.

Brigitta, **whoſe wordes, and Prophecies we haue in reuerence, ſaithe in her** Reuelations, Chriſtus ſumet Benedictionem à Clero Romano, & dabit eam alteri Genti facienti voluntatem Domini: *Chriſte ſhal take his Bleſſinge from the Cleregie of Rome: and ſhal geeue the ſame vnto a people, that ſhal doo his wil.*

By theſe fewe, we maie conceiue the whole ſtate of the Churche of Rome: **whiche onely Churche, aboue al others, M. Hardinge telleth vs, is ſo founded in the Truthe, that it neuer can haue power to be deceiued.**

We haue departed therefore, from Shepeheardes, that ſpoiled the Flocke: **From** Biſhoppes, that deſtroied the Church: **that** oppreſſed the Sprite of God: **that** defied the voice of the Prophetes: **that** perſequuted Chriſte in his members: **that bothe** periſhed **them ſelues, and** killed others: **that walowed** in monſters of filthineſſe: **that** liued, as Heathens **vnder the name of** Chriſte: **That were** voide of Charitie: voide of Faithe: voide of Diſcipline: voide of Religion: **that were** Chriſtians onely in Titles, and Ceremonies: **From whome** Chriſte had withdrawen his Bleſsinge: **To be ſhorte, we haue departed from the** Temple of Hereſie, **and from the** Schoole of Erroure.

This, M. Hardinge, is the bewtie, and face of your Romaine Cleregie: **this is that bleſſed Companie, that we haue forſaken.**

Yet, ſaie you, It had benne better, to haue died, then to haue broken the Vnitie of ſutch a Churche. **For your Friendes tel you, that without the** Obedience of the Biſhop of Rome, there is no Hope of Saluation. **Notwithſtandinge, your owne** Clemens, **whome ye commonly calle the** Apoſtles Felowe, **ſaithe thus,** Schiſma efficit, non qui ab Impijs ſeceſsionem facit, ſed qui à Pijs: *He maketh no Schiſme, or Diuiſion in the* Churche, *that departeth from the wicked: but he, that departeth from the Godly.* **And therefore he addeth further,** Laici, cum ijs qui contraria ſententiæ Dei dogmata defendunt, nolite ſocietatem habere, neque participes illorum Impietatis fieri. Ait enim Dominus, Recedite de medio horum hominum, ne cum eis pereatis: *Yee Laie menne, haue yee no Felowſhip with them, nor be you Partetakers of theire Wickedneſſe, that defende* Doctrines contrarie to the Doctrine of God. *For our Lorde ſaithe, Departe from the middes of this people, leaſte ye periſhe togeather with them.*

De Maioritat. & Obedient. Vnam Sanctam. Subeſſe Romano Pontifici, eſt de neceſſitate Salutis. Clemens. Apoſtolicar. Conſtitu. Lib. 6. cap. 4. Æneas Sylnius ad Rector. & vniuerſitatē Coloniēn. Paralipomena Vſpergenſi. Pag. 435. Auguſt. de Vnitate Eccle. ca. 10. Nicol. Cuſan. De Concordan. Li. 2. Cap. 25.

Pope Pius. 2. **ſaithe,** Reſiſtendum eſt quibuſcunque in faciem, ſiue Paulus, ſiue Petrus ſit, qui ad Veritatem non ambulat Euangelij: *Wee muſte withſtande any man vnto the face, be it* Peter, *be it* Paule, *if he walke not after the Truthe of the Goſpel.*

S. Auguſtine **ſaithe,** Ne Catholicis quidem Epiſcopis conſentiendum eſt, ſicubi fortè falluntur, & contra Canonicas Scripturas aliquid ſentiant: *Wee maie not agree, no not with the Catholique Biſhoppes, if they happen to be deceiued, and thinke any thinge contrarie to the Canonical Scriptures.*

Therefore Cardinal Cuſanus **aduiſe, by the** Councel at S. Gregorie, **whome he** allegeth, **is, If vices haue growen in the Churche, through ouermutche obedience towardes the Prelates, that we ſauoure them not, but withſtande them:** Vt, ſi qua vitia ex nimia obedientia exorta ſint, non foueantur, ſed eis reſiſtatur: **In whiche wordes it is to be noted, that the People maie yelde** too mutche obedience, **and reuerence towardes theire Prelates.**

S. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Ex ipſis Veris Eccleſijs frequenter exeunt ſeductores. Propterea nec ipſis omninò credendum eſt, niſi ea dicant, vel faciant, quæ conuenientia ſint Scripturis: *Euen out of the very True Churches oftentimes there comme deceiuers. Therefore we maie not in any wiſe beleeue, no not them* (notwithſtanding thei be the True Churches of God) *onleſſe they ſpeake, or doo ſuche thinges, as be agreeable to the Scriptures.*

Chryſoſtom. in Matth. Hom. 49.

Anſelmus, a late VVriter, expounding theſe wordes of S. Paule, Tunc Reuelabitur ille iniquus, ſaith thus, Romanus Pontifex, qui tenet nunc Eccleſias, teneat illas, donec de medio fiat: id eſt, donec ab ipſa Romana Eccleſia, quæ eſt Medium, & Cor Eccleſiarum, fiat iniquitas, ob quam ab ea multæ diſcedant Eccleſiæ: *Let the* Biſhop of Rome, *that now holdeth the Churches, holde them ſtil, vntil it be taken awaie from the middes: that is to ſaie, vntil Wickednes be wrought of the Church of Rome, that is the Middeſte, and harte of Churches:* for whiche wickednes, many Churches ſhal departe from her.

Anſelmus in 2. Theſſalon. 2.

S. Ambroſe ſaithe, Nullus pudor eſt, ad meliora tranſire: *It is no ſhame, to goe to the better.*

Ambroſ. in Epiſt. ad Theodoſ. & Valent.

S. Auguſtine ſaithe vnto Fauſtus the Heretique, Ille me quondam de gremio tuo Error excuſſerat. Expertus fugi, quod experiri non debui: *That Erroure ſhooke me ence out of thy boſome. Being taught by proufe, I haue fledde that thinge, that I ſhould not haue proued.*

Aug. contra Faut. Li. 15. ca. 3.

Ambroſius Anſbertus, one of your owne Doctoures ſaithe, Per Hieremiam Prophetam dicitur, Exite de medio eius populus meus, & ſaluet vnuſquiſq; animam ſuam ab ira furoris Domini. Nequaquam enim in hac vita de medio Ciuitatis reprobæ, id eſt, de medio malorum, quos Babylon illa ſignificat, electorum aliquis valet exire, niſi deteſtando, quod ab ipſis agitur, & agendo, quod ab ipſis deteſtatur: *The Prophete* Hieremie *ſaithe, O my people, goe foorth from the middes of them, and ſaue euery man his owne ſoule from the rage of our Lordes furie. For none of the Electe of God can in this life goe foorthe from the middes of that Wicked Cittie, that is to ſaie from the middes of the euil, whiche that* Babylon *ſignifieth, but by deſeinge, that they doo: and by dooinge, that they deſie.* And, whereas ye woulde ſo fayne dalle our eies, and couer youre deformities with the name of the Churche, S Cyprian ſaithe, Non eſt Pax, ſed Bellum: Nec Eccleſiæ iungitur, qui ab Euangelio ſeparatur: *It is no Peace, but Warre: neither is he ioyned to the* Churche, *that is diuided from the* Goſpel.

Ambroſ. Anſber. in Apocalyp. Li. 2. Ca. 2.

Cyprian. De Lapſis. Serm. 5.

S. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Mihi Ciuitas, non habens pios Ciues, Omni Villa vilior eſt, & quacunque Spelunca ignobilior: *A Cittie, that hathe not Godly Citizens, is vnto mee viler, then any Village: and more lotheſome, then any Caue.* And this he ſaith of the Cittie of Antioche, whiche, by your wordes, he more eſteemeth, then the Cittie of Rome.

Chryſoſt. ad populum Antiochen. Hom. 17.

We graunte, we haue departed from you, vpon ſuche occaſion, and in ſuch ſorte, as Moſes ſometime departed from out of Ægypte: or, as S. Auguſtine departed from the Manichees. Howe be it, in very deede, you haue rather departed from out of vs. Chryſoſtome ſaith, Sic de iſta Noua Hieruſalem, id eſt, de Eccleſia, qui Spirituales Chriſtiani fuerunt, relicta Corporali Eccleſia, quam perfidi occupauerant violentia, exierunt ab illis. Magis autem illi exierunt à nobis, ſicut Iohannes exponit. Non enim illi de Eccleſia exire videtur, qui corporaliter exit, ſed qui Spiritualiter Veritatis Eccleſiaſticæ Fundamenta reliquit. Nos enim ab illis exiuimus Corpore: illi à nobis animo. Nos enim ab illis exiuimus Loco: Illi à nobis Fide. Nos apud illos reliquimus Fundamenta parietum: Illi apud nos reliquerunt Fundamenta Scripturarum. Nos ab illis egreſſi ſumus ſecundum aſpectum Hominum: Illi autem à nobis ſecundum Iudicium Dei. Relicta eſt autem deſerta, ex quo de illa Corporali Eccleſia Spiritualis exiuit: Id eſt, de populo ſuo, qui videbatur Chriſtianus, & non erat, Populus iſte exiuit qui non videbatur, & erat. Magis autem, ſecundum quod diximus, illi à nobis exierunt, quam nos ab illis: *Euen ſo, touchinge this* Newe Hieruſalem, *whiche is the Churche, they, that were Spiritual Chriſtian menne, leauinge the Bodily Churche, whiche the wicked by violence had inuaded, departed out from them: Or, as* S. Iohn *expoundethe it, they rather departed out from vs. For he ſeemeth not in deede to departe from the Churche, that* Bodily *departethe: but he, that Spiritually leaueth the Fundations of the Eccleſiaſtical Truthe. Wee haue departed from them, in* Body: *they haue departed from vs, in* Mihde. *Wee from them,*

Chryſoſtom. in Matt. Homi. 49.

by

The Churche in fevve.

by Place: they from vs, by Faithe. *Wee haue leafte with them the Fundations of the Walles: They haue leafte with vs the Fundations of the Scriptures. Wee are departed fforthe from them, in the sighte of Man: They are departed from vs in the Iudgemente of God. But nowe, after that the Spirituall Churche is gonne fforthe, the Bodily Churche is leafte forefaken: That is to saie, from that people, that seemed to be a Christian people, and was not, this people is gonne fforthe, that seemed not outwardely, but was so in deede. Notwithstandinge, as wee haue saide before, they haue rather departed from vs, then wee from them.*

We saie, your Churche of Rome, that nowe is, and the Primitiue Churche, is al One Churche. Euen so the Moone bothe in the ful, and in the wane, is al One Moone: Euen so Hierusalem, as wel vnder Dauid, as vnder Manasses, was al One Cittie. The Holy place, whether the Maiestie of God, or the Abomination of Desolation stande in it, is al one place. The Primitiue Churche, saie you, and the Churche of Rome, that nowe is, is al one Churche. Therefore wee saie, the Churche of Rome, that nowe is, in Truthe, and Religion, ought to agree with the Primitiue Churche.

Whether the Churche maie be brought to a fewe in number, or no, wee had occasion sommewhat to saie before. The Ancient Father Irenæus saithe, Quemadmodum ibi in plurimis eorum, qui peccauerunt, non bene sensit Deus, Sic & hic multi sunt vocati: pauci verò electi: *As in the* Olde Testamente, *in many of them, that offended, God was not pleased: Euen so nowe in the* Newe Testamente, *many are called, and fewe are Chosen.* In consideration whereof, S. Hierome crieth out in an Agonie within him selfe, Tanta erit Sanctorum paucitas: *So smal shalbe the number of holy menne.* One of your owne Doctours saithe, as it is alleged once before, Licet in hoc bello Dæmonum cadant Religiosi Principes, & Milites, & Prælati Ecclesiastici, & Subditi, semper tamen manent aliqui, in quibus seruatur Veritas Fidei, & Iustificatio bonæ Conscientiæ. Et, si non mundo viri Fideles remanerent in mundo, tamen in illis saluaretur Ecclesia, quæ est Vnitas Fidelium: *Notwithstandinge in this warre of Diuelles, bothe the Godly Princes, and Soldiers, and Ecclesiastical Prelates, and Subiectes be ouerthrowne, yet euermore there remaine sommе, in whome the* Truthe of Faithe, *and the Righteousnesse of good Conscience is preserued. And, notwithstandinge* there were but twoo Faitheful menne *remaininge in the worlde, yet euen in them, the* Churche of God, *whiche is the Vnitie of the Faithefull, shoulde be saued.*

Irenæus, Lib. 4. Cap. 46.

Hieron. in Esai. Lib. 8. Cap. 24.

Fortasse illum Eldei, Lib. 5.

But, for that wee saie, wee were brought vp emonge you in Darkenesse, and Ignorance. We enter out of season into a needelesse discourse of comparison of Learninge. In the Liberal Sciences (ye saie) we are not comparable to the Learned men of your side. It was not our meaninge, M. Hardinge, to cal the Bright beames of your Liberal Learninge into question. It appeareth ye woulde faine haue it blased, and magnified to the vttermoste, and no waie to be disgraced. We meante onely the Knowledge of God, and the open profession of his Holy Worde: In comparison of whiche knowledge, al other knowledge, what so euer, is mere darkenesse.

Nowe be it, touchinge any kinde of the Liberal, and Learned Sciences, there was no greate cause, why ye should, either so highely rowse your selfe in your owne opinion, or so greatly disdeigne others. We maie remember, that your Prouincial Constitutions beginne with these wordes, Ignorantia Sacerdotum.

De Summa Trinita, Lin. Woode.

It were no greate Maiesterie, to charge the Chiefe Doctours of your side with some maner of Learninge. Ludouicus Viues saith, Vt quidq; his superioribus sæculis minùs tritum fuit studentium manibus, ita purius ad nos peruenit: *For the space of certaine hundred yeeres paste, the lesse duly Booke came into (your Learned) students handes, the purer, and better it come to vs.* Meaninge thereby, that curry thinge was the worse, for your Learned handeling. Of Thomas, Scotus, Hugo, & others, of whom ye saide to make so greate accompte, your owne frende Catharinus saith, Scholastici multa inerudite Comminiscuntur: *These* Schole Doctours *imagine many matters vnlearnedly.* Erasmus saith, Portenta quæ nunc passim legimus in Commentarijs Recentium Interpretum, tam impudentia, & insulsa sunt, vt videantur Suibus ea scripsisse, non Hominibus: *The monstrous folies, that we commonly reade in the Commentaries of the late Interpreters,*

Ludoui. Viues de Causis Corrupt. Artium, Lib. 5.

Catharinus ad uersus Dominic. à Soto.

Erasm. in Scholijs in Hieron. ad Marcellam.

preters, (whereby he meaneth the very croppe, & the worthiest of al your Scholastical Learned Doctours) *are so far without shame, an so petuishe, as if they* had benne written for Swine, and not for menne. One of your Doctours saithe, Apostolus, dicitur ab Apos, quod est Argumentum, vel præeminentia, & Stolon, quod est Missio: quasi præeminenter missus. An other saith, Apocrisarij, dicuntur Nuntij Domini Papæ. Nam crisis dicitur Secretum: & Apos dicitur Nuntius. An other saithe, Cathedra, est nomen Græcum, & componitur à Cathos, quod est Fides, & Edra, quod est Sponda. An other saithe, Eleemosyna, dicitur ab Eleis, quod est, Misereri, & Mois quod est Aqua. Peter Crab in his late Scholies vpon the Councelles, saith thus, Mulieres συνεισάκτας, id est, Cohabitantes Sæculos: and so by his highe Learninge, like a Clerke, he tourneth VVeemenne into Sackes. Likewise againe he saithe, Phrygium factum est ex Pennis Pauonum. Of your Liberal Learned Cleregie one saithe thus, Nec verba Canonis intelligunt, nec, quæ sint verba Consecrationis sciunt: *They vnderstande not the woordes of theire* Canon: *neither knowe they, whiche be the woordes of Consecration.* And therefore he, that forged the Rule of Monkes, vnder the name of S. Hierome, chargeth them in any wise to pronounce euery worde distinctly, and warily, leste by theire foolishe vtterance they shoulde make the Angels to falle a laughinge.

Erasmus ad Archiepisc. Toleta. Extra. de Elect. & Electi Potest. Significa. in Gloss. Manipul. Curat. Pag. 101. Inter Decreta. Felicis pp. Conc. Tomo 1. Pag. 168 In Donatione Constantini. Herm. Roddus. Hieron. in Reg. Monacho. Ne ad Risum provocentur Angelici Spiritus.

These fewe maie serue you for a taste. Hereby, M. Hardinge, it maie appeare, your Cleregie hath no greate cause, to make suche triumphe of their Learninge. How be it, we vpbraide you not herewith: nor was this the cause of our departure. We holde bothe Faithe, & Learninge, and Churche, and Religion, by enheritance. Christe hath once praied for Peter: Therefore your Faithe, and Learninge can neuer faile. Yet notwithstandinge, your late Bookes, freighte with so many vncivile, and vaine speaches (for of your often Vntruthes I will saie nothinge) sauour more of Choler, and stomake, then of Learninge. S. Hierome saithe, Doctrina viri per patientiam noscitur. Quia tantò quisque minùs ostenditur doctus, quantò conuincitur minùs patiens: *A mans* Learninge *is knowen by his patience. For the lesse patiente a manne sheweth him selfe to be, the lesse he sheweth to be his* Learninge. Therefore, M. Hardinge, your impatiente demeanoure, and vnkindely heates, maie calle your Learninge into question.

Hieron. in Proverb. Li. 2. Ca. 19

Woulde God, we woulde humble your knowledge, and make it obediente to the knowledge of God. Otherwise, that Peter saide vnto Simon Magus, of his monie, maie likewise be saide vnto you, of your knowledge: Thy knowledge be with thee to thy destruction. Our Learninge, is the Crosse of Christe: of other Learninge we make no vauntes. God is called the God of Truthe, and not of Learninge. S. Paule saithe, *All kinde of* Learninge *shalbe abolished, and consumed to nothinge.* God make vs al *Learned to the Kingedome of* Heauen.

Actor. 8.

1. Corinth. 2. 3. Esd. 4. 1. Cor. 13. Matth. 13.

The Apologie, Cap. 13. Diuision. 1.

But, wherefore, I praie you, haue they themselues, the Citizens, & dwellers of Rome, remoued, and comme downe from those Seuen Hilles, whereupon Rome sometime stood, to dwel rather in the Plaine, called the fielde of Mars? Thei will saie peraduenture, bicause the conduites of water, where without menne cannot commodiously liue, haue now failed, & are dried vp in those Hilles. Wel then, lette them geeue vs like leaue in seekinge the VVater of Eternal Life, that they geue themselues in seekinge the VVater of the vvel. For that water verily failed amongest them. The Elders of the Ievves, saithe Ieremie, sente theire litle ones to the VVateringes: and they, findinge no VVater, being in miserable case, and vtterly loste for thirst, brought home againe their vessels emptie. The needy and poore folke, saithe Esaie, sought aboute for VVater: but no vvhere founde they any: theire tongue

Hierem. 14.

Esai. 41.

tongue was euen withered for thirste. Euen so these menne haue broken in peeces al the pipes, and conduites: they haue stopped vp al the springes, & choked vp the Fountaine of Liuinge Water with dirte, and myre. And, as Caligula, many yeeres paste, locked vp faste al the garnardes, and storehouses of corne in Rome, and thereby brought a generall dearth and famine amongst the people, euen so these menne, by damminge vp al the Fountaines of Goddes VVoorde, haue brought the people into a pitiful thirste. They haue broughte into the worlde, as saithe the Prophete Amos, a Hunger, and a Thirste: not the Hunger of Breade, nor the Thirste of VVater, but of hearing the VVoorde of God. With greate distresse wente they scatteringe aboute, seekinge somme sparke of heauenly light, to refreashe theire consciences withal: but that lighte was already thoroughly quenched out, so that they coulde finde none. This was a rueful state: This was a lamentable forme of Goddes Churche. It was a miserie, to liue therein, without the Gospel, without Light, and without al Comforte. Amos. 8.

M. Hardinge.

VVel, and wittely reasoned forsoothe. No no Sirs, if it were that holesome VVater of Eternal life whiche yee thirste after, * yee woulde neuer haue departed from the highe hil, the Catholike Churche, and come downe into the valleis, where yee finde the durty pudles of fleashely pleasures, where the Deuil Behemoth, as Iob saithe, *Dormit in locis humentibus*, sleapeth in moiste places. Al were not sterued for hunger and thirste of that water of Gods VVoorde. Therefore yee speake bothe slaunderously and ignorantly for diuines, where yee saie, that wee had broken in peeces al the pipes and conduites, that wee had stopped vp al the springes, and choked, and dammed vp al the Fountaines of Liuinge VVater with durte and myre. * Vntruthe. For wee are not departed frō the Catholique Churche.

Yet vnwares or ignorantly, they cal that faithles and pagane state, a lamentable forme of Gods Churche, whereas they shoulde haue accoumpted it no Churche at al. For where is no woorde of God, no light, no Gospel at al, howe can there be any Churche? VVithout these, any multitude is no more a Churche, then without Christe, a man is a Christian, then a deade man is a man. And thus with malicious slaunderinge, not with learned reasons: with theire owne affirmations, not with apte allegations, haue they gone aboute to proue, that these many hundred yeeres the Churche hath erred. But thankes be to God, al this winde shaketh no corne. VVhen al these hasty blastes be blowne ouer, the Churche of God shal stande stil vnmoued, vpon the rocke, Christe builded it on, and appeare glorious in her stedfastnes and truthe, maugre the gainsaieinge of al Heretikes, and shal appeare to them terrible, as a stronge armie set in battaile raye.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Here, M. Hardinge, ye beginne out of season to plaie with your Allegories, and Mystical Fantasies. Your Catholique Churche of Rome, you saie, is the Mounte: Worldly pleasure is the Vale. By whiche Comparison, we muste beleue, that the Pope, and his Cardinalles, sittinge on highe vpon the Mounte, passe theire time there onely in Fastinge, and Prayer, and in al manner pouertie, and penurie, and streitenesse of Life, and haue vtterly abandoned al worldly pleasures. Notwithstandinge somme haue saide, In Cardinalibus Superbia, Auaritia, Luxuria validissimè dominantur: *In the Cardinalles of Rome Pride, Auarice, and Lecherie are in their greatest Courrage.* Howe be it, touchinge as wel this, as other your like folies, concerninge the Churche, I wil not saie, Ye harpe your wonte: but I muste needes saie, Ye do but trifle. *Paralipomen. Vrspergen. in Clement. 5.*

The Apologie, Cap. 13. Diuision. 1.

Wherefore, though our Departinge were a trouble to them, yet ought they to consider withal, howe iuste cause we had of our Departure.

M. Hardinge.

In deede our charitie is suche, as wee confesse it to be a griefe vnto vs, to see you plaie the parte of rebellious children, to vse presumption for submission, contempt for obedience, spite for loue. Yet suche that yee are desperate and incorrigible, as by your departinge from vs the Churche felte some anguishe

departing from the Churche of Rome.

anguishe and trouble, so nowe that ye are gone, it is relieued, as the body is eased, when after a purgation it hath auoided euil humours. Nowe saie your Beste.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Wée are not gonne from the Churche of God, M. Hardinge: Wée are gonne onely from you, that haue so vnreuerently abused the Churche. But yee feele good ease (yée saie) and are wel relieued by our departure, as, **to vse your homely comparisons,** a sicke body is relieued by a purgation. **God of his mercie graunt, that yée maie likewise be purged of al the reste of ourc brethren in other Countries. So shal yée fele more ease, and be better relieued.**

Hieronym. ad Fabiolam, De. 42. Mansionibus, Mansione. 1.

S. Hierome saithe, Hebræi dicunt, quòd ea nocte, qua egressus est Israel ex Ægypto, omnia in Ægypto Templa destructa sunt: siue terræ motu, siue ictu fulminum. Spiritualiter autem dicimus, quòd, egredientibus nobis ex Ægypto, errorum Idola corruant, & omnis Peruersarum Doctrinarum cultura quatiatur: *The Rabins, or Hebrewe Doctoures saie, that the same nighte, that* Israel departed out of Egypte, *al the Idolatrous Temples in* Egypte *were destroied: either by Earthequake, or by Lightninge. But hereof wee learne, in a Spiritual sense, that, when wee departe out of* Egypte (**that is to saie, from the companie of** Idolaters) *the* Idolles of errour *falle to the grounde, and al the honour of false Doctrine is shaken downe.* **Suche reliefe, M. Hardinge, wée truste, yée shal finde by our departure.**

Beda in Apocal. Lib. 3. Cap. 18.

Beda, **expounding these wordes of the** Apocalyps, Comme foorthe from her, my people, and be not partetakers of her sinnes, **saithe thus:** Inducit discessionem, quæ est ruina Babylonis: cùm enim Loth discesserit à Sodomis, Sodomæ funditùs tolluntur: S. Iohn *speaketh of the departure, whiche is the ruine, and fal of Babylon. For, when* Loth *shal departe out of* Sodome, *then shal* Sodome *vtterly be ouerthrowen.*

Beda in Apocal. Lib. 3. Cap. 19.

Againe he saithe, Post hæc audiui vocem, Alleluia: Laus, & Gloria, & Virtus Deo nostro. Hæc nunc ex parte dicit Ecclesia. Tunc autem perfectè dicet, cùm discessio facta fuerit: *After this I heard a voice,* Alleluia: *Praise, and Glorie, and Power be to our God. This singe the Churche in parte singeth already. But then shal shee in deede and perfitely singe it, when departure shalbe made (from* Antichriste, or Babylon).

The Apologie, Cap. 14. Diuision. 1.

For if they saie, It is in no wise lawful for one, to leaue the felowship, wherein he hathe benne brought vp, they maie aswel in our names, and vpon our heades, likewise condemne the Prophetes, the Apostles, and Christe him selfe. For why complaine they not also of this, that Loth wente quite his waie out of Sodome: Abraham out of Chaldee, the Israelites out of Egypte, Christe from the Iewes, and Paule from the Pharisеis? For excepte it be possible, there maie be a lawful cause of Departinge. wee see no reason, why Loth, Abraham, the Israelites, Christe, and Paule maie not be accused of Sectes, and Seditions, aswel as others.

M. Hardinge.

Yet bringe ye nothinge to the purpose. Your prouses be so weake, and hange so euil togeather, that wee maie wel tel you (whiche Irenæus obiected to Heretikes) that yee make a rope of sande. VVe saie not, it is in no wise lawful for one to leaue the felowship, wherein he hath benne brought vp. But contrarywise (a) if the felowship be naught and wicked, euery one is bounde to eschewe it. Departe from Babylon my people, and be not ye partakers of her sinnes, saithe the heauenly voice to S. Iohn. (b) Therefore the examples, ye bringe, helpe nothinge your cause.

(a) Thus mutch confessed is sufficiente.

(b) A suddaine Conclusion.

Loth wente out of Sodome, Abraham of Chaldea, the Israelites of Egypte, Paule from the Phariseis, by Gods special warninge. VVhere yee saie, Christe wente from the Iewes, onlesse yee referre it to his steppinge aside from them for a while: yee shoulde rather haue saide, the Iewes wente from Christe. But whereto perteineth this? Though yee were so malicious, as to compare the Catholike Churche to Sodome, to Chaldea, to Egypte, to the Iewes and Phariseis: yet, I weene, yee are not so proude, as (c) to compare your selues to Loth, to Abraham, to Gods peculiar people, to Paule, to Christe him selfe. These departinges wee allowe, and God required them: yours we blame, and God detesteth.

(c) A vaine folie For a good mā maie folowe Christ without presumptuous Comparison.

The

Example of Christ.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Wee compare not our selues, M. Hardinge, neither with Loth, nor with Abraham, nor with Paule: leaste of al with Christe him selfe. But wee humbly submitte our selues bothe in life, and in Doctrine, to be guided by their Examples. And thus, I truste, wee maie lawfully do, without iuste note of presumption. S. Chrysostome saithe, Data est tibi potestas diuinitùs imitandi Christum, vt possis illi similis fieri. Noli expauescere hoc audiens. Timendum enim tibi potius est, si similis illi fieri negligas: *Thou haste power geeuen thee from* God *to followe* Christe, *that thou maiste be like vnto him. Be thou not afraide to heare this thinge. Thou haste more cause to feare, if thou refuse to be like vnto him.* **Likewise saithe the Ancient Father** Origen, Si quem imitari volumus, propositus est nobis Christus ad imitandum: *If wee desire to followe any man,* Christe *is set before vs, that wee shoulde followe him.**Chryso. in Matthe. Homil. 79.*

Origen. in Ezechiel. Homil. 7.

But if it be so Prowde **a parte, as you saie, in Religion, and Life to followe** Christe, **what is he then, that claimeth to him selfe** Christes Authoritie, **and calleth him selfe euen by the name of** Christe? **We knowe, who is wel contented, to beare him selfe thus saluted:** *Touchinge* Primacie, thou arte Abel: *touchinge Gouernemente,* thou arte Noë: *touchinge the Patriarkeship*, thou arte Abraham: *touchinge Order*, thou arte Melchisedech: *touchinge Dignitie*, thou arte Aaron: *touchinge Authoritie*, thou arte Moses: *touchinge Iudgemente*, thou arte Samuel: *touchinge Power*, thou arte Peter: *touchinge Anointinge*, thou arte Christe. **These wordes, I trowe, M. Hardinge, maie sommewhat seeme to sauoure of Pride. Your** Pope **is wel contented, to take the name, not onely of** Peter, **but also of** Christe.*Bernard. De Consideratio. Lib. 2.*

The Apologie, Cap. 14. Diuision. 2.

And, if these menne will needes condemne vs for Heretiques, bicause we doo not al thinges at theire Commaundemente, whom (in Goddes Name) or what kinde of menne ought they them selues to be taken for, whiche despise the Commaundement of Christe, **and of the** Apostles?

M. Hardinge.

Our frailtie concerninge life, wee accuse, and lamente, and commende our selues to Gods infinite mercie. Touchinge belefe and necessarie doctrine of faithe, rayle ye at vs neuer so muche, we neither despise the * Commaundementes of Christe, nor the * traditions of the Apostles.

*Vntruthes notorious, and manifeste vnto the worlde.

The Apologie, Cap. 14. Diuision. 3.

If wee be Schismatiques, bicause wee haue leafte them, by what name then shal they be called them selues, whiche haue forsaken the Greekes, from vvhom thei firste receiued their Faithe, forsaken the Primitiue Churche, forsaken Christe him selfe, and the Apostles, euen as if Children shoulde forsake theire parentes?

M. Hardinge.

VVho so euer departe from the Catholike Churche, they be Schismatikes: yee haue departed from the Catholike Churche, of (a) these nine hundred yeeres: ergo ye be Schismatikes. The firste proposition ye wil not denie, The seconde your selues confesse: the conclusion then muste needes be true. If we saie the same, blame vs not. Neither saie we that onely, but also that yee are Heretikes. VVhereby the measure of your iniquitie is increaced. The same crime yee woulde impute vnto vs, if ye wiste howe. If ye haue no more to laie to our charge, but that wee haue forefaken the Greekes, ye shal not be offended with the worlde, if it geue vs the title, name, and estimation of Catholikes, as heretofore. For (remember your selues) we haue not forsaken the Greekes, but the Greekes in somme pointes haue forsaken vs. By the name of vs, alwaies I vnderstande the Catholike Churche, euen the Holy Romaine Churche, whose faithe wee professe, and with whom wee communicate.

(a) Here M. Har. freely yeldeth vs the firste fixe hundred, and three score yeres, that is to saie, the whole time of the Apostles, and Holy Fathers of the Churche.

(b) And how standeth it with your learninge, that we receiued the faithe firste from the Greekes? For where yee saie, we haue forefaken the Primitiue Church, yea Christe him self, and the Apostles, ye haue tolde vs this so oftē, that now we take them to be but woordes of course, and a common blaste of your railinge sprite. The Romaine Churche receiued the faithe from Ierusalem (c) and not from Greece, as the reste of the worlde did, accordinge to the Prophecie, *De Sion exibit lex, &c.* As for the lande of Britaine our natiue Countrie, if the faithe were firste brought hither by Ioseph of Arimathæa, and his felowes, as by olde tradition wee are tolde: (d) then was the Churche here firste planted by faithefull Iewes, and not by Greekes. This beinge true, wee maruel what yee meane, to charge

(b) Reade the Answeare.

(c) Vntruthe, As shal soone appeare.

(d) Certainely we receiued not our Faithe firste frō the Church of Rome.

The Faith brought to Rome oute of Græcia.

charge vs with forſakinge the Greekes, ſpecially where ye ſaie, we firſte receiued the faithe from them. VVhiche is no truer, then that wee receiued our Engliſhe language from them.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

It were no ſhame for you, M. Hardinge, to confeſſe, that the Churche of Rome firſte receiued her Faithe from the Churches of Græcia. Neither are they ſo vtterly voide of Learninge, that haue laide the ſame. Rather I marueile, what Learninge can leade you ſo vnlearnedly to ſaie the contrarie. S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Terra Græcorum, vnde vbique deſtinata eſt Fides: *The Lande of* Græcia, *from whence the Faithe into al places was ſente abroade.* Againe he ſaithe, Radix Orientalium Eccleſiarum, vnde Euangelium in Aphricam venit: *The Roote of the Eaſte Churches, from whence the Goſpel came into* Aphrica. S. Chryſoſtome ſaithe vnto the people of Antioche, Chriſtianorum nomen velut ex quodam Fonte, hinc incipiens, omnem mundum inundauit: *The name of* Chriſtians *beginninge firſte from this Cittie of* Antioche, *as from a Springe, hath flowed ouer the whole worlde.* The Biſhoppes of the Eaſte wrote thus vnto Iulius the Biſhop of Rome: Ad Eccleſiam Romanam ab Oriente Prædicatores Dogmatis aduenerunt: *The Preachers of Chriſtian Doctrine came from the Eaſte to the* Churche of Rome. Likewiſe S. Baſile ſaithe, *The Goſpel of the Kingedome, ſpringinge vp* firſte in the Churche of Græcia, *was from thence publiſhed abroade into al the worlde.* Euſebius ſaithe, Lucis virtus, & Sacræ Religionis Lex, beneficio Dei, quaſi è ſinu Orientis profecta, cunctum ſimul Orbem Sacro lubare illuſtrauit: *The power of the Lighte, and the Lawe of Holy Religion, by Goddes benefite, ſpringinge out, as it were from the boſome of the Eaſte, hath ſhined euer the whole worlde togeather with a bleſſed beame.* The Emperoure Iuſtinian ſaithe, Conſtantinopolis, Religionis, & Fidei Mater perpetua: *Conſtantinople is the Euerlaſtinge Mother of Faithe, and Religion.* And likewiſe againe, Sacroſancta Conſtantinopolitanæ Ciuitatis Eccleſia, Mater Pietatis noſtræ, & Chriſtianorum Orthodoxæ Religionis omnium: *The moſte Holy Churche of the* Cittie of Conſtantinople, *the Mother of our Holineſſe, and the Mother of al Chriſtians of the Catholique Faithe.*

In like ſorte, the Churche of Conſtantinople, euen vntil this daie, intituleth it ſelfe: ἡ Κωνσταντινουπόλεως ἐκκλησία, ἡ μήτηρ πάντων τῶν ὀρθοδόξων, καὶ διδάσκαλος: The Churche of Constantinople, *the Mother, and Maiſtreſſe of al that be Catholique.* To be ſhorte, if yée wil not beleue any of theſe, yet at leaſte yée maie beleue your owne Felowes. The Biſhop of Bitonto in your late Chapter at Tridente, vttered theſe wordes, as it maie wel appeare, with luſty courage: Eia igitur Græcia Mater Noſtra, cui id totum debet, quod habet Latina Eccleſia: *O therefore oure Mother* Græcia: *vnto whom the Latine Churche, or the* Churche of Rome, *is beholden for al, that euer ſhee hathe.*

Theſe thinges, M. Hardinge, beinge true, yée marueile, what ſhould moue you to denie, that yée firſt receiued the Faithe from the Churche of Græcia. Touchinge the mater it ſelfe, it is written thus in your owne Councelles, Si Græci per quandam Sciſſuram, diuiduntur à Latinis, ita Latini à Græcis. Et ideò videtur, quòd, Si Græci debent dici Schiſmatici propter huiuſmodi Diuiſionem, eadem ratione, & Latini: præterea Græci magis ſeruant Antiquas Conſuetudines Apoſtolorum, & Diſcipulorum Chriſti, in Barbis, &c. *If the* Greekes, *by a certaine* Diuiſion, *be ſundred from the* Latines, *euen ſo be the* Latines *ſundred from the* Greekes. *And therefore it ſeemeth, if the* Greekes *in reſpecte of this* Diuiſion *ought to be called* Schiſmatiques, *that then the* Latines *alſo ought ſo to be called in like caſe. Furthermore, the* Greekes *doo more duely keepe the Olde Cuſtomes of the Apoſtles, and of Chriſtes Diſciples, touchinge Beardes, &c. then doo the* Latines.

The Apologie, Cap. 15. Diuiſion. 1.

For though thoſe Greekes, who this daie profeſſe Religion, and the name of Chriſte, haue many thinges corrupted amongeſt them, yet holde they ſtil a greate number of thoſe thinges, whiche they receiued from the Apoſtles. They haue neither Priuate Maſſes, nor mangled Sacramentes, nor Purgatories, nor Pardones. And as for the Titles

Aug. Epiſt. 178. Aug. Epiſt. 170. Chryſoſt. ad Pop. Antiochen. Homil. 4. Tripart. Hiſtor. Lib. 4. Cap. 16. Socrom. Li. 3. ca. 8 ἐν καὶ ἐν τῆς ἑῴου ἐνελάμψαν αὐτοῖς οἱ τῆς δόγματος ἀκτῖνες. Baſil. in Epiſt. ad Epiſ. per Italiã & Galliam. Euſeb. De vita Conſta. Orati. 2. Cod. de Sacroſã. Eccleſijs. L. Iubemus. §. ſcientes. Cod. in Eod. titu. L. Decernimus. Epiſt. Eccle. Conſtantinop. Ad Eccle. Pragen. Concil. Trident. Oratio Epiſcopi Bitontini.

In opere Tripart. li. 2. ca. 1. In. 2. To. Concil.

The Greke Churche.

titles of Highe Biſhoppes, and thoſe glorious names, they eſteme them ſo, as whoſoeuer he were, that woulde take vppon him the ſame, and would be called, either Vniuerſal Biſhop, or the Heade of the Vniuerſal Churche, they make no doubt, to cal ſutche a one, bothe a paſſing proud man, and a man, that wroughte the deſpite againſte al the other Biſhops his Brethren, and a plaine Heretique.

M. Hardinge.

As ye haue oftentimes belied vs, (a) ſo nowe yee belie the poore Greekes. So little are yee able to ſaie ſomewhat, and therein to ſaie truthe. For they haue Maſſe commonly without companie to communicate with the Prieſte, whiche ye cal Priuate Maſſe: ſo (b) it is al Greece ouer, ſo is it in Aſia, in Syria, in Aſſyria, in Armenia, and where ſo euer the Religion of Chriſte is profeſſed: As amonge the Greekes, in Venis, I my ſelf and diuerſe of our countrie menne haue ſene it commonly practized. Likewiſe praie they al for the deade, and thinke them to be relieued by the praiers, oblations, almoſe, and deedes of charitie, done for them by the liuing. Which minde, and opinion implieth that faithe, (c) which the Churche holdeth of Purgatorie.

(a) Vntruth. As it ſhall plainly appeare.

(b) Vntruth, As large, as manifeſte.

(c) vntruth for the Grecians neuer receiued theſe fantaſies of Purgatorie.

But though (ſaie ye) thoſe Greekes haue many thinges corrupted, yet holde they ſtil a greate number of thoſe thinges, whiche they receiued of the Apoſtles. And wilt thou know, Reader, what they be? Forſothe they haue neither Priuate Maſſes, nor mangled Sacramentes, nor Purgatories, nor Pardons. Is not the witte of this Defender to bee commended, that maketh a man to holde that, whiche he hath not? Thoſe Greekes holde ſtil, ſaithe he. What holde they? Mary they haue not this and that. This is a newe kinde of holding, for a man to holde, that he hathe not. If they holde ſtil, then haue they ſtil. But they haue not, ſaithe he, then howe holde they? A man maie by the rules of this newe Logique, thus reaſon. The Turkes, Saracenes, Iewes, Infidels, Idolaters, yea, the ſhepe of Cotteſholde alſo, if yee wil, haue neither priuate Maſſes, nor Communion vnder one kinde, nor Purgatories, nor Pardons. Ergo, they hold a number of thinges, which they receiued from the Apoſtles. The antecedent is true. Who ſo euer denieth the conſequente, muſte compte this Defenders Logique very ſimple. What if one ſhould make this argumente, This Defender hath neither good Logique nor very fine Rhetorike, nor profound Philoſophie, nor the right knowledge of Diuinitie, Ergo, he holdeth many Hereſies? Though bothe the Antecedent, and Conſequente be true, yet is the argument naught. For by like reaſon one mighte conclude, an honeſt vnlearned Catholike man ro be an Heretique, whiche were falſe and iniurious. Suche is the Logique, ſuche are the topikes of this newe negatiue, and ablatiue diuinitie, for ſo may we worthely cal it. Negatiue, in reſpect of their blaſphemous tongues, denieing ſundrie weightie pointes of our Faithe, Ablatiue, in reſpecte of their wicked handes, caſtinge away, throwinge downe, and takinge away many good thinges, perteininge to the maintenance of Chriſten Religion, and Goddes honoure. Put them from their Negatiues, and from their Ablatiues, then in what caſe ſhal they ſtande?

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

I am aſhamed, the worlde ſhould be combred with ſo childiſhe folies. This Defenders witte (yée ſaie) is to be commended. He maketh a man to holde, that he neuer hadde. And what holde they? ſaie you. Mary, they haue not this, and that. This is a newe kinde of holdinge, for a man to holde, that hee hathe not. If they holde ſtil, then haue they ſtil. But they haue not, then howe holde they? Now ſurely, M. Hardinge, I trowe, yée ſhal Haue, and Holde a mery man. So prety ſporte yée canne make youre ſelfe with Hauing and Holdinge. It were great pitie, yée ſhould euer be otherwiſe occupied. Annibal of Carthage, when he hadde heard Phormio the Oratoure talke pleaſantly a longe whyle togeather, beinge afterwarde demaunded, what he thought of his Eloquence, made aunſweare in this homely ſorte, Multos ſe vidiſſe deliros ſeneſcere, qui magis, quàm Phormio, deliraret, vidiſſe neminem.

Cicero. De Oratore. 2.

But, ſomme what to yelde vnto your pleaſance, why maie not a man Holde, that he neuer Hadde, as wel as Loſe, that he neuer Had? In the Learned Gloſes vpon your Decrees, yée maie finde this note emongeſt others, Nota, quòd aliquis dicitur perdere, quod nunquam habuit: *Marke wel this: A man maie be ſaide to* Loſe, *that he neuer* Hadde. And yet, ye ſaie commonly in the Schooles, Priuatio ſemper præſupponit habitum: *The* Loſinge *of a thinge alwaies preſuppoſethe the* Hauinge *of the ſame.* Or, to anſweare you in plainer wiſe, why maie not a man as wel Holde nothinge, as you maie talke ſo much and yet ſaide nothinge? Galene ſaide ſommetime to one, that ſpake then in ſutche ſubſtantial manner, as you ſpeake nowe, Accipe nihil: & tene fideliter: *Take nothinge, and keepe it ſafely, and holde it faſte.*

Diſt. 17. Concil. in Gloſſ.

Galenus.

But to leaue youre folies, and ſely toies, M. Hardinge, with youre Turkes, and

Saracens, and Sheepe of Cotesholde, wée saye not, The Grékes Holde still, that they neuer Had: But wée say, They Holde still, that they euer Had. Your Priuate Masses, and your Dimi Communions they Holde not: for they Had them neuer. The Holy & Whole Communion in Both kindes, they Holde still; and sithence the Apostels time they haue had them euer.

They pray also for the deade: and therin (ye say) is implied your Fayth of Purgatorie. I wil not here touche the simplicitie of your Rhetorique, or Logique, M. Harding: But onely wish you, to haue better regarde to your Diuinitie. For ought that I can sée, Prayer for the Deade, and your fantasie of Purgatorie, were neuer so straytely coupled together, but that they might well and easily go asunder. The Grecians as they Pray for the Deade, so do they Praie for the Apostels, for the Patriarkes, for the Prophetes, and for the Blessed Virgin our Ladie: as you may some perceiue by S Basils and by S. Chrysostoms Liturgie. Yet, I thinke, ye would not haue your Reader beléeue, as an Article of your Faith, that the Apostels of Christe, the Patriarkes, the Prophetes, and the Blessed Virgin Christes Mother are still in Purgatorie. What so euer other opinion the Grecians haue of the Dead, certaine it is, they could neuer yet be brought to beléeue your Purgatorie.

Liturgia Basilij.

Liturgia Chrysostomi.

Rossensis, one of your greatest doctours, as I haue sayd before, sayth thus: ¶Purgatorium Græcis vsque ad hunc diem non est creditum: *The* Grecians *vntil this daye beléeue not* Purgatorie. Thus M. Harding, I knowe not, whether by your Logique, or by your Diuinitie, (for both are maruellous) ye would faine force your poore Grekes, to Holde that thing, that they neuer Had.

Polydor. De Inuentoribus lib. 8. cap. 1.

Another proper pastime yée make your self with your Negatiues, and Ablatiues. And wherfore, it were hard to tel, sauing that, I sée, yée were wel disposed, & wel it became you, to be merry. The Ancient Learned Fathers, hauing to deale with impudent Heretiques, that in defense of their Errours, auouched the Iudgement of al the Olde Bishops, and Doctors that had bene before them, and the generall consente of the Primitiue and whole vniuersal Church, and that with as good regard of Truth, and as faythfully, as you do nowe, the better to dyscouer the shameles boldenesse, and nakednesse of their Doctrine, were oftentimes likewise forced to vse the Negatiue, and so to driue the same Heretiques as wée do you, to proue their Affirmatiues: which thing to do it was neuer possible. The Auncient Father Irenæus thus stayed himselfe, as wée do, by the Negatiue: Hoc neque Prophetæ Prædicauerunt, neque Dominus docuit, neque Apostoli tradiderunt: *This thing neyther did the Prophets publishe, nor our Lorde teache, nor the Apostles deliuer.* By a like Negatiue Chrysostome sayth, Hanc arborem non Paulus plantauit, non Apollo rigauit, non Deus auxit: *This tree* (of Errour) *neyther* Paule *planted, nor* Apollo *watred, nor* God *encreased.* In like sort Leo sayth, Quid opus est in cor admittere, quod Lex non docuit, quod Prophetia non cecinit, quod Euangelij Veritas non prædicauit, quod Apostolica doctrina non tradidit? *What needeth it to beleue that thing, that neyther the Lawe hath taught, nor the Prophetes haue spoken, nor the Gospel hath preached, nor the Apostels haue deliuered?* And agayn, Quomodo noua inducúntur, quæ nunquam nostri sensere Maiores? *How are these new deuises brought in, that our Fathers neuer knewe?*

Irenæus, Lib. 1. Cap. 1

Chrysost. De Incomprehens. Dei natura, hom. 3.

Leo, epist. 93 Cap. 2.

Leo, epist. 97 Cap. 3.

S. Augustine hauing reckened vp a great number of the Bishoppes of Rome, by a generall Negatiue sayth thus: In hoc ordine Successionis nullus Donatista Episcopus inuenitur: *In al this order of Succession of Bishoppes, there is not one Bishop found that was a Donatist.* S. Gregorie, being himselfe a Byshop of Rome, and writing against the Title of Vniuersal Byshop, sayth thus, Nemo Decessorum meorum hoc tam prophano vocabulo vti consensit: Nullus Romanorũ Pontificũ hoc singularitatis nomen assumpsit: *None of al my Predecessors euer consented to vse this vngodly Title:* No Bishop of Rome *euer toke vpon him this name of Singularitie.* By such Negatiues M. Harding, we reproue the Vanitie, and Noueltie of your Religion. We tell you, none of the Ancient Catholique Learned Fathers, eyther Greeke, or Latine, euer vsed, eyther your Priuate Masse, or your Halte Communion, or your barbarous Vnknowen Prayers. Paule neuer planted them: Apollo neuer watred them: God neuer increased them. Thei are of your selues: Thei are not of God.

Augustin. Epist. 165

Gregorius. Lib. 4. epi. 32

Theis

Priuate Masse in the Greke Churche.

These, and other like Negatiues, the Holy Fathers in Olde times might safely vse without controlment: for that there was no Doctoure of Louaine as yet vp start, to carpe, and quarrel at theire Diuinitie. Leaue this childishe, and vnsauery sporting, and trifling with youre Negatiues, M. Hardinge. It weare a great deale more semely, for a man of Learninge, and Grauitie, and more to youre purpose, to proue your Affirmatiues.

They haue Priuate Masse (yée saie) in al Græcia, Asia, Syria, Assyria, Armenia, and where so euer the Religion of Christe is professed. Al this wée must nedes beleue vpon your worde: for other proufe yée offer to make none. Notwithstandinge, if they haue suche Priuate Masses in al those Countries, tel vs, I beseeche you, who were the Authours, and Makers of these Masses? Yée wil saie, S. Iames, S. Chrysostome, or S. Basile. For of these Names and Masses, yée haue tolde vs many a tale. Yet, if yée consider the mater wel, yée shal finde, that these selfe same Masses were our Communions, and nothing like to your Masses: And, that the Holy Sacramentes at the same, contrarie to your newe diuises, were deliuered generally in Bothe kindes to al the people.

S. Iames in his Masse saithe thus, Diaconi tollunt Discos, & Calices, ad impertiendum populo: *The Deacons take vp the Dishes, and the Cuppes, to minister the Sacramente vnto the people.* *Liturgia Iacobi.*

S. Chrysostome in his Masse saithe thus, Post Mysteria feruntur ad locum, vbi populus debet communicare: *Afterward the Holy Mysteries, or Sacramentes be brought vnto the place, where the people muste receiue togeather.* *Liturgia Chrysostom.*

S. Basile in his Masse saithe thus, Nos omnes de vno Pane, & de vno Calice participantes, &c. Cantores cantant Communionem: & sic Communicant Omnes: *Al we receiuinge of One Breade, and one Cuppe. &c. The Quiere singeth the Communion: and so they Communicate Altogeather.* Therefore, M. Hardinge, yée muste nedes confesse, either that the Grecians this daie vse none of these Masses, or, that their Masses are not youre Masses, but our Communions: Wbiche bothe are contrarie to youre selfe. *Liturgia Basily.*

In the Armenians Liturgie, it is written thus, Qui non sunt digni Communicare hanc Oblationem Dei, exeant foras ante fores Ecclesiæ, & ibi Orent: *They, that are not worthy to receiue this Oblation of God, let them goe forthe before the Churche doore: and there let them praie.* *Georgius Cassander in Liturgijs.*

Of the Grecians order in this behalfe, youre greate, and special Doctoure, Cardinal Bessarion, beinge him selfe a Greeke borne, saithe thus, Hoc ipse ordo rerum poscebat: primùm, Consecrare: deinde, Frangere: posteà, distribuere: Quod nos in præsenti facimus: *This the very order of the thinges required: firste, that wee shoulde* Consecrate, *or Blesse the Breade: Nexte, that wee shoulde* Breake it: *Laste of al, that wee shoulde* Diuide it, (or deliuer it to the people). VVhiche thinge vvee (Grecians) doo at this presente daie. Thus you se, M. Harding, that the Grecians this daie Consecrate, Breake, and Diuide the Sacramente vnto the people, as wée doo. They receiue it not Priuately to them selues alone, the people standinge by, and gasinge on them, as you doo. Therefore it is vntrue, that you saie, They haue this daie youre Priuate Masse. *Bessarion. De Sacrament. Eucharistie. Circa annũ Domi. 1450.*

Touchinge the Grecians, that liue nowe in Venice, what order they vse there, I cannot telle Notwithstandinge, as I haue heard saie, Priuate Masse they haue not. But if they haue, liuinge vnder the Popes Iurisdiction, it is no marueile. Certaine it is, that Venice is no parte of Grecia.

Matthias Illyricus, being him selfe borne in Dalmatia, not far from the Confines, or Borders of Grecia, and therefore, as it maie be thought, the better acquainted with theire Orders, saithe thus: Ecclesia Græca, eique coniunctæ, Asiatica, Macedonica, Mysica, Valachica, Rutenica, Moschouitica, & Aphricana, id est, totus Mundus, vel certè eius maxima pars, nunquam Primatum Papæ communi consensu concesserunt: nunquam Purgatorium probauerunt: nunquam Priuatas Missas: nunquam Communionem sub vna specie: *The Churche of* Grecia, *and the Churches of* Asia, Macedonia, Mysia, Valachia, Russia, Moschouia, *and* Aphrica, *ioined therevnto, that is to saie, in a manner the Whole Worlde, or at least, the greatest parte thereof, neuer graunted the* Pope his Supremacie: *neuer allowed either* Purgatorie, *or* Priuate Masses, *or the* Communion vnder one kinde. *Matthi. Illyricus, in Testibus veritatis. pag. 8*

Conc. Ferrarien. in Præmio.

In the Proeme or Entrie of the Councel of Ferraria, it is written thus, Proxima Dominica quindecim Græci Sacerdotes domi Imperatoris, iussu eius Missam solenniter celebrarunt. Vbi etiam Marchio cum suis Ciuibus adfuit, & Panem Benedictum, per Patriarchæ dexteram more Græcorum, accepit, atq; libauit: *The next Sondaie, fiftiene* Greeke Prieſtes *within the Emperours Palaice, by his Commaundement, ſaide a Solemne* Maſſe (or Communion) *where as the* Marqueſe *was preſente with his Citizens, and,* as the manner of the Grecians is, *receiued, and taſted the Bread Conſecrate, at the hande of the Patriarke.* Here it is to be noted by the way, ỹ theſe fiftene Prieſtes ſaid not fiftiene Seueral Maſſes, as the manner is in the Churche of Rome, but al togeather one onely Maſſe: and that the ſame one Maſſe was no Priuate Miniſtration, but a Communion. Wherefore Petrus Vrbeuetanus ſaith thus, Tum ad inſtar Græcorum, non cantabatur in vna Eccleſia, niſi forſan vna Miſſa: *Then there was ſonge in* one Churche *no more, ſauinge perchaunce* one onely Maſſe, *as the manner of the* Grecians is.

Petrus Vrbeuetanus in Vita Deus dedit Papæ. Durandus in Rationali. Lib. 4.

Like wiſe ſaithe Durandus, Offerebant magnum Panem, & omnibus ſufficientem: Quod adhuc Græci ſeruare dicuntur: *They offered vp one greate loafe, that might ſuffice al the Churche:* VVhiche order they ſaie, the Grecians keepe vntil this daie.

By theſe ſewe, I truſte, M. Hardinge, it maie ſone appeare, whether of vs haue belied your poore Grecians.

The Apologie, Cap. 15. Diuiſion. 2.

Now then, ſince it is manifeſt, and out of al peraduenture, that theſe men are fallen from the Greekes, of whom they receiued the Goſpel, of whom they receiued the Faithe, the True Religion, and their Churche it ſelfe, what is the mater, why they wil not now be called home again to the ſame men, as it were, to their Originalles, and firſte Founders? And why be they afraid to take a paterne of the Apoſtles, and Old Fathers times, as though they al hadde benne boide of vnderſtandinge? Doo theſe menne, weene yee, ſee moze, or ſette moze by the Churche of God, then they did, who firſte deliuered vs theſe thinges?

M. Hardinge.

Soft and faire, Sir Defender, you haue not yet proued, that you ſaie, is manifeſt, and out of al peraduenture. Remember you not the old homely verſe of your Sophiſtrie. *Neque negatiuis recte concludere ſi vis?* Speake to the pourpoſe, or els I wonlde you wouldе make an ende of your ſilly ſollies. For in deede you trifle, and ſaie nothinge woorthe to be anſwered. And heere litle cauſe doo you miniſter vnto me, to vtter ſubſtantial ſtuffe. VVhiche I deſire the diſcrete Reader to conſider, for mine excuſe, that with a trifler I doo alſo but trifle.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Here, M. Hardinge, by youre owne confeſſion, yée doo but trifle with youre Filly follies: for that, I trowe, youre ſubſtantial, and better ſtuffe was not yet ready.

The Apologie Cap. 15. Diuiſion. 3.

In deede, wee haue renounced that Churche, wherein wee coulde neither haue the Woorde of God ſincerely taught, nor the Sacramentes rightly adminiſtred, nor the name of God duely called vpon: Whiche Churche alſo them ſelues confeſſe to bee faulty in many pointes: And wherein was nothinge, hable to ſtaie any wiſe man, or one, that hathe conſideration of his owne ſafetie.

M. Hardinge.

And why haue yee renounced this Church, but for that yee might not be ſuffered to ſette foorthe to the loſſe of Chriſten ſoules the deteſtable hereſies of Wickleſe, Luther, Zwinglius, Caluine, and other youre falſe Maiſters, whiche yee cal your ſincere woorde of God, after youre Schiſmatical, and Heretical maner? That ye ſaie, there was nothinge in the Catholique Churche, hable to ſtay any wiſe man, or any that hathe conſideration of his ſafetie, it is one of youre impudente lies.

There were bothe wiſe menne in the Churche, and greate multitudes of ſuche as hadde good regarde of their ſoule health, alwaies before the Deuil hadde ſuche a hande vpon Luther, and the reſte of youre newe Apoſtles, and Apoſtates.

The

The Apologie, Cap.15. Diuision.4.

To conclude, wee haue forsaken the Churche, **as it is nowe, not as it was in Old times paste, and haue so gone from it, as** Daniel **went out of the Lions Den, and the** three Children **out of the Furnesse: and,** to saie the truthe, **we haue benne caste out by these menne, (beinge cursed of them, as they vse to saie, with Booke, Bel, & Candel) rather then haue gonne awaie from them of our selues.**

M. Hardinge.

The Churche that nowe is, and the Churche that was in Old time, is one Churche, as a man in his old age is the same man, he was in his youth. * From the whiche Churche no faultes, or imperfections can excuse you for youre departinge. Neither haue ye gone from it, as Daniel was deliuered out of the Lions Den, nor as the three Children out of the Furnesse: but ye haue departed wilfully from the house of God, where touching Faithe, al be of one accorde, vnto the Synagog of Antichriste, vnto Babylon of Sectes, where is no order, but confusion, vnto the kingdom of Satan: and there ye remaine as it were in a Denne of Lions, where that rorynge Lion with his fellowes, lieth in waite, seekinge whom he maie deuoure. Ye haue stepped from the place of Spiritual refrigerie, into the frieinge panne of Schismes and Heresies, and from thence, after that ye haue nowe boyled and fried, in malice and rancoure againste the Churche, excepte ye repent, yee are like to leape into the Furnesse of Hel, that for euer shal tormente you, and neuer consume you. Complaine not of youre castinge out of the Churche. To be excommunicate, yee haue deserued. And that kinde of punishement is by a merciful discipline, extended vpon you, partly for your amendement, partly to conserue the reste of the body whole from youre pestiferous contagion.

Vntruth. For God him selfe saithe, Comme forth from the middes of thē, O my people. Apocal.18.

A hote kinde of Diuinitie.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Nowe yē beginne to kēpe Hote Scholes, M. Hardinge. Your frieinge pannes, **and** Furnesses, **with youre like Kitchin implementes of** Frieinge, **and** Boilinge, **are hot, and dangerous to deale withal.**

The causes of oure departure from you, are answeared before.

The Churche (**yē saie**) that nowe is, and the Church, that was in Old times, is one Church. **Euen so, as I shewed you before, the** Moone, **beinge ful, and the same** Moone **eclipsed, is** one Moone: **Euen so, a** Man **wel aduised, and the same** Man **starke madde, is** one Man: **Euen so, the** house of God, **and a** Caue of theeues is one house.

Matthe.21. Ioh.9.12.16 Iohan.epi.3.

Yē haue Excommunicate **vs, and put vs from you. So did certaine of youre Predecessours, and Fathers,** Excommunicate Christe, **and his Apostles. So did** Diotrephes, **that firste claimed youre** Papale primacie, **Excommunicate the Faithfull of Christe, that were the Firste Planters of the Gospel. So it is written in the** Apocalyps, **that** Antichriste **shal** Excommunicate **al them, that wil not Adoure the** Image **of the** Beaste.

Qui amat Primatum gerere. Apoca.13.

But the Pope **him selfe saithe,** Excommunicatus non potest Excommunicare: *He that is Excommunicate him selfe, hathe no Righte, or Power to Excommunicate others.* **And in youre owne Law it is written thus,** Qui illicitè alium Excommunicat, seipsum, non illum, condemnat: *He that vnlawefully Excommunicate the an other, Condemneth not him, but him selfe.*

24.Que. 1.Ait. 24.Que.3. Comperimus Rubri.

S. Augustine **saithe,** Quid obest homini, si eum de illa Tabula delere velit Humana ignorantia, quem de Libro viuentium non delet iniqua conscientia? *What is a man the woorse, if the* ignorance of a man *strike him out of the Booke of the* Church, *if* il Conscience *strike him not oute of the Boke of Life?* **In this case** S. Augustine **saith, It commeth sometimes to passe,** Vt plurimæ sint Foris oues, & plurimi sint Intus Lupi. *That there be many Sheepe without the* Churche, *and many Woulues within the* Churche.

August. Ad Clericos Hipponen. Citatur.11.que.3 Quid obest. Aug. In Iohan. Tra.45

The Apologie, Cap.15. Diuision.5.

And wee are comme to that Churche, **wherein they them selues cannot deme (if they wil saie truely, and as they thinke in theire owne conscience) but al thinges bee gouerned purely, and reuerently, and as muche, as wee possibly could, very neere to the order vsed in old times.**

M. Hardinge.

Ye are come vnto the malignant Church, to the Congregation of Reprobates, whither as into a sinke in maner al the Heresies that Satan euer raised vp from the beginninge, be auoided.

The Apologie. Cap. 16. Diuision. 1.

Let them compare our Churches and theires togeather, and they shal see, that them selues haue moste shamefully gonne from the Apostles: and wee moste iustely haue gonne from them. For wee, folowing the Example of Christe, of the Apostles, and the Holy Fathers, geue the people the Holy Communion, Whole, and perfite: But theise menne, contrarie to al the Fathers, to al the Apostles, and contrarie to Christe him selfe, doo seuer the Sacraments, and plucke awaie the one parte from the people, and that with moste notorious Sacrilege, as Gelasius termethe it.

Wee haue brought againe the Lordes Supper vnto Christes Institution, and haue made it a Communion in very deede, common, and indifferent to a greate number, accordinge to the name. For of that it is called a Communion. But theise menne haue changed al thinges, contrarie to Christes Institution, and haue made a Priuate Masse, of the Holy Communion. And so it commethe to passe, that wee geue the Lordes Supper vnto the people: and they geue them a vaine Pagente, to gase vpon.

Wee affirme togeather with the Ancient Fathers, that the Body of Christe is not eaten, but of the good, and Faitheful, and of those, that are endued with the Spirite of Christe. Their Doctrine is, that Christes very Body Effectually, and, as they speake, Really, and Substantially maie not onely be eaten of the wicked, and vnfaithful menne, but also (whiche is monstrous, and horrible to be spoken) of Mise and Dogges.

1. Cor. 14.

Wee vse to praie in our Churches, after that fashion, as, according to Paules Lesson, the people maie knowe, what wee praie, and maie answeare, Amen, with a general consente. Theise menne, like soundinge Metalle, yelle oute in the Churches vnknowen, and straunge woordes withoute vnderstandinge, without knowledge, and without deuotion: yea, and doo it of pourpose, bicause the people shoulde vnderstande nothinge at al.

(a) Vntruth for there is no better comparison then betweene Contraries. *Contraria iuxta se posita, magis lucescunt.*

(b) Yenough, no doubt, and sufficiente. For in the selfsame foure Articles, M. Hard. hathe vttered foure score and fourtiene great vntruthes.

(c) Vnfruteful, and vaine Distinctiõs. Read the Answeare.

(d) This Boke is ful of Fables and Vanities, and therefore not theught to be S. Gregories

M. Hardinge.

(a) As comparison can not duely be made betweene Lighte and Darkenesse, betweene Truthe and Lieinge, betweene Christe and Belial: so neither betweene the Catholike Churche, and startinge holes of Heretiques. You fare muche, and proue nothinge. The moste ye haue to crake of, which ye haue neuer doone withal, is your ministringe of bothe kindes vnto the people, your new founde holy daie the Englishe Communion, your Seruice in the vulgare tonge and your vile obiection of Mise and Dogges. This is the storehouse of M. Iewelles high Diuinitie, which he maketh no great store of: but shaketh it abroade euery where. To euery poinct I haue saide so muche, as is (b) yenough to staie the hartes of those, that feare God, in mine answeare to M. Iuelles chalenge. To the mater of bothe kindes, and the obiection made out of Gelasius, in the seconde article. To that of Priuate Masse, in the firste article. To al that is saide for the Churche Seruice in the vulgare tongue, in the thirde Article. To the Obiection of Mise, Dogges, and Wormes, in the. 23. Article. The same here to reherse againe, I thinke it needeles.

But where yee affyrme the Bodye of Christe not to be eaten, but of the good, and faithful onely, if yee meane the Sacramental eatinge, so as it is eaten vnder the Sacramente, in the visible forme of Bread, and Wine, and not of the (c) Spiritual eatinge onely, that is false. In that yee saie the Fathers be on your side, meaninge the (c) Sacramental eatinge, ye belie them. And so likewise repottinge our Doctrine to be, that wicked and vnfaithful menne maie eate the Body of (c) Christe effectually, ye belie vs. We teache that the euil maie eate the Body of Christe Really that is in deede, but not effectually. They onely eate effectually, who eatinge it worthely, obteine the effecte of Christes Bodye. Which is the vnitie of the mystical body of Christe, and increase of grace. (d) There is verely (saithe S. Gregorie) in sinners, and in them whiche receiue vnworthely the true Fleashe of Christe, and his true Bloude, *sed essentia, non salubri efficientia*, but in substance, not in holesome effecte. Gregor. Dialog.

That

Comparison of Churches

That euil menne receiue the true Body of Christe Sacramentally, no lesse then good, where I might alleage in maner al the Olde Fathers,(e) S. Augustine onely maie suffyce, who affyrmeth the same, speakinge thus of Iudas. *Tolerat ipse Dominus Iudam, Diabolum, Furem, & venditorem suum sinit accipere inter innocentes Discipulos, quod norunt fideles, pretium nostrum.* Our Lorde him selfe doth tolerate Iudas, and suffereth a Deuil, a Theefe, and him that solde him, to receiue amongest his innocent Disciples (f) our Price, whiche the Faithful doo knowe. But what neede any man to requite the testimonies of Fathers, sithe Paule teacheth vs, so to beleeue? Who so euer (saith he) eateth this Breade, and drinketh of the Cuppe of our Lorde vnworthely, he shalbe guilty of the Body, and Bloude of our Lorde.

(e) S. Augustin is directly to the Contrarie. See the answer.

(f) our price He meneth the Sacramente of our price.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

There is no better comparison to be made, M. Hardinge, then betwéne Lighte, **and** Darkenesse: Truthe, **and** Falsehed: Christe **and** Belial. **For one of theise contraries dothe euermore bewraie the other. And therefore** Christe **saithe,** *He that doothe il, hatethe the* Lighte, *and commethe not to it, lesse his euil doinges shoulde bee espied.* **And this is it, M. Hardinge, that you so carefully kéepe the people from the** Lighte of Goddes VVoorde **lest by comparison thereof, they shoulde beginne to lothe your** Darkenesse: Plinie **saithe,** Tritico reperto, continuò damnatum est Hordeum, & quadrupedum refectibus traditum: *As soone as* VVheate *was once founde* **(by comparison thereof)** *streightway* Barly *was refused, and geeuen to Cattel to feede vpon.*

Iohan. 3.

Plin. Lib. 18.

S. Cyprian **saithe,** Hæc est, frater, vera dementia, non cogitare, quòd mendacia non diu fallant: Noctem tam diu esse, donec illucescat dies? *This is very meere madnesse, my Brother, not to consider, that lies cannot longe deceiue the worlde:* **(Remember)** *it is* Nighte *no longer, but vntil the* Daie springe. **And therefore** Chrysostome **saithe, as it is alleged before,** Hæretici claudunt Ianuas Veritatis: *Heretiques shut vp the Gates of the Truthe.* For they knowe right wel, if the Truthe maie appeare, their falsehed wil soone be espied, and the Churches shalbe none of theires. Tertullian **saithe,** Ipsa Doctrina Hæreticorum cum Apostolica comparata, ex diuersitate, & contrarietate sua pronuntiabit, neque Apostoli alicuius Authoris esse, neque Apostolici Viri: *The very Doctrine of Heretiques compared togeather with the Apostles Doctrine, euen by the diuersitie, and contrarietie, that is in it, beareth witnesse of it selfe, that it neuer came, neither from any Apostle of Christe, nor from any Apostolique Man.*

Cyprian. ad Cornelium. Lib. 1. Epi. 3

Chrysost. In Mat. cap. 23

Tertull. De præscription.

When the Emperoure Adrianus **had yéelded to graunt the** Christians one Church **within the** Cittie of Rome, **certaine of his Prinie Counsel aduised him in any wise not so to do:** *For that, they saide, if the Christians might haue but one Churche within the Cittie, the whole people would al becomme Christians: and by comparison thereof, their* Idolles Churches, *shoulde be foresaken.* **Nether you the** Holy Communion, **M. Hardinge, and ye shal sée your** Masses, **and Pocheries sone falle to grounde, as did the** Idole Dagon **at the presence of the** Arke of God. S. Hierome **saithe,** Mendacium Antichristi, Christi veritas deuorabit: The Truthe of Christe *shal deuoure, and consume the* Liein ge of Antichriste.

Ælius Lampridius.

1 Regum. 5.

Hierony. Ad Algasiam. Qua. 11.

Touchinge the Shakinge out of Stoareboxes, **ye had no great cause to complaine. For there is not one of al theise matters, not onely of** Priuate Masse **excepted, that hitherto throughout this** Apologie **hathe, to my remembraunce, benne touched, or mentioned more, then once. But it is a final mater, M. Hardinge, that maie suffice you, to make a quarrel.**

That Mise, and Dogges maie eate the very Natural Body of Christe, and that Really, Substantially **and in déede: it is your Doctrine: it is not oures. For we vtterly abhorre it, and detest it, as moste detestable, and lothesome villanie.**

I marueile not, to heare you saie, that vvicked Creatures, and Faitheleſſe Infidelles maie eate Christes Body, **seeing ye doubt not, to auouche the same of** Brute Beastes, and Doumbe Cattel. **Yet,** S. Augustine **saithe,** Hoc est Manducare illam Escam, & illum Potum Bibere, in Christo manere, & illum manentem in se habere: *This is the Eatinge of that Meate, and the drinkinge of that Drinke, for a man to dwelle in Christe, and to haue Christe dwellinge within him.* **Euen so saithe Christe him selfe,** He that Eatethe my Fleshe, and Drinkethe my Bloude **(is neither** vvicked Creature, **nor** Faithlesse Infidelle,

Aug. In Iohan. Tra. 26

Iohan. 6.

nor Dogge nor Mouse, but) dwellethe in mee, and I in him.

Auguſt. Epiſt. 162. But S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Iudas accepit Pretium noſtrum: Iudas *receiued our Price, whiche, by your expoſition, can bee none other, but the Body of Chriſte.* O M. Hardinge, ye ſhould not thus haue mocked the worlde with this Authoritie of S. Auguſtine. You your ſelfe knowe, ye deale not plainely: you your ſelfe knowe, that S. Auguſtine by theſe wordes (Our Price) meante onely the Sacramente of oure Price. So Chryſoſtome

Chryſoſtom. Ad Hebræ. Homi. 16. ſaithe, Baptiſma Chriſti, Sanguis Chriſti eſt: *The* Baptiſme *of Chriſte, is the* Bloude of Chriſte. Not, for that it is ſo in deede, but for that, it is a Sacramente of the Bloude of Chriſte. Euen ſo is it noted in your owne Decrees:

De Conſe. Diſt. 2. Hoc eſt. Ipſa immolatio Carnis Chriſti, quæ Sacerdotis manibus fit, Vocatur Chriſti Paſſio, Mors, Crucifixio: Non Rei Veritate, ſed Significante Myſterio: *The Oblation of the Fleaſhe of Chriſte, that is wrought with the Prieſtes handes, is called the Paſſion, the Deathe, and the Crucifeinge of Chriſte: not in Truthe of mater, but in a Myſterie Significinge.* This Expoſition ye maie not wel refuſe: It is S. Auguſtines: It is your owne. Hereof wee haue ſpoken otherwheres more at large. But, to put the mater out of doubte, that it maie appeare, in what ſenſe Iudas receiued the Price of Chriſtes Deathe, S. Auguſtine him ſelfe thereof ſaithe thus,

Auguſt. In Pſal. 3. Chriſtus adhibuit Iudam ad Conuiuium, in quo Corporis, & Sanguinis ſui Figuram Diſcipulis ſuis commendauit, & tradidit: *Chriſte receiued* Iudas *vnto his Banket, whereat he gaue to his Diſciples the Figure of his Body, and Bloude.*

The Booke, that ye allege in the name of S. Gregorie, is vaine, and Childiſhe, as you knowe, and ful of Fables, and not S. Gregories.

1. Cor. 11. But S. Paule ſaithe, *Who ſo euer Eatethe of this Breade, and Drinketh of the Cuppe of our Lorde vnworthily, he ſhal be guilty of the Body, and Bloude of our Lorde.* And what wil you conclude hereof, M. Hardinge? Euen ſo S. Auguſtine writethe of the VVater

Auguſt. Contra Creſco. li. 1. ca. 23 of Baptiſme: Baptiſmus valet, alijs ad Regnum: alijs ad Iudicium: *Baptiſme is auailable to ſomme vnto the Kingedome of God: to ſomme vnto Iudgemente.* Againe he ſaith, Baptiſmum

Auguſt. Cõtra Creſco. li. 2. ca 13 multi habent, non ad Vitam Æternam, ſed ad Pœnam Æternam, non bene vtentes tanto Bono: *Somme haue Baptiſme, not to Life Euerlaſtinge, but to Paine Euerlaſtinge, not wel vſinge ſo good a thinge.*

Tertull. De Baptiſmo. Like wiſe ſaithe Tertullian, Si qui pondus intelligant Baptiſmi, magis timebunt conſecutionem, quam dilationem: *They that vnderſtande the weight of* Baptiſme, *wil feare more the gettinge of it, then the delaieinge.*

Yet yée preſſe the mater further: S. Paule ſaithe, VVho ſo eateth vnworthily of this Breade is guilty of the Body and Bloude of Chriſte: *Ergo,* (ſaie you) Chriſtes Body and Bloude muſt needes be Really Preſente. Here, M. Harding, it were a worthy mater, to ſée, by what enginnes ye woulde proue theſe haſty Concluſions, or how ye would force this Guilt, and this Preſence to goe togeather. For, thinke you, that no man can be guilty of the Body, and Bloude of Chriſte, but he that hath Chriſtes Body, and Bloud Really Preſent

Auguſt. De Tempore. Sermo. 20. in his hande: Verily, S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Reus erit, non parui pretij, ſed Sanguinis Chriſti, qui violat, & commaculat Animam, Chriſti Sanguine, & Paſſione mundatam: *He is* Guiltie *of no ſmal price, but euen of the* Bloude of Chriſte, *that* (by Fornication, or Aduenterie) *defileth his owne ſoule, that was made cleane by the* Paſſion, and Bloud of Chriſt. Yet hathe he not therefore Chriſtes Bloude Really Preſente.

Athana. De Paſſione, & cruce domini Athanaſius ſaithe, Adorantes Dominum, neque ita, vt dignum eſt eo, viuentes, non ſentiunt ſe reos fieri Dominicæ Mortis: *Woorſhippinge Our Lorde, and not liuinge ſo as is meete for our Lorde, they feele not, that thereby they are made* Guilty of our Lordes Deathe.

Ezechiel. 33 So ſaithe God by the Prophete Ezechiel, *I wil require the* Bloude of the people *at thy hande.*

Luke. 11. Chriſte ſaithe, *God ſhal require of you the* Bloude *of the* Prophetes, *that hathe benne ſhedde from the beginninge of the worlde.*

This Guilte, M. Hardinge, maie wel ſtande without any Real Preſence of the Bloude either of Chriſte, or of the Prophetes. Ye maie wel be Guilty of Chriſtes and the Prophetes Bloude, notwithſtanding ye haue neither the one, nor the other Really Preſente in your hande.

This therefore is S. Paules meaninge, that the wicked, reſortinge vnworthily to

Guilty of the Body and bloud &c.

to the Holy Mysteries, and hauinge no regarde, what is meante thereby, despise the Deathe, and Crosse of Christe, and therfore are Guilty of the Lordes Body and Bloud, that are represented in the Sacramente.

Chrysostome saithe, as he is alleged in the seconde Councel of Nice, Is, qui Imaginem Imperatoris violat, in prototypum Dignitatis iniustus est: *He, that defileth the Emperours Image, is iniurious to the Maiestie of the Emperoures Persone, that is pourtraide in the Image.* *Concil. Nicen. 2. Act. 6*

S. Cyprian saith, Impijs, in Morte Christi nullus superest quæstus: sed iustissimè eos beneficia neglecta condemnant: *The wicked haue no gaine by the Death of Christe: but the benefites, that they haue despised, doo moste iustly condemne them.* *Cyprian. De Ablutione pedum.*

To come neare to the pourpose, S. Augustine saithe, Habent Foris Sacramentum Corporis Christi: sed Rem ipsam non tenent Intus, cuius est illud Sacramentum. Et ideò sibi iudicium manducant, & bibunt: *Outwardly they haue the Sacramente of Christes Body: but the thinge it selfe* (whiche is Christes Body, represented by the Sacrament) *inwardly in their hartes, they haue not. And therefore they Eate, and Drinke their owne iudgemente.* Here S. Augustine saithe, they are Guilty, not bicause they receiue, but bicause they receiue not the Body of Christe. Marke wel theise wordes, M. Hardinge: They are effectual. The wicked, by S. Augustines iudgemente are Guilty, Not bicause they receiue, but bicause they receiue not the Body of Christe. *August. Ad Bonifac. Epist. 50.*

Againe he saithe, Qui non manet in Christo, & in quo non manet Christus, procul dubio non Manducat Spiritualiter Carnem eius, nec Bibit eius Sanguinem: licet Carnaliter, & Visibiliter premat dentibus Sacramentum Corporis, & Sanguinis Christi: Sed magis tantæ rei Sacramentum ad Iudicium sibi Manducat & Bibit: *Who so abidethe not in Christe, nor Christe in him, out of doubte he eatethe not Spiritually his Flesh, nor Drinketh his Bloude: notwithstandinge Carnally* (that is to saie, with his bodily Mouthe) *and visibly he doo presse with his teethe the* Sacramente of the Body, and Bloude of Christe: *And rather, eatethe and drinkethe* (not Christes very Body, and Bloude, but) *the Sacrament of so greate a thinge vnto his Iudgemente.* Theise wordes, M. Hardinge, be so plaine, that I can not imagine, what yᵉ shoulde more desire. They are Guilty of the Bloude of Christe, for that they despise the price, wherwith they were saued, not for that they receiue it Really into theire mouthes. *August. In Ioh. Tra. 26*

So S. Augustine saithe againe, Reus erit Æternæ Mortis, quia vilem in se habuit Sanguinem Redemptoris: *The Aduouterour is Guilty of Euerlastinge Deathe, bicause he despised in him selfe the Bloude of our Sauioure.*

The Distinction, that you imagine betwéne Real Receiuinge in the wicked, and Effectual Receiuinge in the Godly, as it is onely of your selfe, without the Authoritie of any Doctoure, Greeke, or Latine so is it nothinge els, but a very Effectual, and Real Folie. For the very Body of Christe, if it be not Effectually receiued, is not receiued. Christe him selfe saithe, He, that eatethe mee, shal liue by mee. S. Ambrose saithe, Hic panis est remissio peccatorum. Qui accipit, non moritur morte peccatoris: *Thy Breade is the Remission of Sinnes. He, that receiuethe it, shal not die the deathe of a Sinner.* *August. De Tempore, Sermo. 120.* *Ambros. De Benedict. Patriarch Cap. 6.*

S. Augustine saithe, Qui non sumit hanc Escam, non habet Vitam: &, qui eam sumit, habet vitam, & hanc vtique Æternam: *He, that receiuethe not this meate, hathe no Life: and he, that receiueth the same, hath Life, and that Euerlastinge.* *August. In Ioh. Tra. 26*

Likewise againe he saithe, Huius rei Sacramentum in Mensa Dominica præparatur, & de Mensa Dominica sumitur: quibusdam ad vitam, quibusdam ad exitium: Res verò ipsa, cuius est Sacramentum, omni homini ad vitam, nulli ad exitium. quicunque eius particeps fuerit: *The Sacramente hereof is prepared vpon the* Lordes Table, *and from the* Lordes Table *is receiued: to some vnto Life, to some vnto destruction. But the thing it selfe,* (that is, the Body of Christ,) *whereof it is a* Sacramente, *is receiued,* of al menne to life, and of no man to destruction, who so euer shalbe partaker of it. You maie not negligently passe ouer theise wordes, M. Hardinge. S. Augustine saithe plainely, *The thinge it selfe, that is presented by the Sacrament* (that is to saie, the very Body of Christe) *is receiued of al men to Life, and of noman to destruction, who so euer shalbe partetaker of it.* Here of you must nedes conclude against your selfe, That the wicked receiue not the Body of Christe. *August. eodem loco.*

The

The Scriptures in the vulgare tongues.

The Apologie, Cap. 16. Diuiſion. 2.

But, not to tarrie about rehearſinge al pointes, wherein wee and they differ, for they haue wel nighe no ende, wee turne the Scriptures **into al tongues: they ſcante ſuffer them to be hadde abroade in any tongue.**

M. Hardinge.

(a) This is nothing, but open mockerie

(b) Vntruthe, to ſonde for a child. For there was neuer ſuch order taken by the gouernours of the Church.

We (a) gladly ſuffer them to be hadde in euery place of Chriſtendome in the learned tonges, Hebrew, Greeke, and Latine (**to be readde of the vulgare Vnlearned people**). Neither were they altogether forebidden to be hadde in ſomme vulgare tongues, before the ſaucy malepertneſſe of Heretiques forced the gouernours of the Church, for ſauegarde of the people, (b) to take other orders.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Ye can vouchſaue to alowe the Scriptures **in the three** Learned Tongues, Greke, Hebrevve, **and** Latine: **that is to ſaie, in ſuch ſort, as the ſimple people maie in no wiſe touche them. But where did God euer ſanctifie theiſe three tongues, & cal them** Learned? **Or, where were they euer ſo ſpecially Canonized and alowed, aboue al other tongues, to the cuſtodie of the** Scriptures?

Aug. epi. 48

Auguſt. De Doctrina Chriſtiani. Lib. 2. cap. 5

Auguſt. In Pſal. 105.

Chryſoſt. In Ioh. homil. 1.

S. Auguſtine **ſaithe,** Scriptura Canonica tot Linguarum Literis, & ordine, & ſucceſſione Celebrationis Eccleſiaſticæ cuſtoditur: *The Canonical Scripture is kept in the* Letters of ſo many tongues, *and by the order, and ſucceſſion of Eccleſiaſtical publiſhinge.* **Againe he ſaithe,** Scriptura Diuina ab vna Lingua profecta, per varias interpretum Linguas, longè, lateque diffuſa: innotuit Gentibus ad Salutem: *The Holy* Scriptures, *paſſinge from one Tongue, and beinge publiſhed abroade, far, and wide,* (**not only by** three Learned Tongues, **but alſo**) by ſundrie Tongues of Interpretours, *haue comme to the knowledge of Nations, and people, to their Saluation.* **Againe he ſaithe,** Habemus Dei beneficium, qui Scripturas ſuas in multis Linguis eſſe voluit: *We haue the benefite of God, that wold haue his* Scriptures *to be* (**not onely in** Three, **but**) in many Tongues. S. Chryſoſtome **ſaithe,** Syri, Ægyptij, Indi, Perſæ, Æthiopes, & innumeræ aliæ Gentes, Dogmata ab hoc introducta, in ſuam transferentes Linguam homines Barbari, Philoſophari didicerunt: *The* Syrians, *the* Egyptians, *the* Indians, *the* Perſians, *the* Ethiopians, *and other* nations innumerable, tranſlatinge into theire owne tongues *the Doctrine, that they had receiued of* S. Iohn, *beinge Barbarous people, endeuoured them ſelues to learne wiſedome.*

Hierony. In Pſalm. 86.

S. Hierome **ſaith,** Scriptura Sancta populis omnibus legitur, vt omnes intelligant: *The Holy Scripture is* readde to al Nations, *that al maie vnderſtande it.* **It were harde to ſaie, that al the Nations of the worlde readde, or hearde the Scriptures in** Greeke, Hebrevve, or Latine, **to the intent they mighte the better vnderſtande it. If theiſe Authorities ſeme not plaine, and ſufficiente,** Theodoretus **ſaithe further,** Hebraici Libri, non modo in Græcum idioma conuerſi ſunt, ſed in Romanam quoque Linguam, Ægyptiam, Perſicam, Indicam, Armenicam, & Schythicam, atque adeò Sauromaticam: ſemelque vt dicam, in Linguas omnes, quibus ad hanc diem Nationes vtuntur: *The Hebrewe Bookes of the* Scriptures *are tranſlated, not onely into the* Greeke, *or* Latine tongue, *but alſo into the tongues of* Egypt, Perſia, India, Armenia, Scythia, *and* Sarmatia: *and, to be ſhort,* into al the tongues, *that vntil this daie are vſed in the Worlde.* **This, I trowe, is ſomewhat more, then** Greeke, Hebrevve, & Latine.

Theodoret. De corrigēd. Græcorum affectib. lib. 5

The Apologie. Cap. 16. Diuiſion. 3.

Wee allure the people to reade, and to heare Goddes Woorde, **they driue the people from it.**

M. Hardinge.

* A mockerie. For many hear not one Sermon in twentie yeeres.

Yee allure the people buſely to heare and reade the Scriptures for euil purpoſe. And thereby yee haue filled theire hartes, whom ye haue deceiued, with pride, ſo as they thinke them ſelues able to iudge of the higheſt queſtions, that be in diuinitie. Wee keepe the people, ſo farre as wee can for you, from hereſies, and require them rather to be hearers, then iudges, and to learne neceſſary knowledge of Goddes Woorde * at holeſome, and Godly ſermons.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Wee teache not the people, to preſume of Knoweledge, as you teache them, to preſume of Ignorance: But onely wee exhort them, for the better ſatisfaction of their conſciences, to read the Scriptures, **and therein to learne the good wil of God. And, notwithſtanding ye maie not allow them to be** Iudges, **that is to ſaie, to diſcerne betweene the**

the Light of God, and your Darkneſſe, yet yée might ſuffer them to pike out ſomme ſmall crummes, that fall from the Lordes Table. How be it. Socrates ſayth, *The ſimple vnlearned people, in caſes of Truthe, iudgeth often times more vprightly than the deepeſt Philoſophers.* Likewiſe Chriſte ſaithe, *I thanke thee O Father, for that thou haſt hidde thiſe things from the Wiſe and politique, and haſt opened the ſame to little babes.*

The Scriptures in the vulgare tongues.

Apol. Socra. Matha. 11.

But yée wil ſay, The Scriptures are hard, and aboue the reach of the people. Euen ſo ſayd the Pelagian Heretique Iulianus. And therefore S. Auguſtine thus repꝛoueth him foꝛ the ſame: Exaggeras quam ſit difficilis, pauciſque conueniens eruditis Sanctarum cognitio Literarum: *Thee enlarge and lay out with many woordes, howe harde a matter the knowledge of the Scriptures is, and meete onely for a fewe learned men.* S. Chryſoſtome ſayth, Scripturæ & Seruo, & Ruſtico, & Viduæ, & Puero, & illi, qui valde imprudens eſſe videatur, faciles ſunt ad intelligendum: *The* Scriptures *are eaſie to the* Sclaue, *to the* Husbandman, *to the* Widovve, *to the* Childe, *and to him that may ſeeme to be very* ſimple *of vnderſtanding.* S. Auguſtine ſayth, Modus ipſe dicendi quo Sacra Scriptura contexitur, &c. quaſi amicus familiaris, ſine fuco ad cor loquitur indoctorum, atque doctorum: *The phraſe, or manner of ſpeache, wherein the Scriptures are written, &c. ſpeaketh without colour as a familiar friende vnto the harte, as well of the Vnlearned, as of the Learned.* S. Cyril ſayth, Scripturæ, vt omnibus eſſent notæ, paruis & magnis, vtiliter familiari ſermone commendatæ ſunt, ita vt nullius captum tranſcendant: *The* Scriptures, *that they might be eaſie to all men as well ſmall as great, are profitably ſet abroade in familiar ſpeache: ſo, that they ouer reache no mannes capacitie.* S. Auguſtine ſayth, Sunt quidam homines, qui, cùm audierint, quòd debent eſſe humiles, nihil volunt diſcere: putantes, quòd, ſi aliquid didicerint, Superbi erunt, &c. Hos reprehendit Scriptura: *Some men, When they heare ſay they muſt be lowlie, will learne nothing: thinking, that, if they learne any thing, they ſhalbe proude. But theſe are reproued by the Scriptures.* Likewiſe agayne S. Auguſtine ſayth, Ipſa ignorantia in illis, qui intelligere noluerunt, ſine dubitatione peccatum eſt: In eis autem, qui non potuerũt, eſt pœna peccati. Ergo, in vtriſque non eſt excuſatio, ſed iuſta damnatio: *Ignoraunce in them, that would not vnderſtande, without doubt is ſinne: But in them that coulde not vnderſtande, it is the pouniſhment of ſinne. Therefore neither of them bothe hathe good excuſe: but either of them hathe iuſte damnation.*

Auguſt. in Pſal. 131.

Auguſt. In Sentent. exceptu ex Auguſtino, pag. 1067.

The Apologie, Cap. 16. Diuiſion. 4

Wee deſire to haue our cauſe knowen to all the woꝛlde: they flee to come to any triall.

M. Hardinge.

Then why came ye not to the * chiefe and moſt lawfull conſiſtorie of the worlde, the late generall Councel at Trent? What triall ſhould wee come vnto? Our doctrine hath had too high a teacher, to bee tried by men nowe. It hath bene approued too long, to be put in daieing in theſe dayes, at the latter ende of the worlde.

*A Woorthy Councel of fourty biſhops, ſutche as they were, in the time of Paulus the thirde.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

That wée made not our appearance at your late Chapter at Trident, yée haue alreadye made our excuſe. The Journey was too long, to be taken in vaine. Yée ſaye Your Doctrine, be it right, be it wrong, may not nowe bee tried, nor put in daieing. So ſayd ſometime the Olde Donatian Heretiques vnto S. Auguſtine, Diſputare nolumus: & Baptizare volumus: *Diſpute we wil not: But* (continue in our errour and) *Baptize we will.*

Auguſt. Epiſt. 169.

The Apologie, Cap. 16. Diuiſion. 5.

Wee leane vnto Knowledge: they vnto Ignorance. Wee truſt vnto Light: they vnto Darkeneſſe.

M. Hardinge.

Ye leane to the fauour of ſecular Princes, whome by flatterie, and Hereſie ye may deceyue. Crake not of your great knowledge, nor of your light. O be to them, crieth our Lorde in Eſay, that ſay, good is euil, and euil is good: that put light for darkneſſe, and darkneſſe for light. Your demeanour is ſo euil, your doctrine ſo falſe, your tong ſo rayling, that we take your worde for no ſlaunder.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Wée flatter oure Pꝛinces, M. Harding, as Nathan flattered King Dauid: as Iohn Baptiſt flattered Herode: as S. Ambroſe flattered Theodoſius, and as ſalt flattereth the grene

Dorman. Pag. 15. Stanislaus Orichouius in Chimæra.

gráne ſoare. In déde wée deſpiſe not the Miniſter of God, as ſundrie of your felowes haue vſed to do: of whom one doubteth not to ſaie, The Pope is the Head: and Kings, and Emperoures are the Feete. An other ſaithe, The Prieſt is ſo farre aboue the King, as a Man is aboue a Beaſte. Sutche wordes of contempte, and villanie wée haue not vſed. They agrée wel with you, and with your Religion. Wée yélde to the Kinge, that is dewe to the Kinge. Wée yélde to God, that is dewe to God. We ſaie to the Prince, as S. Ambroſe ſommetime ſaide to the Emperoure Valentinian: Noli te grauare Imperator, vt putes te in ea, quæ Diuina ſunt, Imperiale aliquod ius habere: *Trouble not your ſelfe, my Lorde, to thinke, that you haue any Princely Power ouer thoſe thinges, that pertaine to God.*

Ambro. Li. 5. Epiſt. 33.

But if they be flatterers, that humbly aduertiſe, and directe their Liege Princes by the Worde of God, what are they then, that ſaie, as you ſaie, Totus Mundus non poteſt accuſare Papam: Nemo poteſt dicere Papæ, Domine cur ita facis? Sacrilegij inſtar eſſet, diſputare de facto Papæ: Dominus Deus noſter Papa. Papa poteſt, quaſi omnia facere, quæ poteſt Deus: *The whole worlde maie not accuſe the* Pope: *No man maie ſaie to the* Pope, *Sir, why doo yee thus? It were a ſinne as bad as Sacrilege, to diſpute of any the* Popes *dooinges:* Our Lord God the Pope: *The* Pope *maie doo in a manner, what ſo euer* God *maie doo.* Theſe, theſe, M. Hardinge, and a thouſande other your like ſpeaches maie ſærue ſommewhat to ſmel of flatterie.

Petr. De Palude, de poteſtate Pp. di. 40. Non nos In Gloſſa. Extranag. Iohan. 22. Cum Inter. In Gloſſa. Hoſtiē. De tranſlatione Prælati. Quante.

The Apologie Cap. 16. Diuiſion 6. & 7.

Wee reuerence, as it becommeth vs, the Writinges of the Apoſtles, and Prophetes: and they burnte them.

Finally, wee in Goddes cauſe, deſire to ſtande to Goddes onely iudgemente: they wil ſtande onely to their owne.

M. Hardinge.

What ſo euer ye pretende, the cauſe ye haue taken in hande to defende, is not Goddes cauſe, neither is this ſtirre, which ye make in the worlde, for Chriſtes ſake. Luther him ſelfe, when at a diſputation with doctour Eckius, inflamed with anger, and paſſinge the bondes of modeſtie, was admoniſhed of certaine, for as muche as it was Gods cauſe, that was treated, to handle the matter more ſoberly, and with the ſprite of ſoftenes, he brake out into theſe words. *Nō propter Deum hæc res capta eſt, nec propter Deum finietur.* This mater is not begonne for Goddes ſake, neither for Goddes ſake ſhal it be ended. Therefore ſpeake no more to vs of Goddes cauſe. There be other cauſes, that moue you to doo, as ye do.

Vntruth, standinge in open, and wilful corruption.

Hoſius contra Brent. Libr. 1.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Luther (yée ſaie) in diſputation, was inflamed with anger, and paſſed the bounder of modeſtie No doubte, M. Hardinge, if he had had ſomme parte of your ſobrietie, and modeſtie, he might haue donne a greate deale better. Touchinge the mater, beinge ielouſly moued with the iniquitie, & wicked wilfulneſſe of his Aduerſaries, he vttered theſe wordes, not of him ſelfe, but of Eckius, that diſputed againſt him: Eckius, and his felowes, neuer beganne this mater for Goddes ſake, nor for Goddes ſake vvil they ende it. For, he ſaw, they had begonne, and were bente to ende it againſte God, as beinge enflamed with ambition, and malice, and procured, and hired by the Pope. Theſe wordes Luther ſpake of Eckius, his Aduerſarie, and not of him ſelfe. Euen ſo, M. Hardinge, maie wé alſo truely ſaie, You, and your Felowes haue not begonne theſe youre Contentious Vanities for Goddes ſake: nor for Goddes ſake wil you ende them.

Iacobus Andreæ cōtra Hoſium. Pag. 352.

The Apologie, Cap. 16. Diuiſion. 8.

Wherfore, if they wil weigh al theſe thinges with a quiet minde, and fully bente to heare, and to learne, they wil not onely allowe this Determination of ours, who haue forſaken Errours, and folowed Chriſte, and his Apoſtles, but themſelues alſo wil forſake their owne ſelues, and ioyne of their owne accorde to our ſide, to goe with vs.

Here endeth the Fifthe Parte.

To take Councell of men.

The Sixth parte.

The Apologie. Cap.1. Diuision.1.

BVt peraduẽture they will say, it was treason, to attempt these maters without a sacred Generall Councell: For that therin consisteth the whole force of the Churche: there Christe hath promised he will euer be a present assistant. Yet they themselues, without tarrying for any Generall Councell, haue broken the Commaundements of God, and the Decrees of the Apostles: and, as we sayde a little aboue, they haue spoyled, and disanulled almost al, not only the Ordinances, but euẽ the Doctrine of the Primitiue Church. And where they say, It is not lawfull, to make a chaunge without a Councell, what was he that gaue vs these lawes, or from whence had they this Iniunction?

M. Hardinge.

If generall Councels continewe in that estimation, and Authoritie they haue euer had, their priuate conspiracies, and false conueyances in corners be like to be dasshed. Now priketh foorth their Secretary, who thinketh himselfe a fresh souldiour in Rhetorike, and giueth the onset vpon vs, with a blinde peraduenture. But Sir, what so euer you imagin vs to say, touching a Generall Councell, we are not so simple as to graunt (which you Peraduenture seme to surmyse of vs) that your Heretical and most vngodly maters, which you speake of, might without blame be attempted by licence of any Coũcel. Such wicked changes in Religion, as ye haue made, neyther is it lawefull to make with a Councell, nor without a Councell.

The Apologie. Cap.1. Diuision.2.

Indeede King Agesilaus did but fondely in this behalfe: who, when he had a determinate aunsweare made him of the opinion and will of mightie Iuppiter, woulde afterwarde bringe the whole matter before Apollo, to know whether he would allowe therof, as his Father Iuppiter had done or no. But yet shoulde we do mutch more fondely, when we heare God him selfe plainly speake to vs in his moste holy Scriptures, and may vnderstande by them his wil and meaning, if we woulde afterward (as though this were of none effect) bring our wholecause to be tried by a Councel: whiche were nothinge els, but to aske, whether men woulde allow as God did, and, whether menne woulde confirme Goddes Commaundemente by their Authoritie.

(a) Vaine folie. For what haue Humaine, or Natural senses to do with the sense of God?

M. Hardinge.

For as muche as the scriptures, wherein God speaketh vnto vs, be in sundry places not moste open and plaine to (a) humaine senses, and many by mistaking them be deceiued: were it not wel donne of you, for the more suretie, and better vnderstandinge of that ye goe about, I meane, in matters concerning religion, to folowe the iudgement of the Catholike Churche represented in generall Councels? Yea we say boldly, that surer it is in poynts of Faith to leane to the (b) exposition of the Fathers agreeing togeather, and to folowe the tradition of the Church, then to truste to your selues, or to the letter of the scriptures, scanned onely by your owne wittes. For the Churche is promised to be leade into al Truthe by the Holy Ghoste. Ye can not saie, any suche promise hathe benne made to your particular companie. Therefore it were not fondly donne, as ye saye, but wisely, saie we, if ye tried, and examined your Doctrine, whiche ye pretend

(b) The Expositions of the Fathers very seldome agree together: yet are they for the moste parte, contrary to the Churche of Rome.

pretende to be accordinge vnto the Scriptures, by the (c) rule of Ecclesiastical Tradition, which is the chefe rule to trie euery Doctrine by.

(c) The Traditions, now vsed in the Romain Churche, are commonly cõtrarie to the Traditions of the Anciente Learned Fathers. Therfore this Rule is deceiteful.

The Bishop of Saresburie.

Wee neuer despised the iudgemente of the Learned, and Holy Fathers: but rather take them, and embrace them, as the Witnesses of Goddes truthe. And therin wee finde you the more blame worthy, M. Hardinge, for that, hauinge with cute cause renounced the iudgemente, and orders of the Primitiue Churche, and Anciente Fathers, as to the wise, and Learned it maie soone appeare, yet neuertheles ye euermore make vaunte of your Antiquitie, and fraie the worlde with a visarde of the Churche, and a shewe of Olde Fathers: as if a pore Summonere, that had losse hys Commission, woulde serue Citations by the vertue of his emptie bore. And thus haue ye sette al your vaine fantasies in place of Goddes Churche: and your Churche in place of God: as, by the wordes, and witnesse of your owne Felowes, I haue before shewed more at large. For example, Cardinal Cusanus saithe, Nulla sunt Christi Præcepta, nisi quæ per Ecclesiam pro talibus accepta sunt: *The Commaundementes of Christe, are no Commaundementes, excepte they be so allowed by the Churche.*

Nicol Cusã. Ad Bohæmos Epist. 2.

Thus yee leaue Iuppiter, and renne to Apollo: or rather, ye forsake God, and seeke to Man: and as it is written in the Prophete Hieremie, *Yee haue the Fountaine of the Water of Life: and rippe vp broken, and filthy Cesternes, that can holde no Water.* Tertullian thus vpbraideth the Heathens, Apud vos de humano arbitratu Diuinitas pensatur: *Emonge you the right of God is weighed by the Iudgemente of menne.*

Hierem. 2.

Tertull. in Apologetico.

But Clemens Alexandrinus saithe, Quoniam ipsum Verbum ad nos venit de Cœlo, non est nobis amplius eundum ad Humanam Doctrinam: *For so muche as* the VVorde it selfe, (that is, Christe) *is comme to vs from Heauen, wee maie not neede anye more seeke vnto the Doctrine of Man.* Likewise S. Chrysostome saithe: Fuisset extremæ absurditatis, eum, qui edoctus fuerat à Deo, postea cum hominibus communicare: *It had ben great folye for* S. Paule, *hauinge receiued his Doctrine from* God *him selfe, afterwarde to conferre thereof with menne,* that is to saie, with Peter, or Iames, or with any others.

Clemens Alexandrin. in Oratione ad Gentes.

Chryso. in Epist. ad Galat. Ca. 1.

The Apologie. Cap. 1. Diuision. 3.

Why, I beseche you, excepte a Councel wil, and commaunde, shal not Truthe be Truthe, or God be God? If Christe had meante to do so from the beginninge, as that he woulde preache, or teache nothinge, without the Bishoppes consente, but referre al his Doctrine ouer to Annas, and Caiphas, where shoulde nowe haue benne the Christian Faithe? Or, who at any time shoulde haue hearde the Gospel taught? Peter verily, whom the Pope hathe oftener in his mouthe, and more reuerently bleathe to speake of, then he doothe of Iesus Christe, did boldely stande againste the Holy Councel, saieinge, It is better to obey God, then Men. And after that Paule had once intierely embraced the Gospel, and had receiued it, not from menne, nor by man, but by the onely VVil of God, he did not take aduise therein of Fleashe, and Bloude, nor broughte his case before hys kinnesmen, and Brethren, but wente foorthwith into Arabia, to preach Goddes Diuine Mysteries, by Goddes onely Authoritie.

M. Hardinge.

If you occupie a flute no better, by my reade, you shal geue ouer your pipinge and flouringe. Truthe is Truthe, and God is God, whether any Councel wil or nil. Mary, as for the Truthe, and for God, euery Councel lawfully assembled hathe wil, so againste the Truthe and againste God, it hathe no nil. When ye proue vnto vs, that ye are specially called, as Paule was, and haue a special Commission to preache against the Doctrine of the Churche, as he had against the wicked Iewes, then a Goddes name take no aduise of any man, but foorthwith preache, and crie out so loude as ye liste, so that ye goe into Arabia.

a Wee preache againste your folies, and fantasies, and not againste the doctrine of the Church.

Arabia, as S. Paule did, or where els ſo euer ye wil. For euery good man would be lothe, England ſhould be troubled with you.

The Apologie, Cap. 2. Diuiſion. 1.

Yet truely, wee doo not deſpiſe Councelles, Aſſemblies, **and conferences of** Biſhoppes, **and Learned menne: neither haue wee deme, that wee haue donne, altogeather without** Biſhoppes, **or without a** Councel. **The mater hathe benne treated in open** Parlamente, **with longe conſultation, and before a notable** Synode, **and** Conuocation.

M. Hardinge.

Either your tonge agreeth not with your harte, or els I wil proue the contrarie by your owne argumentes, whiche in the nexte Paragraphe before this ye haue huddeled vp. For whereas your maters are (as ye ordinarily ſaie) euidente by plaine ſcripture, and the Woorde of God is readen of euery manne (without diſtinction and limitation) therefore ye doo firſte of al plaie as fond a parte, as Kinge Ageſilaus did, who receiuinge an anſweare of mighty Iupiter, would afterwarde bringe the mater before Apollo. Yea furthermore, yee doo muche more fondly then he, if when ye maie heare God him ſelfe ſpeake plainly to you in the moſt holy Scriptures, ye would bringe the whole cauſe to be tried by a Councel.

Howe ſaie ye then nowe, are not theſe your owne proper reaſons, &c. Your foreſaide woorſhipful reaſons, &c? If yee meane (as by reaſon yee muſte) the Parlamentes of theſe later daies, the firſte of al did make moſte of you: and yet howe open was it for you? Had yee any place at al in it? Were ye admitted within the dores? Or had ye any thing to doo in that aſſemblie? Conſider then with what conſultation your purpoſes were concluded. Did they tarie many monethes about it? Had they Biſhoppes? * Had they Diuines and the moſte learned, to reaſon too and fro with al libertie? Was the Authoritie of the Vniuerſal Churche of Chriſte, and the Doctrine of the Aunciente Fathers conſidered? Ye ſaie in Latine, *Plenis comitijs*, that is, in the ful and whole aſſemblie, as though none at al had there reſiſted, but euery man had yelded to your maters. What ſaie ye then of the ſpiritual Lordes, a great parte of the Parlamente, and without al doubt, the parte, whiche muſte be chiefely and onely regarded, when the queſtion is of religion? Howe many of them gaue you theire voice to your Goſpell? Yea, whiche of them al did not reſiſte it? One alone, I muſt confeſſe, was afterwarde made to breake Vnitie, of whom a right good, and Catholike Biſhop ſaide to a noble man, we had but one foole amonge vs, and him ye haue gotten vnto you. But as of the ſpiritual Lordes ye had none at al (excepte that one, little woorthy of the name of a Biſhop and Lorde, whoſe learninge was ſmal, and honoure thereby muche ſteined) ſo of the temporal ye had not al; and ſo had ye alſo in the lower howſe very many, and wel learned, that ſpeake againſte you.

* Vntruthe enclоſed. For they had Diuines, & a ſolemne Diſputation was appointed at Weaſtminſter in the preſence of the States of the Realm. But your Felowes ſtodde from it.

But let vs conſider the notable conuocation, in whiche your matet hathe benne treated. If ye meane the cleregie comminge togeather at that firſte Parlamente time, of whiche wee ſpeake, it was of Catholikes, not of Sacramentaries, and it put vp a bil againſte your proceedinges: ſo farre it was of from confirminge them. If ye meane any ſince that time, in whiche your ſuperintendentſhips mette togeather, for what cauſe was it a notable Synode, and a notable conuocation?

Yee be deſperate in your licinge, and crake of a ful Parlement, and a notable Synode, not regarding by what meanes yee promote your cauſe to the multitude, and ſaue your ſelues from reproche of extreme folie. For otherwiſe yee, whiche can ſo amplifie the ſmal and obſcure meetinges of a fewe Caluiniſtes of one litle Iland what woulde yee not ſaie of the laſte general Councel, to whiche more Nations were aſſembled togeather, then are Shyres in Englande: more yeeres were beſtowed in conſultation, then weekes in your full Parlamente: * more Biſhoppes defined and ſubſcribed, then were Miniſters of al ſortes in your notable Synode by many partes.

* A notable greate companie. There wer onely fourtie poore Biſhops, and yet ſommes of the ſame were no Biſhoppes at al.

Laſtly if they wil nedes haue their maters ſeeme to depende of theire Parlamente, let vs not be blamed, if wee cal it Parlamente Religion, Parlamente Goſpel, Parlamente Faithe.

The Biſhop of Sarſburie.

Wee wil not diſcuſſe the Right, and Intereſt of the Parlamentes of Englande. **As mutche, as concernethe** Goddes euerlaſtinge Truthe, **wee holde not by** Parlamente, **but** by God. Parlamentes **are vncertaine, and often contrarie, as wee haue ſeene. But** Goddes Truthe **is one, and certaine, and neuer changethe. The thinges, that were ſo ſuddainely, and ſo violently ſhaken downe in the late time of** Queene Marie, **are nowe, of Goddes greate mercie, by** oure moſte Noble, and Graceous Lady Queene Elizabeth, **aduiſedly, and ſoberly reared vp againe, that they maie the more firmely continewe, and ſtande the better. What ſo euer wante, ye imagine, was in that** Parlamente, **for as mutche, as we were no parte thereof, I truſte, we maie the more eaſily be excuſed. Howe be it, ſo ſcornefully diſdeiguinge the**

whole State of so Noble a Realme, yée shall hardely winne the opinion, eyther of Sobrietie, or of greate Wisedome. The Parlamente was summoned by Roial Authoritie, and was continewed, and concluded in Order, as heretofore it hathe benne vsed.

But your Bishoppes (yée say) withstoode vs: and your Brethren in the Convocation promoted a bille against our Doctrine. I knowe, M. Hardinge, they subscribed then againste vs with the very same handes, with which, not long before, they had openly protested, and solemnely sworne against the Pope: and with which they haue sithence receiued, and embraced our whole Religion, to the vtter condemnation of al your folies. Theise were they, that promoted billes againste vs, and withstode our Doctrine.

Onely one foole (yée say) ye had emongest al your Bishoppes: And he was soone gotten to come to vs. Happy were they, M. Hardinge, that had but one foole in so great a companie. If somme of your Louanian Clergie had then benne Bishoppes, I thinke, they might haue benne somme what better stored. Notwithstandinge, it was not wel donne, of your parte, so vncourteisely to calle your Brother foole. Al the reste of your Brethren, very fewe excepted, haue donne the like. Yet fooles, I trowe, yée will not call them: leste happily your owne wittes be called in question.

Where yée woulde seeme to saie, that the Parlamente holden in the firste yéere of the Queenes Maiesties Reigne, was no Parlamente, for that your Bishoppes refused wilfully, to agrée vnto the Godly Lawes there concluded, yée seeme therein to bewraie in your selfe somme wante of skille. The wise, and learned coulde soone haue tolde you, that in the Parlamentes of Englande, maters haue euermore vsed to passe, not of necessitie, by the special consente of the Archebishopes, and Bishoppes, as if without them no Statute might lawfully be enacted: but onely by the more parte of the voices, yea althoughe al the Archebishoppes, and Bishoppes were neuer so earnestly bente against it. And Statutes, so passinge in Parlamente, onely by the voices of the Lordes temporal, without the consente, and agrément of the Lordes Spiritual haue neuertheleste alwayes benne confirmed, and ratified by the Real assent of the Prince, and haue benne enacted, and published vnder the names of the Lordes Spiritual, and Temporal.

Reade the Statutes of Kinge Edwarde the Firste. There shal yée finde, that in a Parlamente solemnely holden by him at S. Edmundes Burie, the Archebishoppes, and Bishoppes were quite shutte forthe. And yet the Parlamente helde on, and good, and wholesome Lawes were there enacted, the departinge, or absence, or malice of the Lordes Spiritual notwithstanding. In the Recordes thereof it is written thus, Habito Rex cum suis Baronibus Parlamento, & Clero excluso, Statutum est, &c. *The King keeping the Parlamente with his Barons, the Cleregie,* (that is to saie, the Archebishoppes, and Bishoppes) *being shutte forthe, it was enacted. &c.*

An. do. 1296

Likewise, In Prouisione de Martona, in the time of Kinge Henry the thirde, whereas mater was moued of Bastardie, touchinge the Legitimation of Bastardes borne before Marriage, the Statute past wholy with the Lordes Temporal, whether the Lordes Spirituall would or no: Yea: and that contrarie to the expresse Decrees and Canons of the Church of Rome. The like hereof, as I am enformed, maie be found, Richardi. 2. An. 11. Ca. 3. Howe be it, in theise cases, I muste confesse, I walke somewhat without my compasse. Touchinge the Judgemente hereof, I referre mée selfe wholy vnto the Learned.

An. 1273. In prouisione Martona. Cap. 9. Extra. Qui filij sunt Legitimi.

Further, whereas ye call the Doctrine of Christe, that nowe by Goddes great Mercie, and to your great greefe, is Vniuersally, and freely Preached, a Parlamente Religion, and a Parlamente Gospell, (for suche sobrietie becommeth you well, and maie stande you in steede, when learning faileth) yée might haue remembred, that Christe him selfe, at the beginning, was Vniuersally receiued, and honoured throughe this Realme, by assent of Parlamente: and further, that without Parlamente, your Pope him selfe was neuer receiued, no not in the late time of Queene Marie. Yea, and euen then, his Holinesse was clogged with Parlamente Conditions, that, what so euer had

Tridentine Councel. Superintendentes.

had benne determined in Parlamente, and vvas not repealed, vvere it neuer so contrarie to his vvil, and Canons, shoulde remaine stil inuiolable, and stand in force. Otherwise, his Holinesse had gonne home againe. Sutche, M. Hardinge, is the Authoritie of a Parlamente. Verily, if Parlamentes of Realmes be no Parlamentes, then wil your Pope be no Pope. Therefore as you nowe calle the Truthe of God, that wee professe, a Parlamente Religion, and a Parlamente Gospel, euen so with like sobrietie, and grauitie of speache, yee might haue saide, Our Fathers in olde times had a Parlamente Christe: And your late Fathers, & Brethren had of late in the time of Queene Marie a Parlamente Faithe, a Parlamente Masse, and a Parlamente Pope.

Leges Canuti

Neither is it so strange a mater, to see Ecclesiastical Causes debated in Parlamente. Reade the Lawes of Kinge Inas, Kinge Elfrede, Kinge Edvvarde, Kinge Ethelstane, Kinge Edmunde, Kinge Edgare, Kinge Canute: and yee shal finde, that our godly Forefathers, the Princes, and Peeres of this Realme, neuer vouchesaued to entreat of maters of Peace, or Warre, or otherwise touching the Common state, before al controuersies of Religion, and Causes Ecclesiastical had benne concluded. Kinge Canute in his Parlamente, holden at VVinchester vpon Christemasse daie, after sundrie Lawes, and Orders made, Touchinge the Faithe, the kepinge of Holy Daies, Publique Praiers, learning of the Lordes Praier, Receiuing of the Communion thrise in the yeere, the manner and fourme of Baptisme, Fastinge, and other like maters of Religion, in the ende thereof saithe thus, Iam sequitur Institutio legum Sæcularium: Nowe folovvethe an order for Temporal Lavves.

Thus wee see, that the godly Catholique Princes in Olde times, thought it theire duetie, before al other affaires of the Common Weale, first to determine maters of Religion, and that euen by the Parlamentes of this Realme.

In a Parlamente holden by King VVilliam the Conqueroure, it is vvritten thus: Rex, quia Vicarius Summi Regis est, ad hoc constituitur, vt Regnum, & populum Domini, & super omnia, Sanctam Ecclesiam, Regat, & defendat, &c. *The Kinge, for as mutche as he is the* Vicare of the Highest Kinge, *is therefore appointed to this pourpose, that he shoulde* Rule, *and defende the Kingedome, and People of the Lorde, and aboue al thinges the* Holy Churche, &c. Hereby it appeareth, that Kinges, and Princes are specially, and of pourpose appointed by God, not onely to defende, but also to Gouerne, and Rule the Holy Churche.

How be it, if any imperfection shal appeare in the former Parlamentes, wee geue God thankes for the same, that is: and truste, that, for his owne names sake, he wil confirme, that he hath begonne. The hartes of Princes, and Determinations of Parlamentes are in his hande. If any thinge wante, the Arme of the Lorde is not shortned: He is hable to supplie the same.

Concil. Trident. Sub Carolo Quinto. Rob. Cœcus. vide Concil. Trident. sub Paulo. 3. Matt. Flac. Illyricus in Protest. cõtra Conc. Tridã. Pag. 79. Io. Sleida. li. 23. An. 1551 Conuentus quorundam

Yee magnifie mutche your late Chapter of Tridente, vvhiche you vvoulde so faine haue to be called a General Councel: vvith so many Nations: so many Bishops: and so many yeeres of Consultation. Yet notwithstandinge of al these so many, and so many Nations, and Countries, if it maie please you to sitte downe, and to take the accounpte, yee shal finde there were onely poore fouretie Bishoppes, and certaine of the same, (as Richarde Pates, the Bishop of VVorcester, and Blinde sir Roberte, the Archebishop of Armach) that onely had the bare Titles of Bishoprikes, and in deede were no Bishoppes at al. Two others of your saide so many, and so Notable Learned, and Holy Bishoppes, beinge at your saide worthy Councel, were euen there killed in Aduouterie: the one striken downe with a Clubbe: the other taken in the manoure by the Husbande, and hanged by the necke, out of a greate Lucane windowe, into the streete. For these, and other causes, Henry the Frenche kinge openly, by his Embassadoure, protested againste the same Councel in the presence of al your so many, and so many Bishoppes there, and saide, It vvas not a Councel General, but a Priuate Conuente, or Assemblie of a fevve certaine people summoned togeather for gaines sake.

Nowe, whereas it hathe pleased you, as wel here, as els where, to sporte youre

selfe with Superintendentes, and Superintendentshippes, and to refreashe your wittes with so vaine a fantasie of your owne, if yée had benne so deepely trauailed in the Doctoures, Newe, or Olde, as yée beare vs in hande, yée might easily haue knowen, that a Superintendente, is an Anciente name, and signifiethe none other, but a Bishop. S. Augustine saithe, Vocabulum Episcopatus inde ductum est, quòd ille, qui præficitur, eis, quibus præficitur, Superintendit. Ergo, ἐπισκοπεῖν, Latinè dicere possumus Superintendere. Againe he saithe, Quod Græcè dicitur, Episcopus, hoc Latinè, Superintentor, interpretatur. Chrysostome saithe, Episcopus ex eo dicitur, quòd omnes inspiciat. S. Hierome saithe, ἐπισκοποῦντες, id est, Superintendentes. Anselmus saithe, Episcopus Latinè Superintendens dicitur. Beda likewise saithe, Episcopus Latinè Superintendens dicitur. Petrus de Palude saithe, Episcopus dicitur Superintendens: Et Petrus fuit Superintendens toti Mundo: Peter *was the* Superintendente *of the whole worlde*. Your owne Thomas of Aquine saithe, Episcopi dicuntur ex eo, quòd Superintendunt. Therefore, M. Hardinge, if Podestie moue you not, yet at leaste for your grauities sake, leaue plaieinge with these vaine, and childishe folies. The Bishoppes of Englande haue this daie, not onely the same Name, but also the same Roume, and Authoritie, and Jurisdiction, that other Bishoppes haue euer had before.

Priuatum vti latis gratia institutum.
Aug. De Ciuit. li. 19. c. 19
Augustin. in Psalm. 126.
Chryso. 1. ad Tim. hom. 10.
Hieron. Ad Euagrium.
Anse. ad Philippen. Ca. 1.
Beda. 1. Pe. 2
Petrus de Palude, De Potest. Colla Apostolis. Arti. 1. Th. 2. 2. que. 184. Ar. 6.

The Apologie, Cap. 3. Division. 1.

But touchinge this Councel, whiche is nowe summoned by Pope Pius, wherein menne so lightly are condemned, beinge neither called, nor hearde, nor seene, it is easy to gheasse, what we maie looke for, or hope of it.

M. Hardinge.

The Generall Councel of Trente is nowe at lengthe by Gods special fauoure concluded and ended. What haue ye to saie to it? Forbeare your accustomed lyinge, what haue ye to saie to it? For *matters of Faithe, what is not sounde and true? For *maners, what sore lacketh due salue? For *discipline, what disorder hathe not holesome restraincte and punishmentes? What defectes be not prouidently considered, how to be supplied? What abuses be not required to be taken awaie, as farre, as mannes wit could deuise, and the weakenesse of the presente age can beare?

*Vntruthes open, and without shame. For example your Stewes, your Courtheghianes, and Fornications, and Concubines were neuer touched.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

All this mater is fully answeared by VVhat, and by VVhat. VVhat *mater of Faithe?* VVhat *manners?* VVhat *disorder?* VVhat *defectes?* VVhat *Abuses?* But all these vvhattes notwithstandinge, what if your Pope, your Cardinalles, and youre Cleregie, with the whole disorder of youre Romaine Churche, with so manye Priestes keepinge Concubines, with so manye Non Residentes, with so manye Doumbe Bishoppes, and with so many thousandes of common Harlottes, be in case nowe, euen as they were before? Will yée telle vs neuertheles, that al your soares bee sufficiently salued? Or, muste wée beleue that your keepinge of Concubines, your open Stewes, and Fornications &c. be no soares? Verily S. Bernarde saithe, as it is alleged before, Intestina, & insanabilis est plaga Ecclesiæ: *The wounde of the Church bleedeth inwardely, and is paste cure:* And againe, A planta pedis, vsque ad verticem Capitis non est in ea sanitas: *There is no whole parte in the Churche from the sole of the foote, to the toppe of the Heade.* Baptista Mantuanus saithe, Aegrotatque Fides iam proxima morti: *The* Faithe of the Romaine Churche *is sicke, and almoste deade.*

Bern. in Cãtica, serm 33.
Holcote in Lib. Sapien. Lectio. 23.
Bern. in Cõuers. Pauli.
Bapt. Mãt. Faster lib. 4. ad Leonẽ. 10.
Concil Trident.

In your Olde Latine Translation of the Bible, there be sundrie errours, so open, and so grosse, that a very Babe maie some espie them: as it maie more plainely appeare by Budæus, Erasmus, Valla, Faber, Lindanus, and others. Yet, that notwithstandinge, your Councel saithe precisely thus, Ne quis Veterem vulgatam Editionem reijcere quouis prætextu audeat, vel præsumat: *Lette no man dare, or presume by any manner of coloure, to refuse the* Olde Common Translation of the Bible: As if your Councelles were pourposely summoned, to maintein errours. If ye wil so wilfully deceiue vs in sensible maters, howe maie wée then truste you in maters of Faithe?

The

The Apologie, Cap. 3. Diuiſion. 2.

In times paſte, when Nazianzene ſaw in his daies, how menne in ſutche Aſſemblies were ſo blinde, and wilfull, that they were carried with affections, and laboured more to geate the victorie, then the Truthe, he pronounced openly, that he neuer had ſeene any good ende of any Councel. What woulde he ſaie nowe, if he were aliue at this daie, and vnderſtoode the heauinge, and chouinge of theſe menne? For at that time, thoughe the matter were laboured on all ſides, yet the controuerſies were wel hearde, and open errours were put cleane awaie by the generall voice of al partes: But theſe menne will neither haue the caſe to be freely diſputed, nor yet, how many errours ſoeuer there be, ſuffer they any to be changed. For it is a common cuſtome of theirs, often, and ſhamelesly to boaſte, that their Churche cannot erre, that in it there is no faulte, and that they muſte geeue place to vs in nothinge. Or, if there be any faulte, yet muſte it be tried by their Biſhoppes, and Abbates onely, bicauſe they be the Directours, and Rulers of matters: for that they be the Churche of God. Ariſtotle ſaithe, that a Cittie cannot conſiſte of Baſtardes: Nowe whether the Churche of God may conſiſte of theſe menne, lette them ſelues conſider. For doubteleſſe, neither be theire Abbates, Abbates in deede, nor theire Biſhoppes ſutche natural right Biſhoppes as they ought to be.

Nazian ad Procopium.

M. Hardinge.

Gregorie Nazianzene in his Epiſtle to Procopius ſaith thus: I refuſe to come to whatſoeuer Counſel of Biſhoppes. Becauſe I coulde neuer yet to this daie ſee the ende of any Councel endewed with any profite, and after whiche thinges amiſſe were not rather made more greuous, then healed. Nazianzene in that Epiſtle ſpake of (a) prouincial Councelles, ſpecially thoſe that were holden in his troubleſom times, where moſte commonly Heretikes through fauour of their deceiued Princes bare the ſwea. Which in matters of Faithe coulde hardely then obteine any credite amonge the Catholikes, onleſſe they hadde beene confirmed by the auctoritie of the Biſhop of Rome, of whiche ſorte at that age were fewe. Thoſe other Nazianzene had experience of, of theſe he had not. Albeit in deede the vtilitie of the Nicene Counſell in his time, that is to ſaie, within fo fewe yeeres after the ſame was holden, was not yet thoroughly eſpied, and fully knowen abroade. Neither would he if he were aliue at this daie, reproue the Holy generall Councel of Trente, as yee doo. For why ſhoulde he? * And howe ſhameleſſe be ye, to require vs, to yelde and geeue place vnto you? Who made you iudges ouer vs? Who gaue you commiſſion? Where is your warrante?

What neede yee to ſhewe your malice ſo muche at Biſhoppes, and Abbates? Whiche of them hurteth you? Haue ye not in priſon, or in cuſtody (b) at your appointement al the Biſhoppes of Englande, one Apoſtata yet liuinge excepted, whiche after ſundry flightes and changinge of cotes, is fledde from the tentes of the Churche to your ſcattered troupes? The Abbotes, haue ye not driuen them awaie? Be yee yet afraide of their ſhadowes? As by Ariſtotle a Cittie can not conſiſte of Baſtardes, no more can the Churche of Englande conſiſte of ſutche Baſtarde Biſhoppes, as ye be: what number of Abbotes yee haue leafte in Cloiſters, ſuche number of true Biſhoppes haue yee lefte in Churches. One muſt I ſtil excepte, who is a true Biſhop by conſecration (as I vnderſtande) though a falſe man by Apoſtaſie, and going from his Faithe, and from his Religion.

(a) vntruth. For he ſpeakethe of al manner of Councelles, as wel Generall, as Prouincial. His woordes be, *Prorſus decreui fugere* Omnem Conuentum Epiſcoporũ.

* This is a luſtie kinde of Diuinitie.

(b) Vntruthe. For they are committed onely by the appointemente of the Prince.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Touchinge the vnlucky ſucceſſe of Councelles, the Ancient Father Nazianzene ſaithe thus, Equidem, vt verè, quod res eſt, ſcribam, prorſus decreui fugere Omnem Conuentum Epiſcoporum. Nullius enim Concilij bonum exitum vnquam vidi. Concilia enim non minuunt mala, ſed augent potiùs: *To ſaie the truthe, I am vtterlye determined neuer to comme to any* Councel of Biſhoppes. *For I neuer yet ſawe good end of any* Councel. *For* Councelles *abate not il thinges, but rather encreaſe them.* Theſe woordes thus vttered, whether they be vniuerſally true, or otherwiſe I will not

Grego. Nazianzenus ad Procopiũ.

The ſucceſſe of Councels. Mo kes, & Abbates.

reaſon. It maie ſæme hereby, this Learned Father, for his time, by experience found them true. And for ought, that maie appeare to the contrarie, notwithſtandinge anie thinge contained in your Glose, he ſæmeth to vtter the ſame, as wel of General Councelles, as of Prouincial.

Ὅτι μικρᾶς συνόδου τέλος εἴδομεν ἀρειανὸν μεθ' ὅλης χαιτῆς μᾶλλον ἰσχνίας. ἢ πεφυτίκαμεν. *Sozomenus.*

Certainely after the Greate General Councel of Nice, the Arian Heretiques wared moe, and moze mightie, then euer they hadde benne beſoze. The Emperoures Conſtantius, and Valens, with their Wiues, and Courtes became Arians. Conſtantinus the Greate him ſelfe was alſo doubted to be an Arian. Liberius the Biſhop of Rome, and Oſius that famous Learned Biſhop of Spaine, gaue their handes vnto the Arians. Tenne ſeueral ſundzie Prouinciall Councelles, gaue their voices with the Arians. S. Hierome ſaithe, Ingemuit totus Orbis, & Arianum ſe eſſe miratus eſt: *The whole world beganne to groane, and marueiled, that it had taken parte with the* Arians. Therfoze Nazianzene ſaith, He neuer ſawe Councel, noz Prouincial, noz General, that ended vvel: Foz that, as one ſaithe, The greatter ſide oftentimes ouervveighethe the better. Cuen ſo ſaide the Frenche Kinges Embaſſadoure, in the behalfe of his Pzince, in your late Chapter at Tridente: Noſtra, Patrumque noſtrorum, & Auorum memoria, Synodos indictas fuiſſe, Epiſcopos conueniſſe, maximos in Germania, atque Italia Conuentus peractos eſſe, ſcimus. Vix tamen vllus, aut perexiguus inde fructus Chriſtianitati conſtitit: *Wee knowe, that bothe in our Grandfathers, and Fathers daies, and in oure owne time,* Councelles *haue benne ſummoned*, Biſhoppes *haue mette togeather, greate and ſolemne Aſſemblies haue benne keapte, as* wel *in* Germanie, *as in* Italie, yet ſcarcely any good at al, or very litle good came thereof to the ſtate of Chriſtendome.

Tit. Liuius, Maior pars vincit melioꝛem.

Oratio Synodica Legati Regis Francia. An. 1562. Copm. f. 284

Concerninge Abbates and Monaſteries, we haue ſaide beſoze. We haue as many Abbates in Englande this daie, as either Chriſte euer had, oz his Apoſtles. Notwithſtandinge one of your Learned felowes of Louaine, foz the good will he beareth to that Religion, telleth vs, that the Apoſtles vvere Monkes, and Chriſte him ſelfe was the Abbate. The Abbates and Monkes, that were in olde times, were menne geuen to ſtudie, and Learninge. And out of Monaſteries learned menne were then taken, as out of ſchooles, and Vniuerſities, to the rule, & gouernement of the Churche. But your Abbates now are as mutch like thoſe Abbates, as your Church is like the Primitiue Churche of Chriſte.

Aug. Ep. 81. Aug. Ep. 76.

Eraſm. in Scholijs in Epiſtolam ad Ruſticum Monachum.

Eraſmus ſaithe, Haud ſcio, an nunc magis expediret Eccleſiæ Chriſtianæ, ſi pauciora eſſent Monaſteria, eſſetque omnium idem Cultus, eædemque preces, eademque vitæ ratio: *I knowe not, Whether it were better for the Churche of Chriſte, that there were fewer Monaſteries: and that al menne had* one Seruice of God, one kinde of Praier, and one order of Life.

The Apologie. Cap. 3. Diuiſion. 3.

But graunt, they be the Churche: let them be heard ſpeake in Councelles: let them alone haue authozitie, to greue conſente: yet in old time, when the Churche of God (if yee will compare it with their Churche) was very wel gouerned, bothe Elders, and Deacons, as ſaithe Cyprian, and certaine alſo of the Common people were called thereunto, and made acquainted with Eccleſiaſtical maters.

M. Harding.

Ah Syrs, would yee haue the common people come to the General Councel? Whome meane ye, I praie you? Tinkers, and Tapſters, Fidlers and Pipers, ſuche as your miniſters be? Alas poore ſoules, what ſhoulde they doo there? For there is no tinkinge nor tippinge, no fidlinge nor pipinge. There may they ſhutte vp bothe budgets and mouthes. For neither can they ſpeake in ſuche an audience to be vnderſtanded, nor can they vnderſtande what is ſpoken. Looke in your Bookes better, and you ſhal finde Cyprian to make litle for your purpoſe.

Had your mater benne good, it might haue benne defended without lies. Being as it is, altogeather beſide Truth and reaſon, for ſome coloure of the mainetenance of the ſame, yee paſſe al meaſure in lying.

Where

Prieſtes vnlearned.

Where ſaithe S. Cyprian that certaine of the common people were called to Eccleſiaſtical Councelles? Yea, ſpecially where ſaithe he, (a) that the common people were made iudges of Eccleſiaſtical matters, for ſo hath your Latine, which not without guile your Lady interpreter commonly tourneth, were made acquainted with Eccleſiaſticall matters? If you had meante true dealing, Defender, you woulde haue quoted the place: but you knewe thereby your falſehead ſhoulde haue beene eſpyed. (b) The place which you meane, doubtleſs is in the ſeconde tome of S. Cyprians woorkes, where we finde the ſentences of the Biſhoppes of Aphrike, *De Hæreticis Baptizandis*: Which proueth your ſtraunge ſaying, by you fathered vpon that holy Martyr, nothing at al. The wordes be theſe. *Cum in vnum Carthaginis conuenissent, &c.* When many Biſhoppes in the firſte daie of September were aſſembled togeather at Carthage, out of the prouince of Aphrike, Numidia, Mauritania, with their Prieſtes, and Deacons, the moſt parte of the people alſo being preſent, &c.

(a) S. Cyprians words be plain *Nihil ſine conſenſu plebis, &c. Li. 3. Epiſt. 10.*

(b) your gheſſe deceiueth you. It is not there.

Now what can you gather out of them for your pourpoſe more, but that a great number of the people were preſent onely in the Church or other place, where the Biſhoppes were aſſembled? That certaine of the common people were called to this Councell, there is no ſuche woorde mentioned, nor by Cyprian, nor by any els. • Neither were the Prieſtes them ſelues (which this youthful Gentilwoman interpreteth Elders) and Deacons • called thither, but they attended vppon the Biſhoppes, as in ſuche caſe it hathe beene accuſtomed: for ſentence none might geue in any Councell, but • onely Biſhoppes. Then howe muche leſſe were the common people called to that Councell, ſpecially to ſitte as iudges in Eccleſiaſticall matters? Mary, that you would ſo haue it, I thinke well. For ſuch confuſion might beſt ſerue you to procure the ouerthrowe of good order, in whiche the Churche is gouerned, whiche if it be maintained duely, your diſordered and rebellious ſtate will ſoone be confounded.

• Vntruthes boldly auouched. Read the Antweare.

The Biſhop of Saliſhurie.

Your Tinkers, **and** Tapſters, **M. Hardinge, are aſhamed in your behalfe, to ſee your folie. A poore ſely Jeſter, to winne his dinner, woulde be lothe to ſcoffe ſo coldely. Certaine of our Cleregie wante the knowlege of** Rhetorique, Logique, Philoſophie **the** Hebrewe, **the** Greeke **and the** Latine tongues: **Therefore we call them** Tinkers **and** Tapſters. **Dutche is the Sobrietie, and Modeſtie of your talke. Of what Schoole, or tongue then are your Prieſtes, M. Hardinge, that, for the more parte, can neither** Speake Latine, **nor** Reade Engliſhe, **nor** vnderſtand the Articles of their Faith, **nor** any portion of the Scriptures: Cloudes **without Raine:** Lanternes **without Light:** Salte **without ſauoure:** Blinde guides: Dombe Dogges: **that, as one ſaithe, ſeeme to haue their ſoules geuen them in ſtede of ſalte, to keepe them from ſtinking? Of what** Arte, **or** Occupation **was he, that Baptized a childe in Latine, in this ſorte,** In nomine Patria, & Filia, & Spirita Sancta? **What a ſkilfull Clerke was your** Pope Iulius 2. **that aſſigning a warrant, in ſtede of** Fiat, **wrote,** Fiatur? **Your owne Doctoure,** Alphonſus de Caſtro, **ſaithe,** Conſtat plures Papas adeo illiteratos eſſe, vt Grammaticam penitus ignorent: *It is moſte certaine, that many* Popes *be ſo vnlearned, that they be vtterly ignorante of their Grammar.* **And, being vtterly ignorante of their** Grammare Rules, **I beſeeche you, for what other profounde** ſcience **of** Logique, **or** Philoſophie, **can we praiſe them? An other of your Doctoures ſaithe,** Papa propter defectum literaturæ non poteſt deponi: *The* Pope *may not be depoſed for lacke of Learning.* **That is to ſaie, the** Pope, **though he be neuer ſo ignorant, or voide of knowledge, yet is as good a** Pope **as the beſte.**

De con. diſt. 4. Reſponderũt. Iulius. pp. 2. Alphon. Lib. 1. Cap. 4.

Felinus de Reſcriptis. Si quando.

An other of your Doctoures **ſaith:** Venalitate Curiæ Romanæ, inaniter præficiuntur Lenones, Coqui, Stabularij equorum & Pueri: *Through the briberie of the* Court of Rome, Baudes, Cookes, Hoſtlers, and Children *be placed in Offices to gouerne the Churche.* **Shal we therefore ſaie, as you ſaie, that al your** Prieſtes **be** Fidlers, **and** Pipers, Tinkers, **and** Tapſters?

Aureũ Speculum. In Antilogia.

Somme certaine of oure Cleregie **be ignorant in the tongues, as yours be: but not ignorant in knowledge, as yours be. The worſte of them ſaith, and lamenteth your wilful ignorance.** S. Auguſtine **ſaithe,** Multò minus malum eſt, indoctum eſſe, quàm indocilem: *Leſſe hurte is it, to be vnlearned, then to be wilful, and vnapte to learne.* Irenæus **ſaithe,** Melius eſt, & vtilius, idiotas, & parum ſcientes exiſtere, & per Charitatem proximos Deo fieri, quàm putare ſe multum ſcire, & multa expertos in ſuum Deum blaſphemos inueniri: *Better is it a greate deale, for menne to be ignorante, and to knowe but litle, and by loue to drawe neare to God, then to thinke them ſelues to knowe muche, and*

2. Corin. 11. *Auguſt. contra Academic. li. 3. ca. 7 Irena. Li. 2. Cap. 45.*

to

to haue greate experience, and yet to be founde blaſphemers againſte God.

Ambroſ. De Fide, Lib 1. Cap. 3. S. Ambroſe **ſaithe,** Non in Dialectica complacuit Deo, ſaluum facere populum ſuum. Regnum enim Dei in ſimplicitate Fidei eſt, non in contentione Sermonis: *It pleaſed not God, by* Logique *to ſaue his people. For the Kingedome of God ſtandeth not in contention of talke, but in ſimplicitie of Faithe.* **Likewiſe he ſaithe,** Verba Philoſophorum excludit ſimplex Veritas Piſcatorum: *The ſimple plaine Faith of Fiſhers confoundeth the woordes of the learned Philoſophers.* **The Ancient Father** Origen **ſaithe,** Sapientes huius ſæculi, videntes abſque Arte Grammatica, & peritia Philoſophica conſurgere muros Euangelij, velut cum irriſione quadam dicunt, perfacilè hoc poſſe deſtrui calliditate Sermonum, per aſtutas fallacias, & Argumenta Dialectica: *The wiſe menne of this worlde, ſeeinge the walles of the Goſpel to riſe vp without* Grammare, *and profounde knowledge in* Philoſophie, *ſaie ſcornefully emongeſt them ſelues, that al this by ſubtiletie of ſpeache, and crafty ſhiftes, and* Logical Argumentes, *maie ſuf eaſily be ſhaken downe.*

Conci. Carthag. 3. Can. 19. Et Concil. Hippon. Chryſoſt. in Geneſ. ho. 44 **It appeareth by the** Councels of Carthage, and Hippo Regius, **that in olde times Children vnder foureteene yeres of age were admitted to be** Readers **in the** Churche, **and, notwithſtandinge either their age, or wante of learninge, the people was wel contented, with ſilence, and reuerence to geue eare vnto them.** S. Chryſoſtome **ſaithe,** In humanis negotijs, quando Rex Diademate coronatus, &c. *Euen in worldly affaires, when the Kinge ſendeth foorthe his Proclamations, the Currer, or Pourſeuante is oftentimes a man of ſmal accoumpte, and ſommetime ſo baſe, that he neuer knewe his owne Father, or Grandefather. But they that receiue the Proclamation, haue no regarde vnto him, that brought it: notwithſtandinge, in reſpecte of the Kinges letters, that he brought, they yeilde him honoure, and with ſilence, and reuerence geue attendance to the Proclamation.*

Numer. 22. Hieronym. in Pſalm. 32 **Theſe ſimple vnlearned ones, whom you ſo diſdainefully deſpiſe, ſhal riſe vp in the daie of our Lorde, & condemne you with al your knowledge.** God **is hable to make the poore** Aſſe **to ſpeake, to controlle blinde** Balaams **wilful pourpoſes.** S. Hierome **ſaithe,** Paulus, qui Solœciſmos facit in loquendo, Chriſti Crucem portat, &, quaſi triumphans, omnes capit: Totum Orbem ſubegit, ab Oceano vſque ad Mare Rubrum: Paule, *that is not hable to vtter his minde in congrue ſpeache, beareth the* Croſſe of Chriſte, *and taketh al menne Priſoners, as if it were in triumphe: from the Ocean vnto the Redde Sea, he ſubdewed the whole worlde.* **Likewiſe** S. Ambroſe **ſaithe,** Non quæro, quid loquãtur Philoſophi: requiro quid faciant. Soli in ſuis Gymnaſijs remanſerunt. Vide, quàm Fides Argumentis præponderet. Illi quotidiè à ſuis conſortibus deſeruntur, qui copioſè diſputãt: Iſti quotidie creſcunt, qui ſimpliciter credunt. Non creditur Philoſophis: Creditur Piſcatoribus: *I demaunde not, what theſe greate learned Philoſophers ſaie, but what they doo. They are foreſaken, and leafte alone in their Schooles. Beholde, howe mutche more weighte there is in Faithe, then in Arguments. They with theire* profounde Reaſons *are daiely forſaken of theire ſelewes: Theſe with their* Simple Faithe *goe forewarde, and encreaſe daiely. Menne beleeue not the learned Philoſophers: They beleeue vnlearned Fiſhers.*

Ambroſi. ad Gratianum de Fide, Lib. 1. Cap. 5.

Prieſtes, (ye ſaie) this youthful Gentlewooman interpreteth Elders. **O M. Hardinge, litle needeth that godly Learned, and vertuous Lady, to feare your ſo vnmanly, & childiſhe toies. If ye had benne either ſo ſagely ſtudied, as ye pretende, and your frendes haue thought, ye might ſone haue learned, that** Presbyter **a** Prieſte, **is nothinge els, but** Senior, **that is, an** Elder: **and, that a** Prieſte **and an** Elder **are both one thing. And therfore wheras** S. Paule **ſaithe,** Aduerſus Presbyterum accuſationem ne admiſeris: S. Cyprian **tranſlating the ſame, ſaith thus,** Aduerſus Maiorẽ natu accuſationẽ ne receperis. **Your owne Doctour** Thomas Aquinas **ſaith,** presbyteri in Græco dicũtur, quaſi Seniores. **Your owne** Gratian **ſaith,** Presbyter Græce, Latinè Senior interpretatur. S. Hierome **ſaithe,** Idem eſt Presbyter, qui Epiſcopus. **Theſe two woordes,** πρεσβύτερος, πρεσβύτατος, **are erpounded in Latine,** Natu maior; Natu maximus. **So** Plutarchus **ſaithe,** πρεσβύτερα δένδρα, Olde Trees. **So** Nazianzene **ſaithe,** πρεσβύτας ἑαυτοὺς ποιοῦντες: *Goeinge by a ſtaffe, as olde menne vſe to doo.* **Therfore, M. Hardinge, it had benne more for your grauitie, to haue ſpared theſe youre youthefull folies.**

1 Timoth. 5. πρεσβύτερος. *Cypr. ad Quirinam. li. 3. ca. 76. Thomas Secunda. Secũde que. 184. arti. 6. Diſt. 21. Clerici. Hierony. ad Titum. cap. 1 Plutarch. in Publicola.*

Ye ſaie, The Prieſts, and Deacons waited onely vpon the Biſhoppes: but Sentence in Councel they might geue none. **This tale were true, M. Hardinge, if euery youre woorde were**

a

a Gospel. But S. Luke woulde haue tolde you far otherwise. For, speakinge of the firste Christian Councel, holden in the Apostles time, he saithe thus: Conuenerunt Apostoli, & Seniores, vt dispicerent de hoc negotio: *The* Apostles, *and* Elders *mette togeather, to take order, touchinge this mater.* And againe in the Conclusion, Placuit Apostolis, & Senioribus, cum tota Ecclesia: *It seemed good to the* Apostles, *and* Elders, *togeather with the whole Churche.* Here you se, the Apostles, and Elders, gaue their voices togeather. Nicephorus saithe, Athanasius inter Diaconos Alexandriæ Primarius, non minima pars Nicenæ Synodi: Athanasius *beinge* (not a Bishop, but) *one of the chefe* Deacons *of* Alexandria, *was not the leaste parte of the* Councel of Nice. Tertullian saithe, Præsident probati quiq; Seniores, honorem istum non pretio, sed testimonio adepti: *The iudges in suche* Ecclesiastical Assemblies *be the beste allowed* Elders, *hauinge obteined that honoure, not for money, but by the witnesse of their Brethren.* And in the Seconde Councel of Nice, Petrus Protopresbyter, and Petrus Presbyter, not beinge Bishoppes, but onely Priestes, sent thither by Adrianus the Bishop of Rome, gaue their assentes, and subscribed their names before al the Bishoppes.

Priestes, Deacons, and Laie menne in councelles.

Actorum. 15

Niceph. Li. 8. Cap. 15.

Tertullian in Apologetico.

Concil Nicen. 2. Actio. 24 & 6.

Touchinge S. Cyprian, ye saie, as your grauitie, and modestie best leadeth you, Wee lie without coloure, and passe measure in Lieinge. And here, as menne vse, that goe by gheasse, and answeare longe before they knowe, ye finde out a place in S. Cyprian, that wee thought not of: and, vpon affiance thereof, ye blowe vp your trumpe, and cal vs Liers. How be it, wise menne thinke him a hasty Iudge, that pronounceth before he knowe the cause. S. Cyprian saithe, A primordio Episcopatus mei, statui, nihil sine consilio vestro, & sine consensu Plebis, mea priuatim sententia, gerere: *From my first entringe into the* Bishoprike, *I haue determined to doo nothinge by mine owne authoritie, without your aduise* (beinge the Priestes, and Deacons), *and without the consente of the people.* For doinge the contrarie herof, the Ancient Father Origen rebuketh Bishoppes of Pride, and Rakelinesse. Thus he saithe, Quis hodiè eorum, qui populis præsunt, Consilium dignatur inferioris saltem Sacerdotis accipere? Ne dixerim Laici, vel Gentilis: *What one newe adaye, of al the* Bishoppes, *that haue the ouersight of the people, vouchesaueth to take the* Counsel *of any* Inferioure Priestes? *I wil not saie, of a* Laie man, *or of an* Heathen. Sutch, M. Harding, are youre Cardinalles, and Bishoppes of Rome: They disdeigne the companie, and Counsel of their inferiours. S. Ambrose, touching a case of Faith against the Arians, saithe thus: Veniant, si qui sunt, ad Ecclesiam. Arriuant cum populo: Non vt quisquam Iudex resideat: sed vt vnusquisq; de suo affectu habeat examen: *If there be any of them, let them comme to the* Churche: *Let them geue eare, and hearken with the people: Not that any man there shal sitte as* Iudge: but that euery man maie haue the examination of his owne minde. S. Ambrose alloweth no one man, to sit as Pope, and to ouerrule al the reste, what so euer he saie.

Cyprian, li. 3 Epist. 10.

Origen. in Exodum, Homil. 11.

Ambros. li. 3 Epist. 32.

To conclude, your owne Pope Nicholas, writing vnto Michael the Greeke Emperoure, saithe thus, Vbinam legistis, Imperatores, Antecessores vestros, Synodalibus conuentionibus interfuisse? Nisi fortè in quibusdam, vbi de Fide tractatum est: quæ Vniuersalis est, quæ omnium communis est: quæ non solùm ad Clericos, verùm etiam ad Laicos, & ad omnes omninò pertinet Christianos: *Where did your* Maieshe *euer read, that your* Predecessoures, beinge Emperoures, *were euer presente at the* Assemblies of Councelles? *Onlesse it were, when question was moued concerninge the* Faithe. *For* Faith *is Vniuersal, and common to al menne, and belongeth not onely to the* Priestes, *but also to the* Laie menne, *and generally to al* Christians. But herof we shal haue occasion to speake more hereafter.

Epist. Nicholai pp. ad Imp. Michaelem.

The Apologie. Cap. 3. Diuision. 4.

But, I put case, these Abbates, and Bishoppes, haue no knowlege: what if they vnderstande nothinge, what Religion is, nor howe wee ought to thinke of God? I put case, the pronouncinge, & ministringe of the Lawe be decaied in Priestes, and good counsel faile in the Elders, and as the Prophete Micheas saithe, The Nighte be vnto them in steede of a vision,

Micheæ 3.

and

Esay 56. and darkenesse in steede of Prophesying: Or, as Esaias saithe, VVhat if all the vvatchemen of the Cittie be become blinde? VVhat if the Salte haue loste hys propre

Matt. 5. strength and sauerinesse, and as Christe saithe, be good for no vse, scant vvoorthe the castinge on the dounghill?

M. Hardinge.

The worlde knoweth so well, (yea Heauen also) the great woorthinesse of those Fathers in euery respect, that, I should doo them wronge here to praise them, for that by your foode surmises you seeke their dispraise.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Matthias Flacius Illyricus, in protestatione cõtra Concil. Tridẽ. pa. 79

Heauen, and Earthe knoweth, M. Hardinge, that two of your Reuerende vvorthy Fathers, notwithstandinge their vertues, and al their great worthinesse, were taken, and slaine in Aduouterie, euen there presente at your Councel. Therefore ye do your selfe somme wronge, in respecte of your credite, so wastefully to bestowe your praises.

The Apologie. Cap. 4. Division. 2.

Wel yet then, they wil bring al matters before the Pope, who can not erre. To this I saie, firste it is a madnesse to thinke, that the Holy Ghoste taketh his flight from a General Councel, to renne to Rome, to the ende if he doute, or sticke in any matter, and cannot expounde it of him selfe, he may take counsel of some other spirite, I wote not what, that is better learned, then him selfe. For if this be true, what needed so many Bishoppes, with so great charges, and so farre iorneys, to haue assembled their Conuocation at this present at Tridente? It had ben more wisedome, and better, at least it had bene a mutche nearer, and handsommer waie, to haue brought all things rather before the Pope, and to haue come streight forth, and haue asked counsel at his Diuine Breast. Secondly, it is also an vnlawfull dealing, to tosse our mater from so many Bishoppes and Abbates, and to bring it at laste to the triall of one onely man, specially of him, who himselfe is appeached by vs of hainous, and foule enormities, and hath not yet put in his answere: who hath also afore hand condemned vs without iudgement by order pronounced, and ere euer we were called, to be Iudged.

M. Hardinge.

* We Honour, and Adour the Holy Ghost, as very God: But you shamefully abuse the name of God.

We maie lesse wonder at your iestinge in other thinges, sith now we see you scoffe and iest in thinge touching God him selfe. Sir, set you so lighte by the Holy Ghoste, as thus vnreuerently to talke of hys flight and runninge to Rome, of his doubtinge, and stickinge, of his vnableness to declare doubtfull cases, of asking counsell of an other spirite? Who euer vttered suche vile talke of the Holy Ghost, but some vile caitife, quite voide of his grace? Can not you conceiue that reasonably, the determinations of Councels be referred to the Pope Christes Vicare in Earthe, onlesse ye vtter suche vnreuerent and prophane scoffes? It had become a wicked Celsus, a Porphyrius, a Iulian, thus to talke, rather then any Christian Hickscorner. You should at least haue looked on your square Cappe, and your white rochet, if you haue any: if nothing els, they would haue told you, that such prophane lightnesse became not your person.

*Vntruthes hudled together without shame.

(a) A sage kind of mockerie. For then dothe not the Pope Confirme his Brethren: but rather is Confirmed by his Brethren.

Concerning the pointe it selfe you touche, * although the Pope haue that Priuiledge, which Christe * prayed to his Father for to be geuen vnto Peter, as being Peters Successour, that his * Faith faile not, and that he confirme his Brethren, and therefore be an * assured iudge in matters of Faithe, yet this notwithstanding, Councels be not assembled togeather in vaine. For the Fathers of the Councell doo (a) helpe the Faith and Doctrine of the highest pastour. Wherefore in the first Councell at Ierusalem, when as a greate question rose, and Peter had sayde his iudgement, not propped with any testimonie of the Holy Scriptures, Iames approued it, adding thereto the testimonies of the Prophetes. For Gods prouidence so tendereth the Churche, that the chiefe * members, though they depende of the * Heade, yet defende and healpe the Head.

Luke. 22. Act. 15.

Wherefore Beda admonisheth discretely, that Paule conferred the Gospell, which he had Preached amongest the Gentiles, with the other Apostles, seeking warely to be resolued, whether he preached rightly of the ceasinge of the obseruances of the Lawe. Not that he doubted ought therof him selfe, (sayth he) but

Lib. Rem. in act. 15. stolorum

but that the myndes of them, that were in doubt, might be confirmed by the Auctoritie of that Apoſtolike Councell.

To that you alleage ſecondly, as a great inconuenience, we tel you, that forasmuch as the Pope is at euery generall Councel lawfully aſſembled, eyther in perſon, as ſundry Popes haue benne, or by his Legates: (b) neither is it an vnlaufull dealing, nor ſuch toſſing as you terme it, matters maturely debated in the Councel, to be referred to the Pope head of the Councel, not ſo much for a newe trial, as for final confirmation. The Fathers of the Nicene Councel beſought S. Syluester, that what they had ordeined, he wold confirme and ratifie. And Leo what things the Councell of Calcedon had decreed, touching matters of Faithe, ſaithe, that he approueth them. And the Councell it ſelfe ſpeaking to Leo, ſayth thus: *Decretis tuis noſtrum honora Iuditium:* With thy decrees honour our Iudgement. Likewiſe the Fathers of other Councels, required their conſtitutions to be ſtrengthened by confirmation of the Popes auctoritie.

And ſir, finde you fault with the Pope, by cauſe he hathe not yet put in his anſweare? I pray you, (c) who accuſed him? Where, when, and whereof? In what laufull Courte? Before what lawfull Iudge? O you ſaie, he hath not yet put in his anſweare. Be it that Hicke, Hob, and Hans of your ſectes haue impudently accuſed him. Howe woulde ye haue him bring in his anſweare? To what ſeate of iudgement, to what Conſiſtorie can yee cite him, that is by Chriſte appoynted (d) to be the Supreme iudge of all his Churche, the Sheepeherde of all his Flocke? It is not for him you knowe, to bringe in his aunſweare in Weſtminſter Haull, nor in Sterre Chamber. Will ye haue him appeare before your high Commiſsioners in the longe Chappell at Powles, or in M. Grindalles chaumber thereby, where ye haue ſaide and doone youre pleaſure, and depriued many honeſt menne of their benefices? Or will ye rather haue him come to Geneua, to Zurich, to Frankforde, to Strasburg, to Wittenberg, or to ſome other corner, where ye haue your congregations, there to be iudged by Iacke and Gille? I pitie you, poore ſoules, that yee talke thus ſo farre out of ſquare, and woulde the Pope to bringe in his anſweare, ye knowe not where, hauing neither iuſte Courte, or Conſiſtorie to call him vnto, nor lawfull iudge, nor lawe to paſſe vppon him. For through your Schiſmes and Hereſies, as ye haue made your ſelues Churchleſſe, Chriſteleſſe, and Godleſſe: ſo alſo Courteſſe, Iudgeleſſe, and Lawleſſe. I can not compare you better then to the Rebelles of Northfolke vnder Captaine Kete, amongeſt whom Mount Surrey was their London, and an Oke or an Elme commonly called the tree of Reformation, was their Weſtminſter Haull. Suche Prince, ſuche Dominion, ſuche Iudge, ſuche Conſiſtorie.

Ye complaine, the Pope hath condemned you without iudgement by order pronounced, and before ye were euer called to be iudged. This is as true as that the Murderer, or Theefe anſwereth the Iudge at the barre, faieinge, not gilty my Lorde. Ye haue benne ſundry times called to lawfull Conſiſtories, to Synodes, to Councels. Alwayes eyther ye made not your appearance, or by right of ſafeconduct conueyed your ſelues away, without any ſhewe of Obedience: or vpon promiſe of amendement, you were dimiſſed. Howe many Legates and *Nuncios* haue ſundry Popes ſente into Germanie and other Prouinces, to conuent you, to heare you, to moue you to a better mynde, and call you home, and with all mercyful meanes to gather you againe into the lappe of the Churche? He may ſay, to your condemnation, that was ſaide of the Iewes: What is that I ought to haue done to (e) my Vineyarde, whiche I haue not donne? But all was in vaine, ſuche hath bene your ſtubbournesſe.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Wee ieſte not at Goddes Holy Spirite, **M. Hardinge. Wee know, it is the ſame** Spirite of VViſedome, **that hath renewed the face of the woꝛlde, and diſcouered the multitude of your folies. But wel may wee ieſt at your vnhandſome, and open legierdumaine, that ſo vainely ſeeke to blinde vs with a painted ſhadowe of the** Sprite of God. **Ye pꝛetende longe Pꝛaiers, mutche Faſtinge, great conference of Doctours, and Scriptures, and the vndoubted preſence, and aſſiſtance of** Goddes Holy Sprite **in all your doings, and yet openly ſtriue againſt the manifeſt** VVoorde, **and** Sprite of God. **and folow only your owne** Sprite, **whiche we may truly cal the** Sprite of Vanitie. **The** Sprite **that you meane, is nothing els, but the** Sprite of Rome: **which you ſaie, is the** Sprite of Truthe, **and can not erre. In one of your late** Councelles, **holden in** Rome, **as ye were ſinging, and roaring out** Veni Creator Spiritus, **a pꝛze old Dwle, amazed with the noyſe, leapte out of the hole, where ſhe ſate, and pitched downe in the middes, and ſate amongeſt you. Thus it pleaſed God to diſcouer your Hypocriſie, and your folie, that the woꝛlde might knowe, in what** Sprite **ye were aſſembled.**

Elias **the Pꝛophete of** God **ieſted thus at the** Prieſtes of Baal: *Crie out alowde: Ye is your God. Either he is occupied in ſomme talke: or he is in his Inne: or he is trauaylynge vpon the waie: or els perhaps he is a ſleepe.* **Yet neither was** Elias, **an Hicke Scoꝛner: noꝛ ieſted he at** Goddes holy Sprite: **noꝛ did he any thinge, that was vnſeemely foꝛ his perſonne.**

(b) Wiſely. The Holy Ghoſte that is preſente at the Councel, for better aduiſe, taketh Counſel of the Pope, • By this Diuinitie Iames was a member of Peter.

(c) The whole worlde accuſeth him.

(d) A foule vntruthe. For Chriſte neuer gaue the Pope anye ſuche Commiſsion.

(e) Open Blaſphemie: The Churche is the Popes Vineyarde.

Nicolaus de Clauengijs.

3. Regum. 18

Addition. ☞ If this iesting so mutche offende your tender eares, M. Harding, beware yée offende not your dæreſt frendes, that haue moze liberally vſed the lyke iesting. Foz Nicolaus Cuſanus, being himſelfe a Cardinall of the Churche of Rome, thus ieſteth at Pope Eugenius, his Lozde, and maiſter: Quomodo poteſt Papa Eugenius dicere, hoc verum eſſe, ſi ipſe velit, & non aliter? Ac ſi inſpiratio ipſius Sancti Spiritus foret in poteſtate Romani pontificis, vt tunc inſpiret, quando ipſe velit: *Howe can Pope Eugenius ſaie, This is true, if it pleaſe him to haue it ſo, & none otherwiſe? As though the inſpiration of the Holy Ghoſte were wholy at the Popes commaundemente, to breathe onely, when he wil haue him.* Teraſius the Patriarke of Conſtantinople writeth thus to Adrianus the Biſhop of Rome: Tolerabilior eſt Hæreſis Macedonij, qui aſſerit, Spiritum Sanctum eſſe ſeruum Patris, & Filij. Nam iſti faciunt Spiritum Sanctum ſeruum ſuum: *The Hereſie of* Macedonius, *that helde, that the Holy Ghoſte is a ſclaue to the Father, and to the Sonne, is more tollerable, then the Hereſie of* Simoniſtes. *For they make the Holy Ghoſte theire owne ſclaue.* I wil ſaie nothinge of Laurentius Valla, Canon of the Churche of Rome, foz that he ſo many yéeres agoe, ſo ſharpely found fault with ſundzie errours in the Churche, and therefoze was thought euer partial in his ſpeaches. Note withſtandinge his wozdes be theſe: Papa etiam rem Eccleſiaſticam, & Spiritum Sanctum quæſtui habet, quod Simon ille Magus deteſtatur: *The Pope maketh Marchandiſe of Churche goodes, and raiſeth gaine of the Holy Ghoſt, and ſetteth him to ſale.* This ieſtinge is broade, and bitter, M. Harding, and yet nothing preiudicial to the Sprite of God.

As foz your Councelles, whether they be al, and euermoze ſummoned by the Sprite of God, oz no, it maie wel be doubted. The Vniuerſitie of Parile thus proteſted, by waie of Appeale, againſte Pope Leo. 10. and his Councel of Rome: Dominus Leo Papa Decimus, in quodam Cœtu in Ciuitate Romana, neſcimus qualiter, non tamen in Spiritu Domini, Congregato: Our Lorde Pope Leo 10. *in a certaine* Councel, *gathered in the* Cittie of Rome, *by what meane, wee know not*: but ſurely not by the Sprite of God. And touchinge your Late Chapter, oz Conuenticle, which ye call the Councell of Trente, the Frenche Kinges Embaſſadoure, beinge there in preſence, ſaid thus: Minùs legitima, minusúe libera fuiſſe dicuntur illa Concilia. Qui aderant, ad voluntatem alterius ſemper loquebantur: *The ſaieinge is, that theſe were neither* Lawfull, nor free Councelles. *The* Biſhoppes, *that were there, ſpake* (not alwaies of the Sprite of God, but) *euermore to pleaſe ſomme other:* By whiche Other, he meante the Pope.

Chriſte ſaithe vnto Peter, *I haue praied for thee: and* Paule *went vp to* Hieruſalem, *to viſite* Peter: *Ergo* (yée ſaie) The Pope hath Authoritie to confirme Councelles. O M. Harding, your Logique of Louaine is marueilous haſty. Yée fozce your Concluſions, to renne in poſte. Foz what maketh, either Chriſtes praier for Peter, oz Paules iourney from Arabia to Hieruſalem foz the Confirmation of your Councelles? Verily, here is no manner mention, neither of Confirmation, noz of Conncel, noz of Pope. You might as handſomely haue concluded thus, Peter *tooke his boate, and wente a Fiſhinge:* Ergo, *The* Pope *hathe ſul authoritie to confirme Councelles.* And whether yée will make this ſame to ſerue you foz an Argumente, oz no, it were harde to telle.

Whereas Chriſte praied namely foz Peter, S. Auguſtine ſaithe, as he hath benne alleged before, Nunquid pro Petro rogabat: pro Iacobo, & Iohanne non rogabat? *Did* Chriſte *praie onely for* Peter, *and did he not praie for* Iames, *and* Iohn?

Againe he ſaithe, Hac nocte poſtulauit Satanas vexare vos, ſicut triticum: Sed ego rogaui Patrem pro vobis, ne deficiat Fides veſtra: *This nighte hathe* Sathan *deſired to threaſhe you, as if yee were wheate. But I haue praied to my Father* (not onely foz Peter, but) *for you that your Faithe maie not faile.*

Touching that Paule went vp to Hieruſalem, of Courteſie, to ſée Peter, he ſought not thereby the certainetie of his owne Doctrine, as a man, that otherwiſe ſtode in doubt, whether he had ſo longe, foz the ſpace of fourtiene yéeres, preached Truthe, oz Falſehedde: but rather founde faulte with Peters diſſimulation in Doctrine, and reproued him openly euen vnto the face. S. Hierome ſaith, Perrexit Hieruſalem, non tam vt diſceret aliquid ab Apoſtolis, quàm cum eis Euangelium, quod docuerat, collaturus: Paule

Addition ☞

Nic. Cuſan. De Concordan. Lib. 2. Cap. 20. Pag. 749.

1. qua. 1. Eos qui.

Laur. Valla De Donatione Conſtan.

Appellatio vni. Pariſien. Anno 1517.

Oratio Synodica. Anno 1562.

Luc. 22. Galat. 2.

Au. De que. Noui Teſta. quæſt. 75. Au. De ver. Dom. In Euang. Secundum Lucam. Sermo. 36. Galat. 2.

Hier. in Epi. ad Gal. ca. 1.

Conſer-uation of Coun-celles.

Paule *went vp to* Hieruſalem, *not ſo mucke to learne any thyng of the Apoſtles, as to conferre with them touchyng the* Goſpel, *that he had preached.*

S. Chryſoſtome **ſaithe further,** Paulus nihil opus habebat Petro: nec illius egebat voce, ſed honore par erat illi: Nimis enim hic dicam amplius: Paule *had no neede of* Peter, *nor had any cauſe to crane his voyce: but in honour and worthyneſſe was his equall: As for more I will not ſaie.* *Chryſoſt. ad Gala. cap. 1.*

Concernyng the Confirmation **of** Councelles, **wee haue ſpoken otherwhere more at large.** Councelles **were** Confirmed, **not onely by the** Biſhop of Rome, **but alſo by other** Biſhoppes, **and** Patriarkes: **and not onely by other** Biſhoppes, **but alſo by** Kinges, **and** Emperours. **The** Emperour Martianus **ſaithe,** Sacro noſtræ Serenitatis edicto venerandum Synodum Confirmamus: *By the holy Edicte of our* Maieſtie *wee Confirme this Reuerende* Councell. **Lykewyſe the** Biſhoppes **in the** Councell of Conſtantinople, **beſought the** Emperour Theodoſius, Rogamus Clementiam tuam, vt per literas tuæ pietatis ratum eſſe iubeas, Confirmeſque Concilij Decretum: *Wee beſeeche your fauour, that by your* Maieſties *Letters, yee will ratifie, and* Confirme the Decree of the Councel. *In the former Replie. artic. 4. diuiſio. 26. Con. Chalce do. Actio. 3. Concil. Conſtantinop. 5.*

Touching the Councel **of the** Apoſtles **at** Hieruſalem, **your owne Doctour** ſaith, Poſtquam Petrus dixiſſet, Iacobus, Authoritate pontificali, protulit Definitiuam Sententiam: *When* Peter *had ſaide his minde,* Iames *by his* Epiſcopal authoritie, *pronounced the Definitiue Sentence:* **that is to ſaie, gaue his Confirmation to the whole. By which ſaieinge it maie appeare, that** Iames **was in authoritie aboue** Peter. **For he that pronounceth** Definitiue Sentence, **in al aſſemblies is euer the greateſt.** *Ioan. de Paris. ca. 14.*

To conclude, Councelles **haue benne allowed, and holden for good, whether the** Biſhop of Rome **woulde or no.** Liberatus **ſaithe, when** Anatolius, **by conſent of the** Councel of Chalcedon, **had obteined the** Primacie, **and the** Biſhop of Romes Legates **ſtode againſte it, theire gaine ſaieinge of the** Iudges, **and** Biſhoppes **there, was not receyued.** *And notwithſtanding the apoſtolike See of Rome euen hitherto ſtande againſt it, yet the* Decree of the Councel, by the Authoritie, and maintenance of the Emperour, after a ſorte, ſtandeth ſtil in force. *Liberat. cap. 13.*

Putche pleaſant ſporte yée make vs M. Hardinge, vvithe puttinge in the Popes anſvveare. Be it **(ſaie you)** that Hicke, Hob, and Hans haue accuſed the Pope. Woulde yee haue him appeare in this Courte, or in that, to be iudged by Iacke and Gill? **The whole worlde, M. Hardinge, hath of long time charged the** pope **with** Ambition, Briberie, Simonie, Superſtition, Idolatrie, **and open** Corruption **of the ordinances and wil of God. If he diſdeigne the iudgement of ſo many, and cal the whole worlde** Hicke **and** Hob **let him not marueile, if the whole worlde diſdeigne him. If he maie be both Iudge, and Partie, and may make anſweare onely before him ſelfe, I doubt not but he ſhal haue a good fauourable hearinge.** Quodammodò.

I beſeeche thee good Chriſtian Reader, for ſhortneſſe ſake, conſider that I haue written before, touching the Accuſing, and Iudgeing of the Pope. **There ſhalte thou ſee, as** Ennodius **ſaithe,** *That the* Pope *together with the Power of Teachinge, hath receiued free libertie to doo ill, without controlment.* **Therefore he ſaithe,** Neque ab Auguſto, neque ab omni Clero, neque à Regibus, neque à populo, Iudex iudicabitur: *The* Pope, *that is the* Iudge, *ſhalbe iudged neither by the* Emperour, *nor by the* vvhole Cleregie, *nor by* Kinges, *nor by the* people. **Butche a** Prerogatiue **ſaithe** Athanaſius, **was ſometyme claymed by the** Arian **Heretiques:** Cum ipſi ſint rei, ac Iudicio obnoxij, veluti Caiphas, iudicandi munus inuadunt: *Where as they themſelues be guilty, and in danger of Iudgement, they plaie the parte of* Caiphas, *and take vppon them to bee Iudges themſelues.* **In like manner** Chryſoſtome **ſaithe,** Figura ibi duntaxat Iudicij erat: re autem ipſa erat Latronum impetus: *There was onely a face of Iudgement: but in deede it was a brunte or violence of Theeues.* *Part. 5. ca. 6 Diuiſi. 7. Ennodius. 9. Que. 3. Nemo. Athanaſ. contra Arianos. Ora. 1. Chryſoſt. in Matth. Homil. 85.*

Yée ſaie further The Pope maie ſaie to our condemnation, that God ſaithe vnto the Iewes: What is it, that I ought to haue done to my Vineyard but I haue done it? **And thus ye giue the** pope **power to challenge the** Churche of God, **to be his owne. Euen ſo** Nero, **that wicked** Tyran, **when he had waſted, and conſumed the** Cittie of Rome, **and burnte it with fiere, he called the ſame neuertheleſſe by his owne name,** Neronopolis, Neroes towne. **One of your Doctours ſaithe,** Huius Communitatis non eſt Dominus, niſi Chriſtus, vel Papa, *There is no Lorde of this common ſtate, (that is to ſay, of the Churche,) but eyther* Chriſte, *or the* *Eſai. 5. Sueton. in Nerone. Herueus de poteſt. Papæ In prologo.*

or the pope: As if Christe and the pope were ioynt Pourchasers.

1. *Pet. 5.* But in deede Christ *only is the* Prince of pastours. And the Church is his only Spouse,
Aug. de verb. Domi. in Euang. Secundum Iohan. Sermo. 50. and not the popes. S. Augustine saithe vnto Christe, Tu Petro non dixisti, Pasce Oues tuas: sed, pasce Oues meas: *Thou saidste not vnto* Peter, *Feede thy Sheepe: but feede mine.* Peter belongeth vnto the Churche: but the Churche belongeth not vnto Peter.

Esai. 5. The Churche is not the popes Vine: *It is the* Vine of the Lorde of Sabaoth. Therfore, M. Hardinge, aduise your selfe better. Your wordes are guilty of great blasphemie. It shalbe sufficient for the Pope, if he maie be onely a branche in this Vine: if he be not withered: if he be not cut of, and throwen into the fiere.

Augu. in Iohan. Tractu. 123. S. Augustine saithe, Qui hoc animo pascunt Oues Christi, vt Suas velint esse, non Christi, se conuincuntur amare, non Christum: vel gloriandi, vel dominandi, vel acquirendi cupiditate: *They, that feede the Sheepe of Christ, to that end, that they woulde haue them to be theire Sheepe, and not Christes, are founde to loue themselues, and not Christe: for desire, either of Glorie, or of Gouernement, or of Gaine.*

The Apologie. Cap. 4 Diuision. 2.

Howe saie ye, do we deuise these tales? Is not this the very course of the Councelles in these daies? Are not all thinges remoued from the whole holy Councel and brought before the Pope alone: that as though nothinge had benne donne to purpose, by the iudgementes and consentes of suche a number, he alone maie adde, alter, dimynische, disanulle, allowe, remitte and qualifie, what so euer he liste? Whose woordes be these then? And why haue the Bishoppes and Abbates in the late Councell at Tridente, concluded thus in the ende, Sauinge alwaies the Authoritie of the See Apostolique in all thinges? Or why dooth Pope Paschale write so proudely of him selfe? As though, saithe he, there vvere any General Councell hable to prescribe a Lawe to the Churche of Rome: where as all Councelles bothe haue benne made, and haue receyued their force, and strength by the Authoritie of the Churche of Rome: and in ordinaunces made by Councelles, is euer plainely excepted the Authoritie of the Romaine Bishop. If they will haue these thinges allowed for good, why be Councels called? But if they commaunde them to be voide, why are they leaft in theire Bookes, as things allowable?

De Election. & Electi pote. Significasti.

M. Hardinge.

Sir, what neede you bestowe so muche talke in vaine? Is it not reason the (a) members acknowledge the heade? Woulde you the members to woorke their actions without the heade? Is Pope Paschalis to be called proude for preferringe the Churche of Rome before a Councell? Haue not Councelles euer benne thought to lacke their full Auctoritie, (b) whiche were not called and confirmed by the Bishop of Rome?

(a) Who made al the Faitheful of Christe, the Popes Members.

(b) Vntruthe plain and manifest. For the Pope had no Authoritie to cal Coūcels: As it shal appeare.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

The Modestie, and Sobrietie of pope Paschalis claime, shall better appeare in the nexte Diuision. Verily the Churche of Rome theise many yeares, may seme to haue benne nothing els, but a Mother of Falsehed, and a Schole of Pride. Pope Nicolas saithe, De Sedis apostolicæ iudicio nemini licet iudicare: *It is lawfull for no man to iudge of the* popes iudgement. And of late yeares, pope Leo saide, Papa habet Authoritatem super omnia Concilia: *The* Pope *hath Authoritie ouer al* Councelles. That al lawfull Councelles haue euermore ben summoned, and confirmed by the pope, it is a manyfest, and grosse Untruthe: as hereafter it shalbe opened more at large.

Nicol. Pap. 1 Ad Imp. Michaelem Concil. Lateran. Sub Leone. 10. Sessione 10.

Where ye saie, It is reason, the Members shoulde acknowledge their Heade that is the pope. For shame, M. Hardinge, and for your credites sake, once leaue theise vanities. If the Pope be any parte of Goddes Churche, he is a member, and not the Heade: and the Faithefull of the Churche of God, are Christes members, and not the popes. In deede Pope Athanasius saith thus of him selfe, Mihi cura erit, Euangelij Fidem circa meos populos custodire, partesque Corporis mei per spatia diuersa terrarum, quantum possum

poſſum literis conuenire: *I wil be careful to keepe the Faithe of the Goſpel emongeſt my people, and by letters to deale with* the partes of my Body, *liuing ouer the ſundrie Coaſtes of the Worlde.* **Thus he imaginethe in his dreame, that al the Princes, and ſtates of the Worlde be nothinge els, but the Partes, & Membres of his Body.**

The Apologie, Cap. 5. Diuiſion. 1.

But be it ſo: Let the Bishop of Rome **alone be aboue al** Councells, **that is to ſaie, let ſomme one parte be greater then the whole: let him be of greter Power, let him be of more Wiſedome, then al his: and, in ſpite of** Hieromes **heade, let the Authoritie of one Cittie be greater, then the Authoritie of the** vvhole VVorlde.

Hieron. ad Enagrium.

(a) Vntruth. Or therwise shew vs by what authority he is so.

(b) Ful wisely. As if the Pope were the Hed and the whole Churche were his Body: Or as if the Pope were the Maister, and the Churche his Familie.

(d) O fond folie. For so any simple creature so long as being led by the Holy Ghoste, can neuer erre.

(e) Vntruthe, vaine, and chil dish For S. Hierome speaketh plainly of Authoritie: *Si Authoritas quaritur.* Maior eſt Orbis Vrbe.

M. Hardinge.

The Councel lathe ouer VVise men, and wiſedome, as the Pope ſaith. The Pope ſaith VVise men and wiſedome are the ſame.

It is a common maner of this Defender, what he muſte needes graunt, to make a ſhewe in woordes, as though it were free gifte. So many times beggers wil ſeeme gentilmen, and payers of dette wil ſeeme geuers. Let the Biſhop of Rome, (ſaithe he) alone be aboue all Councelles. (a) Sir, he is ſo, no thanke to you Yet ſpeake you like a liberal gentilman, That is to ſaie, let ſome one parte be greater than the whole. No ſir maugre your ſcoffing heade, parte ſhal not be greater than the whole, but parte ſhall be greater then parte, (b) in a right ſenſe is not the heade greater then the body, the Biſhop, then his Clergie, the (b) maiſter of a houſe, more than his familie? Neither is the Councel the whole pardy, except your mery wiue can diuiſe vs a whole body without a heade. Let him be of greater power, ſaie you. And ſo he is. Lette him be of more wiſedome, then all his. VVee ſaie not ſo. It may be, that his Councel hath more learninge (c) more knowledge and more wiſedome, then his onely perſon. Albeit, when we ſpeake of that wiſedome of the ſee Apoſtolike, whiche is ſure, infallible, and can not erre. We meane not onely the Popes ſingulare perſone, but heade Paſtour and Biſhop, as he doothe, thoſe things, which pertaine to that chaire, that is to ſaie, in aſmuch as he procedeth not vpon his owne priuate iudgement, (d) but by the inſtincte of the Holy Ghoſt, promiſed by Chriſte to his Vicare. VVhere you ſaie, And in ſpite of Hieromes heade, Let the Authoritie of one Cittie be greter than the Authoritie of the whole world, we tel you, that this you ſpeak more ſpitefully, then learnedly. For S. Hierome in his Epiſtle to Euagrius ſpeaketh (e) onely of a particular matter, blaming the cuſtome of Rome, where contrary to the cuſtome of the whole worlde, Deacons in certain caſes were preferred before Prieſtes, wherof we haue ſpoken before.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Sir Defender (**yée ſaie**) ſpeaketh like a liberall Gentleman. **Againe yée ſaie,** No ſir, Maugre your ſcoffinge heade. **Theſe, and other like woordes, M. Hardinge, are fittinge, and ſeemely for your perſon, and maie wel becomme your mery witte.**

Where wee ſaie, Let the Biſhop of Rome be of greater power, then any General Councel. **Yée anſweare vs readily,** And ſo he is: **Where wée ſaie,** Let him be of more VViſedome, then al other Biſhoppes, **Yée anſweare againe,** Wee ſaie not ſo: **As if yée woulde allowe the** Pope **Authoritie, and Power without Wiſedom. Yet wiſe menne haue ſaide, that** Power without VVſedome is the Kingedome of Folie.

The Pope (**you ſaie**) Mauger your ſcoffinge heade, ſhalbe greater then the Churche. And yet ſhal not the parte be greater, then the whole. **Awake a litle, M. Hardinge, and expound vs youre dreame.**

The whole, wée ſpeake of, is the whole Churche of Chriſte. And, I trowe, by your learninge, the Pope **is a Parte, or Member of the ſame. Otherwiſe yée muſte telle vs, that the** Pope **is no parte of the Churche of Chriſte. Whiche thinge, al circumſtances conſidered, were not harde to be graunted.**

But the Pope (**ſaie you**) beinge but a parte, is greater then the whole Churche. Ergo, **ſaie I, it muſt nedes folow, that the parte is greater, then the whole. Neither was it my** ſcoffing heade, **as it pleaſeth you to ſay, that framed this reaſon. Your owne Doctoure** Gerſon **the Directoure of the** Councel of Conſtance, **ſawe it, and vttered it aboue a hundred and fiftie yéres agoe: Yet was he not therefore thought to be a** Scoffer. **Theſe be his woordes:** Quærere, vtrum Papalis authoritas ſit maior, quàm Eccleſia, redit in idem, acſi quæreretur, vtrum totum ſit maius ſua parte: *To demaunde, whether the Authoritie of the* Pope *be greater, then the Authoritie of the Churche, is as muche, as if a man woulde demaunde, whether the whole be greater, then the parte.* **You ſée, M. Hardinge, theſe be** Gerſons **woordes, and not mine. Therefore ye might with more ſobrietie haue ſpared your ſcoffinge, at ſcoffinge heades.**

Io. Gerſo. de de poteſtate Eccleſiaſtic. Conſid. 7.

The Pope aboue Generall Councelles.

Somme of your frendes haue saide, Si totus mundus sententiaret in aliquo negotio contra Papam, videtur quod standum esset Sententiæ Papæ: *If the whole worlde shoulde geeue sentence in any mater against the* Pope, *it semeth, wee ought rather to stande to the* Popes *iudgement, than to the Iudgement of all the worlde.* Albertus Pigghius **saithe,** Certius est iudicium Papæ, quàm iudicium Generalis Concilij, aut Totius Orbis terrarum: *The Iudgement of the* Pope *is more certaine, then is the Iudgemente of a* Generall Councel, *or elſe of all the whole Worlde.* **An other saithe,** Papa virtualiter est tota Ecclesia: *The* pope *by power is the whole vniuersall Churche.* **An other saith,** Potestas solius papæ excedit potestatem residuæ Ecclesiæ. *The* popes *onely power exceedeth the power of al the* Churche *beside.* **An other saithe,** Papa non potest subijcere se Concilio Generali: *The* pope *can not submit himselfe to a* Generall Councel. **Upon theise woꝛthy Fundations, ye haue buylt vp the** popes Infinite, and Vniuersal powver: **And therfoꝛe ye saie,** Sir Defender would seeme, to graunt you of free gifte, that he muste nedes graunt perforce, whether he will or no.

9. quæſt. Nota. In Gloſſ. Alle. Pighius. Hoſtra. 6. ca. 13.

Herueus de potest. Papæ. His præmiss. Peter. de Palude, de potestat. pap. Ar. 4. Extra. de Iudæis. Cũ venissẽt. Ioan. Andr. Berna. Citatur à Pico Mirand. In qua. An papa sit supra Concil. Picus Miran. eod. loco. Con. Ferrar. Sessio. 10. Conci. Basil. Inter Epist. Synodales.

All this notwithstanding, M. Hardinge, others of your moꝛe indifferent Doctours, woulde haue tolde you an other tale. S. Bernarde **saithe,** Quæ maior superbia esse potest, quam vt Vnus homo toti Congregationi iudicium suum præferat, tanquam solus habeat Spiritum sanctum? *What greater pride can there be, then that One man shoulde esteeme his owne iudgement more, then the iudgement of al the Churche, as if he onely had the Sprite of God?* **Wheꝛevnto** Picus Mirandula **addeth theſe woꝛdes,** Imò simplici potiùs Rustico, & Infanti, & Aniculæ magis, quàm Pontifici Maximo, & mille Episcopis credendum est, si isti contra Euangelium, illi pro Euangelio faciant: *Naie, wee ought to beleeue a Simple plaine Husbandman, or a Childe, or an Olde Wooman, rather then the* Pope *and a thousande* Bishoppes, *if the* Pope, *and the* Bishoppes *speake against the* Gospel, *and the others speake with the* Gospel.

In eadẽ appendice. Et primo.

The Bishoppes **in the** Councel of Ferraria **saie thus,** Quacunque facultate Romana Ecclesia prædita sit, Vniuersali tamen Ecclesiæ, quam Generalis Synodus, præ se fert, inferior est: *With what so euer power the* Churche of Rome *be endewed, yet is it inferiour to the* Vniuersal Churche, *that is represented by the* General Councel. **But peꝛhaps yee wil saie, This was a Councel of Rebelles, and Schismatiques: foꝛ that the Bishops assembled there, were not so appliable vnto the** Pope.

In eadẽ appẽdice Cõcil. Basil. Sacrosanctæ Generali.

The Bishops **in the** Coũcel of Basile **saie thus,** Etsi papa sit Caput Ministeriale Ecclesiæ, nõ tamen est maior tota Ecclesia. Alioqui errante pontifice, quod sæpè contingit, & contingere potest, tota erraret Ecclesia: *Although the* pope *be the Myniſterial head of the* Churche, *yet is he not greater, then al the* Churche. *Otherwiſe, When ſo euer the* pope *erreth, Which thing hapneth oftentimes, and may wel happen, the whole* Church *ſhould lykewiſe erre.*

In eadẽ appendice. Eod. capite.

Againe thei saie, Nonnulli os suum ponentes in Cœlum, Potestatem Romani Pontificis supra potestatem Sacrorum Generalium Conciliorum, contra Iuris Diuini, & Humani Veritatem, à Sanctis Patribus aliàs declaratam, exaltare nituntur: *Many menne ſetting their face againſt the Heauen, goe about to exalt the power of the Biſhop of* Rome *aboue the Power of* Holy General Councelles, *contrarie to the Truth of the Lawe, bothe of God, and Man, declared vnto vs by the holy Fathers.*

In eadẽ appẽdice. Eod. capite.

Againe they saie, Ecclesia Romana non est Vniuersa, sed est de Vniuersitate Corporis Mystici, id est Ecclesiæ: Et sic **est** Membrum dicti Corporis Mystici, vt patet per Beatum Gregorium. Igitur ex quo est membrum dicti Corporis, non est, nec esse potest Caput illius: Cum differentia sit inter caput, & Membra: *The* Churche of Rome *is not* Vniuersal, *but a parte of the Vniuerſal Myſtical Body of Chriſte, whiche is the Churche: and ſo is it a Member of Chriſtes ſaide Body Myſtical, as it appeareth by* S. Gregorie. *Therefore, for as muche as it is a Member of the ſaide Body, it is not, neither can it be the Heade of the ſame Body. For there is a difference betweene the Head, and the Body.*

The Pope is not pastoure of the Vniuersall Churche.

Lykewise againe they saie, Allegant, papam impunè posse tollere Constitutionem Concilij Generalis contra prohibitionem ipsius Concilij Generalis: supponentes, papam esse pastorem Vniuersalis Ecclesiæ. Sed ipsorum suppositum est falsum: & consequenter ipsorum assertio super eo fundata est falsa: *They saie, The* pope *maie safely abolish the* Decree of a General Councel, *notwithstandinge the same* General Councell *haue decreed the contrarie: supposinge that the* Pope *is the Biſhop of the Vniuerſal Churche. But theire ſuppoſall*

The Pope aboue General Councelles.

sal is false: and so consequently false is theire Doctrine, that they haue builte thereupon.

But, leste, you shoulde saie, that al theise Bishoppes, & Fathers in the Councelles of Ferraria, & Basile, **were inflamed with Schismatical Spirites, or possessed with Diuels,** Nicolaus Cusanus, **beinge him selfe a** Cardinal, **and a Childe of the Churche of Rome, hathe by expresse woordes auouched the same. Thus he saithe:** Quia sedentes in ipsa Sede ab hominibus assumuntur, deuiabiles, & peccabiles, & nunc maximè, mundo ad finem tendente, & malitia excrescente, sua potestate ad ædificationem data ad destructionem abutuntur, quis dubitare potest sanæ mentis, Vniuersale Consilium tam in abusum, quam in abutentem potestatem habere &c. Vniuersaliter dici potest, Vniuersale Consilium esse omni respectu tam supra Papam, quam supra Sedem Apostolicam: *For as much as* the Popes, *sittinge in the* Apostolique See of Rome, *be chosen of men, and be subiect, as maie erre, and sinne, and now specially, the worlde drawing towardes an ende, and wickednesse increasing,* abuse their Power to the destruction of the Churche, *that was geuen them for the rearinge vp, and furnishing of the Church, what man, hauing his right wittes, can doubt, but a General Councel hathe Authoritie, as wel ouer the abuse, as also ouer the* Pope *that hath made the abuse: Vniuersally it maie be saide, that the* Vniuersal Councel is in euery respecte as wel aboue the Pope, as also aboue his Apostolique See. **Here is specially to be noted, that** Cardinal Cusanus **saith,** *The* Pope *sittinge in his* Apostolique See, *abuseth his* Vniuersal Power, *and that to the destruction of the Churche.*

Nicol. Cusa. De concord. Li. 2. Ca. 17.

Therefore, M. Hardinge, this parte of your Booke, emonge the reste, woulde more aduisedly haue benne considered. D. Cole **him selfe, notwithstandinge otherwise wel** *D. Cole.*
enclined vnto your faction, yet in this point is wel content to geue you ouer. Thus he saithe of him selfe: I holde herein rather with Gerlõ, that the Councel is aboue the Pope The Pope (yet saie) in one respecte, as he is a Man, in his owne singulare person, maie happen to erre: But in an other respecte, as he is Heade Pastoure, and Chiefe Bishop, and is placed in Peters Chaire, he cannot erre.

And thus, as the Heathens, in olde times, imagined theire Centaurus **to be halfe a Man, and halfe a Horse: or theire** Ianus **to haue two faces, the one behinde, and the other before: euen so haue you imagined two** Popes **in one body: the one goinge backewarde, the other forewarde: the one bearinge Light, the other Darckenesse: the one deceiued, the other not deceiued: the One speakinge Truthe, the other Falsehedde: & yet bothe theise** Popes **incorporat togeather in one Person. Geue vs leaue therefore, M. Hardinge, to saie nowe, as the whole** Vniuersitie **of** Parise **saide, not longe sithence, vnto** Pope Leo, A Domino nostro Papa, iam non bene consulto, appellamus: *Wee appeale from our* Lorde the Pope, *beinge, as nowe, not wel aduised.* **Wee appeale from the** Pope, **that hathe erred so shamefully, vnto that** Pope **that cannot erre.**

Appellatio Vniuer. Parisi. à Leone 10. An. 1517.

Certainely, S. Hierome **saithe,** Non est facile, stare in loco Pauli, tenere gradum Petri iam cum Christo regnantium: ne forte veniat Angelus, qui scindat Velum Templi tui, qui Candelabrum tuum de loco moueat: *It is no easy mater, to stande in* Peter, *or* Paules *place now reignge with* Christ: *leste the* Angel *comme, and rent a sunder the vele of thy Temple and thy Candelstike from his place.*

Hie. ad Heliodorũ, De laude vitæ Solitariæ. Part. 2. cap. 3. Diuis. 5.

The place of S. Hierome **to** Euagrius, **is answeared before.**

The Apologie. Cap. 5. Diuision. 2.

Howe then, if the Pope **haue seene none of theise thinges, and haue neuer read, eyther the** Scriptures, **or the Olde** Fathers, **or yet his owne** Councelles? **Howe if he fauour the** Arians, **as once** Pope Liberius **did? Or haue a wicked, and a detestable opinion of the life to comme, and of the immortalitie of the Soule, as** Pope Iohn **had but fewe yeres sithence? Or, to encrease his owne Dignitie, doo nowe corrupte other** Councelles, **as** Pope Zosimus **corrupted the** Councel **holden at** Nice **in tymes paste: and doo saie, that those things were diuised and appointed by the Holye Fathers, whiche neuer once came into their thought: and, to haue the full swaie of Authoritie, doo wreste the** Scriptures, **whiche thinge, as** Carnotensis **saith, is an vsuall custome with the** Popes? **Howe if he haue**

The Pope aboue Generall Councelles.

renounced the Faith of Chriſt, and become an Apoſtata, as Lyranus ſaith, many popes haue benne? Yet, for all this, ſhall the Holy Ghoſt with turning of a hand, knock at his breaſt, and euen whether he wil, or no, yea, and wholy againſt his wil, kindle him a light, ſo as he maie not erre? Shal he ſtreight waie be the Headeſpring of al Right, and ſhal al the treaſures of Wiſedom, and Underſtanding be found in him, as it wer laid vp in ſtore? Or, if theſe thinges be not in him, can he geeue a right, and apte iudgemente of ſo weighty maters? Or, if he be not hable to iudge would he haue, that thoſe maters ſhould be brought beſore him alone?

(a) What then? Should he therfore be aboue Generall Coũceles.

M. Hardinge.

To your howe ifs, and what ifs, I coulde ſoone make an anſweare by the contrary. (a) And Sir, how if the Pope haue ſeene al theſe things, the Scriptures, Fathers, and Councels? What haue ye then to ſaie? Is not your tale then at an ende? Were your mater good, and your ſelfe wiſe, you woulde not ſo commonly vſe that weake kinde of reaſoninge. But to a number of your howe ifs, and what ifs, for the readers ſake, to put away all ſcruple, I geue you this anſweare.

Sadly and ſagely and much to the purpoſe.

Godde's wiſedome (as the Scripture ſaithe) diſpoſeth all things ſweetely, and in one inſtant ſeeſeth the ende, and meanes that be neceſſarie to the ende. If he promiſe any man lyfe euerlaſtinge, withall he geueth him grace alſo to doo good deedes, whereby to obteyne the ſame. Whome he hathe glorified (ſaithe S. Paule) them he hath iuſtified and called. So where as he hath by force of his prayer made to the Father promiſed to Peter, and for the ſafetie of the Churche, (b) to euery Peters ſucceſſoure, that his faithe ſhall not faile, and therefore hath willed him to confirme his brethren, that is, to remoue all doubtes and errours from them: we are aſſured, he will geue him ſuche witte, diligence, learninge, and vnderſtandinge, as this firmneſſe and infallibilitie of Faithe, and confirminge of brethren requireth. Shall wee ſtande in doubte whether that haporeth in thinges ſupernatural, which we ſee to be in things natural, that who geueth the ende, he geueth alſo thinges, that pertcine to the attcinige of the ende? If God woulde promiſe vs aboundance of corne for the nexte yeere to come, what were more fooliſh, then to doubte, and ſaie like to this Defender, howe if, and what if men wil not til the grounde, nor ſowe any ſeede? Doubtleſſe if they ſowe, they ſhal reepe: if they ſowe not, neither ſhal they reepe. But, what? Wee maie gather of the Promiſe of God, that we ſhal haue not onely faire and ſeaſonable weather, whereby the fruites of the earthe maie proue plentiful, but alſo that the husbandmenne ſhal employe their endeuoure, paines, and laboure. For the aboundance of corne ſo promiſed ſhal not be geuen but to ſuche, as till, ſowe, and trauaile. Euen ſo where as Chriſte hath promyſed to the (c) Succeſſours of Peter firmneſſe of Faithe, to the Apoſtles, and their Succeſſours the Spirite of Truthe, and likewiſe to Councelles gathered in his name, wee muſt perſuade our ſelues, that nothing ſhal wante neceſſary for the controuerſies, touchinge Faithe to be decided.

Sapien.

Rom. 8.

Math. 16. Luc. 22.

That you ſaie of Liberius the Pope, is ſtarke falſe. (d) He neuer fauoured the Arians. The moſte ye can find againſt him, is, that he was compelled by the greater perſecution of Conſtantius, the Emperour, to ſubſcribe to the Arians. Neither is that by the Auncient writers of the Eccleſiaſtical ſtories conſtantly affirmed but of the chiefe of them not ſpoken of, where moſt occaſion was, to ſignifie it, if it had ſo beene: of ſomme denied, of ſomme mentioned not as true, but as a falſe rumour bruted abroade of him. By whiche rumour it ſeemeth (e) S. Hierome was deceiued, remayninge in the Eaſte, farre from the places where the Truthe might more certainely be knowen. But were it true, that he ſubſcribed, as Peter denied Chriſte, yet being doone (f) for lacke of Charitie, and not by errour in Faithe, well might that faulte be ſlaunderous to the Churche, but it was not a decree made in fauoure of the Arians, neither to confirme that hereſie.

That you reporte of Pope Iohn the. 22. is likewiſe moſte falſe. The worſt that Marſilius of Padua, and William Ockam Heretikes wrote of him to flatter the Emperor Ludouicus of Bauaria, is, that he had taught openly (g) (which alſo is referred to the time before he was Pope) that the ſoules of the iuſt ſee not God vntil the daie of iudgement. That he hada wicked and a deteſtable opinion of the immortalitie of the ſoule, there was no ſuch his opinió, but it is your falſe ſlander, by which your wicked and deteſtable malice imagined to deface the church, and ſpecially the auctoritie of the holy See Apoſtolik. No ſtorie of any eſtimatiõ mentioneth, that he was of that firſt opinion, after he came to be Pope, much leſſe that he gaue any Definitiue ſentence of any ſuche mater. But contrarywiſe, (h) when as he prepared himſelf to goe to the definition of that queſtion concerning the ſeeing of God, which iuſt ſoules haue before the daie of iudgement, as Benedictus the leuenth *in ſua extranagante* ſaith, he was preuented by deathe, ſo as he might not do it.

Sotem. [illegible] cap. 14. Liber [illegible] illuſtrat. Chronic.

(b) The Pope denieth Chriſt, for lack of charity, but not for lack of Faithe.

(c) S. Hieromes Authoritie refuſed as a man writing raſhly, he knewe not what.

(d) Vntruthe plainly reproued by S. Hierome.

(e) Vntruthe. For Chriſt neuer entred into ſuch couenaũt with Peters Succeſſours.

(f) The Pope denieth Chriſt, for lack of charity, but not for lack of Faithe.

(g) Vntruthe. manyfeſte See the Anſweare.

(h) Vntruth eõtrary to that M. Hardinge ſaid immediatly before. For he held this Error in the time of his Popedõ.

You belye Zoſimus: (i) he corrupted not the Councell of Nice: But ſignified to the Biſhoppes of Aphrike aſſembled in Councell at Carthage, the Truthe concernynge the Canons of the Nicene Councell. The ſame maye bee proued by Iulius the firſte, by the Epiſtle of (k) Athanaſius, and other Biſhoppes of Egypte, Thebais, and Libya, written to Marcus the Pope of the originall of the. 72. Canons of the Nicene Councell, that remayned in ſafe cuſtodie in the Church of Rome, ſubſcribed with the handes of the Fathers, that at the ſame Councel were preſent. And what credit was to be geuen to the cõtrary informatiõ of onely

(i) Vntruthe. manifeſte. repreued the Councell of Aphrike. (k) The very vntruthe. childiſh [illegible] geniꝰ.

of onely twenty Canons, that was retourned from the Bishops of Constantinople and Alexandria (l) when Heretikes before had burned the Bookes, where the whole number was conteined, and left but those twentie, that al Bokes nowe commonly haue?

If we shoulde alleage Camotensis and Lyra, you woulde cal them the blacke garde, and set litle by them. First shewe vs where they haue that you alleage out of them. M. Iuel alegeth that of Camotensis in an other place. But where it is, he kepeth it to him selfe, and of him selfe it is likely it proceeded. For his dealinge is suche, as any falle practise in respecte of him, maie seeme credible. Albeit what woorshipfull Doctour ye meane by Camotensis (m) I knowe not: Peraduenture ye meane Camotensis, otherwise called Iuo I haue cause to geale, that so it shoulde be. And yet foure Bookes of sundry Printes bothe Englishe and Latine so haue. If there be any suche, as I suppose there is not, he is very obscure, nor worth the naminge.

V Whether the Pope may erre or no.

(m) If ye know him not, then maie you beste blame your Ignorance.

The Bishop of Sarisburie

Here ye saie, And Sir, Howe if the Pope haue seene al these things the Scriptures, the Fathers, the Councelles? What haue you then to saie? Is not your tale then at an ende? **No verily, M. Hardinge. I woulde further desire God to geue him grace, to vse them wel, and to his Glorie. Notwithstandinge your owne Doctors wil sone put al these your** whattes and whatis, **out of question. For, concerninge the** Popes **great, and high Learning,** Alphonsus de Castro **saith, as he hath benne alleged before,** Cõstat, plures papas adeò illiteratos fuisse, vt Grãmaticã penitùs ignorarent: *It is certainely knowen, that sundrie* popes *haue benne so vnskilful in learninge, that they neuer vnderstoode their* Grammare. *Alphons. contra Haref. li. 1. ca 4.*

And this he speaketh, not of one Pope **onely, but of sundrie.** But (**you saie**) Christe hath praied for Peter, and made sure promise, that his Faith shoulde neuer faile. **Therefore the** pope **is wise: the** pope **is learned: the** pope **is Catholique: the** pope **can not erre. Al this, and a great deale more, the** pope **maie claime onely by** Vertue of Christes Praier. **Nowe therefore, if the** pope **shoulde erre, or be in** Heresie, **he might sue** Christe **in an Action of couenaunt, and require him to performe his Promise. So saithe the Prophete** Micheas, Sacerdotes in mercede docebant, & prophetæ in pecunia diuinabant: & super Dominum requiescebant, dicentes, Nónne est Dominus in medio nostrum? *The* Priestes *taught the people for hiere: and the* prophetes *Prophesied for monie: and yet thei rested them selues vpon* Gods Promise, *saienge,* And is not the Lorde in the middes emongest vs? **So the** Valentinian Heretiques **said sommetime of them selues,** Nos salutem de Priuilegio status possidemus: *Wee haue our safetie by the Priuilege of our state.* **We cannot miscarrie: we cannot erre. But the** prophete **saithe,** *Euery* man *is a lier: Accursed be he, that trusteth in Man.* **Your owne Doctour** Alphonsus **saithe,** Omnis homo errare potest in Fide, etiamsi papa sit: *Euery man maie erre in* Faithe: *yea, although he be the* Pope.

Micha. 4. Tertul. Aduersus Valentinian. Psalme. 118. Hierem. 17.

Now be it, that your Unlearned Reader maie the better consider, how safely he maie geue credite to your bare worde, whether the Pope maie be deceiued in Faithe or no, **it maie easily appeare by these fewe Examples. Who so listeth to seeke, maie find moe.** Pope Marcellinus **offred vp incense, & m. de Sacrifice vnto Diuelles.** Tertullian **saithe,** Episcopum Romanum agnoscentem iam Prophetias Montani, Priscæ, Maximillæ, &c. *The* Bishop of Rome, *wel liking now the* prophesies (or Heresies) of Montanus, Prisca, and Maximilla &c. **Upon whiche words** Beatus Rhenanus **noteth thus,** Episcopus Romanus Montanizat: *The* Bishop of Rome *fauoureth the Heresie of* Montanus. Pope Liberius vvas an Arian Heretique: **as hereafter it shal better appeare.** Pope Honorius **was condemned for an Heretique in two** General Councelles. **In the** Councell of Constantinople **the wordes of his condemnation be alleged thus:** Anathematizari curauimus Honorium, qui fuerat Papa Antiquæ Romæ: quia in omnibus mentem Sergij sequutus est, & impia dogmata confirmauit: *Wee haue caused* Honorius, *the late* pope of olde Rome, *to be accursed: for that in al thinges he followed the minde of* Sergius the Heretique, *and confirmed his wicked Doctrine.* Alphonsus de Castro **saithe,** Anastasium papam fuisse Nestorianis, qui Historias legerit, non dubitat: *Who so euer hath readde the storie, or course of time, cannot doubte, but* Pope Anastasius *fauoured the* Nestorian Heretiques. **In the very** Legende **of** Hilarius **it is mentioned, that** Pope Leo **was an** Arian Heretique. **In a** Sinode holden at Rome **againste** Pope Hildebrande, **it is written thus,** Incendio tradidimus Decreta eorum Heretica: *Wee haue burnte theire* Heretical Decrees. Pope Sylvester. 2. **was made** Pope **by** Necromancie, **and in recompense thereof, promised him selfe bothe Body, and Soule vnto the** Diuel.

Cõci. Tom. 1. Tertull. Cõtra Proxeã. Beat. Rhena. Hier. in prafatione de viris illustribus. Concil. Nicen. 2. Actis. 7 Con. Cõstan. 6. Actis. 13. Alphons. li. 1. Ca. 4. In Legẽda Hilarij. Synod. Romana in Fasciculo rerum sciendarum impresso Colonia. 1553. Ioãnes Stella Venetus.

Hulderi-

VVhether the Pope may erre or no.

Huldericus the Bishop of Augusta in Germanie, erpresseth the Restraint of priesles Mariage by theise wordes, Periculosum huius Hæresis Decretum: *The dangerous Decree of this Heresie.* Epist. H. decret. ad Nicol. Papam. Eras. Annot. in Epist. Gal. in fine lib. 1.

Notwithstandinge, I haue seene the same Epistle vnto P. Nicolas, togeather with an other Epistle to like pourpose, written in olde Veleme of very ancient Recorde, vnder the name of Volusianus the Bishop of Carthage. But, what nede we to touche al the particulares? The Doctours of the Greate Schole of Sorbona in Parise, haue determined in theire Articles, that S. Peter himselfe erred in the Faithe. The Councel of Basile condemneth pope Eugenius by these wordes: Eugenium contemptorem Sacrorum Canonum: pacis, & Veritatis Ecclesiæ Dei perturbatorem notorium: Vniuersalis Ecclesiæ Scandalizatorem: Simoniacum: periurum: Incorrigibilem: Schismaticum à Fide Deuium: pertinacem Hæreticum. &c. *We condemne, and depose* Pope Eugenius *a despiser of the Holy Canons, a disturber of the Peace, and Vnite of the Churche of God: a notorious offendour of the whole Vniuersal Churche: a Simonist: a Forsworne man: a man Vncorrigible: a Schismatique: a man* fallen from the faith, *and a wilful* Heretique. Of pope Iohns Heresie, touching the immortalitie of the soule, we shall speake more hereafter. S. Hierome saith, Qui Scripturam intelligit aliter, quam Sensus Spiritus Sancti flagitat, quo scripta est, licet ab Ecclesia non recesserit, tamen Hæreticus appellari potest: *Who so euer otherwise vnderstandeth the* Scriptures, *then the sense of the Holy Ghoste requireth, by whom they were written,* (as it is moste certaine, the Pope in infinite places both hath donne, and doth,) *although he be not departed from the* Churche, *yet he maie well be called an Heretique.*

Conci. Basil. Sessione. 34.

24. Qu. 3. Hæresis. In Con. Constan. in Appendice. c. In primis. Quī imò idem Iohā. Pap. 22. dixit, et pertinaciter credidit, animā hominis cum corpore humano mori, & extingui, ad instar animalium brutorum. Conci. Basil. inter Epistol. Synodales. Viselius. 24. Q. 1. A. recta. In Glossa. Ioan. de Parisijs de potestat. Regia et Pap. cap. 18. Gerson. An liceat appellare à Papa. Hostiē. de cō cessione præbendæ. Proposit. Extra. de electione. Significasti. Abb. Æneas Syluius. De Cō cil. Basilien. Lib. i.

Nowe, if Idolaters, Montanistes, Arians, Monothelites, Nestorians, Deniers of the Immortalitie, Simonistes, Sorcerers, Mainteiners of Filthinesse, and other obstinate and wilful Heretiques maie erre, then, what soeuer M. Hardinge, and his Felowes, shall saie to the contrarie, it is easily seene, that the pope maie erre.

Verily, the Councell of Basile saithe thus, Multi ex summis pontificibus in Hæreses, & Errores lapsi esse dicuntur, & leguntur: Certum est, Papam Errare posse: Concilium sæpè Condemnauit, atque deposuit Papam, tam ratione Fidei, quam Morum: *It is reported, and readde, that many* Popes *haue fallen into* Erroures, and Heresies: It is certaine, that the Pope maie Erre: *The* Councell *hathe oftentimes Condemned, and remoued the* Pope, *in respecte, as wel of his heresie in* Faithe, *as of his lewdnesse in lyfe.* Viselius saithe, Summorum Pontificum quidam pestilenter errauerunt: *Certaine of the* Bishoppes of Rome *haue bene in* pestilente Heresies. Your owne glose saithe: Certum est, quòd Papa errare potest: *It is certaine, that the* pope *maie erre.* An other of your Doctours saithe, Interdum possit aliquis esse, qui esset à Sede remouendus: vt si esset Fœmina, vel Hæreticus: sicut fuerunt aliqui: & ob hoc non numerantur in Catalogo Paparum: *The* Pope *maie sometimes be suche a one, as maie seeme woorthy to be remoued: as if he were a* VVooman, *or an* Heretique. *And certaine suche there haue benne: and therefore they be not reckened in the Calendar of the* popes. An other saithe, Aliqui papæ inuenti sunt flagitiosi, & Hæretici: *Somme* popes *haue benne founde wicked men, and* Heretiques. An other saithe, Et Papa, & Episcopi sunt deuiabiles à Fide: *Bothe* Popes *and* Bishoppes *maie wander from the Faith.* An other saithe, Papa mandans, aliquid fieri, quod sonet in Heresim, turbat statum Ecclesiæ, & non est ei parendum: *The* Pope *commaundinge any thinge to be donne, that soundeth of* Heresie, *troubleth the state of the* Churche, *and we maie not obeie him.* An other saithe, Papa potest esse Hæreticus, & de Hæresi iudicari: *The* pope *maie be an* Heretique, *and of* Heresie *maie be iudged.*

All these were the popes vndoubted frendes. But nowe let vs heare the pope himselfe Pope Pius. 2. otherwise called Æneas Syluius, saithe thus, Quid si criminosus papa contraria Fidei prædicet, Hereticisque Dogmatibus imbuat Subditos? *What if a notorious* vvicked pope teach things contrarie to the Faith, *and with* Hereticall Doctrine *peruerte his Subiectes?* He coulde neuer haue moued this question, if he had thoughte it a mater impossible, that euer the pope shoulde be an Heretique.

I woulde not stand so longe in so cleare a case, were it not, that M. Hardinge, al this notwithstanding, telleth vs so sadly, and biddeth vs beleue it vpon his warrant, that the Pope vndoubtedly can neuer erre. Stanislaus Hosius, the greatest stickler of that side, blusheth

VVhether the Pope may erre or no.

Alph. Contra Hæresi. li. 1. cap. 4.

blusheth not to saie thus, Numerentur omnes &c. *Recken al the* Popes, *that euer wer, from* Peter, *vntil this* Iulius, *that now is. There neuer sate in this Chaire any* Arian, *any* Donatiste, *any* Pelagian, *or any other, that professed any maner* Heresie. Yet neuertheles, your owne Doctoure Alphonsus saithe, Non credo, aliquem esse adeò Impudentem Papæ Assentatorem, vt ei tribuere hoc velit, vt nec Errare, nec in Interpretatione Sacrarum Literarum hallucinari possit: *I beleue, there is no so* shameles *a Flatterer of the Pope, that wil graunt him this Prerogatiue, that he can neuer erre, nor be deceiued in the expounding of the* Scriptures. Here, M. Hardinge, your owne principal Doctour Alphonsus calleth al them, that maintein your Doctrine, and saie, as you saie, The shameles Flatterers of the Pope. Certainely, I thinke, it maie safely be saide: If a man wil take the view of al Christendome, he shal not finde so many Heretiques in any one See, what so euer, as may be found in the See of Rome. And, for that cause perhaps, Franciscus Petrarcha calleth Rome, Asylum Hæresum, & Errorum, The Sanctuarie of Errours, and Heresies: And in his Italian Sonets, he calleth it, The Schoole of Errour, and the Temple of Heresie.

Franc. Pet. Epist. 10. Schola di errore, & Tẽpio di Eresia.

As for Nicolaus Lyra, ye doubte of our dealinge, for that the Printer hathe not quoted the place. It maie please you therefore to peruse his Notes vpon the sixtienth Chapter of S. Mathevve. There emong others ye shal finde these wordes: Ex hoc patet, quod Ecclesia non consistit in hominibus, ratione Potestatis, vel Dignitatis Ecclesiasticæ, vel Secularis: Quia multi Principes, & Summi Pontifices inuenti sunt apostatasse à Fide: *Hereby it appeareth, that the* Churche *standeth not vpon menne, in consideration either of theire Power, or of their Dignitie, either Ecclesiastical, or Temporal. For many Princes, and* Popes haue benne founde to haue straied from the Faithe. Therefore Baldus saithe, Cautela est, quòd quis dicat. Credo, quod credit Sancta Mater Ecclesia: non, quod credit Papa: *It is to be marked, that a man maie saie, I beleue, that the Church beleueth: but he maie not saie,* I beleue, that the Pope beleueth. His meaning is, that the Pope maie be deceiued, and beleue amisse. Ye saie, Christe praied for Peter, Ergo, the Pope cannot erre. But where was Christes Praier then, when so many Heretiques were Popes in Rome? Will ye saie, that Christe praied for Arians, for Nestorians, for Montanistes, for Monothelites, for Simonistes, for Idolaters, for Necromancers, for Poisoners, for Murtherers, and for Dame Iohane too? Or, that by the vertue of Christes Praier, none of these could euer Erre? Or, that the Popes Errours muste goe for Truthe, or his Heresies be holden as Right Religion, onely bicause, you telle vs, that, what so euer he saie, He can not Erre? O M. Hardinge, I shewed you before, that Christ Praied not onely for Peter, but also for al the rest of his Disciples. Origen saithe, as he is before alleged, Num audebimus dicere, quòd aduersus vnum Petrum non prævalituræ sint Portæ Interorum: aduersus cæteros Apostolos prævalituræ sint? *Shall wee dare to saie, that the Gates of Helle shal not prevaile against* Onely Peter? *and that the same Gates shal prevaile againste al other the Apostles?* S. Cyprian saithe, Rogabat pro delictis nostris, sicut ipse declarat, cùm dicit ad Petrum: Ego Rogaui pro te, ne deficiat Fides tua: *Christe praied* (not for Peter onely, but) *for our sinnes, as hee him selfe declareth, saieinge vnto* Peter, *I haue praied for thee, that thy Faithe shoulde not faile.* S. Augustine, expounding the same wordes, saithe thus: Ego rogaui Patrem pro vobis, ne deficiat Fides vestra: *I haue praied* (not onely for Peter, but also) *for you, that your Faithe shoulde not faile.* Chrysostome saithe, Omnis Christianus, qui suscipit Verbum Petri, Thronus sit Petri: & Petrus sedet in eo: *Euery Christian man, that receiueth the woorde of* Peter, *is made* Peters Chaire: *and* Peter *him selfe sitteth in him.*

Origen in Matth. Tractat. Cyp. in Orationem Dominicam. August. De verbis Dom. secund. Luc. Sermo. 36. Chrys. in Matth. Hom. 33 Ambros. de Pœniten. Li. 1. Ca. 6. Hier. in Sophonian. ca. 1

Other wise, M. Hardinge, they are not al Peters, that sitte in place of Peter, S. Ambrose saith, Non Habent Hæreditatem Petri, qui Fidem Petri non habent: *They haue not* Peters *Enheritance, that haue not the* Faithe *of* Peter.

S. Hierome saithe, Auferet Dominus nomina vanæ gloriæ, & admirationis falsæ, quæ versantur in Ecclesia: *God wil take awaie these names of vaine Glorie, and false ostentation, that are vsed in the* Churche. Where wee saie, Pope Liberius fauoured the Arians, that (yee saie) is starke false. And yet, ye knowe, S. Hierome is the reporter of that falsehed. But S. Hierome (yee saie) vvas deceiued. In sutche Reuerence, and Regarde ye haue the Doctoures, and Learned Fathers of the Churche. Yee beleue them no further then ye liste. I doubte not, but S. Hierome might better saie, Maister Hardinge is deceiued.

Pope Liberius.

If

If S. Hieromes authoritie ſuffice you not, you may take alſo the authoritie of S. Auguſtin. For S. Auguſtine ſaith, as he is alleged by Cardinal Cuſanus that Pope Liberius gaue his hande, and conſent vnto the Arians. Certainely, Alphonſus, your owne Doctour, ſaithe, De Liberio Papa, Conſtat fuiſſe Arianum: *Touchinge* Pope Liberius, *it is wel knowen, he was an* Arian. Platina ſaithe, Liberius, vt quidam volunt, in rebus omnibus ſenſit cum Hæreticis: Pope Liberius, *as ſomme ſaie, was in al points of one iudgemente with the* (Arian) Heretiques.

Hier. de Ec. Scriptorib. In Fortunatianō.

Nico. Cuſa. De Concordan. li. 2. ca. 5

Alphonſ. Contra Hareſi. li. 1. ca. 4.

Platy. in Liberio Antonin. par. 2. Tit. 10. ca. 4. §. 5.

Antoninus, the Archbishop of Florence, ſaithe, Liberius Papa conſenſit præceptis Auguſti, (Ariani) vt vnà cum Hæreticis communicaret: Pope Liberius *ſo conſented to the Commaundementes of the* Arian Emperoure, *that he Communicated with the* Heretiques. So ſaithe Iouerius in the Abridgement of Councels: So ſaithe Hermannus Gigas: So ſaithe your very Legende, commonly called Hiſtoria Longobardica. Emonge others, Eraſmus ſaithe, Ariana Hereſis, & Romanum Pontificem inuoluit, & ipſos Imperatores: *The* Arians Hereſie *entangled, and wrapte bothe* Pope, *and* Emperoure. By the Pope namely he meanethe Pope Liberius.

Iouerius. Her. Gigas. Hiſtoria Lō gobardica.

Cardinal Cuſanus ſaithe, Liberius, & Honorius, & alij in Cathedra Petri aliquandiu ſedentes, in errorem Schiſmaticum ſeducti ceciderunt: Pope Liberius, *and* Honorius, *and others ſitting in* Peters Chaire, *haue fallen into Schiſmatical errour, and haue benne deceiued.*

Yet you doubte not to ſaie, S. Hierome was shamefully deceiued, and wrote of ignorance, he knew not what, and a is falſe.

Eraſm. in annotation. in Hieron.

Likewyſe yée ſaie, That wee reporte of Pope Iohn is moſte falſe and impudent. Our reporte is, *That* Pope Iohn *denied the immortalitie of the Soule:* not thoroughly, and altogether, but onely in that he ſaide, Vntil the time of the Laſte Iudgemente, the Soule liethe ſtil, as in a traunſe, as doth the Body, vvithout ſenſe of ioie, or paine. Wherein he, not onely withſtoode the Expreſſe VVoord of God, but alſo vnwares quite ouerthrew his owne whole Kingedome of Purgatorie, whiche is the greateſt and faireſt of all his three Crownes.

Contra Luciferian. Nico. Cuſan de Concordan. li. 1. c. 14

For what auaile his Pardonns, and Trentalles, if the Soule lie ſtil aſleepe vntil the daie of Iudgement, and feele no paine? Verily, after the laſte Iudgement, by common conſente, there ſhalbe, nor Purgatorie, nor Trentalle, nor Maſſe, nor Pope, nor Pardonne.

Pope Iohn.

Nowe, if there be no place of Purgatorie, neither before, nor after the laſt Iudgement, then maie wée wel conclude, that abſolutely, and without doubte, there is no Purgatorie. The firſte Authours of this errour, as S. Auguſtine ſaithe, were the Heretiques called Arabici.

Auguſt. ad Quoduultdeum.

Touchinge Pope Iohns errour, Gerſon ſaithe thus, Iohannes Papa. 22. decreuit, &c. Pope Iohn. 22. *decreed, that the Soules of the wicked ſhoulde not be pouniſhed, before the daie of the laſte Iudgemente: whiche errour the* Vniuerſitie *of* Pariſe *condemned for Hereſie, and cauſed the* Pope *to recante.* One of your owne Companions of Louaine ſaithe, Pope Iohn kepte this errour ſecretely to him ſelfe, and neuer had the open conſente of the Churche of Rome. And for better excuſe hereof he ſaithe, Petrus, non Fidem Chriſti, ſed Chriſtum, ſalua Fide, negauit: Peter *denied not the Faithe of* Chriſte, *but, his Faithe ſaued, he denied nomore but onely* Chriſte. And ſo by this prety ſhift of your Louanian Diuinitie, ye haue bothe Chriſte without Faithe, and alſo Faithe without Chriſte. Thus M. Hardinge, it is plaine by your owne Doctours and Felowes, that oure reporte of Pope Iohn, is neyther a falſe Sclaunder, as you ſaie, nor procedethe of deteſtable, and vvicked malice.

Gerſon. Ser. 1. in Feſto Paſchali. Copus Dial. 1. Pag. 50.

Pag. 51.

M. Har. f. 64. a

Addition. M. Hardinge. ¶ What ſhal I ſaie, but all is falſe? It is a fowle thing, M. Iewel, and a wicked impudencie, thus to beelie the Doctoures. Certaine it is, Gerſon neuer ſadie it, not in *Sermone Paſchali*, as you reporte, nor any where els, that this Pope Iohn made any ſuche decree. Neither was his errour, as you vntruely burthen him. &c. That yee write, touching this Pope, either proceedeth of Malice, or of Ignorance. &c. The errour of Pope Iohn. 22. was not, that the ſoules of the wicked be not pouniſhed before the day of the laſte iudgement, but that the ſoules of the good ſee not the face of God before the laſte daie. His poſition was conceiued with theiſe termes, as wee finde it in Adrianus that learned Pope, and in the Extrauagante of Pope Benedictus Vndecimus who ſucceded him nexte: *Animæ purgatæ ante finale Iudicium non habent Stolam, quæ eſt clara, & faciali viſio Dei.*

Addition. ¶ 1. 2. 3.

Of this queſtion ſome Doctours thē held the Affirmatiue, ſome the Negatiue. Amongſt them that held the Negatiue, this pope Iohn. 22. was one before he was Pope, and perhaps alſo afterwarde, But he helde it onely

M. Har. f. 65. a. M. Har. f. 65. b. 3. 4.

Monkes, Nunnes, Frieers.

onely as his priuate opinion.

Nowe this was an errour in Pope Iohn: I denie not: Yet for the same is not he to be compted an Heretike: as neither S. Irenæus, Theophylactus, and S. Bernarde are, who seme to haue benne of the same opinion. Gerson saithe, *Propter, quod apparet Falsitas Doctrinæ Papæ Johannis. 22. qua damnatus fuit cum sono Buccinarum, vel Tuberum coram Rege Philippo Anunculato tuo per Theologos Parisienses.* Remember, good Reader, this errour of Pope Iohn. 22. was not condemned by the Diuines of Parise, when he was Pope, but before, when he was a priuate Doctour, and Liued in the Realme of France &c. And so by this Purgatorie is not taken away at al, as your scoffinge tale, that liketh you so wel, pretendeth it to be. Neither were the heretikes, that of S. Augustine are called *Arabici*, the firste Authours of this errour, as you saie, but the Armenians, and Grecians, if we maie beleue Guido. Now touching that you haue alleged out of the Counsel of Constance, I maruel with what face you bring it in. And what a great falsehed is it to put in your Booke the name of Pope Iohn. 22. for Pope Iohn. 23. The name of this Iohn. 23. was before he toke vpon him to be Pope, Balthazar de Cassa, as there ye haue it declared &c. Nether was he a true Pope, Lawfully elected, but an Vsurper, as two others were with him at the same time. So by this place ye haue proued no Heresie against Pope Iohn. 22. nor against any true Pope at al, but onely haue shewed your selfe a shamelesse shifter, and one that hathe a more malicious minde to hurte the Authoritie of the Pope, then mater of iuste accusation against him.

Fol. 66. b.

Fol. 66. a.

67. a.

The Answeare. **Al this is true, no doubtes. For. M. Hardinges sawes must goe for Gospel. First, Good Reader, I wil tel the, what man this Pope Iohn was: and then make answeare to euery peece hereof in order. The nexte Pope before him was Clemens the fifth, that caused Franciscus Dandalus the Embassador of Venice to come before him tied in an iron chaine, and to wallow vnder his Table as a Dogge, while his Holinesse sats at supper. Otherwise the indignation, he had conceiued against the Venetians, could neuer be swaged. The fourth Pope after him was Vrbanus the fourthe, that toke fiue of his Cardinals vpon displeasure, and tied them vp in Sackes, and threwe them out into the Sea. As for this Pope Iohn him selfe, He turned Bishoprikes into Abbies, and Abbies into Bishoprikes, Bishoprikes into Archebishoprikes, and Archbishoprikes into Bishoprikes: One Bishoprike into twoo, and twoo into one: Cities into Townes, and Townes into Citties: And thus was euermore altering, and neuer contented.** Pope Clemens **his Predecessour beinge deade, the Cardinalles, after they had longe contended emong them selues aboute the Election of a Pope, and could not agree, they committed the whole mater in truste vnto this Iohn, being then also him selfe a Cardinal, that he should chuse, whom he beste liked, and ende the strife, nothinge doubting, but he would haue chosen one of the same Cardinalles, that they had named. But he, hauinge the whole power in his owne hande, like a man of trust, foregate al others, and chose him selfe, and so was Pope by his owne election. Beinge Pope he excommunicated Lodouicus the Emperour, for that he had attempted to execute some parte of his Emperial office without his Licence. By meane wherof, he enflamed al Christendome with suche discorde, and hatred, and deadly Warres, as could not afterward be quenched in thirtie yeeres. He said, he had power to raise vp Emperours and to Depose them at his pleasure: and that, when so euer the Empiere is voide, the Pope is Emperoure: and that there is no power aboue the Pope.**

Sabell. Exm. ad. 9. Lib. 7.

Sabell. Enne. ad. 9. Li. 9.

Naucl. Genera. 44.

Naucl. Genera. 44.

Naucleru.

Carion. pro sua voluntate. Paralipon. Vrspergen.

And, whereas certaine Preachers, Loathinge the intollerable Ambition, and Lordelinesse of the Cleregie, that then was, had tolde the people openly in theire Sermons, that Christ and his Apostles, were simple, and poore, and possessoures of nothing, He caused them to be taken, and condemned, and burnte as Heretiques: Which thinge, saithe one, he did, the better to iustifie his owne greedinesse. For at the time of his death he leaste in his Treasurie fiue & twentie thowsand thowsand Crownes in ready Gold: which thinge was ꝑ more to be wondred at, for ꝑ not longe before the same Pope Iohn had ioined in warre with Robert the King of Apulia, in defense of the state of Genua: in which warre, as Antoninus Florentinus saithe, suche abundance of Golde, and treasure was spente on bothe sides, as might haue bought a good Kingedome. Suche a one, M. Hardinge, was Pope Iohn: whoes Doctrine you may not in any wise suffer to be stained. And therefore, touchinge the mater it selfe, you haue minced it prettily. It was no Heresie, you saie, but onely an Errour. And why so? I trowe, bicause this Iohn was no inferioure Bishop nor Priuate man, but a Bishop of Bishoppes and a Pope. For in

Anſel. Rid. Millies viginti quinque millia. Anto. Par. 3 Ti. 21. ca. 4.

M. Har. 65. b.

Pope Iohn. 22

any other poꝛe man it had benne an Hereſie. The Arabians and Armenians many hundꝛed yæres beſoꝛe were Condemned, and Holden as Heretiques foꝛ the ſame. So bleſſed a thinge is it to be a Pope.

Angu. ad Quodvultdeum.

But if this Errour were no Hereſie in Pope Iohn, then a great many, that ſo charged him, did him greate wꝛonge, and were mutche to blame. Antoninus ſaith, Iohannes, 22. Sermonem faciens in publico Conſiſtorio, dixit quædam Hæreſim ſapientia: Pope Iohn, *ſpeakinge openly in the Conſiſtorie, vttered certaine woordes ſauouringe of Hereſie.* And therefoꝛe, he ſaithe, that of many he was iudged an Heretique. Chriſtianus Maſſæus ſaithe, Iohannes Papa. 22. miſit Pariſios duos, qui hanc Hæreſim prædicarent: Pope Iohn *ſente two Preachers to* Pariſe, *to ſette foꝛthe this Hereſie.* Nauclerus ſaithe, Imò Iohannem Papam. 22. magni, & multi Theologi, ſcientia, & vita probati dogmatizabant eſſe Hæreticum: *Nay, many greate, and famous Doctoures of Diuinitie, notable, as wel foꝛ their Learninge, as foꝛ their Life, publiſhed* Pope Iohn *to be an Heretique.* So many Hiſtoꝛiographers, and ſo many, and ſo notable Doctours of Diuinitie, maie be witneſſes ſufficiente to pꝛoue one Heretique, if he were not a Pope.

Antonin. par. 3. ti. 21. ca. 6. § 13.

Aſſerebat ex eo, ipſum eſſe Hæreticum.

Maſſa. li. 18 an. 1332.

Nauel. Genera. 45.

M. Har. 64. b.

Gerſon ſaithe not, Iohannes Papa decreuit: Pope Iohn *decreed.* This (you ſaie) is a fowle thinge, and a wicked impudencie. *The Anſweare.* It is no manly part, M. Harding, to ſtriue, and wꝛangle aboute woꝛdes, when the mater is plaine. If Gerſon ſaide not, Pope Iohn *decreed theeſe thinges*, yet he ſaid, Pope Iohn *Publiſhed, and taught theſe things.* And a man would thinke, that Teachinge, and Publiſhinge were not mutche leſſe, then Decreeinge. Gerſons woꝛdes be plaine, euen as you your ſelfe haue alleged them. Propterea apparet falſitas Doctrinæ Papæ Iohannis 22. *Hereby appeareth the falſehed of the Doctrine of* Pope Iohn. Chriſtianus Maſſæus ſaithe, Papa Iohannes prædicauit errorem: Pope Iohn *preached, oꝛ ſette foꝛthe this errour.* And it is ſaide, the Popes VVil muſte needes ſtande foꝛ Lawe.

Decreed.

Maſſe. li. 18. De Tranſ. Epiſcopi. Quanto.

You ſaie, Remember, good Reader, this errour of Pope Iohn. 22. was not condemned by the Diuines of Pariſe, when he was Pope, but before when he was a priuate Doctor, & liued in the Realm of France.

Before he was Pope.

The Anſweare. Thou muſte beleue M. Harding, good Reader, be his tale neuer ſo vnlikely, yea though he ſpeake impoſſibilities. This errour of Pope Iohn (ſaith he) was cõdemned in the preſence of Philip the French Kinge, not when Iohn was Pope, but before, when he was a priuate man. Nowe, I beſeꝛche thée, good Reader, foꝛ thy better ſatiſfaction, conſider wel the yæres, and ages, as wel of this Kinge Philip the ſixth, as alſo of this Pope Iohn the two and twentiethe. It appeareth by al Writers what ſo euer, that this Iohn was Conſecrate Pope at Auenion anno 1316. and, that Philippus Valeſius was crowned Kinge in France. anno 1328. By which Computation it is plaine, that this Iohn was Pope thirtiene yæres beſoꝛe this Philip was Kinge. This Hiſtoꝛie is euidente, and agreeably confeſſed by al that haue wꝛitten. Yet it pleaſethe M. Harding, to take it by the toppe, and to turne it backewarde: and to telle vs of him ſelfe onely, without further authoꝛitie, that Philip Valeſius was Kinge, and ſate in place of Iudgement, to heare Cauſes of Religion, thirtiene yæres at the leaſte, beſoꝛe this Iohn was Pope. Thus by M. Hardinges Handling, Pope Iohn when he was Pope, yet was no Pope: And Philip was a Kinge thirtiene yæres at the leaſte, beſoꝛe he was Kinge. Suche pꝛety Verities M. Harding can ſhape vs foꝛ his aduantage.

VVhen he liued in France.

Yet, M. Harding, you telle vs, That this Iohn vvas condemned by the Diuines of Pariſe, not vvhen he vvas Pope (God foꝛbidde: foꝛ then muſt wée confeſſe, that the Pope was an Heretique) but before, vvhen he vvas a Priuate Doctour, and liued in the Realme of France. Here is a marueilous caſe, M. Hard. An Heretique by your confeſſion may be a Pope: But a Pope in no wiſe may be an Heretique. This Iohn (you ſaie) was hereof condemned when he was a Priuate man, and liued in France. I pꝛaie you, M. Harding, and wheꝛe liued he afteꝛwarde beinge Pope? Loke vp your Chꝛonicles. Where was Pope Iohns aboade? Where was his Conſiſtoꝛie? Where was his Courte, duringe al that whole time, while he was Pope? Peꝛhappes, you thinke, it was at Rome. Foꝛ there ſate S. Peter: There is the Continuance of his Succeſſion: And thereof the Popes are called the Bishoppes of Rome. If you ſo thinke, M. Harding, youre thought deceiueth you. Foꝛ in deede it is wel knowen, that Pope Clemens the fifthe, that was the nexte Pꝛedeceſſoure

Sabel. Ennead. 9. Lib. 7.

Pope Iohn.22.

nerte Predeceſſoure beſore Pope Iohn.22. remoued him ſelfe, and al his traine from Rome to Auenion in France, in the yére of our Lorde. 1303. From whiche time, duringe the ſpace of thrée ſcoare and fourtiene yéres ſolowinge, the Pope continued ſtil at Auenion, and neuer returned backe to Rome. It was in vaine therefore for you to ſaie, Pope Iohn at the time of his Condemnation, was no Pope, but only a Priuate man & liued in France. For duringe the whole time of his Popedome, he continued ſtil in France at Auenion. And beinge foure ſcoare and tenne yéres of age, He died at Auenion, and at Auenion was buried, in the Cathedral Churche: where his Body reſteth vntil this daie, and not in Rome. *Platina.*

Saie nomore therefore, M. Hardinge, that Pope Iohns erroure was condemned in Pariſe, and blowen out with Trumpettes in the preſence of the Kinge, not when he was Pope, but onely when he liued in Priuate eſtate. For al the Hiſtoriographers, that haue written hereof, wil ſome Controlle you. Antoninus ſaithe, Pope Iohn helde this erroure in the time of his Popedome, and pronounced woordes ſauouringe of Hereſie, openly in the Conſiſtorie (beeinge Pope.) Nauclerus ſaithe, Imo papam Iohannem Magni, & multi Theologi Scientia, & vita probati, Dogmatizabant eſſe Hæreticum propter errores certos: quos tamen Die obitus ſui dicitur tepidè reuocaſſe: & eius Succeſſor, Benedictus, eos errores fertur publicè damnaſſe: *Nay, many great, and famous Diuines, of great Learninge, and good Life, proclaimed* (not one, or other, by the name of Iohn, but) pope Iohn, *by the name of* pope, *to be an Heretique for certaine erroures Whiche erroures, notwithſtandinge it is ſaide, that he Coldely reuoked at the time of his deathe.* (But not before, neither then, but coldely). *Againe it is ſaide, That* pope Benedictus, *his nexte Succeſſoure, openly Condemned the ſame erroures.* Chriſtianus Maſſæus ſaithe, papa Iohannes prædicauit errorem &c. Miſitque Pariſios duos, alterum Dominicanum, alterum Franciſcanum, qui eandem Hæreſim prædicarent &c. Pope Iohn *preached, and profeſſed an erroure &c. And ſente two Preachers to* Pariſe, *the one a Blacke Freere, and the other a Graye Freere, to mainteine the ſame Hereſie. But one* Thomas *a Preacher of* Englande, *withſtode the* pope. *Him the* pope *tooke, and threwe into Priſon. Hereupon the Kinge ſummoned a Counſel vnto his Palaice in* Vinciana Sylua. *The whole aſſemblie ſubſcribed againſte the* pope. *Immediately the Kinge ſente to* pope Iohn, *and willed him to reſourme his erroure, and to ſette the Preacher at libertie: And ſo he did.* *Nauclerus Genera.45. Anno.1324* Tepidè. *Benedictus Condemnat. Maſſaus. Lib.18. An.1332.*

Thus you ſée, M. Hardinge, That pope Iohn beinge pope ſtode in erroure: That pope Iohn was Condemned for an Heretique: That pope Iohn profeſſed, and preached falſe Doctrine: That pope Iohn ſente out Preacheres, to mainteine His Hereſie, and they were Freers: That pope Iohn was controlled by an Engliſhe Preacher: That pope Iohn was reproued by a Councel: That pope Iohn was willed by the Kinge to reſourme his erroure. And yet can you telle vs, al this notwithſtandinge, that pope Iohn was then a Priuate man, and no pope at al.

Further you ſaie, Touchinge that you haue alleged out of the Councel of Conſtance, what a greate falſched is it, to put in your Booke the name of Pope Iohn 22. for Pope Iohn. 23. The name of this Iohn. 23. was before he tooke vpon him to be Pope, Balthazar de Caſſa, as there yee haue it declared. Neither was it certaine, that he helde that deteſtable opinion. Howe ſo euer it be, Pope Iohn. 23. was not a true Pope Lawfully electe, but an Vſurper. M. Har. 66. b. M. Hard. 67. a.

The Anſweare. And what if I ſhoulde here confeſſe an erroure, M. Hardinge? Or, what if I ſhoulde ſaie, I had not aduiſedly conſidered the Storie, but had taken one number for an other? Yet haue you not one heretique pope Iohn the leſſe, but one the moe. For how ſo euer yée number them, as it ſhal wel appere, both were Iohns, & both were popes, and bothe were Heretiques. But as you can ſo fauourably telle vs, it is no Hereſie in a pope, wilfully to mainteine an open erroure, touchinge the ſtate of the Soule: So I truſte of youre courteſie, yée wil not ſo haſtily Condemne it for hainous Hereſie, if a man happen onely to miſreckon the name, or number of a pope For more, then that, you cannot make it. Otherwiſe it mate happen, that you youre ſelfe, euen in this ſelfe ſame place, maie finde youre ſelfe in like erroure, and yelde youre ſelfe to be an Heretique. For where you ſaie, It vvas Benedictus vndecimus that folovved Iohannes. 22. Onuphrius callethe him Benedictum decimum: And Sabellicus ſaithe, It *Sab. Enne. 9*

Pope Iohn.22.

was Benedictus duodecimus. In this reckeninge, if euery misnumbringe of a pope, be an Heresie, by youre iudgemente wee muste nedes haue two Heresies at the leaste. As for Balthazar à Cossa, whome ye calle Pope Iohn. 23. Platyna callethe him Pope Iohn.24. Onuphrius callethe him, euen as I did, Pope Iohn.22. and not as you doe, pope Iohn,23. And the other Iohn, whome you calle pope Iohn.22. Ye callethe pope Iohn.21. Loke on youre Bokes, and you shal finde it. Nowe, M. Hardinge, you se the very causes of al this errour: and yet no great cause, why you shoulde so fiercely vpbraide vs with so greate falsehed.

The mater, wherewith this Pope Iohn the Later was charged, was this, as it is specially obiected againste him in the Councel of Constance, Quin imò dixit, & pertinaciter credidit, Animam Hominis cum Corpore Humano mori, & extingui, ad instar animalium Brutorum: Pope Iohn *saide, and stubbornely beleeued, that the Soule of Man dieth togeather with the Body, and is consumed to nothinge, as the Soule of Brute Beastes.* Therfore M. Hardinge, the greateste faulte, yee can finde in mee in this behalfe, is this, that seekinge to finde Heretiques emonge the Popes, I thought there had bene but one pope Iohn Condemned of Heresie, whereas in deede there were two.

You saie, This Heresie was obiected only against Pope Iohn. 23. but neuer proued. But it was obiected againste him, M. Hardinge, in the Councel of Constance, and of his parte neuer purged. Seeke his Purgation where you wil: yee shal neuer finde it. And the wante of Purgation is called in Lawe, a plaine Conuiction.

Yet the better to Countenance a badde mater, you saie, This Later Pope Iohn vvas no true pope, nor Lavvfully chosen, as apperteined. Who saithe so, M. Hardinge, but onely your selfe? And what is your owne onely Authoritie against al others? In the Councel of Constance, where al the Enormities, and Villanies of this pope Iohns whole life were blased abroade, yet this Article of his Election, and title of Popedome was neuer laide to his charge. Platina, touchinge his Election, saithe thus, Bononiæ omnium Consensu Pontifex creatur: *This* Iohn *was chosen* Pope *at* Bononia *by the consent of al the Cardinalles.* Hauinge the Consente of al the Cardinalles, he wanted none, no not one. And what Election can be more Canonical, or Lawful, then, when the voices of al the Electours agree togeather. Certainely, in any reasonable iudgement, he was mutche more Lawfully chosen, then pope Iohn 22. that chose him selfe. And yet was that pope Iohn a Lawful pope. In deede the other two Popes were set vp in Schisme, and Diuision, onely by a parte of the Cardinalles. But pope Iohn.23. was Lawfully chosen by the Consent, and agreement of the whole: and had he not benne charged with other crimes, he had neuer benne remoued.

Platina. in Iohan.24.

To conclude, you saie, The Heretiques, that of S. Augustine are called Arabici, were not the first Authours of this errour. But the Armenians, or Greeians, if wee beleeue Guido.

The Answere. And why so, M. Hardinge? Did not the Arabian Heretiques holde this same errour? Verily, S. Augustines wordes are plaine: Arabici dixerunt, animas cum corporibus mori, atque dissolui: & in fine Sæculi vtrunque resurgere. But you saie, The Armenians were the Founders of this errour: and they were longe before the Arabians. For I trowe, so saithe your Guido. But examine you better the course of times. You maie happen to finde youre errour. S. Augustine saithe, The Arabians were in the time of Origene, welneare fourtiene hundred yeres agoe. As for the Armenians, Alphonsus saith, *They began aboute eleuen hundred yeres agoe, after the Councel of* Chalcedon about the yeare of our Lord. 450. that is to saie, two hundred, & fiftie yeares after the Arabians. Nowe, M. Hardinge, telle vs, I praie you, whether of theise two sortes of Heretiques was the former? Is it not a likely mater, that the Arabians, that were fouretiene hundred yeares agoe, lerned first their Heresie of the Armenians, that folowed two hundred and fiftie yeares after them.

Augustin. ad Quodvultdeum.

Arabici. Anno. 212.

Alphons. de Haresi. li. 2. De Adamet Eua Armenij. an. 450.

As for Guido the Carmelite Freere, no doubte, he was a wise, and worthy Doctoure, to be broughte for the for a Witnesse againste the Authoritie of S. Augustine.

Nowe, that the truthe of your wordes maie appeare the better, Lette vs Laie for the a Briefe hereof, by waie of Comparison, as in a table.

M.

M. Hardinge.

This was an errour in Pope Iohn. 22. I denie not. Yet for the same is not he to be counted an Heretique.

The Answeare.

Antoninus. Pope Iohn vttered wordes of Heresie. And many iudged him to be an Heretike.
Massæus. Pope Iohn sente Preachers to Parise to mainteine his Heresie.

M. Hardinge.

Gerson neuer saide, that *Pope Iohn* made any suche Decree.

The Answeare.

Gerson. Pope Iohn professed and taughte this Heresie.
Massæus. Pope Iohn preached, and published this errour. Prædicauit errorem.

M. Hardinge.

This errour of *Pope Iohn. 22.* was not condemned by the Diuines of Parise, in the presence of the Kinge when he was *Pope*, but before, when he was a Priuate Doctoure.

The Answeare.

Pope Iohn. 22. was Pope thirtiene yeres before Kinge Philip was Kinge.
Antoninus. Pope Iohn spake wordes sauouring of Heresie in the Consistorie, that is to saie, beinge pope.
Nauclerus. The most famous Diuines proclaimed pope Iohn, beinge pope to be an Heretike.
Massæus. Pope Iohn preached errour, and sente Preachers abroade to mainteine his Heresie.

M. Hardinge.

Pope Iohn was condemned before he was *Pope*, when he liued in the Realme of *France*.

The Answeare.

Pope Iohn, duringe the whole time of his Popedome, Continued still at Auenion in France, and neuer departed thence to Rome. *Sabellicus.*

M. Hardinge.

Pope Iohn held this errour, onely as his Priuate opinion.

The Answeare.

Gerson. Pope Iohn professed, and taughte this Doctrine.
Massæus. Pope Iohn preached it, and sente out preachers to mainteine it, and emprisoned them, that durste to withstande it.

M. Hardinge.

You name *Pope Iohn. 22.* for *Pope Iohn. 23.*

The Answeare.

Onuphrius calleth him as I do, Pope Iohn. 22. *Platina* calleth him Pope Iohn. 24. and not as you do, Pope Iohn. 23.
In stede of one Heretical Pope Iohn, we haue founde two, and the Later muche more horrible, then the Former.

M. Hardinge.

This Heresie was obiected against *Pope Iohn. 23.* in the Councel of Constance, but neuer proued.

The Answeare.

This Heresie was obiected againste Pope Iohn, but neuer purged.

M. Hardinge.

Pope Iohn. 23. was neuer Lawfullye chosen.

The Answeare.

Platina. Pope Iohn was chosen at Bononia, by the Consente of al the Cardinalles. Who so hathe the Consente of al the Electoures, is lawfully chosen.

M. Hardinge.

The *Arabians* were not the Authoures of this errour, but the *Armenians*.

The Answeare.

S. Augustine. The Arabians were the Authors hereof.
The Arabians were two hundred, and fiftie yeres before the Armenians.

VVhether the Pope may erre or no.

So many waies, M. Hardinge, haue you corrupted, and altered the Truethe of this Storie. And yet you thinke it Lawful for you, to crie out againste vs, All is falſe, Wicked impudencie. Yee belie the Doctours. Yee are malicious. Yee are Ignorante. Yee are ſhamelesſe ſhifters.

Pope Zoſimus. *Art. 4. di. 6. Conc. Aphr. Can. 101.* An Epiſtle forged vnder the name of Athanaſius.

For the reſte, ye ſaie, We belie Pope Zoſimus. He corrupted not the Councel of Nice. For trial wherof, I referre me ſelf to my Former Replie vnto your Anſweare. Certainely, what ſo euer Learned man wil ſtande to the denial hereof, he muſte nedes wante colour in his face. The fraude was notoriouſly founde, and detected to the whole worlde by the Anciente Learned Fathers, Cyrillus, and Atticus, the one beinge Patriarke of Alexandria, the other of Antioche, and was reproued, and publiſhed by two hundred, and ſeuenténe Biſhoppes, openly in the Councel of Aphrica. The pæuiſhe forged Epiſtle, that yée allege vnder the name of the Learned godly Father Athanaſius. The fantaſtical burninge of the Canons of Nice without fire, with other your like childiſhe vanities, ſcarcely méte for children to plaie withal, are likewiſe anſwered.

The Coūcel of Nice corrupted. In the Replie. *Art. 4. di. 6. Copu. pa. 78 Con. Floren. Seſſione. 20. Concil. Carthagi. 6. ca. 4*

One of your owne Louanian companie confeſſeth, that in the Late Councel of Florence, the Greekes there made open complainte, that the Biſhop of Rome had corrupted the Canons of the Councel of Nice. Alypius the Biſhop of Tagaſta, ſpeakinge hereof in the councel of Carthage, ſaithe thus, Adhuc tamen me mouet, quoniam cùm inſpiceremus Græca Exemplaria huius Synodi Niceną, iſta ibi, neſcio, qua ratione, minimè inuenimus: *Yet this thinge mouethe mee, that, when wee examined, and conferred the* Originalles of the Nicene Councel, *vvritten in Greeke, I knowe not, by what meanes, theſe thinges we founde not there.*

Addition. ☞ Howe be it, al this maie be eaſily holpen by a Writte of Errour. For you wil ſaie, Pope Zoſimus alleged the Councel of Sardica in ſtéde of the Councel of Nice And herein he was deceiued: and this was his whole faulte. If this were al the faulte, M. Hardinge, yet were it a greate faulte for Chriſtes Vicare, and S. Peters Succeſſour, in maintenance of his owne inordinate ambition, to allege one Councel for an other, and therewith to face downe two hundred, and ſeuentiene Biſhoppes in Generall Councel. If it were the Councel of Sardica and not of Nice why then did Pope Zoſimus ſo often, and ſo ſtoutely allege it for the Councel of Nice? Howe durſt he ſaie, He had ſéene it, He had read it, and had the very true Copie of it in his Librarie in Rome? Why did he cauſe the Biſhops of Aphrica to ſende ſo many hundred myles, to Conſtantinople in Thracia, to Alexandria in Ægypte, and to Antioche in Syria, to ſearche the originals of the Councel of Nice, him ſelfe knowinge, there was no ſuche thinge written in the Councel of Nice? Was this plaine dealinge, M. Hardinge? Was this no corruption of a Councel? The Lawe ſaithe, Magna negligentia culpa eſt: Magna culpa Dolus eſt: *Great negligence is a faulte: and a great fault is Guile, and falſehed.*

Addition. ☞

Nic. Cuſan. de concordia lib. 2. ca. 25.

As for the Councel of Sardica, Nicolaus Cuſanus ſaithe, Sardicenſe Concilium pro ſtatuto Niceni Concilij per Legatos Apoſtolicæ Sedis falſo fuit allegatum: *The* Councel of Sardica *was deceitefully, or falſely alleged by the Legates of the Apoſtolike See of Rome, ſente from* Pope Zoſimus, *in ſteede of a Canon of the* Councel of Nice. Here, M. Harding, I beſéeche you, of youre courteſie, forgrate not this. Nicolaus Cuſanus one of your principal Doctoures telleth you, that Pope Zoſimus and his Legates, deceitfully, and falſely alleged the Councel of Sardica vnder the name of the Councel of Nice.

Nic. Cuſan. de concordia Li. 2. Ca. 15.

But yet let vs ſée, of what authoritie, and credite was this Councel of Sardica? Nicolaus Cuſanus ſaithe, Auguſtinus non putauit, illud Concilium eſſe Catholicum, ſed potius Arianum: S. Auguſtine *helde not the* Councel of Sardica *for a Catholique Councel: but rather for a* Councel of Arian Heretiques. It goeth hard with the Pope M. Harding, when he is driuen to leaue al Catholique Councelles, and to holde by ſuche euidence.

Nic. Cuſan. de concordia Li. 2. Ca. 25.

Verily Cuſanus openinge his owne iudgemente, touchinge the ſaide Councel of Sardica, ſaithe thus, Verum eſt, ipſos Patres Aphricani Concilij (in quo & S. Auguſtinus interfuit) in Epiſtola ad Cœleſtinum ſcribere, ſe hanc Conſtitutionem nulla Patrum Synodo inueniſſe Conſtitutam. Quare ſatis poſſet dubitari, an Sardicenſis Concilij Conſtitutio exiſtat: *It is certaine, that the Biſhoppes in the* Councel of Aphrica, *emonge whom alſo was* S. Auguſtine, *in theire Letters vnto* Pope Celeſtine *write thus, that they neuer founde*

this

VVhether the Pope may erre or no.

this Conſtitution Decreed in the Councel of any Biſhoppes, wherefore it maie wel be doubted, whether this be a Conſtitution of the Councel of Sardica, *or rather no.* Thus, M. Harding, you ſée, pope Zoſimus falſely alleged a Canon of the Councel of Sardica, for a Canon of the Councel of Nice: You ſée the ſaide Councel of Sardica whereby yée woulde holde, was a Councel of Heretiques: You ſée, your owne Doctour Cuſanus doubteth, whether euer there were any ſutche Canon written, or no, either in the Councel of Nice or in the Councel of Sardica, either by Catholiques, or by Heretiques. And yet wil you ſay, It cannot be proued, that Pope Zoſimus was a Corrupter of Councels?

Yet Pope Bonifacius to ſaue the Credite of the See of Rome, was forced to ſaie, and publiſhe openly, that the ſaide Alypius, and Aurelius the Bishop of Carthage, and S. Auguſtine the Bishop of Hippo, and two hundred and foureteene other Bishoppes, that had eſpied, and reueled this falſehed, were al enflamed, and leadde by the Diuell. And one of your owne ſuddaine Doctours of Louaine ſaithe, Hæc omnia, tanquam ſomnia, tanquam fabulæ, tanquam ſuperſtua, abolita, antiquata, calcata ſunt: *All thieſe* Decrees (of theſe Councels of Carthage, and Aphrica) *are aboliſhed, and repealed, and troden vnder foote, as Dreames, and Fables, and thinges ſuperfluous.* This, M. Hardinge, is the weighinge of youre Councelles. If they like you, they are the expreſſe Voices of the Holy Ghoſt: If they like you not, they are Dreames, and Fables, and thinges ſuperfluous.

Epiſt. Bonifacii. 2. ad Eulalium.

Copus pa. 93

Camotenſis (yée ſaie) is ſome woothipful Doctoure, ſuche as by our owne iudgement, mighte paſſe in the Blacke garde. Yet was he a Bishop, M. Harding, in al reſpectes farre better, then either your Leontius, or youre Hippolytus, or youre newe founde Clemens, whome ye cal the Apoſtles Felowe, or your vaine fable of Amphilochius. Ye would ſéeme to finde faulte with the name: and thinke, we ſhould not haue written, Camotenſis but rather, Iuo Carnotenſis. Your gheaſſe ye ſhewe vs: but reaſon thereof yée ſhewe vs none. Yée mighte as wel haue ſaide, Fulbertus Carnotenſis, who beinge very mutche conſumed, and ſpente with ſickeneſſe, as it is learnedly noted emonge other your Heritics, for a reſtoratiue, ſuckte our Ladies breaſte, and by vertue thereof was made whole. Yée might likewiſe haue gheſſed, it had ben Io. Sarisburienſis, otherwiſe called by ſome, Rupertus Carnotenſis. For he ſaithe, In Eccleſia Romana ſedent Scribæ, & Phariſæi: *In the* Churche of Rome *ſitte the Scribes, and the Phariſies.* But in déede, this Writers name is Iohannes Camotenſis alleged by Cornelius Agrippa. His wordes be theſe, Angelis præcipiunt: poteſtatem habent in Mortuos: Vim faciunt Scripturis, vt habeant plenitudinem Poteſtatis. Ipſe Papa iam factus eſt intolerabilis. Eius pompam, & faſtum nullus Tyrannorum vnquam æquauit. Legati Romanorum Pontificum ſic bacchantur in Prouincijs, acſi ad flagellandam Eccleſiam Sathan egreſſus ſit à facie Domini: *They laie theire Commaundementes vpon the Angells of God: They haue power vpon the Dead: They wreaſt, and racke the Scriptures, that they maie haue the Fulneſſe of Power. The* Pope *him ſelfe is newe becomme vntolerable. No Tyran was euer hable to matche him in Pompe, and Pride. The* Popes Legates *keepe ſutche reuel in Kingedomes, and Countries, as if* Sathan *were ſente abroade from the face of the Lorde, to ſcourge the Churche.* This is not your Iuo Carnotenſis: It is Iohannes Camotenſis: And this is his iudgemente of your Churche of Rome.

Iohan. Camotenſis.

Herm. Rid. Io. Sariſburienſis in Polycratico. Cornel. Agrippa, de vanit. Scientiarum.

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuiſion. 1.

What wil ye ſaie, if the Popes Aduocates, Abbates, and Bishoppes diſſemble not the mater, but ſhewe them ſelues open enimies to the Goſpel, and thoughe they ſee, yet wil not ſee, but wrie the Scriptures, and wittingely, and knoweingely corrupte, and counterfeit the VVoorde of God, and fowly, and wickedly applie to the Pope, al the ſame thinges, which euidently, and properly be ſpoken of the Perſon of Chriſte onely, nor by no meanes can be applied to any other? And what thoughe they ſaie, The Pope is al, and aboue al? Or, That the Pope can doo aſmutche, as Chriſte can doo: and, That one iudgemente place, and one Councel Houſe ſerueth for the Pope, and

Hoſt. ca. Quanto. Abas Panor De Elect. c. 1. venerabilis.

for Christe bothe togeather? Or, That the Pope is the same Lighte, vvhiche should comme into the VVorlde: **whiche woordes** Christe **spake of him selfe alone:** and, That vvho so is an euil dooer, hateth, and flieth from that Light? Or, **that al the other Bishoppes haue receiued of the** Popes fulnesse?

M. Hardinge.

You haue neuer done with your whatifs. Your interpreter good Gentil woman, that fauoureth your pleasant Diuinitie so muche, seemeth to be weary of it her selfe. For here she turneth your *Quid si*, into what wil ye saie, if. And nowe Sir, doo you demaunde of vs, as Madame interpreter maketh you to speake what we wil say. Forsoothe, for this you allege against the Popes aduocates, Abbates and Bishops, we saie, that the moste parte is very false and slaunderous: somewhat maie be taken for truthe in a right sense. As for the Aduocates, I minde not to be their Aduocate, neither haue they neede of my helpe. Let them answear one for an other. Hostiensis for Abbot Panormitane, and he for Hostiensis. In good soothe were those excellent men at this date liuinge, I thinke verily they woulde not doo you that honoure, as to answeare you them selues. Or if they woulde vouchsaue to doo so much, I doubte not, but they woulde make shorte worke with you, and take you vp roundely for halsinge, with one woorde, *Mentiris*, dashinge al your allegations, which woorde in your Diuinitie is a verbe Commune.

* Untruthe, blasphemous, vnadoisedly defended. For the woordes be plaine. Papa Lux venit in Mundum.

Thus leauinge Hostiensis, and Panormitane to defense of the Canonistes, tellinge you by the waie that in questions of Diuinitie wee stande not alwaies to their saieinges: we answeare you on the behalfe of Cornelius the Bishop of Bitonto in Italie, (for him ye meane, I suppose, putting in your margēt the name of Cornelius only) that he neuer saide, * the Pope is the Light, which should come into the world, in that sense, as it is spoken of Christe. If you were hardely charged to shewe, where he sayde it, or where he wrote it, * you woulde be founde a lier, as in many other pointes you are founde alredy. That he neuer wrote it in any of his eloquente Italian Sermons, lette foorthe in Printe, I am assured. And more hathe he not set forthe. Now it remaineth, that you tel vs where he saith so, * or els confesse your slaunderous lie.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Where ye saie, M. Hardinge, I thinke, ye haue learned of a childe, that, Mentiris, **is a** Verbe Common, **if ye holde on, as ye haue begonne, ye wil shortely alter the Propertie thereof to youre selfe, and make it hencefoorthe a** Verbe Priuate. **Touchinge** Hostiensis, **and** Panormitane, **I wil saie nothinge, but onely referre you to the places.**

Con. Tridēt. sub Paulo. 3. Oratio Cornelij Episcopi Bitonniti.

As for Cornelius **the** Bishop of Bitonto, **for as mutche as, contrarie to youre nature, ye pleade ignorance, and saie, ye cannot finde the place, reade therefore these woordes in his** Oration, **openly pronounced in youre Late** Chapter at Tridente: Quis erit tam iniustus rerum æstimator, qui non dicat, Papa Lux venit in Mundum: sed dilexerunt homines Tenebras magis quàm Lucem. Omnis, qui malè agit, odit Lucem: & non venit ad Lucem: vt non arguantur opera eius, quia mala sunt: *Who wil so vniustly weighe thinges, but he wil saie,* The Pope is the Lighte, that is comme into the vvorld? But menne haue loued Darkenesse, more then (**the** Pope **that is**) the Lighte. *Who so euer dothe euil, hatethe the* Lighte: *and commethe not to the* Lighte: *least his workes shoulde be discouered, for that they be euil.*

The Apologie, Cap. 6. Diuision. 2.

Shortely, what though they make Decrees expresselye againste Goddes VVoorde, **and that, not in hucker mucker, or couertly, but openly, and in the face of the worlde: muste it needes yet be Gospel streight, what so euer they saie? Shal these be** Gods Holy Armie? **Or, wil Christ be at hande emong them there? Shal the** Holy Ghoste **flowe in theire tongues, or can they with truthe saie, Wee, and the** Holy Ghoste **haue thoughte so?**

M. Hardinge.

After a great many of your foolishe and false whatifs, you conclude shortly, with What if they make decrees expresselye againste Goddes Woorde, and that openly in the face of the world? Hereto we answeare, requiting your what if, with an other what if, and saie, What if the Learned and Holy Fathers, &c.

The Apologie. Cap. 6. Diuision. 3.

Hosius contra Erennium. Lib. 2.

In deede Peter Asotus, **and his Companion** Hosius **sticke not to affirme, that the same** Councel, **wherin our** Sauecour Iesus Christe **was condemned to die,**

The Sprite of Truth in Annas and Caiphas.

die, had bothe the Sprite of Prophesieinge, and the Holy Ghoste. and the Sprite of Truthe: and that it was neither a false, nor a triflinge saieinge, when those Bishoppes saide, VVe haue the Lavve, and by our Lavve he ought to die: and, that they, so saieinge, did light vpon the very Truthe of Iudgemente (for so be Hosius woordes) and, that the same plainely was a iuste Decree, whereby they pronounced, that Christe was woorthy to die. This, me thinketh, is straunge, that these men are not hable to speake for themselues, and to defende their owne cause, but they muste also take parte with Annas, and Caiphas againste Christe. For, if they wil calle that a Lawful, and a good Councel, wherein the Sonne of God was moste shamefully condemned to die the deathe, what Councel wil they then allowe for false, and naughte? And yet (as al theire Councelles, to saie truthe, commonly be) necessitie compelled them, to pronounce these thinges of the Councel holden by Annas, and Caiphas.

Christ vvorthy to die.

M. Hardinge.

Suche vnhoneste toies better become Brentius, that shameleste railinge Heretike. Nowe to you, Sir Defender. You belie Hosius, as Brentius, of whom you borowed this, belied the reuerent Father Peter a Soto. Either you haue readen the place of Hosius, or you haue not. If you haue not, then are you to blame, to saie so muche euil, that you knowe not. If you haue readen the place, then is your faulte plaine malice, in putting that to Hosius, the contrarie whereof you finde in the place by your selfe alleaged, by whiche you leade vs, as it were by the hande, to beholde and consider your owne dishoneste How iuste cause you haue to reprehende Hosius, for that he wrote againste Brentius in defence of Petrus a Soto, touchinge the Councel in whiche Christe was condemned by Caiphas, it shoulde beste appeare to him, that woulde reade the whole place, where Hosius treateth that mater. The same woulde I here haue rehearsed, to the discoueringe of your false dealinge, and shameleste lieinge, were not the same very longe.

Firste, this is the Truthe, touchinge the whole. (a) The Actes of those Priestes of the Iewes Synagoge were wicked, and contrarie to Christe. (a) But theire Sentence, thoughe them selues were neuer so euil, was not onely true, but also to mankinde moste profitable. And S. Iohn in his Gospel witnesseth it was the oracle of God. For when after long deliberation of the Councel, Caiphas the highe Bishop and President of that Councel, had pronounced his sentence, whereunto al the reste almoste gaue their consente, It is expediente for vs, that one man die for the people, and not that al the Nation perishe: the Euangeliste thereto added his verdite, saieinge, This he saide, not of him selfe, but whereas he was highe Bishop of that yeere, he Prophecied. Therefore let this be the true conclusion of the whole mater. The Actes of that Councel were wicked, the sentence was true and good. Nowe Hosius treateth this mater so learnedly, and so substantially, as you can not truely take any aduantage of his woordes to reprehende him. He staieth him selfe vpon the Scripture, a good grounde to stande vpon. Whiche Scripture referreth doubteful and harde questions to the Priestes of the Leuitical order. Of whom it is saide, *Indicabunt tibi Iudicij Veritatem*: (b) They shal shewe vnto thee the Truthe of Iudgemente. In this iudgemente, saithe Hosius, though it were neuer so wicked, yet was the truthe of iudgemente. Howe that might be, there he proueth it to Brentius by moste manifeste argumente.

(a) A discrete, and a woorthy proctour. The Actes were naught, and the sentence good. The Sentence was, That Christe should die the deathe.

(b) This Truth of Iudgemente was, That the Sonne of God, vvas a Blasphemer and had deserued to die.

Where ye impute to Hosius, to haue saide, that the same plainely was a iuste decree, (c) whereby they pronounced that Christe was woorthy to die, that is your slaunderous lie, not Hosius saieinge. (c) For he saithe the cleane contrarie, and that sundrie times, that it was a wicked Councel, and moste vniuste decree. God forbid any christen man shuld saie, that Christ was worthy to die. (d) He saith, it might haue bene truly pronounced by Caiphas, that he was giltie of death. And there he sheweth howe, very religiously, and witely admonishing the reader, that he was most innocent, and deserued not to die. And thus, Syr you maie see, we take not parte with Annas, and Caiphas, as you raile, and yet be able, God be thanked, to defende oure true cause, and declare you to the worlde to be false teachers. Therefore belie vs no more.

(c) Vntruthe. For thus saide Caiphas: And his Iudgement Hosius defendeth, as true, and Godly.

(d) Christe, by Hosius Iudgemente, vvas guilty of death

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Good Christian Reader, this whole matter concerneth onely the credite, and certainetie of Generall Councelles, Sotus, and Hosius saie, what so euer is determined in Councel, muste be taken as the vndoubted Iudgemente, and VVoorde of God. Vnto the Godly Learned Father, Iohannes Brentius, replieth thus, *Councelles sommetimes haue erred, and haue vtterly wanted the* Sprite of God: *as it maie appeare by that in a*

Councel

The Sprite of Truth in Annas and Caiphas.

Councel *the Sonne of God was condemned, and iudged to die the death.* Hosius **answereth,** *When* Annas, *and* Caiphas *sate as* presidentes *in the* councel, *and* Christe *the Sonne of God, was by them condemned to die, yet neuertheleſſe the ſame* Councel *had the aſſiſtance of the* Holy Ghoſte, *and the vndoubted* Sprite of Truthe. **For, ſpeakinge of the ſame** Councel, **he ſaithe thus,** Vides, Brenti, quemadmodum non defuerit Sacerdotio Leuitico Spiritus Propheticus, Spiritus Sanctus, Spiritus Veritatis: *Yee ſee, friend* Brentius, *how that the* Leuitical prieſthoode (**that pronounced ſentence of deathe againſte** Chriſte) *wanted not the* Sprite of propheſie, the Holy Ghoſte, the Sprite of Truthe. **Againe he ſaithe.** Ex quo tempore primus parens noſter de vetito ligno guſtauit, factus eſt Mortis Reus Chriſtus Dei, &c. Nec falſum fuit illud, quod dixerunt, Nos legem habemus & ſecundum Legem hanc debet mori: *From the time, that our firſt Father taſted of the forebidden fruite,* Chriſt the Sonne of God became guilty of deathe: *Neither was it falſe, that the Iewes ſaide,* VVee haue a Lavve, and according to that Lavve he ought to die **VVith this** Sprite, **I trowe, he was inſpired, that wrote this** Marginal Note **vpon your** Decrees, Iudæi mortaliter peccaſſent, niſi Chriſtum crucifixiſſent: *The* Ievves *had committed mortal ſinne, if they had not nailed Chriſte vnto the Croſſe.* **Againe,** Hoſius **ſaithe,** Nulla eſſe poteſt tanta pontificum improbitas, quæ impedire queat, quò minùs vera ſit illa Dei promiſsio, Qui in dicabunt tibi iudicij Veritatem: *Be the wickednesſe of Biſhoppes neuer ſo greate, it can neuer hinder, but that this promiſſe of God ſhal euer be true,* The Bishoppes shal shevve thee the Truthe of Iudgemente.

Hoſius, lib. 2 contra Brentium. Pag. 62. b.

Pag. 63. a. Diſt. 13. I tẽ In margine. Hoſius contra Brent. Pag. 63. b.

This therefore, M. Hardinge, is your Doctoures meaninge: It is ſufficient, that Biſhoppes **onely mete in** Councel. **God wil ſupplie al the reſte. What ſo euer they determine, the** Holy Ghoſte **will aſſiſte them: they cannot erre. Al this is as true, as that** Hoſius **your Doctoure ſaithe,** Annas, and Caiphas coulde not erre in pronouncinge Sentence of deathe againſte Chriſte.

But, for excuſe hereof, ſomme what to ſalue a ſeſtrie mater, yée tel vs a longe tedious tale, without heade, or foote: and that your Reader maie thinke, yée ſaie ſommewhat, yée crie out alloude, Shameleſſe railinge Hereſiques, wee belie Hoſius, wee belie Sotus. Our falſe dealinge, our ſhameleſſe liesinge, wee are impudente and continewe in beinge. **Theſe, M. Hardinge, be the proufes, and groundes of your Doctrine, and the moſt ſauerie, and faireſt floures in your garlande.**

The ſubſtance of your tale is this: The Actes of the Councel, where Chriſt was condemned, were lewde, and wicked But the Sentence of death pronounced by the Biſhoppes againſt Chriſte, was iuſte and true. **And thus by your dalliance in darke wordes, and by your blinde Diſtinction, betwéne** Acte **and** Sentence, **yée ſeke ſhiftes to mocke the worlde. Yée ſhoulde plainely haue tolde vs, what were theſe** Sentences: **and what were theſe** Actes: **and what greate difference yée canne eſpie betwéne** Acte **and** Sentence: **or, when euer yée hearde of** Sentence in Iudgemente **without** Acte: **or, of perſite** Acte **without** Sentence: **or, howe the** Sentence **of the** Iudge **maie be true, if the** Acte be falſe: **or, howe the** Acte **maie be right, if the** Sentence **be wronge. For the** Acte **is a direction to the** Sentence: **and the** Sentence **groweth vpon the** Acte. **For your credites ſake, leaue theſe toies, M. Hardinge. Yée haue vſed them ouer longe. They are to childiſhe for a childe: they becomme not your grauitie: they deceiue the ſimple.**

In déede, I can eaſily beléeue, that neither Sotus **nor** Hoſius **was euer ſo wicked, to ſaie, that** Chriſte vvas rightly, and vvoorthily donne to deathe. **How be it, he that ſaithe,** The Sentence of deathe, pronounced in Councel againſte Chriſte, vvas iuſte, and true **ſéemeth in déede to ſaie no leſſe. For, if the** Sentence **of** Chriſtes **Deathe were iuſt, then had** Chriſte **vndoubtedly deſerued to die. The very caſe, and courſe of your Doctrine vndoubtedly forced them thus to ſaie. For, if al** councelles **be good, and holy, without exception, then muſte that alſo be a good, and a holy** Councel, **that was aſſembled againſte** God **and againſte his** Chriſte.

Hoſius in Confeſſione Petriconien. Cap. 29.

Hoſius **your Doctoure, to make the mater plaine, ſaith thus,** Iudáſne ſit, an Petrus, an Paulus, Deus attendi non vult: Sed ſolùm hoc, quod ſedet in Cathedra Petri, quod Apoſtolus: quod Chriſti Legatus: quod Angelus eſt Domini exercituum: de

cuius

The Sprite of Truth in Annas and Caiphas.

cuius ore Legem requirere iussus es. Hoc solum spectari vult. Si Iudas est, quandoquidem Apostolus est, nihil te moueat, quòd Fur est: God *wil neuer haue thee consider, whether the* Pope be a Iudas, *or a* Peter, *or a* Paule. *It is sufficiente, onely that he sitteth in* Peters Chaire: *that he is an* Apostle: *that he is* Christes Embassadoure: *that he is the* Angel of the Lorde of Hostes: *from whose mouthe thou arte commaunded to require the Lawe. This thing onely* Christe *woulde haue thee to consider. Be he* Iudas: *for as mutche as he is an* Apostle, *let it not moue thee, though he be a* Theefe.

But Caiphas **saide,** *It is good, that one man die for the people, lesse al the people perishe. Ergo,* **saie you,** Caiphas **had the Sprite of God. Alas, M. Hardinge, although you little passe for your** Diuinitie, **yet why haue you nomore regarde vnto your** Logique? **Euery childe knoweth, that this is a** Paralogismus, **or a deceiteful kinde of reasoninge, called** Fallacia Accidentis. **And, that yée maie the better espie your ouersighte, Like as yée saie,** Caiphas **prophesied blindly, him selfe not vnderstandinge what he saide,** *Ergo,* **he had the holy Ghoste: Euen so maie yée saie,** Balaams Asse **reproued his maister, and spake the Truthe, as Caiphas did.** *Ergo,* Balaams Asse **had the Holy Ghoste.** S. Paule **saithe,** *No man can saie,* The Lorde Iesus, *but in the* Sprite of God. **Hereof, by your** Logique, **yée maie reason thus:** The Diuel saide vnto Christ, **I knowe,** *1. Cor. 12.* **that thou arte Christe the Sonne of the Liuinge God:** *Ergo,* **the Diuel had the Sprite of God.**

It pitieth me, M. Hardinge to se your folies. Although Caiphas **vnwares, and againste his wil, by the enforcemente, & power of God, at one onely time spake wordes of Truthe, as did also** Balaams Asse, **and the** Diuel, **yet it followeth not, that we shoulde therefore at al times renne to** Caiphas **to seeke the Truthe.**

S. Augustine **saithe,** Quando Deus voluit, etiam mutum iumentum rationabiliter loquutum est. Nec ideò admoniti sunt homines, in deliberationibus suis, etiam Asinina expectare Consilia: *When it pleased* God, Balaams Asse, *being a doumbe beast, was hable to speake as a man. Yet are not men therefore commaunded, in al their Consultations, and doubtful cases to seeke* Coun sel of an Asse. *Aug. Ep. 51.*

As for the Lies, Shames **and** Sclaunders, **yée would so liberally laie vpon vs, it maie please you, to take them freely home againe. If yée be ful freight, and haue stoare sufficiente of your owne, yet maie you diuide them emonge your poore** Louanian Brethren **It shalbe a worke of Supererogation. For ye wisse, they haue of theire owne ynough already. To conclude, your whole drifte herein is, to force your Reader, to haue a good opinion of** Annas, **and** Caiphas, **that condemned Christe to die the deathe: for that, as** Hosius **saithe, they had the** Sprite of Prophesie, **the** Holy Ghost, **and the** Sprite of Truth **and therefore coulde not erre in theire Iudgemente.**

The Apologie, Cap. 7. Diuision. 1.

But will theise menne (I saie) reforme vs the Churche, **beinge themselues bothe the Persons guilty, and the Iudges too? Will they abate theire owne Ambition, and theire Pride? Will they ouerthrowe theire owne causes, and geeue sentence againste them selues, that they muste leaue of to be vnlearned** Bishoppes, **Slowbellies, Heapers together of Benefices, takers vpon them as Princes, and Men of Warre? Will the** Abbates, **the** Popes **deere darlinges iudge that** Monke **for a Theefe, whiche laboureth not for his liuinge: and that it is againste al Lawe, to suffer suche a one to liue, and to be founde either in Cittie, or in Countrie, al of other mennes charges? Or els, that a** Monke **ought to lie on the grounde, to liue hardely with Herbes, and Pease, to studie earnestly, to Argue, to Praie, to Worke with hande, and fully to bend him selfe, to comme to the Ministerie of the** Churche? **In faith, as soone will the** Pharisees, **and** Scribes **repaire againe the** Temple of God, **and restoare it vnto vs a House of Praier, in steede of a Denne of Theeues.**

M.

M. Hardinge.

Yee leape with a light skippe from one thinge to an other, neither dwel yee longe in any one point, but in heinge.

But ye saie, they be bothe the persons giltie, and the Iudges also. Iudges doubtlesse they be. For their vocation is lawful, ye can not disproue it, Guilty also they be, we denie not, but whereof? Of fraile liuinge, not of false teachinge (for commonly they teache nothinge). And where? In the courte of conscience, (a) not in the courte of man. Or if any of them be, both before this councel, and in this councel godly orders haue benne decreed for holesome reformation.

(a) Veritathe. For their life is notorious to the world.

As for Monkes, yee maie not looke nowe, that either they getre their liuinge onely by their hand labour, or that they be bounde to the harde discipline, whiche Monkes liued in, for twelue hundred yeeres paste. Nowe be other daies, other manners. Suche great austeritie is to be wondred at, and to be wished for. But whether the Religious men of our time be to be compelled thereto, I leaue it to wise consideration. If it maie be lawful to direct vs in suche spiritual cases, by an olde example of externe prudencie, me thinketh the discretion of Iacobs answeare to his Brother Esau is woorthy to be thought on. When Esau courteously offered his Brother Iacob retourninge from Mesopotamia with al his traine of householde and cattel to go with him, and keepe him companie, the reste of the iourney that remained from the place of their first meetinge. Iacob ful mildely saide, Syr, you knowe, if it like your Lordship, that I haue heere with me tender babes, (b) Ewes with Lambe, (b) and Kine with Calfe. If I ouerlabour them with faste goinge, my flockes wil die al in a daie. Maie it please your Lordship to goe before me your seruaunt? I will folowe after the flocke faire and softe, so as I shall see my litle ones able to beare it. Gene 33.

(b) M. Harding likeneth his Monkes to droaues of Cattel.

Likewise if there be not a discrete moderation vsed, but al Monkes be rigorously driuen to the austeritie of life, they liued in of olde time, in this so great looseneste of manners, specially the discipline of al religions beinge so farre slaked in comparison of the auntiente feueritie, it is to be feared, wee shal rather see Cloisters forsaken (which God graunt), then a godly reformation procured (which wil neuer be).

In the ende of this Paragraph, ye shewe your selfe to despaire of our amendement. God geeue you grace so to doo for your parte, as wee maie haue good cause to hope better of you. But whether we amend our faultes, or otherwise, what perteineth that to the iustification of your newe Gospel, and to the disproofe of the Catholike Faithe by vs defended? You knowe, it is no good argument *à moribus ad Doctrinam*. Who would not hisse you, and trampe you out of schooles, if ye made this foode reason: The Papistes liues be faultie, *Ergo* theire teachinge is false? To this heade al the reasons of your Apologie in effect maie be reduced: and they holde *Per locum topicum nouis Euangely à malis moribus.* (c) Doth not Christe him selfe confute al suche your feble reasons, where he saithe, The Scribes, and Pharisees sitte in the chaire of Moises, what so euer they saie to you, doo yee, but after their woorkes doo yee not? Matth. 23

(c) Here M. Harding comparcth the Pope and his bishops with the Scribes and Phanicis.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Yée saie, If your Monkes, and Freeres shoulde nowe be forced to keepe the olde Discipline, and seueritie of their Fundations, they woulde rather breake their Cloisters, and leaue altogeather. And therefore by a fitte comparison, yée resemble them to the beauy droaues of Iacobs Cattell. Whereby ye séeme secretely to géeue vs to imagine, that the Monkes cowle is not alwaies so holy a weede, as is pretended. S. Hierome describinge the life, and order of Monkes in his time, saithe thus, Nihil arrogant sibi de continentia supercilij. Humilitatis inter omnes contentio est. Quicunque nouissimus fuerit, hic primus putatur. In veste nulla discretio: nulla admiratio. Vtcunque placuerit incedere, nec detractionis est, nec laudis. Ieiunia neminem subleuant: nec defertur inediæ: nec moderata saturitas condemnatur. Suo Domino stat vnusquisque, aut cadit. Nemo iudicat alterum, ne à Domino iudicetur: *They bragge not of their sole, or Single life. All their contention is, who maie be moste humble. Who so euer is laste, he is compted firste. There is neither difference, nor woonderinge in Apparel. How so euer it pleaseth a man to goe, he is neither sclaundered for it, nor commended. No man is auaunced for his Fasting. Neither is abstinence praised, nor sobre refreashing condemned. Eche man either standeth, or falleth to his Lorde. No man iudgeth other, leaste of the Lorde he him selfe be Iudged.*

Hierony. ad Marcellam, vt commigret Bethlehem.

But (yée saie) your Monkes nowe a daies are waxen nice, and cranke. Suche extreame rigoure, and seueritie they maie not beare.

Suche Holy meme they were, of whom Sulpitius Seuerus writeth: Sedentes munera expectant, atque omne vitæ decus mercede corruptum habent dum quasi venalem præ se ferunt sanctimoniam: *Theise* Freeres *sitte stil, and looke for monie: and haue al the bewtie of their life corrupted with hiere, sittinge theire holinesse out to sale.* Of suche Holy Persons, S. Hierome telleth vs, Post cœnam dubiam Apostolos somniant: *After they haue well filled theire bellies, they dreame of the Apostles.* In like sorte, he writeth of certaine

Sulpitius Seuerus in Chronico. Hierony. ad Eustochiũ de Virginita. seruanda.

Munkes Freeres Nunnes.

taine Monkes: Apud hos affectata sunt omnia: Laxæ manicæ: Caligæ follicantes: Vestis crassior: Crebra suspiria: Visitatio virginum: Detractio Clericorum: Et si quando Dies Festus venerit, saturantur ad vomitum: *Emonge theise menne, all things are counterfeite: Their wide sleeues: their greate Bootes: their course gowne: theire often sighes: theire Visitinge of Virgines: their Backbitinge of Priestes. And if there come a Holy Daie, they eate, vntill they be faine to perbrake.* This, no doubt, is that holynesse that Christe brought into the worlde. *In eadem Epist. ad Eustochium.*

Nicolaus Cusanus, a Cardinall of the Churche of Rome, thus setteth out the whole Life, and Holinesse of your Monkes: Apud plures non nisi habitus extrinsecus remansit, & nihil de Spiritu Fundatoris: *In the moste parte of them there appeareth only an outward shewe in theire apparell: but they haue leste them selues no parte of their Founders Sprite.* *Nicolaus Cusan. Excita. Libr. 9. Anima.*

Againe he saithe, Fallacia illorum, qui sub habitu Christi apparent, vix potest sciri, ob suam varietatem. Nam alius quidem sub hac veste, alius sub alia, alius sub capitio, alius sub hoc Religionis signo, alius sub alio se Christo militare asserit: Licet penè omnes non quæ Christi, sed quæ sua sunt, quærant. Omnes enim studeant auaritiæ à maximo vsque ad minimum: *The falsehed of them, that walke vnder the apparell of Christe can hardely be knowen. They are so diuerse. For they all saie, they serue Christe, One vnder one weede, an other vnder an other: One vnder a Cowel, an other vnder a Hoode: One vnder one badge of Religion, and an other vnder an other. Notwithstandinge, the whole sorte of them, for the moste parte, seeke theire owne, and not, that perteyneth to Iesus Christe. For they are all bente to couetousnesse, euen from the greatest to the least.* *Nicola. Cusanus Excita. Libr. 7. Moneta.*

Theise are your Monkes, M. Harding: This is their holynesse. They haue no part of their Founders Sprite: They seeke their owne: They seeke not the glorie of Christe.

But your lyse (ye saie) is no preiudice to your Faithe: How soeuer you liue, yet is your Doctrine right good and Catholique: And that ye proue by the wordes of Christe: The Scribes and Pharisees sit on Moses Chaire. *Whatsoeuer they say to you, do yee, but after their woorkes doe yee not.* If this be the best claime, ye can holde by, then suffer vs, M. Harding, to saie to you, as Christ sometime said to them, whom yee confesse to be your Fathers: *Woe be vnto you, ye* Scribes, and Pharisees, yee Hipocrites. Ye deuoure and rauen vp poore VVidowes houses, *vnder the colowre of longe praier. Outwardly ye seeme Holy: but within yee are full of Hipocrisie and wickednesse.* *Matha. 23.* *In eod. Capite.*

S. Augustine saithe vnto the Olde Heretiques, called the Manichees: Dicitis, non oportere omninò quæri, quales sunt homines, qui vestram sectam profitentur: sed qualis sit ipsa professio. Quid vobis fallacius, quid insidiosius, quid malitiosius dici aut inueniri potest: *Ye saie, we maie not examine, what men they be, that professe your Sect: but only what is their profession. What thing can there be founde more false, more deceyteful, more malicious, than you are?* *Augusti. De morib. Manicha. lib. 2. ca. 19. & 20.*

Thus saide S. Augustine to the Manichees: Take heede M. Hardinge, leste the same maie be saide to somme of you.

The Apologie. Cap. 7. Diuision. 2.

There haue ben, I know, certain of their owne companions, which haue founde faulte with many errours in the Churche, as Pope Adrian, Aeneas Syluius, Cardinal Poole, Pigghius, and others, as is afore saide: they held afterwardes their Councel at Tridente, in the selfe same place, where it is now appointed. There assembled many Bishops, and Abbates, and others, whome it behoued for that matter. They were alone by them selues: whatsoeuer they did, no body gainsaid it: for they had quite shut out & barred our side from al maner of assemblies: and there they sat sixe yeres feeding folkes with a marueilous expectation of theire doinges. The first sixe Monethes, as though it were greatly nedeful, they made many Determinations of the Holy Trinitie, of the Father, of the Sonne, and of the Holy Ghoste, which were godly things in deede, but not so necessary for that time. Let vs see, in all that while, of so many, so manifest, so

The Ferdome of the Councel of Trident.

often confessed by them, and so euident Errours, what one Errour haue they amended? From what kinde of Idolatrie haue they reclaimed the people? What Superstition haue they taken awaie? What peece of their tyrannie, and Pompe haue they diminished? As though al the worlde maie not nowe see, that this is a Conspiracie, and not a Councel: & that theise Bishops, whom the Pope hath nowe caled togeather, be wholly sworne and becomme bounde to beare him their faitheful allegiaunce, and wil doo no manner of thinge, but that they perceiue pleaseth him, and healpeth to auance his Power, and as he wil haue it: Or that they recken not of the number of mens voices, rather then of the weight, and value of the same: Or, that Might, there doth not oftētimes ouercome Right.

M. Hardinge.

As you procede, you talke your pleasure of the godly and learned Fathers assembled in the late Councel of Trent. By the waie, as your maner is, you drop lies. Of which one is, that they had quite shut out, & barred your side from al maner of assemblies: (a) which is a foule lie. That the first six moneths, they occupied themselues with making many determinations of the Holy Trinitie, that also is an other lie. For then the worlde had no neede of any newe determinations or decrees, concerning the Trinitie: what it shall haue hereafter by occasion of your chiefe Maister Iohn (b) Caluines doctrine, it is more feared, then yet perceiued.

Where ye would fayne see of so many, so manyfest, so often confessed by them selues, and so euidente errours, what one errour they haue amended: they are not like to satisfie youre longinge. And yet they haue taken order for the amendement (c) of so many, as they know. Neither is any of the same about any pointe of our faith, but about things of lesse weyght. Your exaggeration of the termes, so many, so manyfest, so often confessed by them, and so euidente, reporteth in one sentence your so many, so manifeste, so often confuted by vs, and so euident lies. When you folowe your hoate humoure, and aske, from what kinde of Idolatry the Fathers of the Tridentine Councel haue reclaimed the people, you go to farre. What soeuer blasphemie ye vtter in Bookes and Sermons against the Adoration of the blessed Sacramente of the Aulter, wee knowe no kynde of Idolatrie vsed in the Churche. (d) Neither is any Idolatrie committed by vs in woorshipping of Saincts, in praying to them, nor in the reuerence we exhibite to their Images, as ye beare the people in hande. (e) As I can not well take a heare from youre lying bearde, so wishe I, that I coulde plucke malice from your blasphemous harte.

(a) Vntruthe manyfeste, as hereafter it shal appeare.
(b) A scleuros Vntruth. For M. Caluin was euer an enimie vnto the Arians.
(c) Vntruthe most impudēt. For their own confessed and knowne Errors they neuer once touched.
(d) Vntruth cō fessed by M. Hardinges owne Felowes. Reade the Answeare.
(e) O profound Diuinitie.

The Bishop of Sarisbury.

Whether the Learned menne of our side were shut out from the right, and libertie of your Councel, or no, it maie soone appeare, partly by that is already saide: partly by that shalbe saide hereafter. Verily, the Pope, for his Premunire, wil not suffer any Bishop, to geeue voice in Councel, onlesse he haue him firste solemnely sworne to the See of Rome: and therefore they be al called his Creatures. So Cicero saith, Verres, when he had bribed, and spoiled the whole Ile land of Sicilia, thought it not good, to suffer his name, or any part of his doinges to come in hazarde, but onely before a Iudge, or Arbiter of his owne.

Therefore, the Frenche Kinges Embassadoure, as it is saide before, protested thus openly euen in your saide Councel, Minùs legitima, minusque libera dicuntur fuisse illa Concilia quæ aderant, ad voluntatem alterius semper loquebantur: *Those* Councelles *are counted neither so free, nor so laweful, as they ought to be: they that were there, spake euermore to please an* other: (by which Other, he meante the Pope.)

And for that cause, the Emperours Maiestie, by his Embassadoure Hurtadus Mendoza solemnely protested against the assemblie of the same Councel. His wordes be these: Ego Iacobus Hurtadus Mendoza, nomine Pientissimi, & Inuictissimi Domini mei, Caroli Cæsaris Romani Imperatoris, ex illius speciali mandato, ac nomine totius Sacri Romani Imperij, aliorumque Regnorum, ac Dominiorū suorum protestor, Nullam posse esse Authoritatem assertorum legatorum Sanctitatis Vestræ, & eorum Episcoporum, qui sunt Bononiæ, Sanctitati vestræ maiori ex parte obnoxiorum, atque ab illius nutu omnino pendentium, vt in Religionis, & morum Reformationis causa, &c. Legem præscribant: I James Hurtado Mendoza, *in the name of the moste godly, and moste mighty Prince my Lorde* Charles, the Romaine Emperoure, *by his special Commission, and in the name of the* whole Romaine Empiere, *and al others his Realmes, and Dominions doo protest, that the Authoritie*

Parte. 1. Dimis. 19.
Part 6. ca. 8. Diuis. 1.
Cic. in Verā actione. 1.
In Con. Trident.
An. 1562.
Anno. 1547.
Citatur ab Illyrico in Protestatione cōtra Cōcil. Trident.

The placing of Embassadours.

ritie of the pretensed Legates of youre holinesse, and of suche other Bishoppes, *as he nowe at* Bononia, (**vnto whiche towne the** Councell **of** Tridente **was then adiourned,**) *for the moste parte bound vnto youre Holinesse, and wholy hangeinge vpon youre becke, is of no force, namely to make Lawes in cause of Reformation of Religion, and maners.*

And that it maie appeare, in what obedience, and seruile subiection, al Bishoppes **be vnto the** Pope, Aeneas Syluius, **otherwise called** Pope Pius **the Second, saithe thus,** Quòd si Episcopus Papæ contradicat, etiam veraloquendo, nihilominus peccat contra Iuramentum Papæ præstitum: *If a* Bishop *speake againste the* Pope, *yea, although he speake the truthe, yet neuertheleſſe he ſinneth againſte the Othe, that he hath made vnto the* Pope. **Therefore, wher as at the late** Conference at Norenberg, **it was required by the** Princes, and States of Germaine, **that al** Bishoppes **comminge to the** Councell, **might bothe be discharged from theire Othe made to the** Pope, **and also ſworne to ſpeake, and to promote the Truthe, the** Popes Legate **there made answeare in greate disdeigne, that it might not so be:** For that so the Popes handes should be bounde. **Hereby, M. Hardinge, a blinde man maie easily se the fourme, and Fredome of your** Councelles. **If the** Bishoppes **be Free, to saie the Truthe, then is the** Pope **leaste in Bondage.**

Cassander in Cõsultatione de Cõmunione sub vtraque specie: In præfatione. Anno. 1562.

Whether youre Fathers, in the Chapter at Tridente **sate there sixe whole Monethes, debatinge, and reasoninge about the** Trinitie, **or no, of certaine knowledge, I cannot telle. But certainely, what thinge els they did, either in al that time, or longe after, you can hardely shewe vs. Therefore, if they did not this,** for as mutche, **as no thinge els appeareth of theire doinges, we** must imagine, **they sat mute in a Mummerie, and saide nothinge. Notwithstandinge,** Cassander **saithe, they bestowed one whole Sommer in great, and holy Disputations about meaner maters, then the** Trinitie: **I meane, onely aboute the** Communion of the Cuppe. Martinus Kemnitius **saith, They helde Disputations there and kepte greate sturre, Seuen whole Monethes together, about the** Iustification of Faithe and VVoorkes: **and yet in the ende leaste it worse, then they founde it. We saie,** You **youre selues haue espied many disorders in your Church of Rome,** as it is plain **by your owne Confessions. To recken them al in particular, it were to long. I haue partly touched them heretofore.** Albertus Pighius **confesseth, there be** Abuses **in your** Masse: **The** Frenche Kinges Embassadour **at your late** Tridentine Chapter, **saithe thus,** Vel Præfectorum Ecclesiæ incuria, vel etiam (ne quid grauius dicã) præpostera Pietate, irrepsisse in Ecclesiam res nonnullas Antiquatione. Abrogatione, vel Moderatione dignas, fateamur necesse est: *Wee muſt nedes confeſſe, that either by the negligence of the Biſhops, or by ſom diſordred opinion of Holineſſe (for I wil saie no more:* **he meaneth falsehed, & Pockerie, and Wilful Auarice**) *certain things are brought into the* Churche, *woorthy either to be put awaie, and aboliſhed, or at leaſte, to be qualified.*

Concil. Tridt. Pag. 638. Albert. Pighius. In controuer. De Miſſ. primã. In Con. Tridem. an. 1562

Picus Mirandula **besoughte** Pope Leo. 10 **to abate the vaine Multitude of youre** Ceremonies: **to reforme youre** Praiers: **and to cut of youre** Fables.

Picus Mirãdula ad Leonẽ Pp. 10. In Con. Lateran.

One of youre owne Louanian Felowes **saithe,** *Euen nowe a daies, many good menne miſlike ſo many* Appeales to Rome: **Somme others finde faulte with your** Pardonnes: **Somme with youre** Simonie: **somme with youre** Stewes: **somme with youre licencious keepinge, and mainteininge of** Concubines.

Copus dialo. 1. pag. 115.

I wil not enlarge the mater further. These, and other like thinges are confessed by youre selues. Other greater maters I wil not touche. For in cases of Faithe, for youre credites sake, ye maie graunte no maner Errour. For, otherwise it might be thought, ye haue neither the Faithe, nor the Life of Christan menne.

Now therefore tel vs, M. Hardinge, what one Abuse **of al the** Abuses **in your** Masse **what one Disorder, or Deformitie, of so many Disorders, and Deformities in youre Churche: What one vaine** Ceremonie: **What one Childishe** Fable: **What** Appeale to Rome: **What** Simonie: **What** Pardonne: **What** Stewes: **What** Courteghianes: **What** Concubins **haue ye reformed: If ye reuerence not those grosse, & sensible Abuses, that ye se with your eies: how then wil ye redresse other more secrete maters, that pertaine onely to Faithe, and be not seene? If ye wil not reforme youre open** Stewes, **whe wil ye reform the** Churche of God? **But ye are bold to assure vs, that there is no kind of Idolatrie, nor euer was any in your whole** Church of Rome. **Notwithstanding**

some others of your best Lerned Frends haue thought otherwise, as it shal appeare.

Epiph. lib. 3. In Oratione De Fide catholica.

Οἱ εἰδωλα μὴ σεβελυσόμενοι εἰδώλους δὲ πρὸς κυνοῦνται.

Epiph. cõtra Collyridian.

Bembus in epist. ad Carolum. 5.

Lipomanus Pagin. 289.

Aug. contra Faustum. li. 20. Cap. 21.

Polyd. Vir. De inuentoribus rerum. Li. 6. cap. 13

Ludo. Viues in li. de ciuitate Dei.

Catharinus in libello de Imaginibus.

Jacob. Nanclantus in Epist. ad Roma. Cap. 1.

Iaco. Payua lib. 9. Fortalitii Fidei.

Rob. Holcot In libru Sapientie. Lectione. 158.

Aug. de ver. De secunda Mat. Ser. 6

August. ad Quodvultdeum.

Paul. Vene. li. 3. cap. 27

Firste, Epiphanius **saithe of certaine** Persians, **named** Magusæi, Idola quidem detestantur: tamen Idolis cultum exhibent: *They abhorre the sight of* Idolles: *yet they fal downe, and worshyp* Idolles. **And what if a man would saie the same of your** Clergie **of** Rome? **Uerily, notwithstandinge ye would seeme to mislike of** Idolles, **yet youre Churches, and Chapels are ful of** Idolles. **Againe, he reporteth certaine wordes of** S. Paule, **as vttered of him by the Spirit of Prophesie,** Erunt Mortuis Cultum Diuinum prestantes, quemadmodum etiam in Israel impiè coluerunt: *They shal gene godly honor vnto dead men, like as also they did in* Israel.

What opinion ye haue had of Saintes departed, I nede not here to remember. Cardinal Bembus, **in an Epistle vnto the** Emperoure Charles 5. **calleth the** Blessed Virgine, Dominam Deam nostram: *Our Lady and Goddesse.* **Youre greate** Hercules Lipomanus **crieth out in his marginal agonie,** Ecce quàm potentissima est Sancta Dei genitrix: & quomodò nullus salnus fieri possit nisi per eam: *Behold how mighty ye the holy Mother of God, and howe noman maie be saued, but by her.* **If this be not manifest** Idolatrie, **it maie please you to giue it somme other name.**

It seemeth, this Errour beganne to springe longe sithence, euen in the time of the Olde Fathers: and that hereof Faustus **the** Heretique **toke occasion thus to charge the** Catholiques **for the same:** Idola vertistis in Martyres: *Ye haue changed the Heathen Idols into youre Martyrs.* **Further, ye saie, the Reuerence, that ye giue vnto** Sainctes Images, **is no** Idolatrie. **Yet** Polidorus Vergilius, **speakinge hereof, saithe thus:** Quia Sacerdotes populum non docent, & vulgo ex vsu suo tacere putantur, idcirco eo insaniæ deuentum est, vt hæc pars Pietatis parùm differat ab Impietate: *For that the Priestes instruct not the people, and are thought to holde theire peace for gaines sake, the mater is brought to suche a dounge, that this parte of Deuotion differeth but litle from Extreme Wickednesse.*

And Ludouicus Viues **saithe, he seeth no greate difference betweene many Christian menne worshippinge their** Images, **& an Heathen man adouring his** Idolles. Catharinus, **one of your greate** Doctours of Tridente, **saithe thus:** An licet Adorare Imagines ipsas, & illis cultum præbere? Sunt qui hoc omnino negent, & clament, esse Idololatriam. Videntur autem non futilibus Argumentis moueri: nec absque Maiorum, imo etiam Scripturarum Authoritate: *Whether is it lawful to Worshyp the very Images, or no? Somme menne saie, nay: and calle it Idolatrie. And they seeme to be moued with no light Argumentes, nor without the Authoritie, as wel of the Fathers, as of the Scriptures.*

Iacobus Nanclantus **saith,** Non solùm fatendum est, Fideles in Ecclesia Adorare coram Imagine, sed & Adorare Imaginem, sine quo volueris scrupulo: quin & eo illam venerari cultu, quo & prototypon eius. Propter quod, si illud habet Adorari Latria, & illa habet Adorari Latria: *Wee muste graunte, that the Faithefull people in the Churche, doo not onely* worshippe before the Image, *but also* worshippe the Image it selfe: *and that without any manner scruple of Conscience, whatsoeuer. And further, They* worshippe the Image with the selfe same honoure, wherewith they worshippe the thinge it selfe, that is represented by the Image. As if the thinge it selfe be worshipped with godly honoure, then must the Image it selfe likewise be worshipped with godly honour. **Hereto agreeth one other of your late Writers,** Iacobus Payua. **And an other of your like Doctours saith,** *This is the very vse, and practise of your Church of Rome.* **But** Robertus Holcote **saith,** This kinde of worshippinge, is plaine Idolatrie. **Therefore, I trowe, there hath ben some** Idolatrie **in the Church of Rome. Ye will saie,** Yee knowe the Image is no God. **And this ye thinke, is ynough sufficient. But so lykewise saide the** Heathens of their Idolles: **and yet, as** S. Augustine **saithe, they were Idolaters notwithstanding.**

Ye will saie, *It is the Image of an Apostle of Christ, or of God himselfe, and therefore it can be no Idolatrie.* **But** S. Augustine **saith:** Marcellina colebat Imaginem Iesu, & Pauli, & Homeri, & Pythagoræ, Adorando, Incensumq; ponendo: Marcellina *Worshipped the Image of Iesus, and of* Paule, *and of* Homere, *and of* Pythagoras, *by kneelinge vnto them, and burninge Incense before them.* **Yet nevertheless, she was an** Idolater. **The** Saracenes **this daie make theire Sacrifices in** Mount Mecha, **not to** Diuels, **or** Heathen Gods: **But to** Abraham, **to** Isaac, **and to** S. Thomas: **yet are they not therefore excused of**

Idola-

Idolatrie. Gregorius the Bishop of Nyssa, S. Basiles Brother, saith thus: Qui Creaturam Adorat, etsi in Nomine Christi id faciat, tamen Simulachrorum Cultor est, Christi nomē Simulachro imponens: *He that worshippeth a Creature, notwithstanding he doo it in the Name of Christe, yet is he a woorshipper of Images, as geeuinge the name of Christ vnto an Image.* By these fewe, M. Hardinge, it may seme appeare, that your Churches are not voide of all Idolatrie. *Gre. Nysse. In Orat. funebri de Placilla.*

The Apologie. Cap. 7. Division. 3.

And therfore we know, that diuers tymes many good men, and Catholique Bishops did tarrie at home, and would not come, when sutche Councels were called, wherin men so apparently laboured to serue factions, and to take parts, bicause they knew, they should but lose their trauaile, and do no good, seeing whervnto theyr enimies mindes were so wholly bente. Athanasius denied to come, when he was called by the Emperour to his Councel at Cæsaria, perceyuing plainly he should but come emong his enimies, which deadly hated him. The same Athanasius whē he came afterwarde to the Councel at Syrmium, and foresaw what would be the ende, by reason of the outrage, and malice of his enimies, he packed vp his carriage, and went away immediately. Iohn Chrysostome, although the Emperour Constantius, commaunded him by foure sundry letters, to come to the Arians Councel, yet kept he himself at home still. Whē Maximus, the Bishop of Hierusalem, sate in the Councel of Palestine, the Old Father Paphnutius tooke him by the hande, and ledde him out at the doores, saieing: It is not lawfull for vs to conferre of these matters with wicked men. The Bishops of the East would not come to the Syrmian councel, after they knew, Athanasius had gotten himselfe thence againe. Cyril called menne back by letters from the Councel of them, whiche were named Patropassians, Paulinus, Bishop of Trier, and many others moe, refused to comme to the Councel at Millaine, when they vnderstoode, what a sturre, and rule Auxentius keapte there: for they sawe, it was in vaine to goe thither, where not reason, but faction shoulde preuaile: and where folke contended, not for the Truthe, and right iudgemente of the mater, but for Partialitie, and Fauour. *Histor. Tripart. lib. 10. cap 13. Euseb. Li. 1. cap. 17.*

And, al be it those Fathers had sutche malicious and stiffe necked enimies, yet if they had come, they should haue had free speach at leaste in the Councelles.

M. Hardinge.

Firste, here I note the falsehed of the Lady enterpreter, who turneth the Latine speaking of Athanasius, *Cùm vocatus esset ab Imperatore ad Concilium Cæsariense:* When he was called by the Emperoure to *his* Councel at Cæsarea. Where by addinge the woorde *his*, of her owne, shee or a worse shrew vnder her name, goeth aboute to perswade, as Heretiques doo, that the Councels be to be accompted the Councels of Temporal Princes, not of Bishoppes: and that they be the heades of them, not the Bishop of Rome. This muche to her. Nowe Sir to you Defender. Al these examples serue you to no pourpose. It is not denied you but that in eases, menne maie refuse to comme to Councels. Your examples declare, that Catholique Bishoppes shunned to come vnto the vnlawful Councels of Heretiques. But ye holding strange opinions, condemned by the Churche, denie to come to the lawfull Councels of Catholike Bishoppes. When yee haue proued vs to be Heretiques, I meane the Fathers of the late Councel, then maie yee iustly alleage the example of Athanasius, Chrysostome, Maximus, Paphnutius, Cyril, Paulinus, and suche other, for not commynge to the Councel.

* And why not as wel as M. Hardinge may call the whole Churche the Popes Vineyard? pa. 283. b Or, al the Bishops through the worlde, the Popes Sheepe? Page. 308. b.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Had you not had a fine wit, M. Harding, and a very good liking of the same, yee coulde neuer haue made your selfe so great sporte of so smal a mater. The Lady interpreter pitieth your case, and wisheth you a litle more discretion: and would

be mutche ashamed to answeare your folies.

If the Councel, we speake of, were not the Emperoures Councel, then much lesse was it the Popes Councel. For in those daies, as hereafter it shalbe declared more at large, Councelles were summoned by Emperoures, and not by Popes. And what reason haue you to shew vs, that the Councel, being summoned by the Emperoure, might not be called the Emperours Councel, as wel, as the Pope, being admitted, & allowed by the Emperour, might be called the Emperours Priest? Odoacer, in the third Councel of Rome, in the time of Pope Symmachus, said thus: Miramur, prætermisis nobis, quicquam fuisse tentatum: Cùm etiam Sacerdote nostro superstite, nihil sine nobis debuisset assumi: *We marueile, that any thinge was attempted without our knowledge: for as mutche as,* Our Priest (*he meaneth the Pope*) *beinge alme, nothinge maie be donne without vs.* As the Pope maie be called the Emperours Priest, so maie the Councel be called the Emperors Councel, without any impeachment of Christian Faithe. Againe, why might not a General Councel holden in Rome, be called the Emperours Councel, as wel as a General Councel holden in Fraunce, might be called the Kings Councel? Gerson, speaking of a Councel holden in Parise, saithe thus, Infamare Regem cum General: Concilio suo conati sunt: *They sought to diffame the Kinge with* His General Councel. It was a General Councel, and a Councel of Bishoppes: And yet was it called the Kinges Councel. Liberatus saithe, Flauianus Episcopus Eutychem ad Concilium Suum venire præcepit: Flauianus *the Bishop* (not of Rome, but of Antioche) *commaunded* Eutyches *to comme to* his *Councel.* Hereafter, M. Hardinge, ye maie take time, to studie for some better quarrel. Surely this was very simple.

In Concil. Roman. 3. sub Symmacho. pp.

Gerson. Trilogus in Materia Schismatis. Liberat. Cap. 11.

Ye excuse Athanasius, Chrysostomus, Maximus, Paphnutius, Hilarius, Cyrillus, Paulinus, and other Learned Bishoppes, and holy Fathers, for not appearinge at General Councelles: for that they were summoned to appeare before Heretiques. As for the Fathers of your late Tridentine Chapter, what so euer they were, ye must in any wise calle them Catholiques. Yet notwithstandinge, ye maie remember, that by such god Catholiques, as you be, the same holy Fathers, Athanasius, Chrysostomus, Maximus, Paphnutius, Hilarius, Cyrillus, Paulinus and others were called Heretiques. Hilarius saithe, Congreget nunc Auxentius, quas volet in me Synodos, & Hæreticum me, vt sæpe iam fecit, publico titulo proscribat: *Nowe let* Auxentius, *the Arian Heretique, calle what Councelles he liste against me: and by open Proclamations let him publishe me for an Heretique, as he hath often times donne already.* The Arian Heretiques saide, that the Catholique Christians, whome they called Homousians, whiche in their meaning was as mutche, as Heretiques, were the cause of al diuision.

Hilarius contra Arianos, & Auxentium Theodo. Li. 2. cap. 3.

S. Hierome saithe vnto Marcus, Hæreticus sum: quid ad te? Quiescam iam dictum est: *I am an Heretique: What is that to thee? Holde your peace: yet haue tolde your tale.* By like right, Christe him selfe, by certaine your Anciente Fathers, was called a Samaritane, a Deceiuer of the people, and an Heretique. And, if it maie please you soberly, and aduisedly to consider the mater, ye shal finde throughout the whole Body of the Scriptures that no people made euer so greate crakes of the Churche, as they, that were the deadly Enimies of the Churche: nor none were so ready to condemne others of Heresie, as they, that in deede were them selues the greatest Heretiques.

Hieron. Ad Marcum presbyterum Celedensem.

The Apologie, Cap. 1. Diuision. 1.

But nowe, sithence none of vs maie be suffered so mutche as to sitte, or once to be seene in these mennes meetinges, mutche lesse suffered to speake freely our minde: and seing the Popes Legates, Patriarches, Archbishops, Bishops, and Abbates, al being conspired together, al linked together in one kinde of fault, and al bound by one othe, sit alone by them selues, and haue power alone to greue theire consente: and at last, when they haue al donne, as though they had donne nothinge, bringe al their opinions to be iudged at the wil, and pleasure of the Pope, being but one man, to thende he maie pronounce his owne sentence of him selfe, who

ought

ought rather to haue answered to his complaint: sithens also the same Ancient, and Christian libertie, which of al right should specially bee in Christian Councelles, is nowe vtterly taken awaie from the Councel: for these causes, I saie, wise and good menne ought not to marueile at this daie, though we do the like now, that, they see, was done in times past in like case, of so many Fathers and Catholique Bishoppes: which is, though we chuse rather to sit at home, and leaue our whole cause to God, then to iourney thither, where as wee neither can haue place, nor be hable to doo any good: where as we can obteine no audience: where as Princes Embassadours be but vsed as mocking stockes: and where as also we be al condemned already before trial: as though the mater wer afore hande dispatched, and agreed vpon.

M. Hardinge.

If I wist, yee would take my counsel in good parte, and listen vnto it, as it standeth you vpon, I would aduise you to cal in al the bookes of your Apologie, and that with no lesse diligence then yee wente aboute to suppresse the Bookes of my answeare to M. Iuelles chalenge, at their first comming abroade. That done, to caste bruites abrode, that the Apologie was made and counterfeited by some crafty Papiste, to bringe you quite out of credite with al the world. So might ye perhaps in time recouer some parte of your lost estimation. For whiles your Bookes be in mennes handes, they shalbe an eudent witnesse to al the worlde, of your shameleste lyinge. • A sage piece of Counsel, and mete for a Doctoure of Diuinitie.

The Booke of the Canons, and Decrees of the Councel, hath bene printed almoste in al partes of Christendome. Looke who liste, in euery Booke he shal finde three seueral solemne Safeconductes, graunted by the Councel, and confirmed by the three Popes, vnder whome the same was celebrated. Whiche Safeconductes conteine firste in moste ample wise ful Libertie, Power, Auctoritie, and assurance for al and singuler persons of al Germanie, of what degree, state, condition, or qualitie so euer they bee, that woulde come to that oecumenical and general Councel, to conferre, propounde, and treate with al freedome, of al thinges to be treated there, and to the same Councel freely, and safely to come, there to tarry and abide, and to offer and put vp Articles, so many as they thought good, as wel in writinge as by woorde, and with the Fathers, and others thereto chosen, to conferre, and without any reproches, or vpbraidinges to dispute, also at theire pleasure safely againe from thence to departe.

An extension to other Nations.

The same holy Councel in the holy Ghoste lawfully assembled, the same Legates de latere of the See Apostolike, beinge president in it, to al and singuler others, vvhiche haue not communion vvith vs in those maters, that be of Faithe, of vvhat so euer Kingedomes, Nations, Prouinces, Citties, and Places, in vvhich openly, and vvithout punishement, is preached, or taught, or beleeued the contrarie of that, vvhiche the holy Romaine Churche holdeth, geueth Faithe publique or Safeconduit, vnder the same forme, and the same vvordes, vvith vvhich it is geeuen to the Germaines. (a) A ful discrete kinde of mockery. Thei offer men libertie to come and speake: but reserue the whole iudgemente to them selues.

This beinge moste true, as the better parte of the worlde seeth, and the Bookes, and Publique instrumentes extant do witnesse, your excuse of your refusal to come to the Councel, as Bishops of other Christian Realmes did, is founde false. (a) Yee had al free libertie and securitie, graunted vnto you for that behalfe, in so ample and large maner, as mannes wit coulde deuise.

The seconde cause why yee came not, is, for that the Popes Legates, Patriarches, Archebishops, Bishops, and Abbates, al beinge conspired together, al linckted together in one kinde of faulte, and al bounde in one Othe, sitte alone by them selues, and haue power alone to geeue their consent. What is here that shoulde let you to ioine with others for procuringe vnitie and peace in Christendome? Complaine ye of the Fathers concorde and agreeing togeather? (b) That is a signe, the spirite of God, authour of Charitie and vnitie gouerneth their hartes. In that respect, they seeme to commne togeather in the holy Ghost. And in deede, had ye gone thither, your Heresies had bene confuted, your selues required to yelde, and to conforme you to the Catholique Churche: or els ye had bene anathematized, accursed, and condemned. (b) They agree togeather against God, and his Christe.

Your thirde cause is, for that the determinations, and Decrees of the Councel, be referred to the Pope. To that wee haue answeared before. The Pope confirmeth al, beinge heade ouer the Councel. (c) Dothe not the Queene so pardy confirme your actes of Parlamente, by geuinge her Roial assente vnto them at the end of the Parlament? What thinge can be done positely by a body without the heade? And who might better confirme Councels, then he, whose Faithe in pronouncinge sentence, rightly, and duely, in matters concerninge Faithe, wee are assured by Christes praier to be infallible? (c) But who made youte Pope a Kinge? And when wil he geeue his Real Consent againste him selfe.

Your fourthe cause is, for as muche as the Ancient, and Christian libertie, whiche of righte shoulde

The Popes sauecon-duit.

specially be in Christian Councels, is nowe vtterly taken away. This cause is not different from your first.

Your fifth cause is a false lye, that Princes Ambassadours be vsed, but as mockinge stockes. (d) Truthe it is, they haue moste honourable seates in all Councels. In this Councel they sate by the Legates. Euery Ambassadour hath his place there accordinge to the degree of honour, the kingdomes, Common weales, States, and Princes be of, from whence, and from whome he commeth.

(d) They are allowed a place, but touchinge iudgemente, they maie saie nothinge.

The sixte and the last cause, ye alleage for your not comminge to the Councel, is, for that yee be condemned already before trial, as though the matter were aforehand dispatched and agreed vpon. In deede (e) your heresies for the more parte be and haue bene condemned aboue a thousande yeeres paste. And therfore they are not nowe to be called to a newe triall, as though the Churche vntill this daie, hadde bene deceyued, and so many Fathers ouerseene. This notwithstanding, maie yee wel saie, touching that pointe, your matter is aforehande dispatched and agreed vpon. For they knowe what yee can say, and see, that ye saie nothing, but onely stande wilfully and stubbornely in your false opinions and fleshly pleasures.

(e) Vntruthe, without any coloure of honeste shame.

The Bishop of Sarisbury.

Wee neuer suppressed any of your Bookes M. Harding, as you knowe: but are very wel contented, to see them so common, that as nowe, children maie playe with them in the Streats. Your manifest Vntruthes: your Simple Conclusions: your often contrarieties to your selfe: your newe found Authoures: your Childish Fables: your Vncourteous Speaches: your rackinge, Corruptinge, & Misreportinge of the Doctours therein conteined, haue mutche bewraied the miserable feblenesse of your cause. Youre Fellowes haue no cause, greately to glorie in suche healpes: nomore then in other your like Pamflettes, vnmete of any wise man to be answeared. This was your onely, and special policie, in the time of your late Kingdome. We suppressed, and called in, & burnt al our Writinges, what so euer, yea, the very Testament and Gospel of Christe, truely translated into Englishe, naminge them heretical, and Vnlawful Bookes. And, if any man had conceled, & keapte vnto him self for his comforte, any suche Booke written by any of our side, by moste terrible, & bloudy Proclamations, we made it Felonie. So mutche we dispaired, and doubted your owne folies.

As for the Bookes of our Apologie, they haue benne spreade so farre, and printed so often, in Latine, in Italian, in Frenche, in Duitche, in Englishe, that, as nowe, it were harde to suppresse them. Touchinge the shamelesse lyinge, wherewith ye charge vs, wee are wel content to stande to the Iudgement of the wise. Certainely, it shameth vs mutche, to see so litle shame in youre Writinges.

Ye saie, The Pope gaue out his Saueconducte to al the Princes, and Free Cities, and to the whole people of Germanie, to come to the Councel, to propound, to dispute at their pleasure, and when they should think it good, freely and safely, to return with a large Extension to other Nations, as yee saie, to like purpole.

But firste, M. Harding, what safetie can there be in his Saueconducte, that is not hable to saue him selfe? Pope Eugenius the fourthe, if he had comme to the Councel of Basile, as you knowe, had benne quite deposed from his Popedome, al his Sauecondactes notwithstanding. Pope Iohn. 22 gaue out as sure a Sauecondacte for the Councel of Constance, as Pope Pius could diuise any for your late Chapter of Tridente. Yet notwithstanding al his Safetie, beinge him self presente in the Councel, he was pulled out of Peters Chaire, and deprined of his Dignitie, & stripte out of his Pontificalibus, and turned home againe in his Minoribus, and alowed onely to be a Cardinal, and no lenger to be a Pope. Ye mate remember, Cicero saithe, Qui multorum Custodem se profiteatur, eum sapientes sui primùm capitis aiunt Custodem esse oportere: *Wise menne saie, Who so wil take vpon him to saue others, ought firste to saue him selfe.*

Concil. Basilien. Session. 3. & 4. Concil. Constan. Session. 23. 4.

Cicero, Philip. 12

And what credit may wee geue to your Sauecondactes? Iacobus Nachiantes, the Bishop of Chioca, for that he had stumped out one halfe worde of truth to the misliking of the Legates, was fain to ren to Rome, to creepe to the Popes feete, & to craue Pardon. Ye shamefully betraied, and cruelly murthered Iohn Husse, and Hieronymus Pragensis in your Councel of Constance. Neither the Protection of the Emperoure, nor the Popes Sauecondacte was hable to saue them. No, youre selues haue already ruled the case in your saide Councel For this ye saie, Fides nõ est seruãda Hæreticis: *Yee may holde no Faithe vnto them, that yee calle* Heretiques. Butche is the Safetie, & Libertie of your Councelles.

Illyricus in Protest. contra Concil. Tridentin. Pag. 77. Con. Const. Session. 9.

Ye saie,

The Agreemēt of the Tridentine Fathers.

Yee saie, Our Learned Men were allowed to Propound, to Talk, to Dispute. What should this auaile? For yee reserued the Determination and whole Iudgement to youre selues: and youre selues are sworne to submitte youre whole Iudgemente to the Pope, and without his Iudgement to Iudge nothing. And how maie this seeme a Free Councel where the guiltie partie shall be the Iudge.

Fabri. in Resp. ad Trid.

Yee saie, There is an extension graunted to other Nations. All this is true in deede. But this same Truthe discrieth your open Mockerie. For if yee hadde seene the Instrumente it selfe, in the ende thereof you shoulde haue founde your saide Extension restrained only to them that would Repent and Recant the Truthe of God, whiche you calle Errour, and yelde themselues thrall vnto the Pope.

Ioan. Sleidanus. li. 23. Anno. 1552.

Howbeit, not longe sithence, the Bishops of your saide Chapter at Trident, were very lothe to allowe any tolerable Saueconduite at all, eyther to the Germaines or to any others.

But yee saie, if wee hadde comme to your Chapter, wee had bene Confounded. No doubtes, by the reuerend authoritie of your Amphilochius, your Abdias, your Leontius, or some other like Doctours, whom yee haue so lately raakt out of your Thanuels, or at least by your Firy Argumentes of Swordes and Faggottes: For such proues must helpe you when others fayle.

As for the gaie stuffe, that your Tridentine Fathers, after they? Mature Deliberation, as they calle it, and more than twentie yeares studie, haue sente vs oute lately into the worlde, it is to simple to mocke Children. Hadde they not bene men impudente, and voide of all shame, they woulde rather haue stolen home secretely in the darke, and haue vttered nothing.

We finde no fault with you, M. Harding, for that your Bishops, and Abbates agree togeather: but for that they agree togeather, as did Herode and Pilate, the Sadducees, and Phariseis againste Christe.

Mat. 22. & 26.

Neither maie you wel vaunte youre selues of your greate agreementes. Ye maie remember, that two of the Principall Pillers of your Chapter Dominicus a Soto and Catharinus, dissented euen there openly and shamefully, and that in great poyntes of Religion: and wrote, the one mightily against the other: the one charging the other with Errour, and Heresie, and coulde neuer yet bee reconciled.

Dominicus a Soto. Catharinus.

Notwithstanding, against other points of Goddes Truthe, bothe they, and the rest toyned stoutely togeather. S. Augustine saithe, Tunc inter se concordant, quando in perniciem iusti conspirant. Non quia se amant, sed quia eum, qui amandus erat, simul oderunt: *Then they agree togeather, when they conspire to destroye the* Iuste: *not for that they them selues loue one an other: but for that they bothe hate him, whome they ought to loue.* Of suche kinde of Consente, S. Hierome, although to a farre contrary purpose, imagineth Iouinian thus to saie: Quod me damnant Episcopi, non est ratio, sed conspiratio. Nolo mihi ille, vel ille respondeat, quorum me Authoritas opprimere potest, docere non potest: *That the* Bishops *condemne me, there is no Reason in theire doings, but a Conspiracie. I woulde not that this man, or that man shoulde aunsweare mee, whiche maie oppresse mee by their Authoritie, and can not teache mee.*

August. in Psal. 36. concione. 2.

Hierony. in Apologetico ad Dominionem

Whether it bee conuenient, that the Pope, being notoriously accused of manifeste corruption in Goddes Religion, shoulde neuertheleese, be the whole and onely Iudge of ỹ same, & pronounce sentence of himself, let it be indifferently cõsidered by the wise.

The Lawe saithe, Qui iurisdictioni præest, non debet sibi Ius Dicere: *No man maie be his owne Iudge.* Suche Authoritie (yee saie, Kings haue in Parliamentes Hereof I am not able to dispute. The Princes right many times palleth by Composition: & therfore is not euermore one in al places. Howbeit, the Pope is a Bishop and not a King, and other Bishops be not his Subiectes, but his Brethren.

ff. De iurisdict. omnium Iudicum.

Your fourth Obiection is but a Cauill. Yee saie, Yee mocke not Princes Embassadours, but place them neare vnto your Legates to sitte still, I trowe, and to telle the Clocke. For beeing in Iudgement ye allowe them none. Thus yee proine their Authoritie, and allowe them Honour, and sette them aloofe, to saie nothynge. Notwithstandynge, whether the Emperoures and Princes Embassadours maie sitte so neare to the Popes Legates

gates or no, I can not tell. Verily, the Emperoure him selfe maie not be so bolde, to preasse so neere vnto the Pope. For thus it is ordered in your Booke of Ceremonies, Adnertendum est, quod locus vbi sedet Imperator, non sit altior loco, vbi tenet pedes Pontifex: *This it to be noted, that the place where the* Emperour *sitteth in* (General Councell) *be no higher, then the place, where the Pope sitteth his feete.* That is to say, the Emperour must sitte at the Popes feete stole, and no higher. And this, saithe your Magister Ceremoniarum, is a thing specially to be noted. *Cæremo. arũ Rom. lib. 1. Sect. 14. ca. 2.*

All the partes of our Religion, which you call Heresies, ye saie, are already condemned, iuste a thousande yeres paste. If all this be not true, then haue you fowly abused your penne, to sclaunder Goddes Truthe, and to beguyle the worlde. But I praie you M. Hardinge, leaue some parte of your wonte, and telle vs the Truthe. Was the Publique Ministration of the Holy Sacrament, was the Holy Communion, in bothe kindes, was the publike Order of Common prayer, in the Common knowen tongue, was the withstanding of the Ambition, and Pride of Rome condemned for Heresie so longe agoe? Howe coulde you dare thus to saie, and the same to publishe so openly, and so boldely vnto the worlde, if ye had any regarde to your sayings? Or woulde haue wonne you somme good credite, if ye coulde haue tolde vs, in what General Councel, vnder what Emperour, by what Doctours, by what Catholike Learned Fathers, these great Errours were thus condemned. As nowe ye roame vnely at large, and feede your simple Reader with your emptie Calendares, of thousandes of yeres, and speake at randonne. If it hadde benne true, ye woulde better haue shewed it: but being most vntrue, as you knowe it to be, for very shame, ye shoulde neuer haue saide it.

The Apologie. Cap. 9. Diuis. 1. & 2.

Neuertheleſſe wee can beare patiently, and quietly our owne priuate wrongs. But wherfore do they shut out Christian Kings, and good Princes from their Conuocation? Why doo they so vncourteously, or with such spite leaue them out, and as though either they were not Christian men, or else coulde not iudge, will not haue them made acquainted with the causes of Christian Religion, nor vnderstād the state of their owne Churches? Or, if the saide Kings and Princes happen to entermeddle in suche matters, and take vpon them to doo, that they may doo, that they be commaunded to doo, and ought of duetie to doo, and the same things that, we know, both Dauid and Salomon, and other good Princes haue donne, that is, if they, whiles the Pope and his prelates slugge, and sleepe, or else mischeuously withstande them, doo bridle the Priestes sensualitie, & driue them to do their duetie, and kepe them till to it: If they do ouerthrowe Idolles, if they take away Superstition, and set vp againe the true worshipping of God, why doo they by and by make an outcrie vpon them, that suche Princes trouble al, and presse by violence into an other bodies office, and doo therin wickedly and malapertly? What Scripture hath at any time forbidden a Christian Prince to be made priuie to suche causes? Who, but them selues alone, made euer any suche Lawe?

(a) Vntruthe, Vaine, and vnaduised. Reade the Answere.
(b) Vntruthe, It is not oure Doctrine. But why emboldē you the Pope, to entermeddle with Princes Offices?
(c) Your Prelates be as blame worthy, and as negligēt as the Priests.

M. Hardinge.

(a) Ye confounde the offices of the Spirituall Gouernours, and Temporall Magistraates. What Kinges and Princes maie doo, what they be commaunded to doo, and ought of ducue to doo: in Gods name lette them doo, and wel maie they so doo. Who is he, that gainesaithe? If by the presented example of Dauid and Salomon, ye (b) animate them to intermeddle with Bishoply offices, then bewaire they (saie wee) that Gods vengeance light not vpon them for suche wicked presumption, whiche lighted vpon King Ozias, for the like offence. 2. Par.

Ye teache Princes to vse violence against Priestes, as though their faultes coulde not be redressed by the (c) Prelates of the Clergie, of whome yee speake by spiteful surmise, as though God had vtterly withdrawen his holy

his holy Spirite from them. But forasmuche as Christe assisteth his Churche alwayes, and shal neuer fayle in thinges necessary, it is not to be doubted, but the Church shal euer be prouided of some good Gouernours, so as thoughe some slugge and sleepe, yet somme other shall wake, and diligently attende their charge. Priestes haue their Ecclesiasticall Courtes, where their defaultes and offences maie duly, and Canonically be punished: and the offenders, by Priestly discipline, beredressed. Neither is it conuenient for a King, to come into Priests consistories, (d) nor to cal Priestes before him, to his owne seate of iudgement.

(d) Vntruth, to proued by the Auncient practise of the Churche, as it shal appeare.

So many as be necessary to ministre, and performe those thinges, that appertayne to the buylding vp of Christes Body the Churche, vntil it come to his perfection, S. Paule reckeneth by name in his Epistle to the Ephesians, saieing, that Christe hath to that ende, placed in his Churche, (e) some Apostles, some Prophetes, some Euangelistes, some Shepeherdes, and teachers. Kinges and Princes be not there named, as they, who haue their propre rancke. That the people be to be stirred by vs to more feruent deuotion to worshippe God, and some perhappes, to be warned of some cases of superstition, wee graunte. But that any other maner or kinde of worshiping of God, is either by vs, or by temporal Princes, to be set vp in Christes Churche, that we denie.

(e) Marke, that Popes and Cardinalles in this ranke are not named.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

We Confounde not these Offices, M. Harding, as ye beste knowe: but rather we teache eche man carefully to attende his owne office. You, and youre Fathers haue brought Confusion of Offices into the Churche of God, in that ye haue made youre Pope Heire apparente vnto the Empiere: and haue armed him with al maner Auctoritie, Spirituall and Temporal: and haue giuen him the right of Bothe Swerdes.

For thus your owne Pope Nicolas telleth you roundely in his owne behalfe, Christus Petro Aeternæ vitæ Clauigero, Terreni simul, & Cœlestis imperij iura commisit: Christe *hath committed vnto* Peter, *the Keybearer of Euerlastinge life, the right as well of the Earthly, as also of the Heauenly Empiere.* No doubte. For Christe by his Commission made Peter a Kinge of this worlde, and dubbed him accordingly with Swerde, and Scepter, and bade him sitte vnder his Cloth of Estate. Thus by your Doctrine, Priestehode, Kingdome, Popedome, Empire, are al conueighed wholy into one mans handes: and so by your handlinge, one man is Priestе, Kinge, Pope, and Emperour, al at once. This perhaps vnto the wise, maie seeme to be somme confusion of Offices. *Dist. 22. Omnes.*

Touching that ye write of the rashe attempte of Kinge Ozias, ye seeme not to vnderstande, neither our wordes, nor your owne. For we teache not Princes, to offer vp Incense in sacrifice, as Ozias did: or by intrusion to thrust themselues into Bishops roumes: or to Preache, or to minister Sacramentes, or to Binde, or to Lose: But onely to discharge their owne Offices, and to doo that duetie, that Dauid, Salomon, Ezechias, Iosias, and other Noble and godly Kinges did, and euermore was lawful for the Prince to do. As for righte of Place, and Voice in Councell, it perteineth no lesse to the Prince than to the Pope: as hereafter it shall better appere. *2. Paral. 26.*

Ye saie, Christe shal alwaies assiste his Churche, and shal euermore prouide her of good Gouernours. Thus, bee youre negligence, and careleste slouthfulnesse neuer so greate: be youre liues ner so lose: be you Doumbe Dogges, not hable to barke, be you Lanternes without Lighte, be you Salte vvithoute sauoure, yet ye euermore dreame swetely of Christes Promise, and assure your selues vndoubtedly of his assistance: Euen as he, that sommetime saide, Pan curet oues ouiumque magistros. Would God your Bishops woulde do theire dutie, and do it faithfully: The worlde shoulde haue lesse cause to complaine. Notwithstandinge, Christe is euermore mindefull of his promise. For when he seeth his Churche defaced, and laide waste, he raiseth vp faithefull Magistrates, and godly Princes, not to do the Priestes, or Bishoppes duties: but to forze the Priestes, and Bishoppes, to do their duties.

But ye saie, Christe hathe placed in his Churche, some Apostles, some Prophetes, some Euangelistes, some Pastours, som Teachers. Kinges, (ye saie) and Princes be not there named. Hereof ye conclude, *Ergo*, The Prince maie not cause the Abuses of his Churche to be reformed: nor ouersee the Priestes, and Bishoppes, if they be negligente: nor forze them to do their duetes.

I marueile, M. Harding, where ye learned somuch Logique. How frame ye this Argument? In what Moode? In what Figure? With what cement can ye make these seely lose peces to cleaue together? It pitieth me to see your case. For by like forme of

Argu-

Argumente, and with mutche more likelihode of Reason, we maie turne the same againste your selfe, and maie saie thus: Christe hath placed in his Churche, somme Apostles, somme Prophetes, somme Euangelistes, some Pastoures, somme Teachers: The Pope and his Cardinalles are not here named: Apostles they are not, For the Apostles were but twelue: Prophetes they are not, for they Prophesie nothinge: Euangelistes they are not, for they Preache not: Pastours, or Feeders they are not, for they Fede not: Doctours, or Teachers they are not, for they teache not. Ergo, by this Authoritie of S. Paul, and by your owne Argumente, The Pope and his Cardinalles be vtterly excluded, and maie not meddle with the charge of the Churche of God.

Epistola Pauli. 3. ad Carolum. 5.

In sutche good Substantiall sorte Pope Paulus. 3. not longe sithence, reasoned againste the Emperoure Charles the Fifthe, En ego supra Pastores meos: *Beholde, saithe* God Almighty, *I will punishe my* Priestes, and Bisshoppes, for theire negligence, and wickednesse: Ergo saithe the Pope Paulus, The Prince, or Emperoure maie not punishe them: as though when the Kinge, or Emperoure punisheth the wicked by Goddes appoyntment, God him selfe were not the punisher.

In this your manner of Reasoning, M. Hardinge, there are we neare as many Errours, as there be wordes. The first is, Ignoratio Elenchi: which is the grossest Fallax of al the rest: Secondly, ye conclude without either Moode, or Figure: as a very childe maie easily see. Thirdely, ye Reason à Meris Particularibus or, A non Distributo ad Distributum. Fourthely, these wordes, Rule, or Charge of the Churche, are wordes of double, and doubteful meaninge. And therefore your Syllogismus sutche as it is, must needes stande of Foure Termes: whiche errour in Reasoning is to simple for a childe.

Touchinge these wordes, Rule, and Charge, whiche I saide, are double, and doubteful, notwithstandinge wee saie, bothe the Prince, and the Bishop haue Charge of the Churche, yet the Prince, and the Bishop haue not bothe one kinde of Charge. The Bishoppes Charge is, to Preache, to Minister Sacramentes, to Order Priestes, to Excommunicate, to Absolue &c. The Princes charge is, not to do any of these thinges him selfe, in his owne Persone, but onely to see, that they be donne, and orderly, and truely donne, by the Bishoppes.

I graunte, there be many Special Priuileges graunted vpon greate, & iuste considerations, of the meere fauoure of the Prince, that a Priestе, being founde negligent, or otherwise offending in his Ministerie, should be conuented, & pounished, not by the Temporal or Ciuile Magistrate, but by the discretion of the Bishop. Yet muste you remember, M. Hardinge, that al theise, & other like priuileges passed vnto the Cleregie from the Prince and not from God: and proceeded onely of speciall fauoure, & not of right. For from the beginninge, you know, it was not so.

And therfore to saie, that a Prince or Magistrate maie not lawfully call a Priestе before him, to his owne seate of iudgement, or that many Catholique and Godly Princes haue not so donne, and donne it lawfully, it is moste untrue. The Emperoure Iustinian himselfe, who of all others most enlarged the Churches Priuileges, saithe thus: Nullus Episcopus inuitus ad Ciuilem, vel Militarem Iudicem, in qualibet causa producatur, vel exhibeatur: nisi Princeps iubeat: *Let no* Bishop *be brought, or presented, againste his wil, before the Captaine, or Ciuile Iudge, what so euer the cause be:* Onlesse the Prince shall so commaunde it. Hereby it appearethe, the Bishop was bounde, to make his answeare before the Magistrate if it had benne the Princes pleasure.

Cod. Li. 1 de Epis. & Clericis N illus

M. Hard. Fol. 379. b

Addition. ☞ M. Hardinge. *Iustinian* in the lawe, that you reherse, M. Iewel, is to be vnderstanded, to speake of Ciuile, and Temporal cases: And, that in those cases no Bishop shoulde be brought before the Lieutenante and Ciuile Magistrate, excepte the Prince so commaunde it. It is a *Maxima*, and a Principle with the Lawyers, that suche Lawes speakyng indefinitely, muste be vnderstanded by an other lawe, that speaketh specially, and particularly &c. It had benne your part to haue vnderstanded those woordes, *In qualibet causa*, spoken there indifinitely by the other Lawes, that speake more specially. But then had you loste a peeuishe Sophistical argument, and men had not knowne your woorthie skill in the Lawe, whiche no doubte will appeare great by your practise.

The Answeare. Wee muste take these wordes, you saie, to be spoken of Ciuile, or Temporal cases onely: In which onely Cases, you graunt the Temporal iudge maie calle

A Bishop cõuented before the magistrate

calle a prieste before him, by the commaundemente of the Prince. Herein I wil not greately contende againste you. Notwithstandinge Iustinians wordes be general, and include al kindes of Cases. For thus he saithe, as I haue alleged his wordes: In qualibet Causa, that is, *Whatsoeuer the action be: Be it Ecclesiastical, be it Ciuile.* But, that you maie the better conceiue, bothe Iustinians meaninge, and also the weakenesse, and vanitie of your Glose, Photius the Patriarke of Constantinople saithe thus, Clerici Constantinopolitani, si nolint actores apud patriarcham agere, à solis prælectis prætorio iudicantur, siue conueniant, siue conueniantur, tam pro priuatis, quam pro Ecclesiasticis: *The Priestes of Constantinople, if they wil not pleade before the* Patriarke, *are iudged onely before the* Lorde Chauncellare, *whether they pleade, or be impleaded: and whether it be their owne Priuate mater, or Ecclesiastical.* Howbeit, by this exposition, it appeareth, if the case be Temporal, that then a prieste maie be conuented before a Temporal Iudge. But what saie you then to Thomas Becket? He alone, as you know, withstoode al the Bishoppes of this Realme, and woulde neuer yelde, that a prieste althoughe he were a Theefe, or a Murtherer, shoulde submit him selfe to Temporal Iudgemente. Theafte, and Murther doubtlesse be Cases Temporal. And it was the expresse wil, and commaundemente of the Prince. Yet, as I haue saide, Thomas Becket would neuer yelde, that the Temporal Magistrate should iudge of it: And therefore the Pope made him a Sainct. Howe, if he did wel, why do you, by this exposition, controlle his doinge? If in so doinge he did euil, why was he Sainted for the same? Doothe the Pope make folkes Sainctes for euil doinge?

Guliel. Neubrigensis. li. 2 cap. 16.

As for the reste, whereas it pleaseth you to make your selfe somme prety sport, and to say, Menne had not knowen the woorthy skil I haue in Lawe &c. Despise not, M. Harding leaste you your selfe be despised. For ought, that I knowe, the Lawe is your profession, no more, then mine?

The Emperoure Martianus commaundeth, if the cause be criminal, that the Bishop be conuented before the Lieutenant: Vt coram præside conueniatur.

Addition. M. Harding. The Lawe, *Cum Clericis*, hath not these woordes, *Vt coram præside conueniantur*, nor any Clause, or sentence soundinge to that pourpose. For trial whereof, I referre me to the Booke.

The Answeare. The Booke wil condemne you, M. Harding. The woordes there are plaine: Cum Clericis in iudicio vocatis pateat Episcopalis Audientia, volentibus tamen actoribus, si actor disceptationem sanctissimi Archiepiscopi noluerit experiri eminentissimæ tuæ Sedis examen tam de suis, quàm de Ecclesiasticis negotijs sibimet noluerit expetendum: qui in nullo alio foro, vel apud quenquam alterum Iudicem, eosdem Clericos litibus irretire, & Ciuilibus, vel criminalibus negotijs tentet inuectere: *Whereas Priestes, when they bee sued in Lawe, maie haue accesse to the Bishoppes Audience,* (if the plainetife thinke it good, and none otherwise) *if the plainetife wil not yeelde him selfe to stande to the moste Holy Archebishoppes iudgemente, then let him knowe, that he must come to the trial of youre moste highe Courte, whether it be in his owne, or in Ecclesiastical Cases. Neither shal it be lawful to the saide plainetife to emplead the said priestes in any other Court, or before any other Iudge, (sauinge onely before the Archebishop, or before thee beinge the Presidente, or Lieutenante there) whether the mater be Ciuile, or els Criminal.* Here you se, that the plaintife, if he thought it good, might sue a prieste before the Lieutenante, yea and that in Causes Ecclesiastical: and, that the prieste was bound to make his appearance, & to stand to his Iudgement. Yet wil you tel vs, M. Harding, that in this Lawe there are no suche woordes, nor any Clause, or Sentence to that purpose? Or can you without blushinge so vainely blase your Margine with M. Ievvels Forgeries?

Cod. De Epis. & Clericis L. Cum Clericis.

If the plaintife thinke it good. To the triall of youre Courte. In Causes Ecclesiastical.

Pope Innocentius 3. him selfe confesseth, that the Pope maie make a Laie man his Delegate, to heare, and determine in prieftes Causes. The like thereof ye maie finde in your owne Glose: Papa Laico delegat causam Spiritualem: *The* Pope *committeth the hearinge of a Spiritual mater vnto a Laie man.*

11. qua. 1. Clericum nullus.

Addition. But, for as mutche as, M. Harding saithe, It is not written, Papa delegat, but, Si Papa delegat, whiche neuertheleese is nothinge els, but an emptie quarrel, he maie also finde this selfe same sentence in the same place specially

A Bishop cõuented before the magistrate

noted without any, Si, or condition at al. The wordes there are thiese, Clericus coram Sæculari quandoque conuenitur: *A Prieste sommetime is called to make answeare before a Temporal Iudge.*

Yea, further yet shal finde euen in the Popes owne Decres, that the Pope hathe committed a Spiritual mater in a cause of Simonie, to be heard, and ended by a VVoman: and that Brunichildis, beinge a VVoman, by vertue of the Popes Commission, summoned a Bishop, to appeare, and solemnely to make his Purgation before her. Notwithstandinge, in your Glose vpon the same it is noted thus: Fuit tamen hic nimium Papaliter Dispensatum: *The* Pope *was too Popelike in this Dispensation.*

2. Que. 4. Menna.

M.Har.382.a. *Addition.* ☞ M. Hardinge. But what if wee cannot finde in the Popes Decrees, to whiche you referre vs, that the Pope euer committed a Spiritual mater in a cause of Simonie, to be heard, and ended by a Woman, and that *Brunichildis* had neither Commission from the Pope, to summone a Bishop, nor euer summoned a Bishop to appeare, and solemnely to make his Purgation before her? What then shal wee saie, but that M. Iewel is a shameleisse falsifier, and a deceiuer of al that beleeue him, &c.

M.Har.383.a. I beseeke you Sir, where is it saide in al this Decree, that the Pope committed a Spiritual mater in a cause of Simonie to be hearde and ended by a Woman &c. In the Text it is not, nor in the Glose, that you so solemnely allege. Had your Lawier forgotten to tel you, or were you so simple, that you could not conceiue, that, whiche is commonly saide, *Maledicta Glosa, quæ corrumpit textum &c.* To let passe your scoffinge, and your Ministerlike interpretation, let vs comme to the mater &c. You saie, the Pope committed a Spiritual mater in a cause of Simonie to be heard, and ended by a Woman. And this is a vaine tale, and Vntrutue fauise of yours, not hable to be gethered by any woord of that Decree. For the cause of Simonie was hearde, and ended by the Pope, and the Bishop was absolued and sente home (or els M. Hardinge euer boldely reporteth Untruthe as his manner commonly is to do.) And a cause once hearde, and determined by the Pope, is not woonte to be committed afterward to the hearinge, and determination of a Woman. After this as though this lie had not beene lowde yenoughe, you tel vs, that *Brunichildis* summoned the Bishop to appeare before her &c. *Brunichildis*, beinge so Holy, so Vertuous, so Religious a Lady, as S. Gregorie reported thee was, it is to be presupposed, that shee wouldo not disquiet a good, and innocent man, nor put him to further trouble.

M.Har.383.b.

The Answeare. A shameleisse falsifier (you saie) A deceiuer of them, that beleeue hym: Scoffinge, and Ministerlike interpretation: As thoughe this lie had not beene lowde yenoughe &c.

This eloquence, M. Hardinge, becommeth noman, but your selfe. It is reason, ye shoulde haue the whole glorie of it without copartenere. Howe be it, sutche intemperance of speache, and sutche vncuile dealinge wil winne smal credite to your Cause in the iudgemente of the Wise. You saie, It cannot be founde that Queene *Brunichildis* had any sutche Commission from the Pope. You Hunte wantonly, and Roame at pleasure, M. Hardinge, and wil finde nothing, but that mate like you. But Pope Gregories Commission is so plaine, that I marueile, with what good countenance you could denie it: sauinge that, I see you are armed with boldenesse, to denie, what you liste. Theise be Pope Gregories owne wordes, Purgationem ante te, duobus sibi Sacerdotibus iunctis, eundem ex se præbere tuo commisimus arbitrio: *I haue geeuen Commission to your discretion, that the saide Bishop, takinge too him two other Prieftes, or Bishoppes, shal make his Purgation before you.* And thus he saide to Brunichildis, being the Queene of Fraunce. Is not this yenough, to proue, that the Pope gaue Commission, that the Bishop should make his Purgation before the Queene? Is not here the plaine, and expresse worde, Purgatio? Are not here two other Prieftes, or Bishoppes appointed, to be Compurgatours? Is not here the Latine worde Commisimus, whereby the Pope gaue the Queene to understande, that he had sent her his special Commission? Are not here these other two Latine wordes, Ante te, that is to saie, before thee, or, in thy presence? Are not here these other two Latine wordes, Tuo arbitrio, whereby it is signified, that the mater was committed to her Discretion? Dothe not the same Pope immediately afterwarde in the same Decree streightly charge the saide Queene Brunichildis, that shee shoulde not require the saide Bishop, to cleare him selfe by any Vulgare Purgation, as by standinge in scaldinge water, or by bearinge a Gadde of burning iron in his bare hand,

2. Quest. 4. Menna.

Purgation.
Compurgatours.
Cõmisimus.
Ante te.

Vulgaris Purgatio.

A Biſsop conuented before the Magiſtrate.

hand, as many then vſed to trie their innocencie, & to purge them ſelues: Bought you ſo buſily for theſe thinges, M. Hardinge, and could you not finde them? Or could you ſee al theiſe thinges in a heape togeather, and yet coulde you ſee nothinge? Or, al this notwithſtandinge, can you ſo aſſuredly tel vs, that the Pope neuer committed any Spiritual mater to be hearde by a Woman? Or, that the Queene had no Commiſſion to any ſuch purpoſe from the Pope? The Pope him ſelfe ſaithe, Yea: you onely ſay, nais. And maie we ſafely gene credite to you alone againſt the Pope?

It is not likely (you ſaie) that beinge once purged before the Pope, he ſhoulde afterwarde be purged againe before a Woman. It is not likely (you ſaie) that Brunichildis beinge ſo holye, ſo Vertuous, and ſo religious a Ladie, woulde diſquiete a good, and an innocente man, or put him to any further trouble, after his cauſe hadde benne hearde, and ended by the Pope. And are not theiſe good and ſubſtantial, and likely reaſons, M. Hardinge? Or, were it not wel worth the while, that your Reader, contrary to the Popes plaine wordes ſhould beleeue you, and rather yelde to ſuche prety likelihodes? Is it not likely, that M. Hardinge, ſo boldely maintening manifeſt falſehed, wil euer geeue place to any Truthe? I beſeeche you, how had this Biſhop made his ſufficient Purgation before the Pope? By what wordes of Gregorie can you learne it? In deede he offered an othe for him ſelfe. And ſo farre forthe onely, and none otherwiſe, he was purged. But there was no Proclamation geeuen out vnto his accuſers, if any man had to allege againſte his Purgation, neither had he any man there to be his Compurgatoure. Nor was he fully reſtoared to his fame: nor had the Pope thoroughly concluded, and ended the mater. And therefore he committed it ouer, to be ended at home before the Queene. For the Lawe ſaithe, Ibi fieri debet purgatio, vbi quiſque eſt infamatus: vt ibi moriatur malum, vbi contigit: *There ought euery man to make his Purgation, where he is defamed: that the euil maie die, and haue an ende, where it began to ſpringe firſte.* To be ſhorte, where as you tel vs, M. Hardinge, that Queene Brunichildis had no ſuche Commiſſion from the Pope, the Expoſitour of that Decree, if it might haue pleaſed you to haue ſeene him, would haue taught you the contrarie. For thus he ſaithe, Papa mandat Reginæ, vt indicat eidem Epiſcopo purgationem cum duobus Sacerdotibus: Et, delegatur hic Laico negotium ſpirituale: Et, Epiſcopus expurgatus coram Papa, cogitur adhuc coram mulierecula ſe purgare: *The Pope geeueth the Commiſſion to the Queene, to appointe the ſaide Biſhop to make his Purgation togeather with twoo other Prieſtes:* Againe, *Here a Spiritual mater is committed ouer to a Laie perſon:* And againe, *A Biſhop beinge purged* (in parte, and after a ſort) *before the Pope, yet neuertheleſſe is compelled afterwarde, to purge him ſelfe before a Woman.* I knowe not, what I ſhoulde ſaie further, Committere is Latine, to geeue Commiſſion: Purgatio in Engliſh, is a Purgation: Simonie, is a Spiritual Cauſe: Queene Brunichildis was a Laie perſon: Ante Reginam, is, before the Quene: The text is plain: The Gloſe is plaine: The wordes are plaine: The ſenſe is plaine. The Pope him ſelfe ſaithe, *I haue geeuen out my Commiſſion, that the Biſhop ſhoulde appeare before the Quene:* The Expoſitoure ſaithe, *A Spiritual cauſe is committed to the Iudgemente of a perſon Temporal.*

M. Harding. fo. 383. b. M. Har. 384. a

In Margarita.

2 Que. 4. Menna.

Yet, M. Hardinge, it is lawful for you to ſaie, M. Iewel is a lewde liar, and a ſhameleſſe falſifier, and a deceiuer of al them, that wil beleeue him. Thus maie you lawfully, and boldly ſaie: For ful wel it becommethe you thus to ſaie, as a man, that recketh not, what he ſaie.

The Emperour Conſtantinus wrote thus vnto the Biſhoppes that had benne at the Councel of Tyrus: Cuncti quotquot Synodum Tyri compleuiſtis, ſine mora ad Pietatis noſtræ caſtra properate: ac re ipſa, quam ſincerè, ac rectè iudicaueritis, oſtendatis: Idque Coram me, quem ſincerum eſſe Dei Miniſtrum, ne vos quidem negabitis: *All ye, that haue benne at the* Councel of Tyrus, *comme without delaie vnto our Campe, and ſhewe me plainely, and without Colours, howe vprightly ye haue dealte in Iudgemente: and that* euen before me ſelfe, *whome you cannot denie to be the true Seruante of God.*

Socrates, lib. 1. Cap. 34.

Iuſtinian the Emperoure, in the Lawe, that he maketh, touching the Publike praiers of the Churche, ſaithe thus: *Wee commaunde al* Biſhoppes, and Prieſtes, *to Miniſter the Holy Oblation, and the Prayer at the Holy Baptiſme, not vnder ſilence, but with ſuche voice, as maie be hearde of the Faithful People, to the intent, that the hearers*

Authen. Conſtitutione. 123.

A Bishop conuented before the Magistrate.

maie be stirred to more deuotion, &c. Afterward he addeth further, *And let the* Holy priestes *vnderstande, that if they neglecte any of theise thinges, they shal make answeare therfore at the dreadful Iudgement of the Great God, and our Sauiour Iesus Christ.* And yet neuertheleſſe vve our ſelues vnderſtanding the ſame, vvil not paſſe it ouer, nor leaue it vnpunished.

Hereby vvas ſo, that Godly Princes maie ſummons Bishoppes, to appeare before them, euen in Cauſes Eccleſiaſtical, to receiue ſuch punishment, as they haue deſerued. Likewiſe the Emperoure Conſtantinus in his Letters vnto the People of Nicomedia, ſpeaking of the wilful Erroures, and Hereſies of Prieſtes, and Bishoppes ſaithe thus: Illorum temeraria præſumptio, mea, hoc eſt, Miniſtri Chriſti, manu coërcebitur: *Their raſhe attemptes ſhalbe repreſſed by my hande, that is to ſaie, by the hande of Chriſtes Seruante.*

Theodoretus Lib. 1. cap. 19 M. Hard. 387

Addition. ☞ M. Hardinge. Where you ſaie, that the Emperoure ſpake of the wilfull Erroures, and Hereſies of the Prieſtes, and Biſhoppes, and adde not, Arian Prieſtes, and Arian Biſhoppes, you declare your malicious harte againſte Prieſtes, and Biſhoppes. But I wil leaue that cankred ſpite of yours &c. Why doo you not reporte the Emperours woordes, as they are in your Authour? Wil you neuer leaue this your accuſtomed vile corruption? Additio. D

The Anſweare. And wil you neuer leaue this Vanitie, M. Harding? You ſaie, I ſpeake of Errours and Hereſies of Prieſtes, and Biſhoppes, but I adde not, Arian Prieſtes, and Arian Biſhoppes. And therein, you ſaie, I declare my malicious harte. Of ſutche good woordes your gentle harte wantethe no ſcoare. It is your ſkil with ſutche terrours, and outcries to amaze the ſimple. For no wiſe man, I trowe, woulde thus demaine him ſelfe without ſomme cauſe. I ſaide not, The Errours, and Hereſies of Arian Prieſtes, and of Arian Biſhoppes. What then? Thinke you therefore, I meante the Erroures, and Hereſies of Catholique Prieſtes, and Godly Biſhoppes? Or, can any man imagine Hereſies without an Heretique? Fy, M. Hardinge. Sutche wantonneſſe is not fitte for your grauitie. When I ſpake of Errours, and Hereſies, a very Babe might wel knowe, I ſpake onely of Heretiques and of none others.

But I haue not reported the Emperoures woordes, as I founde them. And this, in youre accuſtomed courteous ſpeache, you calle my accuſtomed Vile Corruption. Howe be it in deede, I corrupte no parte of the Emperours woordes. He ſpeaketh none otherwiſe, but as I repoꝛte him. Adde hardly the woordes, that you woulde ſame to miſſe. You canne adde nothinge to the meaninge. Thus ſaithe Theodoretus, euen as you haue tranſlated him your ſelfe: *If any man be inflamed boldely, and vncircumſpectly at the remembrance, and commendation of thoſe Wicked, and Peſtilente Heretiques, his boldeneſſe ſhalbe repreſſed ſtreighte waie by my Woorkinge, that is to ſaie, by the Miniſter of God.* This is al that I ſaie, M. Hardinge: I ſaie no more. ☜ ☜

Auguſt. Contra Epi. Parmeniani. Lib 1. cap. 7. M. Har. 388. a.

So likewiſe ſaith S. Auguſtine vnto the Donatiſtes: An fortè de Religione fas non eſt vt dicat Imperator, vel quos miſerit Imperator? Cur ergo ad Imperatorem Legati veſtri venerunt? *Is it not lawful, that the Emperour, or the Emperoures Deputie ſhoulde pronounce in a caſe of* Religion? *Wherfore then went your own Embaſſadours to the* Emperour?

Addition. ☞ M. Hardinge. *S. Auguſtine,* reaſoninge againſt Parmenian the Donatiſte, tooke aduantage of his owne doinges, not as allowinge the appeale to the Emperoure, but as proꝛinge him vnreaſonable, who for aduantage, woulde appeale to the Emperoure, and, when the Emperoure had pronounced ſentence againſte him, would ſtriue, and repine at the ſentence, and ſaie, that he beinge a Temporal Prince, ought not to puniſhe Biſhoppes, &c. S. Auguſtine in this talke againſt the Donatiſtes, cannot be ſaide, to allowe the Emperours authoritie in condemninge of Biſhoppes, and other Eccleſiaſtical cauſes. For he, anſweringe an other Donatiſte, that ſaide, *Non debuit Epiſcopus proconſularis iudicio Purgari*, ſaide, If he be woorthy to be blamed, whom the Temporal Iudge hath abſolued, whereas he him ſelfe did not require it, howe mutche more are they to be blamed, whiche woulde haue a Temporal Prince to be Iudge in theire cauſe? By this it appeareth, that he thought that Princes coulde not be Iudges ouer Biſhops. Moreouer he reporteth, that Conſtantine, who appointed Iudges to heare their cauſe, did it, *à Sanctis Antiſtibus veniam petiturus*, as mindinge to aske pardone of the Holy Biſhoppes for his facte. And the ſame Emperour, ſeeinge their importunitie in repairinge to him, as Iudge, ſaide, *O rabida furoris audacia. Sicut in cauſis Gentilium ſolet fieri, appellationem interpoſuerunt.* Addition. D

The Anſweare. The very ſtorie hereof, is this: The Donatian Heretiques, beinge condemned by an aſſemblie of Biſhoppes in Aphrica, and appealing for aide vnto the Emperoure, were by his authoritie appointed ouer by ſpecial Commiſſion to be

Iudged

A Biſsop conuicted before the Magiſtrate.

Iudged by Miltiades the Bishop of Rome with certaine others. Wherin two thinges are ſpecially to be noted: Firſte, that the Pope in thoſe daies thought not, him ſelfe to be Superioure to the Emperoure, but could be contented, to be his Delegate, and to receiue Authoritie by his Commiſſion: Againe, that the pope was not appointed to Iudge alone, but had other Bishoppes ioined with him. The Donatians beinge condemned before the Pope, and the other Commiſſioners, and once againe appealinge to the Emperoure, were eftſoones appointed ouer by like Commiſſion to be iudged by the Bishop of Arle in France, with certaine others. And here alſo it is to be noted, that in thoſe dayes, it was lawful to appeale from the Pope, and, that an inferioure Bishop might lawfully Iudge of his Iudgementes. But the Donatians, ſeeing them ſelues condemned by the Bishop of Arle, as they were before by the Bishop of Rome, laſte of al appealed to the Emperoures owne perſone, complaininge of the partialitie of the Bishop of Rome, and of the Bishop of Arle, as at whoſe handes they coulde finde no Juſtice. In the ende, beinge likewiſe condemned by the Emperoure him ſelfe, they founde them ſelues alſo greued with his Maieſtie, and condemned his Iudgemente to, as they had donne the others. Hereof S. Auguſtine ſaithe thus, Iudex eligitur Imperator: Iudicans contemnitur Imperator: *They chuſe the* Emperoure *to be theire* Iudge: *and after Iudgement, they deſpiſe the* Emperoure. This is it, that the Emperoure ſo mutche miſliked in the Donatiſtes. Therefore he abhorred them as impudent, and peruerſe Wranglers, that ſeinge Iudgement ſo many waies, and ſo clearely paſſe againſt them, yet woulde not ſubmit them ſelues to any order. Butche this daie, M. Hardinge, is the peruerſeneſſe, and impudencie of al them, that ſeinge theire folies laide open to the worlde by Goddes Holy Worde, and ſo many Kingedomes, and Countries departinge from them, yet neuertheleſſe haue hardened their faces againſte al ſhame, and wil neuer yelde to the confeſſion of any one erroure. Therefore S. Auguſtine ſaithe vnto the Donatiſtes, as we likewiſe maie ſaie vnto you, Quid vultis amplius homines, quid vultis amplius? *O yee menne, telle me, What woulde yee haue more? What more woulde yee haue?*

Enſ. Lib. 10. caput. 5.

The Pope the Emperours Delegate.

Appeale frō the Pope.

Aug. ep. 162

Auguſti. in eadem Epiſt.

As touchinge the mater, that liethe betweene vs, the queſtion is this, Whether a Prince maie be Iudge in Eccleſiaſtical cauſes, or no. He maie not, ſaies you. Here wee alleage the example of the Godly Chriſtian Emperoure Conſtantinus, who beinge only a Temporal Prince, neuertheleſſe toke vpon him, to Iudge in Cauſes Eccleſiaſtical betweene the Donatian Heretiques, and the Catholiques. Vnto this you Anſweare: Thus he did, *à Sanctis Antiſtitibus veniam petiturus*, as minding to aske pardone of the Holy Biſhoppes for his facte. For what his facte, M. Harding? Why deale you ſo darkely? Wil you tel vs, that Conſtantinus knewe in his Conſcience, he did il, and committed Sacrilege, and wickedly intruded vpon the Bishoppes Offices, and wilfully deſerued Goddes Vengeance, as did Ozias or Oza and yet would do it notwithſtandinge vpon the hope of pardone? Verily this had benne the ſinne of Preſumption, whiche ſome men haue reckened, as the ſinne againſt the Holy Ghoſt, that ſhal neuer be forgeuen, neither in this life, nor in the life to come. Or, do you thinke, that theiſe Holy Fathers woulde ſo eaſily haue forgeuen ſo great an offence, ſo preſumptuouſly committed againſte God? Or, is it likely, that the Emperoure Conſtantinus, for thus doinge, ſtode Excommunicate ipſo facto, and was therefore diuided from the Sacramentes, and Prayers, and al other Communion, and comforte of the Churche? Or, that afterward he waited thre daies togeather bareheaded, and barefoote, as did that Noble Emperoure Henrie. 4. vpon Pope Gregorie. 7. to receiue Abſolution for his ſinnes? I knowe, you dare to ſaie many thinges. But thus mutche, I trowe, you dare not ſaie. What Pardon then was it, that the Emperoure minded to ſeeke at the Bishoppes handes? In deede the place it ſelfe is very darke, and ſutche as whereof it is harde to geather a ready, and perfite ſence. Thus ſtande the wordes: Atque vtinam, ſaltem ipſius iudicio, inſaniſsimi, animoſitatibus finem poſuiſſent, atque, vt eis ipſe ceſsit, vt de illa cauſa poſt Epiſcopos iudicarer, à Sanctis Antiſtitibus poſtea veniam petiturus, dum tamen illi, quod vlterius dicerent, non haberent, ſi eius ſententiæ non obtemperarent, ad quem ipſi prouocauerunt, ſic & illi aliquando cederent veritati?

Sabell. Enned. 9. lib. 3.

If yᵉ vnderstande this sentence thorowly, M. Hardinge, yᵉ are more then Dauus: yᵉ are as good as Oedipus. Notwithstandinge, that fæly sense, that you haue imagined, cannot possibly be geathered hereof by any reasonable order of construction. This onely is it, that S. Augustine saithe, The Emperoure minded to excuse him selfe vnto the Bishoppes, not for that he had dealte in a cause Ecclesiastical, but for that he had dealte therein, after that it had benne twise hearde, and determined by the Bishoppes. Theise are his wordes: Ipse eis cessit, vt de illa causa post Episcopos iudicaret, à Sanctis Antistitibus posteà veniam petiturus. You knowe, right wel, M. Hardinge, Veniam petere, is not alwaies to aske Absolution, as for somme hainous offense againste God. Bona tua Venia dicamdabis mihi hanc Veniam &c. are Phrases commonly vsed emonge the Learned. In this place S. Augustine saithe, The Emperoure minded courteously to excuse his doinge vnto the Bishoppes, for that, callinge the mater before him selfe, that had benne before thorowly considered, and debated by them, he mighte seeme to Judge of theire Judgementes, and to calle theire doinges into question. This onely was the thinge, that he woulde haue excused. And this was his courtesie onely, and not his dewtie.

As for the hearinge of Ecclesiastical Causes, whiche is the mater, that liethe betweene vs, he neither thought he offended God therein, for any thinge, that maie appeare, nor minded to aske pardon for the same. For he did nomore therin, then was lawful for him to do: nor euer was there any Pope so vncivile, that durste to condemne him for so doinge. S. Augustine saithe plainely in the same Epistle, Diximus Fœlicem Aptungitanum ad Constantini iussionem, Proconsularibus gestis fuisse Purgatum. Ait quidam, Non debuit Episcopus proconsulari iudicio purgari: quasi verò ipse sibi hoc comparauerit, ac non Imperator ita quæri iusserit: ad cuius Curam, de qua rationem Deo redditurus esset, res illa maximè pertinebat: *Wee tolde you, that* Felix *the* Bishop of Aptungita, *was purged before the Lorde* Lieutenante *by the commaundemente of the* Emperoure. *But one of the* Donatian Heretiques *saithe, A Bishop shoulde not haue made his Purgation before the* Lieutenante: *As though it had benne the* Lieutenantes *seekinge, and not rather the* Emperours *Commaundemente. to whose charge, whereof he shal yeelde Accompte vnto God, that mater specially did belonge.* Beholde theise wordes, M. Harding: Laie them abroade: caste no clowde ouer them: S. Augustine telleth you, that the Purgation of a Bishop, notwithstandinge it were an Ecclesiastical mater, yet belonged specially to the Emperoures Charge: And thus he saithe euen in the selfe same Epistle, and place, that you haue alleaged. And yet muste wᵉ beleeue you vppon your worde, that the Emperoure coulde not deale herein without offendinge of God, and craueinge of Pardon? Againe S. Augustine saithe, An fortè de Religione fas non est, vt dicat Imperator? Cur ergo ad Imperatorem Legati vestri venerunt? *What, Is it not lawful perhaps, that the* Emperoure *shoulde geeue sentence in a cause of Religion? Wherefore then did your Legates sue to the* Emperoure? Here, M. Hardinge, marke this by the waie, They that saide, the Emperoure mought not be Iudge in Ecclesiastical cases, vvere Donatian Heretiques. For S. Augustine, and the Catholiques saide the contrarie. Againe S. Augustine saithe, Si criminis non est, prouocare ad Imperatorem, non est criminis, audiri ab Imperatore. Ergo nec ab illo, cui causam delegauerit Imperator: *If it be no faulte to appeale to the* Emperoure. *Then is it no faulte, to be heards, or Iudged by the* Emperoure. *And so consequently it is no faulte, to be Iudged before him, to whome the cause was committed by the* Emperoure. S. Augustine presupposethe, and laithe it as a grounde, that it is no faulte, neither to appeale to the Emperoure, nor to be Judged before his Maiestie, be the cause neuer so mutche Ecclesiastical.

Aug. epi. 162

Ad cuius curam res ea maximè pertinebat.

Specially belongeth to the Emperoures charge.

Au. Contra Epist. Parmeniani. Li. 1. Cap. 7.

Aug. epi 162 Non est criminis.

Nowe, M. Hardinge, if there were no faulte committed by the Emperour, why shoulde you thus force him to crane Pardon?

Photius de peccatis & iudicio Episco. Tit. 9

Photius, the Patriarke of Constantinople saith thus, Clerici Constantinopolitani, si nolint actores apud Patriarcham agere, à solis præfectis prætorio iudicantur, siue conueniant, siue conueniantur, tam pro priuatis, quàm pro Ecclesiasticis: *The Priestes of* Constantinople, *if they wil not pleade theire maters before the* Patriarke, *then are they iudged onely before the* Lorde Cauncellare, *whether they be plaintines or Defendantes, and whether*

A Bishop conuented before the Magistrate.

ther theire cause be priuate,or Ecclesiastical.

Againe he saithe, *Bishoppes, Priestes, and Monkes are to be sued before the* Lorde Deputie,*or* Presidente *of the Countrie: Or, if they be founde in the Cittie of* Constantinople,*where the* Emperoure *hathe his Courte, then are they to be sued* onely before the Lorde Chauncelloure.

Likewise Balsamon, **expounding a** Canon **of the** Councel of Antioche, **alleageth this sentence of** Iustinian, Patriarcha debet rationem reddere Imperatori, & ab eo corrigi: *The* Patriarke *is bounde to make his answeare before the* Emperoure, *and of him to receiue correction.* **And thus he speaketh of a cause** Ecclesiastical, **as by the place it maie appeare. Againe he saithe,** Patriarcha ab Imperatore, qui Ecclesiæ habet potestatis scientiam, iudicabitur, fortè vt sacrilegus, vel malè de Fide sentiens, vel alicuius alius criminis reus. Hoc enim nos iudicialiter factum esse vidimus diuersis temporibus: *The* Patriarke *shalbe Iudged of the* Emperoure, *hauinge the knoweledge of the Ecclesiastical Power,whether the mater be of* Sacrilege,or of Heresie,*or of any other crime. For this haue wee seene donne oftentimes in fourme of Iudgemente.*

In eodem Titul.

Apud Præsides prouinciarum.

Apud solos præfectos prætorio.

Balsamon.

Conc. Antioch. Cano. 12.

Balsamon, eodem loco.

What woulde ye haue more, M. Hardinge? Heresie **is a** Cause Ecclesiastical: **The** Patriarke **is a** Bishop: **The** Emperoure **is a** Ciuile, **or** Laie Magistrate. **Yet** Balsamon **tellethe you, that this** Bishop, **in this cause, is to be tried before the** Emperoure: **and, that he him selfe hathe oftentimes seene the same iudicially put in practise, no restrainte, or Lawe beinge to the contrarie.**

Gerson, **standinge before the** Frenche Kinge, **and answearinge his Aduersaries in a** Cause Ecclesiastical, **saide thus vnto him:** Loquimur sic ad eos, Rex Serenissime, te audiente, te Iudice: *Thus wee saie to them, ô moste Graceous Kinge in youre hearinge: your Grace shalbe Iudge.* **Here you see, M. Hardinge, the** Cause is Ecclesiastical, **and the Iudge is the** Kinge.

Gerson. Trilogus. Iuma. teria schismatis.

But what speake we of other Priestes, **and** Inferior Bishoppes? **The** Popes **them selues, notwithstanding al their** Vniuersal Povver, **haue submitted them selues, and made their Purgations before** Kinges, **and** Emperours, Pope Liberius **made his humble appearance before the** Emperour Constantius: Pope Sixtus **was accused, and made his Purgation before the** Emperoure Valentinian: Pope Leo 3. **beinge accused, by** Paschalis, **and** Campulus, **pleaded his cause before** Carolus Magnus **at** Rome, **not yet chosen** Emperoure. Pope Iohn. 22. **was accused of** Heresie, **and forced to recante the same vnto** Philip the Frenche Kinge.

Theodo. li. 2 Cap. 16.

2. q. 4. Mandastis.

2. q. 4. Auditum.

Pope Leo 4. **in this wise humbly submitted him selfe vnto the Iudgemente of** Levves the Emperoure: Nos, si incompetenter aliquid egimus, & in subditis iustæ Legis tramitem non conseruauimus, vestro admissorum nostrorum cuncta volumus emendare iudicio: *If wee haue donne any thinge out of order, and if wee haue not folowed the right course of the Lawe ouer oure Subiectes,* wee will amende al our faultes by your Maiesties Iudgemente.

Gerson in sermone paschali. 2. qua. 7. Nos si.

Addition. **M. Hardinge.** If this submission had not benne made voluntarily by them, nor Kinge, nor Cæsar coulde haue had Authoritie, or power to be Iudges ouer them. The good Emperoure Constantine saide to the Bishoppes, *Vos non potestis ab hominibus iudicari.* You cannot be iudged of menne, that is of, Laie menne.

M. Ha. f. 389. 2

The Answeare. **This is wisely considered, M. Hardinge, and for good aduantage.** Laie Menne be menne: **Al others be Angelles, Otherwise if** Bishoppes **were** Menne, **as others be, then could no** Priest, **or** Bishop **be iudged before them. For** Constantinus **saithe,** Vos non potestis ab hominibus iudicari: *You cannot bee iudged by meune.* **And yet in the selfe same place, he seemeth to saie, that a** Bishop **maie not be iudged, neither before any other** Bishop, **nor before the** Pope **himselfe, or any other Creature, but onely before God alone. For thus he saithe vnto the** Bishoppes, Iustæ accusationes vestræ opportunum tempus habent Magni Iudicij diem, & Iudicem tunc omnibus iudicaturum: *Theise quarrelles of yours haue a meete time of triall, I meane the daie of Greate Iudgemente, and a meete Iudge, that shal Iudge ouer al.* **Happie are yee, M. Hardinge, that maie do what ye liste, and neuer comme to answeare before the daie of our Lorde.**

Zozomen. lib. 1. cap. 17.

M.Hardinge. *Pope Liberius*, you saie, made his humble appearance before Constantius. It is true. But Liberius dealinge with the Emperoure Constantius was such, as became a Bishop of the Apostolique See. For in that cause he would neither be overborne by the Authoritie of the Emperour, nor yelde vnto his wickednesse against Athanasius for a longe time (yet at lengthe he yeelded, and subscribed too, as it became a Bishop of the Apostolike See) much lesse acknowledge him for his Superioure, or Iudge. (And yet Pope Gregorie, that followed longe after Pope Liberius, called the Emperoure his Lorde and Maister: *Ego sum vester seruus, & Imperator: Ego sum vestra iussioni subiectus: Imperatori obedientiam præbui:* These be his woordes). As for Pope Sixtus, it is certaine he made his Purgation before the Emperoure Valentinian. But he did it of Humilitie &c. The Emperoure of him selfe had no power too summone the Pope to his Iudgement Seate, nor any Iurisdiction, to force him to make his Purgation before his Maiestie. He gaue him licence to heare his Purgation. Concerninge Leo the 3 and Leo the 4. their case is like &c. And therefore wee saie, The Emperoure was not their Iudge, not Superiour, by any Princely Authoritie, but by their Popes Permission and appointment.

M.Hardin. 389.b.

Greg. Lib. 3. Epist. 61.

The Answeare. **O, what a blessed thinge it is, to be a** Pope? **Be he neuer so wicked, yet if he be also stoute, and wilful, and refuse Iudgemente, then maie he not be Iudged by any creature vnder Heauen, neither by** Kinge, **nor by** Emperoure, **nor by the** Churche, **nor by the whole people of** God. **For so it is enacted by** Pope Innocentius **him selfe.** Kinges **and** Emperoures **liue vnder Lawes. But the** Popes **Prerogatiue is, to do, what him listeth without controlmente, or feare of Lawes. And so is it true that** Ennodius **saith.** Successores Petri, vnà cum Sedis priuilegijs peccandi quoque licentiam accepisse: *That the Successours of* Peter: *together with the Priuileges of their See, haue also gotten free libertie to doo il.*

7. Qu. 3. Nemo.

Your owne Glose **saithe,** Papa potest dare potestatem Imperatori, vt deponat ipsum: & sese in omnibus illi subijcere: *The* Pope *maie geeue the* Emperoure *power to depose him selfe: and maie in al things submit him selfe vnto him.* **Nowe, M. Hardinge, if the** Pope **maie géue the** Emperoure **this Authoritie, what Scripture finde you to the contrarie, why the** Emperoure **maie not take it of him selfe?** **To be shoꝛt,** Franciscus Zabarella **saithe,** Papa accusari potest coram Imperatore de quolibet crimine notorio: Et Imperator requirere potest à papa rationem Fidei: *The* Pope *maie be accused before the* Emperoure *of any notorious crime: and the* Emperoure *maie require the* Pope *to yeelde an accompte of his Faithe.*

Ennodius conc. Tom. 1 Dist. 63. In Synodo. In Gloss. Franc Zabarella, De Schismate, & Concilio.

Addition. **M.Hardinge.** *Zabarella* saithe not, as you reporte. *Papa potest accusari coram Imperatore, &c.* These woordes, *coram Imperatore* are of your owne interlacinge, and bee not in the Authoure. You ought to bee ashamed, so fouly to corrupte your Authoures, and deceiue the people. Againe Zabarella saithe not, *Imperator requirere potest à Papa rationem Fidei.* They are your woords, M. Iewel. That whiche Zabarella saith, is this, *Si Papa erit suspectus de Hæresi, potest Imperator, ab eo exigere, vt iudicet, quid sentiat de Fide.* Now sir, to require a man to yeelde an accompt of his faithe, and to require him to declare, what he thinketh touchinge the faithe, are twoo diuers thinges.

Addition.

M.Har. 391.b

The Answeare. You ought to be ashamed, **you saie: Verily, and so I am, & so ought I to be, in your behalfe, M. Hardinge to see your Vanitie. These woꝛdes,** coram Imperatore, **are not interlaced by me: you maie easily finde them in the Authour. Wherin I wil vse no other pꝛoufe, but onely the very same woꝛds, that you your selfe haue alleged: These they be,** *Nec quenquam moneat, quòd Imperator est Laicus, vt ex hoc putet esse inconueniens, quod se intromittat de Clericis. Non enim semper prohibetur iudicare de Clericis. Sed tunc prohibetur, quando non subest ratio specialis:* Let no man be moued, for that the Emperoure is a Laie man, to thinke it therefore a thinge vnconuenient, that he shoulde intermeddle with Priestes causes. For he is not alwaies forbidden to iudge of Priestes. But then is he forbidden, when there is no special cause.

M.Har. 392.

You see therefoꝛe, M. Hardinge, that vpon somme cause, (him specially mouing) the Emperoure maie lawfully iudge in Ecclesiastical maters. **Againe you saie,** *Zabarella* saithe not, *Imperator requirere potest à Papa rationem Fidei.* But thus he saith, *Imperator exigere potest à Papa, vt iudicet, quid sentiat de Fide.* **Here haue I put,** Requirere, **in steede of** Exigere: **And,** rationem Fidei, **in steed of** quid sentiat de Fide. To require a man to yeeld an accompte of his Faithe. And, to require a man to declare, what he thinketh, touchinge the Faithe (saie you) are twoo diuers thinges. **Is not here a wonderful difference, and a foule coꝛruption of Authoures, M. Hardinge? Is not this a foule deceiuinge of the People?**

Are

A Biſsop conuented before the Magiſtrate.

Are not theſe weighty, and worthy maters, to be proclaimed, and publiſhed to the worlde? I marueile, if you be not aſhamed in your owne behalfe?

The wordes of Zabarella are plaine: Imperator exigere poteſt à Papa, vt iudicet, quid ſentiat de Fide: *The* Emperoure *maie require the* Pope, *to ſhewe him, what he thinketh of the Faithe:* That is to ſaie. The Emperoure maie require the Pope, to yelde a reckeninge of his Faithe. Where alſo it is to be noted, that the Pope maie be an Heretique, or at leaſte ſuſpected of Hereſie. For thus ſaithe Zabarella, Si Papa erit ſuſpectus de Hereſi. Crie out therefore, M. Hardinge, nowe of deceiuinge the People. For, as it appeareth, the Pope him ſelfe maie be an Heretique, and a deceiuer of the People.

Nowe therefore, M. Hardinge, I repoſe me to your owne indifferent iudgement, howe true it is, that ye ſaie, It is not conueniente, for a Kinge to cal Prieſtes before him to his owne Seate of iudgemente. Verily, this Note ye might haue founde Gloſed in your owne Decretalles: Quæritur, quis exemit Clericum de Iuriſdictione Imperatoris, cùm priùs eſſet illi ſubiectus? Dicit Laurentius, quòd Papa de conſenſu Principis: *A queſtion is moued, Who hathe exempted a Prieſte from the Iuriſdiction of the Emperoure, whereas before he was ſubiect to the Emperours Courte?* Laurence *ſaithe, The* Pope *hathe exempted him, by the Conſente of the* Prince. Yea ſir therefore, M. Hardinge, your Prieſtes, Abbates, and Biſhoppes haue their Priuileges, and Exemptions, not by any right of Goddes Worde, but onely by the Popes Policie, and by the Special fauoure of the Prince.

Extra. de maiorita & Obedien. Cap. 2. In Margin.

The Apologie. Cap. 9. Diuiſion. 3.

They wil ſaie to this, I gheaſſe, Ciuile Princes haue learned to gouerne a Common Wealthe, and to order maters of Warre: but they vnderſtande not the ſecrete Myſteries of Religion. If that be ſo, what is the Pope, I praie you, at this day, other then a Monarch, or a Prince? Or, what be the Cardinalles, whoe muſt be none other nowe but Princes, and Kinges Sonnes? What els be the Patriarches, and, for the moſte parte, the Archebiſhoppes, the Biſhoppes, the Abbates? What be they els at this preſent in the Popes Kingdome, but worldly Princes, Dukes, and Erles, gorgeouſly accompanied with bandes of menne, whether ſo euer they goe: Oftentimes alſo gaiely araied with Chaines, and Collars of Golde? They haue at times too, certaine Ornamentes by them ſelues, as Croſſes, Hattes, Miters, and Palles: whiche Pompe the Auncient Biſhoppes, Chryſoſtom, Auguſtine, and Ambroſe neuer had. Settinge theſe thinges aſide, what teache they? What ſaie they? What doo they? Howe liue they? I ſaie not, as maie becomme a Catholique Biſhop, but as maie becomme a Chriſtian man? Is it ſo greate a mater, to haue a vaine title, and by changing a garment onely to haue the name of a Biſhop?

M. Hardinge.

The duetie of Ciuil Princes conſiſteth in ciuil maters: the duetie of Biſhoppes, in ſpiritual thinges. That ſerueth to the preſeruation of mennes perſonnes: this to the Saluation of their Soules. Euery Highe Prieſte (ſaithe S. Paule) that is taken from amoonge menne, is ordeined for menne in thinges appertaininge to God. (a) Yee moue Temporal princes, to take vpon them the office of the pope, and Biſhops, as thoughe it were a thinge ſo indifferent, and ſo common, that when Biſhoppes be negligent, temporal menne maie doo theire ſtrede. But the reaſon, whiche to this ende yee make, is ſo ſlender, as I weene, fewe princes that feare God, wilbe greatly moued to aduenter that thinge ſo muche ſubiecte and thral to Goddes reuenge (b). In effecte your reaſon is this, conſider it who wil: They of the Clergie be no other but Ciuil princes. *Ergo*, Temporal princes maie beare the office of Biſhoppes. Syr, bothe your argumente is naughte, and your Antecedent is falſe. For although Biſhoppes had but a title, and the name of Biſhoppes by chaunginge a garment onely, as you ſaie, yet that defecte in them ſhoulde not geue habilitie to the mere laie, as to Kinges, and Queenes, to doo the Office of Biſhoppes. Now is your Antecedent manifeſtly falſe, for the Biſhoppes of the Catholike Churche, whiche in ſcoffe ye cal the popes Kingdome, be duely ordinated, and conſecrated.

(a) Vntruthe manifeſt. For wee moue no prince, to take vpon him the Biſhops office. (b) vntruth. for this is our Reaſon. A Temporal prince, ſaie you, maie not meddle in Eccleſiaſtical cauſes. But the pope, ſaie we, is nothing els, but a temporal prince. ergo, by your iudgemēt the pope maie not meddle in Eccleſiaſtical Cauſes.

Though

Bishops entangled in vvorldly affaires.

Thoughe the Pope haue a Princely Dominion, and some other Bishoppes of Christendome haue Dukedomes and Erledomes, though they ride vvel accompanied with menne and Horse, yea thoughe some of them otherwise then becommeth that vocation, doo weare Chaines and Coleres of Golde, (c) as you belie them: though they haue other ornamentes to their states perteininge, whiche grieueth you muche in comparison of the (d) beggerie of your married estate: yet al this imbarreth them not but that they be Bishops. Though they teache not, though they saie not, though they doo not, though they liue not, as becommeth Bishoppes, neither is becommeth euen a Christen man. (e) as you raile, al this notwithstanding, yet be they Bishoppes, though euil Bishoppes. Neither for al this maie it be lawful for Laiemen to take their office vpon them. (f) Iudas was an Apostle til the rope choked him. Neither for his wickednesse might Steuen, Mathias, or any other of the Disciples of his owne presumption haue stepte into his roume. Now as this is true, so is your railinge talke false, which malice hathe stirred you to vtter.

(c) Vere Reade A Antocrat (d) Ogle ous Th Then v the Apo state m more be gerly. (e) This Image n oum, but Bernard (f) The by M.H dinge co pared w Iudas.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Once againe wee telle you, M. Vardinge, wee confounde not theise Offices notwithstandinge you so often, and so lewdly report vs, to your owne discredite. Pure Princes neuer take vpon them the Office of Bishoppes: But your Bishoppes haue taken vpon them the Office of Princes. Of your Bishoppes it is written in your owne Councelles: Ecce, iam pene nulla est actio sæculi, quam non Sacerdotes administrent: *Behold, there is nowe in a manner no worldely affaire, but* Priestes, and Bishoppes *haue it in hande.* Sutche Bishoppes be they, of whome S. Chrysostome writeth thus, Qui non credunt Iudicium Dei, nec timent, abutentes Primatu suo Ecclesiastico sæculariter, conuertunt eum in sæcularem: *They that neither beleeue, nor feare the Iudgemente of God, abusinge theire Ecclesiastical Dignitie in Seculare sorte, turne the same into Seculare Dignitie.* Sutche Bishoppes they be, of whome S Hierome saithe thus, Ipsi sibi, & Laici sunt, & Episcopi: *They them selues be to them selues bothe* Laiemenne, *and* Bishoppes *too.* And againe, Adorant Dominum, & Melchom, qui Sæculo pariter, & Domino putant se posse seruire, & duobus Dominis satisfacere, Deo, & Mammonæ: qui Militantes Christo, obligant sese negotijs Sæcularibus, & eandem Imaginem offerunt, & Deo, & Cæsari: *They worshipe the* Lorde, *and* Melchom *bothe togeather, thinkinge, that they maie serue bothe the Worlde, and the Lorde, and satisfie twoo Maisters at once,* God, and Mammon: *who fightinge vnder Christe, binde them selues to worldly affaires, and offer vp one* Image, bothe to God, and to Cæsar.

Conci. Macrense. Citatur ab Illyrico inter Testes Veri. Pag. 121.

Chrysost. In Matt. Homil. 35.

Hieronym. contra Luciferianos.

Hieronym. in Sophoniam. Cap. 1.

And therefore Cardinal Cusanus saithe, Maxima ex hac re deformitas oritur, quòd Prælati tantùm Sæcularibus curis inuigilant: *Hereof groweth a greate deformitie, that* Bishoppes are bente onely to vvorldly cares. Marke wel theise wordes, M. Vardinge: Ye saithe, Your Bishoppes are bente onely to vvorldly cares.

Concil. Trident. Sub Paulo. 3

If ye wil beleeue none of theise, yet youre Popes owne Legates, in youre late Chapter at Trident, speakinge of your Priestelike Apparel, saie thus: Nihil à Laicis, præterquam in Vestis genere, ac ne in hoc quidem differunt: *Our Priestes differ nothinge from* Laiemenne, *sauinge onely in Apparel: nay, in deede they differ not so muche from them, as in Apparel.*

Admonitio Legator.

Ye saie, Your Bishoppes are gaie, and gallante, attended, and garded with Princelike routes, bothe behinde, and before: And thereof ye make no smalle accounpte, specially in respecte of our estate, whiche you calle beggerly. In sutch disdeigne the Heathens sometime saide, *That* Christe *was the* Beggerliest, and Poorest *of al the* Goddes *that were in Heauen.* Howe be it, our Bishoprikes, sauinge that certaine of your Fathers haue shamefully spoiled them, are nowe, euen as they were before. Certainely the Poorest Bishoprike in Englande, as it is reported, is better in reuenewes, then somme three of your Popes Italian Bishoprikes in the Kingedome of Naples. Howe be it, the Gospel of Christe standeth not by Richesse, but by Truthe. In comparison of the ons, we make smal reckeninge of the other.

Anentinus. Lib. 3. De Ruperto. Christū omnium Deorū esse paupe-rimum.

Neuertheless, the Wise, and Godly haue euermore founde fault with the Ecclesiastical Brauerie of your Romaine Clergie. S. Bernarde saithe, Inde est, quem quotidiè vides, Meretricius Nitor: Histrionicus habitus: Regius Apparatus. Inde Aurum in Frenis, in Sellis, in Calcaribus: *Therehence commethe theire Whoorelike Fineneſſe: theire Players Weede: theire Princely Apparel. Therehence commethe theire Goulde in theire Bridle, in theire Saddels, and in theire Spurres.* Againe he saithe, Incedunt nitidi, & ornati,

Bernard. in Cantica Ser. 33. Holcote in Sapien. Lectio. 23. Bernard. in Cantica. Serm. 77.

Ecclesiastical brauerie in Apparel.

ornati, circumamicti varietatibus, tanquam Sponsa procedens de Thalamo suo. Nonne si quempiam talium eminùs procedentem aspexeris Sponsam potiùs putabis, quam Sponsæ Custodem? *They goe trimly, and finely in theire coulours, as if a Spouse shoulde comme from her Chamber. If thou shouldest suddainely see one of them ietting a farre of, wouldest thou not rather thinke, it were a Spouse, then the keeper of the Spouse?*

Laurentius Valla. **although bitterly, yet not vnpleasantely, thus expresseth your Lordly Brauerie.** Existimo, si qua inter Dæmones, qui aereim incolunt, ludorum genera exercentur eos exprimendo Clericorum cultu, fastu, luxu exerceri, & hoc scenici ludius genere maximè delectari: *I thinke, if the Diuels in the aire haue any games emonge them, to make sport withal, they are moste busily occupied in counterfeiting the* apparel, and attire, and Pride, and riot of Priestes, *and haue greatest pastime in this kinde of Mascarie.* *Laur. Valla de Donatione Constan.*

Pope Bonifacius. 8. **in a great** Iubilee, **and in a Solemne** procession, **went apparelled in the** Emperours Roabes: **and had the** Crovvne Emperial **on his Heade, and the** Svverde of Maiestie **borne before him, as an** Emperoure. *Paralipome, Vrspergen.*

This Spirituall Ioilitie, **M. Hardinge, liketh you wel. Notwithstanding** S Bernard **saithe,** Dæmonum magis, quàm Ouium, sunt hæc pascua. Scilicet, ic facitabat Petrus: sic Paulus ludebat: *Theise be Pastures for Diuels, not for Sheepe. No doubte, & euen thus did Peter: euen suche pastime plaide* S. Paule. *Bernard. De cõsiderationi ad Eugenium. Lib. 1.*

Yet tel vs further, Though they teache not, though they liue not, though they doo not, thoughe they liue not, as becommeth Bishoppes, nor as becommeth a Christian man, yet bee they Bishoppes notwithstandinge. **Hereat we will not greatly striue. For so the** Vvoulfe **if he once geate a Sheepehoke, and a Cloke, maie be a Shephearde: and a Blinde man if he geate once into the Watch Tower, maie be a Spie. But miserable are the Poore Sheepe, that so are feede: miserable is that Poore Castle, that so is watched.**

S. Augustine **saith,** Episcopatus est nomen Operis, non Honoris: vt intelligat, se non esse Episcopum, qui præ esse dilexerit, non prodesse: *A* Bishoppes *Office is a name of Labour, and not of Honoure: that, who so loueth to rule, and not to profite, may vnderstand himselfe to be no* Bishop. **Againe he saithe of suche a one,** Canis impudicus dicendus est magis quàm Episcopus: *He ought rather to be called a shameleſſe* Dogge, *then a* Bishop. *8 que. 1. Qui Episcopatum Augustin. 2. que. 7. qui nõ. Augustin. contra Donatist. Lib. 6.*

As, for that yee saie, Your Bishoppes be duely Ordinated, and Consecrated. S. Augustine replieth, Ipsum Characterem multi, & Lupi, & Lupis imprimunt: *Touchinge the outwarde Consecration of a* Bishop, *many geeue it to Woulues, and be Woulues them selues.* *Bernard. De Consideratione ad Eugen. Lib. 3.*

S. Bernard **speakinge of your** Priestes, **and** Bishoppes, **saithe,** Habitu Milites: quæstu Clericos: actu neutros exhibent. Nam neque vt Milites, pugnant: neque vt Clerici euangelizant. Cuius ergo Ordinis sunt? Cum vtriusque esse cupiant, vtrunque deserunt: vtrunque confundunt. Vnusquisque, inquit, in suo Ordine resurget? In quo ritu? An qui sine Ordine peccauerunt, sine Ordine peribunt? Vereor, non alibi Ordinandus, quàm vbi nullus Ordo, sed sempiternus horror inhabitat: *In their apparel, they are* Souldiers: *in their gaines, they are* Priestes, *and* Bishoppes: *but in effecte, and in deede, they are neither of bothe. For neither do they fight in the fielde, as doo* Souldiers: *nor doo they preache, as* Priestes, *and* Bishoppes. *Of whether Order therefore be they? Whereas they woulde be of bothe Orders, they forsake bothe, and confounde bothe.* S. Paule *saithe, Euery man shal rise againe in his owne Order. But in what Order shal theise rise? Whether, for as muche, as they haue sinned without Order, shal they perishe without Order? I feare me, they shalbe Ordered none otherwhere, but where as is no Order, but disorder, and horroure Euerlastinge.* *1. Corinth. 15.*

Thus plainely speake your owne Doctoures, touching your Cleregie: **whiche plainenesse it pleaseth you, M. Hardinge, to calle** false, and malicious railinge.

The Apologie. Cap. 10. Diuision.

Surely, to haue the principal staie, and effecte of al maters committed wholy to these mens handes, who neither know, nor wil knowe these thinges, nor yet set a iote by any pointe of Religion, **saue that, whiche concerneth theire bellie, and riote, and to haue them alone sitte as** Iudges, **& to be sette vp as ouerseers in the Watche tower, being no better**

Supreme Heade. Supreme Gouernoure.

better then Blinde Spies: of the other side, to haue a Christian Prince of good vnderstandinge, and of a right iudgemente, to stande stil like a block, or a stake, not to be suffered, neither to geue his voice, nor to shew his iudgement, but onely to waite, what thiese menne shall will, and commaunde, as one, which had neither eares, nor eies, nor witte, nor harte, and, what so euer they geeue in charge, to allowe it without exception, blindely fulfillinge theire Commaundementes, be they neuer so blasphemous, and wicked, yea, although they commaund him quite to destroie al Religion, and to Crucifie againe Christe him selfe, This surely, bisides that it is proude, and spiteful, is also beyonde al right, and reason, and not to be endured of Christian, and wise Princes. For why, I praie you, maie Caiphas, and Annas vnderstande these maters, and maie not Dauid, and Ezechias doo the same? Is it lawful for a Cardinal, being a man of warre, and deliting in Bloude, to haue place in a Councel: and is it not lawful for a Christian Emperoure, or a Kinge?

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Hereto M. Hardinge saithe nothinge, but that he hathe oftentimes said before.

The Apologie, Cap. 11. Diuision. 1.

Verily, wee graunte no further Libertie to our Magistrates, then that we knowe hathe bothe benne geuen them by the Woorde of God, and also benne confirmed by the Examples of the very beste gouerned Common Wealthes.

M. Hardinge.

If a man shoulde aske you, where that woorde of God is, that maketh a Temporal Prince Supreme heade of that parte of the Churche, whiche he hathe gouernemente of in al Ciuil maters, I am sure you can bringe foorthe(a) no other woorde of God, then that, wherein S. Peter, and S. Paule willeth al menne to obeie the Superiour powers, especially Kinges. Which thinge was written to al Christian men, whiles they liued vnder Heathen Princes, and Infidels, as Claudius Cesar, and Nero were, whome, I suppose, ye wil not saie to haue benne heades of the whole Churche, as they were Monarkes and Princes of the whole world. If then by those Scriptures whiche cannot proue Nero(beinge a(b) persecutour of Christes Church) to haue benne heade of the same, you wil nowe proue, that other Princes are supreme heades of the Churche: it seemeth that either you make Nero heade of the Church with them, or geue more vnto them, then the word of God wil beare. And as for examples of good Common Weales, shewe vs but one since Christes ascension, wherein before Luthers time, any Emperoure Christian, or other Prince did attribute that title vnto him selfe: and wee wil saie, that when you speake of Common Weales in the plural number, you make but one lie: but in case you shewe vs no one Common Weale that hathe so done, then you lie in the plural number. Yea further, if at this daie the Common Weales in Christendome, not onely that are Catholike, but the best also of those, that Lutherishe, and newfangled, doo abhorre from that straunge and vnhard title of (c) Supreme heade of the Churche, whie doo you saie, that yee haue, either Woorde of God for it, or example of approued Common weales?

(a) Vntruthe. For we alleage many other places bisides, as it may lone appeare.

(b) Then can not the Pope be heade of the Churche? For he hathe persecuted the Churche as Nero.

(c) Much a do about nothig: For our Prince hathe not this Title. But Queene Marie had, and vsed the same title of Supreme Heade, as many waies it maie be proued.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Concerninge the title of Supreme Heade of the Churche, wee neede not to search for Scripture to excuse it. For, first, wee diuised it not: Secondly, wee vse it not: Thirdly, our Princes at this present claime it not. Your Fathers, M. Hardinge, first entituled that most Noble, and most Worthy Prince, Kinge Henry the Eighthe, with that Vnused, and Straunge Style, as it maie wel be thought, the rather to bringe him into the talke, and sclaunder of the worlde.

Howe be it, that the Prince is the Higheste Iudge, and Gouernoure ouer al his Subiectes what so euer, as wel Prieستes, as Laie menne, without exception, it is most euidente, by that hathe benne already saide: by that shalbe said hereafter: by the whole

course

Supreme Heade.

Supreme Gouernoure.

course of the Scriptures: and by the vndoubted practise of the Primatiue Churche. Verily, the Prince as it shal afterwarde better appeare, had Bothe the Tables of the lawe of God euermore committed to his charge: as wel the Firste, that perteineth to Religion as also the Seconde, that perteineth to Ciuile Gouernement.

But now, M Hardinge, if a man would aske you, by what VVorde of God your Prieſtes, and Bishoppes haue exempted them ſelues from the Judgement, and Gouernement of theire Princes: Or, by what VVorde of God the Princes hande is reſtreined more from his Cleargie, then from other his Subiectes: or, by what VVorde of God, ye would stablishe Twoo Supreme Gouernoures in one Realme, I marueile, in what Scriptures ye woulde ſeeke to finde it. Your owne Doctoures and Gloſers ſaie, as it is before alleged: Quæritur, quis exemit Clericum de Iurisdictione Imperatoris, cùm priùs eſſet illi Subiectus? Dicit Laurentius, quòd Papa de conſenſu Principis: *Queſtion is moued, who hath exempted the* Prieſte *from the Iuriſdiction of the* Emperoure, *whereas before he was his ſubiecte?* Laurentius *ſaithe* (not the VVoorde of God, but) *the* Pope *exempted him, by the conſente of the* Prince. *Extra de Maioritat. & Obedien. ca. 2. in mar.*

Further, M Hardinge, we beſeeche you, by what VVoorde of God can your Pope claime him ſelfe to be the Heade of the Vniuerſal Churche of God? Where is it recorded? Where is it written? In what parte of the Teſtamente, Newe, or olde? In what Lawe? In what Prophete? In what Epiſtle? In what Goſpel? Where is his Headship? Where is his Vniuerſal power? If ye can finde it, then may ye ſhewe it: If it cannot be founde, then ſhoulde ye not ſaie it. As for that you, and other your Felowes haue alleged before, for proufe hereof, it is ſo childiſhe, and ſo weake, that, I thinke, ye cannot nowe come againe with the ſame, without bluſhing.

Touchinge the Right, that we ſaie, belongeth vnto al Chriſtian Princes, it hath benne inueſted, and planted in them from the beginninge. For, to leaue other Authorities of the Scriptures, Pope Eleutherius him ſelfe wrote thus vnto Lucius, ſometime Kinge of this Realme of Englande: Vos eſtis Vicarius Dei in Regno, iuxta Prophetam Regium: You are Goddes Vicare within your owne Realme, *accordinge to the Prophete* Dauid. *Epiſt. Eleut. Cuntur inter Leges Edwardi primi.*

Paule the Bishop of Apamea, writeth thus vnto the Emperoure Iuſtinian in a cauſe mere Eccleſiaſtical, touchinge Religion: Tranſtulit ipſum Dominus, vt Plenitudinem directionis veſtræ cuſtodiret Serenitati: *Our Lorde hath taken* Pope Agapetus *away, that he might leaue the fulneſſe of order* (concerning theſe Heretiques, Dioſcorus, and Eutiches) *vnto your* Maieſtie. *Quinta Synodi actio. 1. piſſimo.*

Tertullian ſaithe, Colimus Imperatorem, vt hominem à Deo Secundum, Solo Deo Minorem: *Wee woorſhip the* Emperoure, *as a man nexte vnto God, and inferioure onely vnto God.* *Tertullian. ad Scapulã.*

And, notwithſtandinge the name of Heade of the Churche belonge peculiarly, and onely vnto Chriſte as his onely Right, and Enheritance (for as the Churche is the Body, ſo Chriſte is the Heade) yet maie the ſame ſometimes alſo be applied in ſober meaninge, and good ſenſe, not onely vnto Princes, but alſo vnto others, far inferiour vnto Princes. Chriſoſtome ſaithe, Videntur mihi iſtæ mulieres Caput fuiſſe Eccleſiæ, quæ illic erat: *It ſeemeth vnto me,* that theſe vveemen vvere the Heade of the Churche, *that was at* Philippi. Likewiſe againe, ſpeakinge of the Emperoure, he ſaithe thus: Læſus eſt, qui non habet parem vllum ſuper terram. Summitas, & Caput omnium ſuper terram hominum: *Wee haue offended him, that in the Earthe hath no peere, the* Toppe, *and the* Heade of all menne in the vvoorlde. If he were the Heade of al menne, then was he the Heade, not onely of Biſhoppes, and Cardinalles, but alſo of the Pope him ſelfe: Onleſſe the Pope were no man. *Chryſo. in Epi. ad Phil. Hom. 13.* A vvoman heade of the Churche. *Chryſoſt. ad populũ Ant. Homi. 2.*

To conclude, our Princes nede no more to claime theire Lawfull Authoritie, and Emperial Righte, by the example of Nero, wherof ye haue moued mutche vntimely, and wanton talke, then your Pope needeth to claime his Vſurped, and Coloured Power, by the Examples of Annas, and Caiphas.

The Apologie. Cap. 11. Diuiſion. 2.

For beſides that, a Chriſtian Prince hath the charge of Both Tables

Supreme Heade. Supreme Gouernoure.

committed to him by God, to the ende he maie vnderſtande, that, not Temporal matters onely, but alſo Religious and Eccleſiaſtical Cauſes perteine to his office, &c.

M. Hardinge.

You wil proue that Eccleſiaſtical cauſes perteyne to a Kinges office, becauſe he hath the charge of bothe Tables. If you meane that a Kinge is bound to keepe both Tables of the Lawe, ſo is alſo euery priuate man. And yet, as no priuate man is ſupreme heade of the Churche by keeping them, ſo neither the king is proued there by the (a) ſupreme heade. If you meane that the kinge ought to ſee others to keepe bothe Tables of the Lawe: that maie he doo, either in appointing temporal paines for the tranſgreſſours of them, or in executing the ſaide paines vpon the tranſgreſſours. But as he cannot excommunicate any man for not appearing, when he is called, ſo can he not iudge al cauſes of the lawe. For if a man ſinne onely in his harte, as for example in Murther, or Aduoutrie, the kinge cannot haue to doo with him. And yet the true ſupreme heade of the Churche ſhal haue to do with him. For that malicious and ſinful thought (b) ſhal neuer be forgiuen, except the party come to be abſolued of their ſucceſſours, to whom Chriſte ſaide, whoſe ſinnes yee forgiue, they are forgiuen: and whoſe ſinnes ye reteine, they are reteined. To commit murder in harte, is a ſinne, and it is reteined vntil it be forgiuen. (c) Neither can it be forgiuen, vntil he that is iudge, by the keie of diſcretion, perceiue that it is to be forgiuen. Whiche he cannot know, vntil it be confeſſed with a contrite harte, by him who onely knoweth it, and is bounde to tel it, for abſolutions ſake. If then there be a iudge, who can ſee the lawe kepte in an higher pointe, and beyonde the reache of the Kinge, ſurely the Kinge ſhal not be ſupreme heade, ſithe an other is more like to God, then he. As who is iudge of the inwarde conſcience, whereunto no kinge reacheth, but * onely the miniſter of Chriſte, who is the ſpiritual Kinge, * and hath giuen the keies of his Kingdome to his miniſter.

(a) A grane diſputer. Ye concludde againſte that, that is not auouched.

(b) Vntruthe, fonde, and maniſeſt, and leadinge directly to deſperation.

(c) Vntruthe, ioyned withe blaſphemie. Reade the Anſweare.

* Afonde folie. For this Keie is geuen nomore to the Pope, then to any other ſimple Prieſte.

Iohn. 20.

Math. 16.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie

Here, M. Hardinge, ye roaue, and wander without a marke, and replie to that, that was not ſpoken. I marueile, whereof ye can ſpinne your ſelfe ſuche idle talke. For we neither calle our Princes the Heades of the Churche of Chriſte: (it was your Fathers inuention, and not ours) nor ſaie we, They haue power, either to Excõmunicate or to binde or to Looſe: nor haue we leaſure to make ſutche vaine concluſions.

Thus we ſaie, the Prince is put in truſte, as wel with the Firſte, as with the Seconde Table of the Lawe of God: that is to ſaie, as wel with Religion, as with Temporal Gouernemente: not onely to kepe, and perfourme the contentes of Bothe Tables in his owne perſone (for ſo muche euery priuate man is bounde to do) but alſo to ſee, that al others his Subiectes, as wel Priettes, as Laiemenne, eche man in his callinge, do dewly kepe them. This is it, that no priuate man is able to do. Therefore S. Auguſtine ſaithe, In hoc ſeruiunt Domino Reges, in quantum ſunt Reges, cum ea faciunt ad ſeruiendum illi, quæ non poſſunt facere, niſi Reges: *Herein* Kinges *ſerue the Lorde, in that they be* Kinges, *when they doo thoſe thinges to ſerue him, that noman can doo, but onely* Kinges. We ſaie not, the Prince is bounde to do the Biſhoppes dewty: And therefore it is the greater folie of your part, M. Hardinge, to obiecte it ſo often. Wiſe menne vſe not ſo to aduenture theire wordes in vaine. But thus we ſaie, The Prince is bounde to ſee the Biſhoppes to doo theindueties.

Auguſt. in Epiſt. 50. ad Bonifac.

But what meante you, ſo far out of ſeaſon, to talke ſo fondly of your priuie Confeſſion, of Binding, and Looſinge, and powver of Keies? For as it is ſaide before, we ſaie not, that Princes maie, either Binde, or Looſe, or Miniſter Sacramentes: or preache the Gospel, or ſitte downe, and heare Confeſſions. Therefore with all this greate adoe, ye foine onely at your owne ſhadowe, and hit nothinge.

Ye ſaie ful diſcretely, If a man ſinne onely in his harte, the Kinge cannot haue to doo with him, for that he cannot enter to knowe his ſecretes. Here, I beſeach you, M. Harding, what entrance then hath the Pope to knowe the ſecretes of the Harte? Perhaps ye wil ſaie, the Pope maie knowe al the worlde by Confeſſion. But S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Quid mihi eſt cum hominibus, vt audiant confeſſiones meas, &c. Vnde ſciunt, cum à me ipſo de me ipſo audiunt, an verum dicam? quandoquidem nemo ſcit hominum quid agatur in homine, niſi Spiritus hominis, qui in ipſo eſt: *What haue I to doo with theſe menne, that they ſhoulde heare my* Confeſſions, *&c. How know they, when they heare me reporte of mee ſelfe, whether I ſaie true, or no? For noman knoweth, what is in man, but the Sprite of man, that is within him.* Againe he ſaithe vnto the people, Intrantes vos, & exeuntes poſſumus videre. Vſque adeò autem non videmus, quid cogitetis in cordibus veſtris, vt neque quid agatis in domibus veſtris

Aug. Confeſſ. Lib. 10. ca. 3.

Aug. in Pſal. 126.

Supreme Heade. Supreme Gouernoure.

veſtris videre poſſumus: *We maie ſee you commynge in, and goinge forthe. But wee are ſo far from ſeeinge the thoughtes of your hartes, that wee can not ſee, what you doo at home in youre houſes.* **Likewiſe againe he ſaithe,** Quid ſingulorum quorunq; modo conſcientiæ dixerint, ad aures meas, quia homo ſum, peruenire non potuit. Ille, qui Abſens eſt præſentia Corporis, ſed præſens eſt Vigore Maieſtatis, audiuit vos: *What euery of your conſciences hath ſaide, it coulde not enter vnto my eares, for that I am but a Mortal man. Notwithſtandinge,* Chriſte, *that is Abſente, as touchinge the preſence of his* Body, *but preſente by the power of his* Maieſtie, *hath hearde you wel.* **It is, not the** Pope, **but** God **onely, that** trieth the reines, and ſearcheth the harte. *Auguſt. in Pſal. 127.*

Yet yée ſaie, the true Supreme Heade **of the** Churche **ſhal haue to doo with him, that ſinneth onely ſecretely in his harte:** For that malicious, and ſinful thought (**you ſaie**) ſhal neuer be forgiuen, excepte the partie come to be abſolued of their Succeſſours, to whom Chriſte ſaide, Whoſe ſinnes ye forgeeue, &c. **This, M. Hardinge, is the** Supreme Folie **of al other** Folies. **For, firſte, where euer hearde you, that the** Pope **woulde once vouchſaue to** Heare Confeſſions? **And, if he woulde, yet by your owne Doctoures Iudgemente, the** Pope **hath nomore power to** Binde, **and to** Looſe, **then any other poore ſimple Prieſte. As I haue ſhewed you before,** Alphonſus de Caſtro **ſaithe,** Quando Abſoluit Simplex Sacerdos, tantum Abſoluit de Culpa, ſicut Papa: *When a* Simple Prieſte *Abſolueth, he Abſolueth as mutche touchinge the faulte, as if it were the* Pope *him ſelfe.* Origene **ſaithe,** Quæ ſequuntur, velut ad Petrum dicta, ſunt omnium communia, &c. Quod ſi nos idem loquimur, quod Petrus loquutus eſt, efficimur Petrus: *The woordes that folowe, as ſpoken vnto* Peter, *are common vnto al. If wee ſpeake the ſame, that* Peter *ſpake, then are wee made* Peter. **Euen in the** Popes **owne** Gloſe **vpon his** Decretalles **it is noted thus,** In neceſſitate Laicus poteſt, & Audire Confeſſiones, & Abſoluere: *In caſe of neceſſitie a Laieman maie bothe heare Confeſſions, and alſo geeue Abſolutions.* **Yet will yée not ſaie, that euery Laieman is** Peters Succeſſoure. *Alp. de Hæreſi. li. 2. De Abſolutione. Origen. in Matthæ. Tractat. 1. Extra. De offic. Iudicis Ordina. Paſtoralis. In Gloſſa.*

To what purpoſe then ſerueth al this your vaine talke, M. Hardinge, The true Supreme Heade of the Churche ſhal haue to doo with him, that ſinneth onely in his harte? **For euery** Simple Prieſte, **hauing the keie of Goddes woorde, entreth into the harte, and hath to doo with the ſame, as wel, and as mutche, and as dirpely, as the** Pope: **and in reſpecte of beinge** Iudge **of the** Conſcience, **is aboue** Kinges **and** Princes **no leſſe then he.**

But where yée ſaie, The malicious, and ſinful thought ſhal neuer be forgeuen, excepte the partie come to be Abſolued of their Succeſſours, to whom Chriſte ſaide, whoſe ſinnes yee forgeue, &c. **this Doctrine is not onely ſtrange, and falſe, but alſo ful of Deſperation. Your owne** Gratian **ſaithe,** Latentia peccata non probantur neceſſario Sacerdoti confitenda: *It is not proued* **(by any ſufficient authoritie of** Scriptures, **or of** Doctours) *that ſecrete ſinnes are of neceſſitie to be vttered in Confeſſion vnto the* Prieſt. **Againe he ſaith,** Datur intelligi, quod etiam, ore tacente, veniam conſequi poſſumus: *It is giuen vs to vnderſtande, that wee maie obtaine pardone, althoughe wee vtter nothinge with our mouthe.* **And againe,** Non Sacerdotali iudicio, Sed largitate Diuinæ Gratiæ peccator emendatur: *The ſinner is cleanſed, not by the* Iudgement of the Prieſte, *but by the abundance of* Goddes grace. **Againe he ſaithe,** Confeſſio Sacerdoti offertur in ſignum veniæ, non in cauſam Remiſſionis accipiendæ: *Confeſſion is made vnto the* Prieſte, *in token of forgeueneſſe already obteined: not as a cauſe of Forgeueneſſe to be obteined.* **Your very** Gloſe **ſaithe,** Apud Græcos Confeſſio non eſt neceſſaria: quia non emanauit ad illos Traditio talis: *Emong the Chriſtians in* Græcia Confeſſion of ſinnes is not neceſſarie: *for that this Tradition neuer came emonge them.* **Yet, M. Hardinge, I trowe, yée will not ſaie, but their ſinnes maie bee forgeuen.** *De pœnit. Diſt. 1. Quis aliquando. De pœ. diſt. 1. Conuertimini. In eodem ca. De pœ. diſt. 1. Omnis qui. De pœ. di. 5. In pœnitent. In Gloſſa.*

Certainely Chriſoſtome **ſaithe,** Solus te Deus confitentem videat: *Let God onely ſee thee makinge the Confeſſion of thy ſinnes.* *Chryſo. De Confeſſ. & pœnit.*

It was very mutche therefore, M. Hardinge, for you, ſo aſſuredly, and ſo preciſely to ſaie, that ſinnes can neuer be forgeuen without your Priuie Confeſſion: and ſpecially thereby to proue the Vniuerſal Headſhip of the Pope.

The Apologie, Cap. 11. Diuiſion. 3.

Beſides alſo, that God **by his Prophetes often, & earneſtly cõmaundeth the** King, **to cutte downe the Groues, to breake downe the** Images

Supreme Heade.

Supreme Gouernoure.

and Aultars of Idoles: and to write out the Booke of the Lawe for him selfe: and besides that, the Prophete Esaias saithe, A Kinge ought to be a Patrone, and a Nurse of the Churche, &c.

M. Hardinge.

(a) The Kinge is the Priestes Executioner.

(b) O Vanitie of Vanities: Aaron the Bishop set vp the golden Calfe, and cried vnto the people, This is thy God. But Moses the Ciuile Magistrate, or Prince brake it downe.

(c) Ful discretly. As thoughe kinges had not Officers, to keepe their Recordes.

(d) Vntruthe. For wee haue falsified no part hereof, as it shal appeare.

*Here M. Ha woulde faine saie somewhat if he wiste what it were. Reade the Answeare.

(e) by this pretye conclusion, the king is the seruant, and the Priest is the Maister.

Your seconde argumente for the Ecclesiastical power of Kinges is, because God had them to cut downe superstitious groues, and ouerthrowe idols: (a) as though this were not an office of executing a commaundement, rather then of decreeing any thing. The authoritie to discerne an image of Christe from an idol of the Deuil, belongeth to them, who knowe, that an image is a name of arte, whiche is of God: an idol is a name of false worshipping, which is of the Deuil. So that an Image is godly: an idol deuilish. When the Priest hath iudged this or that to be an idol, or when it is euident, that so it is, then the King shal doo wel to breake it downe. (b) But if the Kinge wil breake downe the image of Christe, when the Priest telleth him it is a godly representation, and no idol: then the Kinge dothe more then his office requireth, and shal not onely not proue his supremacie, but also shal incurre danger to be reiected of God, as kinge Saule was, when he despised to keepe the commaundement of Samuel the highe Priest. 1. Reg. 15.

Whereas you alleage for a Kinges Ecclesiastical power, that he was commaunded to write out the booke of the Lawe for him selfe: why lefte yee out that, whiche foloweth there immediatly. *Accipiens exemplar a Sacerdotibus Leuitica tribu?* The Kinge muste write out a Booke of the Deuteronomie: but the example thereof he muste receiue of the Priestes that bee of the Tribe of Leui. If in Spirituall matters the Kinge were aboue the Priestes (c) why hadde hee not the keepinge of the Lawe in his owne handes? Why muste he take it of the Priestes? why did not rather the Priestes come to him, sithe the inferioure taketh al his righte of the Superioure? If the Priestes must giue the holy Scripture vnto the king, then verily muste he take suche as they giue him, and with suche meaninge as they geue vnto it. So that if you had not (b) falsified the meaninge of Godder woorde by leauinge out halfe the sentence, this place had proued against you. It is to be weied to what ende a King is required to haue, and to reade that holy booke. Verily not to take vpon him the parte of a iudge in causes of Religion: but as there it is expressed, to the intent he learne to feare his Lorde God, and keepe his woordes and ceremonies in the law commaunded, and that his harte be not lifted vp into pride, aboue his brethren &c. (d) I omitte that you reade, *Librum legis*, whereas the Churche readeth, Deuteronomium, (e) it were too longe to enter into that disputation. The booke of the lawe signifieth the whole lawe, the Deuteronomie is but one of the fiue bookes. Deut. 17.

Where Esaie calleth a Kinge a Patrone of the Churche, I haue not founde. But were it he called him so, it betokeneth that he shoulde defende the Churche from woorldly enimies, as in repelling the Turkes, in expellinge Heretikes, and suche like kingely actes. Whiche proueth no spiritual supremacie, but vnder God a fealtie, and seruiceable power. I finde where Esaie saithe, *Et erunt Reges nutricij tui, & Regina nutrices tuæ.* Kinges shalbe thy fosterers, and queenes thy nourses. But not euery nourse, or fosterer is aboue him, who is nourished. (c) A faithefull seruante oftentimes fostereth the maister. Yet is he not aboue his maister. Besides, S. Hierome vnderstandeth the Kinges, whom Esaie nameth, to be the Apostles: according to whiche sense it maketh nothing to the purpose as it is alleaged for. Cap. 49.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

De Maior. & Obedient. vnam Sanct. Psal. 2. Authen. Cõstitu. 123. καὶ ἐδὲ ἡμεῖς τοῦτα ἀνακαλύπτα κατ᾽ αλήθειαν. *Fran. Zaba. De Scisma. & Concil.*

Al Christian Princes are mutche beholden to you, M. Hardinge: yée make them so like to Polyphemus the Giante after his eies were striken out: that is to saie, to a man mighty in body, and greate in boanes: but starke blinde, and no waie hable to guide him selfe. A Kinge yée saie, maie not take vpon him to iudge, or pronounce in maters of Religion, be they neuer so cleare: but onely must hearken, and be ready to execute, what so euer shalbe thought good, and commaunded by your Bishops: as if he were onely your Bishops man. So saithe your holy Father Pope Bonifacius 8. Gladius Materialis exercendus est manu Regum, & Militum: Sed ad nutum, & patientiam Sacerdotis: *The Material, or Temporal Swerde muste be vsed by the hande of Kinges, and Souldiers: but at the becke, and sufferance of the* Priest: By whiche Priest he meaneth the Pope.

But Dauid saithe, *Nowe, yee* Kinges, *haue vnderstandinge: Be learned, yee, that iudge the Earthe.* Good kinges haue oftentimes reformed Religion, and haue lawfully controlled, and corrected, and deposed idle, and wicked Bishoppes: as before, in place conuenient, it is largely proued. The Emperour Iustinian threateneth, if the Bishop offended in saying the publique Seruice, or in the Ministration of the Sacramentes, that then he him selfe woulde vse his Authoritie ouer him, and see him punished. Franciscus Zabarella saithe, *That for any crime notorious, the* Emperour *maie summone the* Pope *to appeare before his Maiestie, and maie require him, to yeelde a reckening of his Faithe* And yet wil yée saie, *The* Emperoure *is stil the* Popes *man, and maie iudge nothinge in causes of Religion without him.*

The

The Kinge (yꝛ ſaie) is not able to iudge, whether an Idole be an Idole or no, but by the leadinge, and teachinge of the Prieſte. So wel yꝛ wiſhe al Chriſtian Princes were inſtructed, that they ſhoulde not be hable, either to ſée, oꝛ to ſpeake without you. But what if youre Prieſtes ſaie, as it hath often happened, God is an Idole, and an Idole is God? Lighte is Darkeneſſe, and Darkeneſſe is Light? what if they ſaie, Greate is Diana the Goddeſſe of Epheſus? What if they condemne the innocente, and ſaie, as they ſometime ſaide of Chriſte, *Onleſſe this man were a maleſactoure, we would neuer haue brought him to thy hand?* Yet muſte the Prince neuertheleſſe drawe his ſwerde, and ſtrike, when, and whom ſo euer the Prieſte biddeth: and blindly execute his wicked wil? In déede, M. Hardinge, you ſaie preciſely: If the mater decreed be Spiritual, and appertaining to Faithe, the Prince ought to obeie without queſtion or grudge. Likewiſe againe yꝛ ſaie, It ſhal be ynoughe for you, to doo, as the Succeſſours of Peter bid you to doo. Chriſte nowe requireth of you, not to obeie Peter, and Paule: but to obeie him that ſitteth in their Chaire. What ſo euer he ſaie, True oꝛ falſe. Foꝛ this, no doubt, muſte be your meaninge.

The iudgeth in eccleſiaſtical cauſes. *Eſai. 5. Actor. 19. Johan. 18. M. Hardi. Pag. 302. A M. Hardi. Pag. 192. A. Pag. 192. b.*

The Kinge was bounde to wꝛite out the Booke of the Lavve: This (yꝛ ſaie) proueth not the kinges Superiortie ouer the Prieſtes. No verily, M. Hardinge: Neither was it alleged by vs to that purpoſe. Neuertheleſſe, hereby it appeareth, that God woulde haue the Kinge to be learned in his Lavves.

But the Kinge *muſte receiue the* Booke *of the* Prieſte, *and of none other:* Therfore, ſaie you, the Prieſte is aboue the Kinge. Yꝛ thinketh, M. Hardinge, euen foꝛ your credites ſake, yꝛ ſhould loke better to your Logique. Foꝛ what auaileth the deliuerie of a Booke, to make the Prieſte, either higher, oꝛ lower? When the Pope is at his Conſecration, the Cardinal, that is his orderer, deliuereth him a Booke of the Epiſtles & Goſpelles. Will yꝛ therefoꝛe conclude, that the ſaide Cardinal is aboue the Pope? Mary God foꝛbidde.

Ceremoniar. Li. 1. Sect. 2.

Goddes meaninge, touchinge this Ceremonie, was this, that the Kinges Booke ſhoulde be true, and fautleſſe. And therefoꝛe God commaunded him to take a Copie thereof out of the Regiſtrie, oꝛ Recoꝛdes, whiche were thought to be voide of al coꝛruption, and were euermoꝛe kepte in the Temple, vnder the cuſtodie of the Prieſtes. Paulus Phagius ſaithe, *Euery Priuate man was commaunded to haue one Booke ſeuerally to him ſelfe: But the Kinge was commaunded to haue twoo. And foꝛ as muche as the Kinge was a Publique perſone, therefoꝛe God willed him to take his Copie out of the publique Recordes of the Temple.*

Paul. Phag. in Deu. c. 17.

Your owne Hugo Cardinalis ſaithe, Accipiet exemplar à Sacerdotibus: non à quibuſlibet, ſed a bonis: Vbi nihil fucatum eſt: nihil corruptum: *He ſhal take his Copie of the Prieſtes: not of euery Prieſte, what ſo euer: but of the good: that in the ſame Copie there be nothinge, neither coloured, nor corrupted.*

Hugo in Deu. Ca. 17.

Al this, M. Hardinge, wil hardely proue your ſtrange Concluſion, that the Prieſte vvas Superiour to the Kinge: It ſeemeth mutche better to proue the contrarie, that the Prieſte vvas the Kinges Inferioure, and his Subiecte, and his Clerke of Recoꝛdes, as beinge appointed to kepe his Bookes. So S. Auguſtine ſaith, the Iewes this daie kepe the very true Bookes of the Scriptures: Al be it, not foꝛ their owne vſe, but onely foꝛ ours. And therefoꝛe he ſaithe, they be, not our Superiours, but our Seruantes.

Au. Contra. Fauſt. li. 16. cap. 21. Et in Pſal. 58. Et ſæpe alibi.

Certainely, concerninge the Kinges and Prieſtes of the Olde Lavve, one of youre owne frendes, whom foꝛ many cauſes yꝛ maie not wel refuſe, ſayeth thus: In Veteri Lege Sacerdotium indignius erat Poteſtate Regia, & ei Subiectum: *In the* Olde lavve *the* Prieſtes *Office was Inferioure to the* Prince, *and Subiecte vnto him.*

Ioan. de Pa. De Poteſta. Reg. & Papali. Ca. 5.

Yꝛ ſaie, If the Prieſte muſte geeue the Holy Scriptures to the Kinge, then verily muſte he take ſutche as they geeue him: and with ſutche meaninge as they geeue vnto it. Yea, I trowe, thoughe they teare their roabes againſt Chriſte, as Caiphas did, & crie out, He blaſphemeth, yet muſt wꝛ by your Iudgemente, euermoꝛe ſéeke to them foꝛ the ſenſe, and meaninge of the Scriptures. Foꝛ this is the grounde, and Fundation of your Diuinitie: The Scripture of God hath none other ſenſe, but as it ſhal pleaſe the Prieſte to geeue vnto it. But S. Chryſoſtome ſpeakinge of the ſame Prieſtes, and Biſhoppes, from whom wꝛ haue receiued the ſelfe ſame Scriptures, ſaithe thus: Literæ quidem Legis apud illos ſunt: Senſus autem apud nos: *The Letters, oꝛ Wordes of the* Scriptures *are with them: but the*

Chry in Geneſ. Hom. 2.

A Copie. A Double. *true meaninge of them is with vs.*

Here you mutche disaduantage your selfe, and, as you saie, omitte that we reade, *Librum Legis*, whereas the Churche readeth, *Deuteronomium*: for that, as you saie, it were to longe for you to enter into that disputation. Therefore, M. Hardinge, we wil patiently abide your leasure, vntil ye haue founde out the whole mysterie, and considered it better. In the meane season, it shal not be good for you, to be ouer rank with your Cõmentaries, vntil ye better vnderstand the Text. Certainely the wise and learned thinke, that herein ye are mutche deceiued. For, whereas the woordes are these, Describit sibi Deuteronomium Legis huius, they thinke, that, Deuteronomium, in this place, is not put for any one certaine seuerall Booke of the fiue Bookes of Moses, as it is otherwise commonly vsed, but rather for a Copie, or a Draught of the whole Lawe. And in this sense they saie, that, Δευτερονόμιον is none other, but Ἀπόγραφον, that is to saie, a Copie, or a Double. The Italian Translation hath thus, *Esso si scriuera questo Doppio de la Legge.* The Frenche Translation hath, Le double. Leo Iudas translateth it thus, Describet sibi Exemplum Legis huius: *He shal write out from him selfe a* Copie *of this Lawe.* And, for some proufe hereof, it is thus written in the Booke of Iosua: *Afterwarde* Iosua *readde out of the woordes of the* Lawe, *bothe the blessinges, and the curses, accordinge to euery thinge, that is written in the Booke of the* Lawe. *And there was not one woorde of al the thinges, that* Moses *commaunded, but* Iosua *readde the same before the whole* Congregation of Israel. Thus ye see, M. Hardinge, that this woorde, Deuteronomium, in this place signifieth not the fifthe Booke of Moses, as you imagine, but a ful Copie of al the Lawe. And therefore ekteſones I telle you, ye are mutche deceiued.

Questo Doppio. *Le Double.* *Josua. 8.*

Where we allege the woordes of the Prophete Esai, Kinges *shalbe thy Fosterers, and* Queenes *thy Nurses*: ye saie, Euery Nurse, or Fosterer, is not aboue him, that is nourished. A faithful seruante oftentimes fosterech his Maister. Yet is not he aboue his Maister. So lothe ye are, the Kinge shoulde be Superioure to a Priest. And thus haue ye broughte aboute by your handsome Conclusions, that your Priestes be the Maisters and Kinges theire Seruantes. And therefore it is discretely noted in your Glose, Imperator Romanus est Procurator, siue Defensor Romanæ Ecclesiæ: *The* Emperoure of Rome *is the Stewarde, or Bailife of the* Churche of Rome.

Dist. 98. Si imperat. In Glossa.

The Apologie, Cap. 11. Diuision. 4. & 5.

I saie, besides al these thinges, we see by Histories, & by Examples of the beste times, that good Princes euer tooke the Administration of Ecclesiastical maters to perteine to their duetie.

Moses beinge a Ciuile Magistrate, and chiefe guide of the people, both receiued from God, & deliuered to the people al the order for Religion, and Sacrifices, and gaue Aaron the Bishop a behemente, and soare rebuke for makinge the Golden Calfe, and for sufferinge the Corruption of Religion.

Exod. 32.

M. Hardinge.

(a) Vntruthe. For at that time he was no Priest.
(b) Vntruthe. For it proueth the contrarie. Reade the Answeare.
(c) Vntruthe. confessed by M. Hard. frendes. For in the time of Moses lawe the Priest was inferioure to the Prince.

Moses was not onely a Ciuile Magistrate, (a) but also a Priest. In that he had bothe offices, (b) it proueth that a Priest maie haue bothe: but not contrariwise, that a Kinge maie haue bothe. For the greater may include the lesse, but the lesse can not include the greater. (c) The office of a Priest is the highest of al. (d) And Christe comminge naturally of the Kinges line from Dauid, in the tribe of Iuda, yee esteemed that honour nothinge in respect of that he was a Priest according to the order of Melchisedech. Therfore Melchisedech also beinge bothe Priest and Kinge, was not yet saide to be the figure of Christe so mutche concerninge his Kingdome, as his Priesthoode. For Dauid saide of Christe, Thou art a Priest for euer after the order of Melchisedech. As for his kingdome, it was included in his Priestes office. And therefore when wee speake of Christes Kingdome, though in euery respecte he be the very Kinge in deede of al Kinges, and Lord of al Lordes: yet wee assigne it also to haue benne vpon the Crosse, *Vbi regnauit a ligno Deus*, where God reigned from the woode. Accordinge to the same meaninge, whereas the people of Israel were called *Regnum Sacerdotale*, a Priestly Kingdome. S. Peter writinge to the Christians, tourned the order of the woordes, callinge the Churche of Christe, *Sacerdotium Regale*, a Kingely Priesthoode. Moses was both a Priest and a Ciuile Gouernoure, as beinge a figure of Christe, who ioyned bothe togeather, makinge the tribe of Iuda, which was before kingly, nowe also to be priestly. Therefore S. Augustine vpon those woordes of Dauid,

Psal. 109.

Iustinus in Dial. aduersus Tryph. Exod. 19. 1. Pet. 2.

of Dauid, Moſes and Aaron are in the number of his Prieſtes: concludeth, that Moſes muſt needes haue ben a Prieſte. * For (ſaithe he) if he were not a Prieſte, what was he? * *Numquid maior Sacerdote eſſe potuit*, coulde he be greater then a Prieſte? * As who ſhoulde ſaie, there is no greater dignitie then Prieſthoode. And, ſeinge Moſes had the greateſt dignitie, for he ruled al, and conſecrated Aaron highe Biſhop, and his ſonnes Prieſtes, therefore him ſelfe muſte needes haue beene a Prieſte. (e) Nowe if Moſes were bothe, and his chiefe office was prieſthoode, it foloweth by that example, that the Pope may rule temporally, but not that a Kinge may rule ſpiritually. This you haue gained nothinge by this example.

The Pope is a King. Moſes a Prieſte.

(d) Subſtantial Argumentes, whereby to proue the pope a Kinge.

*Diſcretly reaſoned. For al this perteineth as wel to a ſimple prieſte, as to the Pope.

(e) Louania Logique. Moſes conſecrated Aaron: *Ergo*, the Pope is a Kinge.

The Biſhop of Sariſbury.

Here, M. Hardinge hath many greate woꝛdes of ſmal weight. The final Concluſion, and Summa Summarum is this: The Pope muſt needes be a Kinge. And that he pꝛoueth, as his manner is, by theſe his yonge vntiedy Argumentes: Moſes beinge a Ciuile Magiſtrate, oꝛ a Pꝛince, had alſo the Prieſthoode, and was a Prieſt: *Ergo* ſaith he, The Pope, beinge a Prieſte, muſte haue alſo the Kingdome, and be a Kinge. And thus he peꝛceth theſe maters handſomely together, as though, what ſo euer were once in Moſes, ought of neceſſitie to be alſo in the Pope. But if a man ſhould deſire him to pꝛoue his Argumente, and to make it good, and to ſhewe vs, howe theſe peeces may be framed together, I thinke he woulde be faine to take a daie. Firſte, whether Moſes were a Prieſte, oꝛ no, it is not certaine. As foꝛ that M. Hardinge allegeth theſe woꝛdes of Dauid, Moſes, & Aaron in Sacerdotibus eius, he him ſelfe wel knoweth, that the Hebꝛeyue woꝛde there, is doubtfull, and ſignifieth as wel a Prince, as a Prieſte. And therefoꝛe we cannot neceſſarily conclude by foꝛce of theiſe woꝛdes, that Moſes was a Prieſte: It is ſufficiente, that he was the Captaine, and Prince, and had the leadinge of the people.

S. Hierome ſaithe, Vnus Legis, alter Sacerdotij Regulam tenuit: Moſes *helde the rule of the Lawe:* Aaron *the rule of* Prieſthoode. *Hiero. in Pſal. 98.*

Againe he ſaithe, Emiſit ante faciem noſtram Moſen Spiritualem Legem, & Aaron Magnam Sacerdotem: *God ſente out before our faces*, Moſes (not as the Prieſte, but as) *the Spiritual Lawe, and* Aaron *the greate Prieſte.* Euen Hugo, your owne Doctoure, touchinge the ſame woꝛdes, ſaithe thus, Moſes etſi, &c. *Notwithſtanding* Moſes were not a Prieſte, *yet bicauſe he halowed the peoples praiers, &c. he was called a Prieſte. For in the* Scriptures *Great, and Noble menne are called by the name of* Prieſtes. *Hie. in Michaam. ca. 6. Hugo. in Pſal. 98.*

Here your Hugo telleth you, that, notwithſtandinge Moſes were called a Prieſte, yet in deede he was no Prieſte.

Who ſo liſteth to knowe moꝛe hereof, let him reade Sanctus Pagninus, Dauid Kimchi, Nicolaus Lyra, &c.

But if Moſes in deede were a Prieſte, yee ſhoulde dw wel, M. Hardinge, to reſolue vs, Firſt, whether he were a Prieſte boꝛne, oꝛ els afteꝛwaꝛde made a Prieſte. A Prieſte boꝛne, I trowe, yee wil not ſaie. If yee ſaie, he was afteꝛwaꝛde made a Prieſte, then telle vs, by what Biſhop, oꝛ other Creature was he Conſecrate? At whoſe handes receiued he Authoꝛitie? When, where, and to what purpoſe? What Pꝛieſtlike Apparel euer ware he? Oꝛ in what Office, oꝛ Miniſterie euer ſhewed he him ſelfe to be a Prieſte? S. Paule ſaithe, *A* Prieſte *is appointed to offer vp Oblations, and Sacrifices for ſinne.* What Oblations, oꝛ Sacrifices for ſinne, can yee tel vs, that Moſes offered? If he were neither boꝛne a Prieſte, *nor* made a Prieſte, *nor euer knowen by office to be a* Prieſte, then was he, I trowe, a very ſtrange Prieſte. *Hebra. 5.*

If Moſes were the Higheſt Prieſte, and Heade of the Churche, and Aaron likewiſe the Higheſt Prieſte, and in ſo mutche the Heade of the Churche tw, as wel as he, then had the Churche tvvo Higheſt Biſhops, and tvvoo Heades bothe togeather: Whiche thinge were monſtrous, not onely in ſpeache, but alſo in Nature.

Not withſtandinge, whether Moſes at any one certaine time were a Prieſte, oꝛ no, it is a mater not woꝛthy the ſtriuinge. Certaine it is, that beſoꝛe the Lawe was wꝛitten, Kinges, and Princes, and the beſte boꝛne, and Enheritours, and the wealthieſt of the people, were euer Prieſtes. S. Hierome ſaithe, Hebræi tradunt, Primogenitos ſunctos Officio Sacerdotum, & habuiſſe Veſtimentum Sacerdotale: quo indun, Deo Victimas offerebant, antequam Aaron in Sacerdotium eligeretur: The Hebꝛeyue Rabbines ſaie, *Hie. in Q. Hebraicis in Geneſim.*

saie, that the Firste borne children did the office of the Prieſtes, *and had the Prieſtlike Apparel, and wearinge the ſame, offered vp their Sacrifices vnto God, vntil the time, that* Aaron *was choſen into the* Prieſthoode.

Hierony. in Iob. ca.1. *Dist.21. de capitu. in Gloſſ. Inter acta Gelaſij.* Againe he ſaithe, Priuilegium Offerendi Primogenitis, vel Maximè Regibus debebatur: *The Priuilege of offeringe vp Sacrifices, was deve to the Firſte borne of the children, but moſte of al vnto Kinges.* The Heathen Romane Emperoures, as Veſpatianus, Traianus and others, to encreaſe their Maieſtie towardes their Subiectes, beſide the ſtate of the Empiere, woulde alſo be called Pontifices Maximi.

Exod. 29. Therefore wee will graunt M. Hardinge, ſeinge he hath taken ſo mutche paines, aboute a mater not worthy ſo longe talke, that Moſes for ſome litle ſhorte time bare the Office of a Prieſte. Yet neuertheleſſe had he no Ordinarie Prieſthoode: neither was he a Prieſte more, then for the ſpace of two, or three houres, onely vntil he had conſecrated Aaron, and his children, and no lenger. Immediately afterwarde, al this greate Prieſthoode was at an ende. One of your owne Doctours, M. Hardinge, ſaithe

Iohan. de Pariſijs. ca.18. thus, Non erant Sacerdotes Legales, Dignitate, & Officio, ſicut Aaron: Licet in neceſſitate, & propter Defectum Sacerdotum, aliquos actus Sacerdotum fecerint: vt, quòd Moſes inunxit Aaron: propter quòd Moſes Sacerdos dicitur in Pſalmo: *The Firſte borne were not* Prieſtes *in Office, and dignitie, as* Aaron *was notwithſtanding, in caſe of neceſſitie, and for lacke of* Prieſtes, *they did ſome parte of the* Prieſtes *Office: as, that* Moſes *annointed, or conſecrated* Aaron: *for whiche thinge* Moſes *in the* Pſalme *is called a* Prieſte.

This, M. Hardinge, is that Fundation, that muſt nedes beare the burthen of your whole Churche of Rome. The Pope (yée ſaie) muſte be a Kinge, becauſe Moſes was bothe Prince, and Prieſte. And yet your owne Felowes ſaie, Moſes by office and dignitie, was neuer Prieſte. Yée ſaie, The Pope, beinge a Bishop, maie be a Kinge: but of the other ſide, a Kinge maie in no wiſe be a Bishop. And thus, either vnwittingly, or willingly, yée ſeeme to ouerthrowe your owne Poſition. For the example that yée grounde vpon, of Aaron, and Moſes, proueth quite the contrarie. For Moſes being a Prince, did alſo the Office of a Bishop. But Aaron, beinge a Bishop, did neuer the Office of a Prince. Therefore hereof yée mighte better conclude, that a Prince maie be a Bishop: But a Bishop maie not be a Kinge. Streighten your boltes therefore, M. Hardinge and ſhaue them better, before yée ſo ſodainely, I wil not ſaie, ſo rudely, ſhote them from you.

Extra. De Maiorita et Obed Solim, In Gloſſa. H Ioan de Pa. De poteſta. Regia & Papa. ca.5. Neuertheleſſe, yée ſaie, The Prieſthoode whiche is the more, maie conteine the Kingdome beinge the leſſe. In this reſpecte, I trowe, your Gloſe, as it is ſaide before, compareth the Pope to the Sunne, and the Emperour to the Moone: and findeth out ſubſtantially by good Geometrical Proportion, that the Pope is iuſte ſeuen and fiftie times greater, then the Emperoure. Howe be it, your owne Doctours ſaie, as I haue likewiſe ſhewed before, that in the Lawe of Moſes, the Prince was greater then the Prieſte.

That yée allege of the Prieſthoode, and Kingedome of Chriſte ſerueth you to ſmal purpoſe. For, I beſeeche you, what Crowne, what Scepter, what Swerde bare Chriſte? What Eccleſiaſtical prieſthoode had he, but onely, that he executed vpon the Croſſe? Verily touchinge any Ciuile ſhewe, or outwarde Office, as he was no Kinge, ſo was he no Prieſte. As he ſaide, *My kingdome is not of this worlde.* So mighte he alſo haue ſaide, My Prieſthoode is not of this worlde. Otherwiſe, he was bothe Kinge, and Prieſte, in power, and vertue: but not apparently in outwarde Office.

Ioan. 18.

Ioan de Pa. De Poteſta. Papa. cap. 8. One of your Felowes ſaithe thus, Patet, per Sanctos Expoſitores, quòd Chriſtus non habuit in Temporalibus, Authoritatem, vel Iudicium. Sed dare potuit, & dare habuit Virtutis Documentum: *It appeareth by the Holy Expoſitours, that Chriſte had nother Autheritie, nor Iudgemente in thinges Temporal. But he coulde bothe geeue, and had to geve Inſtructions of Vertue.*

1. Pet. 2. As for theſe two wordes of S. Peter, *Yee are a Kingely Prieſthoode*, yée woulde not haue alleged them to this purpoſe, had yée not benne in your dreame. For thinke you, that S. Peter called the whole *Body of the Churche of Chriſte*, a Kingely prieſthoode, for that you ſanſie your Pope to be togeather both Prieſte, and Kinge? Certainely, the Churche of God was a Kingely prieſthoode, before either the Churche of Rome was a Churche, or the Pope of Rome was a Pope. Yée ſhoulde haue ſomme care to deale

more

The Pope is a King.

more reuerently with the VVoorde of God: For it is holy. S. Peters meaning is this, that euery Faithful Christian man is nowe, after a Spiritual, or Ghostly meaninge, not onely a Priefte, but also a Kinge: and therefore he calleth the whole Churche, a Kingely Priesthoode. Tertullian saithe thus, Nónne & Laici Sacerdotes sumus? Regnum quoque nos, & Sacerdotes Deo, & Patri suo fecit: *And wee, that be Laiemenne, are wee not* Priestes? *Truely* Christe *hath made euen vs a* Kingedome, *and* Priestes *vnto his Father.* S. Augustine saithe, Hoc Sacerdotio Regali consecrantur omnes pertinentes ad Corpus Christi, Summi, & Veri Principis Sacerdotum: *With this* Roial Priesthoode, *al they are consecrate, that pertaine to the* Body of Christe, *whiche is the high, and true* Prince of Priestes. Againe he saithe, Omnes sunt Sacerdotes, quia membra sunt vnius Sacerdotis: *Al be* Priestes, *bicause they are the* Members of one Priefte. S. Ambrose saithe, Omnes Filij Ecclesiæ Sacerdotes sunt: *All the Children of the Churche be* Priestes.

Tert. in Exhor Ad Cast.
Apocal. 1.
August. Q. Euang. lib. 2. cap. 40.
Aug. De Ci. dei. li. 20. c. 10
Am. in Luc.

S. Hierome saithe, Genus Sacerdotale, & Regale sumus omnes, qui Baptizati in Christo, Christi censemur Nomine: *All wee are that* Priestly, *and* Kingely kinred, *that beinge Baptized in Christe, are called* Christians *by the name of* Christe.

lib. 5. cap. 6.
Hieron. in Malac. ca. 1.

Chrisostome saithe, Et tu in Baptismo, & Rex efficeris, & Sacerdos, & Propheta: *Euen thou in thy* Baptisme *arte made bothe a* Kinge, *and a* Priefte, *and a* Prophete.

Chry 2. Cor. Homil. 3.

Nowe, M. Harding, let vs take the viewe of your Priestly Conclusions.

Moses once did one parte of the Bishoppes Office, in Consecratinge Aaron and his Children: and that, neuer at any time els, neither after, nor before. Againe, Christe hath a Spiritual Priesthoode, and a Spiritual Kingedome: for otherwise Ordinarie Priesthoode, and Earthly Kingdome he had none. Againe: S. Peter calleth the whole Churche of Christe, a Kingely priesthoode: *Ergo*, saie you, *The* Pope *beareth bothe the Office of a* Priefte, *and also the Right and State of an earthly Kinge.*

To dissemble al other the fonde weakenesse of these folies, Christe him selfe saithe to the Pope, and to al other Priestes, and Bishoppes: *The kinges of Nations rule ouer them: and they that are greate, exercise Authoritie ouer the people:* But it shal not be so amongest you.

Math. 20.

S. Cyprian saithe, as he is alleged by Gratian, Christus a Filius proprijs, & Dignitatibus distinctis officia Potestatis vtriusque discreuit: Christe *by seuerall duelies, and distinct honoures, hath set a difference betweene the offices of bothe Powers.*

Dist. 10. quemam idem.

Wherevpon your owne Glose saithe, Hic est Argumentum, quòd Papa non habet vtrunque Gladium: *Here is a good Argumente, that the* Pope *hath not bothe Swordes,* that is to saie, that the Pope is not bothe Priefte, and Kinge.

Glossa.

S. Bernarde saithe thus vnto Pope Eugenius, Planum est, quòd Apostolis interdicitur Dominatus. Ergo tu tibi vsurpare aude, aut Dominans Apostolatum, aut Apostolicus Dominatum. Planè ab alter vtro prohiberis. Si vtrunq; similiter habere vis, perdes vtrunque. Alioqui ne te putes exceptum illorum numero, de quibus conqueritur Dominus, dicens ipsi regnauerunt, & non ex me: *It is plaine, that* Temporal Dominion *is forbidden the Apostles. Nowe therefore, thou, beinge* Pope, *dare to vsurpe, either the* Apostleship, *being a* Prince: *or the* princehoode, *beinge the* Successoure of the Apostles. *Doubtlesse from the one of them thou arte forbidden. If thou wilte indifferently haue bothe, thou shalte loose bothe. Otherwise thinke not, thou canst be excepted from the number of them, of whom the Lorde complaineth,* They haue made them selues kinges, and not by mee.

Ber. De con. Lib. 2.

Concerning the place of S. Peter, one of your companie saithe, it nothinge furthereth the Popes Kingdome. Thus he saithe, Sacerdotium dicitur Regale, a Regno, non huius mundi, sed Cœli: S. Peter *calleth vs a* Kingly priesthoode, *of the* kingdome *of* Heauen, *not of the* kingdome *of this worlde.* Yet is this the selfe same kingdome, that the Pope craueth, and that by the authoritie of S. Peter.

Ioan. De Par. cap. 18.

Notwithstandinge one of your Louanian companie, hathe sente vs home lately other newes from Louaine. His wordes be these: Vos estis Regale Sacerdotium, *You are a* kingely priesthoode: *as who should saie, the* priesthoode *before, was not* kingly, *for that then* Kinges *ruled our* Priestes: *But nowe is the* priesthoode kingly, *for that to vse subiecte euen* kinges *themselues.* Thus, onelesse your Priestes maie rule kinges and princes, and al the worlde at their pleasure, ye thinke, they haue no Kingly priesthoode.

Dorman. Fol. 40.

In the

Conc. Mac. Citatur ab Illyrico inter Testes Veritat. Pa. 121.

In the Councel, holden at Macra in France, it is written thus: Solus Dominus noster Iesus Christus verè fieri potuit & Rex, & Sacerdos. Post incarnationem verò, & Resurrectionem, & Ascentionem eius in Cœlum, nec Rex Pontificis Dignitatem: nec Pontifex Reginam Potestatem sibi vsurpare præsumpsit: *Onely our* Lorde Iesus Christe *might truely be bothe* Priest, *and* Kinge. *But sithence his Incarnation, and Resurrection, and Ascention into Heauen, neither hath the* Kinge *presumed to take vpon him the dignitie, or office of a* Bishop, *nor hath the* Bishop *presumed to vsurpe the power and maiestie of a* Kinge.

To be shorte, M. Hardinge, wee saie not, as you so often, and so vntruely haue reported of vs, that the Kinge maie in any wise execute the Bishoppes Office. But thus we saie, and bicause it is true, therefore wee saie it: The King maie lawfully correct, and chastice the negligence, and falsehed of the Bishoppe: and that in so doinge, he dothe onely his owne office, and not the Bishoppes.

The Apologie. Cap. 11. Division. 6.

Iosua. ca. 1.

Iosua also, though he were none other, then a Ciuile Magistrate, yet as soone as he was chosen by God, and sette as a Ruler ouer the people, he receiued Commaundementes, specially touching Religion, and the Seruice of God.

M. Hardinge.

There is no doubte but Iosue receiued commission, and commaundement to worship God, but none to rule Priestes in spiritual maters. Yea rather he was commaunded to goe foorthe, and comme in at the voice and woorde of Eleazarus the Highe Priest, he and al the children of Israel. Doo not these meanne proue their maters handsomely?

The Bishop of Sarisbury.

Iosua was commaunded to goe in, & out, and to be directed by the voice of Eleazarus the Highe Priest. Therefore (yee saie) in Spiritual causes, the Priestes maie not be controlled by the Prince. Yee deliuer out your Argumentes, M. Hardinge, before they be readie. Theise peeces woulde haue benne better tied togeather.

Though the Prince be commaunded to heare the Priest, yet if the Priest be negligent, or deceiue the people, he maie by his Ordinarie authoritie controlle the Priest.

Exod. 32.

When Aaron the Highe Priest had consented to the makinge, and worshipping of the golden Calfe, Moses, beinge then the Temporal Prince, rebuked him sharpely vnto his face: and in so doinge, did not the Bishoppes office, but onely his owne. As touchinge Iosua, whom yee woulde faine haue restrained from al Ecclesiastical Causes, he caused the people to be circumcised: He caused Aultars for their bloudy Sacrifices to be erected: He caused the Priestes to make their Sacrifices: He caused the Deuteronomie to be written in stoanes: He caused both the Blessinges, and the Curses of God to be pronounced: He spake openly to the people, and traied them from Idolatrie. Al these were cases, not of Ciuile politeie, but of Religion. S. Augustine saith, In hoc Reges Deo seruiunt, sicut eis Diuinitus præcipitur, in quantum sunt Reges, si in suo Regno bona iubeant, mala prohibeant: non solum quæ pertinent ad humanam Societatem, verùm etiam, quæ ad diuinam Religionem: *Herein* Kinges *serue God as it is commanded them from aboue, in that they be Kinges, if within their kingdome they commaunde good thinges, and forbidde euil:* not onely in thinges perteininge to humaine Felowshippe, or Ciuile Order, but also in thinges perteininge to Goddes Religion. Yee maie see therefore, M. Hardinge, how handsomely so euer wee proue our maters, that of your parte, hitherto they are but vnhandsomely, and coursely answeared.

Aug. Contra Cresconium. Li. 3. Ca. 51.

The Apologie, Cap. 11. Division. 7.

Kinge Dauid, when the whole Religion of God was altogeather brought out of frame by wicked Kinge Saule, brought home againe the Arke of God, that is to saie, he restoared Religion againe: and was not onely amongest them him selfe, as a Counceller, and furtherer of the woorke, but he appointed also Hymnes, & Psalmes, put in order the companies, and was the onely doer in setting foorth that whole Solemne Triumphe,

1. Paral. 13.

King Dauid ordereth maters in Religion.

Triumphe, and in effecte ruled the Prieſtes.

M. Hardinge.

As Dauid reſtored al thinges to good order, after the euil kinge Saule, ſo did Queene Mary redreſſe diſorders before committed. But as Queene Mary did it by the conſente of Prieſtes, ſo kinge Dauid in Prieſtly maters called for Sadoch, and Abiathar. In deede Dauid paſſed other Princes herein, becauſe he had the *gifte of Propheſie, whereby he wrote Pſalmes, whiche to this daie wee ſinge. But al this maketh nothinge to proue him iudge in Spiritual maters. He did not vſurpe the auctoritie to Sacrifice, to diſcerne the Lepre, and to doo the like thinges of Prieſtly charge.

*An il compariſon. For that the one ſet vp, the other pluckt downe.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Kinge Dauid (yée ſaie) reſtored Religion by meane of the Prieſtes. Nay, verily, M. Hardinge: for by meane of the Prieſtes, the Religion vtterly was decaied. Therefore yée ſpoile that moſte Noble Prince of his worthy praiſes: and giue them to others, that neuer deſerued them. The Holy Tabernacle was broken, and loſte: the Arke of God was keapt, not in the Temple, but in a Priuate mannes houſe: the people had no Common place to reſorte vnto, to heare Goddes vvil: they had eche man his owne Priuate Chapel in their Hilles, and Groaues. And al this was donne by the ſlouthfulneſſe and negligence of the Biſhoppes.

*A ſimple ſhift God wote. For other kinges, that did the like, were no Prophetes.

Dauid therefore called the Biſhoppes, and Prieſtes togeather: He ſhewed them, in what ſorte the Religion of God was defaced: he willed them to bring the Arke into Sion: He was preſente him ſelfe: He appointed, and ordered the whole Triumphe: He aſſigned, whiche of the Leuites, and in what order they ſhoulde ſerue before the Arke: He alloted Aarons Children, whiche were the Prieſtes, to walke eche man in his ſeuerall office. *1. Parali. 16. 1. Paral. 24.*

So likewiſe it is written of kinge Salomon, touchinge the ſame: Kinge Salomon: *accordinge to the Decree, and order of his father* Dauid, *appointed the offices of the* Prieſtes *in their ſeuerall Miniſteries, and the* Leuites, *eche man in his Order: that they ſhould praiſe God, and miniſter before the* Prieſtes. *For ſo* Dauid *the man of God had commaunded* Likewiſe it is written of kinge Ioſaphat: *He appointed, and ordered the* Leuites *and* Prieſtes. *2. Paralip. 8. 2. Paral. 19.*

Thus then did theiſe Godly Princes: and thus doinge, they vſurped not the Biſhoppes Office, but onely did that, they lawfully might doo, and apperteined wholy vnto them ſelues.

Where yée ſaie, Dauid vvas a Prophete, and not onely a Kinge, as thoughe he had donne theiſe thinges by vertue of his propheſie, and not by the rights of his Princely Power, this poore ſhifte is very ſimple. For notwithſtandinge Kinge Dauid were a Prophete, yet Kinge Ioſaphat, and other Princes, that did the like, were no Prophetes: neither doo wée reade of any other Prophete, that euer attempted to doo the like: nor did Dauid theiſe thinges, as a Prophete, but as a Kinge.

The Apologie. Cap. 11. Diuiſion. 1.

Kinge Salomon builte vnto the Lorde the Temple, whiche his Father Dauid had but pourpoſed in his minde to doo: and after the finiſhinge thereof, he made a godly Oration to the people concerning Religion, and the Seruice of God: He afterwarde diſplaced Abiathar the Prieſte, and ſette Sadok in his place. *2. Parali. 8. 3. Reg. 8.*

M. Hardinge.

Salomons buildinge of the Temple, and prayinge therein prouethe no Supremacie ouer the Prieſtes in Spiritual thinges. His puttinge of Abiathar out of his dignitie and roome, *was like to that queene Mary did to Cranmere. Whom ſhe might haue remoued for treaſon, as Salomon laide the like to Abiathar: yet ſhe choſe rather to burne him for Hereſie. But this proueth *onely an outward execution of iuſtice, without any preiudice to the Subſtance of our queſtion, Which is, whether a Temporal Prince maie determine the cauſes of Religion, or no.

*Vntrut'e For what Superiour Biſhoppes authoritie vſed Salomō in the Depoſition of Abiathar?

The Biſhop of Sariſbury.

The Depoſinge of Abiathar, yée ſaie, was onely the execution of outwarde Iuſtice: like to that, Queene Marie did to Doctoure Cranmere the Archbiſhop of Canturburie. Wherein yée ſhewe youre ſelfe to be mutche ouerſéene. For theiſe compariſons are in no wiſe like. Salomon, by his Princely Authoritie, lawfully Depoſed the

*Vntruth manifeſte. Reade the Anſwere.

Kinge Salomon iudgeth in Spiritual cases.

the Highe Prieste Abiathar: But Queene Mary Deposed not, nor coulde shee by your Canonnes lawfully Depose the Archbishop of Canturburie: nor do you thinke it in any case lawful, that a Bishop shoulde be Deposed by a Prince. For, Deposition (yee saie) is a Spirituall punishemente, and onely belongeth vnto a *Bishop*. And your Lawe saithe, Eius est Destituere, cuius est Instituere: *Hee maie depose a Prieste, that hathe Authoritie to place a Prieste.* Therefore these two Princes doinges were not like. But touchinge the Highe Prieste Abiathar, Kinge Salomon Summoned him to appeare before him: Kinge Salomon sate in Iudgemente, and hearde the Accusations, wherewith he was charged: Kinge Salomon pronounced Sentence againste him: Kinge Salomon Deposed him: Kinge Salomon appointed Sadoch to succeede him. If al this be not sufficiente, euer and besides these thinges, Kinge Salomon placed the Arke of God: Kinge Salomon Sanctified, and Halowed the Temple: Kinge Salomon offered vp burnte Sacrifice: King Salomon directed, and ordered the Priestes in theire seuerall Offices: Kinge Salomon blessed the whole people. And as it is written, *The* Priestes, *and* Leuites *leafte nothinge vndoone, of al, that was commaunded them by the Kinge.* If these cases be not Spiritual, telle vs then, what cases maie be allowed for Spiritual? Thus the Godly Kinge Salomon thoughte it lawful for him to deale, not onely in maters of Temporal Gouernemente, but also in Ecclesiastical or Spiritual cases of Religion. Therefore, M. Hardinge, it is but a toie, that yee telle vs of the Execution of outwarde Iustice.

2. Parali. 5. 6. 7. 8.

2. Parali. 8.

Concerninge that moste Graue, and Godly, and Learned Father, the Archbishop of Canturburie, with whom yee did, what so euer your pleasure was, God graunt, his Bloude be neuer required at your handes.

The Apologie. Cap. 11. Diuision. 9.

After this, when the Temple of God was in shamefull wise polluted throughe the naughtinesse, and negligence of the Priestes, Kinge Ezechias commaunded the same to be cleansed from the rubble and filthe, the Priestes to light vp Candles, to burne Incense, and to doo theire Diuine Seruice, according to the Olde, and allowed Order: The same kinge also commaunded the Brasen Serpente whiche then the people wickedly woorshipped, to be taken downe, and beaten to pouder.

2. Paral. 29.

4. Reg. 18.

M. Hardinge.

Howe often shal I telle you, that this proueth no more, but that good Kinges doo good deedes, maintainige true Religion, and pul downe the falle, as the Constable of Fraunce burned the Pulpites of the Hugunotes in Parise? But these factes proue not, that Kinges, and Constables be iudges of Religion, whiche is good, and whiche is euil: whiche true, whiche falle. For therein they *folowe the iudgemente and aduise of Priestes, and Prophetes, who be aboute them as *Esaias was at hande with good Kinge Ezechias to directe his doinges: and so was Elizeus with Kinge Iehu.

*Votruthe For the Priestes did nothinge, but againste theire willes. Reade the answere.

*This is farre from the purpose. For Esaias and Elizeus neither were Priestes, nor had the execution of Priestly Offices.

The Bishop of Sarisbury.

Kinge Ezekias (yee saie) and other kinges folowed the aduice and iudgement of the Priestes and Prophetes. This tale, M. Hardinge, is not onely vnlikely, but also vntrue. For yee know, that Esaias and Elizeus notwithstandinge they were the Prophetes of God, yet were they neither Priestes, nor Bishoppes nor had any manner of Ordinarie Ministration in the Churche. The Bishoppes and Priestes, of whome yee speake, had disordered, and wasted Goddes whole Religion. The Holy place of God was fulle of filthinesse: The Gates of the Temple were shutte vp, that no man might enter in: The people had tourned awaie theire faces from the Tabernacle of the Lorde: There was no Incense: There was no Sacrifice. Al theise thinges had happened throughe the negligence, and wickednesse of the Priestes. In the Olde Latine Texte it is written thus, Sacerdotes & Leuitæ tandem Sanctificati obtulerunt Holocausta: *The* Priestes, *and* Leuites, *at the laste, or with muche adoo, were Sanctified, and offered vp Sacrifices.* Upon whiche place the Later Translation saithe thus, Sacerdotes, & Leuitæ pudore suffusi, Sanctificauerunt se: The Priestes, *and* Leuites, euen for very shame, *Sanctified themselues.* So ready were they, to calle vpon, and to further the kinge in his godly purpose.

2. Parali 30.

They

helde backe, what they could, and yelded to nothinge, but with mutche a doo, and for very shame. They did nothinge, but by the Kinges Commaundements: and made him a reckeninge of theire doinges.

Howe be it, perhappes yee wil discharge this whole mater with one Ordinarie excuse, and telle vs, that al these were but Temporal Cases.

The Apologie. Cap. 11. Diuision. 19.

Kinge Iehosaphat ouerthrewe, and vtterly made awaie the Hille Aultars, and Groaues, wherby he sawe Goddes Honoure hindered, and the people holden backe with Priuate Superstition from the ordinarie Temple, which was at Ierusalem: whereto they shoulde by order haue resorted yeerely from euery parte of the Realme. 1. Parali. 17.

M. Hardinge.

Yee put vs in mynde to consider, howe that your selues are those Priuate Hille Aultares, and darke Groaues. For ye be they, that stoppe the people from the common Temple of Christendome the Catholike Churche: out of whiche is no Saluation, the heade whereof sitteth in Peters Chaire at Rome. For seinge ordre both in matters of Common Weale, and others, Iehosaphat saide thus, concerninge Religyon: *Amarias Sacerdos & Pontifex vester in ijs, quæ ad Deum pertinent, præsidebit:* Amarias the Priest and High Bishop for such maters as perteine to God, he shal be heade ouer you.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Al this whole mater, touchinge as wel Kinge Iehosaphat, as also Amarias the Highe Priest, is answeared in that is passe before.

The Apologie, Cap. 11. Diuision. 21.

Kinge Iosias with greate diligence put the Priestes, and Bishoppes in minde of their dueties: Kinge Iohas bridled the Riot, and Arrogancie of the Priestes: Iehu put to death the wicked Prophetes. 4. Reg. 12. 4. Reg. 10.

M. Hardinge.

The puttinge of Priestes, and Bishoppes in minde of theire duetie, is not a Supremacie in determining Ecclesiastical causes. And whereas you saie, that Kinge Ioas bridled the riot, and arrogancie of the Priestes, if it were so, it was wel doone. But * I finde not those woordes in the texte. Concerninge that Iehu did, it is a * mere temporal office, to put false Preachers, and Heretikes to deathe. Neither can it belonge to Priestes, onles they haue also ciuil iurisdiction. Muche lesse doth that acte proue, that Kinges be Supreme heades of the Churche, and ought to be iudges in controuersies and questions of Religion.

* ye might haue founde it 4. Reg. cap. 12.

* But he iudged them, and condemned them for false Prophets. This was no mere Temporal Office.

The Bishop of Sarisburie

Concerninge the storie of Kinge Ioas, I repore me to that is written of him in the Booke of Kinges. He sequestred the Oblations of the people, which the Priestes had bestowed lewdely, and wantonly vpon themselues, and by his owne Authoritie, turned the same to the Reparations of the Temple. Of King Iosias, it is written thus, Constituit Iosias Sacerdotes in officijs suis: Kinge Iosias *appointed the* Priestes *to minister in theire seueral offices.* And againe, Mundauit Iudam, & Hierusalem ab Excelsis, & Lucis: Kinge Iosias *cleansed, and ridde* Iuda, *and* Hierusalem *from their Hille* Aultars, *and their* Groaues. 4 Reg. 12. 2. Paralipo. 35.

But yee wil saie, He did al thinges by the discretion of the Priestes, and Bishoppes. This thinge in deede is necessarie, while the Priestes, and Bishoppes be Learned, and Godly. But Kinge Iosias did farre otherwise: for he sente the Bishop him selfe vnto Olda the Prophetisse, to learne the Discretion, and Iudgemente of a VVoman: and so was directed in maters of Highest Religion by a VVoman, and not by a Priest. 4. Reg. 22.

These Examples be so manifest, that one of youre Felowes of Louaine is faine thus to excuse the mater, by ouer muche Antiquitie. If we woulde in these daies (saith he) vse in al poinctes the Examples of the Olde Lawe, there woulde solowe an huge number of inconueniencies. It is no good reason, to saie, that therefore oure Kinges nowe a daies muste haue the like Authoritie. Thus saithe he, As though the Princes right were nowe abated, and altered, as the Ceremonies of the Lawe: and were otherwise nowe, then it was before: Or, as if the Comminge of Christe into the worlde, and the Preachinge of the Gospel, had purposely benne to represse and pulle downe the Seate of Kinges. Dorm. Fol. 37 Dorm. Fol 39

The prince is a Iudge in Eccleſiaſtical Cauſes.

The Apologie, Cap. 12. Diuiſion. 1.

And, to rehearſe no moe Examples out of the Olde Lawe, let vs rather conſider ſithence the Birthe of Chriſte, **howe the** Churche **hathe benne gouerned in the time of the Goſpel.**

M. Hardinge.

If we conſider the Offyce of a Kinge in it ſelfe, it is (a) one euery where, not onely amonge Chriſten Princes, but alſo amonge Heathen. (a) The definition of a Kinge, whiche agreeth to Iulius Cæſar, or to Alexander the Greate, as they were Monarkes, and Princes, is one with the definition of a Kinge whiche agreeth to Henrie the Eighte, or to Charles the Fifthe. (b) So that no more coulde Kinge Henry a Kinge, medle with Religion, then Alexander, Iulius Cæſar. (c) His place is chiefe amonge the laie, euen when they are in the Churche at the Seruice of God: and (c) without the Churche in al Temporal thinges and cauſes, he is ouer the Prieſtes them ſelues. Deut. 17.

(a) euen ſo Iuppiter, or Baals Biſhop, was as wel a Biſhop, as the Biſhop of Rome.

And bicauſe al theſe examples are taken out of the Olde Teſtamente, I wil geeue thee a true reſolution out of the ſame Booke, what auctoritie Prieſtes had, and what auctoritie Kinges had. Moſes gaue this rule, concerninge the ſame matter. If (ſaithe he) thou perceiue an harde, and doubtful iudgement to be with thee betweene bloude and bloude, cauſe and cauſe, Lepre and Lepre, and ſeeſt the wordes of the iudges with in thy gates to varie, ariſe, and goe vp to the place, whiche thy Lorde God ſhal choſe, and thou ſhalt come to the Prieſtes of the ſtocke of Leui, and to the Iudge that ſhal be for the time, and thou ſhalt demaunde of them: who ſhal ſheewe the truthe of iudgemente to thee.

(b) Neither can the pope medle more with Religion, then Annas, or Caiphas.

But neither the Prieſte by this place maie medle with that iuriſdiction, which belonged to the Temporal Iudge, neither the Iudge with that which was ſpiritual and belonginge onely to the Prieſte. For of ſuche cauſes Azarias the Prieſte and Biſhop ſaide to Kinge Ozias, It is not thy office Ozias, to burn incenſe vnto our Lord. It is the offyce of the Prieſtes: That is to ſaie, of the Sonnes of Aaron: Who are conſecrated to doo ſuche Miniſteries. But this the Kinge might doo euen in matters of Religion. (d) When the Highe prieſte had geuen ſentence, he might ſee the execution thereof to be donne. But (e) otherwiſe what ſo euer Kinge or Temporal iudge might not doo in his owne perſon, (e) muche leſſe might he iudge, whether an other did wel therein, or no. And this muche concerninge the Olde Teſtamente. 2. Paral. 26.

(c) vntruth. For if the Biſhop had offended, he was ſubiect to the prince, as wel within the Churche, as without.

(d) The prince is Executioner to the prieſte.

(e) vntruth euident. Reade the Anſweare.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

The Office of a Kinge, **yée ſaie, was no moze in** Kinge Henry **the Eighthe, oz in** Charles **the Fifthe, then it was in the Heathen** Princes, Iulius Cæſar, **oz** Alexander **the Greate. And therefoze, yée ſaie, a** Chriſtian Princes **Office ſtandeth onely in** Maters Temporal: **and foz that cauſe yée often calle him a** Mere, Laie, Temporal Prince: **as if he were in Authozitie not mutche better, then an** Heathen Magiſtrate.

Euen ſo, M. Hardinge, is your Pope **no moze a** Biſhop **oz perhaps, mutche leſſe a** Biſhop, **then** Annas **and** Caiphas: **Neither is your** Prieſt **moze a** Prieſt, **then the** Prieſt **of** Dagon **oz** Baal. **The difference ſtandeth, not in Office, but onely in Truth. Yet neuertheleſſe, yée know, that Heathen** Princes **had euermoze a** Soueraine Authoritie, **not onely ouer theire** Prieſtes, **and** Biſhoppes, **but alſo ouer al** Caſes of Religion.

Ariſto. Polyticor. lib. 3. Socrat. lib. 5. In Proœmio.

Ariſtotle **ſaithe,** Βασιλεὺς τᾶν πρὸς τὸς θεὸς μίξιος: The Kinge, *that is Lorde, and Ruler of thinges, that perteine vnto the* Goddes.

And therefoze Socrates **in his ſtozie ſaithe,** Imperatores vnà complexi ſumus, &c. *Wee haue alſo herein compriſed the* Emperoures Liues, *for that, ſithence the* Emperours *were firſte* Chriſtened, *the affaires of the* Church *haue hanged of them, and the greateſt* Councels *bothe haue benne, and are keapte by theire aduiſe.*

τᾶς Ἐκκλησίας πράγματα ἤρτητο ἐξ ἀυτᾶν. τᾶν ἀρχᾶν γνώμας

Yée ſaie, The prince in doubtful Caſes was commaunded to take Counſel of the *Higheſt prieſt.* **This is true. But wil yée conclude hereof, that the** Higheſt Prieſt **maie ſaie, and doo what he liſteth, without Controlmente? What if the** Highe Prieſte **would anſweare thus, as he anſweared ſommetime in déede,** *This Chriſte is a* Samaritane, *a deceiuer of the people, and hath a Diuel? What if he teare his owne roabes foz anger, and crie out,* He blaſphemeth: he is vvoorthy to die. **Yet muſte the** Emperour **nedes geue eare vnto him, and beleue him without exception? Certainely, in the** Olde Lawe **if the** Biſhop **either had benne negligente in his Office, oz of malice, oz ignozance had anſweared** Vntruthe, **he was euermoze vnder the General controlment of the** Prince

Within the Churche (yée ſaie) the prince is inferiour to the prieſte, notwithſtanding, without the Churche he is in Temporal caſes aboue the prieſte. **Thus yée ſetche youre mater rounde, within, without, and rounde aboute, with al the Circumſtances: as if Princes were as changeable, as your ſelfe: and would be other without, then they are within.**

In

The Prince is a Iudge in Ecclesiastical Causes.

In dede, in that the Priest doth his Office, in that he either openeth Gods Wil, or declareth his threates, or rebuketh sinne, or excommunicateth, and cutteth of a deade member from the Body, so farre forthe the Prince, be he neuer so mightye, is inferiour vnto him. But in this respect the Prince is inferioure, not onely to the Pope or Bishop, but also to any other simple Priest: And the Pope him selfe, in this respecte, is inferioure to his Confessoure, be he neuer so poore a Priest. So the Emperoure Constantinus was wonte to saie to the Godly Bishoppes: Ye you Bishoppes within the Churche: and I wilbe Bishop without. But if the Bishop had benne faulty, either in Negligence, or in Falsehedde, whether he had ben within the Church, or abroade, he was alwaies to be controlled by the Prince.

Ye saie, When the Highe Priest had geuen Sentence, the Prince might see the execution thereof to be donne. And thus ye make the Emperoure the Popes man, to putte his Sentence in Execution. So Pope Bonifacius. 8. telleth you, Materialis Gladius exercendus est manu Regum, & Militum, sed ad nutum, & Patientiam Sacerdotis: *The Temporal Swerde muste be drawne by the hande of Kinges, and Souldiers: but at the becke, and sufferance of the Priestes.* *9. qu. 3. nemo in Glossa ab. Eus. De vita Const. orat. 4*

But, I beseeche you, at whoes becke did Kinge Salomon Depose Abiathar the Highe Priest? At whose becke did Iosias, and other Godly Princes, of whom we haue saide before, reforme the Religion of God, which the Priestes so shamefully had deface? At whose becke did they rebuke the careleste negligence of the Priestes? Verily, one of your owne Doctours saithe, In Veteri Lege Sacerdotes, qui Reges inungebant, indubitanter Regibus subdebantur: *In the Olde Lawe, the Bishoppes, that annointed the Kinges, out of doubte were subiectes vnto the Kinges.* *De Maioritate & Obedientia. Vnam Sactam. Iohan. De Paris. ca. 18*

And S. Augustine saithe, Quando Imperatores Veritatem tenent, & ipsa Veritate contra Errorem iubent, quisquis illud contempserit, ipse sibi iudicium acquirit. Nam & inter homines pœnas luit, & apud Deum frontem non habebit, qui hoc facere noluit, quod ei per Cor Regis ipsa Veritas iussit: *When the Emperoure holdeth the Truth, and by force of the same Truthe geueth out Lawes, and Proclamations against Erroure, Who so euer despiseth the same, procureth iudgement againste him selfe. For he shalbe punished before menne, and before God he shal haue no face, that refused to doo that thing, that the* Truethe it selfe, throughe the harte of the Prince, hathe commaunded him. *Augustinus Epi. 166. ad Donatistas.*

The Apologie, Cap. 12. Division. 2.

The Christian Emperours in the old time, appointed the Councelles of the Bishoppes. Constantine called the Councel at Nice: Theodosius the firste, called the Councel at Constantinople: Theodosius the second, called the Councel at Ephesus: Martian called the Councel at Chalcedon.

M. Hardinge.

(a) A diseret distinction. As if the Emperoure receiued his Authoritie from the Pope.

The callinge, or summoninge of Councelles maie be donne (a) either by waie of auctoritie, whiche the caller him selfe hathe: or by waie of auctoritie, whiche he taketh of an other. If Constantine, the two Theodosians, and Marcian called the foure firste generall Councelles by their auctoritie only, then were they no generall Councelles. Neither coulde their decrees binde the whole worlde. For although they were greate Emperours, yet was not the whole Christian worlde vnder them. And therefore those Christian Bishoppes, who liued in Persia, in Ethiopia, in Scotlande, in Scythia, or in any other lande not subiecte to the Emperoure, were neither bounde to comme, nor bounde to obey the Lawes made by them, who were not their Superiours. But if it be farre from reason, that a general Councel shoulde not binde al Bishoppes and al Christians, it is also farre from reason, to saie, that Emperoures called general Councelles by their owne onely auctoritie. In deede they called them by the assente of the Bishop of Rome. (b) Who beinge the generall Sheapeheard of Christes flocke, and therefore also of al Bishoppes, mighte commaunde (c) all his Sheepe to come togeather, excepte they were reasonably to be excused: and they were bounde to heare his voice, and to obey his decree. So that, although ye proued the Emperours to haue summoned and called the foure firste Councelles, yet were ye not able to proue, they did it (d) withoute the assente of the Bishoppes of Rome, whiche for the time sate in Peters Chaire. And by the force of that assente the deede muste take effecte. And this muche generally.

(b) Vntruth manifest, as shal appeare.

(c) Al the Bishoppes throughout the whole worlde are the popes sheepe.

(d) vntruth. for the Emperoure may summone Councels whether the pope wil, or no.

(c) vntruth. for Syluester was dead longe before the summoning of the Councel.

Newe to proue vnto you, that (e) S. Syluester assented to the callinge of the firste Councel, at Nice, it is to be considered, that he onely hathe auctoritie to ratifie, who hath auctoritie to commaunde, and to geue

assente and strength from the beginninge. For none other difference it bitweene commaundinge, assentinge, auctorizinge, and ratificinge, but that assentinge is common to them al, commaundinge is a thinge that goeth before the facte, auctorizinge is the makinge of a thinge good by pre'sent agreeing to it, whiles it is donne, ratificinge is the allowinge of it, when it is donne. If then I shewe, bothe that the Pope did ratifie the callinge of the general Counceller, and auctorize them: I shewe muche more that he assented to the callinge of them. The auctorizinge is proued by reason he sente his legates to euery of them. As (f) S. Sylueſter sent Osius Cordubensis of the prouince of Spain vnto Nice, with Victor & Vincentius, Priests of the Cittie of Rome. Of whiche the laste twoo, beinge them selues no Bishoppes, yet for that they were Legates of the chiefe Bishop, did in (g) the first place put vnto the decrees of that Counsel their consent and names, writinge after this sorte: *Pro venerabili viro Papa & Episcopo nostro Syluestro subscripsimus:* We haue subscribed for the reuerende man our Pope and Bishop Sylueſter. And at the very (h) same time, that the general Councel was keapte at Nice, S. Sylueſter called an other Counsel in Rome, at the whiche twoo hundred seuentie and fiue Bishoppes were assembled. And it is expressely written in the same Counsel, *Syluester collegit vniuersam Synodum Episcoporum cum consilio Augusti, vel matris eius:* Sylueſter gathered togeather the whole Synode of the Bishoppes with the Counsel of the (i) Emperoure, or his mother. Why his Counsel was needeful, it appeareth there. Because the Emperoure bare the charges of theire diette, and cariage. So that his Counsel was necessary, not chiefely for Religion, but rather for supportation of the charges of so greate a iourney. For then neither was the Bishop of Rome, nor other Bishoppes endewed with so large possessions, as they were afterwarde.

(f) Vntruth, vaine, and vnaduised. For neither was Hosius Sylueſters Legate, nor was Sylueſter then aliue.

Lib. 14. cap. 34.

Nowe to returne to the Councel of Nice. The Emperour was in deede the cause of their commynge together, aswel for that him selfe perswaded that meane of concorde, as also for that liberally he defrayed the charges. Yet called he not the Bishoppes of his owne heade. And that these men might haue seene in the Ecclesiastical Historie, where Ruffinus writeth: *Tum ille ex Sacerdotum sententia apud Vrbem Niceam Episcopale Concilium conuocat.* The Emperoure calleth togeather a Councel of Bishoppes accordinge to the determination of the Priestes. He did it accordinge as it seemed good to the Bishoppes. (k) And shal we thinke the Bishop of Rome was none of them that consented to the callinge? Yea verily he was the chiefest of al. Howe can it otherwise seeme? For when al the Decrees were made, *Placuit vt hæc omnia mitterentur ad Episcopum Vrbis Romæ Syluestrum:* It was thought good, that al those actes, and Decrees should be sente to Sylueſter Bishop of the Cittie of Rome. If he were the last, that had the vewe and confirminge of al thinges, there is no doubte, but he had a voice, and greate auctoritie in calling the Councel.

Li. 10. ca. 1. Make, ex sacerdotum sententia.

In summ. Nice. cecil.

What other is that, which Socrates in his Ecclesiastical Historie witnesseth, saying, *Cùm vtique Regula Ecclesiastica iubeat, nõ oportere (l) præter sententiã Romani Pontificis cõcilia celebrari:* Whereas the Ecclesiastical rule commaundeth, that no Councelles ought to be kepte bisides the determinate consente of the Bishop of Rome? Wee knowe (saith Athanasius, and the Bishoppes of Aegypt assembled in Councel at Alexandria) that in the greate Councel of Nice of 318. Bishoppes, it was with one accorde by al confirmed there, that without the determination of the Bishop of Rome, neither Councelles shoulde be keapte, nor Bishoppes condemned. I omitte here as a thinge wel knowen, howe Constantine the Emperoure refused in expresse woordes, to be iudge ouer Bishoppes, saieinge, that God had geuen them power to iudge of him: muche lesse did he arrogate to him selfe onely and chiefly auctoritie to summone Councels, or to iudge Bishoply affaires. As for mee (saithe Valentinian the Emperoure) in as muche as I am but one of the people, it is not lawful to searche suche maters: (he speaketh of the Heretikes doctrines) but let the priestes, to whome this charge belongeth, be gathered togeather within them selues, where they wil, &c.

Hist. trip. li. 4. ca. 9. Epistola Aegyptior. pontificum.

Russi. li. 10. Cap. 2. Hist. Trip. lib. 7. ca. 14. Photius in Li. de concilijs.

Concerninge the seconde Councel, whiche was the firste of those that were kepte at Constantinople, it maie be, that Theodosius called it, as Constantine called the firste at Nice. But what auctoritie Damasus bare in the same, it appeareth partly by that he had his (n) Legates there, partely also by that Photius Patriarke of Constantinople writeth in his Epistle to Michael Prince of Bulgaria. Where hauinge declared the comminge together of the Patriarkes of Alexandria and Ierusalem, he saithe thus. *Quibus haud multò pòst & Damasus Episcopus Romæ eadem confirmans, atque idem sentiens accessit.* To whiche (Patriarkes of Alexandria and Ierusalem) not longe after, Damasus the Bishop of Rome ioyned him selfe, confirminge (o) and determininge the same mater. This muche saithe Photius of the seconde Councel, the confirmation whereof he doothe attribute, not to Theodosius the Emperoure, but to Damasus the Pope.

But what did Theodosius then? (wil some man saie). Did he nothinge? Yes verily he did verie muche, as in the saide Epistle Photius recordeth. Then did greate Theodosius (saithe he) in deede woorthy of greate praise rule the Empiere, who was him selfe also a Defender, and a maintainer of Godlinesse. Beholde what the Emperoures parte was, not to sitte in iudgemente of matters of Religion, and (p) determine whiche was the true Faithe, but to defende it, and maintetaine it. And that thou maiste see, reader, plainely, what Theodosius thoughte of Religion, whome these Defenders woulde make a iudge in causes of Religion. I aduise thee to Reade the ninthe Booke of the Tripartite Historie, where appeare many greate argumentes of his owne Faithe, whiche hee published to the worlde from Thessalonica, in a Publique lawe,

(g) vntruth impudente. For they had the fourthe place in the Councel, & subscribed after Eustathius.

(h) vntruth onelesse a dead maie Summon Councelles.

(i) By the Counsel of the emperoure, or of his mother, wisely: He woteth not whether. And yet the Empeſours Mother was ded before Sozom. Lib. 2. Ca. 2. and 3.

(k) Ful Clerkly proued. For Ruffinus saith, The Emperour herein folowed the aduice of Alexander the Bishop of Alexandria. &c. But of the Pope there is no mention.

(l) Vntruthe fondly forged. For Sylueſter was dead long before.

(m) Vntruthe, standinge in plaine corruption of the woordes. See the Answeare.

(n) So had sundrie other Bishoppes.

(o) Other Bishoppes likewise gaue their Consentes, and Confirmed &c. Yet had they no Authoritie to Summone Councelles.

(p) Vntruthe manifest. For Theodosius the Emperoure expressely determined, what should be holden for Christian Faithe.

lawe, to be ſuche, as Peter had taught the Romaines, (q) and as Damaſus who ſucceded Peter, taughte at that daie, requiringe al his ſubiectes to beleue the ſame. He required not them to folow his owne Priuate Faith, but Peters Faithe, and the Popes Faithe. And whereas there were twoo Biſhoppes of Alexandria at that time, the one, whoſe name Peter, holdinge with the Biſhop of Rome, the other named Lucius, not ſo: Theodoſius commaunded his ſubiectes, to beleeue as Peter did, who folowed the firſte Peter, and Damaſus the Biſhop of Rome.

Socrat. li. 11 Cap. 5.

Touchinge the thirde General Councel, it was kepte in deede vnder Theodoſius the yonger at Epheſus. But he was not Supreme Heade there. Yea rather who knoweth not, that Cyrillus beinge him ſelfe Patriarke of Alexandria, yet was Preſident at Epheſus, bearinge the ſteede, and perſon of Pope Celeſtine? If Cyril was in ſteede of the Biſhop of Rome there Preſident, (r) who maie doubte, but that he was Supreme Heade of the Churche, in whoſe name the Preſident ſate? Doothe the Preſident of the Queenes Maieſties Counſel vſe to ſitte at her Counſel in the name of any other inferiour perſon? If Theodoſius were Supreme and Chiefe, why ſate not Cyril in his name, as Preſident? But ſeeinge that Photius writeth, and Nicephorus alſo, that Cyril Archebiſhop of Alexandria ſate in the ſteede of Celeſtine pope of Rome ouer that Councell kepte at Epheſus, vndoubtedly it can not be denied, but that Celeſtine was Supreme Heade, as well of the Churche, as of the General Councel.

Lib. 14. cap. 34.

It is not therefore onely to be conſidered, that Theodoſius ſente abroade his meſſengers to ſummone the Fathers to the General Councel, but alſo it is to be conſidered, (s) by whoſe Auctoritie it was donne. If in our time it had pleaſed the Emperoure Ferdinande of Famouſe Memorie to haue ſente his Meſſengers to the Kinges and Princes of Spaine, Praunce, Englande, Hungarie, Bemelande, Pole, and to the Eſtates, and Dukes of Italie, and Germanie, to ſummone them to the Councel, whiche the Pope thought good to indict at Trente: I thinke verily the Pope woulde haue thanked the Emperoure for it, and him ſelfe ſhoulde haue ſaued ſo muche charges, as merne of experience knowe, ſuche an enterpriſe to require. But nowe, ſithe the Pope hathe of his owne ſufficient to beare the charges of ſuche affaires, he asketh not any more of the Emperoure ſuche expenſes, as in olde time to that neceſſarie pourpoſe by the Empetoures were allowed.

Laſte of al Martian (ſaie you) called the fourthe General Councel at Chalcedon. Wee anſweare. He called it not in ſuche ſorte as yee meane, to wit, as Supreme Heade and Ruler therof, but as one hable to ſend Meſſengers for the Biſhoppes aboute the worlde, and to ſuſteine the charges, alſo willinge to ſee peace and concorde in the Churche of God. Who liſte to reade the Epiſtles of Pope Leo to Pulcheria the Empreſſe, to Martian him ſelfe, to Theodoſius, to Flauianus Archebiſhop of Conſtantinople, to the Synode firſte aſſembled at Epheſus, afterwarde for certaine cauſes at Chalcedon: in the ſame Epiſtles he maie ſee bothe the cauſe of the Councel, and what (t) conference was had thereof with the ſaide Leo Biſhop of Rome, who ſent firſt to Epheſus, Iulianus a Biſhop, Renatus a Prieſte, and Hilarius a Deacon, and afterwarde to Chalcedon, Paſchaſinus, and Lucentius Biſhoppes, and Boniface a Prieſte, to repreſente his perſone. In one of the ſaid Epiſtles written to the Seconde Synode at Epheſus, Leo ſaithe thus. *Religioſiſſima Clementiſſimi Principis Fides &c.* The moſte religious Faithe of our moſte clemente prince knowinge it to perteine chiefely to his renome, if within the Catholike Churche no braunche of errour ſpringe, hathe deferred this reuerence to Gods ordinaunces, as to vſe the auctoritie of the ſee Apoſtolike, to atchieue the effect of a Holy pourpoſe, as though he were deſirous by the moſte bleſſed peter him ſelfe, that to be declared, whiche in his confeſſion was prayſed. By whiche woordes it is plaine, that in matters of Religion the Emperoure proceeded not vpon his owne Head, but (u) was directed by the See of peter. What ſhal I taie more?

If the Emperoure firſt Chriſtened the pope, let the Emperoure be ſuperiour in thinges to Godwarde. But if the Pope Chriſtened the Emperoure, (as (x) Sylueſter did Conſtantine) let the ſpirituall Father in that degree of rule be aboue the ſpirituall Childe.

(q) Vntruthe, guiletully enclofed. For Theodoſius willed his ſubiectes, to folow as wel the faith of ſundry other Biſhoppes, as the Popes.

(r) A fonde ſolie. For the Biſhop of Rome had euermore the Firſte place in Councelles. Yet was he not therefore the Heade of the Churche.

(s) No dout by the Auctoritie of the Pope. And ſo was the Emperour only the popes man.

(t) Vntruth for the Councel was ſummoned to Chalcedon quite contrarie to the popes will. Read the Anſweare.

(u) Vntruthe moſt manifeſt. Reade the Anſweare.

(x) vntruth, for he was Chriſtened by Euſebius the biſhop of Nicomedia, long after that Sylueſter was deade.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

No man coulde vtter ſo many Vntruthes **togeather, with ſutche affiance, without ſome cunninge. Firſte, M. Hardinge, ye beare vs in hande, that the** Emperours **of the Worlde, in thoſe daies, ſummoned** Councelles **not by theire owne Authoritie, but by the Authoritie, and Warrante of the** Pope: **As if the** Popes **authoritie at that time, had ben many degrees aboue the** Emperoure. **Notwithſtandinge,** Pope Pius. 2. **as you knowe, ſaithe thus,** Ante Nicenam Synodum vnuſquiſque ſibi vixit: & paruus reſpectus ad Romanam Eccleſiam habebatur? *Before the Councel of Nice, eche Biſhop liued ſeuerally to him ſelfe: and little regarde was there then hadde to the Churche of Rome.* Pope Innocentius **complaineth, that he had not Authoritie ſufficiente, to force** Pelagius, **beinge but one manne, to commne before him: matche leſſe had he Authoritie ſufficiente, to commaunde, and calle the whole Worlde.** Pope Leo **bothe was an humble ſuiter him ſelfe vnto the** Emperoure Martianus, **that it woulde pleaſe his** Maieſtie **to commaunde a** Councel, **and alſo entreated other** Biſhoppes **to promote the cauſe.**

Æneas Syluius in Epiſt. 288.

Inter Epiſtolas Aug. Epiſt. 96.

Thus he writeth, Humiliter,ac ſapienter expoſcite,vt Petitioni noſtræ,qua Plenariam indici Synodum poſtulamus, Clementiſſimus Imperator dignetur annuere: *Make ſuite with diſcrete, and humble Praier, that our moſte* Graceous Emperoure *woulde vouchesaue to graunte oure requeſte,in that wee haue deſired a* General Councel **It is not likely,that** Pope Leo **would thus haue written,if his owne Authoritie had benne ſufficiente.**

Leo ad Clerũ et plebem Cõſtan. Epi.23

Naie,it is the more vnlikely,that the Emperoure **ſhould** herein at any time vſe **the Authoritie of the** Pope, **for that the** Pope **him ſelfe was neuer hable to ſummone** Bishoppes,**as hereafter it ſhal appeare,but onely by the Authoritie of the** Emperoure. Pope Damaſus **commaunded the** Bishoppes **of the** Eaſte,**to comme to** Rome: **How be it,not in his owne name, for that had benne no warrante, but by the** Emperours **ſpecial letters.** Euſebius **ſaithe thus,** Ἀντιγράφου βασιλικῆς, ἐπιστολῆς, διὶ ἧς σύνοδον ἐπισκόπων ἐκ τῆ ῥώμης γενέσθαι κελεύει: Exemplar Regiarum Literarum,quibus iubet Romæ Epiſcoporum Concilium celebrari: *This is a Copie of the Emperours Write, Whereby he commaunded a Councel to be keapte in Rome.* **As for the** Pope, **notwithſtandinge al his** Vniuerſal Povver,**he was commaunded by the** Emperours **ſummone, to be preſent at** Councelles,**as wel as others.**

Theod. Li.5. ca.9. Διὰ τοῦτο τὸ θεοφιλέστατε βασιλέως γράμματος. *Euſebius, lib. 10 Cap.5.*

In the Councel **of** Chalcedon **it is written thus:** Eodem tenore à Piiſſimis, & Chriſtianiſſimis Imperatoribus, Sanctiſſimus noſter Papa,Romanæ Eccleſiæ præpoſitus Leo, vocatus eſt: *By order of the ſame* VVrite, Oure moſte Holy Pope Leo, *ruler of the* Churche of Rome, *Was called to the Councel by the moſte Godly,and moſte Chriſtian Emperours.*

Concil. Chalcedo. Actio.1 Pag.748.

Zozomenus **ſaithe,** Conſtantinus ſcripſit ad omnes Præſides Eccleſiarum, vt ad diem adeſſent: Ad Epiſcopos Apoſtolicarum Sedium: Ad Macarium Hieroſolymitanum: ad Iulium Romanum, &c. *The* Emperoure Conſtantinus *ſent out his Letters vnto al the Rulers of the Churches, that they ſhoulde meete al at* Nice *vpon a daie: vnto the* Bishoppes of the Apoſtolike Sees: *vnto* Macarius *the* Bishop of Hieruſalem: and vnto Iulius the Bishop of Rome &c. *But* Iulius *excuſed his abſence bicauſe of his age.* **Otherwiſe of Obedience,and Dewtie towardes the** Emperoure, **he was as mutche bound,to haue made his appearance there,as the reſte of his Brethren.**

Sozom. Lib.1 Cap.17.

Theod. Lib.1 Ca.7. Διὰλλησας ἀπελείφθη ἐκεῖ.

Yea ſaie, If the Emperoure ſhoulde haue ſummoned the Councel by his owne Authoritie, then the Biſhoppes of Perſia, and Scotlande, whiche Countries were not then vnder the Obedience of the Romaine Empiere, woulde not haue appeared vpon the Summone and ſo had it benne no General Councell. **This cauil wanteth bothe truthe and ſauoure. For proufe whereof, I wil bringe forthe your ſelfe,M.Hardinge,to reproue your ſelfe. Ye ſhould not ſo ſone haue forgotten your owne Decree,ſpecially conceiued,and publiſhed in this ſelf ſame Booke.**

M.Hardinge. Fol.329.a.

Thus you ſaie: theſe be your owne wordes: A Councel is not accoumpted General, bicauſe Biſhoppes of al Countries vnder Heauen be aſſembled,but bicauſe many be aſſembled, and al bee lawfully called **Otherwiſe your Late** Chapter **of** Trident,**with your worthy number of Fourtie Prelates, whereof certaine were onely** Maie Bishoppes,**otherwiſe by you called** Nulliatenſes,**coulde neuer haue benne a** General Councel.

Nicol. Cuſan. De Concord. Cathol. Lib.2.ca.25

Nicolaus Cuſanus **ſaithe,** Authoritas Concilij non ita dependet à congregante, vt, niſi à Papa congregetur,non ſit Concilium: quia tunc omnia Octo Vniuerſalia Concilia non fuiſſent firma: quoniam per Imperatores conuocata leguntur.Et Romanus Pontifex ad inſtar aliorum Patriarcharum, Diuales Sacras iuſsiones, de veniendo, aut mittendo ad Concilium,recepit: *The authoritie of a Councel dependeth not of him,by whom it was ſummoned,that onleſſe it be ſummoned by the Pope,it can be no Councel. For ſo wee ſhould auoide al the firſt eight General Councels. For we read,they were ſummoned by Emperors,and not by Popes. And the Pope receiued the Emperours Maieſties Commaundemente to comme, or ſende to Councelles,as other Patriarkes did.*

Certainely it cannot appeare, that there was any Bishop, **either of** Scotlande **or of** Englande **then called** Britaine, **at any of the firſte foure** Councelles, **either at** Nice **or at** Epheſus, **or at** Conſtantinople, **or at** Chalcedon. **Yet are theſe** Councelles **neuertheleſſe called** General.

Chryſoſt. Ad Popul. Antiochē. Hom.2

Touchinge the reſte,the Emperoure **was then the onely** Monarke **of the worlde: and, as** Chryſoſtome **calleth him,** Summitas,& Caput omnium ſuper terram hominum:

The

The Summoninge of Councelles.

The Toppe, and Heade of al menne in the worlde. No doubte, who ſo euer would then haue refuſed the Emperours Summone, mutche more woulde he haue refuſed the Summone of the Pope.

To qualifie the mater, yée ſaie, the Emperoure did theſe thinges, although not by the Popes VVarrante, yet, at the leaſte, by the Popes Conſent and neuer otherwiſe. Here likewiſe is an other Vntruthe. For the Emperoure commaunded Councelles, bothe when he woulde, and whither he would, whether the Pope would, or no, many times without any manner of regarde had to his pleaſure. Pope Leo wrote thus vnto the Emperoure Theodoſius, Omnes noſtræ Eccleſiæ, Omnes Manſuetudini Veſtræ cum gemitibus, & Lachrymis ſupplicant Sacerdotes, vt Generalem Synodum iubeatis intra Italiam celebrari: *Al our Churches, and al our Prieſtes moſt humblie beſeche your Maieſtie with ſobbes, and teares, that yee wil commaunde a General Councel to be holden within* Italie. In like ſorte he moued the Cleregie of Conſtantinople, to be ſuiters vnto his Maieſtie for the ſame: yet neuertheleſſe the Emperoure continewed ſtill in his pourpoſe: and, contrarie to the Popes humble petition, keapte the Councel, not in Italie, but at Chalcedon: where alſo, as it is ſaid before, Pope Leo him ſelfe was ſummoned to appeare by the Emperours Commaundement, with other Biſhoppes.

Leo ad Theodoſium. Epiſt. 14.

Nicol. Cuſa. De Concord. Cathol. Lib. 2. Ca. 12

Of ſutche Authoritie was the Popes conſent in Summoninge of Councelles. He humbly craued it vpon his knées, with ſighes, and teares: and could not geate it. And therfore Nicolaus Cuſanus ſaith, Habetur ex præſcriptis vna Concluſio, ſcilicet in Concilijs Romanum Pontificem in condendis ſtatutis generalibus non habere eam poteſtatem, quam quidam adulatores illi contribuunt: *Hereof wee haue one Concluſion, that in Generall Councelles, and in makinge of Lawes General, the Biſhop of Rome hathe no ſutche Power, as* certaine flatterers *would allowe him.* Take hede therfore, M. Harding, leſt for your great paines in a deſperate cauſe, yée be taken for one of the Popes Flatterers.

Hereof Æneas Syluius, whiche afterwarde was Pope Pius. 2. ſaithe thus. Ex hiſce Authoritatibus mirum in modum ſe putant armatos, qui Concilia negant fieri poſſe ſine conſenſu Papæ. Quorum ſententia, ſi, vt ipſi volunt, inuiolata perſiſtet, ruinam ſecum Eccleſiæ trahit. Quid enim remedij erit, ſi criminoſus Papa perturbet Eccleſiam: ſi animas perdat: ſi peruertat malo exemplo populos: ſi denique contraria Fidei prædicet, Hæreticiſque Dogmatibus imbuat ſubditos? Sinemúſne cum ipſo cuncta ruere? At ego, dum veteres lego Hiſtorias, dum Actus perſpicio Apoſtolorum, hunc equidem morem non inuenio, vt Soli Papæ Concilia conuocauerint: Nec pòſt, tempore Conſtantini Magni, & aliorum Auguſtorum, ad Congreganda concilia quæſitus eſt magnoperè Romani conſenſus Papæ: *By theſe Authorities they thinke them ſelues armed, that ſaie, no Councel maie be keapte without the conſente of the Pope. Whoſe Iudgemente, if it ſhoulde ſtande, as they woulde haue it, woulde drawe with it the decaie, and ruine of the Churche. For what remedie were there then, if the Pope him ſelfe were vitious, deſtroyed ſoules, ouerthrew the people with euil example, taught Doctrine contrarie to the Faithe, and filled his Subiectes ful of Hereſies? Should wee ſuffer al to goe to the Diuel? Verily, when I reade the Olde Stories, and conſider the Actes of the Apoſtles, I finde no ſutch order in thoſe daies, that onely the Pope ſhuld Summone Councelles. And afterwarde, in the time of* Conſtantine *the Greate, and of other Emperours, when Counſelles ſhould be called, there was no greate accoumpt made of the Popes conſente.* Cardinal Cuſanus ſaithe, Negligente, aut Contradicente Papa, Imperator poteſt præceptiuè Synodos indicere, ad prouidendum fluctuanti Eccleſiæ: *If the* Pope *be negligente, or if he ſaie nate, the* Emperoure, *to ſtaie the wauerinye ſtate of the Churche, maie* commaunde Councelles by his ovvne Authoritie. Thus the Emperoure Sigiſmunde called a Councel at Conſtance: notwithſtandinge it ſtode Pope Iohn mutche vppon, neuer to yelde his conſente vnto it. For in the ſame Councel he was depriued, and of a Pope was made a Cardinal.

Æneas Syluius, De Concil. Baſilien: Lib. 2.

Cuſanus. De Concordia Catholica. Lib. 3. cap. 15

Yée ſaie, The Pope had no Authoritie to Confirme Councelles. *Ergo*, Mutche more he had Authoritie to calle Councelles. And here yée tel vs a very ſolemne tale, what is Commaundinge: what is Aſſentinge: what is Authorizinge: what is Ratifieinge: as if it had benne ſomewhat to the pourpoſe. But if your reaſon holde, then muſte General Councelles haue many Callers. For, as I ſhal hereafter ſufficiently proue, not only

ly the Pope, or the other principal Patriarkes, but also al other Bishoppes, that were presente, yea Emperours, Kinges, Lieutenantes, and Counsellers had Authoritie to Confirme Councelles.

Sozomen.li. 6.Cap.23. Zozomenus saithe, Nec Romanus, nec Vincentinus, nec alij confirmarunt: *This Councel was Confirmed, neither by the Bishop of Rome, nor by the Bishop of* Vincentia, *nor by the rest of the Bishoppes.* Whereby it appeare the, that in Confirmation of Councelles al other Bishoppes what so euer, had as good right, and authoritie, as the Bishop of Rome. And the Emperoure Martianus saithe, Sacrosancto nostræ Serenitatis Edicto venerandam Synodum Confirmamus: *Wee Confirme the Reuerende Councel by the Holy Edicte of onre Maiestie.* Thus you see, that, not onely al Bishoppes, but also Emperoures, and Laie Princes had authoritie to confirme Councelles. Nowe therfore, M. Hardinge, if it be true, that you saie, that who so euer hathe authoritie to Confirme Councelles, muche more hath authoritie to Calle Councelles, then muste it nedes follow, that, not onely Kinges, and Emperours, but also al Bishoppes through the worlde, haue authoritie to Calle Councelles.

Concil. Calcedon. Actio. 3 Pag. 804.

Yea saie, Pope Sylvester sente that Famous Learned Father Hosius, the Bishop of Corduba, to the Councel of Nice, to represente his persoune. This maie wel passe emonge the reste of your Truthes. For neither was Hosius there in the Popes behalfe, but in his owne: nor was Pope Sylvester then alive, or hable to sende him, duringe the whole time of the Nicene Councel, notwithstanding any thinge, that your Fabulare, Peter Crabbe hath saide to the contrarie. As for Hosius the Bishop of Corduba, of what Authoritie, and estimation he was in al Ecclesiastical Assemblies, it maie appeare by these wordes of Athanasius: In qua Synodo Dux ille, & Antesignanus non fuit? Quæ Ecclesia istius Præsidentiæ non pulcherrima monumenta retinet? *In what* Councel *hath not* Hosius *benne Chiefe, and Presidente? What Churche is without some notable remembrance of his gouernemente?* Certainely, M. Hardinge, it seemeth, he was a greate deale to good, to be sent so farre in a deade mannes errante.

Athana. Apologia. 2.

Sozomen. lib 1. Cap. 17. Notwithstandinge, Iulius, beinge then Bishop of Rome, for that he was vnhable to trauaile, bicause of his age, sente thither two Priestes, Vitus, and Vincentius, to supplie his rowme. Thus he did, not of pride, the better by his absence to maineteine a state, but onely for that he was forced of necessitie so to do. For if he had benne hable to trauaile so farre, he had benne forced to goe thither him selfe. Therefore Pope Agatho afterwarde thus excused his Absence vnto the Emperours: Christianissimi Domini Filij, secundum Pijssimam Iussionem Mansuetudinis vestræ, pro Obedientia, quam debuimus, præsentes consamulos nostros misimus: *My most Christian Lordes, and Children, accordinge to the moste godly Commaundement of your Maiesties, and accordinge to the Obedience, that wee owe of dewtie, wee haue sente these presente our Felowe Seruantes.*

Con. Constantinopolitan. Actio. 4. Ad Heraclium, & Tiberium Imper. pagi. 288.

Other Bishoppes in like cases of age, or infirmitie, did the like. For example, Lucifer the Bishop of Sardinia: sente Herennius, and Agapetus: and Paulinus sent Maximus, and Calemerus to the Councel of Nice to be in their steedes.

Athanasi. ad Antio. To. 2

Yea saie, Vitus, and Vincentius, for that they were the Popes Legates, had therefore the Firste place in Subscription emonge the Bishoppes. Here is an other greate Vntruthe. For Theodoretus saithe, the Firste, and Chiefe of al that companie, bothe in place, and in speache, was, not Vitus, or Vincentius, the Popes Legates, but Eustathius the Patriarke of Antioche.

Theodoret. Lib. 1. cap. 7.

Touchinge these two the Popes Legates, Zozomenus placeth them onely in the Fourthe rowme: Athanasius saithe, Subscripserunt, Hosius ab Hispania, Iulius Romanus per Archidamum, & Philoxenum Presbyteros: *They Subscribed their names to the* Councel, Hosius *that came out of Spaine, and* Iulius *the* Bishop of Rome, *by* Archidamus, *and* Philoxenus *Priestes, that were his Legates.* By which wordes he alloweth the Bishop of Romes Legates the Seconde place in Subscription: but not the Firste. And thus, yea se, Hosius the Bishop of Corduba subscribeth before Iulius the Bishop of Rome.

Sozomenus. Lib. 1. cap. 17 Athanasius. Apologia. 2.

Conc. Aphri. cap. 100. In the Councel of Aphrica, Philippus, and Asellius the Popes Legates, had the Last Place in Subscription after al others. In the Councel of Chalcedon, Philippus one of the Popes Legates, had an hundred, and seuen e fiftie others to Subscribe before him.

Conc. Chalcedon. Actio. 1. Sanctæ.

These

The Summoninge of Councelles.

These Fathers, I trowe, would not haue benne so vnhanerly in their dealing, if they had taken the Pope for the Heade of the vvhole Vniuersal Churche, to haue placed his Legate behinde so many. Further, ye say, At the very same time, that the General Councel was kepte at Nice, S. Sylueſter called an other Councell in Rome. This, I trowe, M. Hardinge, is an other Vntruthe. Onleſſe ye haue power to raiſe vp deade menne, to kepe Councelles. For Sylueſter was deade longe before.

Sozomenus saithe, Vitus, and Vincentius were sente to Nice, not by Pope Sylueſter, who then was deade, but by Pope Iulius, that was the seconde after him. The like maie eaſily appeare by Athanaſius, Theodoretus, Nicephorus, and others. Beda also in his Chronicles telleth you, that the Councel of Nice was holden, not in the time of Pope Sylueſter, who then was deade, but in the time of Pope Iulius.

Therefore, M. Harding, you muſte nedes deuiſe two Councelles of Nice about one time: two Sylueſter Popes: two Writers of this one Storie, the one true, the other falſe. Otherwiſe, this fraile ſtuffe wil neuer holde. Ye are ouer eaſie to credite Fables.

Sozom. Lib. 1. Cap. 17.
Athanaſ. Apologia. 2.
Theodo. Lib. 1. Cap. 7.
Nicepher. Lib. 8. cap. 14
Beda in Chronicis.

The Councel, that ye imagine, was holden in Rome by Pope Sylueſter, is nothinge els but a greate heape of childiſhe Vanities. The holy diſcrete Learned Fathers saie there, Nemo Presbyterorum Chrisma conficiat: quoniam Chriſtus a Chriſmate vocatur: Præſul Summus non iudicabitur à quoquam. Quoniam ſcriptum eſt, Non eſt Diſcipulus ſupra Magiſtrum. Neque ab Auguſto, neque ab omni Clero, neque à Regibus, neque ab omni Populo Iudex Iudicabitur: *No* Prieſte *maie make or halowe the* Chriſme: *For* Chriſte *of* Chriſme *hath his name. The* Higheſt Prelate (*that is, the* Pope) *maie be iudged of no ma.: For it is written,* The Scholar is not aboue his Maiſter. *The Iudge,* (that is, the Pope) *ſhal not be Iudged, neither by the Emperoure, nor by al the Clergie, nor by Kinges, and Princes, nor by the whole people.* Sutche and other like good ſtuffe haue you in your Councel of Rome.

Conc. Rom. Ca. 5. Ca. 3. Ca. 12.

Notwithſtandinge, of what credite ſo euer this Councel were, yet, M. Harding, it vtterly ouerthroweth your whole purpoſe. For, if euer there were any ſutche Councel ſummoned in Rome, it was ſummoned, not by Sylueſter the deade Pope, but by the Authoritie of the Emperoure that then was aliue. So Euſebius writeth of the Councel of Rome, holden in the time of Pope Melciades, as it is saide before: Exemplar Regiarum Literarum, &c. *Here is a Copie of the* Emperours VVrite, *whereby he hath commaunded a* Councel of Bishoppes *to be kepte at* Rome.

Enſeb. Lib. 10. cap. 5.

Likewiſe the Bishoppes aſſembled in the Councel of Conſtantinople, wrote vnto the Bishoppes in the Councel of Rome: Cum indixiſſetis, &c. After ye had called a Councel to Rome, ye warned vs also to comme thither, *as the Members of your owne Body, by the moſte godly* Emperours VVrite.

Theodoret. Lib. 5. cap. 9.

By these it appeareth, if there were any ſutche Councel called to Rome, it was called by the Emperoure, and not by the Pope.

Euſe. De vita Conſtantini. Oratione. 1. Ruf. lib. 1. 5. 1 Art. 4. di. 29 Soc. li. 2. ca. 17 καὶ ἐπειτα ἐγὼ γνώμην τὰ ἐπισταθεντα ὑπ' αὐτοῦ συναγαγεῖν τὰς Ἐκκλησίας. Caſſiod. Lib. 4. ca. 16. Regula iuris. Quod omnes tangit, ab omnibus debet approbari.

Ye ſaie, The Emperoure in ſuche affaires was aduiſed euermore by the Biſhoppes. This is not vnlikely, and therefore eaſily maie be graunted. Notwithſtandinge, for ought, that ye can finde, he was more aduiſed oftentimes by ſomme other Biſhoppes, then by the Pope, as it ſhal appeare. Euſebius, touchinge the Emperoure Conſtantinus, writeth thus: Quaſi Communis quidam Epiſcopus a Deo conſtitutus, Miniſtrorum Dei Synodos conuocauit: *As if he had benne one* Common Bishop *appointed by God, he appointed* Councelles *of* Bishoppes *to aſſemble togeather.* Ruffinus saithe, The Emperoure was aduiſed hereto by Alexander, the Bishop of Alexandria, and by other Biſhoppes, and Prieſtes of Egypte. Here is no mention of the Pope. In the like caſes of Eccleſiaſtical Affaires, Athanaſius was an earneſt ſuiter vnto the Emperoure Conſtantius: Dioſcorus, vnto Theodoſius and ſo others, vnto other.

But of the Popes omnipotente conſente, without whiche, ye telle vs, no Emperoure maie ſummone a Councel, there is no man that maketh mention.

Ye ſaie, There ought no Councel to be kepte without the determinate conſent of the Biſhop of Rome. This also is an other of your Vntruthes, ſtandinge in the manifeſte corruption of the wordes of Socrates: as in my Former Replie I haue declared more at large.

The

The wordes of Socrates be these, Non licet scribere Ecclesiastica Decreta præter sententiam Episcopi Romani: *It is prouided, that* Ecclesiastical Lawes *be not made without the consente of the* Bishop of Rome: For that the Bishop of Rome was one of the Foure Greate Patriarkes, whoes allentes in al General Councelles were thought necessarie. But Socrates meaneth suche Ecclesiastical Lawes, as perteine to the whole Churche of God. For this is a rule agreeable to reason, That toucheth al, must be allowed by al.

Nowe, whereas ye haue exchanged the Allowinge of Canons, into the Summoninge, or Callinge of Councelles, it maie please you to remember, that Allowveinge of Canons was common to al the Members of the Councel, and specially to the Foure Principal Patriarkes, as it is saide before: But the Authoritie of Callinge Councelles belonged onely to the Emperoure.

That ye allege of Athanasius, is a vaine, and shameles Forgerie: as I haue otherwhere declared more at large. Suche Religion, suche Doctoures. Suche Folie is worthy no other answeare.

Sozomen. lib 6. Cap. 7.

Valentinian the Emperoure (ye saie) accoumpted him selfe as one of the people: and therefore saide, It was not lawful for him, to Examine maters of Religion. Thus he saide, either of humilitie, or els for wante of time. His forreine Enimies, his Warres, and his Ciuile Cares had filled his heade with other thoughtes. Nicephorus imagineth him thus to saie,

Nicephor. Lib. 11. cap. 3

Mihi negotijs occupato, & Reipublicæ curis distento, res huiusmodi inquirere non est facile: *For me, being thus occupied with Businesse, and Publique Cares, it is not easie to enquire of suche maters.* Otherwise, that Ecclesiastical Causes bee within the Princes Charge, I doubte not, but hereafter it shal wel appeare. King Odoacer saide vnto Pope Symmachus, and vnto the Cleregie of Rome, as it is alleged once before:

Conc. Roma. 3. Cap. 2.

Miramur, quicquam tentatum fuisse sine nobis: Nam, viuente nostro Presbytero, sine nobis nihil tentari oportuit: *Wee marueile, that any thinge was attempted without vs: For without vs nothing should haue benne donne, so longe as* Our Prieste (he meaneth the Pope) *was aliue.*

After this ye fille the house ful with Patriarkes of Constantinople, Patriarkes of Alexandria, Patriarkes of Hierusalem, Princes of Bulgaria, and with other like greate, and stately persones. The Conclusion hereof is this, That Pope Damasus gaue his consente to the Councel of Constantinople. Al this, M. Hardinge, ye might some haue obteined with more fauoure, and lesse adoe. Howe be it, ye maie not hereof wel reason thus, The Pope consented vnto the Councel: *Ergo*, The Pope had Authoritie to calle the Councel: lest children wonder at your Logique.

In the meane while, ye saie, the Emperoure Theodosius ruled the Empiere: whereby ye geue vs to vnderstand, that he had no charge ouer the Church. And thus ye continewe stil to enriche your self, and to heape your Reader with vntruthes.

Post Conc. Ephesinum Primum.

Certainely the Bishoppes in the Councel of Constantinople wrote thus in humble wise vnto the same Emperoure Theodosius: Obsecramus Clementiam tuam, vt, quemadmodum Literis honorasti Ecclesiam, quibus nos Conuocasti, ita finalem Conclusionem nostrorum Decretorum corrobores sententia tua, & Sigillo: *We beseeche your* Maiestie, *that, as you haue honoured the* Churche *by your Letters, wherewith yee haue called vs togeather, so it maie please you, to* Confirme the final Conclusion *of our Decrees with your* Sentence, *and with your* Seale.

Further, as it appeareth by your owne Allegation, the same Emperoure Theodosius toke vpon him, to bounde, and to limite the Catholique Faithe, and that euen in the Bodye of his Ciuile Lawes: which thing neither coulde he haue donne wythoute Judgemente: nor woulde he haue donne without Authoritie. But, if ye meane, that by this Determination of the Emperoure Theodosius, that Faithe onely shoulde be taken for Catholique, that was then professed by Pope Damasus, and should afterwarde be professed by others succedinge in Peters Chaire, then haue ye secretely conueighed vs in an other Vnrruthe. The place it selfe wil some reproue you. The Emperoures wordes be these, Cunctos populos in tali volumus Religione versari, quam Diuinum Petrum Apostolum tradidisse Romanis, Religio vsque nunc ab eo insinuata declarat: quamque Pontificem Damasum sequi claret, & Petrum Alexandriæ Episcopum, Virum Apostolicæ Sanctitatis: *Wee wil al menne to walke in that* Religion, *which Holy* Peter the Apostle

The Emperoure limiteth the Catholique Faithe.

Cod. Theodosian. Lib. 16. Titu de Fide Catholic. Cunctos Populos.

The Summoninge of Councelles.

poſtle *deliuered to the Romaines, as the Faithe firſte enkendled by him, and ſtil continewed vntil this daie, dooth declare: which* Religion *alſo it is plaine, that* Pope Damaſus *foloweth, and* Peter the Bishop of Alexandria, *a man of Apoſtolique holineſſe.* **Here the** Emperoure Theodosius **commaundeth his Subiectes to folowe, as wel the Faithe of** Peter **the** Bishop of Alexandria, **as of** Damaſus **the** Bishop of Rome.

And yet in the nexte title folowinge, he openeth his owne meaning in this wiſe by other Examples, more at large: Epiſcopis tradi omnes Eccleſias mox iubemus, quos conſtabit vti Communione Nectarij Epiſcopi Conſtantinopolitanæ Eccleſiæ, & Timothei, &c. *Wee commaunde, that forth with the* Churches *be reſtored to al* Bishoppes, *of whom it ſhal appeare, that they Communicate with* Neſtorius *the* Bishop of Conſtantinople, *or with* Timotheus: *or ſuch as ſhal haue felowſhip or agreement in Faithe, with the* Bishoppes of Alexandria *in* Egypte: *and with* Pelagius *the* Bishop *of* Laodicea: *and with* Diodorus *the* Bishop *of* Tarſus in Asia: *and with* Amphilochius *the* Bishop *of* Iconium: *and with* Optimus *the* Bishop *of* Antioche: *and with* Helladius *the* Bishop *of* Cæſaria: *and with* Otreius *the* Bishop *of* Melite: *and with* Gregorius *the* Bishop *of* Nyſſa: *and with* Terennius *the* Bishop *of* Scythia: *and with* Marmarius *the* Bishop *of* Martianopolis. **Euery of theiſe ſeueral** Bishoppes, **M. Hardinge, by the** Emperoures **iudgemente, in trial of the** Catholique Faithe, **had as great Authoritie, and weight, as had** Damaſus **the** Bishop of Rome.

Cod. Theod. Lib. 16. Tit. 1. Sozom. Li. 7. ca. 9.

But Pope Cœleſtinus, **yet ſaie, deſired** Cyrillus **the** Bishop of Alexandria, **to repreſente his perſone, and to ſupplie his roume in the** Councel of Epheſus, **that is to ſaie, to haue the** Firſte Place **in the** Councel. **For the** Firſte Place **in al Eccleſiaſtical Aſſemblies was allotted to the** Bishop of Rome: **The** Seconde, **to the** Bishop of Conſtantinople: **The** Thirde, **to the** Bishop of Alexandria: **The** Fourth, **to the** Bishop of Antioche: **The** Fifthe, **to the** Bishop of Hieruſalem.

Diſt. 22. Renouantes.

This packinge of places therefore betwéne Cœleſtinus, **and** Cyrillus, **was a Myſterie, pourpoſely canuelled, to kéepe the** Bishop of Conſtantinople, **whome the** Pope **euermore enuied, out of countenaunce. For by this Policie, the** Bishop of Alexandria **that ſhoulde haue had the** Thirde Place, **was handſomely ſhifted into the** Firſte: **and the** Bishop of Conſtantinople **which, in the** Bishop of Romes **abſence, ſhould haue had the** Firſte Place, **was remoued downe to the** Seconde.

Howe be it, what auaileth al this, M. Harding, to further your pourpoſe, and to proue, that Councelles were ſummoned by the Pope? Verily it appeareth not hitherto, that either Cœleſtinus, **or** Cyrillus, **or any other** Bishop **had any ſuche Power, or Authoritie to ſummone** Councelles. **This is it, that yée ſhoulde haue proued. As for the** Firſte, **or** Seconde Place **in** Councelles, **wée moued no queſtion.**

Againe, yée ſéeme to ſaie, The pope of right was euermore preſidente in al Councelles. **This if yée knowe it is an other** Vntruthe: **If yée knowe it not, it is an erroure. For it is plaine, that in the Firſt** Councel of Nice Pope Iulius **was not** President, **but** Euſtachius **the** Bishop of Antioche. **The** Popes Legates, **as it is ſaide before, were placed benethe in the fourthe roume: In the Fifthe** Councel of Conſtantinople, Menna **the** Bishop **of the ſame Cittie, was** President, **and not the** Pope. **In the Seconde** Epheſine Councel, Dioſcorus **the** Bishop of Alexandria **was** Presidente. **In the Second** Councel of Carthage **it ſéemethe** Gennedius **was the** Presidente.

Theo. li. 1. ca. 7. Enagr. lib. 4. ca. 38. Nicephor. Li. 17 Cap. 27. Conc. Calced. Act. 1. Dioſ. Exactis con. Carthag. 2.

Nicolaus Cuſanus, **after he had wel debated this mater, ſaithe thus,** In Concilijs fuit ſemper Præſidentialis Romani Pontificis authoritas, ſine qua Vniuerſale Concilium non fuiſſet, dummodò ſaltem intereſſe voluiſſet, aut potuiſſet: *The* Bishop of Rome *had alwaies authoritie to be* Presidente *in* Councelles, *otherwiſe the* Councel *had not ben General: So that the* Bishop of Rome *either woulde, or coulde be preſente at the* Councel. **For otherwiſe he was not** President. **Therefore of your parte, M. Harding, it was a great** Vntruthe, **to ſaie,** The Pope of Right vvas euermore President in al Councelles. **Againe** Cuſanus **ſaithe,** Imperatore in perſona exiſtente, reperio eum ſemper præſediſſe. In Sexta Synodo Conſtantinus Imperator præſedit in medio cum decem de maioribus Patritijs, & ad leuam eius Vicarij Senioris Romæ &c. *When the* Emperoure *was preſente in perſone, I finde, that he was alwaies* President. *In the Sixthe* Councel of Conſtantinople, Con-

Nicol. Cuſan. Decõcor. Catholi. li. 2. ca. 2

Nico. Cuſan De Concord. Li. 3. Cap. 16

Constantinus *the* Emperoure *was* Presidente, *and sate in the midde with tenne of his greatest Lordes: and at his leafte hande sate the* Popes Legates. &c. This, M. Hardinge, is very farre from your reckeninge.

This Dignitie then paſſed not by Enheritance, or by Succeſſion, as the Pope nowe woulde ſeme to claime it: but, either by choiſe of the Councel, or by fauoure of the Prince. Thus Hoſius, the Bishop of Corduba in Spaine, not by right of his place, but for the worthineſſe of his perſone, was appointed Presidente in the Councel of Sardica. And Athanaſius ſpeaketh of him in this wiſe with greate admiration, Cuius non fuit Concilij Princeps? *In what* Councel *hathe not* Hoſius *benne the* Presidente, *or* Chiefe?

Sozom. Li. 3 Cap. 12. Socrat. Lib. 2. Cap. 20. Athanaſ. Apologia. 2.

Yée ſaie, Pope Syluester Christened the Emperour Constantinus, and therfore was his Spiritual Father. This maie paſſe emong other your Truthes. For your Popes, by their Omnipotente Power maie Miniſter Sacramentes, beinge dead. It is knowen, that, as longe as Syluester was aliue, Constantinus was neuer Chriſtened. And, yet notwithſtanding al this were true, M. Harding, yet your cauſe thereby were litle furthered. Onleſſe perhaps yée wil reaſon thus: Pope Syluester Chriſtened the Emperoure: Ergo, The Pope hathe Authoritie, to cal Councelles. How be it, onleſſe this Argumente be better digeſted, youre very Sophiſters, of Louaine wil hardly allowe it. But in déede, that whole tale, touchinge the Chriſteninge of the Emperour Constantine, is nothing els, but a péeuiſhe fable. Constantius, the Emperours owne Sonne, vtterly denieth, that Syluester euer Baptized Constantinus his Father. Euſebius ſaithe, Constantinus was Chriſtened, not in the flouriſhing ſtate of his age, but onely a litle before he died: not in Rome, but at Nicomedia, in the Kingdome of Epirus: not in a corner, but in the preſence of many Bishoppes: and, as S. Hierome ſaithe, not by Pope Syluester that then was deade, but by Euſebius the Bishop of Nicomedia. For proufe wherof, S. Ambroſe ſaithe, Constantino in vltimis conſtituto, Gratia Baptiſmatis omnia peccata dimiſit: *The Grace of Baptiſme foregaue* Constantine *al his ſinnes, euen at the endinge of his life.* Therefore, M. Hardinge, wée muſte néedes ſaie, that either your tale is vntrue, which is not ſtrange: or els Constantine was twiſe Baptized, which is very vnlikely.

Inter Acta Liberij. ca. 6 Euſeb. De vita Conſtã. Orat. 4. Socra. Anno etatis ſue. 65 συγκαλέσας τοὺς ἐπισκόπους: Hieron. in Chronico. Ambro de obitu Theodoſij.

Cardinal Poole, ſeinge the mater to paſſe ſo cleare, telleth vs roundely in one worde, that Euſebius, and Constantius were Arian Heretiques, and therefore refuſeth the whole ſtorie written by Euſebius touching the Chriſteninge of Constantine. But, ſomme what to ſothe you in your tale, let a Fable ſtand for Truth: and let vs graunt you an impoſſibilitie, that Constantine was Baptized by Pope Syluester being deade. Yet wil you néedes geather hereof, that therefore the Emperoure is Subiecte to the Pope? Or, that the Pope hathe Authoritie to cal Councelles? What wil you then ſaie, when the Emperoure is Baptized by ſomme other Prieſte, or Bishop, or by a Midwife? Shal euery of theiſe therefore require to haue, and to do the like? Or, muſt wée beléeue, that ſutche a Prieſte, Bishop, or Midwife, ſhal haue Authoritie to calle Councelles? In déede, this were a good ſhorte waie to geate Supremacie. But it mighte haue pleaſed you, to remember, that the Cardinal of Oſtia vſeth alwaies of Office to Conſecrate the Pope. Yet, I trowe, yée wil not therefore place him aboue the Pope. Elizæus anointed Kinge Iehu: yet was he not therefore aboue the Kinge. Your owne Doctoure ſaithe, Quòd hoc Argumentum non concludat, patet: quia in Veteri Lege, Sacerdotes, qui Reges inungebant, indubitanter Regibus Subdebantur: *It appearethe, that this* Argumente *is nothinge woorthe, and concludeth nothinge. For in the* Old Lawe, *the* Prieſtes *that anointed the* Kinges, *were vndoubtedly ſubiecte to the* Kinges.

Cardinal. Polus de Baptiſmo Conſtãtini. pag. 87. Iohan. De Pariſ. cap. 19

To conclude, what right Emperoures had in Summoning of Councelles, by theſe fewe Authorities, and Examples folowinge, it maie ſone appeare. Euſebius ſaithe, Constantinus Synodum Oecumenicam Collegit, & Epiſcopos, vt vndique accelerarent, honorificis literis conuocauit: (Not the Pope, but) Constantine *the* Emperoure *geathered a* General Councel, *and by honorable Writes called the* Bishoppes *of all Countries to repaire thither.* Theodoretus ſaithe, *A great, and a Holy* Councel *was gathered to* Nicæa, *by the* Grace of God, *and* (not by the Pope, but) *by the* Godly Emperoure Constantinus. Zozomenus ſaithe, (Not the Pope, but) *The* Emperoure Constantine *wrote vnto al the*

Euſeb. De Vita Conſtan. Orat. 3 Theod. Lib. 1. Cap. 9. Soz. li. 1. c. 17

Rulers

The ſummoninge of Councelles.

Rulers of the Churches, that they ſhoulde be at Nice *by a daie: to the* Biſhoppes *of the* Apoſtolique Sees, *to* Marcarius *the* Biſhop of Hieruſalem, *and to* Iulius *the* Biſhop of Rome. **In whiche wordes this alſo maie be noted, that the** Pope **then was vnder the** Emperours Summone, **no leſſe then others.**

In the Councel of Conſtantinople, **the** Biſhoppes **wrote thus vnto the** Emperoure, Ex mandato tuæ Pietatis Conſtantinopolim conuenimus: *Wee are comme to* Conſtantinople, (**not by the** Popes **Authoritie, but**) *by your* Maieſties Commiſſion. Athanaſius **ſaithe,** Ab Imperatore, Præfectisque Literæ ſequentes in omnem partem miſſæ ſunt, eos, qui illuc ituri eſſent, conuocantes: *Theiſe* Letters, *or* VVrites *folowinge were ſente out into al places* (**not from the** Pope, **but**) *from the* Emperoure, *and his* Lieuetenantes, *ſummoninge them, that ſhoulde comme vnto the* Councel. S. Chryſoſtome **ſaithe,** *Wee wente in, and humbly beſought* (**not the** Pope, **but**) *the moſte* Chriſtian Prince, *to calle a* Councel. S. Ambroſe, **ſpeakinge of him ſelfe, and of other** Biſhoppes, **beinge then at the** Councel of Aquilea, **ſaithe thus,** Nos conuenimus Aquileiam iuxta Præceptum Imperatoris: *Wee are mette togeather, at* Aquileia, *by the Commaundemente of the* Emperoure (**and not of the** Pope.)

Concil. Conſtantino. 1.
Athanaſi de Synodis Arimin. & Seleuceen.
Chry. Epi. 1. ad Innocen.
Ambroſi. in Conc. Aquil.

S. Hierome **ſaithe,** Orientis, atque Occidentis Epiſcopos ob quaſdam Eccleſiaſticas diſſenſiones Romani Imperiales Literæ contraxerunt: *To ſtaie certaine Eccleſiaſtical diſſenſions,* (**not any the** Popes **Letters of Commaundement, but**) *the* Emperours VVrites cauſed *the* Biſhoppes, *as wel of the* Eaſte, *as of the* VVeaſt, *to drawe to* Rome.

Hie. in Epitaphio Paulæ

Of Pope Leo, **we haue ſaide before. Beinge** Pope, **and, as, M. Hardinge imagineth, hable to ſummone the worlde withe a becke, thus he writeth to the** Emperoure Theodoſius: Dignetur Pietas veſtra ſupplicationi noſtræ annuere, vt intra Italiam haberi iubeatis Epiſcopale Concilium: *Wee beſeeche your* Godly Maieſtie, *to graunte vnto our humble requeſte, that it maie pleaſe you to Commaunde a* Councel *of* Biſhoppes *to be holden within* Italie.

Leo, Epiſt. 9. ad Theodoſi. Imperatorē.

Sozomenus **ſaithe,** *The* Arians *beſought* (**not the** Pope, **but**) *the* Emperoure Conſtantius, *to commaunde a* Councel, *to be holden at* Antioche. *The ſame* Arians *afterwarde beſought* (**not the** Pope, **but**) *the ſame* Emperoure Conſtantius, *to ſummone an other* Councel *at* Millaine. **Againe** Sozomenus **ſaithe,** *The* Catholique Biſhoppes *ſente* Hypatianus *theire Embaſſadoure, to entreate* (**not the** Pope, **but**) *the* Emperoure, *that to redreſſe certaine Errours, they might haue leaue to meete togeather.* Pope Liberius **ſaithe,** *A* Councel *is holden at* Millaine, (**not by my Authoritie, but**) *by the* commaundemente of the Prince. Pope Leo **ſaithe,** *The* greate Councel of Calcedon *was ſummoned* (**not by him ſelfe, but**) *by the trauaile of* Martianus *the* Emperoure. **The** Emperoure Conſtantius *Commaunded two* ſeuerall Councelles *to be keapte at one time: the one at* Seleucea *in* Iſauria *in the* Eaſte: *the other at* Ariminum *in* Italie *in the* VVeaſte. Socrates **ſaithe,** *Sithence the* Emperoures *were firſte Chriſtened, the ſtate of the Churche hath hanged on them: and the greateſt* Councelles *haue benne, and be keapte by theire aduiſe.*

The Pope humbly deſireth the Emperoure to ſummon a Councel.

Sozom. li. 4. ca. 22.
Soc. l. 2. ca. 8.
Theo. l. 2. c. 15
Ruf. l. 1. c. 19.
Soz. l. 6. c. 7.
Inter acta Liberij.
Leo ad Anatolium.
Soc. l. 2. c. 37
Socra. Li. 5. In proœmio.

Thus many Anciente Councelles **we are hable to ſhewe you, ſummoned by** Emperoures. **Nowe ſhewe you, M. Hardinge, either that the** Emperoure **did al theiſe thinges by the Authoritie of the** Pope: **or, that the** Emperoure **was onely the** Popes Summoner **to cal to** Councel **ſuche, and ſo many, as it ſhoulde like his Holineſſe to commaunde: Or, that the** Pope **did euer ſummone any one** Anciente General Councel **by his owne onely righte, without further Commiſſion from the** Emperoure. **then wil we ſaie, ye haue ſaide ſomme thinge. As for al that ye haue nowe ſaide, in good ſothe, it is leſſe, then nothinge.**

The Apologie. Cap. 12. Diuiſion. 3.

And when Rufine, **the** Heretique, **had alleged for his Authoritie a** Councel, **whiche as he thought, ſhoulde make for him:** S. Hierome **his Aduerſarie, to confute him,** Tel, vs (**quod he**) what Emperoure commaunded that Councel to be called? **The ſame** S. Hierome **againe in his** Epitaphe **vpon** Paula, **maketh mention of the** Emperoures Letters, **whiche gaue commaundemente, to cal the** Biſhoppes of Italie, and Græcia to

Rome, to a Councel.

M. Hardinge.

Beſides that yee ſo ſtrangely, to cal Ruffine an Heretike, wee ſaie, that S. Hierome might wel demaunde, what Emperoure ſummoned that Councel, whiche was neuer ſummoned. Againe wee confeſſe, that ſome Emperoures haue ſummoned bothe Latine and Greeke Biſhoppes. But yee proue not, that any did it as ſupreme heade, and as iudge in maters of Religion, but by the conſente of the Biſhoppes of Rome, as I haue declared before.

The Biſhop of Sariſbury.

Were you not a ſtranger in your owne Bokes, M. Harding, yée would not thinke it ſo ſtrange a mater, to heare Ruffinus called an Heretique. S. Hierome doubted not ſo to calle him. Thus he ſaithe: Dum mihi inconſtantiæ crimen impingit, ſe Hæreticum non Caueret: *While* Ruffinus *chargeth me with inconſtancie, he proueth him ſelfe to be an* Heretique, &c. Ruffinus *hath ſo tranſlated* Origen *into* Latine, *that who ſo findeth him Catholique touchinge the* Trinitie, *ſhoulde neuer ſuſpect him, in any thinge els, to be an* Heretique. Againe he ſaithe vnto him, Solos Hereticos non recipimus, quos vos ſolos recipitis: *Only* Heretiques *wee receiue not into our houſes: And yet them onely you receiue.*

Anaſtaſius, the Bishop of Rome, hath thus publiſhed his Iudgemente of the ſame Ruffinus: Omni ſuſpicione ſepoſita, Ruffinum ſcito, quòd propria mente Origenis dicta in Latinum tranſtulit, ac probauit. Nec diſſimilis ab eo eſt, qui alienis vitijs præſtat aſſenſum. Illud tamen ſcire te cupio, ita haberi à noſtris partibus alienum, vt quid agat, vbi ſit, nec ſcire cupiamus: *All ſuſpicion ſette aparte, knowe thou, that* Ruffinus *hath tranſlated* Origen (the Heretiques) *woordes into* Latine, *accordinge to his owne likinge,* and vvel alovveth the ſame. *And, who ſo euer geueth his conſente vnto an other mannes faulte, is not vnlike vnto him. Notwithſtandinge, thus mutche I would haue thee to knowe, that* Ruffinus *is ſo farre from our felowſhip, or profeſſion of* Faithe, *that wee deſire not to knowe, neither* What he doo: he, *nor* Where he is.

Vincentius ſaithe, that S. Hierome charged Ruffinus with the Pelagian Hereſie. Eraſmus ſaithe, Ruffinus non fuit alienus ab Origeniſtarum Hæreſi: Ruffinus *was not cleare from the* Origenians Hereſie. Againe, ſpeaking of the ſame Heretiques, he ſaith, Huius rei Dux, & Signifer Aquileienſis Ruffinus fuit. Againe, Notat, neſcio quem: ipſum, opinor, Ruffinum, qui in eam Hæreſim inductus eſt à Magiſtro quopiam, &c. Againe, Monet, vt exploſa factione Origeniſtarum, eos etiam eijciat, qui clam, & obliquè eſſent Origeniſtæ, Ruffinum, & illius amicos: *The Captaine, and Standarde bearer of this* Hereſie, *was* Ruffinus of Aquileia, &c. Againe, S. Hierome *here noteth, ſome bodye, I knowe not whom: but I thinke,* Ruffinus *him ſelfe: that was broughte into this* Hereſie *by ſomme teacher, &c.* Againe, *He warneth his friende, that hauing renounced the* Origenian Heretiques, *he woulde likewiſe renounce them, that priuily: and in ſecrete were* Origenian Heretiques, *meaning* Ruffinus, *and his friendes.*

Likewiſe againe he ſaithe, Ruffinus grauiſſima ſuſpicione premebatur, quòd eſſet Origeniſta. Sub hoc enim titulo Arianorum Hæreſis conata eſt repullulaſcere: Ruffinus *was greeuouſly ſuſpected to be an* Origenian Heretique. *For vnder that name the* Arian Hereſie *beganne to reuiue.* Thus yée ſée, M. Hardinge, it was not ſo great an Hereſie, to ſaie, that Ruffinus was an Hererique.

The Apologie, Cap. 12. Diuiſion. 4.

Continually for the ſpace of Fiue Hundred yeeres, the Emperoure alone appointed the Eccleſiaſtical Aſſemblies, and called the Councelles of the Biſhoppes togeather.

Wee nowe therefore marueile the more at the vnreaſonable dealing of the Bishop of Rome, who knowing what was the Emperours right, when the Churche was wel ordered, knowinge alſo that it is nowe a common righte to al Princes, for ſo mutche, as Kinges are nowe fully poſſeſſed in the ſeueral partes of the whole Empire, doothe ſo without conſideration, aſſigne that office alone to him ſelfe, and taketh it ſufficiente

Votruth, proceeding of Ignorance: as it may ſoone appeare.

Reade the former Anſweare.

Hierom. in Apologia cõtra Ruffinũ.

In eadem Apologia.

Ana. ad Epiſc. Hieroſ. Apum Hierony. To. 4.

Vinc. in Speculo. li. 17. ca. 99.

Eraſ. in vita Hieronymi.

Eraſ. in Epi. Hierony. ad Principi. In Schol.

Era. in Argum. Epiſtola Theophili ad Hierony.

Era. de libris Origenis.

ciente in Summoninge a General Councel, to make that man, that is Prince of the whole worlde, none otherwise partaker thereof, then he woulde make his owne seruante.

M. Hardinge.

Where you saie, The Emperoure alone celebrated, kepte, or helde Councelles, for so is your Latine, (a) it is too impudently faced, without any face, without prouse, without Truthe. They were Celebrated, or holden (b) by the Popes Legates, the Patriarkes, and Bisshoppes, and not by Emperoures. Al be it, Emperoures might sitte in them, (c) but not as Iudges. And they haue euer beene called *Episcopalia Concilia*, not (d) *Imperatoria*, Councelles of Bisshoppes, not of Emperoures. And diuers Councelles, not accompted General, were keapte by Bishoppes before any Emperoure was Christened. As those, whiche were keapte by S. Peter in Hierusalem, mentioned in the Actes of the Apostles: in the time of Victor the Pope, in Palestina, and other places, concerning the keepinge of Easter. At Rome about the time of Pope Fabian, againste the Nouatian Heresie: At Antioche, againste Paulus Samosatenus, and many others. Al whiche Councelles were keapte, not onely without the presence of the Emperoures person, but (e) also without his Power, or Authoritie. And yet, if he were heade of the Churche, it coulde not haue beene donne without him.

Victor, 15.

If you saie, He was not then Christened, I answeare, that Christianitie is no parte of his Imperial Power. It is a spiritual Power, whereby he is made the sonne of God. He maie thereby be ruled by a Christian Bishop. But verily, he hath no Power geuen to him, whereby he maie rule Bisshoppes. (f) Baptisme maketh a man the Childe of the Churche. But (f) it is Imposition of handes, in consecratinge a Christian Priestе to be a Bisshop, that geueth him rule ouer others, and not the Sacramente of Baptisme. Therefore Emperoures were not the holders, or kepers of Councelles, the firste fiue hundred yeres. Yea three hundred were fully expired, before the Emperoure professed openly the Christian Faithe. So mutche the lesse maie you marueile, that nowe the Bisshop of Rome, calleth, and keepeth Councelles, chiefly by his owne authoritie (g) For he succedeth Peter, not Nero. He tooke his authoritie of Christe immediately, not of the people of Rome. Be the Emperoure Christian, or not Christian, the Bisshop of Rome by (h) nature of his Bisshoppes Office, is not onely alwayes a Christian man, but also a chiefe Priestе.

Where you saie, the Bisshop of Rome in summoninge the Late Councel, did besides good consideration, in that he made a man, that is Prince of the whole worlde, no otherwise partaker thereof, then he woulde make his owne seruante: you forgette your selfe fouly, and seeme to recke litle what you speake, so you vtter your malice. For who is that, whome you cal Prince of the whole worlde? What contradiction is this: Saide you not in the same sentence before, that Kinges are nowe fully possessed in the Seuerall partes of the whole Empire? Howe then cal you Ferdinande (i) Prince of the whole worlde? Wel, this is but one of the common ornamentes of your Rhetorique. Sir, the Emperoure Ferdinande, of famous memorie, was not so abused of Pius the fourthe, that blessed man, Bisshop of Rome in these our daies. Ye rather are they who abuse the Emperoures Maiestie. For ye depose him cleane from his seate: ye finde faulte that euer Leo the thirde made an Emperoure in the Weste. Ye complaine openly that the Emperial Maiestie had not continued stil at Constantinople. Belike to the intente the Turke mighte nowe haue had it, who is knowen to suffer in his Dominions al Faithes and Religions: For whiche cause it maie seeme yee fauor him. As for Pope Pius that nowe is, he deferred the olde priuilege of honoure vnto the Emperoure Ferdinande, without the olde burthen. For whereas in olde times (k) Councelles were holden by authoritie of the Pope, (k) as Socrates witnesseth, yet the Emperoure bare the charge of callinge the Bisshoppes togeather. But nowe the Pope him selfe bare a greate parte of that burthen, and communicated his pourpose fully with the Emperoure.

Lib. 2.

The Bisshop of Sarisburie.

Whether it were the Emperoure alone, that appointed Ecclesiastical Councelles, it maie appeare by that wee haue already saide. The Pope alone, I assure you, it was not. Naie, the Emperoure as it is saide, and proued before, oftentimes helde suche Assemblies, when, and where him selfe listed, whether the Pope would, or no. The Popes duetie was onely to appeare emongeste other Bisshoppes, when he was called.

I graunte suche Councelles had theire name of Bisshoppes, and were called Concilia Episcopalia, for that maters there were specially ordered by the discretion, and iudgemente of the Bisshoppes. But wil you therefore conclude, that the same Councels perteined nothinge to the Ptince? Certainely, the Emperoure Constantinus commaunded al the Bisshoppes to appeare before him, and to yelde him a reckeninge of their Determination in the Councel. This was the tenour of his Write: Quotquot Synodum Tyri habitam compleuistis, sine mora ad Pietatis nostræ Castra properetis: ac re ipsa, quam sincerè, ac rectè iudicaueritis, ostendatis: Idque Coram me: quem sincerum esse Dei Ministrum, ne vos quidem ipsi negabitis: *As many of you, as haue keapte the Councel at Tyrus, repaire to our Campe without delaie: and shewe me in deede, how sincerely,*

(a) This is M. Hardinges modesty. Read the answeare next goeinge before this lauing one

(b) Vntruthe, plaine, and euident. For many times the Popes Legates were vnderlinges, and inferioures vnto others.

(c) Vntruthe. For the Emperours Embassadoures sittinge in Councel, were called, Illustrissimi Iudices.

(d) Nomore were they called Concilia Papalia.

(e) So were the moste parte of the same councelles keapte without, either the presence, or the power, or authoritie of the Pope.

(f) O folie of folies. As if the Emperours power wer either encreased, or empaired by his Baptisme.

(g) A substancial good reason. But what it S. Ambrose saie, He succedeth Iudas.

(h) The Pope a Christian man by Nature of Office.

(i) It is written in your owne Glose, Iura cõmunia dicunt, quod Imperator est Dominus Mundi.

(k) Vntruthe in two together. For neither was it so, nor dothe Socrates record it so. *Socr. l. 2. c. 28. Soc. lib. 1. c. 33.*

Peters Succeſſours.

and rightly yet haue proceeded: And that, euen before me, *whome you your ſelues cannot denie to be the* Sincere ſeruante of God.

Tripart. Hiſt. 2.c.2. Athanaſius **was the greateſt trauailer in the** Councel of Nice, **againſte the** Arians: **yet was he then no** Bishop, **but onely a** Deacon. **Your owne** Ceremoniarie of Rome **telleth you, that** Abbates **haue right & authoritie to determine, and ſubſcribe in** Councel, **as wel, as** Bishoppes: **And yet were they neuer called the** Councelles **of** Abbates, **but onely of** Bishoppes. **Therefore, M. Hardinge, this ghelſe is ouer ſimple, and ſerueth you not. But hereof we haue ſufficiently ſaide before.**

Chriſtianitie (**ye ſaie**) is no parte of the Emperial Power. **Ye might likewiſe haue ſaide,** Chriſtianitie is no parte of the Papale Power. **Verily, it can not wel appeare, that** Peter **and** Paule **had euer any ſuche** Chriſtianitie. **The** Emperours **righte is neither encreaſed, nor abated by his** Baptiſme. **Whether he be Faithful, or vnfaithful, he is the Miniſter of God, and beareth the Swerde to puniſhe ſinne.**

Ye ſaie, The Pope ſuccedeth Peter, and not Nero: Therfore he calleth, and keepeth Councelles chiefly by his owne authorine. **Of ſuche proper** Argumentes, **M. Hardinge, we marueile not muche, though ye make no ſtoare. How be it, ſomme menne haue thought, ye do** S. Peter **greate wronge, appointinge him ſuche Children, to be his** Heires. **For many of**

Ber. de Conſiderat. li. 4. **them in al their dealinges, haue reſembled** Nero, **more then** Peter. S. Bernarde **ſaithe thus vnto** Pope Eugenius: In his ſucceſſibus, non Petro, ſed Conſtantino: *In theſe thinges yee haue ſucceeded, not* Peter *the Apoſtle, but the* Emperoure Conſtantine. Pope Adrian

Citatur ab Illyrico inter Teſt. verita. pag. 387. **the fourth was wont to ſaie,** Succedimus, non Petro in docendo, ſed Romulo in parricidio: *Wee ſucceede, not* Peter *in teachinge, but* Romulus *in killinge our Brethren.*

Eraſ. in Adagio. Sileni Alcibiadis. Eraſmus **ſaithe,** Pontifices nunc ſunt Vicarij Iulij Cæſaris, Alexandri Magni, Crœſi, Xerxis: non Chriſti, non Petri: *The* Popes *nowe are the Vicares of* Iulius Cæſar, *of* Alexander *the* Great, *of* Crœſus, *and of* Xerxes: *not of* Chriſte, *nor of* Peter. **It is written in**

Am. Citatur ab Illyrico inter Teſt. Pag 142. **a Sermon, bearing the name of** S Ambroſe: Qui debuerint eſſe Vicarij Apoſtolorum, facti ſunt Socij Iudæ: *They that ſhoulde haue ben the Apoſtles Vicares, are nowe become* Iudas *felowes.* Robertus Gallus, **that liued welnere three hundred yeres paſt, imagineth**

Rob. Gallus, Cap. 5. Chriſte **thus to ſaie of the** Pope: Quis poſuit Idolum hoc in Sede mea, vt imperaret Gregi meo? *Who ſet this Idol in my roume, and made him ruler ouer my Flocke?* **And beinge ſo vile in his owne houſe, howe can he be glorious in the** Houſe of God?

Diſt. 19. Sic omnes. In Gloſſa. Yet (**you ſaie**) the Pope is alwaies, not onely a Chriſtian man, but alſo a chiefe Prieſte, (**not by Faithe, but**) by the nature of his Office. **Euen ſo your** Gloſe **telleth you,** Papa Sanctitatem recipit a Cathedra: *The* Pope *receiueth his holineſſe of his Chaire:* **that is to ſaie,** *of the nature of his Office.*

Nicol. Cuſa. Ad Bohem. Epiſt. 2. Cardinal Cuſanus **ſaithe,** Veritas adhæret Cathedræ, &c. Veritas per Chriſtum Cathedræ alligata eſt, non Perſonis. Ait enim: ſuper Cathedram Moſi ſederunt Scribæ, & Phariſæi: *The Truthe cleaueth faſte to the* Popes *Chaire, &c. Chriſte hath nailed his Truthe to the* Popes *Chaire, and not to his Perſone. For he ſaithe,* The Scribes, *and*

Diſt. 40. Nõ nos. In Gloſ. *Phariſeis are placed in* Moſes Chaire. **An other ſaith,** Tametſi Papa non ſit bonus, tamen ſemper præſumitur eſſe bonus. In Papa ſi deſint bona acquiſita per meritum, ſufficiunt, quæ à loci Prædeceſſore præſtantur: *Notwithſtandinge the Pope be not good, yet he is euer preſumed to be good: If the Pope lacke good vertues of his owne, the vertues of* Peter *his Predeceſſoure are ſufficiente.*

Part hereof hath benne touched before.

Addition. ☞ **M. Hardinge.** You beare your Reader in hande, that *Nicolaus Cuſanus* wrote a Booke intituled, *De Authoritate Eccleſiæ, & Concilij, ſupra & contra Scripturam.* Nowe, M. Iewel, if you be hable to ſhewe vs any Booke of Cuſanus ſo intituled, either in printe, or in authentique written hande, I wil ſaie, that you wil proue your ſelfe a truer man, then euer I tooke you to be, &c.

Addition. ☞

The Anſweare. **This mater, M. Hardinge, you haue blaſed out with ſuche eloquence, as is moſte mete for a man of your ſobrietie. In deede, at what time I wrote mine Anſweare, I had not that Booke of** Cuſanus, **nor coulde not geate it by any meanes: but was faine therein to vſe the report, and credite of** Matthias Flacius Illyricus: **whom, I thinke you wil not denie, to be a man of good readinge. His woordes hereof are theſe,** Nicolai Cuſani ſententia, de Authoritate Eccleſiæ, & Concilij, ſupra & contra Scripturas. **Herevpon you crie out in the miſchefe of youre ſpyte,** A ſhame-

leſſe

Peters Succeſſours.

leſſe Man: A falſe Harlotte, An impudente Lier, Growen to ſtiche impudencie, A Sclaunderer, A Bragger, A Boaſter of greate readinge, &c. O, M. Hardinge, it were mutche fitter for a wiſe man, to be ſober, then thus to fare. But you paſſe alonge boldely, and conſtantely, as your manner is.

M. Hard. 412 a.

M. Hardinge. Wel, ſaie you, perchaunce you wil ſaie, thoughe the title be altered, yet the woordes out of the ſame Epiſtle be truely recited, wherein conſiſteth the chiefe effecte, and principal purpoſe. If you ſo ſaie, you wil be proued no leſſe a lier, and falſe reporter herein, then you haue benne in the reſte. And for example herein, I wil bringe euen the very firſte place, that you haue alleged out of him. You telle vs Pag. 55. that thus he ſaithe, *Sequuntur Scripturæ Eccleſiam, & non è conuerſo:* The Scriptures of God folowe the Churche: but contrariewiſe, the Churche followeth not the Scriptures. You haue here clipped the Authours ſentence, and quite altered the ſenſe. His woordes are theſe, *Eccleſia igitur, ſicut recipit Scripturam, ita & interpretatur: ſequũtur Scripturæ Eccleſiam, qua prior eſt, & propter quam Scripturæ, & non è conuerſo:* The Churche, as it receiueth the Scripture, ſo doth it expounde the ſame. The Scriptures therefore doo folowe the Churche, whiche is the former, and for the whiche the Scripture is ordeined, and not contrariewiſe. Cuſanus woordes in their righte forme doo boothe ſtande wel, and haue a good meaninge. But your falſe chaunginge of them, cauſeth them to importe an intolerable derogation of the Scriptures, withoute anye coloure of truethe. For as it is mooſte true, that the Churche was before the Scriptures, that is to ſaie, the written woorde of God, and that the Scriptures were ordeined and appointed for the Churche: For it is very falſe, that the Scriptures doo folowe the Churche, and the Churche not the Scriptures. For why hath the Churche, receiued the Scriptures, but to folowe them, and to put them in Execution, bothe in our inwarde beleefe, and in our outwarde actions? Doo you not bluſhe, M. Iewell, thus wilfully to peruerte that with your falſe iuggling, and conueighing awaie of thoſe wordes, *Qua prior eſt, & propter quam Scriptura*, which before had a good righte ſenſe? You thought belike, you ſhoulde neuer here hereof againe, nor be called to any reckening: or els ye would haue had more regarde to your good name, and honeſtie, &c. You thought, you would paſſe Illyricus an aſe in falſehoode, although he be his craftes maiſter therein.

The Anſweare. A fierce Oratoure you are, and a fauourable Interpreter, M. Hardinge. Cardinal Cuſanus muſte nedes be defended, and ſtaide vprighte, in reſpecte of his Dignitie, and what ſo euer he hathe written, it muſte haue a right good Catholique meaninge. But peace, M. Iewel muſte bluſhe, and be aſhamed of his iugglinge. But, I praie you, M. Hardinge, are not theſe Cuſanus your Doctoures owne woordes? Dothe he not ſaie plainely, Sequuntur Scripturæ Eccleſiam, & non è conuerſo? *The Scriptures folowe the Churche, but contrariwiſe, the Churche folowethe not the Scriptures?* You ſaie, There be other woordes betweene *Qua prior eſt, & propter quam Scriptura:* That is to ſaie, *The Churche was before the Scriptures, and the Scriptures are to ſerue the Churche* Is this the mater, M. Hardinge, that muſte make M. Iewel to change his coloure? Or, are theſe woordes ſufficiente, to putte Cuſanus from his meaninge? Firſte he ſaithe, The Scriptures folowe the Churche: Dath he afterwarde by theſe woordes recante the ſame, and telle vs, that the Church folowveth the Scriptures.

You wil ſaie, Cuſanus ſaithe not, The Scriptures folowe the Churche in Authoritie, but onely in time: For he ſaithe, The Churche was before the Scriptures. So might he haue ſaide, Moſes was before Chriſte: or, The Lawe was before the Goſpel: or, the Synagoge was before the Churche. But what had this benne to his purpoſe? Awake a litle, M. Hardinge, and remember your ſelfe. Was this the queſtion, that laie betweene Cardinal Cuſanus, and the Bohemians, whether the Churche, or the Scriptures were former in time? Or if it were not the queſtion, would he ſpeake ſo mutche, and ſo vainely, as you oftentimes doo, beſides his purpoſe? Leaue, leaue this triflinge, M. Hardinge, It wil not healpe you: learne rather to vnderſtande youre Doctoures meaninge by him ſelfe.

The mater, as you knowe, was this: The Bohemians required the Holy Communion in bothe kindes, and therein alleaged the warrante of the Scriptures, For Chriſte ſaide they, ordeined, and miniſtred the Communion in bothe kindes. Cuſanus defended the abuſe, and diſorder of the Communion in one kinde onely, and therein alleaged the warrante of the Churche of Rome. Hereof this iſſue grewe betweene them, whether they ought, in caſes of Religion, to folowe the Churche of Rome, or ra-

ther the Scriptures. To this Cuſanus ſaithe, The Churche of Rome is aboue the Scriptures. This he laithe, as a Fundation of the whole. And therefore of the Scriptures he ſpeaketh ſul meanely, and very coldly, or rather diſdeinefully, as it ſhal appeare, and alloweth al Power, and Authoritie to the Churche of Rome. Theiſe thinges conſidered, I beſeche you, to what purpoſe had it benne, for Cuſanus to ſaie, The Churche was before the Scriptures? For the queſtion was not, whether the Churche, or the Scripture were the elder, but whether of theiſe twoo, in trial of the Truthe, wee ought rather to folowe.

Cuſan. ad Bohe. Epi. 2.

Nowe, concerninge the Authoritie of the Churche, Cuſanus ſaithe thus, Veritas adhæret Cathedræ Petri: Vniuerſa Catholica Eccleſia ad Petri Cathedram conglabata, à Chriſto nunquam recedet: Hæc eſt vna, quæ tenet, & poſsidet omnem Sponſi ſui Domini poteſtatem: Veritas Cathedræ per Chriſtum alligata eſt, non perſonis: Extra Romanam Sanctam Catholicam Eccleſiam non eſt ſalus: Quam firma eſt ædificatio Eccleſiæ? Quia

Cuſan Excitationē. li. 2. Non diceret. Excimt. li. 6. Vbi Eccleſia.

nemo decipi poteſt etiam per malum præſidentem. Si dixeris, Domine obediui tibi in præpoſito, hoc tibi ſufficiet ad ſalutem: etiam ſi præpoſitus de oneribus humeris tuis impoſitis, Præceptis, & ſolutionibus rationem ſit Deo redditurus. Tu enim per obedientiam, quam facis præpoſito, quem Eccleſia tolerat, decipi nequis, etiam ſi præceperit alia, quàm debuit. Quare Sententia Paſtoris ligat te pro tua ſalute, propter bonum obedientiæ, etiamſi iniuſta fuerit. Nam ad te non attinet cognoſcere, quòd Sententia ſit iniuſta, nec conceditur tibi, vt non obedias, ſi tibi iniuſta videatur. Nulla enim eſſet obedientia, ſi in tuo arbitrio eſſet, de Sententia Paſtoris iudicare. Præſumit enim Eccleſia de illa Sententia: Cui ſi tu obedieris, magna erit merces tua. Obedientia igitur irrationalis eſt conſummata obedientia, & perfectiſſima: ſcilicet, quando obeditur ſinè inquiſitione rationis, ſicut iumentum obedit Domino ſuo &c. *The truth cleaueth ſtille to* Peters *Chaire: The whole Vniuerſal Catholique Churche, rolled vp to* Peters *Chaire, ſhal neuer departe from Chriſte: This Churche* (of Rome) *is that onely Churche, that holdeth, and poſſeſſeth al the Power of the Lorde her Spouſe: Chriſte hath tied his Truthe to the Chaire, not to the perſones of the Biſhoppes: Without the Holy, Catholique Church of* Rome *there is no ſalnation: How*

No man can be deceiued.

ſtronge is the buildinge of the Churche? For no man can be deceiued, no not by an euil Biſhop: If thou ſaie vnto God, O Lorde, I haue obeied thee in my Biſhop, this ſhal ſuffice thee vnto Sal-

Vnto Saluation.

uation: notwithſtandinge the Biſhop of his parte ſhal yeelde an accompte vnto God, for the burthens, that he hath laide vpon thy ſhoulders, for his commaundementes, and for thy paymentes. For thou canſte not be deceiued by thy obedience, that thou yeeldeſte to the Biſhop, whome the Churche ſuffereth, although he commaunde thee other thinges, then he ought to doo. Therefore the Biſhoppes ſentence, although he be vniuſte, bindeth thee for thy Saluation, bicauſe of the goodneſſe of obedience. For it behoueth not thee, to know, that his Sentence is vniuſt: Nor is it lawful for thee to diſobeie it, although thou take it to be vniuſte. For it were no obedience at al, if it were in thy Power, to iudge of the ſentence of thy Biſhop. For the Churche preſumeth

Obedience vvithout reaſon:

his Sntence to be good: Whiche Sentence if thou obeie, thy reward ſhalbe greate. Obedience therefore without reaſon is a fulle, and moſte perfite obedience: That is, when thou obeieſte without requiring of reaſon, as a Horſe is obediente to his Maiſter. With ſutche coloures

As a Horſe is obediente to his Maiſter.

Cuſanus abourneth and blaſeth the Maieſtie of the Churche of Rome: and ſutche obedience, and bondage he requireth to be yelded vnto the ſame. So muſte vve be obediente vnto the Pope, as a Horſe is obediente vnto his Maiſter.

Nowe let vs conſider, in what regarde he hath the Scriptures of God: ſo ſhal wee ſee, howe farre he placeth the one in Authoritie before the other. Thus therefore he

Nic. Cuſan. ad Bohemos Epi. 2. Pag. 832. Pag. 833.

laithe to the Bohemians: Dicitis, Præcepto Chriſti obediendum eſſe primo loco, deinde Eccleſiæ: &, ſi aliud præceperit Eccleſia, quàm Chriſtus, non Eccleſiæ, ſed Chriſto obediendum eſſe. Certè in hoc eſt omnium præſumptionum initium, quando iudicant particulares ſuum ſenſum in Diuinis Præceptis conformiorem, quàm Vniuerſæ Eccleſiæ. Intelligè, Scripturas eſſe ad tempus adaptatas, & variè intellectas, ita, vt vno tempore ſecundum

Ep. 7. p. 857. Ep. 2. p. 833.

currentem vniuerſalem ritum exponantur: mutato ritu, iterum Sententia mutetur. Non mirum, ſi Praxis Eccleſiæ vno tempore interpretetur Scripturam vno modo, & alio tempore alio modo. Nam intellectus currit cum Praxi. Intellectus enim, qui cum Praxi concurrit, eſt Spiritus viuificans. Fatuum eſt ergo argumentum, velle Vniuerſalem Eccleſiæ

ritum,

Peters Succeſſours.

ritum, ex Scripturis Prædeceſſorum arguere. Legitur enim, Apoſtolos non tradidiſſe Fidem per Scripturas &c. Hæc eſt omnium ſanè intelligentium Sententia, qui Scripturarum Authoritatem, aut intellectum in Eccleſiæ Authoritate fundant, quæ vnam accipit, & alteram abijcit: & non è conuerſo, Eccleſiæ firmamentum in Scripturarum Authoritate locant. Dicetis forſitan, quomodo mutabuntur Præcepta Chriſti Authoritate Eccleſiæ, vt tunc ſint obligatoria, quando Eccleſiæ placuerit? Dico, nulla eſſe Chriſti Præcepta, niſi quæ per Eccleſiam pro talibus accepta ſint. Mutato iudicio Eccleſiæ, mutatum eſt & Dei iudicium: *You ſaie, wee muſte Firſte obeie Chriſtes Commaundemente, and afterwarde the Churche. And if the Churche commaunde vs to doo otherwiſe, then Chriſte commaundeth, wee muſte then obeie Chriſte, and not the Churche. Verily herein ſtandeth the beginninge of al preſumption, when particulare menne thinke, theire owne iudgemente to be more agreable to Goddes commaundementes, then the iudgemente of the Vniuerſal Churche. Vnderſtande thou, that the* Scriptures are appointed to ſerue the time, and haue diuerſe vnderſtandinges: ſo that at one time they may be expounded after the Vniuerſal, common, and ordinarie cuſtome: *and that, the ſame cuſtome beinge changed, the meaninge of the Scriptures maie likewiſe be changed. No marueile, though the Practiſe of the Churche at one time doo expounde the Scriptures after one ſorte, and at an other time, after an other ſorte, for the vnderſtandinge of the Scriptures renneth with the practiſe of the Churche. For the vnderſtandinge, that renneth with the Practiſe is the quickening Sprite. It is a fooliſh enterpriſe, to goe about to reproue the Vniuerſal order of the Churche by the Scriptures of our Anceſtours. For wee reade, that the Apoſtles deliuered not the Faithe by the Scriptures. This is the iudgemente of al that, be wiſe, that* builde, and founde the Authoritie, and vnderſtanding of the Scriptures in the Authoritie of the Church, *which receiueth one Scripture, and refuſeth an other: but contrariwiſe they builde not the ſtaie of the Church, in the Authoritie of the Scriptures. Perhaps you wil ſaie, how ſhal Chriſtes cõmaundementes be changed by the Authoritie of the Church, that they ſhal binde vs, when the Churche ſhal thinke it good? I tel thee,* there is nothing to be taken for Chriſtes cõmaundement, onleſſe it be ſo allowed of the Church. When the Church hath once changed her iudgemente, Goddes iudgemente is likewiſe changed.

Pag. 834.

Ep. 3 p. 838.

First Chriſt.

Preſumptiõ.

Scriptures ſerue times.

Scriptures changed.

Scriptures folovv Practiſe.

A foolishe enterpriſe.

Faith not by Scriptures.

Church not founded in the Scriptures.

Chriſtes cõmandemẽt, vvithout the Church, is no cõmaundement.

Hereby, M. Hardinge maie you knowe Cardinal Cuſanus **iudgemente, touchinge the** Scriptures of Almightie God. The Scriptures, **ſaithe he,** folovve the Practiſe of the Churche, **not onely in time, as you ſaie, but alſo in Authoritie, and in credite. As for your** Commentaries **they are to ſimple, and ouer partial, and a greate waie beſide the texte. Nowe iudge you indifferently, M. Hardinge, whether** Cuſanus **ſaie not, as I haue alleaged him,** Sequuntur Scripturæ Eccleſiam, & non è conuerſo. *The Scriptures ſilowe the Churche: but contrarywiſe the Churche ſillowethe not the Scriptures.* **To conclude, hereby maie yée iudge of the Title of theſe** Epiſtles, **wherewith you finde your ſelfe ſo mutche encombred,** De Authoritate Eccleſiæ, ſupra, & contra Scripturas: *Certainely it is manifeſt by his plaine woordes, that he placeth the Authoritie of the* Church, *not onely aboue, but alſo againſte the Authoritie of the* Scriptures.

There were neuer ſo many Heretiques **in any one** See, **as haue beene in the** See of Rome: **as I haue already ſufficiently, and fully proued. And yet, yée ſaie,** The Pope cannot erre. **There were neuer ſo notorious Crymes, or, as** Platyna **calleth them, Monſters of filthy life:** Yet (**yée ſaie**) they are al Holy Fathers, and holde their Chriſtianitie by nature of Office. **Howe be it, your Doctour** Alphonſus **ſaithe,** Quamuis credere teneamur ex Fide, Verum Petri Succeſſorem eſſe Supremum Paſtorem Totius Eccleſiæ, non tamen tenemur eadem Fide credere, Leonem, aut Clementem eſſe Verum Petri Succeſſorem: *Although wee be bounde to beleeue, that the true Succeſſours of* Peter *is the Higheſte Paſtoure of al the Churche, yet are wee not bounde with like Faithe to beleeue, that* Pope Leo, *and* Pope Clement *are the True Succeſſours of* Peter. Iohn **the** Baptiſte **ſaide rightely vnto the** Phariſeis, **that likewiſe made vaunte of their** Succeſſion, *Neuer ſaie* Abraham *is your Father. For God is able, euen of theſe ſtoanes to raiſe vp Children vnto* Abraham. Chriſoſtome **ſaithe,** Non locus Sanctificat hominem, ſed homo locum: Nec Cathedra facit Sacerdotem, ſed Sacerdos Cathedram: *The place ſanctifieth not the Man, but the Man ſanctifieth the Place: Neither doothe the Chaire make the Prieſte, but the Prieſte maketh the Chaire.*

Platyna, In Benedict. 4.

Alphonſus, aduer. Hæreſ. Lib. Cap. 9.

Matthæ. 3. Chriſoſto. In Opere Imperfecto. Homil. 43.

Di. 41. Multi.

Nazianzene saithe: Non locorum est Gratia, sed Spiritus: *The grace of God goeth not by Place, but by the holy Ghoste.*

Greg. Naz. In sanctum Lauacrum.

Chrisostome saithe: Omnis Christianus, qui suscipit Verbum Petri, sit Thronus Petri, & Petrus sedet in eo: *Euery Christian man, whiche receiueth the woorde of* Peter, *is made* Peters *Chaire, and* S. Peter *reasteth in him.*

Chrysost. In Mat. ho. 33.

But here haue you founde out a foule contradiction in our woordes. Who is he (saie you) whom ye calle the Prince of the woorlde? Not the Pope, M. Hardinge: Least ye should happily be deceiued: notwithstandinge, your Felowes haue so often tolde vs, Papa totius Orbis obtinet Principatum: *The* Pope *hath the Princehoode of al the woorlde.*

In sexto, li. 3 Tiul. 16. ca. Unico.

The Emperours Maiestie was finde oftentimes entitled by this name: but your Popes Holinesse, so entitled, was finde neuer: Onelesse it be some certaine late Decrees, and Glosses of his owne. Al be it, you of late haue mutche abated the Emperours honoure, and haue made him onely the Popes man. For thus ye saie: Imperator (Occidentis) est Procurator, siue Defensor Romanæ Ecclesiæ: *The* Emperoure (*of the* VVeast) *is the Procloure, or Stewarde of the* Churche of Rome.

Dist. 98. Si Imperator. In Glossa.

Yet Chrisostome saithe, Imperator est Summitas, & Caput omnium super terram hominum: *The Emperoure is the Toppe, and Heade of al menne vpon the Earthe.* In the Councel of Calcedon, the Emperoure is called, Dominus Vniuersi Mundi: *The Lorde of the Whole worlde.*

Chrysost. ad Pop. Antio. Homil. 2.

Conci. Chal. Actio. 1. In nomine.

Perhaps ye wil saie, The state of the Empire is nowe empouerished: And therefore the Emperoure hath loste his Title. Yet your owne Doctoures, and Glosers coulde haue tolde you: Iura communia dicunt, quòd Imperator est Dominus Mundi: Notwithstandinge the Decaie of the Empiere, *The Common Lawes saie, that the Emperoure is the Lorde of the woorlde.* Roberte Holcote, speakinge of the Emperoure of Germanie, saithe thus: Hic est Rex Regum, cui omnes subditæ sunt Nationes, & Populi, &c. *The Emperoure is the Kinge of Kinges, vnto whome al Nations, and Countries be in subiection.*

Extra de Maiorit. & Obedien. vnã sanctam. In Glossa. Holcote, In Sapien. Lectio. 199. Otho Frisingensis.

The Romaines of late yeres wrote thus vnto the Emperoure Conradus: Excellentissimo, & Præclarissimo Vrbis, & Orbis totius Domino, &c. *Vnto the moste excellente, and moste noble Emperoure, the Lorde bothe of the Citie of* Rome, *and also of al the whole woorlde.* Therefore, M. Hardinge, to mone this vaine quarel, without some cause, it was great folie.

Councelles (ye saie) in old times were holden by authoritie of the Pope. For proufe whereof, ye allege Socrates in the eighth Booke, and the seconde Chapter: But Worde, or Sentence ye allege none. Yet be it, it was a great ouersighte, to allege the Eighth Booke of Socrates, whereas Socrates him selfe neuer wrote but Seuen, and so farre to ouerleape your Authoure. Notwithstandinge, this smal Erroure maie wel be dissembled amongest so many. Howe be it, touchinge the thinge it selfe, ye maie as easily finde it in the Eighth Booke of Socrates, that neuer was written, as els where. For in deede emongest al, that euer he wrote, this thinge certainely, that you allege, he wrote neuer.

The Apologie, Cap. 12. Diuision. 5. & Cap. 13. Division. 1.

And, although the modestie, and mildenesse of the Emperoure Ferdinando be so greate, that he can beare this wronge, bicause peraduenture he vnderstandeth not wel the Popes packing, yet oughte not the Pope of his holinesse to offer him that wronge, nor to claime an other mans right, as his owne.

But hereto somme wil replie: The Emperoure in deede called Councelles at that time, yee speake of, bicause the Bishop of Rome was not yet growen so great, as he is nowe, but yet the Emperour did not then sitte togeather with the Bisshoppes in Councel, nor bare any stroke with his Authoritie in their consultations. I answeare, nay, that is not so. For, as witnesseth Theodore, the Emperoure Constantine, not

onely

onely ſate togeather with them in the Councel of Nice, but gaue alſo aduiſe to the Biſhoppes, howe it was beſte to trie out the mater by the Apoſtles, and Prophetes writinges. as appeareth by theſe his owne woordes. In diſputation (ſaithe he) of maters of Diuinitie, we haue ſet before vs to folowe, the doctrine of the Holy Ghoſt. For the Euangeliſtes and the Apoſtles woorkes, and the Prophetes ſayings ſhewe vs ſufficiently, what opinion we ought to haue of the wil of God.

Conſtantine in the Councel of Nice.

M. Hardinge.

For the ſitinge of Emperoures in Councelles, you treate a common place not neceſſarie. No man euer denied, but Emperoures maie ſitte in them, wee acknowledge two ſortes of ſettinge: one for the aſſeſſours, an other for the iudges. (a) No Emperoure euer ſate as a iudge in Councel: but many, bothe Emperoures in perſon, and theire Lieuetenantes for them haue ſitten, as beinge ready to aſſiſte and defende that, whiche the Biſhoppes had iudged and decreed.

(a) Vntruthe. For Cuſanus ſaithe, Inuenio Imperatores in Concilijs in dicia feciſſe. Reade the Anſweare.

What maner a ſeate great Conſtantine had in the firſte Councel at Nice. Euſebius in his life, and Theodoritus doothe declare. After that al the Biſhoppes were ſette in their ſeates to the number of 318. in came the Emperoure laſte with a ſmal companie. (b) A lowe litle chaire beinge ſette for him in the middeſt, he woulde not ſitte downe, before the Biſhoppes had reuerently ſignified ſo mutche vnto him, and as Theodoritus writeth, not before he had deſired the Biſhoppes to permitte him ſo to doo. Nowe thinke you that the Supreme heade of the Churche ſhoulde haue (c) comme in laſte, and haue ſitten (d) beneath his ſubiectes, and haue ſtaide to ſitte, vntil they had as it were geuen him leaue.

(b) Vntruthe-cloſed. For this lowe litle Chaire was al of beaten gold, and was ſet in the higheſt place of the Councel

(c) Vaine folie. For the Prince neuercommeth into the Parlamente Houſe, before the Lordes be ſet.

Neither conſulted he with the Biſhoppes, but required them to conſulte of the maters, they came for, as Theodorite witneſſeth. Neither ſpake he there ſo generally as you reporte, nor framed his tale in that ſorte as you faine. (e) Vniuerſally of the wil of God, (e) but of the Godheade, ſayinge, that the Bookes of the Goſpelles, and of the Apoſtles, and the Oracles of the Prophetes doo plainely teache vs, what we ought to thinke of the Godhead, περὶ τοῦ θείου. For the controuerſie aboute whiche the Arians made ſo mutche adoo, was touchinge the equalitie of the Godhead in Chriſte, and his conſubſtantialitie with God the Father. And by thoſe woordes and other, whiche there be vttered, he tooke not vpon him to define, or iudge, but onely to exhorte them to agree togeather in one Faithe. For amonge thoſe Biſhoppes certaine there were, that fauoured the Hereſie of Arius. Suche examples you bringe for defenſe of your parte, as make mutche againſte you. Not that you delight in making a todde for your ſelfe, but bicauſe you haue no better: and ſomewhat muſte you needes ſaie, leſte the ſtage you plaie your parte on, ſhoulde ſtande ſtil.

(d) Vntruthe. For Sozomenus ſaithe. Erat thronus ille maximus, & alios omnes ſuperans.

The Biſhop of Sariſbury.

Emperoures (yée ſaie) ſate in Councelles, as Aſſeſſoures onely, but not as Iudges: **That is to ſaie, they ſate by the Biſhoppes, and helde theire peace, and tolde the clocke, and ſaide nothinge. Yet your Doctoures ſaie,** Aſſeſſor Epiſcopi non poteſt eſſe Laicus: *The Aſſeſſoure of a Biſhoppe maie not be a Laieman.* **But, touching the mater it ſelfe,** Euſebius, **that was alwaies neare aboute the** Emperoure Conſtantine, **and wrote his life, and was preſente at the** Councel, **ſaithe thus:** Conſtantinus, quaſi Communis quidam Epiſcopus à Deo conſtitutus, Miniſtrorum Dei Synodos conuocauit: Nec dedignatus eſt adeſſe, & conſidere in medio illorum, conſorsque fieri ipſorum, &c. Conſtantine, *as if he had benne a Common Biſhop appointed by God, called togeather Councelles of Goddes Miniſters: and diſdeigned not him ſilfe to ſitte in the middes amonges them, and to be partaker of theire dooinges.* **Againe,** Conſtantinus **him ſelfe ſaithe thus:** Ego intereram Concilio, tanquam vnus ex vobis: *I was preſente at the Councel emongeſte you, as one of you.* **Againe** Euſebius **ſaithe,** Vnus, & Vnicus Deus inſtituit Conſtantinum Miniſtrum ſuum, & Doctorem Pietatis omnibus terris: *The One, and Onely God, hathe appointed* Conſtantine *to be his Miniſter, and the Docteure of true Godlineſſe vnto al Nations.* **And** Theodoretus **ſaithe,** Laudatiſſimus Rex Apoſtolicas curas ſuſcipiebat animo ſuo: At Pontifices, non ſolùm non ædificare Eccleſiam, ſed etiam illius fundamenta labefactare conabantur. *The good Emperoure had Apoſtolique Caret in his harte. But the Biſhoppes did not onely not builde vp the Churche of God, but alſo ouerthrewe the fundations of the ſame.* **M. Hardinge ſaithe,** The Biſhoppes did al, and the Emperoure did nothinge. **But** Theodoretus **ſaithe,** *The* Emperoure *builte vp, that the* Biſhoppes *had throwen downe.*

(e) Vntruthe, euident. For Caſſiodorus expoundeth it thus, Quid de diuina Lege Sapere debeamus. *De Preſcriptis Statu. 6. Aſſeſſorem Geminianus. Euſ. In vita Con. Orat. 3.* αὐτὸς δὲ καὶ θάπερ εἷς ἐξ ἡμῶν ἐτύγχανον συμπαρών. *Euſ. Eodem loco. Theo. li. 1. ca. 24.*

And againe Euſebius **ſaithe,** Conſtantinus erat Vocaliſſimus Dei præco, & quaſi Seruator

in Con. Lib 3. in Lib. 1. 27. τοῦ τὸς πάντως ἀνας.

Euſ. In vita Con. Orat. 1. Niceph. in præfacione ad Emmanuelem. Theo. l. 1. c. 7 εἰσελεῖν τε ἐπέτρεψε δὴ πόσμῳ τῶ πρέποντι ἡ πᾶσα καθῆσο σύνοδος. Πάντων δὲ ἐξαναστάντων ἐπὶ συνθήματι ὅτ τὴν βασιλέως εἴσοδον ἐδήλου: Σμικρῶ τινος ἀυτῶ καθίσματος ὕλης χρυσῶ πεποιημένου.

Seruator, ac Medicus animarum: Constantine the Emperoure *was a moſte cleare Preacher of God, and as it were, the Sauecur, and Phiſition of Soules.* **In this ſorte** Nicephorus **writeth vnto the** Emperoure Emmanuel Palæologus: Tu es Dux profeſſionis Fidei noſtræ, &c. *Your* Maieſtie *is the Captaine of the Profeſſion of our Faithe: your* Maieſtie *hath reſtoared the Catholique, and Vniuerſal Church. Your* Maieſtie *hath reformed the* Temple of God *from Marchantes, and Exchangers of the Heauenly Doctrine, and from Heretikes, by the woorde of* Truthe.

Yée ſaie, When the Biſhoppes were ſet, in came the Emperour laſt with a ſmal companie. **Whereof yée woulde haue vs to gather, that he came onely as ſomme inferioure perſone, and not as a Iudge. Howe be it,** Theodoretus **ſaithe,** Constantinus iuſſit Epiſcopos ingredi: Constantine commaunded the Bishoppes to goe in.

And Euſebius **ſaithe,** Sedit tota Synodus reuerenter, vt par fuit, cum ſilentio expectans aduentum Principis: *The whole Councel ſate in reuerente, and comely order, quietly, and in ſilence looking for the Princes comminge.*

This is no good proufe, M. Hardinge, that the Emperour **in the** Councel **was inferioure to the** Bishops. **Nay, the** Bishops **were commaunded to take their places, to ſitte in ſilence, and to waite for the** Emperoures **comming, as it becommeth ſubiectes to waite for their** Prince. **Againe he ſaithe:** Signo, quo aduentus Imperatoris indicatus eſt dato, omnibus exurgentibus, ipſe deinde ingreſſus eſt medius, tanquam aliquis Dei Cœleſtis Angelus: *When the watchewoorde was giuen, that the Emperour was comme, the Biſhoppes ſtoode vp from their places, and his Maieſtie paſte alonge through the middes of them, as if he had benne an Angel of God.*

But the Emperoure (**yée ſaie**) ſate vpon a litle lowe ſtoole, and therein ſhewed him ſelfe inferioure to the Biſhoppes. **Yea, M. Hardinge, but** Euſebius **ſaithe, that the ſame** litle lowe ſtoole **was made of whole beaten Golde: And therein, I trowe, as low as yée place him, he was ſomewhat aboue the Biſhoppes.**

Yée ſaie, he ſate alowe, and in the middes of the Biſhoppes. **And hereof yée conclude, he was their** Inferiour. **So** Iulius Cæſar, **notwithſtanding he were the** Emperoure of Rome, **yet, when he came into the** College of Poëtes, **he was wel contented, to be placed in the loweſt roume: And yet was he not therefore their Inferioure.**

Ῥοιζηθὲν ἐπὶ τὴν πρώτην τῶν ταγμάτων ἀρχήν. Μέγιστος δὲ ἦν ὅτος, καὶ τὰς ἄλλας ὑπερφέρων.

But touchinge the Emperoure Constantines **place in the** Councel, Euſebius **ſaith thus:** Acceſſit ad ſummum gradum ordinum: *He wente vp to the higheſt riſinge of al the benches.* Sozomenus **ſaithe:** Imperator peruenit ad Caput Concilij, & ſedit in Throno quodam, quem ipſe ſibi fecerat. Erat autem Thronus ille Maximus, & alios omnes ſuperans: *The* Emperoure *wente vp to the head, or higheſt place of the Councel, and ſate downe in a Throne of eſtate, that he had prepared for him ſelfe. But this Throne was very great, and farre paſſed al the reſte.* **In the meane ſeaſon, the** Popes Legate **ſate, as it is ſaide before, neither in the firſte place, nor in the ſeconde, nor in the thirde, but in the fourthe. Hereby it ſeemeth, to appeare plainely, that** Constantinus **the** Emperour **had his place in the** Councel **aboue al the Biſhoppes.**

Ceremonia. li. 2. Sect. 14. cap. 2.

Notwithſtandinge, ſithence that time the Pope **hathe determined, it muſte nowe be otherwiſe. His order is this, as it hathe benne alleged before:** Sedes Imperatoris parabitur, &c. *The* Emperoures Seate *ſhalbe prepared nexte vnto the* Popes Seate, *and ſhal haue twoo ſteppes ioined vnto the ſame: but neither ſo broade, nor ſo longe, as be the* Popes. *It ſhalbe apparelled with clothe of Golde: but Canapie ouer the headde it ſhal haue none. Howe be it, this thinge is ſpecially to be marked, that the place, wherevpon the* Emperoure *ſitteth, maie be no higher, then the place, where the* Pope *ſetteth his Feete.* **Thus wée ſée, the** Emperoure **is allowed to ſitte at the** Popes foote ſtoole: **but in any caſe to mounte no higher.**

Et aduertendum quòd locus, vbi ſedet Imperator, non ſit altior loco, vbi tenet pedes Pontifex.

The Emperoure (**yée ſaie**) ſtoode ſtil (**no doubt, with Cappe in hande**) and durſte not ſitte downe without leaue: **And thereby teſtified, him ſelfe to be Inferioure to the Biſhoppes. Theſe colde Concluſions, M. Hardinge, wil hardely ſerue you. For** Traianus, **beinge the** Emperoure of Rome, **was contented him ſelfe to ſtande aſote, and, for honoures ſake, commaunded the** Conſulles **to ſitte downe. Yet was he not therefore Inferioure in dignitie to the** Conſulles.

Helena

Constantine in the Councel of Nice.

Helena the Empreſſe, apparelled her ſelfe like a Seruante, and miniſtred vnto the Holy Virgines, and gaue them water to their handes, as if in déede ſhée had benne their Seruante: yet was ſhée not therefore Inferioure vnto the Virgines.

Ruffinus. li.1 ca 7.

The ſame Emperoure Conſtantine at the time of the Eccleſiaſtical Sermons, ſtode vpright, and would not ſitte: for the reuerence, that he bare to the VVoord of God. Yet was he not Inferioure to the Preacher. This was that good Emperoures modeſtie, and Humilitie, M. Hardinge: but not his dewtie. It were wiſedome for Princes, to take héede, they committe not ouermuche to your handes. For what ſo euer they once yélde of méere curteſie, ſtreight waie yée claime it, as your owne,

Euſe. In vita Con. Ora. 4.

Howe be it, touchinge the Emperoures ſittinge in the Councel, it was farre otherwiſe, then you repoꝛte it. Sozomenus ſaithe, Imperator reſedit in Throno, qui illi paratus fuerat: & Synodus iuſſa eſt ſedere: *The* Emperoure *ſate downe in his* Chaire of eſtate *prouided for him: and* (then) *the* Councel *was Commaunded to ſitte downe.* Here by it appeareth, the Emperoure néeded not the Biſhoppes leaue: but rather gaue leaue to the Biſhoppes.

Soz. li.1. c.19. Καὶ ὁ σύνεδρος κατῆθεν ἐκελεύθη.

No doubte, that Godly, and Milde Prince, béinge in that reuerende aſſemblie, bare him ſelfe with muche Reuerence. And therefore Euſebius ſaithe, He ſate not downe, before the *Biſhoppes had beckened vnto him.* But he added withal, Poſt Imperatorem, idem fecerunt omnes: (*Not before, but*) *After that the* Emperoure *was ſette, they ſate downe al togeather.* Nowe, M. Hardinge, if he, that ſate Firſte in the Councel, were the Heade of the Churche, as you ſame to ſaie, then maie I reaſon thus: The Pope, oꝛ his Legate in that Councel ſate not Firſte: *Ergo*, the Pope then was not Heade of the Churche.

Euſe. In vita Con. Ora. 4. ὁ πρέσβεις, ἢ τὸ σύνεδρον καθεῖλε τοῦτον τὸν ἐπέκεινα πάντες μετὰ ἑαυτὸν λέα.

Againe, The Emperoure in that Councel ſate Firſte: Ergo, by your owne Concluſion, the Emperoure was the Heade of the Churche. Certainely the Pope him ſelfe ſaithe plainely, The Emperoure Conſtantine vvas the Preſidente, or Ruler of the Nicene Councel. His woꝛdes be theſe: Conſtantinus Præſidens Sanctæ Synodo, quæ apud Nicæam congregata eſt: Conſtantius *the* Emperoure, *beinge Preſidente of the Holy Councel that was keapte at* Nice. Theiſe be not our woꝛdes, but the Popes, regiſtred euen in his owne Recoꝛdes. Therefoꝛe, I truſte, yée wil not refuſe to gaue them credite.

12. Qua. 1. Futu. Greg.

But you ſaie, The Emperoure determined and defined nothinge. Yet the Emperoure him ſelfe, contrarie to your ſayinge, ſaithe thus: Ego ſuſcepi, & perfeci res ſalutiferas, perſuaſus Verbo tuo: O Lorde, I tooke in hande, and brought to paſſe vvholeſome thinges, beinge perſvvaded by thy vvoorde.

Euſe. In vita Con. Orat. 2.

And againe, wꝛitinge hereof vnto the Biſhoppes of ſundꝛie Churches, he ſaithe: Ego vobiſcum interfui, tanquàm vnus ex vobis. Non enim negauerim, conſeruum me veſtrum eſſe: Quia de re mihi maximè gratulor: *I was preſente at the* Councel *withe you, as one of you. For I cannot denie mee ſelfe to be youre* Felovve Seruante. *In which thinge I moſte reioyce.*

Euſ. In vita Con. Orat. 3.

Likewiſe againe he ſaithe: Ego Nicæam contraxi magnum numerum Epiſcoporum: Cum quibus, cùm eſſem vnus ex vobis, & Conſeruus veſter vehemèter eſſe cuperem, etiam ipſe ſuſcepi inquiſitionem Veritatis: *I cauſed a greate compame of* Biſhoppes *to comme to* Nice: *with whom togeather*, I tooke in hande the Examination of the Truthe, beinge mee ſelfe one of you, *and muche deſiring to be therein your Felowe Seruante.*

Soc. li.1. ca. 9. Καὶ ἀυτὸς τὴν τῆς ἀληθείας ἐξέτασιν ἀνεδεξάμην.

Likewiſe ſaithe Euſebius, Imperator, quaſi luculentam facem accendens, ne quæ occultæ Erroris reliquiæ ſupereſſent, oculo Regio circumſpexit: *The* Emperoure, *as hauinge enkendled a great flame, lookte wel about with his Princely Eie, that no prinie remnantes of errour ſhoulde reſte behinde.*

Euſ. In vita Con. Ora. 3. ἅμιλλαν βασιλικῷ περιεσκόπει.

The Biſhoppes in the ſame Nicene Councel, beinge at variance emongeſt them ſelues, offered vp their Bookes of accuſation, not vnto the Pope, oꝛ to his Legates, of whome they had then no greate regarde, but vnto the Emperoure. Neither did the Emperoure putte ouer theire quarelles vnto the Popes Iudgemente, but vnto the Iudgemente of God. Againe, the ſame Emperoure Conſtantine ſaithe, If any Biſhop vvickedly offende, by the hande of Goddes ſeruante, that is to ſaie, by my hande, he ſhalbe

Soc. li.1. ca. 8. Theodoret. li.1. ca. 9.

Conſtantine in the Councel of Nice.

shalbe punished.

Card. Cuſa. De Con. l. 3. cap. 16.

To be ſhorte, Cardinal Cuſanus **ſaithe,** Sciendum eſt, quòd in vniuerſalibus octo Concilijs, vbi Imperatores interfuerunt, & non Papa, ſemper inuenio Imperatores, & Iudices ſuos cum ſenatu Primatum habuiſſe, & officium Præſidentiæ per interloquutiones, & ex conſenſu Synodi, ſine mandato, concluſiones, & iudicia feciſſe. Et non reperitur inſtantia in octo concilijs, præter quam in tertia Actione Concilij Calcedonenſis: *Wee muſt knowe, that in the Eight General Councelles, where the* Emperoures *were preſente, and not the* Pope, *I euermore finde, that the* Emperoures, *and theire* Iudges, *with the* Senate *had the* Gouernemente, *and* Office of Preſidence, *by hearinge, and conferringe of matters: and that they made Concluſions, and Iudgementes, with the conſente of the* Councel, *and without any further* Commiſſion. *And there is no manner inſtance, or exception to be founde in the firſt* Eight Councelles, *ſauinge onely in the thirde Action of the* Councel of Calcedon.

Here yͤ ſͤ plainely, by the Authoritie of Cardinal Cuſanus, **one of your owne ſpecial Doctoures, that in the Eight firſte Generall Councelles, the** Emperoure **was Preſidente, and not the** Pope.

Where as the Emperoure **willed the** Bishoppes **to conclude their maters by the** Apoſtolical, **and** Prophetical Scriptures, He ſpeaketh not (**ſaie yee**) ſo generally, as wee reporte him, nor frameth his tale in that ſorte, as wee faine, vniuerſally of the wil of God, but of the Godheade. **For,** τὸ θεῖον **in your ſenſe ſignifieth onely the** Subſtance, and nature of God, **and not** Goddes VVil, or his Religion. **Here, M. Hardinge, it were** ſomme **point of Learninge, to knowe, what ſkilful** Greeke Reader **tolde you this tale, that,** τὸ θεῖον **is nothinge els, but the** Godhead, **or** Nature of God. **Verily** Caſſiodorus, **in plaine wiſe, tranſlateth it thus:** Euangelici & Apoſtolici libri erudiunt nos, quid de Sacra Lege ſapiamus: *The* Bookes of the Euangeliſtes, and Apoſtles, *teache vs, what wee oughte to thinke,* (**not onely of the** Subſtance, and Nature of God, **but alſo**) *of the* Holy Lavve.

Tripar. Hi. lib. 2. cap. 3.

Therefore Theodoretus **addeth further theſe woordes:** Accipiamus Explicationes quæſtionum noſtrarum ex dictis Sancti Spiritus: *Let vs take the reſolution of our queſtions, out of the woordes of the* Holy Ghoſte. **And immediately before he ſaithe:** De rebus Diuinis diſputantes, præſcriptam habemus Doctrinam Sancti Spiritus: *In our Diſputations* (**not onely of the** Godheade, **but alſo**) *of* Godly maters, *wee haue laide before vs the Doctrine of the* Holy Goſpel. **In like ſenſe** S. Hilarie **ſaithe:** Non eſt relictus hominum eloquijs de Dei rebus alius, præterquam Dei Sermo. Omnia reliqua & arcta, & concluſa, & impedita ſunt, & obſcura: *In maters touchinge God, there is no ſpeache leafte vnto menne, but onely the woorde of God. All other Authorities be ſhorte, and narrowe, and darke, and troubleſome.* **Beleeue them not hencefoorthe, M. Hardinge, that telle you, that,** τὸ θεῖον, **ſignifieth onely the** Subſtance, and Nature of Goddes Diuinitie. **For as yͤ maie eaſily ſͤe, your** Gloſe **is vaine, and fighteth directly againſt the Texte.**

Theodoret. lib. 1. cap. 7. περὶ θείων πραγμάτων

Hilar. De Trin. li 7. De rebus dei περὶ τοῦ θείου

The Apologie, Cap. 13. Diuiſion. 2.

The Emperoure Theodoſius (**as ſaithe** Socrates) **did not onely ſitte emongeſt the Biſchoppes, but alſo ordered the whole argueinge of the cauſe, and tare in peeces the** Heretiques Bookes, **and allowed for good the Iudgemente of the** Catholiques.

M. Hardinge.

(a) As if a priuate Councel were no Councel.

* Fonde folie. As though the Emperoure coulde Condemne the Heretiques, or allowe the Catholikes, without Iudgemente.

It is a wonder to ſee, how theſe menne abuſe the Eccleſiaſtical hiſtories. Whereas they talke a litle before of the ſittinge of Emperoures in General Councelles, a man woulde thinke, that nowe alſo Theodoſius had ben ſaide to haue ſitten amonge Biſhoppes (a) in ſome General Councel. But there is no ſuche mater. Theodoſius the Emperoure conferred with Nectarius the Biſhop of Conſtantinople, how al Chriſten men might be broughte to an vnitie in Faithe. And after that Nectarius had learned of Siſinnius a greate Clerke, the beſte waie to be, if al the Heades of eche Hereſie and Secte, might be induced to be iudged by the olde Fathers and Doctoures of the Churche: the Godly Emperoure hearinge this aduiſe, cauſed bothe the Heretiques, and Catholiques alſo, to write eche of them ſuche thinges, as eche of them had to ſaie for his Beleefe. And after praier made, readinge ouer al the writinges, *he reiected the Arians, the Macedonians, and the Eunomians, *Embracinge onely their ſentence, who agreed vpon the Conſubſtancialitie of the ſonne of God. Here (ſaie theſe Defenders) Theodoſius did not onely ſitte amonge the Biſhoppes, but alſo ordered the whole

whole arguinge of the cause, tearinge the papers of the Heretikes, and allowinge the Iudgement of the Catholikes. To which obiection I make this answeare. First, that Theodosius here tooke counsel of Nectarius the Bishop, and followeth it. Secondly, that he intended not to Iudge, whether opinion of al the Sectes were truer, (b) but onely sought howe to ridde the Churche of controuersies. Otherwise he wouldе not onely haue taken counsel of Nectarius the Catholike Bishop, but also of the Arians, Macedonians, and Eunomians. For he is not a right Iudge, that calleth one side onely to him, and in iudgement is ruled by it. If then it be plaine, that the Emperour onely consulted with Catholiques, it is no lesse plain, (c) that he sate not Iudge vpon the Catholiques. What did he then? Verily he entended to execute that iudgemente, whiche the Bishoppes had pronounced at Nice, and therefore he conferred onely with men of that side. And because he was enstructed, that by disputation no good should come, he chose this way, to make al to write their opinions. Not that he minded nowe to learne his Faithe out of their writinges, sith he had learned that longe before, and professed the same in his Baptisme: but he sought a way, whereby to put al Heretikes to silence. Therefore, hauinge read al the writinges, and hauinge made his praier to God for grace, (d) to chose the better side, which also he made not doubtinge of his Faithe (for els he were an Infidel, and vnworthy to be a Iudge, euen in the Temporal matters amonge Christians) but partely he declared, that all goodnesse is to be asked of God, (e) partly he wouldе the Heretikes to vnderstand, that he went not to worke with affection, but with the feare of God. Thus hauinge praied and readen the writinges, he executed the iudgemente of the Nicene Councel, and reiected those Heretiques.

Now to retourne to the woordes of the Apologie, howe saie they, that the Emperoure not onely sate amonge Bishoppes, but also *causa disceptationis præsuit*, was chiefe Ruler and moderatour of the reasoninge, and debatinge of the mater? They cannot saie thus, as of a Councel, whereof they talke. * For there was no Councel indicted, not onely by the Pope, but neither by the Emperoure, nor by any other Archebishop. * It was a priuate callinge togeather of certaine heades of eche Secte, and not a solemne ordinarie Councel. If there were no Councel of Bishoppes, no sittinge of Bishoppes: if no sittinge, no presidence at al. Howe then was Theodosius President, and Iudge of Ecclesiastical causes?

If wee shall reporte the thinge, as it was in truthe donne, onely Theodosius vsed a politike waie, to put Heretiques to silence. Other iudgemente he tooke not vpon him, as he that protested alwaies, that Spirituall causes, and controuersies of Doctrine coulde not better be decided, then by Bishoppes. For whiche saieinge, S. Ambrose praised him. So that we are sure of Theodosius, that he neuer meante to intermedle with Ecclesiastical maters, (f) otherwise then to execute the Bishoppes Decrees.

Theodosius iudgeth Ecclesiastical causes.

(b) A woorthy reason. The Emperoure sought meanes to abandon Heresies: Ergo, He iudged not whether parte was the truer.

(c) Vntruthe, contrary to the plaine storie.

(d) And howe could he make choise without Iudgemente?

(e) Thus M. Hardinge maketh the Emperour a dissemblinge Hypocrite.

*A fond cauil. It was a priuat Councel of sundry Bishoppes, and the Iudgemente thereof was specially directed by the Emperoure.

(f) Thus the Emperoure is becomme the Bishops man. *Sozom. Li.7 cap.12. Socr. li.5.c.10*

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Here (yée saie) it is a woonder, to see, howe these meone abuse the Ecclesiastical stories: It was a Priuate Councel (yée saie) whereat Theodosius was presente, and not a General: **As if this poore healpe were sufficient, to salue the mater: or, as if a** Priuate Councel, **were no** Councel: **Or, as if an** Emperoure **mighte sitte as a Iudge in** Priuate Councelles, **but not in** General **I cannot blame you, M. Hardinge, for seekinge sutche shiftes. A simple sticke maie make a staie. The storie in briefe is this,** Theodosius **the** Emperoure, **the better to bring his** Churches **into** Vnitie, **Commaunded an Assemblie of the Bishoppes, and best Learned, to appeare before him, and eche parte to write a seuerall Confession of his** Faithe, **that he him selfe might Iudge betweene them, whiche** Faithe **were the best. Hauinge receiued their writinges, he willed Publique Praiers to be made, and also bothe openly, and priuately praied him selfe, that it might please God, to assiste him with his Holy Spirite, and to make him hable to Iudge iustely.**

Then he perused, and considered eche Confession **a sunder by it selfe: allowed onely the** Catholiques: **and Condemned the** Confessions, **that were written by the** Arians **and** Eunomians, **and tare them in peeces. This is the true reporte of the storie, M. Hardinge. Whatsoeuer yée haue added hereunto, as youre manner is, it is youre owne. Nowe, whether the** Emperoure Theodosius **tooke vpon him, to** Heare **and** Determine Ecclesiastical Causes of Religion, **or no, I repoꝛt me to your owne indifferent iudgemente.**

But yée wil saie, The Emperoure presumed not, to Iudge any thing of him selfe: but was wholy ruled by the Bishoppes, as the executoure of their willes. **And hereof,** yée saie, yee are vvel assured. **Thus by your handlinge, yée make the** Prince **onely youre** Bishoppes **man: to strike blindely, whome so euer your** Bishop **shal Commaunde: to Condemne, to Depriue, to Spoile, to Kille his owne Subiectes: not of any Iudgemente, or Knowe-ledge, but onely vpon the doubtful Credite, and at the pleasure of your** Bishop. **So simple yée make this** Godly Emperoure **in his dealinge. He willed the Congregation to praie: He praied him selfe, that God woulde directe him with his** Sprite **and** giue

Doo. him

him wiſedome, to diſcerne the Truthe: Ye Conferred the Confeſſions: Ye weighed eche Reaſon: Ye allowed one ſide for true and godly: All the reſt he Condemned for falſe, and wicked. And yet (yee ſaie) yee are ſure of Theodoſius that he intended not to iudge, whether of all theſe Sectes were the truer. And ſo, by your diſcretion, he both Allowed, and Condemned without Iudgement, he knewe not, what.

The Apologie, Cap. 14. Diuiſion. 1.

In the Councel of Chalcedon a Ciuile Magiſtrate Condemned for Heretiques, by the Sentence of his owne mouthe, the Biſhops, Dioſcorus, Iuuenalis, and Thalaſſius, and gaue Iudgement, to put them downe from their Dignities in the Churche.

M. Hardinge.

(a) Vntruth en cloſed, ſtanding in ignorance. For if M. Har. had read the Councel, he might haue founde it.

Where true, and good matter wanteth, for defenſe of this cauſe, theſe men care not what they bring, ſo they make a ſhewe of ſome Learning, to deceiue the vnlearned. Firſte, for condemnation of Heretiques, by ſentence of a Ciuil Magiſtrate, they alleage the name of the longe Councel of Chalcedon, not ſhewinge in what Action or parte thereof it may be found. True it is, that all theſe three are named in that Councel, Dioſcorus, Iuuenalis, and Thalaſſius. (a) But that al three were condemned, we finde not. Much leſſe, that they were condemned by any Ciuil Magiſtrate, doo we finde. The condemnation of Dioſcorus Archbiſhop of Alexandria, was pronounced by the Legates of the Pope of Rome in forme as followeth.

Actio. 3.

Paſchaſinus, hauing asked the conſent of the Fathers preſent in the Councel to the condemnation of Dioſcorus, after his faultes rehearſed, with his two felowes Lucentius Biſhop of Tuſculum, and Bonifacius Prieſte of the greate Churche of Rome, ſaide: The moſt holy, and bleſſed Archbiſhop of the great, and elder Rome Leo, by vs, and by this preſent holy Synode, with the thriſe moſte bleſſed and worthy of all praiſe, Peter the Apoſtle, • who is the rocke and • higheſt toppe of the Catholique Church, and who is the • foundation of the right Fuith, hathe depriued Dioſcorus, as wel of the dignitie of his Biſhopprike, as alſo of his Prieſtly miniſterie. This was the ſentence pronounced by the Popes Legates, in the name of the Biſhop of Rome, vnder the Authoritie of Peter. Which ſentence the whole Councel allowed. This being true, howe did the Ciuil Magiſtrate condemne Dioſcorus? Was then the Biſhop of Lilybæum, or the Pope, in whoſe name he gaue ſentence, a Ciuil Magiſtrate? (b) What is impudencie, what is lacertious lying, what is deceitful dealing, if this be not?

(b) This is the impudence of M. Hardinges Sprite. When he ſhal reade the Councel, & ſee his owne errour, he wil be colder.

Of Iuuenalis Archebiſhop of Hieruſalem, and Thalaſſius Archbiſhop of Cæſaria in Cappadocia, thus muche I ſay. They might wel haue a rebuke for miſuſing them ſelues in the ſeconde Councel at Epheſus, where they ſate, like Iudges, (c) without authoritie of the See of Rome (which, as Lucentius ſaid in the Synode of Chalcedon, was neuer orderly doo, neither was it lawful to be doone) they might, I ſay, take a rebuke for ſo preſuming beſides the Popes authoritie, but for as much as they (d) maintened not their facte, but amonge other Biſhoppes of the Eaſt cried out, *Omnes peccauimus, Omnes veniam poſtulauimus:* Wee haue al ſinned, We al beſeche pardone: Yea for as muche as Iuuenalis reiected the faulte vpon Elpidius, who did not commaunde Euſebius the accuſer of Eutyches to come in, and Thalaſſius ſaide, he was not cauſe thereof: it maie well be, they were pardonned, although the honorable Iudges, and Senate ſayde vnto them: *In Iudicio Fides non eſt defenſio:* In a Iudgement of Faith this is no excuſe. But in caſe they were deposed, (e) then are we ſure, (f) it was not done by the Ciuil Magiſtrates otherwiſe, then that they might allowe, and execute the ſentence of Depoſition before geuen.

Actio. 1. de noua vnda.

(c) Vntruthe, vaine and childiſhe. For then there belonged no ſuche Authoritie to the See of Rome.

(d) Vntruthe, ſhameleſſe aboue meaſure. For they neuer aſked pardone, for ſittinge without the Popes Authoritie.

(e) M. Harding is wel aſſured, before he knowe.

(f) Manifeſte Vntruth. Read the Antweare. *Copus, Dialo. 1. pag. 28.*

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

If the Councel of Chalcedon ſeme ouer longe, with better Readinge, yee maie make it ſhorter. That Dioſcorus, Iuuenalis and Thalaſsius were al three condemned in that Councel, That (yee ſaie) yee finde not, Howe be it, if yee had ſought it better, yee might ſone haue founde it. One of your owne Frendes of Louaine ſaithe, that herein yee were to mutche ouerſene. The very wordes, truely recorded in the Councel are theſe: Videtur nobis iuſtum eſſe, eidem pœnæ Dioſcorum Reuerendum Epiſcopum Alexandriæ, & Iuuenalem Reuerendum Epiſcopum Hieroſolymorum, & Thalaſsium Reuerendum Epiſcopum Cæſariæ Cappadociæ ſubiacere: & à Sancto Concilio, ſecundum Regulas, ab Epiſcopali dignitate fieri alienos: *Vnto vs it ſeemeth righte, that* Dioſcorus *the Reuerende Biſhop of* Alexandria, *and* Iuuenalis, *the Reuerende Biſhop of* Hieruſalem, *and* Thalaſsius, *the Reuerende Biſhop of* Cæſaria *in* Cappadocia, *ſhoulde be put to the ſame pounisheмente: and by the holy* Councel, *accordinge to the* Canons, *ſhould be remoued from their* Epiſcopal dignities. The whiche wordes yee might alſo haue founde fully reported in Euagrius.

Likewiſe alſo ſaith Pope Leo, touching the ſame: De nominibus Dioſcori, Iuuenalis & Euſta-

& Euſtachij (vel potiùs, Thalaſsij) ad Sacrum Altare non recitandis, dilectionem tuam hoc decet cuſtodire: *Touchinge the names of* Dioſcorus, Iuuenalis, *and* Euſtachius (*or rather,* Thalaſsius) *not to be rehearſed at the Holy Aultare* (**whiche was the** Communion Table) *ye muſte keepe this order.*

Dioſcorus Iuuenalis. Thalaſsius *Con. Chalce. Act. 1. pa. 831 Euagr. Lib. 2. Ca. 4. Leo Epi. 40. Ad Anatolium.*

But yée ſaie, Notwithſtandinge theſe Biſshoppes were condemned in the Councel, yet the Ciuile or Laie Iudges condemned them not. For they were there (**yée ſaie**) onely to ſee good order, and to kepe peace. **This, M. Hardinge, is your owne onely idle gheaſſe, without any manner further Authoritie, onely grounded vppon your ſelfe. Certainely, the wordes of the** Councell **be plaine:** Glorioſiſsimi Iudices, & ampliſsimus Senatus dixerunt: *The moſte* Noble Iudges, *and moſte worthy* Senate *ſaide.* **Likewiſe ſaith** Euagrius, Οἱ ἀπὸ τῆς συγκλήτου βουλῆς ἐκρίναντο τάδε: The Lordes of the Emperoures Councel decreed theſe thinges.

Conc. Chalcedon. Actio. 1 Euagr. Li. 2 Ca. 4.

Neither were the Ciuile Iudges **then ſo ſcrupulous, to thinke, they might not deale in Caſes of** Religion, **as it maie wel appeare by their wordes. For thus they ſaie:** Glorioſiſsimi Iudices, & Ampliſsimus Senatus dixerunt, De Recta, & Catholica Fide, perfectiùs ſequenti die, conuenienti Concilio, diligentiorem Examinationem fieri oportere, perſpicimus: *The moſte* Noble Iudges, *and moſte* vvoorthy Senate *ſaide, Wee ſee, that touchinge the* Right Catholique Faithe, *the nexte daie, when the* Councel *ſhal meete, there muſte be had a more diligente Examination.*

Conc. Chalc. Act. 1. pa. 831

And when the maters were concluded, and publiſhed, the Biſshoppes **of the** Eaſt **brake out into fauourable ſhoutes, in this ſorte:** Iuſtum, & Rectum Iudicium: vita longa Senatui: Multi anni Imperatori: *Juſte, and Righte is this Iudgemente: Longe liſe vnto the Senate: Many yeeres vnto the Emperoure.* **For in al caſes, as wel** Eccleſiaſtical **as** Temporal, **the** Emperoure **was** Iudge **ouer al. What ſo euer the** Councel **had determined, without the** Emperoures **conſent, it had no force. And therefore bothe the** Biſshoppes, **and other** Temporal Iudges **in the** Councel, **vſed oftentimes to ſuſpende, and to ſtaie theire** Decrees **in this ſorte:** Videtur nobis iuſtum, ſi placuerit Diuiniſsimo, & Piiſsimo Domino noſtro: *Vnto vs it ſeemeth right, if it ſhal alſo like our moſte vertuous, and moſt Godly Lorde (the Emperoure.)* **In the ende, they conclude thus:** Omnibus, quæ acta ſunt, ad Sacrum Apicem referendis: *So that al oure doinges be remitted to the Emperoures Maieſtie.* **Al whiche wordes are borowed, as the reſte, out of the** Eccleſiaſtical ſtorie of Euagrius.

Conc. Chalc. Act. 1. pa. 831 Euag. lib. 2. ca. 4 ἐπὶ παρασκέψει τῷ θειοτάτῳ ἡμῶν δεσπότῃ.

Yée ſaie, Iuuenalis, and Thalaſsius might wel haue a rebuke, for ſittinge like Iudges in the Second Councel of Epheſus, withoute Authoritie of the Pope. **O M. Hardinge, either yée are muche deceiued, and preſume to ſpeake before yée knowe, whiche were greate folie: or els yée ſpeake directly againſt your knowledge, and Conſcience, and willingely ſeeke to deceiue others: which were great wickednelle. Verily, yée might eaſily haue knowne that theſe three** Biſshoppes **were condemned, not for intrudinge vppon the** Popes **authoritie, as yée haue imagined, but onely for Condemninge other** Godly Biſshoppes, **wickedly, and without cauſe. The wordes of the** Councel **are plaine:** Glorioſiſsimi Iudices dixerunt, Vos quidem primitùs docuiſtis, quia per vim, & neceſſitatem, in pura Charta Coacti eſtis ſubſcribere ad damnationm Sanctæ memoriæ Flauiani. Orientales, &, qui cum ipſis erant. Reuerendiſsimi Epiſcopi, clamauerunt. Omnes peccauimus: Omnes veniam poſtulamus: *The moſte Noble Iudges ſaide, yee haue heere proned before vs, that yee were driuen by force, and violence, in a blanke paper to ſubſcribe youre names to the Condemnation of* Flauianus *of godly memorie. The Biſshoppes of the Eaſte, and other Reuerende Biſshoppes, that were with them, cried oute,* VVee haue all offended: VVee al deſire pardonne. **This in deede was theire faulte, M. Hardinge: Al that you imagine of vſurpinge the** Popes Authoritie, **is but a fanſie. For the** Popes Huge, and Vniuerſal Authoritie, **whereby nowe he claimeth the whole Iuriſdiction of al the worlde, at that time was not knowen.**

Conc. Chalcedon. Act. 16. Conſulatu.

The ſame Councel of Chalcedon **maketh him** Equal in Authoritie, and Dignitie **with the** Biſshop of Conſtantinople. **The wordes be theſe:** Sedi Senioris Romæ, propter Imperium Ciuitatis illius, Patres conſequenter Priuilegia reddiderunt. Et eadem inſentione permoti Centum quinquaginta Deo amantiſsimi Epiſcopi, æqua Sanctiſsimæ

Dioscorus Iuuenalis. Thalassius

Sedi Nouæ Romæ Priuilegia tribuerunt: rationabiliter iudicantes, Imperio, & Senatu Vrbem Ornatam, æquis Senioris Regiæ Romæ Priuilegijs frui, & in Ecclesiasticis, sicut illa, Maiestatem habere negotijs: *Vnto the See of the Olde Rome, in consideration of the Empiere of that Cittie, Our Fathers haue accordingly geeuen Priuileges. And vpon like consideration, the hundred and fiftie godly Bishoppes haue geeuen* equal, and like Priuileges to the Cittie of Newe Rome, (**whereby is meant the** Cittie of Constantinople:) *For that they thought it reasonable, that the same* Cittie of Constantinople, *being now adourned with* Empire and Senate, *shuld also haue* Priuileges, Equal with Rome the Elder: and haue the same Maiestie, and Authoritie in Ecclesiastical affaires, that Rome hathe.

Thus, yée sir, your Pope **hath not then a Power Pereleße ouer al the Worlde: but was made Like, and Euen, and Equal in al respectes to one of his Brethren. Therefore, if the** Bishop of Rome **were the** Head of the Church, **then was the** Bishop of Constantinople **likewise the** Heade of the Churche. **And if the** Bishop of Romes Power **were** Vniuersal, **then was the** Bishop of Constantinoples Power Vniuersal, **as wel as his. For the** Councel **alloweth as muche** Ecclesiastical Authoritie **to the one** Bishop **as to the other.**

Nowe, shortely to consider the whole substance of your talke. Firste, yée saie, These three Bishoppes, Dioscorus, Iuuenalis, and Thalassius were neuer condemned in the Councel of Chalcedon: **This, yée sir, is** One Vntruthe. **Secondly, yée saie,** The ciuile Magistrate neuer condemned them. **This is an** Other Vntruthe. **Thirdely, yée saie,** Iuuenalis, and Thalassius were rebuked for sittinge as Iudges in Councel without the Popes Authorine. **These are** twoo other Vntruthes. **For neither had the** Pope **any** Suche Prerogatiue **at that time, nor was this the Cause of their Condemnation. And yet, as if yée woulde renne vs ouer with terroure of wordes, yée crie out with a courage,** What is Impudencie, what is Licenceous Lieinge, what is deceiteful dealinge, if this be not?

Touchinge these fiery termes, M. Hardinge, I dare not Answeare you. But, as for Plaine lieinge, **without a difference, if ye knowe not, what it is, loke through your owne** Bookes: **and ye cannot faile of it. Verily, it is, to publishe** Vntruthes **so largely, and so liberally, as you haue doone, onely vpon affiance of the simplicitie, and ignorance of your Reader, without regarde, or feare, of God, or Man.**

The Apologie, Cap. 14. Diuision. 2.

In the Thirde Councel at Constantinople, Constantine a Ciuile Magistrate, **did not onely sitte amongst the** Bishoppes, **but did also subscribe with them. For, saithe he,** Wee haue bothe reade, and Subscribed.

M. Hardinge.

(*) A Vaine Distinction.

* Vntruth manifeste. Reade the Answeare.

The subscribinge is not the matter, but the iudginge. Constantine subscribed to the Councel as newe al Christen Princes, beinge required, ought to subscribe to the Tridentine Councel. (*) But Constantine vsed not this stile, when he subscribed, *Definiens subscripsi*, I haue subscribed with geuing definitiue sentence. * For so to subscribe, it appertained onely to Bishoppes.

The Apologie. Cap. 14. Diuision. 3.

In the Second Councel **called** Arausicanum, **the** Princes Embassadours, **beinge** Noble Men **borne, not onely spake their minde, touchinge** Religion, **but sette to their handes also, as wel as the** Bishoppes. **For thus it is written in the later ende of that** Councel: Petrus, Marcellinus, Felix, and Liberius, beinge Moste Noble Menne, and famous Lieutenants, and Captaines of France, and also Peres of the Realme, haue geuen their consent, and sette to their handes. **Further,** Syagrius, Opilio, Pantagathus, Deodatus, Cariattho, and Marcellus, men of very great honour, haue Subscribed.

M. Hardinge.

What if al the Laiemen of the worlde had subscribed by the woorde of consentinge, or agreeinge to the Bishops decree, eche one writing thus, as in that cause the olde manner was, *Consentiens subscripsi?* What other thinge is proued thereby then that they thought it necessarie to allowe that, whiche Bishoppes had determined? Whiche wee wishe ye woulde doo.

The

The Temporal Magistrate Subscribeth in Councel.

The Apologie. Cap.14. Division.4.

If it be so then, that Lieutenantes, Chiefe Captaines, and Peeres **haue hadde Authoritie to Subscribe in** Councel, **haue not** Emperoures, **and** Kinges **the like Authoritie?**

M. Hardinge.

Kinges, and Queenes, not onely might, but ought to subscribe, when they are required.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Here, M. Hardinge, ye are driuen to many shiftes. Some of you saie, that Princes Embassadours, **and** Ciuile Magistrates **had no right to** Subscribe in Councel, **but only by licence, and sufferance of the** Bishoppes. **Some others haue found out a certaine difference in** Subscriptions. **The** Bishop (**ye saie**) Subscribed in one Fourme, and the Ciuile Magistrate in an other: **The** Bishop **thus,** *Definiens Subscripsi*, By geuing my Definitiue Sentence, I haue Subscribed: **The** Laie Magistrate **thus,** *Consentiens Subscripsi*, Geuinge Consente hereto, I haue Subscribed. **Thus haue you found out a knot in a rushe: and diuised a** Diuersitie **without a** Difference. **Certainly in the** Olde Councelles **there appeareth only** one Fourme of Subscripsions, **and no moe. And afterwarde these Two Wordes,** Definiens, and Consentiens, **wherein you imagine so greate a difference, were vsed indifferently, as wel of** Bishoppes, **as of others: as eche man was best affected. Sommetime the** Bishop **Subscribed,** Consentiens: **Sommetime the** Laieman **Subscribed,** Definiens, **without scruple. In the** Councel **of** Chalcedon **it is written thus,** Ego Dorotheus Episcopus Consensi, & Subscripsi: I Bishop Dorothee haue Consented, and Subscribed &c. **Likewise it is written in the** Councel **of** Parise, Ego Probianus Episcopus Bituricensis Consensi, & Subscripsi: I Probiane the Bishop of Bourges haue Consented, and Subscribed. Marius Victorinus **saithe,** Nicenæ Fidei multa Episcoporum millia Consenserunt: *Many thousande* Bishoppes Consented *vnto the* Nicene Faithe.

consentiens Subscripsi. *Conci. Calce. Actio.1. Pa. 780. Conc. Parisien. Marius Victorinus contra Arianos. Lib.2.*

Of the other side, the Laie Prince in Councel **hathe had Authoritie, not onely to** Consente, **and** agree **vnto others, but also to** Define, **and** Determine, **and that in Cases of** Religion, **as by many euidente Examples it maie appeare.** Euagrius **saithe, as it is before alleged,** οἱ ἀπὸ τῆς συγκλήτου βουλῆς ἐψηφίσαντο τάδε: *They, that were of the Senate of the* Lordes *of the* Councel, Determined *these thinges.* Sozomenus **saithe,** Imperator Constantinus iussit decem Episcopos Orientis, & totidem Occidentis, quos Synodus designasset, ad Aulam suam venire, & sibi exponere Decreta Concilij: vt ipse quo consideraret, an secundum Scripturas inter se conuenissent: & de rebus agendis, quæ optima viderentur, Determinaret: *The* Emperoure Constantine *commaunded, that tenne* Bishoppes *of the Easte, and tenne of the Weaste, chosen by the* Councel, *shoulde repaire to his* Courte, *and open vnto him the* Decrees of the Councel: *that his* Maiestie *mighte consider, whether they were agreed accordinge to the* Scriptures: *and that he might further,* (**not onely** Consente, **or** agree, **but also**) Determine, *and* Conclude, *what were beste to be donne.* Æneas Syluius, **which afterwarde was** Pope Pius. 2. **saithe thus:** Visum est Spiritui Sancto, & nobis: vnde apparet, alios quàm Episcopos, in Concilijs habuisse vocem Decidentem: *It seemeth good to the* Holy Ghoste, *and to vs: Hereby it appeareth, that somme others, beside* Bishoppes, *had a voice* Definitiue in Councelles. **And againe he saithe,** Nec ego cuiusuis Episcopi mendacium, quamuis ditissimi, Veritati præponam Pauperis Presbyteri. Nec dedignari debet Episcopus, si aliquando ignarus, & rudis, sequacem non habeat multitudinem: *Neither wil I sette more by any* Bishoppes lie, *be he neuer so riche, then I woulde sette by any* Prieste Truthe, *be he neuer so poore. Neither maie the ignorant, and vnlearned* Bishop *disdeigne, if he see the people vnwillinge to folowe him.*

ἄρξε καὶ ἀυτὸν συνοδεῦσαι ἐπισκόπους ἐκ χώρας ἑκατέρας ἑκατὸν συνελθόντας ἀλλήλοις: καὶ περὶ τῶν πραχθέντων ὑπ' αὐτῶν ἄριστα δοκοῦντα ἐπιτελέσαι. *Æneas Syluius de Gestis Concil. Basilien. Lib.1.*

Gerson **saith,** Iudicium, & Conclusio Fidei, licet Authoritatiúe spectent ad Prælatos, & Doctores, spectare tamen possunt ad alios, quàm Theologos, Deliberatio, sicut & Cognitio super his, quæ Fidem respiciunt. Ita, vt ad Laicos etiam hoc possit extendi: & plùs aliquando, quàm ad multos Clericorum: *Notwithstandinge the* Iudgemente, and Conclusion of Faithe, *belonge by Authoritie vnto* Bishoppes, *and* Doctoures, *yet as wel the* Deliberation *hereof, as also the* Knowveledge, and Iudgemente, *concerninge matters, that touche the* Faithe, *maie belonge vnto others too, besides the Diuines, or Doctoures, and Professoures of* Diuinitie. *Yea, it maie sommetimes be extended euen vnto the* Laiemenne:

Eodem Loco Gerson. quæ veritates sint credendæ.

The Temporal Magistrate Subscribeth in Councel.

And more sommetimes vnto them, then vnto many Priestes.

The Emperoure Iustinian in Ecclesiastical Causes, **oftentimes** vseth these **wordes**, Definimus, Mandamus, Iubemus, &c. *Wee* Determine, *wee* Conclude, *wee* Commaunde, *wee* Bidde. **Touchinge** Bishoppes, **he writeth thus,** Definimus, vt nullus Deo amabilium Episcoporum foris à sua Ecclesia, plus quam per totum annum abesse audeat: *Wee* Define, *or* Determine, *that none of the* Godly Bishoppes *shal dare to be absent from his* Church *more then by the space of one whole yere.* **Here, yea sir, the** Temporal Prince **in an** Ecclesiastical Cause **saithe,** Definimus. **To be shorte,** Pope Nicolas **him selfe saithe, writinge vnto the** Emperoure Michael, Vbinam legistis, Imperatores Antecessores vestros Synodalibus Contentionibus interfuisse? Nisi fortè in quibusdam, vbi de Fide tractatum est: quæ Vniuersalis est: quæ omnium Communis est: quæ non solùm ad Clericos, verùm etiam ad Laicos, & ad omnes omninò pertinet Christianos: *Where haue you readde, that your* Predecessours, *being* Emperours, *were euer Presente at our Disputations in* Councels? Onlesse happily it vvere in certaine cases, vvhereas mater vvas moued touching the Faith. *For Faithe is* Vniuersal, and Common to al: and perteineth not onely vnto Priestes, but also vnto Laiemen: and generally, and thorovvly to al Christians.

Vbinam.

Nico. Cusa. de Concord. lib. 3 cap. 16.

Nicolaus Cusanus **saithe,** In Sexta Synodo Basilius Imperator Patriarchalium Sedium Vicarijs, & Patriarchis in Subscriptione se postposuit ex humilitate, tota Synodo rogante, vt se præponeret: *In the Sixthe Councel of* Constantinople *the* Emperoure Basilius *subscribeth his name after the Legates of the Patriarkal Seas, and after the* Patriarkes: But this he did of humilitie. *For the whole* Councel *besought him, to subscribe his name before al others.* **Thus yea sir, M. Hardinge, by the** Popes **owne Iudgemente, that Cases, and Disputations of the** Faith, **belonge as wel to the** Temporal Prince, **as to the** Pope.

The Apologie, Cap. 14. Diuision. 5.

Truely, there had benne no neede to handle so plaine a matter, as this is, with so many woordes, and so at lengthe, if we had not to doo with those menne, who for a desire they haue to striue, and to winne the maisterie, vse of course to denie al thinges, be they neuer so cleare, yea, the very same, whiche they presently see, and beholde with theire owne eies.

M. Hardinge.

The matter ye speake of, is so cleare, that from the beginninge of the worlde to this daie, ✱no secular Prince can be named, who by the ordinary power of a Prince without the gifte of prophecie, or special reuelation, did laudably intermeddle with Religion, as a iudge and ruler of spiritual causes. The reason therof is cleare. Religion is an order of Diuine woorshippinge, belonginge to God onely: whereupon no man hath power, but he that is called thereto by God. He is called in the iudgemente of men, who can shewe his callinge outwardly, as by consecration, and imposition of handes. Priestes and Bishoppes are called to be the dispensatours of the mysteries of God. In that consecration the keies of knowledge, and discretion, the power of bindinge and loosinge is geuen. (✱) If a secular Prince can not shewe the keies geuen too him, howe dareth he aduenture to breake vp rather then to open the clasped booke of God, the doore of the Churche, and the gates of the Kingedome of Heauen? Wherefore S. Ambrose saide vnto Valentinian, *Quando audisti, Imperator, in causa Fidei Laicos de Episcopo iudicasse?* When haste thou hearde, Emperoure, Laymen to haue benne Iudges of a Bishop in the cause of Faithe? And yet nowe these menne thinke, that whiche S. Ambrose neuer hearde of, not onely to haue benne vsed continually the firste fiue hundred yeeres after Christes birthe, but also to be as cleare a matter, as if we beholde it with our eies.

✱Vntruth, euident, as by sundrie examples it shal appeare.

(✱) O vaine man. What pertein these keies to General Councelles? For by them euery poore Prieste hath as good righte in Councel, as the Pope.

Mat. 16. & 18.

Li. 5. Ep. 33.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

The Temporal Prince (**yea saie**) hath not the Keies of the Kingedome of Heauen: *Ergo* he maie not iudge in Ecclesiastical Causes, nor geeue *Definitiue Sentence in General Councel.* **This is a very sely poore Argument, M. Hard. as hereafter it shal appere. But** S. Ambrose **saith vnto the** Emperoure Valentintan: *When did youre* Maiestie *euer heare, that in a* Cause of Faithe Laiemenne *were* Iudges *ouer* Bishoppes? **Here, M. Hardinge, by the waie,** S. Ambrose **geueth you to vnderstand, that onlesse it be in a** Cause of Faithe **a** Laieman **may be** Iudge ouer a Bishop: **whiche thinge is contrarie, not onely to your Former** Doctrine **but also to the whole course, and practise of your** Churche of Rome.

Parte 6. ca. 9 Diui. 2.

Howe be it, touchinge the meaning of these woordes, it behoueth vs to knowe,

Firste,

The Prince may deale in Eccleſiaſtical Cauſes.

Firſte, the cauſe, wherefore S. Ambroſe ſo ſhunned, and fledde the Emperoures Judgemente: Nexte, before what Judges he deſired to be tried.

Firſte, the Emperoure Valentinian, at that time, was very yonge, as wel in Age, as alſo in Faithe: He was not yet Baptized: He knewe not the Principles of Chriſtes Religion: He was an Arian Heretique, and beleaued not the Godhedde of Chriſte, but bente al his ſtudie, and power to mainteine the Arians: He woulde haue thruſte out the Chriſtians and would haue poſſeſſed the Heretiques in their Churches: and to that ende had raiſed his Power, and filled Millaine ful of Souldiers: He ſaide, *It was lawful for him, to doo, what him liſted.* Briefely, his whole dealing was ful of force, and violence, ſuche as hathe benne ſeene in ſomme Countries, not many yeeres ſithence. *Ambro. lib. 5 Epi. 33. Mãdatur deniq; Trada Baſilicam.*

In conſideration hereof, S. Ambroſe worthily refuſed him to be his Iudge. And therefore he ſaide vnto him, Tolle Legem, ſi vis eſſe Certamen: *Take awaie the rigoure of your Lawe, if yee wil haue the mater tried by diſputation.* Againe, Noli te grauare, Imperator, vt putes te in ea, quæ Diuina ſunt, Imperiale aliquod ius habere: Noli te extollere: Eſto Deo ſubiectus Scriptum eſt, quæ Dei, Deo: quæ Cæſaris Cæſari: *O my Lorde, trouble not youre ſelfe, to thinke, you haue any Princely Power ouer thoſe thinges, that perteine to God. Vaunte not youre ſelfe: be ſubiecte vnto God. It is written,* Geeue vnto God, that belongeth vnto God: Geeue vnto Cæſar, that belongethe vnto Cæſar. *Allegatur Imperatori licere omnia: Ambro. lib. 5 Epiſt. 32. ad Valentinian Li. 5. epi. 33.*

But, as S. Ambroſe ſaithe, The Emperoure hathe no powver ouer Goddes cauſes, ſo maie we likewiſe, and as truely ſaie, The Pope hath no powver ouer Goddes cauſes. S. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Siquidem eſt in Cauſa Fidei, fuge illum, & euita: non ſolùm ſi homo fuerit, verùm etiam ſi Angelus de Cœlo deſcenderit: *If it be a* Mater of Faith, (wherein he ſeeketh to abuſe thee) *flee him, and ſhunne him: not onely, if he be a man, but alſo if an* Angel *ſhoulde comme downe from Heauen.* Thus it appearethe, S. Ambroſe refuſed not the Emperoures Powver, and Authoritie of Iudgemente in Caſes Eccleſiaſtical, but onely his wilful Ignorance, and his Tyrannie: For that he knewe, his Iudgemente was corrupted, and not indifferente. *Chryſoſtom. ad Hebre. Hom. 34.*

And for that cauſe he ſaith, Veniſſem, Imperator, ad Conſiſtorium Clementiæ tuę, &c. *O my Lord, I would haue made mine appearance at your Conſiſtorie, to haue vttered theſe thinges in your Preſence, if either the* Biſhoppes, *or the People woulde haue ſuffered mee. For they tolde mee, that* Maters of Faithe *ought to be diſputed in the* Churche openly before the people. Againe he ſaithe, Veniant ſanè, ſi qui ſunt, in Eccleſiam: Audiant cum Populo: non vt quiſquam reſideat Iudex, ſed vt vnuſquiſque de ſuo affectu habeat examen, & eligat quem ſequatur: *Let them hardely comme to the* church: *let them hearken togeather with the people: not that any man ſhould ſitte as Iudge: but that euery man maie after his owne minde examine the mater, and ſo chuſe whome he maie followe.* Of ſuche Tyrannie in Councelles, Athanaſius like wiſe complaineth: Quo iure contra nos Synodum vllam conſtituere potuerunt? Aut qua fronte talem Conuentum Synodum appellare audent, cui Comes præſedit? Vbi Spiculator apparebat? Vbi Commentarienſis, ſiue Carcerarius, pro Diaconis Eccleſiæ, aduentantes introducebat? Comes Imperio vtebatur: Nos a militibus ducebamur: *By what Lawe could they keepe a* Councel *againſte vs? Or with what face could they cal ſuche an* Aſſemblie *by the name of a* Councel? *Where as the Lorde* Lieutenante *was Preſident? Where the Hangman was Apparitoure? Where the* Iailer *preſented the ſuiters in ſteede of the* Deacons *of the Churche? The* Lieutenant *did al thinges by Authoritie, and Commaundement: Wee were taken by the* Souldiers, *and carried to Priſon.* *Ambro. lib. 5 Epiſt. 32. Dicentes, de Fide in Eccleſia coram populo debere tractari. In eadem Epiſt. Athan. Apolo. 2. Poteramus.*

Therefore he ſaithe, Fiat Eccleſiaſtica Synodus longè à Palatio: vbi nec Imperator præſtò eſt: nec Comes ſe ingerit: nec Iudex minatur: & vbi Solus Timor Dei ad omnia ſufficit, &c. *Let there be made an* Eccleſiaſtical Synode, *far from the* Emperours *Palaice: where as neither the* Emperoure *is Preſent: nor the* Lieutenante *thruſteth in him ſelfe: nor the* Iudge *with his threates maketh menne afraide: but where as the feare of God to al purpoſes is ſufficiente.* For this cauſe S. Ambroſe refuſed to be tried by the Emperoure Valentinian: That is to ſaie, as then it was, by a rathe yonge man: by a man Vnbaptiſed, and therefore no Chriſtian: by a Tyranne: and by an Arian Heretique, that vtterly denied the Godhedde of Chriſte. *Athanaſ. ad Solitariam vitam agentes. Has Literas.*

Otherwiſe Athanaſius him ſelfe was wel contented to commit his whole cauſe

The Prince may deale in Eccleſiaſtical Cauſes.

vnto the Emperoure. For thus he ſaithe, Poſtulamus, cauſam iſtam Pientiſſimo Imperatori reſeruari: apud quem licebit, & iura Eccleſiæ, & noſtra proponere, Planè enim confidimus, eius Pietatem, cognitis noſtris rationibus, nequaquam nos condemnaturam eſſe: *Wee require, that the* Emperoures *moſte Godly, and moſte* Religious Maieſtie, *maie haue the hearinge of the ſame mater: Before whome wee maie open bothe our* Churches *Right, and alſo our owne. For wee haue good hope, that his* Godlineſſe, *vnderſtandinge our Reaſons, wil neuer condemne vs.*

Athana. Apol. 2. Cum multis.

Auguſt. contra Epiſt. Parmeniani. Lib. 1.

Likewiſe S Auguſtine ſaith vnto the Donatian Heretiques, An fortè de Religione fas non eſt, vt dicat Imperator, vel quos miſerit Imperator? Cur ergo ad Imperatorem veſtri venere Legati? Cur eum fecerunt Cauſæ ſuæ Iudicem? *Is it not lawful, for the* Emperoure, *or his* Deputie, *to geeue* Sentence *in a mater of* Religion? *Wherefore then went your* Embaſſadours *to the* Emperoure? *Why made they him the Iudge of theire cauſe?*

Thus, M. Hardinge, it appeareth, that you, in defraudinge Emperoures, and Kinges of theire Emperial, and Princely Right, are faine to take parte with the Donatian Heretiques.

As for vs, wee claime no other right in Eccleſiaſtical Cauſes vnto oure Chriſtian Princes this daie, then that maie wel appeare, hathe benne inſtely vſed, both by Conſtantinus the Emperoure, and alſo by other Catholique, and Godly Princes.

Liberatus. Ca. 11.

The Emperoure Theodoſius wrote thus vnto the Councel of Chalcedon: Quoniam ſcimus, Magnificentiſsimum Florentium Patritium eſſe Fidelem, & probatum in Recta Fide, volumus eum intereſſe audientiæ Synodi: quoniam ſermo de Fide eſt: *For that wee knowe, the moſte* Noble Florentius *to be faithfull, and wel approued in the* Righte Faithe, *therefore wee wil, that he be preſent at the hearing, and debating of Caſes in the* Councel, *for as mutche as the* Diſputation is of the Faithe.

diſ. 96. vbinã

For Pope Nicolas him ſelfe ſaithe, as it is alleged before, Fides Vniuerſalis eſt: Fides omnium Communis eſt: Fides non ſolùm ad Clericos, verum etiam ad Laicos, & ad omnes omninò pertinet Chriſtianos: *Faithe *is Vniuerſal:* Faith *is common to al:* Faith *perteineth, not onely vnto* Prieſtes, *but alſo vnto* Laiemenne, *and generally to al* Chriſtians.

*He ſpeaketh of queſtions of faith moued in coũcelles

As touchinge the Pope, and his Vniuerſalitie of Powre, in, and ouer al Councelles of Bishoppes, wee maie rightly ſaie, as Athanaſius ſaithe of Conſtantius the Arian Emperoure, Obtendit in ſpeciem Epiſcoporum Iudicium: ſed interim facit, quod ipſi libet: Quid opus eſt Hominibus Titulo Epiſcopis? *He maketh a ſhewe of* Iudgementes, *or* Determinations *of* Bishoppes: *In the meane while he dothe what he liſteth him ſelfe. What are wee the neare for theſe manne, that beare onely the name of* Bishoppes? Mutche commonly be the Popes Prelates. What ſo euer Learninge they haue beſides, Diuinitie is commonly the leaſt parte of theire ſtudie. And therefore, when they are aſſembled in Councel, they maie wel iudge by Authoritie, but not by Learninge.

Athana. Ad Solitariam Vitam agentes.

Luitprãdus. Iohan. 13

Verily, Luitprandus ſaithe, Imperator, vti experientia didicimus, intelligit negotia Dei, & facit, & amat ea: & tuetur omnibus viribus, & Eccleſiaſticas res, & Ciuiles. Sed Iohannes Papa facit contra hæc omnia: *Wee ſee by experience, that the* Emperoure vnderſtandeth Goddes cauſes, *and fauoureth, and perfourmeth the ſame: and with all his Power maintaineth bothe* Eccleſiaſtical, and Temporal maters. *But* Pope Iohn *doothe al* the contrarie.

The Apologie, Cap. 14. Diuiſion. 6.

The Emperoure Iuſtinian made a Lawe, to correcte the behaueour of the Cleregie, and to cutte ſhorte the inſolente lewdneſſe of the Prieſtes, And, albeit hee were a Chriſtian, and a Catholique Prince, yet putte hee downe from theire Papal Throone, two Popes, Syluerius, and Vigilius, notwithſtandinge they were Peters Succeſſours, and Chriſtes Vicars.

M. Hardinge.

*Vntruth, For he did but conferre with the Pope touching his Lawes. Touching the askinge of allowance, there appeareth nothinge.

Iuſtinians lawe concerninge good order to be kepte amonge Prieſtes morally was good, and bound them by the force of reaſon. If he made any other Lawe touchinge matters of Religion. Pope Ioannes then beinge, approued it, or at the leſte, Iuſtinian * asked approbation thereof, * as it maie appeare in his owne Epiſtle, wherein he confeſſeth in the facte it ſelfe, that his Lawes coulde not binde in ſupernatural cauſes belonginge to faithe, excepte the heade of the Vniuerſal Churche confirme them. Sylueriꝰ and Vigilius

were

deposed rather by Theodora the Empresse, then by Iustinian the Emperoure. (*) Yee doo wrong to impute that wicked tyrannie vnto him. (*) He is not to be burthened therewith, onelesse the man be countable for his vices iniquities.

How so euer it was, that extraordinary violence and tyrannie can not iustly be alleged to the defense of your false assertion. Neither woulde your selfe haue mentioned the same, if ye couldè haue founde better matter. As hungrie Dogges eate durtie puddinges, accordinge to the prouerbe, cleane ynoughe for sutche vncleane writers, so your foule matters be defended by foule factes.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Iustinian (yée saie) might wel make somme Moral Lawe, to keepe Priestes and Bishops in good order. **Wherein neuertheleſſe** Pope Paule. 3. **condemneth you vtterly. For thus he writeth, and reasoneth substantially against the** Emperoure Charles the Fifthe: Eccè ego super Pastores meos: *Beholde, saithe Almighty God, I mee selfe wil ouersee my Sheepe-heardes:* Ergo, **saithe** Pope Paulus, *The* Emperoure *maie not deale with the manners of* Priestes, *and* Bishoppes. **Thus, it appeareth, the** Pope **and M. Hardinge cannot agrée.**

Howe be it, the Emperoures **made** Lawes, **Touchinge the** Holy Trinitie: **Touchinge the** Faithe: **Touchinge** Baptisme: **Touchinge the** Holy Communion: **Touching the** Publique Praiers: **Touchinge the** Scriptures: **Touchinge the** keeping **of** Holy daies: **Touchinge** Churches **and** Chapels: **Touchinge the** Consecration of Bishoppes: **Touchinge** Non Residences: **Touchinge** Periurie, &c.

Addition. ☞ Michael an Emperoure of the Easte, **contrarie to the custome, and order of the** Churche, **made a Lawe that no** Monke shoulde serue the Ministerie in any Cure. **The** Emperoure Iustinian **gaueth licence to a** Bishop, **to release a** Priestе **from parte of his** Penaunce, **and to restoare him to the** Ministerie. Emperoures **had Authoritie to appointe** Patriarkal Sees, **and that, not by warrante from the** Pope, **but, as** Balsamon **saith,** Secundum Potestatem illis desuper Datam. *According to that Power, that is geeuen to them from aboue.* **By the** Ecclesiastical Lawes **no** Bishop **maie geue orders without his owne Diocese. Yet** Balsamon **saithe,** Characterem dare extra Diœcesim Imperatorio iussu permissum est: *A Bishop beeinge without his owne Diocese maie geeue orders, so that the* Emperoure *so commaunde him.* **Here wee see, the** Emperours **commaundemente is aboue the** Lawe **of the** Churche. **By the** Apostles Canons a Priestе **maie not wander from one Diocese, or Cure to an other. Yet** Balsamon **saithe,** Nota quòd etiam Imperatori Concessum est, facere Clericorum translationes: *Marke thou, that the* Emperoure *hathe a Priuiledge, to translate* Priestes, *from one Cure to an other.* ☞

Balsamon De Fide. Titulo. 1.
Balsam. De pœnitentia. apud tit. 9
Balsa. In Conc. Chalced. ca. 12
Balsam. in Canon Apost. Can. 14.
Balsam. In Canon. Apost. Can. 16.

It were mutche for you, M. Hardinge, to saie, as nowe yée woulde seeme to saie, *All theise were Moral Lawes, and pertained onely to good order.* But the Pope (yée saie) allowed the Emperoures Ecclesiastical Lawes: Otherwise, of the Emperoures owne Authoritie, they had no force. **The truthe hereof, by the Particulares, maie some appeare.**

By one of the Emperoures Lawes **it is prouided,** *That the* Bishop of Constantinople *shal haue* Equal Power, and Prerogatiue *with the* Bishop of Rome. **This** Lawe **the** Pope **coulde neuer breake. And yet, that notwithstandinge,** Liberatus **saithe,** *It holdeth stil by the* Emperours Authoritie, *whether the* Pope *wil, or no.* **Againe, it is prouided in the same** Lawe, **that the** Churches of Illyricum, **in their doubtful cases, shal appeale to** Constantinople, **and not to** Rome.

Cod. de Sacrosanct. Ecclesijs. omni innouatione.
Liberat⁹. ca. 13 Imperatoris Patrocinio.

The Emperoure Constantine **saithe,** *If the Bishop moue trouble* (**by Doctrine, or otherwise**) *by my hande he shalbe pounished: For my hande is the hande of Goddes Minister:*

Cod. de Sacrosanct. Ecclesijs. Omni innouatione.

Iustinian **the** Emperoure **in his** Lawe **commaundeth,** *That the Priest, or Bishop in Pronouncinge the Publique Praiers, and in the Ministration of the Sacramentes, lifte vp his voice, and speake alowde, that the people maie saie,* Amen, *and be sturred to more Deuotion.* **Againe he saithe, as it is noted in the** Glose **vpon the** Authentiques, Papa Temporalibus immiscere se non debet: *The Pope maie not intermeddle with Temporal Causes:*

Theod. Lib. 1. Ca. 20. Ministri Dei, hoc est, mea manu coercebitur.

In the same Lawes, **the same** Emperoure Iustinian **saith,** *Wee Commaund the most Holy Archbishoppes, and Patriarkes, of* Rome, *of* Constantinople, *of* Alexandria, *of* Antioche, *and of* Hierusalem. **The same** Emperour Iustinian **commaundeth,** *That al Monkes either be driuen to studie the Scriptures, or els be forced to Bodily Labours.* Carolus Magnus **made a** Lawe, *That nothinge shoulde be readde openly in the Churche, sauinge onely the Canonical*

Auth. Tit. 123 Authen. coll. 1
Quomodo oporteat Episcopos.

The Prince may deale in Ecclesiastical Causes.

Vntruth. For it was no tyrannie but iust iudgemẽt And Iustinian gaue Belisari⁹ great thankes for so doonge. Ezechiel. 34. Paulus. 3. in Epistola ad Carol. 5.

The Prince may deale in Eccleſiaſtical Cauſes.

nonical Bokes of the Holy Scriptures: And that the Faithful People ſhould receiue the Holy Communion euery Sonnedaie. I leaue the rehearſal of infinite other like Examples.

Nowe, M. Hardinge, wil you ſaie, or maie wee beleeue, that al theſe, and other like Lawes were allowed by the Pope? Verily, certaine of them are made directly againſte the Pope.

In deede your Gloſer ſaithe, Ad quid intromittit ſe Imperator de Spiritualibus, vel Eccleſiaſticis, cùm ſciat ad ſe non pertinere? *Wherfore doothe the Emperoure thus buſie him ſelfe with theſe Spiritual, or Eccleſiaſtical maters, ſeeinge he knoweth, they are no parte of his Charge?* To ſo profound a queſtion, after a longe ſolemne ſtudie, he diuiſeth this anſweare: Dic, quòd Authoritate Papæ hoc facit: *Saie thou, that he doothe it by the Popes Authoritie:* And then the whole mater is diſcharged, and al is wel.

Notwithſtandinge, ſomme likelihode hereof yee woulde ſeeme to geather, euen out of Iuſtinians owne woordes. For thus he ſaithe vnto the Pope, although far otherwiſe, then you haue forced him to ſaie: Omnia, quæ ad Eccleſiarum ſtatum pertinent, feſtinauimus ad notitiam deferre Veſtræ Sanctitatis. Neceſſarium ducimus, vt ad notitiam Veſtræ Sanctitatis peruenirent. Nec enim patimur, quicquam, quod ad Eccleſiarum Statum pertinet, vt non etiam Veſtræ innoteſcat Sanctitati: quæ Caput eſt omnium Sanctarum Eccleſiarum: *What ſo euer thinges perteine to the ſtate of the Churches, wee haue ſpedily brought to the knowledge of youre* Holineſſe. *Wee thought it neceſſarie, that youre* Holineſſe *ſhould haue knowledge thereof. Wee ſuffer not any thinge, that concerneth the* State of the Churches, *but it be brought to the knowledge of your* Holineſſe, *whiche is the* Head, or Chiefe of al the Holy Churches.

Authen. Col. 9 Tit. 15. De Sanctiſſ. Epiſcopis. Iubemus Beatiſſimos Archiepiſcopos, Senioris Romæ, &c.

Authen. tit. 133 Anſigiſus. Lib. 1. Cap. 19. Carolus Magnus. Lib. 6. Cap. 162.

Authen. Col 1. Titu. 6. Quomodo oporteat Gloſſ. in verbũ Sancimus.

Cod. de Summa Trinita. & Fide Catho. Inter Claras.

Cod. De Vet. Iure Enucleando Chryſoſt. ad Romanos. ho. 18

Prudẽtius in Enthiridio.

Nazian. in Ep. ad Baſi.

Auth. Col. 1. Vt determinatus.

The Emperoure willeth the Pope, to take knowledge of his Lawes, for that he was the Chiefe of the Foure Principal Patriarkes, and, in reſpect of his See, the greateſt Bishop of al the Worlde: for whiche cauſe alſo he calleth him, the Heade, or Chiefe of al Churches. So Iuſtinian ſaithe, Roma eſt Caput Orbis Terrarum: Rome *is the Head of al the Worlde.* So S. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Caput Prophetarum Elias: Elias, *the Heade of the Prophetes.* So ſaithe Prudentius, Sancta Bethlem Caput eſt Orbis: *The Holy towne of* Bethlem *is the Heade of the worlde.*

So Nazianzene calleth S. Baſile, τὸν τῆς οἰκουμένης ὀφθαλμόν, Oculum Orbis Terrarum: *The Eie of al the Earthe.* So Iuſtinian calleth the Bishop of Conſtantinople, an Vniuerſal Patriarke: Epiphanio Vniuerſali Patriarchæ.

These, and other like woordes, paſſe oftentimes in fauoure, as Titles of Honoure. But they importe not alwaies that Vniuerſal Gouernemente, or Infinite Authoritie, that the Pope ſithence hathe imagined. But, touchinge the Confirmation, and allowance of the Emperoures Lawes, in theſe woordes of Iuſtinian yee finde nothinge: Vnleſſe yee wil ſaie, Notitia, is Latine for, Allowance: or, Peruenire, is Latine to Confirme.

Cod. de Summa Trinita. et fide Cath. Inter Claras

The Emperoures purpoſe was, as it plainly appeareth by his woordes, by theſe, and al other meanes, to bringe the See of Rome into credite. For thus he ſaithe, Properamus, Honorem, & Authoritatem Creſcere Sedis Veſtræ: Omnes Sacerdotes Vniuerſi Orientalis Tractus, & ſubijcere, & vnire Sedi Veſtræ Sanctitatis properauimus. Plus ita Veſtræ Sedis creſcet Authoritas: *Wee labeure, to auaunce the Honoure, and Authoritie of your See: Wee labeure to ſubdewe, and to ioine al the Prieſtes of the Eaſte parte vnto the* See of your Holineſſe. *Thus ſhal the Authoritie of your See the more encreaſe.*

Gregor. Haloander, Et Azo.

Notwithſtandinge, it is noted by the Learned of your owne ſide, that theſe Epiſtles betweene the Emperoure, and the Pope, in the Oldeſt Allowed Bookes are not founde: and therefore are ſuſpected to ſauoure of ſomme Romaine forgerie. Hereby it is eaſie to vnderſtande, that vntil the time of the Emperoure Iuſtinian, which was wel neare fiue hundred yeares after Chriſt, the Biſhoppes of the Eaſte Churche were not ſubiect to the Bishop of Rome: and, that for ſo long time, the Pope was not yet known for the Head of the Vniuerſal Churche of God. One of your owne Allowed Doctours ſaithe thus, Dicere, quòd Princeps non poteſt facere Leges, vel eis vti, quouſque fuerint approbatæ per Papam, falſum eſt: *To ſaie, that the Prince cannot, either make, or vſe his Lawes, before the Pope haue allowed them, it is plainely falſe.* Abbate Panormitane, to quaſ-

liſs

The Prince may deale in Eccleſiaſtical Cauſes.

like the mater, ſaith thus, Lex Principis Prejudicialis Eccleſijs, non extenditur ad Eccleſias, niſi expreſsè approbetur per Papam: Sed, ſi fauet Eccleſijs, intelligitur approbata, niſi expreſsè reprobetur: *The Princes Lawe, if it be Preiudicial, or hurtful to the Churche, is not extended vnto the Churche, onleſſe it be expreſſely allowed by the Pope: But if it be profitable for the Church, we muſt thinke, it is allowed, onleſſe it be expreſſely diſallowed.*

But here, M. Hardinge, this one thinge yᵉ maie note by the way: that, notwithſtandinge you cannot finde, by any ſhifte, or coloure, whereof yᵉ lacke no ſoare, that the Pope hathe Authoritie to allowe the Emperoures Lawes: yet, of the other ſide, wᵉ are hable readily to finde, that the Emperoure hathe Authoritie to allowe the Popes Lawes. For ſo the Emperoure Iuſtinian him ſelfe ſaithe: A præcedentibus nos Imperatoribus, & à nobis ipſis rectè dictum eſt, Oportere Sacras Regulas pro Legibus valere: *It is wel ſaide, both by other Emperours our Predeceſſours, and alſo by vs, that the Holy Canons muſte be holden for Lawes.*

Extra. De Conſtitu. Eccleſie Sancte Marie. Numero. 9.

Auth. Coll. 1 Quomodo oporteat.

Like wiſe ſaithe Pope Honorius. 3. Imperator Iuſtinianus decreuit, vt Canones Patrum vim Legum habere oporteat. *The* Emperoure Iuſtinian *hathe decreed, that the* Canons *of the Fathers ſhal haue the force of Lawes.*

Extra. De Iuramen. Calum. Inhærentes.

But, what can be ſo plaine, as that Iuſtinian hereof writeth him ſelfe? Theſe be his wordes: Niſi intra præſcriptum tempus ad Eccleſias ſuas redeant, deponantur, & alij in illorum locum ſurrogentur, idque Authoritate, & vi huius Præſentis Legis: *Onleſſe Biſhoppes, and Prieſtes, repaire againe vnto their Churches by a date appointed, let them be depriued from their liuinges, and let others be placed in their rowme.* (not by the Authoritie of the Pope, but) by the force, and Authoritie of this Preſent Lawe. So ſaithe S. Auguſtine, Reges in Terris ſeruiunt Chriſto, faciendo Leges pro Chriſto: *Kinges in the worlde ſerue Chriſte, in that they make Lawes for Chriſte.* Like wiſe ſaithe Iuſtinian, Legum Authoritas & Diuinas, & Humanas res bene diſponit: *By the Authoritie of the* (Emperoures) *Lawes both the Heauenly, and Worldly thinges are wel ordered.* And againe, Nullum genus rerum eſt, quod non ſit penitùs quæſendum Authoritate Imperatoris; Is enim recipit à Deo communem gubernationem, & Principalitatem ſuper omnes homines: *There is no kinde of thinge, but it muſt be thorowly examined by the* Authoritie of the Emperoure. *For he receiueth from* God a General Gouernement, *and* Principalitie *ouer al menne*: that is, as well of the Cleregie, as of the Laitie. So ſaithe Paulus the Bishop of Apamea vnto the ſame Emperoure Iuſtinian, vpon the deathe of Agapetus the Biſhoppe of Rome: Tranſtulit ipſum Dominus, vt Plenitudinem directionis Veſtræ cuſtodiret Serenitati: *Our Lorde hath taken the Pope awaie, that he might reſerue the whole fulneſſe of order vnto your* Maieſtie.

Auguſt. epiſt. 48. Cod. De Veteri Iure Enuclean. L. 1.

Authen. Titu. 133. κελεύει ἕκαστον ἐξ ἡμῶν τῇ ἐκκλησίᾳ.

Touchinge the Depriuation of the two Popes, Syluerius, and Vigilius, yᵉ ſaie, it was done onely by Theodora the Empreſſe, and not by the Emperoure Iuſtinian: And therein, yᵉ thinke, yᵉ haue taken vs in ſome great aduantage. Notwithſtandinge in your owne Pontifical it is written thus, Beliſarium interrogauit Imperator, quomodò ſe haberet cum Romanis: vel quomodò in loco Syluerij ſtatuiſſet Vigilium. Tunc gratias ei egerunt Imperator, & Auguſta: *The* Emperoure *demaunded of his* Captaine Beliſarius, *how he had donne with the* Romaines: *and howe he had depoſed* Pope Syluerius, *and placed* Vigilius *in his ſteede. Vpon his anſweare, both the* Emperour, *and the* Empreſſe *gaue him thankes.* Now yᵉ knowe, it is a Rule in Lawe, Ratihabitio retrotrahitur, & mandato comparatur: *The* Allowance *of a thing donne, is as good, as a* Commiſsion *for the doinge.*

Conc. Conſtantin. 5. Actio. 1

Concil. Tomo. 2. in vita Vigily.

ff. In Regulis Iuris.

Some of your Friendes haue ſaide, Totus Mundus non poteſt Deponere, aut Iudicare Papam: *The whole Worlde cannot Depoſe, or Iudge the Pope.* Yet Eutropius ſaithe, Si quando Imperialis Legatus mitteretur à Principe, vt Romanus Pontifex proficiſceretur Conſtantinopolim ad Imperatorem, omni neglecta occaſione, ibat: etiamſi pro certo ſciret, ſe iturum in exilium: *If the Emperoures Embaſſadoure had commaunded the* Bishop *of* Rome *to appeare at* Conſtantinople *before the Emperoure, he went ſtreight waie without excuſe: Yea*, although he certainely knewe, that he ſhoulde be bannished. Here I leaue ſundrie Cramples of Emperoures, that by theire Authoritie haue Depoſed, not onely other Bishoppes but alſo Popes: As the Crample of Honorius, that Depoſed Pope Bonifacius: Of Theodoricus, that Depoſed Pope Symmachus: Of Otho, that Depoſed Pope Ihon 12. Of Henrie, that Depoſed Pope Benedictus. 9. and that, as

Petr. De Palude. De poteſt. Pape. Arti. 4.

Eutropij appendix, De Syluerio.

Ennodius: Inter Decreta Bonifa. 1.

The Prince may deale in Eccleſiaſtical Cauſes.

as it is recorded, not by wilful might, or Tyrannie, but, Imperiali, & Canonica Cenſura: *By his Emperial, and by the Canonical Cenſures.* Yea, one of your owne Friendes ſaithe thus: Populus commendabiliter Zelo Fidei commotus, Conſtantinum Papam, qui erat Eccleſiæ in ſcandalum, priuauit oculis, & Depoſuit: *The people of* Rome, *moued with the Zele of Faithe, toke Pope* Conſtantine, *and pulled out his eies, and Depoſed him, for that he was ſclaunderous vnto the Churche: and they deſerued greate Praiſe for the ſame.*

Johan. De Pariſijs, De Poteſtate Regia. et Papali. cap. 14. 23

Howe be it (yée ſaie) theſe twoo Popes, Syluerius, and Vigilius were good menne, and Godly Fathers: and therefore the remouinge of them was Violence, and Tyrannie. And hereto yée applie the vnſauerie Similitude of your Homely Puddinges. Notwithſtandinge, what Vertue, or Holineſſe was in either of theſe menne, it maie ſone appeare by the Storie.

Idem, eodem loco.

Pope Syluerius was choſen Pope by Corruption, and Simonie, contrary to the wil of the Cleregie: Pope Vigilius accuſed him of Treaſon, for that he woulde haue betraied the Cittie of Rome to the Gotthians. As for Pope Vigilius, youre Pontifical ſaithe, *He was a Falſe Witneſſe againſte his Predeceſſoure,* Pope Syluerius: *He ſought vndewe meanes to remoue him, and to place him ſelfe: He keapt him in Priſon, and ſterued him for hunger: He gaue a greate ſumme of monie to procure the Popedome to himſelfe: He killed his owne Notarie: He killed a yonge man, beinge a Widowes Sonne: And of theſe crimes he was accuſed before the* Emperoure. Sutche Vertue, and ſutche Holineſſe the worlde founde in them. Therefore the Godly Emperoure in remouinge of them, vſed neither Extraordinarie Violence, as you ſaie, nor Iniurious Tyrannie.

Conc. Tom. 2 In Syluerio. Euagrius. lib. 1. cap. 19. Pontificale, In Vigilio.

Your owne felowes ſaie, Si papa ſit incorrigibilis, nec Cardinales poſsint per ſe amouere ſcandalum de Eccleſia, tunc in ſubſidiũ iuris, deberent ſupplicando inuocare Brachium Sæculare. Et tunc Imperator, requiſitus à Cardinalibus, deberet procedere contra Papam: *If the Pope be vncorrigible, and the* Cardinalles *be not hable of them ſelues to remoue the offenſe from the* Churche, *then ought they, for aide of the Lawe, by way of intreatie, to cal vpon the Seculare power. And then the Emperoure, being thus deſired, ought to proceede orderly againſt the Pope.*

Iohã. de Pariſijs, Cap. 14

Franciſcus Zabarell ſaithe, as he is alleged before, Papa poteſt accuſari coram Imperatore, de quolibet crimine notorio: Et Imperator requirere poteſt à Papa rationem Fidei: *The* Pope *in any notorious crime, maie be accuſed before the* Emperoure: *And the* Emperoure *maie require the* Pope, *to yeelde a reckening of his* Faithe.

Franc. Zabarella De Schiſmate, & Concilio.

The Apologie. Cap. 15. Diuiſion. 1.

Lette vs ſee then, ſutch menne as haue Authoritie ouer the Biſhops, ſutche menne, as receiue from God Commaundements concerning Religion, ſuch, as bring home againe the Arke of God, make Holy Himnes ouerſee the Prieſtes, build the Temple, make Orations touching Diuine Seruice, cleanſe the Temples, deſtroy the Hil Aultares, burne the Idolles Groues, teach the Prieſtes their dueties, write them out Precepts, howe they ſhoulde liue, kill the wicked Prophetes, diſplace the High Prieſtes, ſummone togeather Holy Councelles, ſit togeather with the Biſhops, inſtructinge them what they ought to doo, Examine, Condemne, and puniſhe Heretiques, be made acquainted with mater of Religion, Subſcribe, and geue Sentence to the Determinations of Councelles: and do all theſe thinges, not by any other Mannes Commiſſion, but in their owne name, and that both vprightly, and Godly: Shal we ſay, It perteineth not to ſuch men, to haue to do with Religion? Or, ſhall we ſay, A Chriſtian Magiſtrate, which dealeth emongſt others in theſe maters, doth either naughtily, or preſumptuouſly, or wickedly? The moſte Ancient, and Chriſtian Emperours, and Kinges, that euer were, did occupie them ſelues in theſe maters: and yet were they neuer, for this cauſe noted either of wickednesſe, or of Preſumption. And what is he, that can finde out, either Princes more Catholique, or Examples more notable.

M.

The Popes power Supernatural

M. Hardinge.

Nowe then Kinges, and Emperours, who haue their firste authoritie by the positiue Lawe of Nations, must by supernatural grace from God, as Priestes haue, who can haue no more power then the people hathe, of whom they take their Temporal iurisdiction: Who haue euer (a) ben annointed and blessed by Bishoppes, who so euer blesseth, beinge greater then he that is blessed: shal we saie, that suche Kinges, and Emperoures haue authoritie to rule the Churche, (b) whose Sonnes they are? To be supreme Heades ouer them, whom they ought to kneele vnto for absolution? To controll their spiritual Iudges, whom if they shone by humanitie frailtie, they (c) ought to couer with their clokes, (c) as the Great Constantine saide: to degrade them, of whom they muste be Baptized, Anointed, Crowned, and Buried?

(a) Vntruthe, Confessed by M Hardinges owne Doctors.

(b) And is not the Pope a sonne of the Church? Then is he not the sonne of God. *Di. 22. omn.*

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Nowe, M. Hardinge, yée huddle vp hastily your poore Argumentes in heapes together. One, or two of them onely I minde to touche: The rest are not worth the hurringe. Firste yée saie, The Popes Power is of God, The Princes Power is onely of Man. The one Supernatural, the other Natural. In suche sorte your Pope Nicholas adourneth, and magnifieth his owne Chaire. For thus he saithe with a lolly courrage: Illud Verbum, quo constructum est Cœlum, & Terra, quo denique omnia facta sunt Elementa, Romanam fundauit Ecclesiam: *The Woorde of God, whereby Heauen, and Earthe was made, and whereby al the Elementes were fashioned, the same Woorde founded the* Churche of Rome. As if the Churche of Rome and other Churches, were not al of one Fundation. An other of your Popes Ketciners saithe, Papatus est summa Virtus Creata: *The* Popedome *is the Highest Vertue, or Power, that euer God made: that is to saie, the* Popedome *is aboue* Angels, Archangels, Thrones, Dominations, *and al the* Powers, *in, vnder, or aboue the* Heauens. An other saithe, euen as you saie, and, as I haue partely saide before: Rex per hominem fit: Sacerdos autem proximè nascitur ex Deo ipso: Quantùm Deus præstat Sacerdoti, tantùm Sacerdos præstat Regi: *The Kinge is made by man: But the Priestе is immediately begotten of God. As muche as God excelleth the Priestе, so muche the Priestе excelleth the Kinge.*

Iohan de Parisus. De Potesta Regia, & Pap. Cap 25.

Stanislaus Orichonius in Chimara. Fo 97 et. 99

Pe. de Palude. de Potestate Curator. Artic. 6.

And notwithstanding, al this Supernatural powver, be as wel in the simplest Priest, as in the Pope, yet an other of your Doctours saithe, Papa eligitur secundum Ius Diuinum: alij verò Episcopi, secundum Ius humanum: *The Pope is chosen by the* Lawe of God: *But other Bishoppes are chosen by the Law of Man.* Thus yée thinke no colour to deare, to painte out the Popes face, and to make it to shine faire, and glorious.

But the Princes power (yée saie) is Temporal, and Natural, and onely from beneathe, and onely of Man: and therefore can be no greater then Man maie geue him. This is your Louanian Diuinitie, M. Hardinge: So highely yée esteeme the Dignitie, and Maiestie of the Prince, But God him selfe saithe, Per me Reges regnant: Kinges rule by me (and not by Man.) S. Paule saithe, Non est potestas, nisi a Deo: *There is no* powver, *or* Princehoode, *but from* God. Likewise Christe him selfe saide vnto Pilate, *Thou couldest haue no Power ouer me, onlesse it were geuen thee* (not from Man, but) from aboue. To like purpose the Emperoure Iustinian saithe, Maxima in omnibus sunt Dona Dei, & superna collata Clementia, Sacerdotium, & Imperium &c. Ex vno eodemque Principio vtraque procedentia Humanam exornant vitam: *Priesthoode, and Princehoode be in al thinges the greatest gifies of God, geuen vnto vs from the Mercie aboue. Their two flowinge* (not the one onely from Man, and the other from God, but) *bothe from one Original, doo adourne and beautifie the Life of Man.* Upon whiche woordes it is noted in your Glose, Idem Principium habent, & Parum Differunt: Priesthoode, *and* Princehoode *haue one* Original, *and smal difference.* He saithe not, as you saie, The oodes betweene these two is so great, as is betweene Natural and Supernatural, betweene Heauen & Earth: or betweene God & Man. But he saithe plainely, Priesthoode, and Princehoode haue one Original, & litle oodes, and smal difference. Theodorus Balsamon saithe thus, Nota Canonem, qui dicit, Spirituales dignitates esse præstantiores sæcularibus, seu mundanis dignitatibus. Sed ne hoc eo traxeris, vt Ecclesiasticæ dignitates præferantur Imperatorijs: Illis enim subijciuntur: *Marke wel this Canon, that saith, The Spiritual dignities, are better then the Temporal, or worldly dignities. But yee maie not gather thereof, that the* Dignities of the Church are aboue the Dignitie of an Emperoure. For they are subiectes and inferioure to him.

Proverb. 8. Rom. 13. Iohan. 19. Auth. Col. 8 Quomodo oporteat Episcopos. Maxima. Glosa. In Verbum Vtraque

Balsamon in Sexto Syno. Canon. 7.

The Popes power Super natural

Thus you ſée, M. Hardinge, howe eaſily your lighte coniectures maie deceiue you. And therefore an other of your Doctoures ſaithe, Supponunt, quòd Poteſtas Regalis ſit Corporalis, & non Spiritualis? & quòd habeat Curam Corporum, & non Animarum: quod falſum eſt: *They imagine, that the* Princes Powver *is onely* Bodily, *and not* Ghoſtly: *and, that the* Prince *hath the charge of mennes* Bodies, *but none of theire* Soules. But this is ſtarke falſe.

Iohan. de Pariſi. c. 18.

Iohan. de Pariſi De Poteſtate Regia, & Papali ca. 25.

And whereas you ſo highly extolle your Popes Vniuerſal Powver as if it were Supernatural, and heauenly, it came onely from God: An other of your Doctours ſaithe, Ea, quæ ſunt Iuriſdictionis Papæ, non ſunt ſupra Naturam, & Conditionem negotij, nec ſupra Conditionem hominum. Quia non eſt ſupra Conditionem hominis, quòd homines præſint hominibus. Imò naturale eſt quodammodo: *Suche thinges, as belonge to the Popes Iuriſdiction, are not aboue Nature, nor aboue the Condition of the thinge it ſelfe, nor aboue the Capacitie of a Man. For it is not aboue the Nature of a Man, for Man to rule ouer Menne. Nay rather, in a ſorte, it is Natural.*

Nowe, M. Hardinge, if the Princes Powver be from God as wel, as the Popes: If the Popes Powver concerninge Iuriſdiction, be Natural, as wel, as the Princes: If they howe bothe from one Original: If they haue ſo ſmal difference, what meant you then, by theſe odious Compariſons, ſo highly, and ſo ambicioufly to auance the one, and ſo diſdeignefully, and ſcornefully to abaſe the other? What meant you ſo vainely to ſaie, that Kinges, and Emperoures haue their Authoritie by the poſitiue Lawe of Nations: and Popes haue theire Authoritie by the Supernatural grace of God? Touchinge the Princes Powver, wée are certainely aſſured by Goddes Holy VVorde, It is from God. As for the Popes Infinite, and Vniuerſal Powver throughoute the whole Scriptures, from the Geneſis vnto the Apocalips, onleſſe it be the Powver of Darkeneſſe, yée can finde nothinge.

Yée ſaie, Kinges haue euermore benne Annointed, and Bleſſed by Biſhoppes. This is an other fowle Vntruthe. For you might eaſily haue knowen, that Chriſtian Kinges in olde times were neuer Anointed. Your owne Doctoure ſaithe, In Nouo Teſtamento non legimus, quòd Sacerdotes debeant inungere Reges: Nec etiam nunc obſeruatur in omnibus Regibus Chriſtianis: vt patet in Regibus Hiſpaniæ: *Wee reade not in the New Teſtamente, that Prieſtes or Biſhoppes ought to anoint Kinges. Neither is that order at this daie vſed emongeſt al Kinges, that be Chriſtened: as it appeareth by the Kinges of* Spaine. For they are not annointed. Againe yée ſaie, and that yée bringe in, as a ſpecial good Argumente of your ſide, The Emperoure kneeleth to the Prieſte for Abſolution: *Ergo*, The Emperour is not the Heade of the Churche. Howe maie a man anſweare ſuche Folies, better then with the like Folie. *The Pope him ſelfe, by your owne Decrees, is bounde to Confeſſe his Sinnes, and kneeleth downe to a Simple Prieſte for Abſolution:* For your Canoniſtes ſaie, Papa tenetur Confiteri peccata ſua vni Sacerdoti: Et Simplex Sacerdos poteſt illum Ligare, & abſoluere: *The* Pope *is bounde to confeſſe his Sinnes to ſomme one* Prieſte: *and a* Simple Prieſte *maie bothe Binde him, and Abſolue him.* Ergo, by your owne Concluſion, The Pope is not Heade of the Churche. Suche a handſome Proctour the Pope hathe gotten to promote his Cauſe.

Hermann. de Poteſtate Pa. Ca. 18.

With ſuche Piety ſuffe, M. Hardinge, yée thinke to ouerrenne, and to conquere the woorlde.

The Apologie, Cap. 15. Diuiſion. 2.

Wherefore, if it were lawful for them to doo thus, beinge but Ciuile Magiſtrates, and hauinge the chiefe Rule of Common Weales, what offence haue our Princes at this daie committed, that they being in the like degree, maie not haue leaue to doo the like? Or what eſpecial gifte of Learning, or of Iudgement, or of Holineſſe haue theſe menne nowe, that they, contrarie to the Cuſtome of al the Anciente and Catholique Biſhoppes, who vſed to conferre with Princes, and Peeres, concerninge Religion, doo nowe thus reiecte and caſte of Chriſtian Princes from knowinge of the cauſe, and from theire meetinges?

M. Har-

Affiance in Darkeneſſe.

M. Hardinge.

We anſweare, it was *neuer lawful in any Temporal Prince, to iudge in cauſes of Religion. aNeither did any Prince before this time euer vſe it.

aVntruthe. As it maie eaſily apeare by that, hath ben ſaide before.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

This is an other of your Abſolute Truthes, M. Hardinge. For anſweare whereof, it maie pleaſe you indifferently to weighe, that I haue written a litle before touchinge the ſame.

Part. 6. c. 14 Diu. 4. & 5.

The Apologie, Cap. 15. Diuiſion. 3.

Wel, thus doeing, they wiſely, and warily prouide for them ſelues, and for their Kingdome, which otherwiſe they ſee is like ſhortely to come to naught. For if ſo be they, whom God hath placed in greateſt Dignitie, did ſee, and perceiue theſe mennes practiſes, howe Chriſtes commaundementes be deſpiſed by them, how the Light of the Goſpel is darkened, and quenched out by them, and how them ſelues alſo be ſubtily beguiled, and mocked, and vnwares be deluded by them, and the waie to the Kingdome of Heauen ſtopped vp before them, no doubte they would neuer ſo quietly ſuffer them ſelues, neither to be diſdeined after ſuch a proude ſorte, nor ſo deſpitefully to be ſcorned, and abuſed by them. But nowe through their owne lacke of vnderſtandinge, and through their owne blindeneſſe, theſe menne haue them faſte yoked, and in their daunger.

M. Hardinge.

Biſhoppes (a) can not vpholde their Kingedome by wronge dooinge: (b) that is the waie to pul them downe. Therefore wee are wel aſſured that your Schiſmatical Superintendentſhip can not ſtande, thoughe al the power of the worlde were bente to holde it vp. Your wicked ſtate is not planted of God, and therefore it ſhalbe rooted out. It is God that ruleth: it is God that ſetteth vp, and putteth downe. This ſtate of Chriſtes Church hath continued, and the ſucceſſour of Peter hath gouerned it, whereas the groundleſſe building of al the Heretiques from Simon Magus downewarde to this daie hath failed. Luther is rotten, and his newe found Religion decaied, and the Pope ſitteth in Peters Chaire, and ſo ſhal his ſucceſſours to the ende.

(a) Otherwiſe it were not the Kingdome of Darkeneſſe.

(b) VVhen they be once eſpied: and not before.

Yee woulde menne to beleeue, that Emperoures, and Kinges are deceiued by the Popes and Biſhoppes. But I praie you, what is the cauſe, that Princes can not eſpie theſe deceites (if any ſuche were) as wel as yee? If them ſelues lacke your knowledge, yet haue they wiſe menne aboute them, who for their dueties ſake, and their alleagiance to them, woulde ſoone aduertiſe them, howe by the Biſhoppes they be ſubtilly beguiled, and mocked.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Of the maintinance of your Kingdome, M. Hardinge, Chriſte ſaide vnto certaine of your Forefathers, Hoc eſt tempus veſtrum, & Poteſtas Tenebrarum: *This is your time, and the Power of Darkeneſſe. Blinde they are, and the guides of the Blinde. If the Blind leade the Blinde, they wil bothe fal into the ditche.* The Lion or wilde Bulle, be they neuer ſo cruel, or great of courrage, yet, if yee maie once cleſely couer their eies, yee maie eaſily leade them, whither yee liſte, without reſiſtance. Euen ſo doth the Pope hoodwinke, and blindefolde the Princes of the worlde, and holde them in Ignorance: which don, he maketh them to holde his Stirope, to leade his Horſe, to knele downe, and to kiſſe his Shooe, and to attende vpon him, at his pleaſure. But, if they knewe, either him, or them ſelues, they woulde not doe it.

Luke. 22. Mat. 15.

S. Chryſoſtome ſaith, as it is noted before, Hæretici Sacerdotes claudunt Ianuas Veritatis. Sciunt enim, ſi manifeſtata eſſet veritas, quòd ipſorum Eccleſia eſſet relinquenda: & ipſi de Sacerdotali Dignitate ad Humilitatem venirent popularem: Heretical Biſhoppes *ſhut vp the gates of the Truthe. For they knowe, that, if the Truthe be once laide open, their Churche ſhalbe forſaken: And they from their* Pontifical Dignitie, *ſhalbe brought downe to the baſeneſſe of the people.*

Chry. in Opere imperfecto. Ho. 44.

Petrus Ferrarienſis, in conſideration hereof, complaineth thus, O miſeros Imperatores, & Sæculares Principes, qui hæc, & alia ſuſtinetis, & vos ſeruos Eccleſiæ facitis: Et Mundum per eos infinitis modis vſurpari videtis: nec de remedio cogitatis: Quia prudentiæ, & Sapientiæ non intenditis: *Alas, miſerable are yee, the* Emperoures, and

Petrus Ferrarien. Citatur ab Illyrico. Inter Teſtes Veritatis.

Affiance in Darkeneſſe.

Princes of the VVorlde, *that abide theiſe, and other like things* (at the Popes handes,) *and make your ſelues ſlaues vnto their* Churche. *Yee ſee the worlde is by innumerable waies miſerably abuſed by them: yet yee neuer bethinke your ſelues of any remedie:* Bicauſe yee apply not your mindes to vviſedome, and knovvledge.

Hier. in Eſaia. li. 9. 30.

S. Hierome ſaithe, Vt ſagittent in obſcuro rectos corde. Iſti tantam ſibi aſſumunt Authoritatem, vt ſiue Dextra doceant, ſeu Siniſtra, id eſt, ſiue bona, ſiue mala, nolint Diſcipulos ratione diſcutere, ſed ſe Præceſſores ſequi. Tunc hi, qui priùs decipiebant, nequaquam vltrà ad eos valebunt accedere, poſtquam ſe ſenſerint intellectos: *To ſtrike in the darke them that be ſimple of hart. Theiſe menne challenge vnto them ſelues ſutch Authoritie, that, whether they teache with the Right hande, or with the Leafte, that is to ſaie, whether they teache good thinges, or badde, they wil not haue theire Diſciples, or Hearers, withe reaſon to examine theire ſaeinges, but onely to folowe them, beinge theire Leaders. For then they, whithe before deceiued the people, can no more comme vnto them, after they once perceiue, they be eſpied.*

The Apologie, Cap. 16. Diuiſion. 1.

Uerily, we for our partes, as we haue ſaide, haue donne nothinge in alteringe Religion, vpon either Raſhneſſe, or Arrogancie: nor nothing, but with good leaſure, and great conſideration. Neither had we euer entended to doo it, except both the manyfeſt, & moſt aſſured Wil of God, opened to vs in his Holy Scriptures, and the regarde of our owne Saluation had euen conſtrained vs therevnto. For though we haue departed from that Churche, which theſe menne cal Catholike, and by that meanes geate vs enuie amongeſt them, that want ſkil to iudge, yet is this yenough for vs, and it ought to be yenough for euery wiſe, & good man, and one that maketh accompte of euerlaſtinge Life, that we haue gonne from that Churche, which hath power to erre: whiche Chriſte, who can not erre, tolde ſo longe before, it ſhoulde erre: and whiche we our ſelues did euidently ſee with our eies, to haue gonne from the Olde Holy Fathers, and from the Apoſtles, and from Chriſte him ſelfe, & from the Primitiue and Catholique Churche of God: and we are comme, as neare, as we poſſibly could, to the Churche of the Apoſtles, and of the Olde Catholique Biſhoppes, & Fathers: which Church we knowe, was ſound, and perfite, and, as Tertullian termeth it, a Pure Virgine, ſpotted as then with no Idolatrie, nor with any foule, or ſhameful faulte: and haue directed, according to their Cuſtomes, & Ordinances, not only our Doctrine, but alſo the Sacramentes, and the fourme of Common Praier.

M. Hardinge.

Ye haue treated thereof, after your accuſtomed manner, that is to ſaie, with al Vntruthe, and Lies.

Ye comme in with many gaie woordes. Whereto with guiltie conſcience inwardly yee ſaie yea, thereto with lieinge tongue outwardly doo yee not ſaie naie?

This generation of looſe Apoſtates, inceſtuous Vowebreakers, Sacrilegious Churchrobbers, deſpiſers of al Holineſſe, breakers of the deade mennes willes, ouerthrowers of al anciente order, and diſcipline.

If it be ſo, where be your Signes? where be your Miracles? where be the examples of your rare Vertue, and Holineſſe.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

The reſte of your ſpeache we wil paſſe ouer, as talke of courſe. Touchinge your curious demaunde of Signes, and Miracles, Pope Leo maie anſweare you. For whereas certaine of your Forefathers in olde times ſaide, *If he be the* Kinge of Itrael, *let him comme downe from the* Croſſe, *and wee wil beleeue him:* Pope Leo ſaithe thus vnto them, Non erat veſtræ Cœcitatis arbitrio, Stulti Scribæ, & Impij Sacerdotes, oſtendenda potentia Saluatoris: *Ye fooliſhe Scribes, and wicked Prieſtes, the Power of our Sauioure was not to be ſhewed at the diſcretion of your Blindeneſſe.* God ſheweth his Miracles when, and where, and to whom he wil.

Matt. 27.

Leo in Ser. De Paſſione Domini.

S. Chryſoſtome

S. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, In fine temporis concedenda eſt poteſtas Diabolo, vt faciat Signa vtilia: vt iam Miniſtros Chriſti non per hoc cognoſcamus, quia vtilia faciunt Signa, ſed quia omninò hæc Signa non faciunt: *In the ende of time Power ſhalbe geuen to the* Diuel, *to woorke* profitable Signes, *and* Miracles. *So that then wee cannot knowe the* Miniſters of Chriſte, *by that they woorke* profitable Miracles, *but by that they* vvoorke no Miracles at al. *Ch. in Mat. Hom. 49.*

S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Non dicat, Ideò verum eſt, quia illa, vel illa mirabilia fecit, vel iſte, vel ille: aut quia homines ad memorias mortuorum noſtrorum orant, & exaudiuntur: aut quia illa, vel illa ibi contingunt, &c. Remoueantur iſta, vel Figmenta mendacium hominum, vel portenta Fallacium Spirituum: *Let no man ſaie, Therefore it is true, for that this man, or that man hath wrought this, or that* Miracle: *for that men make theire* Praiers *at the* Toumbes *of our deade, and obteine their deſires: or, for that theſe, or theſe* Miracles *be wrought there, &c Awaie with theſe thinges, they maie be either the* Iuggelinges, and Mockeries of deceitful menne, or els Illuſions of lieinge Sprites. *Auguſt. De Vnitate Eccleſia. Ca. 10.*

Againe S. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Per Signa cognoſcebatur, qui eſſent Veri Chriſtiani, qui Falſi. Nunc autem ſignorum operatio omninò leuata eſt: Magis autem inuenitur apud eos, qui falſi ſunt Chriſtiani: *In olde times it was knowen by* Miracles, *who were the* True Chriſtians, *and who the* Falſe. *But nowe the woorking of Miracles is taken quite away: and is rather founde emong them that be falſe Chriſtians.* *Ch. in Mat. Hom. 49.*

Therefore S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Contra illos Mirabiliarios cautum me fecit Deus meus, dicendo: In nouiſſimis diebus exurgent Pſeudoprophetæ facientes Signa, & Portenta, vt inducant in errorem, ſi fieri poſſit, etiam Electos: *Againſte theſe Moungers of Miracles, my God hath armed me, ſaying: In the later daies there ſhal riſe vp falſe Prophetes woorking Signes, and woonders, to deceiue the Electe of God, if it be poſſible.* *Au. in Joh. Tract. 13. Matt 24.*

Neither is the Goſpel of Chriſte preached this daie vtterly without Miracles. The Blinde ſee: the Doumbe ſpeake: your Idolles are fallen: your Great Babylon is comme to grounde. Theſe, M. Hardinge, if you haue eies to ſee them, are no ſmal Miracles. S. Chryſoſtome ſaithe, The Conuerſion of the vvorlde is a Miracle. S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Modò Caro Cæca con aperit oculos Miraculo Domini: Et Cor Cæcum aperit oculos Sermone Domini: *Newe a daies the Blinde fleaſh openeth not her eies by the* Miracle of our Lorde: *But the* Blinde harte *openeth his eies at the* VVoorde of our Lorde. And againe, Modò Aures Corporis ſurdæ non aperiuntur. Sed quàm multi habent clauſas Aures Cordis, quæ tamen, Verbo Dei penetrante, pateſcant. *Newe adaies the deafe Eares of the Body be not opened: yet many there are, that haue the Eares of theire harte ſhut vp: Which Eares notwithſtanding are opened by entering of the* VVoorde of God. *Chryſ. in t. Cor. Ho. 6. Au. de Verbis Domi. Secun. Mat. Serm. 18. Eodem loco.*

Therefore wee maie rightly ſaie to you with other woordes of S. Auguſtine, Quiſquis adhuc Prodigia, vt credat, inquirit, Magnum eſt ipſe prodigium: qui, mundo credente, non credit: *Who ſo euer yet requireth* Miracles, *to bringe him to the* Faithe, *is him ſelfe a great Miracle: that the woorlde beleeuinge, remaineth ſtil in vnbeliefe.* *Au. De Ciuitate Dei. Li. 22. ca. 8.*

Where as the Phariſeis ſaide of Chriſte, *Lette him nowe comme downe from the Croſſe, and wee wil beleeue him.* S. Hierome ſaithe vnto them, Etiamſi de Cruce deſcenderet, ſimiliter non crederetis: *Yea, althoughe he ſhoulde comme downe from the Croſſe, yet woulde ye not beleeue him.* *Hierony. in Matt. 27.*

But it were a woorld, to behold the glorious countenance of your Miracles, M. Hardinge. Your Croſſes can ſpeake: your Idolles can goe: your Images can light their own Lampes: your Holy vvater is hable to calme the Sea, to chaſe awaie Miſe, & to make barren wemen to conceiue. If you doubte hereof, conferre with M. Cope, one of your owne Louanian companie: or with that woorthy Prelate the Bishop of Verona, your Holy Father Lipomanus. I am aſhamed to remember the thinges, that you are not aſhamed, euen nowe in theſe daies to publiſhe in Writinge. Howe be it, ſutche Religion, ſutche Miracles. S. Hierome ſaithe, Mendacium Antichriſti Chriſti Veritas deuorabit: *The* Truthe of Chriſte *ſhal deuoure, and conſume the* Falſehedde of Antichriſte. *Cope. Di. 1. Pag. 18. Hierony. ad Algaſiam.*

The Apologie, Cap. 16. Diuiſion. 2.

And as wee knowe, bothe Chriſte him ſelfe, and al good menne here-

toſoꝛe haue donne, wee haue called home againe to the Original, and firſte Fundation, that Religion, whiche hathe benne ſowly neglected, and vtterly coꝛrupted by theſe menne. Foꝛ we thought it meete, thence to take the Paterne of reſoꝛming Religion, from whence the ground of Religion was firſt taken: Bicauſe this one reaſon, as ſaithe the moſt ancient father Tertullian, hath great foꝛce againſt al Hereſies, Looke what ſo euer was firſte, that is true: and what ſo euer is later, that is corrupte. Irenæus oftentimes appealed to the Oldeſt Churches, which had ben neareſt to Chriſtes time, and which, it was harde to beleue, had ben in erroure. But why, at this day, is not the ſame common regarde, and conſideration had? Why returne we not to the Paterne of the Olde Churches? Why maie not we heare, at this time amongſt vs, the ſame ſaying, which was openly pꝛonounced in times paſte in the Councel at Nice, by ſo many Biſhoppes, and Catholique Fathers, and no body once ſpeaking againſt it? τὰ ἀρχαῖα κρατείτω: Holde ſtil the Olde Cuſtomes.

M. Hardinge.

(a) Here folowed ſomwhat touchinge the Sacrament, and ſacrifice, which maters are otherwhere anſwered more at large.

Yee laie mutche in your owne commendation, but lies be no prouſes: Yee haue not called Religion home againe to the Original, and firſt Fundation, as yee ſait: but yee haue quite ouerthrowne al true Religion from the fundation. As for your Apiſthe noueltie, yee haue taken the paterne thereof from Satan auctor of diuiſion, the anciente ennemie of Chriſte, and of his true Religion. Wee admitte the ſayinge of Tertullian (thoughe it be not altogeather as yee alleage it) that this reaſon hath greate force againſt al Hereſies. What ſo euer was firſte, that is true, what ſo euer is later, that is corrupte. Of the Bleſſed Sacramente Chriſte ſaide firſte, &c. (a) Contra Praxeam.

(b) Irenæus neuer knewe the diſorders and deformities, that nowe are in the Churche of Rome. (c) vntruth. For as now, it is al vnfaithfully peruerted. (d) Vntruthe manifeſte, and apparente to al the worlde.

Yee woulde ſeeme to be faine, that wee folowed the Aduiſe of Irenæus. Wee are contente with al our hartes. And with Irenæus wee appeale to that Tradition, whiche is from the Apoſtles, whiche (as he ſaithe) is keapte in the Churches by Prieſtes, that ſucceeded them. With Irenæus leauinge other Churches, whoſe ſucceſsions of Biſhoppes it were a longe woorke to rehearſe, wee require to haue recourſe for trial of our Faithe to the Tradition of Doctrine of the Romaine Churche, whiche he termeth, Greateſt Oldeſt, beſte knowen to al, founded, and ſet vp by the two moſte glorious Apoſtles, Peter, and Paule. Wee appeale to the Faithe of that Churche, taughte abroade in the worlde, and by ſucceſsions of Biſhoppes brought downe vnto vs. For to this Churche, (b) ſaithe Irenæus, muſt al the Churche of Chriſte repaire, where ſo euer it be, for that it is the chiefe of al, and for that the Tradition of the true Doctrine, whiche the Apoſtles leafte behinde them, (c) is there faithfully keapte. Wherefore if yee woulde after the Councel of Irenæus reſorte to Rome for deciſion of the Controuerſies, that be betwixte you and vs, and would them to be tried by that ſenſe of Doctrine, (d) whiche hath continued by ſucceſsions of Biſhoppes euen from Peter to Pius the fourthe, nowe Pope, and woulde ſtande to the Authoritie of that See Apoſtolike, al ſtrife were ended, wee ſhoulde be at accorde. But wee haue litle hope yee wil folowe this Godly Councel of S. Irenæus that bleſſed Martyr, whoſe body your brethren the Huguenotes of Fraunce, vilanouſly burned at Lions, Anno Dom. 1562. after it had reſted there thirtene hundred yeres and more. Lib. 3. ca. 2. Lib. 3. ca. 3.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Fred. 3. c. 3. Valde longũ eſt, omnium Eccleſiarum enumerare Succeſſiones.

The Preeminence that Irenæus gæueth to the Churche of Rome, ſtandeth in Conſente, and Vnitie, and Agrement of Doctrine, not in Superioꝛitie, oꝛ Gouernemente ouer al the woꝛlde. Foꝛ pꝛoufe whereof, yee maie vnderſtande, that Irenæus in the ſame place likewiſe ſpecially noteth the Churche of Smyrna planted by Polycarpus: and the Churche of Epheſus, planted by S. Iohn: and generally ſundꝛy other great Churches, planted by menne of Apoſtolical Dignitie: vnto which he willeth vs in like maner to repaire: and not onely to the Churche of Rome.

Ced. Theod. Ls. 16. Ti. 3.

The Emperoure Theodoſius willeth his Subiectes, to conſoꝛme themſelues in Doctrine, not onely to the Romaine Biſhop, but alſo, either to Nectarius the Biſhop of Conſtantinople: oꝛ to Timotheus the Biſhop of Alexandria: oꝛ to Pelagius the Biſhop of Laodicea, oꝛ to Diodorus the Biſhop of Tharſus: oꝛ to Amphilochius the Biſhop of Iconium: oꝛ to Optimus the Biſhop of Antioche: oꝛ to Helladius the Biſhop of Cæſarea: oꝛ to Otreius

the

The Paterne of Faithe.

the Bishop of Melite: or to Gregorius the Bishop of Nice: or to Terennius the Bishop of Scythia: or to Marmarius the Bishop of Martianopolis. Unto al, and euery of theise notable great Churches the Emperour willeth al other inferiour Churches to repaire.

By sutche Examples the Fathers in the Councel of Calcedon were contented, to direcle theire Faithe. For thus they brake out in a general shote, Omnes ita credimus: Leo Papa ita credit: Cyrillus ita credit: Leo & Anatolius ita credunt: *Al wee beleeue thus: Pope* Leo *beleeueth thus:* Cyrillus (*the Bishop of* Alexandria) *beleeueth thus:* Leo, *and* Anatolius (*the Bishop of* Constantinople) *beleeue thus.* *Con. Chalcedon. Actio. 2*

So saithe Tertullian, Videamus, quod lac à Paulo Corinthij hauserint: ad quam Regulam Galathæ sint recocti: quid legant Philippenses, Thessalonicenses, Ephesij: quid etiam Romani de proximo sonent: quibus Euangelium Petrus, & Paulus sanguine quoque suo signatum reliquerunt: *Let vs se, what milke the* Corinthians *sucke of* S. Paule: *after what Paterne the* Galathians *were reformed: what the* Philippians *reade, what the* Thessalonians, *what the* Ephesiens: *what sounde the* Romaines *geeue, that are so neare vs: vnto whom* Peter, *and* Paule *haue leafte the* Gospel *sealed, and confirmed with theire Bloud.* *Tert. Contra Marcion. Lib. 4*

In like sorte writeth Gregorie Nazianzene of the Church of Cæsarea: Cuiuslibet Ecclesiæ, tanquam Corporis Christi, habenda est ratio: maximè verò nostræ (Cæsariensis) quæ & ab initio fuit & nunc est, Mater propè omnium Ecclesiarum: Eam Christiana Respublica, velut Centrum suum Circulus, vndique obseruat, non solùm propter Orthodoxam Doctrinam vbiq; ab initio prædicatam, sed etiam propter conspicuam Concordiæ Gratiam, quam diuinitus accepit: *Wee muste make greate accompte of al* Churches, *euen as of the* Body of Christe: *but specially of this our* Churche of Cæsarea: *for that it hath benne from the beginninge, and stil is in a* maner the Mother of al Churches. *The whole* Christian cõmon VVeale *beholdeth this* Churche *of euery side, euen as the* Circle *beholdeth the* Center: *not onely for the* Catholike Doctrine, *that from thence hath ben published euery where, but also for the notable* Grace of Concorde, *that it hath receiued from aboue* *Nazianze. Epist. 30.*

Thus the Anciente Godly Fathers willed the Faithful, to haue recourse vnto euery of these Churches, of Smyrna, of Ephesus, of Constantinople, of Alexandria, of Laodicea, of Tharsus, of Iconium, of Antioche, of Cæsarea, of Melite, of Nice, of Scythia, of Martianopolis, of Corinthus, of Galatia, of Philippi, of Thessalonica, of Ephesus, and of Rome: not for any secrete vnremoueable vertue in them conteined, but onely as Irenæus saith, for that the Tradition, and Doctrine of the Apostles had continued there stil without corruption. *Iren l. 3. c. 3. In qua semper conseruata est ea quæ est ab Apostolis Traditio.*

Therefore Tertullian saithe, Percurre Ecclesias Apostolicas, apud quas ipsæ adhuc Cathedræ Apostolorum suis locis præsidentur: apud quas ipsæ Authenticæ Literæ eorum recitantur, sonantes vocem, & repræsentantes faciem vniuscuiusque. Proxima est tibi Achaia: habes Corinthum. Si non longè es à Macedonia, habes Philippos, habes Thessalonicenses. Si potes in Asiam tendere, habes Ephesum. Si autem Italiæ adiaces, habes Romam: vnde nobis quoque Authoritas præstò est: *Renne ouer, and beholde the* Apostolike Churches, *whereas the* Apostles Chaires *are yet stil continued, and where as the* Authentical VVritinges *of the* Apostles *are openly pronounced, soundinge out the voice, and representinge the face of ethe one of them. The next Countrey to you is* Achaia: *There haue you the* Church of Corinthe. *If yee be not farre from* Macedonia, *there haue yee the* Churche of Philippi, *and the* Churche of Thessalonica. *If yee maie goe ouer into* Asia, *there haue yee the* Churche of Ephesus *If yee border neare to* Italie, *there haue yee the* Churche of Rome: *from whence we also (dwelling in* Aphrica) *maie with speede receiue Authoritie.* *Tertul. De Præscriptio. contra Hæreticos.*

Againe, touching the name of a Churche Apostolike, whereby yée would euermore seeme to vnderstande the Churche of Rome, he saithe thus: Tot, ac tantæ Ecclesiæ, vna est illa ab Apostolis Prima, ex qua omnes. Sic omnes primæ, & omnes Apostolicæ, dum vnam omnes probant vnitatem: *Theise so many, and so greate* Churches, *are al that same one* firste Churche, *planted by the* Apostles, *from whence issued al the reste. And so are they al* firste Churches, *and al* Apostolique, *in that they al folowe one* Vnitie. *Tertul. De Præscriptio. contra. Hæreticos.*

Thus the Anciente Fathers taughte the people to reforme them selues by the Example, and Doctrine, not onely of the Churche of Rome, but also of al other Notable Apostolique Churches.

Neither were they directed onely by the Authoritie of Aunciente Churches, but also by the Authoritie of certaine particulare vvoorthy menne. For resolution in cases of doubte, somme sente to S. Augustine: somme to S Hierome: somme to the Bishoppes of France: somme to the Bishoppes of Rome: and somme to others. S. Hierome thus writeth vnto S. Augustine, Tu, vt Episcopus in toto Orbe notissimus, debes hanc promulgare Sententiam, & in Assensum tuum omnes Coepiscopos trahere: *Then, as the moste notable* Bishop *in al the woorlde, oughtest to publishe this* Decree, *and to drawe al thy* Felovvbishoppes *vnto thy Iudgemente.* Yet was S. Augustine the Bishop of Hippo in Aphrica, and not of Rome. Certainely, whereseoeuer any flame of Truth, and Learninge maie appeare, out of what place soeuer it breake forthe, menne wil of them selues willingly, and grædely flæ vnto it.

Euse. li. 5. c. 3 Aug. Epi. 11.

Dam. Hier. Hieron. ad Algasiam.

Damasus the Bishop of Rome, wrote vnto S. Hierome in doubtful Cases, to knowe his Councel. S. Hierome him selfe saithe, Filius meus Apodemius de Oceani Littere, atque vltimis Galliarum finibus, Roma præterita, quæsiuit Bethlehem: *My sonne* Apodemius, *commynge from the shoare of the* Ocean Sea, *and from the furthest Coast of* France, leauinge Rome, *sought for* Bethlehem, (*where I dwel, to conferre with mee.*)

Ambr. li. 10. Epist. 83.

Thus wæ se, Godly menne, desirous to knowe the Truthe, and to be resolued of theire doubtes, leaste the Bishop of Rome with al his Cardinalles, and wente eighte hundred miles further, to seke Councel of poore Hierome. Likewise S. Ambrose saithe. Post Alexandrinæ Ecclesiæ, Episcopi quoque Romanæ Ecclesiæ Definitionem, per Literas plærique meam adhuc expectant Sententiam: *After the Resolution of the* Churche of Alexandria, *and also of the* Bishop *of the* Churche of Rome, *many menne yet write Letters vnto me, and woulde also vnderstande my iudgemente.*

Apud Atha. Tomo 1.

Pope Liberius him selfe writeth thus vnto Athanasius, the Bishop of Alexandria: Si mecum sentis quæso subscribas: quò certiores reddamus, num eiusdem nobiscum suffragij sis, eademque statuas de Vera Fide: vt & ego securior efficiar, Tuaque mandata indesinenter obeam: *If yee be of my Iudgemente, then I beseche you to subscribe* (your name vnto these Articles) *that I maie be out of doubt, whether you thinke, as I thinke, touchinge the* True Faithe: *and, that I maie be the better confirmed in mee selfe, and maie euermore* doo your Commaundementes *without delaie.* Here you se, your Head of the Churche offereth him selfe with al his

Bernar. Epist. 238.

Vniuersal Povver, to be at the Commaundemente of an other inferiour Bishop. Bernarde beinge but an Abbate, writeth thus vnto Pope Eugenius: Aiunt, non vos esse Papam, sed me. Et vndique ad me confluunt, qui habent negotia: *They saie, that I am* Pope, *and not you. And on euery side, they, that haue suites, comme renning vnto mee.*

Hie. in Apologia aduc. Ruffin. Nazian. ad Simplicium.

Thus were menne wont to seke for Councel, not onely at Rome, but also, where so euer it mighte be founde. And therefore was Origen called, Magister Ecclesiarum, *The* Enformer, *or* Maister *of the* Churches. S. Basile, Canon Fidei, *The Ruler of the Faithe.* Eusebius Samosatensis, Regula Veritatis, *The Standerde of the Truthe.* Athanasius, Orbis oculus, *The eye of the woorlde.* And in doubtful Cases, they were as diligently sought vpon, as the Pope.

Nazian ad Heronem. Greg. Li. 12 Ind. 7. ca. 9.

Here, by the waie, it were a worthy mater, to consider somme of the Profounde, and Learned Resolutions, that wæ haue receiued from the See of Rome. Augustine the Italian Monke, whom somme haue called the Apostle of Englande, demaunded of Pope Gregorie, by waie of great councel, whether a Woman with Childe mighte be Baptized, or no: and howe long afterwarde it might be lawful for her to comme to the Churche.

Inter Decr. Zacharie. Inter Decr. Alexand. 3. part. 30 c. 2 Si maculam in oculo. Inter Decr. Grego. 2. Ad Bonifacium.

Bonifacius, the Apostle of Germanie, demaunded the like questions of Pope Zacharie, whether, Iaies, Dawes, Storkes, Beauers, Otters, Hares and Vvilde Horses be mans meate, or no: what order were to be taken with Man or Horse, hauinge the Fallinge sickenesse: at what time of the yære it maie be lawful, or wholesome for folkes, to eate Bacon: and, if a man liste to eate it Rawe, how olde it ought to be, before he eate it: What maie be donne, if a Priestе haue a blacke in his eie: Who maie hallovv oile: Who maie weare the Palle: At what time, in what place, in what sorte, ouer, or vnder, openly, or secretely, it maie be lawful to weare it.

To these, and other like doubtful, and profounde questions, the Pope hath gemen

outs

The Paterne of Faithe.

oute his Answeares, and that in sutche graue, and solemne sorte, as if no other Creature vnder Heauen, besides his Holinesse, were hable to vnderstande sutche highe Mysteries.

There fells out sommetime an Odious quarel betwæne the Thomistes, and Scotistes, whether the Bletsed Virgine were conceiued in sinne, or no. The one side, saide: yea: the other cried, nay. There were learned menne of bothe sides: Parties grewe: the Scholes were enflamed: the worlde was troubled: no Conference, no Doctour, no Councel was hable to quiet the mater, and to make them frendes. The Scotistes alleged for them selues the Councel of Basile: The Thomistes cried out, the Councel of Basile was disorderly summoned, and therefore vnlawful. In the middes of this heate, Pope Sixtus toke vpon him, to be Iudge betwæne them, and to determine the botome of the cause. In conclusion, when al the worlde lokte to be resolued, and satisfied in the question, the Pope commaunded bothe the Thomistes, and the Scotistes, to departe home, and to dispute no more of the mater, but to let al alone: and so leaft them as doubtful, as he founde them. This was a resolution for a Pope.

Augustin. De Ciuita. li. 20. c. 26. Viues.

A greate contention felle out betwæne them, of Ratispone in Germanie, and the Abbie of S. Denise in France, whether of them had the whole Body of S. Denise: for that either parte saide, and bare the worlde in hande, they had the whole. To Rome they wente: The Pope sate sadly in Iudgemente, and examined theire Allegations, and grewe to conclusion: and in the ende, gaue his aduised, and definitiue Sentence, that either part, as wel they of France, as also the others of Germanie, had the whole Body of S. Denise: and that who so euer would saie nay, should be an Heretique. Of sutche substance, and certainetie are the Oracles of your See of Rome.

Io Calui. de Reliquys.

Somme of your frendes haue saide, Veritas per Christum Cathedræ alligata est: non personis: Christe *hath fastened his* Truthe, *not to the* Popes *personnes, but to his* Chaire. Meaninge thereby, that the Pope, what so euer he decrée, or saie, sittinge in S. Peters Chaire, can neuer erre. And thus, by this Doctours Iudgemente, wæ are taught, to gæue credite rather to the Popes Chaire, then to the Pope.

Nico. Cusa. Ad Bohem. Epist. 2.

Yet neuertheleste, the same Irenæus, whom yæ haue here alleged, openly reproued Pope Victor: and S. Ciprian likewise reproued Pope Steuin: for that they thoughte, notwithstandinge their Chaire, they were in errour. Erasmus, speaking of the Answeare of Pope Innocentius vnto the Councel of Carthage, saithe thus, In hac Epistola & Dictionem, & Ingenium, & Eruditionem, tali Præsule dignam cogimur desiderare: *In this Epistle wee misse bothe Eloquence, and Witte, and Learninge meete for sutche a Prelate,* S. Ambrose saithe, In omnibus cupio seqai Ecclesiam Romanam. Sed tamen & nos Homines sensum habemus. Ideò quod alibi rectiùs seruatur, & nos recte custodimus: *I desire in al thinges to folowe the* Churche of Rome. *Howe be it, wee our selues, for that we be menne, haue vnderstandinge, and Iudgemente too. Therefore, what so euer is better keapte in other places, wee doo wel to keepe the same.*

Eu. l. 5. c. 26 Cyprian ad Pompeium. Inter Epist. Aug. Ep. 91. Eras. Ambro. De Sacr. l. 3. c. 1

But touchinge the state of Rome, that nowe is, Arnulphus saide openly in the Councel of Remes, Cùm hoc tempore Romæ nullus sit, vt fama est, qui Sacras Literas didicerit, qua fronte aliquis illorum docere audebit, quod non didicerit? *For as muche as nowe a daies, as it is reported, there is none in* Rome, (neither Pope, nor Cardinal) *that hathe Learned the* Scriptures, *with what face dareth any of them to teache vs that thinge, that he him selfe neuer learned?*

Arnulph. in Con. Remen.

It is not sufficiente to saie, The Pope sitteth in Peters Chaire. As Antichriste maie sitte in place of Christe, so maie Iudas sitte in place of Peter. S. Hierome saithe, Bethel, quæ priùs vocabatur Domus Dei, postquam Vituli in ea positi sunt, appellata est Bethauen, id est, Domus inutilis, & Domus idoli: Bethel, *that before was called the* House of God, *after that* Hieroboams golden Calues *were sitte vp in it, was called* Bethauen, *that is to saie, a* House vnprofitable, *and the* House of an Idole. And what marueile is it, if the like haue happened to the Churche of Rome.

Hie. in Osa. lib. 1. Cap. 4.

Therfore wæ thinke it better, to examine, and trie the groundes of your Religion, by the VVoorde of God, that is one, and Vniforme, and endureth for euer, then by your touche of Rome, that is so vncertaine, and so mutable, and so often hath deceiued

vs S. Cyprian saithe, Si ad Diuinæ Traditionis Caput, & Originem reuertamur, cessat error humanus: *If wee returne to the* Head, and Original *of the heauenly* Tradition (which is the VVoorde of God) *al humaine erreur giueth place.*

Cyprian ad Pompeium.

Touching the reste of your nedeleste talke, our Brethren in France, whom in your pleasante manner ye cal Huguenotes, burnte not the Body of Irenæus. They knewe, he was a Blessed Martyr of God: and his Body sommetime the Temple of the Holy Ghoste. Without any reproche, or vilanie, either donne, or meant to that Holy Father, if they burnte any thinge, whiche also maie wel be doubted, they burnt onely an Idole, that you had so vnreuerently set vp against the Glorie of God. Chrysostome saithe, Ioseph moriens ait. Ossa mea efferetis hinc vobiscum: Ne Aegiptij memores beneficiorum eius, Corpus Iusti haberent in occasionem Impietatis: Ioseph *lieinge in his deathe bedde, saide vnto his Children, and Nieuews, yee shal carrie my bones with you from the out of* Egypte: *Leste the* Egyptians *remembringe the good thinges, he had donne, shoulde vse that good mannes* Body, *to an occasion of* VVickednesse, or Idolatrie.

Chry. in Genes. Ho. 67.

Aug. de mirabili. Sacræ Scriptu. li. 1. Cap. vltimo.

So saithe S. Augustine, Nemo conscius erat Sepulchri Mosis, ne populus, si cognouisset, vbi esset, adoraret. *No man was made priuie to* Moses Graue: *leste, if the people had knowen, where his* Body *had beene, they shoulde adoure it.*

In the former replie. Arti. 17.

Your obiection of the Sacrifice is otherwhere answeared more at large. S. Augustine saithe, Nunc manibus nō offerimus Carnem: Sed Corde, & ore offerimus Laudem: *Nowe wee offer not vp fleash with our handes: but with harte and mouthe wee offer praise.* Againe he saithe, Intùs habeo Sacrificium, quo flectam Deum meum: *Within mee selfe I haue a* Sacrifice, *wherewith I maie pacifie my* God.

Aug. contra Iudæos. ca. 1. August in Psal. 41.

The Apologie. Cap. 17. Diuision 1. & 2.

When Esdras went about to repaire the ruines of the Temple of God he sente not to Ephesus, although the most beautiful & gorgeous Temple of Diana were there: and when he purposed to restore the Sacrifices, and Ceremonies of God, he sent not to Rome, although peraduenture he had heard, that there were the solemne Sacrifices called Hecatombæ, and other called Solitorilia, Lectisternia, and Supplicationes, & Numa Pompilius Ceremonial Bookes, or Manuals, or Portueses, conteining the seruice of their Goddes. He thoughte it ynough for him, to set before his eies, and folowe the Paterne of the Olde Temple, which Salomon at the beginninge builded, accordinge as God had appointed him, and also those olde Customes and Ceremonies, whiche God him selfe had written out by special woordes for Moses.

The Prophete Aggæus, after the Temple was repaired againe by Esdras, and the people might thinke, they had a very iuste cause to reioice on their owne behalfe, for so great a benefite receiued of Almighty God, yet made he them al burst out into teares, bicause that they which were yet aliue, and had sene the former building of the Temple, before the Babylonians destroied it, called to mind, how far of it was yet, from that beautie, & excellencie, which it had in the old times past before. For then in dede would they haue thought the Temple worthily repaired, if it had answeared to the ancient Paterne, & to the Maiestie of the firste Temple. S. Paule, bicause he would amend the abuse of the Lordes Supper, which the Corinthians euen then begonne to corrupte, he set before them Christes Institution, to folowe, saying: I haue deliuered vnto you, that thing, that I first receiued of the Lorde. And when Christe confuted the errour of the Phariseis, yee must, saithe he, returne to the firste beginninge: for from the beginning it was not thus. And when he found great fault with the Priestes for their vncleannesse of life, and couetousnesse,

and

and would cleanse the Temple from al euil Abuses, This house, saithe he, at the firste beginninge it was a house of Praier, wherein al the people might deuoutly, & sincerely pray togeather. And so it were your part to vse it now also at this daie. For it was not builded to the end it should be a denne of theues. Likewise al the good & cõmendable Princes mentioned of in the Scriptures, were praised specially by these wordes, that they had walked in the waies of their Father Dauid: That is, bicause they had returned to the Firste and Original Fundation, & had restoared the Religion euen to the perfection wherein Dauid leaft it. And therfore when we likewise saw, that al thinges were quite troden vnder foote by these men, & that nothing remained in the Temple of God, but pitieful spoiles, & decaies, we reckened it the wiseft, and the safest waie, to set before our eies those Churches, which we knowe for a suretie, that they neuer had erred, and yet neuer had, neither Priuate Masse, nor Praiers in a strange, and barbarouse Language, nor this corruption of Sacramentes, and other toies.

And, for so mutch as our desire was, to haue the Temple of the Lord restored anewe, we would seeke none other Fundation, then the same, which, we knew, was longe agoe laide by the Apostles, that is to wit, Our Saueour Iesus Christe. And, for so mutch as we heard God him selfe speaking vnto vs in his Worde, and saw also the notable Examples of the Olde, and Primitiue Churche: againe, howe vncertaine a mater it was, to waite for a General Councel, and, that the successe therof wold be mutch more vncertaine: but specially, for so mutch as we were most ascertained of Goddes Wil, and therefore counted it a wickednesse to be too careful, and ouercombered aboute the Iudgementes of Mortal Menne, wee coulde no longer stande takinge aduise with fleashe, and bloud, but rather thought good, to doo the same thing, that both might rightly be donne, & hath many a time benne donne, as wel of other good men, as also of many Catholique Bishoppes: that is, to remedie our owne Churches by a Prouincial Synode. For thus we knowe, the Olde Fathers vsed to put maters in experiẽce, before they came to the Publike Vniuersal Councel. There remaine yet at this daie sundrie Canons, written in Councelles of Free Cities, as of Carthage vnder Cyprian, as of Ancyra, Neocesarea, and Gangra, whiche is in Paphlagonia, as somme thinke, before that the name of the General Councel at Nice was euer heard of. After this fashion in Olde time did they spedily meete with, and cutte shorte those Heretiques, the Pelagians, and the Donatistes at home, by Priuate Disputation, without any General Councel. Thus also, when the Emperoure Constantius euidently, and earnestly tooke parte with Auxentius, the Bishop of the Arians faction, Ambrose, the Bishop of the Christians, appealed, not vnto a General Councel, where he sawe no good could be done, by reason of the Emperours mighte, and greate labour: but onely to his owne Cleargie, and people, that is to saie, to a Prouincial Synode. And thus it was decreed in the Councel at Nice, that the Bishoppes shoulde assemble twice euery yere. And in the Counsel at Carthage it was decreed, that the Bishoppes shoulde meete togeather in eche of their Prouinces, at leaste once in the yeere: whiche

whiche was donne, as saithe the Councel of Chalcedon, of pourpose, that if any Errours, or Abuses had happened to springe vp any where, they might immediatly at the first entrie be destroied, euen where they firste began. So likewise when Secundus, and Palladius reiected the Councelof Aquileia, bicause it was not a General, and Common Councel, S. Ambrose Bishop of Millaine, made answeare, that no man oughte to take it for a newe, or strange mater, that the Bishoppes of the Weast Parte of the worlde did cal togeather Synodes, and make Priuate Assemblies in their Prouinces, for that it was a thinge before that time not seldome vsed by the Bishoppes of the Weast Church, & by the Bishoppes of Græcia vsed oftentimes, and commonly to be donne. And so Charles the Greate, beinge Emperoure, helde a Prouincial Councel in Germanie, for puttinge awaie Images, contrarie to the Seconde Councel at Nice. Neither pardie euen amongest vs is this so very a strange, and a newe trade. For we haue had ere nowe in Englande Prouincial Synodes, and haue governed our Churches by home made Lawes. What shoulde one saie more? Of a truthe, euen those greatest Councelles, and where moste Assemblie of people euer was (whereof these menne vse to make such an exceding reckening) compare them with al the Churches, which throughout the worlde acknowledge & professe the Name of Christe, & what els, I pray you, can they seme to be, but certaine Priuate Councelles of Bishoppes, and Prouincial Synodes? For admitte peraduenture Italie, France, Spaine, Englande, Germanie, Denmarke, and Scotlande meete togeather: if there wante Asia, Græcia, Armenia, Persia, Media, Mesopotamia, Egypte, Ethiopia, India, and Mauritania, in al whiche places there be bothe many Christian menne, and also Bishoppes: howe can any man, beinge in his righte minde, thinke sutche a Councel to be a General Councel? And, where so many partes of the worlde doo lacke, howe can they truely saie, they haue the consente of the whole worlde? Or what manner of councel weene you, was the same laste of Trident? Or howe mighte it bee termed a General Councel, where as oute of al Christian Kingedomes, and Nations, there came vnto it but onely fourtie Bishoppes, and of the same, some so cunninge, that they mighte be thoughte meete, to bee sente home againe, to learne their Grammare, and so wel learned, that they had neuer studied any parte of Diuinitie?

M. Hardinge.

(a) Vntruthe. For in many respects it was vnlawful.

Your waitinge for a general Councel, was not vncertaine. For at the settinge foorthe of your Apologie, it was farre and wel entred, and almost ended. What so euer inconuenience thereof shoulde followe, yee oughte not to haue refused it (a) beinge in al respectes lawful.

Your assurance of Gods wil is none. That is but your common bieworde, as it hath alwaies beene of Heretikes. Ye ought to haue shewed good euidence for your beinge sure of Gods wil, before ye attempted these great and dangerous changes in Religion. Neither becommeth it you to cal the determinations of a General Councel, the iudgementes of mortal men, so muche as concerneth declaration of necessarie pointes of Faithe, but the prompting and teachinge of the Holy Ghoste.

(b) Vntruth, by many examples soone reproued.

As for your prouincial Synode, it was none. Synodes can not be keapte without Bishoppes. Before yee chalenge the name of a Synode for your packing and huddling togeather, yee must proue your selues Bishoppes, whiche yee are not able to doo. What so euer yee saie, (b) there were neuer good men, not Catholiques Bishoppes, that keapte prouincial Synodes, contrarie to approued and lawful General Councels.

(c) In

(c)as your Synode is most contrary. Neither can yee pretende, that yee folowed any olde fathers, puttinge thinges in experience before the comminge to an Vniuersall Councel.

(c) vntruth. For our Synode is most agreable to the Olde Councelles.

Your Councel prouincial holden in Germanie by Charles the greate, againste the seconde Nicene Councel general, (d) is a false forged matter, as the Booke againste images is, whiche one Elias Philippus Modonensis sonne, Caluine, Illyricus, and other Heretikes haue fathered vpon that moste godly, and Catholike Emperoure.

(d) A greate Vntruthe. As it may soone appeare.

The Councel, whiche you meane, was a Godly, and a Catholike Councel, holden at Franckforde by Pope Adrian, and Charles the greate, against the wicked Councel of the Heretikes named Imagebreakers, whiche they helde a litle before that at Constantinople, whiche of those Heretikes was called the seuenth, and general, of the Catholikes *Pseudosynodus*, that is to saie, the false or forged Councel. Of bothe these Councels, thus writeth Abbas Vspergensis, so muche commended of Melanchthon: The Councel which a fewe yeres before, was assembled at Constantinople, in the time of Irene and Constantine her sonne, of them called the seuenth and Generall (in this Councel holden at Frankforde) was repealed and put away by contente of al, as voide and superfluous, so as from thence foorthe it should be named neither the seuenth, nor ought els.

Vntruth. For the woordes be plaine, *Pseudosynodus* pro Adorandis Imaginibus, *abiecta est. Ado.*

If you beleeue not this as the witnesse of a Catholike writer, then beleeue Anselmus Ridanus earnest professoure of your owne the newest *Gospell*. Who writeth that Adrian the Bishop of Rome, and Kinge Charles, at the Councel holden at Frankforde execrated, and accursed as Heretical, the Councel of the Empire of Constantinople and of the Greekes, whiche they helde for the abolishinge of Sainctes images. Those be his very woordes. Beleeue Peucerus Philip Melanchthons Sonne in lawe writinge, that the Councell of Nice, was kepte by common contente of the Greeke Emperoure and of Charles. If the Seconde Councel of Nice, whiche was altogeather for Images, was holden by contente of Charles, howe helde he a Councel in Germanie for puttinge away Images, againste the Councel of Nice? Beleeue Carion, and specially Partaleo of Zurich, a man of your owne the moste Euangelical Religion, who vppon warrante of the authoritie of Regino writeth, that the Councell of Frankforde abrogated, and disanulled the Greekes Councel, that was againste the worshipp of Images. Briefely, howe falsely you and sundrie other of your sect haue herein belied that woorthy Prince Charles the Greate, it maie easely appeare by that Paulus Aemylius writeth of him: That he sente twelue Bishoppes out of Fraunce to the Councel then holden at Laterane in Rome, in whiche the Imagebreakers false named and forged Councel was abregated.

Where of Generalle Councelles yee make priuate and prouincial Synodes, yee doo besides leasinge, reason, and custome of the Churche. A Councel is not accompted general bicause Bishoppes of all Countries vnder Heauen be assembled, (e) but bicause many bee assembled, and all be lawefully called. Els in times, when Heresies raigne the Church should neuer haue the necessarie remedie of a general Councel: for alwaies Heretikes woulde refuse to come to it, as yee haue, to come to the late Councel at Trente.

(e) By this rule the Councel of Trisente was not General.

In Persia, Media, Egypte, Mauritania, I weene, yee finde fewe Bishoppes at this date not manye in the other Countries, whiche yee recken, and those in manner altogeather ignorant and schismatikes. Yet the Patriarkes of Assyria, or Syria Orientalis, and of Armenia, who of late yeeres were at Rome, haue for theire Prouinces bothe subscribed to the Councel of Trente, (f) and receiued the whole Decrees of the same for their peoples.

(f) Vntruthe, withoutshame or measure.

Your reporte of fourtie Bishoppes onely presente at the Councel of Trente, and of their slender learninge, is as true, as your Doctrine contrary to that Councel is, (g) that is to saie, in plaine termes, starke falste. It is wel knowen there were at this late Councel of Trent in this Popes time, wel neare two hundred Bisheppes.

(g) Vntruthe manifest Read the Recordes, and Subscriptions of the same Councel.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

What hope wée might conceiue of your Late Chapter of Trident, wé were sufficiently warned by the former, holden vnder Pope Paulus. 3 and Pope Iulius. 3 wher in, not withstandinge your many yéres studie, and great conference of so many, and so Learned, and so excellente, and so mutche a doo, yet in the ende, yée were neuer hable, neither to suppresse your open stewes, nor to auoide your Priestes-Concubines, nor to cause your Bishoppes to be residente vpon theire Charge, and to doo their duties, nor to resolue vs, whether the Pope be aboue the Councel or the Councel aboue the Pope. In the Summons, and firste Entrie of your Assemblie there, Pope Paule had forgotten Christe, and leaft him quite out of Companie, and supplied the want of him, with the Authoritie of Peter, and Paule as it is plaine, and euident by his Bulle. An other of your Reuerende Fathers there, maketh Marie the Blessed Virgine, Equalle with Christe, and calleth her, his moste Faithful Felowe: Fidelissimam Christi Sociam. An other of the same Companie telleth vs, that the Pope is the Lighte, that is comme into the worlde: Papa Lux venit in Mundum. To be shorte, the whole Issue, and Conclusion

Omnipotētis Dei benignitate, & Apostolorum Petri, & Pauli Authoritate freti. Ambros. Catharinus. Cornel. epis. Bitontinus.

Conclusion of al your doings there, by the ful agrément of al your Fathers, hangeth vpon the Popes onely pleasure, as by expresse wordes vttered in the firthe Session of the same Councel it maie appeare. And, by your Doctrine, the Pope maie not be controlled, what so euer he do, neither by the Cleregie nor by al the whole World. And, what so euer the Pope shal wil to state, or passe, your Doctoures telle vs, His onely VVil muste stande for Lawe.

Sessione. 6. Salua semper in omnibus Sedis Apostolicæ Authoritate. 9. qu. 3. nemo Io. Sleidan. Anno 1551. Illyri. in protesta. aduers. Conc. Trident. pag. 24 August. De Vnitate Eccl. Ca. 10. Eodē lib. ca. 7

For these, and other like causes, bothe the Emperoure Charles. 5. and also Francise the Frenche King, diuide sundrie other Christian Princes, made open Protestation against your saide Tridentine Conuenticle, beinge then remoued to Bononia, and said, it was no lawful General Councel, but onely an Assemblie of a fewe certaine persons, to serue one mannes affection, and to seke for gaine. Suche is the opinion, that your owne Princes haue of your Assemblies.

It becommeth vs not (yée saie) to calle the determinations of your General Councelles, the Iudgementes of Mortal menne. Yet it became S. Augustine to calle the same, Concilia Contendentium Episcoporum: *The* Councelles *of quarrellinge* Bishoppes.

And againe, Humanarum contentionum animosa, & pernicioſa certamina: *The bolde and hurtful Contentions of worldly quarrells.* If it like you not, that your Councels should be called the Iudgementes of menne, then calle them, as S. Augustine bothe, *The Councelles of quarrellinge Bishoppes.* Or, *The hurtful Contentions of worldly quarrels.* But what nede we many wordes? Your owne Panormitane saithe, Leges Summorum Pontificum, & Conciliorum appellantur Statuta Humana: & sic ſtrictè non poſſunt dici Ius Diuinum: *The Lawes, and Determinations of* Popes, *and Councelles, are called the Determinations, and* Lawes of menne: *and so in streite manner of speache, they cannot be called the* Lawes of God.

Extra. De Consangui. & Affin. Non debet.

Yée saie, Wee are no Bishoppes, and therefore haue no Authoritie to holde a Synode. Euen so your Fathers in olde time saide, that S. Paule was no Apostle, and that S. Basile, and S. Hilarie were no Bishoppes. Of S. Paule, it is plaine, therfore he saithe in his owne Defense, *Am not I an Apostle? Am not I a free man? Haue I not seene the Lorde Iesus?* S. Hilarie saithe of him selfe, Auxentius de Persona mea calumniatus est, damnatum me à Saturnino, audiri, vt Episcopum, non oportere: *The* Heretique Auxentius *laieth a quarrel to my persone: and, for as muche as* Saturninus the Heretique, *hath condemned me, he saithe, I muste not be hearde,* as a Bishop.

Basil. Ep. 72 Ξύνοδον ἀθετοῦντων προσαγορεύουσι, μὴ κτλ. *Hila. Cōtra Arianos & Auxentium.*

1. Corin. 9.

Likewise the Arian Heretiques vsed to say, that S. Basile and other like Learned, and Catholique Fathers of that time, were no Bishoppes. S. Basile therof writeth thus: *They calle the Councel of Catholique* Bishoppes, a Councel of vvicked menne: *neither wil they once vouchsaue to name them* Bishoppes, *leaste they shoulde seeme to allowe the Decrees, that they haue made against them. And they challenge them to be no* Bishoppes, *for that, as they saie, they are the Captaines of a wicked Hereſie.* In like sorte he writeth vnto Patrophilus of the Heretique Eustathius: *He taketh great heede, lest he should happily be forced to calle vs* Bishoppes. Thus, M. Hardinge, in denieing vs to be Bishoppes, yée do none otherwise, but as other your Predecessours haue donne before you.

Basil. Epist. 82 Ἐπισκόπους οἱ ὅτι αἱρετικῶν, φησὶ ποιμὰς προσηγόρευσαν.

Of the Bishops, and Prelates of your side, I wil saie nothing. What your owne frendes haue thought of them, I haue saide before.

As for vs, it shalbe sufficient, if wee be onely the voice of a Crier in the Wildernesse. S. Paule, to auouche his Apostleship, saide openly thus, Gratia Dei sum id quod sum: *By the* Grace of God, *I am, that I am.*

Marc. 1. 1. Cor. 15.

Yée saie, A Prouincial Councel maie not repeale a Councel General: as if the Authoritie of your Councelles stode onely in number, and not in Truthe. Howe be it, the Simple Truthe of God shal ouerweigh Falsehedde, be it neuer so General. But euen thus saide Auxentius, the Arian Heretique, against S. Hilarie. These be his wordes, Ego quidem, pijssimi Imperatores, existimo, non oportet sexcentorum Episcoporum Vnitatem, post tantos labores, ex contentione Paucorum hominum refricari: *My moste* Graceous Lordes, *in my Iudgemente, it is not meete, after so greate paines taken, for the contentious striuinge of a fewe, to hazarde the consente, and Vnitie of* Sixe hundred Bishoppes. Thus the Heretique Auxentius alleged greate multitudes of his Companions againste

Councels General repealed by Prouincial.

againſte S. Hilarie and the Catholiques: whiche, he ſaide, were but a fewe.

Notwithſtandinge, it were no harde mater, to ſhewe euidente Examples of General Councelles, that haue benne ouerruled by Particulares. The General Councel of Nice determined, as you ſaie, but you ſaie it vntruely, that al appeales, oute of al partes of the worlde, ſhoulde lye to Rome. Yet the Particulare, or Prouincial Councel of Aphrica ſaithe, Si prouocandum putauerint, non prouocent, niſi ad Aphricana Concilia. Ad tranſmarina autem qui putauerit appellandum, à nullo intra Aphricam in Communionem recipiatur: *If they ſhal thinke it good to appeale, let them not appeale, but onely to ſuche* Councelles, *as ſhal be holden within* Aphrica. *But who ſo euer ſhal appeale beyonde the* Seas (that is to ſaie, to the Biſhop of Rome) *let noman within* Aphrica *receiue him to his* Communion. *Concil. Aphric. ca. 92.*

The General Councel of Nice durſte not to diſſolue Prieſtes Mariage: The Particulare Councel of Carthage diſſolued it vtterly. The order of Priuate, or Auricular Confeſſion, whiche in your fantaſie, was receiued generally throughout the whole Churche of God, was notwithſtanding quite abolished in the Church of Conſtantinople, onely by the particulare aduiſe of Nectarius. *Soz. l. 1. c. 23 Concil. Carthag. 2. c. 2. Soc. li. 5. c. 9.*

Your Blacke Friers in their Particulare Chapters, haue controlled, and cut of the General Determination of the Councel of Baſile, touchinge the conceiuing of our Lady in Original ſinne. And Albertus Pighius, by his like Particulare Authoritie, telleth you, that as wel this Councel of Baſile as alſo the Councel of Conſtance, beinge bothe General (in that they ſaide, The Councel is aboue the Pope) *Decreed plainely againſte* Nature, *againſte the manifeſte* Scriptures, *againſte al* Antiquitie, *and againſte the* Catholique Faithe of Chriſte. *Aug. de Ci. li. 20. ca. 26. Viues. Alber. Pigg. in Hierarc.*

Certainely, the Truthe of God is not bounde, neither to Perſonne, nor to Place. Where ſo euer it be, either in fewe, or in many, it is euermore Catholique, euen becauſe it is the Truthe of God. In the Councel of Conſtantinople it is written thus, Definierunt pariter, vt, ſi quid in Prouincia quahbet emergeret, Prouinciæ Concilio finiretur: *The fathers agreed al togeather, that, if any mater ſhould happen to growe in the* Prouince *by a* Councel of the Prouince *it ſhoulde be ended.* Likewiſe ſaithe Iſidorus: Manifeſtum eſt, quòd illa, quæ ſunt per vnamquanque Prouinciam, ipſius Prouinciæ Synodus diſpenſet: ſicut Niceno conſtat decretum eſſe Concilio: *It is cleare, that maters happening in euery* Prouince, *by a* Prouincial Synode *maie be ordered: as it is concluded in the* Councel of Nice. Likewiſe S. Ambroſe ſaithe, Sciebant eſſe conſuetudinem, vt in Oriente, Orientalium eſſet Concilium: Intra occidentem, Occidentalium: *They knewe, it was a Cuſtome, that a* Councel of the Eaſt Biſhoppes *ſhoulde be holden in the* Eaſte, *and a* Councel of the VVeaſte Biſhoppes *ſhoulde be holden aparte in the* VVeaſte. *Hiſt. Trip. lib. 9. ca. 13. Iſid. in Præfacione in Concilia. In concilio Aquilein.*

S. Auguſtine ſaithe, Literas Epiſcoporum, & per Sermonem fortè ſapientiorum cuiuſlibet in ea re peritioris, licet reprehendi, ſi quid in eis fortè à Veritate deuiatum eſt: Biſhoppes Letters, *if they ſwarue any thinge from the* Truthe, *maie be controlled by the diſcretion of any other man, that hath more ſkil in the mater.* *Aug de Baptiſm. contra Do. li. 2. c. 3.*

In like ſorte Abbate Panormitane your owne Doctoure ſaithe, as it hath benne alleged before: In concernentibus Fidem, etiam dictum Vnius Priuati eſſet præferendum dicto Papæ, ſi ille moueretur melioribus rationibus Noui, & Veteris Teſtamenti: *In maters concerninge the Faithe, the ſaieinge of any one* Priuate Man *were to be taken before the ſaieinge of the* Pope, *if he were moued with better reaſons of the* Olde, and Newe Teſtamente, *then the* Pope. *Extra de Electi. & Electis poteſt. Significaſti. & Abb.*

Howbeit, wee haue not by our Prouincial Councel remoued, or ſhaken the Authoritie of any one Anciente General Councel, M. Hardinge. For of al the Anciente Councelles, that haue benne, touchinge the caſes, that lie betweene vs in controuerſie, yee are not yet hable to allege one. Wee haue vpon good cauſes remoued your Vanities, and vnſeemely Folies: and haue reſtoared againe, ſo mutche as in vs lie, the Decrees and Canones of the Ancient Councelles. Hincmarus the Bishop of Remes, ſaithe thus: Cùm duarum, aut trium Prouinciarum Præſules in vnum conueniunt, ſi Antiquorum Canonum inſtitutione muniti, aliquid prædicationis, aut dogmatis inſtituunt, quod tamen ab Antiquorum Patrum dogmatibus nón diſcrepit, Catholicum eſt, quod faciunt: *Hincmarus Rem. ca. 20.*

faciunt: & fortasse dici potest, Vniuersale: *When the* Bishoppes, *of two, or three* Prouinces *meete togeather, if they by the warrante of the* Olde Councelles, *appointe any mater of preaching or doctrine, so that it disagree not from the doctrine of the anciente Fathers, it is* Catholike, *that they doo, and perhaps maie be called* Vniuersal. **Suche are our doinges, M. Hardinge: they agree with the doinges of the** Anciente Fathers, **and haue the warrante of the** Councelles **of the** Primitiue Churche: **and therefore they are Catholique.**

The credite of the Emperoure Charles Booke, **reportinge the Decrees of the** Councel **of** Frankfoorde, **touchinge the** Adoration of Images, **I leaue wholy to the indifferente discretion of the Reader.**

It was printed, not at Geneua, **as you surmise, but in** Parise: **The better out proueth it, not to be forged, by many good, and likely Reasons. An anciente copie of the same is yet stil to be seene in** Rome **in** Laterane, **euen in the** Popes owne Librarie. Augustinus Steuchus, **the Maister of the same** Librarie, **reporteth the same. The** Emperoure Ludouicus, Sonne **vnto** Charles, **wrote a Booke, yet extante, and remaininge in** France, **to like purpose.** Eckius **also beareth witnesse vnto the same** Booke **of the** Emperoure Charles, **although vntruely, and guilefully, as his manner is. For he saith, that** Charles **wrote foure** Bookes in Defence of Images: **where as in deede the** Bookes **are directly written against** Images.

Aug. Steuc. De Donat. Const. l. 1. c. 6

Ecki. De Imaginibus.

Although ye thinke Eli Phili, **or I knowe not, who, maie easily be charged with corruption, and forgerie, yet why the** Pope **him selfe shoulde corrupte, and forge his owne** Booke **in his owne** Librarie, **against him selfe, it were harde for you to shewe good Reason.**

The Councel of Frankforde (**ye saie**) was Godly and Catholique, and made Decrees against Image breakers, in the behalfe of Images. **Yet notwithstandinge** Auentinus **saith.** In Frankfordiensi Concilio Scita Græcorum, de Adorandis Imaginibus, rescissa sunt: *In the* Councel of Frankforde the Græcians *Decrees, for the* Adoration of Images, *were quite abolished.* Regino **saithe,** Pseudosynodus Græcorum, quam pro adorandis Imaginibus fecerunt, reiecta est: *The* False Councel *of the* Greekes, *whiche they had made for* Adoration of Images, *was repealed in the* Councel of Frankforde. **Likewise** Ado **saithe,** Pseudosynodus, quam Græci Septimam vocant, pro Adorandis Imaginibus, abdicata est penitus: *The* False Councel, *whiche the* Greekes *calle the seuenthe, wherein Decrees were made* for the Adoration of Images, *was there vtterly put awaie.*

Auentin. Fol. 337.

Regino.

Ado.

Hincmarus, **the** Archbishop of Remes, **speakinge of the same** Councel **of** Fraukforde **saithe thus:** Pseudosynodus Græcorum destructa est, & penitus abdicata. De cuius destructione, non Modicum Volumen, quod in Palatio adolescentulus legi, ab eodem Imperatore Romam est per quosdam Episcopos missum: *The* False Councel *of the* Greekes *was repealed, and vtterly ouerthrowen in the* Councel of Frankforde. *Whereof, when I was a yonge man, I readde a prety bigge Booke in the* Popes Palaice in Rome: *whiche Booke was sente thither by certaine* Bishoppes *from the saide* Emperoure Charles.

Hincmar. ca. 20.

Certaine wordes of the saide Leuvde, **or** False Councel **of the** Greekes, **amongest others are these:** Qui timet Deum, Adorat Imagines, vt Filium Dei: Qui Adorat Imaginem, dicit: hoc est Christus, non peccat: peccat, qui non Adorat Imaginem. Qui non Adorat Imaginē, est Hæreticus, Imago Adoranda est eodem cultu, quo Sancta Trinitas: *He, that feareth* God, adoureth an Image, *as he woulde* adoure the sonne of God: *He that* adoureth an Image, *and saithe,* This is Christe, *offendeth not: he offendeth that* adoureth not an Image: *He that* adoureth not an Image, *is an Heretike: we must* adoure an Image *with the same Reuerence, wherewith wee* adoure the Holy Trinitie.

Citantur. in Libro Caro. Magni.

Nowe, whether these, and other like worthy saieinges, and sentences were to be reproued, or no, it maie please you, M. Hardinge, to consider.

That Councel (**ye saie**) is called General, not, whereunto al Christian Nations doo resorte in deede: but whereunto al Christian Nations are lawfully summoned. **As this answeare is true, and not denied, so by the same, your late** Councel of Tridente, **maie in no wise be called** General. **For, what lawful Summones sente your** Pope Pius, **either to** Preter Gian into Ethiopia: **or to other Bishoppes, and Christians in** India **or** Europa **onely, and that not whole, excepted) what Sommones sente he into any other Kingdome, or Countris**

A Councel Generall.

trie of the woꝛlde?

But yꝛ saie, In Persia, Media, Egypte, Mauritania, and in other Countries adioininge, there are fewe Christians at this day to be founde. Yet the Authoures of Nouus Orbis, discribinge the state of the woꝛlde, saie thus, In al Countries whither so euer yee comme, there be somme Christians. Againe, In India many Kinges, and Princes professe Christe. And againe, In Armenia, and Cilicia, in a manner, the whole people is Christened. Onely they are subiecte to the Cham of Tartarie. Their Priestes be maried: And, who so is vnmaried, maie be no Priestе. *Nouus Orbis.* *Fol. 324.*

Yꝛ saie, The Patriarkes of Assyria, and Armenia (that neuer saw, neither the one Countrie, noꝛ the other) were at Rome (yꝛ knowe not, when) and subscribed to all the Articles of your Councel of Tridente. O M. Hardinge, yꝛ can geate no greate credite by open mockerie. It is no harde matter foꝛ youre Pope, oute of his owne garde to make sutche Patriarkes ynoughe, one foꝛ Hierusalem, an other foꝛ Constantinople, an other foꝛ Alexandria, an other foꝛ Antioche, an other foꝛ Sidon, an other foꝛ Tyrus: and I maruell, if there be not somme Patriarke, one, oꝛ other, foꝛ Sodome and Gomorre. These poꝛe Holy, and Hungry Fathers are contented at al times, to yꝛlde their Submissions, and to sette their handes to what so euer they shalbe required, and in the names of those Countries, that they scarcely euer hearde of, to confesse, the Pope their maister, to be al, and moꝛe then al. With sutche vaine shewes, and visardes, it pleaseth you to smoothe the woꝛlde.

If yꝛ doubte hereof, yꝛ maie easily finde, that one Augustinus de Roma in your late Councel of Basile, bare the name of the Archebishop of Nazareth in Iurie: And yet, poꝛe man, had he neuer seene Nazareth in al his life. Likewise, that one Petrus Paludensis, a poꝛe Frere Obseruante, not longe sithence, bare the name of the Patriarke of Hierusalem: And yet hadde he neuer seene Hierusalem, noꝛ knewe, whiche waie to goe to it. But what neede moꝛe Examples? Youre owne Ceremoniarie of Rome telleth you thus, Consueuerunt Antiqui ponere Patriarchas quatuor Ecclesiarum Principalium, inter Episcopos Cardinales mixtim. Nostro tempore ponuntur immediatè post Cardinales. Sunt enim quodammodò Titulares: *They were woonte in olde times, to place the* Patriarkes *of the foure Principal Churches togeather with the Cardinal Bishoppes, one with an other. But nowe adaies they are placed nexte beneathe al the* Cardinalles. *For in a maner they haue nowe nothinge els, but the names of* Patriarkes. Sutche gheastes were your Patriarkes of Assyria, and Armenia, that subscribed to your Councel of Tridente. They bare the names of theise Countries, M. Hardinge: but the Countries they had neuer seene. *Concil. Basilien. Petrus Paluden. Patriar. Hierosolymitanus.* *Ceremoniar. l. 1. section. 8*

It is moste certaine, that the Christian Patriarkes, and Bishoppes of those Countries, will neither Communicate with the Pope, either in Sacramentes, oꝛ in Prayers: noꝛ any wise yꝛlde to his Authoꝛitie, noꝛ geue any manner of honoure, oꝛ reuerence to his personne: nomoꝛe then to Mahomete oꝛ Antichriste: as I haue sufficiently shewed befoꝛe.

Touchinge the Number of Bishoppes, presente at youre Former Assemblie at Tridente, I referre me selfe to the Recoꝛdes of the same. If yꝛ finde there moꝛe then Fourtie Bishoppes, I am contente to lose my credite. And yet of the same number, Blinde sir Roberte of Scotlande, as I haue saide befoꝛe, and M. Pates of Englande were surely poꝛe Bishoppes, God knoweth, endewed onely with bare names, without Bishoprikes. In your later Assemblie, two of youre Holy Fathers were slaine there presently in Aduouterie. By meane of whiche misfoꝛtune, youꝛ nounber by so mutch was abated. *Flacius Illyricus. In protestatione aduersus conci. Trident.*

These be the greate woꝛthies of the woꝛlde: These, Cornelius Bitontinus, one of the same Companie, calleth the Starres of the Churches, and the Mightie Armie of Goddes Angelles. These haue power to determine matters, that they neuer vnderstode, by Authoꝛitie onely, but not by knowledge. *Alphon. aduersus haereses. li. 1. cap. 4*

Alphonsus de Castro, as I haue shewed you befoꝛe, saithe thus, *It is certaine, that somme Popes be so voide of Learninge, that they vnderstande not the* Grammare Rules. Erasmus, speakinge of sundꝛie the greate Learned of youre syde, saithe thus, Sibi videntur *Erasmus. In epistolam Hierony. ad Euslochium*

The building of Goddes Church.

videntur Semidei, miro ſupercilio præ ſe deſpicientes Grammaticos: Qui ſi Grammaticæ litaſſent, non ad hunc modum ſe pueris deridendos propinarent: *They thinke them ſelues* halfe Goddes, *and with highe lookes they deſpiſe* poore Grammariens. *But if they had wel Learned their* Grammare, *they woulde not offer ſuche occaſions, that Children, and Babes ſhoulde ſcorne at their folie.*

Concerning the whole mater, your Doctours of Sorbona **in** Pariſe **haue concluded thus,** Vt Concilium legitimè congregetur, ſufficit, quòd ſolennitas, & forma Iuris ſolenniter ſit ſeruata. Quia, ſi quis trahere velit hoc in diſputationem, vtrum Prælati, qui ibi ſedent, habeant Rectam Intentionem, & vtrùm ſint Docti, & vtrùm habeant Scientiam Sacrarum Literarum, & animum obediendi Sanæ Doctrinæ, eſſet proceſſus in infinitum: *That the* Councel *be lawfully aſſembled, it is ſufficient, that the Solemnitie, and forme of Law be ſolemnely obſerued. For if a man woulde caſte doubtes, whether the* Biſhoppes, *that ſitte in* Councel, *haue a good Meaninge, and whether they be Learned, and whether they be skilful in the* Scriptures, *and whether they haue a minde to obeie ſounde Doctrine, or no, then wee ſhoulde neuer make an ende.*

Articul. 22.

Theſe be they, M. Hardinge, to whom yée would haue vs to géue eare, what ſo euer they ſaie, euen as to the Secretaries of the Holy Ghoſte. **But** S. Auguſtine **ſaithe,** Eccleſiæ inter nos agitur cauſa, non mea Eccleſia in nullo homine ſpem ponere, à ſuo dicit Redemptore: *It is the* Churches *cauſe, that wee talke of, it is not mine. The* Churche *hath learned of her* Redeemer, *to put no truſt in any man.*

August. contra Creſcon. lib. 3. cap. 79.

The Apologie. Cap. 18. Diuiſion. 1.

Howe ſo euer it bee, the truthe of the Goſpel of Ieſus Chriſte dependeth not vpon Councelles, not as S. Paule **ſaithe, vpon the Iudgementes of Mortal Creatures. And if they, whiche ought to be carefull for** Goddes Church, **wil not be wiſe, but ſlacke their duetie, and harden theire heartes againſte** God, **and his** Chriſte, **goeinge on ſtil to peruert the righte waies of the** Lorde, God **will ſtirre vp the very ſtones, and make children and babes cunninge, that there maie euer be ſomme, to confute theire lies.**

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Hereto M. Hardinge anſweareth nothing els, but thus, The Counsel is the Schoole of Truth: The Biſhops cannot foreſlowe their duetie: The Church of Rome cannot erre. **Which tales wée haue ſo often, and not without wearineſſe heard already,** Petrus de Palude, **emongeſt other your Doctours ſaithe,** Non eſt credendum, Eccleſiam Romanam erraſſe à Fide. Ipſa enim poteſt è contrario cum Chriſto dicere, Ego Teſtimonium perhibeo de meipſa. Teſtimonium meum verum eſt: *No man maie beleeue, that the* Churche of Rome *maie erre from the* Faithe: *Contrarywiſe that* Churche *maie ſaie with* Chriſte, I beare vvitneſſe of mee ſelfe. And my vvitneſſe is iuſte, and true **Therefore ſo long, as the** Churche **of** Rome **can ſpeake for her ſelfe, there is no doubte, but al is wel.**

Petrus De Palude, De Poteſta. Papæ. Arti. 4.

The Apologie. Cap. 18. Diuiſion. 2.

For God **is hable (not onely without** Councelles, **but alſo, wil the** Councelles, **nil the** Councelles) **to maineteine, and aduaunce his owne** Kingdome. Ful many be the thoughtes of mannes heart (**ſaith** Salomon) but the Counſel of the Lord abideth ſtedfaſt: There is no wiſdome, there is no knowledge, there is no counſel againſt the Lord. Things endure not **ſaithe Hilarius,** that be ſet vp with mannes woorkemanſhip: By an other manner of meanes muſt the Churche of God be builded and preſerued: For that Church is grounded vppon the Foundation of the Apoſtles, and Prophets, and is holden faſt together by one corner ſtone, which is Chriſt Ieſus.

Hilarius in Pſalm. 126.

M. Hardinge.

Where yee ſaie, that by an other manner of meanes the Church of God muſt be builded and preſerued

ſeeme

The building of Goddes church.

ſhewe vs what other meanes they are, and wee muſte ſaie, yee are very cunninge menne, who correct, I wil not ſaie, *Magnificat*, but Chriſtes owne ordinaunce for gouernemente of his Church, who hathe ordeined Apoſtles, Prophetes, Euangeliſtes, Shepeherds, and Teachers (as is before mentioned) *In ædificationem Corporis Chriſti*, To the buildinge vp of the Body of Chriſt, which is his Church. Yee ſhal pardone vs if wee beleeue S. Paule before you. Wee ſee what is the marke yee ſhoote at, that the lawful ſucceſſoures of the Apoſtles, Prophetes, and Euangeliſtes, and the lawful Shepeherdes, and Doctoures beinge putte from the buildinge of Chriſtes Body the Churche, your ſelues maie take the wooike in hande, and gouerne all. Set your heartes at reaſte, it ſhal not be ſo.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

In déede Chriſt hath ordeined Apoſtles, Prophets, Euangeliſtes, Paſtours and Teachers, for the gouernment of his Church: notwithſtandinge the ſame be not alwayes allowed to ſitte in Councelles, nor be alwaies knowen by Rochetes or Miters. If God had not prouided other Paſtours, and Feeders, beſides your Prelates the whole Churche might ſterue for hunger. S Paules Wordes be true: but your idle Conſtructions are vntrue. Wee finde not faulte with Goddes Ordinance: but wee reioice in Goddes Mercie, for that it hath pleaſed him, to viſite his people, and to diſcouer the multitude of theſe Vanities, wherewith you haue ſo longe, and ſo vncourteouſly beguiled the worlde. Therefore wee correcte not Magnificat, M. Pardinge, as you ſaie: but rather wee humbly ſinge, Te Deum laudamus, *and reioice in* God *our* Saueoure. The right, and onely waie of buildinge Goddes Houſe, is, to laie the Fundation thereof vpon the Euerlaſtinge vvoorde, and vvil of God. S. Paule ſaithe, *Other Fundation no man can laie, but the ſame that is laide already: which is* Chriſte Ieſus. The Prophet Eſaie ſaithe, To the Lavve (of God) and to the Teſtimonie. *If they ſpeake not accordinge to this Woorde, they ſhal haue no morninge Lighte.* Therfore S. Hilarie ſaithe, as it is alleged in the Apologie, Aliter extruenda, aliter cuſtodienda Eccleſia eſt: Fundamentum eius ſuper Prophetas, & Apoſtolos collocandum eſt. Eccleſia ita à Deo, id eſt, Doctrinis Dei ædificata, non concidet: *Otherwiſe muſt the* Church *be built, and otherwiſe muſt it be keapt. The Fundation of it muſt be laide vpon the* Apoſtles, *and* Prophetes. *The* Churche *being thus built by* God, *that is to ſaie, by the* Doctrine of God, *ſhal neuer falle.*

* By this reckeninge, it appeareth not, that God euer ordeined Popes, or Cardinalles, to builde his Churche.

1. Corin. 3.
Eſai. 8.
Hilarius in Pſalm. 126.

The Apologie, Cap 19. Diuiſion. 1.

But marueilous notable, and to very good pourpoſe, for theſe daies, bee S. Hieroms wordes: Whom ſo euer (ſaithe he) the Deuil hath deceiued, and entiſed to fal a ſlepe, as it were with the ſweete, and deadly enchauntments of the Maremaids the Sirenes, thoſe perſons dooth Goddes Woorde awake vp, ſaieing vnto them: Ariſe thou that ſleapeſt, liſt vp thee ſelfe: and Chriſt ſhal geeue thee light. Therfore at the comming of Chriſt, of Gods Word, of the Eccleſiaſtical Doctrine, and of the ful deſtruction of Niniue, and of that moſt beutiful Harlot, then ſhal the people, which heretofore had benne caſt in a traunſe vnder their Maiſters, be raiſed vp, and ſhal make haſt to goe to the Mountaines of the Scripture: and there ſhall they finde Hilles, I meane Moſes, and Ioſua the Sonne of Nun: other Hilles alſo, which are the Prophets: and Hilles of the Newe Teſtamente, which are the Apoſtles, and the Euangeliſts. And when the people ſhall flee for ſuccour to ſutch Hilles, and ſhal be exerciſed in the reading of this kind of Mountains, though they finde not one to teach them (for the harueſt ſhalbe great, but the labourers few) yet ſhal the good deſire of the people be wel accepted, in that they haue gotten them to ſutch Hilles: and the Negligence of their Maiſters ſhalbe openly reproued. Theiſe be S. Hieromes wordes, and that ſo plaine, as there nedeth no Interpretour. For they agree ſo iuſte with the thinges, wee nowe ſee with our eies, haue alreadie come to paſſe, that wee maie verily thinke, he ment to foretel, as it were, by the Spirite of Prophesie, and to painte before oure face,

Hieronym. in Naum. cap. 3
Epheſ. 5.

the Vniuerſall ſtate of our time: the falle of the moſte gorgeous Harlot Babylon: **the repairing againe of** Gods Church: **the blindneſſe, & ſlouth of the** Biſhops, **and the good wil, and forewardneſſe of the people. For, who is ſo blinde, but he ſeeth, theſe menne be the** Maiſters, **by whome the people, as ſaithe S.** Hierome, **hath bene leadde into errour, and lulled a ſleepe? Or, who ſeeth not, that** Rome, **that is their** Niniue, **which ſommetime was painted with faireſt colours, nowe, her bizarde beinge pulled of, is bothe better ſeene, and leſſe let by? Or, who ſeeth not, that good menne, beinge awaked, as it were, out of their deade ſleepe, at the light of the Goſpell, and at the voice of** GOD, **haue reſorted to the** Hilles of the Scriptures, **waitinge not at all for the Councelles of ſuche** Maiſters?

M. Hardinge.

Ye wreaſte the ſaieinge of S. Hierome to your purpoſe, that is to ſaie, ſo as it maie ſeeme to be ſpoken againſte the Churche, that nowe is, wherein ye make him a Prophete. And that this place might ſounde the more againſt the Clergie, to the commendation of the people, and to ſtirre them to reade the Scriptures: after your accuſtomed manner yee ſticke not to adde ſomewhat of your owne in one place: to take awaie a little of the Doctoute in an other place: to alter the woordes in an other place. Who looketh ſo narrowly for trial of this, as your ſecretarie thought maliciouſly, when he wrote it: by diligent conference of this Apologie with S. Hierome he ſhal finde it. 1.150.

Nowe, concerninge the right ſenſe of the place S. Hieromes intente was not, to foretel and painte before our face (as you ſaie) the vniuerſal ſtate of our time, but to tell, and declare the meaning of the Prophet Nahum, (a) ſignifieinge the ſtate of the time nowe paſte, to witte, the time of Chriſtes firſte comminge into the worlde: for the woordes doo expreſſely ſpeake thereof. After S. Hieromes expoſition, by Niniue, that Prophete meaneth the worlde: by the Aſſyrian Kinge, the Deuil. And there he propheciеth the ruine of the worlde, and of the Deuil at the comminge of Chriſte. S. Hierome (b) ſpeaketh neuer a woorde of youre Harlotte Babylon, whereof yee and your vnlearned Miniſters haue neuer conne bablinge, meaninge thereby the Holy Romaine Churche. 1.10.

(a) vntruth. For S. Hierome in the ſame place ſaithe, *Hæc in Conſummationem Mundi magis complentur &c. Hucuſq; de mũdi ruina.*

(b) vntruth. for he ſpeaketh oftétimes of her: and ſaith plainly, that Rome is Babylon.

Firſte you Sir Defender, that penned this geare, haue plaide a falſe parte by diuidinge the one member of the ſentence into twoo: Or rather by puttinge in one woorde, and leauinge out an other. For, where S. Hierome hathe thus, *Et conſummationis Niniue ſpecioſiſſima quondam Meretricis*, whereby he meante the vndooinge of the Deuils power in the worlde once, that is to ſaie (c) before the commioge of Chriſte, a moſte beautiful harlotte) that you mighte geue occaſion of reproche to the Romaine Churche, which falſeficinge the Doctoures ſenſe you vnderſtande by Niniue, you haue ſet it foorth thus, *Et conſummationis Niniue, & ſpecioſiſſima meretricis*. Then you deſcant vpon it, as thoughe S. Hierome had ſo written, and ſaie that he ſetteth before our face the falle of the moſte gorgeous Harlot Babylon, whiche you interprete to be Rome. And then further corruptinge S. Hieromes ſenſe, you make him to ſpeake of the repairinge againe of Goddes Church, as though at this daie it were by default of the Catholike Clergie fallen downe, and ſhoulde be ſet vp againe by you and your Miniſters, alſo of the blindeneſſe of the Biſhoppes of our time, that they be the maiſters by whome the people hathe benne lead into errour, and lulled a ſleepe. And hereto ye adde, as ſaithe Hierome, where S. Hierome ſaithe not ſo neither of the maiſters at Chriſtes firſt commioge, but of the Deuil, who broughte the people a ſleepe, by whom he vnderſtandeth (d) not the people that liueth nowe, but them that were deceiued by the Deuil vnder euil maiſters, before the commioge of Chriſte. In Comment. in Nahum Cap. 3.

(c) As thoughe ſithence the Birthe of Chriſte, there neuer had ben, neither Niniue nor Babylon, nor Ignorance, nor Negligẽce in the Clergie.

(d) No doubte, if there be credite ſuffieient in this Commentarie.

But becauſe this Defender thinketh he hathe acquited him ſelfe like a Clercke by alleaging this place out of S. Hierome againſte the Catholike Churche, I requite all the learned to reade ouer what S. Hierome writeth vpon the ende of the Prophete Nahum, from theſe woordes of the text, *Brucus irruit & euolauit &c.* foorthe to the ende of the Chapter, and moſte diligently to marke that goeth immediatly before the place by this defender alleaged. As for thee, good reader, that vnderſtandeſt not the Latine tongue, I aſſure thee, S. Hierome ſpeaketh thoſe woordes of * Heretikes, & of teachers of euil Doctrine, of ſuche as wil not heare the voice of the Churche, of whiche ſorte this newe Engliſhe Clergie is. And in that diſcourſe he commendeth to true beleeuers, not onely the Hilles, that is, the written Scriptures, but alſo the Doctrine of the Churche (as thou ſeeſt in the allegation put in the Apologie) and before that he commendeth likewiſe *Latibula Doctorum*, the Caues of the Doctoures, in whiche the faithful people alſo as by flying to the Hilles, couche them ſelues ſafe from danger of the Deuil ſtirrer of Hereſies. So that if the place bee well ſcanned, by that allegation they ſhal ſeeme to haue made a rodde to whippe them ſelues. The whole place beinge ouer longe to recite here, a ſentence or twoo, that are ſpecially meant of ſuche as they be, may ſuffiſe. In Nahum Cap. 3.

* As thoughe the Popes Clerkes were not Heretiques and teachers of Falſe doctrine.

Væ itaq; his &c. Woe then to thoſe, whiche are teachers of peruerſe Doctrine in Niniue, by whiche

is ſignified

Rome. Niniue. Babylon.

is ſignified the worlde. And aptly to them it is ſaide, thy Shepeheardes haue ſlepte, for they haue geuen ſleepe to their eies, and ſlomberinge to their eielyddes. And therefore haue they not founde a place for our Lorde, nor a Tabernacle for the God of Iacob. Neither haue they heарde out of Ephrata, that is to ſaie *Frugifera Eccleſia*, the fruiteful Churche. Nor haue they founde the Churche in the thickettes of the woddes. Neither onely the Shepeheardes of this rifferaffe (*miſticij huius*, he meaneth by ὁ συμμικτὸς, whiche is the woorde of the ſeuenty tranſlatours, al ſortes of people deceiued by falſe teachers) and of the locuſte (they are the captaine Heretikes) which in time of froſt ſitteth in the hedges, haue ſlepte: but by the Kinge of Aſſyrians (who is the Diuel) they haue benne lulled aſleepe. For alwaies it is the ſtudie of the Diuel, howe he maie bringe aſleepe waking ſoules. Thus S. Hierome.

Nowe I reporte me to thoſe that haue eies to ſee, whether our newe Cleargie maie not ſeeme thoſe, whom the Diuel lulled aſleepe (gladly I vſe their owne terme) in their newe deuiſes, in their owne liked conceites, in their Schiſmes, and Hereſies, in their vniuſte poſſeſsion of Benefices, and Biſhoprickes, thoſe yet liuinge, to whome the righte belongeth, in their preſumption of that office they are not duely called vnto, in their malice towarde the Churche, in the continual ſatiſfyinge of their fleaſhly luſtes, and in their vnlawful and lecherous embracinges.

Let them feare the dreadful ſaieinge of S. Hierome folowing ſtreight after their allegation: *Non eſt ſanitas contritioni tuæ, &c.* There is no healthe for thy bruze, thy woonde ſwelleth. Therfore the rifferaffe of Niniue cannot be healed, becauſe he laieth not downe his pride, and the wounde is alwaies freshe, and daiely he is wounded whiles the Deuil ſtrike at him. And when al commeth to al, there is no healthe for his bruze. For although he ſeeme to him ſelfe hole, yet is his ſoule broken, and cruſhed with the bitle of the whole earthe, that tounceth downe vpon it. and it is not healed, bicauſe continually it is lifted vp with pride) But if it become humble, and ſubmit it ſelfe to Chriſte, a contrite and humble harte God deſpiſeth not. Thus deſcribeth S. Hierome theſe menne. Neither let them ſaie, they ſubmit them ſelues to Chriſte, whome and whoſe Goſpel they haue ſo mutche in their mouthes, vntil they folowe his Doctrine, faieinge of the gouernoures of his Churche. He that heareth you, heareth me: and he that deſpiſeth you, deſpiſeth me. And this mutche for anſweare to the place of S. Hierome.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Here is a marueilous worke. Sir defender ſingeth diſcant, and quiteth him ſelfe like a Clercke, He altereth S. Hieromes minde, He ſaithe S Hierome ſaithe ſo, whereas S. Hierome ſaithe not ſo. He of proude Niniue, hath made the Churche of Rome, He of the Diuel, hath made Antichriſte. He babieth about Babylon. He diuideth one ſentence into two. He putteth in one woorde, and leaueth out an other. He is lulled aſleepe. He ſcattereth his rifferaffe. He doothe, and ſaithe, **I knowe not what, what ſo euer it ſhal pleaſe, M. Pardinge of his courteſie to reporte.**

Touchinge this heinous imagined corruption, and altering of S. Hieromes **minde,** S. Chriſoſtome **ſaithe,** Qui mendax eſt, neminem putat verum dicere, ne ipſum quidem Deum: *He that him ſelfe is a lier, imagineth, that no man ſaithe the Truthe, no not God him-ſelfe.* *Chryſoſto. in Mat. H. 19.*

With ſutche corruption, and change of woordes, Palladius, **a lewde felowe, thought him ſelfe ſommetime hable to charge** S. Hierome. S. Hieromes **woordes therof are theſe:** Concionatur, me eſſe Falſarium: me Verbum non expreſſiſſe de Verbo: pro Honorabili, dixiſſe Chariſſimum. Hæc, & huiuſmodi nugæ mea crimina ſunt: *He preacheth, and publiſheth abroade, that I am a Falſarie: that I haue not preciſely tranſlated woorde for woorde: That I, in ſtedde of this woorde,* Honorable, *haue written theiſe woordes,* deerely Beloued. *Theſe thinges, and ſutche trifles are laide to my charge.* *Hiero. Ad Pamma. De optimo gene. re Interpremandi. To. 2.*

To theiſe folies S. Hierome **anſweareth thus,** Cùm ipſa Epiſtola doceat, nihil mutatum eſſe de ſenſu, nec res additas, nec aliquod dogma confictum, faciunt næ iſti intelligendo, vt nihil intelligant: & dum alienam imperitiam volunt coarguere, produnt ſuam: *Where as the Epiſtle it ſelfe declareth, that there is no alteration made in the ſenſe, and that there is neither mater of ſubſtance added, nor any Doctrine imagined, verily by their greate cunninge, they proue them ſelues fooles: and ſeekinge to reproue other mennes vnskilfulneſſe, they betraie their owne.* *In eadē Ep.*

Yet ſaie, S. Hierome in theiſe woordes ſpake nothinge neither of the Churche of Chriſte, nor of your Cleargie of Rome **For trial whereof, let** S. Hierome **him ſelfe be heарde to ſpeake, as a witneſſe indifferente of him ſelfe. Firſte in other places he ſaithe thus (To this place we ſhal reporte afterwarde)** Dicimus, Non venient ſuper nos mala. Audiamus ſententiam Domini. Sion, & Hieruſalem, & Mons Templi ſpeculatorium, & viſio pacis, & Templum Chriſti in Conſummatione. & in fine: *Wee ſaie, There ſhal no harte comme vpon vs. Let vs heare the ſaieinge of our Lorde.* Sion, *and* Hieruſalem, *and the Mounte, that is the Watche Tower of the Temple, and the ſight of peace, and the* Temple, or Church of Chriſte, *Hierom. In Micha. c. 3.*

shalbe

shalbe consumed, and brought to an ende.

These wordes be plaine: not onely that the haute Lady Niniue, **but also that the** Churche, or Temple, **that beareth the** Name of Christe, **shalbe consumed, and brought to an ende.**

Hierō. in Sophoniā. ca. 2. **Likewise he saithe,** Quos Deus inseruit ex Oleastro in radicem Bonæ Oliuæ, si illi immemores recesserint à Conditore suo, & adorauerint Assyriam, cur illos Deus non euertat, & ad eandem sitim reducat, in qua priùs fuerunt? *Euen they, whom God hath grafted from out of the wild Olive tree, into the roote of the good Olive* (**that is to saie, the children of the** Churche) *if they forgeate them selues, and flee from theire* Maker, *and worshippe the* Kinge of Assyria (**that is to saie,** Antichriste, **or any other** Creature, **that is not God**) *why maie not God ouerthrowe them, and bringe them to the same thirste, and drouthe, they were in before.*

Hi in Mat. ca. 24. Li. 4. **Marke, M. Hardinge,** S. Hierome **applieth theise wordes, not onely vnto** Niniue, **but also vnto the** Churche of God. **Againe he saithe,** Abominatio Desolationis, intelligi potest omne dogma peruersum: quod cum viderimus stare in Loco Sancto, id est, in Ecclesia, debemus fugere de Iudæa ad Montes: The Abomination of Desolation, *maie be taken for any* VVicked Doctrine: *whiche when wee shal see standinge in the* Holy Place, *that is to saie, in the* Churche of Christe, *then wee muste flee from* Iurie *to the* Mountaines (**of the** Scriptures.)

Hieronym. in Esai. ca 23. **And againe likewise he saithe,** Paxillus auferetur de loco fidei, hoc est, de Ecclesia, per impietatem quotidiè succrescentem: &, qui super eum antè pependerant Fide: posteà infidelitate frangentur, & cadent, & peribunt: *The Pinne, or barre* (**whereby he meaneth** Christe, **for that the Faithful hange vpon him, as in a house thinges are hanged vp safely vpon a** Pinne,) *shalbe taken awaie from the place, that was Faithful, that is to saie, from the Churche, bicause of the wickednesse, that daiely groweth. And they, that before honge vpon him by Faithe, afterwarde, by infidelitie, shalbe broken downe, and fal, and perishe.*

What so euer Glose **yᵉ shal geue to the other wordes of** S. Hierome, **certainely theise wordes are plaine, & euident, and wil not easily receiue your** Glose. **Likewise** S. Gregorie, **speakinge, not of the** Firste commynge of Christe, **but of the time, that is described, to be before the ende of the worlde, saith thus:** In diebus illis Ecclesia, quasi quodam senio debilitata, per Prædicationem parere filios non valebit: *In those daies the* Churche, *as beinge ouermuche weakened with age, shal not be hable by preachinge to beare Children.*

Greg. in Iob. c. 9 l 19. c. 29

Hie. in Hieremi. l. 1. c. 4. **Nowe, touchinge your** Cleargie, S. Hierome **him selfe saithe,** Ipsi quoque Sacerdotes, qui Legem Domini docere deberent, & subiectos sibi populos à Leonis furore defendere quodam stupore infatuati, vertentur in amentiam: *The* Priestes *them selues, that ought to teache the* Lawe of our Lorde, *and to defende the people, committed to their charge, from the furie of the* Lion (**that is the** Diuel) *beinge amazed, and bereste of theire witte, shalbe turned into madnesse.*

Hieronym. in Naum 3. **Againe he saithe,** Scit Rex Assyrius, non posse se Oues decipere, nisi Pastores antè consopierit. Semper Diaboli studium est, vigilantes animas consopire: *The* Kinge of Assyria (**that is the** Diuel) *knoweth, that he can neuer deceiue the Sheepe, onlesse firste he caste the* Shepheardes *into a traunse. It is euermore the* Diuels *policie, to laie watchful soules asleepe.*

Hier. in Sopho. cap. 1. **And therefore againe he saithe,** Auferet Dominus nomina Vanæ Gloriæ, & Admirationis faltæ, quæ versantur in Ecclesia. Sed & nomina Sacerdotum cum Sacerdotibus, qui frustra sibi applaudunt in Episcopali nomine, & in Presbyterij Dignitate, & non in opere: God *wil take awaie the* names of vaine Glorie, *and* False Credite, *that are in the* Churche: *and the* names of Priestes, *together with the* Priestes *them selues, that vainely boaste them selues of the* Names of Bishoppes, *and of the* Dignitie of Priesthoode, *but doo nothinge.* **Hitherto, I trowe, it is plaine, that** S. Hierome **by theise wordes, meant not onely** Niniue, **as you saie, but also the** Churche, **and the same** Churche **that is called, the** Churche of God.

Hier. in Catalo. Script. Eccles. in Marco. But about Babylon (**yᵉ saie**) **ye neuer make an ende of Bablinge. What Bablinge then, I pray you, made** S. Hierome, **when he saide,** Petrus in Prima Epistola, sub nomine Babylonis, Romam significat? S. Peter *in his first Epistle meant* Rome *vnder the name of* Babylon.

S. Augustine

The people shal flee to the Scriptures

S Augustine saithe, Roma est quasi Secunda Babylon: Rome *is as the Seconde* Babylon **Againe he sayeth,** Ciues Babyloniæ nos fecerunt: dimittimus Creatorem: Adorauimus Creaturam: dimisimus eum, à quo facti sumus: Adorauimus illud, quod fecimus; *They haue made vs the* Citizens of Babylon: **(for)** *wee haue leaft our Creatour, and haue worshipped a Creature: wee haue leafte him, that made vs: and haue Adoured that thing, that wee made our selues.* *August. De Genesi cõtra Maniche. Lib. 2. Ca. 1.*

Likewise saith Primasius, Tunc Babylon cadet, quando nouissimè potestatem persequendi Sanctos accepent: *Then shal* Babylon *comme to grounde, when shee shal last of al take power to persecute the* Saincles of God. *Au. in ps. 44 Primasius in Apoc. ca. 16.*

And againe, Vbi Mulierem sedentem super Vestem Coccineam, plenam Nominibus Blasphemiæ, habentem Capita Septem. Septem Capita dicit Septem Montes: Romam, quæ super Septem Montes præsidet, significans: *I sawe a Woman sitting vpon a scarlet roabe, ful of Names of Blasphemie,* hauinge Seuen Heades. Seuen Heades he calleth the Seuen Mountes, vpon vvhich Rome vvas built: *meaninge thereby* Rome, *that sitteth vpon Seuen Hilles.* *In idē caput*

Ludouicus Viues, **your owne very friende, saithe thus:** Hieronymus, ad Marcellam scribens, non aliam existimat discribi &c. S. Hierome, *writing vnto* Marcella, *thinketh there is none other* Babylon *discribed by* S Iohn *in his* Reuelations, *but the* Citie of Rome. *August. De Ciuitate Dei Lib. 18. Ca. 22. Viues.*

Ambrosius Ansbertus **saithe,** Vbi est illa dudum super omnium Regna exaltata Inclita Roma, Babylon Secunda? *Where is that* Noble Rome, *auanced of late aboue al* Kingdomes, the Seconde Babylon? *Ambrosius Ansbertus in Apocal. li. 6.*

I passe ouer Beatus Rhenanus, Auentinus, Petrarcha, Dantes, **and a great number of other your owne Doctours, mentioned before in place more conuenient: At whom yet maie not of your courteise charge with bablinge.**

Yet saie, *S. Hierome* meant not the state of our time, but onely the state of the time nowe paste: **that is to saie, as it is said before,** The time of Christes firste comming into the vvorlde. **And this, in your Margine, yea cal the right sense of** S Hierome **truely reported. How be it, your Reader, that hathe eies to see, maie easily finde, that this is your owne only sense, M. Hardinge, and not** S. Hieromes. **For, I beseache you, howe was** Niniue **fully destroyed, or what** Gospelles **were there** written, **at the** Firste comming of Christ into the VVorld? S. Hieromes **meaning, and speache is plaine,** The people, before the Seconde Comminge of Christe, vvhiche shalbe in Glorie, shal leaue their negligente, and idle Scholemaisters, vvhich haue of long time deceiued them: and shal flee to the Mountaines of the Scriptures. And, al be it they finde not one to teache them, yet shal their desire, and endeuoure be accepted before God, for that they haue sought vnto these Mountaines: and the negligence, and slouthfulnesse of their Maisters shalbe reproued. *Hierony. in Naum. ca. 3* The true sense of S. Hieromes woordes.

To like pourpose S. Chrysostome **saithe,** Fieri non potest, vt is, qui Diuinis Scripturis magno studio, feruentique desiderio vacat, semper negligatur. Licet enim desit nobis hominis Magisterium, tamen ipse Dominus, superne intrans in corda nostra, illustrat mẽtem: rationi iubar suum infundit: deregit occulta: Doctorque fit eorum, que ignoramus: tantùm si nos ea, quæ à nobis sunt, afferre velimus: *It cannot possibly be, that he, that with earnest studie, and feruent desire* readeth the Scriptures, *should euermore be forsaken. For although wee wante the instruction of Man, yet God him selfe from aboue entring into oure hartes, lighteneth our minde: poureth his beames into our wittes: openeth thinges, that were hidden: and becommeth vnto vs a Scholemaister of that, wee knowe not: onely if wee wil doo so muche, as in vs lieth.* *Chrysostom. In Gen. Hom. 36.*

So saithe S. Hierome, Postquam conuersi fuerint, & Clarum Christi Lumen aspexerint, pascent in vijs, & in semitis Sanctarum Scripturarum: & dicent, Dominus pascit me, & nihil mihi deerit: *When they shalbe turned, and shal beholde the Cleare Lighte of Christ, they shal feede in the pathes, and waies of* Holy Scriptures: *and shal saie,* The Lorde feedeth me: and I shal vvante nothinge. *Hierony. in Esai. Lib. 12. ca. 49. Psalm. 23.*

Againe he saithe, Circundabit sibi, quasi murum firmissimum, Scripturarum doctrinam: ne ad interiora eius possit hostis irrumpere: *He wil enclose him selfe with the Doctrine of the Scriptures, as with a stronge walle: that the Enimie maie not enter into his heart.* **Again he saithe,** Hæc est via, Ambulate in ea. Neque ad Dextram, neque ad Sinistram. Tunc omnes *Hieron. In Naum. ca. 3 His in Esai. lib. 9. ca. 30.*

The people shal flee to the Scriptures

omnes Errores, & Idola, & Similitudines Veritatis comminues, atque disperges, & ita iudicabis immunda, vt ea menstruatæ mulieris sordissimo Sanguini compares: *This is the waie: Walke in it. Goe neither to the Righte hande, nor to the Leafte. Then shalt thou breake, and scatter al Errours, and Idolles, and* Counterfeite likenesse of the Truthe: *and shalte iudge them to be so filthie, that thou shalte liken them to moste vile, and lothesome Blonde.*

But, for as mutche as yt saie, Al these woordes of S. Hierome pertcine vnto somme other mater, **I knowe not what,** and not vnto the ouerthrowe of Babylon, or fal of Antichriste, that shalbe before the ende of the worlde, **notwithstanding** S. Hieromes **woordes of them selfe be plaine ynoughe, yet it maie please you, to consider these woordes of** S. Chrysostome, **touching the same. Thus he saithe,** Tunc, qui in Iudæa sunt, fugiant ad Montes, id est, qui sunt in Christianitate, conferant se ad Scripturas. Montes sunt Scripturæ Apostolorum, & Prophetarum, &c. Sciens Dominus tantam confusionem rerum in nouissimis diebus esse futuram, ideò mandat, vt Christiani, qui sunt in Christianitate, volentes firmitatem accipere Fidei veræ, ad nullam rem fugiant, nisi ad Scripturas. Alioqui, si ad alias res aspexerint, scandalizabuntur, & peribunt, non intelligentes, quæ sit Vera Ecclesia. Et per hoc incident in Abominationem Desolationis: *Then let them, that be in* Ievvrie, *flee to the* Mountaines: *that is to saie, let them that be in* Christes Profession, *flee to the* Scriptures. *The* Scriptures of the Apostles, and Prophetes, be the Mountaines, &c. *Oure Lorde knowinge, that there shoulde be sutche confusion in the laste daies, therefore commaundeth, that* Christian *menne, that beleue in* Christe, *willinge to haue an assurance of the* True Faithe, *shoulde haue recourse to nothinge els, but vnto the* Scriptures. *Otherwise, if they haue regarde to any other thinge, they shalbe offended, and perishe, not vnderstanding, what is the* True Churche. *And by meane hereof they shal falle into the* Abomination of Desolation.

Chrysostom. In Matt. Hom. 49.

Here, M. Harding, no Glose **wil serue you. Certainely, these woordes were spoken, not of the** Firste comminge of Christe into the vvorlde, **as you imagine: but of the** Kingdome of Antichrist, **and of the Ende, and Consummation of the worlde.**

Hereof S. Gregorie **saith thus:** Ecclesia post eosdem dies, quibus deprimitur, tamen circa finem temporum grandi prædicationis Virtute roborabitur: *The* Church *after these daies of her affliction, shal afterwarde notwithstandinge be strengthened with greate Power, and mighte of Preachinge.*

Gregori. In Iob. ca. 29. li. 19. ca. 9.

The Apologie, Cap. 20. Diuision. 1.

But, by youre fauoure, somme wil saie, these thinges oughte not to haue bene attempted without the Bishop of Romes **commaundement for so mutche as he onely is the knotte, and band of** Christian Societie: **He onely is that** Prieste of Leuies Order, **whome** God **signified in the** Deuteronomie, **from whome Counsel in matters of weighte, and true iudgemente oughte to be fette: and, who so obeieth not his iudgement, the same man oughte to be killed in the sight of his brethren: and, that no Mortal creature hath Authoritie to be Iudge ouer the Pope, what so euer he doo: that Christ reigneth in Heauen, and the Pope in Earth: that the Pope alone can doo as muche, as Christe, or God him selfe can doo: bicause Christ, and the Pope haue but one** Consistorie: **That without him is no** Faith, no Hope, no Church: **and, who so goeth from him, quite casteth awaie, and renounceth his owne Saluation. Such talke haue the** Canonistes, **the** Popes Parasites, **but with smal discretion, or sobrenesse. For they coulde scantly saie more, at leaste, they coulde not speake more highly of Christe him selfe.**

M. Hardinge.

What somme wil saie, we knowe not. We tel you, that your change of Religion, and manifolde Heresies ought not to haue bene attempted at al, neither without the Bishop of Romes commaundemente, nor with his commaundement. Touching the Bishop of Rome him selfe, you haue neuer doone with him. He is a great blocke in your waie. And so hath he euer bene in the waie of al Heretikes. Yet could he neuer

by

by you, or them be removed. To your scoffes against him, and beliefinge of the Canonistes before by you vttered, and here idly repeted, my former antweare may suffise.

The Apologie, Cap. 20. Diuision. 2.

As for vs, truely, wee haue fallen from the Bishop of Rome, vpon no manner of worldly respect, or commoditie. And would to Christe, he so behaued him selfe, that this fallinge awaie had not needed: But so the case stoode, that onelesse wee leafte him, wee couldе not come to Christe. Neither wil he nowe make any other League with vs, then sutche a one, as Nahas the Kinge of the Ammorites woulde haue made in times paste with them of the Citie of Iabes, whiche was to put out the righte Eie of eche one of the Inhabitantes, and so to receiue them into his frendship. Euen so wil the Pope plucke from vs the Holy Scripture, the Gospel of our Saluation, and al the Confidence, whiche we haue in Christe Iesu, as the eie from our heade. And vpon other condition can he not agree vpon peace with vs.

M. Hardinge.

Yee are not fallen from the Bishop of Rome onely, whiche were a damnable schisme but ye are fallen from Christes Church. Your comparison of the Pope with kinge Nahas is not very agreable. But firs, yee speake more maliciously, then credibly. Be yee good Christen men, and conforme your selues to the Catholike Faithe, (and denie Christe, and his Gospel: For, this also yee shoulde haue added) and I warrante you, the Pope wil not plucke from you, neither the Scriptures, nor your confidence in Christ Iesu, no more then he dothe from vs.

The Apologie Cap. 20. Diuision 3.

For whereas somme vse to make so greate a vaunte, that the Pope is onely Peters Successour, as thoughe thereby he caried the Holy Ghost in his bosome, and could not erre, this is but a mater of nothing, and a very trifelinge tale. Goddes grace is promised to a good minde, and to any one, that feareth him, not vnto Sees, and Successions. Richesse, saithe S. Hierome, maie make one Bishop to be of more might, then the rest: but al Bishoppes, who so euer they be, are the Successours of the Apostles. If so be the Place, and Consecration onely be sufficient, why then, Manasses succeded Dauid, and Caiphas succeded Aaron. And it hathe benne often seene, that an Idol hathe benne placed in the Temple of God. In olde time, Archidamus the Lacedemonian boasted mutch of him selfe, howe he came of the bloude of Hercules, as the Pope this daie boasteth him selfe of the succession, and place of Peter. But one Nicostratus, in this wise abated his pride: Naie, quod he, thou seemest not to descende from Hercules. For Hercules destroied euil menne: and thou makest good menne euil. And when the Phariseis bragged of their Linage, howe they were of the kinred, and bloud of Abraham. Ye, saithe Christe, seeke to kil me, a man whiche haue tolde you the truthe, as I heard it from God. Thus Abraham neuer did. Yee are of your Father the Deuil, and wil needes obeie his wil. *Iohn. 8:*

M. Hardinge.

The Pope succedeth Peter in authoritie and power. For whereas the Sheepe of Christe continewe to the worldes ende, he is not wise, that thinketh Christe to haue made a shepeherde temporarie, or for a time, ouer his perpetual flocke. Then what shepeherdly endeuor ente our Lorde gaue to the first shepherde, at the institution of the shepeherdly office of the Churche? that is, he vnderstanded to haue geuen ordinarily to euery successour. To Peter he gaue that he obteined by his prayer made to the Father, that his Faithe shoulde not faile. Againe, to him he gaue grace, that to performe, the performance whereof at him he required, to witte, that he confirmed and strengthened his Brethren, wherefore the grace of stedfastnesse, of Faithe, and of Confirminge the waueringe and doubteful in Faithe, euery Pope obteineth

The Pope can not Erre.

of the holy Ghoste for the benefite of the Churche. And so the Pope, although he maie erre by personed errour, in his owne priuate iudgemente, as a man, and as a particular Doctour in his owne opinion: *yet as he is Pope, the Successour of Peter, the Vicare of Christe in earthe, the shepeherde of the Vniuersal Churche, in publike iudgemente, in deliberation and definitiue sentence *he neuer erreth, *nor neuer erred. For when so euer he ordeineth or determineth any thing by his high Bishoply authoritie, intending to bind Christian menne to performe or beleue the same, he is alwaies gouerned and holpen with the grace and fauour of the holy Ghoste. This is to Catholique Doctours a very certainetie, thoughe to suche doughtie Clerkes as ye are, it is but a matter of nothinge, and a very triflinge tale.

*Vntruth, ioined with impudente flattery, and extreme folie.

*This place of S. Hierome is answeared before. Part 2. Ca. 3 Diui. 5.

*Peter was the Shepeherd, and the Apostles the Sheepe. A vaine vntruthe without sauor, Ciprian saithe. *Christus parem dedit Apostolis omnibus potestatem.*

Goddes grace in one respecte, is promised bothe to a good minde, and to one that feareth God, and also in an other respecte, to the Successours of Peter. S. Hieromes saieinge to Euagrius, whiche newe you haue alleged three or foure times, wil not handsomely serue you for so diuers poiotes, as a shipmans hose for diuers legges. *Once againe I tel you, thereby he meaneth nothinge els, but that, the greatenesse of Rome ought not to giue authoritie to a wronge priuate custome, (by whiche Deacons in certaine cases were preferred before Priestes) againste the righte general custome of the worlde. And Bishoppes be the Successours of the Apostles, we graunte, yet is the Pope the Successour of Peter, *who was shepherde of al Christes Lambes, and Sheepe, and therefore also *of the Apostles them selues, and so hathe a higher authoritie.

As for your example of Archidamus, who boastingly fetched his Petigree from Hercules, you muste consider, succession of Vertue alwaies followeth not succession of Bloude. Nowe we doo acknowledge in the Pope a succession of Shepeherdly power, euen suche as was in Peter. *Whiche power is not taken awaie by lacke of Peters holinesse.

The Pope Succedeth in power, but not in holinesse.

Christe likewise by his answeare to the Phariseis, thoughe he affirmed, they succeeded not Abraham in lone of truthe, and that for their malice they were of their father the Diuel: yet he denied not, but that they came lineally of Abraham, and were of his bloude, thoughe not of his godlinesse. Suche succession meane not wee, speaking of the Pope, whose succession is deriued of Peter: but the succession of Power and auctoritie, *and of infallibilitie of Faithe in iudgemente and sentence definitiue.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Here we haue founde one Pope **with two Capacities. In one respecte he is a** Man: **in an other respecte he is more then a** Man: **but whether, in that respecte, he be Angel, or Archangel, it is passe in silence. One waie he succeedeth** Peter: **an other waie, he succeedeth, I knowe not, whom. One waie he maie** Erre: **an other waie, thoughe he would neuer so faine,** he can not erre. **In his Bed, at his Table, on Horsebacke, or els where, we maie wel mistruste him: for in these places he maie be deceiued, as wel, as others. But, in** Councel, **in** Consistorie, **and in** place of Iudgemente **it is moste certaine, ye saie,** he can not erre. **For in these places he hath the** Holy Ghost, **I trowe, at his Commaundemente. His** power Pastoral, **his** Succession **in Authoritie, and** Infallibilitie of Faithe, **his** Place, **his** Chaire, **and his** Consecration **are sufficient for euer to preserue him from Errour.** To like purpose Saluste sometime saide of Cicero, Aliud Stans, aliud Sedens, de Republica sentit: *While he standeth vp, he hath one minde, touchinge the common State: When he sitteth downe, he hath an other.* **It is fitte for a Pope to haue shift of mindes,** Apolloes Nonne, **while she sate meeued in hir Caue, was inspired, and Prophecied, and gaue Oracles: but after that she came abroade, she was no wiser, then other women. Thus your Doctours saie, as it is before reported,** Veritas adhæret Cathedræ: Papa Sanctitatem recipit a Cathedra: *The* Popes Truthe *is fastened vnto his* Chaire: *The* Pope *from his* Chaire *receiueth his* Holinesse.

Sallustius in Ciceronem.

Nico. Cusa. ad Bohemos Epist. 2.

It shameth me, M. Hardinge, to see you so vainely occupied aboute these vanities. Ye maie wel be liberal in dealinge hereof. They coste you but litle: they are onely your owne. Scriptures, Doctours **or** Councelles, **to witnesse your saieinges, ye allege none. For further declaration of this whole mater, I beseeche thee, good Christian Reader, to consider the shorte treatie that I haue written before, touchinge the sundrie** Errours **and** euident Heresies, **that haue benne notably founde in** Popes. Alphonsus de Castro, **one of M. Hardinges owne special Doctours, saithe,** Non dubitamus an Hæreticum esse, & Papam esse, coire in vnum possint, &c. Non enim credo, aliquem esse adeò Impudentem Papæ Assentatorem, vt ei tribuere hoc velit, vt nec Errare, nec in Interpretatione Sacrarum Literarum hallucinari possit: *Wee doubte not, whether one man maie be a* Pope, *and an* Heretique *bothe togeather. For, I beleeue, there is none so* shameleesse a Flatterer of the Pope, *that wil saie* (**as you saie, M. Hardinge**) *The* Pope *can neuer* Erre, *nor be deceiued in the Exposition of the* Scriptures. **There is no Flatterer so shameleesse,**

Part. 6. ca. 5. Diui. 2.

Alphon. De Her. l. 1. c. 4.

The Pope can not Erre.

lesse, that wil so saie.

Likewise Erasmus saithe, Si verum est, quod quidam asseuerant, Romanum Pontificem Errore Iudiciali Errare non posse, quid opus est Generalibus Concilijs? quid opus est in Concilium accersere Iurisconsultos, ac Theologos eruditos? Si Papa pronuncians labi non potest, cur datus est Appellationi locus, vel ad Synodum, vel ad eundum rectiùs edoctum? Quorsum attinet, tot Academias in tractandis Fidei quæstionibus distorqueri, cùm ex vno Pontifice, quod verum est: audire liceat? Imò qui fit, vt huius Pontificis decreta cum illius Pontificis decretis pugnent? *If it be true, that somme menne saie, that the* Bishop of Rome can neuer Erre in Erroure of Iudgemente, *what neede wee then so many* General Councelles? *And in the same, what neede wee so many* Lawyers, and learned Diuines? *If the* Pope *cannot Erre in geeuinge sentence, wherefore lieth there any Appeale from the* Pope, *either to a* Councel, *or els to the* Pope him selfe, *beinge better enformed? What neede wee to trouble so many* Vniuersities, *in discussinge of Matters of Faithe, whereas wee maie learne the Truthe of the* Pope alone? *Naie, howe commeth it aboute, that one* Popes Decrees *are founde* contrarie to an others, *if it be so certaine, that the* Pope, *who so euer he be, and what so euer he saie, can neuer Erre.*

Athana. In Apologia Secunda.

Hieron. ad Euagr.um.

That ye speake of Peters Succession, **is vaine, & childishe. Of suche folie** Athanasius **saithe,** Persuasus est, in Magnitudine Vrbium Religionem esse sitam: *This wise man imagineth, that Religion standeth in the* Greateneſse of Cities. S. Hierome **saithe,** Potentia Diuitiarum, & Paupertatis Humilitas vel Sublimiorem, vel Inferiorem Episcopum non facit. Cæterùm omnes Apostolorum Successores sunt: *The wealthe of Richesse, and the Baseneſse of Powertie maketh a Bishop neither Higher, nor Lower.* But al Bishoppes be the Apostles successours.

The Apologie, Cap. 21. Diuision. 1.

Yet notwithstandinge, bicause wee wil graunte somme what **to** Succession, **tel vs, hath the** Pope alone Succeeded Peter? **And wherein, I praye you? In what** Religion, **in what Office, in what peece of his life hathe he Succeeded him? What one thinge (tel me) had** Peter **euer like vnto the** Pope, **or the** Pope **like vnto** Peter? **Excepte peraduenture he wil saie thus, That** Peter, **when he was at** Rome, **neuer taught the** Gospel, **neuer Fedde the Flocke, tooke awaie the Keies of the Kingedome of Heauen, hid the Treasures of his Lorde, sat him downe onely in his** Castle of S. Iohn Laterane, **and pointed out with his finger al the places, and Chambers of** Purgatorie, **and kindes of punishementes, committinge some poore Soules to be tormented, and other some againe suddainely releasinge thence at his owne pleasure, taking Monie for so doinge: or, that he gaue order to saie** Priuate Masses **in euery corner: or, that he mumbled vp the** Holy Seruice **with a loude voice, and in an vnknowen language: or, that he hanged vp the** Sacrament **in euery** Temple, **and on euery Aultare, and caried the same about before him, whither so euer he wente, vpon an amblinge Jannet, with lightes, and belles: or, that he Consecrated with his holy Breathe,** Oile, Waxe, Wulle, Belles, Chalices, Churches, **and** Aultares: **or that he sold** Iubilees, Graces, Liberties, Auousons, Preuentions, First fruites, Palles, the wearing of Palles, Bulles, Indulgences, and Pardonnes: **or, that he called him selfe by the name of the** Heade of the Churche, the Higheſt Bishop, the Bishop of Bishoppes, alone most Holy: **or, that by vsurpation, he tooke vpon him selfe the right, and authoritie ouer other Bishops Churches: or, that he exempted him selfe from the Power of any** Ciuil Gouernment: **or, that he mainteined warres, and set Princes togeather at variance: or, that he sitting in his** chaire, **with his** Triple crowne **ful of Labelles,**

Peters Succeſſours.

with ſumptuous, & Perſianlike gorgiouſneſſe, with his Roial Scepter, with his Diademe of gould, and glittering with ſtoanes, was carried about, not vpon a palfraie, but vpon the ſhoulders of Noble men. Theſe thinges, no doubt, did Peter at Rome in times paſte, and leafte them in charge to his Succeſſours, as you would ſaie, from hande to hande: for theſe thinges be nowe a daies donne at Rome by the Popes, and be ſo donne, as though nothinge els ought to be donne.

M. Hardinge.

The Pope alone hathe ſucceeded S. Peter. Aske you wherein? in what Religion? in what office? Wee tel you, he ſucceeded in Peters Chaire, in whiche he ſate at Rome, and ruled the Churche, in Chriſtian Religion, (a) in that office whiche Chriſte committed to Peter, when he ſaide, *Paſce Oues meas*: Feede my ſheepe. Then whiche office he neuer gaue greater, nor with like circumſtance of charge, (b) nor to any other gaue he it, then to Peter. For to him alone, he ſaide, Feede my Sheepe. What aske yee vs of this Officers life?

(a) Vntruthe. For the Pope feedeth not.

(b) Vntruthe. For the ſame power was geuen to al the reſte.

You aske what thinge had Peter euer like vnto the Pope, or the Pope like vnto Peter? We tel you, Peter had authoritie to feede Chriſtes ſheepe, like vnto the Pope. And the Pope hath authoritie to feede Chriſtes ſheepe, like vnto Peter, (c) Like power, like commiſsion. He that gaue them authoritie to feede, gaue them alſo authoritie to doo what ſo euer maie pertcine to feedinge.

(c) And wel proued.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

For that yée telle vs ſo many faire tales of Peters Succeſſion, wée demaunde of you, wherein the Pope ſuccedeth Peter? You anſwere, He ſuccedeth him in his Chaire: as if Peter had benne ſommetime enſtalled in Rome, and had ſate ſolemnely al daie with his Triple Crovvne, in his Pontificalibus, and in a Chaire of goulde. And thus, hauinge loſte bothe Religion, and Doctrine, yét thinke it ſufficiente, at leaſte to holde by the Chaire: as if a ſouldier, that had loſte his Swerde, woulde plaie the man with the ſcaberde. But ſo Caiphas ſucceded Aaron: ſo wicked Manaſſes ſucceded Dauid: ſo maie Antichriſte eaſilie ſitte in Peters Chaire.

Diſt. 40. Multi.

Chryſoſtome ſaithe, Non Cathedra facit Sacerdotem: ſed Sacerdos Cathedram: Nec Locus Sanctificat Hominem: ſed Homo Locum. *It is not the* Chaire, *that maketh the* Bishop: *but it is the* Bishop, *that maketh the* Chaire. *Neither is it the* Place, *that halloweth the* Man: *but it is the* Man, *that halloweth the* Place. Likewiſe S. Hierome ſaithe, Non Sanctorum Filij ſunt, qui tenent Loca Sanctorum: *They are not alwaies the Children of* holy Menne, *that ſitte in the roumes of* holy Menne.

Diſt. 40. Non eſt facile.

Ye dothe great wrongs vnto S. Peter, that placeth ſutche a one in ſutche a Chaire: For, neither is the Pope in any thinge like S. Peter: nor was S. Peter in any thinge like the Pope. When Simeones ſawe, that Arſacius, an vnlearned, and an vnvvoorthy olde doatinge Man, was placed in Chryſoſtomes roume, he cried out, Prò pudor! Quis, Cui? *Out for ſhame! what a ſpary hinde is this? and in whoſe place haue we ſette him?* Euen ſo maie we iuſtly ſaie of the Popes ſitting in Peters Chaire, Prò pudor, Quis, Cui? If he haue any regarde of him ſelfe, he cannot thinke of S. Peter without blushinge.

Nicep. l. 13. cap. 28.

The Apologie, Cap. 21. Diuiſion. 2.

Or contrariewiſe, peraduenture they had rather ſaie thus, that the Pope dothe nowe al the ſame thinges, that wee knowe, Peter did many a daie ago: that is, that he reineth vp and downe into euery Countrie, to Preache the Goſpel, not onely openly abroade, but alſo priuately from houſe to houſe: that he is diligente, and applieth that buſineſſe, in ſeaſon, and out of ſeaſon, in due time, and out of due time: that he dothe the parte of an Euangeliſte, that he fulfilleth the worke, and miniſterie of Chriſte, that he is the watcheman of the Houſe of Iſrael, receiueth anſweres, and wordes at Gods mouth: and, euen as he receiueth them, ſo deliuereth them ouer to the people: That he is the Salt of the earth: that he is the Lighte of the worlde: that he dothe not fede him ſelfe, but his flock: that he doth not entangle himſelfe with the worldly

cares

cares of this life: that he dothe not vse a Soueraintie ouer the Lordes people: that he seeketh not to haue other menne Ministers vnto him, but him selfe rather Ministreth vnto others: that he taketh al Bishoppes as his Felowes, and Equalles: that he is Subiect to Princes, as to personnes sente from God: that he geueth to Cæsar that, whiche is Cæsars: and that he, as the Olde Bishoppes of Rome did without contradiction, calleth the Emperoure his graceous Lorde. Onlesse therfore the Popes do the like nowe a daies, as Peter did, there is no cause at al, whye they shoulde glorie so mutche of Peters name, and of his Succession.

M. Hardinge.

The Pope nowe renneth not vp and downe into euery Countrie, he goeth not openly and priuately, from house to house, and to euery alehouse, as yee wouldе him to doo, like one of your Ministers: Neither I trowe, yee maisters that be Superintendentes your selues, thinke it conueniente, that ye goe from house to house, to preache your Gospel at these daies. And wouldе yee the Pope to abase him selfe to that yee thinke becommeth not your selues? He hathe (as meete it is) other fitte menne to helpe to beare his burthen with him. And where as one body suffiseth not for so greate and so many affaires: For Counсel, he hath many heades: for ouersighte, many eies: for care, many hartes: for preaching, many tongues: for worke, many handes: for knowledge, many eares: for expedition of matters, many feete: for the greate weighte of his charge, many shoulders. Briefly, for al necessarie and behoouteful cases, conueniente helpes. The like helpes wouldе S. Peter vse, were he nowe liuinge.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

To speake of the Popes renninge vp, and downe, from Alehouse to Alehouse, it is great folie. It shoulde be sufficiente, if he wouldе goe from Churche to Churche, and remember his Charge, and Feede the Flocke, and Preache the Gospel. Yea saie, The Pope hath many heades, many eies, many hartes, many tongues, many handes, many eares, many shoulders. And thus, of your Pope yee make a Monster, with many eies, eares, tongues, and hartes of others, and none of his owne. A wise man sommetime saide: Improbè facit, qui, cùm alienis oculis omnia ei agenda sint, postulet aliorum vitas omitti sibi: *It is but lewdely donne, if a man, that muste ouersee al thinges with other mennes eies, desire to haue the liues of others committed ouer to his charge.* *Titus Liuius.*

God geue him eies to see, and eares to heare, and harte to vnderstand: that he maie knowe the time of Goddes Visitation.

The Apologie, Cap. 22. Diuision. 1.

Mutche lesse cause haue they, to complaine of our departinge, and to calle vs againe to be felowes, and frendes with them, and to beleue, as they beleue. Menne saie, that one Cobilon a Lacedemonian, when he was sent Embassadour to the King of the Persians, to treate of a league, and founde by chaunce them of the Court playinge at dice, he returned straight waie home againe, leauinge his message vndonne. And when he was asked, why he had slackt to doo the thinges, whiche he had receiued by publique Commission to doo, he made answere, he thought it should be a great reproche to his common Wealthe, to make a league with Dicers. But, if we should cõtent our selues to returne to the Pope, and to his Errours, and to make a cournant, not onely with Dicers, but also with men farre more vngraceous, and wicked, then any Dicers be: besides that, this shoulde be a great blotte to our good name, it shoulde also be a very dangerous mater, both to kendle Goddes wrath against vs, and to clogge, and condemne our owne soules for euer.

(a) Yee flee wicked company, as he did. (b) Vntruthe. For where did Christe euer sende vs to the B. of Rome.

M. Hardinge.

Ye doo wel to compare your selues with this Cobilon. For in deede (a) yee doo as he did. Yee were sente (b) by Christe to his Vicare, Peters Successour, to be fedde and gouerned like sheepe vnder the shepeheарde.

(c) By this rule the Pope is left voide of life: For that he is deuided from Chriſte, that is the heade.

heade. Chriſte and his Churche be a perfite body, he the heade, the true beleuers knitte togeather in charitie the members, eche one in his order and degree. He is the vine, wee the boughes and branches. (c) What member cutte off from the body, liueth? what boughe broken from the tree, groweth? As euery ſuche member dieth, and bough withereth, So if yee remaine not in the Catholique Churche, whiche is the body of Chriſte, yee drawe no life from the head, yee haue no parte of the Spirite, that from thence redoundeth to euery member, yee haue no portion of the vital iouyſſe that iſſueth from the roote. Then what remaineth, but that yee be caſte into the fire? For this cauſe S. Cyprian and other Fathers, oftentimes haue ſaide that out and beſides the Churche, there is no ſaluation.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Chriſte neuer tolde vs, neither of any his Vicare General: **nor of** Rome: **nor of** Laterane: **nor of** Peters Chaire: **nor willed vs to haue recourſe to the** Biſhop of Rome, **more then to any other ſeueral Biſhop. Therefore, M. Pardinge, we muſte recken this amongeſt the reſte of your** Vntruthes.

It is true, that you ſaie, A member diuided from the body cannot liue. **But your Concluſion is vntrue, like the reſte. For,** Rome **is not the** Body, **but onely a Member of that** Body: Rome **is not the** Tree, **but onely a** Bough: Rome **is not the** Heade, **but onely a** Springe. **And therefore, ſeinge it is nowe diuided from that** Body: **ſeing it is broken from that** Tree: **ſeing, it is cutte off from that** Heade, **it is no maruile, thoughe it be ſtrued, though it be withered, though it be leafte drie, without either Spirite, or life: as this daie it appeareth to the eies of al them, that wil beholde it.**

The Apologie. Cap. 22. Diuiſion. 2.

For of very truthe, we haue departed from him, who we ſawe had blinded the whole worlde this many a hundred yeere: from him, who too farre preſumptuouſly was wonte to ſaie, He coulde not erre, **and, what ſo euer he did,** No mortal man had power to condemne him, neither Kinge, nor Emperour, nor the whole Cleargie, **nor yet al the people in the worlde togeather, no though he ſhould carrie away with him a thouſande** Soules into Hel. **From him who toke vpon him power to cõmaund, not only men, but euen the** Angels of God, **to goe, to returne, to leade Soules into Purgatorie, and to bringe them backe againe, when he liſte him ſelfe: who,** Gregorie ſaithe, **without al doubt, is the very forrenner, and ſtanderd bearer of** Antichriſte, **and hath vtterly forſaken the** Catholique Faithe: **From whom alſo theſe ringleaders of ours, who nowe with might & maine reſiſte the Goſpel, and the truth, which they knowe to be the truthe, haue ere this departed euery one of their owne accorde, and good wil: and would euen now alſo gladly departe from him againe, if the note of inconſtancie, & ſhame, & their owne eſtimation among the people, were not a let vnto them. In concluſion, we haue departed from him, to whom we were not bounde, & who had nothing to laie for him ſelfe, but onely, I knowe not what, vertue, or power of the place, where he dwelleth, and a continuance of ſucceſſion.**

M. Hardinge.

As yee confeſſe your departinge, ſo woulde God yee vnderſtoode your gylte.

Thoſe reuerent Fathers and Godly learned menne, whoſe roomes yee holde wrongfully, whom it liked your interpreter to cal ringleaders, reſiſte not the Goſpel, but ſuffer perſecution for the Goſpel. Your Goſpel, that is to ſaie, your vile hereſies and blaſphemies, woorthely they deteſte. Your newe trouth, that is to ſaie, your falſe and wicked lies, they abhorre. Neither euer departed they from any parte of the dute of Catholique menne, •by their owne accorde and good wil, as yee ſaie. •But wherein they ſtepte aſide, they were compelled by ſuche feare, as might happen to a righte conſtante man, I meane the terrour of death, whiche as Ariſtotle ſaithe, of al terrible thinges is moſte terrible. Nowe becauſe yet they finde the terrour of a guilty conſcience, more terrible then death of their perſons, they entende by Gods grace aſſiſtinge them, neuer ſo to ſteppe aſide againe, but rather to ſuffer what ſo euer extremities. Whoſe blonde, or the blonde of any of them, if God to his honour ſhal at any time permitte you to drawe, whiche ſo muche yee thirſte,

*M. Hardinges Reuerende Fathers cõtinued twentie yeeres togeather in Hypocriſie.

Truthe preuaileth

thirſte, ſoone after looke yee for the retourninge of the Iſraelites againe, that texte beinge then fulfilled, *Completa ſunt iniquitates Amorrhæorum.*

Were not they wel aſſured of the truthe, moſte certaine it is, what ſo euer ye ſaie, they would not make ſo fooliſhe a bargaine as your ſelues doo, as to buye vaine eſtimation among the people, with the certaine loſſe of their ſoules.

The Biſhop of Sariſburie.

Certaine of your freendes, **whome yée cal** Reuerende Fathers, ſuffer impriſonmente, (**yée ſaie**) and perſecution for the Goſpel. **Notwithſtandinge, it is not ſo longe ſithence the ſaide** Reuerende Fathers, **were them ſelues the Burners, and Perſequutours of the** Goſpel. **Butche complainte ſommetime made** Arius **the wicked** Heretique. **For thus he writeth,** ℣ Arius, *that ſuffer perſequution for the Truthe, that euer preuaileth.* Ruffinus, **notwithſtanding he were a great fauourer of the** Origenian Heretiques, **yet he ſaide, euen as you ſaie,** Noſtra Fides perſequutionis Hæreticorum tempore, cùm in Sancta Alexandrina Eccleſia degeremus, in carceribus, & Exilijs, quæ pro fide inferebantur, probata eſt: *While we lined in the* Holy Churche of Alexandria, *in the time of the perſequution of Heretiques, our Faithe was proued in Priſons, and Bamſhments, whiche were laide vpon vs for the Faithes ſake.* **Unto whome** S. Hierome **in his pleaſante manner anſweareth thus:** Miror quòd non adiecerit, Vinctus Ieſu Chriſti: Liberatus ſum de ore Leonis: Alexandriæ ad beſtias depugnaui: Curſum Conſummaui: Fidem ſeruaui: Supereſt mihi corona Iuſtitiæ: ℣ *marueile mutche, that he ſaide not further,* Ruffinus *the Priſoner of Ieſus Chriſte: I was deliuered out of the Lions mouthe: I was throwen amongeſt wilde beaſts at* Alexandria: *I haue paſt my Courſe:* ℣ *haue keapte the Faithe: Nowe there remaineth for me the* Crowne of Righteouſneſſe.

Epiphanius: Διὰ τὴν ἀεὶ νικᾶσαν ἀλήθειαν διωκόμενος.

Hiero. Aduerſus Ruff. lib. 2.

Hier. eodem loco.

Thus the Woulfe, when he is reſtrained from ſpoile and rauen, maie likewiſe complaine of Perſequution.

S. Hierome, **writing vnto** Apronius **of the ſtate of the** Eaſte Churches, **where he then liued, ſaithe thus:** Hic quieta ſunt omnia. Etſi enim venena pectoris non amiſerint, tamen os impietatis non audent aperire. Sed ſunt ſicut aſpides ſurdæ, obturantes aures ſuas: *All thinges here are quiete. For, al be it they haue not leafte the poiſon of their heartes, yet they dare not open their wicked mouthes. But they are as the deafe Serpentes, ſhutting vp their eares, and wil heare nothinge.*

Hieron. Ad Apronium.

Steph. Gard. De Vera Obedien.

The ſaide Reuerende Fathers, **that, as nowe, ſtte ſo firmely of your ſide, not longe agoe, were wel contented, bothe to maintaine, and to publiſhe the contrarie, as wel, as you.** Howe be it, al this (**you ſaie**) they did not of good wil, but onely of feare, and of ſutche feare, as maie happen vpon a conſtante man. **That is to ſaie, of mere** Hypocriſie, **and** Diſsimulation, **and by open flatteringe of their** Prince.

He examineth the matter vvith al his ſenſes.

He is perſvvaded by the vvorking of Goddes grace.

He is cõpelled by the povver of the Truthe.

And thus, to ſaue your Fathers from beinge Schiſmatiques, yée are wel contente to make them Hypocrites. Thus ſaie you. But your ſaide Reuerendes **them ſelues woulde haue tolde you farre otherwiſe.**

Doctour Gardiner **of him ſelfe ſaithe thus:** In the diſcuſſinge, and trial of the truthe, I did not ſo eaſily contente me ſelfe. But I ſo framed me ſelfe, that, as it had benne in aſkinge the iudgemente of al me ſenſes, onleſſe I perceiued, that I firſte of al heard them vvith mine eares, ſmelled them vvith my noſe, ſavve them vvith mine eies, and felte them vvith my handes, I thought, I had not ſeene yenough.

Againe he ſaithe, This aduiſed conſideration hath pulled avvaie al ſcrupulous doubtes: And by the vvoorkinge of Goddes grace, hath conueighed and brought them into the lighte of the Veritie.

Doctor Bonner, In Prefatione in Veram Obedientiam.

And againe, In deede to tel you at a vvoorde, that compelleth me, that compelleth al men, euen the mightie povver of the Truthe.

He examineth the matter to the vttermoſte.

Likewiſe ſaithe Doctour Bonner, **touchinge the ſame:** The mater vvas not rashely taken in hande: but vvith Iudgement, and vviſedome examined, and diſcuſſed. **Againe he ſaithe,** The Biſhop of VVincheſter had longe agoe throughely bulted this mater, euen vnto the branne.

If theſe tales be true, M. Hardinge, then is your tale moſte vntrue. If yée wil iuſtifie your ſelfe, yée muſte nedes condemne your Reuerende Fathers. Certainely,

your tales beinge direatly contrary, to make them bothe true, it is not possible.

But here ye beginne to fraie vs with your Prophetical threates. If wee once beginne to touche your Bleude, then (ye saie) your Louanian Israel immediately afterwarde shalbe restoared. I thinke, you meane, Domus Iacob de populo Barbaro.

In sutche blinde Prognostications, I haue no skil. God oftentimes suffereth iniquitie, and falsehedde to prevaile for a season, to chasten the vnkindnesse of his people. Let his wil be donne with mercie, as it shal seame good in his eies. But if ye prevaile againe, ye shal prevaile to your owne confusion. Wel ye maie repelle the Truthe of God, as your Fathers haue often donne before: But vtterly to abolithe it, ye shal neuer be hable.

Sutche vaine hope had the Ievves in olde times, to recouer their Religion, and Ceremonies, and vtterly to ouerthrowe the Gospel of Christe. They conspired together, gotte Masons, and Carpenters, and beganne to caste the Fundation, to repaire their Temple. Immediately the Emperoure Constantine raised a power, and set vpon them, and put them to the swerde, as rebelles, and Traitours. Others, that he spared alive, he made slaues, and cutte of somme their tongues, somme their handes, somme their eares, somme their noses: somme he burnte in the face: and so sente them abroade, for an example, from Towne to Towne throughout the worlde.

Chrysost. In Oratio, contra Iudaeos. Afterwarde, when the wicked Emperour Iulian, in despite of Christe, had genen the Iewes leaue to builde, and repaire their Temple, as is saide before, and, the Princes power assistinge them, no power seemed hable to withstande their purpose, then God him selfe from Heauen aboue encountred with them. Earthequakes brake out, and ouerthrewe theire buildinges. Lightninges fel downe, and burnt both the toles in their handes, and the coates on their backes. Then was the Gospel of Christe more bewtiful, and more glorious, then euer it had benne before.

Ambros. li. 5. Epist. 29. S. Gregorie saithe, Tulerunt Dagon, & restituerunt eum in locum suum. Hoc est, in Templo, vbi arca Dei posita fuerat. Quid est ergo Dagon in locum suum restituere, nisi Idololatriæ statum subtili consideratione perquirere? Et quia, quò subtiliùs Idololatriæ error aspicitur, eò veriùs condemnatur, subiunctum est, Rursus diluculo surgentes inuenerunt Dagon iacentem super faciem coram Arca Domini: *They tooke the Idole* Dagon, *and restoared him againe into his place: that is to saie, in the Temple of God, where the Arke of God was placed before. And what is it, to restoare againe* Dagon *into his place, but discretely, and aduisedly to examine the state of Idolatrie? And, for as mutche as, the better the* Errour of Idolatrie *is seene, the better it is condemned, therfore it followeth further, They rising in the morninge, founde* Dagon *lieinge flatte vpon his face, before the Arke of the Lorde.*

Gregor. In primum Regum ca. 4. l. 3. c. 5.

Euen so, M. Hardinge, yf ye raise vp your Dagon once againe, once againe he shal comme to grounde, and shal squatte his handes, and feete, and be vtterly dismembred by the falle, and shal lie groueling, as a blocke, before the presence of the Arke of God. There is no Councel againste the Lorde.

Prou. 21.

The Noble Prince Iosua after that he had once, by Gods commaundement destroied the Cittie of Ierico, adiured al his posteritie in this sorte: Accursed be he before the Lorde, that shal stande vp, and restoare againe this Cittie of Hiericho. In the deathe of his eldest sonne he shal laie the fundation: and in the deathe of his yongest chylde he shal close the gates.

Iosue. 6.

Theodo. Eccle. hi. fo. 283 in Greco. καν γὰρ πάλιν ἰσχύσωσι, καὶ πάλιν κατηφήσουσι

Theodoretus saithe, *The wicked shal not be hable to prevaile againste God. But if they once geate the ouer hande, yet shal they comme downe againe: as it is written by the* Prophete Esaie.

As for drawinge of your bleude, ye nede not so greatly to complaine. The Gospel of Christe is not bloudy. It hath hitherto prevailed without any one drop of al your bloude. God giue you grace, to repente, leaste your owne bloude be vpon your owne heade in the date of the Lorde. Fire, and swerde, and merciless Cruelte are the onely instrumentes of your Doctrine. And therfore ye same newe to saie, in your blinde hope, as cursed Esau sommetime saide of his Brother Iacob, Venient dies luctus patris mei, & occidam Iacobum fratrem meum: *The daies shal comme, that my Father shal die. Then wil I kille my Brother Iacob.*

Genesis. 27.

Athanasius

Persequution.

Athanasius saithe, Cædi Christianorum proprium est: Cædere autem Christianos, Pilati, & Caiphæ officia sunt: *It is the parte of Christians, to suffer persequution: But to persequute the* Christians, *it is the very office of* Pilate, *and* Caiphas. *Athana. Ad Solitaria vitam agentes.*

We will saie vnto you with S. Augustine: Illi in vos sæuiant, qui nesciunt, quo cum labore verum inueniatur, & quàm difficilè caueantur errores: *Let them persecute you, and vse cruelties ouer you, that knowe not, what a labour it is, to finde the truthe: and howe harde it is, to beware of errours.* *Aug. Contrà Epistola Fundamenti. c. 1.*

Againe he saithe, Nemo de præteritis insultat Erroribus, nisi qui Diuinam Misericordiam expertus non est, vt careret erroribus. Tantum id agamus, vt errores aliquando finiantur: *No man vpbraideth other, with errours paste, but he, that hath not felte Goddes Diuine Mercie, to be voide of errours. Let this be oure onely labour, that errours at laste maie haue an ende.*

We will saie of you, as S. Peter sometime saide of Simon the Sorcerer, when the people for anger, seing his falsehoode, woulde haue stoned him to deathe, Imò viuat, & Regnum Christi crescere videat, vel inuitus: *Naie, naie, let him liue: and let him see the kingdome of Christe to growe, and prosper, euen against his wil.* Thus, M. Hardinge, maie we saie to you. As for your bloud, we longe not for it. *Abdias in Petro.*

The Apologie. Cap. 23. Diuision. 1.

And, as for vs, we of al others haue moste iustly leafte the Pope. For our Kinges, yea euen they, whiche with greatest Reuerence did folow, and obeie the Authoritie, and Faithe of the Bishoppes of Rome, haue longe sithence founde, and felte the yoke, and Tyrannie of their Kingdome. For the Bishoppes of Rome sometime tooke the Crowne from the Heade of our Kinge, Henry the Seconde, and compelled him to put aside al his Princely estate, and Maiestie, and like a meere Priuate man, to come vnto their Legate with great submission, and humilitie, so as al his Subiectes mighte laughe him to scorne. More then this, they caused Bishoppes, and Monkes, and somme parte of the Nobilitie, to be in the fielde againste our Kinge Iohn, and set al the people at libertie from theire othes, whereby they oughte allegeance to theire Kinge: and at laste, wickedly, and moste abhominably they bereeued the same Kinge, not onely of his Kingdome, but also of his life. Besides this, they Excommunicated, and cursed Kinge Henry the Eighth, that moste famous Prince, and stirred vp against him, sometime the Emperoure, sometime the Frenche kinge: and as mutche as in them was, put our Realme in hazarde to haue benne a very praie, and spoile vnto the Enimie. Yet were they but fooles, and madde men, to thinke, that either so mightie a Prince coulde be fraide with bugges, and ratties: or els, that so Noble, and greate a Kingedome might so easily, euen at one morsel, be deuoured, and swalowed vp.

M. Hardinge.

Concerninge the case betweene these three Kinges of Englande, and the Bishoppes of Rome for the time beinge, I saie litle. If they did wel, and the Bishoppes euil, they haue their rewarde: the other theire punishmente. If otherwise, or howe so euer, eche one at Goddes iudgemente shal haue his deserued measure. But be it graunted al were true ye saie, thoughe wee knowe the more parte to be false. What thoughe Kinge Henry the Seconde were euil treated of Pope Alexander, about the murtheringe of S. Thomas the Archebishop of Canturburie, and Kinge Iohn likewise of that zelous and learned Pope Innocentius the thirde. &c.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

Notwithstandinge the Pope as his manner hath benne, raise Commotion within the Realme, and arme the subiectes against their Soueraigne, and put the Crowne Emperial from his heade, yet by your Doctrine, who so euer dare speake in his Princes right, is a fole, and killeth him selfe: as if there were no life, or saluation, but onely vnder

The Popes Exactions.

vnder the frantike gouernemente of the Pope. Hutche obedience, and loialtie the Pope hath taught you towardes your Prince.

The Apologie. Cap. 23. Diuision. 2.

And yet, as thoughe al this were to little, they woulde needes haue made al the Realme Tributarie to them, and exacted thence yeerely most vniuste and wrongful Taxes. So deere coste vs the frendeship of the Cittie of Rome. Wherefore, if they haue gotten these thinges of vs by extortion, through their fraude, and suttle sleightes, wee see no reason, why we maie not plucke awaie the same from them againe, by lawful waies, and iuste meanes. And, if our Kinges in that darkenesse, & blindenesse of the former times, gaue them these thinges of their owne accorde, and liberalitie, for Religions sake, beinge moued with a certaine opinion of their fained holinesse: now, when the ignorance and erroure is espied out, maie the Kinges their Successours take them awaie againe, seinge they haue the same Authoritie, the Kinges their Auncestours had before. For the gifte is voide, excepte it be allowed by the wil of the geeuer: and that cannot seeme a perfite wil, whiche is dimmed, and hindered by erroure.

M. Hardinge.

As for Peterpens, and what other so euer summes of monie were yeerely paide to the Churche of Rome, whiche were not by extortion and subtil sleightes by the Popes gotten, as yee slaunder, but freely and discretely by the Prince and the Realme for a greate cause graunted, it is not a thinge that so muche greeueth the Pope, as your departure from the true Faithe and Churche dothe, as it maie wel appeare by that whiche happened in Queene Maries raigne, in whiche time althoughe the Pope were acknowledged, yet him selfe neuer was knowen to haue demaunded his Peterpens, or any other yeerely pensiones againe. But what is this to your Schismes and Heresies? This healpeth you nothinge for answeare to the haienous crime of your Apostasie. The liberalitie of our Countrie to the See of Rome, Whiche is the mother of al the VVest Churches, hath benne so smal in comparison of certaine other Realmes, as with the honour of the Realme it might not seeme to finde it selfe greeued therewith. Yet here yee set a Gnatte to an Elephante, and make greate adoo aboute a little. The Realme is not so muche enriched by retayninge that smal summe from the Pope, as it is dishonored by your vndiscrete talke sauoringe altogether of miserie and nigardnesse. Yee shoulde haue shewed better stuffe at leaste in the ende of your Booke. The laste acte of a Fable, by rules of Poetrie shoulde be beste. Yee haue doune like a fool she Poete, makinge your ende so badde. The Pope seeketh not your monie, he seeketh you. He seeketh the saferie of your soules. He seeketh, like a good shepeherde, howe to reduce the straied sheepe of Englande vnto the folde of Christes Churche. God graunt wee maie see his good intente happely achieued.

No doubte. For the very cause hereof was Auarice, and treacherie.

But remember the olde Verse. Curia Romana non captat Oue sine lana. Aug. de Verbis Domini Secundum Matthæ. Sermo. 19.

The Bishop of Sarisburie.

The Pope hath enriched him selfe, and gotten the treasures of the worlde into his owne handes, not by fraude, or guile, as you saie, but onely by the free liberalitie of Kinges, and Princes. Yet S. Augustine saithe, Non possumus dicere, Nemo nos inuasores arguit: violentiæ nullus accusat: Quasi non maiorem interdum prædam à viduabus Blandimenta eliciant, quàm tormenta. Nec interest apud Deum, vtrùm vi, an circumuentione quis res alienas occupet: dummodò quoquo pacto teneat alienum: *Wee cannot saie, No man chargeth vs with extortion: no man accuseth vs of violence. For oftentimes of poore widowes a man maie geate more by flatterie, then by rackinge. And there is no difference before God, whether a man holde an other mannes goodes by open violence, or by guile: of the thinge that he holdeth be not his owne.*

But howe maie this by your learninge, M. Hardinge, be called the Liberalitie of the Prince? He is liberal, that is free in bestowinge of his owne. But you tel vs, that al the Temporal goodes of the worlde are the Popes and not the Princes: and that the Prince hath nothinge, but by fauoure and sufferance of the Pope. Your Honoures wordes be these, Papa est Dominus omnium Temporalium: secundum illud dictum Petri, Dabo tibi omnia regna mundi: *The Pope is the Lord of al temporal goodes, according to that*

Archidiaco. De Hæresi. Ver. Et quia tanta. Fo. 15.

The Popes Exactions.

to that saieinge of S. Peter (that S. Peter neuer spake: for they are the wordes of the Diuel) *I wil geue thee al the Kingdomes of the worlde.*

An other of your Doctours saithe thus, Dicunt quòd solus Papa est verus Dominus temporalium, ita quòd potest auferre ab alio, quòd aliâs suum est. Sed prælati cæteri, & Principes, non sunt Domini, sed Tutores, Procuratores & Dispensatores: *They saie, that the Pope onely is the very Lorde of Temporal thinges: so that he maie take from any man, that is his owne. As for other Prelates, and Princes, they be the ouersears, and stewardes of worldly things, but not the Lordes.* And Matthias Parisiensis saithe, that Pope Innocentius 3. called Kinge Iohn the Kinge of Englande, Vasallum suum, That is to saie, his sæde man, or his Tenante, meaning thereby, that the Realme of Englande was the Popes, and not the Kinges. If al this be true, howe can the Kinges of Englande, in graunting any thinge to the Pope, be counted liberal? Verily it is an easie kinde of liberalitie, for a man to geue that thinge that is not his owne.

Matthe. 4. Citatur à Felino, de Offi. & Potest. iudicis delega. Ex parte 1. Ioha. de Parisijs, de Potesta. Regia, & Papali. Math. Paris. in Iohan.

But the Pope (yæ saie) fetcheth no more by al his reuenewes out of Englande, then an Elephante by a Gnatte: and that therefore, during the whole time of Queene Marie, he neuer demaunded of vs any manner of yeerely paiemente. We must beare with your erroure herein, M. Hardinge, for that yæ neuer were the Popes Collectoure, and therefore not mutche acquainted with his Bokes. Otherwise yæ might haue remembred, that Cardinal Poole, beinge not the Pope, but onely a Legate, or messenger from the Pope, had a thousande poundes paide him yearely out of one Bishoprike in Englande, towardes the prouision of his kitchin. Ye might haue remembred, that al the Bishoppes of Englande, paide the Pope the whole firste fruites of al their liuinges: whiche by any common estimation, amounted to more sommewhat, then a Gnatte. And althoughe I were neuer, neither skilful, nor curious in the Popes Collections, yet, as wel for the discouerie of so greate vntruthe, as also for the better satisfaction of the Reader, I haue thought it good, briefly, and by the waie to touche, what maie be founde in olde Recordes of good credite, touchinge the same.

Firste therefore the Archbishop of Canturburie paide vnto the Pope for his Annates, or Firste fruites at euery vacation, tenne thousande Florences: besides other fiue thousande Florenes for the vse, and right of his Palle.

The Archbishop of Yorke paide likewise for his Firste fruites tenne thousande Florences, and, as it is thought, other fiue thousande Florenes for his Palle.

The Bishop of Elie paide for his Firste fruites seuen thousande Florenes.

The Bishop of London paide for his Firste fruites thræ thousande Florenes.

The Bishop of VVinchester paide for his Firste fruites fyue thousande Florenes.

The Bishop of Exceter paide for his Firste fruites fyue thousande Florenes.

The Bishop of Lincolne paide for his Firste fruites fiue thousande Florenes.

The Bishop of Lichefielde, and Couentrie, paide for his Firste fruites thræ thousand Florenes.

The Bishop of Herforde paide for his Firste fruites one thousande, and eight hundred Florenes.

The Bishop of Sarisburie paide for his Firste fruites foure thousande, and fiue hundred Florenes. And so the reste, eche man accordingly after his rate.

Here is to be noted, that a Florene is an Italian Crowne, of the valewe of foure shillinges and fyre pense sterlinge.

Thus mutch I haue noted onely for example. By these fewe the discrete Reader maie easilie gheasse the Exactions, and paiementes of the other Bishoppes.

The whole value of the Popes Firste fruites throughout Europe, as I finde in one Recorde (although very vnperfite, for that it lacketh sundrie great, knowen, and notable Bishoprikes, as Durham, Carlile, VVorcester, Norvviche, Bathe, Chichester, which with many other mo Archbishoprikes, and Bishoprikes, as wel within the Dominions of our Kinges of Englande, as also in sundrie other Christian Kingedomes, and Countries, are leafte vnreckened) ariseth to the Summe of two thousande thousande, foure hundred thræ score thousande, eighte hundred, fourtie and thræ Florenes.

Legatio Adriane Papæ 6. Excusa. Wittenber. Anno. 1538.

Notwith-

Notwithstandinge ye make your Pope as bigge, as an Elephante, yet, M. Harding theis reckeninges are euer huge, in any reasonable proportion, to be resembled to a Gnatte. Here I leaue out the yerely perquisities, that the Pope made of his Elections, Prouentions, Dispensations, Pluralities, Trialities, Totquottes, Toleration: for his Bulles, his Seales, his Signatures: for Eatinge Fleashe, for Egges, for VVhite meate, for Prieftes Concubines, and for other like marchandise, I know not what. The summe whereof notwithstandinge amounteth to more, then niene hundred thousande Florens. As for your Smoke farthinges and Peter pense, I make no reckeninge, by the vile and contemptuous reporte whereof, ye shewe your selfe, not onely ignorante, and vnskilful, in that ye write, whiche argueth somme folie, but also iniurious vnto your Countrie. Reade Matthias Parisiensis and ye shal finde, both by what tyrannie, and treacherie, and also what masses, and intolerable summes of money the Popes Ministers haue caried out of this Realme.

Anno. 1213. The Pope (saithe he) beinge diseased with a spiritual dropsie, that is to saie, with an vnquencheable thirste of monie, shooke out al the Prieftes purses, and spoiled the Abbies of al theire Treasures.

Anno. 1246 Againe, *The* Pope *made a Decree in* Rome, *that the goodes, and monies of al Bishoppes, and Prieftes deceassed within* Englande, *shoulde be taken to his vse.*

Eodē Anne. *The* Pope *gaue streighte commaundemente to the* Bishoppes of Englande, *that al Personnes, and vicares beinge resident vpon their Benefices shoulde paie yeerely vnto him the third parte of al the valewe of their saide Benefices: And, that al Personnes, and Vicares, beinge not residente, shoulde paie vnto him yeerely the oze ful halfe parte of theire benefices. Al theise paiementes to continue, duringe the space of three whole yeere.* Whiche amounteth at the leaft to the summe of a hundred and three scoare and tenne thousande pounde.

Anno. 1247. The Bishoppes of Englande after great and forceable intreatie, agreed togeather to geue the Pope a Contribution of eleuen thousande Markes.

Eodē Anno. At that time the poore Prior of VVincester was forced to paie yerely three hundred threescoare and fiue Markes towardes the furniture of the Popes Table.

Eodē Anno. The Pope made a straite Decree, that al Bisshoppes Electe shoulde immediately trauaile out of Englande to Rome, to attende vpon his Holinesse, as Matthias saithe, Vt Romanorum loculos impregnaret, in ruinam regni Angliæ: *To stuffe the* Romaines *purses, and to decaie the Kingdome of* Englande.

Matthæus Westmonastē riensis. The Pope had the Tenthes of al the Spiritual Liuinges in Englande, during the space of tenne whole yeres.

Anno. 1301. Rustandus the Popes Legate cracted intolerable great paimentes of the Cleargie
Anno. 1255. of Englande in a Synode holden in London, as Matthias saithe, Per scripta Papæ plena iniurijs, & iniquitate, quæ possent patientissimum cor virulenter sauciare: *Al thu he did by the Authoritie of the Popes Letters, ful of iniurie, and iniquitie: Whiche were hable moste cruelly to wounde any harte, were it neuer so pacient.* The Bishoppes of London, and VVorcester answeared the Popes Legate, that they woulde rather lose their liues, then they woulde geue their consente to so open iniurie, and seruitude, and intolerable oppression of the Churche.

The Kinge had entred into an Obligation, to paie vnto the Pope two hundred thousande Markes, besides other fiftie thousande poundes sterlinge. For paiment whereof, the Bishop of Hereforde, beinge then the Popes Agente, had bounde the Bishoppes of Englande, before they were ware. Suche like pretie Gnattes your Pope can straine, if Kinges and Princes wil geue him leaue.

Ioha. Sarisburien. lib. 6. cap. 24. Iohannes Sarisburiensis, otherwise called Rupertus Carnotensis, in the familiare talke that he had with Pope Adriane 4. saide thus vnto him: Ipse Romanus Pontifex omnibus ferè est intolerabilis: Lætatur spolijs Ecclesiarum: quæstum omnem reputat pietatem: Prouinciarum diripit spolia, acsi Thesauros Crœsi studeat reparare: *The* Pope *is nowe becomme intolerable almoste to al the Worlde: He reioiseth in the spoile of Churches: Al manner of gaine he counteth Holinesse: He maketh suche hauocke of* Kingedomes, *and* Prouinces, *as if he had intended to repaire againe* Crœsus Treasurie. Againe, *His Legates so rage, and rampe for monie, as if the Infernal furies were sente from*

Hell

the popes Exactions

Helle to goe at libertie. What shal wée nède many wordes? Ambition, and Auarice haue no bottome. Matthias Parisiensis saith, In Romana Curia omnia possunt pecuniæ: *Money maie do al things in the* Courte of Rome. And he calleth these vnsatiable prollinges of the Pope, Quotidianas Extortiones, *Daily Extortions.* Againe he saith, that the King of Englande, vpon a very frivolous, and fonde mater, made true paiement vnto Pope Alexander the fourthe, of nine hundred, and fiftie thousande Markes. VVhich thinge, he saithe, is horrible, and abominable to be thought. To be short, that ye maie the better viewe the bignesse, and quantitie of youre Gnatte, Doctoure Bonner hereof writeth thus: *The* Popes *praie in* Englande *was so greate, that it came to as mutche almoste, as the Reuenewes of the Crowne.*

Lib. 5. ca. 16

Acsi mittatur ab Inferis Tesiphone, vel Megæra.

Anno. 1247

Anno. 1257

Quod est horribile cogitatu.

D. Bonner, in præfatione in Libell. Stephan Gardineri de vera Obedient.

Therfore Mathias saithe, Imperator reprehendit Regem Angliæ, quòd permitteret terram suam tam impudenter per Papam depauperari: *The* Emperoure *friendly reproued* Henrie *the 3.* Kinge of Englande, *for that he suffered his Kingdome so impudently to be empouerished by the* Pope.

Againe he saith, King Henrie the third made open complaint by his Embassadour in the Councel of Lions in Fraunce, of the Popes innumerable Exactions.

Anno. 1240

Likewise he saithe before, Rex Henricus 3. represit impetum Legati, propter violentiam Denariorum: *The Kinge staied the attemptes of the* Popes Legate *touchinge his intolerable greedinesse in prollinge for monie.*

Anno. 1215.

Yée sir therfore, M. Harding, neither is this gnatte so litle, as by your scornefull comparison, to the greate dishonoure of this Noble Realme, yée woulde séeme to make it: nor is the griefe, and complainte thereof so newe, as yée beare vs in hande. Kinge Canutus, the King of Englande, almost fiue hundred yéres agoe, being at Rome, wrote home to the Archebishops, and Bishoppes, and States of the Realme, on this wise: Conquestus sum item coram Domino Papa, & mihi valdè displicere dixi, quòd mei Archiepiscopi in tantum angariabantur immensitate pecuniarum, quæ ab eis expetebantur, &c. *Also I haue made my complainte vnto the* Pope, *and tolde him, that it mutche misliketh mee, that my* Archebishoppes *shoulde be vexed with sutche vnreasonable summes of monie required of them.*

Wilibelmus Malmesbu. Anno. 1031.

Likewise Matthias Parisiensis writeth of King VVilliam the Conqueroure, Concipiens indignationem contra Papam, allegauit quòd nullus Archiepiscopus, vel Episcopus de Regno suo, ad Curiam Romanam, vel ad Papam haberet respectum: Kinge VVilliam, *vpon displeasure conceiued againste the* Pope, *saide, that no* Archebishop, *or Bishop of his* Realme, shoulde from thencefoorth haue regarde either to the Courte of Rome, or to the Pope.

Anno. 1094.

Al this notwithstanding, yée saie, the Pope is an Elephant: and al these summes, in Comparison of his treasures, are but a gnatte.

Verily, al these, and other farre greater reckeninges the Realme of England is wel hable to defraie. Neither make wée any accompt of the monie, but of the deceitful extortinge of the monie: neither is it dishonorable to the Realme to represse these lewde, and iniurious mockeries, and to preserue the subiectes from open spoile. Other Kinges, and Countries haue oftentimes donne the same. Lewes the Frenche Kinge, whom, for his Holinesse, they haue made a Sainct, hereof complaineth thus, Exactiones impositas per Romanam Curiam, quibus Regnum nostrum miserabiliter depauperatum est, leuari, aut colligi nullatenus volumus: *These Exactions, or paiments of monie, laid vpon vs by the Courte of Rome, by meane whereof our Realme is miserably empouerished, wee wil not in any wise to be leuied, or gathered.* The gaines, and pelferies, that the Phariseis made of the people, were not so greate. Neuertheles Christe saide vnto them, VVoe be vnto you, yee Scribes, and Phariseis, that rauen vp poore vvidowes houses, vnder pretense of longe praieinge.

Ludouicus 9

Matth. 23.

I knowe, you make no greate accoumpte of Laurentius Valla, yet thus he writeth, touchinge the vnsatiable ambition, and grædinesse, that in his time he sawe in the Churche of Rome: Quid ergo, Summe Pontifex, omnes Reges, ac principes Occidentis spoliare Vrbibus, aut cogere, vt annua tibi tributa pensitent, sententia est? At ego contrà existimo, iustiùs licere principibus spoliare te Imperio omni, quod obtines: *What then,*

my Lorde Pope, is it your minde, to ſpoile al the Kinges, and Princes of the Weaſte of theire Townes, and Territories, or els to force them to beare you an yerely tribute? Nay, in my iudgement it were fitter meeter, that they ſhoulde ſpoile you of al that Empiere, that you haue gotten. Thus wrote Laurentius Valla an hundred yeres & more, before Luther began to preach. And therefore, what ſo euer he were, I trowe, at leaſt he was no Lutherane.

Rome (yée ſaie) is the Mother Church of al the Weast: and therefore, I trowe, wée are bounde to paie, what ſo euer paimentes thée ſhal require. If wée allowe ſutche ſimple reaſons, then is the Pope likewiſe bounde to paie to the Churche of Hieruſalem, what ſo euer paiementes thée ſhal require. For Hieruſalem is in déede the Mother Churche, not onely of the Weaſte, but alſo of al the whole worlde. Howe be it, it is a cruel Mother, *2. Corin. 12* that deuoureth vp her owne Children. S. Paule ſaithe, Non debent filij parentibus thetaurizare, ſed parentes filijs: *The Children ought not to laie vp treaſure for theire Parentes, but the Parentes for their Children.* *Lib. 6. ca. 24* But Iohannes Sarisburienſis in his Polycraticon ſaithe, Roma nunc non tam matrem exhibet, quàm nouercam: Rome *newe ſheweth her ſelfe not ſo mutche a natural* Mother, *as a* Stepdame: For ſhée ſpoileth, and deuoureth her Children.

This Defender (yée ſaie) in makinge his ende ſo badde, hathe plaied the parte of a fooliſhe Poete. Here, M. Hardinge, wée haue good cauſe to thinke, your Diuinitie is wáren colde, ſéeinge you are thus driuen to pleade in Poëtrie. But maie wée beléeue, the Churche of Rome is of late growen ſo Holy, that monie is now become the vileſt parte of al her Plaie? Certainely, if your Pope once leſe his monie, al his Plaiers wil ſone ſit a cold. *Felin. De Offic. & Poteſt. Iudicis delegati. Ex parte. 1.* One of your owne Doctours ſaithe thus, Ceſſante tali redditu, qui maximus eſt, attenta hodierna Tyrannide, Sedes Apoſtolica contemneretur: *If this rente (of* Simonie) *whiche is very greate, were once ſtaide, conſideringe* the Tyrannie of Princes, that nowe is, the Apoſtolike See of Rome woulde be deſpiſed. In whiche woordes thus mutche is alſo to be noted by the waie, that, what ſo euer Prince wil not ſuffer the Pope to take what him liſteth, muſte be taken, and iudged, as a Tyranne. Therefore Iohannes Andreæ, one of youre greateſt Canoniſtes, ſaithe thus, *In ſexto. De Elect. & Electi poteſt. Fundamen. In Gloſſ.* Roma fundata fuit à Prædonibus, & adhuc de primordijs retinet: dicta Roma, quaſi rodens manus. Vnde verſus, Roma manus rodit: quos rodere non valet, odit. *The firſte fundation of* Rome *was laid by* Theeues: *and hitherto ſhee ſauoureth ſtil of her beginning, and is called* Roma, quia rodit manus. *Thereof cometh the common verſe,* Rome biteth you by the handes. And whome shee cannot bite, them shee hateth.

The ſtate of the Romaine Popedome ſpronge firſte of monie, and encreaſed by monie, and ſtandeth nowe, neither by Truthe of Doctrine, nor by ſeueritie of Diſcipline, nor by Praier, nor by Holineſſe, nor by ought els, but onely by monie. Set monie aparte, and the Pope is equal with other Bishoppes. *Codrus Vrceus. Sermo. 1* Codrus Vrceus ſaithe, Pontifex Maximus, ſi non Virtute, tamen Pecunia: *The* Pope *is the greateſt* Bishop, *although not in* Vertue, *yet at leaſt in* monie. Therefore wée maie ſaie of the Pope, as *Cicero ad Attic. Lib. 2* Diphilus ſometime ſaide of Pompeius, Noſtra miſeria Magnus es.

Baptiſta Mantuanus, ſpeakinge of the ſtate of Rome, ſaithe thus,

Venalia nobis
Templa, Sacerdotes, Altaria, Sacra, Coronæ,
Ignis, Thura, Preces, Cælum eſt venale, Deuſq;

Emongeſt vs in Rome, Churches, Prieſtes, Altars, Maſſes, Crowvnes, Fire, Incenſe Praiers, and Heauen are ſet to ſale. Yee God him ſelfe emongeſt vs maie be had for monie.

Budæus in Panaetis. Budæus ſaithe, Sanctiones Pontificiæ non moribus regendis vſui ſunt: ſed, propemodum dixerim, Argentariæ faciendæ Authoritatem videntur accommodare: *The* Popes Canons *ſerue not nowe, to guide mennes liues, but, if I maie ſo ſaie, they ſerue rather to make a banke, and to geate monie.*

Bernarde of Clunice, ſaithe thus,

Roma

the popes Exactions

Roma dat omnibus omnia dantibus: Omnia Romæ Cum Pretio.

Bernardus Cluniacen. in Satyra.

Rome *geueth al thinges to them, that geue al thinges: Al thinges at* Rome *wil passe for* monie. **Euen in the** Popes **owne** Decretales **ye shal finde it noted thus,** Roma est Caput Auaritiæ. Ideò omnia ibi venduntur: Rome *is the* Heade *of al Couetous treacherie. And therefore al thinges there are set to sale.*

In sexto. De Elect. & Electi Potestat. Fundamẽm. In margine.

Yea Thomas Becket **him selfe, whome a little before, ye called a** Saincte, **when, for his wilful disobedience, and Treason committed againste his** Prince, **he had for aide, and succoure, fledde to** Rome, **and sawe, that nothinge woulde be wrought there without** monie, **thus he wrote thereof to the** Bishop of Menze: Mater Roma facta est Meretrix, & prostituta est pro mercede: Rome our Mother *is becomme an* Harlot, *and for* monie, *and* meede *laieth her selfe to sale.* **To be shorte, ye knowe, that our** Fathers, **longe sithence, were wonte to saie,**

In Epist. ad Archiepis. Moguntinũ

Curia Romana non captat Ouem sine lana:

The Courte of Rome *wil not take the Sheepe without the fleece.*

Therefore, M. Hardinge, your Poëte **concluded in good order, and wente not so farre beside his Rules. For,** monie **is bothe the** Firste, **and the** Middle, **and the** laste Acte **of al your** Fable.

Christe **sommetime thrust forthe Buiers, Sellers, Brokers, and Scorsers out of the** Temple: **But contrariwise, ye haue receiued in Buiers, and Sellers, and thrust out** Christe: **and so haue turned the** House of God **into a** Caue of Theues. S. Paule **saith thus vnto the people of** Ephesus, Argentum, & Aurum nullius concupiui: *I haue desired nomans* Gould, or Syluer. **Upon whiche wordes, in the** Glose **it is noted thus,** Per hoc Lupi cognoscuntur, qui talia concupiscunt: *Hereby, they that desire suche things, are knowne for Woulues.* S. Hierome **saithe,** Quia Prophetæ pecuniam accipiebant, Prophetiæ eorum facta est Diuinatio: *For that the Prophetes fille to takinge of monie, therefore their Prophesie was becomme a Soothsaieinge:* **that is to saie, it was of the** Diuel **and not of** God.

Matth. 21

Actor. 20.

1. q. 1. Nunquam Diuinatio.

Thus, M. Harding, to conclude, what so euer faulte, ye can finde with the Defenders Poëtrie. **Verily, by the iudgement of your nearest frends,** Monie **was the best** parte of al your Fable.

The Recapitulation of the Apologie.

THus thou seest, good Christian Reader, It is no newe thinge, though at this daie the Religion of Christ be entertained with despites, and checkes, being but lately restoared, and as it were, comminge vp againe a newe: for so mutche as the like hath chaunced bothe to Christe him selfe, and to his Apostles: yet neuertheless, for feare, thou maiste suffer thee selfe to be leadde amisse, and to be seduced with these exclamations of our Aduersaries, wee haue declared at large vnto thee the very whole manner of our Religion, what our Faithe is of God the Father, of his onely Sonne Iesus Christe, of the Holy Ghoste, of the Churche, of the Sacramentes, of the Ministerie, of the Scriptures, of Ceremonies, and of euery parte of Christian Beliefe. Wee haue saide, that wee abandon, and deteste, as plagues, and poisones, al those olde Heresies, which either the sacred Scriptures, or the Ancient Councels haue vtterly condemned: that wee calle home againe, asmuche as in vs lieth, the right Discipline of the Churche, which our Aduersaries haue quite brought into a poore, and weake case: That we punische al licenceousnesse of life, and vnrulinesse of manners, by the olde, and long con-

tinued Lawes, and with as mutche sharpenesse, as is conuenient, and lieth in our power: That we mainteine stil the state of kingdomes, in the same condition, and state of honoure, wherein wee founde them, without any diminishinge, or alteration, reseruinge vnto oure Princes their Maiestie, and worldly preeminence safe, and without empairing, to our possible power: That wee haue so gotten our selues awaie from that Churche, whiche they had made a denne of Theeues, and wherein nothinge was in good frame, or once like to the Churche of God, and which, by their owne confessions, had erred many waies, euen as Loth in times past gate him out of Sodome, or Abraham out of Chaldee, not vpon a desire of contention, but by the warninge of God him selfe: And that wee haue searched out of the Holy Bible, which wee are sure, cannot deceiue vs, one sure fourme of Religion, and haue returned againe vnto the Primitiue Church of the Inciente Fathers, and Apostles, that is to saie, to the grounde, and beginninge of thinges, vnto the very fundations, and headsprynges of Christes Churche.

Neither haue wee tarried in this mater for the Authoritie, or consente of the Tridentine Councel, wherein wee sawe nothinge done vprightly, nor by good order: where also euery body was sworne to the maintenaunce of one man: where Princes Embassadours were contemned: where not one of our Diuines coulde be heard, and where partes takinge, and Ambition was openly, and earnestly procured & wrought: but as the Holy Fathers in former time, and as oure Predecessoures haue commonly donne, wee haue restoared our Churches by a prouincial Conuocation, and haue cleane shaken of, as oure duetie was, the yoke, & tyrannie of the Bishop of Rome, to whom we were not bound: who also had no manner of thinge like, neither to Christe, nor to Peter, nor to an Apostle, nor yet like to any Bishop at al. Finally, we saie, that wee agree amongest our selues, touchinge the whole Judgemente, and chiefe substance of Christian Religion, and with one mouthe, and with one spryte do worship God, and the Father of our Lord Iesus Christe.

Wherefore, O Christian, and Godly Reader, for so mutche, as thou seeste the Reasones, and Causes, bothe why wee haue restoared Religion, and why wee haue forsaken these menne, thou oughtest not to marueile, thoughe wee haue chosen to obeie our Maister Christe, rather then menne. S. Paule hath geuen vs warninge, that we should not suffer oure selues to be carried away with sutche sundrie learninges, and to flee their companies, specially suche, as would sowe debate and variance, cleane contrarie to the Doctrine, whiche they had receiued of Christe, and the Apostles.

Long sithence haue these mennes crafts, and treacheries detained, and banished, and fledde awaie at the lighte, and lighte of the Gospel, euen as the owle doothe at the sunne rising. And albeit their trumperie be built vp, and reared as highe as the Skie, yee euen in a moment, and as it were of it selfe, falleth it downe againe to the grounde, and commeth to naught.

For you muste not thinke, that al these thinges haue come to passe by chaunce, or at aduenture: It was Gods pleasure, that, againste al

menne's

mennes willes wel nighe, the Gospel of Iesus Christe shoulde be spread abroade throughout the whole worlde at these daies. And therfore men folowinge Goddes commaundemente, haue of their owne free wil reforted vnto the Doctrine of Iesus Christe.

And, for our partes, truely wee haue sought hereby, neither glorie, nor wealthe, nor pleasure, nor ease. For there is plentie of all these thinges with our Aduersaries.

And, when wee were of their side, we enioied sutche worldly commodities mutche more liberally, and bountifully, then wee doo now.

Neither doo we eschewe Concorde, and Peace. But, to haue peace with man, wee maie not be at warre with God. The name of Peace is a sweete, and pleasant thinge, saith Hilarius: But yet beware, saith he, Peace is one thinge, and bondage is an other. For, if it shoulde so be, as they seeke to haue it, that Christe shoulde be commaunded to keepe silence, that the Truthe of the Gospel shoulde be betraied, that horrible errours should be cloked, that Christian mennes eies should be bleared, and that they might be suffred to conspire openly againste God: this were not a Peace, but a most vngodly couenaunt of seruitude. There is a peace, saith Nazianzene, that is vnprofitable: againe, there is a Discorde, saith he, that is profitable. For wee muste conditionally desire peace, so far, as is lawful before God, and so far, as we maie conueniently. For otherwise, Christe him selfe brought not peace into the worlde, but a swerde. Wherfore if the Pope wil haue vs reconciled to him, his duetie is first to be reconciled to God: For, from thence, saith Cyprian, springe Schismes, and Sectes, bicause menne seeke not the Heade, and haue not their recourse to the Fountaine (of the Scriptures) and keepe not the Rules geuen by the Heauenly Teacher: For, saith he, that is not peace, but warre: neither is he ioined vnto the Churche, whiche is seuered from the Gospel. Is for these men, they vse to make a marchandise of the name of peace. For that peace, which they so faine wold haue, is onely a reast of idle bellies. They, and wee might easily be brought to atonemente, touchinge al these maters, were it not that Ambition, Gluttonie, and excesse doothe let it. Hence commeth their whininge: their harte is on their Halfepennie. Out of doubte, theire clamoures, and stirres be to none other ende, but to maineteine more shamefully, and naughtily il gotten goodes. Matth. 10.

Nowe a daies the pardoners complaine of vs, the Dataries, the Popes Collectoures, the Bawdes, and others whiche thinke gaine to be godlinesse, and serue not Iesus Christe, but theire owne bellies. Many a daie agoe, and in the olde worlde, a wonderful great aduantage grewe hereby to these kindes of people. But now, they recken, al is loste vnto them, that Christe gaineth. The Pope him selfe maketh a greate complaint at this present, that Charitie in people is waxen colde. And why so, trowe yee. Forsooth bicause his profites decaie more, and more. And for this cause dooth he hale vs into hatred, al that euer he maie, laieing lode vpon vs with despiteful railinges, and condemninge vs for Heretiques, to the ende, they, that vnderstande not the matter, maie thinke 1. Tim. 6.

there be no woorse menne vpon earth, then wee be. Notwithstanding, in the meane season we are not ashamed in this behalfe: neither ought wee to be ashamed of the Gospel: For we sette more by the Glorie of God, then wee doo by the estimation of menne. Wee are sure, al is true, that wee teache, and we maie not either goe against our owne conscience, or beare any witnesse against God. For if we denie any part of the Gospel of Iesus Christe before menne, he on the other side wil denie vs before his Father. And if there be any, that wil stil be offended, and can not endure Christes Doctrine, (as the saieng wee, be blinde, and Leaders of the blinde: the Truthe neuertheless must be preached, and preferred aboue al: and wee must with patience waite for Goddes Judgemente.

Let these folke in the meane time take good heede, what they doo, and let them be well aduised of their owne Saluation, and cease to hate, and persecute the Gospel of the Sonne of God, for feare leste they feele him once a redresser, and reuenger of his owne cause. God wil not suffer him selfe to be made a mockinge stocke. The worlde espieth a good while agoe, what there is a dooinge abroade. This flame, the more it is keapte downe, so muche the more with greater force, and strengthe doothe it breake out, and flie abroade. The vnfaithfulnesse of menne shal not disapointe Goddes faithful promisse. And, if they shal refuse, to laie awaie this their hardenesse of hearte, and to receiue the Gospel of Christe, then shal Publicanes, and sinners goe before them into the Kingdome of Heauen.

God, and the Father of our Lord Iesus Christ, open the eies of them al, that they maie be hable to see that blessed hope, wherunto they haue benne called: so as we maie altogeather in one, glorifie him alone, who is the true God, and also that same Iesus Christe, whome he sent downe to vs from Heauen: vnto whom with the Father, and the Holy Ghoste, be geuen al Honoure, and Glorie Euerlastingly. So be it.

FINIS.

¶ To M. Hardinge.

IT appeareth, M. Hardinge, by that yee haue lately sente vs ouer, and specially by the vnpleasante verdure of your speache, that my Replie hath somewhat disordered your quiet minde. Whiche thinge notwithstandinge I mighte easily haue gheassed, was not vnlikely to comme to passe, specially beinge before not vtterly vnskilful of your affections: Yet, as I haue neuer soughte to write any thinge, that of pourpose, and iustely mighte offende you (the righte of the cause, and Defense of the Truthe euermore forepriſed) euen so am I newe right sory, to see you so vnable to maister your passions, and so vnadvisedly to make them open to so many. If it greeue you in respecte of your credite, for that I haue thus discouered your errours, that was your faulte: it was not mine. If yee had not made your errours knowen, they should neuer, of my parte, haue benne discouered. If you knewe, howe sory I am in your behalfe, yee woulde not so impatiently be offended.

It misliketh you, that I haue alleged so many Doctours, and Councelles, and, as you saie, haue so ambitiously painted my Margine with so many Authorities, bothe Greeke, and Latine. Yet you, for your parte, haue not spared, ouer and besides these twoo tongues, to painte your Margine, for a surcharge, with woordes in Hebrewe: besides other suche rankes of your Englishe Scholies, so many, so thicke, and so close togeather, that it were a harde mater, to force in one woorde of Truthe to stande emongest them. It is no courteous dealinge, M. Harding, to reproone that in others, that you so commonly doo your selfe.

If the number of Doctoures haue offended you, I doo not marueile: A cowardely Challenger woulde alwaies wishe the Defendente to comme vnarmed vnto the fighte. If I had alleged, either no Doctoures at al, or nothinge to pourpose, as your woonte commonly is to doo, yee woulde haue borne it a greate deale better. Howe be it, my Authorities of Doctours, and Councelles, be they neuer so many, yet, as you haue vsed them, are fewe yenoughe. For of the whole number, by your good skil, more then three partes are leafte vntouched. And in deede this was the wiseſt waie. Children, where they cannot reade, thinke it beſte, to skippe ouer.

Whereas I examine, and laie abroade, al the partes, and branches of your Argumentes, and shewe, howe directly yee growe to youre Concluſions, that youre Reader maie see, by what weapons yee seeke to maister him, this, you saie, is a kinde of scoffinge. Yee telle mee, I racke, and alter, and abuse your Argumentes, and plaie with shadowes of mine owne. But, M. Hardinge: if ye wil haue your Argumentes to passe smothly without controlment, then learne henceforthe to make them better. Yee are ouer tender, if yee looke to speake, what yee liſte, and yet to heare nothinge, but to your likinge: and, to sende abroade suche simple Wares, to serue the people, and yet maie suffer noman to telle you of it. Verily, where yee saie, I haue of pourpose Changed your Argumentes, if yee make them otherwise, then I haue made them, hauinge alwaies an eie vnto your Concluſion, yee shalbe forced to make them woorse. Touching the Scoffes, wherewith yee finde your selfe so mutche agreened, doubteleſſe, who so hadde that grace that is in you, as maie wel appeare throughout al your Bookes, mighte soone deserue to be called a Scoffer.

Where yee saie, you, and youre Felowes haue espied a thousande fowle greate Lies in my Writinges: had not one of you benne a greate Father of Lies, yee coulde neuer haue hitte so readily vpon the number. Suche an auditour, I trow, was he, that founde vs out eleuen thousande Lies in Sleidans storie. The very true multitude hereof, and the hugeneſſe of the heape, as it bewrayeth wel youre stomake, so in any indifferente iudgemente, it deciseth the credite of youre reckeninge. A man maie reasonably thinke, it is as possible, to finde twoo hundred, and fifte Untruthes in your Booke, as in mine to finde a thousande. Verily, as I neuer minded Laurent. Surius Carthusian. In prefatione in Nauclerum.

to defende any thinge, what so euer, that in any my writinges, shalbe founde amisse, so I see, by the viewe, of your accomptes, it were no harde maistry, with your eies, to finde Vntruthes in the Gospel. For what so euer I saie, be it neuer so true, yet if it like not your taste, it is a Lie: What so euer I allege, or translate, it is corrupted. So euil is my lucke: I can touche nothinge, but it is either too mutche, or too litle: or too shorte, or too longe: or to blacke, or to white: or one waie, or other it standeth awrie. If I translate, Nonnulli Sacerdotes, Sundrie Prieſtes,

M Hardinge. Reioinder, Fol. 203 b.

yee crie out, A corrupter, a falsarie. I should haue saide, Certaine Prieſtes: or, some Prieſtes: but I should not in any wise haue saide, Sundrie Prieſtes: For that were an Hereſie.

M Hardinge, Reioinder. Fol. 115. b.

If I translate ὁμοτρόφους, Vnà nutritos, Fedde togeather, yee telle the worlde, It is Falsehedde, it is fowle corruption. Thus yee saie, I shoulde haue translated it, Eodem Cibo alitos: Fedde with one Kinde of meate: as if ὁμῶ in Greeke, were not Vnà in Latine, or had not Relation to the Place. Deale herein with your freendes, M. Hardinge, as you maie: The

M. Hardinge, Reioinder. Fol. 163 b.

Greeke Reader wil allowe you no sutch Translations. If I happen to saie, M. Hardinge saith, The thing, that wee receiue in the Sacramente, is no Breade, Yee crie, Alarma: Looke, yee saie, in my Booke, Reader: M. Iewel is an vntrue man: Here he is taken with a Lie: Marke wel: I saie, it is not Breade: I saie not, It is No Breade. Not Breade, yee saie: No Breade, yee saie not: As if there were so many miles distance betweene No and Not.

These and sutche like, be the shameful Vntruthes, and horrible Lies, that you, and your Felowes with greate seekinge, and diligence haue espied. And thus, if a man happen to vse Ensis, for Gladius, or Nam, for Enim, or Que, for Et, yee thinke it cause sufficiente to make a Tragedie. Howe be it, I doubte not, but in my Replie, beinge so longe, and so ful of necessarie allegations, yee maie happen to finde some ouersightes of greater importance. And in acknowledginge, and reformminge of the same, yee shal finde me as sharpe, and eger, as your selfe. But these fewe examples I haue touched by the waie, that it might appeare, howe inquisitiue, and fierce yee are, to seeke occasions: and that your Reader maie see, yee hunte wantonly, and renne riote, and open ofte times without a cause. Yet notwithstandinge, if yee can telle vs sadly, as your maner is, that M. Iewel bringeth triflinge obiections, and trasshe, and pelfe, and nothinge to pourpose, without learninge, without reason, without witte, that he racketh, that he stretcheth, that he wringeth, that he wreasteth, that he nippeth, and clippeth the Doctoures, and Councelles: (for these be the woordes, whereby yee thoughte, yee might beste vtter your preaty fansies): if yee can crie out, False partes, False reportes, False dealinges, False Marchantes, False Ballance, False Diſe, and al is False: If yee can saie, Loe, Sir Defender, yee vvrangle, yee trifle, yee are taken tardee, yee haue prooued nothinge, yee haue nothinge to answeare: If yee can thus saie, and saie it boldly, it shalbe sufficiente: al is safe: youre freendes wil thinke, yee haue saide sommewhat, and that yee woulde neuer haue framed sutch a countenance, to saie nothinge.

Yee telle vs ful often, wee are no Bisshoppes. I trowe, for that wee haue not sworne our obedience to the Pope. And therefore yee geene the worlde to vnderstande, wee can consecrate no Ministers, wee can holde no Synodes, we can doe nothinge. Euen so ermine your Forefathers in Olde time tolde S. Paule, He was no Apoſtle: and others afterwarde by like authoritie tolde S. Basile, and S. Hilarie, they were no Bishoppes. But M. Hardinge, they were False Apoſtles, they were Arian Heretiques, that so tolde them. It booteth not, to trie our titles before you. Wee wil onely saie with S. Paule. By the grace of God, vvee are, that vvee are. And wee truste, wee haue not his Grace in vaine.

2. Corin. 9.

1. Corin. 15.

But specially, and aboue al other thinges, and that throughout al your three Bookes, yee saie, that Sir Defender is vnlearned: that his beste skil is in a fewe figures of Rhetorique: that he hathe neither Greeke, nor Logique, nor Philosophie, nor Diuinitie: that he hathe readde no kinde of Doctoures, nor Newe, nor Olde, nor of his owne, nor of others: that al the furniture of his Booke was broughte to his hande, somme by Greeke Readers, somme by Schoolemaisters, somme by Ciuilians, somme by Canonistes, somme by Summistes, somme by Glosers, somme by others: that he hathe nothinge els but patched Notebookes, hudled togeather by snappes, and peeces. Somme parte hereof, or rather the Whole altogeather, without exception, to doo you pleasure, I woulde easily haue graunted you, M. Hardinge, vppon smal suite, with more fauoure, and lesse adoe. Take from me, what learninge yee liſte: distreine it, and

M. Hard. Confut. 214. a. Et 259 a. And commonly in other places.

it, and pounde it at your pleasure: I wil neuer trouble you with Repleuin. Howe be it, if yee vttere al this of your indifferente iudgemente, and certaine knowledge, yet is it impertinente for vvee pleaded of Faithe, and not of Learninge: if otherwise ye speake it of heate of minde, and abundance of Cholere, and thereupon thus proclaime it to the vvorlde, it is great folie. Truely yee neuer sawe Sir Defenders Bookes, nor neuer sette your foote within his studie. A wise Iudge wil seldome pronounce before he knowe. If it shal please you, for trial hereof, to send your freende, he maie happily see, that Sir Defender hath al these Summistes, and Canonistes, and Greekereaders, and Scholemaisters of his owne.

Notwithstanding, it maie becomme vs bothe to saie, as a Heathen vviseman sometime saide. This onely thinge vvee knovve, that vvee knovve nothinge. Godde es Truthe dependeth not of our knowledge. Our tongues shal cease, and our knowledge shal faile: But the Glorie of God shal stand for euer. For my parte, I wil saie to you with S. Augustine, Quære doctiores: sed caue præsumptores: Seeke others of more Learninge: but bevvare of them, that presume of Learninge. If any praise falle out in this respecte, bestowe it freely vpon your Greekereaders, and Scholemaisters, who, in your iudgemente, haue beste deserued it. It shalbe sufficiente for mee, to haue saide the Truthe: which thoughe it appeare neuer so simple, yet is hable to remoue a Mountaine of Learninge. But happy are your Brethren of Louaine, that are so speedely growen Learned vpon the suddaine not by great studie, I trow, but rather by destinee. As sone as they had once sauoured the soile of that Countrie, they lookte onely vpon two poore Titles of the Lavve, De Maledicis, and De Clerico promoto per Saltum: and suddainely they were transformed, and nowe goe for Doctoures. Socrates. Extra. lib. 5.

As for your Learninge, M. Hardinge, wee neuer reproued it. Howe be it, greately to feare it, wee haue no cause. God geue you Grace, yee maie wholy turne it to his glorie: leaste in the daie of the Lorde it be laide againste you. He is ouer wel learned that bendeth his Learninge againste God. But, if wee be so vtterly voide of al manner of Learninge, paintinge, as you saie, our Bookes, and Margines with the Names, and Authorities of so many Doctours, what maie your freendes then thinke of you, that standinge so longe in the Defense of your Priuate Masse, are not yet hable to allege one Doctoure, nor Greeke, nor Latine, nor one, nor other? It seemeth greate marueile, yee shoulde haue such abundance of Doctours, and shewe, so fewe, specially where it standeth you so mutch vpon, to open your stoare. Consider, I beseeche you, your late Reioinder: wherein, as it is thoughte, nothinge of your parte is leaste vntouched. Of the Seuen and twentie Articles contemned in my Replie, yee haue taken vpon you onely to answeare One. And yet of the same One, yee haue scarcely touched the tenthe parte. Your pourpose shoulde haue benne herein, by euidente Examples, and good Authorities, substantially to haue proued your Priuate Masse.

Nowe consider the order, and plainnesse of your dealinge. Yee bestowe welneare the thirde parte of your Booke aboute the Sacrifice: as thoughe there were no Sacrifice without Priuate Masse. Al the reste yee consume in idle discourses, and needelesse talkes, of Consecration, of the Intention of the Prieste, of Minglinge the vvater vvith the vvine, of the Name of the Masse, of Trāsubstantiatiō, of Real Presence, of Church Feasts, (which in Old time were called Agapæ,) of Singulare Communion, of Communion of Faithe, of our Vnion vvith Christe, of sending abroade the Sacrament, of Prieستes vviues, of Vovves, of Bigamie, of Good vvoorkes, of Only Faith, of Publique Praier in a tongue vnknowne, of Ceremonies, of Fourmes, of Accidentes, of the Epistles Decretal, of Clemens, Cletus, Anacletus, Abdias, Leontius, &c. Hereof ye haue told vs such thinges, as perhaps we knewe before, and were not harde to be knowen, and perteined full litle to the pourpose. Ye shoulde rather haue proued, that within the first sixe hundred yeres after Christ, some one, or other of the Holy Learned Catholique Fathers Ministred the Holy Communion openly in the church, & receiued the Sacrament alone, not diuiding the same to any other, the vvhole multitude of the people sitting, or standing by, and looking on him. This was the mater that laie betweene vs: Hereunto yee should haue laid your force. This was it, ye should haue proued. For proufe of such things, as needed no proufe, yee haue brought forth great shewes of Learning. But, as touching your Priuate Masse, which only ye had taken in hand to proue, yee haue hitherto proued nothinge. Your Reader, M. Hardinge, can neuer be, neither so simple,

ſimple, nor ſo partial, but he muſte needes haue an eie vnto your iſſue, and remember, what yee had in hande. If emongeſt ſo many, and ſo Learned woordes, he finde not one woorde of that he ſoughte for, may not he thinke, he hathe loſte his laboure, and that there is ſomme filthe in your ſurdle? Maie he not ſaie with him ſelfe, Quo nunc ſe proripit iſte? *What ſhal I make of theſe vagaries? What meaneth this man, to ſhoote ſo faire biſide the marke? He muſte needes perceiue by your ſilence, that, notwithſtandinge your ſo many faire, and liberal promiſes, yet the thinge, he ſoughte for, cannot be founde. Naie, you your ſelfe, for excuſe hereof, by expreſſe woordes haue tolde vs plainely,* It mighte be, that none receiued the Sacramente vvith the Prieſte: *And againe,* VVhether the Prieſte had alvvaies a companie, to receiue vvith him, or ſommetimes receiued alone, that is a circumſtance of a facte: the prouſe vvhereof by manifeſte teſtimonies, can not vvith reaſon be demaunded. *Againe,* It is contentious, to put vs to prouſe of the Circumſtance. *Againe,* It forceth not, vvhether vvee bringe foorthe Teſtimonies of the fixe hundred yeeres, or no. *Againe,* VVhether I can shevve, that a Maſſe vvas ſaid vvithout companie preſent to receiue vvith the Prieſte, that ſaide it, or no, vvhat skilleth it? *Againe,* I muſte telle you, that I ſeeke not for Priuate Maſſe, vvhiche to finde, your ſcoffinge pretendeth mee to be deſirous. I ſeeke not for that, vvhiche I acknovvledge not. *And againe,* It forceth not greately, vvhether it maie be prooued, or no: *Whiche is as mutche, as if yee had tolde vs in plainer wiſe, that for the ſpace of ſixe hundred yeeres after Chriſt, yee can heare no tidinges in any* Doctoure, *or* Councel, *of your* Priuate Maſſe. *Whiche thinge, thus of your parte confeſſed, to our pourpoſe is ſufficiente.*

M. Hard. Reioind. fo. 281. a Et Fol. 88. a.
M. Hard in his Reioinder, in the Preface to the Reader &c.
In the ſame Preface, & ij.
M. Hardinge, Reioinder, Fol. 210. a.
Reioind. 219. a

Nowe, touchinge the Authoritie of your Amphilochius, *not longe ſithence, yee thought his force had benne inuincible. And therfore yee ſtoode vp alofte, and braued alowde,* Novve M. Ievvel, and his Conſacramentaries doo ſtagger, I doubte not. *And for that cauſe, as if it had benne ſome greate woorthy* Authoure, *yee alleged him ſeuen times, with ſpecial reuerence, in your Booke. And yet nowe at the laſte, yee are contente, for ſhame, to turne him ouer, and to let him goe. Perhappes yee thoughte, for the while, a weake threede was ſufficiente to leade the people: and that, as folkes vſe ſometimes to pleaſe children, yee mighte quenche their thirſte with an emptie Cuppe. Thus mutche hitherto, touchinge ſome partes of your* Reioinder.

M. Harding in his anſweare. Fol 29. a.
Reioinder. Fo. 267. b.

Concerninge your Former Booke, *whiche yee haue entituled, a* Confutation, *I neede to ſaie nothinge. By the iudgemente of the Wiſe, it ſaithe ſufficiently of it ſelfe. But what meante you, M. Hardinge, therin to make ſo large diſcourſe, I wil not ſaie, in the* Defenſe, *(for that woorde your freendes maie not beare) but at the leaſte in the fauoure of* Open Stevves: *and to calle the ſame,* Malum neceſſarium, *that is to ſaie, although it is ill thinge, yet ſutche a thinge, as no good Common Weale maie be without it? What meante you, to that pourpoſe, to ſhewe vs the name, and Authoritie of* S. Auguſtine: *muſt we thinke, that* S. Auguſtine *was a Proctoure, or Patrone for your* Stevves? *What meant you? thus to vpbraide vs in the ende,* In good ſoothe Maiſters, yee are too yonge, to controlle the Citie of Rome in her dooinges? *What needed you to beſtowe ſo fine eloquence in ſo foule a cauſe? Is vice growne ſo colde in* Louaine, *that it muſt now be enflamed, and authoriſed by open writinge? What meante you to allege the* Prophete Dauid, *the* Euangeliſte S. Mathevve, *and* S. Paule *the* Apoſtle, *for prouſe of your* Pardonnes? *Wil ye telle vs, that* Dauid, Mathevve, *and* Paule, *were* Pardoners? *Or, if yee dare to telle vs ſo, muſte wee beleeue you? if you ſo manifeſtly mocke vs with open folies, howe maie wee truſte you in higher Myſteries?* S. Paule *ſaithe, Thoughe our outwarde man be corrupted, yet our inwarde man is renewed daie by daie. Here yee telle vs, in greate ſoothe, that theſe woordes vndoubtedly ſerue to proue* Purgatorie. *Chriſte ſaithe vnto* Peter, I haue praied for thee, &c. *Therefore yee ſaie,* Chriſte novve requireth vs, not to be obediente to Peter, or Paule, but to the Pope, that ſitteth in their Chaire. Chriſte *ſaithe,* The Sonne of Man came, not to deſtroie, but to ſaue: Ergo, *ſaie you,* The Breade, and VVine in the Sacramente loſe no parte of their former vertues: but remaine in Fourmes, and Accidentes, euen as they vvere before: *as if the* Sonne of God *had comme downe from Heauen to ſaue* Accidentes.

M. Har. Confu. fol. 162. b.
Con. fol. 162. a
M. Har. Confu. fol. 163. a.
Confu. 251. a. & deinceps.
2. Corin. 4.
M. Har. Confu. fol 117. a.
Luke. 22.
M. Har. Confu. fol. 192. b.
M. Har. Confu. fol. 99. a.

Thus yee nippe of the ſenſe, and meaninge of the Holy Scriptures, *and fiede vs onely*

with

With emptie woordes, as if yee woulde pike awaie the corne, and geue vs the chaffe: or conueighe away the Jewelles, and throwe vs the Bagge. O M. Hardinge, be not wilful: let your owne conscience leade you. Was this the meaninge of S. Paule? *Was this the commynge of* Christe *into the worlde? Was this the sense of the* Holy Ghoste? *I wil not saie, what* Olde Doctoure, *or* Anciente Father, *but what* Summiste, *what* Canoniste, *what* Childe, *what* Heretique, *euer either so vndiscretely, or so vnreuerently vsed the* VVoorde of God?

I leaue the misconstruinge, and falsifieinge of so many Fathers: *the allowinge, and soothinge of manifeste Forgeries: the vpholdinge of Abuses, and open Errours: your weake Proufes: your seely Coniectures: your simple Gheasses: your greate ouersightes: your bold Affirmations: your heapes of Vntruthes: your disdeigneful scornes, your immoderate Sceffes: your vngentle, and vnciuile woordes, as for example,* Villaines, Theeues, Fooles, Disardes, Lourdaines, &c. *I leaue other your vnmanerly, and vncleanly speaches:* Hungry Dogges eate dirtie puddinges: As common as Life vvith Beggers: They serue the belly, and the thinges beneath the belly. *These be your woordes, M. Hardinge: you may not denie them. These be the floures, and ornamentes of your Bookes.* Confut. 318. b. Confut. 250. b

But was this a presente, M. Hardinge, meete either for the modestie of a Virgine, *or for the* Maiestie *of a* Prince: *specially suche a* Virgine, *and suche a* Prince, *so Chaste, so Graue, so Learned, so Wise, so Vertuous, so Godly, as Christendome seldome hathe seene the like? What? thought you, that either her Wisedome coulde not espie your fraudes, and mockeries: or, that her chaste eares coulde quietly beare your lotheſome talke? Or, thoughte you by the weight of suche reasons, to moue Mountaines, and to woorke woonders, and to force her* Maiestie *to leaue* Christe, *and his* Gospel, *and comme to* Louaine *to folowe you?*

Yee threape her Maiestie *fondely with kindenesse, and, as yee woulde haue the worlde imagine with good likinge, and fauouringe of your side: as if her* Maiestie, *hauinge benne broughte vp from her cradle in the knowledge and feare of* God, *and throughe Goddes great Mercie, and according to his knowne Wil, by the good aduise, and Counsel of the states of her* Realme, *hauinge reformed the* House of God *from the filthe, and soile of your diuises, shee stoode nowe in a mammering, and were not hable to discerne, either* Falsehed *from* Truthe, *or* Darkenesse *from* Light: *or, as if your Errours were not so grosse, that a blinde man may grope them with his Fingers.*

Yee telle her Maiestie, *shee hathe neither* Parlamente, *nor* Lavve, *nor* Churche, *nor* Clergie: *The Churche of Englande yee commonly calle the* Tovver of Babylon, *the* Synagog of Antichriste, *and the* Schoole of Sathan: *yee charge her Maiestie with disordered proceedinges, with maintenance of infidelitie, of Sacrilege, of Schisme, of Heresie: For your possible power, yee dishonoure her Maiestie, both abroade, and at home: where yee maie geate credite to your folies, yee slaunder the gouernemente: yee disquiet her Maiesties louinge Subiectes: yee breede Seditions: yee procure Rebellions: yee hazarde her estate. And yet dare yee to ponder all this poison with a fewe dissembled, and sugred woordes, and to offer the same vnto her Maiestie for a Presente? Wel, M. Hardinge, if yee had foreseene the thankes, that her Maiestie moste iustely yeelded you for your trauailes, yee woulde not haue benne so bolde, so rudely to presse into her presence. It behoued you, to be aduised, not onely, what yee wrote, but also what Personage shoulde viewe your writinges.* Confu fo. 42. a & throughout the whole Booke. Confu. fol 5. a. 15. a 38. a 49. & so through the whole.

If yee shal happen to write hereafter, send vs fewer woordes, and more Learning. If ye shal diuise to talke any more of your Priuate Masse, *leaue your vagaries, and goe directely to the purpose. Telle vs no more suche longe tales, either of the* Sacrifice, *or of other matters so farre from the question. It is no good* Logique, *to shifte of the thinge, yee haue in hand, and to mocke your poore Reader with an other. Treade not so nicely, and so gingerly, M. Hardinge: Saie not, your* Masse *is a* Circumstance, *and a mater of Facte, and standeth onely vpon suppoſalles, and gheasses, and therefore needeth no further proofe. Why shoulde yee so trifle with the simple? This is the Issue, that falleth out betweene vs:* VVhether any one of the Anciente Learned Fathers, &c. euer saide your Priuate Masse, &c. *This is it, that is denied. If yee proue not this, what so euer yee proue, yee proue not hinge. Bringe out sōme* Learned Father: *shewe sōme* Catholique Doctoure: *keepe them no longer for the commynge. The worlde looketh yee shoulde deale plainely.* Reioind. 233. b. 233. a.

Denie

Denie no more the manifeſt Truth: anouche no more the open Falſhedde: let there be ſumme probabilitie, and likelihoode in your ſaieinges. Leaue your immoderate, and vncourteous talkes. They are tokens of ſtomake, and not of Learninge. Therein yee haue deſerued the honoure aboue al others. In ſutche kinde of Eloquence noman can matche you, but your ſelfe. A good cauſe mighte haue benne pleaded with better woordes. The more vntemperate, and fiery yee ſhewe your ſelfe without cauſe, the more in the ende wil appeare your falſe. If yee haue hitherto taken any pleaſure in ſpeakinge il, at my hande, by hearinge il, yee ſhal not looſe it. If yee bring vs moe Fables of your Pardonnes, *and* Purgatories: *If yee feede vs, as yee haue donne, with* Vntruthes: *If yee deprane the* Scriptures: *If yee falſifie the* Doctours: *If yee conclude without* Premiſſes: *If yee place your* Antecedente at Rome, *and your* Conſequente at Louaine: *If yee ſtuffe ſo mutche Paper, and blotte ſo many Leaues, and ſhewe vs nothinge: briefely, if yee write none otherwiſe, then yee haue donne hitherto, no wiſe man wil greatly feare your force.*

Deceiue not the ſimple. They are bought with price: They are the people of God, for whom Chriſte *hathe ſheadde his* Bloude. *Your ſhiftes be miſerable. Yee trouble your ſelfe, as a birde in the Lime. The more yee ſturre, the faſter yee cleane: the longer yee ſtriue, the weaker yee are. Yee cannot bridle the flowinge Seas: yee cannot blinde the Sunnebeames. Kicke not ſtil againſte the ſpurre: Geue place vnto the Glorie of God. Wil yee, nil yee, the* Truthe *wil conquere. God geeue vs bothe humble hartes, and the people eies to ſee: that al fleſh maie be obediente to his wil. Amen.*

From London. 27. Octobris. 1567.

Iohn Sariſburie.

X 6120